1   --X

2   NEW YORK CITY

3   TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION

4   PUBLIC MEETING

5   --X

6   33 Beaver Street
                                         New York, New York
7
                                         September 13, 2023
8   10:02 a.m.

9

10

11   H E L D   B E F O R E :

12   DAVID DO - Chair/Commissioner

13   SHERRYL ELUTO - General Counsel

14

15
      BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS:
16

17   COMMISSIONER PAUL BADER

18   COMMISSIONER KENNETH CHAN

19   COMMISSIONER SARAH KAUFMAN

20   COMMISSIONER THOMAS SORRENTINO

21   COMMISSIONER ELISA VELAZQUEZ

22

23

24   Sabrina Brown Stewart,
      Court Reporter
25

                   LH Reporting Services, Inc.
                   Computer-Aided Transcription
                        (718)526-7100

1   S P E A K E R S:

2

3   CAROLYN WOLPERT - Deputy General Counsel, TLC

4   FABIAN CANCEL - Director of Base and Business

5   Services

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1   CHAIR DO: Good morning, everyone. My

2   name is David Do, Commissioner and the Chair

3   of the Taxi and Limousine Commission. The

4   time is now 10:03, and I'm calling this

5   meeting to order.

6   I'm joined today by our three new board

7   of commissioners; Commissioner Bader,

8   Commissioner Chan, and Commissioner Kaufman,

9   welcome to our board. I also want to thank

10   Commissioner Sorrentino for his continued

11   service and his reappointment. And, of

12   course, we have Commissioner Velazquez here

13   as well.

14   Before we get into today's agenda

15   items, I'd like to remind everyone that a

16   week from today, on September 20th, we will

17   be hearing public comments on our proposed

18   Green Rides rules, which will require our

19   high-volume fleet to be zero-emissions or

20   wheelchair accessible by 2030.

21   The initiative represents the

22   meaningful commitment to sustainability and

23   accessibility by New York City. TLC's fleet

24   is responsible for an estimated 600,000

25   metric tons of carbon emissions each year,

1   the majority of it coming from our rideshare

2   vehicles. And Green Rides has saved drivers

3   about 40 percent in fuel and maintenance

4   cost. Uber and Lyft have already committed

5   to their own, and this would formalize a

6   measured and gradual approach. And I

7   emphasize "gradual" because we're talking

8   about small steps over a six-year period.

9   We saw tremendous interest in EVs back

10   in March. The market is evolving rapidly,

11   and we would like to hear your comments and

12   ideas. So, please join us on Wednesday to

13   make yourself heard.

14   I'm also excited to announce that we

15   have completed our Flex Fare pilot evaluation

16   report, which has been sent to our

17   commissioners and will be posted on our

18   website.

19   The Flex Fare pilot allow licensed taxi

20   E-Hail apps to charge upfront fees, fares, to

21   passengers, allowing taxi passengers to get

22   the same kind of price enjoyed by FHV

23   passengers. We are busy putting together the

24   rules consistent with the report's

25   conclusions, and look forward to presenting

1   on the report and the rules at our future

2   hearing.

3   Today, we're voting on two rule

4   proposals. The first rule proposal would

5   allow for a broader range of cameras in

6   taxis, SHLs, and all for-hire vehicles. And

7   the rules would remove the requirement for

8   partitions and cameras in livery vehicles.

9   The second rule proposal establishes a

10   short-term for-hire vehicle storage program.

11   FHV licenses could be placed in storage once

12   during the two-year licensed period. We had

13   originally proposed a 60-day period, but

14   after listening to public testimony, we

15   extended this to 90 days, in the final

16   version.

17   Now, before I begin, I would like to

18   turn it over to any of our commissioners for

19   any comments this morning, especially our new

20   commissioners.

21   Commissioner Bader, this is your first

22   in-person meeting. Do you want to say a few

23   words?

24   COMMISSIONER BADER: Good morning,

25   Mr. Chair, fellow commissioners. It's a

1   pleasure to be selected to serve as a member

2   of this Commission. The responsibilities

3   that we have affect millions of people who

4   both work in the industry and who are served

5   by the industry, and I look forward to

6   working with fellow commissioners, the staff,

7   and interested parties throughout the City,

8   to ensure the protection and the best service

9   we can provide to our taxi riding public and

10   the hundreds of thousands of people who are

11   employed in the industry.

12   Thank you.

13   CHAIR DO: Thank you so much,

14   Commissioner Bader.

15   Commissioner Chan.

16   COMMISSIONER CHAN: Thank you, Chair

17   Do, and fellow commissioners.

18   It is my privilege and honor to serve

19   as commissioner on the New York City Taxi and

20   Limousine Commission. It is -- as Mister --

21   as Commissioner Bader has mentioned, this is

22   a role that comes with responsibilities. I

23   look forward to working with my fellow

24   commissioners and all stakeholders, to make

25   for-hire vehicles work efficiently, and be

1   accessible to the riding public.

2   Thank you.

3   CHAIR DO: Thank you so much,

4   Commissioner.

5   Commissioner Kaufman.

6   COMMISSIONER KAUFMAN: Thank you,

7   Commissioner, and hello to fellow

8   commissioners.

9   And as Commissioner Chan and Bader

10   said, I take this -- I am honored and

11   privileged to serve as a commissioner here on

12   the Taxi and Limousine Commission, to serve

13   the riders and drivers and everyone employed

14   by this industry, and I take the gravity of

15   this role very seriously. And I'm looking

16   forward to diving into the issues and helping

17   New Yorkers get around sustainably and

18   innovatively, and to serve all New Yorkers.

19   Thank you.

20   CHAIR DO: Thank you so much,

21   Commissioner.

22   And Commissioner Sorrentino, we're

23   really excited about your reappointment.

24   Would you have a couple of words?

25   COMMISSIONER SORRENTINO: Yes.

1   Good morning all. I would like to

2   first welcome our new commissioners. I look

3   forward to working with you all, and I look

4   forward to working with the Chair and the

5   staff of the TLC as we go forward and along

6   with the existing commissioners as well. So,

7   thank you, and I look forward to

8   collaborating together.

9   Thank you.

10   CHAIR DO: All right. And last, but

11   not least, a familiar face, that she has

12   continued to work with us, and we're very

13   excited for your continued support.

14   Commissioner Velazquez.

15   COMMISSIONER VELAZQUEZ: Hi, everyone.

16   I just want to say welcome to our new

17   commissioners and our returning commissioner.

18   I am really -- I'm honored to be on the

19   board. I think we do a lot of good work, and

20   I really look forward to working with all of

21   you and working for everybody that we serve.

22   Thank you.

23   CHAIR DO: Thank you, Commissioner.

24   And now, I would like to introduce a

25   special guest of ours. Our deputy general

```
 1              counsel will lead us to the agenda today,

 2       Carolyn Wolpert.

 3              MS. WOLPERT:  Thank you, Commissioner

 4       Do.

 5              Commissioners, the first item before

 6       you are the minutes for the May 3, 2023

 7       meeting.  I'll call a vote now to adopt those

 8       minutes.

 9              All in favor of adopting the minutes

10       from the May 3rd Commission meeting, please

11       raise your hands.

12              (All hands raised.)

13              MS. WOLPERT:  The minutes are adopted

14       unanimously.  Thank you.

15              I will now call on director of Base and

16       Business Services, Fabian Cancel, to present

17       the Base License Application.

18              MR. CANCEL:  Good morning,

19       Commissioners and attendees.  My name is

20       Fabian Cancel.  I'm the director of the TLC

21       Base and Business Licensing Unit.

22              Twenty-five bases have been submitted

23       for your review, and we are awaiting your

24       approval.

25              MS. WOLPERT:  Commissioners, can we
```

1   have a vote on adopting the Base License

2   recommendations.

3   All in favor of adopting the Base

4   License recommendation, please raise your

5   hands.

6   (All hands raised.)

7   MS. WOLPERT: The motion is adopted

8   unanimously.

9   Thank you.

10   MR. CANCEL: Thank you.

11   MS. WOLPERT: Commissioners, we will

12   now turn to Item 5 on the agenda, the

13   in-vehicle camera specifications rule

14   proposal package. The proposed rules were

15   published in the City Record on July 10,

16   2023, for public comment. A public hearing

17   was held by the TLC on August 9, 2023. On

18   September 8th, the final version of the

19   proposed rule was posted on our website and

20   circulated to the commissioners, along with

21   the hearing transcript and all of the written

22   comments that were received.

23   Commissioners, may we move for a vote.

24   All those in favor of adopting the rule as

25   amended, please raise your hand.

1   (All hands raised.)

2   MS. WOLPERT: The rule is adopted

3   unanimously.

4   Commissioners, we now turn to our last

5   item, Item 6 on the agenda, the short-term

6   for-hire vehicle storage program rule

7   proposal package.

8   The proposed rules were published in

9   the City Record on July 20, 2023, for public

10   comments. A public hearing was held by the

11   TLC on August 23, 2023. On September 8th,

12   the final version of the proposed rule was

13   posted on our website and circulated to the

14   commissioners, along with the hearing

15   transcript and all written comments that were

16   received.

17   Commissioners, may we move for a vote.

18   All those in favor of adopting the rule as

19   amended, please raise your hand.

20   (All hands raised.)

21   MS. WOLPERT: The rule is adopted

22   unanimously.

23   Commissioner Do, do we have any

24   additional business?

25   CHAIR DO: Thank you so much, Carolyn.

1   And thank you to all of our

2   commissioners for joining us today and moving

3   towards a vote for these very two important

4   items, including our bases.

5   At this time, I would like to call the

6   meeting to a conclusion at 10:12.

7   Thank you, everybody.

8   (TIME ADJOURNED: 10:12 a.m.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1   C E R T I F I C A T E

2

3   STATE OF NEW YORK)

4   :SS

5   COUNTY OF QUEENS)

6

7   I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a shorthand

8   reporter within and for the State of New York, do

9   hereby certify that the within is a true and

10   accurate transcript of the statement taken on

11   September 13, 2023.

12   I further certify that I am not related to

13   any of the parties to this action by blood or by

14   marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the

15   outcome of this matter.

16   IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my

17   hand this 27th day of September, 2023.

18

19

20   _Sabrina Brown-Stewart_
                          Sabrina Brown Stewart

21

22

23

24

25

& 3

20th 3:16

27th 13:17

3rd 9:10

60day 5:13

8th 10:18 11:11

about 4:3,8 7:23

accessibility 3:23

accessible 3:20 7:1

accurate 13:10

action 13:13

additional 11:24

adjourned 12:8

adopt 9:7

adopted 9:13 10:7 11:2,21 (4)

adopting 9:9 10:1,3,24 11:18 (5)

affect 6:3

after 5:14

agenda 3:14 9:1 10:12 11:5 (4)

allow 4:19 5:5

allowing 4:21

along 8:5 10:20 11:14

already 4:4

also 3:9 4:14

am 8 7:10 8:18 12:8 13:12,14 (6)

amended 10:25 11:19

announce 4:14

application 9:17

approach 4:6

approval 9:24

apps 4:20

are 4:23 6:4,10 9:6,13,23 (6)

around 7:17

attendees 9:19

august 10:17 11:11

awaiting 9:23

b 11

back 4:9

bader 17 3:7 5:21,24 6:14,21 7:9 (7)

base 2:4 9:15,17,21 10:1,3 (6)

bases 9:22 12:4

beaver 6

because 4:7

before 3:14 5:17 9:5

begin 5:17

best 6:8

blood 13:13

board 15 3:6,9 8:19 (4)

both 6:4

broader 5:5

brown 24 13:7

business 2:4 9:16,21 11:24 (4)

busy 4:23

c 13:1,1

call 9:7,15 12:5

calling 3:4

camera 10:13

cameras 5:5,8

can 6:9 9:25

cancel 2:4 9:16,18,20 10:10 (5)

carbon 3:25

carolyn 2:3 9:2 11:25

certify 13:9,12

chair 3:1,2 5:25 6:13,16 7:3,20 8:4,10,23 11:25 (11)

chaircommissioner 12

chan 18 3:8 6:15,16 7:9 (5)

charge 4:20

circulated 10:20 11:13

city 2 3:23 6:7,19 10:15 11:9 (6)

collaborating 8:8

comes 6:22

coming 4:1

comment 10:16

comments 3:17 4:11 5:19 10:22 11:10,15 (6)

commission 3 3:3 6:2,20 7:12 9:10 (6)

commissioner 17,18,19,20,21
3:2,7,8,8,10,12 5:21,24
6:14,15,16,19,21
7:4,5,6,7,9,11,21,22,25
8:14,15,17,23 9:3 11:23 (33)

commissioners 15 3:7 4:17
5:18,20,25 6:6,17,24 7:8
8:2,6,17 9:5,19,25 10:11,20,23
11:4,14,17 12:2 (23)

commitment 3:22

committed 4:4

completed 4:15

computeraided 25

conclusion 12:6

conclusions 4:25

consistent 4:24

continued 3:10 8:12,13

cost 4:4

could 5:11

counsel 13 2:3 9:1

county 13:5

couple 7:24

course 3:12

court 24

d 11

david 12 3:2

day 13:17

days 5:15

deputy 2:3 8:25

director 2:4 9:15,20

diving 7:16

drivers 4:2 7:13

during 5:12

e 11,11,11 2:1,1 13:1,1 (7)

each 3:25

efficiently 6:25

ehail 4:20

elisa 21

eluto 13

emissions 3:25

emphasize 4:7

employed 6:11 7:13

enjoyed 4:22

ensure 6:8

especially 5:19

establishes 5:9

estimated 3:24

evaluation 4:15

everybody 8:21 12:7

everyone 3:1,15 7:13 8:15 (4)

evolving 4:10

evs 4:9

excited 4:14 7:23 8:13

existing 8:6

extended 5:15

f 11 13:1

fabian 2:4 9:16,20

face 8:11

familiar 8:11

fare 4:15,19

fares 4:20

favor 9:9 10:3,24 11:18 (4)

fees 4:20

fellow 5:25 6:6,17,23 7:7 (5)

few 5:22

fhv 4:22 5:11

final 5:15 10:18 11:12

first 5:4,21 8:2 9:5 (4)

fleet 3:19,23

flex 4:15,19

forhire 5:6,10 6:25 11:6 (4)

formalize 4:5

forward 4:25 6:5,23 7:16
8:3,4,5,7,20 (9)

fuel 4:3

further 13:12

future 5:1

general 13 2:3 8:25

get 3:14 4:21 7:17

go 8:5

good 3:1 5:24 8:1,19 9:18 (5)

gradual 4:6,7

gravity 7:14

green 3:18 4:2

guest 8:25

h 11

hand 10:25 11:19 13:17

hands 9:11,12 10:5,6 11:1,20 (6)

has 4:2,16 6:21 8:11 (4)

hear 4:11

heard 4:13

hearing 3:17 5:2 10:16,21 11:10,14 (6)

held 10:17 11:10

hello 7:7

helping 7:16

here 3:12 7:11

hereby 13:9

hereunto 13:16

hi 8:15

highvolume 3:19

his 3:10,11

honor 6:18

honored 7:10 8:18

hundreds 6:10

i'd 3:15

i'll 9:7

i'm 3:4,6 4:14 7:15 8:18 9:20 (6)

ideas 4:12

important 12:3

inc 25

including 12:4

industry 6:4,5,11 7:14 (4)

initiative 3:21

innovatively 7:18

inperson 5:22

interest 4:9

interested 6:7 13:14

into 3:14 7:16

introduce 8:24

invehicle 10:13

is 3:2,4,24 4:10 5:21 6:18,20,21 9:19 10:7 11:2,21 13:9 (13)

issues 7:16

item 9:5 10:12 11:5,5 (4)

items 3:15 12:4

join 4:12

joined 3:6

joining 12:2

july 10:15 11:9

just 8:16

k 2:1

kaufman 19 3:8 7:5,6 (4)

kenneth 18

kind 4:22

l 11

last 8:10 11:4

lead 9:1

least 8:11

lh 25

license 9:17 10:1,4

licensed 4:19 5:12

licenses 5:11

licensing 9:21

like 3:15 4:11 5:17 8:1,24 12:5 (6)

limousine 3 3:3 6:20 7:12 (4)

listening 5:14

livery 5:8

look 4:25 6:5,23 8:2,3,7,20 (7)

looking 7:15

lot 8:19

lyft 4:4

maintenance 4:3

majority 4:1

make 4:13 6:24

march 4:10

market 4:10

marriage 13:14

matter 13:15

may 9:6,10 10:23 11:17 (4)

meaningful 3:22

measured 4:6

meeting 4 3:5 5:22 9:7,10 12:6 (6)

member 6:1

mentioned 6:21

metric 3:25

millions 6:3

minutes 9:6,8,9,13 (4)

mister 6:20

morning 3:1 5:19,24 8:1 9:18 (5)

motion 10:7

move 10:23 11:17

moving 12:2

ms 9:3,13,25 10:7,11 11:2,21 (7)

much 6:13 7:3,20 11:25 (4)

my 3:1 6:18,23 9:19 13:16 (5)

name 3:2 9:19

new 2,6,6 3:6,23 5:19 6:19 7:17,18 8:2,16 13:3,8 (13)

no 13:14

now 3:4 5:17 8:24 9:7,15 10:12 11:4 (7)

o 11

once 5:11

order 3:5

originally 5:13

our 3:6,9,17,18 4:1,15,16,17 5:1,18,19 6:9 8:2,16,17,25 10:19 11:4,13 12:1,4 (21)

ours 8:25

outcome 13:15

over 4:8 5:18

own 4:5

p 2:1

package 10:14 11:7

parties 6:7 13:13

partitions 5:8

passengers 4:21,21,23

paul 17

people 6:3,10

percent 4:3

period 4:8 5:12,13

pilot 4:15,19

placed 5:11

please 4:12 9:10 10:4,25 11:19 (5)

pleasure 6:1

posted 4:17 10:19 11:13

present 9:16

presenting 4:25

price 4:22

privilege 6:18

privileged 7:11

program 5:10 11:6

proposal 5:4,9 10:14 11:7 (4)

proposals 5:4

proposed 3:17 5:13 10:14,19 11:8,12 (6)

protection 6:8

provide 6:9

public 4 3:17 5:14 6:9 7:1 10:16,16 11:9,10 (9)

published 10:15 11:8

putting 4:23

queens 13:5

r 11 2:1 13:1

raise 9:11 10:4,25 11:19 (4)

raised 9:12 10:6 11:1,20 (4)

range 5:5

rapidly 4:10

really 7:23 8:18,20

reappointment 3:11 7:23

received 10:22 11:16

recommendation 10:4

recommendations 10:2

record 10:15 11:9

related 13:12

remind 3:15

remove 5:7

report 4:16 5:1

report's 4:24

reporter 24 13:8

reporting 25

represents 3:21

require 3:18

requirement 5:7

responsibilities 6:2,22

responsible 3:24

returning 8:17

review 9:23

riders 7:13

rides 3:18 4:2

rideshare 4:1

riding 6:9 7:1

right 8:10

role 6:22 7:15

rule 5:3,4,9 10:13,19,24
11:2,6,12,18,21 (11)

rules 3:18 4:24 5:1,7 10:14
11:8 (6)

s 2:1,1

sabrina 24 13:7

said 7:10

same 4:22

sarah 19

saved 4:2

saw 4:9

say 5:22 8:16

second 5:9

selected 6:1

sent 4:16

september 3:16 10:18 11:11
13:11,17 (5)

seriously 7:15

serve 6:1,18 7:11,12,18 8:21
(6)

served 6:4

service 3:11 6:8

services 25 2:5 9:16

set 13:16

she 8:11

sherryl 13

shls 5:6

shorthand 13:7

shortterm 5:10 11:5

signature 13:20

sixyear 4:8

small 4:8

so 4:12 6:13 7:3,20 8:6 11:25
(6)

sorrentino 20 3:10 7:22,25 (4)

special 8:25

specifications 10:13

ss 13:4

staff 6:6 8:5

stakeholders 6:24

state 13:3,8

statement 13:10

steps 4:8

stewart 24 13:7

storage 5:10,11 11:6

street 6

submitted 9:22

support 8:13

sustainability 3:22

sustainably 7:17

t 13:1,1

take 7:10,14

taken 13:10

talking 4:7

taxi 3 3:3 4:19,21 6:9,19 7:12
(7)

taxis 5:6

testimony 5:14

thank 3:9 6:12,13,16
7:2,3,6,19,20 8:7,9,22,23
9:3,14 10:9,10 11:25 12:1,7
(20)

their 4:5

these 12:3

think 8:19

thomas 20

those 9:7 10:24 11:18

thousands 6:10

three 3:6

throughout 6:7

time 3:4 12:5,8

tlc 2:3 8:5 9:20 10:17 11:11
(5)

tlc's 3:23

today 3:6,16 5:3 9:1 12:2 (5)

today's 3:14

together 4:23 8:8

tons 3:25

towards 12:3

transcript 10:21 11:15 13:10

transcription 25

tremendous 4:9

true 13:9

turn 5:18 10:12 11:4

twentyfive 9:22

two 5:3 12:3

twoyear 5:12

uber 4:4

unanimously 9:14 10:8 11:3,22 (4)

unit 9:21

upfront 4:20

us 4:12 8:12 9:1 12:2 (4)

vehicle 5:10 11:6

vehicles 4:2 5:6,8 6:25 (4)

velazquez 21 3:12 8:14,15 (4)

version 5:16 10:18 11:12

very 7:15 8:12 12:3

vote 9:7 10:1,23 11:17 12:3 (5)

voting 5:3

want 3:9 5:22 8:16

way 13:14

we're 4:7 5:3 7:22 8:12 (4)

website 4:18 10:19 11:13

wednesday 4:12

week 3:16

welcome 3:9 8:2,16

well 3:13 8:6

wheelchair 3:20

whereof 13:16

which 3:18 4:16

who 6:3,4,10

will 3:16,18 4:17 9:1,15 10:11 (6)

within 13:8,9

witness 13:16

wolpert 2:3 9:2,3,13,25 10:7,11 11:2,21 (9)

words 5:23 7:24

work 6:4,25 8:12,19 (4)

working 6:6,23 8:3,4,20,21 (6)

would 4:5,11 5:4,7,17 7:24 8:1,24 12:5 (9)

written 10:21 11:15

x 1,5

year 3:25

yes 7:25

york 2,6,6 3:23 6:19 13:3,8 (7)

yorkers 7:17,18

your 4:11 5:21 7:23 8:13

9:11,23,23 10:4,25 11:19 (10)

yourself 4:13

zeroemissions 3:19

1002 8

1003 3:4

1012 12:6,8

2023 13 9:6 10:16,17 11:9,11 13:11,17 (8)

2030 3:20

600000 3:24