

Г

		2
1		
2	HEARING CONVENED AT 9:50 A.M.	
3	COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:	
4	Meera Joshi, Chair	
5	Edward Gonzalez	
6	Frank Carone	
7	Bill Aguado	
8	Jacques Jiha	
9	Nora Constance Marion	
10		
11	ALSO PRESENT:	
12	Chris Wilson, General Counsel	
13		
14		
15	Staff	
16	The Public	
17	The Press	
18		
19		
20		
21	Reported by: Vicky Galitsis	
22	VICKY GALLESIS	
23		
24		
25		

		3
1		
2	PRESENTATION ON PROPOSED ADMINISTRATIVE UPDATES	
3	PAGE	
4	Theadora Palucci12	
5	Angelique Neolos18	
6	SPEAKERS ON PROPOSED CLEAN UP RULES PACKAGE	
7	Cira Angeles, Livery Bas Owners23	
8	Pedro Aguiar, Coalition Taxistas, NY37	
9	Reverend Erick Salgado41	
10	Nancy Reynoso, GTNY62	
11	Hector Leonardo German, 12273	
12	SPEAKERS ON MISCELLANEOUS ISSUES	
13	Kamaleldi Abdalla, Cairo68	
14	MD Zahirul Islam, Cairo72	
15	John Sideris, Cairo	
16	Mamdouh Mobarak, Cairo81	
17	Mr. Sirin	
18	Michael O'Lauglin, Cab Rides Unlimited96	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

4

1 Proceedings 2 CHAIR JOSHI: Good morning. The 3 time now is 9:50, and we're going to move to go into executive session to 4 discuss two discretionary revocation 5 6 appeals, and after that we will 7 reconvene for our regular meeting. All in favor? 8 9 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of 10 ayes.) CHAIR JOSHI: With that we'll 11 12 start executive session. We expect to 13 be back probably 15 minutes? 15, 14 20 minutes at the most. Thank you. 15 (Whereupon, the executive session was held from 9:50 a.m. until 16 10:30 a.m.) 17 CHAIR JOSHI: Good morning. 18 The time is 10:30, and we're going to start 19 our public meeting. We will break 20 probably somewhere midway to briefly 21 recess to finish our executive session 22 23 deliberations. But we will let you 24 know as soon as we figured out when, if 25 people need to plan accordingly.

1 Proceedings So just to start out with a few 2 3 notes on comings and goings. So we have a bittersweet announcement that 4 Commissioner Jo Rausen has left our 5 6 agency. Jo joined us over four years 7 ago to manage a very small project, Taxi Technology, but she quickly found 8 herself in the eye of the storm. As 9 she rose to the position of assistant 10 commissioner she created the first time 11 12 ever specifications to technology in yellow taxis, shepherding their 13 introduction into green taxis, 14 15 developed grounded policy for based dispatch, and brought electronic hail 16 17 to yellow and green taxis. Most of 18 all, she was passionate about all of 19 her projects and left no detail unattended to. 20 21 Last year I e-hailed a green taxi in Brooklyn. When the trip ended, the 22 23 driver was having some trouble figuring 24 out payments. So I shared the tiny bit 25 of knowledge that I have on the

1	Proceedings
2	project. He thanked me for my patience
3	and admitted it was only the second
4	time using e-hail, commenting, although
5	it took sometime to get used to he
6	really liked it. It was convenient and
7	nice ladies use it. In fact, the first
8	time he e-hailed he had a lot of
9	difficulty, and the nice lady actually
10	came to the front of the cab and showed
11	him how to reset his meter and his DIM.
12	I already knew the answer, but I asked
13	him if the lady had long brown hair.
14	She did. It was Jo.
15	And that embodies the kind of
16	dedication Jo had for every single one
17	of her projects. So she will be sorely
18	missed, but we're happy. She's not
19	just a techie but she's a foodie. So
20	her position, designing the website for
21	Blue Apron, couldn't be more perfect.
22	And we're very proud to have been part
23	of her journey.
24	A few other announcements. Frank
25	Carone, Commissioner Frank Carone, and

7

1 Proceedings 2 Luby Polanco, Commissioner Luby Polanco 3 who is not with us today, will be joining us for seven more years. 4 They've committed. 5 6 (Applause.) 7 CHAIR JOSHI: So we're happy that they took the official plunge. 8 9 And our former commissioner and now Federal Judge LaShann DeArcy, had 10 11 her investiture a few weeks ago. The courtroom and the overflow rooms were 12 13 packed. There were hundreds of people there, and it was a true testament to 14 15 her intellect, empathy and strength. We will miss her, but now a larger 16 17 audience gets the benefit of her wisdom. 18 19 Also this month, we announced a third in a number of settlements we've 20 21 done with the New York State Attorney General's Office on lease cab 22 23 overcharge. These are joint 24 prosecutions. And based on a complaint 25 that came into our driver protection

1	Proceedings
2	unit, our attorneys uncovered a pattern
3	of overcharges. And with the help of
4	the Attorney General's Office attained
5	a settlement of \$750,000 in restitution
б	that will go back to drivers at \$50,000
7	in fines.
8	I want to give thanks to David
9	Ross, Jason Gonzales, Sherry Cohen and
10	Ray Scanlon who spearheaded these
11	investigations and prosecutions.
12	(Applause.)
13	CHAIR JOSHI: So cumulatively
14	they brought in almost \$3 million worth
15	of restitution for drivers within the
16	three settlements we've done. And
17	we're not done, so we can like say,
18	stay tuned.
19	In April we'll continue our
20	licensing streamlining process by
21	moving renewals online. The process is
22	new, so if you have any difficulty at
23	all, please be assured our offices are
24	open, our phones are open, and we're
25	here to assist you. We don't want

Proceedings
people to feel stranded by us moving
online. We do think everything will be
online eventually, but it is a
transition so if people are getting
used to it, please don't be shy about
reaching out to us or coming by the
office. There will be people at the
counter willing to assist.
We also opened our Staten Island
office, which is a vast improvement
over the prior one, over 3,000 square
feet. And it could not have been
possible without the dedication of now
retired Commissioner Elias Arout. He
was an advocate from day one, so it is
gratifying to watch him cut the opening
ribbon.
I'd also like to thank several
the TLC staff that were fundamental to
getting this off the ground. Lorenzo
Luiz, John Thomas, and the entire MIS
team, Dave Emeritt, Karen Dougan, Chris
Rivera, Victor Rodriguez, the Office of
Facility and Fleet Management, and most

1 Proceedings 2 of all, Brian Switzer, who really made 3 the whole office happen. So thank you very much. 4 On our agenda today, we have a 5 6 proposal to amend our used car pilot to 7 allow used wheelchair accessible vehicles to be hacked up as taxicabs. 8 We also have a proposal to make 9 partitions optional. And for those who 10 11 take the option, they will have to install one of our authorized cameras. 12 13 And we have a cleanup package that contains a clarifying rule that's 14 15 gotten considerable media attention. TLC rules today prohibit drivers from 16 17 harassing passengers. The proposal before us makes it clear that 18 19 harassment includes unwanted sexual conversation and contact. This will 20 21 serve as a conduct guide for drivers, and only for those who have found to 22 23 violate it, and this is important, 24 after a hearing before impartial judge. One question I got was, will we always 25

11

Proceedings 1 2 have to take the word of the passenger? And the answer is simply, no. It is a 3 matter of credibility. The other thing 4 5 that people raise is, well, can you 6 compel the witness to come forward for 7 a hearing? And, yes, an OATH judge can compel a witness to come forward for a 8 hearing so that the accuser and accused 9 are in the courtroom together. 10 The 11 prerequisite for that is that the 12 driver should request that the witness be present in the courtroom. 13 And anybody who has questions about that, 14 15 we're happy to go over it and refer you 16 to specific OATH rules that allow for 17 that process. Now this wouldn't be confined to cases of harassment. This 18 19 is a general OATH rule. So we wanted to make sure people understood that. 20 21 We have a presentation before we start our regular meeting, because 22 23 today and at this very moment, you can access our 2016 TLC Factbook, which is 24 25 on our website. Thea Palucci, from our

1	Proceedings
2	Policy Division, will do a brief
3	presentation with some of the
4	highlights. And I want to thank the
5	staff members who have put this
6	Factbook together, because it is a true
7	Herculine task. That's Jeff Roth,
8	Deputy Commissioner; Rodney Styles,
9	Executive Director of Policy and
10	Analytics; and the project team, Jeff
11	Garber, Jason Gonzales, Ben Kerlin,
12	Erica Lavaya, Omar Pointero, Jason
13	Sherif, and Saline Cardian, as well as
14	Theadora Palucci will be doing our
15	presentation.
16	MS. PALUCCI: Good morning,
17	Commissioners. My name is Theadora
18	Palucci, and I am a policy analyst here
19	at the TLC. I'm really excited to
20	present some highlights of the 2016 TLC
21	Factbook, which we really enjoy
22	compiling. This Factbook contains
23	information from 2014 and 2015, and
24	also introduces some new topics that
25	I'll talk about.

Proceedings 1 2 So the 2016 Factbook explores 3 patterns and trends within the four hired vehicle industries in New York 4 City, again for the years 2014 and 5 6 2015. I'd like to call out two of the 7 biggest changes, which are the increase of TLC license black car vehicles, 8 which rose to just over 39,000 in 2015 9 from just under 22,000 in 2014. And 10 the increase overall of TLC drivers 11 12 from around 129,000 to nearly 144,000. The chart on this slide shows the 13 average trips per day by industry, 14 15 yellow medallion, SHL, or street hail livery. At-based FHVs, or for hired 16 17 vehicle, and for-hire vehicles associated with the top 50 traditional 18 19 FHV bases. Together medallion taxis and FHVs made about 474,000 trips a day 20 over 2014 and 2015. At-based FHVs, 21 which are represented on the light 22 23 green line on this chart, performed an 24 average of 146,000 trips a day on the second half of 2015. And the top 50 25

		14
1	Proceedings	
2	traditional FHVs bases, which is	
3	represented by the darker grey line in	
4	the chart, together performed nearly	
5	52,000 trips a day in the last quarter	
б	of 2015.	
7	When it comes to trip	
8	distribution for 2014 and 2015,	
9	medallion taxis have continued to pick	
10	up passengers primarily in Manhattan.	
11	So 92 percent of their trips originate	
12	in that borough. The same also goes	
13	for at-based FHVs who completed	
14	70 percent pick ups in Manhattan. SHL	
15	service is spread throughout the	
16	boroughs, mainly upper Manhattan,	
17	Queens and Brooklyn. And the top	
18	traditional 50 FHVs to complete nearly	
19	half their trips from the Bronx, with	
20	the rest of their trips spread equally	
21	between Manhattan Queens and Brooklyn.	
22	In 2014, Medallion taxis	
23	transported around 20 percent of all	
24	passengers arriving or departing at	
25	LaGuardia Airport. SHLs which are	

1 Proceedings 2 authorized to drop off street hailed 3 passengers at airports transported less than 1 percent of all passengers at 4 LaGuardia. 5 6 At JFK Airport, the same year, 7 which is shown on this slide, medallion taxis transported a lower percentage of 8 passengers, while the Air Train at JFK 9 transported roughly 12 percent. 10 11 Drivers represent 167 countries around the world, which I think is 12 13 pretty astounding. And here's a map showing the overall top five counties 14 15 where drivers are born, and the percentages that make up each industry. 16 More than half of TLC license 17 drivers live in inner Brooklyn or 18 19 Queens, with the remainder living throughout to Tristate area. 20 21 And when you look at gender breakdown across the industries, 22 23 females are represented in all four 24 industries, but more particularly in 25 the top 50 FHVs sectors.

Proceedings 1 2 Drivers of FHVs -- of at-based 3 FHVs are far younger than their counterparts in other industries. 4 The median age for an at-based FHV driver 5 6 is 39 compared to over 45 in the other 7 three industries that we are looking at here today. 8 In January 2015 the Commission 9 passed rules allowing passengers to use 10 11 TLC license apps to electronically hail 12 medallion taxis and SHLs, and to paid 13 for their rides following a two-year long pilot program. And so the math 14 15 here shows the number of fulfilled 16 e-hailed trips throughout New York City 17 in 2015. More e-hails happen outside of Manhattan Central Business District 18 19 as compared to all taxi trips. A trend that has become more and more 20 21 pronounced as FHLs who are unable to pickup passengers in Manhattan before 22 23 have begun using e-hail. 24 The light blue shows trips where less than 365 trips occurred for the 25

Proceedings 1 2 year 2015. And so the darker the color 3 the more e-hail trips fulfilled. And I'm not sure if you can make out on 4 this screen, but the small yellow dot 5 6 shows just how much folks in DUMBO love 7 to electronically hail their taxis and SHLs. 8 9 Accessible options are expanding in New York. At the end of 2015 there 10 11 were 596 medallions, and 1,275 SHLs on 12 the road accessible to passengers who 13 use wheelchairs. Those numbers are going to keep growing. As of this 14 15 year, additional yellow medallions will 16 be required to put wheelchair accessible vehicles into service to 17 reach a goal of having half the 18 19 medallion fleet to be wheelchair accessible by 2020. And together 20 accessible vehicles perform a total of 21 over 7 million trips in 2015. 22 23 The accessible dispatch program, 24 which served 47,000 trips in 2015, will 25 also serve to expand passengers in all

		18
1	Proceedings	
2	five boroughs, which is very exciting.	
3	So thank you for taking the time	
4	to hear about the new Factbook. This	
5	is just a really small snapshot of	
6	everything that we've included in the	
7	volume. You can navigate to	
8	NYC.GOV/TLCFACTBOOK, which is also here	
9	on the screen, where you will find	
10	editions to all of our Factbooks, and	
11	the data behind the facts and figures.	
12	Thank you.	
13	CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you very	
14	much.	
15	And now we'll move to adoption of	
16	minutes. All in favor of adopting the	
17	minutes of the February 25th,	
18	Commission meeting.	
19	(Whereupon, there was a chorus of	
20	ayes.)	
21	CHAIR JOSHI: With that the	
22	minutes are unanimously adopted. And	
23	we'll move to the Base Applications.	
24	MS. NEOLOS: Good morning,	
25	Commissioners. My name is Angelique	

		19
1	Proceedings	
2	Neolos, I am supervisor of the Business	
3	Unit. Today we have 26 bases for your	
4	approval. Two new applications, 13	
5	renewals, and 11 various changes,	
6	relocations, ownerships, name changes.	
7	MR. WILSON: All in favor?	
8	(Whereupon, there was a chorus of	
9	ayes.)	
10	MS. NEOLOS: Thank you.	
11	MR. WILSON: Next on the agenda	
12	is a resolution to extend the	
13	Commission's Used Vehicle Taxi Pilot to	
14	March 26, 2017, and to modify the pilot	
15	to permit participation of used	
16	wheelchair accessible vehicles with	
17	provisions for grants from the Taxi	
18	Improvement Fund at levels lower than	
19	available for new cars. 14,000 for new	
20	cars versus 10,500 for one year old	
21	car, and \$7,000 for a two-year old car.	
22	To participate, vehicles must, as were	
23	not accessible vehicles, be no more	
24	than two vehicle-year old, and have	
25	been in service for-hire.	

20 1 Proceedings 2 It's Local Law 5 requires the 3 final Commission action be posted on the TLC website on April 18th, 2016 and 4 sent to the Commissioner on that date. 5 6 All in favor? 7 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of 8 ayes.) 9 MR. WILSON: Thank you. So that passed unanimously. 10 Next on the Commissions' agenda 11 12 are essentially technical rules making 13 certain changes to TLC rules regarding licensing and enforcement. I wanted to 14 15 clarify, because several people have made comments about this, and we will 16 17 clarify the rule. Enhancing exclusionary zone enforcement for 18 19 street hail liveries, we are not changing the provisions that 20 21 prearranged trips can be done at the airports. The rule is only intended to 22 23 clarify. As State law provides that 24 prearranged trips cannot be picked up below East 96th and below West 25

21 1 Proceedings 2 110th Street. 3 In addition -- and so that's only picking up trips. It is not regarding 4 operations within those areas either on 5 6 a for-hire trip or when you're not 7 operating for-hire at all. The rules would also require 8 9 drivers to end their affiliations with suspended bases, allow licensees to 10 11 demonstrate social security registration without providing original 12 13 social security card, simplify the penalty sections relating to portable 14 15 electronic devices, clarify the penalty section relating to certain for-hire 16 17 data collection, remove the requirement for suspended licensees to turn in 18 19 their licenses before suspensions take effect, remove the requirement for-hire 20 vehicle drivers display the vehicle 21 license within the vehicle, provide 22 23 that a vehicle is subject to forfeiture 24 as permitted by the add code, if the owner has committed two or more 25

		2
1	Proceedings	
2	violations of Section 19506 in the past	
3	36-month, define and establish	
4	penalties for sexual harassment, sexual	
5	contact as the Chairwoman has already	
6	discussed, and increase the length of	
7	time. The completed defensive driver	
8	course remains valid.	
9	We have a number of speakers on	
10	this rule. The first of whom is Cira	
11	Angeles.	
12	CHAIR JOSHI: I just want to make	
13	a quick comment before we start. There	
14	are some aspects of the rule that may	
15	have caused confusion that we'd like to	
16	clarify. One is a bullet point on	
17	page 2 of the statement on Bases and	
18	Purpose, which could be read as giving	
19	the impression that you cannot drive	
20	through the exclusionary zone in a	
21	green taxi, and that is not the intent	
22	of the rule. So Chris Wilson will be	
23	redrafting that bullet point to reflect	
24	the actual rule, because that's	
25	absolutely not something that the	

		2
1	Proceedings	
2	Commission is interested in prohibiting.	
3	And then the other point which I	
4	made earlier is on the sexual	
5	harassment issue of whether or not you	
6	can confront witnesses, and that is an	
7	issue that is addressed in OATH rules.	
8	And we're happy to provide the sites	
9	for those OATH rules for people that	
10	need to make sure that the industry is	
11	aware of those.	
12	MS. ANGELES: Good morning,	
13	Commissioners, Commissioner Joshi. My	
14	name is Cira Angeles. Although I've	
15	heard how open the Commission is to	
16	make changes into the proposed rules, I	
17	am going to testify before you on	
18	behalf of the livery-based owners, our	
19	affiliates, that include 200 bases and	
20	12,000 drivers are currently	
21	affiliated. Our goals are the	
22	continued safe and efficient	
23	transportation of our passengers, while	
24	protecting our hard working small	
25	businesses and drivers that we rely on.	

1	Proceedings
2	Over the years we've enjoyed a good
3	working relationship with the
4	Commission based on open communication
5	and mutual respect. However, we have
6	not always agreed. There is no not
7	that it is different this time.
8	We support many of the
9	Commission's initiatives to protect our
10	passengers and our professional
11	licensed drivers. At the same time we
12	are very concerned that some proposed
13	amendments do not take a comprehensive
14	approach to the issues that our drivers
15	and bases are facing. These particular
16	proposed rules changes do not address
17	the concerns and recommendations that
18	we have brought to the Commission's
19	attention in the past. We support
20	proposed changes to end vehicle
21	affiliation with suspended bases, the
22	elimination of original social security
23	card requirement, simplifying the
24	penalty section of the portable
25	electronic devises, removing the

1	Proceedings
2	requirement that vehicle's license be
3	displayed in for-hire vehicles, and to
4	increase the length of time under the
5	defensive driving course certificate.
6	However, we cannot support
7	changes to enhance exclusionary zone
8	enforcement. For example, the proposed
9	rules and amendments are expected to
10	prevent a base from improperly
11	dispatching a SHL, unless the driver
12	has already locked into the LPEP. As
13	you might know, a lot of our bases
14	already have systems that block those
15	drivers from going into the
16	exclusionary zone. As you know, we
17	also cannot on a constant basis see
18	when a driver locks in or locks out.
19	Verifying CNT are more capable of
20	following through on these issues.
21	We also feel that we, in order to
22	prevent the SHL drivers from travelling
23	through the exclusionary zone, except
24	to drop off passengers from trips, the
25	meter is completely off when this

		26
1	Proceedings	
2	situation happen. This targets the SHL	
3	drivers specifically in an issue that	
4	is already covered by the Street Hill	
5	Liberty Laws and Regulations.	
6	Furthermore, we do not believe	
7	the issue is an exclusive situation of	
8	SHL drivers, but rather the liveries,	
9	black cars luxuries who sometimes don't	
10	have enough business and continue to	
11	pickup illegally in the exclusionary	
12	zone. Why penalize our street hail	
13	liveries only?	
14	Regarding the proposed rule,	
15	Changes to Define Sexual Harassment and	
16	Unwanted Sexual Contact. We believe	
17	that the data presented by the NYPD and	
18	the Commission does not support these	
19	changes and penalties being put	
20	forward. While our industry increased	
21	over 40 percent, 2014 to 2015 according	
22	to that data, sexual harassment charges	
23	have counted for less than 1 percent of	
24	the complaints.	
25	In addition, the reporting failed	

1	Proceedings
2	to identify whether the perpetrator was
3	the driver or the passenger. Current
4	rules already provide passenger
5	protections by prohibiting any driver
6	from harassing, threatening or abusing
7	any passenger, including service
8	animals, imposing penalties of \$350 to
9	\$1,000, in addition suspensions and
10	leaving the Commission with the
11	discretion to revoke that license if
12	they found that he is at fault.
13	We strongly believe that adding
14	new language or definition does not
15	significantly change what is considered
16	unacceptable behavior, and we cannot
17	support providing a full sense of
18	protection to our public.
19	We firmly believe that training
20	and education are our best tools to
21	change behavior, not definitions or
22	higher penalty. We also fear that
23	these rules do not protect our drivers
24	from being unfairly victimized by the
25	false complaints, and sadly, they sadly

		2
1	Proceedings	
2	happen, too often they are not. We do	
3	not want an established mechanism to	
4	protect drivers from the circumstance	
5	leaving them vulnerable to the unfair	
6	position of being presumed, in some	
7	cases guilty, before they can actually	
8	prove their innocence.	
9	What makes our City great is our	
10	ability to communicate with people.	
11	It's how diverse our industry is, and	
12	our drivers are no exception.	
13	We urge the Commission to	
14	reconsider on these proposed rule	
15	changes. Working together we can all	
16	protect our precious cargo, our	
17	passengers, while still protecting the	
18	rights of the livelihood of our drivers	
19	in the workplace. And the workplace is	
20	their cabs. Thank you.	
21	CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you. I just	
22	have two comments on some points you	
23	made.	
24	(Applause.)	
25	CHAIR JOSHI: On the basic	

29 Proceedings 1 2 accountability, I think that you raise 3 a very legitimate practical issue on how can a base, and the way it is 4 written is that you must not dispatch a 5 6 street hail livery. And those liveries 7 might not even be affiliated vehicles, because you can dispatch other bases 8 9 vehicles. MS. ANGELES: Right. 10 11 CHAIR JOSHI: So we -- I'm going to speak for myself, that I think it is 12 13 worthy of, should we go forward with this package today, maybe pulling this 14 15 section to reconsider on how best to enforce what we want, which is really 16 17 to make sure that drivers are logging into the LPEP. 18 19 On the second piece, I just had a question for you. It sounds like 20 21 you're not objecting to the fact that the harassment rule -- well, your 22 23 acknowledging that today's harassment rule covers unwanted sexual contact and 24 25 conduct. The objection is to the

30 1 Proceedings 2 increased penalty. 3 MS. ANGELES: The objection is 4 to --5 CHAIR JOSHI: Can I just finish? 6 MS. ANGELES: -- to the 7 definition. 8 CHAIR JOSHI: Let me ask you, if 9 the current rule said, you know, no harassment including -- and it included 10 11 to highlight so the drivers understand 12 specifically what is considered 13 harassment, so it was just a clarification to the existing rule, 14 15 everything else staying the same, that would take care of some of your 16 17 objections. 18 MS. ANGELES: My objection is, if 19 we already have a regulation and the rule in place that has worked for 20 21 years, that harassment is harassment no matter how you define it. If I feel 22 23 harassed by you, it's the victim who determines what she considers 24 25 harassment. Something that is

1 Proceedings 2 inappropriate that I have said no, or I 3 do not welcome is considered harassment. 4 Putting definitions without 5 6 including anything and everything that 7 anyone can think of is just simply not addressing the issue completely. It is 8 just putting some remedy to something 9 that is so broad. Because in order to 10 11 protect our public, in order to protect 12 our drivers, we need to make 13 definitions that are clear. But not, I mean, like I said, harassment is 14 15 harassment. And it is for the victim to determine when she felt harassed. 16 17 You don't have to say --CHAIR JOSHI: But isn't it 18 19 important for the driver to understand the variety of situations in which a 20 21 passenger may feel harassed? And the point of a rule is not -- part of it is 22 23 penalty, but the first initial point of a rule is to serve as education. 24 So 25 drivers understand that sometimes

1	Proceedings
2	conversation that they may think is
3	okay may not be perceived by the
4	passenger as okay. Wouldn't they want
5	to know that up front, rather than
б	having the passenger file a complaint
7	and being forced to deal with that
8	complaint?
9	MS. ANGELES: The truth of the
10	matter is that our drivers do not know,
11	do not get educated by rules and
12	penalties. Our drivers get know the
13	rules and know the extent of what they
14	need to learn to avoid it when they get
15	trained or educated. It is unfortunate
16	to say that a lot of our drivers find
17	that out
18	CHAIR JOSHI: If their education
19	includes the rules and also coverage,
20	like this brought up a discussion and
21	raised awareness among drivers. So I
22	think in and of itself it created an
23	educational opportunity.
24	MS. ANGELES: The truth is that
25	we have a behavior of responding with

1 Proceedings 2 new regulations to something that can 3 be easily corrected. Our drivers do not get a manual when they get a 4 license as to the things they can and 5 6 cannot do. We've been fighting for 7 that manual of the top ten things that drivers do on a regular basis, and key 8 issues, like harassment and protecting 9 the public. 10 11 CHAIR JOSHI: One piece of news 12 that's good for you. First of all, 13 there's new education requirements for all FHA drivers. So new drivers will 14 15 get that 24-hour training. But we're 16 also putting together a two-page 17 summary of what that curriculum is that's going to be available on our 18 19 website. And it will include things like what you just said, the top ten 20 21 things. MS. ANGELES: Don't you believe 22 23 that addressing that through education 24 and training is better than finding a 25 driver in the verge of losing almost

		3
1	Proceedings	
2	his family, because he's been accused.	
3	And until they can prove what happened,	
4	and all the parties are there, the	
5	drivers don't know how to navigate the	
6	system. And this is what I found in	
7	20 years working with drivers and	
8	bases.	
9	And we hear it in their voices.	
10	A lot of the times you find out that	
11	you violated a regulation, because they	
12	gave you an summons, and you were	
13	completely unaware that you were doing	
14	that. So for that simple reason I	
15	don't want to put that burden on our	
16	drivers, and anyone for that matter,	
17	that doesn't understand the language in	
18	which you are putting to clarify what?	
19	And to whom?	
20	I mean, doing things for to	
21	responding to perhaps in some cases	
22	to the media, when we already have	
23	regulations in place. We need to do	
24	the proper enforcement. We need to get	
25	the two parties involved, we need to	

Proceedings 1 2 get proof. Our drivers cannot even 3 prove it with a telephone and recorded conversation. 4 CHAIR JOSHI: I think that's why 5 6 I mentioned, and I don't think people 7 are aware of the ability for the driver to require the witness to be there 8 under OATH rules. If credibility is an 9 issue, and the phone is not adequate or 10 11 sworn affidavits required by the TLC is 12 not adequate, the driver needs to make sure that the OATH judge knows that 13 they need to have the witness there, 14 15 because credibility is important. And 16 that's a right that people should 17 exercise and I encourage them to. 18 Because the process is suppose to be a 19 fair and impartial hearing. And I understand that that is more likely to 20 21 happen when both people are in a 22 courtroom. 23 MS. ANGELES: And our drivers are 24 already fearing that once they go to 25 court, they're going to be found

1	Proceedings
2	guilty, because on most cases they
3	understand that putting a defense, even
4	if that defense is true, they cannot
5	prove it. They don't have the
6	mechanisms to do that, nor do they have
7	the money to hire a good lawyer. In
8	the meantime, he is presumed to have
9	violated or harassed improperly a
10	passenger. There goes his family,
11	there goes his work. He's suspended
12	until they can prove what happens. If
13	the passenger complains, even the base
14	gets suspended if they don't answer in
15	a proper time and manner.
16	So I think it's all a problem
17	between bases drivers, but I do
18	understand sincerely that the
19	Commission has rules in place. We just
20	need to enforce them properly. And
21	create mechanisms that our drivers do
22	not continue to fear the system that is
23	there and put in place to protect the
24	public and also the licensees that they
25	actually issue licenses to.

		37
1	Proceedings	
2	CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you.	
3	(Applause.)	
4	MR. WILSON: I'd like to note for	
5	the record, Commissioner Marino joined	
6	us at 10 minutes to 11.	
7	COMMISSIONER MARINO: Yeah, may I	
8	just extend my apologies to my	
9	colleagues and everyone in the	
10	audience. I made a big mistake of	
11	driving today instead of taking the	
12	train, which I won't be doing again.	
13	MR. WILSON: Thank you.	
14	The next speaker is Manuel	
15	Grullon. No?	
16	The next speaker is Pedro Aguiar.	
17	CHAIR JOSHI: Good morning.	
18	MR. GRULLON: Good morning,	
19	Commissioner Madame Joshi. My name is	
20	Manuel Grullon, official advocator of	
21	the New York City.	
22	MR. AGUIAR: (Through the	
23	interpreter) My name is Pedro Aguiar,	
24	I am President of the New York City	
25	Taxicab Drivers Coalition. On behalf	

1	Proceedings
2	of all members of this working class, I
3	want to express our total disagreement
4	and opposition to the intention to put
5	in practice a new regulation to punish
6	the taxi drivers on sexual harassment
7	allegations from passengers without any
8	credible evidence to sustain their
9	claim.
10	First, we are opposed, because it
11	is not fair that a few months ago you
12	say that the majority of the taxi
13	drivers were good drivers who do things
14	right. How is it possible that your
15	perception has changed in such a short
16	time without any reasons? Since the
17	statistics of allegations of sexual
18	harassment committed by taxi drivers
19	have not increased, and even the
20	existing ones are not significant in
21	relation to the quantity of passengers
22	that we have come to daily, which is
23	estimated in approximately a million.
24	Do you believe that 14 cases of sexual
25	harassment in approximately 400 million

1	Proceedings
2	passengers that we have come to
3	annually, it is a statistic to
4	implement a regulation portraying us as
5	common criminals. I don't think so.
б	Second, we have become an
7	important piece to keep the security of
8	this City and lowering the crimes rate
9	preventing a lot of crimes. But now
10	with that new regulations, you see us
11	as criminals instead of allies to
12	prevent crimes.
13	Third, there are many cases in
14	which taxi drivers have saved the
15	lives. It was not once nor twice that
16	we have seen parturient women who have
17	given birth in our cars. And because
18	our rapid actions to help those women,
19	probably we have avoided that the
20	mother and her newborn infant died.
21	I'm sure if the regulations is
22	approved, the taxi drivers will not
23	give this kind of aid, fearing to be
24	accused of touching inappropriately a
25	woman in such situations, therefore, be

1 Proceedings 2 accused of sexual harassment. 3 Finally, also we are opposed to this new regulation, for understanding 4 that is unjust, discriminatory and 5 6 lacking in elements for its 7 application. It is not possible that the honor and the likelihood of the 8 9 family of the hardworking member of our society be at expense to the word of a 10 11 person, who for not wanting to pay or 12 pay certain tariff or for wanting to 13 hurt a particular person, be given a blank check to accusers of sexual 14 15 harassment to one of our taxi drivers. Therefore, I ask you and the 16 17 member of the City Council in favor of this regulation that withdraw their 18 19 support and dismiss its implementation. Thank you very much. 20 21 (Applause.) CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you very much 22 23 for your testimony. And I think you've 24 given us a lot of good points that we 25 need to consider. So I appreciate

		41
1	Proceedings	
2	that.	
3	MR AGUIAR: You're welcome.	
4	Thank you.	
5	MR. WILSON: I notice there are a	
6	number of speakers from the same group.	
7	So we will ask when I get to those	
8	groups that one speaker can be	
9	designated in the interest of the	
10	Commissioners' time.	
11	The next speaker I have listed is	
12	Hector Ramirez. Mr. Ramirez doesn't	
13	seem to be here.	
14	Susan Keredia from TAUNY? Okay.	
15	The next speak is Reverend Eric	
16	Salgado.	
17	REVEREND SALGADO: Good morning,	
18	Commissioner. My name is Reverend	
19	Erick Salgado. I'm a former candidate	
20	for mayor of this City, and also an	
21	activist, and a person who cares about	
22	the most vulnerable ones in this City;	
23	and working together with many taxi	
24	coalition and union throughout the	
25	City; in the Bronx, Manhattan, and in	

1 Proceedings 2 Brooklyn. 3 The concern of most of the taxi drivers with this new regulation, first 4 of all, we already have in place 5 6 regulations that prohibit any driver 7 from engaging in a misconduct or in a sexual harassment with a passenger. 8 The path to resolve the problem would 9 not be to increase regulation or to 10 11 increase the penalty. We have to work with the heart and the core of the 12 13 problem. I'm pretty sure that all the Commissioners over here with their best 14 15 interests is not perhaps taking more 16 money or to damage any of the people 17 who are working so hard for this City with honor and with dignity. 18 19 We have to remember that these people, they have to get a New York 20 State license and then they have to get 21 -- they have to go through the process 22 23 of getting the license also, the permit from the TLC. 24 Most of the sexual offenders have 25

	4
1	Proceedings
2	been proven that they repeatedly and
3	continuously behaved in that manner.
4	And that if the people for so long they
5	have behaved in a way that is
6	honorable, now all of a sudden when
7	they start to work TLC or as a driver
8	they are going to become a sexual
9	offender.
10	We believe and they believe that
11	the remedy for this is to get the extra
12	education that they need. Education is
13	basically the problem solver in this
14	case. Therefore, they are suggesting
15	that we should emphasize in their
16	education that they need to prevent
17	perhaps any kind of conversation that
18	they might not know, especially many
19	people coming from different country,
20	with different culture, they might not
21	know that it is considered in this City
22	and in this nation as harassment. So
23	therefore we have to emphasize in the
24	education.
25	The concern number 1 is that most

1	Proceedings
2	of these people have served the City
3	and citizens of this City with honor
4	and dignity. Why though create
5	something that might allude that this
6	social group is perhaps a group where
7	they have many sexual offenders. That
8	will be something damaging to the
9	Hispanic Community, to all the
10	community where these people are
11	working right now with the taxi
12	industry. We are concerned that they
13	get the education that they need and we
14	are concerned also that they get that
15	education free of charge, because they
16	are already serving this City with
17	dignity and honor, and extra education
18	should be provided at no expense to
19	them.
20	And also we have to make sure
21	that these extra regulation not an
22	invitation for passenger who really
23	tried to abuse the driver, because we
24	all know that many passengers try to
25	abuse. And when they see a way to

		4
1	Proceedings	
2	abuse the system and get retaliation to	
3	any of this driver for any reason that	
4	they might have, they could cause	
5	problem to the person who is the	
б	victim, in this case the driver, his	
7	family, and his reputation.	
8	Therefore, I really suggest that	
9	we should emphasize in the education.	
10	The education should be free of charge,	
11	and no extra regulation should be	
12	included, because that's going to	
13	damage the reputation of the great	
14	people from the taxi industry.	
15	Thank you so much.	
16	(Applause.)	
17	CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you.	
18	MR. WILSON: The next speaker is	
19	from	
20	COMMISSIONER CARONE: Can I ask	
21	you a question, sir?	
22	REVEREND SALGADO: Sure, sure.	
23	Sorry, I didn't see you.	
24	COMMISSIONER CARONE: I didn't	
25	press the button fast enough and you	

Proceedings 1 2 walked away. I apologize. 3 I heard from three speakers -- we heard from three speakers all talk 4 about many things, but against the rule 5 6 as presented, I think as it defines 7 sexual harassment. And instead what I certainly heard you say and I know I 8 heard Ms. Angeles say, we should focus 9 on education, right? And I'm a little 10 11 undecided myself. On the one hand, I 12 think the Chair already said that education, as it relates to harassment, 13 is something that is already an 14 15 education requirement. But if you're educating about how you should, as a 16 17 licensee, conduct yourself as it relates to harassment, specifically 18 19 sexual harassment, shouldn't it then be a corresponding rule that defines what 20 it is you're educating the driver or 21 the licensee about? Why have education 22 23 without a corresponding rule? 24 REVEREND SALGADO: First of all, 25 there already a rule in place,

1 Proceedings 2 harassment is harassment no matter how 3 you define it. The problem that we have is that in many of the countries 4 where the drivers originate they might 5 6 define it differently. Therefore, we 7 have to educate what harassment is in New York City, and New York State, and 8 9 in our country. Therefore, we already have rules 10 11 that we have already have laws that 12 punish and prohibit harassment. What we have to make sure is that our taxi 13 drivers they understand in what many 14 15 ways they could be probably accused of 16 harassment, so they could avoid to go 17 to those edges in any way, form or 18 matter. 19 COMMISSIONER CARONE: And that's a fair point. I'm just curious how you 20 21 feel from the passenger's perspective. Would the passenger and the riding 22 23 public feel more comfortable knowing 24 there was a specific rule which stated and I'll read, "Sexual harassment shall 25

48 Proceedings 1 2 be" -- and I'll read the last part of 3 it -- "expressing a desire to enter into a type of relationship with 4 another person, making it clear that 5 6 that type of personal conversation is 7 per se harassment." Do you think that would make the riding public feel more 8 comfortable and therefore be clearer 9 for the drivers? 10 11 REVEREND SALGADO: No, because 12 that's already part of harassment itself. So what we have to do is to 13 educate the driver so they could 14 15 understand clearly what are the path 16 that they should not take. And if 17 they already -- we already have many of 18 what harassment is in the City, and it 19 is already punished. If somebody feel and they know their rights that they 20 21 have been harassed, they could have complained anyway, and one way or the 22 23 other, the driver is going to be held 24 accountable. 25 But when you ask extra regulation

1	Proceedings
2	from this Commissioner, is adding more
3	pressure to the already pressure that
4	the drivers have. And also is probably
5	opening a door for those abusers of the
6	system to try to accuse a innocent
7	person for something that they have not
8	done. We already have rules. We
9	already have definition of what
10	harassment is. What we have to do is
11	to educate the drivers so they don't go
12	to that path.
13	COMMISSIONER CARONE: It seems to
14	make this is what I'm struggling
15	with and what I'm hearing over and over
16	again, and there may be a some truth in
17	it. There is a lack of trust in the
18	administrative process when there is a
19	hearing. And that seems to be coming
20	across loud and clear. And I know it's
21	something we should be looking at a
22	little more carefully.
23	(Applause.)
24	COMMISSIONER CARONE: But what
25	I'm struggling with also is if we have

		50
1	Proceedings	
2	a rule in place, as you just mentioned,	
3	then what is the harm of clarifying the	
4	rule that's already in place? Since I	
5	don't hear anyone advocating for the	
6	removal of the rule. If it is already	
7	there, what's the difference?	
8	REVEREND SALGADO: It is the	
9	over-regulation. It's the	
10	over-regulation. When you	
11	over-regulation something you open the	
12	door for abusers to attack an innocent	
13	person. We're talking about the life	
14	of a person. I understand, with all	
15	due respect, you sitting in the other	
16	side, you're not behind the driver's	
17	seat. But these people, if they get	
18	accused on the new regulation they will	
19	be suspended, they won't be able to	
20	work, they wouldn't be basically	
21	CHAIR JOSHI: I'm sorry. If	
22	you're accused you're not automatically	
23	suspended. We wouldn't suspend until	
24	if that was part of the penalty.	
25	REVEREND SALGADO: But while the	

		51
1	Proceedings	
2	hearing goes through the person	
3	CHAIR JOSHI: Yes, after the	
4	hearing.	
5	REVEREND SALGADO: Exactly.	
6	is not going to be able to	
7	work. This is the way these people	
8	basically gain their food, you know.	
9	And they're not going to be able to	
10	they're going to be suspended, they're	
11	not going to be providing for their	
12	family.	
13	CHAIR JOSHI: I don't mean to	
14	interrupt. You can work up until your	
15	hearing. You're not summarily	
16	suspended. And when you have your	
17	hearing, then that's when the facts	
18	should be flushed out.	
19	As I pointed out earlier, it	
20	should invoke the right to have the	
21	person who is filing that allegation	
22	appear in the hearing room and make	
23	sure that you can face the accuser.	
24	REVEREND SALGADO: How about when	
25	the process the point is, the	

1 Proceedings 2 over-regulation opens the door for 3 abusers to be accusing innocent people that are working so hard. They take 4 people who already passed through the 5 6 process of getting a New York State 7 license. People who have already been working for many years without any 8 incident. And over-regulation would 9 just cause that this whole social group 10 11 is going to be --CHAIR JOSHI: Is it fear that it 12 13 will be abused, this rule, it would be invoked --14 15 REVEREND SALGADO: Yes, yes. CHAIR JOSHI: And by highlighting 16 17 it you're inviting people to invoke it, that's your fear? 18 19 REVEREND SALGADO: Exactly. For avoiding to pay for the fair. They're 20 just going to use this to take 21 regulations to the driver and he's 22 23 going to be exposed to the process. We 24 already have rules, we should enforce 25 those rules.

53 Proceedings 1 2 CHAIR JOSHI: I appreciate it. I 3 mean part of the public comment process is that we get to get practical 4 feedback. 5 6 REVEREND SALGADO: That's why I'm 7 here. I appreciate. CHAIR JOSHI: And I appreciate 8 everybody who is attending today to 9 give us that feed back. 10 11 REVEREND SALGADO: Thank you so 12 much. 13 CHAIR JOSHI: In light of that, and I know that we got a lot of people 14 15 out here, I'm just going to make a motion now that on two of the 16 17 provisions, we withdraw them for continual consideration, and sort of go 18 19 forward with the rest of the package. And those would be Section 24, the one 20 21 on the dispatch prohibition that says a base must not dispatch a street hail 22 23 livery, and then as well as the 24 provisions on sexual harassment. And 25 that way the Commission can take the

1	Proceedings
2	time to digest a lot of the feedback
3	that we've gotten.
4	I think that there are two goals
5	here; one is certainly education and
6	good education. I think Commissioner
7	Carone is correct. Good education has
8	to come in the form of a rule that has
9	a penalty, so that it is taken
10	seriously. But we can't dismiss the
11	importance of education in the first
12	instance.
13	And the second thing that hasn't
14	been raised, but is truly a
15	consideration, and I know some of the
16	people who encourage that we go forward
17	with this rule, is clarification for
18	hearing judges so they understand what
19	harassment is. And that harassment
20	includes unwanted conversation. So
21	that was another target for the rule so
22	that the hearing judge understands what
23	that is. So we're happy to consider
24	the feedback we've gotten, as well as
25	incorporate that into the goals that we

1	Proceedings
2	still believe in. And we want to make
3	sure that the public is aware that they
4	have a venue if they feel uncomfortable
5	in a ride.
6	And somebody quoted earlier, and
7	they're correct, we have a very low
8	percentage of these types of
9	complaints. And even the numbers
10	provided by PD, it is not certain that
11	they're actually licensed vehicles,
12	licensed drivers. So I think even that
13	number we don't know for certain. And
14	it's just a difficult process. These
15	allegations don't facts are
16	difficult to develop when you get these
17	allegations. So that's completely
18	understandable.
19	But in the interest of everybody
20	who has been here, we don't want to
21	have everyone testify and we'll get
22	right to the end and let you know now
23	that we will withdraw for today those
24	two sections, and continue.
25	(Applause.)

56 1 Proceedings 2 I appreciate it. Thank you. 3 COMMISSIONER MARINO: Can I just make a comment or ask a question? One 4 of the speakers said -- and I know it 5 6 is an excellent idea, Madam Chair, just 7 withdraw them for today. But one of the speakers said that out of 400 8 million passengers a year there's been 9 14 complaints. I mean --10 11 COMMISSIONER JIHA: It is not even 14. 12 13 COMMISSIONER MARINO: I never heard of sexual harassment in taxis 14 15 before. CHAIR JOSHI: It is hard to start 16 17 talking about stats, because we're in a realm where facts are difficult to 18 19 develop. So different agencies investigate them and have different 20 21 standards of what they label as CAD, and what they label as sexual 22 23 harassment. So I think it is hard for 24 us to engage on a meaningful discussion 25 on statistics.

57 1 Proceedings 2 COMMISSIONER MARINO: I mean, as 3 far as newspaper are --CHAIR JOSHI: As an industry they 4 transfer millions of people every day, 5 6 and the level of complaints we get is 7 not very big in every category, compared to the number of people that 8 travel in for-hire vehicles every day. 9 And that's a testament to the people 10 11 that are in the audience that do the 12 professional work day in and day out. 13 COMMISSIONER CARONE: I just want to make one quick point. And I agree 14 15 with my colleague, Commissioner Marino. The number is perhaps lower than we've 16 17 been let on to believe, but it doesn't 18 mean to say even one allegation of a 19 rape or violent -- or violence or harassment is to be taken lightly. So 20 I think it is a serious issue and I 21 think we need more time for it. 22 23 (Applause.) 24 MR. WILSON: Okay, so in light of 25 all these comments the next speaker is

Proceedings 1 2 from Asotiny, Fernando Garcia. 3 And please let us know if you still need to make comments given what 4 the Commissioner has just said. 5 Ιf 6 your comments have been addressed by 7 theirs, we'd appreciate it if we can just get through the agenda. 8 MR. GARCIA: (Through the 9 interpreter) Good afternoon, 10 11 Commissioner. Good afternoon 12 everybody. I believe that we talk about -- the speech about the same 13 thing. And I just want to -- I want to 14 15 put an example that long before it was a good situation of the drivers. 16 17 And today I see that the 18 situation is very very concerning, and 19 that's why we are here, because we think that this regulation, new 20 21 regulations, is not going to be healthy to the industry. I'm going to let you 22 23 know just in a few seconds that two 24 examples that a bribe in our offices 25 later. In Jerome Avenue on 183rd in

1	Proceedings
2	the Bronx County exists a woman and she
3	always is asking for drivers at
4	nighttime. She says, "If you don't
5	give me any money right now, I'm going
6	to call 911, and I'm going to accuse
7	you because I want your money." Some
8	members, taxi drivers of the Asotiny,
9	has to give them money because they
10	don't want any trouble, to avoid that
11	he's been reported to the Taxi and
12	Limousine Commission.
13	That woman take off the clothes
14	inside the cars, provoking to the
15	drivers. That's why more than
16	three years I've been saying to you
17	guys that everyone has an issue against
18	a driver, it has to be in front of you
19	guys in person. Because there exists
20	people, people outside, passengers,
21	that they want to hurt the industry.
22	CHAIR JOSHI: Just two notes.
23	The first issue you raised I think is
24	something we're happy to coordinate
25	with NYPD, because that's it

1	Proceedings
2	involves both agencies. And the second
3	one we're happy to share with you the
4	section of the OATH rules that allow
5	the driver to request the witness to be
6	present at the hearing.
7	MR. GARCIA: We want to express
8	to our drivers in the classroom over
9	here that you better go in a situation
10	like this, you better go to the NYPD
11	precinct and report the situation of
12	people who are using. I have the
13	experiences working night shift, some
14	passengers, woman passengers, females,
15	they go inside my cab, and if I don't
16	do whatever she wants, unrespectable to
17	the driver, and they say, "I'm going to
18	call 911 or 311 for TLC and you get
19	license suspended and everything",
20	because he say that many of the
21	passengers that used to do that they
22	think, the perception is that they can
23	do whatever, if they call Taxi and
24	Limousine Commission the driver has to
25	suspend the license.

Proceedings 1 2 CHAIR JOSHI: I think we've 3 already decided that things that have been raised today are worthy of 4 consideration. So we're going to table 5 6 this provision in light of the comments 7 that we've gotten. And I want to emphasize Commissioner Carone's, that 8 we still need to balance that with the 9 fact that one incident of harassment, 10 11 or one rape, is one too many. And that is a real issue as well. 12 13 On the bribery issue, which basically is what you described, 14 15 contact our Driver Protection Unit. We can help you liaison with NYPD. That's 16 17 information you need to give us and you need to give law enforcement. And that 18 is actually separate with the issues 19 that we're dealing with in this rule. 20 MR. GARCIA: We have an office 21 prepare it, open to our drivers 22 23 association. Okay, he says that just 24 like they are going to open offices, 25 they have office open for drivers

1 Proceedings 2 association, and they will try to 3 educate the drivers into -- the drivers around the association. But they need 4 5 to get some money from TLC, because it 6 is a lot of tickets on there. 7 CHAIR JOSHI: I can't give you money, but I can have our Driver 8 Protection Unit come out and help you 9 with the education, as well as offer 10 11 their phone number so that you have a 12 direct line to contact when you have 13 problems. 14 MR. GARCIA: Thank you so much. 15 My name is Hernandez Garcia. Thank you 16 so much. Thank you. 17 CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you. 18 MR. WILSON: Thank you. The next 19 two speakers are both from Green Taxi New York, and I ask if you can do the 20 21 comments as one, and to the extent the Commissioners have already addressed 22 23 your comments. 24 MS. REYNOSO: Hi, good morning, 25 Commissioners. Nancy Reynoso for Green

1	Proceedings
2	Taxis New York, Vice President. I
3	already understood the fact that we're
4	going to stop on the sexual harassment
5	until there's further education to talk
6	about it. I'm happy about that.
7	Because like Commissioner Frank said,
8	there's a lot of discontent within the
9	drivers that there's never a level of
10	fairness. And when there is
11	complaints, drivers are always found
12	guilty, so with little minor things,
13	what about sexual harassment, which is
14	pretty serious.
15	We as Green Cab advocates want to
16	talk a little bit about points. You
17	said something about how something had
18	changed with street hailed liveries
19	not being able to drive into the
20	restricted zones in Midtown, which we
21	found was very unconstitutional because
22	our drivers are only drivers
23	CHAIR JOSHI: I think we
24	clarified that at the beginning.
25	MS. REYNOSO: Okay.

1 Proceedings 2 CHAIR JOSHI: To the extent there 3 was a bullet that gave people that impression, we would withdraw that 4 bullet. And I think Chris is actually 5 6 probably going to rewrite that, and he 7 could read out loud for us. MS. REYNOSO: Yeah, it sounded a 8 9 little awkward, because even my mother lives on 90th Street and Columbus. 10 CHAIR JOSHI: I don't think we 11 have quite that jurisdictional power to 12 13 stop you from driving into midtown if 14 that's what you want to do. 15 MS. REYNOSO: Yeah. And another point that how bases should be able to 16 17 find out if their dispatch green cabs are on the system, on the LPEP system. 18 19 CHAIR JOSHI: That's another one that we would table in light of the 20 comments that we receive. 21 MS. REYNOSO: It is very hard I 22 23 think for a base to find out if the 24 green cab out there, even though it 25 might be logged on in the system with

		65
1	Proceedings	
2	pre-dispatched service at the base,	
3	even though they can know if they're at	
4	work now because they're doing	
5	pre-arraignments for the base, they	
6	can't really know if they are on the	
7	LPEP. I think we're good with that.	
8	TLC would have to work with them to	
9	find another way.	
10	There is something else there, I	
11	don't know if you clarified anything.	
12	I believe I read something that says	
13	that now, I mean, the original rule of	
14	SHLs was that if a SHLs goes into any	
15	airport in the City and there's a	
16	dispatch call, right there at the	
17	moment they walk into the airport, they	
18	can pick it up through pre-arraignment.	
19	It is saying somewhere around the rule	
20	like is going to be taken way. Can you	
21	clarify a little bit on that?	
22	MR. WILSON: The rule didn't say	
23	that. That is unchanged. The greens	
24	they can continue to pickup in	
25	prearranged calls at the airports.	

1 Proceedings 2 Yes. All that the rule does was just 3 clarify that the greens may not pickup a prearranged call in a prearranged 4 dispatch zone which is Manhattan below 5 6 East 96th Street and below West 130. 7 MS. REYNOSO: Basically we know 8 that. Okay, great. Thanks for 9 clarifying that. And we're clear with social 10 11 security card not needed. When you 12 say, would it be -- I'm a little lost with the term there. Original social 13 security card, or would you have to 14 15 bring a copy, or just vocally, we all know our social securities by heart. 16 CHAIR JOSHI: Your number. 17 MS. REYNOSO: Your number? 18 19 CHAIR JOSHI: Yes. 20 MS. REYNOSO: Okay, great. Ι think we're all set on that. And thank 21 22 you so much. 23 CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you. 24 And for everyone here I just want 25 to make a general comment. If anybody

1	Proceedings
2	wants to read our rules, has trouble or
3	questions about what they mean, please
4	feel free to contact us. You don't
5	have to wait for the public hearing.
6	It is actually really helpful, because
7	then we might be able to make changes
8	in advance of a hearing. And I know
9	spending the day here is probably not
10	your best option when you could be out
11	earning money. So we're here to
12	provide clarifications any time, up
13	until the hearing, and I encourage
14	everyone to take advantage of that.
15	MR. WILSON: I have a number of
16	people signed up to speak for something
17	called Cairo. I'll read them off. I
18	ask that the speaker that only one
19	speaker come up. And I also ask, to
20	the extent that you have comments, if
21	they have been addressed already by
22	what the Commissioner has said, that
23	you don't need to speak at all. So the
24	speakers would be Mr. Mobarak,
25	Mr. Sideris, Mr. Shams Mer Ali,

68 1 Proceedings 2 Mr. Mohamed Label, Mr. Ashraful Alam, 3 Mr. Ibrahim Sultan, MD Zahirul Islam, Malik Amar Ashraf, and Kamaleldi 4 Abdalla. And I apologize if I've 5 6 mispronounced you're names. 7 Can I assume that they are not 8 here to speak? 9 CHAIR JOSHI: No. 10 MR. WILSON: Okay. 11 MR. ABDALLA: My name is 12 Kamaleldi Abdalla. I drive a green 13 taxi. One day I drop somebody, he wants to go to 110th and Broadway. 14 15 When we reach -- before we reach Columbus he asking me to make a left 16 17 and go right. And then I see them tell 18 me I drop him between Columbus 19 and Amsterdam. And he pay cash. 90 percent of the people pay cash. 20 You don't work with the screen like there. 21 Sometimes I forgot to put the meter on. 22 23 So the fare like they like 20-something 24 when I start to pickup another. 25 Anyway, so I make my cell phone

69 Proceedings 1 2 remind to push the meter. And then I turn right, the traffic light was 3 green, I turn right on Amsterdam go to 4 5 up downtown, somebody helds his hand, 6 and tell me from the window, "Can you 7 take me to 121st and Park?" "Sure." That's north jurisdiction. "Sure," I 8 said, "Okay." "How much?" "I go by 9 the meter." He keep silent, and I see 10 11 somebody come from the front that left 12 window, and asking me the papers, license, driver's license. Okay, I 13 give. I learn to don't speak because 14 15 when I speak I say, "Why? What 16 happened?" I got more tickets. I keep 17 myself silent. CHAIR JOSHI: Is this an 18 19 enforcement issue? You got a summons? 20 MR. ABDALLA: Yes. CHAIR JOSHI: Where were you when 21 it happened? 22 23 MR. ABDALLA: Between 109th and 24 110th, I know that's where I stay. 25 CHAIR JOSHI: So I think that's

1	Proceedings
2	not exactly relevant to the rules
3	today. But it is an extremely
4	important complaint that we've gotten
5	from not only you, but other people in
6	the green taxi industry. And I know
7	I don't know if anybody from
8	enforcement is here today, but I know
9	Ed Murray who's worked on several
10	enforcement issues, in back, and we'll
11	be happy to take a look on the summons
12	you got and learn more about that a
13	case.
14	MR. ABDALLA: Okay, ma'am, but I
15	already went to court, the TLC for
16	that. And when I stop everything you
17	hear is wrong, I didn't pickup, I
18	didn't say \$10, I didn't ask him 125th
19	and Broadway like here, I asked
20	everything is he says, no problem,
21	you agreed. No, I don't agree. If I
22	agree, he didn't, because when he said
23	how much, I tell him by the meter. And
24	the meter was on.
25	CHAIR JOSHI: Right. So you went

1	Proceedings
2	in for a settlement, and we're happy to
3	find out more about that process, and
4	if it didn't go the way it should, to
5	make sure we look into it. So I just
б	ask that you speak to Ed in the back
7	about your particular case.
8	MR. ABDALLA: Okay, ma'am, but
9	you know something, nobody listen.
10	Nobody, nobody, nobody. I ask tell
11	him, I got camera. Open the camera if
12	the guy said is true, I pay the fine
13	ten times.
14	CHAIR JOSHI: That's exactly the
15	kind of evidence that we need to make
16	sure you get your day in court, and
17	that we're able to flush out the real
18	facts. And Ed is back there and wants
19	to listen. And we definitely take it
20	seriously, and we appreciate you coming
21	forward.
22	MR. ABDALLA: Okay, alright,
23	ma'am. Something else. I heard, I
24	don't know if that's true or not, that
25	the green taxi can go to Manhattan

		72
1	Proceedings	
2	empty. I live in Jersey. I use the	
3	Holland Tunnel to come.	
4	CHAIR JOSHI: That we clarified.	
5	There is no prohibition into driving	
6	through Manhattan at all.	
7	MR. ABDALLA: Okay, thank you.	
8	CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you for	
9	coming.	
10	MR. ABDALLA: Thank you. Where	
11	is the guy I have to talk?	
12	CHAIR JOSHI: He's right back	
13	there.	
14	MR. ISLAM: Commissioner TLC, my	
15	name is MD Zahirul Islam. I am owner	
16	of the corporation which name is Macton	
17	Tintin, and I have green permit from	
18	owner of the green permit. Thank you	
19	for giving me a chance to talk.	
20	Sometime my driver, I have two drivers,	
21	and I did agreement with them. They	
22	cannot pickup person unauthorized place	
23	which TLC rule regulation. But driver	
24	they pickup passenger on unauthorized	
25	place.	

Proceedings 1 2 MR. WILSON: Sir. 3 MR. ISLAM: They give me two ticket, owner of the corporation. 4 Then they give me a ticket by mail, sometime 5 6 mail me, and they fine from us. This 7 is not fair for us, because we never told the driver at unauthorized place 8 to pick up the passengers. That's why 9 I'm requesting to all of you so you can 10 11 stop this regulation for giving ticket, or someone owner of the corporation. 12 13 Thank you very much. CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you. 14 15 MR. WILSON: I have three more 16 speakers. And again I'll ask you if 17 your concerns have already been addressed by what the Commissioner said 18 19 before, you'll take that under consideration to let us move forward. 20 21 Jose Merette? Hector Leonardo? 22 MR. GERMAN: (Through the 23 interpret.) Good morning, everybody. 24 First of all, thanks God for giving me 25 an opportunity. Taxi drivers of New

1	Proceedings
2	York City. I want to say thank you for
3	listening everybody here in defense of
4	our drivers and our families and in New
5	York City.
6	Everybody, the reality, the true
7	realty of taxi drivers working outside,
8	just to be rethinking about sexual
9	harassment we wanted to say three
10	things. We want to say three things.
11	First, 2014, 10 cases is registered.
12	In 2015, the 14 cases registered. He's
13	wondering what about 6 percent like the
14	rate and the commissioner police
15	officers. There is one thing very
16	important. Okay, that's the case is
17	that it was reported says only
18	mentioning about the drivers, not the
19	chauffeur's license. In cases through
20	about the driver's license. We have
21	150,000 licenses drivers registered to
22	TLC. This quantity is only
23	0.0066 percent. Because we are not
24	perfect with classes. We are drivers.
25	The last year we heard about you,

1	Proceedings
2	Chair Joshi, announcing that the last
3	year you, Mrs. Joshi, that last year
4	you say that 150 drivers will be
5	summonses because of passengers outside
6	they were reporting 39 311. Do you
7	remember those information that you
8	were publishing to the public saying
9	to the public? Our situation problem
10	is not the 750 drivers. It is just
11	about why there were summonses and they
12	were guilty without any
13	representations, any voice, any
14	nothing, just guilty, the 750 drivers.
15	In the name of our families, taxi
16	drivers' families, we have to say like
17	the same like the professionals in law
18	says about the sexual harassment, for
19	them this is very easy to defend into
20	the court is hard to defend in the
21	court, but it is very easy to raise to
22	that a person is in the name of God
23	we need you to reflect that.
24	CHAIR JOSHI: I just want to make
25	sure in translation, has the speaker

76 1 Proceedings 2 been given the information that we're 3 tabling this rule to take into account everything that's been said today? 4 Has he been given that update? 5 6 (Through the interpreter.) MR. GERMAN: He had. Thank you 7 so much. We need to make a point, very 8 hard point to this situation because it 9 is concerning about taxi drivers 10 11 outside of the association. That's all. 12 13 CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you very much. And I appreciate you coming and 14 15 sharing your perspective to us. 16 MR. GERMAN: Thank you so much. 17 (Applause.) MR. WILSON: I believe 18 19 Mr. Merette entered the room. Does he still wish to speak? 20 21 MR. SIDERIS: How are you doing, Commissioners? How are you? My name 22 23 is John Sideris and my company is NYC 24 CABS. 25 MR. WILSON: Excuse me,

1	Proceedings
2	Mr. Sideris, I know we have had,
3	Mr. Sideris, I know we've had testimony
4	with a lot of people with your group.
5	And I know the Commissioner is already
6	addressed a number of these issues. Do
7	you have testimony beyond those issues?
8	MR. SIDERIS: I'm actually going
9	to take the question nobody took, if
10	you don't mind. Everybody's questions
11	pretty much got answered except one of
12	the rules about the electronic device,
13	nobody mentioned it. You guys want me
14	to continue?
15	CHAIR JOSHI: Yes, definitely.
16	MR. SIDERIS: Okay. Again, thank
17	you.
18	So in the past week I take a
19	sample set of about 15 people, mostly
20	base owners and drivers. And the
21	majority feel that the rule must be
22	made a little more flexible to include
23	drivers to be able to use the cell
24	phone during an emergency situation.
25	And even if not permissible in a

1	Proceedings
2	non-standing zone, given the rate in
3	which technology has been engulfing the
4	taxi industry in the past year, it will
5	be extremely difficult for drivers,
6	specifically black car drivers, to be
7	able to accept dispatch or communicate
8	with the bases.
9	Lastly, given the rule the
10	rules of the TLC is proposing for
11	electronic device use is adversely
12	promoting drivers to accept and use
13	phones while driving, as opposed to
14	pulling over as a stop as a stopped
15	taxi driver. He's at risk of two
16	violations, as opposed to one
17	violation. One will be the cell phone
18	use, and the other would be the
19	non-standing. Now there is no
20	sufficient maps of where is the
21	appropriate standing zones in the City.
22	The other thing that I found was
23	that the rule, the way it is written,
24	shall only state should be stated as
25	following: The driver must not use an

1 Proceedings 2 electronic device while driving, 3 period. Nothing following that statement. The rule should take effect 4 after the TLC provides a video on how 5 6 to safely use electronic devises. In 7 addition, show how a black car driver or any HSL should be able to accept the 8 9 request for an electronic app or dispatcher while --10 11 MR. WILSON: In fact, Mr. Sideris, under our rule for HV 12 drivers a short communication with a 13 base regarding a dispatch is not an 14 15 improper use of an electronic communication device. If the 16 communication is out of dispatch, the 17 communication occurs using a device 18 19 which is in a fixed position and not handheld. And is encouraged using 20 21 either voice or a non-touch program. MR. SIDERIS: That's fine, is 22 23 that stated in the rule? 24 MR. WILSON: That's in the 25 existing rule today.

1	Proceedings
2	MR. SIDERIS: All right. Thank
3	you very much.
4	CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you.
5	MR. WILSON: Thank you.
6	I can't remember, was Mr. Merette
7	in the room or do we move onto the last
8	speaker?
9	COMMISSIONER MARINO: Just a
10	quick question. I'm going to clarify.
11	What about the emergency situation?
12	Was there anything defining the
13	emergency situation or providing that
14	as an exception? That's an interesting
15	point. I mean, what if there is some
16	type of an emergency? Whether it is
17	within the car itself or within, you
18	know, a call from a family member? I
19	don't know. I'm just curious if there
20	is any provision or a definition of an
21	emergency situation.
22	MR. WILSON: There is not a
23	definition of an emergency situation.
24	That's not one of the exceptions.
25	Certainly, I think, a fixed device with

1	Proceedings
2	an emergency button that can always be
3	used at any time. If it is telephone
4	call, no. It is not about a dispatch,
5	people should probably pull over.
6	MR. MOBARAK: Can I say
7	something? If the drivers move over,
8	they're get two tickets; one for using
9	the phone, if he is illegal parking or
10	no standing. Two tickets; one no
11	standing, and one for using the phone.
12	He's not driving.
13	COMMISSIONER MARINO: That's an
14	interesting point.
15	MR. MOBARAK: I want to talk
16	about this one too. My name is Mamdouh
17	Mobarak, from Cairo Center. I'm glad
18	that we talk about sexual harassment,
19	about travelling through Manhattan with
20	green cab, or also that we still have
21	pre-arraignment for pickup from JFK and
22	airports.
23	What about I don't know his
24	name I agree with him when he said
25	we must have definition about sexual

82 1 Proceedings 2 harassment. And you mentioned that a 3 driver administrative about how we practice how we -- we have some tickets 4 -- I have some tickets that the TLC 5 6 officer call the base to make 7 pre-arraignment call for JFK. The driver arrive, he gave him two tickets. 8 One for come to the zone that you 9 should not be there, and he gives the 10 11 owner another ticket which is illegal. 12 Right now the driver can for 13 prearrangement he go pickup from the airport. So TLC officer, they try to 14 15 trap the driver. He is 109 Street, 109 Street, West Side, then they ask him 16 17 for a fair. These drivers already 18 leaving the zone. They stop them, 19 sometimes the meter is working, they trap him, and give him a ticket. 20 He 21 doesn't give him. They say, give me your license. They sit down, tell them 22 23 you are okay, go ahead, go a home. And 24 after five days we receive tickets that 25 up pickup, and each ticket is \$500.

		8
1	Proceedings	
2	TLC acts in all tickets as	
3	restitution, meaning they have to find	
4	the driver guilty. So how can we fight	
5	this? Especially if we have sexual	
6	harassment.	
7	What I suggest about sexual	
8	harassment complaint, that if somebody	
9	made a complaints, TLC calls the	
10	drivers, come over, listen to him the	
11	situation. Then if TLC sees in this	
12	case it should go for trial, they tell	
13	him that you got to go for trial, send	
14	him, and tell him about his rights. If	
15	he needs a witness, we can bring a	
16	witness. Not most of the drivers	
17	don't know if they have the right to	
18	bring the witness or not.	
19	MR. WILSON: I just wanted to	
20	clarify that our rules do actually	
21	provide that it would be an affirmative	
22	defense to charge of unlawfully using	
23	the electronic device if the	
24	communication was an emergency	
25	operator.	

84 1 Proceedings 2 COMMISSIONER MARINO: Can we 3 please keep it down in the audience, please? 4 5 MR. WILSON: Or the communication 6 reports an imminent threat to life or 7 property. MR. MOBARAK: What this means? 8 9 MR. WILSON: It is an affirmative defense to use -- improper use of 10 electronic communication device if the 11 12 communication was an emergency response 13 to the operator, and the communication 14 reports imminent threat to either life 15 or property. MR. MOBARAK: I have the rule 16 here it says, I can read it. I know 17 it. The drivers can use only 18 19 electronic device while -- the driver can only use his electronic device when 20 he is only lawfully parking or 21 22 standing. 23 MR. WILSON: That's the exception 24 to that. 25 COMMISSIONER MARINO: It sounds

		8
1	Proceedings	
2	like enforcement might not know that.	
3	COMMISSIONER JIHA: Even	
4	enforcement doesn't know that.	
5	CHAIR JOSHI: Both of these	
6	issues are actually not the subject of	
7	amendments that are up, but we're happy	
8	to speak with you as well as NYPD,	
9	because it is primarily NYPD that the	
10	tickets come from or TLC inspectors.	
11	MR. MOBARAK: TLC. TLC give me	
12	two tickets.	
13	CHAIR JOSHI: Okay. So we are	
14	happy to address that with you. I	
15	don't know I think Ed is no longer	
16	Ed is back there. So if you can	
17	speak with Ed, because that is an	
18	enforcement issue that is not actually	
19	addressed by these rules, but I'm glad	
20	you're raising it now, and we're happy	
21	to get more details and see what we can	
22	do.	
23	MR. MOBARAK: Okay. I want to	
24	hand it to you about the success of	
25	green cabs, because we have which is	

86 1 Proceedings 2 more better, but it is most stuff have 3 to do about the green cab to be successful. 4 CHAIR JOSHI: Yes, and I 5 6 appreciate you. You've been a regular 7 constructive critic, and some of your suggestions we've taken and hopefully 8 that's made the process better. But, 9 yes, feel free to hand it to them. 10 11 MR. MOBARAK: Thank you. 12 MR. WILSON: Okay, thank you. I 13 have one more speaker and that's Jose 14 Gomez. 15 MR. SIRIN: I'm not Jose. My 16 name is Sirin, is that okay? 17 CHAIR JOSHI: I didn't hear you. MR. SIRIN: My name is not Jose. 18 19 My name is Sirin. I just came a little bit late. 20 21 CHAIR JOSHI: Okay. Do you understand that the decision we've 22 23 already made, so if you have testimony 24 on something other than those rules. 25 That's right. MR. SIRIN:

87 Proceedings 1 2 CHAIR JOSHI: That would be 3 additive. MR. SIRIN: Thank you so very 4 much. Thank you, Madame Joshi, for 5 6 giving opportunity. I think we need to 7 have a more meeting like this as green taxi because I see -- I'm a driver -- I 8 was a driver, then I'm a green taxi 9 permit owner, and I'm a TLC wheelchair 10 11 teacher, and -- I'm sorry, I'm a little bit nervous. And I'm a wheelchair taxi 12 13 specialist in green taxi and yellow taxi. But I see a lot of problems 14 15 especially in the green taxi. First, let me just give you one thing. 16 We 17 have classification call hack-up 18 letters. Hack-up letters take normally 19 for the green taxi to go to inspection you need hack-up letters. So before 20 21 TLC used to give from the window, once you have a registration. Now they 22 23 changed the rules and you have to wait 24 ten business days. But --25 MR. WILSON: Sir, can I ask you.

1	Proceedings
2	This isn't a matter that's actually
3	addressed by the rules by which we're
4	having a public hearing. Is anyone
5	still here from TLC licensing?
6	CHAIR JOSHI: I spot Keith Walsh,
7	who is trying to walk out.
8	MR. WILSON: He's trying to find
9	somebody for you. Can I direct you to
10	Keith Walsh in the back to get your
11	information?
12	CHAIR JOSHI: Let me ask you
13	though, can you also give Keith your
14	contact information, because as
15	somebody who has experience in multiple
16	levels of the green taxi industry, we
17	love to reach out and discuss other
18	issues as they come as well.
19	MR. SIRIN: I speak nine
20	different languages.
21	COMMISSIONER MARINO: Wow,
22	impressive.
23	CHAIR JOSHI: You got us beat, at
24	least me.
25	MR. SIRIN: Thank you.

89 1 Proceedings 2 CHAIR JOSHI: Thank you. 3 We have the schedule, this rule package scheduled for a hearing. We 4 could move to a vote, but I suggest 5 6 that in light of the good variety of 7 feedback we've gotten, and the balancing that we need to do, I think 8 on something, especially the sexual 9 harassment rule, that we absorb all of 10 the material when we do the vote next 11 12 month, and just use this time to sort 13 of follow-up on some of the issues that have been raised at the hearing. 14 15 So next on our agenda is a rule 16 to -- a proposed rule to allow 17 partitions to be optional. And do we have any speakers? I have none on my 18 19 list. SPEAKER: I would like to speak. 20 21 I called. Sorry. CHAIR JOSHI: Are you speaking on 22 23 the partition rule? 24 SPEAKER: No, yes, rule changes. CHAIR JOSHI: We've finished that 25

1 Proceedings 2 hearing, but I'm going to make sure 3 somebody in the back, Jeff Garber I see, and he will take your name and 4 contact information to make sure we get 5 6 your comments. Okay. 7 SPEAKER: I call and make an appointment. I would like to speak 8 9 something about my experience. CHAIR JOSHI: Sure, and we're 10 11 interested. But we are going to move on to the next rule now. And Jeff 12 13 Garber, he's right behind you. So please give him your contact 14 15 information as well as a full 16 explanation of your situation. 17 Are you going to speak to the 18 partition rules? Okay. Here we go. 19 MR. O'LAUGHLIN: Hi, Michael O'Laughlin, Cab Rides United. I just 20 want to ask for clarification. So if 21 it is, we're supportive of the idea of 22 23 allowing people not to use the 24 partition, because the partitions 25 create structural changes to the

1	Proceedings
2	vehicle, they can affect the way they
3	perform in a crash, they create clearly
4	a crash hazard for passengers' faces.
5	In fact, I think it was one of your
6	predecessors when the original
7	partition rule was adopted that called
8	the taxi partition a gift to New York's
9	plastic surgeons. We think it was
10	great that people will now not be
11	required to put that in the middle of a
12	vehicle.
13	However, we now have the we'll
14	have the option, as I understand it, to
15	use a camera. We'll have the option of
16	vehicles that have safer partitions and
17	have been crash tested with that
18	partition installed, and the air bag
19	still employed. Will we still have
20	dangerous unsafe partitions allowed in
21	taxis? And if so, why?
22	CHAIR JOSHI: I think you'll see
23	first all, you have to remember
24	there's a wheelchair conversion that's
25	happening, 50 percent, and those are

1 Proceedings 2 going to be taxis of tomorrow, 3 wheelchair accessible vehicles with crash-tested partitions. So that's 4 going to have a dramatic affect on the 5 6 profile of the fleet. I'm not going to 7 say your characterization is accurate. That is some people's characterization 8 9 of the partition. MR. O'LAUGHLIN: Including 10 11 medical professionals who have come in 12 and provided testimony. 13 CHAIR JOSHI: By making it optional, combined with the 50 percent 14 15 requirement, I don't think there will be a large population of the fleet that 16 17 has partitions that were installed 18 several years ago. 19 MR. O'LAUGHLIN: So there will still be under the rules the option for 20 installing a partition that is not 21 original equipment manufacturer, that 22 23 is not proven safe in the event of a 24 crash, that option will continue? CHAIR JOSHI: Yes, the rule makes 25

1 Proceedings 2 it a choice. But that choice is in 3 response to feedback from the industry that obviously advocates for something 4 other than a partition. So if that's 5 6 reflective of the trend, then I don't 7 think that people will be, you know, droves hacking up with partitions. 8 9 COMMISSIONER MARINO: I'd like to add, quite a bit of feedback in the 10 11 last few years against the partition. I think this is a great rule. I think 12 this is better for the drivers. 13 T've heard drivers say that one of their 14 15 problems with competing with other aspects of the industry is that there's 16 17 no partition, and therefore the drivers can be social with the passengers, and 18 19 yellows are prevented from being social. It affects their tips. I 20 think it is a great law. I support it 21 22 completely. 23 MR. O'LAUGHLIN: It is great, to the extent that it will reduce the 24 25 number of dangerous partitions. But it

		94
1	Proceedings	
2	is not great to the extent that it will	
3	continue to authorize the installation	
4	of partitions that medical	
5	professionals have come and testified	
6	to the TLC about the number of victims	
7	that they see. They call it partition	
8	face in the emergency room. It has	
9	been extensively covered in the media.	
10	CHAIR JOSHI: I think you	
11	characterize this as a great step in	
12	the right direction.	
13	MR. O'LAUGHLIN: Yes. But why	
14	don't we just go all the way? Why	
15	don't we take that next step and	
16	eliminate something that's an	
17	identified hazard to passengers in the	
18	interior of the vehicle.	
19	CHAIR JOSHI: We are happily	
20	moving forward in the right direction.	
21	But we'll happily take it into	
22	consideration what you said about the	
23	future.	
24	MR. O'LAUGHLIN: Thank you. I	
25	look forward to continuing the	

95 1 Proceedings 2 conversation. 3 MR. WILSON: Thank you. The rule also does one other thing. It makes a 4 change in the way that people can apply 5 6 for one of the 496 waivers available 7 for people who have to hack-up a wheelchair accessible vehicle, to 8 9 hack-up the taxi of tomorrow. These rules were published on the 10 11 City Record on March 22nd, 2016 with a comment deadline of today. No written 12 comments have been received. The local 13 law requires the final rule which was 14 15 unchanged from the proposed rule, was posted for the TLC website in 16 17 April 18th, 2016 and sent to the Commissioners on that day. 18 19 Are the Commissioners ready the 20 vote? All in favor? 21 (Whereupon, there was a chorus of 22 23 ayes.) 24 CHAIR JOSHI: So the rule passes. MR. WILSON: I believe we'll 25

		96
1	Proceedings	
2	return to executive session. We didn't	
3	finish the two Commission appeals. So	
4	we'll leave the meeting open so I can	
5	report after the session what happened.	
6	And I'll be back hopefully very	
7	shortly.	
8	(Whereupon, an executive session	
9	was held from 12:15 p.m. until 12:35	
10	p.m.)	
11	MR. WILSON: I can announce that	
12	in executive session in the matter of	
13	TLC versus Zakoutt, the Commission did	
14	not amend the penalties or decisions	
15	set by the Commissioner. So that	
16	license is so revoked, and a \$2,050	
17	fine.	
18	In the outcome of the appeal of	
19	TLC versus Choo, the Commissioners	
20	determined to suspend the license for	
21	30 days requiring Mr. Choo to complete	
22	his certificate of anger management,	
23	and reduce the fine to zero. The cost	
24	for the anger management course to be	
25	performed by the respondent, and if the	

Proceedings respondent fails to complete the course his license will be revoked. With that said, we are now ready to adjourn the Commission meeting. All in favor? (Whereupon, there was a chorus of ayes.) MR. WILSON: We are adjourned. And thank you, everybody. (Whereupon, the meeting was adjourned at 12:37 p.m.)

		98
1		
2	CERTIFICATE	
3	STATE OF NEW YORK)	
4) ss.:	
5	COUNTY OF NEW YORK)	
6		
7	I, VICKY GALITSIS, a Certified	
8	Reporter and Notary Public with and for	
9	the State of New York, do hereby certify:	
10	I reported the proceedings in	
11	the within-entitled matter, and that the	
12	foregoing transcript is a true record of	
13	said proceedings.	
14	I further certify that I am not	
15	related, by blood or marriage, to any of	
16	the parties in this matter and that I am	
17	in no way interested in the outcome of	
18	this matter.	
19	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have	
20	hereunto set my hand this 3rd day of	
21	May, 2016.	
22		
23		
24	VICKY GALITSIS, C.S.R.	
25	No. 000866-1	

		•
Α	affect (2) 91:2 92:5	anyway (2) 48:22 68:25
	affidavits (1) 35:11	apologies (1) 37:8
a.m (3) 2:2 4:16,17	affiliated (2) 23:21 29:7	apologize (2) 46:2 68:5
Abdalla (11) 3:13 68:5,11,12 69:20	affiliates (1) 23:19	app (1) 79:9
69:23 70:14 71:8,22 72:7,10	affiliation (1) 24:21	appeal (1) 96:18
ability (2) 28:10 35:7	affiliations (1) 21:9	appeals (1) 90:10 appeals (2) 4:6 96:3
able (10) 50:19 51:6,9 63:19 64:16	affirmative (2) 83:21 84:9	appear (1) 51:22
67:7 71:17 77:23 78:7 79:8	afternoon (2) 58:10,11	Applause (10) 7:6 8:12 28:24 37:3
absolutely (1) 22:25	age (1) 16:5	40:21 45:16 49:23 55:25 57:23
absorb (1) 89:10	agencies (2) 56:19 60:2	76:17
abuse (3) 44:23,25 45:2	• • • • •	
abused (1) 52:13	agency (1) 5:6	application (1) 40:7
abusers (3) 49:5 50:12 52:3	agenda (5) 10:5 19:11 20:11 58:8	applications (2) 18:23 19:4
abusing (1) 27:6	89:15	apply (1) 95:5
accept (3) 78:7,12 79:8	ago (4) 5:7 7:11 38:11 92:18	appointment (1) 90:8
access (1) 11:24	agree (4) 57:14 70:21,22 81:24	appreciate (9) 40:25 53:2,7,8 56:2
accessible (11) 10:7 17:9,12,17,20	agreed (2) 24:6 70:21	58:7 71:20 76:14 86:6
17:21,23 19:16,23 92:3 95:8	agreement (1) 72:21	approach (1) 24:14
account (1) 76:3	Aguado (1) 2:7	appropriate (1) 78:21
accountability (1) 29:2	Aguiar (5) 3:8 37:16,22,23 41:3	approval (1) 19:4
accountable (1) 48:24	ahead (1) 82:23	approved (1) 39:22
accurate (1) 92:7	aid (1) 39:23	approximately (2) 38:23,25
accuse (2) 49:6 59:6	air (2) 15:9 91:18	apps (1) 16:11
accused (7) 11:9 34:2 39:24 40:2	airport (5) 14:25 15:6 65:15,17	April (4) 1:10 8:19 20:4 95:17
47:15 50:18,22	82:14	Apron (1) 6:21
accuser (2) 11:9 51:23	airports (4) 15:3 20:22 65:25 81:22	area (1) 15:20
accusers (1) 40:14	Alam (1) 68:2	areas (1) 21:5
accusing (1) 52:3	Ali (1) 67:25	Arout (1) 9:15
acknowledging (1) 29:23	allegation (2) 51:21 57:18	arrive (1) 82:8
action (1) 20:3	allegations (4) 38:7,17 55:15,17	arriving (1) 14:24
actions (1) 39:18	allies (1) 39:11	Ashraf (1) 68:4
activist (1) 41:21	allow (5) 10:7 11:16 21:10 60:4	Ashraful (1) 68:2
acts (1) 83:2	89:16	asked (2) 6:12 70:19
actual (1) 22:24	allowed (1) 91:20	asking (3) 59:3 68:16 69:12
add (2) 21:24 93:10	allowing (2) 16:10 90:23	Asotiny (2) 58:2 59:8
adding (2) 27:13 49:2	allude (1) 44:5	aspects (2) 22:14 93:16
addition (4) 21:3 26:25 27:9 79:7	alright (1) 71:22	assist (2) 8:25 9:9
additional (1) 17:15	Amar (1) 68:4	assistant (1) 5:10
additive (1) 87:3	amend (2) 10:6 96:14	associated (1) 13:18
address (2) 24:16 85:14	amendments (3) 24:13 25:9 85:7	association (4) 61:23 62:2,4 76:11
addressed (8) 23:7 58:6 62:22	Amsterdam (2) 68:19 69:4	assume (1) 68:7
67:21 73:18 77:6 85:19 88:3	analyst (1) 12:18	assured (1) 8:23
addressing (2) 31:8 33:23	Analytics (1) 12:10	astounding (1) 15:13
adequate (2) 35:10,12	Angeles (13) 3:7 22:11 23:12,14	at-based (5) 13:16,21 14:13 16:2,5
adjourn (1) 97:5	29:10 30:3,6,18 32:9,24 33:22	attack (1) 50:12
adjourned (2) 97:9,12	35:23 46:9	attained (1) 8:4
administrative (3) 3:2 49:18 82:3	Angelique (2) 3:5 18:25	attending (1) 53:9
admitted (1) 6:3	anger (2) 96:22,24	attention (2) 10:15 24:19
adopted (2) 18:22 91:7	animals (1) 27:8	Attorney (2) 7:21 8:4
adopting (1) 18:16	announce (1) 96:11	attorneys (1) 8:2
adoption (1) 18:15	announced (1) 7:19	audience (4) 7:17 37:10 57:11 84:3
advance (1) 67:8	announcement (1) 5:4	authorize (1) 94:3
advantage (1) 67:14	announcements (1) 6:24	authorized (2) 10:12 15:2
adversely (1) 78:11	announcing (1) 75:2	automatically (1) 50:22
advocate (1) 9:16	annually (1) 39:3	available (3) 19:19 33:18 95:6
advocates (1) 9.16 advocates (2) 63:15 93:4	answer (3) 6:12 11:3 36:14	Avenue (2) 1:22 58:25
advocates (2) 63.15 93.4 advocating (1) 50:5	answered (1) 77:11	average (2) 13:14,24
advocating (1) 50.5 advocator (1) 37:20	anybody (3) 11:14 66:25 70:7	avoid (3) 32:14 47:16 59:10
	•	•

avoided (1) 39:19 avoiding (1) 52:20 aware (3) 23:11 35:7 55:3 awareness (1) 32:21 awkward (1) 64:9 ayes (6) 4:10 18:20 19:9 20:8 95:23 97:8 В back (11) 4:13 8:6 53:10 70:10 71:6,18 72:12 85:16 88:10 90:3 96:6 bag (1) 91:18 balance (1) 61:9 balancing (1) 89:8 Bas (1) 3:7 base (11) 18:23 25:10 29:4 36:13 53:22 64:23 65:2,5 77:20 79:14 82:6 based (3) 5:15 7:24 24:4 bases (14) 13:19 14:2 19:3 21:10 22:17 23:19 24:15,21 25:13 29:8 34:8 36:17 64:16 78:8 basic (1) 28:25 basically (5) 43:13 50:20 51:8 61:14 66:7 basis (2) 25:17 33:8 beat (1) 88:23 Beaver (1) 1:11 beginning (1) 63:24 begun (1) 16:23 behalf (2) 23:18 37:25 behaved (2) 43:3,5 behavior (3) 27:16,21 32:25 believe (14) 26:6,16 27:13,19 33:22 38:24 43:10,10 55:2 57:17 58:12 65:12 76:18 95:25 Ben (1) 12:11 benefit (1) 7:17 best (4) 27:20 29:15 42:14 67:10 better (6) 33:24 60:9,10 86:2,9 93:13 beyond (1) 77:7 big (2) 37:10 57:7 biggest (1) 13:7 Bill (1) 2:7 birth (1) 39:17 bit (6) 5:24 63:16 65:21 86:20 87:12 93:10 bittersweet (1) 5:4 black (4) 13:8 26:9 78:6 79:7 blank (1) 40:14 block (1) 25:14 blood (1) 98:15 blue (2) 6:21 16:24 born (1) 15:15 borough (2) 1:13 14:12

boroughs (2) 14:16 18:2 break (1) 4:20 breakdown (1) 15:22 Brian (1) 10:2 bribe (1) 58:24 bribery (1) 61:13 brief (1) 12:2 briefly (1) 4:21 bring (3) 66:15 83:15,18 broad (1) 31:10 Broadway (2) 68:14 70:19 Bronx (3) 14:19 41:25 59:2 Brooklyn (5) 5:22 14:17,21 15:18 42:2 brought (4) 5:16 8:14 24:18 32:20 brown (1) 6:13 bullet (4) 22:16,23 64:3,5 burden (1) 34:15 business (4) 16:18 19:2 26:10 87:24 businesses (1) 23:25 button (2) 45:25 81:2 С C.S.R (1) 98:24 cab (9) 3:18 6:10 7:22 60:15 63:15 64:24 81:20 86:3 90:20 cabs (4) 28:20 64:17 76:24 85:25 CAD (1) 56:21 Cairo (6) 3:13,14,15,16 67:17 81:17 call (13) 13:6 59:6 60:18,23 65:16 66:4 80:18 81:4 82:6,7 87:17 90:7 94:7 called (3) 67:17 89:21 91:7 calls (2) 65:25 83:9 camera (3) 71:11,11 91:15 cameras (1) 10:12 candidate (1) 41:19 capable (1) 25:19

car (7) 10:6 13:8 19:21,21 78:6 79:7 80:17 card (4) 21:13 24:23 66:11,14 Cardian (1) 12:13 care (1) 30:16 carefully (1) 49:22 cares (1) 41:21 cargo (1) 28:16 Carone (10) 2:6 6:25,25 45:20,24 47:19 49:13,24 54:7 57:13 Carone's (1) 61:8 cars (5) 19:19,20 26:9 39:17 59:14 case (6) 43:14 45:6 70:13 71:7 74:16 83:12 cases (9) 11:18 28:7 34:21 36:2 38:24 39:13 74:11,12,19

cash (2) 68:19,20

category (1) 57:7 cause (2) 45:4 52:10 caused (1) 22:15 cell (3) 68:25 77:23 78:17 Center (1) 81:17 Central (1) 16:18 certain (5) 20:13 21:16 40:12 55:10,13 certainly (3) 46:8 54:5 80:25 certificate (3) 25:5 96:22 98:2 Certified (1) 98:7 certify (2) 98:9,14 Chair (79) 2:4 4:2,11,18 7:7 8:13 18:13,21 22:12 28:21,25 29:11 30:5,8 31:18 32:18 33:11 35:5 37:2,17 40:22 45:17 46:12 50:21 51:3,13 52:12,16 53:2,8,13 56:6 56:16 57:4 59:22 61:2 62:7,17 63:23 64:2,11,19 66:17,19,23 68:9 69:18,21,25 70:25 71:14 72:4,8,12 73:14 75:2,24 76:13 77:15 80:4 85:5,13 86:5,17,21 87:2 88:6,12,23 89:2,22,25 90:10 91:22 92:13,25 94:10,19 95:24 Chairwoman (1) 22:5 chance (1) 72:19 change (3) 27:15,21 95:5 changed (3) 38:15 63:18 87:23 changes (14) 13:7 19:5,6 20:13 23:16 24:16,20 25:7 26:15,19 28:15 67:7 89:24 90:25 changing (1) 20:20 characterization (2) 92:7.8 characterize (1) 94:11 charge (3) 44:15 45:10 83:22 charges (1) 26:22 chart (3) 13:13,23 14:4 chauffeur's (1) 74:19 check (1) 40:14 choice (2) 93:2,2 Choo (2) 96:19,21 chorus (6) 4:9 18:19 19:8 20:7 95:22 97:7 Chris (4) 2:12 9:23 22:22 64:5 Cira (3) 3:7 22:10 23:14 circumstance (1) 28:4 citizens (1) 44:3 City (23) 1:3 13:5 16:16 28:9 37:21 37:24 39:8 40:17 41:20,22,25 42:17 43:21 44:2,3,16 47:8 48:18 65:15 74:2,5 78:21 95:11 claim (1) 38:9 clarification (3) 30:14 54:17 90:21 clarifications (1) 67:12 clarified (3) 63:24 65:11 72:4 clarify (10) 20:15,17,23 21:15 22:16 34:18 65:21 66:3 80:10

83:20 clarifying (3) 10:14 50:3 66:9 class (1) 38:2 classes (1) 74:24 classification (1) 87:17 classroom (1) 60:8 CLEAN (1) 3:6 cleanup (1) 10:13 clear (5) 10:18 31:13 48:5 49:20 66:10 clearer (1) 48:9 clearly (2) 48:15 91:3 clothes (1) 59:13 CNT (1) 25:19 coalition (3) 3:8 37:25 41:24 code (1) 21:24 Cohen (1) 8:9 colleague (1) 57:15 colleagues (1) 37:9 collection (1) 21:17 color (1) 17:2 Columbus (3) 64:10 68:16,18 combined (1) 92:14 come (15) 11:6,8 38:22 39:2 54:8 62:9 67:19 69:11 72:3 82:9 83:10 85:10 88:18 92:11 94:5 comes (1) 14:7 comfortable (2) 47:23 48:9 comina (6) 9:7 43:19 49:19 71:20 72:9 76:14 comings (1) 5:3 comment (5) 22:13 53:3 56:4 66:25 95:12 commenting (1) 6:4 comments (12) 20:16 28:22 57:25 58:4,6 61:6 62:21,23 64:21 67:20 90:6 95:13 Commission (18) 1:4,12 16:9 18:18 20:3 23:2,15 24:4 26:18 27:10 28:13 36:19 53:25 59:12 60:24 96:3,13 97:5 Commission's (3) 19:13 24:9,18 commissioner (43) 5:5,11 6:25 7:2 7:9 9:15 12:8 20:5 23:13 37:5,7 37:19 41:18 45:20,24 47:19 49:2 49:13,24 54:6 56:3,11,13 57:2,13 57:15 58:5.11 61:8 63:7 67:22 72:14 73:18 74:14 77:5 80:9 81:13 84:2,25 85:3 88:21 93:9 96:15 Commissioners (11) 2:3 12:17 18:25 23:13 42:14 62:22,25 76:22 95:18,19 96:19 Commissioners' (1) 41:10 Commissions' (1) 20:11 committed (3) 7:5 21:25 38:18 common (1) 39:5

communicate (2) 28:10 78:7 communication (10) 24:4 79:13 79:16,17,18 83:24 84:5,11,12,13 community (2) 44:9,10 company (1) 76:23 compared (3) 16:6,19 57:8 compel (2) 11:6,8 competing (1) 93:15 compiling (1) 12:22 complained (1) 48:22 complains (1) 36:13 complaint (5) 7:24 32:6,8 70:4 83:8 complaints (7) 26:24 27:25 55:9 56:10 57:6 63:11 83:9 complete (3) 14:18 96:21 97:2 completed (2) 14:13 22:7 completely (5) 25:25 31:8 34:13 55:17 93:22 comprehensive (1) 24:13 concern (2) 42:3 43:25 concerned (3) 24:12 44:12,14 concerning (2) 58:18 76:10 concerns (2) 24:17 73:17 conduct (3) 10:21 29:25 46:17 confined (1) 11:18 confront (1) 23:6 confusion (1) 22:15 consider (2) 40:25 54:23 considerable (1) 10:15 consideration (5) 53:18 54:15 61:5 73:20 94:22 considered (4) 27:15 30:12 31:3 43:21 considers (1) 30:24 Constance (1) 2:9 constant (1) 25:17 constructive (1) 86:7 contact (10) 10:20 22:5 26:16 29:24 61:15 62:12 67:4 88:14 90:5,14 contains (2) 10:14 12:22 continual (1) 53:18 continue (8) 8:19 26:10 36:22 55:24 65:24 77:14 92:24 94:3 continued (2) 14:9 23:22 continuing (1) 94:25 continuously (1) 43:3 **CONVENED** (1) 2:2 convenient (1) 6:6 conversation (7) 10:20 32:2 35:4 43:17 48:6 54:20 95:2 conversion (1) 91:24 coordinate (1) 59:24 copy (1) 66:15 core (1) 42:12 corporation (3) 72:16 73:4,12

correct (2) 54:7 55:7 corrected (1) 33:3 corresponding (2) 46:20,23 cost (1) 96:23 Council (1) 40:17 Counsel (1) 2:12 counted (1) 26:23 counter (1) 9:9 counterparts (1) 16:4 counties (1) 15:14 countries (2) 15:11 47:4 country (2) 43:19 47:9 County (2) 59:2 98:5 course (4) 22:8 25:5 96:24 97:2 court (5) 35:25 70:15 71:16 75:20 75:21 courtroom (4) 7:12 11:10,13 35:22 coverage (1) 32:19 covered (2) 26:4 94:9 covers (1) 29:24 crash (4) 91:3,4,17 92:24 crash-tested (1) 92:4 create (4) 36:21 44:4 90:25 91:3 created (2) 5:11 32:22 credibility (3) 11:4 35:9,15 credible (1) 38:8 crimes (3) 39:8,9,12 criminals (2) 39:5,11 critic (1) 86:7 culture (1) 43:20 cumulatively (1) 8:13 curious (2) 47:20 80:19 current (2) 27:3 30:9 currently (1) 23:20 curriculum (1) 33:17 cut (1) 9:17 D daily (1) 38:22

damage (2) 42:16 45:13 damaging (1) 44:8 dangerous (2) 91:20 93:25 darker (2) 14:3 17:2 data (4) 18:11 21:17 26:17,22 date (1) 20:5 Dave (1) 9:23 David (1) 8:8 day (14) 9:16 13:14,20,24 14:5 57:5,9,12,12 67:9 68:13 71:16 95:18 98:20 days (3) 82:24 87:24 96:21 deadline (1) 95:12 deal (1) 32:7 dealing (1) 61:20 DeArcy (1) 7:10 decided (1) 61:3 decision (1) 86:22

decisions (1) 96:14 dedication (2) 6:16 9:14 defend (2) 75:19,20 defense (5) 36:3,4 74:3 83:22 84:10 defensive (2) 22:7 25:5 define (5) 22:3 26:15 30:22 47:3,6 defines (2) 46:6,20 defining (1) 80:12 definitely (2) 71:19 77:15 definition (6) 27:14 30:7 49:9 80:20.23 81:25 definitions (3) 27:21 31:5,13 deliberations (1) 4:23 demonstrate (1) 21:11 departing (1) 14:24 Deputy (1) 12:8 described (1) 61:14 designated (1) 41:9 designing (1) 6:20 desire (1) 48:3 detail (1) 5:19 details (1) 85:21 determine (1) 31:16 determined (1) 96:20 determines (1) 30:24 develop (2) 55:16 56:19 developed (1) 5:15 device (10) 77:12 78:11 79:2,16,18 80:25 83:23 84:11,19,20 devices (1) 21:15 devises (2) 24:25 79:6 died (1) 39:20 difference (1) 50:7 different (6) 24:7 43:19,20 56:19 56:20 88:20 differently (1) 47:6 difficult (4) 55:14,16 56:18 78:5 difficulty (2) 6:9 8:22 digest (1) 54:2 dignity (3) 42:18 44:4,17 DIM (1) 6:11 direct (2) 62:12 88:9 direction (2) 94:12,20 Director (1) 12:9 disagreement (1) 38:3 discontent (1) 63:8 discretion (1) 27:11 discretionary (1) 4:5 discriminatory (1) 40:5 discuss (2) 4:5 88:17 discussed (1) 22:6 discussion (2) 32:20 56:24 dismiss (2) 40:19 54:10 dispatch (13) 5:16 17:23 29:5,8 53:21,22 64:17 65:16 66:5 78:7 79:14,17 81:4

dispatcher (1) 79:10 dispatching (1) 25:11 display (1) 21:21 displayed (1) 25:3 distribution (1) 14:8 District (1) 16:18 diverse (1) 28:11 Division (1) 12:2 doing (6) 12:14 34:13,20 37:12 65:4 76:21 door (3) 49:5 50:12 52:2 dot (1) 17:5 Dougan (1) 9:23 downtown (1) 69:5 dramatic (1) 92:5 drive (3) 22:19 63:19 68:12 driver (42) 5:23 7:25 11:12 16:5 22:7 25:11,18 27:3,5 31:19 33:25 35:7,12 42:6 43:7 44:23 45:3,6 46:21 48:14,23 52:22 59:18 60:5 60:17,24 61:15 62:8 72:20,23 73:8 78:15,25 79:7 82:3,8,12,15 83:4 84:19 87:8,9 driver's (3) 50:16 69:13 74:20 drivers (95) 8:6,15 10:16,21 13:11 15:11,15,18 16:2 21:9,21 23:20 23:25 24:11,14 25:15,22 26:3,8 27:23 28:4,12,18 29:17 30:11 31:12.25 32:10.12.16.21 33:3.8 33:14.14 34:5.7.16 35:2.23 36:17 36:21 37:25 38:6,13,13,18 39:14 39:22 40:15 42:4 47:5,14 48:10 49:4,11 55:12 58:16 59:3,8,15 60:8 61:22,25 62:3,3 63:9,11,22 63:22 72:20 73:25 74:4,7,18,21 74:24 75:4,10,14 76:10 77:20,23 78:5,6,12 79:13 81:7 82:17 83:10 83:16 84:18 93:13.14.17 drivers' (1) 75:16 driving (7) 25:5 37:11 64:13 72:5 78:13 79:2 81:12 drop (4) 15:2 25:24 68:13,18 droves (1) 93:8 due (1) 50:15 DUMBO (1) 17:6 Е e-hail (3) 6:4 16:23 17:3 e-hailed (3) 5:21 6:8 16:16 e-hails (1) 16:17 earlier (3) 23:4 51:19 55:6 earning (1) 67:11

easily (1) 33:3

East (2) 20:25 66:6

Ed (6) 70:9 71:6,18 85:15,16,17

easy (2) 75:19,21

edges (1) 47:17

editions (1) 18:10 educate (4) 47:7 48:14 49:11 62:3 educated (2) 32:11,15 educating (2) 46:16,21 education (24) 27:20 31:24 32:18 33:13,23 43:12,12,16,24 44:13 44:15,17 45:9,10 46:10,13,15,22 54:5,6,7,11 62:10 63:5 educational (1) 32:23 Edward (1) 2:5 effect (2) 21:20 79:4 efficient (1) 23:22 either (3) 21:5 79:21 84:14 electronic (13) 5:16 21:15 24:25 77:12 78:11 79:2,6,9,15 83:23 84:11,19,20 electronically (2) 16:11 17:7 elements (1) 40:6 Elias (1) 9:15 eliminate (1) 94:16 elimination (1) 24:22 EMAIL (1) 1:24 embodies (1) 6:15 emergency (10) 77:24 80:11,13,16 80:21,23 81:2 83:24 84:12 94:8 Emeritt (1) 9:23 empathy (1) 7:15 emphasize (4) 43:15,23 45:9 61:8 emploved (1) 91:19 empty (1) 72:2 encourage (3) 35:17 54:16 67:13 encouraged (1) 79:20 ended (1) 5:22 enforce (3) 29:16 36:20 52:24 enforcement (11) 20:14,18 25:8 34:24 61:18 69:19 70:8,10 85:2,4 85:18 engage (1) 56:24 engaging (1) 42:7 engulfing (1) 78:3 enhance (1) 25:7 Enhancing (1) 20:17 enjoy (1) 12:21 enjoyed (1) 24:2 enter (1) 48:3 entered (1) 76:19 entire (1) 9:22 equally (1) 14:20 equipment (1) 92:22 Eric (1) 41:15 Erica (1) 12:12 Erick (2) 3:9 41:19 especially (4) 43:18 83:5 87:15 89:9 essentially (1) 20:12 establish (1) 22:3 established (1) 28:3

estimated (1) 38:23 event (1) 92:23 eventually (1) 9:4 everybody (7) 53:9 55:19 58:12 73:23 74:3,6 97:10 Everybody's (1) 77:10 evidence (2) 38:8 71:15 exactly (4) 51:5 52:19 70:2 71:14 example (2) 25:8 58:15 examples (1) 58:24 excellent (1) 56:6 exception (3) 28:12 80:14 84:23 exceptions (1) 80:24 excited (1) 12:19 exciting (1) 18:2 exclusionary (6) 20:18 22:20 25:7 25:16,23 26:11 exclusive (1) 26:7 Excuse (1) 76:25 executive (8) 4:4,12,15,22 12:9 96:2,8,12 exercise (1) 35:17 existing (3) 30:14 38:20 79:25 exists (2) 59:2,19 expand (1) 17:25 expanding (1) 17:9 expect (1) 4:12 expected (1) 25:9 expense (2) 40:10 44:18 experience (2) 88:15 90:9 experiences (1) 60:13 explanation (1) 90:16 explores (1) 13:2 exposed (1) 52:23 express (2) 38:3 60:7 expressing (1) 48:3 extend (2) 19:12 37:8 extensively (1) 94:9 extent (6) 32:13 62:21 64:2 67:20 93:24 94:2 extra (5) 43:11 44:17,21 45:11 48:25 extremely (2) 70:3 78:5 eye (1) 5:9 F face (2) 51:23 94:8 faces (1) 91:4 Facility (1) 9:25 facing (1) 24:15 FACSIMILE (1) 1:24 fact (6) 6:7 29:21 61:10 63:3 79:11 91:5 Factbook (6) 11:24 12:6,21,22 13:2 18:4 Factbooks (1) 18:10 facts (5) 18:11 51:17 55:15 56:18

71:18 failed (1) 26:25 fails (1) 97:2 fair (6) 35:19 38:11 47:20 52:20 73:7 82:17 fairness (1) 63:10 false (1) 27:25 families (3) 74:4 75:15,16 family (6) 34:2 36:10 40:9 45:7 51:12 80:18 far (2) 16:3 57:3 fare (1) 68:23 fast (1) 45:25 fault (1) 27:12 favor (7) 4:8 18:16 19:7 20:6 40:17 95:21 97:6 fear (4) 27:22 36:22 52:12,18 fearing (2) 35:24 39:23 February (1) 18:17 Federal (1) 7:10 feed (1) 53:10 feedback (6) 53:5 54:2,24 89:7 93:3,10 feel (12) 9:2 25:21 30:22 31:21 47:21,23 48:8,19 55:4 67:4 77:21 86:10 feet (1) 9:13 felt (1) 31:16 females (2) 15:23 60:14 Fernando (1) 58:2 FHA (1) 33:14 FHLs (1) 16:21 FHV (2) 13:19 16:5 FHVs (9) 13:16,20,21 14:2,13,18 15:25 16:2,3 fight (1) 83:4 fighting (1) 33:6 figured (1) 4:24 figures (1) 18:11 figuring (1) 5:23 file (1) 32:6 filing (1) 51:21 final (2) 20:3 95:14 Finally (1) 40:3 find (9) 18:9 32:16 34:10 64:17,23 65:9 71:3 83:3 88:8 finding (1) 33:24 fine (5) 71:12 73:6 79:22 96:17,23 fines (1) 8:7 finish (3) 4:22 30:5 96:3 finished (1) 89:25 firmly (1) 27:19 first (14) 5:11 6:7 22:10 31:23 33:12 38:10 42:4 46:24 54:11 59:23 73:24 74:11 87:15 91:23 five (3) 15:14 18:2 82:24 fixed (2) 79:19 80:25

fleet (4) 9:25 17:19 92:6,16 flexible (1) 77:22 FLOOR (1) 1:12 flush (1) 71:17 flushed (1) 51:18 focus (1) 46:9 folks (1) 17:6 follow-up (1) 89:13 following (4) 16:13 25:20 78:25 79:3 food (1) 51:8 foodie (1) 6:19 for-hire (8) 13:17 19:25 21:6,7,16 21:20 25:3 57:9 forced (1) 32:7 foregoing (1) 98:12 forfeiture (1) 21:23 forgot (1) 68:22 form (2) 47:17 54:8 former (2) 7:9 41:19 forward (10) 11:6,8 26:20 29:13 53:19 54:16 71:21 73:20 94:20 94:25 found (8) 5:8 10:22 27:12 34:6 35:25 63:11,21 78:22 four (3) 5:6 13:3 15:23 Frank (4) 2:6 6:24,25 63:7 free (4) 44:15 45:10 67:4 86:10 front (4) 6:10 32:5 59:18 69:11 fulfilled (2) 16:15 17:3 full (2) 27:17 90:15 Fund (1) 19:18 fundamental (1) 9:20 further (2) 63:5 98:14 Furthermore (1) 26:6 future (1) 94:23 G gain (1) 51:8 Galitsis (3) 2:21 98:7,24 Garber (3) 12:11 90:3,13 Garcia (6) 58:2,9 60:7 61:21 62:14 62:15 gender (1) 15:21 general (3) 2:12 11:19 66:25 General's (2) 7:22 8:4 German (4) 3:11 73:22 76:7,16 getting (4) 9:5,21 42:23 52:6 gift (1) 91:8 give (19) 8:8 39:23 53:10 59:5,9 61:17,18 62:7 69:14 73:3,5 82:20 82:21,21 85:11 87:16,21 88:13 90:14 given (8) 39:17 40:13,24 58:4 76:2 76:5 78:2,9 gives (1) 82:10 giving (5) 22:18 72:19 73:11,24

		I
87:6	hair (1) 6:13	Hispanic (1) 44:9
glad (2) 81:17 85:19	half (4) 13:25 14:19 15:17 17:18	Holland (1) 72:3
go (27) 4:4 8:6 11:15 29:13 35:24	hand (5) 46:11 69:5 85:24 86:10	home (1) 82:23
42:22 47:16 49:11 53:18 54:16	98:20	honor (4) 40:8 42:18 44:3,17
60:9,10,15 68:14,17 69:4,9 71:4	handheld (1) 79:20	honorable (1) 43:6
71:25 82:13,23,23 83:12,13	happen (5) 10:3 16:17 26:2 28:2	hopefully (2) 86:8 96:6
87:19 90:18 94:14	35:21	HSL (1) 79:8
goal (1) 17:18	happened (4) 34:3 69:16,22 96:5	hundreds (1) 7:13
goals (3) 23:21 54:4,25	happening (1) 91:25	hurt (2) 40:13 59:21
God (2) 73:24 75:22	happens (1) 36:12	HV (1) 79:12
goes (5) 14:12 36:10,11 51:2 65:14	happily (2) 94:19,21	
going (37) 4:3,19 17:14 23:17	happy (13) 6:18 7:7 11:15 23:8	
25:15 29:11 33:18 35:25 43:8	54:23 59:24 60:3 63:6 70:11 71:2	Ibrahim (1) 68:3
45:12 48:23 51:6,9,10,11 52:11	85:7,14,20	idea (2) 56:6 90:22
52:21,23 53:15 58:21,22 59:5,6	harassed (5) 30:23 31:16,21 36:9	identified (1) 94:17
60:17 61:5,24 63:4 64:6 65:20	48:21	identify (1) 27:2
77:8 80:10 90:2,11,17 92:2,5,6	harassing (2) 10:17 27:6	illegal (2) 81:9 82:11
goings (1) 5:3	harassment (54) 10:19 11:18 22:4	illegally (1) 26:11
	23:5 26:15,22 29:22,23 30:10,13	
Gomez (1) 86:14 Gonzales (2) 8:9 12:11	30:21,21,25 31:4,14,15 33:9 38:6	imminent (2) 84:6,14
		impartial (2) 10:24 35:19
Gonzalez (1) 2:5	38:18,25 40:2,15 42:8 43:22 46:7	implement (1) 39:4
good (22) 4:2,18 12:16 18:24	46:13,18,19 47:2,2,7,12,16,25	implementation (1) 40:19
23:12 24:2 33:12 36:7 37:17,18	48:7,12,18 49:10 53:24 54:19,19	importance (1) 54:11
38:13 40:24 41:17 54:6,7 58:10	56:14,23 57:20 61:10 63:4,13	important (6) 10:23 31:19 35:15
58:11,16 62:24 65:7 73:23 89:6	74:9 75:18 81:18 82:2 83:6,8	39:7 70:4 74:16
gotten (6) 10:15 54:3,24 61:7 70:4	89:10	imposing (1) 27:8
89:7	hard (8) 23:24 42:17 52:4 56:16,23	impression (2) 22:19 64:4
grants (1) 19:17	64:22 75:20 76:9	impressive (1) 88:22
gratifying (1) 9:17	hardworking (1) 40:9	improper (2) 79:15 84:10
great (10) 28:9 45:13 66:8,20	harm (1) 50:3	improperly (2) 25:10 36:9
91:10 93:12,21,23 94:2,11	hazard (2) 91:4 94:17	improvement (2) 9:11 19:18
green (25) 5:14,17,21 13:23 22:21	healthy (1) 58:21	inappropriate (1) 31:2
62:19,25 63:15 64:17,24 68:12	hear (5) 18:4 34:9 50:5 70:17	inappropriately (1) 39:24
69:4 70:6 71:25 72:17,18 81:20	86:17	incident (2) 52:9 61:10
85:25 86:3 87:7,9,13,15,19 88:16	heard (9) 23:15 46:3,4,8,9 56:14	include (3) 23:19 33:19 77:22
greens (2) 65:23 66:3	71:23 74:25 93:14	included (3) 18:6 30:10 45:12
grey (1) 14:3	hearing (23) 1:12 2:2 10:24 11:7,9	includes (3) 10:19 32:19 54:20
ground (1) 9:21	35:19 49:15,19 51:2,4,15,17,22	including (4) 27:7 30:10 31:6
grounded (1) 5:15	54:18,22 60:6 67:5,8,13 88:4	92:10
group (5) 41:6 44:6,6 52:10 77:4	89:4,14 90:2	incorporate (1) 54:25
groups (1) 41:8	heart (2) 42:12 66:16	increase (6) 13:7,11 22:6 25:4
growing (1) 17:14	Hector (3) 3:11 41:12 73:21	42:10,11
Grullon (3) 37:15,18,20	held (3) 4:16 48:23 96:9	increased (3) 26:20 30:2 38:19
GTNY (1) 3:10	helds (1) 69:5	industries (5) 13:4 15:22,24 16:4,7
guide (1) 10:21	help (4) 8:3 39:18 61:16 62:9	industry (15) 13:14 15:16 23:10
guilty (6) 28:7 36:2 63:12 75:12,14	helpful (1) 67:6	26:20 28:11 44:12 45:14 57:4
83:4	Herculine (1) 12:7	58:22 59:21 70:6 78:4 88:16 93:3
guy (2) 71:12 72:11	hereunto (1) 98:20	93:16
guys (3) 59:17,19 77:13	Hernandez (1) 62:15	infant (1) 39:20
	Hi (2) 62:24 90:19	information (8) 12:23 61:17 75:7
Н	higher (1) 27:22	76:2 88:11,14 90:5,15
hack-up (5) 87:17,18,20 95:7,9	highlight (1) 30:11	initial (1) 31:23
hacked (1) 10:8	highlighting (1) 52:16	initiatives (1) 24:9
hacking (1) 93:8	highlights (2) 12:4,20	inner (1) 15:18
hail (8) 5:16 13:15 16:11 17:7	Hill (1) 26:4	innocence (1) 28:8
	hire (1) 26.4	
20:19 26:12 29:6 53:22	hired (1) 36.7 hired (2) 13:4,16	innocent (3) 49:6 50:12 52:3
hailed (2) 15:2 63:18	111 CU (2) 13.4,10	inside (2) 59:14 60:15
		1

inspection (1) 87:19 inspectors (1) 85:10 install (1) 10:12 installation (1) 94:3 installed (2) 91:18 92:17 installing (1) 92:21 instance (1) 54:12 intellect (1) 7:15 intended (1) 20:22 intent (1) 22:21 intention (1) 38:4 interest (2) 41:9 55:19 interested (3) 23:2 90:11 98:17 interesting (2) 80:14 81:14 interests (1) 42:15 interior (1) 94:18 interpret (1) 73:23 interpreter (3) 37:23 58:10 76:6 interrupt (1) 51:14 introduces (1) 12:24 introduction (1) 5:14 investigate (1) 56:20 investigations (1) 8:11 investiture (1) 7:11 invitation (1) 44:22 inviting (1) 52:17 invoke (2) 51:20 52:17 invoked (1) 52:14 involved (1) 34:25 involves (1) 60:2 Islam (5) 3:14 68:3 72:14,15 73:3 Island (1) 9:10 issue (15) 23:5,7 26:3,7 29:3 31:8 35:10 36:25 57:21 59:17,23 61:12,13 69:19 85:18 issues (11) 3:12 24:14 25:20 33:9 61:19 70:10 77:6,7 85:6 88:18 89:13 J Jacques (1) 2:8 January (1) 16:9 Jason (3) 8:9 12:11,12 Jeff (4) 12:7,10 90:3,12 Jerome (1) 58:25 Jersey (1) 72:2 JFK (4) 15:6,9 81:21 82:7 Jiha (3) 2:8 56:11 85:3 Jo (4) 5:5,6 6:14,16 John (3) 3:15 9:22 76:23 joined (2) 5:6 37:5 joining (1) 7:4 joint (1) 7:23 Jose (4) 73:21 86:13,15,18 Joshi (81) 2:4 4:2,11,18 7:7 8:13 18:13,21 22:12 23:13 28:21,25 29:11 30:5,8 31:18 32:18 33:11

35:5 37:2,17,19 40:22 45:17 50:21 51:3,13 52:12,16 53:2,8,13 56:16 57:4 59:22 61:2 62:7.17 63:23 64:2,11,19 66:17,19,23 68:9 69:18,21,25 70:25 71:14 72:4,8,12 73:14 75:2,3,24 76:13 77:15 80:4 85:5,13 86:5,17,21 87:2,5 88:6,12,23 89:2,22,25 90:10 91:22 92:13,25 94:10,19 95:24 journey (1) 6:23 judge (5) 7:10 10:24 11:7 35:13 54:22 judges (1) 54:18 jurisdiction (1) 69:8 jurisdictional (1) 64:12 Κ Kamaleldi (3) 3:13 68:4,12 Karen (1) 9:23 keep (5) 17:14 39:7 69:10,16 84:3 Keith (3) 88:6,10,13 Keredia (1) 41:14 Kerlin (1) 12:11 key (1) 33:8 kind (4) 6:15 39:23 43:17 71:15 knew (1) 6:12 know (47) 4:24 25:13,16 30:9 32:5 32:10.12.13 34:5 43:18.21 44:24 46:8 48:20 49:20 51:8 53:14 54:15 55:13,22 56:5 58:3,23 65:3 65:6,11 66:7,16 67:8 69:24 70:6 70:7.8 71:9.24 77:2.3.5 80:18.19 81:23 83:17 84:17 85:2,4,15 93:7 knowing (1) 47:23 knowledge (1) 5:25 knows (1) 35:13 87:11 L label (3) 56:21,22 68:2 lack (1) 49:17 lacking (1) 40:6 63:18 ladies (1) 6:7 lady (2) 6:9,13 LaGuardia (2) 14:25 15:5 language (2) 27:14 34:17 languages (1) 88:20 large (1) 92:16 larger (1) 7:16 LaShann (1) 7:10 Lastly (1) 78:9 late (1) 86:20 Lavaya (1) 12:12 law (6) 20:2,23 61:18 75:17 93:21 95:14 lawfully (1) 84:21 laws (2) 26:5 47:11

lawyer (1) 36:7 learn (3) 32:14 69:14 70:12 lease (1) 7:22 leave (1) 96:4 leaving (3) 27:10 28:5 82:18 left (4) 5:5,19 68:16 69:11 legitimate (1) 29:3 length (2) 22:6 25:4 Leonardo (2) 3:11 73:21 letters (3) 87:18,18,20 level (2) 57:6 63:9 levels (2) 19:18 88:16 liaison (1) 61:16 Liberty (1) 26:5 license (20) 13:8 15:17 16:11 21:22 25:2 27:11 33:5 42:21,23 52:7 60:19,25 69:13,13 74:19,20 82:22 96:16,20 97:3 licensed (3) 24:11 55:11,12 licensee (2) 46:17,22 licensees (3) 21:10,18 36:24 licenses (3) 21:19 36:25 74:21 licensing (3) 8:20 20:14 88:5 life (3) 50:13 84:6,14 light (8) 13:22 16:24 53:13 57:24 61:6 64:20 69:3 89:6 lightly (1) 57:20 liked (1) 6:6 likelihood (1) 40:8 Limousine (3) 1:4 59:12 60:24 line (3) 13:23 14:3 62:12 list (1) 89:19 listed (1) 41:11 listen (3) 71:9,19 83:10 listening (1) 74:3 little (10) 46:10 49:22 63:12,16 64:9 65:21 66:12 77:22 86:19 live (2) 15:18 72:2 livelihood (1) 28:18 liveries (5) 20:19 26:8,13 29:6 livery (4) 3:7 13:16 29:6 53:23 livery-based (1) 23:18 lives (2) 39:15 64:10 living (1) 15:19 local (2) 20:2 95:13 locked (1) 25:12 locks (2) 25:18,18 logged (1) 64:25 logging (1) 29:17 long (4) 6:13 16:14 43:4 58:15 longer (1) 85:15 look (4) 15:21 70:11 71:5 94:25 looking (2) 16:7 49:21 Lorenzo (1) 9:21 losing (1) 33:25

Г

lost (1) 66:12	media (3) 10:15 34:22 94:9	81:24 86:16,18,19 90:4
lot (12) 6:8 25:13 32:16 34:10 39:9	median (1) 16:5	names (1) 68:6
40:24 53:14 54:2 62:6 63:8 77:4	medical (2) 92:11 94:4	Nancy (2) 3:10 62:25
87:14	Meera (1) 2:4	nation (1) 43:22
loud (2) 49:20 64:7	meeting (8) 4:7,20 11:22 18:18	navigate (2) 18:7 34:5
love (2) 17:6 88:17	87:7 96:4 97:5,11	nearly (3) 13:12 14:4,18
low (1) 55:7	member (3) 40:9,17 80:18	need (26) 4:25 23:10 31:12 32:14
lower (3) 15:8 19:18 57:16	members (3) 12:5 38:2 59:8	34:23,24,25 35:14 36:20 40:25
lowering (1) 39:8	mentioned (4) 35:6 50:2 77:13	43:12,16 44:13 57:22 58:4 61:9
LPEP (4) 25:12 29:18 64:18 65:7	82:2	61:17,18 62:4 67:23 71:15 75:23
Luby (2) 7:2,2	mentioning (1) 74:18	76:8 87:6,20 89:8
Luiz (1) 9:22	Mer (1) 67:25	needed (1) 66:11
luxuries (1) 26:9	Merette (3) 73:21 76:19 80:6 meter (8) 6:11 25:25 68:22 69:2,10	needs (2) 35:12 83:15 Neolos (4) 3:5 18:24 19:2,10
M	70:23,24 82:19	nervous (1) 87:12
ma'am (3) 70:14 71:8,23	Michael (2) 3:18 90:19	never (3) 56:13 63:9 73:7
Macton (1) 72:16	middle (1) 91:11	new (36) 1:3,23 7:21 8:22 12:24
Madam (1) 56:6	midtown (2) 63:20 64:13	13:4 16:16 17:10 18:4 19:4,19,19
Madame (2) 37:19 87:5	midway (1) 4:21	27:14 33:2,13,14 37:21,24 38:5
mail (2) 73:5,6	million (5) 8:14 17:22 38:23,25	39:10 40:4 42:4,20 47:8,8 50:18
majority (2) 38:12 77:21	56:9	52:6 58:20 62:20 63:2 73:25 74:4
making (3) 20:12 48:5 92:13	millions (1) 57:5	91:8 98:3,5,9
Malik (1) 68:4	mind (1) 77:10	newborn (1) 39:20
MAMARONECK (2) 1:22,23	minor (1) 63:12	news (1) 33:11
Mamdouh (2) 3:16 81:16	minutes (6) 4:13,14 18:16,17,22	newspaper (1) 57:3
manage (1) 5:7	37:6	nice (2) 6:7,9
management (3) 9:25 96:22,24	MIS (1) 9:22	night (1) 60:13
Manhattan (12) 1:13 14:10,14,16	MISCELLANEOUS (1) 3:12	nighttime (1) 59:4
14:21 16:18,22 41:25 66:5 71:25	misconduct (1) 42:7	nine (1) 88:19
72:6 81:19	mispronounced (1) 68:6	non-standing (2) 78:2,19
manner (2) 36:15 43:3	missed (1) 6:18	non-touch (1) 79:21
manual (2) 33:4,7	mistake (1) 37:10	Nora (1) 2:9
Manuel (2) 37:14,20	Mobarak (10) 3:16 67:24 81:6,15	normally (1) 87:18
manufacturer (1) 92:22	81:17 84:8,16 85:11,23 86:11	north (1) 69:8
map (1) 15:13	modify (1) 19:14	Notary (1) 98:8
maps (1) 78:20	Mohamed (1) 68:2	note (1) 37:4
March (2) 19:14 95:11	moment (2) 11:23 65:17	notes (2) 5:3 59:22
Marino (12) 37:5,7 56:3,13 57:2,15	money (8) 36:7 42:16 59:5,7,9 62:5	notice (1) 41:5
80:9 81:13 84:2,25 88:21 93:9	62:8 67:11	number (15) 7:20 16:15 22:9 41:6
Marion (1) 2:9	month (2) 7:19 89:12	43:25 55:13 57:8,16 62:11 66:17
marriage (1) 98:15 material (1) 89:11	months (1) 38:11 morning (10) 4:2,18 12:16 18:24	66:18 67:15 77:6 93:25 94:6 numbers (2) 17:13 55:9
material (1) 69.11 math (1) 16:14	23:12 37:17,18 41:17 62:24	NY (1) 3:8
matter (11) 11:4 30:22 32:10 34:16	73:23	NYC (1) 76:23
47:2,18 88:2 96:12 98:11,16,18	mother (2) 39:20 64:9	NYC.GOV/TLCFACTBOOK (1)
mayor (1) 41:20	motion (1) 53:16	18:8
MD (3) 3:14 68:3 72:15	move (8) 4:4 18:15,23 73:20 80:7	NYPD (6) 26:17 59:25 60:10 61:16
mean (10) 31:14 34:20 51:13 53:3	81:7 89:5 90:11	85:8,9
56:10 57:2,18 65:13 67:3 80:15	moving (3) 8:21 9:2 94:20	
meaning (1) 83:3	multiple (1) 88:15	0
meaningful (1) 56:24	Murray (1) 70:9	O'Laughlin (7) 90:19,20 92:10,19
means (1) 84:8	mutual (1) 24:5	93:23 94:13,24
mechanism (1) 28:3		O'Lauglin (1) 3:18
mechanisms (2) 36:6,21	N	OATH (8) 11:7,16,19 23:7,9 35:9
medallion (7) 13:15,19 14:9,22	name (20) 12:17 18:25 19:6 23:14	35:13 60:4
15:7 16:12 17:19	37:19,23 41:18 62:15 68:11	objecting (1) 29:21
medallions (2) 17:11,15	72:15,16 75:15,22 76:22 81:16	objection (3) 29:25 30:3,18
	l	l

objections (1) 30:17 obviously (1) 93:4 occurred (1) 16:25 occurs (1) 79:18 offender (1) 43:9 offenders (2) 42:25 44:7 offer (1) 62:10 office (8) 7:22 8:4 9:8,11,24 10:3 61:21,25 officer (2) 82:6,14 officers (1) 74:15 offices (3) 8:23 58:24 61:24 official (2) 7:8 37:20 okay (25) 32:3,4 41:14 57:24 61:23 63:25 66:8,20 68:10 69:9,13 70:14 71:8.22 72:7 74:16 77:16 82:23 85:13,23 86:12,16,21 90:6 90:18 old (3) 19:20,21,24 Omar (1) 12:12 once (3) 35:24 39:15 87:21 ones (2) 38:20 41:22 online (3) 8:21 9:3,4 open (10) 8:24,24 23:15 24:4 50:11 61:22,24,25 71:11 96:4 opened (1) 9:10 opening (2) 9:17 49:5 opens (1) 52:2 operating (1) 21:7 operations (1) 21:5 operator (2) 83:25 84:13 opportunity (3) 32:23 73:25 87:6 opposed (4) 38:10 40:3 78:13,16 opposition (1) 38:4 option (6) 10:11 67:10 91:14,15 92:20,24 optional (3) 10:10 89:17 92:14 options (1) 17:9 order (3) 25:21 31:10,11 original (6) 21:12 24:22 65:13 66:13 91:6 92:22 originate (2) 14:11 47:5 outcome (2) 96:18 98:17 outside (5) 16:17 59:20 74:7 75:5 76:11 over-regulation (5) 50:9,10,11 52:2.9 overall (2) 13:11 15:14 overcharge (1) 7:23 overcharges (1) 8:3 overflow (1) 7:12 owner (7) 21:25 72:15,18 73:4,12 82:11 87:10 owners (3) 3:7 23:18 77:20 ownerships (1) 19:6 Ρ

p.m (3) 96:9,10 97:12 package (5) 3:6 10:13 29:14 53:19 89:4 packed (1) 7:13 page (2) 3:3 22:17 paid (1) 16:12 Palucci (5) 3:4 11:25 12:14,16,18 papers (1) 69:12 Park (1) 69:7 parking (2) 81:9 84:21 part (6) 6:22 31:22 48:2,12 50:24 53:3 participate (1) 19:22 participation (1) 19:15 particular (3) 24:15 40:13 71:7 particularly (1) 15:24 parties (3) 34:4,25 98:16 partition (12) 89:23 90:18,24 91:7 91:8,18 92:9,21 93:5,11,17 94:7 partitions (10) 10:10 89:17 90:24 91:16,20 92:4,17 93:8,25 94:4 parturient (1) 39:16 passed (3) 16:10 20:10 52:5 passenger (13) 11:2 27:3,4,7 31:21 32:4,6 36:10,13 42:8 44:22 47:22 72:24 passenger's (1) 47:21 passengers (27) 10:17 14:10,24 15:3.4.9 16:10.22 17:12.25 23:23 24:10 25:24 28:17 38:7.21 39:2 44:24 56:9 59:20 60:14,14,21 73:9 75:5 93:18 94:17 passengers' (1) 91:4 passes (1) 95:24 passionate (1) 5:18 path (3) 42:9 48:15 49:12 patience (1) 6:2 pattern (1) 8:2 patterns (1) 13:3 pay (6) 40:11,12 52:20 68:19,20 71:12 payments (1) 5:24 PD (1) 55:10 Pedro (3) 3:8 37:16,23 penalize (1) 26:12 penalties (5) 22:4 26:19 27:8 32:12 96:14 penalty (9) 21:14,15 24:24 27:22 30:2 31:23 42:11 50:24 54:9 people (46) 4:25 7:13 9:2,5,8 11:5 11:20 20:15 23:9 28:10 35:6,16 35:21 42:16,20 43:4,19 44:2,10 45:14 50:17 51:7 52:3,5,7,17 53:14 54:16 57:5,8,10 59:20,20 60:12 64:3 67:16 68:20 70:5 77:4 77:19 81:5 90:23 91:10 93:7 95:5 95:7

people's (1) 92:8 perceived (1) 32:3 percent (12) 14:11,14,23 15:4,10 26:21,23 68:20 74:13,23 91:25 92:14 percentage (2) 15:8 55:8 percentages (1) 15:16 perception (2) 38:15 60:22 perfect (2) 6:21 74:24 perform (2) 17:21 91:3 performed (3) 13:23 14:4 96:25 period (1) 79:3 permissible (1) 77:25 permit (5) 19:15 42:23 72:17,18 87:10 permitted (1) 21:24 perpetrator (1) 27:2 person (13) 40:11,13 41:21 45:5 48:5 49:7 50:13,14 51:2,21 59:19 72:22 75:22 personal (1) 48:6 perspective (2) 47:21 76:15 phone (7) 35:10 62:11 68:25 77:24 78:17 81:9,11 phones (2) 8:24 78:13 pick (4) 14:9,14 65:18 73:9 picked (1) 20:24 picking (1) 21:4 pickup (11) 16:22 26:11 65:24 66:3 68:24 70:17 72:22,24 81:21 82:13.25 piece (3) 29:19 33:11 39:7 pilot (4) 10:6 16:14 19:13,14 place (11) 30:20 34:23 36:19,23 42:5 46:25 50:2,4 72:22,25 73:8 plan (1) 4:25 plastic (1) 91:9 please (7) 8:23 9:6 58:3 67:3 84:3 84:4 90:14 plunge (1) 7:8 point (13) 22:16,23 23:3 31:22,23 47:20 51:25 57:14 64:16 76:8,9 80:15 81:14 pointed (1) 51:19 Pointero (1) 12:12 points (3) 28:22 40:24 63:16 Polanco (2) 7:2,2 police (1) 74:14 policy (4) 5:15 12:2,9,18 population (1) 92:16 portable (2) 21:14 24:24 portraying (1) 39:4 position (4) 5:10 6:20 28:6 79:19 possible (3) 9:14 38:14 40:7 posted (2) 20:3 95:16 power (1) 64:12 practical (2) 29:3 53:4

practice (2) 38:5 82:4 pre-arraignment (3) 65:18 81:21 82:7 pre-arraignments (1) 65:5 pre-dispatched (1) 65:2 prearranged (5) 20:21,24 65:25 66:4,4 prearrangement (1) 82:13 precinct (1) 60:11 precious (1) 28:16 predecessors (1) 91:6 prepare (1) 61:22 prerequisite (1) 11:11 present (5) 2:3,11 11:13 12:20 60.6 presentation (4) 3:2 11:21 12:3,15 presented (2) 26:17 46:6 President (2) 37:24 63:2 press (2) 2:17 45:25 pressure (2) 49:3,3 presumed (2) 28:6 36:8 pretty (4) 15:13 42:13 63:14 77:11 prevent (4) 25:10,22 39:12 43:16 prevented (1) 93:19 preventing (1) 39:9 primarily (2) 14:10 85:9 prior (1) 9:12 probably (8) 4:13,21 39:19 47:15 49:4 64:6 67:9 81:5 problem (8) 36:16 42:9,13 43:13 45:5 47:3 70:20 75:9 problems (3) 62:13 87:14 93:15 proceedings (96) 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:10 98:13 process (13) 8:20,21 11:17 35:18 42:22 49:18 51:25 52:6,23 53:3 55:14 71:3 86:9 professional (2) 24:10 57:12 professionals (3) 75:17 92:11 94:5 profile (1) 92:6 program (3) 16:14 17:23 79:21 prohibit (3) 10:16 42:6 47:12

prohibiting (2) 23:2 27:5 prohibition (2) 53:21 72:5 project (3) 5:7 6:2 12:10 projects (2) 5:19 6:17 promoting (1) 78:12 pronounced (1) 16:21 proof (1) 35:2 proper (2) 34:24 36:15 properly (1) 36:20 property (2) 84:7,15 proposal (3) 10:6,9,17 proposed (11) 3:2,6 23:16 24:12 24:16,20 25:8 26:14 28:14 89:16 95:15 proposing (1) 78:10 prosecutions (2) 7:24 8:11 protect (7) 24:9 27:23 28:4,16 31:11,11 36:23 protecting (3) 23:24 28:17 33:9 protection (4) 7:25 27:18 61:15 62:9 protections (1) 27:5 proud (1) 6:22 prove (5) 28:8 34:3 35:3 36:5,12 proven (2) 43:2 92:23 provide (5) 21:22 23:8 27:4 67:12 83:21 provided (3) 44:18 55:10 92:12 provides (2) 20:23 79:5 providing (4) 21:12 27:17 51:11 80:13 provision (2) 61:6 80:20 provisions (4) 19:17 20:20 53:17 53:24 provoking (1) 59:14 public (15) 2:16 4:20 27:18 31:11 33:10 36:24 47:23 48:8 53:3 55:3 67:5 75:8.9 88:4 98:8 published (1) 95:10 publishing (1) 75:8 pull (1) 81:5 pulling (2) 29:14 78:14 punish (2) 38:5 47:12 punished (1) 48:19 Purpose (1) 22:18 push (1) 69:2 put (9) 12:5 17:16 26:19 34:15 36:23 38:4 58:15 68:22 91:11 putting (5) 31:5,9 33:16 34:18 36:3 Q

quantity (2) 38:21 74:22 quarter (1) 14:5 Queens (3) 14:17,21 15:19 question (6) 10:25 29:20 45:21 56:4 77:9 80:10 questions (3) 11:14 67:3 77:10 quick (3) 22:13 57:14 80:10 quickly (1) 5:8 quite (2) 64:12 93:10 quoted (1) 55:6

R

raise (3) 11:5 29:2 75:21 raised (5) 32:21 54:14 59:23 61:4 89:14 raising (1) 85:20 Ramirez (2) 41:12,12 rape (2) 57:19 61:11 rapid (1) 39:18 rate (3) 39:8 74:14 78:2 Rausen (1) 5:5 Ray (1) 8:10 reach (4) 17:18 68:15,15 88:17 reaching (1) 9:7 read (8) 22:18 47:25 48:2 64:7 65:12 67:2,17 84:17 ready (2) 95:19 97:4 real (2) 61:12 71:17 reality (1) 74:6 really (10) 6:6 10:2 12:19,21 18:5 29:16 44:22 45:8 65:6 67:6 realm (1) 56:18 realty (1) 74:7 reason (2) 34:14 45:3 reasons (1) 38:16 receive (2) 64:21 82:24 received (1) 95:13 recess (1) 4:22 recommendations (1) 24:17 reconsider (2) 28:14 29:15 reconvene (1) 4:7 record (3) 37:5 95:11 98:12 recorded (1) 35:3 redrafting (1) 22:23 reduce (2) 93:24 96:23 refer (1) 11:15 reflect (2) 22:23 75:23 reflective (1) 93:6 regarding (4) 20:13 21:4 26:14 79:14 registered (3) 74:11,12,21 registration (2) 21:12 87:22 regular (4) 4:7 11:22 33:8 86:6 regulation (15) 30:19 34:11 38:5 39:4 40:4,18 42:4,10 44:21 45:11 48:25 50:18 58:20 72:23 73:11 regulations (8) 26:5 33:2 34:23 39:10,21 42:6 52:22 58:21 related (1) 98:15 relates (2) 46:13,18 relating (2) 21:14,16 relation (1) 38:21 relationship (2) 24:3 48:4

relevant (1) 70:2 relocations (1) 19:6 rely (1) 23:25 remainder (1) 15:19 remains (1) 22:8 remedy (2) 31:9 43:11 remember (4) 42:19 75:7 80:6 91:23 remind (1) 69:2 removal (1) 50:6 remove (2) 21:17,20 removing (1) 24:25 renewals (2) 8:21 19:5 repeatedly (1) 43:2 report (2) 60:11 96:5 reported (4) 2:21 59:11 74:17 98:10 Reporter (1) 98:8 reporting (3) 1:22 26:25 75:6 reports (2) 84:6,14 represent (1) 15:11 representations (1) 75:13 represented (3) 13:22 14:3 15:23 reputation (2) 45:7,13 request (3) 11:12 60:5 79:9 requesting (1) 73:10 require (2) 21:8 35:8 required (3) 17:16 35:11 91:11 requirement (6) 21:17.20 24:23 25:2 46:15 92:15 requirements (1) 33:13 requires (2) 20:2 95:14 requiring (1) 96:21 reset (1) 6:11 resolution (1) 19:12 resolve (1) 42:9 respect (2) 24:5 50:15 respondent (2) 96:25 97:2 responding (2) 32:25 34:21 response (2) 84:12 93:3 rest (2) 14:20 53:19 restitution (3) 8:5,15 83:3 restricted (1) 63:20 retaliation (1) 45:2 rethinking (1) 74:8 retired (1) 9:15 return (1) 96:2 Reverend (15) 3:9 41:15,17,18 45:22 46:24 48:11 50:8,25 51:5 51:24 52:15,19 53:6,11 revocation (1) 4:5 revoke (1) 27:11 revoked (2) 96:16 97:3 rewrite (1) 64:6 Reynoso (10) 3:10 62:24,25 63:25 64:8,15,22 66:7,18,20 ribbon (1) 9:18

ride (1) 55:5 rides (3) 3:18 16:13 90:20 riding (2) 47:22 48:8 right (21) 29:10 35:16 38:14 44:11 46:10 51:20 55:22 59:5 65:16 68:17 69:3,4 70:25 72:12 80:2 82:12 83:17 86:25 90:13 94:12 94:20 rights (3) 28:18 48:20 83:14 risk (1) 78:15 Rivera (1) 9:24 road (1) 17:12 Rodney (1) 12:8 Rodriguez (1) 9:24 room (5) 1:12 51:22 76:19 80:7 94:8 rooms (1) 7:12 rose (2) 5:10 13:9 Ross (1) 8:9 Roth (1) 12:7 roughly (1) 15:10 rule (58) 10:14 11:19 20:17,22 22:10,14,22,24 26:14 28:14 29:22,24 30:9,14,20 31:22,24 46:5,20,23,25 47:24 50:2,4,6 52:13 54:8,17,21 61:20 65:13,19 65:22 66:2 72:23 76:3 77:21 78:9 78:23 79:4,12,23,25 84:16 89:3 89:10.15.16.23.24 90:12 91:7 92:25 93:12 95:3,14,15,24 rules (36) 3:6 10:16 11:16 16:10 20:12,13 21:8 23:7,9,16 24:16 25:9 27:4,23 32:11,13,19 35:9 36:19 47:10 49:8 52:24.25 60:4 67:2 70:2 77:12 78:10 83:20 85:19 86:24 87:23 88:3 90:18 92:20 95:10 S sadly (2) 27:25,25 safe (2) 23:22 92:23 safely (1) 79:6 safer (1) 91:16 Salgado (15) 3:9 41:16,17,19 45:22 46:24 48:11 50:8,25 51:5 51:24 52:15,19 53:6,11 Saline (1) 12:13 sample (1) 77:19 saved (1) 39:14 saying (3) 59:16 65:19 75:8 says (8) 53:21 59:4 61:23 65:12 70:20 74:17 75:18 84:17 Scanlon (1) 8:10 schedule (1) 89:3 scheduled (1) 89:4 screen (3) 17:5 18:9 68:21 se (1) 48:7

seat (1) 50:17 second (6) 6:3 13:25 29:19 39:6 54:13 60:2 seconds (1) 58:23 section (6) 21:16 22:2 24:24 29:15 53:20 60:4 sections (2) 21:14 55:24 sectors (1) 15:25 securities (1) 66:16 security (6) 21:11,13 24:22 39:7 66:11.14 see (13) 25:17 39:10 44:25 45:23 58:17 68:17 69:10 85:21 87:8,14 90:4 91:22 94:7 seen (1) 39:16 sees (1) 83:11 send (1) 83:13 sense (1) 27:17 sent (2) 20:5 95:17 separate (1) 61:19 serious (2) 57:21 63:14 seriously (2) 54:10 71:20 serve (3) 10:21 17:25 31:24 served (2) 17:24 44:2 service (5) 14:15 17:17 19:25 27:7 65:2 **SERVICES (1)** 1:22 serving (1) 44:16 session (8) 4:4,12,15,22 96:2,5,8 96:12 set (4) 66:21 77:19 96:15 98:20 settlement (2) 8:5 71:2 settlements (2) 7:20 8:16 seven (1) 7:4 sexual (32) 10:19 22:4,4 23:4 26:15,16,22 29:24 38:6,17,24 40:2,14 42:8,25 43:8 44:7 46:7 46:19 47:25 53:24 56:14.22 63:4 63:13 74:8 75:18 81:18,25 83:5,7 89:9 Shams (1) 67:25 share (1) 60:3 shared (1) 5:24 sharing (1) 76:15 shepherding (1) 5:13 Sherif (1) 12:13 Sherry (1) 8:9 shift (1) 60:13 SHL (6) 13:15 14:14 25:11,22 26:2 26:8 SHLs (6) 14:25 16:12 17:8,11 65:14,14 short (2) 38:15 79:13 shortly (1) 96:7 show (1) 79:7 showed (1) 6:10 showing (1) 15:14

	I
shown (1) 15:7	S
shows (4) 13:13 16:15,24 17:6	s
shy (1) 9:6	S
side (2) 50:16 82:16	S
Sideris (11) 3:15 67:25 76:21,23	S
77:2,3,8,16 79:12,22 80:2	S
signed (1) 67:16	S
significant (1) 38:20	s
significantly (1) 27:15	s
silent (2) 69:10,17	S
	3
simple (1) 34:14	
simplify (1) 21:13	S
simplifying (1) 24:23	
simply (2) 11:3 31:7	S
sincerely (1) 36:18	s
single (1) 6:16	S
sir (3) 45:21 73:2 87:25	S
Sirin (9) 3:17 86:15,16,18,19,25	S
87:4 88:19,25	S
sit (1) 82:22	S
sites (1) 23:8	S
sitting (1) 50:15	s
situation (15) 26:2,7 58:16,18 60:9	s
60:11 75:9 76:9 77:24 80:11,13	s
80:21,23 83:11 90:16	S
situations (2) 31:20 39:25	
slide (2) 13:13 15:7	S
small (4) 5:7 17:5 18:5 23:24	S
snapshot (1) 18:5	S
social (10) 21:11,13 24:22 44:6	s
52:10 66:10,13,16 93:18,20	s
society (1) 40:10	_
solver (1) 43:13	
somebody (9) 48:19 55:6 68:13	s
69:5,11 83:8 88:9,15 90:3	S
soon (1) 4:24	S
sorely (1) 6:17	S
sorry (4) 45:23 50:21 87:11 89:21	S
sort (2) 53:18 89:12	S
sounded (1) 64:8	S
sounds (2) 29:20 84:25	S
speak (15) 29:12 41:15 67:16,23	S
68:8 69:14,15 71:6 76:20 85:8,17	S
88:19 89:20 90:8,17	S
speaker (14) 37:14,16 41:8,11	S
45:18 57:25 67:18,19 75:25 80:8	S
86:13 89:20,24 90:7	S
speakers (12) 3:6,12 22:9 41:6	S
46:3,4 56:5,8 62:19 67:24 73:16	s
89:18	S
speaking (1) 89:22	
	S
spearheaded (1) 8:10	S
specialist (1) 87:13	S
specific (2) 11:16 47:24	S
specifically (4) 26:3 30:12 46:18	
78:6	S
specifications (1) 5:12	S
- • •	

peech (1) 58:13 pending (1) 67:9 pot (1) 88:6 pread (2) 14:15,20 quare (1) 9:12 s (1) 98:4 staff (3) 2:15 9:20 12:5 tandards (1) 56:21 tanding (4) 78:21 81:10,11 84:22 tart (8) 4:12,19 5:2 11:22 22:13 43:7 56:16 68:24 tate (8) 7:21 20:23 42:21 47:8 52:6 78:24 98:3,9 tated (3) 47:24 78:24 79:23 tatement (2) 22:17 79:4 taten (1) 9:10 tatistic (1) 39:3 tatistics (2) 38:17 56:25 tats (1) 56:17 tay (2) 8:18 69:24 taying (1) 30:15 TENO-KATH (1) 1:22 tenokath@verizon.net (1) 1:24 tep (2) 94:11,15 top (6) 63:4 64:13 70:16 73:11 78:14 82:18 topped (1) 78:14 torm (1) 5:9 stranded (1) 9:2 streamlining (1) 8:20 street (14) 1:11 13:15 15:2 20:19 21:2 26:4,12 29:6 53:22 63:18 64:10 66:6 82:15,16 trength (1) 7:15 strongly (1) 27:13 structural (1) 90:25 truggling (2) 49:14,25 stuff (1) 86:2 ityles (1) 12:8 ubject (2) 21:23 85:6 uccess (1) 85:24 uccessful (1) 86:4 udden (1) 43:6 sufficient (1) 78:20 suggest (3) 45:8 83:7 89:5 uggesting (1) 43:14 uggestions (1) 86:8 ultan (1) 68:3 ummarily (1) 51:15 ummary (1) 33:17 ummons (3) 34:12 69:19 70:11 ummonses (2) 75:5,11 supervisor (1) 19:2 support (7) 24:8,19 25:6 26:18 27:17 40:19 93:21 upportive (1) 90:22 uppose (1) 35:18

sure (21) 11:20 17:4 23:10 29:17 35:13 39:21 42:13 44:20 45:22 45:22 47:13 51:23 55:3 69:7.8 71:5,16 75:25 90:2,5,10 surgeons (1) 91:9 Susan (1) 41:14 suspend (3) 50:23 60:25 96:20 suspended (10) 21:10,18 24:21 36:11,14 50:19,23 51:10,16 60:19 suspensions (2) 21:19 27:9 sustain (1) 38:8 Switzer (1) 10:2 sworn (1) 35:11 system (7) 34:6 36:22 45:2 49:6 64:18,18,25 systems (1) 25:14 т table (2) 61:5 64:20 tabling (1) 76:3 take (23) 10:11 11:2 21:19 24:13 30:16 48:16 52:4,21 53:25 59:13 67:14 69:7 70:11 71:19 73:19 76:3 77:9,18 79:4 87:18 90:4 94:15,21 taken (4) 54:9 57:20 65:20 86:8 talk (9) 12:25 46:4 58:12 63:5,16 72:11.19 81:15.18 talking (2) 50:13 56:17 target (1) 54:21 targets (1) 26:2 tariff (1) 40:12 task (1) 12:7 **TAUNY (1)** 41:14 taxi (41) 1:4 5:8,21 16:19 19:13,17 22:21 38:6,12,18 39:14,22 40:15 41:23 42:3 44:11 45:14 47:13 59:8,11 60:23 62:19 68:13 70:6 71:25 73:25 74:7 75:15 76:10 78:4,15 87:8,9,12,13,14,15,19 88:16 91:8 95:9 Taxicab (1) 37:25 taxicabs (1) 10:8 taxis (13) 5:13,14,17 13:19 14:9,22 15:8 16:12 17:7 56:14 63:2 91:21 92:2 Taxistas (1) 3:8 teacher (1) 87:11 team (2) 9:23 12:10 techie (1) 6:19 technical (1) 20:12 technology (3) 5:8,12 78:3 telephone (2) 35:3 81:3 tell (7) 68:17 69:6 70:23 71:10 82:22 83:12,14 ten (4) 33:7,20 71:13 87:24

term (1) 66:13 testament (2) 7:14 57:10 tested (1) 91:17 testified (1) 94:5 testify (2) 23:17 55:21 testimony (5) 40:23 77:3,7 86:23 92:12 thank (50) 4:14 9:19 10:3 12:4 18:3 18:12,13 19:10 20:9 28:20,21 37:2,13 40:20,22 41:4 45:15,17 53:11 56:2 62:14,15,16,17,18 66:21,23 72:7,8,10,18 73:13,14 74:2 76:7,13,16 77:16 80:2,4,5 86:11,12 87:4,5 88:25 89:2 94:24 95:3 97:10 thanked (1) 6:2 thanks (3) 8:8 66:8 73:24 Thea (1) 11:25 Theadora (3) 3:4 12:14,17 theirs (1) 58:7 thing (7) 11:4 54:13 58:14 74:15 78:22 87:16 95:4 things (11) 33:5,7,19,21 34:20 38:13 46:5 61:3 63:12 74:10,10 think (45) 9:3 15:12 29:2,12 31:7 32:2,22 35:5,6 36:16 39:5 40:23 46:6,12 48:7 54:4,6 55:12 56:23 57:21.22 58:20 59:23 60:22 61:2 63:23 64:5.11.23 65:7 66:21 69:25 80:25 85:15 87:6 89:8 91:5 91:9,22 92:15 93:7,12,12,21 94:10 third (2) 7:20 39:13 Thomas (1) 9:22 threat (2) 84:6,14 threatening (1) 27:6 three (8) 8:16 16:7 46:3,4 59:16 73:15 74:9,10 Thursday (1) 1:10 ticket (6) 73:4,5,11 82:11,20,25 tickets (11) 62:6 69:16 81:8,10 82:4,5,8,24 83:2 85:10,12 time (18) 4:3,19 5:11 6:4,8 18:3 22:7 24:7,11 25:4 36:15 38:16 41:10 54:2 57:22 67:12 81:3 89:12 times (2) 34:10 71:13 Tintin (1) 72:17 tiny (1) 5:24 tips (1) 93:20 TLC (38) 9:20 10:16 11:24 12:19 12:20 13:8,11 15:17 16:11 20:4 20:13 35:11 42:24 43:7 60:18 62:5 65:8 70:15 72:14,23 74:22 78:10 79:5 82:5,14 83:2,9,11 85:10,11,11 87:10,21 88:5 94:6 95:16 96:13,19

today (18) 7:3 10:5,16 11:23 16:8 19:3 29:14 37:11 53:9 55:23 56:7 58:17 61:4 70:3.8 76:4 79:25 95:12 today's (1) 29:23 told (1) 73:8 tomorrow (2) 92:2 95:9 tools (1) 27:20 top (7) 13:18,25 14:17 15:14,25 33:7,20 topics (1) 12:24 total (2) 17:21 38:3 touching (1) 39:24 traditional (3) 13:18 14:2,18 traffic (1) 69:3 train (2) 15:9 37:12 trained (1) 32:15 training (3) 27:19 33:15,24 transcript (2) 1:2 98:12 transfer (1) 57:5 transition (1) 9:5 translation (1) 75:25 transportation (1) 23:23 transported (4) 14:23 15:3,8,10 trap (2) 82:15,20 travel (1) 57:9 travelling (2) 25:22 81:19 trend (2) 16:19 93:6 trends (1) 13:3 trial (2) 83:12.13 tried (1) 44:23 trip (3) 5:22 14:7 21:6 trips (18) 13:14,20,24 14:5,11,19 14:20 16:16,19,24,25 17:3,22,24 20:21,24 21:4 25:24 Tristate (1) 15:20 trouble (3) 5:23 59:10 67:2 true (7) 7:14 12:6 36:4 71:12,24 74:6 98:12 truly (1) 54:14 trust (1) 49:17 truth (3) 32:9,24 49:16 try (4) 44:24 49:6 62:2 82:14 trying (2) 88:7,8 tuned (1) 8:18 Tunnel (1) 72:3 turn (3) 21:18 69:3,4 twice (1) 39:15 two (21) 4:5 13:6 19:4,24 21:25 28:22 34:25 53:16 54:4 55:24 58:23 59:22 62:19 72:20 73:3 78:15 81:8,10 82:8 85:12 96:3 two-page (1) 33:16 two-year (2) 16:13 19:21 type (3) 48:4,6 80:16 types (1) 55:8

U unable (1) 16:21 unacceptable (1) 27:16 unanimously (2) 18:22 20:10 unattended (1) 5:20 unauthorized (3) 72:22,24 73:8 unaware (1) 34:13 unchanged (2) 65:23 95:15 uncomfortable (1) 55:4 unconstitutional (1) 63:21 uncovered (1) 8:2 undecided (1) 46:11 understand (13) 30:11 31:19,25 34:17 35:20 36:3,18 47:14 48:15 50:14 54:18 86:22 91:14 understandable (1) 55:18 understanding (1) 40:4 understands (1) 54:22 understood (2) 11:20 63:3 unfair (1) 28:5 unfairly (1) 27:24 unfortunate (1) 32:15 union (1) 41:24 unit (4) 8:2 19:3 61:15 62:9 United (1) 90:20 unjust (1) 40:5 unlawfully (1) 83:22 Unlimited (1) 3:18 unrespectable (1) 60:16 unsafe (1) 91:20 unwanted (4) 10:19 26:16 29:24 54:20 update (1) 76:5 UPDATES (1) 3:2 upper (1) 14:16 ups (1) 14:14 urge (1) 28:13 use (19) 6:7 16:10 17:13 52:21 72:2 77:23 78:11,12,18,25 79:6 79:15 84:10,10,18,20 89:12 90:23 91:15

valid (1) 22:8 variety (2) 31:20 89:6 various (1) 19:5 vast (1) 9:11 vehicle (12) 13:4,17 19:13 21:21 21:21,22,23 24:20 91:2,12 94:18 95:8 vehicle's (1) 25:2 vehicle-year (1) 19:24 vehicles (15) 10:8 13:8,17 17:17 17:21 19:16,22,23 25:3 29:7,9 55:11 57:9 91:16 92:3 venue (1) 55:4 verge (1) 33:25

V

West (3) 20:25 66:6 82:16

wheelchair (9) 10:7 17:16,19

Verifying (1) 25:19 versus (3) 19:20 96:13,19 Vice (1) 63:2 Vicky (3) 2:21 98:7,24 victim (3) 30:23 31:15 45:6 victimized (1) 27:24 victims (1) 94:6 Victor (1) 9:24 video (1) 79:5 violate (1) 10:23 violated (2) 34:11 36:9 violation (1) 78:17 violations (2) 22:2 78:16 violence (1) 57:19 violent (1) 57:19 vocally (1) 66:15 voice (2) 75:13 79:21 voices (1) 34:9 volume (1) 18:7 vote (3) 89:5,11 95:20 vulnerable (2) 28:5 41:22 w wait (2) 67:5 87:23 waivers (1) 95:6 walk (2) 65:17 88:7 walked (1) 46:2 Walsh (2) 88:6,10 want (29) 8:8,25 12:4 22:12 28:3 29:16 32:4 34:15 38:3 55:2,20 57:13 58:14,14 59:7,10,21 60:7 61:7 63:15 64:14 66:24 74:2,10 75:24 77:13 81:15 85:23 90:21 wanted (4) 11:19 20:14 74:9 83:19 wanting (2) 40:11,12 wants (4) 60:16 67:2 68:14 71:18 watch (1) 9:17 way (15) 29:4 43:5 44:25 47:17 48:22 51:7 53:25 65:9,20 71:4 78:23 91:2 94:14 95:5 98:17 ways (1) 47:15 we'll (11) 4:11 8:19 18:15,23 55:21 70:10 91:13,15 94:21 95:25 96:4 we're (30) 4:3,19 6:18,22 7:7 8:17 8:24 11:15 23:8 33:15 50:13 54:23 56:17 59:24 60:3 61:5,20 63:3 65:7 66:10,21 67:11 71:2,17 76:2 85:7,20 88:3 90:10,22 we've (16) 7:20 8:16 18:6 24:2 33:6 54:3,24 57:16 61:2,7 70:4 77:3 86:8,22 89:7,25 website (5) 6:20 11:25 20:4 33:19 95:16 week (1) 77:18 weeks (1) 7:11

welcome (2) 31:3 41:3

went (2) 70:15,25

87:13

19:16 87:10.12 91:24 92:3 95:8 wheelchairs (1) 17:13 WHEREOF (1) 98:19 willing (1) 9:9 Wilson (33) 2:12 19:7,11 20:9 22:22 37:4,13 41:5 45:18 57:24 62:18 65:22 67:15 68:10 73:2,15 76:18,25 79:11,24 80:5,22 83:19 84:5,9,23 86:12 87:25 88:8 95:3 95:25 96:11 97:9 window (3) 69:6,12 87:21 wisdom (1) 7:18 wish (1) 76:20 withdraw (5) 40:18 53:17 55:23 56:7 64:4 within-entitled (1) 98:11 witness (10) 11:6,8,12 35:8,14 60:5 83:15,16,18 98:19 witnesses (1) 23:6 woman (4) 39:25 59:2,13 60:14 women (2) 39:16,18 wondering (1) 74:13 word (2) 11:2 40:10 work (10) 36:11 42:11 43:7 50:20 51:7,14 57:12 65:4,8 68:21 worked (2) 30:20 70:9 working (13) 23:24 24:3 28:15 34:7 38:2 41:23 42:17 44:11 52:4 52:8 60:13 74:7 82:19 workplace (2) 28:19,19 world (1) 15:12 worth (1) 8:14 worthy (2) 29:13 61:4 wouldn't (4) 11:17 32:4 50:20,23 Wow (1) 88:21 written (3) 29:5 78:23 95:12 wrong (1) 70:17

Х Y

Yeah (3) 37:7 64:8,15 year (10) 5:21 15:6 17:2,15 19:20 56:9 74:25 75:3,3 78:4 years (10) 5:6 7:4 13:5 24:2 30:21 34:7 52:8 59:16 92:18 93:11 yellow (6) 5:13,17 13:15 17:5,15 yellows (1) 93:19 York (19) 1:3,23 7:21 13:4 16:16 17:10 37:21,24 42:20 47:8,8 52:6 62:20 63:2 74:2,5 98:3,5,9 York's (1) 91:8

younger (1) 16:3

	• •
Ζ	
Zahirul (3) 3:14 68:3 72:15	
Zakoutt (1) 96:13	
zero (1) 96:23	
zone (10) 20:18 22:20 25:7,16,23	3
26:12 66:5 78:2 82:9,18	
zones (2) 63:20 78:21	
0	
0.0066 (1) 74:23	
000866-1 (1) 98:25	
01543 (1) 1:23	
4	
1	
1 (3) 15:4 26:23 43:25	
1,000 (1) 27:9	
1,275 (1) 17:11	
10 (3) 37:6 70:18 74:11	
10,500 (1) 19:20	
10:30 (2) 4:17,19	
109 (2) 82:15,15	
1 09th (1) 69:23	
11 (2) 19:5 37:6	
110th (3) 21:2 68:14 69:24	
12 (2) 3:4 15:10	
12,000 (1) 23:20	
12:15 (1) 96:9	
12:35 (1) 96:9	
12:33 (1) 90:9	
21st (1) 69:7	
1 22 (1) 3:11	
25th (1) 70:18	
129,000 (1) 13:12	
13 (1) 19:4	
130 (1) 66:6	
139 (1) 1:22	
14 (4) 38:24 56:10,12 74:12	
14,000 (1) 19:19	
144,000 (1) 13:12	
146,000 (1) 13:24	
15 (3) 4:13,13 77:19	
150 (1) 75:4	
150,000 (1) 74:21	
67 (1) 15:11	
18 (1) 3:5	
183rd (1) 58:25	
18th (2) 20:4 95:17	
19506 (1) 22:2	
19TH (1) 1:12	
2	
2 (1) 22:17	
2,050 (1) 96:16	
20 (3) 4:14 14:23 34:7	
20-something (1) 68:23	
200 (1) 23:19 2014 (8) 12:23 13:5 10 21 14:8 2:	n

2014 (8) 12:23 13:5,10,21 14:8,22