NEW YORK CITY TAXI AND LIMOUSINE COMMISSION

DECEMBER 19, 2013

PROPOSED SPECIFICATIONS REQUIRING

PARTITION CRASH TESTING AND AIR CONDITIONING

AND

E-HAIL RULES

PUBLIC HEARING

Held on December 19, 2013 33 Beaver Street New York, New York Time: 9:45 a.m.

Reported By:

Margaret Crane

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD. 139 MAMARONECK AVENUE MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543 (212) 95-DEPOS (953-3767) or (914) 381-2061 FACSIMILE: (914) 381-2064 Email: Stenokat@verizon.net stenokath@verizon.net

| 1 | | 2 |
|----|--|---|
| 2 | APPEARANCES: | 2 |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | FOR THE COMMISSION: | |
| 5 | | |
| 6 | DAVID YASSKY, Commissioner | |
| 7 | FRANK CARONE, Commissioner | |
| 8 | ELIAS AROUT, Commissioner | |
| 9 | LASHANN DEARCY, Commissioner | |
| 10 | IRIS WEINSHALL, Commissioner | |
| 11 | EDWARD GONZALES, Commissioner | |
| 12 | LAUVIENSKA POLANCO, Commissioner | |
| 13 | NORA CONSTANCE MARINO, Commissioner | |
| 14 | MEERA JOSHI, General Counsel | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | SPEAKERS: | |
| 17 | CHRIS TORMEY, Applicant Licensing, TLC | |
| 18 | ERHAN TUNCEL, LOMTO | |
| 19 | RICHARD THALER | |
| 20 | ETHAN GERBER, GNYTA | |
| 21 | DR. ERNEST CHIODO | |
| 22 | DAVID POLLACK | |
| 23 | OSMAN CHOWDHURY | |
| 24 | DAVID BARNES | |
| 25 | MICHAEL WOLOZ, MTBOT | |
| | | |

SPEAKERS CONTINUED: PAUL HERZAN IRA GOLDSTIEN, Black Car Fund ANDREW FRANK, Queens resident б KEVIN HATFIELD, HAILO MICHAEL KEOGH, HAILO WASEEM IQBAL, Taxi driver AVIK KABESSA BHAIRAVI DESAI, NYTWA

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 4 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Good | |
| 3 | morning. Thank you for joining us | |
| 4 | this morning. We are beginning | |
| 5 | this meeting of the Taxi and | |
| 6 | Limousine Commission at 9:45 a.m. | |
| 7 | Present are Commissioners Marino | |
| 8 | Gonzales, Weinshall, myself, | |
| 9 | Yassky, Arout and Carone. Just a | |
| 10 | couple of things I want to run | |
| 11 | through before we get down to | |
| 12 | business this morning. | |
| 13 | First, as you all know, | |
| 14 | we're pleased to announce that the | |
| 15 | first tranche of our medallion sale | |
| 16 | went off not just smoothly, but I | |
| 17 | think very successfully, both, | |
| 18 | presumably, for the purchasers, | |
| 19 | some of whom have already closed on | |
| 20 | their medallions and are out on the | |
| 21 | street working, and for the city. | |
| 22 | The average price of that auction | |
| 23 | was in the neighborhood of | |
| 24 | \$1.1 million per medallion, and I | |
| 25 | hope and trust that those groups be | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 5 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | good value for the purchasers. | |
| 3 | I can also report today that | |
| 4 | 168 accessible independent | |
| 5 | medallions will be auctioned in | |
| 6 | lots of one on February 26th, 2014. | |
| 7 | Sealed bids will be accepted in | |
| 8 | person on February 20th, 21st, 24th | |
| 9 | and 25th, 2014, from 9 o'clock a.m. | |
| 10 | through 12, noon, at the TLC's | |
| 11 | offices at 33 Beaver Street, 19th | |
| 12 | floor, it says here, New York, New | |
| 13 | York 1004, but it's in person. So, | |
| 14 | come here. | |
| 15 | MS. WEINSHALL: What's that | |
| 16 | date again? | |
| 17 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: The | |
| 18 | auction will be on February 26th. | |
| 19 | That's when bids will be opened. | |
| 20 | Sealed bids are accepted prior to | |
| 21 | that on February 20th, 21st, 24th | |
| 22 | and 25th, so the four business days | |
| 23 | prior, 168 accessible independent | |
| 24 | medallions. | |
| 25 | MS. WEINSHALL: What does | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 6 |
|----|---------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | that mean? | |
| 3 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: They're | |
| 4 | independent medallions, so they | |
| 5 | must be owner driven, and they're | |
| б | accessible, meaning that they must | |
| 7 | be used with a wheelchair | |
| 8 | accessible car. | |
| 9 | MS. WEINSHALL: Mind telling | |
| 10 | me what we purchased last time? | |
| 11 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Well, the | |
| 12 | last auction was 200 mini-fleet | |
| 13 | medallions. Also, under the state | |
| 14 | law that authorizes any medallions | |
| 15 | we sell, really, from here on in, | |
| 16 | every medallion must be wheelchair | |
| 17 | accessible, new medallion, where we | |
| 18 | split them $60/40$, roughly, between | |
| 19 | mini fleet and independent or owner | |
| 20 | driver. The mini-fleet medallions | |
| 21 | last summer were 200, that's what | |
| 22 | we started with, and this time it | |
| 23 | will be 168, maintaining that 60/40 | |
| 24 | ratio, independents. | |
| 25 | MS. WEINSHALL: Is that it, | |
| | | |

TLC NYC 12/19/13 7 1 2 you're not selling any more? 3 CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Those are -- you know, and Commissioners, 4 5 our thinking -- and I should 6 preface this by noting, of course, 7 this is my last meeting as Chair of this Commission, so, many policy 8 9 decisions -- I feel maybe even that I shouldn't speculate too much 10 about how policy decisions will be 11 12 made going forward. 13 I can say that what our 14 thinking was to date was we would 15 take -- the state law authorizes 2,000 medallions. It's true that 16 17 the budget plans on the sale of 18 those over the next few years, or 19 those assumptions are incorporated 20 into the budget in a prudent way, 21 in other words, not overestimating 22 the results. But our thinking here 23 has been that we would take 24 information into account as we get it. So the first medallion sale 25

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 8 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | demand was quite strong. That led | |
| 3 | us to we knew we would always do | |
| 4 | the second because you have to do | |
| 5 | the mini fleet and the owner driver | |
| 6 | in parity, you know, to keep that | |
| 7 | ratio. I would say that the demand | |
| 8 | for that first auction was quite | |
| 9 | strong. So that should encourage | |
| 10 | people to continue and do more of | |
| 11 | the 2,000. | |
| 12 | On the other hand, there are | |
| 13 | many factors that the next | |
| 14 | leadership team will no doubt take | |
| 15 | into account. We wanted to, we | |
| 16 | always intended to. And the TLC | |
| 17 | certainly will, going forward, you | |
| 18 | know, monitor our TPEP data to see | |
| 19 | if it appears to be affecting | |
| 20 | earnings and if there's any risk | |
| 21 | that the market has gotten somehow | |
| 22 | too many taxicabs. I think that's | |
| 23 | extremely unlikely, given that we | |
| 24 | know the existing number's well | |
| 25 | below demand. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 9 |
|----|------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | But, at any rate, I just | |
| 3 | want to give you a full answer to | |
| 4 | that. We were careful not to kind | |
| 5 | of commit to any fixed schedule | |
| 6 | knowing that information may come | |
| 7 | in that would cause you to adjust | |
| 8 | what you think. | |
| 9 | MS. WEINSHALL: When do you | |
| 10 | think you'll close on the 200 that | |
| 11 | you | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: So the | |
| 13 | first 200, I was overly | |
| 14 | pessimistic. Last meeting, | |
| 15 | somebody asked that and I said I | |
| 16 | thought it would be a couple of | |
| 17 | months. | |
| 18 | MS. WEINSHALL: I think it | |
| 19 | was me. | |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Then I'm | |
| 21 | doubly apologetic for my missed | |
| 22 | estimation. | |
| 23 | MS. WEINSHALL: That's all | |
| 24 | right. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I thought | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 10 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | it would be a couple months because |
| 3 | of the backlog in converting |
| 4 | vehicles for accessibility. I |
| 5 | underestimated the fact that when |
| 6 | you have a bulk purchaser, a big |
| 7 | fleet, they can get things done |
| 8 | pretty quickly. So the first, you |
| 9 | know, I'm going to look out, four |
| 10 | or six maybe have closed, and there |
| 11 | are additional closings scheduled |
| 12 | over the next several weeks. So |
| 13 | apparently, some of the purchasers |
| 14 | are nobody wants to close and |
| 15 | pay us the money until they have a |
| 16 | car they can put on the street, |
| 17 | right. So apparently the cars are |
| 18 | being up-fitted on a faster |
| 19 | schedule than I expected. So |
| 20 | that's good news. |
| 21 | Okay. Accessibility, as all |
| 22 | of you know, the TLC and the city |
| 23 | entered into a settlement agreement |
| 24 | with plaintiffs in disability |
| 25 | litigation. I couldn't be more |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 11 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | thrilled by this. I believe that | |
| 3 | the issue of wheelchair | |
| 4 | accessibility was one that we had | |
| 5 | not, or, "we," the TLC, kind of had | |
| 6 | not dealt with satisfactorily | |
| 7 | during my time here. And prior to | |
| 8 | that as well, but certainly during | |
| 9 | my time, which I bear | |
| 10 | responsibility for. And I'm | |
| 11 | pleased that we've put together a | |
| 12 | framework that I do think will | |
| 13 | yield not just kind of a fair | |
| 14 | outcome and reasonable and a | |
| 15 | compromised sort of outcome, but | |
| 16 | one that does achieve the this | |
| 17 | really is a matter of justice for | |
| 18 | people who need government to make | |
| 19 | sure that they get a fair deal. | |
| 20 | And it was structured in a way that | |
| 21 | allows for the transition. We will | |
| 22 | be publishing a rule, if not | |
| 23 | tomorrow, I guess not tomorrow | |
| 24 | because that's the end of this | |
| 25 | week, but next week then, and that | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 12 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | will be voted on then after the new | |
| 3 | year. | |
| 4 | And, you know, I just want | |
| 5 | to particularly note again, I did | |
| 6 | at the time, but our colleague, | |
| 7 | Frank Carone, who, from his first | |
| 8 | days or weeks on the Commission, | |
| 9 | raised with me his belief that what | |
| 10 | we had done to date was inadequate, | |
| 11 | pushed, in his polite and | |
| 12 | thoughtful but firm way, for the | |
| 13 | TLC to do the right thing. And I | |
| 14 | do think that he deserves a great | |
| 15 | deal of the credit or have the | |
| 16 | respect for this settlement and | |
| 17 | this path going forward. So I just | |
| 18 | wanted him to get acknowledged for | |
| 19 | that. | |
| 20 | MR. CARONE: I want to thank | |
| 21 | you for those remarks. And before | |
| 22 | I forget, you mentioned earlier | |
| 23 | this would be your last Commission | |
| 24 | hearing. And before you conclude | |
| 25 | your remarks, I just want to say, | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 13 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | we didn't always agree on every | |
| 3 | single policy, principle/policy | |
| 4 | parameter that you put forth, but I | |
| 5 | know that you believed in | |
| 6 | everything did; you did it with | |
| 7 | your heart. You served the city | |
| 8 | very, very well, from my | |
| 9 | perspective, and I want to | |
| 10 | congratulate you for a job well | |
| 11 | done and wish you the best. And | |
| 12 | wherever your life takes you I'm | |
| 13 | sure you will do very well. | |
| 14 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you | |
| 15 | very much, Frank. I appreciate | |
| 16 | your saying that. | |
| 17 | I'll conclude very briefly | |
| 18 | with some thoughts on that, but | |
| 19 | first, the last thing before that, | |
| 20 | I just want to make an announcement | |
| 21 | this morning, although apparently | |
| 22 | it's already in the Daily News. | |
| 23 | But, Commissioners, you will | |
| 24 | recall, we've spoken about lease | |
| 25 | caps, the driver protection rules | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 14 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | that the TLC has had in place for | |
| 3 | decades and that really had not | |
| 4 | been enforced. And there's reasons | |
| 5 | for everything, but we formed here | |
| 6 | a Lease Cap Enforcement Unit a | |
| 7 | couple of years ago. A few months | |
| 8 | ago, when it became clear to me | |
| 9 | that the scope of the problem was | |
| 10 | not trivial, but rather was of | |
| 11 | magnitude, I signed a memorandum of | |
| 12 | understanding with the Attorney | |
| 13 | General creating a joint | |
| 14 | prosecution, or joint enforcement | |
| 15 | task force. | |
| 16 | The Attorney General's | |
| 17 | Office, of course, the Labor | |
| 18 | Division, specializes in worker | |
| 19 | protection. And while our staff at | |
| 20 | the TLC is enormously capable and | |
| 21 | enormously dedicated, it is also | |
| 22 | enormously small. Does that make | |
| 23 | sense? It is also small. And | |
| 24 | quite honestly, we have not had, | |
| 25 | even though people have done | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 15 |
|----|--------------------------------------|
| 2 | exceptional work here, as I will |
| 3 | say in a moment, we have not |
| 4 | developed decades of expertise on |
| 5 | this. So partnering with the |
| 6 | Attorney General has given us the |
| 7 | capability to protect the workers |
| 8 | in this industry who work |
| 9 | unbelievably hard, long hours at a |
| 10 | very hard job. |
| 11 | That joint enforcement task |
| 12 | force has borne fruit. Today, or |
| 13 | yesterday, we concluded a |
| 14 | settlement with what I believe is |
| 15 | the largest fleet operator in the |
| 16 | city. It's a collection of four |
| 17 | fleets that have common ownership, |
| 18 | 28th Street Management, Downtown |
| 19 | Taxi Management, Tunnel Taxi |
| 20 | Management and Woodside Management. |
| 21 | They operate approximately 900 |
| 22 | medallions; the common owner, |
| 23 | Evegny Friedman. They will pay a |
| 24 | \$1.2 million settlement to settle a |
| 25 | pattern of pervasive cheating of |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 16 |
|----|--------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | taxi drivers. \$700,000 of that | |
| 3 | will be in restitution that will go | |
| 4 | directly to drivers for the | |
| 5 | earnings that they have been | |
| б | deprived of, an additional \$500,000 | |
| 7 | fine will be paid to the City of | |
| 8 | New York. | |
| 9 | In context, one could look | |
| 10 | at that and curse to me and say, | |
| 11 | \$1.2 million is one single of those | |
| 12 | 900 medallions, but still, I do | |
| 13 | believe that this will send a | |
| 14 | strong message to people in the | |
| 15 | industry. | |
| 16 | I do want to be clear. It's | |
| 17 | my belief and certainly my hope | |
| 18 | that the bulk of fleet owners | |
| 19 | absolutely respect the rules and | |
| 20 | play by the rules and do the right | |
| 21 | thing, or do what the rules | |
| 22 | dictate. That's my assumption, | |
| 23 | that's my hope. But to make sure, | |
| 24 | we all know that if the government | |
| 25 | isn't vigilant, you can't count on | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 17 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | that. And this joint enforcement | |
| 3 | task force will ensure, I believe, | |
| 4 | that the industry does follow the | |
| 5 | rules and play by the rules, | |
| 6 | particularly as they relate to the | |
| 7 | most vulnerable people in the | |
| 8 | industry, the drivers. | |
| 9 | As much, really, as anything | |
| 10 | we've done here, this is something | |
| 11 | that I feel deeply proud that the | |
| 12 | TLC has taken this step and is | |
| 13 | achieving this measure of economic | |
| 14 | justice for our working drivers. | |
| 15 | On our side, and I'll leave | |
| 16 | it to the Attorney General's side | |
| 17 | to discuss themselves, but on our | |
| 18 | side, Meera Joshi, our general | |
| 19 | counsel, our remarkably capable | |
| 20 | general counsel, did a tremendous | |
| 21 | amount of work. And the folks in | |
| 22 | the Enforcement Division, Ray | |
| 23 | Scanlon, our deputy commissioner | |
| 24 | for USB, Sherry Cohen, our | |
| 25 | assistant commissioner for | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 18 |
|----|--------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | enforcement, and David Ross and | |
| 3 | Jason Gonzales. By the way, those | |
| 4 | two individuals make up the | |
| 5 | entirety of our Lease Cap | |
| 6 | Enforcement Unit. We doubled it in | |
| 7 | size a few months ago from one | |
| 8 | person to two people. | |
| 9 | So, this is by far the | |
| 10 | largest. They have concluded | |
| 11 | several other investigations with | |
| 12 | much smaller amounts at stake, in | |
| 13 | the aggregate somewhere in a little | |
| 14 | over a \$100,000 in fines, and maybe | |
| 15 | about \$200,000 in restitution in | |
| 16 | the other investigations combined. | |
| 17 | So this one is by far the largest. | |
| 18 | But there are others that are | |
| 19 | ongoing, and their work has been | |
| 20 | excellent. And I just want to | |
| 21 | thank them and credit them. | |
| 22 | Last, I will note that as of | |
| 23 | yesterday, or two days ago, the | |
| 24 | days are beginning to blur a little | |
| 25 | bit, we have now completed our | |
| | 1 | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 19 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | online initiative. You can apply | |
| 3 | for a new license online, you can | |
| 4 | renew your license online, you can | |
| 5 | pay your fines online. And that is | |
| 6 | really Gary Weiss and Jeff | |
| 7 | Grunfeld. They have put a ton of | |
| 8 | time and effort into this. | |
| 9 | As difficult as major | |
| 10 | technology projects always are in | |
| 11 | the context of a giant government | |
| 12 | where and we're partnering with | |
| 13 | DoITT, and DoITT has been very | |
| 14 | helpful with this but we have to | |
| 15 | respect everybody else's security | |
| 16 | concerns, and it makes it extra | |
| 17 | hard. So Gary and Jeff really | |
| 18 | deserve a lot of credit, which | |
| 19 | leads me, I guess, to the last | |
| 20 | thing. | |
| 21 | As this is, Frank, my final | |
| 22 | meeting as your Chair, I just want | |
| 23 | to first say what a joy, really, it | |
| 24 | has been. I mean, it's been hard | |
| 25 | work and conflict and this and | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 20 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | that, and maybe not every single | |
| 3 | day, but most days, by a long shot, | |
| 4 | I just love coming to work here and | |
| 5 | working with an extraordinary team | |
| 6 | at the TLC. That's something I | |
| 7 | hope everyone in this room | |
| 8 | appreciates. | |
| 9 | I can't imagine that you | |
| 10 | would find, pound for pound, a | |
| 11 | better group of public servants. | |
| 12 | And in every part of the agency, | |
| 13 | the people at Licensing who have | |
| 14 | brought down wait times by a third | |
| 15 | over the last few years, and the | |
| 16 | online thing should drive it down | |
| 17 | even further as people don't have | |
| 18 | to come into Long Island City to | |
| 19 | conduct their business; and the | |
| 20 | folks at Woodside, both in the | |
| 21 | inspection garage, who are ever | |
| 22 | looking for a way to speed things | |
| 23 | up. | |
| 24 | I was just talking to Martin | |
| 25 | Grindley yesterday, who runs the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 21 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | garage with, you know, I will say | |
| 3 | this, private sector efficiency, | |
| 4 | about how he's figured out a way to | |
| 5 | shave another half minute off one | |
| б | of the tests that they run, which | |
| 7 | is something that they've never | |
| 8 | stopped looking for ways to do | |
| 9 | business better. And the folks who | |
| 10 | work those lanes, and sometimes, by | |
| 11 | the way, because all the doors are | |
| 12 | open, so in the winter time it gets | |
| 13 | really cold, and in the summer time | |
| 14 | it gets really hot, they just pound | |
| 15 | it out day in day out, and I have | |
| 16 | great respect and affection. | |
| 17 | The folks in the Enforcement | |
| 18 | side, who, as we've grown, have | |
| 19 | kept up their productivity. You | |
| 20 | would think, a lot of entities, if | |
| 21 | you double or grow by 150 percent | |
| 22 | in size, all of a sudden nothing | |
| 23 | works anymore. They work even | |
| 24 | better now than when they were | |
| 25 | smaller. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 22 | 2 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | I have some numbers here | |
| 3 | that Allen, thank you for | |
| 4 | them I'm not going to read | |
| 5 | through them all, but I think | |
| б | everybody knows that they're taking | |
| 7 | cars, illegal cars off the street | |
| 8 | and summonsing cars who are not | |
| 9 | what they're supposed to be doing | |
| 10 | at unprecedented rates. And it is | |
| 11 | absolutely making a difference. | |
| 12 | And I know that folks in the | |
| 13 | industry will routinely call and | |
| 14 | tell me, well, I saw a black car | |
| 15 | pick up on 67th Street and of | |
| 16 | course, it has not gotten rid of | |
| 17 | rule-breaking entirely or even | |
| 18 | close, but it has made a | |
| 19 | difference. I don't doubt that for | |
| 20 | a second and I don't doubt that it | |
| 21 | will continue to make a difference | |
| 22 | and more and more over time. | |
| 23 | And then all the support | |
| 24 | functions which let the operating | |
| 25 | people do their thing. Everything | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 23 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | from personnel to the budget staff | |
| 3 | who had just kept the money coming | |
| 4 | to hire all these new inspectors. | |
| 5 | To Meera's legal team, to the | |
| 6 | court's unit under Sherry which | |
| 7 | makes sure that all the summonses | |
| 8 | that are given out stick, to the | |
| 9 | consumer folks who've | |
| 10 | revolutionized, or transformed, I | |
| 11 | guess, the capability that we have | |
| 12 | to deal with customer complaints, | |
| 13 | which kind of was broken and now is | |
| 14 | one of the best functioning parts | |
| 15 | of the agency. It's just been a | |
| 16 | pleasure to work with every single | |
| 17 | part of this entity. | |
| 18 | And finally, Colleagues, to | |
| 19 | work with you. And, of course, | |
| 20 | there's been disagreement, you | |
| 21 | know. We | |
| 22 | MS. MARINO: Really? | |
| 23 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I'm not | |
| 24 | going to say pushed the envelope, | |
| 25 | but pushed I believe that we | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 24 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | have done what people are put in | |
| 3 | public service to do, which is to | |
| 4 | address the hard issues, not duck | |
| 5 | them, not push them away for | |
| 6 | another day, but address them. And | |
| 7 | they wouldn't be hard issues if | |
| 8 | there were easy answers, and they | |
| 9 | wouldn't be hard issues if it was | |
| 10 | all gain and no downside. They're | |
| 11 | hard issues because they call on us | |
| 12 | to make judgements. And working | |
| 13 | together with each of you to make | |
| 14 | the collective judgements that | |
| 15 | we've made has been a very | |
| 16 | satisfying experience, and I am | |
| 17 | grateful for the relationships that | |
| 18 | we've developed, each of us | |
| 19 | individually and as a group. | |
| 20 | So, at any rate, I made | |
| 21 | that, you know, no tearing, no | |
| 22 | nothing. I'm proud of that. Small | |
| 23 | achievements. | |
| 24 | So with that, let's get to | |
| 25 | business for today. The first item | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 25 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | on our agenda is the Chair's | |
| 3 | report. I think we've knocked that | |
| 4 | out. | |
| 5 | The adoption of minutes. We | |
| 6 | have the minutes before you, | |
| 7 | Colleagues, of the November 21st, | |
| 8 | 2013 meeting. I move that we adopt | |
| 9 | those minutes as they are before | |
| 10 | you. All in favor say aye. | |
| 11 | (Chorus of Ayes.) | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Opposed, | |
| 13 | no. | |
| 14 | (No response.) | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: That | |
| 16 | motion is adopted. | |
| 17 | We have base applications. | |
| 18 | Director Tormey is here. | |
| 19 | MR. TORMEY: Good morning. | |
| 20 | My name is Chris Tormey, director | |
| 21 | of Applicant Licensing with the | |
| 22 | Taxi & Limousine Commission. This | |
| 23 | month, we have 13 bases for your | |
| 24 | approval. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I move | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 26 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | that we adopt the recommendations | |
| 3 | of the Licensing Division and | |
| 4 | approve the bases that are before | |
| 5 | us and deny the three bases that | |
| 6 | are before us for denial. | |
| 7 | All in favor say aye. | |
| 8 | (Chorus of Ayes.) | |
| 9 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Opposed, | |
| 10 | no. | |
| 11 | (No response.) | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: A | |
| 13 | unanimous vote that recommendations | |
| 14 | adopted. Thank you, Chris. | |
| 15 | MR. TORMEY: Thank you. | |
| 16 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: We have | |
| 17 | two rules on the agenda for today. | |
| 18 | The first is our proposed | |
| 19 | specifications requiring petition | |
| 20 | crash testing and air conditioning. | |
| 21 | This is here for public hearing and | |
| 22 | vote. The first speaker oh, | |
| 23 | Meera, do you describe this or not? | |
| 24 | Okay, we can go to the first | |
| 25 | speaker. First speaker is Erhan | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 27 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | Tuncel, representing the League of | |
| 3 | Mutual Taxi Owners. The second | |
| 4 | speaker is Richard Thaler. We have | |
| 5 | two rules, folks, so I will ask you | |
| 6 | to stick to the three-minute limit | |
| 7 | because I know there are speakers | |
| 8 | on both, multiple speakers. | |
| 9 | MR. TUNCEL: Good morning, | |
| 10 | Commissioners. My name is | |
| 11 | Chairman Yassky. | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Good | |
| 13 | morning. | |
| 14 | MR. TUNCEL: My name is | |
| 15 | Ehran Tuncel, managing director of | |
| 16 | the League of Mutual Taxi Owners. | |
| 17 | Thank you for allowing me to | |
| 18 | testify today. | |
| 19 | The rules you're considering | |
| 20 | today are nothing less than an | |
| 21 | effort to circumvent the New York | |
| 22 | State's supreme court ruling. It | |
| 23 | will accomplish exactly what the | |
| 24 | Bloomberg Administration has been | |
| 25 | trying to accomplish for years. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 28 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | That is, they are forced to |
| 3 | accept it will force us to |
| 4 | accept a concept which is not |
| 5 | applied in any other city in the |
| 6 | U.S., probably not anywhere else in |
| 7 | the world. That concept is a |
| 8 | single-vehicle concept for the |
| 9 | entire fleet of New York City |
| 10 | taxis. It is wrong, it is risky |
| 11 | and it is not necessary. |
| 12 | About six, seven years ago, |
| 13 | our Commissioner, David Yassky, was |
| 14 | a New York City council member and |
| 15 | he had a dream. That dream was to |
| 16 | make every New York City taxi a |
| 17 | hybrid. Taxi industry was against |
| 18 | the idea, I was against the idea |
| 19 | because, at that time, the hybrid |
| 20 | industry was a new and unapproved |
| 21 | industry. I didn't want to be |
| 22 | forced into buying a vehicle that |
| 23 | wasn't tested and proven. Yes, I |
| 24 | was skeptical then, but look at me |
| 25 | now. Today I'm driving a hybrid. |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 29 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | The hybrid vehicles passed | |
| 3 | the industry's test and made a | |
| 4 | believer out of me and thousands of | |
| 5 | other owners. Approximately | |
| 6 | 75 percent of the medallion taxis | |
| 7 | are now hybrids. | |
| 8 | Commissioner Yassky, your | |
| 9 | mission of a more green taxi fleet | |
| 10 | has been accomplished. It is | |
| 11 | accomplished not by your mandating | |
| 12 | it, but hybrid vehicles' success on | |
| 13 | the road. | |
| 14 | The point I'm trying to make | |
| 15 | is that the Nissan MV 200 is | |
| 16 | probably a good vehicle. It's been | |
| 17 | approved by the Commission, and | |
| 18 | rightfully so. It deserves to be | |
| 19 | on the road and put to the test. | |
| 20 | But in the interest of our members, | |
| 21 | being in the competition is a much | |
| 22 | healthier way for any vehicle to | |
| 23 | prove itself to the taxi industry, | |
| 24 | the riding public, and you, our | |
| 25 | regulators. With all due respect | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 30 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | to all of you, it doesn't need to | |
| 3 | be shoved down our throat. | |
| 4 | The drastic measures you're | |
| 5 | considering today will not make the | |
| 6 | taxi ride any safer than it already | |
| 7 | is; yet, they will eliminate all | |
| 8 | vehicles but the Nissan MV 200 as a | |
| 9 | choice for the taxi industry. | |
| 10 | Injuries involved in the | |
| 11 | partitions in taxis are easily | |
| 12 | avoidable by simply buckling up. I | |
| 13 | don't wish it upon anybody, but | |
| 14 | when your taxi driver must come to | |
| 15 | a short stop, the partition of a | |
| 16 | Nissan MV 200 is going to hurt just | |
| 17 | as much if you're not wearing your | |
| 18 | seat belt. | |
| 19 | I encourage you to join | |
| 20 | hands with the industry to find | |
| 21 | ways to promote seat belts, seat | |
| 22 | belt use in taxis to put an end to | |
| 23 | partition-related injuries instead | |
| 24 | of making up rules that appear to | |
| 25 | have only one purpose, which is to | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 31 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | eliminate competition. | |
| 3 | I urge you to vote no to | |
| 4 | proposed rules. Thank you for your | |
| 5 | time. | |
| 6 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes. The | |
| 7 | next speaker is Richard Thaler, to | |
| 8 | be followed by Ethan Gerber of the | |
| 9 | Greater New York Taxi Association. | |
| 10 | MR. THALER: Good morning, | |
| 11 | Chair Yassky and Commissioners. | |
| 12 | Any measure which | |
| 13 | potentially may reduce passenger | |
| 14 | and driver injuries is beneficial, | |
| 15 | but the cost benefit must also be | |
| 16 | considered together with the likely | |
| 17 | chance as to whether the measure | |
| 18 | would actually reduce or prevent | |
| 19 | injury. In this case, for the need | |
| 20 | for the proposed partition crash | |
| 21 | testing, there have been no | |
| 22 | anecdotal or reported cases of | |
| 23 | injuries due to partition design or | |
| 24 | mounting failure, which could have | |
| 25 | been identified or prevented by | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 32 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | crash testing. Therefore, crash | |
| 3 | testing would have played no role | |
| 4 | in the injury prevention. | |
| 5 | In any event, the taxi and | |
| 6 | livery crashes reported each year, | |
| 7 | for example, the 9,128 crashes in | |
| 8 | 2004 provide extensive information | |
| 9 | and experience regarding partition | |
| 10 | safety design compared to the | |
| 11 | National Highway Traffic | |
| 12 | Safety/FMVSS laboratory crash test | |
| 13 | simulation, where in fact, the TLC | |
| 14 | should understand that the purpose | |
| 15 | of NHTSA/FMVSS crash test is to | |
| 16 | determine the safety of new, | |
| 17 | untested vehicle designs not yet in | |
| 18 | public use. A case can only be | |
| 19 | made for the proposed partition | |
| 20 | crash test rule for new taxi models | |
| 21 | with substantially different body | |
| 22 | and chassis structures to determine | |
| 23 | potential FMVSS crash intrusions of | |
| 24 | a partition. | |
| 25 | The comments provided by | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 33 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | Mr. Sander and other medical | |
| 3 | professionals in the previous | |
| 4 | public hearing failed to disclose | |
| 5 | that the injuries cited were due to | |
| 6 | passengers' failure to use seat and | |
| 7 | shoulder belts and not related to | |
| 8 | partition failure. While steps for | |
| 9 | the prevention of passenger and | |
| 10 | driver injuries in the event of an | |
| 11 | accident should not be overlooked, | |
| 12 | the unintended risk of increased | |
| 13 | taxi vehicle cost and market | |
| 14 | withdrawal of an important OEM Taxi | |
| 15 | provider must be considered as a | |
| 16 | result of the proposed partition | |
| 17 | crash test rule. | |
| 18 | Is it the intention of the | |
| 19 | rule to require an approved Taxi | |
| 20 | OEM to provide the partition as | |
| 21 | standard equipment under 67-04(b) | |
| 22 | or could the crash tested partition | |
| 23 | be manufactured and installed in | |
| 24 | the "after market," which would | |
| 25 | require publication of the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 34 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | partition specifications? If more | |
| 3 | than one after-market partition | |
| 4 | could be eligible for approval for | |
| 5 | each taxi model, each partition | |
| 6 | would need to be crash tested | |
| 7 | separately by the OEM. | |
| 8 | But of greater importance, | |
| 9 | the TLC should not continue to | |
| 10 | ignore the more important | |
| 11 | requirement for either Taxi | |
| 12 | OEM-provided Collision Avoidance | |
| 13 | Systems or for requiring the | |
| 14 | after-market installation of Real | |
| 15 | Time Accident/Collision Avoidance | |
| 16 | Systems for drivers and passenger | |
| 17 | protection and enabling a reduction | |
| 18 | in Industry and Property Damage | |
| 19 | Liability Insurance premiums if the | |
| 20 | systems are not yet available as | |
| 21 | standard equipment from an approved | |
| 22 | Taxi OEM. | |
| 23 | Thank you for your | |
| 24 | consideration. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| | | |
| | | |

Г

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 35 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | Mr. Thaler. |
| 3 | Mr. Gerber, to be followed |
| 4 | by Dr. Ernest Chiodo. |
| 5 | MR. GERBER: Good morning, |
| 6 | Commissioners. |
| 7 | There's an old saying that |
| 8 | those who ignore history are |
| 9 | condemned to repeat it. A few |
| 10 | years ago, a Federal Court U.S. |
| 11 | District Judge, Paul Crotty, told |
| 12 | the TLC that it can not mandate |
| 13 | that all taxi vehicles be hybrids |
| 14 | because the TLC had exceeded its |
| 15 | legal authority. He should know, |
| 16 | he was also the former Corporation |
| 17 | Counsel of the city. |
| 18 | The TLC, which always knows |
| 19 | better than the courts, always |
| 20 | knows better than the judges, tried |
| 21 | to circumvent the court by |
| 22 | manipulating the lease rules in |
| 23 | order to do exactly what the court |
| 24 | said was illegal. The court |
| 25 | rebuked the attempt. The federal |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 36 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | court saw it for what it was, a | |
| 3 | transparent attempt to bypass its | |
| 4 | order. | |
| 5 | Then you did it again. This | |
| 6 | time, the New York State supreme | |
| 7 | court, by Justice Peter Moulton, | |
| 8 | said that the TLC could not mandate | |
| 9 | the Nissan Van 200 as the exclusive | |
| 10 | taxi because the TLC was ignoring | |
| 11 | city laws designed to encourage | |
| 12 | hybrids. The court also noted that | |
| 13 | it appeared that the TLC was | |
| 14 | exceeding its authority in the | |
| 15 | first place. Again, you ignored | |
| 16 | the clear language and guidance of | |
| 17 | the court, tinkered at the edges | |
| 18 | and tried to circumvent Judge | |
| 19 | Moulton's clear decision. | |
| 20 | Despite the warning of the | |
| 21 | court, you passed rules again | |
| 22 | overtly designed to force the | |
| 23 | Nissan 200 upon unwilling buyers | |
| 24 | and drivers. This time another | |
| 25 | justice, Justice Shlomo Hagler, saw | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 37 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | through this transparent | |
| 3 | circumvention and struck it down | |
| 4 | again. The court made it clear | |
| 5 | that you're acting beyond your | |
| 6 | authority in this misguided attempt | |
| 7 | to force the Nissan down our | |
| 8 | throats. | |
| 9 | Now we are here again, | |
| 10 | another day, in another last-ditch | |
| 11 | effort to save a failed program, a | |
| 12 | program despised by the owners, by | |
| 13 | the drivers who have to pay more | |
| 14 | for gas, by the disabled community | |
| 15 | and by the people who are concerned | |
| 16 | about clean air. It has been | |
| 17 | condemned by the City Comptroller | |
| 18 | and, most importantly, by the | |
| 19 | mayor-elect who will take office | |
| 20 | 12 days from today. | |
| 21 | Make no mistake, this is not | |
| 22 | about safety. The Nissan Van 200 | |
| 23 | is a top-heavy vehicle that is more | |
| 24 | prone to tipping. It has no rear | |
| 25 | crumple zone. It has a glass roof | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 38 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | that can spread debris on the heads | |
| 3 | of passengers in a crash. It has | |
| 4 | no posted ratings on the National | |
| 5 | Highway and Safety Administration | |
| 6 | website. None. It is more prone | |
| 7 | to serious injury in a | |
| 8 | high-velocity crash. Corporation | |
| 9 | Counsel's own papers in our current | |
| 10 | lawsuits say that it is not clear | |
| 11 | if side air bags would deploy at | |
| 12 | all in the event of a crash because | |
| 13 | of the partition. The sliding | |
| 14 | doors create no safety barrier in a | |
| 15 | crash, and the seats near the rear | |
| 16 | door are more vulnerable to | |
| 17 | rear-end collisions. Not | |
| 18 | surprising because this vehicle was | |
| 19 | always, always, always intended to | |
| 20 | be a cargo van and not a passenger | |
| 21 | car. | |
| 22 | These rules are designed for | |
| 23 | one purpose and one purpose only, | |
| 24 | to save the Nissan Van 200. A | |
| 25 | Mayor Bloomberg vanity project. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 39 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | This vote is not just | |
| 3 | disrespectful to the industry, it | |
| 4 | is disrespectful to the court; it | |
| 5 | is disrespectful to the City | |
| 6 | Charter; it is disrespectful to the | |
| 7 | new mayor; and it is disrespectful | |
| 8 | to the rule of law. If you care | |
| 9 | about safety, vote no or vote to | |
| 10 | postpone this vote. Let the new | |
| 11 | administration come in and design | |
| 12 | specifications meant to support the | |
| 13 | public and not meant to support | |
| 14 | Nissan Corporation. Thank you. | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 16 | Mr. Gerber. | |
| 17 | I just, we can have time | |
| 18 | later, if we wish, but I just want | |
| 19 | to make sure that people understand | |
| 20 | because the first couple of | |
| 21 | speakers have focused on the MV | |
| 22 | 200. And I understand the point | |
| 23 | that they are making, that they | |
| 24 | believe that this would lead to | |
| 25 | more MV 200s, but I want to be | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 40 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | clear about what the rule actually | |
| 3 | does. It simply says that any | |
| 4 | vehicle would have to meet crash | |
| 5 | test specifications. It does not | |
| 6 | mandate MV 200s. It does not | |
| 7 | mandate any other car. It simply | |
| 8 | says that any taxi that we're going | |
| 9 | to put on the streets should meet | |
| 10 | federal safety crash test | |
| 11 | specifications with the partition | |
| 12 | installed; in other words, as it is | |
| 13 | functioning as a taxicab. | |
| 14 | And any manufacturer would | |
| 15 | be not just free but would be | |
| 16 | encouraged to do whatever they need | |
| 17 | to do to meet those specifications | |
| 18 | and put their vehicle on the road. | |
| 19 | So I just want to be clear about | |
| 20 | what is within the four corners of | |
| 21 | this rule. The fate of the MV 200 | |
| 22 | and that project will be decided by | |
| 23 | the courts. | |
| 24 | Commissioners, I know, you | |
| 25 | know, we send you updates and | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 41 | 1 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | whatnot, but just, of course, as | |
| 3 | Mr. Gerber describes, the supreme | |
| 4 | court has enjoined the rules | |
| 5 | mandating the MV 200. That's | |
| 6 | correct. That decision is on | |
| 7 | appeal and that appeal will be | |
| 8 | heard in January. And the fate of | |
| 9 | that project rests in the hands of | |
| 10 | the courts. | |
| 11 | MS. MARINO: Can I just | |
| 12 | clarify though, isn't it true that | |
| 13 | the only car that does meet those | |
| 14 | specifications at this time is the | |
| 15 | Nissan? | |
| 16 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: That is | |
| 17 | the only car where the manufacturer | |
| 18 | has demonstrated that to us. I | |
| 19 | want to give you my lawyerly | |
| 20 | answer, which is, that's what I | |
| 21 | know. I do not believe that other | |
| 22 | cars do. If this becomes a | |
| 23 | MS. MARINO: Isn't it kind | |
| 24 | of a coincidence, though? | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I wouldn't | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 42 | 2 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | call it a coincidence. What I | |
| 3 | would say is that in the six-year | |
| 4 | effort that was the Taxi of | |
| 5 | Tomorrow project, the agency | |
| 6 | thought through what do we want out | |
| 7 | of a vehicle, what do we want out | |
| 8 | of a taxicab that's on the streets. | |
| 9 | Some things are obvious, you want | |
| 10 | enough legroom for people taller | |
| 11 | than me, people of Mr. Gerber's | |
| 12 | height, to be able to sit | |
| 13 | comfortably in the car. | |
| 14 | And, by the way, I got my | |
| 15 | first e-mail, I've had several | |
| 16 | e-mails from friends about the | |
| 17 | borough ones, but I got my first | |
| 18 | e-mail now from a friend who said, | |
| 19 | Hey, just rode one of those new | |
| 20 | cabs. It said, "It's so big!" Not | |
| 21 | big on the outside, you know, it's | |
| 22 | actually shorter than a Crown Vic | |
| 23 | in length, but inside, because it's | |
| 24 | designed to be a taxicab anyway. | |
| 25 | We thought through what we wanted | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 43 | \$ |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | out of a taxi. Some things you can | |
| 3 | debate, some things are frills. | |
| 4 | You know, chargers, I think, nice. | |
| 5 | Is that fundamental? No. | |
| 6 | Safety, to me, is not a | |
| 7 | frill; that is a fundamental. And | |
| 8 | in things for what we want out of a | |
| 9 | vehicle, it surfaced a | |
| 10 | long-standing thing that people in | |
| 11 | the agency had been talking about, | |
| 12 | but I don't know if it ever kind of | |
| 13 | had got into the leadership level, | |
| 14 | of the fact that the existing cabs | |
| 15 | on the road don't have to meet | |
| 16 | crash test standards. And once | |
| 17 | that kind of was thought about, to | |
| 18 | me, it was crystal clear it's what | |
| 19 | you want to do. | |
| 20 | So the purpose of this rule | |
| 21 | today is whatever happens with the | |
| 22 | MV 200, court upholds it, court | |
| 23 | throws it out, that piece of the | |
| 24 | agenda should certainly survive. | |
| 25 | That would, at least, be my view. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 44 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | Each of you will have to form your | |
| 3 | own views. That would be my view. | |
| 4 | I don't want to delay Dr. | |
| 5 | Chiodo. | |
| 6 | I'll note that we've been | |
| 7 | joined by Commissioner DeArcy, who, | |
| 8 | I am happy to say, she's not always | |
| 9 | happy to say | |
| 10 | MS. MARINO: I don't think | |
| 11 | we noted, also, Commissioner | |
| 12 | Polanco's presence. | |
| 13 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: You know, | |
| 14 | you're absolutely right. I note | |
| 15 | that we're joined by Commissioners | |
| 16 | Polanco and DeArcy. | |
| 17 | And I would also just let | |
| 18 | colleagues know that Commissioner | |
| 19 | DeArcy was elected this morning, or | |
| 20 | at least it was announced this | |
| 21 | morning, that she has joined the | |
| 22 | partnership of Morrison and | |
| 23 | Foerster. So congratulations to | |
| 24 | you. | |
| 25 | MS. DEARCY: Thank you. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 45 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I won't | |
| 3 | make the obvious joke that, you | |
| 4 | know, that lunch is on you, but I | |
| 5 | do think that that means that | |
| 6 | Commissioner DeArcy, with her | |
| 7 | enhanced status, should be entitled | |
| 8 | to two votes at the Commission | |
| 9 | meetings. | |
| 10 | MS. WEINSHALL: She can have | |
| 11 | mine. | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: All right. | |
| 13 | Well, we'll leave that up to the | |
| 14 | next chair to decide. | |
| 15 | So, at any rate, | |
| 16 | congratulations, LaShann. That's | |
| 17 | quite an accomplishment. | |
| 18 | MS. DEARCY: Thank you. | |
| 19 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: So the | |
| 20 | next speaker is Dr. Chiodo and then | |
| 21 | David Pollack. And we're going to | |
| 22 | stay on schedule. So, please, Dr. | |
| 23 | Chiodo and David Pollock, to be | |
| 24 | followed by Osman Chowdhury. | |
| 25 | DR. CHIODO: Yes, sir. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 46 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | Thank you, Commission, for having |
| 3 | me here. |
| 4 | I'm a physician, a public |
| 5 | health physician, also a |
| б | vehicular-impact biomechanic, as |
| 7 | well as a former senior public |
| 8 | health official. In fact, I used |
| 9 | to be the medical director, the |
| 10 | chief physician in charge of all |
| 11 | public health and medical services |
| 12 | for the City of Detroit, the Motor |
| 13 | City. |
| 14 | I have been asked to comment |
| 15 | about the safety issues concerning |
| 16 | the use of a vehicle like the |
| 17 | Nissan MV 200. In essence, it's a |
| 18 | van. That design for the use as a |
| 19 | cab presents two fundamental |
| 20 | problems from a safety standpoint. |
| 21 | Problem number one, it's a van. It |
| 22 | does not have a trunk like a |
| 23 | conventional taxi or taxi car; as a |
| 24 | result, you do not have crumple |
| 25 | zones in the back that protect |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 47 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | rear-seat occupants from intrusion | |
| 3 | from the rear-ending vehicle. | |
| 4 | That's a safety issue. | |
| 5 | Second is that that big, | |
| 6 | roomy seat in back. I agree with | |
| 7 | you, I like a lot of legroom also. | |
| 8 | The problem is if you have a | |
| 9 | non-restrained passenger, that long | |
| 10 | legroom allows the passenger with a | |
| 11 | sudden stop to essentially dive | |
| 12 | headfirst into the partition, not | |
| 13 | unlike diving into a shallow | |
| 14 | swimming pool. And, as a result, | |
| 15 | the injuries that one would expect | |
| 16 | are called a Jefferson fracture, a | |
| 17 | fracture of the top cervical | |
| 18 | vertebra, the atlas. | |
| 19 | In this case, when the atlas | |
| 20 | shrugs, the individual will end up, | |
| 21 | either a sudden fatality or a | |
| 22 | permanent ventilator-dependent | |
| 23 | quadriplegic. That is a safety | |
| 24 | issue that's presented by this | |
| 25 | vehicle that would not be presented | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 48 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | by conventional taxis with less |
| 3 | legroom. |
| 4 | In addition, there are two |
| 5 | fundamental public health concerns |
| б | that are not considered. First |
| 7 | public health concern, when the |
| 8 | person dives into the partition and |
| 9 | ends up fracturing their atlas, |
| 10 | their first cervical vertebra, that |
| 11 | individual's going to need sudden, |
| 12 | if they do survive, is going to |
| 13 | need mouth-to-mouth resuscitation. |
| 14 | Bystanders are going to have to be |
| 15 | called upon to provide |
| 16 | mouth-to-mouth resuscitation with |
| 17 | risk of exposure to bloodborne |
| 18 | pathogens, Hepatitis, AIDS. That's |
| 19 | a public health concern. That's |
| 20 | something that could happen to a |
| 21 | bystander just being a Good |
| 22 | Samaritan. |
| 23 | The second issue is the |
| 24 | following: If in fact the taxi |
| 25 | fleet here in New York is driven to |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 49 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | utilize one vehicle, it is not | |
| 3 | unlike what happened to the Irish | |
| 4 | with the Potato Famine. If there's | |
| 5 | a problem with that vehicle and you | |
| 6 | lose all your taxis because of a | |
| 7 | recall or some serious | |
| 8 | unanticipated problem with that one | |
| 9 | vehicle, you're going to lose taxi | |
| 10 | service suddenly at the same time | |
| 11 | throughout New York. And that | |
| 12 | presents a public health risk | |
| 13 | because people need taxis to get to | |
| 14 | hospitals. | |
| 15 | Thank you very much. I | |
| 16 | appreciate the time that you've | |
| 17 | given me. | |
| 18 | MS. JOSHI: Our next speaker | |
| 19 | is David Pollack. | |
| 20 | MR. POLLACK: Good morning, | |
| 21 | Commissioners. I'm David Pollack, | |
| 22 | executive director of the Committee | |
| 23 | for Taxi Safety. | |
| 24 | Congratulations, | |
| 25 | Commissioner DeArcy. And if anyone | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 50 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | deserves two votes, it should be | |
| 3 | Elias Arout, who, at the end of | |
| 4 | this year, this is the last meeting | |
| 5 | for the year, I think you've done | |
| 6 | 25 years as a commissioner. So, | |
| 7 | congratulations. And we certainly | |
| 8 | wish you well, Mr. Chairman, in | |
| 9 | your future endeavors. | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 11 | David. | |
| 12 | MR. POLLACK: The proposed | |
| 13 | regulation would require all New | |
| 14 | York City taxi vehicles with the | |
| 15 | stated exception of accessible | |
| 16 | vehicles and hybrid vehicles and an | |
| 17 | unstated exception for street hail | |
| 18 | livery vehicles to undergo crash | |
| 19 | testing with a partition installed. | |
| 20 | By this regulation, the city and | |
| 21 | the TLC is blatantly seeking to do | |
| 22 | an end-around the judicial | |
| 23 | decisions that have struck down | |
| 24 | ill-advised Taxi of Tomorrow | |
| 25 | regulations, which would have | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 51 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | mandated the use of a single | |
| 3 | vehicle, the Nissan MV 200. | |
| 4 | Those regulations have | |
| 5 | already been held invalid by the | |
| б | courts of this state twice, | |
| 7 | notwithstanding the prior judicial | |
| 8 | decisions. Knowing that the only | |
| 9 | approved taxi vehicle that has been | |
| 10 | crash tested with a partition is | |
| 11 | the Nissan MV 200, the TLC, under | |
| 12 | the rationale of passenger safety | |
| 13 | and comfort, have now tried once | |
| 14 | again to mandate the single | |
| 15 | vehicle. | |
| 16 | If the true interest of the | |
| 17 | city and the TLC were passenger | |
| 18 | safety, we ask the obvious question | |
| 19 | as to why the proposed TLC | |
| 20 | regulation specifically exempts | |
| 21 | from the regulation accessible | |
| 22 | vehicles, hybrid vehicles, and by | |
| 23 | other regulations, the new SHL, | |
| 24 | green street hail liveries. | |
| 25 | Although we applaud the goal | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 52 | 2 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | of trying to make the partition | |
| 3 | safer, crash testing is not the | |
| 4 | methodology to achieve that goal; | |
| 5 | rather, the partition should be | |
| 6 | redesigned. TLC refers to Dr. John | |
| 7 | Sherman who testified that there'd | |
| 8 | been hundreds of injuries to | |
| 9 | passengers throughout the years. | |
| 10 | Of course, and without any way | |
| 11 | making light of the serious nature | |
| 12 | of those injuries and the pain and | |
| 13 | suffering they caused, the TLC | |
| 14 | leaves out exactly how many | |
| 15 | hundreds of injuries or over how | |
| 16 | many years those injuries have | |
| 17 | occurred. | |
| 18 | Interestingly enough, our | |
| 19 | attorney, David Beyer met Dr. John | |
| 20 | Sherman and had a discussion with | |
| 21 | him. And his suggestion concerning | |
| 22 | the partition industries was not to | |
| 23 | crash test the vehicle but rather | |
| 24 | to use technology to make the | |
| 25 | partition itself safer. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 53 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | Rather than approving the | |
| 3 | proposed regulation, we suggest the | |
| 4 | TLC and the city speak to the | |
| 5 | vehicle manufacturers and the | |
| 6 | partition manufacturers and try to | |
| 7 | make the partitions and the | |
| 8 | vehicles in which they are | |
| 9 | installed safer for the benefit of | |
| 10 | all the passengers for all the | |
| 11 | for-hire ground industries, not | |
| 12 | just some of them. | |
| 13 | We ask the TLC Commissioners | |
| 14 | to allow sufficient time for other | |
| 15 | vehicle manufacturers to crash test | |
| 16 | their vehicles with the partition | |
| 17 | installed. | |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: That's a | |
| 19 | fair point. | |
| 20 | MR. POLLACK: And finally, | |
| 21 | we ask that the Commissioners do | |
| 22 | not exceed this vindictive and | |
| 23 | transparent proposal to disregard | |
| 24 | the courts of this state and | |
| 25 | achieve by any means a policy goal | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 54 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | that was misguided from the start. |
| 3 | Thank you. |
| 4 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: All right. |
| 5 | Thank you, Mr. Pollack. |
| 6 | Okay. Osman Chowdhury is |
| 7 | the next speaker, followed by David |
| 8 | Barnes and then Michael Woloz. And |
| 9 | those are the only people who are |
| 10 | signed up at this point. |
| 11 | MR. CHOWDHURY: Hi. Good |
| 12 | afternoon, everybody. My name is |
| 13 | Osman Chowdhury. |
| 14 | I'm talking about just the |
| 15 | MV 200. This car, this is so big, |
| 16 | and need it not to rush. Make a |
| 17 | pilot program, then we can see |
| 18 | what's happening, the problem |
| 19 | particularly, because that, after |
| 20 | on the road, all the cars is going |
| 21 | to have problems. It's a big mess. |
| 22 | And also I have the previous |
| 23 | experience, the Chevy Minivan. |
| 24 | Under six months on the road to get |
| 25 | out far away. That's why you need |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 55 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | to make a pilot program. The MV | |
| 3 | 200 needs a pilot program, then we | |
| 4 | can see what realistic. We driver, | |
| 5 | we know what's a problem. We have | |
| 6 | testing. | |
| 7 | Another thing is, MV 200s, | |
| 8 | another problem is, like I say, | |
| 9 | | |
| | expensive car. (Inaudible) take the | |
| 10 | lease car, medallion lease, three | |
| 11 | years. Afterward, the car's very | |
| 12 | expensive. What's going to happen? | |
| 13 | The driver, they spend a lot of | |
| 14 | money, \$40,000, \$50,000 to put in | |
| 15 | the investment. After three years, | |
| 16 | the medallion lease can expire. | |
| 17 | What can happen, put the car in a | |
| 18 | museum? This car, they're | |
| 19 | expensive. | |
| 20 | That's what I'm saying. | |
| 21 | Thank you very much. | |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 23 | Mr. Barnes and Mr. Woloz. | |
| 24 | MR. BARNES: Good morning, | |
| 25 | Chairman Yassky, Commissioners. My | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 56 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | name is David Barnes. I'm working | |
| 3 | for Ricardo. Ricardo Engineering | |
| 4 | is being retained by the Taxi and | |
| 5 | Limousine Commission since about | |
| 6 | late 2007 to advise them on | |
| 7 | automotive aspects and all aspects | |
| 8 | and stuff related to taxis in | |
| 9 | general, particularly how a vehicle | |
| 10 | design can be improved. | |
| 11 | I've been working in the | |
| 12 | automotive industry for about | |
| 13 | 25 years now doing principally | |
| 14 | passenger car design, so I've | |
| 15 | touched most parts of the vehicle | |
| 16 | during that time frame. | |
| 17 | I'd like to address a couple | |
| 18 | of points that have been made by | |
| 19 | some of your previous speakers. | |
| 20 | The first | |
| 21 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Summarily, | |
| 22 | if you please. | |
| 23 | MR. BARNES: Yes. First is | |
| 24 | related to the presence or lack | |
| 25 | thereof of a crumple zone in the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 57 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | vehicle. The vehicle is actually | |
| 3 | fitted with a zone that is designed | |
| 4 | to deform during a rear impact. | |
| 5 | That zone is designed to mitigate | |
| б | and reduce the amount of energy | |
| 7 | transmitted to the occupants in the | |
| 8 | event of an impact. The vehicle, | |
| 9 | as delivered, meets all of the | |
| 10 | federal crash test requirements for | |
| 11 | front and rear impact, so I think | |
| 12 | we have to assume that there is, | |
| 13 | indeed, a crumple zone in the | |
| 14 | vehicle. | |
| 15 | The second point I would | |
| 16 | like to make relates to the value | |
| 17 | in actually carrying out crash | |
| 18 | tests on vehicles with partitions. | |
| 19 | There are a number of benefits to | |
| 20 | this that we see. The first is, | |
| 21 | you know, front impact, where you | |
| 22 | want to ensure that the partition | |
| 23 | remains correctly attached to the | |
| 24 | vehicle, does not move forward and | |
| 25 | impact the driver. The second is | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 58 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | in a rear impact, again, it remains | |
| 3 | attached to the vehicle and does | |
| 4 | not move backwards. In both of | |
| 5 | those situations, there is an | |
| 6 | additional benefit to crash testing | |
| 7 | related to the retention of TPEP | |
| 8 | components. You want to make sure | |
| 9 | that the TPEP components stay | |
| 10 | attached to the partition and don't | |
| 11 | start to fly around in the cabin. | |
| 12 | The third point is related to side | |
| 13 | impact where the crash testing | |
| 14 | really confirms that the air bag is | |
| 15 | able to deploy correctly. | |
| 16 | In all three of these tests, | |
| 17 | the crash test itself is the | |
| 18 | validation and the verification | |
| 19 | that a change or a new partition | |
| 20 | design is actually effective. You | |
| 21 | can design it all you like. Until | |
| 22 | you actually test it, you won't | |
| 23 | know whether it worked. | |
| 24 | Thank you very much. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 5 | 59 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | MS. MARINO: I have a | |
| 3 | question. You're saying that it | |
| 4 | has a crumple zone in the back. I | |
| 5 | just think it's common sense, I | |
| 6 | would rather have a trunk | |
| 7 | separating me and the front end of | |
| 8 | a car than not a trunk. | |
| 9 | MR. BARNES: How do you see | |
| 10 | that the trunk is different from | |
| 11 | the | |
| 12 | MS. MARINO: It's a big | |
| 13 | space of metal. | |
| 14 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Correct, | |
| 15 | but it's also | |
| 16 | MS. MARINO: I mean, it's | |
| 17 | common sense to me. I just think a | |
| 18 | passenger is going to be safer with | |
| 19 | a trunk behind them. | |
| 20 | MS. DEARCY: Can I I'm | |
| 21 | sorry. My problem with us making | |
| 22 | this trunk versus not a trunk | |
| 23 | issue, and I'm certainly not an | |
| 24 | engineer, but is it you know, we | |
| 25 | have just made strides with respect | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 60 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | to wheelchair accessible vehicles. |
| 3 | Are there wheelchair accessible |
| 4 | vehicles that have a trunk? I |
| 5 | don't think that we should suppose |
| б | that just because there's no trunk |
| 7 | that we are creating a danger to |
| 8 | our passengers. I think the |
| 9 | wheelchair accessible vehicles |
| 10 | don't have the traditional trunk |
| 11 | that we are accustomed to seeing in |
| 12 | terms of a four-door vehicle. |
| 13 | MS. MARINO: That may or may |
| 14 | not be true, and I can't comment |
| 15 | either way, but my common sense |
| 16 | just tells me that, I mean, if I |
| 17 | had a child in the car, I'd rather |
| 18 | have that trunk separating me from |
| 19 | a rear-end collision. |
| 20 | MS. WEINSHALL: That's not |
| 21 | the issue we're talking about. |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Under- |
| 23 | stood. |
| 24 | MR. BARNES: If I may |
| 25 | MS. MARINO: I mean, it's a |
| | |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 61 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | safety issue. |
| 3 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Mr. |
| 4 | Barnes, do you want to address |
| 5 | that? |
| 6 | MR. BARNES: Yes. |
| 7 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Again, |
| 8 | summarily, if you can. |
| 9 | MR. BARNES: The crash test |
| 10 | requirements for passenger cars do |
| 11 | not differ from minivans or other |
| 12 | vehicles whether they have a trunk |
| 13 | or a hatchback. They all have to |
| 14 | meet exactly the same standard. So |
| 15 | there is no practical difference as |
| 16 | far as the FMVSS is concerned as to |
| 17 | whether it has a trunk or it |
| 18 | doesn't have a trunk. |
| 19 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you |
| 20 | very much, Mr. Barnes. |
| 21 | Mr. Woloz, and then Paul |
| 22 | Herzan, is, I believe, the final |
| 23 | speaker. |
| 24 | MR. WOLOZ: Good morning, |
| 25 | Mr. Chair, Commissioners. I'd just |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 62 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | like to read an excerpt from a | |
| 3 | letter that Ron Sherman from | |
| 4 | Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade | |
| 5 | distributed two days ago on this | |
| б | rule, and then I'd like to come up | |
| 7 | and discuss the other rule. I'd | |
| 8 | like to stress that MTBOT is urging | |
| 9 | a no vote on both rules, but let's | |
| 10 | get to the crash testing rule | |
| 11 | first. | |
| 12 | The crash testing rule is a | |
| 13 | third attempt to mandate the Taxi | |
| 14 | of Tomorrow and should be voted | |
| 15 | down. A rule to mandate that all | |
| 16 | taxis except hybrids have | |
| 17 | factory-installed, rear-seat air | |
| 18 | conditioning and undergo separate | |
| 19 | crash testing with certain | |
| 20 | after-market alterations, a | |
| 21 | mandatory factory-installed | |
| 22 | partition, but not others, an | |
| 23 | accessibility retrofit, for | |
| 24 | example, is arbitrary, capricious | |
| 25 | and unsupported by a law or federal | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 63 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | regulations. | |
| 3 | The proposed rule is a third | |
| 4 | attempt to mandate the so-called | |
| 5 | Taxi of Tomorrow, and is designed | |
| б | as an end runaround of the supreme | |
| 7 | court's October 8th, 2013 decision | |
| 8 | striking down the TLC's second | |
| 9 | attempt to mandate the Taxi of | |
| 10 | Tomorrow. The TLC's appealed this | |
| 11 | decision but the decision is not | |
| 12 | likely before February 1, 2014. | |
| 13 | The TLC has touted the Taxi | |
| 14 | of Tomorrow, the Nissan MV 200, as | |
| 15 | the first one purportedly crash | |
| 16 | tested with a partition. In | |
| 17 | response to repeated requests, the | |
| 18 | TLC finally provided MTBOT with a | |
| 19 | letter from Nissan, dated Friday, | |
| 20 | December 13, 2013, certifying that | |
| 21 | certain tests were completed. But | |
| 22 | the supporting documentation fails | |
| 23 | to specify how the MV 200 fared in | |
| 24 | the tests. | |
| 25 | More significantly, there is | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 64 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | currently no other vehicle on the | |
| 3 | market that would be able to meet | |
| 4 | the tailor-made requirements in the | |
| 5 | proposed rules, and manufacturers | |
| 6 | are unlikely to spend the millions | |
| 7 | of dollars necessary or absorbed | |
| 8 | the considerable liability costs | |
| 9 | and risks for the limited New York | |
| 10 | City market. | |
| 11 | This rule is not about | |
| 12 | public safety. If it were, there | |
| 13 | would be no exemptions for certain | |
| 14 | taxicabs, such as hybrids. This | |
| 15 | proposal is a blatant attempt to | |
| 16 | resurrect the TOT through the back | |
| 17 | door. | |
| 18 | In any event, even if the | |
| 19 | vehicle were crash tested with the | |
| 20 | manufacturer-installed partition, | |
| 21 | it would not be crash tested after | |
| 22 | it is retrofitted for | |
| 23 | accessibility. Not the Nissan, nor | |
| 24 | any other car on the market. | |
| 25 | Accessibility retrofitting is | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 |
|----|------------------------------------|
| 2 | likely to invalidate any prior |
| 3 | crash testing results. The |
| 4 | Commission should not be placed in |
| 5 | a position to pick and choose when |
| 6 | to care about passenger safety. |
| 7 | The proposed rules should |
| 8 | not approved. There is nothing |
| 9 | urgent about proposing this rule |
| 10 | right now. If this rule is seen at |
| 11 | a later date, nothing happens. |
| 12 | This is a last-ditch effort to |
| 13 | salvage the TOT which has already |
| 14 | been invalidated by the courts |
| 15 | twice. |
| 16 | I urge you to vote no on |
| 17 | this rule, and I also urge you to |
| 18 | vote no on the next rule, which |
| 19 | I'll explain later, and that's a |
| 20 | rule that would benefit MTBOT. But |
| 21 | what we're saying here today is |
| 22 | don't pass any rules that you're |
| 23 | just going to just jam through the |
| 24 | Commission on the last hearing of |
| 25 | the year because you can because |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 66 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | it's not the right thing to do, not | |
| 3 | for this rule and not for the next | |
| 4 | rule. Thank you. | |
| 5 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 6 | Mr. Woloz. | |
| 7 | Mr. Herzan. | |
| 8 | MR. HERZAN: Good morning. | |
| 9 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Good | |
| 10 | morning. | |
| 11 | MR. HERZAN: Good morning, | |
| 12 | Commissioners. My name is Paul | |
| 13 | Herzan, and I'm speaking today as a | |
| 14 | passenger, a concerned citizen and | |
| 15 | a frequent taxi rider. I'm here to | |
| 16 | read a statement that is joined by | |
| 17 | the following people and | |
| 18 | organizations. Thank you for the | |
| 19 | opportunity to share our opinion | |
| 20 | with the TLC and its commissioners. | |
| 21 | The people and organizations | |
| 22 | are as follows: Dan Biederman, | |
| 23 | President, 34th Street Partnership | |
| 24 | and Bryant Park's Restoration | |
| 25 | Corporation; Lee Sander, Chairman, | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 67 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | Regional Plan Association, former | |
| 3 | TLC commissioner and former MTA | |
| 4 | executive director; Dr. John | |
| 5 | Sherman, Clinical Assistant | |
| б | Professor, Cornell University | |
| 7 | Medical College; the Manhattan | |
| 8 | Chamber of Commerce; Transportation | |
| 9 | Alternatives; Lily Auchincloss | |
| 10 | Foundation; Global Gateway | |
| 11 | Alliance; Design Trust for Public | |
| 12 | Space; Smart Design; and Sarah | |
| 13 | Holloway, a passenger who was in a | |
| 14 | critical accident with her | |
| 15 | daughter. | |
| 16 | We wholeheartedly support | |
| 17 | the proposed rule requiring taxis | |
| 18 | to undergo crash testing with a | |
| 19 | partition installed. New York City | |
| 20 | has arguably the most innovative | |
| 21 | public transit system in the world. | |
| 22 | When New Yorkers ride the subway, | |
| 23 | the bus, commuter trains or even in | |
| 24 | their personal cars, they assume | |
| 25 | that significant investment in | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 68 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | rigorous vehicle engineering and | |
| 3 | safety validation has been | |
| 4 | completed. Yet, in all likelihood, | |
| 5 | only a handful of the daily 650,000 | |
| 6 | yellow cab users are aware that the | |
| 7 | partitions looming in front of them | |
| 8 | are not approved for use by any | |
| 9 | vehicle manufacturer. The truth is | |
| 10 | the taxi partitions have not been | |
| 11 | designed or installed by any car | |
| 12 | manufacturer. The partitions have | |
| 13 | never been tested to determine | |
| 14 | their effect on public safety. | |
| 15 | By introducing a nonfixed | |
| 16 | partition into any taxicab, the | |
| 17 | manufacturer's rigidity | |
| 18 | specifications may be undermined. | |
| 19 | The partition affects the vehicle's | |
| 20 | intended design to protect | |
| 21 | passengers when an impact occurs. | |
| 22 | This may cause a change in the | |
| 23 | deployment of the timing of the air | |
| 24 | bags. | |
| 25 | The most cost-effective | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 69 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | solution is for the vehicle | |
| 3 | manufacturer to provide the | |
| 4 | partition design and the air-bag | |
| 5 | design. As a matter of public | |
| б | safety, all partition designs | |
| 7 | should be validated by the vehicle | |
| 8 | manufacturer in order to ensure | |
| 9 | that the factory-tested crash | |
| 10 | safety parameters are not | |
| 11 | compromised. | |
| 12 | Opponents of the rule have | |
| 13 | suggested that in lieu of mandating | |
| 14 | crash tested partitions, partitions | |
| 15 | should just be redesigned. But the | |
| 16 | only way to know whether a | |
| 17 | partition is safe, whether | |
| 18 | redesigned or not, is to crash test | |
| 19 | it. | |
| 20 | Under the proposed rule a | |
| 21 | redesigned partition would be | |
| 22 | permissible. It would merely have | |
| 23 | to pass a crash test. | |
| 24 | Today we're discussing the | |
| 25 | first major safety innovation | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 70 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | specifically designed for the New | |
| 3 | York City taxi rider. It's a | |
| 4 | safety innovation that is a long | |
| 5 | time coming. We support this | |
| 6 | challenge by the TLC to insist that | |
| 7 | the auto industry consider the | |
| 8 | health and safety needs and | |
| 9 | interest of New York City | |
| 10 | passengers and drivers. We applaud | |
| 11 | Nissan for rising to the challenge. | |
| 12 | All TLC stakeholders should support | |
| 13 | the Commission's goals today. All | |
| 14 | other vehicle manufacturers should | |
| 15 | as well. | |
| 16 | Today's rule says to any | |
| 17 | vehicle manufacturer that will not | |
| 18 | commit to passenger safety, there | |
| 19 | is no place for their unsafe | |
| 20 | vehicles in the New York City taxi | |
| 21 | fleet. | |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 23 | I'm sorry, if you want to conclude, | |
| 24 | Mr. Herzan. | |
| 25 | MR. HERZAN: As regulators | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 71 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | of the taxi industry, public safety | |
| 3 | is priority number one of the TLC. | |
| 4 | The riding public shouldn't have to | |
| 5 | think twice about getting into the | |
| б | backseat of a vehicle that is not | |
| 7 | fully validated by crash test data. | |
| 8 | New York City passengers should not | |
| 9 | be treated as the industry's crash | |
| 10 | test dummies. Thank you. | |
| 11 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 12 | I gather that Ira Goldstein | |
| 13 | would like to be heard; is that | |
| 14 | right? | |
| 15 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: Yes. | |
| 16 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Okay. | |
| 17 | While you're coming up, I'll just | |
| 18 | thank I mean, Ira, of course, is | |
| 19 | the former chief of staff here at | |
| 20 | the TLC, and over his many years of | |
| 21 | service, he contributed to the | |
| 22 | realization of this important | |
| 23 | safety initiative. So, again, I | |
| 24 | thank you, Ira, for all your | |
| 25 | service. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 7 | 2 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: Thank you, | |
| 3 | Commissioner. | |
| 4 | As most of you on the Board | |
| 5 | know, this isn't really my issue, | |
| 6 | being a representative of the black | |
| 7 | car industry, but just hearing the | |
| 8 | testimony and what was going on, I | |
| 9 | just felt compelled to just briefly | |
| 10 | give my opinion. | |
| 11 | The Commission should be | |
| 12 | commended for bringing this issue | |
| 13 | to the forefront, and that is | |
| 14 | something that needs to be tackled; | |
| 15 | however, I don't think that there | |
| 16 | is this urgent need to pass this in | |
| 17 | the late hours of an administration | |
| 18 | that's now coming to a conclusion. | |
| 19 | I think it's important that | |
| 20 | the upcoming administration be | |
| 21 | given a chance to look at all | |
| 22 | issues with a fresh perspective, | |
| 23 | look at things in a cohesive | |
| 24 | manner, globally, at everything | |
| 25 | that's before it. And I think that | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 73 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | if the Commission has resolved to | |
| 3 | get this done, it will get done in | |
| 4 | a future time. It just appears to | |
| 5 | be very political, it appears to be | |
| 6 | a back doorway of bringing in the | |
| 7 | Taxi of Tomorrow, and I just feel | |
| 8 | that it would be proper for it to | |
| 9 | be adjourned at this point. Thank | |
| 10 | you. | |
| 11 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 12 | Mr. Goldstein. | |
| 13 | Commissioner Polanco, you | |
| 14 | have a motion? | |
| 15 | MS. POLANCO: Yes, yes. | |
| 16 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I'm sorry. | |
| 17 | First, Meera needs to just make | |
| 18 | some comments for the record. | |
| 19 | Please. | |
| 20 | MS. JOSHI: Just to | |
| 21 | summarize, what we just had was the | |
| 22 | public hearing pursuant to CAPA on | |
| 23 | a proposed rule to amend taxicab | |
| 24 | specifications to require crash | |
| 25 | testing with partition installed | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 74 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | and rear-passenger-controlled air | |
| 3 | conditioning. The rules appeared | |
| 4 | in the city record on November 15, | |
| 5 | 2013, and there was a comment | |
| 6 | deadline of December 18, 2013. | |
| 7 | Thirty comments were received and | |
| 8 | four were related to the | |
| 9 | commissioners. | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 11 | Commissioner Polanco? | |
| 12 | MS. POLANCO: Thank you. I | |
| 13 | know we just had a hearing about | |
| 14 | the crash test rule, and I think we | |
| 15 | all realize the importance of | |
| 16 | having this rule, which, the | |
| 17 | intention is, quote/unquote, to | |
| 18 | exclusively deal with the safety of | |
| 19 | passengers. But based on what we | |
| 20 | have heard and the controversy | |
| 21 | surrounding the rule and the | |
| 22 | potential for, yet again, another | |
| 23 | lawsuit, I will move to postpone | |
| 24 | this rule for next year to give an | |
| 25 | opportunity even for the new | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 75 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | administration to even have a say | |
| 3 | on this. | |
| 4 | I will also move to postpone | |
| 5 | the hearing and the vote of the | |
| 6 | E-Hail rules for the same reason, | |
| 7 | but most importantly because the | |
| 8 | pilot program has not run its | |
| 9 | course. My understanding is that | |
| 10 | the program ends in April 2014, at | |
| 11 | which time, I believe, that we | |
| 12 | should revisit the rules | |
| 13 | themselves. | |
| 14 | So I basically move to | |
| 15 | postpone the vote on the crash test | |
| 16 | rule and the hearing and vote on | |
| 17 | the E-Hail rule. | |
| 18 | MS. MARINO: I second. | |
| 19 | MS. DEARCY: Wait, are | |
| 20 | they I'm sorry, forgive me. Are | |
| 21 | these separate? Because we may | |
| 22 | have an inconsistent | |
| 23 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Let me | |
| 24 | make a it's my intention not to | |
| 25 | bring the E-Hail rule forward for a | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 76 | .) |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | vote today. I've heard from a | |
| 3 | number of Commissioners in a | |
| 4 | particular light, Commissioner | |
| 5 | Arout has spoken powerfully. I | |
| 6 | understand your view, Commissioner | |
| 7 | Polanco. And in light of fact that | |
| 8 | that pilot is ongoing, so there's | |
| 9 | no as far as the public's | |
| 10 | concern, one month is the same as | |
| 11 | the next. | |
| 12 | MS. POLANCO: So I withdraw | |
| 13 | then the second motion. I'll just | |
| 14 | stay with the first motion. | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I will | |
| 16 | just say, because I know you spoke | |
| 17 | about the hearing as well, | |
| 18 | Commissioners, it's, with | |
| 19 | everyone's you know, unless | |
| 20 | there's an objection to this, we'll | |
| 21 | have the hearing so people's views | |
| 22 | can be heard. But there will be no | |
| 23 | vote, so | |
| 24 | MS. POLANCO: No, then I | |
| 25 | basically bring back my second | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 7 | 7 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | motion. For me, it doesn't make a | |
| 3 | point to have a hearing at this | |
| 4 | point. | |
| 5 | MS. WEINSHALL: But people | |
| 6 | came here to be heard. | |
| 7 | MR. GONZALES: People came | |
| 8 | here. | |
| 9 | MR. KEOGH: We're here | |
| 10 | though. We're here to talk to you. | |
| 11 | We're all here to vote. | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: In all | |
| 13 | honesty, Commissioner, then let us | |
| 14 | make it two separate votes then, | |
| 15 | because people may feel differently | |
| 16 | about one versus the other. | |
| 17 | MS. POLANCO: I understand, | |
| 18 | but the program has not run its | |
| 19 | course, and I | |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: No, I | |
| 21 | I'm sorry, I don't want to stop | |
| 22 | you, in other words | |
| 23 | MS. DEARCY: Commissioner | |
| 24 | Polanco, I agree with you. I share | |
| 25 | your sentiment that we need to | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 78 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | allow the program to run its | |
| 3 | course. I think that what we're | |
| 4 | saying is there are people who took | |
| 5 | time out of their schedules to come | |
| 6 | and be heard. And I think as a | |
| 7 | courtesy to them, I think it would | |
| 8 | be, it would be, for us, this | |
| 9 | courtesy to them to not allow them | |
| 10 | to have their say even if we don't | |
| 11 | take action on it. | |
| 12 | MS. POLANCO: I agree with | |
| 13 | you, but I just want my point is | |
| 14 | that I don't want this to come back | |
| 15 | and not have other people to have | |
| 16 | an opportunity after the program | |
| 17 | has run its course to basically | |
| 18 | have an opinion on it because | |
| 19 | things could change. Once hearings | |
| 20 | are done and concluded, you cannot | |
| 21 | come back and reargue the same | |
| 22 | issues. That's my point. | |
| 23 | MS. DEARCY: We can do that. | |
| 24 | It's up to us. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Correct. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 79 |
|----|-----------------------------------|
| 2 | MR. CARONE: Mr. Chairman, |
| 3 | perhaps the compromise is keeping |
| 4 | the hearing open, don't close it |
| 5 | after today and just don't |
| 6 | conclude. Start the hearing, keep |
| 7 | it open |
| 8 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Excellent. |
| 9 | There is a mechanism for that. |
| 10 | Thank you for that, Commissioner |
| 11 | Carone. |
| 12 | MS. POLANCO: Very good |
| 13 | point. |
| 14 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: So we'll |
| 15 | keep the hearing record open so |
| 16 | that it may continue to the next |
| 17 | meeting. |
| 18 | So I don't want to put |
| 19 | words, but just want to clarify, |
| 20 | the motion is to |
| 21 | MS. POLANCO: Just a motion. |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: to |
| 23 | table the |
| 24 | MS. POLANCO: Crash test |
| 25 | vote. |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 30 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: the | |
| 3 | crash test vote. Okay. Very good. | |
| 4 | MS. MARINO: And I seconded | |
| 5 | that motion. | |
| 6 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Very good. | |
| 7 | All in favor of tabling | |
| 8 | MR. CARONE: Before we vote | |
| 9 | there, I just want to make a | |
| 10 | comment. I join in Commissioner | |
| 11 | Polanco's motion. I do want to say | |
| 12 | that I think it's inarguable that a | |
| 13 | rule, a rule on public safety is | |
| 14 | not an appropriate one for the | |
| 15 | Commission. I think it is | |
| 16 | completely our responsibility to be | |
| 17 | voting and passing rules on safety. | |
| 18 | I don't believe this | |
| 19 | particular rule accomplishes that, | |
| 20 | and we'll get to that in a moment, | |
| 21 | but I do think the motion is | |
| 22 | appropriate. Now, I don't think | |
| 23 | the objective is compromised if we | |
| 24 | hear and discuss this more and vote | |
| 25 | in January. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 81 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | MR. GONZALES: I'd like to | |
| 3 | make a statement as well. I'm | |
| 4 | uncomfortable with waiting to take | |
| 5 | action on issues that involve | |
| 6 | driver and passenger safety, which, | |
| 7 | in my opinion, are just out and out | |
| 8 | nonnegotiable. | |
| 9 | There were a couple items | |
| 10 | that did come up in the hearing | |
| 11 | that I think are important. And I | |
| 12 | think the mindset, and I want to | |
| 13 | say collectively we will agree with | |
| 14 | this, I hope, but one of the | |
| 15 | speakers suggested we continue to | |
| 16 | promote and encourage, strongly | |
| 17 | encourage seat belt use, which | |
| 18 | probably is even better than crash | |
| 19 | test, as far as keeping passengers | |
| 20 | from being injured, and also about | |
| 21 | as well as doing I guess more | |
| 22 | extensive study, from what I | |
| 23 | gather, on partition design. | |
| 24 | But then I kind of come back | |
| 25 | to, well, what's wrong with having | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 8 | 2 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | all three? I mean, we can have, | |
| 3 | you know, increased use of seat | |
| 4 | belts as far as strongly | |
| 5 | encouraging that, we can also | |
| 6 | encourage better partition design. | |
| 7 | But again, you really don't know | |
| 8 | what happens until it's in a | |
| 9 | vehicle and crash tested. | |
| 10 | So I don't quite see this as | |
| 11 | either/or, I'm not for this | |
| 12 | particular motion, I'm prepared to | |
| 13 | vote today, and I see all three | |
| 14 | elements as necessary to address | |
| 15 | driver and passenger safety. | |
| 16 | MS. MARINO: I'd like to | |
| 17 | make a statement as well. I'm | |
| 18 | going to ask my colleagues to join | |
| 19 | in Commissioner Polanco's motion | |
| 20 | for a couple of reasons. | |
| 21 | Number one, we do have a new | |
| 22 | administration coming in in 12 | |
| 23 | days. I mean, this is not an | |
| 24 | urgent issue, in my opinion, | |
| 25 | especially in light of a lot of the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 8 | 33 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | comments today and that the | |
| 3 | specifications are limited to the | |
| 4 | Nissan. I find that quite the | |
| 5 | coincidence, and it makes this rule | |
| 6 | suspect to me. | |
| 7 | I also think we should show | |
| 8 | some respect to the new | |
| 9 | administration and let them deal | |
| 10 | with this issue the way they feel | |
| 11 | appropriate. We're at the last | |
| 12 | hearing of a 12-year administration | |
| 13 | that's on its way out now. And I | |
| 14 | think out of respect to the new | |
| 15 | administration, we should not hold | |
| 16 | this or any vote today. | |
| 17 | And with respect to | |
| 18 | Mr. Herzan's comment that Nissan | |
| 19 | has risen to the level of safety, | |
| 20 | it's more like the TLC has risen to | |
| 21 | the level of Nissan by designing | |
| 22 | these rules to fit only that | |
| 23 | vehicle. If this is truly about | |
| 24 | safety, why aren't we addressing | |
| 25 | green cars. People in the outer | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 84 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | boroughs, don't they deserve | |
| 3 | safety? | |
| 4 | I mean, it's not making | |
| 5 | sense to me. And I think safety is | |
| 6 | an issue, but we need to approach | |
| 7 | it on a global, practical, logical | |
| 8 | level, and I don't think this is | |
| 9 | it. | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: So let's | |
| 11 | vote on the motion to table. | |
| 12 | All in favor of tabling the | |
| 13 | crash testing with partition rule, | |
| 14 | please raise your hand now and say | |
| 15 | aye. | |
| 16 | MS. MARINO: Aye. | |
| 17 | MS. POLANCO: Aye. | |
| 18 | MR. CARONE: Aye. | |
| 19 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I count | |
| 20 | three ayes, Commissioners Marino, | |
| 21 | Polanco and Carone. | |
| 22 | All opposed to the motion | |
| 23 | tabled, raise your hand. | |
| 24 | I count five, Commissioners | |
| 25 | Arout, DeArcy, myself, Weinshall | |
| | | |

Г

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 85 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | and Gonzales. |
| 3 | Motion to table fails. |
| 4 | MS. DEARCY: Can |
| 5 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes, |
| 6 | please. |
| 7 | MS. DEARCY: I'm sorry, I |
| 8 | didn't mean to interrupt you. |
| 9 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: No, go |
| 10 | ahead. |
| 11 | MS. DEARCY: I think by the |
| 12 | fact that I just voted not to table |
| 13 | the vote on the crash testing |
| 14 | perhaps gives some indication that |
| 15 | I am in favor of it. |
| 16 | We've heard a lot of |
| 17 | compelling testimony. I have |
| 18 | personally received phone calls, |
| 19 | which has never happened since I |
| 20 | joined the Commission, from |
| 21 | passengers who have urged me to |
| 22 | vote in favor of the crash testing. |
| 23 | It's interesting to me because a |
| 24 | lot of people have bantered about |
| 25 | the word "political." And none of |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 86 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | those individuals called me as | |
| 3 | people who sit in the back of the | |
| 4 | taxi has considered this to be a | |
| 5 | political issue at all. They | |
| 6 | considered it to be one only about | |
| 7 | safety. And I suspect that the | |
| 8 | urges for us to delay this because | |
| 9 | of politics is kind of dumbfounding | |
| 10 | to them. And I don't consider this | |
| 11 | to be political. | |
| 12 | But what I will say is that | |
| 13 | I believe that the proposed rule is | |
| 14 | in need of amendment. I think that | |
| 15 | we need to have a grace period. | |
| 16 | We've heard some testimony today | |
| 17 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: We have. | |
| 18 | MS. DEARCY: we've heard, | |
| 19 | I think all of us have gotten some | |
| 20 | comments and some phone calls that | |
| 21 | there are manufacturers who don't | |
| 22 | have the ability right now to | |
| 23 | comply with the rule as it's been | |
| 24 | drafted. | |
| 25 | I would urge the Commission, | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 87 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | and I've said this to you all | |
| 3 | individually, I think it's | |
| 4 | important that I say this publicly. | |
| 5 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes. | |
| б | MS. DEARCY: And I'm not | |
| 7 | certain how you all came out in | |
| 8 | terms of that, but I think we need | |
| 9 | to have a grace period to allow | |
| 10 | certain manufacturers the ability | |
| 11 | to comply with the rules. I think, | |
| 12 | and I've said to you, that six | |
| 13 | months, in my mind, would be | |
| 14 | reasonable. | |
| 15 | The other point that I want | |
| 16 | to make that I think is significant | |
| 17 | is I'm not clear why we are tieing | |
| 18 | the crash testing, which I think is | |
| 19 | important, which I think is timely, | |
| 20 | to the other change related to air | |
| 21 | conditioning. I like air | |
| 22 | conditioning like the next person, | |
| 23 | I'm not certain what's immediate | |
| 24 | about it. It seems to me like a | |
| 25 | luxury. And it also seems to me | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 88 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | that the basis for why I want to | |
| 3 | vote for this, which is that safety | |
| 4 | is important, does not tie the same | |
| 5 | way to air conditioning. And so I | |
| 6 | would urge that we amend the rule | |
| 7 | so that we separate the two. | |
| 8 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I agree | |
| 9 | with that. I'm sorry. | |
| 10 | Commissioner Carone. | |
| 11 | MR. CARONE: Thank you, | |
| 12 | Commissioner DeArcy. | |
| 13 | I happen to agree | |
| 14 | conceptually with your points. I | |
| 15 | think luxury items are best kept in | |
| 16 | the marketplace, and I don't think | |
| 17 | it's appropriate for us to regulate | |
| 18 | luxury items. And I deem air | |
| 19 | conditioning in the backseat, front | |
| 20 | seat, wherever, a luxury item. | |
| 21 | I also confine myself to | |
| 22 | support crash testing, but the | |
| 23 | grace period of six months I think | |
| 24 | is a little short to give | |
| 25 | manufacturers the time to do the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 89 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | crash testing and actually report | |
| 3 | on the findings, analyze the | |
| 4 | findings from a passenger point of | |
| 5 | view, not from a vehicle integrity | |
| 6 | point of view, meaning, how does | |
| 7 | the vehicle holdup in a crash | |
| 8 | testing. So I would ask for a year | |
| 9 | rather than six months. | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Well, | |
| 11 | thank you for that contribution, | |
| 12 | Commissioner. | |
| 13 | So, Commissioner DeArcy, I | |
| 14 | agree completely. I just want to | |
| 15 | say, first, I understand your | |
| 16 | concern. I think both parts of the | |
| 17 | concern, to me, are well-founded. | |
| 18 | And, there was discussion | |
| 19 | about grace period. You know, one | |
| 20 | thing that happens when all the | |
| 21 | discussion is on the threshold | |
| 22 | issue of yes or no, there's often | |
| 23 | not enough discussion about the | |
| 24 | real meat and potatoes of it. I | |
| 25 | think the rule as drafted was | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 90 |
|----|-----------------------------------|----|
| 2 | deficient in not taking into | |
| 3 | account a grace period because it | |
| 4 | is not for one vehicle because we | |
| 5 | do want any taxi that's competing | |
| 6 | on the market. And it's true, | |
| 7 | there's speakers raised that | |
| 8 | there's an exemption for hybrids. | |
| 9 | That's because the City Council | |
| 10 | the Administrative Code would not | |
| 11 | admit of that. So that's why | |
| 12 | there's an exception. | |
| 13 | I would think that every | |
| 14 | taxi that goes on the road should | |
| 15 | be crash tested, but we have to | |
| 16 | respect the Council the | |
| 17 | Administrative Code. So I believe | |
| 18 | there should be a grace period. | |
| 19 | Let me address in a second the | |
| 20 | length. | |
| 21 | On the air conditioning, I | |
| 22 | just want to explain to you, | |
| 23 | Commissioner DeArcy, why that | |
| 24 | seemed to make sense. If the | |
| 25 | manufacturer's designing the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 91 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | partition in the first place, then | |
| 3 | the added kind of burden of | |
| 4 | incorporating air conditioning to | |
| 5 | that seemed, to the staff, a | |
| 6 | minimal thing. However, on | |
| 7 | reflection, and certainly with your | |
| 8 | inputs, I do understand that that | |
| 9 | is a bridge too far, and certainly | |
| 10 | I think the Commission as a whole | |
| 11 | would be a bridge too far. | |
| 12 | So Meera has prepared a | |
| 13 | version that incorporates those two | |
| 14 | changes. I believe the grace | |
| 15 | period in the version before that | |
| 16 | is here and it's for June 30th. In | |
| 17 | other words, until June 30th. | |
| 18 | What, Commissioner Carone, I | |
| 19 | would suggest | |
| 20 | MS. DEARCY: That's the six | |
| 21 | months that I had previously | |
| 22 | suggested. | |
| 23 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: That was | |
| 24 | the six months that you had | |
| 25 | suggested. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 92 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | MS. DEARCY: Okay. | |
| 3 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I would | |
| 4 | suggest that that be made October | |
| 5 | or, let's say, November 1st of 2014 | |
| 6 | to give enough time for a model | |
| 7 | year to come out. In other words, | |
| 8 | here's why | |
| 9 | MS. DEARCY: So, 11 months. | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: All right. | |
| 11 | I take your point. I take your | |
| 12 | point. I didn't mean I wasn't | |
| 13 | looking to haggle. | |
| 14 | MR. CARONE: (Inaudible.) | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I was just | |
| 16 | trying to think of a natural | |
| 17 | stopping point. | |
| 18 | So let's make that the end | |
| 19 | of 2014; is that correct? | |
| 20 | MR. CARONE: Yes. | |
| 21 | MS. DEARCY: That's fine | |
| 22 | with me. | |
| 23 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: So without | |
| 24 | objection, then I would like to | |
| 25 | amend the rule that's before us. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 93 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | And I think, close to being |
| 3 | realistic, there would not be |
| 4 | majority support for a rule, the |
| 5 | rule as published. |
| б | So I would like to move |
| 7 | without objection that we amend the |
| 8 | rule to incorporate the changes |
| 9 | that LaShann has described with the |
| 10 | grace period being until |
| 11 | December 31st, 2014. |
| 12 | MS. WEINSHALL: (Inaudible.) |
| 13 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Without |
| 14 | air conditioning. No requirement |
| 15 | of air conditioning. |
| 16 | MS. WEINSHALL: Got it. |
| 17 | Okay. |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: No |
| 19 | requirement of air conditioning, |
| 20 | end of 2014 grace period. |
| 21 | MS. POLANCO: Quick comment. |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Is there |
| 23 | objection? Yes. |
| 24 | MS. POLANCO: No objection, |
| 25 | I just have a quick comment. |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 9 | 94 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | Is it realistic that in | |
| 3 | 11 months manufacturers and other | |
| 4 | vehicles are basically going to | |
| 5 | assemble to do | |
| 6 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Ab- | |
| 7 | solutely. That's when the next | |
| 8 | model year comes out. | |
| 9 | MS. DEARCY: That's what | |
| 10 | they do. That's their business. | |
| 11 | MS. POLANCO: Okay. | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: All right. | |
| 13 | Then | |
| 14 | MS. JOSHI: (Inaudible.) | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes, if | |
| 16 | you can do that in a brief way. | |
| 17 | MS. JOSHI: So before the | |
| 18 | Commission are the rules, the | |
| 19 | amendments to taxicab | |
| 20 | specifications as were published | |
| 21 | with the following two changes: | |
| 22 | the references to rear air | |
| 23 | conditioning requirement have been | |
| 24 | deleted, and in addition to Section | |
| 25 | 1, the Section 2, the following | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 95 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | phrase is added to 67-04(b): | |
| 3 | "Taxicab models approved | |
| 4 | prior to the effective date of this | |
| 5 | section must meet all requirements | |
| 6 | of this section by December 31st, | |
| 7 | 2014 to remain an approved taxicab | |
| 8 | model in accordance with this | |
| 9 | chapter. Any taxicab vehicle | |
| 10 | hacked up prior to December 31, | |
| 11 | 2014 can remain in service." | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Okay. So | |
| 13 | then I would like to call for a | |
| 14 | vote on that. By a show of hands, | |
| 15 | all in favor of adopting the rule | |
| 16 | as amended, please raise your hand | |
| 17 | to signify an "aye" vote. | |
| 18 | I count one, two, three, | |
| 19 | four, five, six votes, | |
| 20 | Commissioners Gonzales, Weinshall, | |
| 21 | myself, DeArcy, Arout and Carone. | |
| 22 | All opposed, signify by | |
| 23 | raising your hand to vote no. | |
| 24 | I count one vote, | |
| 25 | Commissioner Marino. | |
| | | |

Г

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 96 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | And all abstentions. |
| 3 | I count one vote, |
| 4 | Commissioner Polanco. |
| 5 | So by a vote of six in |
| 6 | favor, one in the negative and one |
| 7 | abstention, the crash test rule is |
| 8 | adopted. |
| 9 | So, Commissioners, |
| 10 | consistent with our earlier |
| 11 | discussion, we will now proceed to |
| 12 | a hearing on the E-Hail rule. |
| 13 | That is it for votes today. |
| 14 | And I understand, I know, |
| 15 | Commissioner Arout, you have |
| 16 | pressing business in Staten Island. |
| 17 | MR. AROUT: I'd just like to |
| 18 | say something for the record. |
| 19 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Oh, |
| 20 | please. Please do. |
| 21 | MR. AROUT: I want to thank |
| 22 | everyone for being here. And I'm |
| 23 | sure you don't want to hear me |
| 24 | repeat everything that you've |
| 25 | heard, and, believe me, I've gotten |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 97 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | plenty of phone calls, plenty of | |
| 3 | letters, but I had to come to a | |
| 4 | decision, and I came this way. | |
| 5 | And some people are not | |
| 6 | going to like it, but, please, I'm | |
| 7 | still your friend, you don't have | |
| 8 | to be my friend, but I had to do | |
| 9 | what I had to do, and I'm sorry | |
| 10 | about that. But I think it would | |
| 11 | be a great idea if it really gets | |
| 12 | into operation. | |
| 13 | So again, thank you very | |
| 14 | much for being so patient, and I | |
| 15 | certainly want to thank the | |
| 16 | Chairman for doing a great job over | |
| 17 | the years. And I hope to have the | |
| 18 | new administration come on board | |
| 19 | and maybe we can do a better job. | |
| 20 | I apologize. Some people | |
| 21 | don't like the way I voted, but, | |
| 22 | again, I have to vote my | |
| 23 | conscience. So thank you very | |
| 24 | much. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Can I just | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 98 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | say before you leave, and I believe | |
| 3 | that, Commissioner Arout, and I | |
| 4 | know that you probably already are | |
| 5 | going to be late for your | |
| 6 | MR. AROUT: Excuse me. It's | |
| 7 | just that I have a very important | |
| 8 | meeting this morning, and I told my | |
| 9 | wife I won't be long | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Say no | |
| 11 | more. | |
| 12 | MR. AROUT: but I'm | |
| 13 | running a fair in Staten Island and | |
| 14 | I have my vice chairman to do my | |
| 15 | work now. I said hopefully by 12 | |
| 16 | o'clock I'll pick you up. And you | |
| 17 | know how it is when your wife says | |
| 18 | you have to be there on time. So I | |
| 19 | apologize. | |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Well, I | |
| 21 | certainly know how it is not to be | |
| 22 | there on time. | |
| 23 | But just when I talked | |
| 24 | before about the fact that holding | |
| 25 | a position of responsibility means | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 99 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | making a decision on things where | |
| 3 | there are people on both sides, I | |
| 4 | think a lot of people doing that | |
| 5 | for even a few years, it kind of | |
| 6 | wears on them. To be able to do | |
| 7 | that for 25 years takes a really | |
| 8 | special kind of commitment. And I | |
| 9 | just want to salute you and tip my | |
| 10 | hat to you for that. | |
| 11 | MR. AROUT: Thank you very | |
| 12 | much. | |
| 13 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 14 | Commissioner. | |
| 15 | MR. AROUT: Have a happy | |
| 16 | holidays, everybody. | |
| 17 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: So, the | |
| 18 | final item is a hearing | |
| 19 | MS. MARINO: Before we move | |
| 20 | on, I'm sorry, and I'm going to | |
| 21 | make this really quick, I just want | |
| 22 | to point out, I did read Judge | |
| 23 | Hagler's decision from start to | |
| 24 | finish, and I really think I | |
| 25 | have a big problem with this rule | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 100 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | because of that as well. I think | |
| 3 | we're completely violating his | |
| 4 | clear intent in that decision. | |
| 5 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: The record | |
| 6 | has now been established. | |
| 7 | MS. MARINO: I just think | |
| 8 | we're inviting another lawsuit. | |
| 9 | And there was just an article in | |
| 10 | the Post the other day about | |
| 11 | another lawsuit about the health | |
| 12 | care fund. I just think we need to | |
| 13 | be more careful with our rulemaking | |
| 14 | because, frankly, there's been so | |
| 15 | many lawsuits and the plaintiffs | |
| 16 | can create a track record. | |
| 17 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Ab- | |
| 18 | solutely. | |
| 19 | So, Commissioners, the | |
| 20 | remaining business for today is a | |
| 21 | public hearing on the E-Hail rule. | |
| 22 | Again, I will not be bringing that | |
| 23 | forward for a vote, so I think it's | |
| 24 | worth hearing people's views. I | |
| 25 | understand people have busy | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 1 | 01 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | schedules. Let's now move forward | |
| 3 | with that hearing. | |
| 4 | And I guess I will say to | |
| 5 | people that are here, if you are, | |
| 6 | if you will, our kind of regular | |
| 7 | customers, so you will be at the | |
| 8 | next meeting regardless, you can | |
| 9 | consider speaking then instead, if | |
| 10 | you wish. | |
| 11 | MS. DEARCY: (Inaudible.) | |
| 12 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes. | |
| 13 | Especially if your purpose is to | |
| 14 | delay the vote. I can assure you | |
| 15 | we will do that. | |
| 16 | So with that, the first two | |
| 17 | are Erhan Tuncel from League of | |
| 18 | Mutual Taxi Owners and Richard | |
| 19 | Thaler. | |
| 20 | MR. TUNCEL: I have no | |
| 21 | comment at this time. | |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Okay. | |
| 23 | Thank you, Mr. Tuncel. | |
| 24 | Mr. Thaler. | |
| 25 | MR. THALER: Chairman | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 102 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | Yassky, Commissioners. There are | |
| 3 | three items. In the zone E-Hail | |
| 4 | Application restrictions, under | |
| 5 | 78-21d(1), they should not apply to | |
| 6 | E-Payment. In particular, there | |
| 7 | are zone restrictions at the | |
| 8 | airports. That's for either | |
| 9 | discovering a car through a | |
| 10 | broadcast system or through direct | |
| 11 | contact, but I don't see any reason | |
| 12 | why E-Payment should be restricted. | |
| 13 | So I think a correction should be | |
| 14 | applied there. | |
| 15 | Item two. If a TPEP | |
| 16 | integration rule waiver is granted | |
| 17 | to an E-Hail Application provider | |
| 18 | under 78-21b(4), then the E-Hail | |
| 19 | Application provider should not be | |
| 20 | required to pay any fee to a TPEP | |
| 21 | vendor installed in a taxi where a | |
| 22 | lease driver users the E-Hail | |
| 23 | Application provider's E-Payment | |
| 24 | for credit and debit card fare | |
| 25 | payment. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 103 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | Item three. The amended |
| 3 | Lease Cap Rules 58-21 C (1, 2, 3, |
| 4 | 4) and A, B, C should explicitly |
| 5 | state that lease drivers have the |
| 6 | option to pay all credit and debit |
| 7 | card fare payment transaction |
| 8 | processing fees at the |
| 9 | TLC-specified rate and pay the |
| 10 | lower lease cap rate which does not |
| 11 | include transaction fees. It |
| 12 | doesn't explicitly say that. |
| 13 | This will protect drivers |
| 14 | using E-Payment to be charged twice |
| 15 | for the same transaction if the |
| 16 | E-Hail Application provider |
| 17 | processes the fare payment |
| 18 | transaction through their payment |
| 19 | gateway, as the rule allows, |
| 20 | independent of the TPEP vendor's |
| 21 | payment gateway. Thank you. |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Okay. |
| 23 | Next is Mr. Ethan Gerber and Andrew |
| 24 | Frank. |
| 25 | MR. GERBER: You know, it |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 104 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | seems that in the last 12 years the | |
| 3 | TLC has felt the compulsion to | |
| 4 | radically change the business model | |
| 5 | of the taxi industry almost on a | |
| 6 | monthly basis. Rules have become a | |
| 7 | thicket to issue violations. This | |
| 8 | year, the TLC bragged in the Daily | |
| 9 | News that violations against | |
| 10 | drivers went up 7,200 percent. | |
| 11 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I'm | |
| 12 | MR. GERBER: Not | |
| 13 | surprising I'll get there, Mr. | |
| 14 | Yassky. Don't worry. | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: You're | |
| 16 | right. | |
| 17 | MR. GERBER: Not surprising, | |
| 18 | the rules have grown long and | |
| 19 | complex. The drivers' rules, which | |
| 20 | I brought here today, from 1993 | |
| 21 | were 18 pages; the drivers' rules | |
| 22 | today are 70 pages. The owners' | |
| 23 | rules have more than five times | |
| 24 | that amount totaling hundreds of | |
| 25 | pages with the base licenses as | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 105 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | well with the agent licenses as | |
| 3 | well agent rules as well. | |
| 4 | You've had 12 years to | |
| 5 | reinvent the industry, and, as a | |
| 6 | lawyer and a bar leader, I thank | |
| 7 | you for making it critical that | |
| 8 | teams of lawyers are employed just | |
| 9 | to get through this industry and | |
| 10 | advise the owners and the drivers. | |
| 11 | Now, in your last 12 days, | |
| 12 | you're doing your best to continue | |
| 13 | the trend. Four months ago, the | |
| 14 | TLC initiated what was supposed to | |
| 15 | be a yearlong pilot project on the | |
| 16 | use of smartphone apps to request | |
| 17 | yellow taxicabs. Rather than wait | |
| 18 | for the data to come in and analyze | |
| 19 | it impartially, you rushed it ahead | |
| 20 | despite only four months of testing | |
| 21 | of data four months of testing, | |
| 22 | which, by the way, if anything, | |
| 23 | supported a change in the program. | |
| 24 | Your last TLC presentation | |
| 25 | was remarkable. Per your own | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 106 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | presentation, the TLC reported that | |
| 3 | only 24 percent of the customers | |
| 4 | using the apps were satisfied with | |
| 5 | the service. The TLC reported that | |
| 6 | there was a larger portion of apps | |
| 7 | requesting street hail for taxis in | |
| 8 | the outer boroughs than in | |
| 9 | Manhattan, exactly where you were | |
| 10 | discouraging yellow service by | |
| 11 | flooding the areas with green cars. | |
| 12 | According to your own | |
| 13 | numbers, the FHV fares have | |
| 14 | declined. In an answer to that, | |
| 15 | Mr. Yassky, you said that you | |
| 16 | didn't trust your own data, that | |
| 17 | your own reports were not | |
| 18 | scientific, your analysis was | |
| 19 | flawed and your own surveys were | |
| 20 | poor. Remarkable, because when | |
| 21 | that same survey approach supports | |
| 22 | your positions, you tout it. You | |
| 23 | also reported that the people who | |
| 24 | used apps were people who would | |
| 25 | have otherwise used mass transit. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 1 | .07 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | So these apps take people of mass | |
| 3 | transit and put them in cars. This | |
| 4 | is contrary to public policy that | |
| 5 | you stated in the past. | |
| 6 | The Commission has done its | |
| 7 | best to support Nissan, now it's | |
| 8 | doing its best to support Hailo. | |
| 9 | Let's have the new administration | |
| 10 | and the riding public analyze the | |
| 11 | data after one year fairly, just, | |
| 12 | impartially, and analyze it. | |
| 13 | Finally, Mr. Yassky, and to | |
| 14 | all the Commissioners and all the | |
| 15 | people in the room, I want to wish | |
| 16 | you a Happy New Year. You won't be | |
| 17 | seeing everybody. I hope everyone | |
| 18 | here a very happy and healthy New | |
| 19 | Year. And happiness spreads in | |
| 20 | many ways. As Oscar Wilde once | |
| 21 | said, There are those who spread | |
| 22 | happiness wherever they go, and | |
| 23 | those who spread happiness whenever | |
| 24 | they go. I hope everyone a Happy | |
| 25 | New Year. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 108 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: That was | |
| 3 | characteristically elegant, | |
| 4 | Mr. Gerber, and I take the wish of | |
| 5 | for happy holidays on its face. | |
| 6 | And I will say, just very | |
| 7 | quickly while I'm sorry, Andrew | |
| 8 | Frank is next and then Kevin | |
| 9 | Hatfield. | |
| 10 | While Mr. Frank is coming | |
| 11 | up, I'll just point out, no need | |
| 12 | for extended discussion here, just | |
| 13 | on the issue of number of | |
| 14 | summonses. I am proud that so many | |
| 15 | more summonses have been issued | |
| 16 | this year than last year. I want | |
| 17 | people to understand what those | |
| 18 | summonses are, what the increase | |
| 19 | is, are both illegal taxis, people | |
| 20 | that are not licensed by us at all | |
| 21 | poaching on the legitimate business | |
| 22 | of our licensees, and cars that are | |
| 23 | licensed only to do prearranged | |
| 24 | service but are doing street hails. | |
| 25 | That is where the increase has been | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 109 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | over the last couple of years in | |
| 3 | the summonses we've issued. I'm | |
| 4 | proud of that record. I think | |
| 5 | those are exactly those | |
| 6 | summonses need to be issued. | |
| 7 | On the E-Hail part, I want | |
| 8 | to just recognize, this one, I | |
| 9 | think there's very legitimate room | |
| 10 | for debate. To me, I felt that | |
| 11 | there were facts enough out there | |
| 12 | for people to form their opinions. | |
| 13 | I wouldn't go as far as to say that | |
| 14 | any reasonable person would | |
| 15 | conclude it's good, but I think | |
| 16 | there are facts enough out there | |
| 17 | for people to form their | |
| 18 | judgements. That's why I thought | |
| 19 | it was worth doing. | |
| 20 | However, I absolutely | |
| 21 | recognize people's belief and | |
| 22 | understandable belief that some | |
| 23 | more time will generate more useful | |
| 24 | information, and there's no harm to | |
| 25 | doing that. So, as I say, we do | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 10 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | not need to proceed to a vote. | |
| 3 | And just on the, you know, | |
| 4 | on the good-year part. I do want | |
| 5 | to say, not just the we talked | |
| 6 | before about the Commissioners, but | |
| 7 | to our partners and colleagues in | |
| 8 | the industry who I've worked with | |
| 9 | now for four years, and on many | |
| 10 | things, to be sure, you know, | |
| 11 | disagreed. I do think that, and I | |
| 12 | want to thank you for the fact that | |
| 13 | I've, with rare exceptions, I feel | |
| 14 | that we've been able to disagree | |
| 15 | agreeably and to have reasonable | |
| 16 | conversation back and forth. And | |
| 17 | I'm sure that that will continue | |
| 18 | with the next Commission. | |
| 19 | MS. DEARCY: Can I say | |
| 20 | something? | |
| 21 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes. | |
| 22 | MS. DEARCY: I disagreed | |
| 23 | with the proposal to have the | |
| 24 | E-Hail vote now and I think some of | |
| 25 | the other ones, but it does | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 111 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | disappoint me when we cannot | |
| 3 | disagree politely and courteously. | |
| 4 | I'm not certain why we need to | |
| 5 | resort to the personal attacks. | |
| 6 | They may be funny, but I think | |
| 7 | they're unfair. | |
| 8 | You know, we're all adults | |
| 9 | and you certainly can proceed as | |
| 10 | you wish, but I think it's an | |
| 11 | unnecessary dig and it disappoints | |
| 12 | me that that's what we would resort | |
| 13 | to. | |
| 14 | I don't think that you | |
| 15 | should have to, on your last day, | |
| 16 | as you have served this Commission | |
| 17 | to the best of your ability, | |
| 18 | whether people agree with | |
| 19 | everything that Chairman Yassky has | |
| 20 | done, he has served to the best of | |
| 21 | his ability. And I think it's | |
| 22 | unfair that on this day that you | |
| 23 | should have to defend yourself. | |
| 24 | And I apologize to you that you | |
| 25 | have to. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 1 | 12 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: (In- | |
| 3 | audible), so please have a box of | |
| 4 | tissues at the ready. | |
| 5 | Thank you for your comments, | |
| 6 | LaShann. | |
| 7 | Mr. Frank, I take it, and to | |
| 8 | be followed by Kevin Hatfield. | |
| 9 | MR. FRANK: Yes. Thanks for | |
| 10 | having me today. I am a resident | |
| 11 | of Astoria, Queens and I'm an | |
| 12 | entrepreneur. I have an energy | |
| 13 | efficiency startup, I have an | |
| 14 | office in Manhattan. And living in | |
| 15 | western Queens and being an | |
| 16 | entrepreneur, E-Hailing is really | |
| 17 | key for two reasons. Number one, | |
| 18 | it's hard to get yellow cabs out | |
| 19 | where I live; and number two, I'm | |
| 20 | really poor. I mean, I could use, | |
| 21 | you know, black cabs and use some | |
| 22 | of the unregulated stuff, but | |
| 23 | frankly it could be just too | |
| 24 | expensive. | |
| 25 | I'm also a really big | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 113 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | believer in government innovation. | |
| 3 | And, frankly, when I heard about | |
| 4 | this issue on E-Hailing, it kind of | |
| 5 | seemed like a no-brainer to me. I | |
| 6 | couldn't actually believe that | |
| 7 | anybody would not make that | |
| 8 | available. | |
| 9 | Someone earlier talked about | |
| 10 | letting the market decide with the | |
| 11 | crash test stuff you guys were | |
| 12 | talking about, and it sort of seems | |
| 13 | like the market should decide for | |
| 14 | this. You know, if you have | |
| 15 | E-Hailing, it just makes sense to | |
| 16 | do it. I can pay via my phone, I | |
| 17 | can get something. You know, I'm | |
| 18 | going to the airport and I need to | |
| 19 | make a business meeting, I don't | |
| 20 | it's hard for me to go out there | |
| 21 | and basically play roulette on | |
| 22 | whether I'm going to catch a cab. | |
| 23 | So, I don't know if there's | |
| 24 | any I mean, I don't know as much | |
| 25 | about this as probably you guys do, | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 114 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | obviously, but I don't really know |
| 3 | any legitimate reason why you |
| 4 | wouldn't just do this. If it |
| 5 | doesn't work, it doesn't work. |
| 6 | Private capital isn't going to put |
| 7 | money into applications and |
| 8 | marketing if no one's going to do |
| 9 | it. |
| 10 | So it seems to me, I mean, I |
| 11 | know you're not voting on it today, |
| 12 | but it seems to me like it's a |
| 13 | no-brainer. And as a citizen and a |
| 14 | voter of New York, I would really, |
| 15 | really like to see this be made |
| 16 | permanent so that my life can be |
| 17 | enhanced. Thank you. |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you |
| 19 | for taking your time. |
| 20 | MS. MARINO: Can I address |
| 21 | that? |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Please, go |
| 23 | right ahead. |
| 24 | MS. MARINO: I understand |
| 25 | what you're a saying, I think it's |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 115 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | inevitable. Just to answer your | |
| 3 | question, I think the reason why we | |
| 4 | have to take this slow is because | |
| 5 | New York City has a very unique | |
| 6 | livery/taxi structure that was born | |
| 7 | in the 1980s with street hails and | |
| 8 | prearranged cars that other cities | |
| 9 | don't have. So that's why we need | |
| 10 | to really kind of figure this out | |
| 11 | where it works for all industries | |
| 12 | because we're a unique city in that | |
| 13 | respect. | |
| 14 | MR. FRANK: Well, I guess, | |
| 15 | why do you care about the industry | |
| 16 | more than you care about the normal | |
| 17 | people that are E-Hailing? | |
| 18 | MS. MARINO: We care about | |
| 19 | everybody. | |
| 20 | MR. FRANK: Sure, but, okay. | |
| 21 | I guess I just don't understand why | |
| 22 | you would care more about the | |
| 23 | livery industry than my ability to | |
| 24 | get a cab. | |
| 25 | MS. MARINO: It's not | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | L16 |
|----|------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | "more." It's not "more." No one's | |
| 3 | saying "more," but everything has | |
| 4 | to be taken into consideration. | |
| 5 | You know, these people have | |
| 6 | families and college funds and you | |
| 7 | can't just rip the rug out of an | |
| 8 | entire industry. | |
| 9 | MR. FRANK: I understand, | |
| 10 | but I'm paying more for livery | |
| 11 | cabs. | |
| 12 | MS. MARINO: Well, we're | |
| 13 | working on it. | |
| 14 | MR. FRANK: Okay, thank you. | |
| 15 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 16 | again, sir. And as the earlier | |
| 17 | speaker talked about the number of | |
| 18 | rules, I actually do see this one | |
| 19 | as reducing restrictions. Why do | |
| 20 | you tell people how to run their | |
| 21 | business when customers could | |
| 22 | choose some more what makes more | |
| 23 | sense for them. But I appreciate | |
| 24 | your being here. | |
| 25 | Mr. Hatfield and then | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 117 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | Michael Keogh. |
| 3 | MR. HATFIELD: Hi. Kevin |
| 4 | Hatfield from Hailo. In the |
| 5 | interest of the time, we will |
| 6 | simply submit and do it at the |
| 7 | postponement, but we'll simply |
| 8 | submit our testimony. |
| 9 | I do want to just say that |
| 10 | we think that the E-Hail program is |
| 11 | going very well. We believe that |
| 12 | New Yorkers are very much in |
| 13 | support of the program. In |
| 14 | particular, we get very regular |
| 15 | constant feedback from the |
| 16 | underserved, from disabled, et |
| 17 | cetera. I think you'll hear from a |
| 18 | few of those folks today. Thank |
| 19 | you. |
| 20 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. |
| 21 | And I appreciate your brevity. |
| 22 | Kevin Malcolm. I mean, no, |
| 23 | sincerely. I appreciate your |
| 24 | taking that into account and |
| 25 | everyone's interest. Thank you. |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | .18 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | Mr. Keogh, followed by Kevin | |
| 3 | Malcolm, representing VeriFone. | |
| 4 | MR. KEOGH: Hi. My name's | |
| 5 | Michael Keogh. I represent Hailo. | |
| 6 | I don't usually talk at public | |
| 7 | hearings, and I'm going to be very | |
| 8 | brief because, to be perfectly | |
| 9 | honest, the pilot program is | |
| 10 | speaking for itself. And that guy | |
| 11 | just said it better than I could. | |
| 12 | It really is going to help people. | |
| 13 | And you said it that it's | |
| 14 | inevitable, so why wait for the | |
| 15 | inevitability, tomorrow is here. | |
| 16 | Having said that, because I | |
| 17 | just want to use the balance of my | |
| 18 | time to say this, you have been an | |
| 19 | adversary and a collaborator, you | |
| 20 | have you been somebody who has | |
| 21 | infuriated and inspired a lot of | |
| 22 | the people in this room to do | |
| 23 | things that they never thought were | |
| 24 | possible before. I have had many | |
| 25 | heated discussions with you and I | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 119 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | have had many calm, rational |
| 3 | discussions with you. I enjoyed |
| 4 | those much better. |
| 5 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Me too. |
| 6 | MR. KEOGH: Because I |
| 7 | usually won on those. So I just |
| 8 | wanted to say that there may be |
| 9 | people who have disagreed with you |
| 10 | and I've disagreed with policy |
| 11 | objectives that you've had, and |
| 12 | I've disagreed about methods that |
| 13 | you have used, but I have never |
| 14 | doubted for one minute your desire |
| 15 | to serve here in this capacity and |
| 16 | get results. |
| 17 | So you should be proud of |
| 18 | the book of accomplishments that |
| 19 | you walk out the door with, and I, |
| 20 | as Ethan pointed out, all of us who |
| 21 | get to represent and advise about |
| 22 | all of the litigation out there, we |
| 23 | could not thank you more. |
| 24 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I think we |
| 25 | can agree that that's an |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 120 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | appropriately judicious use of |
| 3 | humor, but a heartfelt thank you |
| 4 | for those comments, Michael. Thank |
| 5 | you. |
| 6 | Mr. Malcolm? |
| 7 | MALE SPEAKER: (Inaudible.) |
| 8 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. |
| 9 | VeriFone. |
| 10 | The final two are then Ira |
| 11 | Goldstein and Bhairavi Desai. |
| 12 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: Thank you. |
| 13 | First, I just want to |
| 14 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I'm sorry. |
| 15 | There was an additional speaker. |
| 16 | Michael Woloz also signed up for |
| 17 | this. I apologize. Oh, and Avik |
| 18 | Kabessa. You know what? Got it. |
| 19 | There we go. |
| 20 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: Okay. I too |
| 21 | will keep it brief. I think |
| 22 | that just, I applaud the Board |
| 23 | for putting off the vote. I'm not |
| 24 | here to tell you I'm against it, |
| 25 | I'm here to tell you that, just, it |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 121 | L |
|----|------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | hasn't run its course yet. It's | |
| 3 | clearly the largest, far-reaching | |
| 4 | pilot that the agency has ever | |
| 5 | done, and I think it's | |
| 6 | inconclusive. There's some | |
| 7 | positives, I think there's some | |
| 8 | negatives. | |
| 9 | Myself as the Black Car | |
| 10 | Assistance Corp. and the Livery | |
| 11 | Roundtable, we submitted a couple | |
| 12 | of rounds of questions which | |
| 13 | haven't been answered. I think | |
| 14 | most of them were relevant. A | |
| 15 | couple, maybe, we were trying to | |
| 16 | harass you guys, but for the most | |
| 17 | part they were relevant, and we | |
| 18 | haven't gotten any answers on that | |
| 19 | yet. So I think it's appropriate | |
| 20 | just to put that vote off for now. | |
| 21 | And I just want to say, from | |
| 22 | having been on both sides of the | |
| 23 | fence, I think I like that side a | |
| 24 | little better at times. | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: They each | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 122 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | have their pros and cons, like |
| 3 | everything. |
| 4 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: Yeah. The |
| 5 | money's better over here, though. |
| 6 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Tell me |
| 7 | about it. |
| 8 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: But, anyway, |
| 9 | I just want to say that overall, |
| 10 | since it's probably the last one of |
| 11 | this administration, again, I too |
| 12 | have been on opposite sides of the |
| 13 | fence on a few things, but I |
| 14 | enjoyed working with everyone, the |
| 15 | Commission. I found you to be a |
| 16 | very refreshing bunch, open-minded. |
| 17 | And Commissioner Yassky, |
| 18 | again, we were on different sides |
| 19 | of some things, but I, too, I don't |
| 20 | doubt your intentions even if we |
| 21 | didn't agree. Thanks. |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I |
| 23 | appreciate you saying that. |
| 24 | MR. GONZALES: I |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I just |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 123 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | if I can, Ed | |
| 3 | MR. GONZALES: Sure. | |
| 4 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I just | |
| 5 | wanted to say, when you came up | |
| 6 | earlier, I was reminded of my first | |
| 7 | few weeks and months here. And I | |
| 8 | said it at the time, but I don't | |
| 9 | think I've said it since in the | |
| 10 | last few years, that without your | |
| 11 | tutelage and tutelage, I guess, | |
| 12 | in helping me understand the place, | |
| 13 | it would have been a much slower | |
| 14 | start for sure. And I don't think | |
| 15 | I would have had as, to the extent | |
| 16 | it's been a successful period, | |
| 17 | would not have been. Which, don't | |
| 18 | let anybody don't hold that | |
| 19 | against Ira, anybody out there, | |
| 20 | please. | |
| 21 | But I say, sincerely, once | |
| 22 | again, thank you for your enormous | |
| 23 | help when I started here. Thank | |
| 24 | you, again. | |
| 25 | MR. GOLDSTEIN: Thank you. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 124 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | In the end, everything worked out | |
| 3 | right for everybody here. | |
| 4 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: There you | |
| 5 | go. | |
| 6 | MR. GONZALES: I'd like to | |
| 7 | also say, you know, in addition to | |
| 8 | echoing Chairman Yassky's comments | |
| 9 | to you, Ira, in particular, we | |
| 10 | couldn't have been here talking | |
| 11 | about technology and things like | |
| 12 | that without your direct and | |
| 13 | timeless effort to get us to this | |
| 14 | point, and I'm forever grateful for | |
| 15 | that. | |
| 16 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: In the | |
| 17 | interest of time, Commissioners, at | |
| 18 | the beginning of the meeting, I did | |
| 19 | not we prepared you should | |
| 20 | take a bow we prepared a set of | |
| 21 | slides that reviewed the | |
| 22 | accomplishments of the agency | |
| 23 | during the Bloomberg Era. Not just | |
| 24 | the last four years, but the entire | |
| 25 | 12. I skipped those yes, you're | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 125 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | welcome, Nora in the interest of | |
| 3 | the time. But one of the key | |
| 4 | slides was about TPEP and credit | |
| 5 | cards and everything that has | |
| 6 | which was before my time. But, Ira | |
| 7 | and Matt Daus, who is here, I know, | |
| 8 | they're a particular legacy. | |
| 9 | And I won't go on, but it's | |
| 10 | just impressive how much that has | |
| 11 | helped the industry. And I really | |
| 12 | do think that all of the stuff that | |
| 13 | we do, if it makes a better service | |
| 14 | for passengers, it helps the | |
| 15 | industry in the end. That's my | |
| 16 | core belief. | |
| 17 | But, at any rate, had you | |
| 18 | seen those slides you'd all be even | |
| 19 | more appreciative of Ira. | |
| 20 | MS. MARINO: I'm unclear | |
| 21 | where I came into that. | |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yeah, I | |
| 23 | don't know. I know you want to get | |
| 24 | to the point. | |
| 25 | So, I'm sorry, I've been now | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 12 | 6 |
|----|-------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | I was looking at the wrong list | |
| 3 | when I read the speakers before. | |
| 4 | The next is Waseem Iqbal, to be | |
| 5 | followed by Ira Goldstein, but he's | |
| 6 | already so, Waseem Iqbal, to be | |
| 7 | followed by Osman Chowdhury. | |
| 8 | MR. IQBAL: Good morning, | |
| 9 | Commission. Thank you very much | |
| 10 | for giving me a chance to speak | |
| 11 | here. My name is Waseem Iqbal, I'm | |
| 12 | a taxi driver for over 10 years. | |
| 13 | My father was a driver for over | |
| 14 | 22 years. I'm here to speak in | |
| 15 | support of E-Hail program and I | |
| 16 | would really like you to make it | |
| 17 | permanent. | |
| 18 | Before E-Hail, taxi drivers | |
| 19 | spent hours, empty, cruising down | |
| 20 | the road looking for the next fare. | |
| 21 | With the help of E-Hail, not only | |
| 22 | is it easier for passengers to get | |
| 23 | a cab, a close-by taxi, but also | |
| 24 | for a driver to catch the next | |
| 25 | fare. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 127 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | Now, with the sorry. My | |
| 3 | point is for past year and half, | |
| 4 | I've been working with the Hailo to | |
| 5 | interact with drivers explaining | |
| 6 | them how to use the app, and I had | |
| 7 | a chance to work with the I | |
| 8 | mean, speak with many, many drivers | |
| 9 | who love the service and actually | |
| 10 | wanting to continue with this. It | |
| 11 | is connecting drivers and | |
| 12 | passengers like it was never | |
| 13 | possible before. | |
| 14 | Lastly, please let me just | |
| 15 | be the voice of hundreds of drivers | |
| 16 | that I interacted with and make | |
| 17 | this program permanent because not | |
| 18 | only it's helping the drivers, taxi | |
| 19 | industry, but also connecting the | |
| 20 | passengers with one cab. So, | |
| 21 | please. Thank you. | |
| 22 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 23 | and thank you for taking your time. | |
| 24 | We talked before about pay, pay | |
| 25 | scales in various places. It's the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 128 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | drivers, folks like you, who are | |
| 3 | working the hardest, so thank you | |
| 4 | again. | |
| 5 | MR. IQBAL: You're welcome. | |
| 6 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Next, | |
| 7 | Mr. Chowdhury, to be followed by | |
| 8 | Avik Kabessa. | |
| 9 | MR. CHOWDHURY: Hi. Good | |
| 10 | afternoon. My name is Osman | |
| 11 | Chowdhury. I would like to support | |
| 12 | the E-Hail program | |
| 13 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I'm just | |
| 14 | going to say this at the outset and | |
| 15 | this applies to everybody. I kind | |
| 16 | of would ask that since we were | |
| 17 | going to do this and we were going | |
| 18 | to continue the hearing next time, | |
| 19 | if people speak at this hearing, | |
| 20 | I'd ask that you consider not | |
| 21 | speaking at the next one. It's one | |
| 22 | big record. So, thank you. I | |
| 23 | mean, on this issue, of course. | |
| 24 | Mr. Chowdhury. Please. | |
| 25 | MR. CHOWDHURY: The things | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 129 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | that the E-Hail, because in New | |
| 3 | York City, we get this hybrid car, | |
| 4 | and we get the GPS, we get the | |
| 5 | credit cards. Ultimately the | |
| 6 | E-Hail taxi and driver benefitting | |
| 7 | this decision because I have a | |
| 8 | 12-hour shift I work, and after | |
| 9 | that I go to make a line in garage | |
| 10 | to make my payment, but I don't | |
| 11 | want. I go directly through the | |
| 12 | E-Hail system, that account goes to | |
| 13 | my account. I don't go back to | |
| 14 | garage right after work. It's easy | |
| 15 | for us. | |
| 16 | Another thing, we'd like to | |
| 17 | extend the rules to any device and | |
| 18 | phone in (inaudible). If the | |
| 19 | tax or TLC inspector or NYPD see | |
| 20 | the mobile phones in front of us, | |
| 21 | they issue the summonses. But | |
| 22 | that's why we need (inaudible), | |
| 23 | because we like this E-Hail program | |
| 24 | things. Benefit drivers and | |
| 25 | passengers. Thank you. | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 130 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 3 | Thank you very much. | |
| 4 | Mr. Kabessa, followed by | |
| 5 | Michael Woloz. | |
| 6 | MR. KABESSA: Good morning. | |
| 7 | I was hoping that you would | |
| 8 | postpone the votes so I actually | |
| 9 | made two testimonies. | |
| 10 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Okay. | |
| 11 | MR. KABESSA: And so, my | |
| 12 | name is Avik Kabessa. I am the CEO | |
| 13 | of Carmel and a member of Livery | |
| 14 | Roundtable. First, I would like to | |
| 15 | say that I'm not here to testify in | |
| 16 | support or against of the future of | |
| 17 | the E-Prearrangement, or the | |
| 18 | E-Hail, as you call it. I'm only | |
| 19 | here to commend you on not | |
| 20 | prematurely taking the step of | |
| 21 | converting the pilot program into a | |
| 22 | permanent rule. Accordingly, my | |
| 23 | testimony centers on the currently | |
| 24 | available taxi data, the very | |
| 25 | limited for-hire industry data, and | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 131 | Ĺ |
|----|------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | how collection and information may | |
| 3 | be improved upon. | |
| 4 | So let's examine the two | |
| 5 | major components of the data | |
| 6 | published by the TLC. The first | |
| 7 | one, and I'm quoting from the | |
| 8 | presentation itself, is that | |
| 9 | "E-Hail success rate was | |
| 10 | 23 percent." I suppose the | |
| 11 | agency's statement is in line with | |
| 12 | the concept of never leading with | |
| 13 | your chin. Another way, and more | |
| 14 | useful, to interpret the data is | |
| 15 | that so far "E-Hail failure rate | |
| 16 | was 77 percent." So the data needs | |
| 17 | to be further collected and | |
| 18 | evaluated to better understand the | |
| 19 | impact of the high failure rate on | |
| 20 | the public. | |
| 21 | On the data collected from | |
| 22 | the for-hire industry, the picture | |
| 23 | is much starker, but, again, needs | |
| 24 | to be clarified through improved | |
| 25 | collection and evaluation of the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 132 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | data. And here, I have to disagree |
| 3 | with you, Commissioner Yassky, that |
| 4 | you have held this data as |
| 5 | valuable. And let me explain. |
| 6 | The TLC collected data from |
| 7 | only 29 percent of the industry on |
| 8 | a voluntary basis. This is |
| 9 | critical; i.e., the data does not |
| 10 | hold to any sample standard values. |
| 11 | You cannot use it as a sample |
| 12 | standard value. |
| 13 | Non-sampling data of |
| 14 | 29 percent over three months, or |
| 15 | six months, is equal to the third |
| 16 | of this period. So, bringing here, |
| 17 | which you didn't do, thank God, |
| 18 | bringing here to a vote something |
| 19 | that's based on one, or, the best |
| 20 | case scenario, two months, is not |
| 21 | the proper way to do it. And, |
| 22 | therefore, the first thing to do |
| 23 | for the second three months, the |
| 24 | reporting period, is to establish |
| 25 | sample standards and make it |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 133 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | mandatory for the bases selected. | |
| 3 | It goes by base size, vehicles per | |
| 4 | base, locations per borough, that's | |
| 5 | a standard. If you want to do 29 | |
| 6 | percent, you do that standard and | |
| 7 | then you can do multiplication. | |
| 8 | So once the standard would | |
| 9 | be applied and verified, it should | |
| 10 | be followed the same way for the | |
| 11 | remaining two, two or three months | |
| 12 | period to allow accurate | |
| 13 | measurement. | |
| 14 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I just | |
| 15 | want to make sure I understand. | |
| 16 | You're suggesting a mandatory | |
| 17 | requirement on the businesses of | |
| 18 | reporting data to us? | |
| 19 | MR. KABESSA: You select a | |
| 20 | certain standard, base size, | |
| 21 | location, type of the trips, et | |
| 22 | cetera. Then from that standard, | |
| 23 | you collect sample. And that | |
| 24 | participation | |
| 25 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Okay, I | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 134 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | got it. I just wanted to make sure |
| 3 | I got it. |
| 4 | MR. KABESSA: because our |
| 5 | industry has so much seasonability |
| 6 | and variation within the industry, |
| 7 | that you will never, you know, you |
| 8 | can never use this data. |
| 9 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Now that |
| 10 | you're saying it, it's registering |
| 11 | that sometimes voluntary compl |
| 12 | isn't going to get you the useful |
| 13 | thing, and you need something |
| 14 | that's a mandatory requirement to |
| 15 | get there. I take your point. |
| 16 | MR. KABESSA: The TLC should |
| 17 | probably consider, then, if we |
| 18 | establish this, revisiting the |
| 19 | numbers it compiled for the first |
| 20 | three months report as based on the |
| 21 | collection methodology they may |
| 22 | that actually are useless. |
| 23 | So in my previous |
| 24 | profession, for those of you who do |
| 25 | not know, I was a veterinarian. |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 135 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | And as such, I was required to | |
| 3 | engage in research. In research, | |
| 4 | like in the pilot, establishing a | |
| 5 | sample by following certain | |
| 6 | standards is a must. I would be | |
| 7 | more than happy to work with the | |
| 8 | TLC on establishing such sample | |
| 9 | standards and help with the data | |
| 10 | collection. | |
| 11 | Just for illustration, when | |
| 12 | you flip a coin ten times, you will | |
| 13 | rarely have the coin land five | |
| 14 | times on heads or five times on | |
| 15 | tails. Rather, you need to flip it | |
| 16 | a thousand times in order to come | |
| 17 | up with the 50/50 statistical | |
| 18 | probability. The same is true here | |
| 19 | when it comes to such an important | |
| 20 | decision. Our for-hire industry | |
| 21 | has so many variation and | |
| 22 | seasonability differences that only | |
| 23 | carefully acquired, substantial and | |
| 24 | substantiated data will provide | |
| 25 | I'm finishing will provide a | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 136 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | proper statistical forecast for |
| 3 | converting the pilot program. |
| 4 | In summary, proper data |
| 5 | collection is crucial. While I'm |
| 6 | dubious about the pilot program, |
| 7 | when the time comes to make the |
| 8 | final decision on it, you should do |
| 9 | it based on an understanding |
| 10 | deriving from carefully acquired |
| 11 | and, therefore, more solid data. |
| 12 | And if the pilot will eventually |
| 13 | become a rule after it ran its |
| 14 | course and the data shows no harm |
| 15 | to the for-hire industry, it will |
| 16 | be as close to the probable outcome |
| 17 | as possible. Thank you. |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. |
| 19 | I want you to know, I appreciate |
| 20 | again, this is my last meeting as |
| 21 | Chair, so, but as the I think it |
| 22 | would be useful very much to have, |
| 23 | you know, for the agency going |
| 24 | forward to have your assistance |
| 25 | with the data collection, both with |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 137 |
|----|------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | the conceptualizing of the data, | |
| 3 | analysis and collection. And, | |
| 4 | indeed, I know that Carmel has an | |
| 5 | app, and data from that would | |
| 6 | probably provide a very useful | |
| 7 | standard as well, or at least | |
| 8 | factors taken into account. So I | |
| 9 | appreciate the offer of assistance | |
| 10 | on data. | |
| 11 | And just on the last part | |
| 12 | about it, just to clarify, folks, | |
| 13 | about the pilot, your testimony | |
| 14 | speaks of no harm to the for-hire. | |
| 15 | One of the standards in the pilot | |
| 16 | is assessing the impact on other | |
| 17 | industries. I didn't want to | |
| 18 | misread your statement to say that | |
| 19 | if any harm is shown anywhere, it | |
| 20 | means the pilot chose won't | |
| 21 | continue. The agency will | |
| 22 | obviously have to balance all the | |
| 23 | various impacts and ultimately, | |
| 24 | presumably, one hopes, make a | |
| 25 | decision on what's best for the | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 13 | 38 |
|----|------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | passenger. | |
| 3 | MR. KABESSA: Thank you. | |
| 4 | The interpretation of the data I | |
| 5 | will have to leave to the | |
| 6 | Commissioners, of course, but at | |
| 7 | least it's a solid data. | |
| 8 | But what I will urge you and | |
| 9 | your staff is to never use the | |
| 10 | excuse you actually used to show | |
| 11 | that there's no harm. That's | |
| 12 | literally saying that the decline | |
| 13 | of the for-hire industry started | |
| 14 | before the pilot started; i.e., if | |
| 15 | the for-hire bleeds, let it bleed | |
| 16 | anyway. It doesn't matter. | |
| 17 | There's no connection with the | |
| 18 | E-Hail. | |
| 19 | I urge you to investigate. | |
| 20 | There should be a writing on the | |
| 21 | wall for us to dig deeper and see | |
| 22 | how much of this contribution to | |
| 23 | the E-Hail. | |
| 24 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: I | |
| 25 | understand. I don't want to take | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 139 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | people's time. You know, I started | |
| 3 | out as a revenue forecaster for the | |
| 4 | city, and that kind of analysis of, | |
| 5 | you know, regression analysis to | |
| 6 | identify which independent variable | |
| 7 | has the most impact or what their | |
| 8 | various impacts are, I appreciate | |
| 9 | your point that that's often | |
| 10 | enormously complicated. | |
| 11 | I'd also note that it is not | |
| 12 | always one is not always able to | |
| 13 | do that to perfection. I try and | |
| 14 | follow the Colin Powell 80/20 rule. | |
| 15 | If you want to make a decision when | |
| 16 | you feel like you've gotten 80 | |
| 17 | percent of the information you | |
| 18 | could get, because if you wait till | |
| 19 | you have 100 percent, you'll never | |
| 20 | make a decision. If you do it | |
| 21 | based on 10 percent, probably | |
| 22 | uninformed. | |
| 23 | But, anyway, again, thank | |
| 24 | you for your testimony. | |
| 25 | MR. KABESSA: I just want to | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 140 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | say |
| 3 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: You can |
| 4 | have the last word. |
| 5 | MR. KABESSA: the data |
| 6 | was wrong, in my opinion, so that's |
| 7 | why the interpretation came wrong. |
| 8 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Got it. |
| 9 | Okay. Thank you, sir. |
| 10 | Tariq is passing. Thank you |
| 11 | so much. |
| 12 | Mike Woloz is the next |
| 13 | speaker, followed, and I believe |
| 14 | the last person yes. Yes, got |
| 15 | it. |
| 16 | MR. WOLOZ: Am I the last |
| 17 | speaker? |
| 18 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: No. |
| 19 | There's one additional. There's |
| 20 | Ms. Desai. |
| 21 | MR. WOLOZ: That would have |
| 22 | been poetic. |
| 23 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: And we |
| 24 | have taken your advice and delayed |
| 25 | the vote. So, thank you, |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 141 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | Mr. Woloz. |
| 3 | MR. WOLOZ: Thank you. And |
| 4 | I just wanted to say a few words on |
| 5 | that. I want to thank the |
| б | Commissioners for delaying this |
| 7 | vote, and I want to explain where |
| 8 | Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade |
| 9 | is coming from on this because I |
| 10 | think it's very important to note. |
| 11 | MTBOT represents the owners |
| 12 | of nearly 5500 yellow medallion |
| 13 | taxicabs. MTBOT successfully |
| 14 | fought alongside Chairman Yassky |
| 15 | and the Bloomberg Administration |
| 16 | for this E-Hail pilot program, both |
| 17 | in court and in public. And MTBOT |
| 18 | members would benefit from seeing |
| 19 | such a rule pass today. However, |
| 20 | despite this fact and that the |
| 21 | E-Hail rule has great merit and its |
| 22 | principle tenets are deserving of |
| 23 | passage at a later date, it is our |
| 24 | strong opinion that no rule, |
| 25 | including this one, should go |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 42 |
|----|-------------------------------------|----|
| 2 | forward today. It's the right and | |
| 3 | respectful thing to do. | |
| 4 | MTBOT believes that the | |
| 5 | E-Hail rules have fundamental | |
| 6 | merit, but it is premature to vote | |
| 7 | on this now and we thank you for | |
| 8 | postponing this even though we | |
| 9 | would benefit from this. | |
| 10 | E-Hails belong in yellow | |
| 11 | taxis. We fought for the right of | |
| 12 | our yellow taxi passengers to use | |
| 13 | E-Hail apps as long as the apps | |
| 14 | were used for immediate travel and | |
| 15 | went through safe, secure and | |
| 16 | regulated TPEP systems. | |
| 17 | MTBOT believes strongly that | |
| 18 | the yellow cab industry must not be | |
| 19 | shut out of new technologies that | |
| 20 | can benefit our passengers now and | |
| 21 | in the future, and our drivers. | |
| 22 | And indeed, we believe that so far | |
| 23 | the pilot program has accomplished | |
| 24 | this without harming our friends in | |
| 25 | the livery and black car | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 143 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | industries. |
| 3 | The TLC did the right thing |
| 4 | by passing the one-year pilot |
| 5 | program. The TLC is doing the |
| 6 | right thing now by postponing this |
| 7 | until the program has the ability |
| 8 | to move forward closer towards its |
| 9 | completion date. And we say this |
| 10 | out of respect to our friends in |
| 11 | the livery and black car industries |
| 12 | who we certainly don't want to see |
| 13 | harmed in any way. We wouldn't |
| 14 | like it if there was a pilot |
| 15 | program that was putting us at a |
| 16 | disadvantage that we couldn't have |
| 17 | the full benefit of the full-year |
| 18 | program, and we don't think that |
| 19 | that should be imposed on another |
| 20 | industry. |
| 21 | And I would just finally |
| 22 | like to say that this should be a |
| 23 | more inclusive process of all of |
| 24 | the stakeholders. I want to thank |
| 25 | every Commissioner here for all |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 144 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | their hard work. I know and my |
| 3 | colleagues at MTBOT know how hard |
| 4 | you work and how you weigh |
| 5 | decisions and how you make |
| 6 | decisions based on the piles of |
| 7 | opposition papers and support |
| 8 | papers, and it's not an easy thing |
| 9 | to do. We recognize that, and we |
| 10 | thank you for all of your service, |
| 11 | and we hope to see many of you |
| 12 | continue. |
| 13 | And what we would like to |
| 14 | hope for is an inclusive TLC, an |
| 15 | industry altogether, that we're not |
| 16 | always battling in court, that |
| 17 | we're not always battling in |
| 18 | public, and I think the only way to |
| 19 | achieve that is through honest |
| 20 | communication and dialogue. And we |
| 21 | look forward to doing that in the |
| 22 | future. Thank you very much. |
| 23 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. |
| 24 | Ms. Desai. |
| 25 | MS. DESAI: Good morning. |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 145 |
|----|------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | On the proposed rule, I'd like to | |
| 3 | say that I actually agree with a | |
| 4 | lot of what Mr. Woloz has just | |
| 5 | said. It's indeed a poetic | |
| 6 | morning. | |
| 7 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Stars are | |
| 8 | aligned. | |
| 9 | MS. DESAI: We are in | |
| 10 | support of the E-Hail program. I | |
| 11 | understand why you have elected to | |
| 12 | postpone the vote. And I do also | |
| 13 | want to assure that people in this | |
| 14 | room from the black car and livery | |
| 15 | industry that we have always | |
| 16 | said I mean, when the | |
| 17 | outer-borough plan was first | |
| 18 | introduced, we have said from the | |
| 19 | get-go that we believe that all of | |
| 20 | us have rights in this industry, | |
| 21 | and we have to learn to work as | |
| 22 | partners across all of these | |
| 23 | different sectors. And so while | |
| 24 | the E-Hail issue is being | |
| 25 | discussed, I want to assure them | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 146 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | that we hold on to that same | |
| 3 | principle. | |
| 4 | So I'm going to reserve more | |
| 5 | of my comments for the next hearing | |
| 6 | that comes up, but in ending, I | |
| 7 | would really like to say to you, | |
| 8 | Commissioner Yassky, I have been in | |
| 9 | this industry for 17 and a half | |
| 10 | years. I have made a lot of | |
| 11 | enemies, a lot of people in this | |
| 12 | room. But I have to tell you that | |
| 13 | I wear that badge with a lot of | |
| 14 | pride, and so should you. | |
| 15 | A lot of the criticism that | |
| 16 | you've gotten is simply because you | |
| 17 | stood up for drivers. You | |
| 18 | championed a fare raise that, for | |
| 19 | the first time in history, went to | |
| 20 | the workers in this industry. You | |
| 21 | didn't put a lease cap on the table | |
| 22 | that would have gutted those | |
| 23 | incomes. You championed a vote on | |
| 24 | a historic health care and | |
| 25 | disability fund that will give a | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 147 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | workforce of predominately | |
| 3 | immigrant workers, many who have | |
| 4 | labored in blue collar professions | |
| 5 | for 15, 20, 30 years in this | |
| 6 | country without a day of benefits | |
| 7 | on the job, and thanks to your | |
| 8 | leadership, for thousands and | |
| 9 | thousands and thousands of lives, | |
| 10 | that is now going to change. | |
| 11 | You put in practice a Lease | |
| 12 | Cap Enforcement Prosecution Unit | |
| 13 | that has given this generation of | |
| 14 | taxi drivers a first sense of | |
| 15 | economic protection as the | |
| 16 | settlement that was announced this | |
| 17 | morning has shown. And, you know, | |
| 18 | the fact that the industry player | |
| 19 | that is beholden to that settlement | |
| 20 | I think showed a lot of, you know, | |
| 21 | great courage to agree to sign on | |
| 22 | to that settlement. And I'm sure | |
| 23 | much of that had to do with the | |
| 24 | relationship that you have been | |
| 25 | able to build with people, whether | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 148 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | they have agreed with you or |
| 3 | whether they have been adversaries |
| 4 | with you, throughout your tenure. |
| 5 | So, really, on behalf of the |
| 6 | drivers in this industry, I want to |
| 7 | say to you that for decades we were |
| 8 | never included, the doors were |
| 9 | never opened, we never got to see |
| 10 | the table that others got a seat |
| 11 | at. But those days have finally |
| 12 | changed in the Taxi and Limousine |
| 13 | Commission and that is because of |
| 14 | your leadership, and thanks to the |
| 15 | leadership of the Commissioners. |
| 16 | Those of you who also have |
| 17 | supported the rights of taxi |
| 18 | drivers and whether you agreed with |
| 19 | us or you disagreed with us, you |
| 20 | stated in public whatever you said |
| 21 | to us in private, unlike other |
| 22 | commissioners who may have said one |
| 23 | thing in private and said another |
| 24 | in public. |
| 25 | So, I want to thank you for |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 149 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | your courage and I want to thank | |
| 3 | you for your dedication to the taxi | |
| 4 | drivers. Thank you. | |
| 5 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 6 | So, really not much to add to that. | |
| 7 | Your statement, Ms. Desai, means an | |
| 8 | enormous amount to me, and I just | |
| 9 | want to thank you for those words. | |
| 10 | Like, I think, most probably | |
| 11 | all of my colleagues here on the | |
| 12 | Commission, what drew me to public | |
| 13 | service in the first place was the | |
| 14 | belief that there's a role for | |
| 15 | government in helping to stand up | |
| 16 | for folks who have less power | |
| 17 | outside of government. And there's | |
| 18 | a lot of things that we do in | |
| 19 | government, there's a lot of | |
| 20 | business, there's a lot of ordinary | |
| 21 | kind of, just trying to make the | |
| 22 | trains run on time. But | |
| 23 | fundamentally, what makes work in | |
| 24 | government different from working | |
| 25 | in other places is you have a | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 150 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | chance once in a while to strike a | |
| 3 | little bit of a blow for justice. | |
| 4 | And I do think we've done some of | |
| 5 | that, and that's with your help. | |
| 6 | And that's why your statement means | |
| 7 | so much to me. Thank you. | |
| 8 | MS. MARINO: Mr. Chairman, I | |
| 9 | just want to make a remark, being | |
| 10 | that this is your last day. I | |
| 11 | don't know if you've noticed, but | |
| 12 | we haven't always agreed on things, | |
| 13 | and I do want to wish you very well | |
| 14 | in your new endeavors. | |
| 15 | And despite our differences, | |
| 16 | it has been an absolute pleasure | |
| 17 | this past I've been on this | |
| 18 | Commission for two and a half | |
| 19 | years, and this past year, 2013, as | |
| 20 | the other one and a half years, | |
| 21 | it's really been a challenge and a | |
| 22 | pleasure. | |
| 23 | And one thing I will say | |
| 24 | about all my colleagues is that | |
| 25 | everyone is very bright and | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 151 |
|----|-------------------------------------|
| 2 | dedicated, and it's and I really |
| 3 | wish you well. |
| 4 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. |
| 5 | Well, with that |
| 6 | MS. POLANCO: No, I want to |
| 7 | say something. |
| 8 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Yes. What |
| 9 | I meant was, I recognize |
| 10 | Commissioner Polanco. |
| 11 | MS. POLANCO: (Inaudible) |
| 12 | everyone make a speech or anything. |
| 13 | But I also want to echo what |
| 14 | everyone has said, like their |
| 15 | sentiments. |
| 16 | I work with you directly |
| 17 | with the Boro Taxi, so that's what |
| 18 | I will talk a little bit about |
| 19 | because that was something so major |
| 20 | that the previous administration, I |
| 21 | mean, mayors and so forth, have |
| 22 | tried to, but really no one could. |
| 23 | And basically, I remember from the |
| 24 | beginning the way that it was |
| 25 | shaping up to be and then it |
| | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 152 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | changed completely, and now we have | |
| 3 | what we have, and it's working | |
| 4 | perfectly well, I wouldn't use | |
| 5 | the word "perfectly," but it's | |
| 6 | working. So I want to thank you | |
| 7 | for your courage during that time. | |
| 8 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you. | |
| 9 | MS. POLANCO: And it's been | |
| 10 | a pleasure to work with you and | |
| 11 | always with the phone calls and so | |
| 12 | forth, I really appreciate it. | |
| 13 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: At all | |
| 14 | hours, you know. But you never | |
| 15 | know, sometimes I fear people are | |
| 16 | most relaxed around midnight and | |
| 17 | it's a perfect time to chat. | |
| 18 | Well, thank you. You know, | |
| 19 | just on that, thank you for saying | |
| 20 | that, Lauvy (phonetic), and for | |
| 21 | your friendship and collegiality. | |
| 22 | And on the theme of economic | |
| 23 | justice, just because it is | |
| 24 | something that's kind of, to me, at | |
| 25 | the heart of everything, there was | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 153 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | an article that just came out | |
| 3 | yesterday profiling one of the Boro | |
| 4 | Taxi drivers whose income has gone | |
| 5 | from 700 bucks a week, working just | |
| 6 | prearranged, to 1100 because now he | |
| 7 | can fill that interstitial time | |
| 8 | when he is waiting for a | |
| 9 | prearranged call, essentially, with | |
| 10 | work. And it's work that's in the | |
| 11 | outer boroughs, so it wouldn't be | |
| 12 | coming from the yellows. | |
| 13 | I mean, that's the | |
| 14 | difference between a driver that | |
| 15 | every week has to worry about | |
| 16 | making the rent and the driver that | |
| 17 | can put some Christmas gifts under | |
| 18 | the tree. It's just, I think | |
| 19 | well, fundamentally, it was for the | |
| 20 | passengers, but that aspect of it, | |
| 21 | I think is just wonderful. So, | |
| 22 | thank you. | |
| 23 | MR. GONZALES: Yeah, I'd | |
| 24 | also like to say thank you, David, | |
| 25 | for all your leadership at your | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 154 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | time here. | |
| 3 | And also, previously with | |
| 4 | Matt Daus, with respect to one of | |
| 5 | the things that I've noticed, and | |
| 6 | it's been very helpful for me as | |
| 7 | far as trying to disseminate the | |
| 8 | myriad of materials and what have | |
| 9 | you, is that the level of data, | |
| 10 | level of objectivity that we're now | |
| 11 | able to arrive at conclusions where | |
| 12 | I believe are in the most balanced | |
| 13 | manner, which we probably did not | |
| 14 | have prior to the previous two, but | |
| 15 | I do thank you for ushering that | |
| 16 | forward for us. | |
| 17 | CHAIRMAN YASSKY: Thank you, | |
| 18 | Ed. And you're reminding me, | |
| 19 | somewhat embarrassedly, that in | |
| 20 | talking about all the staff | |
| 21 | earlier, I didn't single out | |
| 22 | specifically the policy and | |
| 23 | external affairs staff which does | |
| 24 | work extraordinarily hard and kind | |
| 25 | of astounds me daily, or but | |
| | | |

| 1 | TLC NYC 12/19/13 | 155 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | astounds me weekly or biweekly with | |
| 3 | the stuff that they produce. You | |
| 4 | know, maps, because I didn't know | |
| 5 | you could do this kind of thing, | |
| 6 | but maps that make crystal clear to | |
| 7 | you at a glance what actually is | |
| 8 | going on out in the world. And I | |
| 9 | am super proud that we've built | |
| 10 | that capacity here. | |
| 11 | And it's peopled by really | |
| 12 | bright folks who could probably not | |
| 13 | sell their service, but probably be | |
| 14 | employed in the private sector | |
| 15 | earning a fair bit more because | |
| 16 | they have the kind of skills that | |
| 17 | are valued in industries like | |
| 18 | yours. And the fact that they're | |
| 19 | working here is great, and I really | |
| 20 | hope that the agency can keep that. | |
| 21 | Thank you, Ed. | |
| 22 | With that, the meeting is | |
| 23 | adjourned even before noon. How | |
| 24 | about that. Meeting is adjourned. | |
| 25 | (Time noted: 11:48 a.m.) | |
| | | |

| 1 | | 156 |
|----|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 2 | CERTIFICATION | |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | STATE OF NEW YORK)) ss.: | |
| 5 | COUNTY OF NEW YORK) | |
| 6 | I, MARGARET CRANE, a | |
| 7 | Notary Public within and for the | |
| 8 | State of New York, do hereby | |
| 9 | certify: | |
| 10 | I reported the proceedings | |
| 11 | in the within-entitled matter, and | |
| 12 | that the within transcript is a | |
| 13 | true record of such proceedings. | |
| 14 | I further certify that I am | |
| 15 | not related to any of the parties | |
| 16 | to this action by blood or marriage | |
| 17 | and that I am in no way interested | |
| 18 | in the outcome of this matter. | |
| 19 | IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have | |
| 20 | hereunto set my hand this 22nd day | |
| 21 | of December, 2013. | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | MARGARET CRANE | |
| 25 | | |
| | | |
| | | |

| Α | addressing (1) 83:24 | alterations (1) 62:20 |
|------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|
| \$1.1 (1) 4:24 | adjourned (3) 73:9 155:23,24 | Alternatives (1) 67:9 |
| \$1.2 (2) 15:24 16:11 | adjust (1) 9:7 | altogether (1) 144:15 |
| \$100,000 (1) 18:14 | administration (15) 27:24 38:5 | amend (4) 73:23 88:6 92:25 93:7 |
| | 39:11 72:17,20 75:2 82:22 83:9 | amended (2) 95:16 103:2 |
| \$200,000 (1) 18:15 | 83:12,15 97:18 107:9 122:11 | amendment (1) 86:14 |
| \$40,000 (1) 55:14 | 141:15 151:20 | amendments (1) 94:19 |
| \$50,000 (1) 55:14 | Administrative (2) 90:10,17 | amount (4) 17:21 57:6 104:24 |
| \$500,000 (1) 16:6 | admit (1) 90:11 | 149:8 |
| \$700,000 (1) 16:2 | adopt (2) 25:8 26:2 | amounts (1) 18:12 |
| a.m (4) 1:15 4:6 5:9 155:25 | | |
| Ab (2) 94:6 100:17 | adopted (3) 25:16 26:14 96:8 | analysis (4) 106:18 137:3 139:4 |
| ability (6) 86:22 87:10 111:17,21 | adopting (1) 95:15 | analyze (4) 89:3 105:18 107:10, |
| 115:23 143:7 | adoption (1) 25:5 | Andrew (3) 3:6 103:23 108:7 |
| able (8) 42:12 58:15 64:3 99:6 | adults (1) 111:8 | anecdotal (1) 31:22 |
| 110:14 139:12 147:25 154:11 | adversaries (1) 148:3 | announce (1) 4:14 |
| absolute (1) 150:16 | adversary (1) 118:19 | announced (2) 44:20 147:16 |
| absolutely (4) 16:19 22:11 44:14 | advice (1) 140:24 | announcement (1) 13:20 |
| 109:20 | advise (3) 56:6 105:10 119:21 | answer (4) 9:3 41:20 106:14 115 |
| absorbed (1) 64:7 | affairs (1) 154:23 | answered (1) 121:13 |
| abstention (1) 96:7 | affection (1) 21:16 | answers (2) 24:8 121:18 |
| abstentions (1) 96:2 | after-market (3) 34:3,14 62:20 | anybody (4) 30:13 113:7 123:18 |
| accept (2) 28:3,4 | afternoon (2) 54:12 128:10 | 123:19 |
| accepted (2) 5:7,20 | Afterward (1) 55:11 | anymore (1) 21:23 |
| | agency (9) 20:12 23:15 42:5 43:11 | anyway (4) 42:24 122:8 138:16 |
| accessibility (6) 10:4,21 11:4 | 121:4 124:22 136:23 137:21 | 139:23 |
| 62:23 64:23,25 | 155:20 | apologetic (1) 9:21 |
| accessible (10) 5:4,23 6:6,8,17 | agency's (1) 131:11 | apologize (4) 97:20 98:19 111:2 |
| 50:15 51:21 60:2,3,9 | agenda (3) 25:2 26:17 43:24 | 120:17 |
| accident (2) 33:11 67:14 | agent (2) 105:2,3 | app (2) 127:6 137:5 |
| Accident/Collision (1) 34:15 | aggregate (1) 18:13 | apparently (3) 10:13,17 13:21 |
| accomplish (2) 27:23,25 | | |
| accomplished (3) 29:10,11 142:23 | ago (8) 14:7,8 18:7,23 28:12 35:10 | appeal (2) 41:7,7 |
| accomplishes (1) 80:19 | 62:5 105:13 | appealed (1) 63:10 |
| accomplishment (1) 45:17 | agree (13) 13:2 47:6 77:24 78:12 | appear (1) 30:24 |
| accomplishments (2) 119:18 | 81:13 88:8,13 89:14 111:18 | APPEARANCES (1) 2:2 |
| 124:22 | 119:25 122:21 145:3 147:21 | appeared (2) 36:13 74:3 |
| account (7) 7:24 8:15 90:3 117:24 | agreeably (1) 110:15 | appears (3) 8:19 73:4,5 |
| 129:12,13 137:8 | agreed (3) 148:2,18 150:12 | applaud (3) 51:25 70:10 120:22 |
| accurate (1) 133:12 | agreement (1) 10:23 | Applicant (2) 2:17 25:21 |
| accustomed (1) 60:11 | ahead (3) 85:10 105:19 114:23 | Application (5) 102:4,17,19,23 |
| achieve (4) 11:16 52:4 53:25 | AIDS (1) 48:18 | 103:16 |
| 144:19 | air (18) 1:8 26:20 37:16 38:11 | applications (2) 25:17 114:7 |
| achievements (1) 24:23 | 58:14 62:17 68:23 74:2 87:20,21 | applied (3) 28:5 102:14 133:9 |
| | 88:5,18 90:21 91:4 93:14,15,19 | applies (1) 128:15 |
| achieving (1) 17:13 | 94:22 | apply (2) 19:2 102:5 |
| acknowledged (1) 12:18 | air-bag (1) 69:4 | appreciate (10) 13:15 49:16 |
| acquired (2) 135:23 136:10 | airport (1) 113:18 | 116:23 117:21,23 122:23 136: |
| acting (1) 37:5 | airports (1) 102:8 | 137:9 139:8 152:12 |
| action (3) 78:11 81:5 156:16 | aligned (1) 145:8 | appreciates (1) 20:8 |
| add (1) 149:6 | Allen (1) 22:3 | appreciative (1) 125:19 |
| added (2) 91:3 95:2 | | |
| addition (3) 48:4 94:24 124:7 | Alliance (1) 67:11 | approach (2) 84:6 106:21 |
| additional (5) 10:11 16:6 58:6 | allow (5) 53:14 78:2,9 87:9 133:12 | appropriate (5) 80:14,22 83:11 |
| 120:15 140:19 | allowing (1) 27:17 | 88:17 121:19 |
| address (7) 24:4,6 56:17 61:4 | allows (3) 11:21 47:10 103:19 | appropriately (1) 120:2 |
| | alongside (1) 141:14 | approval (2) 25:24 34:4 |

| approve (1) 26:4 | 95:17 | 107:7,8 111:17,20 132:19 137:25 |
|--|---|---|
| approved (8) 29:17 33:19 34:21 | ayes (3) 25:11 26:8 84:20 | better (14) 20:11 21:9,24 35:19,20 |
| 51:9 65:8 68:8 95:3,7 | | 81:18 82:6 97:19 118:11 119:4 |
| approving (1) 53:2 | B | 121:24 122:5 125:13 131:18 |
| approximately (2) 15:21 29:5 | B (1) 103:4 | Beyer (1) 52:19 |
| apps (7) 105:16 106:4,6,24 107:2 | back (12) 46:25 47:6 59:4 64:16 | beyond (1) 37:5 |
| 142:13,13 | 73:6 76:25 78:14,21 81:24 86:3 | Bhairavi (2) 3:11 120:11 |
| April (1) 75:10 | 110:16 129:13 | bids (3) 5:7,19,20 |
| arbitrary (1) 62:24 | backlog (1) 10:3 | Biederman (1) 66:22 |
| areas (1) 106:11 | backseat (2) 71:6 88:19 | big (10) 10:6 42:20,21 47:5 54:15 |
| arguably (1) 67:20 | backwards (1) 58:4 | 54:21 59:12 99:25 112:25 128:22 |
| Arout (14) 2:8 4:9 50:3 76:5 84:25 | badge (1) 146:13 | biomechanic (1) 46:6 |
| 95:21 96:15,17,21 98:3,6,12 | bag (1) 58:14 | bit (4) 18:25 150:3 151:18 155:15 |
| 99:11,15 | bags (2) 38:11 68:24 | biweekly (1) 155:2 |
| arrive (1) 154:11 | balance (2) 118:17 137:22 | black (8) 3:5 22:14 72:6 112:21 |
| article (2) 100:9 153:2 | balanced (1) 154:12 | 121:9 142:25 143:11 145:14 |
| asked (2) 9:15 46:14 | bantered (1) 85:24 | blatant (1) 64:15 |
| aspect (1) 153:20 | bar (1) 105:6 | blatantly (1) 50:21 |
| aspects (2) 56:7,7 | Barnes (12) 2:24 54:8 55:23,24 | bleed (1) 138:15 |
| assemble (1) 94:5 | 56:2,23 59:9 60:24 61:4,6,9,20 | bleeds (1) 138:15 |
| assessing (1) 137:16 | barrier (1) 38:14 | blood (1) 156:16 |
| assistance (3) 121:10 136:24 | base (5) 25:17 104:25 133:3,4,20 | bloodborne (1) 48:17 |
| 137:9 | based (6) 74:19 132:19 134:20 | Bloomberg (4) 27:24 38:25 124:23 |
| assistant (2) 17:25 67:5 | 136:9 139:21 144:6 | 141:15 |
| Association (2) 31:9 67:2 | bases (4) 25:23 26:4,5 133:2 | blow (1) 150:3 |
| assume (2) 57:12 67:24 | basically (6) 75:14 76:25 78:17 | blue (1) 147:4 |
| assumption (1) 16:22 | 94:4 113:21 151:23 | blur (1) 18:24 |
| assumptions (1) 7:19 | basis (3) 88:2 104:6 132:8 | board (5) 62:4 72:4 97:18 120:22 |
| assure (3) 101:14 145:13,25 | battling (2) 144:16,17 | 141:8 |
| Astoria (1) 112:11 | bear (1) 11:9 | body (1) 32:21 |
| astounds (2) 154:25 155:2 | Beaver (2) 1:14 5:11 | book (1) 119:18 |
| atlas (3) 47:18,19 48:9 | beginning (4) 4:4 18:24 124:18 | born (1) 115:6 |
| attached (3) 57:23 58:3,10 | 151:24 | borne (1) 15:12 |
| attacks (1) 111:5 | behalf (1) 148:5 | Boro (2) 151:17 153:3 |
| attempt (7) 35:25 36:3 37:6 62:13 | beholden (1) 147:19 | borough (2) 42:17 133:4 |
| 63:4,9 64:15 | belief (6) 12:9 16:17 109:21,22 | boroughs (3) 84:2 106:8 153:11 |
| attorney (5) 14:12,16 15:6 17:16 | 125:16 149:14 | bow (1) 124:20 |
| 52:19 | believe (21) 11:2 15:14 16:13 17:3 | box (1) 112:3 |
| Auchincloss (1) 67:9 | 23:25 39:24 41:21 61:22 75:11 | bragged (1) 104:8 |
| auction (4) 4:22 5:18 6:12 8:8 | 80:18 86:13 90:17 91:14 96:25 | brevity (1) 117:21 |
| auctioned (1) 5:5 | 98:2 113:6 117:11 140:13 142:22 | bridge (2) 91:9,11 |
| audible (1) 112:3 | 145:19 154:12 | brief (3) 94:16 118:8 120:21 |
| authority (3) 35:15 36:14 37:6 | believed (1) 13:5 | briefly (2) 13:17 72:9 |
| authorizes (2) 6:14 7:15 | believer (2) 29:4 113:2 | bright (2) 150:25 155:12 bring (2) 75:25 76:25 |
| auto (1) 70:7 automotive (2) 56:7,12 | believes (2) 142:4,17 belong (1) 142:10 | |
| available (3) 34:20 113:8 130:24 | belt (3) 30:18,22 81:17 | bringing (5) 72:12 73:6 100:22 132:16,18 |
| AVENUE (1) 1:22 | belts (3) 30:10,22 01.17 belts (3) 30:21 33:7 82:4 | broadcast (1) 102:10 |
| average (1) 4:22 | beneficial (1) 31:14 | broken (1) 23:13 |
| Avik (4) 3:10 120:17 128:8 130:12 | benefit (9) 31:15 53:9 58:6 65:20 | brought (2) 20:14 104:20 |
| avoidable (1) 30:12 | 129:24 141:18 142:9,20 143:17 | Bryant (1) 66:24 |
| Avoidance (2) 34:12,15 | benefits (2) 57:19 147:6 | buckling (1) 30:12 |
| aware (1) 68:6 | benefitting (1) 129:6 | bucks (1) 153:5 |
| aye (7) 25:10 26:7 84:15,16,17,18 | best (10) 13:11 23:14 88:15 105:12 | budget (3) 7:17,20 23:2 |
| ayo (1) 20.10 20.1 07.10,10,11,10 | | |
| | 1 | 1 |

| build (1) 147:25 | 91:18 92:14,20 95:21 | 87:20 104:4 105:23 147:10 |
|---|------------------------------------|--|
| built (1) 155:9 | carrying (1) 57:17 | changed (2) 148:12 152:2 |
| bulk (2) 10:6 16:18 | cars (13) 10:17 22:7,7,8 41:22 | changes (3) 91:14 93:8 94:21 |
| bunch (1) 122:16 | 54:20 61:10 67:24 83:25 106:11 | chapter (1) 95:9 |
| burden (1) 91:3 | 107:3 108:22 115:8 | characteristically (1) 108:3 |
| bus (1) 67:23 | case (4) 31:19 32:18 47:19 132:20 | charge (1) 46:10 |
| business (13) 4:12 5:22 20:19 21:9 | cases (1) 31:22 | charged (1) 103:14 |
| 24:25 94:10 96:16 100:20 104:4 | catch (2) 113:22 126:24 | chargers (1) 43:4 |
| 108:21 113:19 116:21 149:20 | cause (2) 9:7 68:22 | Charter (1) 39:6 |
| businesses (1) 133:17 | caused (1) 52:13 | chassis (1) 32:22 |
| busy (1) 100:25 | centers (1) 130:23 | chat (1) 152:17 |
| buyers (1) 36:23 | CEO (1) 130:12 | cheating (1) 15:25 |
| buying (1) 28:22 | certain (9) 62:19 63:21 64:13 87:7 | Chevy (1) 54:23 |
| bypass (1) 36:3 | 87:10,23 111:4 133:20 135:5 | chief (2) 46:10 71:19 |
| bystander (1) 48:21 | certainly (12) 8:17 11:8 16:17 | child (1) 60:17 |
| Bystanders (1) 48:14 | 43:24 50:7 59:23 91:7,9 97:15 | chin (1) 131:13 |
| | 98:21 111:9 143:12 | Chiodo (6) 2:21 35:4 44:5 45:20,23 |
| C | certify (2) 156:9,14 | 45:25 |
| C (4) 103:3,4 156:2,2 | certifying (1) 63:20 | choice (1) 30:9 |
| cab (7) 46:19 68:6 113:22 115:24 | cervical (2) 47:17 48:10 | choose (2) 65:5 116:22 |
| 126:23 127:20 142:18 | cetera (2) 117:17 133:22 | Chorus (2) 25:11 26:8 |
| cabin (1) 58:11 | chair (6) 7:7 19:22 31:11 45:14 | chose (1) 137:20 |
| cabs (5) 42:20 43:14 112:18,21 | 61:25 136:21 | Chowdhury (11) 2:23 45:24 54:6 |
| 116:11 | Chair's (1) 25:2 | 54:11,13 126:7 128:7,9,11,24,25 |
| call (6) 22:13 24:11 42:2 95:13 | chairman (141) 4:2 5:17 6:3,11 7:3 | Chris (3) 2:17 25:20 26:14 |
| 130:18 153:9 | 9:12,20,25 13:14 23:23 25:12,15 | Christmas (1) 153:17 |
| called (3) 47:16 48:15 86:2 | 25:25 26:9,12,16 27:11,12 31:6 | circumvent (3) 27:21 35:21 36:18 |
| calls (4) 85:18 86:20 97:2 152:11 | 34:25 39:15 41:16,25 44:13 45:2 | circumvention (1) 37:3 |
| calm (1) 119:2 | 45:12,19 50:8,10 53:18 54:4 | cited (1) 33:5 |
| cap (6) 14:6 18:5 103:3,10 146:21 | 55:22,25 56:21 58:25 59:14 | cities (1) 115:8 |
| 147:12 | 60:22 61:3,7,19 66:5,9,25 70:22 | citizen (2) 66:14 114:13 |
| CAPA (1) 73:22 | 71:11,16 73:11,16 74:10 75:23 | city (33) 1:3 4:21 10:22 13:7 15:16 |
| capability (2) 15:7 23:11 | 76:15 77:12,20 78:25 79:2,8,14 | 16:7 20:18 28:5,9,14,16 35:17 |
| capable (2) 14:20 17:19 | 79:22 80:2,6 84:10,19 85:5,9 | 36:11 37:17 39:5 46:12,13 50:14 |
| capacity (2) 119:15 155:10 | 86:17 87:5 88:8 89:10 91:23 92:3 | 50:20 51:17 53:4 64:10 67:19 |
| capital (1) 114:6 | 92:10,15,23 93:13,18,22 94:6,12 | 70:3,9,20 71:8 74:4 90:9 115:5 |
| capricious (1) 62:24 | 94:15 95:12 96:19 97:16,25 | 115:12 129:3 139:4 |
| caps (1) 13:25 | 98:10,14,20 99:13,17 100:5,17 | clarified (1) 131:24 |
| car (27) 3:5 6:8 10:16 22:14 38:21 | 101:12,22,25 103:22 104:11,15 | clarify (3) 41:12 79:19 137:12 |
| 40:7 41:13,17 42:13 46:23 54:15 | 108:2 110:21 111:19 112:2 | clean (1) 37:16 |
| 55:9,10,17,18 56:14 59:8 60:17 | 114:18,22 116:15 117:20 119:5 | clear (12) 14:8 16:16 36:16,19 37:4 |
| 64:24 68:11 72:7 102:9 121:9 | 119:24 120:8,14 121:25 122:6,22 | 38:10 40:2,19 43:18 87:17 100:4 |
| 129:3 142:25 143:11 145:14 | 122:25 123:4 124:4,8,16 125:22 | 155:6 |
| car's (1) 55:11 | 127:22 128:6,13 130:2,10 133:14 | clearly (1) 121:3 |
| card (2) 102:24 103:7 | 133:25 134:9 136:18 138:24 | Clinical (1) 67:5 |
| cards (2) 125:5 129:5 | 140:3,8,18,23 141:14 144:23 | close (6) 9:10 10:14 22:18 79:4 |
| care (8) 39:8 65:6 100:12 115:15 | 145:7 149:5 150:8 151:4,8 152:8 | 93:2 136:16 |
| 115:16,18,22 146:24 | 152:13 154:17 | close-by (1) 126:23 |
| careful (2) 9:4 100:13 | challenge (3) 70:6,11 150:21 | closed (2) 4:19 10:10 |
| carefully (2) 135:23 136:10 | Chamber (1) 67:8 | closer (1) 143:8 |
| cargo (1) 38:20 | championed (2) 146:18,23 | closings (1) 10:11 |
| Carmel (2) 130:13 137:4 | chance (5) 31:17 72:21 126:10 | Code (2) 90:10,17 |
| Carone (15) 2:7 4:9 12:7,20 79:2 | 127:7 150:2 | Cohen (1) 17:24 |
| 79:11 80:8 84:18,21 88:10,11 | change (7) 58:19 68:22 78:19 | cohesive (1) 72:23 |
| | | |
| | 1 | 1 |

| | 1 | 1 |
|-----------------------------------|--|---|
| coin (2) 135:12,13 | 66:12,20 74:9 76:3,18 84:20,24 | congratulate (1) 13:10 |
| coincidence (3) 41:24 42:2 83:5 | 95:20 96:9 100:19 102:2 107:14 | congratulations (4) 44:23 45:16 |
| cold (1) 21:13 | 110:6 124:17 138:6 141:6 148:15 | 49:24 50:7 |
| Colin (1) 139:14 | 148:22 | connecting (2) 127:11,19 |
| collaborator (1) 118:19 | commit (2) 9:5 70:18 | connection (1) 138:17 |
| collar (1) 147:4 | commitment (1) 99:8 | cons (1) 122:2 |
| colleague (1) 12:6 | Committee (1) 49:22 | conscience (1) 97:23 |
| colleagues (8) 23:18 25:7 44:18 | common (5) 15:17,22 59:5,17 | consider (5) 70:7 86:10 101:9 |
| 82:18 110:7 144:3 149:11 150:24 | 60:15 | 128:20 134:17 |
| collect (1) 133:23 | communication (1) 144:20 | considerable (1) 64:8 |
| collected (3) 131:17,21 132:6 | community (1) 37:14 | consideration (2) 34:24 116:4 |
| collection (8) 15:16 131:2,25 | commuter (1) 67:23 | considered (5) 31:16 33:15 48:6 |
| 134:21 135:10 136:5,25 137:3 | compared (1) 32:10 | 86:4,6 |
| collective (1) 24:14 | compelled (1) 72:9 | considering (2) 27:19 30:5 |
| collectively (1) 81:13 | compelling (1) 85:17 | consistent (1) 96:10 |
| college (2) 67:7 116:6 | competing (1) 90:5 | CONSTANCE (1) 2:13 |
| collegiality (1) 152:21 | competition (2) 29:21 31:2 | constant (1) 117:15 |
| collision (2) 34:12 60:19 | compiled (1) 134:19 | consumer (1) 23:9 |
| collisions (1) 38:17 | compl (1) 134:11 | contact (1) 102:11 |
| combined (1) 18:16 | complaints (1) 23:12 | context (2) 16:9 19:11 |
| come (16) 5:14 9:6 20:18 30:14 | completed (3) 18:25 63:21 68:4 | continue (11) 8:10 22:21 34:9 |
| 39:11 62:6 78:5,14,21 81:10,24 | completely (4) 80:16 89:14 100:3 | 79:16 81:15 105:12 110:17 |
| 92:7 97:3,18 105:18 135:16 | 152:2 | 127:10 128:18 137:21 144:12 |
| comes (4) 94:8 135:19 136:7 146:6 | completion (1) 143:9 | CONTINUED (1) 3:2 |
| comfort (1) 51:13 | complex (1) 104:19 | contrary (1) 107:4 |
| comfortably (1) 42:13 | complicated (1) 139:10 | contributed (1) 71:21 |
| coming (9) 20:4 23:3 70:5 71:17 | comply (2) 86:23 87:11 | contribution (2) 89:11 138:22 |
| 72:18 82:22 108:10 141:9 153:12 | components (3) 58:8,9 131:5 | controversy (1) 74:20 |
| commend (1) 130:19 | compromise (1) 79:3 | conventional (2) 46:23 48:2 |
| commended (1) 72:12 | compromised (3) 11:15 69:11 | conversation (1) 110:16 |
| comment (8) 46:14 60:14 74:5 | 80:23 | converting (3) 10:3 130:21 136:3 |
| 80:10 83:18 93:21,25 101:21 | Comptroller (1) 37:17 | core (1) 125:16 |
| comments (9) 32:25 73:18 74:7 | compulsion (1) 104:3 | Cornell (1) 67:6 |
| 83:2 86:20 112:5 120:4 124:8 | concept (4) 28:4,7,8 131:12 | corners (1) 40:20 |
| 146:5 | conceptualizing (1) 137:2 | Corp (1) 121:10 |
| Commerce (1) 67:8 | conceptually (1) 88:14 | Corporation (4) 35:16 38:8 39:14 |
| Commission (28) 1:4 2:4 4:6 7:8 | concern (5) 48:7,19 76:10 89:16 | 66:25 |
| 12:8,23 25:22 29:17 45:8 46:2 | 89:17 | correct (4) 41:6 59:14 78:25 92:19 |
| 56:5 65:4,24 72:11 73:2 80:15 | concerned (3) 37:15 61:16 66:14 | correction (1) 102:13 |
| 85:20 86:25 91:10 94:18 107:6 | concerning (2) 46:15 52:21 | correctly (2) 57:23 58:15 |
| 110:18 111:16 122:15 126:9 | concerns (2) 19:16 48:5 | cost (2) 31:15 33:13 |
| 148:13 149:12 150:18 | conclude (5) 12:24 13:17 70:23 | cost-effective (1) 68:25 |
| Commission's (1) 70:13 | 79:6 109:15 | costs (1) 64:8 |
| commissioner (45) 2:6,7,8,9,10,11 | concluded (3) 15:13 18:10 78:20 | council (3) 28:14 90:9,16 |
| 2:12,13 17:23,25 28:13 29:8 44:7 | conclusion (1) 72:18 | counsel (4) 2:14 17:19,20 35:17 |
| 44:11,18 45:6 49:25 50:6 67:3 | conclusions (1) 154:11 | Counsel's (1) 38:9 |
| 72:3 73:13 74:11 76:4,6 77:13,23 | condemned (2) 35:9 37:17 | count (6) 16:25 84:19,24 95:18,24 |
| 79:10 80:10 82:19 88:10,12 | conditioning (14) 1:8 26:20 62:18 | 96:3 |
| 89:12,13 90:23 91:18 95:25 96:4 | 74:3 87:21,22 88:5,19 90:21 91:4 | country (1) 147:6 |
| 96:15 98:3 99:14 122:17 132:3 | 93:14,15,19 94:23 | COUNTY (1) 156:4 |
| 143:25 146:8 151:10 | conduct (1) 20:19 | couple (11) 4:10 9:16 10:2 14:7 |
| commissioners (31) 4:7 7:4 13:23 | confine (1) 88:21 | 39:20 56:17 81:9 82:20 109:2 |
| 27:10 31:11 35:6 40:24 44:15 | confirms (1) 58:14 | 121:11,15 |
| 49:21 53:13,21 55:25 61:25 | conflict (1) 19:25 | courage (3) 147:21 149:2 152:7 |
| | | |
| | 1 | 1 |

| | I | I |
|-------------------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|
| course (15) 7:6 14:17 22:16 23:19 | 141:23 143:9 | deploy (2) 38:11 58:15 |
| 41:2 52:10 71:18 75:9 77:19 78:3 | dated (1) 63:19 | deployment (1) 68:23 |
| 78:17 121:2 128:23 136:14 138:6 | daughter (1) 67:15 | deprived (1) 16:6 |
| court (17) 27:22 35:10,21,23,24 | Daus (2) 125:7 154:4 | deputy (1) 17:23 |
| 36:2,7,12,17,21 37:4 39:4 41:4 | David (14) 2:6,22,24 18:2 28:13 | deriving (1) 136:10 |
| 43:22,22 141:17 144:16 | 45:21,23 49:19,21 50:11 52:19 | Desai (7) 3:11 120:11 140:20 |
| court's (2) 23:6 63:7 | 54:7 56:2 153:24 | 144:24,25 145:9 149:7 |
| courteously (1) 111:3 | day (11) 20:3 21:15,15 24:6 37:10 | describe (1) 26:23 |
| courtesy (2) 78:7,9 | 100:10 111:15,22 147:6 150:10 | described (1) 93:9 |
| courts (6) 35:19 40:23 41:10 51:6 | 156:20 | describes (1) 41:3 |
| 53:24 65:14 | days (10) 5:22 12:8 18:23,24 20:3 | deserve (2) 19:18 84:2 |
| Crane (3) 1:20 156:6,23 | 37:20 62:5 82:23 105:11 148:11 | deserves (3) 12:14 29:18 50:2 |
| crash (61) 1:8 26:20 31:20 32:2,2 | deadline (1) 74:6 | deserving (1) 141:22 |
| 32:12,15,20,23 33:17,22 34:6 | deal (5) 11:19 12:15 23:12 74:18 | design (15) 31:23 32:10 39:11 |
| 38:3,8,12,15 40:4,10 43:16 50:18 | 83:9 | 46:18 56:10,14 58:20,21 67:11 |
| 51:10 52:3,23 53:15 57:10,17 | dealt (1) 11:6 | 67:12 68:20 69:4,5 81:23 82:6 |
| 58:6,13,17 61:9 62:10,12,19 | DeArcy (30) 2:9 44:7,16,19,25 45:6 | designed (9) 36:11,22 38:22 42:24 |
| 63:15 64:19,21 65:3 67:18 69:9 | 45:18 49:25 59:20 75:19 77:23 | 57:3,5 63:5 68:11 70:2 |
| 69:14,18,23 71:7,9 73:24 74:14 | 78:23 84:25 85:4,7,11 86:18 87:6 | designing (2) 83:21 90:25 |
| 75:15 79:24 80:3 81:18 82:9 | 88:12 89:13 90:23 91:20 92:2,9 | designs (2) 32:17 69:6 |
| 84:13 85:13,22 87:18 88:22 89:2 | 92:21 94:9 95:21 101:11 110:19 | desire (1) 119:14 |
| 89:7 90:15 96:7 113:11 | 110:22 | despised (1) 37:12 |
| crashes (2) 32:6,7 | debate (2) 43:3 109:10 | despite (4) 36:20 105:20 141:20 |
| create (2) 38:14 100:16 | debit (2) 102:24 103:6 | 150:15 |
| creating (2) 14:13 60:7 | debris (1) 38:2 | determine (3) 32:16,22 68:13 |
| credit (7) 12:15 18:21 19:18 | decades (3) 14:3 15:4 148:7 | Detroit (1) 46:12 |
| 102:24 103:6 125:4 129:5 | | developed (2) 15:4 24:18 |
| | December (8) 1:5,14 63:20 74:6 | |
| critical (3) 67:14 105:7 132:9 | 93:11 95:6,10 156:21 | device (1) 129:17 |
| criticism (1) 146:15 | decide (3) 45:14 113:10,13 | dialogue (1) 144:20 |
| Crotty (1) 35:11 | decided (1) 40:22 | dictate (1) 16:22 |
| Crown (1) 42:22 | decision (15) 36:19 41:6 63:7,11 | differ (1) 61:11 |
| crucial (1) 136:5 | 63:11 97:4 99:2,23 100:4 129:7 | difference (5) 22:11,19,21 61:15 |
| cruising (1) 126:19 | 135:20 136:8 137:25 139:15,20 | 153:14 |
| crumple (5) 37:25 46:24 56:25 | decisions (6) 7:9,11 50:23 51:8 | differences (2) 135:22 150:15 |
| 57:13 59:4 | 144:5,6 | different (5) 32:21 59:10 122:18 |
| crystal (2) 43:18 155:6 | decline (1) 138:12 | 145:23 149:24 |
| current (1) 38:9 | declined (1) 106:14 | differently (1) 77:15 |
| currently (2) 64:2 130:23 | dedicated (2) 14:21 151:2 | difficult (1) 19:9 |
| curse (1) 16:10 | dedication (1) 149:3 | dig (2) 111:11 138:21 |
| customer (1) 23:12 | deem (1) 88:18 | direct (2) 102:10 124:12 |
| customers (3) 101:7 106:3 116:21 | deeper (1) 138:21 | directly (3) 16:4 129:11 151:16 |
| | deeply (1) 17:11 | director (6) 25:18,20 27:15 46:9 |
| D | defend (1) 111:23 | 49:22 67:4 |
| daily (4) 13:22 68:5 104:8 154:25 | deficient (1) 90:2 | disability (2) 10:24 146:25 |
| Damage (1) 34:18 | deform (1) 57:4 | disabled (2) 37:14 117:16 |
| Dan (1) 66:22 | delay (3) 44:4 86:8 101:14 | disadvantage (1) 143:16 |
| danger (1) 60:7 | delayed (1) 140:24 | disagree (3) 110:14 111:3 132:2 |
| data (32) 8:18 71:7 105:18,21 | delaying (1) 141:6 | disagreed (6) 110:11,22 119:9,10 |
| 106:16 107:11 130:24,25 131:5 | deleted (1) 94:24 | 119:12 148:19 |
| 131:14,16,21 132:2,4,6,9,13 | delivered (1) 57:9 | disagreement (1) 23:20 |
| 133:18 134:8 135:9,24 136:4,11 | demand (3) 8:2,7,25 | disappoint (1) 111:2 |
| 136:14,25 137:2,5,10 138:4,7 | demonstrated (1) 41:18 | disappoints (1) 111:11 |
| 140:5 154:9 | denial (1) 26:6 | disclose (1) 33:4 |
| date (7) 5:16 7:14 12:10 65:11 95:4 | deny (1) 26:5 | discouraging (1) 106:10 |
| | | |
| | | |

Г

| discovering (1) 102:9 | dumbfounding (1) 86:9 | encouraging (1) 82:5 |
|---|---|---|
| discuss (3) 17:17 62:7 80:24 | dummies (1) 71:10 | end-around (1) 50:22 |
| discussed (1) 145:25 | | endeavors (2) 50:9 150:14 |
| discussing (1) 69:24 | Ε | ends (2) 48:9 75:10 |
| discussion (6) 52:20 89:18,21,23 | E (1) 156:2 | enemies (1) 146:11 |
| 96:11 108:12 | E-Hail (33) 1:10 75:6,17,25 96:12 | energy (2) 57:6 112:12 |
| discussions (2) 118:25 119:3 | 100:21 102:3,17,18,22 103:16 | enforced (1) 14:4 |
| disregard (1) 53:23 | 109:7 110:24 117:10 126:15,18 | enforcement (9) 14:6,14 15:11 |
| disrespectful (5) 39:3,4,5,6,7 | 126:21 128:12 129:2,6,12,23 | 17:2,22 18:2,6 21:17 147:12 |
| disseminate (1) 154:7 | 130:18 131:9,15 138:18,23 | engage (1) 135:3 |
| distributed (1) 62:5 | 141:16,21 142:5,13 145:10,24 | engineer (1) 59:24 |
| District (1) 35:11 | E-Hailing (4) 112:16 113:4,15 | engineering (2) 56:3 68:2 |
| dive (1) 47:11 | 115:17 | enhanced (2) 45:7 114:17 |
| dives (1) 48:8 | E-Hails (1) 142:10 | enjoined (1) 41:4 |
| diving (1) 47:13 | e-mail (2) 42:15,18 | enjoyed (2) 119:3 122:14 |
| Division (3) 14:18 17:22 26:3 | e-mails (1) 42:16 | enormous (2) 123:22 149:8 |
| documentation (1) 63:22 | E-Payment (4) 102:6,12,23 103:14 | enormously (4) 14:20,21,22 |
| doing (12) 22:9 56:13 81:21 97:16 | E-Prearrangement (1) 130:17 | 139:10 |
| 99:4 105:12 107:8 108:24 109:19 | earlier (6) 12:22 96:10 113:9 | ensure (3) 17:3 57:22 69:8 |
| 109:25 143:5 144:21 | 116:16 123:6 154:21 | entered (1) 10:23 |
| DoITT (2) 19:13,13 | earning (1) 155:15 | entire (3) 28:9 116:8 124:24 |
| dollars (1) 64:7 | earnings (2) 8:20 16:5 | entirely (1) 22:17 |
| door (3) 38:16 64:17 119:19 | easier (1) 126:22 | entirety (1) 18:5 |
| doors (3) 21:11 38:14 148:8 | easily (1) 30:11 | entities (1) 21:20 entitled (1) 45:7 |
| doorway (1) 73:6 double (1) 21:21 | easy (3) 24:8 129:14 144:8 echo (1) 151:13 | entity (1) 23:17 |
| doubled (1) 18:6 | echoing (1) 124:8 | entrepreneur (2) 112:12,16 |
| doubly (1) 9:21 | economic (3) 17:13 147:15 152:22 | envelope (1) 23:24 |
| doubt (4) 8:14 22:19,20 122:20 | Ed (3) 123:2 154:18 155:21 | equal (1) 132:15 |
| doubted (1) 119:14 | edges (1) 36:17 | equipment (2) 33:21 34:21 |
| downside (1) 24:10 | EDWARD (1) 2:11 | Era (1) 124:23 |
| Downtown (1) 15:18 | effect (1) 68:14 | Erhan (3) 2:18 26:25 101:17 |
| Dr (9) 2:21 35:4 44:4 45:20,22,25 | effective (2) 58:20 95:4 | Ernest (2) 2:21 35:4 |
| 52:6,19 67:4 | efficiency (2) 21:3 112:13 | especially (2) 82:25 101:13 |
| drafted (2) 86:24 89:25 | effort (6) 19:8 27:21 37:11 42:4 | essence (1) 46:17 |
| drastic (1) 30:4 | 65:12 124:13 | essentially (2) 47:11 153:9 |
| dream (2) 28:15,15 | Ehran (1) 27:15 | establish (2) 132:24 134:18 |
| drew (1) 149:12 | either (4) 34:11 47:21 60:15 102:8 | established (1) 100:6 |
| drive (1) 20:16 | either/or (1) 82:11 | establishing (2) 135:4,8 |
| driven (2) 6:5 48:25 | elected (2) 44:19 145:11 | estimation (1) 9:22 |
| driver (19) 3:9 6:20 8:5 13:25 | elegant (1) 108:3 | et (2) 117:16 133:21 |
| 30:14 31:14 33:10 55:4,13 57:25 | elements (1) 82:14 | Ethan (4) 2:20 31:8 103:23 119:20 |
| 81:6 82:15 102:22 126:12,13,24 129:6 153:14,16 | Elias (2) 2:8 50:3 | evaluated (1) 131:18 evaluation (1) 131:25 |
| drivers (29) 16:2,4 17:8,14 34:16 | eligible (1) 34:4 eliminate (2) 30:7 31:2 | Evegny (1) 15:23 |
| 36:24 37:13 70:10 103:5,13 | else's (1) 19:15 | event (5) 32:5 33:10 38:12 57:8 |
| 104:10,19,21 105:10 126:18 | Email (1) 1:24 | 64:18 |
| 127:5,8,11,15,18 128:2 129:24 | embarrassedly (1) 154:19 | eventually (1) 136:12 |
| 142:21 146:17 147:14 148:6,18 | employed (2) 105:8 155:14 | everybody (8) 19:15 22:6 54:12 |
| 149:4 153:4 | empty (1) 126:19 | 99:16 107:17 115:19 124:3 |
| driving (1) 28:25 | enabling (1) 34:17 | 128:15 |
| dubious (1) 136:6 | encourage (6) 8:9 30:19 36:11 | everyone's (2) 76:19 117:25 |
| duck (1) 24:4 | 81:16,17 82:6 | exactly (6) 27:23 35:23 52:14 |
| due (3) 29:25 31:23 33:5 | encouraged (1) 40:16 | 61:14 106:9 109:5 |
| | l | l |
| | | |

| examine (1) 131:4 |
|---|
| example (2) 32:7 62:24 |
| example (2) 52.7 02.24 |
| exceed (1) 53:22 |
| exceeded (1) 35:14 |
| exceeding (1) 36:14 |
| excellent (2) 18:20 79:8 |
| exception (3) 50:15,17 90:12 |
| exceptional (1) 15:2 |
| exceptions (1) 110:13 |
| excerpt (1) 62:2 |
| exclusive (1) 36:9 |
| exclusively (1) 74:18 |
| excuse (2) 98:6 138:10 |
| executive (2) 49:22 67:4 |
| exemption (1) 90:8 |
| |
| exemptions (1) 64:13 |
| exempts (1) 51:20 |
| existing (2) 8:24 43:14 |
| expect (1) 47:15 |
| expected (1) 10:19 |
| expensive (4) 55:9,12,19 112:24 |
| experience (3) 24:16 32:9 54:23 |
| expertise (1) 15:4 |
| expire (1) 55:16 |
| explain (4) 65:19 90:22 132:5 |
| 141:7 |
| explaining (1) 127:5 |
| explicitly (2) 103:4,12 |
| |
| avnosura (1) /8.17 |
| exposure (1) 48:17 |
| extend (1) 129:17 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 face (1) 108:5 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 face (1) 108:5 FACSIMILE (1) 1:24 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 face (1) 108:5 FACSIMILE (1) 1:24 fact (12) 10:5 32:13 43:14 46:8 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 face (1) 108:5 FACSIMILE (1) 1:24 fact (12) 10:5 32:13 43:14 46:8 48:24 76:7 85:12 98:24 110:12 |
| extend (1) 129:17 extended (1) 108:12 extensive (2) 32:8 81:22 extent (1) 123:15 external (1) 154:23 extra (1) 19:16 extraordinarily (1) 154:24 extraordinary (1) 20:5 extremely (1) 8:23 F F (1) 156:2 face (1) 108:5 FACSIMILE (1) 1:24 fact (12) 10:5 32:13 43:14 46:8 |

factory-installed (2) 62:17,21

failure (5) 31:24 33:6,8 131:15,19

fair (5) 11:13,19 53:19 98:13

factory-tested (1) 69:9 facts (2) 109:11,16

failed (2) 33:4 37:11

fails (2) 63:22 85:3

155:15 fairly (1) 107:11 families (1) 116:6 Famine (1) 49:4 far (13) 18:9,17 54:25 61:16 76:9 81:19 82:4 91:9,11 109:13 131:15 142:22 154:7 far-reaching (1) 121:3 fare (6) 102:24 103:7,17 126:20,25 146:18 fared (1) 63:23 fares (1) 106:13 faster (1) 10:18 fatality (1) 47:21 fate (2) 40:21 41:8 father (1) 126:13 favor (8) 25:10 26:7 80:7 84:12 85:15,22 95:15 96:6 fear (1) 152:15 February (5) 5:6,8,18,21 63:12 federal (5) 35:10,25 40:10 57:10 62:25 fee (1) 102:20 feedback (1) 117:15 feel (7) 7:9 17:11 73:7 77:15 83:10 110:13 139:16 fees (2) 103:8,11 felt (3) 72:9 104:3 109:10 fence (2) 121:23 122:13 FHV (1) 106:13 figure (1) 115:10 figured (1) 21:4 fill (1) 153:7 final (5) 19:21 61:22 99:18 120:10 136:8 finally (6) 23:18 53:20 63:18 107:13 143:21 148:11 find (3) 20:10 30:20 83:4 findings (2) 89:3,4 fine (2) 16:7 92:21 fines (2) 18:14 19:5 finish (1) 99:24 finishing (1) 135:25 firm (1) 12:12 first (41) 4:13,15 7:25 8:8 9:13 10:8 12:7 13:19 19:23 24:25 26:18,22,24,25 36:15 39:20 42:15,17 48:6,10 56:20,23 57:20 62:11 63:15 69:25 73:17 76:14 89:15 91:2 101:16 120:13 123:6 130:14 131:6 132:22 134:19 145:17 146:19 147:14 149:13 fit (1) 83:22 fitted (1) 57:3

five (5) 84:24 95:19 104:23 135:13 135:14 fixed (1) 9:5 flawed (1) 106:19 fleet (9) 6:19 8:5 10:7 15:15 16:18 28:9 29:9 48:25 70:21 fleets (1) 15:17 flip (2) 135:12,15 flooding (1) 106:11 floor (1) 5:12 fly (1) 58:11 FMVSS (2) 32:23 61:16 focused (1) 39:21 Foerster (1) 44:23 folks (12) 17:21 20:20 21:9,17 22:12 23:9 27:5 117:18 128:2 137:12 149:16 155:12 follow (2) 17:4 139:14 followed (12) 31:8 35:3 45:24 54:7 112:8 118:2 126:5,7 128:7 130:4 133:10 140:13 following (5) 48:24 66:17 94:21,25 135:5 follows (1) 66:22 for-hire (8) 53:11 130:25 131:22 135:20 136:15 137:14 138:13,15 force (6) 14:15 15:12 17:3 28:3 36:22 37:7 forced (2) 28:2,22 forecast (1) 136:2 forecaster (1) 139:3 forefront (1) 72:13 forever (1) 124:14 forget (1) 12:22 forgive (1) 75:20 form (3) 44:2 109:12,17 formed (1) 14:5 former (5) 35:16 46:7 67:2,3 71:19 forth (4) 13:4 110:16 151:21 152:12 forward (12) 7:12 8:17 12:17 57:24 75:25 100:23 101:2 136:24 142:2 143:8 144:21 154:16 fought (2) 141:14 142:11 found (1) 122:15 Foundation (1) 67:10 four (11) 5:22 10:9 15:16 40:20 74:8 95:19 105:13,20,21 110:9 124:24 four-door (1) 60:12 fracture (2) 47:16,17 fracturing (1) 48:9 frame (1) 56:16 framework (1) 11:12

| Frank (14) 2:7 3:6 12:7 13:15 | 72:21 147:13 | grown (2) 21:18 104:18 |
|------------------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|
| 19:21 103:24 108:8,10 112:7,9 | gives (1) 85:14 | Grunfeld (1) 19:7 |
| 115:14,20 116:9,14 | giving (1) 126:10 | guess (8) 11:23 19:19 23:11 81:21 |
| | glance (1) 155:7 | 101:4 115:14,21 123:11 |
| frankly (3) 100:14 112:23 113:3 | | |
| free (1) 40:15 | glass (1) 37:25 | guidance (1) 36:16 |
| frequent (1) 66:15 | global (2) 67:10 84:7 | gutted (1) 146:22 |
| fresh (1) 72:22 | globally (1) 72:24 | guy (1) 118:10 |
| Friday (1) 63:19 | GNYTA (1) 2:20 | guys (3) 113:11,25 121:16 |
| Friedman (1) 15:23 | go (15) 16:3 26:24 85:9 107:22,24 | |
| friend (3) 42:18 97:7,8 | 109:13 113:20 114:22 120:19 | Н |
| friends (3) 42:16 142:24 143:10 | 124:5 125:9 129:9,11,13 141:25 | hacked (1) 95:10 |
| friendship (1) 152:21 | goal (3) 51:25 52:4 53:25 | haggle (1) 92:13 |
| frill (1) 43:7 | goals (1) 70:13 | Hagler (1) 36:25 |
| frills (1) 43:3 | God (1) 132:17 | Hagler's (1) 99:23 |
| front (6) 57:11,21 59:7 68:7 88:19 | goes (3) 90:14 129:12 133:3 | hail (3) 50:17 51:24 106:7 |
| 129:20 | going (38) 7:12 8:17 10:9 12:17 | Hailo (6) 3:7,8 107:8 117:4 118:5 |
| | | |
| fruit (1) 15:12 | 22:4 23:24 30:16 40:8 45:21 | 127:4 |
| full (2) 9:3 143:17 | 48:11,12,14 49:9 54:20 55:12 | hails (2) 108:24 115:7 |
| full-year (1) 143:17 | 59:18 65:23 72:8 82:18 94:4 97:6 | half (5) 21:5 127:3 146:9 150:18,20 |
| fully (1) 71:7 | 98:5 99:20 113:18,22 114:6,8 | hand (6) 8:12 84:14,23 95:16,23 |
| functioning (2) 23:14 40:13 | 117:11 118:7,12 128:14,17,17 | 156:20 |
| functions (1) 22:24 | 134:12 136:23 146:4 147:10 | handful (1) 68:5 |
| fund (3) 3:5 100:12 146:25 | 155:8 | hands (3) 30:20 41:9 95:14 |
| fundamental (5) 43:5,7 46:19 48:5 | Goldstein (11) 71:12,15 72:2 73:12 | happen (4) 48:20 55:12,17 88:13 |
| 142:5 | 120:11,12,20 122:4,8 123:25 | happened (2) 49:3 85:19 |
| fundamentally (2) 149:23 153:19 | 126:5 | happening (1) 54:18 |
| funds (1) 116:6 | GOLDSTIEN (1) 3:5 | happens (4) 43:21 65:11 82:8 |
| funny (1) 111:6 | Gonzales (11) 2:11 4:8 18:3 77:7 | 89:20 |
| further (3) 20:17 131:17 156:14 | 81:2 85:2 95:20 122:24 123:3 | happiness (3) 107:19,22,23 |
| future (5) 50:9 73:4 130:16 142:21 | 124:6 153:23 | happy (8) 44:8,9 99:15 107:16,18 |
| 144:22 | good (25) 4:2 5:2 10:20 25:19 27:9 | 107:24 108:5 135:7 |
| | 27:12 29:16 31:10 35:5 48:21 | harass (1) 121:16 |
| G | 49:20 54:11 55:24 61:24 66:8,9 | hard (13) 15:9,10 19:17,24 24:4,7 |
| gain (1) 24:10 | 66:11 79:12 80:3,6 109:15 126:8 | 24:9,11 112:18 113:20 144:2,3 |
| garage (4) 20:21 21:2 129:9,14 | 128:9 130:6 144:25 | 154:24 |
| Gary (2) 19:6,17 | good-year (1) 110:4 | hardest (1) 128:3 |
| gas (1) 37:14 | gotten (7) 8:21 22:16 86:19 96:25 | harm (5) 109:24 136:14 137:14,19 |
| gateway (3) 67:10 103:19,21 | 121:18 139:16 146:16 | 138:11 |
| gather (2) 71:12 81:23 | government (8) 11:18 16:24 19:11 | harmed (1) 143:13 |
| | 113:2 149:15,17,19,24 | harming (1) 142:24 |
| general (6) 2:14 14:13 15:6 17:18 | | |
| 17:20 56:9 | GPS (1) 129:4 grace (9) 86:15 87:9 88:23 89:19 | hat (1) 99:10 |
| General's (2) 14:16 17:16 | • • • • | hatchback (1) 61:13 |
| generate (1) 109:23 | 90:3,18 91:14 93:10,20 | Hatfield (6) 3:7 108:9 112:8 116:25 |
| generation (1) 147:13 | granted (1) 102:16 | 117:3,4 |
| Gerber (11) 2:20 31:8 35:3,5 39:16 | grateful (2) 24:17 124:14 | headfirst (1) 47:12 |
| 41:3 103:23,25 104:12,17 108:4 | great (7) 12:14 21:16 97:11,16 | heads (2) 38:2 135:14 |
| Gerber's (1) 42:11 | 141:21 147:21 155:19 | health (10) 46:5,8,11 48:5,7,19 |
| get-go (1) 145:19 | greater (2) 31:9 34:8 | 49:12 70:8 100:11 146:24 |
| getting (1) 71:5 | green (4) 29:9 51:24 83:25 106:11 | healthier (1) 29:22 |
| giant (1) 19:11 | Grindley (1) 20:25 | healthy (1) 107:18 |
| gifts (1) 153:17 | ground (1) 53:11 | hear (3) 80:24 96:23 117:17 |
| give (7) 9:3 41:19 72:10 74:24 | group (2) 20:11 24:19 | heard (12) 41:8 71:13 74:20 76:2 |
| 88:24 92:6 146:25 | groups (1) 4:25 | 76:22 77:6 78:6 85:16 86:16,18 |
| given (6) 8:23 15:6 23:8 49:17 | grow (1) 21:21 | 96:25 113:3 |
| | | |
| | | |

| | | - |
|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| hearing (26) 1:11 12:24 26:21 33:4 | hybride (6) 20.7 25.12 26.12 60.16 | individually (2) 24:40 97:2 |
| 65:24 72:7 73:22 74:13 75:5,16 | hybrids (6) 29:7 35:13 36:12 62:16 64:14 90:8 | individually (2) 24:19 87:3 individuals (2) 18:4 86:2 |
| 76:17,21 77:3 79:4,6,15 81:10 | 04.14 90.0 | industries (7) 52:22 53:11 115:11 |
| 83:12 96:12 99:18 100:21,24 | | 137:17 143:2,11 155:17 |
| 101:3 128:18,19 146:5 | i.e (2) 132:9 138:14 | industry (44) 15:8 16:15 17:4,8 |
| hearings (2) 78:19 118:7 | idea (3) 28:18,18 97:11 | 22:13 28:17,20,21 29:23 30:9,20 |
| heart (2) 13:7 152:25 | identified (1) 31:25 | 34:18 39:3 56:12 70:7 71:2 72:7 |
| heartfelt (1) 120:3 | identify (1) 139:6 | 104:5 105:5,9 110:8 115:15,23 |
| heated (1) 118:25 | ignore (2) 34:10 35:8 | 116:8 125:11,15 127:19 130:25 |
| height (1) 42:12 | ignored (1) 36:15 | 131:22 132:7 134:5,6 135:20 |
| held (3) 1:14 51:5 132:4 | ignoring (1) 36:10 | 136:15 138:13 142:18 143:20 |
| help (5) 118:12 123:23 126:21 | ill-advised (1) 50:24 | 144:15 145:15,20 146:9,20 |
| 135:9 150:5 | illegal (3) 22:7 35:24 108:19 | 147:18 148:6 |
| helped (1) 125:11 | illustration (1) 135:11 | industry's (2) 29:3 71:9 |
| helpful (2) 19:14 154:6 | imagine (1) 20:9 | inevitability (1) 118:15 |
| helping (3) 123:12 127:18 149:15 | immediate (2) 87:23 142:14 | inevitable (2) 115:2 118:14 |
| helps (1) 125:14 | immigrant (1) 147:3 | information (6) 7:24 9:6 32:8 |
| Hepatitis (1) 48:18 | impact (11) 57:4,8,11,21,25 58:2 | 109:24 131:2 139:17 |
| hereunto (1) 156:20 | 58:13 68:21 131:19 137:16 139:7 | infuriated (1) 118:21 |
| Herzan (8) 3:4 61:22 66:7,8,11,13 | impacts (2) 137:23 139:8 | initiated (1) 105:14 |
| 70:24,25 | impartially (2) 105:19 107:12 | initiative (2) 19:2 71:23 |
| Herzan's (1) 83:18 | importance (2) 34:8 74:15 | injured (1) 81:20 |
| Hey (1) 42:19 | important (11) 33:14 34:10 71:22 | injuries (11) 30:10,23 31:14,23 |
| Hi (4) 54:11 117:3 118:4 128:9 | 72:19 81:11 87:4,19 88:4 98:7 | 33:5,10 47:15 52:8,12,15,16 |
| high (1) 131:19 | 135:19 141:10 | injury (3) 31:19 32:4 38:7 |
| high-velocity (1) 38:8 | importantly (2) 37:18 75:7 | innovation (3) 69:25 70:4 113:2 |
| Highway (2) 32:11 38:5 | imposed (1) 143:19 | innovative (1) 67:20 |
| hire (1) 23:4 | impressive (1) 125:10 | inputs (1) 91:8 |
| historic (1) 146:24 | improved (3) 56:10 131:3,24 | inside (1) 42:23 |
| history (2) 35:8 146:19 | inadequate (1) 12:10 | insist (1) 70:6 |
| hold (4) 83:15 123:18 132:10 146:2 | inarguable (1) 80:12 | inspection (1) 20:21 |
| holding (1) 98:24 | inaudible (9) 55:9 92:14 93:12 | inspector (1) 129:19 |
| holdup (1) 89:7 | 94:14 101:11 120:7 129:18,22 | inspectors (1) 23:4 |
| holidays (2) 99:16 108:5 | 151:11 | inspired (1) 118:21 |
| Holloway (1) 67:13 | include (1) 103:11 | installation (1) 34:14 |
| honest (2) 118:9 144:19 | included (1) 148:8 | installed (9) 33:23 40:12 50:19 |
| honestly (1) 14:24 | including (1) 141:25 | 53:9,17 67:19 68:11 73:25 |
| honesty (1) 77:13 | inclusive (2) 143:23 144:14 | 102:21 |
| hope (11) 4:25 16:17,23 20:7 81:14 | income (1) 153:4 | Insurance (1) 34:19 |
| 97:17 107:17,24 144:11,14 | incomes (1) 146:23 | integration (1) 102:16 |
| 155:20 | inconclusive (1) 121:6 | integrity (1) 89:5 |
| hopefully (1) 98:15 | inconsistent (1) 75:22 | intended (3) 8:16 38:19 68:20 |
| hopes (1) 137:24 | incorporate (1) 93:8 | intent (1) 100:4 |
| hoping (1) 130:7 | incorporated (1) 7:19 | intention (3) 33:18 74:17 75:24 |
| hospitals (1) 49:14 | incorporates (1) 91:13 | intentions (1) 122:20 |
| hot (1) 21:14 | incorporating (1) 91:4 | interact (1) 127:5 |
| hours (4) 15:9 72:17 126:19 | increase (2) 108:18,25 | interacted (1) 127:16 |
| 152:14 | increased (2) 33:12 82:3 | interest (7) 29:20 51:16 70:9 117:5 |
| humor (1) 120:3 | independent (6) 5:4,23 6:4,19 | 117:25 124:17 125:2 |
| hundreds (4) 52:8,15 104:24 | 103:20 139:6 | interested (1) 156:17 |
| 127:15 | independents (1) 6:24 | interesting (1) 85:23 |
| hurt (1) 30:16 | indication (1) 85:14 | Interestingly (1) 52:18 |
| hybrid (8) 28:17,19,25 29:2,12 | individual (1) 47:20 | interpret (1) 131:14 |
| 50:16 51:22 129:3 | individual's (1) 48:11 | interpretation (2) 138:4 140:7 |
| | l | l |
| L | | |

Г

| interrupt (1) 85:8 | June (2) 91:16,17 | law (4) 6:14 7:15 39:8 62:25 |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|
| interstitial (1) 153:7 | justice (7) 11:17 17:14 36:7,25,25 | laws (1) 36:11 |
| introduced (1) 145:18 | 150:3 152:23 | lawsuit (3) 74:23 100:8,11 |
| introducing (1) 68:15 | | lawsuits (2) 38:10 100:15 |
| intrusion (1) 47:2 | К | lawyer (1) 105:6 |
| intrusions (1) 32:23 | Kabessa (13) 3:10 120:18 128:8 | lawyerly (1) 41:19 |
| invalid (1) 51:5 | 130:4,6,11,12 133:19 134:4,16 | lawyers (1) 105:8 |
| invalidate (1) 65:2 | 138:3 139:25 140:5 | lead (1) 39:24 |
| invalidated (1) 65:14 | keep (5) 8:6 79:6,15 120:21 155:20 | leader (1) 105:6 |
| investigate (1) 138:19 | keeping (2) 79:3 81:19 | leadership (6) 8:14 43:13 147:8 |
| investigations (2) 18:11,16 | Keogh (7) 3:8 77:9 117:2 118:2,4,5 | 148:14,15 153:25 |
| investment (2) 55:15 67:25 | 119:6 | leading (1) 131:12 |
| inviting (1) 100:8 | kept (3) 21:19 23:3 88:15 | leads (1) 19:19 |
| involve (1) 81:5 | Kevin (6) 3:7 108:8 112:8 117:3,22 | League (3) 27:2,16 101:17 |
| involved (1) 30:10 | 118:2 | learn (1) 145:21 |
| lqbal (6) 3:9 126:4,6,8,11 128:5 | key (2) 112:17 125:3 | lease (13) 13:24 14:6 18:5 35:22 |
| Ira (10) 3:5 71:12,18,24 120:10 | kind (22) 9:4 11:5,13 23:13 41:23 | 55:10,10,16 102:22 103:3,5,10 |
| 123:19 124:9 125:6,19 126:5 | 43:12,17 81:24 86:9 91:3 99:5,8 | 146:21 147:11 |
| IRIS (1) 2:10 | 101:6 113:4 115:10 128:15 139:4 | leave (4) 17:15 45:13 98:2 138:5 |
| lrish (1) 49:3 | 149:21 152:24 154:24 155:5,16 | leaves (1) 52:14 |
| Island (3) 20:18 96:16 98:13 | knew (1) 8:3 | led (1) 8:2 |
| issue (20) 11:3 47:4,24 48:23 | knocked (1) 25:3 | Lee (1) 66:25 |
| 59:23 60:21 61:2 72:5,12 82:24 | know (75) 4:13 7:4 8:6,18,24 10:9 | legacy (1) 125:8 |
| 83:10 84:6 86:5 89:22 104:7 | 10:22 12:4 13:5 16:24 21:2 22:12 | legal (2) 23:5 35:15 |
| 108:13 113:4 128:23 129:21 | 23:21 24:21 27:7 35:15 40:24,25 | legitimate (3) 108:21 109:9 114:3 |
| 145:24 | 41:21 42:21 43:4,12 44:13,18 | legroom (4) 42:10 47:7,10 48:3 |
| issued (3) 108:15 109:3,6 | 45:4 55:5 57:21 58:23 59:24 | length (2) 42:23 90:20 |
| issues (8) 24:4,7,9,11 46:15 72:22 | | let's (8) 24:24 62:9 84:10 92:5,18 |
| 78:22 81:5 | 69:16 72:5 74:13 76:16,19 82:3,7 | 101:2 107:9 131:4 |
| | 89:19 96:14 98:4,17,21 103:25 | |
| item (5) 24:25 88:20 99:18 102:15 103:2 | 110:3,10 111:8 112:21 113:14,17 | letter (2) 62:3 63:19 |
| | 113:23,24 114:2,11 116:5 120:18 | letters (1) 97:3 |
| items (4) 81:9 88:15,18 102:3 | 124:7 125:7,23,23 134:7,25 | letting (1) 113:10 |
| J | 136:19,23 137:4 139:2,5 144:2,3 | level (6) 43:13 83:19,21 84:8 154:9 |
| | 147:17,20 150:11 152:14,15,18 | 154:10 |
| jam (1) 65:23 | 155:4,4 | liability (2) 34:19 64:8 |
| January (2) 41:8 80:25 | knowing (2) 9:6 51:8 | license (2) 19:3,4 |
| Jason (1) 18:3 | knows (3) 22:6 35:18,20 | licensed (2) 108:20,23 |
| Jeff (2) 19:6,17 | | licensees (1) 108:22 |
| Jefferson (1) 47:16 | | licenses (2) 104:25 105:2 |
| job (5) 13:10 15:10 97:16,19 147:7 | Labor (1) 14:17 | Licensing (4) 2:17 20:13 25:21 |
| John (3) 52:6,19 67:4 | laboratory (1) 32:12 | 26:3 |
| join (3) 30:19 80:10 82:18 | labored (1) 147:4 | lieu (1) 69:13 |
| joined (5) 44:7,15,21 66:16 85:20 | lack (1) 56:24 | life (2) 13:12 114:16 |
| joining (1) 4:3 | land (1) 135:13 | light (4) 52:11 76:4,7 82:25 |
| joint (4) 14:13,14 15:11 17:2 | lanes (1) 21:10 | likelihood (1) 68:4 |
| joke (1) 45:3 | language (1) 36:16 | Lily (1) 67:9 |
| Joshi (6) 2:14 17:18 49:18 73:20 | larger (1) 106:6 | limit (1) 27:6 |
| 94:14,17 | largest (4) 15:15 18:10,17 121:3 | limited (3) 64:9 83:3 130:25 |
| joy (1) 19:23 | LaShann (4) 2:9 45:16 93:9 112:6 | Limousine (5) 1:4 4:6 25:22 56:5 |
| Judge (3) 35:11 36:18 99:22 | last-ditch (2) 37:10 65:12 | 148:12 |
| judgements (3) 24:12,14 109:18 | Lastly (1) 127:14 | line (2) 129:9 131:11 |
| judges (1) 35:20 | late (3) 56:6 72:17 98:5 | list (1) 126:2 |
| judicial (2) 50:22 51:7 | LAUVIENSKA (1) 2:12 | literally (1) 138:12 |
| judicious (1) 120:2 | Lauvy (1) 152:20 | litigation (2) 10:25 119:22 |
| | I | l |
| L | | |

| little (6) 19:12 24 99:24 121:24 | _ |
|---|--------|
| little (6) 18:13,24 88:24 121:24 150:3 151:18 | n |
| live (1) 112:19 | l n |
| liveries (1) 51:24 | - |
| livery (9) 32:6 50:18 115:23 116:10 | n |
| 121:10 130:13 142:25 143:11 | n |
| 145:14 | n |
| livery/taxi (1) 115:6 | |
| lives (1) 147:9 | n |
| living (1) 112:14 location (1) 133:21 | |
| locations (1) 133:4 | |
| logical (1) 84:7 | |
| LŎMTO`(1) 2:18 | |
| long (8) 15:9 20:3,18 47:9 70:4 | |
| 98:9 104:18 142:13 | n |
| long-standing (1) 43:10 | |
| look (6) 10:9 16:9 28:24 72:21,23 | n |
| 144:21 looking (5) 20:22 21:8 92:13 126:2 | n |
| 126:20 | n N |
| looming (1) 68:7 | n |
| lose (2) 49:6,9 | n |
| lot (18) 19:18 21:20 47:7 55:13 | Ν |
| 82:25 85:16,24 99:4 118:21 | n |
| 145:4 146:10,11,13,15 147:20 | |
| 149:18,19,20 | n |
| lots (1) 5:6 | n |
| love (2) 20:4 127:9 lower (1) 103:10 | n n |
| lunch (1) 45:4 | |
| luxury (4) 87:25 88:15,18,20 | |
| | |
| <u> </u> | |
| magnitude (1) 14:11 | n n |
| maintaining (1) 6:23 major (4) 19:9 69:25 131:5 151:19 | n |
| majority (1) 93:4 | n |
| making (9) 22:11 30:24 39:23 | n |
| 52:11 59:21 84:4 99:2 105:7 | n |
| 153:16 | n |
| Malcolm (3) 117:22 118:3 120:6 | n |
| MALE (1) 120:7 | n |
| MAMARONECK (2) 1:22,23 | n |
| Management (4) 15:18,19,20,20 managing (1) 27:15 | n |
| mandate (9) 35:12 36:8 40:6,7 | |
| 51:14 62:13,15 63:4,9 | n |
| mandated (1) 51:2 | N |
| mandating (3) 29:11 41:5 69:13 | |
| mandatory (4) 62:21 133:2,16 | Ν |
| 134:14 | n |
| Manhattan (3) 67:7 106:9 112:14 | |
| manipulating (1) 35:22 | n |
| | |

nanner (2) 72:24 154:13 nanufactured (1) 33:23 manufacturer (7) 40:14 41:17 68:9 68:12 69:3,8 70:17 nanufacturer's (2) 68:17 90:25 manufacturer-installed (1) 64:20 nanufacturers (9) 53:5,6,15 64:5 70:14 86:21 87:10 88:25 94:3 naps (2) 155:4,6 Margaret (3) 1:20 156:6,23 Marino (26) 2:13 4:7 23:22 41:11 41:23 44:10 59:2,12,16 60:13,25 75:18 80:4 82:16 84:16,20 95:25 99:19 100:7 114:20,24 115:18,25 116:12 125:20 150:8 narket (9) 8:21 33:13,24 64:3,10 64:24 90:6 113:10,13 narketing (1) 114:8 narketplace (1) 88:16 narriage (1) 156:16 Martin (1) 20:24 mass (2) 106:25 107:2 naterials (1) 154:8 Matt (2) 125:7 154:4 natter (5) 11:17 69:5 138:16 156:11,18 nayor (2) 38:25 39:7 nayor-elect (1) 37:19 nayors (1) 151:21 mean (20) 6:2 19:24 59:16 60:16 60:25 71:18 82:2,23 84:4 85:8 92:12 112:20 113:24 114:10 117:22 127:8 128:23 145:16 151:21 153:13 neaning (2) 6:6 89:6 means (6) 45:5 53:25 98:25 137:20 149:7 150:6 neant (3) 39:12,13 151:9 neasure (3) 17:13 31:12,17 neasurement (1) 133:13 neasures (1) 30:4 neat (1) 89:24 nechanism (1) 79:9 medallion (9) 4:15,24 6:16,17 7:25 29:6 55:10,16 141:12 nedallions (10) 4:20 5:5,24 6:4,13 6:14,20 7:16 15:22 16:12 nedical (4) 33:2 46:9,11 67:7 Meera (5) 2:14 17:18 26:23 73:17 91:12 Meera's (1) 23:5 neet (8) 40:4,9,17 41:13 43:15 61:14 64:3 95:5 neeting (14) 4:5 7:7 9:14 19:22

25:8 50:4 79:17 98:8 101:8 113:19 124:18 136:20 155:22,24 meetings (1) 45:9 meets (1) 57:9 member (2) 28:14 130:13 members (2) 29:20 141:18 memorandum (1) 14:11 mentioned (1) 12:22 merely (1) 69:22 merit (2) 141:21 142:6 mess (1) 54:21 message (1) 16:14 met (1) 52:19 metal (1) 59:13 methodology (2) 52:4 134:21 methods (1) 119:12 Metropolitan (2) 62:4 141:8 Michael (8) 2:25 3:8 54:8 117:2 118:5 120:4,16 130:5 midnight (1) 152:16 Mike (1) 140:12 million (3) 4:24 15:24 16:11 millions (1) 64:6 mind (2) 6:9 87:13 mindset (1) 81:12 mine (1) 45:11 mini (2) 6:19 8:5 mini-fleet (2) 6:12,20 minimal (1) 91:6 Minivan (1) 54:23 minivans (1) 61:11 minute (2) 21:5 119:14 minutes (3) 25:5,6,9 misguided (2) 37:6 54:2 misread (1) 137:18 missed (1) 9:21 mission (1) 29:9 mistake (1) 37:21 mitigate (1) 57:5 mobile (1) 129:20 model (5) 34:5 92:6 94:8 95:8 104:4 models (2) 32:20 95:3 moment (2) 15:3 80:20 money (4) 10:15 23:3 55:14 114:7 money's (1) 122:5 monitor (1) 8:18 month (2) 25:23 76:10 monthly (1) 104:6 months (22) 9:17 10:2 14:7 18:7 54:24 87:13 88:23 89:9 91:21.24 92:9 94:3 105:13,20,21 123:7 132:14,15,20,23 133:11 134:20 morning (23) 4:3,4,12 13:21 25:19

27:9,13 31:10 35:5 44:19,21 49:20 55:24 61:24 66:8,10,11 98:8 126:8 130:6 144:25 145:6 147:17 Morrison (1) 44:22 motion (15) 25:16 73:14 76:13,14 77:2 79:20,21 80:5,11,21 82:12 82:19 84:11,22 85:3 Motor (1) 46:12 Moulton (1) 36:7 Moulton's (1) 36:19 mounting (1) 31:24 mouth-to-mouth (2) 48:13,16 move (11) 25:8,25 57:24 58:4 74:23 75:4,14 93:6 99:19 101:2 143:8 MTA (1) 67:3 MTBOT (10) 2:25 62:8 63:18 65:20 141:11,13,17 142:4,17 144:3 multiple (1) 27:8 multiplication (1) 133:7 museum (1) 55:18 Mutual (3) 27:3,16 101:18 MV (17) 29:15 30:8,16 39:21,25 40:6,21 41:5 43:22 46:17 51:3,11 54:15 55:2,7 63:14,23 myriad (1) 154:8 Ν N(1) 156:2 name (9) 25:20 27:10,14 54:12 56:2 66:12 126:11 128:10 130:12 name's (1) 118:4 National (2) 32:11 38:4 natural (1) 92:16 nature (1) 52:11 near (1) 38:15 nearly (1) 141:12 necessary (3) 28:11 64:7 82:14 need (26) 11:18 30:2 31:19 34:6 40:16 48:11.13 49:13 54:16.25 72:16 77:25 84:6 86:14,15 87:8 100:12 108:11 109:6 110:2 111:4 113:18 115:9 129:22 134:13 135:15 needs (6) 55:3 70:8 72:14 73:17 131:16,23 negative (1) 96:6 negatives (1) 121:8 neighborhood (1) 4:23 never (15) 21:7 68:13 85:19 118:23 119:13 127:12 131:12 134:7,8 138:9 139:19 148:8,9,9 152:14 new (53) 1:3,15,15,23 5:12,12 6:17

12:2 16:8 19:3 23:4 27:21 28:9 28:14,16,20 31:9 32:16,20 36:6 39:7,10 42:19 48:25 49:11 50:13 51:23 58:19 64:9 67:19,22 70:2,9 70:20 71:8 74:25 82:21 83:8,14 97:18 107:9,16,18,25 114:14 115:5 117:12 129:2 142:19 150:14 156:3,4,8 news (3) 10:20 13:22 104:9 NHTSA/FMVSS (1) 32:15 nice (1) 43:4 Nissan (21) 29:15 30:8,16 36:9,23 37:7,22 38:24 39:14 41:15 46:17 51:3,11 63:14,19 64:23 70:11 83:4,18,21 107:7 no-brainer (2) 113:5 114:13 non-restrained (1) 47:9 Non-sampling (1) 132:13 nonfixed (1) 68:15 nonnegotiable (1) 81:8 noon (2) 5:10 155:23 Nora (2) 2:13 125:2 normal (1) 115:16 Notary (1) 156:7 note (6) 12:5 18:22 44:6,14 139:11 141:10 noted (3) 36:12 44:11 155:25 noticed (2) 150:11 154:5 noting (1) 7:6 notwithstanding (1) 51:7 November (3) 25:7 74:4 92:5 number (9) 46:21 57:19 71:3 76:3 82:21 108:13 112:17,19 116:17 number's (1) 8:24 numbers (3) 22:2 106:13 134:19 NYC (152) 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1 102:1 103:1 104:1 105:1 106:1 107:1 108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1 112:1 113:1 114:1

115:1 116:1 117:1 118:1 119:1 120:1 121:1 122:1 123:1 124:1 125:1 126:1 127:1 128:1 129:1 130:1 131:1 132:1 133:1 134:1 135:1 136:1 137:1 138:1 139:1 140:1 141:1 142:1 143:1 144:1 145:1 146:1 147:1 148:1 149:1 150:1 151:1 152:1 153:1 154:1 155:1 NYPD (1) 129:19 NYTWA (1) 3:11 Ο **O (1)** 156:2 o'clock (2) 5:9 98:16 objection (5) 76:20 92:24 93:7,23 93:24 **objective (1)** 80:23 objectives (1) 119:11 objectivity (1) 154:10 obvious (3) 42:9 45:3 51:18 obviously (2) 114:2 137:22 occupants (2) 47:2 57:7 occurred (1) 52:17 occurs (1) 68:21 October (2) 63:7 92:4 OEM (4) 33:14,20 34:7,22 OEM-provided (1) 34:12 offer (1) 137:9 office (3) 14:17 37:19 112:14 offices (1) 5:11 official (1) 46:8 oh (3) 26:22 96:19 120:17 okay (17) 10:21 26:24 54:6 71:16 80:3 92:2 93:17 94:11 95:12 101:22 103:22 115:20 116:14 120:20 130:10 133:25 140:9 old (1) 35:7 once (7) 43:16 51:13 78:19 107:20 123:21 133:8 150:2 one's (2) 114:8 116:2 one-year (1) 143:4 ones (2) 42:17 110:25 ongoing (2) 18:19 76:8 online (5) 19:2,3,4,5 20:16 open (4) 21:12 79:4,7,15 open-minded (1) 122:16 opened (2) 5:19 148:9 operate (1) 15:21 operating (1) 22:24 operation (1) 97:12 operator (1) 15:15 opinion (7) 66:19 72:10 78:18 81:7 82:24 140:6 141:24

opinions (1) 109:12 **Opponents (1)** 69:12 opportunity (3) 66:19 74:25 78:16 opposed (4) 25:12 26:9 84:22 95:22 opposite (1) 122:12 opposition (1) 144:7 option (1) 103:6 order (4) 35:23 36:4 69:8 135:16 ordinary (1) 149:20 organizations (2) 66:18,21 Oscar (1) 107:20 Osman (6) 2:23 45:24 54:6,13 126:7 128:10 outcome (4) 11:14,15 136:16 156:18 outer (3) 83:25 106:8 153:11 outer-borough (1) 145:17 outset (1) 128:14 outside (2) 42:21 149:17 overall (1) 122:9 overestimating (1) 7:21 overlooked (1) 33:11 overly (1) 9:13 overtly (1) 36:22 owner (4) 6:5,19 8:5 15:22 owners (9) 16:18 27:3,16 29:5 37:12 101:18 104:22 105:10 141:11 ownership (1) 15:17 Ρ pages (3) 104:21,22,25 paid (1) 16:7 pain (1) 52:12 papers (3) 38:9 144:7,8 parameter (1) 13:4 parameters (1) 69:10 parity (1) 8:6 Park's (1) 66:24 part (6) 20:12 23:17 109:7 110:4 121:17 137:11 participation (1) 133:24 particular (7) 76:4 80:19 82:12 102:6 117:14 124:9 125:8 particularly (4) 12:5 17:6 54:19 56:9 parties (1) 156:15 partition (44) 1:8 30:15 31:20,23 32:9,19,24 33:8,16,20,22 34:2,3 34:5 38:13 40:11 47:12 48:8 50:19 51:10 52:2,5,22,25 53:6,16 57:22 58:10,19 62:22 63:16 64:20 67:19 68:16,19 69:4,6,17

69:21 73:25 81:23 82:6 84:13 91:2 partition-related (1) 30:23 partitions (8) 30:11 53:7 57:18 68:7,10,12 69:14,14 partnering (2) 15:5 19:12 partners (2) 110:7 145:22 partnership (2) 44:22 66:23 parts (3) 23:14 56:15 89:16 pass (4) 65:22 69:23 72:16 141:19 passage (1) 141:23 passed (2) 29:2 36:21 passenger (19) 31:13 33:9 34:16 38:20 47:9,10 51:12,17 56:14 59:18 61:10 65:6 66:14 67:13 70:18 81:6 82:15 89:4 138:2 passengers (19) 33:6 38:3 52:9 53:10 60:8 68:21 70:10 71:8 74:19 81:19 85:21 125:14 126:22 127:12,20 129:25 142:12,20 153.20 passing (3) 80:17 140:10 143:4 path (1) 12:17 pathogens (1) 48:18 patient (1) 97:14 pattern (1) 15:25 Paul (4) 3:4 35:11 61:21 66:12 pay (10) 10:15 15:23 19:5 37:13 102:20 103:6,9 113:16 127:24,24 paying (1) 116:10 payment (6) 102:25 103:7,17,18 103:21 129:10 people (53) 8:10 11:18 14:25 16:14 17:7 18:8 20:13,17 22:25 24:2 37:15 39:19 42:10,11 43:10 49:13 54:9 66:17,21 77:5,7,15 78:4,15 83:25 85:24 86:3 97:5,20 99:3,4 100:25 101:5 106:23,24 107:2,15 108:17,19 109:12,17 111:18 115:17 116:5,20 118:12 118:22 119:9 128:19 145:13 146:11 147:25 152:15 people's (4) 76:21 100:24 109:21 139:2 peopled (1) 155:11 percent (12) 21:21 29:6 104:10 106:3 131:10,16 132:7,14 133:6 139:17,19,21 perfect (1) 152:17 perfection (1) 139:13 perfectly (3) 118:8 152:4,5 period (13) 86:15 87:9 88:23 89:19 90:3,18 91:15 93:10,20 123:16 132:16,24 133:12

permanent (5) 47:22 114:16 126:17 127:17 130:22 permissible (1) 69:22 person (7) 5:8,13 18:8 48:8 87:22 109:14 140:14 personal (2) 67:24 111:5 personally (1) 85:18 personnel (1) 23:2 perspective (2) 13:9 72:22 pervasive (1) 15:25 pessimistic (1) 9:14 Peter (1) 36:7 petition (1) 26:19 phone (6) 85:18 86:20 97:2 113:16 129:18 152:11 phones (1) 129:20 phonetic (1) 152:20 phrase (1) 95:2 physician (3) 46:4,5,10 pick (3) 22:15 65:5 98:16 picture (1) 131:22 piece (1) 43:23 piles (1) 144:6 pilot (21) 54:17 55:2,3 75:8 76:8 105:15 118:9 121:4 130:21 135:4 136:3,6,12 137:13,15,20 138:14 141:16 142:23 143:4,14 place (6) 14:2 36:15 70:19 91:2 123:12 149:13 placed (1) 65:4 places (2) 127:25 149:25 plaintiffs (2) 10:24 100:15 plan (2) 67:2 145:17 plans (1) 7:17 play (3) 16:20 17:5 113:21 played (1) 32:3 player (1) 147:18 please (15) 45:22 56:22 73:19 84:14 85:6 95:16 96:20,20 97:6 112:3 114:22 123:20 127:14,21 128:24 pleased (2) 4:14 11:11 pleasure (4) 23:16 150:16,22 152:10 plenty (2) 97:2,2 poaching (1) 108:21 poetic (2) 140:22 145:5 point (25) 29:14 39:22 53:19 54:10 57:15 58:12 73:9 77:3,4 78:13,22 79:13 87:15 89:4,6 92:11,12,17 99:22 108:11 124:14 125:24 127:3 134:15 139:9 pointed (1) 119:20 points (2) 56:18 88:14

| Polanco (25) 2:12 44:16 73:13,15 | pressing (1) 96:16 | 32:19 33:16 50:12 51:19 53:3 |
|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|
| 74:11,12 76:7,12,24 77:17,24 | presumably (2) 4:18 137:24 | 63:3 64:5 65:7 67:17 69:20 73:23 |
| | | |
| 78:12 79:12,21,24 84:17,21 | pretty (1) 10:8 | 86:13 145:2 |
| 93:21,24 94:11 96:4 151:6,10,11 | prevent (1) 31:18 | proposing (1) 65:9 |
| 152:9 | prevented (1) 31:25 | pros (1) 122:2 |
| Polanco's (3) 44:12 80:11 82:19 | prevention (2) 32:4 33:9 | prosecution (2) 14:14 147:12 |
| policy (7) 7:8,11 13:3 53:25 107:4 | previous (6) 33:3 54:22 56:19 | protect (4) 15:7 46:25 68:20 |
| 119:10 154:22 | 134:23 151:20 154:14 | 103:13 |
| polite (1) 12:11 | previously (2) 91:21 154:3 | protection (4) 13:25 14:19 34:17 |
| politely (1) 111:3 | price (1) 4:22 | 147:15 |
| political (4) 73:5 85:25 86:5,11 | pride (1) 146:14 | proud (6) 17:11 24:22 108:14 |
| politics (1) 86:9 | principally (1) 56:13 | 109:4 119:17 155:9 |
| Pollack (8) 2:22 45:21 49:19,20,21 | principle (2) 141:22 146:3 | prove (1) 29:23 |
| 50:12 53:20 54:5 | principle/policy (1) 13:3 | proven (1) 28:23 |
| Pollock (1) 45:23 | prior (8) 5:20,23 11:7 51:7 65:2 | provide (7) 32:8 33:20 48:15 69:3 |
| pool (1) 47:14 | 95:4,10 154:14 | 135:24,25 137:6 |
| poor (2) 106:20 112:20 | priority (1) 71:3 | provided (2) 32:25 63:18 |
| portion (1) 106:6 | private (5) 21:3 114:6 148:21,23 | provider (4) 33:15 102:17,19 |
| position (2) 65:5 98:25 | 155:14 | 103:16 |
| positions (1) 106:22 | probability (1) 135:18 | provider's (1) 102:23 |
| positives (1) 121:7 | probable (1) 136:16 | prudent (1) 7:20 |
| possible (3) 118:24 127:13 136:17 | probably (13) 28:6 29:16 81:18 | public (35) 1:11 20:11 24:3 26:21 |
| Post (1) 100:10 | 98:4 113:25 122:10 134:17 137:6 | 29:24 32:18 33:4 39:13 46:4,7,11 |
| posted (1) 38:4 | 139:21 149:10 154:13 155:12,13 | 48:5,7,19 49:12 64:12 67:11,21 |
| postpone (6) 39:10 74:23 75:4,15 | problem (10) 14:9 46:21 47:8 49:5 | 68:14 69:5 71:2,4 73:22 80:13 |
| 130:8 145:12 | | |
| | 49:8 54:18 55:5,8 59:21 99:25 | 100:21 107:4,10 118:6 131:20 |
| postponement (1) 117:7 | problems (2) 46:20 54:21 | 141:17 144:18 148:20,24 149:12 |
| postponing (2) 142:8 143:6 | proceed (3) 96:11 110:2 111:9 | 156:7 |
| Potato (1) 49:4 | proceedings (2) 156:10,13 | public's (1) 76:9 |
| potatoes (1) 89:24 | process (1) 143:23 | publication (1) 33:25 |
| potential (2) 32:23 74:22 | processes (1) 103:17 | publicly (1) 87:4 |
| potentially (1) 31:13 | processing (1) 103:8 | published (3) 93:5 94:20 131:6 |
| pound (3) 20:10,10 21:14 | produce (1) 155:3 | publishing (1) 11:22 |
| Powell (1) 139:14 | productivity (1) 21:19 | purchased (1) 6:10 |
| power (1) 149:16 | profession (1) 134:24 | purchaser (1) 10:6 |
| powerfully (1) 76:5 | professionals (1) 33:3 | purchasers (3) 4:18 5:2 10:13 |
| practical (2) 61:15 84:7 | professions (1) 147:4 | purportedly (1) 63:15 |
| practice (1) 147:11 | Professor (1) 67:6 | purpose (6) 30:25 32:14 38:23,23 |
| prearranged (4) 108:23 115:8 | profiling (1) 153:3 | 43:20 101:13 |
| 153:6,9 | program (28) 37:11,12 54:17 55:2 | pursuant (1) 73:22 |
| predominately (1) 147:2 | 55:3 75:8,10 77:18 78:2,16 | push (1) 24:5 |
| preface (1) 7:6 | 105:23 117:10,13 118:9 126:15 | pushed (3) 12:11 23:24,25 |
| premature (1) 142:6 | 127:17 128:12 129:23 130:21 | put (18) 10:16 11:11 13:4 19:7 24:2 |
| prematurely (1) 130:20 | 136:3,6 141:16 142:23 143:5,7 | 29:19 30:22 40:9,18 55:14,17 |
| premiums (1) 34:19 | 143:15,18 145:10 | 79:18 107:3 114:6 121:20 146:21 |
| prepared (4) 82:12 91:12 124:19 | project (5) 38:25 40:22 41:9 42:5 | 147:11 153:17 |
| 124:20 | 105:15 | putting (2) 120:23 143:15 |
| presence (2) 44:12 56:24 | projects (1) 19:10 | |
| Present (1) 4:7 | promote (2) 30:21 81:16 | Q |
| presentation (3) 105:24 106:2 | prone (2) 37:24 38:6 | quadriplegic (1) 47:23 |
| 131:8 | proper (4) 73:8 132:21 136:2,4 | Queens (3) 3:6 112:11,15 |
| presented (2) 47:24,25 | Property (1) 34:18 | question (3) 51:18 59:3 115:3 |
| presents (2) 46:19 49:12 | proposal (3) 53:23 64:15 110:23 | question (3) 31.18 39.3 113.3 |
| President (1) 66:23 | proposed (17) 1:7 26:18 31:4,20 | quick (3) 93:21,25 99:21 |
| | Pioposeu (17) 1.7 20.10 31.4,20 | quick (3) 30.21,20 33.21 |
| | I | I |

| | 1 | 1 |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| quickly (2) 10:8 108:7 | 151:9 | representing (2) 27:2 118:3 |
| quite (6) 8:2,8 14:24 45:17 82:10 | recommendations (2) 26:2,13 | represents (1) 141:11 |
| 83:4 | record (9) 73:18 74:4 79:15 96:18 | request (1) 105:16 |
| | | |
| quote/unquote (1) 74:17 | 100:5,16 109:4 128:22 156:13 | requesting (1) 106:7 |
| quoting (1) 131:7 | redesigned (4) 52:6 69:15,18,21 | requests (1) 63:17 |
| | reduce (3) 31:13,18 57:6 | require (4) 33:19,25 50:13 73:24 |
| R | reducing (1) 116:19 | required (2) 102:20 135:2 |
| R (1) 156:2 | reduction (1) 34:17 | requirement (6) 34:11 93:14,19 |
| radically (1) 104:4 | references (1) 94:22 | 94:23 133:17 134:14 |
| raise (4) 84:14,23 95:16 146:18 | refers (1) 52:6 | requirements (4) 57:10 61:10 64:4 |
| raised (2) 12:9 90:7 | reflection (1) 91:7 | 95:5 |
| | | |
| raising (1) 95:23 | refreshing (1) 122:16 | requiring (4) 1:7 26:19 34:13 |
| ran (1) 136:13 | regarding (1) 32:9 | 67:17 |
| rare (1) 110:13 | regardless (1) 101:8 | research (2) 135:3,3 |
| rarely (1) 135:13 | Regional (1) 67:2 | reserve (1) 146:4 |
| rate (9) 9:2 24:20 45:15 103:9,10 | registering (1) 134:10 | resident (2) 3:6 112:10 |
| 125:17 131:9,15,19 | regression (1) 139:5 | resolved (1) 73:2 |
| rates (1) 22:10 | regular (2) 101:6 117:14 | resort (2) 111:5,12 |
| ratings (1) 38:4 | regulate (1) 88:17 | respect (13) 12:16 16:19 19:15 |
| ratio (2) 6:24 8:7 | regulated (1) 142:16 | 21:16 29:25 59:25 83:8,14,17 |
| | | |
| rational (1) 119:2 | regulation (5) 50:13,20 51:20,21 | 90:16 115:13 143:10 154:4 |
| rationale (1) 51:12 | 53:3 | respectful (1) 142:3 |
| Ray (1) 17:22 | regulations (4) 50:25 51:4,23 63:2 | response (3) 25:14 26:11 63:17 |
| read (5) 22:4 62:2 66:16 99:22 | regulators (2) 29:25 70:25 | responsibility (3) 11:10 80:16 |
| 126:3 | reinvent (1) 105:5 | 98:25 |
| ready (1) 112:4 | relate (1) 17:6 | restitution (2) 16:3 18:15 |
| real (2) 34:14 89:24 | related (8) 33:7 56:8,24 58:7,12 | Restoration (1) 66:24 |
| realistic (3) 55:4 93:3 94:2 | 74:8 87:20 156:15 | restricted (1) 102:12 |
| realization (1) 71:22 | relates (1) 57:16 | restrictions (3) 102:4,7 116:19 |
| realize (1) 74:15 | relationship (1) 147:24 | rests (1) 41:9 |
| | | |
| really (36) 6:15 11:17 14:3 17:9 | relationships (1) 24:17 | result (3) 33:16 46:24 47:14 |
| 19:6,17,23 21:13,14 23:22 58:14 | relaxed (1) 152:16 | results (3) 7:22 65:3 119:16 |
| 72:5 82:7 97:11 99:7,21,24 | relevant (2) 121:14,17 | resurrect (1) 64:16 |
| 112:16,20,25 114:2,14,15 115:10 | remain (2) 95:7,11 | resuscitation (2) 48:13,16 |
| 118:12 125:11 126:16 146:7 | remaining (2) 100:20 133:11 | retained (1) 56:4 |
| 148:5 149:6 150:21 151:2,22 | remains (2) 57:23 58:2 | retention (1) 58:7 |
| 152:12 155:11,19 | remark (1) 150:9 | retrofit (1) 62:23 |
| rear (6) 37:24 38:15 57:4,11 58:2 | remarkable (2) 105:25 106:20 | retrofitted (1) 64:22 |
| 94:22 | remarkably (1) 17:19 | retrofitting (1) 64:25 |
| rear-end (2) 38:17 60:19 | remarks (2) 12:21,25 | revenue (1) 139:3 |
| | remember (1) 151:23 | reviewed (1) 124:21 |
| rear-ending (1) 47:3 | | |
| rear-passenger-controlled (1) | reminded (1) 123:6 | revisit (1) 75:12 |
| 74:2 | reminding (1) 154:18 | revisiting (1) 134:18 |
| rear-seat (2) 47:2 62:17 | renew (1) 19:4 | revolutionized (1) 23:10 |
| reargue (1) 78:21 | rent (1) 153:16 | Ricardo (2) 56:3,3 |
| reason (4) 75:6 102:11 114:3 | repeat (2) 35:9 96:24 | Richard (4) 2:19 27:4 31:7 101:18 |
| 115:3 | repeated (1) 63:17 | rid (1) 22:16 |
| reasonable (4) 11:14 87:14 109:14 | report (4) 5:3 25:3 89:2 134:20 | ride (2) 30:6 67:22 |
| 110:15 | reported (7) 1:19 31:22 32:6 106:2 | rider (2) 66:15 70:3 |
| reasons (3) 14:4 82:20 112:17 | 106:5,23 156:10 | riding (3) 29:24 71:4 107:10 |
| rebuked (1) 35:25 | reporting (3) 1:22 132:24 133:18 | right (21) 9:24 10:17 12:13 16:20 |
| | | |
| recall (2) 13:24 49:7 | reports (1) 106:17 | 44:14 45:12 54:4 65:10 66:2 |
| received (2) 74:7 85:18 | represent (2) 118:5 119:21 | 71:14 86:22 92:10 94:12 104:16 |
| recognize (4) 109:8,21 144:9 | representative (1) 72:6 | 114:23 124:3 129:14 142:2,11 |
| | | |

| 143:3,6 | rushed (1) 105:19 | 144:11 148:9 |
|---|---|---|
| rightfully (1) 29:18 | | seeing (3) 60:11 107:17 141:18 |
| rights (2) 145:20 148:17 | S | seeking (1) 50:21 |
| rigidity (1) 68:17 | safe (2) 69:17 142:15 | seen (2) 65:10 125:18 |
| rigorous (1) 68:2 | safer (5) 30:6 52:3,25 53:9 59:18 | select (1) 133:19 |
| rip (1) 116:7 | safety (39) 32:10,16 37:22 38:5,14 | selected (1) 133:2 |
| risen (2) 83:19,20 | 39:9 40:10 43:6 46:15,20 47:4,23 | sell (2) 6:15 155:13 |
| rising (1) 70:11 | 49:23 51:12,18 61:2 64:12 65:6 | selling (1) 7:2 |
| risk (4) 8:20 33:12 48:17 49:12 | 68:3,14 69:6,10,25 70:4,8,18 | send (2) 16:13 40:25 |
| risks (1) 64:9 | 71:2,23 74:18 80:13,17 81:6 | senior (1) 46:7 |
| risky (1) 28:10 | 82:15 83:19,24 84:3,5 86:7 88:3 | sense (9) 14:23 59:5,17 60:15 84:5 |
| road (8) 29:13,19 40:18 43:15 | Safety/FMVSS (1) 32:12 | 90:24 113:15 116:23 147:14 |
| 54:20,24 90:14 126:20 | sale (3) 4:15 7:17,25 | sentiment (1) 77:25 |
| rode (1) 42:19 | salute (1) 99:9 | sentiments (1) 151:15 |
| role (2) 32:3 149:14 | salvage (1) 65:13 | separate (4) 62:18 75:21 77:14 |
| Ron (1) 62:3 | Samaritan (1) 48:22 | 88:7 |
| roof (1) 37:25 | sample (6) 132:10,11,25 133:23 | separately (1) 34:7 |
| room (6) 20:7 107:15 109:9 118:22 | 135:5,8 | separating (2) 59:7 60:18 |
| 145:14 146:12 | Sander (2) 33:2 66:25 | serious (3) 38:7 49:7 52:11 |
| roomy (1) 47:6 | Sarah (1) 67:12 | servants (1) 20:11 |
| Ross (1) 18:2 | satisfactorily (1) 11:6 | serve (1) 119:15 |
| roughly (1) 6:18 | satisfied (1) 106:4 | served (3) 13:7 111:16,20 |
| roulette (1) 113:21 | satisfying (1) 24:16 | service (13) 24:3 49:10 71:21,25 |
| rounds (1) 121:12 | save (2) 37:11 38:24 | 95:11 106:5,10 108:24 125:13 |
| Roundtable (2) 121:11 130:14 | saw (3) 22:14 36:2,25 | 127:9 144:10 149:13 155:13 |
| routinely (1) 22:13 | saying (12) 13:16 35:7 55:20 59:3 | services (2) 1:22 46:11 |
| rug (1) 116:7 | 65:21 78:4 114:25 116:3 122:23 | set (2) 124:20 156:20 |
| rule (61) 11:22 32:20 33:17,19 | 134:10 138:12 152:19 | settle (1) 15:24 |
| 39:8 40:2,21 43:20 62:6,7,10,12 | says (5) 5:12 40:3,8 70:16 98:17 | settlement (7) 10:23 12:16 15:14 |
| 62:15 63:3 64:11 65:9,10,17,18 | scales (1) 127:25 | 15:24 147:16,19,22 |
| 65:20 66:3,4 67:17 69:12,20 | Scanlon (1) 17:23 | seven (1) 28:12 |
| 70:16 73:23 74:14,16,21,24 | scenario (1) 132:20 | shallow (1) 47:13 |
| 75:16,17,25 80:13,13,19 83:5 84:13 86:13,23 88:6 89:25 92:25 | schedule (3) 9:5 10:19 45:22 scheduled (1) 10:11 | shaping (1) 151:25 share (2) 66:19 77:24 |
| 93:4,5,8 95:15 96:7,12 99:25 | schedules (2) 78:5 101:2 | shave (1) 21:5 |
| 100:21 102:16 103:19 130:22 | scientific (1) 106:18 | Sherman (4) 52:7,20 62:3 67:5 |
| 136:13 139:14 141:19,21,24 | scope (1) 14:9 | Sherry (2) 17:24 23:6 |
| 145:2 | Sealed (2) 5:7,20 | shift (1) 129:8 |
| rule-breaking (1) 22:17 | seasonability (2) 134:5 135:22 | SHL (1) 51:23 |
| rulemaking (1) 100:13 | seat (9) 30:18,21,21 33:6 47:6 | Shlomo (1) 36:25 |
| rules (37) 1:10 13:25 16:19,20,21 | 81:17 82:3 88:20 148:10 | short (2) 30:15 88:24 |
| 17:5,5 26:17 27:5,19 30:24 31:4 | seats (1) 38:15 | shorter (1) 42:22 |
| 35:22 36:21 38:22 41:4 62:9 64:5 | second (13) 8:4 22:20 27:3 47:5 | shot (1) 20:3 |
| 65:7,22 74:3 75:6,12 80:17 83:22 | 48:23 57:15,25 63:8 75:18 76:13 | shoulder (1) 33:7 |
| 87:11 94:18 103:3 104:6,18,19 | 76:25 90:19 132:23 | shoved (1) 30:3 |
| 104:21,23 105:3 116:18 129:17 | seconded (1) 80:4 | show (3) 83:7 95:14 138:10 |
| 142:5 | section (4) 94:24,25 95:5,6 | showed (1) 147:20 |
| ruling (1) 27:22 | sector (2) 21:3 155:14 | shown (2) 137:19 147:17 |
| run (9) 4:10 21:6 75:8 77:18 78:2 | sectors (1) 145:23 | shows (1) 136:14 |
| 78:17 116:20 121:2 149:22 | secure (1) 142:15 | shrugs (1) 47:20 |
| runaround (1) 63:6 | security (1) 19:15 | shut (1) 142:19 |
| running (1) 98:13 | see (15) 8:18 54:17 55:4 57:20 | side (7) 17:15,16,18 21:18 38:11 |
| runs (1) 20:25 | 59:9 82:10,13 102:11 114:15 | 58:12 121:23 |
| rush (1) 54:16 | 116:18 129:19 138:21 143:12 | sides (4) 99:3 121:22 122:12,18 |
| | | l |
| | | |

sign (1) 147:21 signed (3) 14:11 54:10 120:16 significant (2) 67:25 87:16 significantly (1) 63:25 signify (2) 95:17,22 simply (6) 30:12 40:3,7 117:6,7 146:16 simulation (1) 32:13 sincerely (2) 117:23 123:21 single (7) 13:3 16:11 20:2 23:16 51:2.14 154:21 single-vehicle (1) 28:8 sir (3) 45:25 116:16 140:9 sit (2) 42:12 86:3 situations (1) 58:5 six (11) 10:10 28:12 54:24 87:12 88:23 89:9 91:20,24 95:19 96:5 132:15 six-year (1) 42:3 size (4) 18:7 21:22 133:3,20 skeptical (1) 28:24 skills (1) 155:16 skipped (1) 124:25 slides (3) 124:21 125:4,18 sliding (1) 38:13 slow (1) 115:4 slower (1) 123:13 small (3) 14:22,23 24:22 smaller (2) 18:12 21:25 Smart (1) 67:12 smartphone (1) 105:16 smoothly (1) 4:16 so-called (1) 63:4 solid (2) 136:11 138:7 solutely (2) 94:7 100:18 solution (1) 69:2 somebody (2) 9:15 118:20 somewhat (1) 154:19 sorry (13) 59:21 70:23 73:16 75:20 77:21 85:7 88:9 97:9 99:20 108:7 120:14 125:25 127:2 sort (2) 11:15 113:12 space (2) 59:13 67:12 speak (5) 53:4 126:10,14 127:8 128:19 speaker (14) 26:22,25,25 27:4 31:7 45:20 49:18 54:7 61:23 116:17 120:7,15 140:13,17 speakers (9) 2:16 3:2 27:7,8 39:21 56:19 81:15 90:7 126:3 speaking (4) 66:13 101:9 118:10 128:21 speaks (1) 137:14 special (1) 99:8

specializes (1) 14:18 **specifically (3)** 51:20 70:2 154:22 specifications (12) 1:7 26:19 34:2 39:12 40:5,11,17 41:14 68:18 73:24 83:3 94:20 specify (1) 63:23 **speculate (1)** 7:10 speech (1) 151:12 speed (1) 20:22 spend (2) 55:13 64:6 spent (1) 126:19 split (1) 6:18 spoke (1) 76:16 spoken (2) 13:24 76:5 spread (3) 38:2 107:21,23 spreads (1) 107:19 ss (1) 156:4 staff (7) 14:19 23:2 71:19 91:5 138:9 154:20,23 stake (1) 18:12 stakeholders (2) 70:12 143:24 stand (1) 149:15 standard (11) 33:21 34:21 61:14 132:10,12 133:5,6,8,20,22 137:7 standards (5) 43:16 132:25 135:6 135:9 137:15 standpoint (1) 46:20 starker (1) 131:23 Stars (1) 145:7 start (5) 54:2 58:11 79:6 99:23 123:14 started (5) 6:22 123:23 138:13,14 139:2 startup (1) 112:13 state (8) 6:13 7:15 36:6 51:6 53:24 103:5 156:3,8 State's (1) 27:22 stated (3) 50:15 107:5 148:20 statement (7) 66:16 81:3 82:17 131:11 137:18 149:7 150:6 Staten (2) 96:16 98:13 statistical (2) 135:17 136:2 status (1) 45:7 stay (3) 45:22 58:9 76:14 STENO-KATH (1) 1:22 Stenokat@verizon.net (1) 1:24 stenokath@verizon.net (1) 1:25 step (2) 17:12 130:20 steps (1) 33:8 stick (2) 23:8 27:6 stood (2) 60:23 146:17 stop (3) 30:15 47:11 77:21 stopped (1) 21:8 stopping (1) 92:17

street (13) 1:14 4:21 5:11 10:16 15:18 22:7,15 50:17 51:24 66:23 106:7 108:24 115:7 streets (2) 40:9 42:8 stress (1) 62:8 strides (1) 59:25 strike (1) 150:2 striking (1) 63:8 strong (4) 8:2,9 16:14 141:24 strongly (3) 81:16 82:4 142:17 struck (2) 37:3 50:23 structure (1) 115:6 structured (1) 11:20 structures (1) 32:22 study (1) 81:22 stuff (5) 56:8 112:22 113:11 125:12 155:3 submit (2) 117:6,8 submitted (1) 121:11 substantial (1) 135:23 substantially (1) 32:21 substantiated (1) 135:24 subway (1) 67:22 success (2) 29:12 131:9 successful (1) 123:16 successfully (2) 4:17 141:13 sudden (4) 21:22 47:11,21 48:11 suddenly (1) 49:10 suffering (1) 52:13 sufficient (1) 53:14 suggest (3) 53:3 91:19 92:4 suggested (4) 69:13 81:15 91:22 91:25 suggesting (1) 133:16 suggestion (1) 52:21 summarily (2) 56:21 61:8 summarize (1) 73:21 summary (1) 136:4 summer (2) 6:21 21:13 summonses (7) 23:7 108:14,15,18 109:3,6 129:21 summonsing (1) 22:8 super (1) 155:9 support (16) 22:23 39:12,13 67:16 70:5,12 88:22 93:4 107:7,8 117:13 126:15 128:11 130:16 144:7 145:10 supported (2) 105:23 148:17 **supporting (1)** 63:22 supports (1) 106:21 suppose (2) 60:5 131:10 supposed (2) 22:9 105:14 supreme (4) 27:22 36:6 41:3 63:6 sure (15) 11:19 13:13 16:23 23:7

| | I | I |
|---|--|------------------------------------|
| 39:19 58:8 96:23 110:10,17 | taxis (13) 28:10 29:6 30:11,22 48:2 | 152:6,8,18,19 153:22,24 154:15 |
| 115:20 123:3,14 133:15 134:2 | 49:6,13 56:8 62:16 67:17 106:7 | 154:17 155:21 |
| 147:22 | 108:19 142:11 | thanks (4) 112:9 122:21 147:7 |
| surfaced (1) 43:9 | team (3) 8:14 20:5 23:5 | 148:14 |
| surprising (3) 38:18 104:13,17 | teams (1) 105:8 | theme (1) 152:22 |
| surrounding (1) 74:21 | tearing (1) 24:21 | thereof (1) 56:25 |
| survey (1) 106:21 | technologies (1) 142:19 | thicket (1) 104:7 |
| surveys (1) 106:19 | technology (3) 19:10 52:24 124:11 | thing (21) 12:13 13:19 16:21 19:20 |
| survive (2) 43:24 48:12 | tell (6) 22:14 116:20 120:24,25 | 20:16 22:25 43:10 55:7 66:2 |
| suspect (2) 83:6 86:7 | 122:6 146:12 | 89:20 91:6 129:16 132:22 134:13 |
| swimming (1) 47:14 | telling (1) 6:9 | 142:3 143:3,6 144:8 148:23 |
| system (3) 67:21 102:10 129:12 | tells (1) 60:16 | 150:23 155:5 |
| systems (4) 34:13,16,20 142:16 | ten (1) 135:12 | things (20) 4:10 10:7 20:22 42:9 |
| Systems (4) 34.13,10,20 142.10 | | |
| т | tenets (1) 141:22 | 43:2,3,8 72:23 78:19 99:2 110:10 |
| | tenure (1) 148:4 | 118:23 122:13,19 124:11 128:25 |
| T (2) 156:2,2 | terms (2) 60:12 87:8 | 129:24 149:18 150:12 154:5 |
| table (6) 79:23 84:11 85:3,12 | test (26) 29:3,19 32:12,15,20 33:17 | think (95) 4:17 8:22 9:8,10,18 |
| 146:21 148:10 | 40:5,10 43:16 52:23 53:15 57:10 | 11:12 12:14 21:20 22:5 25:3 43:4 |
| tabled (1) 84:23 | 58:17,22 61:9 69:18,23 71:7,10 | 44:10 45:5 50:5 57:11 59:5,17 |
| tabling (2) 80:7 84:12 | 74:14 75:15 79:24 80:3 81:19 | 60:5,8 71:5 72:15,19,25 74:14 |
| tackled (1) 72:14 | 96:7 113:11 | 78:3,6,7 80:12,15,21,22 81:11,12 |
| tailor-made (1) 64:4 | tested (11) 28:23 33:22 34:6 51:10 | 83:7,14 84:5,8 85:11 86:14,19 |
| tails (1) 135:15 | 63:16 64:19,21 68:13 69:14 82:9 | 87:3,8,11,16,18,19 88:15,16,23 |
| take (16) 7:15,23 8:14 37:19 55:9 | 90:15 | 89:16,25 90:13 91:10 92:16 93:2 |
| 78:11 81:4 92:11,11 107:2 108:4 | testified (1) 52:7 | 97:10 99:4,24 100:2,7,12,23 |
| 112:7 115:4 124:20 134:15 | testify (2) 27:18 130:15 | 102:13 109:4,9,15 110:11,24 |
| 138:25 | testimonies (1) 130:9 | 111:6,10,14,21 114:25 115:3 |
| taken (4) 17:12 116:4 137:8 140:24 | testimony (7) 72:8 85:17 86:16 | 117:10,17 119:24 120:21 121:5,7 |
| takes (2) 13:12 99:7 | 117:8 130:23 137:13 139:24 | 121:13,19,23 123:9,14 125:12 |
| talk (3) 77:10 118:6 151:18 | testing (25) 1:8 26:20 31:21 32:2,3 | 136:21 141:10 143:18 144:18 |
| talked (5) 98:23 110:5 113:9 | 50:19 52:3 55:6 58:6,13 62:10,12 | 147:20 149:10 150:4 153:18,21 |
| 116:17 127:24 | 62:19 65:3 67:18 73:25 84:13 | thinking (3) 7:5,14,22 |
| talking (7) 20:24 43:11 54:14 60:21 | 85:13,22 87:18 88:22 89:2,8 | third (5) 20:14 58:12 62:13 63:3 |
| 113:12 124:10 154:20 | 105:20,21 | 132:15 |
| taller (1) 42:10 | tests (5) 21:6 57:18 58:16 63:21,24 | Thirty (1) 74:7 |
| | Thaler (8) 2:19 27:4 31:7,10 35:2 | thought (7) 9:16,25 42:6,25 43:17 |
| Tariq (1) 140:10 task (3) 14:15 15:11 17:3 | 101:19,24,25 | 109:18 118:23 |
| | | |
| tax (1) 129:19 | thank (107) 4:3 12:20 13:14 18:21 | thoughtful (1) 12:12 |
| taxi (68) 1:4 3:9 4:5 15:19,19 16:2 | 22:3 26:14,15 27:17 31:4 34:23 | thoughts (1) 13:18 |
| 25:22 27:3,16 28:16,17 29:9,23 | 34:25 39:14,15 44:25 45:18 46:2 | thousand (1) 135:16 |
| 30:6,9,14 31:9 32:5,20 33:13,14 | 49:15 50:10 54:3,5 55:21,22 | thousands (4) 29:4 147:8,9,9 |
| 33:19 34:5,11,22 35:13 36:10 | 58:24,25 61:19 66:4,5,18 70:22 | three (14) 26:5 55:10,15 58:16 |
| 40:8 42:4 43:2 46:23,23 48:24 | 71:10,11,18,24 72:2 73:9,11 | 82:2,13 84:20 95:18 102:3 103:2 |
| 49:9,23 50:14,24 51:9 56:4 62:13 | 74:10,12 79:10 88:11 89:11 | 132:14,23 133:11 134:20 |
| 63:5,9,13 66:15 68:10 70:3,20 | 96:21 97:13,15,23 99:11,13 | three-minute (1) 27:6 |
| 71:2 73:7 86:4 90:5,14 101:18 | 101:23 103:21 105:6 110:12 | threshold (1) 89:21 |
| 102:21 104:5 126:12,18,23 | 112:5 114:17,18 116:14,15 | thrilled (1) 11:2 |
| 127:18 129:6 130:24 142:12 | 117:18,20,25 119:23 120:3,4,8 | throat (1) 30:3 |
| 147:14 148:12,17 149:3 151:17 | 120:12 123:22,23,25 126:9 | throats (1) 37:8 |
| 153:4 | 127:21,22,23 128:3,22 129:25 | throws (1) 43:23 |
| taxicab (11) 40:13 42:8,24 62:4 | 130:2,3 132:17 136:17,18 138:3 | tie (1) 88:4 |
| 68:16 73:23 94:19 95:3,7,9 141:8 | 139:23 140:9,10,25 141:3,5 | tieing (1) 87:17 |
| taxicabs (4) 8:22 64:14 105:17 | 142:7 143:24 144:10,22,23 | till (1) 139:18 |
| 141:13 | 148:25 149:2,4,5,9 150:7 151:4 | time (49) 1:15 6:10,22 11:7,9 12:6 |
| | | |
| | 1 | 1 |

| | | 19 |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| | | |
| 19:8 21:12,13 22:22 28:19 31:5 | 79:5 82:13 83:2,16 86:16 96:13 | tutelage (2) 123:11,11 |
| 34:15 36:6,24 39:17 41:14 49:10 | 100:20 104:20,22 112:10 114:11 | twice (4) 51:6 65:15 71:5 103:14 |
| 49:16 53:14 56:16 70:5 73:4 | 117:18 141:19 142:2 | two (27) 18:4,8,23 26:17 27:5 45:8 |
| | | |
| 75:11 78:5 88:25 92:6 98:18,22 | Today's (1) 70:16 | 46:19 48:4 50:2 62:5 77:14 88:7 |
| 101:21 109:23 114:19 117:5 | told (2) 35:11 98:8 | 91:13 94:21 95:18 101:16 102:15 |
| 118:18 123:8 124:17 125:3,6 | tomorrow (10) 11:23,23 42:5 | 112:17,19 120:10 130:9 131:4 |
| 127:23 128:18 136:7 139:2 | 50:24 62:14 63:5,10,14 73:7 | 132:20 133:11,11 150:18 154:14 |
| 146:19 149:22 152:7,17 153:7 | 118:15 | type (1) 133:21 |
| 154:2 155:25 | ton (1) 19:7 | |
| timeless (1) 124:13 | top (1) 47:17 | UU |
| timely (1) 87:19 | top-heavy (1) 37:23 | U.S (2) 28:6 35:10 |
| times (7) 20:14 104:23 121:24 | Tormey (5) 2:17 25:18,19,20 26:15 | ultimately (2) 129:5 137:23 |
| 135:12,14,14,16 | TOT (2) 64:16 65:13 | unanimous (1) 26:13 |
| timing (1) 68:23 | totaling (1) 104:24 | unanticipated (1) 49:8 |
| tinkered (1) 36:17 | touched (1) 56:15 | unapproved (1) 28:20 |
| | | |
| tip (1) 99:9 | tout (1) 106:22 | unbelievably (1) 15:9 |
| tipping (1) 37:24 | touted (1) 63:13 | unclear (1) 125:20 |
| tissues (1) 112:4 | TPEP (8) 8:18 58:7,9 102:15,20 | uncomfortable (1) 81:4 |
| TLC (200) 2:17 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 | 103:20 125:4 142:16 | underestimated (1) 10:5 |
| 8:16 9:1 10:1,22 11:1,5 12:1,13 | track (1) 100:16 | undergo (3) 50:18 62:18 67:18 |
| 13:1 14:1,2,20 15:1 16:1 17:1,12 | Trade (2) 62:4 141:8 | undermined (1) 68:18 |
| 18:1 19:1 20:1,6 21:1 22:1 23:1 | traditional (1) 60:10 | underserved (1) 117:16 |
| 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 | Traffic (1) 32:11 | understand (18) 32:14 39:19,22 |
| 30:1 31:1 32:1,13 33:1 34:1,9 | trains (2) 67:23 149:22 | 76:6 77:17 89:15 91:8 96:14 |
| 35:1,12,14,18 36:1,8,10,13 37:1 | tranche (1) 4:15 | 100:25 108:17 114:24 115:21 |
| 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 | transaction (4) 103:7,11,15,18 | 116:9 123:12 131:18 133:15 |
| 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 | transcript (1) 156:12 | 138:25 145:11 |
| | | |
| 50:1,21 51:1,11,17,19 52:1,6,13 | transformed (1) 23:10 | understandable (1) 109:22 |
| 53:1,4,13 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 | transit (3) 67:21 106:25 107:3 | understanding (3) 14:12 75:9 |
| 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1,13 | transition (1) 11:21 | 136:9 |
| 63:18 64:1 65:1 66:1,20 67:1,3 | transmitted (1) 57:7 | unfair (2) 111:7,22 |
| 68:1 69:1 70:1,6,12 71:1,3,20 | transparent (3) 36:3 37:2 53:23 | uninformed (1) 139:22 |
| 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 | Transportation (1) 67:8 | unintended (1) 33:12 |
| 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1,20 | travel (1) 142:14 | unique (2) 115:5,12 |
| 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 | treated (1) 71:9 | unit (4) 14:6 18:6 23:6 147:12 |
| 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 | tree (1) 153:18 | University (1) 67:6 |
| 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1 | tremendous (1) 17:20 | unnecessary (1) 111:11 |
| 102:1 103:1 104:1,3,8 105:1,14 | trend (1) 105:13 | unprecedented (1) 22:10 |
| 105:24 106:1,2,5 107:1 108:1 | tried (4) 35:20 36:18 51:13 151:22 | unregulated (1) 112:22 |
| 109:1 110:1 111:1 112:1 113:1 | trips (1) 133:21 | unsafe (1) 70:19 |
| 114:1 115:1 116:1 117:1 118:1 | trivial (1) 14:10 | |
| | | unstated (1) 50:17 |
| 119:1 120:1 121:1 122:1 123:1 | true (7) 7:16 41:12 51:16 60:14 | unsupported (1) 62:25 |
| 124:1 125:1 126:1 127:1 128:1 | 90:6 135:18 156:13 | untested (1) 32:17 |
| 129:1,19 130:1 131:1,6 132:1,6 | truly (1) 83:23 | unwilling (1) 36:23 |
| 133:1 134:1,16 135:1,8 136:1 | trunk (14) 46:22 59:6,8,10,19,22 | up-fitted (1) 10:18 |
| 137:1 138:1 139:1 140:1 141:1 | 59:22 60:4,6,10,18 61:12,17,18 | upcoming (1) 72:20 |
| 142:1 143:1,3,5 144:1,14 145:1 | trust (3) 4:25 67:11 106:16 | updates (1) 40:25 |
| 146:1 147:1 148:1 149:1 150:1 | truth (1) 68:9 | upholds (1) 43:22 |
| 151:1 152:1 153:1 154:1 155:1 | try (2) 53:6 139:13 | urge (7) 31:3 65:16,17 86:25 88:6 |
| TLC's (3) 5:10 63:8,10 | trying (7) 27:25 29:14 52:2 92:16 | 138:8,19 |
| TLC-specified (1) 103:9 | 121:15 149:21 154:7 | urged (1) 85:21 |
| today (29) 5:3 15:12 24:25 26:17 | Tuncel (8) 2:18 27:2,9,14,15 | urgent (3) 65:9 72:16 82:24 |
| 27:18,20 28:25 30:5 37:20 43:21 | 101:17,20,23 | urges (1) 86:8 |
| 65:21 66:13 69:24 70:13 76:2 | Tunnel (1) 15:19 | |
| 03.21 00.13 03.24 / 0.13 / 0.2 | | urging (1) 62:8 |
| | | I |

| USB (1) 17:24 | vigilant (1) 16:25 | 156:17 |
|---|---|-----------------------------------|
| | | |
| use (21) 30:22 32:18 33:6 46:16,18 | vindictive (1) 53:22 | ways (3) 21:8 30:21 107:20 |
| 51:2 52:24 68:8 81:17 82:3 | violating (1) 100:3 | we'll (5) 45:13 76:20 79:14 80:20 |
| 105:16 112:20,21 118:17 120:2 | violations (2) 104:7,9 | 117:7 |
| 127:6 132:11 134:8 138:9 142:12 | voice (1) 127:15 | we're (21) 4:14 19:12 40:8 44:15 |
| 152:4 | voluntary (2) 132:8 134:11 | 45:21 60:21 65:21 69:24 77:9,10 |
| useful (5) 109:23 131:14 134:12 | vote (45) 26:13,22 31:3 39:2,9,9,10 | 77:11 78:3 83:11 100:3,8 111:8 |
| 136:22 137:6 | 62:9 65:16,18 75:5,15,16 76:2,23 | 115:12 116:12 144:15,17 154:10 |
| useless (1) 134:22 | 77:11 79:25 80:3,8,24 82:13 | we've (15) 11:11 13:24 17:10 |
| users (2) 68:6 102:22 | 83:16 84:11 85:13,22 88:3 95:14 | 21:18 24:15,18 25:3 44:6 85:16 |
| ushering (1) 154:15 | 95:17,23,24 96:3,5 97:22 100:23 | 86:16,18 109:3 110:14 150:4 |
| usually (2) 118:6 119:7 | 101:14 110:2,24 120:23 121:20 | 155:9 |
| utilize (1) 49:2 | 132:18 140:25 141:7 142:6 | wear (1) 146:13 |
| | 145:12 146:23 | wearing (1) 30:17 |
| VV | voted (4) 12:2 62:14 85:12 97:21 | wears (1) 99:6 |
| validated (2) 69:7 71:7 | voter (1) 114:14 | website (1) 38:6 |
| validation (2) 58:18 68:3 | votes (6) 45:8 50:2 77:14 95:19 | week (4) 11:25,25 153:5,15 |
| valuable (1) 132:5 | 96:13 130:8 | weekly (1) 155:2 |
| value (3) 5:2 57:16 132:12 | voting (2) 80:17 114:11 | weeks (3) 10:12 12:8 123:7 |
| valued (1) 155:17 | vulnerable (2) 17:7 38:16 | weigh (1) 144:4 |
| values (1) 132:10 | | Weinshall (16) 2:10 4:8 5:15,25 |
| van (6) 36:9 37:22 38:20,24 46:18 | W | 6:9,25 9:9,18,23 45:10 60:20 |
| 46:21 | wait (5) 20:14 75:19 105:17 118:14 | 77:5 84:25 93:12,16 95:20 |
| vanity (1) 38:25 | 139:18 | Weiss (1) 19:6 |
| variable (1) 139:6 | waiting (2) 81:4 153:8 | welcome (2) 125:2 128:5 |
| variation (2) 134:6 135:21 | waiting (2) 01.4 100.0 waiver (1) 102:16 | well-founded (1) 89:17 |
| various (3) 127:25 137:23 139:8 | walver (1) 102.10 walk (1) 119:19 | went (4) 4:16 104:10 142:15 |
| vehicle (47) 28:22 29:16,22 32:17 | walk (1) 113.19 wall (1) 138:21 | 146:19 |
| 33:13 37:23 38:18 40:4,18 42:7 | | |
| | want (77) 4:10 9:3 12:4,20,25 13:9 13:20 16:16 18:20 19:22 28:21 | western (1) 112:15 |
| 43:9 46:16 47:3,25 49:2,5,9 51:3 | | whatnot (1) 41:2 |
| 51:9,15 52:23 53:5,15 56:9,15 | 39:18,25 40:19 41:19 42:6,7,9 | wheelchair (6) 6:7,16 11:3 60:2,3 |
| 57:2,2,8,14,24 58:3 60:12 64:2 | 43:8,19 44:4 57:22 58:8 61:4 | 60:9 |
| 64:19 68:2,9 69:2,7 70:14,17 | 70:23 77:21 78:13,14 79:18,19 | WHEREOF (1) 156:19 |
| 71:6 82:9 83:23 89:5,7 90:4 95:9 | 80:9,11 81:12 87:15 88:2 89:14 | who've (1) 23:9 |
| vehicle's (1) 68:19 | 90:5,22 96:21,23 97:15 99:9,21 | wholeheartedly (1) 67:16 |
| vehicles (21) 10:4 29:2,12 30:8 | 107:15 108:16 109:7 110:4,12 | wife (2) 98:9,17 |
| 35:13 50:14,16,16,18 51:22,22 | 117:9 118:17 120:13 121:21 | Wilde (1) 107:20 |
| 53:8,16 57:18 60:2,4,9 61:12 | 122:9 125:23 129:11 133:5,15 | winter (1) 21:12 |
| 70:20 94:4 133:3 | 136:19 137:17 138:25 139:15,25 | wish (10) 13:11 30:13 39:18 50:8 |
| vehicular-impact (1) 46:6 | 141:5,7 143:12,24 145:13,25 | 101:10 107:15 108:4 111:10 |
| vendor (1) 102:21 | 148:6,25 149:2,9 150:9,13 151:6 | 150:13 151:3 |
| vendor's (1) 103:20 | 151:13 152:6 | withdraw (1) 76:12 |
| ventilator-dependent (1) 47:22 | wanted (7) 8:15 12:18 42:25 119:8 | withdrawal (1) 33:14 |
| verification (1) 58:18 | 123:5 134:2 141:4 | within-entitled (1) 156:11 |
| verified (1) 133:9 | wanting (1) 127:10 | WITNESS (1) 156:19 |
| VeriFone (2) 118:3 120:9 | wants (1) 10:14 | Woloz (14) 2:25 54:8 55:23 61:21 |
| version (2) 91:13,15 | warning (1) 36:20 | 61:24 66:6 120:16 130:5 140:12 |
| versus (2) 59:22 77:16 | Waseem (4) 3:9 126:4,6,11 | 140:16,21 141:2,3 145:4 |
| vertebra (2) 47:18 48:10 | wasn't (2) 28:23 92:12 | won (1) 119:7 |
| veterinarian (1) 134:25 | way (26) 7:20 11:20 12:12 18:3 | wonderful (1) 153:21 |
| Vic (1) 42:22 | 20:22 21:4,11 29:22 42:14 52:10 | Woodside (2) 15:20 20:20 |
| vice (1) 98:14 | 60:15 69:16 83:10,13 88:5 94:16 | word (3) 85:25 140:4 152:5 |
| view (5) 43:25 44:3 76:6 89:5,6 | 97:4,21 105:22 131:13 132:21 | words (8) 7:21 40:12 77:22 79:19 |
| views (3) 44:3 76:21 100:24 | 133:10 143:13 144:18 151:24 | 91:17 92:7 141:4 149:9 |
| | | |
| | | |

| | | 21 |
|---|------------------------------------|---|
| | | |
| work (26) 15:2,8 17:21 18:19 19:25 | 107:11,16,19,25 108:16,16 127:3 | 117 (1) 117:1 |
| 20:4 21:10,23 23:16,19 98:15 | 150:19 | 118 (1) 118:1 |
| | | |
| 114:5,5 127:7 129:8,14 135:7 | yearlong (1) 105:15 | 119 (1) 119:1 |
| 144:2,4 145:21 149:23 151:16 | years (28) 7:18 14:7 20:15 27:25 | 12 (9) 5:10 12:1 37:20 82:22 98:15 |
| 152:10 153:10,10 154:24 | 28:12 35:10 50:6 52:9,16 55:11 | 104:2 105:4,11 124:25 |
| worked (3) 58:23 110:8 124:2 | 55:15 56:13 71:20 97:17 99:5,7 | 12-hour (1) 129:8 |
| worker (1) 14:18 | 104:2 105:4 109:2 110:9 123:10 | 12-year (1) 83:12 |
| workers (3) 15:7 146:20 147:3 | 124:24 126:12,14 146:10 147:5 | 12/19/13 (152) 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 |
| | | |
| workforce (1) 147:2 | 150:19,20 | 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 |
| working (15) 4:21 17:14 20:5 | yellow (8) 68:6 105:17 106:10 | 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 |
| 24:12 56:2,11 116:13 122:14 | 112:18 141:12 142:10,12,18 | 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 |
| 127:4 128:3 149:24 152:3,6 | yellows (1) 153:12 | 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 |
| 153:5 155:19 | yesterday (4) 15:13 18:23 20:25 | 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 |
| works (2) 21:23 115:11 | 153:3 | 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 |
| world (3) 28:7 67:21 155:8 | yield (1) 11:13 | 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 |
| | | |
| worry (2) 104:14 153:15 | York (28) 1:3,15,15,23 5:12,13 | 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 |
| worth (2) 100:24 109:19 | 16:8 27:21 28:9,14,16 31:9 36:6 | 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 |
| wouldn't (8) 24:7,9 41:25 109:13 | 48:25 49:11 50:14 64:9 67:19 | 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 |
| 114:4 143:13 152:4 153:11 | 70:3,9,20 71:8 114:14 115:5 | 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 |
| writing (1) 138:20 | 129:3 156:3,4,8 | 76:1 77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 |
| | | 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 |
| wrong (5) 28:10 81:25 126:2 140:6 | Yorkers (2) 67:22 117:12 | |
| 140:7 | | 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 |
| | Z | 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 |
| X | zone (8) 37:25 56:25 57:3,5,13 | 100:1 101:1 102:1 103:1 104:1 |
| | 59:4 102:3,7 | 105:1 106:1 107:1 108:1 109:1 |
| Y | zones (1) 46:25 | 110:1 111:1 112:1 113:1 114:1 |
| Yassky (145) 2:6 4:2,9 5:17 6:3,11 | | 115:1 116:1 117:1 118:1 119:1 |
| | 0 | |
| 7:3 9:12,20,25 13:14 23:23 25:12 | | 120:1 121:1 122:1 123:1 124:1 |
| 25:15,25 26:9,12,16 27:11,12 | | 125:1 126:1 127:1 128:1 129:1 |
| 28:13 29:8 31:6,11 34:25 39:15 | 11 | 130:1 131:1 132:1 133:1 134:1 |
| 41:16,25 44:13 45:2,12,19 50:10 | 1 (4) 1:1 63:12 94:25 103:3 | 135:1 136:1 137:1 138:1 139:1 |
| 53:18 54:4 55:22,25 56:21 58:25 | 10 (3) 10:1 126:12 139:21 | 140:1 141:1 142:1 143:1 144:1 |
| 59:14 60:22 61:3,7,19 66:5,9 | 100 (2) 100:1 139:19 | 145:1 146:1 147:1 148:1 149:1 |
| 70:22 71:11,16 73:11,16 74:10 | 1004 (1) 5:13 | 150:1 151:1 152:1 153:1 154:1 |
| | | |
| 75:23 76:15 77:12,20 78:25 79:8 | 101 (1) 101:1 | 155:1 |
| 79:14,22 80:2,6 84:10,19 85:5,9 | 102 (1) 102:1 | 120 (1) 120:1 |
| 86:17 87:5 88:8 89:10 91:23 92:3 | 103 (1) 103:1 | 121 (1) 121:1 |
| 92:10,15,23 93:13,18,22 94:6,12 | 104 (1) 104:1 | 122 (1) 122:1 |
| 94:15 95:12 96:19 97:25 98:10 | 105 (1) 105:1 | 123 (1) 123:1 |
| 98:20 99:13,17 100:5,17 101:12 | 10543 (1) 1:23 | 124 (1) 124:1 |
| | | 125 (1) 125:1 |
| 101:22 102:2 103:22 104:11,14 | 106 (1) 106:1 | . , |
| 104:15 106:15 107:13 108:2 | 107 (1) 107:1 | 126 (1) 126:1 |
| 110:21 111:19 112:2 114:18,22 | 108 (1) 108:1 | 127 (1) 127:1 |
| 116:15 117:20 119:5,24 120:8,14 | 109 (1) 109:1 | 128 (1) 128:1 |
| 121:25 122:6,17,22,25 123:4 | 11 (3) 11:1 92:9 94:3 | 129 (1) 129:1 |
| 124:4,16 125:22 127:22 128:6,13 | 11:48 (1) 155:25 | 13 (3) 13:1 25:23 63:20 |
| 130:2,10 132:3 133:14,25 134:9 | 110 (1) 110:1 | 130 (1) 130:1 |
| | | 131 (1) 131:1 |
| 136:18 138:24 140:3,8,18,23 | 1100 (1) 153:6 | |
| 141:14 144:23 145:7 146:8 149:5 | 111 (1) 111:1 | 132 (1) 132:1 |
| 151:4,8 152:8,13 154:17 | 112 (1) 112:1 | 133 (1) 133:1 |
| Yassky's (1) 124:8 | 113 (1) 113:1 | 134 (1) 134:1 |
| Yeah (3) 122:4 125:22 153:23 | 114 (1) 114:1 | 135 (1) 135:1 |
| year (18) 12:3 32:6 50:4,5 65:25 | 115 (1) 115:1 | 136 (1) 136:1 |
| 74:24 89:8 92:7 94:8 104:8 | 116 (1) 116:1 | 137 (1) 137:1 |
| 17.27 00.0 02.1 07.0 107.0 | | |
| | I | I |

212.953.3767 - 914.381.2061 stenokat@verizon.net

| 130 (1) 120.1 | 24th (2) 5.9 21 | 59 31 (1) 102:2 |
|--|------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 138 (1) 138:1 | 24th (2) 5:8,21 | 58-21 (1) 103:3 |
| 139 (2) 1:22 139:1 | 25 (4) 25:1 50:6 56:13 99:7 | 59 (1) 59:1 |
| 14 (1) 14:1 | 25th (2) 5:9,22 | |
| 140 (1) 140:1 | 26 (1) 26:1 | 6 |
| 141 (1) 141:1 | 26th (2) 5:6,18 | 6 (1) 6:1 |
| 142 (1) 142:1 | 27 (1) 27:1 | 60 (1) 60:1 |
| 143 (1) 143:1 | 28 (1) 28:1 | 60/40 (2) 6:18,23 |
| 144 (1) 144:1 | 28th (1) 15:18 | 61 (1) 61:1 |
| 145 (1) 145:1 | 29 (4) 29:1 132:7,14 133:5 | 62 (1) 62:1 |
| 146 (1) 146:1 | 29 (4) 29.1 152.7,14 155.5 | |
| | 3 | 63 (1) 63:1 |
| 147 (1) 147:1 | | 64 (1) 64:1 |
| 148 (1) 148:1 | 3 (2) 3:1 103:3 | 65 (1) 65:1 |
| 149 (1) 149:1 | 30 (2) 30:1 147:5 | 650,000 (1) 68:5 |
| 15 (3) 15:1 74:4 147:5 | 30th (2) 91:16,17 | 66 (1) 66:1 |
| 150 (2) 21:21 150:1 | 31 (2) 31:1 95:10 | 67 (1) 67:1 |
| 151 (1) 151:1 | 31st (2) 93:11 95:6 | 67-04(b) (2) 33:21 95:2 |
| 152 (1) 152:1 | 32 (1) 32:1 | 67th (1) 22:15 |
| 153 (1) 153:1 | 33 (3) 1:14 5:11 33:1 | 68 (1) 68:1 |
| 154 (1) 154:1 | 34 (1) 34:1 | 69 (1) 69:1 |
| 155 (1) 155:1 | | 65 (1) 65.1 |
| | 34th (1) 66:23 | 7 |
| 156 (1) 156:1 | 35 (1) 35:1 | |
| 16 (1) 16:1 | 36 (1) 36:1 | 7 (1) 7:1 |
| 168 (3) 5:4,23 6:23 | 37 (1) 37:1 | 7,200 (1) 104:10 |
| 17 (2) 17:1 146:9 | 38 (1) 38:1 | 70 (2) 70:1 104:22 |
| 18 (3) 18:1 74:6 104:21 | 381-2061 (1) 1:23 | 700 (1) 153:5 |
| 19 (3) 1:5,14 19:1 | 381-2064 (1) 1:24 | 71 (1) 71:1 |
| 1980s (1) 115:7 | 39 (1) 39:1 | 72 (1) 72:1 |
| 1993 (1) 104:20 | | 73 (1) 73:1 |
| 19th (1) 5:11 | 4 | 74 (1) 74:1 |
| 1st (1) 92:5 | 4 (2) 4:1 103:4 | 75 (2) 29:6 75:1 |
| 101 (1) 02:0 | 40 (1) 40:1 | 76 (1) 76:1 |
| 2 | | 77 (2) 77:1 131:16 |
| | 41 (1) 41:1 | |
| 2 (3) 2:1 94:25 103:3 | 42 (1) 42:1 | 78 (1) 78:1 |
| 2,000 (2) 7:16 8:11 | 43 (1) 43:1 | 78-21b(4) (1) 102:18 |
| 20 (2) 20:1 147:5 | 44 (1) 44:1 | 78-21d(1) (1) 102:5 |
| 200 (22) 6:12,21 9:10,13 29:15 | 45 (1) 45:1 | 79 (1) 79:1 |
| 30:8,16 36:9,23 37:22 38:24 | 46 (1) 46:1 | |
| 39:22 40:21 41:5 43:22 46:17 | 47 (1) 47:1 | 8 |
| 51:3,11 54:15 55:3 63:14,23 | 48 (1) 48:1 | 8 (1) 8:1 |
| 2004 (1) 32:8 | 49 (1) 49:1 | 80 (2) 80:1 139:16 |
| 2007 (1) 56:6 | | 80/20 (1) 139:14 |
| 200s (3) 39:25 40:6 55:7 | 5 | 81 (1) 81:1 |
| 2013 (9) 1:5,14 25:8 63:7,20 74:5,6 | 5 (1) 5:1 | 82 (1) 82:1 |
| 150:19 156:21 | | |
| | 50 (1) 50:1 | 83 (1) 83:1 |
| 2014 (10) 5:6,9 63:12 75:10 92:5 | 50/50 (1) 135:17 | 84 (1) 84:1 |
| 92:19 93:11,20 95:7,11 | 51 (1) 51:1 | 85 (1) 85:1 |
| 20th (2) 5:8,21 | 52 (1) 52:1 | 86 (1) 86:1 |
| 21 (1) 21:1 | 53 (1) 53:1 | 87 (1) 87:1 |
| 212 (1) 1:23 | 54 (1) 54:1 | 88 (1) 88:1 |
| 21st (3) 5:8,21 25:7 | 55 (1) 55:1 | 89 (1) 89:1 |
| 22 (2) 22:1 126:14 | 5500 (1) 141:12 | 8th (1) 63:7 |
| 22nd (1) 156:20 | 56 (1) 56:1 | |
| 23 (2) 23:1 131:10 | 57 (1) 57:1 | 9 |
| 24 (2) 24:1 106:3 | 58 (1) 58:1 | 9 (2) 5:9 9:1 |
| | | |
| | I | I |

| 9,128 (1) 32:7 9:45 (2) 1:15 4:6 90 (1) 90:1 900 (2) 15:21 16:12 91 (1) 91:1 914 (2) 1:23,24 92 (1) 92:1 93 (1) 93:1 94 (1) 94:1 95 (1) 95:1 95-DEPOS (1) 1:23 953-3767 (1) 1:23 96 (1) 96:1 97 (1) 97:1 98 (1) 98:1 99 (1) 99:1 | |
|---|--|
| | |