CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

March 2, 2011 / Calendar No. 18

IN THE MATTER of an application submitted by the Department of Small Business Services on behalf of the Chinatown Business Improvement District pursuant to Section 25-405 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, as amended, concerning the formation of the Chinatown Business Improvement District, Borough of Manhattan, Community Districts 1, 2 and 3.

On November 8, 2010, the Mayor authorized the preparation of a district plan for the Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID). On November 30, 2010, on behalf of the Chinatown District Management Association (DMA), the Department of Small Business Services (DSBS) submitted the district plan for the BID, located in Community Districts 1, 2 and 3 in the Borough of Manhattan.

BACKGROUND

The proposed Chinatown BID is located in the Borough of Manhattan. The BID boundaries generally include Broome Street on the north; Broadway on the west; Allen and Rutgers streets on the east; and White, Worth and Madison streets on the south. The proposed BID is within Community Districts 1, 2 and 3. The proposed Chinatown BID is on the southern border of the proposed SoHo BID, which was approved by the City Planning Commission with qualifications on January 26, 2011.

The BID encompasses 50 blocks, 2,325 tax lots and over 6,000 retail businesses. There are over 800 commercial and 786 residential properties in the BID. The Chinatown neighborhood is one of the oldest in the City. Buildings within the BID area are typically low-rise buildings with commercial uses on the ground floor and residential uses on the upper floors.
The BID Plan includes funding to primarily address sanitation and holiday lighting. The first year budget for the BID is projected to be $1,300,000. The budget will allocate $1,000,000 to sanitation; $100,000 to holiday lighting and contingency; and $200,000 to administrative expenses.

The BID assessment method is based upon a combination of linear front footage and assessed value. Wholly commercial properties shall be assessed a front footage rate not to exceed $15 per linear front foot and an assessed value rate not to exceed $1.50 per $1,000 of assessed value. All wholly residential properties will be assessed at one dollar annually. Government and not-for-profit owned property devoted in whole to public or not-for-profit use shall be exempt from assessment. Parking and vacant lots shall be assessed the same rate as commercial properties. Properties that are within two BID Districts devoted in whole or in part to commercial uses shall be assessed at 50 percent of the commercial assessment.

Outreach to property owners, merchants and residents was done by the Chinatown Steering Committee. The BID has obtained support from 96.9 percent assessed value property owners who responded.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The district plan was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York State Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq., and the New York City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 11SBS003M. The lead agency is the Department of Small Business Services.
After a study of the potential environmental impact of the proposed action, a Negative Declaration was issued on November 3, 2010.

**LAND USE REVIEW**

On November 30, 2010 the Department of Small Business Services submitted the district plan for the Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID) to the Department of City Planning. The plan was then transmitted for review to the Office of the Mayor, Office of the Manhattan Borough President, City Council Speaker, City Council Member of Council District 1 and Manhattan Community Boards 1, 2 and 3.

**Community Board Public Hearing**

On January 25, 2011, at a meeting held by Manhattan Community Board 1, the board voted 35 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions, to approve the Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID).

On December 16, 2010, at a meeting held by Manhattan Community Board 2, the board voted to approve the Chinatown BID, 40 in favor, 0 opposed and 1 abstention, with the following conditions:

That the block on Lafayette Street between Grand Street and Broome Street be removed from the proposed district; and

CB#2 Manhattan urges the applicants to work with businesses and residents in neighboring communities to assure that their interests are well-served by the BID with regard to preserving and enhancing established neighborhood identities.
At its December 2010 meeting, Manhattan Community Board 3 voted 30 in favor, 0 opposed and 4 abstentions, with recommendations, to approve the Chinatown BID District Plan.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On January 5, 2011 (Calendar No. 14), the Commission scheduled January 26, 2011 for a public hearing on the district plan. On January 26, 2011 (Calendar No. 32), the hearing was duly held. There were 23 appearances in favor of the proposal and no appearances in opposition.

A council member from Manhattan City Council District One spoke about how the proposed Chinatown BID would be a historic moment for Chinatown if established. She spoke about how the BID would bring revitalization to the area. She recalled how the bordering communities had holiday lighting plans in place and how in 2010, the stakeholders in the community convinced businesses groups to contribute short term funding prior to the BID being established. Those funds would allow sanitation services not to be discontinued as a result of the ending of a grant from the Downtown Lower Manhattan Association. She also stated that sanitation services are a problem for the Chinatown community.

Three members, one each, from Manhattan Community Boards 1, 2 and 3 spoke about holding committee and full board meetings, the testimony for and against the proposed BID received at the meetings, and recommendations made by two of the three community boards.

They expressed appreciation for the extensive outreach conducted by the BID Steering Committee. They emphasized sanitation being an issue in the community and their desire to see improved services from the proposed BID.
Several members of the BID Steering Committee, who are also property and business owners, spoke about the extensive outreach efforts conducted by the BID Steering Committee. They spoke of past efforts made by stakeholders to provide services to address the issues in the neighborhood, which could not be continued. They expressed the desire to be able to address and resolve the issues of the community through the BID which is made up property owners, business owners and residents.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that the proposal to establish the Chinatown BID in Manhattan is appropriate.

BIDs promote business development and improve an area’s quality of life. The City Planning Commission believes that the Chinatown BID will provide additional sanitation services that will address a longstanding problem in the area but will also improve and promote a more favorable image for the district.

The City Planning Commission recognizes that there were some property and business owners as well as residents in the community, who opposed the BID and wanted to be excluded from the BID’s boundaries.

Furthermore, subsequent to the public hearing, the City Planning Commission received a number of letters in opposition to the BID stating concerns that were mainly centered on the assessment that the property owners would have to pay.
The Commission believes that although the BID assessment may involve an additional financial charge to some property owners, the overall, long-term benefits of the BID will bring economic opportunities that will offset the assessment cost.

The Commission believes that the BID Steering Committee is committed to working with the community to resolve concerns from the one residential co-op building that was concerned about the BID's boundaries.

RESOLUTION

The Commission supports the proposed plan, and has adopted the following resolution:

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission certifies its approval of the District Plan for the Chinatown Business Improvement District.

The above resolution duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on March 2, 2011 (Calendar No. 18) is filed with the City Council and the City Clerk pursuant to Section 25-405 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York.
AMANDA M. BURDEN, FAIC, Chair,
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES., Vice Chairman,
ANGELA M. BATTAGLIA, RAYANN BESSER,
IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ALFRED C. CERULLO, III,
BETTY Y. CHEN, MARIA M. DEL TORO, RICHARD W. EADDY,
ANNA HAYES LEVIN, SHIRLEY A. MCRAE, KAREN A. PHILLIPS
COMMISSIONERS
December 30, 2010

Hon. Amanda M. Burden, Chair
City Planning Commission
22 Reade Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: District Plan for the Chinatown Business Improvement District
   N 110156 BNDM

Dear Amanda:

Attached is a resolution adopted by Manhattan Community Board One on December 16, 2010, regarding the proposal to establish a Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID). Community Board One understands that the BID will provide sanitation services, holiday lights, marketing, transportation and parking management and advocacy services for the greater Chinatown business community.

Thank you for your consideration of our resolution and please feel free to contact us if your staff would like to discuss this matter.

Sincerely,

Julie Menin
Chairperson
COMMUNITY BOARD # 1 – MANHATTAN
RESOLUTION

DATE: DECEMBER 16, 2010

COMMITTEE OF ORIGIN: SEAPORT/CIVIC CENTER & TRIBECA

SEAPORT
COMMITTEE VOTE: 8 In Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstained 0 Recused

TRIBECA
COMMITTEE VOTE: 3 In Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstained 0 Recused
PUBLIC MEMBER: 1 In Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstained 0 Recused

BOARD VOTE: 25 In Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstained 0 Recused

*This was an unofficial vote due to the absence of a quorum. Community Board One will vote on whether to approve this resolution at its meeting on January 25, 2011.

RE: Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID)

WHEREAS: Chinatown is an important part of Lower Manhattan; and

WHEREAS: A proposal to establish a Business Improvement District (BID) has been submitted by the Chinatown Business Improvement District Steering Committee to the City Planning Commission pursuant to procedures established by the New York City Department of Small Business Services; and

WHEREAS: The proposed BID seeks to enhance sanitation services, holiday lights, marketing, transportation management and parking, and advocacy services; and

WHEREAS: The Chinatown Partnership Local Development Corporation, which has been providing similar services to Chinatown since September 11, 2001, will no longer be funded by the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation for this purpose after December 31, 2010; and

WHEREAS: Community Board 1 recognizes the economic difficulties faced by Chinatown as a result of the events on September 11, 2001 and the current economic recession; and
WHEREAS: Community Board 1 has worked collaboratively over the past two years with Community Boards 2 and 3 and with close to 50 neighborhood organizations to plan for the improvement of the greater Chinatown area; now

THEREFORE
BE IT
RESOLVED
THAT: Community Board #1 supports the establishment of the Chinatown Business Improvement District.
January 26, 2011

Hon. Amanda M. Burden, Chair
City Planning Commission
22 Reade Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: District Plan for the Chinatown Business Improvement District
N 110156 BNDM

Dear Amanda:

Attached is a resolution adopted by Manhattan Community Board One on January 25, 2011, regarding the proposal to establish a Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID).

Community Board One understands that the BID will provide sanitation services, holiday lights, marketing, transportation and parking management and advocacy services for the greater Chinatown business community.

Thank you for your consideration of our resolution and please feel free to contact us if your staff would like to discuss this matter.

Sincerely,

Julie Menin
Chairperson
COMMUNITY BOARD #1 – MANHATTAN
RESOLUTION

DATE: JANUARY 25, 2011

COMMITTEE OF ORIGIN: SEAPORT/CIVIC CENTER & TRIBECA

BOARD VOTE: 35 In Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstained 0 Recused

RE: Chinatown Business Improvement District (BID)

WHEREAS: Chinatown is an important part of Lower Manhattan; and

WHEREAS: A proposal to establish a Business Improvement District (BID) has been submitted by the Chinatown Business Improvement District Steering Committee to the City Planning Commission pursuant to procedures established by the New York City Department of Small Business Services; and

WHEREAS: The proposed BID seeks to enhance sanitation services, holiday lights, marketing, transportation management and parking, and advocacy services; and

WHEREAS: The Chinatown Partnership Local Development Corporation, which has been providing similar services to Chinatown since September 11, 2001, will no longer be funded by the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation for this purpose after December 31, 2010; and

WHEREAS: Community Board 1 recognizes the economic difficulties faced by Chinatown as a result of the events on September 11, 2001 and the current economic recession; and

WHEREAS: Community Board 1 has worked collaboratively over the past two years with Community Boards 2 and 3 and with close to 50 neighborhood organizations to plan for the improvement of the greater Chinatown area; now

THEREFORE
BE IT RESOLVED
THAT: Community Board #1 supports the establishment of the Chinatown Business Improvement District.
December 22, 2010

Amanda Burden. Chair
Department of City Planning
22 Reade Street
New York, New York 10007

Robert W. Walsh, Commissioner
NYC Department of Small Business Services
110 William Street, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10038

Jessica Dewberry
Department of City Planning
22 Reade Street
New York, New York 10007

Dear Madam Chair Burden, Commissioner Walsh and Ms. Dewberry:

At its Full Board meeting on December 16, 2010, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

Proposed CHINATOWN BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT and the DISTRICT PLAN

Whereas, There was significant support for the BID at the public hearing though there were also a few in opposition, And,

Whereas, In addition to required mailings, the steering committee has shown documentation of the strong outreach and the extensive support from the bid area with over a 90% response rate in favor of the BID, And,

Whereas, The Board recognizes the hard work that the steering committee has done in preparation for this proposal, And,

Whereas, The local City Council Member expressed strong support and great need for the formation of this BID, And,

Whereas, The Chinatown Partnership has been providing sanitation services in this area, however, the partnership no longer has a source of funding needed to service this area, And,

Whereas, The bid assessment is very low and the monies will be mostly used for sanitation services, And,
Whereas, The proposed BID will provide a range of services beyond the sanitation services and there is a survey shows a clear need for these services, And,

Whereas, CB#2, Man. has the will have a permanent non voting membership on the Board of Directors, And,

Whereas, The Steering Committee stated they would provide a mechanism to offer assistance to residents for whom such assessments are financially burdensome; And,

Whereas, The Steering Committee also promised to reach out to advise all coop tenants of the availability of such assistance; And,

Whereas, The Steering Committee expressed an understanding of the importance of establishing a board that is truly reflective of the district, And,

Whereas, The Steering Committee agreed to work closely with CB#2, Man. to continue to reach out to all businesses and residents as the process moves forward; And,

Whereas, The Board requests the removal of the west side of Lafayette St from Grand St. to Broome St because, while the boundaries of neighborhoods are often not strict lines, the block in question is not just official SoHo: it has a SoHo look and feel, a SoHo-ness, and

Whereas, the block on the west side of Lafayette Street between Grand Street and Broome Street is included in the proposal district but some retail stores on the block have a character more typical of SoHo; and

Whereas, CB#2, Man. recognizes that neighborhoods are not divided by defined borders, but instead are knit together in a way that adds interest and vitality to the urban quality of a broader area; and

Whereas, including this block in the district may conflict with the marketing strategy included in the district to create “a strong image” and “brand identity” for the district and to “highlight its unique character”; and

Whereas, including this block creates an irregular and confusing northern delineation for the district; and

Whereas, opposition to including this block in the district was persuasively expressed at the hearing and in subsequent letters received by CB#2, Man.;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that CB#2, Man. supports this application for a proposed CHINATOWN BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT, And

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that CB#2, Man. requests that the block on Lafayette Street between Grand Street and Broome Street be removed from the proposed district; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that CB#2, Man. urges the applicants to work with businesses and residents in neighboring communities to assure that their interests are well-served by the BID with regard to preserving and enhancing established neighborhood identities.

Vote: Passed, with 40 Board members in favor and 1 abstention (S. Sweeney).

Please advise us of any decision or action taken in response to this resolution.
Sincerely,

Jo Hamilton, Chair
Community Board #2, Manhattan

David Reck, Chair
Land Use and Business Development Committee
Community Board #2, Manhattan

cc: Hon. Jerrold L. Nadler, Congressman
Hon. Thomas K. Duane, NY State Senator
Hon. Daniel L. Squadron, NY State Senator
Hon. Deborah J. Glick, Assembly Member
Hon. Scott M. Stringer, Man. Borough President
Hon. Christine C. Quinn, Council Speaker
Hon. Margaret Chin, Council Member
Hon. Rosie Mendez, Council Member
Sandy Myers, CB2 Liaison, Man. Borough President’s office
Lolita Jackson, Manhattan Director, CAU
Jeremy Waldrup, Assistant Commissioner, Business Development Division,
   Dept. of Small Business Services
Wellington Chen, Chinatown Business Improvement District
December 22, 2010

Hon. Amanda M. Burden, Chair
City Planning Commission (CPC)
22 Reade Street
New York, NY 10007

Dear Chair Burden:

At its December 2010 monthly meeting, Community Board #3 passed the following resolution:

Whereas, Chinatown is an important part of Community Board #3, and

Whereas, a proposal to establish a Business Improvement District (BID) has been submitted by the Chinatown Business Improvement District Steering Committee pursuant to procedures established by the New York City Department of Small Business Services, and

Whereas, the proposed district seeks to enhance sanitation services, holiday lights, marketing, transportation management and parking, and advocacy services, and

Whereas, Community Board #3 has recognized the economic difficulties faced by Chinatown as a result of the 9-11-01 disaster and the current economic recession,

Whereas, Community Board #3 understands that Columbus Park is not included as part of a BID area,

Therefore, Community Board #3 supports the establishment of the Chinatown Business Improvement District.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call.

Sincerely,

Dominic Pisciotta, Chair
Community Board #3

cc: Jessica Dewberry, Housing, Economic and Infrastructure Planning Division/DCP
    Arthur Huh, DCP
    Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer
    Council Member Margaret Chin
December 22, 2010

Hon. Amanda M. Burden, Chair
City Planning Commission (CPC)
22 Reade Street
New York, NY 10007

Dear Chair Burden:

Community Board 3, Manhattan passed a resolution at the December, 2010 meeting to approve the formation of a Chinatown Business Improvement District. In addition, the Community Board voted to make the following two recommendations regarding the BID formation.

1. The BID should canvas in three years to assess whether or not the BID should be continued.
2. When the BID Board is formed, it should vote to take a position to support paying a living wage as defined by the NYC City Council to BID employees.

Sincerely,

Dominic Pisciotta, Chair
Community Board 3

cc: Jessica Dewberry, Housing, Economic and Infrastructure Planning Division/DCP
Arthur Huh, DCP
Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer
Council Member Margaret Chin