

In Re Audio Transcription October FCRC Public Meeting NYC -  
Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)  
October 11, 2023

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X  
PUBLIC MEETING  
FRANCHISE AND CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE  
-----X

October 11, 2023  
2:30 p.m.

Audio Transcription

Transcribed by: Stephanie O'Keefe, Court Reporter

In Re Audio Transcription October FCRC Public Meeting NYC -  
Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)  
October 11, 2023

2

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

APPEARANCES:

Mayor:  
Allison Stoddart

Office of the Mayor:  
Malcolm Cain

Corporation Counsel:  
Matthew Bridge

Office of Management and Budget:  
Yvonne Quintian

Comptroller:  
Ricky Da Costa

Borough President of Manhattan:  
Chris Carroll

Borough President of Queens:  
Allan Swisher

Borough President of Staten Island:  
Jasmin Djokovic

Clerk:  
Kimberly Egbert

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 CHAIR STODDART: Good afternoon.  
3 Thank you all for being here. My name  
4 is Allison Stoddart.

5 The Franchise and Concession  
6 Review Committee public meeting will  
7 now come to order.

8 Will the Clerk please call the  
9 roll?

10 THE CLERK: Mayor?

11 CHAIR STODDART: Allison  
12 Stoddart, present.

13 THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor?

14 MR. CAIN: Malcolm Cain,  
15 present.

16 THE CLERK: Comptroller?

17 MR. DA COSTA: Ricky Da Costa,  
18 present.

19 THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel?

20 MR. BRIDGE: Matthew Bridge,  
21 present.

22 THE CLERK: Office of Management  
23 and Budget?

24 MS. QUINTIAN: Yvonne Quintian,  
25 present.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

THE CLERK: President, Borough  
of the Bronx?

(No response.)

Let the record reflect,  
president, Borough of the Bronx is not  
present.

President, Borough of Manhattan?

MR. CARROLL: Chris Carroll,  
present.

THE CLERK: President, Borough  
of Brooklyn?

(No response.)

Let the record reflect,  
president, Borough of Brooklyn is not  
present.

President, Borough of Queens?

MR. SWISHER: Allan Swisher for  
Queens Borough President, Donovan  
Richards.

THE CLERK: President, Borough  
of Staten Island?

MR. DJOKOVIC: Jasmin Djokovic  
for Staten Island Borough President,  
Vito Fosella.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

CHAIR STODDART: Will the Clerk please call the first calendar item?

THE CLERK: New York City Police Department Calendar Item Number 1: In the matter of the intent to seek Franchise and Concession Review Committee approval pursuant to Section 1-16 of the Concession Rules of the City of New York, to utilize a different procedure, to enter into an amendment to the existing Concession Agreement between NYPD and Regent Catering Incorporated for the provision of Snack Bar/Cafeteria services at the NYPD's Police Academy in College Point, Queens. The amendment extends the second Renewal Agreement for this Concession for two years. The period covered by the two-year Amendment/Extension will start on December 8, 2023, and run through December 7, 2025.

CHAIR STODDART: Is there a member who would like to make a

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

statement or ask a question on this  
matter?

(No response.)

If not, will a member please  
make a motion to move this item?

MR. BRIDGE: I move.

CHAIR STODDART: Will another  
member please second the motion?

MR. CAIN: Malcolm Cain, I  
second the motion.

CHAIR STODDART: Will the Clerk  
please take the vote?

THE CLERK: Mayor?

CHAIR STODDART: Yes.

THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor?

MR. CAIN: Yes.

THE CLERK: Comptroller?

MR. DA COSTA: Yes.

THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel?

MR. BRIDGE: Yes.

THE CLERK: Office of Management  
and Budget?

MS. QUINTIAN: Yes.

THE CLERK: President, Borough

PROCEEDINGS

of Queens?

MR. SWISHER: Yes.

THE CLERK: Calendar Item Number  
2, resolution is adopted.

CHAIR STODDART: Will the Clerk  
please call the second calendar item?

THE CLERK: New York City  
Department of Parks and Recreation,  
Calendar Item Number 2: In the matter  
of the intent to seek Franchise and  
Concession Review Committee approval  
pursuant to Section 1-16 of the  
Concession Rules of the City of New  
York, to utilize a different  
procedure, to negotiate a Sole Source  
License Agreement with the selected  
offeror Statue Cruises, LLC for the  
operation and maintenance of a  
commercial ferry service for the  
purpose of embarking and discharging  
passengers on a regular schedule  
between The Battery, Liberty Island,  
and Ellis Island, and for the purpose  
of embarking and discharging

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

passengers of vessels on sightseeing cruises and other ferry operations, which may include but are not limited to day and night charters of vessels, owned, operated, or chartered by the selected offeror Statue Cruises, LLC at landing slips and adjacent walkways located in The Battery, Manhattan.

CHAIR STODDART: Is there a member who wishes to make a statement or ask a question on this matter?

(No response.)

If not, will a member please make a motion to move this item?

MR BRIDGE: I move.

CHAIR STODDART: Will another member please second the motion?

MR. CAIN: Malcolm Cain, I second the motion.

CHAIR STODDART: Will the Clerk please take the vote?

THE CLERK: Mayor?

CHAIR STODDART: Yes.

THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor?



1 PROCEEDINGS

2 MR. CAIN: Yes.

3 THE CLERK: Comptroller?

4 MR. DA COSTA: Yes.

5 THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel?

6 MR. BRIDGE: Yes.

7 THE CLERK: Office of Management  
8 and Budget?

9 MS. QUINTIAN: Yes.

10 THE CLERK: President, Borough  
11 of Manhattan?

12 MR. CARROLL: Yes.

13 THE CLERK: Calendar Item Number  
14 2, resolution is adopted.

15 We ask that the reporter make  
16 the entire public meeting agenda,  
17 which was made publicly available and  
18 distributed at this meeting, part of  
19 the final record of this proceeding.

20 That completes the calendar.

21 CHAIR STODDART: Thank you all,  
22 meeting adjourned.

23 (Time: Approximately 2:34  
24 p.m.)  
25



**In Re Audio Transcription October FCRC Public Meeting NYC -  
Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)**

<b>October 11, 2023</b>		
<b>12th</b> 10:16	<b>blood</b> 10:12	<b>committee</b> 4 3:6 5:8 7:12 (4)
<b>academy</b> 5:16	<b>borough</b> 2:10,12,13 4:2,6,8,11,15,17,19,21,24 6:25 9:10 (14)	<b>completes</b> 9:20
<b>accurate</b> 10:9	<b>bridge</b> 2:6 3:20,20 6:7,21 8:16 9:6 (7)	<b>comptroller</b> 2:9 3:16 6:18 9:3 (4)
<b>action</b> 10:12	<b>bronx</b> 4:3,6	<b>concession</b> 4 3:5 5:7,9,12,19 7:12,14 (8)
<b>adjacent</b> 8:8	<b>brooklyn</b> 4:12,15	<b>corporation</b> 2:6 3:19 6:20 9:5 (4)
<b>adjourned</b> 9:22	<b>budget</b> 2:7 3:23 6:23 9:8 (4)	<b>costa</b> 2:9 3:17,17 6:19 9:4 (5)
<b>adopted</b> 7:5 9:14	<b>c</b> 10:2,2	<b>counsel</b> 2:6 3:19 6:20 9:5 (4)
<b>afternoon</b> 3:2	<b>cain</b> 2:5 3:14,14 6:10,10,17 8:19,19 9:2 (9)	<b>county</b> 10:4
<b>agenda</b> 9:16	<b>calendar</b> 5:3,5 7:4,7,10 9:13,20 (7)	<b>court</b> 16
<b>agreement</b> 5:13,19 7:17	<b>call</b> 3:8 5:3 7:7	<b>covered</b> 5:20
<b>allan</b> 2:12 4:18	<b>carroll</b> 2:11 4:9,9 9:12 (4)	<b>cruises</b> 7:18 8:3,7
<b>allison</b> 2:3 3:4,11	<b>catering</b> 5:14	<b>da</b> 2:9 3:17,17 6:19 9:4 (5)
<b>am</b> 10:11,13	<b>certify</b> 10:8,11	<b>day</b> 8:5 10:16
<b>amendment</b> 5:12,18	<b>chair</b> 3:2,11 5:2,24 6:8,12,15 7:6 8:10,17,21,24 9:21 (13)	<b>december</b> 5:22,23
<b>amendmentextension</b> 5:21	<b>chartered</b> 8:6	<b>department</b> 5:5 7:9
<b>another</b> 6:8 8:17	<b>charters</b> 8:5	<b>different</b> 5:11 7:15
<b>appearances</b> 2:2	<b>chris</b> 2:11 4:9	<b>discharging</b> 7:21,25
<b>approval</b> 5:8 7:12	<b>city</b> 5:4,10 7:8,14 (4)	<b>distributed</b> 9:18
<b>approximately</b> 9:23	<b>clerk</b> 2:16 3:8,10,13,16,19,22 4:2,11,21 5:2,4 6:12,14,16,18,20,22,25 7:4,6,8 8:21,23,25 9:3,5,7,10,13 (30)	<b>djokovic</b> 2:14 4:23,23
<b>are</b> 8:4	<b>college</b> 5:17	<b>donovan</b> 4:19
<b>ask</b> 6:2 8:12 9:15	<b>come</b> 3:7	<b>e</b> 10:2,2
<b>audio</b> 8	<b>commercial</b> 7:20	<b>egbert</b> 2:16
<b>available</b> 9:17		<b>ellis</b> 7:24
<b>barcafeteria</b> 5:15		<b>embarking</b> 7:21,25
<b>battery</b> 7:23 8:9		<b>enter</b> 5:11
<b>being</b> 3:3		
<b>between</b> 5:13 7:23		

In Re Audio Transcription October FCRC Public Meeting NYC -  
Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)

October 11, 2023

12

<b>entire</b> 9:16	<b>landing</b> 8:8	<b>ms</b> 3:24 6:24 9:9
<b>existing</b> 5:12	<b>let</b> 4:5,14	<b>my</b> 3:3 10:16
<b>extends</b> 5:18	<b>liberty</b> 7:23	<b>name</b> 3:3
<b>f</b> 10:2	<b>license</b> 7:17	<b>negotiate</b> 7:16
<b>ferry</b> 7:20 8:3	<b>like</b> 5:25	<b>new</b> 5:4,10 7:8,14 10:3,7 (6)
<b>final</b> 9:19	<b>limited</b> 8:4	<b>night</b> 8:5
<b>first</b> 5:3	<b>llc</b> 7:18 8:7	<b>no</b> 4:4,13 6:4 8:13 10:13 (5)
<b>fosella</b> 4:25	<b>located</b> 8:9	<b>notary</b> 10:7
<b>franchise</b> 4 3:5 5:7 7:11 (4)	<b>made</b> 9:17	<b>now</b> 3:7
<b>further</b> 10:11	<b>maintenance</b> 7:19	<b>number</b> 5:5 7:4,10 9:13 (4)
<b>good</b> 3:2	<b>make</b> 5:25 6:6 8:11,15 9:15 (5)	<b>nypd</b> 5:13
<b>hand</b> 10:16	<b>malcolm</b> 2:5 3:14 6:10 8:19 (4)	<b>nypd's</b> 5:16
<b>here</b> 3:3	<b>management</b> 2:7 3:22 6:22 9:7 (4)	<b>o'keeffe</b> 16 10:6
<b>hereby</b> 10:8	<b>manhattan</b> 2:10 4:8 8:9 9:11 (4)	<b>october</b> 6 10:10,10,16 (4)
<b>hereunto</b> 10:15	<b>marriage</b> 10:13	<b>offeror</b> 7:18 8:7
<b>include</b> 8:4	<b>matter</b> 5:6 6:3 7:10 8:12 10:14 (5)	<b>office</b> 2:4,7 3:13,22 6:16,22 8:25 9:7 (8)
<b>incorporated</b> 5:14	<b>matthew</b> 2:6 3:20	<b>operated</b> 8:6
<b>intent</b> 5:6 7:11	<b>may</b> 8:4	<b>operation</b> 7:19
<b>interested</b> 10:13	<b>mayor</b> 2:3,4 3:10,13 6:14,16 8:23,25 (8)	<b>operations</b> 8:3
<b>into</b> 5:11	<b>meeting</b> 3 3:6 9:16,18,22 (5)	<b>order</b> 3:7
<b>is</b> 3:4 4:6,15 5:24 7:5 8:10 9:14 10:8 (8)	<b>member</b> 5:25 6:5,9 8:11,14,18 (6)	<b>other</b> 8:3
<b>island</b> 2:13 4:22,24 7:23,24 (5)	<b>motion</b> 6:6,9,11 8:15,18,20 (6)	<b>outcome</b> 10:14
<b>item</b> 5:3,5 6:6 7:4,7,10 8:15 9:13 (8)	<b>move</b> 6:6,7 8:15,16 (4)	<b>owned</b> 8:6
<b>jasmin</b> 2:14 4:23		<b>parks</b> 7:9
<b>kimberly</b> 2:16		<b>part</b> 9:18
		<b>parties</b> 10:12

In Re Audio Transcription October FCRC Public Meeting NYC -  
Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)

October 11, 2023

13

<p><b>passengers</b> 7:22 8:2</p> <p><b>period</b> 5:20</p> <p><b>please</b> 3:8 5:3 6:5,9,13 7:7 8:14,18,22 (9)</p> <p><b>pm</b> 2 9:24</p> <p><b>point</b> 5:17</p> <p><b>police</b> 5:4,16</p> <p><b>present</b> 3:12,15,18,21,25 4:7,10,16 (8)</p> <p><b>president</b> 2:10,12,13 4:2,6,8,11,15,17,19,21,24 6:25 9:10 (14)</p> <p><b>procedure</b> 5:11 7:16</p> <p><b>proceeding</b> 9:19</p> <p><b>proceedings</b> 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1,10 (9)</p> <p><b>provision</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>public</b> 3 3:6 9:16 10:7 (4)</p> <p><b>publicly</b> 9:17</p> <p><b>purpose</b> 7:21,24</p> <p><b>pursuant</b> 5:8 7:13</p> <p><b>queens</b> 2:12 4:17,19 5:17 7:2 (5)</p> <p><b>question</b> 6:2 8:12</p> <p><b>quintian</b> 2:8 3:24,24 6:24 9:9 (5)</p> <p><b>r</b> 10:2</p> <p><b>record</b> 4:5,14 9:19</p> <p><b>recorded</b> 10:9</p> <p><b>recreation</b> 7:9</p>	<p><b>reflect</b> 4:5,14</p> <p><b>regent</b> 5:13</p> <p><b>regular</b> 7:22</p> <p><b>related</b> 10:11</p> <p><b>renewal</b> 5:18</p> <p><b>reporter</b> 16 9:15 10:6</p> <p><b>resolution</b> 7:5 9:14</p> <p><b>response</b> 4:4,13 6:4 8:13 (4)</p> <p><b>review</b> 4 3:6 5:7 7:12 (4)</p> <p><b>richards</b> 4:20</p> <p><b>ricky</b> 2:9 3:17</p> <p><b>roll</b> 3:9</p> <p><b>rules</b> 5:9 7:14</p> <p><b>run</b> 5:22</p> <p><b>schedule</b> 7:22</p> <p><b>second</b> 5:18 6:9,11 7:7 8:18,20 (6)</p> <p><b>section</b> 5:8 7:13</p> <p><b>seek</b> 5:6 7:11</p> <p><b>selected</b> 7:17 8:7</p> <p><b>service</b> 7:20</p> <p><b>services</b> 5:16</p> <p><b>set</b> 10:15</p> <p><b>sightseeing</b> 8:2</p> <p><b>signature</b> 10:19</p> <p><b>slips</b> 8:8</p> <p><b>snack</b> 5:15</p>	<p><b>sole</b> 7:16</p> <p><b>source</b> 7:16</p> <p><b>ss</b> 10:3</p> <p><b>start</b> 5:22</p> <p><b>state</b> 10:3,7</p> <p><b>statement</b> 6:2 8:11</p> <p><b>staten</b> 2:13 4:22,24</p> <p><b>statue</b> 7:18 8:7</p> <p><b>stephanie</b> 16 10:6</p> <p><b>stoddart</b> 2:3 3:2,4,11,12 5:2,24 6:8,12,15 7:6 8:10,17,21,24 9:21 (16)</p> <p><b>suffolk</b> 10:4</p> <p><b>swisher</b> 2:12 4:18,18 7:3 (4)</p> <p><b>t</b> 10:2,2</p> <p><b>take</b> 6:13 8:22</p> <p><b>taken</b> 10:10</p> <p><b>thank</b> 3:3 9:21</p> <p><b>through</b> 5:23</p> <p><b>time</b> 9:23</p> <p><b>transcribed</b> 16</p> <p><b>transcript</b> 10:9</p> <p><b>transcription</b> 8</p> <p><b>true</b> 10:8</p> <p><b>two</b> 5:19</p> <p><b>twoyear</b> 5:21</p> <p><b>utilize</b> 5:10 7:15</p> <p><b>vessels</b> 8:2,5</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

In Re Audio Transcription October FCRC Public Meeting NYC -  
Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)

October 11, 2023

14

**vito** 4:25  
**vote** 6:13 8:22  
**walkways** 8:8  
**way** 10:13  
**whereof** 10:15  
**which** 8:4 9:17  
**who** 5:25 8:11  
**will** 3:6,8 5:2,21 6:5,8,12 7:6  
8:14,17,21 (11)  
**wishes** 8:11  
**within** 10:7,8  
**witness** 10:15  
**would** 5:25  
**x** 2,5  
**years** 5:20  
**yes** 6:15,17,19,21,24 7:3 8:24  
9:2,4,6,9,12 (12)  
**york** 5:4,10 7:8,15 10:3,8 (6)  
**yvonne** 2:8 3:24  
**234** 9:23  
**2023** 6 5:22 10:10,16 (4)  
**2025** 5:23