

In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)
December 13, 2022

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----x
PUBLIC MEETING
FRANCHISE AND CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE
-----x

December 13, 2022
2:36 p.m.

PUBLIC HEARING
Held Via Microsoft Teams Videoconference

In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)
December 13, 2022

2

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES:

Mayor:

Allison Stoddart

Clerk:

James Goebel

Office of the Mayor:

Ya-Ting Liu

Corporation Counsel:

Kenisha Sutton

Office of Management and Budget:

Yvonne Quintian

Comptroller:

John Katsorhis

Borough President of Brooklyn:

John Douglas

Borough President of the Bronx:

Tom Lucania

Borough President of Manhattan:

Tomi Vest

Borough President of Staten Island:

Lauren Lefkowitz

Department of Transportation:

Rachel Frumin

Department of Parks and Recreation:

Phil Abramson

PROCEEDINGS

MR. GOEBEL: Hello everyone.

This is James Goebel, Clerk for the
FCRC.

Before we get started with
today's proceedings, I'd like to
confirm everyone can hear me clearly.

(Chorus of yeses.)

MR. GOEBEL: Thank you.

Today's hearing is being held
via Microsoft Teams conference call.
And we ask that all attendees announce
their name for the record each time
they speak on the call for ease of
transcription.

If you're not speaking, we ask
that you mute your microphone to avoid
background noises during the call.

Only one person should be
speaking at any given time. I will
direct, should there be any conflicts.

Chair, we are ready to begin.

MS. STODDART: Good afternoon
and thank you all for being here.

In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)
December 13, 2022

4

1

2

My name is Allison Stoddart,
Chair of the FCRC.

4

5

6

The Franchise and Concession
Review Committee remote public hearing
will now come to order.

7

8

Will the clerk please call the
roll.

9

MR. GOEBEL: The Mayor?

10

11

MS. STODDART: Allison Stoddart,
here.

12

13

MR. GOEBEL: Office of the
Mayor?

14

MS. LIU: Ya-Ting Liu, here.

15

MR. GOEBEL: Comptroller?

16

17

MR. GOEBEL: John Katsorhis,
here.

18

19

MR. GOEBEL: Corporation
Counsel?

20

21

MS. SUTTON: Kenisha Sutton,
here.

22

23

MR. GOEBEL: Office of
Management and Budget?

24

25

MS. QUINTIAN: Yvonne Quintian,
here.

In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)
December 13, 2022

5

1

2

MR. GOEBEL: President, Borough
of the Bronx?

4

MR. LUCANIA: Tom Lucania, here.

5

6

MR. GOEBEL: President, Borough
of Brooklyn?

7

8

MR. DOUGLAS: John Douglas,
here.

9

10

MR. GOEBEL: President, Borough
of Manhattan?

11

MS. VEST: Tomi Vest, here.

12

13

MR. GOEBEL: President, Borough
of Queens?

14

(No response.)

15

16

MR. GOEBEL: Let the record
reflect, the president of the Borough
of Queens is not present.

17

18

President, Borough of Staten
Island?

19

20

MS. LEFKOWITZ: Lauren
Lefkowitz, here.

21

22

MR. GOEBEL: Representative,
Department of Transportation?

23

24

MS. FRUMIN: Rachel Frumin,
here.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. GOEBEL: Representative for
the Department of Parks and
Recreation?

MR. ABRAMSON: Phil Abramson,
here.

MR. GOEBEL: Thank you.

MS. STODDART: Thank you.

Welcome to this remote public
hearing of the Franchise and
Concession Review Committee.

The hearing being conducted
today has been publicly advertised in
accordance with the New York City
Charter and Concession Rules of the
City of New York.

We want to be sure that anyone
desiring to be heard has an
opportunity to do so. We are
registering individuals now for later
testimony. Those registered will be
called upon to testify after their
calendar item has been called.

All persons wishing to speak
must now provide their name,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

affiliation, indicate which calendar items they wish to testify on, and whether they are for or against said item to the clerk at this time.

MR. GOEBEL: Does anyone wish to testify?

(No response.)

It appears no one from the public wishes to testify at the meeting.

MS. STODDART: Thank you.

Just so you know, you may also submit written testimony to the clerk, which will be made part of the record.

Any written submissions must be given to the clerk before the close of the remote public hearing via e-mail to fcrc@mocs.nyc.gov and will be provided to committee after the hearing.

Will the clerk please call the first calendar item.

MR. GOEBEL: New York City Department of Transportation.

1
2 Calendar Item Numbern 1: In the
3 matter of the intent to seek Franchise
4 and Concession Review Committee
5 approval pursuant to Section 116 of
6 the Concession Rules of the City of
7 New York, to utilize a different
8 procedure, to enter into a license
9 agreement with DUMBO District
10 Management Association, Inc. to
11 provide for the operation, management,
12 and maintenance of a pedestrian plaza
13 located on Old Fulton Street, Front
14 Street and Water Street, in the
15 borough of Brooklyn. The License will
16 provide for one five-year initial
17 term, commencing upon written Notice
18 to Proceed, which may be renewed for
19 up to two additional five-year terms,
20 exercisable at the sole discretion of
21 DOT.

22 MS. STODDART: We will take
23 testimony from the public, but first
24 I'd like to ask the members of
25 Committee if they have any statements.

(No response.)

Will if clerk please call anyone
who wishes to testify.

MR. GOEBEL: We have now heard
all testimony on this calendar item.

MS. STODDART: Will the clerk
please call the next calendar item.

MR. GOEBEL: New York City
Department of Transportation Calendar
Item Number 2: in the matter of the
intent to seek Franchise and
Concession Review Committee approval
pursuant to Section 116 of the
Concession Rules of the City of New
York, to utilize a different
procedure, to enter into a license
agreement with MetroTech Area District
Management Association, Inc. d/b/a
MetroTech Business Improvement
District, to provide for the
operation, management, and maintenance
of a pedestrian plaza located on
Willoughby Street between Pearl Street
and Adams Street, in the borough of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Brooklyn. The License will provide for one five-year initial term, commencing upon written Notice to Proceed, which may be renewed for up to two additional five-year terms, exercisable at the sole discretion of DOT.

MS. STODDART: We will take testimony from the public, but first I'd like to ask the members of the committee if that have any statements.

(No response.)

Will the clerk please call anyone who wishes to testify.

MR. GOEBEL: We have now heard all testimony on this calendar item.

MS. STODDART: Will the clerk please call the next calendar item.

MR. GOEBEL: New York City Department of Parks and Recreation Calendar Item Number 3: In the matter of the intent to seek Franchise and Concession Review Committee approval pursuant to Section 116 of

1
2 the Concession Rules of the City of
3 New York, to utilize a different
4 procedure, to enter into a concession
5 agreement with Red Hook Initiative,
6 Inc., for the maintenance, operation
7 and management of an urban garden at
8 560 Columbia Street in Red Hook,
9 Brooklyn. The agreement will provide
10 for a twenty year term.

11 MS. STODDART: We will take
12 testimony from the public but first
13 I'd like to ask the members of the
14 committee if they have any statements.

15 (No response.)

16 Is there anyone from the public
17 who would like to make any statements?

18 (No response.)

19 MR. GOEBEL: We have now heard
20 all testimony on this calendar item.

21 MS. STODDART: Thank you.

22 Before we conclude, I want to
23 ask if any of the agencies presenting
24 calendar items today have any
25 statements for the record prior to the

1
2 closing of the hearing.

3 (No response.)

4 MS. FRUMIN: Rachel Frumin from
5 DOT does not have any statement to
6 provide.

7 MS. STODDART: Thank you.

8 If no one else wishes to speak,
9 that concludes today's hearing.

10 We ask that the reporter make
11 the entire public hearing agenda,
12 which is made publicly available and
13 distributed at this hearing, part of
14 the final record of the proceeding.

15 The hearing is now closed.
16 Thank you.

17 (Time Noted: 2:44 p.m.)
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

[illegible]

I, STEPHANIE O'KEEFFE, a Reporter
and Notary Public within and for the State of New
York, do hereby certify that the within is a true
and accurate transcript of the proceedings taken on
December 19, 2022.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
set my hand this 19th day of December, 2022.

Stephanie O'Keefe
Stephanie O'Keefe

**In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)**

December 13, 2022				
19th 13:17	area 9:18	10:17,19,22 11:20,24 (12)	11:2,4 (11)	douglas 2:13 5:7,7
abramson 2:20 6:5,5	ask 3:13,17 8:24 10:11 11:23 12:10 (6)	call 3:12,15,19 4:7 7:22 9:3,8 10:14,19 (9)	conclude 11:22	dumbo 8:9
accordance 6:14	askthe 11:13	called 6:22,23	concludes 12:9	during 3:19
accurate 13:10	association 8:10 9:19	can 3:8	conducted 6:12	e 13:2,2
action 13:13	attendees 3:13	certify 13:9,12	conference 3:12	each 3:14
adams 9:25	available 12:12	chair 3:23 4:3	confirm 3:8	ease 3:15
additional 8:19 10:6	avoid 3:18	charter 6:15	conflicts 3:22	else 12:8
advertised 6:13	background 3:19	chorus 3:9	corporation 2:8 4:18	email 7:18
affiliation 7:2	before 3:6 7:17 11:22	city 6:14,16 7:24 8:6 9:9,15 10:20 11:2 (8)	counsel 2:8 4:19	enter 8:8 9:17 11:4
after 6:22 7:20	begin 3:23	clearly 3:8	county 13:5	entire 12:11
afternoon 3:24	being 3:11,25 6:12	clerk 2:5 3:4 4:7 7:5,14,17,22 9:3,7 10:14,18 (11)	day 13:17	everyone 3:3,8
against 7:4	between 9:24	close 7:17	dba 9:19	exercisable 8:20 10:7
agencies 11:23	blood 13:14	closed 12:15	december 6 13:11,17	f 13:2
agenda 12:11	borough 2:12,14,15 5:2,5,9,12,16,18 8:15 9:25 (11)	closing 12:2	department 2:18,20 5:23 6:3 7:25 9:10 10:21 (7)	fcrc 3:5 4:3
agreement 8:9 9:18 11:5,9 (4)	bronx 2:14 5:3	columbia 11:8	desiring 6:18	fcrc@mocsnyco v 7:19
allison 2:4 4:2,10	brooklyn 2:12 5:6 8:15 10:2 11:9 (5)	come 4:6	different 8:7 9:16 11:3	final 12:14
also 7:13	brough 2:17	commencing 8:17 10:3	direct 3:22	first 7:23 8:23 10:10 11:12 (4)
am 13:12,14	budget 2:9 4:23	committee 4 4:5 6:11 7:20 8:4,25 9:13 10:12,24 11:14 (10)	discretion 8:20 10:7	fiveyear 8:16,19 10:3,6 (4)
announce 3:13	business 9:20	comptroller 2:11 4:15	distributed 12:13	franchise 4 4:4 6:10 8:3 9:12 10:23 (6)
anyone 6:17 7:6 9:3 10:15 11:16 (5)	c 13:2,2	concession 4 4:4 6:11,15 8:4,6 9:13,15 10:24	district 8:9 9:18,21	front 8:13
appearances 2:2	calendar 6:23 7:2,23 8:2 9:6,8,10		does 7:6 12:5	frumin 2:19 5:24,24 12:4,4 (5)
appears 7:9			dot 8:21 10:8 12:5	fulton 8:13
approval 8:5 9:13 10:25				
are 3:23 6:19 7:4				

**In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)**

December 13, 2022				15
further 13:12 garden 11:7 get 3:6 given 3:21 7:17 goebel 2:5 3:3,4,10 4:9,12,15,16,18,22 5:2,5,9,12,15,22 6:2,7 7:6,24 9:5,9 10:16,20 11:19 (25) good 3:24 hand 13:17 has 6:13,18,23 hear 3:8 heard 6:18 9:5 10:16 11:19 (4) hearing 9 3:11 4:5 6:10,12 7:18,21 12:2,9,11,13,15 (12) held 10 3:11 hello 3:3 here 3:25 4:11,14,17,21,25 5:4,8,11,21,25 6:6 (12) hereby 13:9 hereunto 13:16 hook 11:5,8 i'd 3:7 8:24 10:11 11:13 (4) improvement 9:20	inc 8:10 9:19 11:6 indicate 7:2 individuals 6:20 initial 8:16 10:3 initiative 11:5 intent 8:3 9:12 10:23 interested 13:15 into 8:8 9:17 11:4 is 3:4,11 4:2 5:17 11:16 12:12,15 13:9 (8) island 2:17 5:19 item 6:23 7:5,23 8:2 9:6,8,11 10:17,19,22 11:20 (11) items 7:3 11:24 james 2:5 3:4 john 2:11,13 4:16 5:7 (4) just 7:13 katsorhis 2:11 4:16 kenisha 2:8 4:20 know 7:13 later 6:20 lauren 2:17 5:20 lefkowitz 2:17 5:20,21 let 5:15	license 8:8,15 9:17 10:2 (4) like 3:7 8:24 10:11 11:13,17 (5) liu 2:7 4:14,14 located 8:13 9:23 lucania 2:14 5:4,4 made 7:15 12:12 maintenance 8:12 9:22 11:6 make 11:17 12:10 management 2:9 4:23 8:10,11 9:19,22 11:7 (7) manhattan 2:15 5:10 marriage 13:14 matter 8:3 9:11 10:23 13:15 (4) may 7:13 8:18 10:5 mayor 2:3,6 4:9,13 (4) me 3:8 meeting 3 7:11 members 8:24 10:11 11:13 metrotech 9:18,20 microphone 3:18 microsoft 10 3:12	ms 3:24 4:10,14,20,24 5:11,20,24 6:8 7:12 8:22 9:7 10:9,18 11:11,21 12:4,7 (18) must 6:25 7:16 mute 3:18 my 4:2 13:17 name 3:14 4:2 6:25 new 6:14,16 7:24 8:7 9:9,15 10:20 11:3 13:4,8 (10) next 9:8 10:19 no 5:14 7:8,9 9:2 10:13 11:15,18 12:3,8 13:14 (10) noises 3:19 notary 13:8 noted 12:17 notice 8:17 10:4 now 4:6 6:20,25 9:5 10:16 11:19 12:15 (7) number 9:11 10:22 numbern 8:2 o'keeffe 13:7 office 2:6,9 4:12,22 (4) old 8:13 one 3:20 7:9 8:16 10:3 12:8 (5)	only 3:20 operation 8:11 9:22 11:6 opportunity 6:19 order 4:6 outcome 13:15 parks 2:20 6:3 10:21 part 7:15 12:13 parties 13:13 pearl 9:24 pedestrian 8:12 9:23 person 3:20 persons 6:24 phil 2:20 6:5 plaza 8:12 9:23 please 4:7 7:22 9:3,8 10:14,19 (6) pm 2 12:17 present 5:17 presenting 11:23 president 2:12,14,15,17 5:2,5,9,12,16,18 (10) prior 11:25 procedure 8:8 9:17 11:4 proceed 8:18 10:4

**In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)**

December 13, 2022				16
proceeding 12:14	renewed 8:18 10:5	10:12 11:14,17,25 (5)	their 3:14 6:22,25	way 13:14
proceedings 3:2,7 13:10	reporter 12:10 13:7	staten 2:17 5:18	those 6:21	welcome 6:9
provide 6:25 8:11,16 9:21 10:2 11:9 12:6 (7)	representative 5:22 6:2	stephanie 13:7	time 3:14,21 7:5 12:17 (4)	whereof 13:16
provided 7:20	response 5:14 7:8 9:2 10:13 11:15,18 12:3 (7)	stoddart 2:4 3:24 4:2,10,10 6:8 7:12 8:22 9:7 10:9,18 11:11,21 12:7 (14)	today 6:13 11:24	whether 7:4
public 3,9 4:5 6:9 7:10,18 8:23 10:10 11:12,16 12:11 13:8 (12)	review 4 4:5 6:11 8:4 9:13 10:24 (6)	street 8:13,14,14 9:24,24,25 11:8 (7)	today's 3:7,11 12:9	which 7:2,15 8:18 10:4 12:12 (5)
publicly 6:13 12:12	roll 4:8	submissions 7:16	tom 2:14 5:4	who 9:4 10:15 11:17
pursuant 8:5 9:14 10:25	rules 6:15 8:6 9:15 11:2 (4)	submit 7:14	tomi 2:16 5:11	will 3:21 4:6,7 6:21 7:15,19,22 8:15,22 9:3,7 10:2,9,14,18 11:9,11 (17)
queens 5:13,17	said 7:4	suffolk 13:5	transcript 13:10	willoughby 9:24
quintian 2:10 4:24,24	section 8:5 9:14 10:25	sure 6:17	transcription 3:16	wish 7:3,6
r 13:2	seek 8:3 9:12 10:23	sutton 2:8 4:20,20	transportation 2:18 5:23 7:25 9:10 (4)	wishes 7:10 9:4 10:15 12:8 (4)
rachel 2:19 5:24 12:4	set 13:17	t 13:2,2	true 13:9	wishing 6:24
ready 3:23	should 3:20,22	take 8:22 10:9 11:11	twenty 11:10	within 13:8,9
record 3:14 5:15 7:15 11:25 12:14 (5)	signature 13:20	taken 13:10	two 8:19 10:5	witness 13:16
recreation 2:20 6:4 10:21	so 6:19 7:13	teams 10 3:12	up 8:19 10:5	would 11:17
red 11:5,8	sole 8:20 10:7	term 8:17 10:3 11:10	upon 6:22 8:17 10:4	written 7:14,16 8:17 10:4 (4)
reflect 5:16	speak 3:15 6:24 12:8	terms 8:19 10:6	urban 11:7	x 2,5
registered 6:21	speaking 3:17,21	testify 6:22 7:3,7,10 9:4 10:15 (6)	utilize 8:7 9:16 11:3	yating 2:7 4:14
registering 6:20	ss 13:4	testimony 6:21 7:14 8:23 9:6 10:10,17 11:12,20 (8)	vest 2:16 5:11,11	year 11:10
related 13:13	started 3:6	thank 3:10,25 6:7,8 7:12 11:21 12:7,16 (8)	via 10 3:12 7:18	yeses 3:9
remote 4:5 6:9 7:18	state 13:4,8		v id eoconference 10	york 6:14,16 7:24 8:7 9:9,16 10:20 11:3 13:4,9 (10)
	statement 12:5		want 6:17 11:22	you're 3:17
	statements 8:25		water 8:14	

In Re Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Hearing
NYC - Mayor`s Office of Contract Services (MOCS)

December 13, 2022

17

your 3:18

yvonne 2:10 4:24

244 12:17

560 11:8

2022 6 13:11,17