TRANSCRIPT OF THE

NEW YORK CITY

TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION

Thursday, June 19, 2014

33 BEAVER STREET

COMMISSION HEARING ROOM, 19TH FLOOR

BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.

139 Mamaroneck Avenue

Mamaroneck, New York 10543

(212)95-DEPOS (953-3767)*(914)381-2061

Email: stenokat@verizon.net

Fax: 914)381-2064

1	
2	HEARING CONVENED AT 9:40 A.M.
3	COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:
4	
5	Meera Joshi, The Chair
6	Elias Arout
7	Frank Carone
8	Edward Gonzales
9	Nora Constance Marino (present for general meeting)
10	Iris Weinshall
11	
12	ALSO PRESENT:
13	Chris Wilson, Assistant General Counsel
14	Christopher Tormey, Director of Applicant Licensing
15	Jo Rausen, Director of Technology Programs
16	
17	Staff
18	The Public
19	The Press
20	
21	
22	Reported by:
	Kari L. Reed
23	
24	
25	

1		
1		
2	SPEAKERS ON INSURANCE DOCUMENTATION RULES	PAGE
3	Joseph Gatti, BCC Group	33
4	Sergio Sanchez, Luxury Base Operators	
5	Association	37
6	Bill Gorton, Ben's Limousine	41
7	Michael Katzman, Pro-Tech Agency	44
8	Phillip Hom, Windels Marx Lane and	
9	Mittendorf	47
10	Ethan Gerber, GNYTA	51
11	Pat Russo, Windels Marx Lane and	
12	Mittendorf	52
13	Osman Chowdhury	55
14		
15	CDEAKEDS ON TAXI SCHOOL WATER DILLES	DACE
16	SPEAKERS ON TAXI SCHOOL WAIVER RULES	PAGE
17	Peter Mazer, MTBOT	67
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	THE CHAIR: It's now 9:40, almost
3	9:40, and we're going to open our public
4	meeting. And the first item on the agenda is
5	a motion to move into executive session. All
6	in favor?
7	(Chorus of ayes)
8	THE CHAIR: Aye. So with that,
9	we'll move into executive session to review
10	an appeal from a discretionary revocation
11	licensee, Mohamed Diallo.
12	(Whereupon, an executive session
13	was begun at 9:40 a.m.)
14	(Recess taken)
15	(Whereupon, the Commissioners
16	returned from executive session and the
17	following proceedings commenced at 9:55 a.m.)
18	THE CHAIR: Good morning. It's
19	now 9:55 and we are going to continue with
20	our public session.
21	In the executive session the
22	Commission reviewed a discretionary or an
23	appeal from a discretionary revocation, and
24	it was the unanimous decision of the
25	Commission to reinstate the OATH Judge's

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 recommendation, which is for licensee Mohamed Diallo to reinstate a 45 day suspension and \$1,500 fine. And, in addition, the Commission has ordered that the licensee attend a six month anger management program. Previously the agency had modified the OATH's Judge's recommendation and revoked Mr. Diallo's license. So his license will now be reinstated, but he'll have a 45 day suspension. Next we'll move to the chairs' reports, and I'm just going to give you a few updates from last month. We have in the upcoming weeks a few information fairs on the Green Taxi program. It's for passengers as well as for potential purchasers. There's one in Queens, June 23rd; Manhattan, June 25th; Brooklyn,

In the past couple weeks we did -- we were -- participated in a hearing at City

June 26th; Staten Island, June 30th, and the

Bronx, July 7th. And we have some fliers, we

can put them in the back, as well as the

information is posted on our Web site.

2.1

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

Council on the Green Taxi program, and we also submitted to the state a disabled accessibility plan, outlining the agency's goals to create a more accessible fleet, yellow, green and livery, throughout New York City. And that plan is now with the state, and they will consider it for 60 days, and we should hear back from them by the end -- by mid August.

On enforcement. Year-to-date we've issued 913 street hail livery summonses against drivers or owners, and that is for street hail livery vehicles that are in the exclusionary zone picking up hail customers. And on seizures, which is illegal car service by wholly unlicensed vehicles, calendar year-to-date we've done 3,800 seizures.

Vision Zero. We've continued to attend town halls. And in the last month we attended one on May 22nd in the Bronx and June 3rd in Rockaway. And we have some upcoming in the Bronx, June 24 -- I'm sorry, June 24th in Queens, and in the Bronx tonight there will be one at Parkchester Library.

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

2.1

2.5

Also in the last week four pieces of legislation were passed by City Council that give the TLC additional tools to penalize drivers who are reckless and unsafe. All of them relate to drivers that are involved in serious crashes that involve critical injury, three of them do, and one of them requires the TLC to provide additional information on its Web site and to the public on crash data involving TLC licensed vehicles. Those have been passed by City Council. There was a hearing held a week ago at City Hall, and the mayor is expected to sign them in the upcoming weeks.

And today we have on our agenda another important TLC Vision Zero initiative, and that is a proposed -- before the Commission is a proposed pilot to test vehicle safety technology, that will really allow us to find out how this technology works in the for-hire industry. And there's really three categories of technology. Black boxes, which record data and, most importantly, how a vehicle -- vehicle data

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 prior to a crash. Alerting technology, which tells the driver when they are going above a 3 4 certain speed limit. And speed governing 5 technology, which actually stops the car from 6 going above certain speed limits. So we are 7 going to hear a presentation on that before the Commission votes on the proposed pilot. 8 9 We also have two rules packages up for hearing and vote. One of them is on a 10 11 lifetime exception to our education rule, our 12 taxi school, and the other one is really a 13 technical amendment to our rules to 14 memorialize a practice in insurance requirements by putting it into a rule, and 15 16 that simply is to put the vehicle identification numbers of covered vehicles on 17 the dec page of an umbrella policy. 18 19 So with that we are going to move to adoption of the minutes. All in favor of 20 2.1 adopting the minutes from the May 15th, 2014 22 Commission meeting? 23 (Chorus of ayes) 24 THE CHAIR: Aye. So with that, 2.5 the minutes are unanimously adopted. And now

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	we'll hear about base applications.
3	Good morning.
4	MR. TORMEY: Good morning. My
5	name is Christopher good morning. My name
6	is Chris Tormey. I'm the Director of
7	Applicant Licensing with the Taxi and
8	Limousine Commission. The following bases
9	are being recommended for approval this month
10	in your package, with three for denial.
11	THE CHAIR: So all in favor of
12	accepting the approvals and denials?
13	COMM. MARINO: Can you just tell
14	us why the denials?
15	MR. TORMEY: They didn't meet
16	their outstanding requirements in time. Some
17	had less than ten vehicles, different rules
18	infractions, so they didn't meet the
19	requirements.
20	COMM. MARINO: But they can
21	reapply if they want?
22	MR. TORMEY: They can.
23	Any other questions?
24	THE CHAIR: Okay. All in favor of
25	the approvals and denials?

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 (Chorus of ayes) 3 THE CHAIR: Aye. So those are 4 unanimously approved and denied. Thank you. 5 MR. TORMEY: Thank you. THE CHAIR: If Jo Rausen is 6 7 available, I'd like to move straight to our black box pilot resolution. 8 Since we have a minute while she 9 10 enters the room, I'm going to let Chris 11 Wilson just give a summary of what the actual resolution is before the pilot present --12 13 before the presentation of the pilot. 14 MR. WILSON: The resolution will 15 do -- will authorize the pilot for a one year 16 period. Participants will have to enter into 17 an MOU with the MO -- with the TLC regarding their participation in the pilot. 18 19 Participants will be required to submit 20 security and privacy plans as part of their 2.1 pilot proposal. Any participant with the 22 technology capturing passenger images or 23 video will be required to post warnings to passengers. Participants must also submit 24 cost information and describe how the 2.5

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

technology proposed will increase passenger and public safety. There should be no cost to drivers from the proposal. Participants will be required to report to the Commission regularly with data summarizing speed and speeding events, braking and hard braking events, acceleration and hard acceleration, collision events, algorithmic scoring, and a summary of all complaints related to the pilot program received from drivers, owners and passengers.

The Commission itself will prepare a report within four months of the conclusion of the program, summarizing the program and making conclusions and recommended rule making or not.

Participating vehicles will be exempt from certain TLC rules, including those eliminating additional equipment.

Drivers participating with vehicles will be exempt from some restrictions on the use of electronic communications devices, but only insofar as these relate to the technology being piloted. And data obtained during the

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 pilot will not be used for TLC enforcement, 3 although the data maybe reviewed in the event 4 of a serious crash that captures data 5 regarding that crash. The final resolution was -- for 6 7 action was posted in the Commission's Web site and transmitted to the Commissioners as 8 9 required by Local Law on June 16th. 10 THE CHAIR: Okay. And Jo's here 11 right now, good timing. MS. RAUSEN: Is there a clicker? 12 13 Good morning. My name is Jo Rausen. I'm the 14 Director of Technology Programs here at the This morning I'll be briefing you on 15 16 the vehicle safety technology pilot program 17 resolution that's before you today. This pilot program would allow all 18 19 of the industries that we regulate to put 20 various vehicle safety technologies into 2.1 service, and would enable the TLC to evaluate 22 the effectiveness of these technologies at 23 reducing crashes and dangerous driving behaviors. 24

This pilot program is one of the

2.5

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 many TLC initiatives outlined in Mayor de Blasio's Vision Zero action plan. Vision Zero is a wide reaching program to eliminate traffic fatalities in New York City that calls for street redesigns led by the Department of Transportation, public education campaigns, stepped up NYPD enforcement against the most dangerous driving behaviors, and increased vigilance on the part of all drivers, pedestrians and cyclists, to ensure that lives are not lost or forever altered due to preventable traffic crashes. Vehicle technologies like the ones proposed in the pilot present an excellent opportunity to improve the safety of TLC regulated industries by changing the everyday environment that drivers experience, and providing them with the tools to become even safer drivers.

While most TLC drivers are safe drivers already, they drive so many miles each year, and are such a big part of the City's traffic flow, that any improvements to their driving habits could help change the

2.1

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

tone of driving in New York City. By testing these technologies on a pilot basis, we will have the opportunity to obtain data to measure the impact that these technologies have on safety. We will also have the opportunity to gain feedback on them from the industry and from the public, and identify any implementation issues in a real world, for-hire application in New York City.

Based on the types of companies that responded to two safety technology requests for information that TLC released earlier this year, we expect pilot technologies to fall into three main categories. Black boxes record vehicle data and can identify events such as speeding and hard braking, which can indicate aggressive driving. These devices can be useful for analyzing the events that surrounded a crash, and have been found to cause drivers to be more cautious just by knowing that they're installed. They can also be used as a tool to provide drivers with feedback about their driving.

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

2.1

Many commercial fleets such as
FedEx and UPS use recording devices to
promote safety. Some insurance companies,
like Progressive, allow companies to use
these devices to demonstrate their driving
behavior and qualify for discounts. City
vehicles, including TLC's own service
vehicles, are also getting these types of
data recorders installed as a part of Vision
Zero. And TLC volunteered to be the first
agency to get them installed in our fleet.
In addition, some TLC regulated FHV fleets
have begun to install black boxes in their
cars already.

Driver alert systems take black box data recorders a step further and alert drivers when they're speeding or when there is something in their path. This live feedback can help drivers drive more safely, and over time drivers tend to get fewer alerts because they've positively modified their behaviors in response to the alerts. These types of systems are already in use in Dubai taxis, warning drivers when they exceed

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 a certain speed limit for 60 seconds.

2.1

Speed governors are devices that actually limit the speed that the vehicle can travel. They can be relatively simple and cap a vehicle's speed at a set speed limit, such as 55 miles per hour, or they can limit speeds at different levels in different geographic areas based on geofencing. Speed governors are already required in all commercial vehicles over 3.5 tons, and coaches with more than nine seats in the European Union.

Some of these technologies integrate with cameras that may face outwards towards the front of the vehicle, backwards towards the back of the vehicle, or inwards towards the driver. These are already in use in some New York City FHVs, and assist with determining the circumstances surrounding a crash and expediting insurance proceedings.

This footage can also be helpful in identifying the offenders when drivers are victims of crimes, and has been used to exonerate drivers who have been falsely

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

accused of wrong doing. In Russia and South

Korea, these types of things are extremely

common.

Vision Zero applies to all New
Yorkers and all TLC regulated vehicles. So
technology companies that apply to
participate may partner with owners of FHVs,
yellow taxis, borough taxis, commuter vans,
fleets, bases, or individual driver/owners.
They official pilot program participants will
be the technology companies. TLC will
evaluate their proposals and, if approved,
they will enter into a memorandum of
understanding with the TLC, further detailing
the provisions in the resolution before you
today.

Approved participating technology companies will identify owners of TLC regulated vehicles or businesses who wish to pilot their technologies. And these parties will agree on who will bear the cost of the pilot program, if any.

In any case where data are (sic) being collected, measures to protect privacy

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

are very important. The pilot resolution

contains various privacy protections. First,

privacy policies and protections will be one

of the criteria on which the TLC will

evaluate all proposals. Technologies that do

not adequately protect driver and passenger

privacy, such as unauthorized access, will

not be approved.

Second, both vehicle owners and drivers must consent to participate. This is an optional pilot.

Third, for technologies involving cameras, TLC will require stickers in the vehicles notifying passengers that the cameras are present.

Fourth, TLC will not use pilot data for enforcement. The point of this pilot is for the TLC and the industry to learn. So it's important that pioneering drivers are not penalized.

Finally, for technologies
involving cameras, TLC will not review video
except in the evaluation of circumstances
surrounding serious crashes. Most video,

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 therefore, will not be reviewed.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

In preparing for this program, the TLC benefited from several conversations with the New York Civil Liberties Union, whose input helped shape the privacy provisions in the resolution before you today.

We believe that the TLC will learn a great deal from this pilot. Our primary vehicle sources will be crash records derived from DMV accident reports, data collected by the safety technologies, and feedback from technology companies and TLC licensees that participate in the pilot. The goal of the pilot is to determine whether these technologies reduce the incidence of serious Therefore, a key indicator of the crashes. success of the technology will be whether the crash rates differ between drivers with and without safety technologies, and drivers with different types of safety technology. Our research and evaluation division will look at things such as pilot program drivers as compared to non-pilot program drivers, and pilot program drivers as compared to their

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 own past records, looking for evidence of improvement over time.

2.1

2.5

In addition to crash rates, we'll examine whether there is evidence that technologies are reducing the incidence of dangerous behaviors commonly associated with crashes. For example, we can look to see if drivers with a speeding alert system speed less frequently over time. We can compare the effectiveness of different types of technologies by looking at whether drivers with one technology reduce their speeding or hard braking more over time as compared to other groups.

We will also examine what types of behaviors are most highly correlated with crashes. For example, if we find that drivers who were speeding are more likely to get into serious crashes, but we find that hard braking is not highly associated with crashes amongst our regulated vehicles, it will help us prioritize what types of technologies and policies would be more helpful in the future.

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

2.1

2.5

Although safety is the primary motivation behind testing these technologies, we also want to understand the other values that they bring to drivers and owners. For example, some of these technologies help drivers improve fuel efficiency, or can remotely provide vehicle owners with maintenance alerts, such as an activation of a check engine alert.

Safety technologies can also sometimes help drivers get lower insurance rates. One industry player told us that he appreciates getting an alert when one of his drivers gets in a crash. He can reach out to the driver to see if he needs help, and take other steps necessary after the crash.

Finally, we'll also be learning what challenges exist with these technologies, and whether they are a good fit for all TLC regulated industries or -- as they are -- or with some modification.

Going forward, we envision the next following steps. First, you will have the opportunity to vote on the resolution

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 today. If it passes, the TLC will publish a template MOU outlining further details for 3 4 companies interested in participating. 5 that time TLC will be then accepting 6 proposals from technology companies. 7 will evaluate the proposals on a rolling basis. The pilot will officially launch when 8 9 the first approved technology goes into 10 service. Additional companies may join the 11 program while it's in progress. The pilot 12 will end a year after the first technology 13 goes into service. We will report our 14 findings to you every four months and at the 15 conclusion of the pilot. We hope that this 16 program will help identify which technologies 17 are most effective at preventing crashes and saving lives, and look forward to working 18 19 with the technology companies, the industry, and with you to learn more about their 20 2.1 effectiveness in New York City's for-hire 22 industries. 23 Thank you very much for

considering this pilot program resolution,

and I'm happy to answer any questions you may

24

25

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	have at this time.
3	COMM. WEINSHALL: I have a
4	question. How many vehicles do you plan on
5	putting these black boxes in?
6	MS. RAUSEN: We're going to leave
7	that up to the partnerships that the
8	technology companies can make with industry
9	partners. So however many, you know,
10	volunteers want to actually participate with
11	them are welcome to participate in the pilot.
12	COMM. WEINSHALL: But you hope
13	that there will be a big enough group so that
14	you
15	MS. RAUSEN: Correct.
16	COMM. WEINSHALL: will be able
17	to get a good data
18	MS. RAUSEN: Correct.
19	COMM. WEINSHALL: that will
20	come in.
21	MS. RAUSEN: Any data is good
22	data, but yes, obviously the more data that
23	we can collect, the more conclusions that we
24	can draw.
25	COMM. WEINSHALL: And you're going

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	to try and put these in an array of cars, not
3	just one
4	MS. RAUSEN: Correct. Correct.
5	COMM. WEINSHALL: vehicle,
6	you're going to try and get make sure
7	they're in all different vehicles?
8	MS. RAUSEN: Yes. We would love
9	to see them in all of the different types of
10	vehicles, because they all have different
11	patterns and rules and things that they
12	follow, so we would love to see that.
13	COMM. WEINSHALL: And would the
14	company be responsible for installing the
15	black box and then taking it out and doing
16	any repairs that are necessary?
17	MS. RAUSEN: Yes, that's correct.
18	COMM. WEINSHALL: Thank you.
19	MS. RAUSEN: No problem.
20	COMM. GONZALES: Okay, I have a
21	question. Can you elaborate a little bit on
22	what the participant's selection criteria
23	will be, like how we are going to decide
24	on
25	MS. RAUSEN: Sure. Sure. So we

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

are going to -- we're going to have them submit a proposal that basically speaks to how does their technology meet the goals of Vision Zero and safety. So it will describe what the technology does and what the safety goals are. They will have to produce a privacy plan that will talk about specific risks related to their technology in vehicles and how they're mitigated, as well as a security plan that talks about how they're going to safeguard the data and make sure there's not unauthorized access. And then we'll do some testing of our own. actually take a look at it in vehicles, similar to what we do with all of our technology programs with the EL pilot, and even with T-PEP and L-PEP we do testing and we take a look and see how they work and make sure that they're not interfering with any of the other operations of the vehicles, like the T-PEP if it's in a yellow taxi or the roof light or any other equipment that's

required to be in the vehicles. So we'll be

reviewing both, you know, proposals as to how

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	it's going to work, as well as doing our own
3	testing of the solutions.
4	COMM. GONZALES: Okay. Thank you.
5	MS. RAUSEN: Any other questions?
6	MR. WILSON: Are there any other
7	questions from the Commissioners?
8	(No response)
9	MR. WILSON: Are we ready to vote?
10	Okay. Do you want me to do a roll call?
11	Okay.
12	Commissioner Carone?
13	COMM. CARONE: Yes.
14	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Arout?
15	COMM. AROUT: Yes.
16	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Joshi?
17	THE CHAIR: Yes.
18	MR. WILSON: Commissioner
19	Weinshall?
20	COMM. WEINSHALL: Yes.
21	MR. WILSON: Commissioner
22	Gonzales?
23	COMM. GONZALES: Yes.
24	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Marino?
25	COMM. MARINO: Yes.

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	MR. WILSON: Thank you.
3	THE CHAIR: The resolution is
4	adopted with a unanimous vote.
5	Next
6	COMM. WEINSHALL: Can I, I'm
7	sorry, I should have asked you this when you
8	gave your report, and I was remiss, I was on
9	my iPhone. So I have noticed, because I
10	travel around the city a lot for my job, that
11	there are a number of taxi garages that have
12	many new Taxi of Tomorrows in their
13	facilities. And some of them look as though
14	they are hacking them up, they are getting
15	them ready.
16	COMM. MARINO: Iris, is your mike
17	on?
18	COMM. WEINSHALL: Yeah, it is on.
19	But they are getting them ready to go on the
20	street and I've seen some on the street. Can
21	you sort of give us a update as to
22	THE CHAIR: Sure.
23	COMM. WEINSHALL: the numbers
24	and fleets voluntarily buying these cabs and
25	what's going on?

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

2.1

THE CHAIR: Sure. The Taxi of
Tomorrow, the NV200 taxi, is an authorized
taxi model, so anyone who purchases one can
hack it up and put it into service. So the
ones that you see in service are done on a
voluntary basis. People have chosen that
vehicle among 16 other models that they could
have chosen. They chose to buy the Taxi of
Tomorrow. To date we have 238 Taxi of
Tomorrows in service. And they are probably
about at sort of an increasing rate, but even
this week I think there were about nine or
ten a day were coming in to be hacked up.

COMM. WEINSHALL: Okay. Thank you.

THE CHAIR: Next on the agenda is a rule package amending certain requirements for insurance paperwork that is submitted to licensing prior to getting your TLC license. We have a hearing first on the rule and then we can, if the Commission is ready, move to a vote. So first on our speaker list is Joseph Gatti, BCC Group.

MR. WILSON: Perhaps before

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 Mr. Gatti begins I'll just give a quick summary of the rule for the benefit of the Commissioners and the audience. The rule is intended to aid Commission staff in reviewing insurance policies provided as proof of insurance by licensees. Notably, the rule doesn't change current TLC standards for amounts of liability to be provided. Currently \$100,000 per occurrence and \$300,000 per occurrence for bodily injury and death for taxis in most for-hire vehicles, with higher limits for larger for-hire vehicles. In developing the rules, the TLC consulted with insurers and brokers, and we believe that most will have no difficulty in complying with the standards. In fact, several of the insurers told us that in fact they will have no difficulty in complying with the standards. Specifically under the rules, the

Specifically under the rules, the declaration page for an insurance policy submitted must include: The level of insurance provided for personal injury protection; the level of insurance provided

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 for bodily injury and death; the name of the registered vehicle owner, who must be the licensee as the named insured; policy dates identical to those in the certificate of insurance; a policy number identical to that on the certificate of insurance; and, if the registered vehicle owner is submitting a policy for more than one vehicle and a schedule of the vehicle identification numbers is provided, it will be accepted only if the name of the insured -- if the named insured is the same on both the certificate and the declaration page. In addition, the rules provide that the schedule of vehicles must tie each vehicle by VIN number to the type of insurance provided, the insurer must be authorized to provide coverage in New York state, and no report forms will be authorized.

Finally, for black cars, luxury limousines and certain larger livery vehicles, base umbrella policies will not be accepted as proof of additional coverage in excess of TLC's regular limits, unless the

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 base actually owns those vehicles. 3 The rules were published in the 4 City Record on May 14, 2014, and comments were due June 13th, 2014. Two comments were 5 received, which were forwarded to the 6 7 Commission. No changes have been proposed to the rule as originally published. The final 8 9 rule for action was posted on the Commission's Web site and transmitted to 10 11 Commissioners as required by Local Law on 12 June 16th. 13 COMM. MARINO: I have a question before you continue. You said that the 14 15 limits right now are one hundred, three 16 hundred, the limits right now are one 17 hundred, three hundred for regular cars and you said they're greater for larger cars. 18 19 Can you be more specific? 20 MR. WILSON: Sure. Our for-hire 2.1 vehicle rules provide that -- so those are the limits for taxis and most for-hire 22 23 vehicles. And then --24 COMM. MARINO: I think it's the 2.5 larger vehicles, the limos, what's the limit

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	on that?
3	MR. WILSON: Correct. Let me give
4	you those, I've just got to find them.
5	So for for-hire vehicles with a
6	seating capacity of nine to 15 passengers,
7	it's a minimum liability for bodily injury
8	and death of one million five hundred
9	thousand. And then for luxury limousines
10	COMM. MARINO: Hold on, a single
11	limit, one point five?
12	MR. WILSON: A single limit of one
13	point five.
14	COMM. MARINO: Okay.
15	MR. WILSON: And then for luxury
16	limousines with a seating capacity of less
17	than nine, it's a single limit of one point
18	five million.
19	COMM. MARINO: So they're both one
20	point five million?
21	MR. WILSON: Excuse me?
22	COMM. MARINO: So they're both one
23	point five million?
24	MR. WILSON: Yes. Oh, excuse me,
25	no, no. For one to eight it's five hundred

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	per person and a \$1,000,000 per occurrence
3	for the luxury limousines.
4	COMM. MARINO: I'm sorry, five
5	hundred what?
6	MR. WILSON: Five hundred per
7	person and \$1,000,000 per occurrence on
8	limousines for one to eight passengers.
9	COMM. MARINO: So five hundred/one
10	million for one to eight, and one point five
11	single limit for nine plus, and one
12	hundred/three hundred for everything else;
13	correct?
14	MR. WILSON: And then yes. And
15	then for luxury limousines which seat 16 to
16	20 passengers, it's a single limit of five
17	million.
18	COMM. MARINO: All right. I have
19	questions, but perhaps we'll listen first.
20	MR. GATTI: And I have copies of
21	this if you want, anybody wanted them.
22	MR. WILSON: Yes.
23	THE CHAIR: You can give it to the
24	inspector there.
25	MR. GATTI: Good morning,

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 Commissioners. My name is Joseph Gatti, and I'm the Executive Vice President and Chief 3 4 Operating Officer of the BCC Group, which is 5 an insurance brokerage firm, consulting and underwriting, here in the city. I have 6 7 almost 30 years --THE CHAIR: Do you mind just 8 9 speaking a little louder? 10 MR. GATTI: I'm sorry. 11 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 12 MR. GATTI: I have almost 30 years 13 of experience in the insurance industry. And 14 I have worked for companies, local companies, such as AIG, AI and Willis. My resume is 15 16 attached for your reference. And I'm here to 17 testify against the proposed changes in the TLC's rules regarding insurance requirements, 18 19 which would, among other things, prohibit the use of excess insurance to meet the TLC 20 2.1 insurance requirements, as you just stated. 22 Using excess insurance provides 23 TLC licensed businesses and drivers an 24 affordable way to meet TLC requirements, 25 while providing adequate protection for the

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

public. Excess auto liability is a

statutorily approved form of insurance by the

New York State Department of Financial

Services. And until about 18 months it was

also --

COMM. MARINO: Louder, slower.

MR. GATTI: The excess liability is statutorily approved by the insurance -- New York State Department of Financial Services, and until about 18 months ago it was also accepted by the TLC. Excess auto liability insurance is accepted by regulatorily (sic) authorities for taxi and for-hire across the United States and in New York state.

Our policies specifically identifies the vehicle and the driver, and provides 24/7 coverage to the vehicle. Our declaration page clearly states the level of insurance provided for bodily injury and/or death. The insurance carrier has been authorized by the state and federal government to write excess auto liability in New York state. Each individual vehicle is

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014
issued their own policy with one policy
number which matches the insured on the dec
page and the certificates of insurance that
are issued. Our declaration page clearly
states the effective date of coverage.

There is an important aspect that has not been addressed. Our policy and our insurance company is an A rated carrier, and our reinsurer is an A plus fifteen, excellent, with five billion in assets, to cover claims. Our primary carriers are NR, and they don't have the size, reserves, experience and support as the well-established carriers in our program. In addition, the primary carriers do not have enough capacity or surplus to meet the demands of the new rules mandating the higher limits. Therefore, our excess program would provide a lower cost option, with full coverage for the increased demand.

We are also approved by our insurance carriers to write higher limits for medallion owners. It is voluntary. Some have decided to purchase that to cover

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 catastrophic losses.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Many of the TLC licensed entities are small businesses that are the foundation of this great city. By prohibiting the use of excess insurance to meet TLC's insurance requirements, you will deprive many of these small businesses of the lower cost option and reduce competition. This rule may have the unintended consequences of driving home -driving TLC regulated business and individuals from seeking TLC licensing because they cannot meet their insurance requirements. We will also surely reduce the choices that TLC drivers have, and businesses, and raise insurance policies because of the lack of competition. respectfully ask that you not approve this rule change prohibiting the use of excess insurance.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

Next, Sergio Sanchez, Luxury Base Operators Association.

MR. SANCHEZ: Good morning. My name is Sergio Sanchez. I'm the President of

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

the Luxury Base Operators Association, a

trade association for luxury limousine bases.

LBOA represents over 3,200 drivers in the

luxury limousine industry. I am a third

generation yellow cab driver. And I have

been in the for-hire industry myself for over

27 years.

The TLC rules governing insurance requirements for the different segments of the industry are antiquated and do not reflect how luxury limousine bases operate today. Limousine bases used to operate the larger stretch limousines, but the days of those larger limousines has passed. Today, luxury bases operate approximately over 3,000 vehicles. Of the 3,000 vehicles, 2,500 of them are sedans and SUVs, the exact same vehicles operated by black car bases. Yet, insurance requirements for limousine vehicles with a capacity of one to eight passengers is \$500,000 per person and \$1,000,000 per occurrence, versus the \$100,000 per person and \$300,000 per occurrence for black car vehicles. As discussed, the luxury vehicle,

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	the limousine vehicles, are the same as the
3	black car vehicles.
4	THE CHAIR: I just want to clarify
5	for the record.
6	MR. SANCHEZ: Yeah.
7	THE CHAIR: Today the rule that's
8	before the amendment to the rule
9	MR. SANCHEZ: Yes.
10	THE CHAIR: that's before the
11	Commission
12	MR. SANCHEZ: I'm getting there.
13	THE CHAIR: Yeah, it doesn't
14	change at all the minimum requirements or
15	address minimum insurance requirements.
16	MR. SANCHEZ: No, I understand
17	that. I'm just making the analogy that it's
18	the same business model.
19	THE CHAIR: Okay.
20	MR. SANCHEZ: So why the
21	difference in insurance.
22	THE CHAIR: That may be another
23	rule another day, but it's not today's rule.
24	MR. SANCHEZ: Good enough. Good
25	enough.

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

MR. SANCHEZ: I'll move on.

I'm not testifying that the

limousine bases should not put -- not be put in the same category of black cars. are reasons to keep these two categories separate. The proposed rule change eliminate excess insurance, as discussed. Because of the higher insurance, our drivers pay approximately \$5,400 per year for insurance, versus 44 for black cars. Drivers pay the insurance premiums, and paying an extra \$1,000 per year at \$100 is significant, \$100 a month is significant. The practical effect of the different insurance premiums is that drivers for limousine bases are choosing to leave portions of the industry and move their segment with lower insurance requirements. Limousine bases used to be able to work with drivers to obtain insurance to meet TLC requirement at a lower cost with the excess insurance, but can no longer do that if the rule goes through. Limousine bases are in an extreme disadvantage competing with qualified

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 drivers because of the insurance disparity. 3 Excess insurance provides a way 4 for many drivers to meet the insurance 5 requirements at a lower cost. Eliminating the use of excess insurance would further 6 7 compound the higher cost of insurance facing luxury drivers by eliminating a viable lower 8 9 cost option. I urge you to please reject the 10 changes to the insurance requirements and to 11 review current insurance requirements for 12 luxury bases, which do not make any sense 13 today. 14 Thank you for your time, and I'm 15 available for any questions. Anybody? 16 MR. WILSON: Thank you. 17 The next speaker is Bill Gorton from Ben's Limousines. 18 MR. GORTON: Good morning, 19 20 Commissioners. My name is Bill Gorton, and I 2.1 am the chauffeur manager for Ben's Limousine, which is a licensed luxury base with the Taxi 22 23 and Limousine Commission. I have over 30 24 years of experience in working in the 2.5 business. I am here to provide comments

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

against the proposed rule change, which

would, among other things, prohibit the use

of excess insurance for drivers and others to

meet the TLC's insurance requirements.

Although I am here to comment on the rule prohibiting the use of excess insurance, I first would like to just simply explain the background of the industry. As my colleague mentioned, many years ago limousines were the large vehicles that we know as limousines. But the bases today don't operate that way. They use SUVs and sedans as their prime vehicle. One major difference between limousine bases and black car bases is the limousine vehicle does not require the base standard markings. This is a significant appeal to our clients, being unmarked.

However, despite using the same vehicles, drivers affiliated with luxury bases must have higher insurance requirements than their fellow drivers who affiliate with black car bases. Drivers for limousine bases pay \$1,200 to \$1,500 a year more for

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014
insurance than those who work with black car
bases. This is fundamentally unfair and puts
drivers for limousine bases at a severe
disadvantage to serve the same purpose, and
serve no purpose because of the insurance.

Most limousine companies are small businesses, and are hurt by the higher insurance requirements and the cost of providing higher insurance. By accepting excess insurance to help meet TLC requirements, luxury bases had a way to assist the vehicle owner/driver to meet the higher costs. Excess insurance made the playing field equal.

As a chauffeur manager for Ben's Limo, it is part of my job to recruit new drivers. The task has become harder and harder as many drivers realize they can work for a black car company and have no increase of the cost of insurance, while drivers for our base, a luxury base, have to have that higher requirement. Currently there are only two, and I repeat two, companies that offer this higher insurance in the state of New

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	York. Two. That is a big hump to go over.
3	The biggest obstacle when recruiting drivers
4	who used to drive for black car companies is
5	that unless they are insured by one of these
6	two companies, they then have to cancel their
7	existing insurance, are forced for a pay out,
8	have to file new paperwork, and pay the
9	increased cost.
10	MR. WILSON: Mr. Gorton, can I ask
11	you to wrap up?
12	MR. GORTON: Yes. Okay.
13	I urge you to keep the excess
14	insurance policy and don't change it. Thank
15	you.
16	MR. WILSON: Thank you.
17	And the next speaker is Michael
18	Katzman from the Pro-Tech Agency.
19	MR. KATZMAN: Good morning,
20	Commissioners. My name is Michael Katzman,
21	and I am the president and CEO of Pro-Tech
22	Agency. It's a New York City based,
23	full-service insurance brokerage company. I
24	have been in the insurance business
25	personally over 40 years as an owner and

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 operator of my own insurance agencies and businesses.

2.1

2.5

During all the years in business I have always represented the consumer on their various business entities, which is why I felt the necessity to testify before the Commission against the proposed rule changes prohibiting the purchase of excess insurance. Whether intentional or not, this change will hurt the small business people trying to make a living in the for-hire vehicle industry.

The Commission requires certain vehicles to have \$1,000,000 of auto liability limits to protect the public riding in these vehicles. Yet, by making this rule change, it would make it so difficult that the vast majority of drivers cannot find companies that are willing to provide them with the limit of liability coverage. The demand for the insurance far outweighs the supply. As you heard my predecessor say, there are two companies that are doing it, and I believe these companies have reached their maximum limits on issuing a million dollars.

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

2.1

2.5

I understand that there is a company ready, willing and able to provide the insurance so that these for-hire vehicles can meet the TLC's \$1,000,000 requirement where necessary. The company has an A rating, backed by an A plus rated insurance company. These are the highest ratings that you can get in the insurance industry. In addition, the company is approved in the state of New York by the Department of Financial Services insurance department.

I can't understand why this

Commission would seek to exclude this
important excess coverage, which would be a

direct penalty to be imposed on the common
small business owner by impeding and
excluding a whole segment of potential
business for which they can't qualify because
they can't attain the required coverage.

This is both unfair and unjust, and it should
not be passed by this Commission.

In a great city such as New York, which just elected a mayor who stood for the common people, the small, hard working

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	citizens, there can be no justification to
3	limit their ability to make a living even
4	further. The costs involved in the livery
5	business are way too high as is, and to limit
6	the ability to compete in all areas would not
7	be in the best interests of the city or
8	public or the people trying to provide the
9	coverage.
10	I implore you as a fair minded
11	as fair minded protectors of the public to
12	vote down this unfair rule change that would
13	exclude excess auto liability insurance for
14	being used to meet the TLC's requirements.
15	Thank you for your time. Any
16	questions? I'll be happy to
17	MR. WILSON: Thank you.
18	The next speaker is Frank Caponi
19	of Cavallino Risk Management.
20	(No response)
21	MR. WILSON: The next speaker
22	after that if Mr. Caponi comes in, we'll
23	call him is Phillip Hom of Windels Marx.
24	MR. HOM: Good morning,
25	Commissioners. My name is Phillip Hom, and

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

2.1

2.5

I'm an attorney with Windels Marx. And I had sent in comments last week, so you have them, it's the same letter that's going around right now, so I'm going to make this brief and just summarize my points.

We're here to provide comments on behalf of our client, the BCC Group, which testified just a few minutes ago, to oppose the change to the TLC rules which would prohibit the use of excess insurance policies to meet the TLC's insurance requirements. I have three main points.

The first point is, you know, we believe that such a rule change would be preempted under state law, whether explicitly or implicitly. The TLC rules right now regarding insurance specifically reference the state law, the Vehicle and Traffic Law section 370, and under VTL section 370 it specifically says that you can meet insurance requirements for for-hire vehicles by using a combination of bonds or policies. Currently there's nothing in the TLC rules that says that you can't use this combination until you

2.1

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

pass, you know, pass or consider this rule

that's up for consideration right now. Until

about a year and a half ago TLC did accept

excess policies, and then my understanding is

they stopped accepting this policy -- this

excess insurance without any notice, which I

believe is probably preempted by state law.

The second point I'd like to make is people in the industry and people from insurance companies have told me that this policy change was made, as I said before, without notice, and it's, you know, until, you know, you wait until now to pass the rules. So it seems like it's just being done backwards. And it's problematic because it shows that the TLC probably shouldn't have made that policy change in the first place.

And my last point is that there are, as, you know, many people before me have testified, there are a lot of people in the industry who have, you know, thousands of limousine operators who are waiting for the TLC to accept excess insurance to help them fulfill this \$1,000,000 insurance coverage

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 requirement. This provides them a less 2 expensive way to meet the insurance 3 4 requirements that they otherwise would not be 5 able to satisfy. And we're confident that, 6 you know, the insurance companies working 7 with the TLC can make excess insurance work if there are any issues. 8 9 Thank you for listening to my 10 comments. 11 MR. WILSON: Thank you. 12 The last, next speaker listed is 13 Ethan Gerber from the Greater New York Taxi 14 Association. 15 COMM. MARINO: Can I just ask the chair a question? Is that true, that we 16 17 stopped accepting excess before this rule has gone into effect? 18 19 THE CHAIR: Two years ago or maybe 20 longer, we notified people that they had to 2.1 have certain information on the dec page. 22 That had always been a requirement, but we 23 were officially notifying people that were 24 not complying with that. And this rule 25 memorializes that practice that's been in

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	effect for two years.
3	COMM. MARINO: But not but
4	having something in the dec sheet is not the
5	same as rejecting excess insurance, so I'm
6	just trying to clarify that.
7	THE CHAIR: Well, if we reject
8	insurance if it doesn't have the vehicle
9	identification information on the dec page,
10	the insureds on the dec page, a base policy
11	that doesn't cover that covers vehicles
12	that are not owned by the base. So whatever
13	name you want to give the insurance that we
14	reject, it's really those characteristics
15	that we are looking for.
16	COMM. MARINO: Okay.
17	AUDIENCE MEMBER: The answer is
18	yes.
19	COMM. MARINO: Okay, thank you.
20	MR. GERBER: Good morning. I'm
21	Ethan Gerber from the Greater New York Taxi
22	Association. I'll be very brief.
23	The rule at first sets out what
24	its intention is. The second part of the
25	rule recognizes bonds and recognizes

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 policies. The third part of the rule sets 3 only what a policy is supposed to be stating 4 and what that requirement is. It doesn't address the bonds, and we would like 5 clarification from this Commission that this 6 7 does not address bonds. That's all. THE CHAIR: Thank you. 8 9 MR. GERBER: If we could get that clarification. 10 11 MR. WILSON: The next speaker is Pat Russo from Windels Marx. 12 13 MR. RUSSO: Good morning, 14 Commissioners. I'm here to address just some 15 of the questions that just happened in the 16 colloquy. But first I want to say the stated 17 basis and purpose of the rule today is to address several bullet points as it's been 18 19 proposed. The elimination of excess 20 insurance does not get to that point. 2.1 There's no rational basis to pursue this when 22 declaration pages from insurance companies 23 not only can be presented to licensing to 24 address each and every one of these points on 25 page two, but in the last year, through

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

personal experience of our firm, we've

presented them. So this is really today a

matter of form over substance. And that form

has been rejected. The more fundamental

question is, what kind of insurance is being

provided, what kind of coverage is being

provided, and what kind of companies. This

doesn't even address the issue of ratings of

insurance companies, which both folks from

the insurance industry spoke of.

Today's rule adversely affects drivers, specifically those in the independent contractor model who want to work in the luxury limousine bases. It's eliminating from them the possibility of a cheaper alternative to provide the same insurance coverage and the same protections to the TLC, the passenger and other drivers. What really today does is promote a duopoly, where a limited number of insurance companies can go forth and provide this coverage as it's set forth, even though, again, what's been presented in the last year in terms of forms, in terms of samples, meets each and

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014
every one of these requirements. So what
today's rule does is it throws out the baby
with the bath water, and it doesn't address
what you're trying to do in the stated basis
and the purpose.

So the history of it in the last eighteen months is, insurance companies have presented and continue to present in dialogue with the TLC to meet each and every one of these requirements. By promoting these rules today and by voting on them today, you will be in effect eliminating a viable alternative, a cheaper alternative that meets all those requirements, that has been in business for years. And this is the first time that I can think of that the Commission has actually gone forward and eliminated a viable industry, a viable source of business, a viable protection for drivers and small businesses alike, just to achieve a goal that it cannot otherwise achieve by stipulating and concerning what declaration pages include, which is actually what your rule is trying to get at. So I think we'd like to

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 continue that dialogue, and we strongly urge you to either postpone the vote or actually deny the proposed rules.

Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

MR. WILSON: Thank you.

And the final speaker is Mr. Osman Chowdhury.

MR. CHOWDHURY: Hello, good afternoon, everybody. My name is Osman Chowdhury. I also have to say that the insurance has not only has -- I'm here to talk about the Zero Vision policy of Bill de Blasio. I'm talking about the Zero Vision policy of Bill de Blasio. But what's going on right now, and it's still going on, because there are some places that don't have any green arrow sign, at the intersection of 20 Park Avenue, 20 Third Avenue, 11 7th Avenue does not have a green arrow. People cannot, motorists cannot go across the street. And you need to take action, because if the police start to crack down, the drivers are going to lose their licenses, and very soon. And I also have a --

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	THE CHAIR: Thank you. Today's
3	hearing is on the rule amending the
4	proposed rule to amend our insurance
5	requirements.
6	MR. CHOWDHURY: Okay.
7	THE CHAIR: So there are town
8	halls that we're doing throughout the city,
9	where it sounds like what you're discussing
10	would be a perfect topic for those. So you
11	can somebody can meet you in the back and
12	give you a list of the next one.
13	MR. CHOWDHURY: Okay. Thank you
14	very much.
15	THE CHAIR: Thank you.
16	MR. CHOWDHURY: You're welcome.
17	MR. WILSON: Thank you.
18	Do any of the Commissioners have
19	anything they want to add or questions or
20	COMM. MARINO: Yes, I do. I
21	don't I don't understand why we are why
22	we have a rule here that really has not only
23	the potential but it's going to have the
24	effect of eliminating excess insurance. I
25	mean I deal with insurance companies in my

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

practice. In my law firm, 80 percent of my practice deals with insurance companies.

Excess insurance is a great thing. I mean why do we want to cut out that option for people? I mean I have it on my home, I could have it on my malpractice. I mean if excess was cut out, for me personally it's going to have a detrimental effect. A million, \$1.5 million in coverage is a huge nut. I mean their assessment is only two companies that offer that.

Just, I think the intent is -- there's a good intent but I think the effect is going to be very negative. And I think limiting people's options is not productive, it's not the American way, and I am really urging my colleagues to vote against this. I think the rules need to be revamped. I think there's good ideas here, but this is not -- this is not a good plan the way this is right now.

COMM. GONZALES: This is

Commissioner Gonzales. I partially agree

with Commissioner Marino. I guess overall I

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 see this rule before us to help improve on the transparency of what -- both -- I guess 3 4 particularly in administrative issues, in 5 that it's explicit what's on the declaration page, there's no ifs, ands or buts, the 6 vehicle numbers, so on and so forth. I 7 personally would probably like I guess 8 9 further review of, I guess what -- first I 10 have one question, we should start there. 11 With respect to the rules before us, it's 12 not -- it does not prohibit the industry from 13 obtaining umbrella insurance just for -- just 14 as incremental supplemental insurance for their business and their vehicles; correct? 15 16 As long as they have -- they meet the --17 they're compliant with the VIN numbers and 18 items on the declaration page; correct? 19 MR. WILSON: That's correct. 20 THE CHAIR: That's correct. 2.1 COMM. MARINO: I think it's going 22 to have the unintended effect of doing that. 23 That's the issue here. 24 THE CHAIR: It's correct for if the base owns all of the vehicles. It's not 25

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	correct for vehicles that are not owned by
3	that base.
4	COMM. GONZALES: Okay.
5	COMM. MARINO: Can you say that
6	again? It's correct if
7	THE CHAIR: If the base owns all
8	of the vehicles that are covered under the
9	umbrella.
10	COMM. MARINO: That eliminates
11	excess.
12	THE CHAIR: But if the umbrella
13	policy covers vehicles that are not owned by
14	the base, then it will not meet the TLC
15	requirements.
16	COMM. MARINO: Well
17	COMM. CARONE: Madam Chair, I'm
18	listening to a lot of testimony about excess
19	insurance and umbrella policies, and the
20	stated purpose of the rule doesn't address
21	eliminating those type of insurances. So I'm
22	looking at the rule and I'm reading what is
23	it that I'm really missing. And it seems
24	that there's a level of ambiguity here and a
25	lack of clarity. And when there is such

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 ambiguity, perhaps we should table the vote and clarify that. Because I don't think the 3 4 intention was that. You also have questions from Mr. Gerber about self insurance. So to 5 6 the extent that we have this ambiguity, 7 perhaps we should table this vote. THE CHAIR: So we can make a 8 9 motion to -- we actually, we have the hearing 10 today, but we can or cannot vote, that's up 11 to us. So we can just vote it at another, at 12 the next following hearing continue --COMM. WEINSHALL: So we don't have 13 14 to make a motion to table? 15 THE CHAIR: No, we don't have to 16 have a motion to table. So the hearing is 17 closed, and we can vote on it at the next 18 meeting. 19 COMM. AROUT: I'd rather vote on 20 it now and get it over with. 2.1 THE CHAIR: I agree that there's been some questions raised during the 22 23 testimony, the testimony that we heard today, 24 and definitely some ambiguity among the 25 Commissioners' understanding of the rule,

-	7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7
1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	that it's worthwhile to take the extra time
3	to clarify those and, if we need to, make
4	further amendments.
5	COMM. AROUT: Put it to a vote.
6	THE CHAIR: I can take a make a
7	motion to see who would like to vote today,
8	but it sounds from just the general
9	discussions that at least three Commission
10	members would prefer to table, which means
11	that that vote would not the vote would be
12	to table it.
13	COMM. MARINO: But just to be
14	clear, I think there needs to be changes in
15	these rules to address the ambiguity and
16	address these concerns.
17	THE CHAIR: I think that that's
18	the purpose of not voting today.
19	COMM. CARONE: That would be the
20	purpose for tabling it, yes.
21	COMM. MARINO: Right. But I'm
22	saying it's not just bringing the same rule
23	back next month.
24	THE CHAIR: No, I don't think we
25	would do that. Then we could vote today.

1 Proceedings - June 19, 2014 2 COMM. MARINO: Yeah. I'm just 3 making sure, for the record. 4 COMM. GONZALES: I'd just like to 5 reemphasize, I mean, as far as the rules are 6 concerned, again, the emphasis on objectivity 7 and clarity and details, I'm, you know, for that. But I do agree there's ambiguity with 8 9 respect to use of excess insurance and things of that nature. I would like some more 10 11 information on that before I'm prepared to 12 vote. 13 COMM. MARINO: And I would like to 14 say if these rules are revamped at all, which 15 they should be and probably will be, I really 16 strongly urge us and our staff to do 17 everything to not limit excess insurance. 18 Excess insurance is a great thing for 19 businesses. I think having any rule that 20 even can remotely possibly excess the option 2.1 of purchasing excess insurance is a bad idea. 22 That's my two cents. 23 COMM. AROUT: But can I say is 24 this going to change everything else if we 2.5 have to not vote on this?

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	THE CHAIR: No. We can
3	COMM. AROUT: What do we do?
4	THE CHAIR: We can vote next month
5	on this. This will allow further
6	COMM. AROUT: What are we going to
7	gain by holding it for the next meeting?
8	THE CHAIR: We are going to gain
9	some clarity. There's Commission members
10	that need additional information on the
11	objects of the rule and whether they are
12	being met as drafted, as well as testimony
13	that the Commissioners just got today. We
14	got two written submissions in testimony, but
15	the Commissioners just today got the benefit
16	of public testimony. So they'd like time to
17	consider that. As well as have further
18	discussions with staff on how the rule can be
19	fine tuned before they're prepared to vote.
20	COMM. AROUT: And at the next
21	meeting you'll vote on it, is that the
22	schedule?
23	THE CHAIR: That's the schedule,
24	yes.
25	Next on the agenda is a rule that

2.1

2.5

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

would provide an exemption to taxi school for licensees that have been -- obtained their license before 1999, which is the year the taxi school requirement came into being. It would allow those people who let their license lapse come in and get another license without having to get -- to take taxi school as long as they meet all the other licensing requirements of TLC.

And also a question that came up in comments that I just want to clarify.

Today, people that get a license after 1999 that have already taken taxi school, if they do let their license lapse and they want to come back in and get another license, we have a record that they have attended taxi school and that the requirement was met when they first attended, it's transferred over, and so they don't have to take taxi school for a second time. That's not covered by the rule. It's our current practice and we have no intention on changing that.

COMM. WEINSHALL: So I'm unclear. So if you -- before 1999 if you didn't take

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 taxi school, you now will not be required to? 3 THE CHAIR: If you meet all the 4 other conditions of licensure, that's a good 5 driving history, a fitness review, and you have no -- what's the last? 6 7 MR. WILSON: No outstanding fines 8 and you are back in two years. 9 THE CHAIR: No outstanding fines, 10 then you can come back within two years. 11 This was driven by discussions with the 12 industry on the difficulty of retaining 13 drivers, retaining long term drivers. And 14 sometimes drivers may leave for a year or two. And in order to entice them to come 15 16 back to driving, removing one of those 17 obstacles, which is taxi school. So the idea 18 is because they have the life experience, 19 that will count as an equivalency to taxi 20 school. The rule eventually sunsets because 2.1 this is a limited group of people and over 22 time it will age out. 23 COMM. MARINO: So we're making 24 things easier for people at this point? 25 THE CHAIR: Yin and yang.

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	COMM. WEINSHALL: Isn't there a
3	benefit to having people going to taxi
4	school?
5	THE CHAIR: Absolutely, and
6	there's still an education requirement, every
7	driver will have to take a renewal course and
8	wheelchair accessibility training, and
9	there's defensive driving courses. So there
10	are annual course requirements regardless of
11	whether you take the initial taxi school.
12	This just alleviates the initial burden of
13	having to pay for the expense of taxi school
14	to re-enter the driving world.
15	COMM. AROUT: Madam Chairlady, if
16	you don't mind, can we go right back to the
17	vote? Can you just have a raise of hands who
18	wants to go back to the board and vote on
19	this in the next meeting? I say I had
20	said I would like to vote this today.
21	THE CHAIR: On the insurance rule?
22	COMM. AROUT: Yes.
23	THE CHAIR: Okay. So I'll make a
24	motion. Who would like to table a vote on
25	the amendment to the insurance rules for

Proceedings - June 19, 2014 1 2 today? All in favor? It looks like one, 3 two, three, four, five out of six. 4 COMM. AROUT: Thank you. 5 THE CHAIR: And we have one speaker scheduled for the hearing on the 6 7 education exemption rule. MR. WILSON: Peter Mazer, please. 8 9 MR. MAZER: Good morning, 10 Commissioners. Peter Mazer, General Counsel, 11 Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade. You have my written comments which I submitted, 12 and it was addressed this morning by the 13 14 chair. 15 My concern was that the rule does 16 not provide that those people who have taken 17 the school requirement since January 1st of 1999 and who allow their license to lapse, 18 19 that some of those people have been told by 20 employees at Licensing that in order to 2.1 reapply for the license they would be 22 required to go back to school. I am glad for 23 the clarification that we now have that 24 Licensing will no longer be requiring anybody 2.5 who has completed the school requirement to

Proceedings - June 19, 2014

go back to school as long as their license

was voluntarily lapsed, they were not

addressing people that were revoked or lost

their licenses for other reasons. It's not

in the rule, it's a policy of the Commission.

At some point we would urge the Commission to

adopt that formally as a rule.

Thank you.

2.1

MR. WILSON: Thank you.

These rules were originally published in the City Record on May 15th, 2014, with a comment deadline of June 16th, 2014. Two written comments were received, which have been provided to the Commissioners. There were comments from the New York Taxi Workers Alliance and the Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade. Based on the comment from the New York Taxi Workers Alliance, the staff recommended one change to the rule as originally proposed. That was to clarify. The original language in the proposed rule had said that a returning licensee could have no outstanding summonses or fines. We removed the language about

1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	outstanding summonses, because the time for
3	those had been passed, but reduced the
4	required payment of any outstanding fines
5	before somebody is qualified to return as a
6	licensee. And the final rule for action with
7	that comment reflected was posted on the
8	Commission's Web site and transmitted to the
9	Commissioners, as required by Local Law, on
10	June 16th.
11	And are we ready for a vote? Any
12	questions, comments?
13	(No response)
14	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Carone?
15	COMM. CARONE: Yes.
16	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Arout?
17	COMM. AROUT: Yeah.
18	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Joshi?
19	THE CHAIR: Yes.
20	MR. WILSON: Commissioner
21	Weinshall?
22	COMM. WEINSHALL: Yes.
23	MR. WILSON: Commissioner
24	Gonzales?
25	COMM. GONZALES: Yes.

[
1	Proceedings - June 19, 2014
2	MR. WILSON: Commissioner Marino?
3	COMM. MARINO: Yes.
4	MR. WILSON: Thank you. Thank
5	you.
6	THE CHAIR: That concludes our
7	meeting today, and the time now is 11:00 a.m.
8	(Time noted: 11:00 a.m.)
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1 2 3	CERTIFICATE
4	STATE OF NEW YORK)) SS:
5 6 7	COUNTY OF ORANGE)
8	I, KARI L. REED, a Registered
9	Professional Reporter (Stenotype) and Notary
	Public with and for the State of New York, do
10	hereby certify:
11	I reported the proceedings in the
12	within-entitled matter and that the within
13	within-entitled matter and that the within
14	transcript is a true record of such
15	proceedings.
	I further certify that I am not
16	related, by blood or marriage, to any of the
17	parties in this matter and that I am in no
18	
19	way interested in the outcome of this matter.
20	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
	hereunto set my hand this 25th day of June,
21	2014.
22 23	
24	
25	KARI L. REED, RPR

a.m (5) 2:2 4:13,17 70:7,8 ability (2) 47:3,6 able (4) 23:16 40:20 46:3 50:5 **Absolutely (1)** 66:5 acceleration (2) 11:8,8 accept (2) 49:4,24 accepted (4) 30:11,24 35:12,13 accepting (5) 9:12 22:5 43:10 49:6 access (2) 18:8 25:13 accessibility (2) 6:4 66:8 accessible (1) 6:5 accident (1) 19:11 accused (1) 17:2 achieve (2) 54:21,22 action (5) 12:7 13:3 31:9 55:22 69:6 activation (1) 21:9 actual (1) 10:11 add (1) 56:19 addition (6) 5:4 15:13 20:4 30:14 36:16 46:10 additional (6) 7:4,9 11:20 22:10 30:24 63:10 address (11) 39:15 52:5,7,14,18 52:24 53:9 54:4 59:20 61:15.16 addressed (2) 36:8 67:13 addressing (1) 68:4 adequate (1) 34:25 adequately (1) 18:7 administrative (1) 58:4 adopt (1) 68:8 adopted (2) 8:25 27:4 adopting (1) 8:21 adoption (1) 8:20 adversely (1) 53:12 affiliate (1) 42:23 affiliated (1) 42:21 affordable (1) 34:24 **afternoon (1)** 55:10 age (1) 65:22 agencies (1) 45:2 agency (5) 3:7 5:7 15:12 44:18,22 agency's (1) 6:4 agenda (4) 4:4 7:16 28:17 63:25 aggressive (1) 14:18 **ago (6)** 7:13 35:11 42:10 48:9 49:4 agree (4) 17:22 57:24 60:21 62:8 **AI (1)** 34:15 aid (1) 29:5 **AIG (1)** 34:15 alert (5) 15:16,17 20:9 21:10,14

```
Alerting (1) 8:2
alerts (3) 15:22,23 21:9
algorithmic (1) 11:9
alike (1) 54:21
alleviates (1) 66:12
Alliance (2) 68:17,20
allow (6) 7:21 12:18 15:5 63:5 64:6
  67:18
altered (1) 13:13
alternative (3) 53:17 54:14,14
ambiguity (6) 59:24 60:2,6,24
  61:15 62:8
amend (1) 56:4
amending (2) 28:18 56:3
amendment (3) 8:13 39:8 66:25
amendments (1) 61:4
American (1) 57:18
amounts (1) 29:9
analogy (1) 39:17
analyzing (1) 14:20
and/or (1) 35:21
ands (1) 58:6
anger (1) 5:6
annual (1) 66:10
answer (2) 22:25 51:17
antiquated (1) 38:11
anybody (3) 33:21 41:15 67:24
appeal (3) 4:10,23 42:18
Applicant (2) 2:14 9:7
application (1) 14:10
applications (1) 9:2
applies (1) 17:5
apply (1) 17:7
appreciates (1) 21:14
approval (1) 9:9
approvals (2) 9:12,25
approve (1) 37:18
approved (9) 10:4 17:13,18 18:9
  22:9 35:3,9 36:22 46:10
approximately (2) 38:16 40:11
areas (2) 16:9 47:6
Arout (14) 2:6 26:14,15 60:19 61:5
  62:23 63:3,6,20 66:15,22 67:4
  69:16,17
array (1) 24:2
arrow (2) 55:18,20
asked (1) 27:7
aspect (1) 36:7
assessment (1) 57:11
assets (1) 36:11
assist (2) 16:19 43:13
Assistant (1) 2:13
associated (2) 20:7,21
association (6) 3:5 37:23 38:2,3
```

50:14 51:22 attached (1) 34:16 attain (1) 46:20 attend (2) 5:6 6:20 attended (3) 6:21 64:17,19 attorney (1) 48:2 audience (2) 29:4 51:17 August (1) 6:10 authorities (1) 35:14 authorize (1) 10:15 authorized (4) 28:3 30:18,20 35:23 auto (5) 35:2,12,24 45:14 47:13 available (2) 10:7 41:15 **Avenue (4)** 1:19 55:19,19,20 **Ave (3)** 4:8 8:24 10:3 ayes (3) 4:7 8:23 10:2

```
В
baby (1) 54:3
back (13) 5:22 6:9 16:17 56:11
  61:23 64:16 65:8,10,16 66:16,18
  67:22 68:2
backed (1) 46:7
background (1) 42:9
backwards (2) 16:16 49:16
bad (2) 57:13 62:21
base (16) 3:4 9:2 30:23 31:2 37:22
  38:2 41:22 42:17 43:22,22 51:10
  51:12 58:25 59:3,7,14
based (4) 14:11 16:9 44:22 68:18
bases (22) 9:8 17:10 38:3,12,13,16
  38:19 40:5,17,20,24 41:12 42:12
  42:15,16,22,24,24 43:3,4,12
  53:15
basically (1) 25:3
basis (6) 14:3 22:8 28:7 52:17,21
  54:5
bath (1) 54:4
BCC (4) 3:3 28:24 34:4 48:8
bear (1) 17:22
BEAVER (1) 1:7
begins (1) 29:2
begun (2) 4:13 15:14
behalf (1) 48:8
behavior (1) 15:7
behaviors (5) 12:24 13:10 15:23
  20:7.17
believe (5) 19:8 29:16 45:23 48:15
  49:8
Ben's (4) 3:6 41:18,21 43:16
benefit (3) 29:3 63:15 66:3
benefited (1) 19:4
best (1) 47:7
big (3) 13:23 23:13 44:2
```

biggest (1) 44:3 **Bill (5)** 3:6 41:17,20 55:13,15 **billion (1)** 36:11 bit (1) 24:21 black (18) 7:23 10:8 14:16 15:14 15:16 23:5 24:15 30:21 38:19,24 39:3 40:6,12 42:15,24 43:2,20 44:4 Blasio (2) 55:14,15 Blasio's (1) 13:3 **blood (1)** 71:16 board (3) 66:18 67:11 68:18 **bodily (4)** 29:11 30:2 32:7 35:21 **bonds (4)** 48:23 51:25 52:5,7 borough (2) 1:9 17:9 **box (3)** 10:8 15:17 24:15 boxes (4) 7:24 14:16 15:14 23:5 braking (5) 11:7,7 14:18 20:14,21 brief (2) 48:5 51:22 briefing (1) 12:15 bring (1) 21:5 **bringing (1)** 61:22 brokerage (2) 34:5 44:23 brokers (1) 29:15 Bronx (4) 5:21 6:21,23,24 Brooklyn (1) 5:19 bullet (1) 52:18 burden (1) 66:12 business (13) 37:11 39:18 41:25 44:24 45:4,6,11 46:17,19 47:5 54:16,19 58:15 businesses (9) 17:20 34:23 37:4,8 37:16 43:8 45:3 54:21 62:19 buts (1) 58:6 buy (1) 28:9 buying (1) 27:24

C

C (2) 71:2,2 cab (1) 38:6 cabs (1) 27:24 calendar (1) 6:17 call (2) 26:10 47:23 calls (1) 13:6 cameras (4) 16:15 18:14,16,23 campaigns (1) 13:8 cancel (1) 44:6 cap (1) 16:6 capacity (4) 32:6,16 36:17 38:21 Caponi (2) 47:18,22 captures (1) 12:4 capturing (1) 10:22 car (10) 6:16 8:5 38:19,24 39:3 42:16,24 43:2,20 44:4

Carone (7) 2:7 26:12,13 59:17 61:19 69:14,15 carrier (2) 35:22 36:9 carriers (4) 36:12,15,16,23 cars (7) 15:15 24:2 30:21 31:17,18 40:6,12 case (1) 17:24 catastrophic (1) 37:2 categories (3) 7:23 14:16 40:7 category (1) 40:6 cause (1) 14:21 cautious (1) 14:22 Cavallino (1) 47:19 cents (1) 62:22 **CEO (1)** 44:21 certain (8) 8:4,6 11:19 16:2 28:18 30:22 45:13 50:21 certificate (3) 30:5,7,13 certificates (1) 36:4 certify (2) 71:10,15 chair (58) 2:5 4:2,8,18 8:24 9:11 9:24 10:3,6 12:10 26:17 27:3,22 28:2,17 33:23 34:8,11 37:21 39:4 39:7,10,13,19,22 40:2 50:16,19 51:7 52:8 56:2,7,15 58:20,24 59:7,12,17 60:8,15,21 61:6,17,24 63:2,4,8,23 65:3,9,25 66:5,21,23 67:5,14 69:19 70:6 Chairlady (1) 66:15 chairs' (1) 5:12 challenges (1) 21:19 change (16) 13:25 29:8 37:19 39:14 40:8 42:2 44:14 45:10,16 47:12 48:10,15 49:12,18 62:24 68:20 changes (5) 31:7 34:17 41:10 45:8 61:14 changing (2) 13:17 64:23 characteristics (1) 51:14 chauffeur (2) 41:21 43:16 **cheaper (2)** 53:17 54:14 check (1) 21:10 Chief (1) 34:3 **choices (1)** 37:15 choosing (1) 40:17 Chorus (3) 4:7 8:23 10:2 **chose (1)** 28:9 **chosen (2)** 28:7,9 **Chowdhury (7)** 3:13 55:8,9,11 56:6,13,16 Chris (3) 2:13 9:6 10:10 Christopher (2) 2:14 9:5

city (20) 1:2 5:25 6:7 7:3,12,14 13:5 14:2,10 15:7 16:19 27:10 31:4 34:6 37:5 44:22 46:23 47:7 56:8 68:12 City's (2) 13:24 22:21 Civil (1) 19:5 claims (1) 36:12 clarification (3) 52:6,10 67:23 **clarify (6)** 39:4 51:6 60:3 61:3 64:12 68:22 clarity (3) 59:25 62:7 63:9 **clear (1)** 61:14 clearly (2) 35:20 36:5 clicker (1) 12:12 client (1) 48:8 clients (1) 42:18 closed (1) 60:17 coaches (1) 16:12 **colleague (1)** 42:10 **colleagues (1)** 57:19 collect (1) 23:23 collected (2) 17:25 19:11 **collision (1)** 11:9 colloquy (1) 52:16 combination (2) 48:23,25 **come (5)** 23:20 64:7,16 65:10,15 comes (1) 47:22 coming (1) 28:14 **COMM (68)** 9:13,20 23:3,12,16,19 23:25 24:5,13,18,20 26:4,13,15 26:20,23,25 27:6,16,18,23 28:15 31:13,24 32:10,14,19,22 33:4,9 33:18 35:7 50:15 51:3,16,19 56:20 57:23 58:21 59:4,5,10,16 59:17 60:13,19 61:5,13,19,21 62:2,4,13,23 63:3,6,20 64:24 65:23 66:2,15,22 67:4 69:15,17 69:22,25 70:3 commenced (1) 4:17 comment (4) 42:6 68:13,19 69:7 comments (11) 31:4,5 41:25 48:3 48:7 50:10 64:12 67:12 68:14,16 69:12 commercial (2) 15:2 16:11 Commission (26) 1:3,8 4:22,25 5:5 7:19 8:8.22 9:8 11:5.13 28:22 29:5 31:7 39:11 41:23 45:8,13 46:14,22 52:6 54:17 61:9 63:9 68:6,7 **Commission's (3)** 12:7 31:10 69:8 **Commissioner (14)** 26:12,14,16 26:18,21,24 57:24,25 69:14,16 69:18,20,23 70:2 Commissioners (17) 2:3 4:15 12:8

circumstances (2) 16:20 18:24

citizens (1) 47:2

26:7 29:4 31:11 34:2 41:20 44:20 47:25 52:14 56:18 63:13,15 67:10 68:16 69:9 Commissioners' (1) 60:25 common (3) 17:4 46:16,25 commonly (1) 20:7 communications (1) 11:23 commuter (1) 17:9 companies (31) 14:11 15:4,5 17:7 17:12,19 19:13 22:4,6,10,19 23:8 34:14,14 43:7,24 44:4,6 45:18,23 45:24 49:11 50:6 52:22 53:8.10 53:21 54:8 56:25 57:3,11 company (8) 24:14 36:9 43:20 44:23 46:3,6,8,10 **compare (1)** 20:10 compared (3) 19:24,25 20:14 compete (1) 47:6 competing (1) 40:25 competition (2) 37:9,17 complaints (1) 11:10 completed (1) 67:25 compliant (1) 58:17 complying (3) 29:17,19 50:24 compound (1) 41:7 **concern (1)** 67:15 concerned (1) 62:6 **concerning (1)** 54:23 concerns (1) 61:16 concludes (1) 70:6 conclusion (2) 11:14 22:15 **conclusions (2)** 11:16 23:23 conditions (1) 65:4 confident (1) 50:5 consent (1) 18:11 consequences (1) 37:10 consider (3) 6:8 49:2 63:17 consideration (1) 49:3 considering (1) 22:24 **Constance (1)** 2:9 consulted (1) 29:15 **consulting (1)** 34:5 **consumer (1)** 45:5 contains (1) 18:3 **continue (5)** 4:19 31:14 54:9 55:2 continued (1) 6:19 contractor (1) 53:14 **CONVENED (1)** 2:2 conversations (1) 19:4 copies (1) 33:20 correct (14) 23:15,18 24:4,4,17 32:3 33:13 58:15,18,19,20,24

correlated (1) 20:17 cost (12) 10:25 11:3 17:22 36:20 37:8 40:22 41:5,7,9 43:9,21 44:9 costs (2) 43:14 47:4 Council (3) 6:2 7:3,13 Counsel (2) 2:13 67:10 count (1) 65:19 **COUNTY (1)** 71:5 couple (1) 5:24 course (2) 66:7,10 courses (1) 66:9 cover (3) 36:12,25 51:11 coverage (14) 30:18,24 35:19 36:6 36:21 45:20 46:15,20 47:9 49:25 53:7,18,22 57:10 covered (3) 8:17 59:8 64:21 covers (2) 51:11 59:13 crack (1) 55:23 crash (11) 7:11 8:2 12:4,5 14:20 16:21 19:10,19 20:4 21:15,17 crashes (10) 7:7 12:23 13:14 18:25 19:17 20:8,18,20,22 22:17 create (1) 6:5 crimes (1) 16:24 criteria (2) 18:5 24:22 critical (1) 7:8 current (3) 29:8 41:11 64:22 Currently (3) 29:10 43:23 48:23 **customers (1)** 6:15 cut (2) 57:5,8 cyclists (1) 13:12

D dangerous (3) 12:23 13:9 20:7 data (19) 7:11,24,25 11:6,25 12:3,4 14:4,16 15:10,17 17:24 18:18 19:11 23:17,21,22,22 25:12 date (2) 28:10 36:6 dates (1) 30:4 day (5) 5:3,10 28:14 39:23 71:20 davs (2) 6:8 38:14 de (3) 13:2 55:13,15 deadline (1) 68:13 deal (2) 19:9 56:25 deals (1) 57:3 death (4) 29:12 30:2 32:8 35:22 dec (6) 8:18 36:3 50:21 51:4,9,10 decide (1) 24:23 decided (1) 36:25 decision (1) 4:24 declaration (8) 29:22 30:14 35:20 36:5 52:22 54:23 58:5,18 defensive (1) 66:9 definitely (1) 60:24

demand (2) 36:21 45:20 demands (1) 36:18 demonstrate (1) 15:6 denial (1) 9:10 denials (3) 9:12,14,25 **denied (1)** 10:4 deny (1) 55:4 department (5) 13:7 35:4,10 46:11 46:12 deprive (1) 37:7 derived (1) 19:10 describe (2) 10:25 25:5 despite (1) 42:20 detailing (1) 17:15 details (2) 22:3 62:7 **determine (1)** 19:15 determining (1) 16:20 detrimental (1) 57:9 **developing (1)** 29:14 devices (5) 11:23 14:19 15:3,6 16:3 Diallo (2) 4:11 5:3 **Diallo's (1)** 5:9 dialogue (2) 54:9 55:2 differ (1) 19:19 difference (2) 39:21 42:15 different (10) 9:17 16:8,8 19:21 20:11 24:7,9,10 38:10 40:16 difficult (1) 45:17 difficulty (3) 29:16,19 65:12 direct (1) 46:16 Director (4) 2:14,15 9:6 12:14 disabled (1) 6:3 disadvantage (2) 40:25 43:5 discounts (1) 15:7 discretionary (3) 4:10,22,23 discussed (2) 38:25 40:9 discussing (1) 56:9 discussions (3) 61:9 63:18 65:11 **disparity (1)** 41:2 division (1) 19:22 **DMV (1)** 19:11 **DOCUMENTATION (1)** 3:2 doing (6) 17:2 24:15 26:2 45:23 56:8 58:22 dollars (1) 45:25 drafted (1) 63:12 draw (1) 23:24 drive (3) 13:22 15:20 44:4 driven (1) 65:11 driver (8) 8:3 15:16 16:18 18:7 21:16 35:18 38:6 66:7 driver/owners (1) 17:10 drivers (60) 6:13 7:5,6 11:4,11,21

59:2.6

13:11,18,20,21,22 14:21,24 15:18,20,21,25 16:23,25 18:11 18:21 19:19,20,23,24,25 20:9,12 20:19 21:5,7,12,15 34:23 37:15 38:4 40:10,12,17,21 41:2,4,8 42:4,21,23,24 43:4,18,19,21 44:3 45:18 53:13,19 54:20 55:24 65:13,13,14 driving (13) 12:23 13:10,25 14:2 14:19,25 15:6 37:10,11 65:5,16 66:9.14 **Dubai (1)** 15:25 due (2) 13:13 31:5 duopoly (1) 53:20

Ε

E (2) 71:2,2 earlier (1) 14:14 easier (1) 65:24 education (4) 8:11 13:8 66:6 67:7 Edward (1) 2:8 effect (8) 40:15 50:18 51:2 54:13 56:24 57:9,15 58:22 effective (2) 22:17 36:6 effectiveness (3) 12:22 20:11 22:21 efficiency (1) 21:7 eight (4) 32:25 33:8,10 38:21 eighteen (1) 54:8 either (1) 55:3 **EL (1)** 25:17 elaborate (1) 24:21 elected (1) 46:24 electronic (1) 11:23 Elias (1) 2:6 eliminate (2) 13:4 40:8 eliminated (1) 54:18 eliminates (1) 59:10 eliminating (7) 11:20 41:5,8 53:16 54:13 56:24 59:21 **elimination (1)** 52:19 Email (1) 1:23 emphasis (1) 62:6 employees (1) 67:20 enable (1) 12:21 enforcement (4) 6:11 12:2 13:9 18:18 engine (1) 21:10 **ensure (1)** 13:12 enter (2) 10:16 17:14 enters (1) 10:10 entice (1) 65:15 entities (2) 37:3 45:6

envision (1) 21:23 equal (1) 43:15 equipment (2) 11:20 25:23 equivalency (1) 65:19 Ethan (3) 3:10 50:13 51:21 **European (1)** 16:13 evaluate (4) 12:21 17:13 18:6 22:7 evaluation (2) 18:24 19:22 event (1) 12:3 events (5) 11:7,8,9 14:17,20 eventually (1) 65:20 everybody (1) 55:10 everyday (1) 13:17 evidence (2) 20:2,5 exact (1) 38:18 examine (2) 20:5,16 example (3) 20:8,18 21:6 exceed (1) 15:25 excellent (2) 13:15 36:11 exception (1) 8:11 excess (40) 30:25 34:20,22 35:2,8 35:12,24 36:19 37:6,19 40:9,22 41:3,6 42:4,7 43:11,14 44:13 45:9 46:15 47:13 48:11 49:5,7,24 50:7,17 51:5 52:19 56:24 57:4,7 59:11,18 62:9,17,18,20,21 exclude (2) 46:14 47:13 excluding (1) 46:18 exclusionary (1) 6:15 excuse (2) 32:21,24 executive (6) 4:5,9,12,16,21 34:3 exempt (2) 11:19,22 exemption (2) 64:2 67:7 exist (1) 21:19 existing (1) 44:7 **exonerate (1)** 16:25 expect (1) 14:14 expected (1) 7:14 expediting (1) 16:21 **expense (1)** 66:13 **expensive (1)** 50:3 experience (6) 13:18 34:13 36:14 41:24 53:2 65:18 explain (1) 42:9 explicit (1) 58:5 explicitly (1) 48:16 extent (1) 60:6 extra (2) 40:13 61:2 **extreme (1)** 40:25 **extremely (1)** 17:3

F (1) 71:2 face (1) 16:15 facilities (1) 27:13 facing (1) 41:7 fact (2) 29:17,18 fair (2) 47:10,11 fairs (1) 5:16 fall (1) 14:15 falsely (1) 16:25 far (2) 45:21 62:5 **fatalities (1)** 13:5 favor (5) 4:6 8:20 9:11,24 67:2 Fax (1) 1:22 federal (1) 35:23 FedEx (1) 15:3 feedback (4) 14:7,24 15:20 19:12 fellow (1) 42:23 felt (1) 45:7 fewer (1) 15:21 **FHV (1)** 15:13 FHVs (2) 16:19 17:8 field (1) 43:15 fifteen (1) 36:10 file (1) 44:8 final (4) 12:6 31:8 55:7 69:6 Finally (3) 18:22 21:18 30:21 Financial (3) 35:4,10 46:12 find (5) 7:21 20:18,20 32:4 45:18 findings (1) 22:14 fine (2) 5:4 63:19 fines (4) 65:7,9 68:25 69:4 firm (3) 34:5 53:2 57:2 first (17) 4:4 15:11 18:3 21:24 22:9 22:12 28:21,23 33:19 42:8 48:14 49:18 51:23 52:16 54:16 58:9 64:19 fit (1) 21:20 fitness (1) 65:5 five (14) 32:8,11,13,18,20,23,25 33:4,6,9,10,16 36:11 67:3 fleet (2) 6:5 15:12 fleets (4) 15:2,13 17:10 27:24 fliers (1) 5:21 FLOOR (1) 1:8 flow (1) 13:24 folks (1) 53:10 follow (1) 24:12 following (4) 4:17 9:8 21:24 60:12 footage (1) 16:22 for-hire (13) 7:22 14:10 22:21 29:12,13 31:20,22 32:5 35:15 38:7 45:12 46:4 48:22 forced (1) 44:7 forever (1) 13:13 form (3) 35:3 53:4,4 formally (1) 68:8

environment (1) 13:18

forms (2) 30:19 53:25 forth (3) 53:22,23 58:7 forward (3) 21:23 22:18 54:18 forwarded (1) 31:6 found (1) 14:21 foundation (1) 37:4 four (4) 7:2 11:14 22:14 67:3 Fourth (1) 18:17 Frank (2) 2:7 47:18 frequently (1) 20:10 front (1) 16:16 fuel (1) 21:7 fulfill (1) 49:25 full (1) 36:20 full-service (1) 44:23 fundamental (1) 53:5 fundamentally (1) 43:3 further (10) 15:17 17:15 22:3 41:6 47:4 58:9 61:4 63:5,17 71:15 future (1) 20:25

gain (3) 14:7 63:7,8 garages (1) 27:11 Gatti (9) 3:3 28:24 29:2 33:20,25 34:2,10,12 35:8 general (4) 2:9,13 61:8 67:10 generation (1) 38:6 geofencing (1) 16:9 **geographic (1)** 16:9 **Gerber (6)** 3:10 50:13 51:20,21 52:9 60:5 getting (6) 15:9 21:14 27:14,19 28:20 39:12 give (9) 5:13 7:4 10:11 27:21 29:2 32:3 33:23 51:13 56:12 glad (1) 67:22 **GNYTA (1)** 3:10 go (8) 27:19 44:2 53:22 55:21 66:16,18 67:22 68:2 qoal (2) 19:14 54:21 goals (3) 6:5 25:4,7 goes (3) 22:9,13 40:24 going (31) 4:3,19 5:13 8:3,6,7,19 10:10 21:23 23:6,25 24:6,23 25:2 25:2.12 26:2 27:25 48:4.5 55:15 55:16,24 56:23 57:8,15 58:21 62:24 63:6,8 66:3 Gonzales (11) 2:8 24:20 26:4,22 26:23 57:23,24 59:4 62:4 69:24 69:25

good (24) 4:18 9:3,4,5 12:11,13

21:20 23:17,21 33:25 37:24

39:24,24 41:19 44:19 47:24

51:20 52:13 55:9 57:14,21,22 65:4 67:9 Gorton (6) 3:6 41:17,19,20 44:10 44:12 governing (2) 8:4 38:9 government (1) 35:24 qovernors (2) 16:3,10 great (5) 19:9 37:5 46:23 57:4 62:18 greater (3) 31:18 50:13 51:21 green (5) 5:16 6:2,6 55:18,20 group (6) 3:3 23:13 28:24 34:4

groups (1) 20:15 guess (4) 57:25 58:3,8,9

48:8 65:21

Н

habits (1) 13:25 hack (1) 28:5 hacked (1) 28:14 hacking (1) 27:14 hail (3) 6:12,14,15 half (1) 49:4 Hall (1) 7:14 halls (2) 6:20 56:8 hand (1) 71:20 hands (1) 66:17 happened (1) 52:15 happy (2) 22:25 47:16 hard (6) 11:7,8 14:18 20:14,21 46:25 harder (2) 43:18,19 he'll (1) 5:10 hear (3) 6:9 8:7 9:2 heard (2) 45:22 60:23 hearing (11) 1:8 2:2 5:25 7:13 8:10 28:21 56:3 60:9,12,16 67:6 held (1) 7:13 Hello (1) 55:9 help (10) 13:25 15:20 20:23 21:6 21:12.16 22:16 43:11 49:24 58:2 **helped (1)** 19:6 helpful (2) 16:22 20:25 hereunto (1) 71:20 high (1) 47:5 higher (11) 29:13 36:18,23 40:10 41:7 42:22 43:8,10,14,23,25 highest (1) 46:8 highly (2) 20:17,21 **history (2)** 54:7 65:5 Hold (1) 32:10 holding (1) 63:7 Hom (4) 3:8 47:23,24,25 home (2) 37:10 57:6

hope (2) 22:15 23:12 hour (1) 16:7 huge (1) 57:10 hump (1) 44:2 hundred (9) 31:15,16,17,17 32:8 32:25 33:5,6,12 hundred/one (1) 33:9 hundred/three (1) 33:12 hurt (2) 43:8 45:11

idea (2) 62:21 65:17 ideas (1) 57:21 identical (2) 30:5,6 identification (3) 8:17 30:10 51:9 identifies (1) 35:18 identify (4) 14:8,17 17:19 22:16 identifying (1) 16:23 ifs (1) 58:6 illegal (1) 6:16 images (1) 10:22 **impact (1)** 14:5 impeding (1) 46:17 implementation (1) 14:9 implicitly (1) 48:17 **implore (1)** 47:10 important (5) 7:17 18:2,20 36:7 46:15 importantly (1) 7:25 imposed (1) 46:16 **improve (3)** 13:16 21:7 58:2 improvement (1) 20:3 improvements (1) 13:24 incidence (2) 19:16 20:6 include (2) 29:23 54:24 including (2) 11:19 15:8 increase (2) 11:2 43:20 increased (3) 13:10 36:21 44:9 increasing (1) 28:12 incremental (1) 58:14 independent (1) 53:14 indicate (1) 14:18 indicator (1) 19:17 individual (2) 17:10 35:25 individuals (1) 37:12 industries (4) 12:19 13:17 21:21 22:22 industry (20) 7:22 14:8 18:19 21:13 22:19 23:8 34:13 38:5,7,11 40:18 42:9 45:12 46:9 49:10,22 53:11 54:19 58:12 65:12 information (9) 5:16,23 7:10 10:25

14:13 50:21 51:9 62:11 63:10

infractions (1) 9:18

initial (2) 66:11,12 **initiative (1)** 7:17 **initiatives (1)** 13:2 injury (6) 7:8 29:11,24 30:2 32:7 35:21 input (1) 19:6 insofar (1) 11:24 inspector (1) 33:24 install (1) 15:14 installed (3) 14:23 15:10,12 installing (1) 24:14 insurance (114) 3:2 8:14 15:4 16:21 21:12 28:19 29:6,7,22,24 29:25 30:6,7,17 34:5,13,18,20,21 34:22 35:3,9,13,21,22 36:4,9,23 37:6,6,13,16,20 38:9,20 39:15,21 40:9,10,11,13,16,19,21,23 41:2,3 41:4,6,7,10,11 42:4,5,8,22 43:2,6 43:9,10,11,14,21,25 44:7,14,23 44:24 45:2,9,21 46:4,7,9,12 47:13 48:11,12,18,21 49:7,11,24 49:25 50:3,6,7 51:5,8,13 52:20 52:22 53:6,10,11,18,21 54:8 55:12 56:4,24,25 57:3,4 58:13,14 59:19 60:5 62:9,17,18,21 66:21 66:25 insurances (1) 59:21 insured (5) 30:4,12,13 36:3 44:5 insureds (1) 51:10 insurer (1) 30:17 insurers (2) 29:15,18 integrate (1) 16:15 intended (1) 29:5 intent (2) 57:14,15 intention (3) 51:24 60:4 64:23 intentional (1) 45:10 interested (2) 22:4 71:18 interests (1) 47:7 interfering (1) 25:20 intersection (1) 55:18 involve (1) 7:7 involved (2) 7:7 47:4 involving (3) 7:11 18:13,23 inwards (1) 16:17 iPhone (1) 27:9 Iris (2) 2:10 27:16 Island (1) 5:20 issue (2) 53:9 58:23 issued (3) 6:12 36:2,5 issues (3) 14:9 50:8 58:4 **issuing (1)** 45:25 item (1) 4:4 items (1) 58:18

January (1) 67:17 **Jo (3)** 2:15 10:6 12:13 Jo's (1) 12:10 job (2) 27:10 43:17 join (1) 22:10 Joseph (3) 3:3 28:23 34:2 **Joshi (3)** 2:5 26:16 69:18 Judge's (2) 4:25 5:8 July (1) 5:21 **June (81)** 1:6 4:1 5:1,19,19,20,20 6:1,22,23,24 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1,9 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1,5,12 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1,13 69:1 69:10 70:1 71:20 justification (1) 47:2

Κ

Kari (3) 2:22 71:7,24 **Katzman (4)** 3:7 44:18,19,20 **keep (2)** 40:7 44:13 key (1) 19:17 kind (3) 53:6,7,8 know (11) 23:9 25:25 42:12 48:14 49:2,13,14,20,22 50:6 62:7 knowing (1) 14:22 Korea (1) 17:3

L (3) 2:22 71:7,24 **L-PEP (1)** 25:18 lack (2) 37:17 59:25 Lane (2) 3:8,11 language (2) 68:22,25 lapse (3) 64:7,15 67:18 lapsed (1) 68:3 large (1) 42:11 larger (6) 29:13 30:22 31:18,25 38:14,15 launch (1) 22:8 law (8) 12:9 31:11 48:16,19,19 49:8 57:2 69:9 **LBOA (1)** 38:4 learn (3) 18:20 19:8 22:20 learning (1) 21:18 leave (3) 23:6 40:18 65:14

led (1) 13:6 legislation (1) 7:3 **letter (1)** 48:4 level (4) 29:23,25 35:20 59:24 levels (1) 16:8 liability (9) 29:9 32:7 35:2,8,13,24 45:14,20 47:13 **Liberties (1)** 19:5 **Library (1)** 6:25 license (12) 5:9,9 28:20 64:4,7,7 64:13,15,16 67:18,21 68:2 licensed (4) 7:11 34:23 37:3 41:22 licensee (6) 4:11 5:2,5 30:4 68:24 69:6 licensees (3) 19:13 29:7 64:3 licenses (2) 55:24 68:5 licensing (8) 2:14 9:7 28:20 37:12 52:23 64:9 67:20,24 licensure (1) 65:4 life (1) 65:18 lifetime (1) 8:11 light (1) 25:23 limit (15) 8:4 16:2,4,6,7 31:25 32:11,12,17 33:11,16 45:20 47:3 47:5 62:17 limited (2) 53:21 65:21 limiting (1) 57:16 limits (10) 8:6 29:13 30:25 31:15 31:16,22 36:19,23 45:15,25 Limo (1) 43:17 limos (1) 31:25 limousine (22) 1:3 3:6 9:8 38:3,5 38:12,13,20 39:2 40:5,17,20,24 41:21,23 42:15,16,24 43:4,7 49:23 53:15 limousines (11) 30:22 32:9,16 33:3,8,15 38:14,15 41:18 42:11 42:12 list (2) 28:23 56:12 listed (1) 50:12 listen (1) 33:19 listening (2) 50:9 59:18 little (2) 24:21 34:9 live (1) 15:19 livery (5) 6:6,12,14 30:22 47:4 lives (2) 13:12 22:18 living (2) 45:12 47:3 local (4) 12:9 31:11 34:14 69:9 long (4) 58:16 64:9 65:13 68:2 longer (3) 40:23 50:20 67:24 look (6) 19:22 20:8 22:18 25:15,19 27:13 looking (4) 20:2,12 51:15 59:22 looks (1) 67:2

lose (1) 55:24 losses (1) 37:2 lost (2) 13:12 68:4 lot (3) 27:10 49:21 59:18 louder (2) 34:9 35:7 love (2) 24:8,12 lower (7) 21:12 36:20 37:8 40:19 40:22 41:5,8 luxury (20) 3:4 30:21 32:9,15 33:3 33:15 37:22 38:2,3,5,12,16,25 41:8,12,22 42:21 43:12,22 53:15

M Madam (2) 59:17 66:15 main (2) 14:15 48:13 maintenance (1) 21:9 major (1) 42:14 majority (1) 45:18 making (6) 11:16,17 39:17 45:16 62:3 65:23 malpractice (1) 57:7 Mamaroneck (2) 1:19,20 management (2) 5:6 47:19 manager (2) 41:21 43:16 mandating (1) 36:18 Manhattan (2) 1:9 5:19 Marino (33) 2:9 9:13,20 26:24,25 27:16 31:13,24 32:10,14,19,22 33:4,9,18 35:7 50:15 51:3,16,19 56:20 57:25 58:21 59:5,10,16 61:13,21 62:2,13 65:23 70:2,3 markings (1) 42:17 marriage (1) 71:16 Marx (5) 3:8,11 47:23 48:2 52:12 matches (1) 36:3 matter (4) 53:4 71:12,17,18 maximum (1) 45:24 mayor (3) 7:14 13:2 46:24 Mazer (4) 3:16 67:8,9,10 mean (6) 56:25 57:4,6,7,10 62:5 means (1) 61:10 measure (1) 14:5 measures (1) 17:25 medallion (1) 36:24 Meera (1) 2:5 meet (24) 9:15,18 25:4 34:20,24 36:17 37:6,13 40:21 41:4 42:5 43:11,13 46:5 47:14 48:12,21 50:3 54:10 56:11 58:16 59:14 64:9 65:3 meeting (8) 2:9 4:4 8:22 60:18 63:7,21 66:19 70:7 meets (2) 53:25 54:14

members (2) 61:10 63:9 memorandum (1) 17:14 memorialize (1) 8:14 memorializes (1) 50:25 mentioned (1) 42:10 met (2) 63:12 64:18 Metropolitan (2) 67:11 68:18 Michael (3) 3:7 44:17,20 mid (1) 6:10 mike (1) 27:16 miles (2) 13:22 16:7 million (9) 32:8,18,20,23 33:10,17 45:25 57:9,10 mind (2) 34:8 66:16 minded (2) 47:10,11 minimum (3) 32:7 39:14,15 minute (1) 10:9 minutes (4) 8:20,21,25 48:9 missing (1) 59:23 mitigated (1) 25:10 Mittendorf (2) 3:9,12 **MO (1)** 10:17 model (3) 28:4 39:18 53:14 models (1) 28:8 modification (1) 21:22 modified (2) 5:7 15:22 Mohamed (2) 4:11 5:2 month (7) 5:6,14 6:20 9:9 40:15 61:23 63:4 months (5) 11:14 22:14 35:5,11 54:8 morning (15) 4:18 9:3,4,5 12:13,15 33:25 37:24 41:19 44:19 47:24 51:20 52:13 67:9,13 motion (6) 4:5 60:9,14,16 61:7 66:24 **motivation (1)** 21:3 motorists (1) 55:21 MOU (2) 10:17 22:3 move (8) 4:5,9 5:12 8:19 10:7 28:22 40:3,18 MTBOT (1) 3:16 Ν

name (12) 9:5,5 12:13 30:2,12 34:2 37:25 41:20 44:20 47:25 51:13 55:10 named (2) 30:4,12 nature (1) 62:10 necessary (3) 21:17 24:16 46:6 necessity (1) 45:7 need (4) 55:22 57:20 61:3 63:10 needs (2) 21:16 61:14

negative (1) 57:16

new (29) 1:2,20 6:6 13:5 14:2,10 16:19 17:5 19:5 22:21 27:12 30:18 35:4,10,15,25 36:18 43:17 43:25 44:8,22 46:11,23 50:13 51:21 68:17,19 71:4,9 nine (5) 16:12 28:13 32:6,17 33:11 non-pilot (1) 19:24 Nora (1) 2:9 Notably (1) 29:7 **Notary (1)** 71:8 **noted (1)** 70:8 **notice (2)** 49:7,13 noticed (1) 27:9 **notified (1)** 50:20 **notifying (2)** 18:15 50:23 NR (1) 36:12 number (5) 27:11 30:6,16 36:3 53:21 numbers (5) 8:17 27:23 30:11 58:7 58:17 **nut (1)** 57:10 NV200 (1) 28:3 **NYPD (1)** 13:8

0

OATH (1) 4:25 OATH's (1) 5:7 objectivity (1) 62:6 objects (1) 63:11 obstacle (1) 44:3 **obstacles (1)** 65:17 obtain (2) 14:4 40:21 obtained (2) 11:25 64:3 **obtaining (1)** 58:13 obviously (1) 23:22 occurrence (6) 29:10,11 33:2,7 38:23,24 offenders (1) 16:23 offer (2) 43:24 57:12 Officer (1) 34:4 official (1) 17:11 officially (2) 22:8 50:23 Oh (1) 32:24 Okay (16) 9:24 12:10 24:20 26:4 26:10,11 28:15 32:14 39:19 44:12 51:16,19 56:6,13 59:4 66:23 ones (2) 13:14 28:6 open (1) 4:3 operate (4) 38:12,13,16 42:13 operated (1) 38:19 **Operating (1)** 34:4 operations (1) 25:21 operator (1) 45:2

MEMBER (1) 51:17

operators (4) 3:4 37:23 38:2 49:23 opportunity (4) 13:16 14:4,7 21:25 oppose (1) 48:9 option (5) 36:20 37:8 41:9 57:5 62:20 optional (1) 18:12 options (1) 57:17 **ORANGE (1)** 71:5 order (2) 65:15 67:20 ordered (1) 5:5 original (1) 68:22 originally (3) 31:8 68:11,21 Osman (3) 3:13 55:7,10 outcome (1) 71:18 outlined (1) 13:2 outlining (2) 6:4 22:3 outstanding (6) 9:16 65:7,9 68:24 69:2,4 outwards (1) 16:15 outweighs (1) 45:21 overall (1) 57:25 owned (3) 51:12 59:2,13 owner (4) 30:3,8 44:25 46:17 owner/driver (1) 43:13 owners (8) 6:13 11:11 17:8,19 18:10 21:5,8 36:24 owns (3) 31:2 58:25 59:7

Ъ

package (2) 9:10 28:18 packages (1) 8:9 page (14) 3:2,15 8:18 29:22 30:14 35:20 36:4,5 50:21 51:9,10 52:25 58:6,18 pages (2) 52:22 54:23 paperwork (2) 28:19 44:8 Park (1) 55:19 Parkchester (1) 6:25 part (7) 10:20 13:11,23 15:10 43:17 51:24 52:2 partially (1) 57:24 participant (1) 10:21 participant's (1) 24:22 participants (5) 10:16,19,24 11:4 participate (5) 17:8 18:11 19:14 23:10.11 participated (1) 5:25 participating (4) 11:18,21 17:18 22:4 participation (1) 10:18 particularly (1) 58:4 parties (2) 17:21 71:17 **partner (1)** 17:8

partners (1) 23:9 partnerships (1) 23:7 pass (3) 49:2,2,14 passed (5) 7:3,12 38:15 46:22 69:3 passenger (4) 10:22 11:2 18:7 passengers (8) 5:17 10:24 11:12 18:15 32:6 33:8,16 38:21 passes (1) 22:2 Pat (2) 3:11 52:12 **path (1)** 15:19 patterns (1) 24:11 pay (6) 40:10,12 42:25 44:7,8 66:13 **paying (1)** 40:13 payment (1) 69:4 pedestrians (1) 13:11 penalize (1) 7:5 penalized (1) 18:21 penalty (1) 46:16 people (20) 28:7 45:11 46:25 47:8 49:10,10,20,21 50:20,23 55:20 57:6 64:6,13 65:21,24 66:3 67:16 67:19 68:4 people's (1) 57:16 percent (1) 57:2 perfect (1) 56:10 period (1) 10:16 person (4) 33:2,7 38:22,23 personal (2) 29:24 53:2 personally (3) 44:25 57:8 58:8 **Peter (3)** 3:16 67:8,10 Phillip (3) 3:8 47:23,25 picking (1) 6:15 pieces (1) 7:2 pilot (34) 7:19 8:8 10:8,12,13,15,18 10:21 11:11 12:2,16,18,25 13:15 14:3,14 17:11,21,23 18:2,12,17 18:19 19:9,14,15,23,25 22:8,11 22:15,24 23:11 25:17 piloted (1) 11:25 pioneering (1) 18:20 **place (1)** 49:18 places (1) 55:17 plan (7) 6:4,7 13:3 23:4 25:8,11 57:22 plans (1) 10:20 player (1) 21:13 playing (1) 43:15 please (2) 41:9 67:8 plus (3) 33:11 36:10 46:7 point (13) 18:18 32:11,13,17,20,23 33:10 48:14 49:9,19 52:20 65:24

points (4) 48:6,13 52:18,24 police (1) 55:23 policies (11) 18:4 20:24 29:6 30:23 35:17 37:16 48:11,23 49:5 52:2 59:19 **policy (18)** 8:18 29:22 30:4,6,9 36:2,2,8 44:14 49:6,12,18 51:10 52:3 55:13,15 59:13 68:6 portions (1) 40:18 positively (1) 15:22 **possibility (1)** 53:16 possibly (1) 62:20 post (1) 10:23 posted (4) 5:23 12:7 31:9 69:7 **postpone (1)** 55:3 potential (3) 5:18 46:18 56:23 practical (1) 40:15 practice (5) 8:14 50:25 57:2,3 64:22 predecessor (1) 45:22 preempted (2) 48:16 49:8 **prefer (1)** 61:10 premiums (2) 40:13,16 prepare (1) 11:13 prepared (2) 62:11 63:19 preparing (1) 19:3 present (7) 2:3,9,12 10:12 13:15 18:16 54:9 presentation (2) 8:7 10:13 presented (4) 52:23 53:3,24 54:9 president (3) 34:3 37:25 44:21 **Press (1)** 2:19 preventable (1) 13:13 preventing (1) 22:17 Previously (1) 5:7 primary (4) 19:9 21:2 36:12,16 prime (1) 42:14 prior (2) 8:2 28:20 prioritize (1) 20:23 privacy (7) 10:20 17:25 18:3,4,8 19:6 25:8 Pro-Tech (3) 3:7 44:18,21 **probably (5)** 28:11 49:8,17 58:8 62:15 problem (1) 24:19 problematic (1) 49:16 proceedings (71) 4:1,17 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1,21 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1

68:7

50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:11,14 produce (1) 25:7 **productive (1)** 57:17 Professional (1) 71:8 program (21) 5:6,17 6:2 11:11,15 11:15 12:16,18,25 13:4 17:11,23 19:3,23,24,25 22:11,16,24 36:15 36:19 programs (3) 2:15 12:14 25:17 progress (1) 22:11 Progressive (1) 15:5 **prohibit (4)** 34:19 42:3 48:11 58:12 prohibiting (4) 37:5,19 42:7 45:9 promote (2) 15:4 53:20 promoting (1) 54:11 proof (2) 29:6 30:24 proposal (3) 10:21 11:4 25:3 proposals (5) 17:13 18:6 22:6,7 25:25 proposed (15) 7:18,19 8:8 11:2 13:15 31:7 34:17 40:8 42:2 45:8 52:19 55:4 56:4 68:21,23 protect (3) 17:25 18:7 45:15 protection (3) 29:25 34:25 54:20 protections (3) 18:3,4 53:18 protectors (1) 47:11 provide (16) 7:9 14:24 21:8 30:15 30:18 31:21 36:20 41:25 45:19 46:3 47:8 48:7 53:17,22 64:2 provided (10) 29:6,9,24,25 30:11 30:17 35:21 53:7,8 68:15 provides (4) 34:22 35:19 41:3 50:2 **providing (3)** 13:19 34:25 43:10 provisions (2) 17:16 19:6 public (13) 2:18 4:3,20 7:10 11:3 13:7 14:8 35:2 45:15 47:8,11 63:16 71:9 publish (1) 22:2 **published (3)** 31:3,8 68:12 purchase (2) 36:25 45:9 **purchasers (1)** 5:18 **purchases (1)** 28:4 purchasing (1) 62:21 purpose (7) 43:5,6 52:17 54:6 59:20 61:18,20 pursue (1) 52:21 put (8) 5:22 8:16 12:19 24:2 28:5 40:5,5 61:5 **puts (1)** 43:3 putting (2) 8:15 23:5

Q qualified (2) 40:25 69:5 qualify (2) 15:7 46:19 Queens (2) 5:18 6:24 question (7) 23:4 24:21 31:13 50:16 53:6 58:10 64:11 questions (12) 9:23 22:25 26:5,7 33:19 41:15 47:16 52:15 56:19 60:4,22 69:12 quick (1) 29:2

R

R (1) 71:2 raise (2) 37:16 66:17 raised (1) 60:22 rate (1) 28:12 rated (2) 36:9 46:7 rates (3) 19:19 20:4 21:13 rating (1) 46:7 ratings (2) 46:8 53:9 rational (1) 52:21 Rausen (14) 2:15 10:6 12:12,13 23:6,15,18,21 24:4,8,17,19,25 26:5 re-enter (1) 66:14 reach (1) 21:15 reached (1) 45:24 reaching (1) 13:4 reading (1) 59:22 ready (6) 26:9 27:15,19 28:22 46:3 69:11 real (1) 14:9 realize (1) 43:19 really (10) 7:20,23 8:12 51:14 53:3 53:20 56:22 57:18 59:23 62:15 reapply (2) 9:21 67:21 reasons (2) 40:7 68:5 received (3) 11:11 31:6 68:14 Recess (1) 4:14 reckless (1) 7:5 recognizes (2) 51:25,25 recommendation (2) 5:2,8 recommended (3) 9:9 11:16 68:20 record (8) 7:24 14:16 31:4 39:5 62:3 64:17 68:12 71:13 recorders (2) 15:10,17 recording (1) 15:3 records (2) 19:10 20:2 recruit (1) 43:17 recruiting (1) 44:3 redesigns (1) 13:6 reduce (4) 19:16 20:13 37:9,14 reduced (1) 69:3 reducing (2) 12:23 20:6

Reed (3) 2:22 71:7,24 reemphasize (1) 62:5 **reference (2)** 34:16 48:18 reflect (1) 38:12 reflected (1) 69:7 regarding (4) 10:17 12:5 34:18 48:18 regardless (1) 66:10 registered (3) 30:3,8 71:7 regular (2) 30:25 31:17 regularly (1) 11:6 regulate (1) 12:19 regulated (7) 13:17 15:13 17:6,20 20:22 21:21 37:11 regulatorily (1) 35:14 reinstate (2) 4:25 5:3 reinstated (1) 5:10 reinsurer (1) 36:10 reject (3) 41:9 51:7,14 rejected (1) 53:5 rejecting (1) 51:5 relate (2) 7:6 11:24 related (3) 11:10 25:9 71:16 relatively (1) 16:5 released (1) 14:13 remiss (1) 27:8 remotely (2) 21:8 62:20 removed (1) 68:25 removing (1) 65:16 renewal (1) 66:7 repairs (1) 24:16 repeat (1) 43:24 report (5) 11:5,14 22:13 27:8 30:19 reported (2) 2:21 71:11 **Reporter (1)** 71:8 **REPORTING (1)** 1:18 reports (2) 5:13 19:11 represented (1) 45:5 represents (1) 38:4 requests (1) 14:13 require (2) 18:14 42:17 required (12) 10:19,23 11:5 12:9 16:10 25:24 31:11 46:20 65:2 67:22 69:4,9 requirement (11) 40:22 43:23 46:5 50:2.22 52:4 64:5.18 66:6 67:17 67:25 requirements (32) 8:15 9:16,19 28:18 34:18,21,24 37:7,14 38:10 38:20 39:14,15 40:19 41:5,10,11 42:5.22 43:9.12 47:14 48:12.22 50:4 54:2,11,15 56:5 59:15 64:10 66:10 requires (2) 7:9 45:13

70 mulining (4) C7:04	f- (4) 12:21	ah awa (4) 40:47
requiring (1) 67:24	safe (1) 13:21	shows (1) 49:17
research (1) 19:22	safeguard (1) 25:12	sic (2) 17:24 35:14
reserves (1) 36:13	safely (1) 15:20	sign (2) 7:15 55:18
resolution (11) 10:8,12,14 12:6,17	safer (1) 13:20	significant (3) 40:14,15 42:18
17:16 18:2 19:7 21:25 22:24 27:3	safety (15) 7:20 11:3 12:16,20	similar (1) 25:16
respect (2) 58:11 62:9	13:16 14:6,12 15:4 19:12,20,21	simple (1) 16:5
respectfully (1) 37:18	21:2,11 25:5,6	simply (2) 8:16 42:8
responded (1) 14:12	samples (1) 53:25	single (5) 32:10,12,17 33:11,16
response (4) 15:23 26:8 47:20	Sanchez (11) 3:4 37:22,24,25 39:6	site (5) 5:23 7:10 12:8 31:10 69:8
69:13	39:9,12,16,20,24 40:3	six (2) 5:6 67:3
responsible (1) 24:14	satisfy (1) 50:5	size (1) 36:13
restrictions (1) 11:22	saving (1) 22:18	slower (1) 35:7
resume (1) 34:15	saying (1) 61:22	small (7) 37:4,8 43:7 45:11 46:17
retaining (2) 65:12,13	says (2) 48:21,24	46:25 54:20
return (1) 69:5	schedule (4) 30:10,15 63:22,23	solutions (1) 26:3
returned (1) 4:16	scheduled (1) 67:6	somebody (2) 56:11 69:5
returning (1) 68:23	school (18) 3:15 8:12 64:2,5,8,14	soon (1) 55:25
revamped (2) 57:20 62:14	64:17,20 65:2,17,20 66:4,11,13	sorry (4) 6:23 27:7 33:4 34:10
review (5) 4:9 18:23 41:11 58:9	67:17,22,25 68:2	sort (2) 27:21 28:12
65:5	scoring (1) 11:9	sounds (2) 56:9 61:8
reviewed (3) 4:22 12:3 19:2	seat (1) 33:15	source (1) 54:19
reviewing (2) 25:25 29:5	seating (2) 32:6,16	sources (1) 19:10
revocation (2) 4:10,23	seats (1) 16:12	South (1) 17:2
revoked (2) 5:8 68:4	second (4) 18:10 49:9 51:24 64:21	speaker (9) 28:23 41:17 44:17
riding (1) 45:15	seconds (1) 16:2	47:18,21 50:12 52:11 55:7 67:6
right (11) 12:11 31:15,16 33:18	section (2) 48:20,20	SPEAKERS (2) 3:2,15
48:5,17 49:3 55:16 57:22 61:21	security (2) 10:20 25:11	speaking (1) 34:9
66:16		
	sedans (2) 38:18 42:14	speaks (1) 25:3
Risk (1) 47:19	see (8) 20:8 21:16 24:9,12 25:19	specific (2) 25:8 31:19
risks (1) 25:9	28:6 58:2 61:7	specifically (5) 29:21 35:17 48:18
Rockaway (1) 6:22	seek (1) 46:14	48:21 53:13
roll (1) 26:10	seeking (1) 37:12	speed (11) 8:4,4,6 11:6 16:2,3,4,6
rolling (1) 22:7	seen (1) 27:20	16:6,9 20:9
roof (1) 25:23	segment (2) 40:19 46:18	speeding (6) 11:7 14:17 15:18
room (2) 1:8 10:10	segments (1) 38:10	20:9,13,19
RPR (1) 71:24	seizures (2) 6:16,18	speeds (1) 16:8
rule (57) 8:11,15 11:16 28:18,21	selection (1) 24:22	spoke (1) 53:11
29:3,4,7 31:8,9 37:9,19 39:7,8,23	self (1) 60:5	SS (1) 71:4
39:23 40:8,24 42:2,7 45:8,16	sense (1) 41:12	staff (5) 2:16 29:5 62:16 63:18
47:12 48:15 49:2 50:17,24 51:23	sent (1) 48:3	68:20
51:25 52:2,17 53:12 54:3,24 56:3	separate (1) 40:8	standard (1) 42:17
56:4,22 57:13 58:2 59:20,22	Sergio (3) 3:4 37:22,25	standards (3) 29:8,17,20
60:25 61:22 62:19 63:11,18,25	serious (5) 7:7 12:4 18:25 19:16	start (2) 55:23 58:10
64:21 65:20 66:21 67:7,15 68:6,8	20:20	state (15) 6:3,7 30:19 35:4,10,16
68:21,23 69:6	serve (2) 43:5,6	35:23,25 43:25 46:11 48:16,19
rules (28) 3:2,15 8:9,13 9:17 11:19	service (8) 6:16 12:21 15:8 22:10	49:8 71:4,9
24:11 29:14,21 30:15 31:3,21	22:13 28:5,6,11	stated (4) 34:21 52:16 54:5 59:20
34:18 36:18 38:9 48:10,17,24	Services (4) 1:18 35:5,11 46:12	Staten (1) 5:20
49:15 54:11 55:4 57:20 58:11	session (6) 4:5,9,12,16,20,21	states (3) 35:15,20 36:6
61:15 62:5,14 66:25 68:11	set (3) 16:6 53:23 71:20	stating (1) 52:3
Russia (1) 17:2	sets (2) 51:23 52:2	statutorily (2) 35:3,9
Russo (3) 3:11 52:12,13	severe (1) 43:4	STENO-KATH (1) 1:18
	shape (1) 19:6	stenokat@verizon.net (1) 1:23
<u> </u>	sheet (1) 51:4	Stenotype (1) 71:8

step (1) 15:17 **stepped (1)** 13:8 steps (2) 21:17,24 stickers (1) 18:14 stipulating (1) 54:22 stood (1) 46:24 stopped (2) 49:6 50:17 stops (1) 8:5 straight (1) 10:7 street (7) 1:7 6:12,14 13:6 27:20 27:20 55:22 stretch (1) 38:14 strongly (2) 55:2 62:16 **submissions (1)** 63:14 **submit (3)** 10:19,24 25:3 submitted (4) 6:3 28:19 29:23 67:12 **submitting (1)** 30:8 **substance (1)** 53:4 success (1) 19:18 **summarize (1)** 48:6 **summarizing (2)** 11:6,15 summary (3) 10:11 11:10 29:3 summonses (3) 6:12 68:24 69:2 sunsets (1) 65:20 supplemental (1) 58:14 supply (1) 45:21 support (1) 36:14 supposed (1) 52:3 sure (9) 24:6,25,25 25:12,20 27:22 28:2 31:20 62:3 **surely (1)** 37:14 surplus (1) 36:17 surrounded (1) 14:20 surrounding (2) 16:20 18:25 suspension (2) 5:3,11 SUVs (2) 38:18 42:13 system (1) 20:9 systems (2) 15:16,24

T (2) 71:2,2 T-PEP (2) 25:18,22 table (7) 60:2,7,14,16 61:10,12 66:24 tabling (1) 61:20 take (12) 15:16 21:16 25:15,19 55:22 61:2,6 64:8,20,25 66:7,11 taken (3) 4:14 64:14 67:16 talk (2) 25:8 55:13 talking (1) 55:14 talks (1) 25:11

taxi (32) 1:3 3:15 5:16 6:2 8:12 9:7

25:22 27:11,12 28:2,3,4,9,10 35:14 41:22 50:13 51:21 64:2,5,8 64:14,17,20 65:2,17,19 66:3,11 66:13 68:17,19 Taxicab (2) 67:11 68:18 taxis (5) 15:25 17:9,9 29:12 31:22 technical (1) 8:13 technologies (22) 12:20,22 13:14 14:3,5,15 16:14 17:21 18:6,13,22 19:12,16,20 20:6,12,24 21:3,6,11 21:20 22:16 technology (28) 2:15 7:20,21,23 8:2,5 10:22 11:2,24 12:14,16 14:12 17:7,12,18 19:13,18,21 20:13 22:6,9,12,19 23:8 25:4,6,9 25:17 tell (1) 9:13 tells (1) 8:3 template (1) 22:3 ten (2) 9:17 28:14 tend (1) 15:21 term (1) 65:13 terms (2) 53:24,25 test (1) 7:19 testified (2) 48:9 49:21 testify (2) 34:17 45:7 **testifying (1)** 40:4 testimony (6) 59:18 60:23,23 63:12,14,16 testing (5) 14:2 21:3 25:14,18 26:3 thank (31) 10:4,5 22:23 24:18 26:4 27:2 28:15 34:11 37:21 40:2 41:14,16 44:14,16 47:15,17 50:9 50:11 51:19 52:8 55:5,6 56:2,13 56:15,17 67:4 68:9,10 70:4,4 they'd (1) 63:16 thing (2) 57:4 62:18 things (7) 17:3 19:23 24:11 34:19 42:3 62:9 65:24 think (16) 28:13 31:24 54:17,25 57:13,14,15,16,19,20 58:21 60:3 61:14,17,24 62:19 third (4) 18:13 38:5 52:2 55:19 thousand (1) 32:9 thousands (1) 49:22 three (9) 7:8.23 9:10 14:15 31:15 31:17 48:13 61:9 67:3 throws (1) 54:3 Thursday (1) 1:6 tie (1) 30:16 time (17) 9:16 15:21 20:3,10,14 22:5 23:2 41:14 47:15 54:17 61:2 63:16 64:21 65:22 69:2 70:7,8 timing (1) 12:11

TLC (56) 7:4,9,11,17 10:17 11:19 12:2,15,21 13:2,16,21 14:13 15:11,13 17:6,12,15,19 18:5,14 18:17,19,23 19:4,8,13 21:21 22:2 22:5,6 28:20 29:8,14 34:20,23,24 35:12 37:3,11,12,15 38:9 40:21 43:11 48:10,17,24 49:4,17,24 50:7 53:19 54:10 59:14 64:10 TLC's (8) 15:8 30:25 34:18 37:6 42:5 46:5 47:14 48:12 today (26) 7:16 12:17 17:17 19:7 22:2 38:13,15 39:7 41:13 42:12 52:17 53:3,20 54:12,12 60:10,23 61:7,18,25 63:13,15 64:13 66:20 67:2 70:7 today's (4) 39:23 53:12 54:3 56:2 told (4) 21:13 29:18 49:11 67:19 **Tomorrow (2)** 28:3,10 **Tomorrows (2)** 27:12 28:11 tone (1) 14:2 tonight (1) 6:24 tons (1) 16:11 tool (1) 14:23 tools (2) 7:4 13:19 topic (1) 56:10 Tormey (6) 2:14 9:4,6,15,22 10:5 town (2) 6:20 56:7 trade (3) 38:3 67:11 68:18 traffic (4) 13:5,13,24 48:19 training (1) 66:8 transcript (2) 1:1 71:13 transferred (1) 64:19 transmitted (3) 12:8 31:10 69:8 transparency (1) 58:3 Transportation (1) 13:7 travel (2) 16:5 27:10 true (2) 50:16 71:13 try (2) 24:2,6 trying (5) 45:11 47:8 51:6 54:5,25 tuned (1) 63:19 two (20) 8:9 14:12 31:5 40:7 43:24 43:24 44:2,6 45:22 50:19 51:2 52:25 57:11 62:22 63:14 65:8,10 65:15 67:3 68:14 type (2) 30:17 59:21 types (9) 14:11 15:9,24 17:3 19:21 20:11,16,23 24:9 umbrella (6) 8:18 30:23 58:13 59:9 59:12,19 unanimous (2) 4:24 27:4

unanimously (2) 8:25 10:4

unauthorized (2) 18:8 25:13

task (1) 43:18

unclear (1) 64:24 understand (5) 21:4 39:16 46:2,13 56:21 understanding (3) 17:15 49:5 60:25 underwriting (1) 34:6 unfair (3) 43:3 46:21 47:12 unintended (2) 37:10 58:22 **Union (2)** 16:13 19:5 United (1) 35:15 unjust (1) 46:21 unlicensed (1) 6:17 unmarked (1) 42:19 **unsafe (1)** 7:5 upcoming (3) 5:15 6:23 7:15 **update (1)** 27:21 updates (1) 5:14 **UPS (1)** 15:3 urge (5) 41:9 44:13 55:2 62:16 68:7 urging (1) 57:18 use (16) 11:22 15:3,5,24 16:18 18:17 34:20 37:5,19 41:6 42:3,7 42:13 48:11,25 62:9 useful (1) 14:19

V

values (1) 21:4 vans (1) 17:9 various (3) 12:20 18:3 45:6 vast (1) 45:17 vehicle (33) 7:20,25,25 8:16 12:16 12:20 13:14 14:16 16:4,16,17 18:10 19:10 21:8 24:5 28:8 30:3 30:8,9,10,16 31:21 35:18,19,25 38:25 42:14,16 43:13 45:12 48:19 51:8 58:7 vehicle's (1) 16:6 vehicles (48) 6:14,17 7:12 8:17 9:17 11:18,21 15:8,9 16:11 17:6 17:20 18:15 20:22 23:4 24:7.10 25:9,15,21,24 29:12,14 30:15,23 31:2,23,25 32:5 38:17,17,19,20 38:25 39:2,3 42:11,21 45:14,16 46:4 48:22 51:11 58:15,25 59:2,8 59:13 versus (2) 38:23 40:12 viable (5) 41:8 54:13,19,19,20 Vice (1) 34:3 victims (1) 16:24 video (3) 10:23 18:23,25 vigilance (1) 13:10 VIN (2) 30:16 58:17

Vision (9) 6:19 7:17 13:3,3 15:10

17:5 25:5 55:13,14
voluntarily (2) 27:24 68:3
voluntary (2) 28:7 36:24
volunteered (1) 15:11
volunteers (1) 23:10
vote (29) 8:10 21:25 26:9 27:4
28:23 47:12 55:3 57:19 60:2,7,10
60:11,17,19 61:5,7,11,11,25
62:12,25 63:4,19,21 66:17,18,20
66:24 69:11
votes (1) 8:8
voting (2) 54:12 61:18
VTL (1) 48:20

W

wait (1) 49:14 waiting (1) 49:23 **WAIVER (1)** 3:15 want (13) 9:21 21:4 23:10 26:10 33:21 39:4 51:13 52:16 53:14 56:19 57:5 64:12,15 wanted (1) 33:21 wants (1) 66:18 warning (1) 15:25 warnings (1) 10:23 water (1) 54:4 way (9) 34:24 41:3 42:13 43:12 47:5 50:3 57:18,22 71:18 we'll (10) 4:9 5:12 9:2 20:4 21:18 25:14,14,24 33:19 47:22 we're (7) 4:3 23:6 25:2 48:7 50:5 56:8 65:23 we've (4) 6:12,18,19 53:2 Web (5) 5:23 7:10 12:7 31:10 69:8 week (4) 7:2,13 28:13 48:3 weeks (3) 5:15,24 7:15 Weinshall (20) 2:10 23:3,12,16,19 23:25 24:5,13,18 26:19,20 27:6 27:18,23 28:15 60:13 64:24 66:2 69:21,22 welcome (2) 23:11 56:16 well-established (1) 36:15 wheelchair (1) 66:8 **WHEREOF (1)** 71:19 wholly (1) 6:17 wide (1) 13:4 willing (2) 45:19 46:3 Willis (1) 34:15 Wilson (41) 2:13 10:11,14 26:6,9 26:14,16,18,21,24 27:2 28:25 31:20 32:3,12,15,21,24 33:6,14 33:22 41:16 44:10,16 47:17,21 50:11 52:11 55:6 56:17 58:19 65:7 67:8 68:10 69:14,16,18,20

69:23 70:2,4 Windels (5) 3:8,11 47:23 48:2 52:12 wish (1) 17:20 within-entitled (1) 71:12 **WITNESS (1)** 71:19 work (7) 25:19 26:2 40:20 43:2,19 50:7 53:14 worked (1) 34:14 Workers (2) 68:17,19 working (4) 22:18 41:24 46:25 50:6 works (1) 7:22 world (2) 14:9 66:14 worthwhile (1) 61:2 wrap (1) 44:11 write (2) 35:24 36:23 written (3) 63:14 67:12 68:14 wrong (1) 17:2 Χ

<u> Y</u>

yang (1) 65:25 Yeah (5) 27:18 39:6,13 62:2 69:17 year (12) 10:15 13:23 14:14 22:12 40:11,14 42:25 49:4 52:25 53:24 64:4 65:14 year-to-date (2) 6:11,18 years (12) 34:7,12 38:8 41:24

42:10 44:25 45:4 50:19 51:2 54:16 65:8,10 yellow (4) 6:6 17:9 25:22 38:6 Yin (1) 65:25

York (24) 1:2,20 6:6 13:5 14:2,10 16:19 19:5 22:21 30:18 35:4,10 35:16,25 44:2,22 46:11,23 50:13 51:21 68:17,19 71:4,9

Yorkers (1) 17:6

7

Zero (9) 6:19 7:17 13:3,4 15:11 17:5 25:5 55:13,14 **zone (1)** 6:15

0

1

1,000 (1) 40:14

1,000,000 (6) 33:2,7 38:22 45:14 46:5 49:25

1,200 (1) 42:25 **1,500 (2)** 5:4 42:25 **1.5 (1)** 57:9

```
100 (2) 40:14,14
100,000 (2) 29:10 38:23
                                      3,000 (2) 38:16,17
10543 (1) 1:20
                                      3,200 (1) 38:4
11 (1) 55:19
                                      3,800 (1) 6:18
11:00 (2) 70:7,8
                                      3.5 (1) 16:11
139 (1) 1:19
                                      30 (3) 34:7,12 41:23
13th (1) 31:5
                                      300,000 (2) 29:11 38:24
14 (1) 31:4
                                      30th (1) 5:20
15 (1) 32:6
                                      33 (2) 1:7 3:3
15th (2) 8:21 68:12
                                      37 (1) 3:5
16 (2) 28:8 33:15
                                      370 (2) 48:20,20
16th (4) 12:9 31:12 68:13 69:10
                                      3rd (1) 6:22
18 (2) 35:5,11
19 (68) 1:6 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1
  10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1
                                      40 (1) 44:25
  16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1
                                      41 (1) 3:6
 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1
                                      44 (2) 3:7 40:12
 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1
                                      45 (2) 5:3,10
 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1
                                      47 (1) 3:9
 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1
 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1
                                                       5
 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1
                                      5,400 (1) 40:11
 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1
                                      500,000 (1) 38:22
 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1
                                      51 (1) 3:10
 70:1
                                      52 (1) 3:12
1999 (4) 64:4,13,25 67:18
                                      55 (2) 3:13 16:7
19TH (1) 1:8
1st (1) 67:17
                                                       6
                                      60 (2) 6:8 16:2
                 2
                                      67 (1) 3:16
2,500 (1) 38:17
20 (3) 33:16 55:19,19
2014 (74) 1:6 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1,21
                                      7th (2) 5:21 55:19
 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1
  16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1
                                                       8
 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1
                                      80 (1) 57:2
 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1,4,5 32:1 33:1
 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1
                                                       9
 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1
                                      9:40 (4) 2:2 4:2,3,13
 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1
                                      9:55 (2) 4:17,19
 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1
                                      913 (1) 6:12
 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1
                                      914)381-2061 (1) 1:21
 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1,13,14
                                      914)381-2064 (1) 1:22
 69:1 70:1 71:21
                                      953-3767 (1) 1:21
212)95-DEPOS (1) 1:21
22nd (1) 6:21
238 (1) 28:10
23rd (1) 5:19
24 (1) 6:23
24/7 (1) 35:19
24th (1) 6:24
25th (2) 5:19 71:20
26th (1) 5:20
27 (1) 38:8
```