

Franchise & Concession Review Committee Public Meeting
February 13, 2019

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X

PUBLIC MEETING
FRANCHISE and CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE

-----X

February 13, 2019
2:37 p.m.

22 Reade Street
Spector Hall
New York, New York

Julia M. Speros
Court Reporter

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

Mayor:
Kapil Longani

Office of the Mayor:
Benjamin Furnas

Corporation Counsel:
Amrita Barth

Office of Management and Budget:
Yvonne Quintian

Comptroller:
Jennifer Conovitz

Borough President of Brooklyn:
Tonya Cantlo-Cockfield

Borough President of Queens:
Allan Swisher

Borough President of Staten Island:
Lashay Young

Clerk:
Gemayel Jean-Paul

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PROCEEDINGS

MR. LONGANI: Good afternoon, and thank you all for being here.

The Franchise and Concession Review Committee Public Meeting will now come to order.

Will the Clerk please call the roll?

THE CLERK: Mayor.

MR. LONGANI: Here.

THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor.

MR. FURNAS: Here.

THE CLERK: Comptroller.

MS. CONOVITZ: Here.

THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel.

MS. BARTH: Here.

THE CLERK: Office of Management and Budget.

MS. QUINTIAN: Here.

THE CLERK: President, Borough of the Bronx.

(No response.)

THE CLERK: Let the record reflect the President, Borough of the Bronx is not present.

President, Borough of Brooklyn.

1 MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: Here.

2 THE CLERK: President, Borough of
3 Manhattan.

4 (No response.)

5 THE CLERK: Let the record reflect
6 that the President, Borough of Manhattan
7 is not present.

8 President, Borough of Queens.

9 MR. SWISHER: Here.

10 THE CLERK: President, Borough of
11 Staten Island.

12 MS. YOUNG: Here.

13 MR. LONGANI: Will the Clerk please
14 call the first calendar item?

15 THE CLERK: New York City Department
16 of Transportation, Calendar Item Number
17 1: In the matter of intent to seek
18 Franchise and Concession Review
19 Committee approval to utilize a
20 different procedure, pursuant to Section
21 1-16 of the Concession Rules of the City
22 of New York, to negotiate a Sole Source
23 License Agreement with The New York City
24 Economic Development Corporation, to
25 provide for the operation, management

1 and maintenance of a pedestrian plaza
2 located on Humboldt Street between Moore
3 Street and Varet Street in Brooklyn.

4 MR. LONGANI: Is there a member who
5 wishes to make a statement or ask a
6 question on this matter?

7 (No response.)

8 MR. LONGANI: Hearing none, will a
9 member please make a motion to move this
10 item?

11 MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: So moved.

12 MR. LONGANI: Will another member
13 please second the motion?

14 MR. FURNAS: Second.

15 MR. LONGANI: Will the Clerk please
16 take the vote?

17 THE CLERK: Mayor.

18 MR. LONGANI: Yes.

19 THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor.

20 MR. FURNAS: Yes.

21 THE CLERK: Comptroller.

22 MS. CONOVITZ: Yes.

23 THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel.

24 MS. BARTH: Yes.

25 THE CLERK: Office of Management and

1 Budget.

2 MS. QUINTIAN: Yes.

3 THE CLERK: On behalf of the Borough
4 Presidents, President, Borough of
5 Brooklyn.

6 MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: Yes.

7 THE CLERK: Calendar item number 1,
8 Resolution is adopted.

9 MR. LONGANI: Will the Clerk please
10 call the second calendar item?

11 THE CLERK: New York City Department
12 of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item
13 Number 2: In the matter of the intent
14 to seek Franchise and Concession Review
15 Committee approval to utilize a
16 different procedure, pursuant to Section
17 1-16 of the Concession Rules of the City
18 of New York, to enter into a Sole Source
19 License Agreement with the Greenbelt
20 Conservancy, Inc.

21 The Agreement shall permit Greenbelt
22 Conservancy to operate and maintain the
23 Carousel for all Children, as well as a
24 food, beverage, and souvenir concession
25 at the facility located in Willowbrook

1 Park Staten Island.

2 The Agreement provides for a term
3 commencing on the date Parks gives
4 written notice to proceed to the
5 Greenbelt Conservancy and terminating on
6 September 14, 2019, unless a new
7 maintenance and operation agreement is
8 entered into between Parks and the
9 Greenbelt Conservancy by that date, in
10 which event the term shall be five years
11 from the commencement date, with options
12 to renew for up to four one-year periods
13 at Parks' sole discretion, provided that
14 in no event shall the term of the
15 Agreement extend past the end of any new
16 maintenance and operation agreement.

17 MR. LONGANI: Is there a member who
18 wishes to make a statement or ask a
19 question on this matter?

20 (No response.)

21 MR. LONGANI: Hearing none, will a
22 member please make a motion to move this
23 item?

24 MS. YOUNG: So moved.

25 MR. LONGANI: Will another member

1 please second the motion?

2 MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: Second.

3 MR. LONGANI: Will the Clerk please
4 take the vote?

5 THE CLERK: Mayor.

6 MR. LONGANI: Yes.

7 THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor.

8 MR. FURNAS: Yes.

9 THE CLERK: Comptroller.

10 MS. CONOVITZ: Yes.

11 THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel.

12 MS. BARTH: Yes.

13 THE CLERK: Office of Management and
14 Budget.

15 MS. QUINTIAN: Yes.

16 THE CLERK: On behalf of the Borough
17 Presidents, President, Borough of Staten
18 Island.

19 MS. YOUNG: Yes.

20 THE CLERK: Calendar item number 2,
21 Resolution is adopted.

22 MR. LONGANI: Will the Clerk please
23 call the third calendar item?

24 THE CLERK: New York City Department
25 of Parks and Recreation, Calendar Item

1 Number 3: In the matter of the intent
2 to award as a concession for the
3 operation and maintenance of a parking
4 lot at Manhattan Beach Park, identified
5 as Block 8760, Lot 485 in the Borough of
6 Brooklyn, located at Oriental Boulevard
7 and Irwin Street, for one seven-season
8 term to City University of New York,
9 Kingsborough Community College.

10 MR. LONGANI: Is there a member who
11 wishes to ask a question on this matter?

12 (No response.)

13 MR. LONGANI: Hearing none, will a
14 member please make a motion to move this
15 item?

16 MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: So moved.

17 MR. LONGANI: Will another member
18 please second the motion?

19 MS. BARTH: Second.

20 MR. LONGANI: Will the Clerk please
21 take the vote?

22 THE CLERK: Mayor.

23 MR. LONGANI: Yes.

24 THE CLERK: Office of the Mayor.

25 MR. FURNAS: Yes.

1 THE CLERK: Comptroller.

2 MS. CONOVITZ: Yes.

3 THE CLERK: Corporation Counsel.

4 MS. BARTH: Yes.

5 THE CLERK: Office of Management and
6 Budget.

7 MS. QUINTIAN: Yes.

8 THE CLERK: On behalf of the Borough
9 Presidents, President, Borough of
10 Brooklyn.

11 MS. CANTLO-COCKFIELD: Yes.

12 THE CLERK: Calendar item number 3,
13 Resolution is adopted.

14 We ask that the Reporter make the
15 entire Public Meeting Agenda, which was
16 made publicly available and distributed
17 at this meeting, part of the final
18 record of this proceeding.

19 That completes the calendar.

20 MR. LONGANI: Thank you. Meeting
21 adjourned.

22 (Time noted: 2:42 p.m.)

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATION

I, JULIA M. SPEROS, a Notary Public for and within the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness whose testimony as herein set forth, was duly sworn by me; and that the within transcript is a true record of the testimony given by said witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 13th day of February, 2019.



Julia M. Speros

13th 11:19	block 9:5	9,11,13,16,20,22,24 9:20,22,24 10:1,3,5,8,12 (42)	different 4:20 6:16	gives 7:3
action 11:14	blood 11:14		discretion 7:13	good 3:2
adjourned 10:21	borough 2:10,12,13 3:19,23,25 4:2,6,8,10 6:3,4 8:16,17 9:5 10:8,9 (17)	college 9:9	distributed 10:16	greenbelt 6:19,21 7:5,9 (4)
adopted 6:8 8:21 10:13		come 3:5	duly 11:8	hall 1:13
afternoon 3:2		commencement 7:11	economic 4:24	hand 11:19
agenda 10:15	boulevard 9:6	commencing 7:3	end 7:15	hearing 5:8 7:21 9:13
agreement 4:23 6:19,21 7:2,7,15,16 (7)	bronx 3:20,23	committee 1:5 3:5 4:19 6:15 (4)	enter 6:18	hereby 11:6
allan 2:12	brooklyn 2:10 3:25 5:3 6:5 9:6 10:10 (6)	community 9:9	entered 7:8	herein 11:8
am 11:12,15	budget 2:7 3:17 6:1 8:14 10:6 (5)	completes 10:19	entire 10:15	hereunto 11:18
amrita 2:6	c 2:2	comptroller 2:9 3:12 5:21 8:9 10:1 (5)	event 7:10,14	humboldt 5:2
another 5:12 7:25 9:17	calendar 4:14,16 6:7,10,12 8:20,23,25 10:12,19 (10)	concession 1:5 3:4 4:18,21 6:14,17,24 9:2 (8)	extend 7:15	identified 9:4
approval 4:19 6:15		conovitz 2:9 3:13 5:22 8:10 10:2 (5)	facility 6:25	inc 6:20
ask 5:5 7:18 9:11 10:14 (4)	call 3:7 4:14 6:10 8:23 (4)	conservancy 6:20,22 7:5,9 (4)	february 1:11 11:19	intent 4:17 6:13 9:1
available 10:16	cantlocockfield 2:11 4:1 5:11 6:6 8:2 9:16 10:11 (7)	corporation 2:6 3:14 4:24 5:23 8:11 10:3 (6)	final 10:17	interested 11:16
award 9:2		counsel 2:6 3:14 5:23 8:11 10:3 (5)	first 4:14	into 6:18 7:8
barth 2:6 3:15 5:24 8:12 9:19 10:4 (6)	carousel 6:23	court 1:20	five 7:10	irwin 9:7
beach 9:4	certification 11:2	date 7:3,9,11	food 6:24	island 2:13 4:11 7:1 8:18 (4)
behalf 6:3 8:16 10:8	certify 11:6,12	day 11:19	forth 11:8	item 4:14,16 5:10 6:7,10,12 7:23 8:20,23,25 9:15 10:12 (12)
being 3:3	children 6:23	department 4:15 6:11 8:24	four 7:12	jeanpaul 2:17
benjamin 2:5	city 4:15,21,23 6:11,17 8:24 9:8 (7)	development 4:24	franchise 1:5 3:4 4:18 6:14 (4)	jennifer 2:9
between 5:2 7:8	clerk 2:17 3:7,8,1 0,12,14,16,19,22 4:2,5,10,13,15 5:1 5,17,19,21,23,25 6:3,7,9,11 8:3,5,7,		furnas 2:5 3:11 5:14,20 8:8 9:25 (6)	julia 1:20 11:4
beverage 6:24			gemayel 2:17	kapil 2:3
			given 11:10	kingsborough 9:9

<p>lashay 2:14</p> <p>let 3:22 4:5</p> <p>license 4:23 6:19</p> <p>located 5:2 6:25 9:6</p> <p>longani 2:3 3:2,9 4:13 5:4,8,12,15,18 6:9 7:17,21,25 8:3,6,22 9:10,13,17,20,23 10:20 (22)</p> <p>lot 9:4,5</p> <p>made 10:16</p> <p>maintain 6:22</p> <p>maintenance 5:1 7:7,16 9:3 (4)</p> <p>make 5:5,9 7:18,22 9:14 10:14 (6)</p> <p>management 2:7 3:16 4:25 5:25 8:13 10:5 (6)</p> <p>manhattan 4:3,6 9:4</p> <p>marriage 11:15</p> <p>matter 4:17 5:6 6:13 7:19 9:1,11 11:17 (7)</p> <p>mayor 2:3,4 3:8,10 5:17,19 8:5,7 9:22,24 (10)</p> <p>meeting 1:4 3:5 10:15,17,20 (5)</p> <p>member 5:4,9,12 7:17,22,25 9:10,14,17 (9)</p>	<p>moore 5:2</p> <p>motion 5:9,13 7:22 8:1 9:14,18 (6)</p> <p>move 5:9 7:22 9:14</p> <p>moved 5:11 7:24 9:16</p> <p>ms 3:13,15,18 4:1,12 5:11,22,24 6:2,6 7:24 8:2,10,12,15,19 9:16,19 10:2,4,7,11 (22)</p> <p>my 11:19</p> <p>negotiate 4:22</p> <p>new 1:13,13 4:15,22,23 6:11,18 7:6,15 8:24 9:8 11:5 (12)</p> <p>no 3:21 4:4 5:7 7:14,20 9:12 11:15 (7)</p> <p>none 5:8 7:21 9:13</p> <p>notary 11:4</p> <p>noted 10:22</p> <p>notice 7:4</p> <p>now 3:5</p> <p>number 4:16 6:7,13 8:20 9:1 10:12 (6)</p> <p>office 2:4,7 3:10,16 5:19,25 8:7,13 9:24 10:5 (10)</p> <p>one 9:7</p>	<p>oneyear 7:12</p> <p>operate 6:22</p> <p>operation 4:25 7:7,16 9:3 (4)</p> <p>options 7:11</p> <p>order 3:6</p> <p>oriental 9:6</p> <p>outcome 11:16</p> <p>p 2:2,2</p> <p>park 7:1 9:4</p> <p>parking 9:3</p> <p>parks 6:12 7:3,8 8:25 (4)</p> <p>parks' 7:13</p> <p>part 10:17</p> <p>parties 11:13</p> <p>past 7:15</p> <p>pedestrian 5:1</p> <p>periods 7:12</p> <p>permit 6:21</p> <p>plaza 5:1</p> <p>please 3:7 4:13 5:9,13,15 6:9 7:22 8:1,3,22 9:14,18,20 (13)</p> <p>pm 1:2 10:22</p> <p>present 3:24 4:7</p> <p>president 2:10,12,13 3:19,23,25 4:2,6,8,10 6:4</p>	<p>8:17 10:9 (13)</p> <p>presidents 6:4 8:17 10:9</p> <p>procedure 4:20 6:16</p> <p>proceed 7:4</p> <p>proceeding 10:18</p> <p>proceedings 3:1</p> <p>provide 4:25</p> <p>provided 7:13</p> <p>provides 7:2</p> <p>public 1:4 3:5 10:15 11:4 (4)</p> <p>publicly 10:16</p> <p>pursuant 4:20 6:16</p> <p>queens 2:12 4:8</p> <p>question 5:6 7:19 9:11</p> <p>quintian 2:8 3:18 6:2 8:15 10:7 (5)</p> <p>reade 1:22</p> <p>record 3:22 4:5 10:18 11:10 (4)</p> <p>recreation 6:12 8:25</p> <p>reflect 3:22 4:5</p> <p>related 11:13</p> <p>renew 7:12</p> <p>reporter 1:20 10:14</p>	<p>resolution 6:8 8:21 10:13</p> <p>response 3:21 4:4 5:7 7:20 9:12 (5)</p> <p>review 1:5 3:4 4:18 6:14 (4)</p> <p>roll 3:7</p> <p>rules 4:21 6:17</p> <p>said 11:10</p> <p>second 5:13,14 6:10 8:1,2 9:18,19 (7)</p> <p>section 4:20 6:16</p> <p>seek 4:17 6:14</p> <p>september 7:6</p> <p>set 11:8,19</p> <p>sevensession 9:7</p> <p>shall 6:21 7:10,14</p> <p>signature 11:23</p> <p>sole 4:22 6:18 7:13</p> <p>source 4:22 6:18</p> <p>souvenir 6:24</p> <p>spector 1:13</p> <p>speros 1:20 11:4</p> <p>state 11:5</p> <p>statement 5:5 7:18</p> <p>staten 2:13 4:11 7:1 8:17 (4)</p> <p>street 1:22</p>
---	---	--	--	--

<p>5:2,3,3 9:7 (5)</p> <p>swisher 2:12 4:9</p> <p>sworn 11:8</p> <p>take 5:16 8:4 9:21</p> <p>term 7:2,10,14 9:8 (4)</p> <p>terminating 7:5</p> <p>testimony 11:7,10</p> <p>thank 3:3 10:20</p> <p>third 8:23</p> <p>time 10:22</p> <p>tonya 2:11</p> <p>transcript 11:9</p> <p>transportation 4:16</p> <p>true 11:9</p> <p>university 9:8</p> <p>unless 7:6</p> <p>up 7:12</p> <p>utilize 4:19 6:15</p> <p>varet 5:3</p> <p>vote 5:16 8:4 9:21</p> <p>way 11:15</p> <p>well 6:23</p> <p>whereof 11:18</p> <p>which 7:10 10:15</p>	<p>who 5:4 7:17 9:10</p> <p>whose 11:7</p> <p>will 3:5,7 4:13 5:8,12,15 6:9 7:21,25 8:3,22 9:13,17,20 (14)</p> <p>willowbrook 6:25</p> <p>wishes 5:5 7:18 9:11</p> <p>within 11:5,9</p> <p>witness 11:7,11,18</p> <p>written 7:4</p> <p>x 1:2,7</p> <p>years 7:10</p> <p>yes 5:18,20,22,24 6:2,6 8:6,8,10,12,15,19 9:23,25 10:2,4,7,11 (18)</p> <p>york 1:13,13 4:15,22,23 6:11,18 8:24 9:8 11:5 (10)</p> <p>young 2:14 4:12 7:24 8:19 (4)</p> <p>yvonne 2:8</p> <p>242 10:22</p> <p>485 9:5</p> <p>2019 1:11 7:6 11:20</p> <p>8760 9:5</p>			
---	---	--	--	--

PUBLIC MEETING

FRANCHISE AND CONCESSION REVIEW COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 13, 2019 @ 2:30 P.M.

22 READE STREET, NEW YORK, NY

NOTE: This location is accessible to individuals using wheelchairs or other mobility devices. For further information on accessibility or to make a request for accommodations, such as sign language interpretation services, please contact the Mayor's Office of Contract Services (MOCS) via e-mail at DisabilityAffairs@mocs.nyc.gov or via phone at (212) 788-0010. Any person requiring reasonable accommodation for the public meeting should contact MOCS at least three (3) business days in advance of the meeting to ensure availability. ☒

*Franchise and Concession Review Committee Joint Public Meeting
Wednesday, February 13, 2019 @ 2:30 P.M.*

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

No. 1: **IN THE MATTER** of intent to seek Franchise and Concession Review Committee approval to utilize a different procedure, pursuant to Section 1-16 of the Concession Rules of the City of New York, to negotiate a Sole Source License Agreement (Agreement) with The New York City Economic Development Corporation ("EDC"), to provide for the operation, management and maintenance of a pedestrian plaza located on Humboldt Street between Moore Street and Varet Street in Brooklyn ("Licensed Plaza"), including through DOT-approved events, sponsorships, and subconcessions, including but not limited to providing for the sale of any of the following: prepared food, flowers, locally grown produce or locally manufactured products, merchandise (such as souvenirs or T-shirts) that promotes the neighborhood or EDC, and other similar merchandise within the Licensed Plaza. Subconcessions would be awarded based on solicitations issued by EDC in the basic form of Request for Proposals or Request for Bids, subject to DOT's prior written approval of both solicitation and award.

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 2: **IN THE MATTER** of the intent to seek Franchise and Concession Review Committee approval to utilize a different procedure, pursuant to Section 1-16 of the Concession Rules of the City of New York, to enter into a Sole Source License Agreement ("Agreement") with the Greenbelt Conservancy, Inc. The Agreement shall permit Greenbelt Conservancy to operate and maintain the Carousel for all Children, as well as a food, beverage, and souvenir concession at the facility located in Willowbrook Park Staten Island. The Agreement provides for a term commencing on the date Parks gives written notice to proceed to the Greenbelt Conservancy and terminating on September 14, 2019, unless a new maintenance and operation agreement is entered into between Parks and the Greenbelt Conservancy by that date, in which event the term shall be five years from the commencement date, with options to renew for up to four (4) one-year

periods at Parks' sole discretion, provided that in no event shall the term of the Agreement extend past the end of any new maintenance and operation agreement. Greenbelt Conservancy, Inc., shall pay the City a guaranteed annual flat fee of \$6,000 each year of the five year term, and \$6,500 a year for any renewal thereof.

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

No. 3: **IN THE MATTER** of the intent to award as a concession for the operation and maintenance of a parking lot at Manhattan Beach Park, identified as Block 8760, Lot 485 in the Borough of Brooklyn, located at Oriental Boulevard and Irwin Street, for one (1) seven-season term to City University of New York, Kingsborough Community College. Compensation to the City will be as follows: Operating Season 1 (Sept. 9, 2019 - May 12, 2020): \$114,000; Operating Season 2 (Sept. 14, 2020 – May 10, 2021): \$114,000; Operating Season 3 (Sept. 13, 2021 - May 9, 2022): \$114,000; Operating Season 4 (Sept. 12, 2022 - May 8, 2023): \$114,000; Operating Season 5 (Sept. 11, 2023 - May 12, 2024): \$114,000; Operating Season 6 (Sept. 9, 2024 – May 11, 2025): \$114,000, Operating Season 7 (Sept. 15, 2022 – May 10, 2026): \$114,000.