



The City of New York
Department of Investigation

MARK G. PETERS
COMMISSIONER

80 MAIDEN LANE
NEW YORK, NY 10038
212-825-5900

Release 31-2016
nyc.gov/html/doi

**FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE
TUESDAY, OCTOBER 4, 2016**

**CONTACT: DIANE STRUZZI
NICOLE TURSO
212-825-5931**

DOI INVESTIGATION REVEALS NYCHA STAFF NEGLECT SAFETY CHECKS IN PUBLIC HOUSING APARTMENTS

--More than half of units re-inspected by DOI after maintenance visits had safety deficiencies--

-- Staff often submitted false reports claiming to have performed the checks when they did not--

Mark G. Peters, Commissioner of the New York City Department of Investigation ("DOI"), announced today the findings of a DOI investigation prompted by the April 2016 fire at NYCHA's Butler Houses in the Bronx that killed two young children and in which neighbors and other witnesses reported not hearing smoke alarms at the time of the fire. DOI's investigation revealed that a NYCHA maintenance worker had been inside the apartment only hours before the fire occurred, and learned that a smoke alarm was broken, but then falsely reported to NYCHA on the work order form that the apartment's smoke alarms were working. DOI's Report also included a systemic review of NYCHA's compliance with its apartment safety checks policy, finding failures by NYCHA staff to properly conduct six key apartment safety checks including testing smoke and carbon monoxide ("CO") detectors. The Report also found that NYCHA staff often falsely reported that they had conducted the checks when they had not. A copy of DOI's Report is attached to this release and can be found at the following link: <http://www.nyc.gov/html/doi/html/doireports/public.shtml>

DOI Commissioner Mark G. Peters said, "Once again, a DOI investigation has determined that the City's failure to follow the rules has put children in real danger, just like prior investigations over the past two years into the FDNY, DOH, DHS and of course ACS. DOI has now found that NYCHA workers blatantly flouted basic precautions, supervisors failed to check on them, and tragedy was the result."

As part of its investigation, DOI reviewed apartments at five NYCHA developments and found that maintenance workers frequently ignore their obligation to perform safety checks and often falsify documents to cover up that fact. DOI's re-inspection of 240 apartments recently visited by maintenance workers found that 128 units -- or 53% -- had deficiencies in one or more of the six safety conditions NYCHA requires its maintenance staff to check when they enter an apartment. Furthermore, because NYCHA management offices had failed to properly maintain work orders in violation of agency policy, 104 of the original 240 work orders had been lost and could not be reviewed.

According to the investigation, on April 13, 2016 at 6:30 p.m., a fire started in the living room of a NYCHA Butler Houses apartment, fatally injuring two children. A NYCHA maintenance worker visited that apartment just four hours prior to the fire to conduct routine maintenance on a clogged shower drain. NYCHA requires that maintenance staff document the condition of six critical apartment safety issues each time they enter a unit, including checking for a fire safety procedure sticker, a working CO detector, a working smoke detector, window guards, and other features. The worker later stated to DOI that the apartment had two smoke alarms and that on the day of the fire he had checked one alarm, which did not work, and checked the other smoke alarm, which was operational. The worker told NYCHA's Senior Vice President for Property Management Operations a different story, stating he had found that two smoke detectors in the apartment were not working.

more

However, on the work order report filled out hours before the fire, the worker indicated that the condition of all six safety items, including the smoke detectors, was “satisfactory.”

As an outgrowth of these findings, DOI began a broader investigation to determine whether maintenance workers assigned to other apartments in NYCHA developments in the Bronx, Staten Island and Manhattan were properly inspecting the six apartment safety items and addressing or reporting any problems. The investigation found:

- In 106 out of 188 NYCHA apartments – 56% – DOI investigators observed deficiencies in one or more of the six critical safety items, including numerous missing smoke and CO detectors and missing or damaged fire safety notices.
- In comparing the available original work orders with DOI inspection results, investigators determined that in 29% of apartments, NYCHA maintenance staff had failed to report that smoke or CO detectors were missing, damaged, or not functioning.
- At Butler Houses where the fatal fire occurred, DOI investigators found deficiencies in 70 of the 114 apartments they re-inspected – 61% – and of 62 apartments where original work orders were available NYCHA staff inaccurately reported that smoke alarms or CO alarms were functioning in 25, or 42%, of apartments.

After finding these major safety issues, DOI then continued its investigation by obtaining a list of apartments scheduled for maintenance, and then following NYCHA maintenance workers to 52 apartments, re-inspecting them within 36 hours of NYCHA's visit so that DOI investigators could see the same conditions. DOI found one or more safety deficiencies in 22 of these 52 apartments (42%). In only 30 of those apartments did NYCHA have the proper paperwork available for review resulting in the following finding: NYCHA maintenance staff inaccurately reported that smoke detectors and/or CO alarms were functioning in 9 out of 30 apartments (30%) even though they clearly were not.

DOI also interviewed maintenance staff and supervisors concerning the discrepancies and found numerous staff stated they conducted only visual checks of the smoke alarms, rather than pushing the test button on the detectors to confirm they were fully operational. One supervisor said he did not perform spot checks of workers' jobs to ensure they were properly conducted, contrary to NYCHA policy. As a result, DOI has referred a total of eight maintenance workers and one Assistant Superintendent to NYCHA for disciplinary action.

DOI made several recommendations to NYCHA to ensure that staff properly perform safety checks, accurately document their findings and are closely supervised for accountability:

- NYCHA should immediately commence an audit of the six apartment safety check items in a sampling of its developments citywide. In developments where problems are identified, NYCHA must conduct comprehensive testing to ensure full compliance.
- Within 60 days, NYCHA should develop and implement a written plan to ensure better compliance with NYCHA rules requiring that: a) every time maintenance staff enter an apartment, they must perform a physical test of all smoke alarms and CO detectors to determine whether they are operational; b) maintenance staff must also check window guards, fire safety notices, Ground Fault Circuit Interrupter (“GFCI”) outlets, and apartment front doors during every visit; c) any safety deficiencies must be duly noted on the work order submitted to development management; and d) development supervisors must perform spot checks to review maintenance staff work and the accuracy of work order reporting, including concerning the six apartment safety items. This compliance plan could include additional training for development staff; quality assurance checks to review the performance of maintenance workers and supervisory staff; and affirmative audits of the condition of the safety items in NYCHA apartments.

- NYCHA should revise its work order form to indicate that employees may not rely on solely visual inspections of smoke or CO detectors or window guards, but rather must physically test the operability of apartment smoke and CO alarms by pushing the test button, and manually check that window guards are securely installed.
- NYCHA must improve its recordkeeping by reinforcing the obligation of development management offices to obtain, organize, and secure all original work orders, in order to document safety conditions as well as apartment maintenance and repair. NYCHA should continue to implement and review the efficacy of electronic work order reporting via handheld devices.
- NYCHA must consider appropriate disciplinary action against the nine employees described in this report.

NYCHA has accepted each of these recommendations and already begun implementation, and DOI will continue to monitor progress.

DOI Commissioner Peters thanked NYCHA Chair and Chief Executive Officer Shola Olatoye and her staff for their cooperation and assistance on this investigation.

This investigation was conducted by DOI's Office of the Inspector General for NYCHA, specifically First Deputy Inspector General Pamela Sah, Deputy Inspector General Osa Omoigui, Chief Investigators Nancy Roa and Ivonne Alvarado-DeJesus, Confidential Investigators Alfred Carletta, Wenny Hon and Tatiana-Maria Biess, and Special Investigator David Haynes, under the supervision of Inspector General Ralph M. Iannuzzi, Associate Commissioner James J. Flaherty, Deputy Commissioner/Chief of Investigations Michael Carroll, and First Deputy Commissioner Lesley Brovner.

DOI is one of the oldest law-enforcement agencies in the country and New York City's corruption watchdog. Investigations may involve any agency, officer, elected official or employee of the City, as well as those who do business with or receive benefits from the City. DOI's strategy attacks corruption comprehensively through systemic investigations that lead to high-impact arrests, preventive internal controls and operational reforms that improve the way the City runs.

**DOI's press releases can also be found at twitter.com/doinews
*Bribery and Corruption are a Trap. Don't Get Caught Up. Report It at 212-3-NYC-DOI.***



New York City Department of Investigation

**Smoke Alarm and Other Safety Deficiencies in NYCHA Public Housing:
Routine Neglect of Safety Rules and Falsification of Documents
by NYCHA Maintenance Staff**

**MARK G. PETERS
COMMISSIONER**

October 2016

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary.....	1
------------------------	---

INVESTIGATIVE FINDING

I. The Fatal Fire.....	2
II. NYCHA Procedures and NYC Law Concerning Smoke Detectors.....	3
III. Butler Houses Smoke Detectors.....	4
IV. DOI Inspections of Critical Apartment Safety Items.....	5
A. <i>Butler, Stapleton, and LaGuardia Houses</i>	
B. <i>Carver and Jefferson Houses</i>	
C. <i>Interviews of Maintenance Workers and Supervisors</i>	
V. Policy and Procedure Recommendations.....	7

CONCLUSION.....	9
-----------------	---

APPENDICES

Appendix A: NYCHA Work Order #43459210

Appendix B: Butler Houses Apartment Inspections

Appendix C: Stapleton Houses Apartment Inspections

Appendix D: LaGuardia Houses Apartment Inspections

Appendix E: Carver Houses Apartment Inspections

Appendix F: Jefferson Houses Apartment Inspections

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On the evening of April 13, 2016, two young children who had been left home alone were killed in an apartment fire at the New York City Housing Authority's ("NYCHA") Butler Houses public housing development in the Bronx. Neighbors and first responder witnesses reported that they did not hear any smoke alarms at the time of the fire.

Immediately following the fire, the New York City Department of Investigation ("DOI"), Office of the Inspector General for NYCHA commenced an investigation and found that NYCHA maintenance worker Rene Rivera ("Rivera") had been inside the apartment only hours before the fire, and filed false paperwork stating that he had tested the apartment's smoke alarms and found they were functioning. In fact, they were not. Rivera's false report meant that no one at NYCHA was aware of, and thus in a position to correct, the dangerous condition.

Following the fire, NYCHA inspected safety conditions in several Butler Houses apartments recently visited by Rivera, and identified several inaccurate reports by Rivera, which NYCHA reported to DOI.

NYCHA policy mandates that every time maintenance staff are inside an apartment, they must perform six critical apartment safety checks, including testing smoke alarms, and report any safety deficiencies on a work order form.¹ Following the Butler Houses fire, DOI conducted an independent systemic investigation to assess NYCHA's compliance with its apartment safety checks policy. DOI's investigation determined that maintenance staff routinely neglect to perform required safety checks, and falsify work orders to cover up this failure, but are not held accountable by their supervisors.

Specifically, DOI inspected 136 apartments that had recently been visited by maintenance workers and where original work orders were available, and found 40 instances (29%) in which maintenance workers had inaccurately reported that smoke or carbon monoxide ("CO") detectors were in satisfactory condition, when in fact they were not. DOI also found that development management offices had failed to properly maintain, and were thus unable to locate, many original work orders. In total, DOI inspected 240 apartments, and found that 128 units (53%) had deficiencies in one or more of the six safety items.

DOI investigators subsequently interviewed maintenance staff and supervisors concerning discrepancies between maintenance workers' work order reports and DOI's inspection results. Maintenance workers universally reported understanding that their job includes conducting the six safety checks. However, numerous maintenance staff admitted that instead of confirming that smoke alarms are fully operational by pushing the test button, they conduct only visual checks to look for a lit indicator light. In

¹ NYCHA requires that work orders be used to track and document all maintenance and repair requests and responses. Maintenance staff are also required to indicate on work order forms the results of their testing of six apartment safety items: fire safety procedure notices, CO detectors, window guards, smoke detectors, Ground Fault Circuit Interrupter outlets where present, and apartment doors.

addition, one development supervisor admitted that he did not perform spot checks of maintenance workers' jobs to ensure that safety checks are being conducted, contrary to NYCHA policy. DOI referred eight maintenance workers and one Assistant Superintendent to NYCHA for consideration of employee disciplinary action.

In addition, this report makes Policy and Procedure Recommendations to ensure that NYCHA maintenance staff properly perform safety checks, accurately document their findings, and are closely supervised for accountability. NYCHA has accepted each of these Policy and Procedure Recommendations and begun implementation, and DOI will continue to monitor progress.

INVESTIGATIVE FINDINGS

I. The Fatal Fire

On April 13, 2016, at 6:30 p.m., a fire started in the living room of NYCHA Butler Houses apartment #3F at 1368 Webster Avenue in the Bronx. Two sisters, ages 1 and 2, suffered injuries and died that evening. The FDNY Bureau of Fire Investigation concluded that the fire was caused by burning incense.

Numerous witnesses who were near the apartment during the fire told FDNY Bureau of Fire Investigation investigators that smoke alarms were not activated in the apartment: three neighbors, as well as the first firefighter on-site, stated that they did not hear any alarms during the fire.² Consequently, the official FDNY report concluded that the apartment's smoke detector(s) were "Present Not Operational."³

The tenant of record of the apartment, who allowed the children and their mother to stay in the apartment, told NYPD and NYCHA representatives that the smoke alarms had been working in the days before the fire, but he was not in the apartment at the time of the fire and he stated that he could not confirm that the smoke alarms had been functioning on the day of the fire.⁴

II. NYCHA Procedures and NYC Law Concerning Smoke Detectors

Both New York City law and NYCHA rules require that as a landlord, NYCHA must install at least one smoke detector in every apartment at move-in.⁵ It is tenants' responsibility to test and maintain smoke detectors throughout the tenancy.⁶

² FDNY Bureau of Fire Investigation, Fire Incident Report and Interview Sheets, BFI Job Number 20196-2016.

³ FDNY Bureau of Fire Investigation, 10-45 Reports for deceased.

⁴ The tenant of record spoke with NYPD PSA 7 Community Affairs Officer Angel Irizarry, NYCHA Senior Vice President for Operations Brian Clarke, and NYCHA Social Services Administrator Marilyn Goulbourne, among others.

⁵ "New York City Local Law 62 of 1981 requires landlords, including NYCHA, to install at least one battery-operated smoke detecting device in each apartment. More than one smoke detector shall be installed in apartments with two distinct bedroom areas." NYCHA Management Manual (4/27/16),

Though not mandated by New York City law, NYCHA procedure requires that “[s]moke detectors are to be checked to determine that they are operational each time that development maintenance personnel enters an apartment.”⁷ To document these checks, NYCHA’s standard work order form requires that maintenance staff document the presence and condition of six critical apartment safety issues: fire safety procedures sticker on inside of apartment door; a working CO detector; window guards in place; a working smoke detector; a functioning Ground Fault Circuit Interrupter (“GFCI”) outlet where present⁸; and a self-closing apartment door.⁹ These safety checks must be completed and reported as “satisfactory,” “unsatisfactory,” or documented with “corrective action” taken, for each one of thousands of work orders processed each day by NYCHA. The work order forms are not merely an administrative convenience. They are a vital safety check that can apprise NYCHA of unsafe conditions in its buildings.

III. Butler Houses Smoke Detectors

NYCHA work order records show that approximately four hours before the fatal fire, on April 13, 2016 at 2:30 p.m., Rivera, a 27-year NYCHA veteran maintenance worker, went to the subject four-bedroom Butler Houses apartment to conduct the routine maintenance job of fixing a clogged shower drain. See work order #43459210, attached as Appendix A. Rivera reported that he was in the apartment for 20 minutes until 2:50 p.m., and that he “cleared” (fixed) the problem. Rivera signed the work order with his signature and NYCHA badge number.

During an interview with DOI investigators, Rivera stated that the apartment had two smoke alarms and that on the day of the fire, he checked one alarm, which did not work,

at 93-94. Because of the importance of smoke detectors, NYCHA policy provides that tenants who refuse installation may be subject to tenancy termination action. *Id.*

⁶ “It shall be the sole duty of the occupant of each dwelling unit . . . in which a smoke detecting device has been provided and installed by the owner . . . to: (1) keep and maintain such device in good repair; and (2) replace any and all devices which are either stolen, removed, missing or rendered inoperable during the occupancy of such dwelling unit . . . an owner of [a multiple dwelling] shall not be required to keep and maintain such device in good repair or to replace any such device which is stolen, removed, missing or rendered inoperable during the occupancy of such dwelling unit.” NYC Housing Maintenance Code § 27-2045; see also NYC Housing Preservation & Development regulations § 12-02. See also NYCHA Management Manual (4/27/16), at 93-94: “Tenants are responsible for maintaining their detectors in good operating condition. Proper maintenance includes: Testing the detector weekly[;] Battery replacement[;] Following manufacturer’s instructions for installation and maintenance[;] Replacing smoke detectors missing or rendered inoperative during occupancy.”

⁷ NYCHA Standard Procedure 040:04:3, “Fire Safety” (8/17/04), at 6 (emphasis added).

⁸ A GFCI outlet is designed for use in wet locations such as bathrooms and kitchens, to prevent accidental electrical shock. NYCHA does not require a GFCI outlet in every apartment, but where a GFCI outlet is present, it must be functioning.

⁹ After the Butler Houses fire, NYCHA sometimes refers to these safety items as “5 ALIVE”: Alarms (smoke and CO detectors present, installed and operating); Ledges (window guards installed in every window in units with children, but never on fire escape or emergency exit windows); Info (fire safety notice posted on door); Volts (Ground Fault Circuit Interrupter outlets tested and power cuts out properly); and Entrance (front door self-closes and latch catches).

and that he checked the other smoke alarm and it was operational. Rivera also admitted that sometimes, because he was “rushing” to do his work, “you don’t check the alarm – it happens, very often,” and “sometimes . . . I didn’t check, I seen [the alarm] but I didn’t check.”¹⁰

During a separate conversation with NYCHA’s Senior Vice President for Property Management Operations, Rivera stated that the afternoon of the fire, he had checked two hard-wired smoke detectors in the apartment, and both were non-operational. Rivera also stated that he checked a third, battery-operated smoke detector mounted on the wall, which worked.

On the April 13, 2016 work order, Rivera indicated that all six safety items, including smoke detectors and window guards, were “satisfactory.” In fact, if Rivera had properly undertaken his responsibility to document the broken smoke detector (or detectors) on the work order, NYCHA would have been alerted to this critical safety threat.¹¹

Soon after identifying Rivera’s inaccurate reports of safety conditions, NYCHA suspended him from work, and served him with employee disciplinary charges for false reporting and other failures to perform his job duties. On July 1, 2016, while suspended and disciplinary charges were pending, Rivera retired.

IV. DOI Inspections of Critical Apartment Safety Items

In the wake of the fire, DOI commenced an independent systemic investigation to determine whether NYCHA maintenance workers assigned to apartments to conduct routine maintenance work are properly inspecting the six apartment safety items and addressing or reporting any problems.

DOI inspected a total of 240 apartments in five NYCHA developments in the Bronx, Staten Island, and Manhattan, in order to observe and document the condition of the six safety items. Investigators observed deficiencies in one or more of the six critical safety items in 128 apartments (53%), including numerous missing smoke and CO detectors and missing or damaged fire safety notices. A strong majority of apartment residents surveyed by DOI reported that to their knowledge, maintenance workers had not conducted the safety checks.¹²

¹⁰ DOI investigators interviewed Rivera two times during the course of this investigation, in April and August 2016. The quoted statements are from the August interview.

¹¹ Rivera should have indicated “unsatisfactory” on the work order, thus alerting NYCHA to the problem, or should have taken “corrective action” by replacing any broken smoke alarms on the spot and so documenting on the work order. NYCHA Standard Procedure 040:09:7 (4/27/09) at 12: “General Repairs – Maintenance Worker after completing the investigation must note on the Work Order a description of the work needed or completed, completion times and materials used or needed.” He did neither.

¹² For example, of 31 surveys at Butler Houses, only 3 (10%) of residents reported that the maintenance worker performed the safety checks, whereas 24 (77%) reported that safety checks were not conducted, and the remaining residents could not recall. At Jefferson Houses, out of 114

Investigators also obtained NYCHA’s computerized records of work orders, and additionally requested from each development management office the original work orders with handwritten notations by maintenance staff. Notably, 104 (43%) of the original 240 work orders had not been properly maintained by the management offices and could not be located. After comparing available original work orders with DOI inspection results, investigators determined that in 29% of apartments – 40 out of 136 apartments where original work orders were available – NYCHA maintenance staff had failed to report that smoke or CO detectors were missing, damaged, or not functioning.

A. Butler, Stapleton, and LaGuardia Houses

In April and May 2016, DOI inspected 188 apartments at Butler Houses, Bronx; Stapleton Houses, Staten Island; and LaGuardia Houses, Manhattan. Investigators then compared available original work orders, which had been filled out by maintenance workers between one day and nine weeks earlier, against DOI’s inspection results.

The complete investigative findings are attached as Appendices B (Butler Houses), C (Stapleton Houses), and D (LaGuardia Houses), and summarized as follows:

NYCHA Development	DOI Apartment Inspections	Apartments with Observed Safety Deficiencies	Discrepancies Between Maintenance Staff Reports that Smoke/CO Alarms Were Functioning and DOI Observations¹³
Butler Houses, Bronx ¹⁴	114	70 (61%)	25 out of 62 (42%)
Stapleton Houses, Staten Island ¹⁵	31	18 (58%)	1 out of 16 (6%)
LaGuardia Houses, Manhattan ¹⁶	43	18 (42%)	5 out of 28 (18%)
	188	106 (56%)	31 out of 106 (29%)

When interviewed by investigators, several maintenance staff from these developments insisted that they had conducted all safety checks, but stated that *after* their maintenance

surveys, 31 residents (27%) reported that safety checks were performed, and 47 residents (41%) said that they were not.

¹³ This column reports smoke and CO alarm deficiencies as a percentage of work orders actually produced by each development.

¹⁴ DOI investigators conducted apartment inspections at Butler Houses on 4/19/16, 4/22/16, and 5/4/16, reviewing work orders performed from 3/1-4/25/16.

¹⁵ DOI investigators conducted apartment inspections at Stapleton Houses on 5/10/16, reviewing work orders performed from 4/2-4/25/16.

¹⁶ DOI investigators conducted apartment inspections at LaGuardia Houses on 5/6/16 and 5/10/16, reviewing work orders performed from 4/1-4/29/16.

visit, tenants might have removed or damaged the safety items. In a few apartments, tenants said that at some point before DOI's inspection, they had themselves taken down smoke alarms or removed the batteries.¹⁷

B. *Carver and Jefferson Houses*

In order to obtain contemporaneous evidence of the condition of the six safety items immediately after maintenance workers' visits, on May 19, 2016, DOI investigators inspected 52 apartments at Jefferson Houses and Carver Houses in Manhattan, and compared inspection results against work orders completed on May 18 and May 19, 2016.

Complete investigative findings are attached as Appendices E (Carver Houses) and F (Jefferson Houses), and summarized as follows:

NYCHA Development	DOI Apartment Inspections	Apartments with Observed Safety Deficiencies	Maintenance Staff Inaccurately Reported that Smoke and/or CO Alarms Were Functioning
Carver Houses, Manhattan	21	6 (29%)	3 out of 12 (25%)
Jefferson Houses, Manhattan	31	16 (52%)	6 out of 18 (33%)
	52	22 (42%)	9 out of 30 (30%)

Thus, even when investigators visited apartments immediately following maintenance worker visits (within 36 hours), DOI found that 42% of apartments had safety deficiencies, including broken and missing smoke and CO alarms. Furthermore, on 30% of these work orders, maintenance workers inaccurately reported that smoke and/or CO alarms were functioning. These investigative findings strongly suggest that NYCHA maintenance workers routinely submit work orders that falsely certify that they have tested the critical safety items and found them in satisfactory condition.

C. *Interviews of Maintenance Workers and Supervisors*

After identifying these discrepancies, DOI interviewed maintenance workers whose work order reports of satisfactory safety conditions were contradicted by DOI's inspection results. At Butler Houses, DOI identified two maintenance workers with numerous instances and high rates of inaccurate reports.¹⁸ Both claimed that they had properly performed safety checks in all apartments.

¹⁷ These two apartments, both at Butler Houses, were excluded from the above statistics.

¹⁸ One maintenance worker inaccurately reported that smoke and/or CO detectors were present and functioning on 6 out of 13 sampled work orders; the other made inaccurate reports on 7 out of 16 sampled work orders.

At Jefferson Houses, DOI investigators interviewed six maintenance workers who admitted that they sometimes conducted only “visual checks” by looking at smoke detectors for an indicator light, but did not always perform physical checks by pushing the test button. One maintenance worker admitted that even if the indicator light is off, she did not always press the test button and likely “miss[es] some” alarms. Another maintenance worker, asked whether he conducts physical tests, responded, “Not every time, no . . . because the job becomes repetitive,” and admitted that he was less likely to press the test button when he was in a rush or encountered a hostile resident, or when the smoke alarm was a newer model. In addition, a Jefferson Houses Assistant Superintendent admitted that he did not routinely spot check maintenance workers’ work orders as required by NYCHA policy, in order to confirm that the maintenance jobs and the safety checks were properly performed.

DOI has referred these eight maintenance workers and one Assistant Superintendent to NYCHA for consideration of appropriate disciplinary action.

V. Policy and Procedure Recommendations

This investigation found widespread disregard of NYCHA rules requiring that every time maintenance staff enter an apartment, they must inspect and accurately document the condition of six critical apartment safety items. Specifically, DOI’s investigation determined that maintenance workers frequently ignore their obligation to perform these safety checks. Furthermore, DOI obtained admissions from a supervisor that, contrary to NYCHA policy, he did not routinely perform spot checks to review maintenance workers’ completed work.

Accordingly, DOI makes the following Policy and Procedure Recommendations:

- 1) NYCHA should immediately commence an audit of the six apartment safety check items in a sampling of developments city-wide. In developments where problems are identified, NYCHA must conduct comprehensive testing to ensure full compliance.

NYCHA’s Response: Accepted. NYCHA will institute annual internal audits to identify developments that require additional training and controls to ensure compliance. Currently, NYCHA’s office of Internal Audit & Assessments is performing an audit on the accuracy of safety check information on work orders. The findings, which NYCHA expects this Fall, will inform the necessary corrective actions that should be taken. Additionally, NYCHA’s quality assurance inspectors have been tasked with performing recurring Safety Spot Checks as part of their quality assurance review of apartment maintenance and repairs.

- 2) Within 60 days, NYCHA should develop and implement a written plan to ensure better compliance with NYCHA rules requiring that: a) every time maintenance staff enter an apartment, they must perform a physical test of all smoke alarms and CO detectors to determine whether they are operational; b) maintenance staff must also check window guards, fire safety notices, GFCI outlets where present, and apartment front doors during every visit; c) any safety deficiencies must be duly noted on the work order submitted to development management; and d) development supervisors must perform spot checks to review maintenance staff work and the accuracy of work order reporting, including concerning the six apartment safety items. This compliance plan could include additional training for development staff; quality assurance checks to review the performance of maintenance workers and supervisory staff; and affirmative audits of the condition of the safety items in NYCHA apartments.

Response: Accepted. NYCHA issued written guidance to property management staff on June 7, 2016 on safety items maintenance workers must inspect, required documentation, and the expectations on necessary repairs that must be made. In addition, NYCHA hosted two webinar sessions in June attended by nearly 250 staff to review expectations and requirements of performing safety checks, and created a data warehouse (Sharepoint Site) for staff to access the Guidance Document, view the Webinar and retrieve other pertinent information as needed. Also in June, as part of National Safety Month, NYCHA launched the “5 ALIVE” employee public awareness campaign to increase focus on the five¹⁹ required safety checks.

- 3) NYCHA should revise its work order form to indicate that employees may not rely on solely *visual* inspections of smoke or CO detectors or window guards, but rather must *physically* test the operability of apartment smoke and CO alarms by pushing the test button, and manually check that window guards are securely installed.

Response: Accepted. Within the next 30 days, NYCHA will 1) update paperwork procedures, which will also be updated in NYCHA’s recordkeeping software, Maximo, and 2) integrate a pop-up reminder message on handheld devices on checking, not just visually inspecting, the safety measures before a work order is closed.

¹⁹ NYCHA consolidates two checks – smoke and carbon monoxide detectors—into one task, making a total of five safety assurances compared to six outlined in the report.

- 4) NYCHA must improve its recordkeeping by reinforcing the obligation of development management offices to obtain, organize, and secure all original work orders, in order to document safety conditions as well as apartment maintenance and repair. NYCHA should continue to implement and review the efficacy of electronic work order reporting via handheld devices.

Response: Accepted. NYCHA is committed to becoming a modern, digital organization in order to become a more efficient and effective landlord. This summer, NYCHA started issuing handheld devices to maintenance workers so supervisors can electronically assign work orders and staff can receive them in real-time on his or her device, eliminating the need to print out paper work orders. There will no longer be a need for property management offices to print or maintain thousands of paper ticket records. Additionally handheld devices improve the efficiency of real-time safety checks, prompting workers to physically check, fix or install, and document the required five safety-related items. NYCHA is on target to deploy handheld devices to all maintenance workers by the end of the year and all 3,500 front line staff by the end of the first quarter of 2017.

- 5) NYCHA must consider appropriate disciplinary action against the nine employees described in this report.

Response: Accepted. Failing to perform a smoke detector or safety inspection, or misrepresenting that an inspection has been performed, is simply unacceptable. Neglect or indifference that jeopardizes the safety of NYCHA residents or employees is not tolerated. NYCHA is reviewing the cases and pursuing appropriate disciplinary actions against the employees identified in this report.

CONCLUSION

DOI's investigation determined that Rene Rivera, a NYCHA maintenance worker who was present in an apartment hours before a fatal fire, failed to report a broken smoke alarm on the work order form to alert NYCHA to the dangerous condition, in violation of NYCHA policy. Consequently, DOI conducted a proactive investigation that found that Rivera's failure was not an isolated instance, but rather one example of a culture in which some NYCHA maintenance staff neglect to perform their job duties as required to protect public housing residents, and their supervisors fail to consistently review their work and hold them accountable.

DOI has referred nine NYCHA employees for consideration of employee disciplinary action. In addition, in order to prevent similar tragedies, DOI recommends that NYCHA take immediate action to audit the apartment safety check items in developments city-wide. Finally, DOI provided NYCHA with recommendations to strengthen its apartment safety checks to protect public housing residents.

APPENDIX A



New York City Housing Authority Work Order

WO #: 43459210		Reported By: MXINTADM		Craft: MAINT		Work Type: CM		Print Count: 0	
Parent:		Actual Reported: 4-13-2016 12:51 PM		Status: APPR		Sub Work Type:		Scheduled:	
Priority: 7		Ownergroup: DEV113		Resolution:		Court Date:		5.0	

Location Details				Resident Information			
Development: BUTLER Location: 113.03.003.F03.03F.BTH01 Description: Bathroom 01 Address: 1368 WEBSTER AVENUE BRONX, NY 10456 Location Type: BATHROOM Class: Bathtub Shower Problem: Stoppage				Child Under 6: N Child Under 11: N Senior Citizen: N Life Support: N Apt Size: 6 Apt SEC 8: N Smoke Detector: HW			
				Name: [REDACTED] Apt: 03F Permission to Enter: [] Phone: [REDACTED]			
				Caller Information			
				Caller Phone: [REDACTED] Caller Name: [REDACTED] Call Taken By: Irgs Canales			

Work Order Description		Last Insp Date: 07/12/2012	
BATHTUB SHOWER - MAINT			

Workorder Status ☒ Completed ☐ Resident Not at Home ☐ Material not in Stock ☐ Interrupted		Safety Information: N/A	
---	--	-----------------------------------	--

Select Craft for Follow-Up Work			
☐ Asbestos Handler	☐ Elevator Mechanic	☐ Maintenance	☐ Vendor
☐ Asbestos Hazard Investing	☐ Exterminator	☐ Painter	☐ Welder
☐ Bricklayer	☐ Glazier	☐ Plaster	☐ OTHERS
☐ Carpenter	☐ Lead Abatement Worker	☐ Roofer	
☐ Electrician	☐ Lead Investigator	☐ Tech services 504	

☐ Normal Wear and Tear ☐ Vandalism ☐ Accidental Damage		Reasonable Accomodation: Mildew Square Footage:	
---	--	--	--

Choose One Remedy from the List Below

☐ Abated ☒ Cleared ☐ Installed ☐ Repaired ☐ Repaired Replaced ☐ Replaced ☐ Unfounded ☐ Verified

Check for These Items			
Fire Safety Notice	☒ Satisfactory	☐ Unsatisfactory	☐ Corrective Action
CO Detector	☒ Satisfactory	☐ Unsatisfactory	☐ Corrective Action
Window Guards	☒ Satisfactory	☐ Unsatisfactory	☐ Corrective Action
Smoke Detector	☒ Satisfactory	☐ Unsatisfactory	☐ Corrective Action
G.F.C.I OUTLET	☒ Satisfactory	☐ Unsatisfactory	☐ Corrective Action
Apartment Door	☒ Satisfactory	☐ Unsatisfactory	☐ Corrective Action
Apt Temp: 69	Water Temp: 111	Cat in Apt: ☒	Dog In Apt: ☒
☐ HA Follow Up:			

Notes:

13-APR-16 BATHTUB SHOWER - MAINT BATHTUB SHOWER - MAINT (FUB)

13-APR-16 Did you pour any type of drain de-clogger solution into the drain?: No Is it back to back with another fixture?_1: No Is the tub flooding?: No

Started: 2/30	Completed: 2/30	How Many Installed: 4-13-16
----------------------	------------------------	------------------------------------

To be Completed by the Resident

Resident Satisfied?: Yes ☒ No ☐ **Resident Confirmed Work:** _____ **Start** _____ **End Date/Time:** _____

Resident Refused Work: I, the resident of this apartment am refusing to allow NYCHA to complete the repair work listed in this work ticket.

Resident (print and surname): _____ **Resident Refused to Sign:** Yes ☐ No ☐

Resident Comments:

APPENDIX B: Butler Houses						
<u>Rene Rivera (#13946) - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 4/19/16)</u>						
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found Between NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/ CO Alarms and DOI Observations</u>		
redacted	4/8/2016	All present and functioning	Smoke detector missing batteries and CO detector not functioning	YES		
	04/06/16, 04/13/16	All present and functioning	CO not working & fire safety sign missing	YES		
	3/9/2016	All present and functioning	Fire safety sign missing, CO and smoke detectors missing	NO		
			GFCI not working			
	4/7/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	3/28/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector was not functioning for approximately 1 year until replaced on 4/19/16	YES		
	3/7/16, 3/8/16	All present and functioning	GFCI not functioning	NO		
	4/4/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing	YES		
	4/8/2016	Resident Not Home	Fire safety sign semi-detached	NO		
	4/8/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/7/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	3/7/2016	All present and functioning	Fire safety sign blocked, smoke detector needed batteries, CO detector not on wall and needed batteries (OIG replaced batteries in smoke and CO detector)	YES		
	3/11/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/11/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/11/2016	All present and functioning	Smoke & CO detectors not functioning	YES		
	4/6/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	3/8/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not working	YES		
	3/7/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	04/04/16, 04/13/16	All present and functioning	CO detector had no batteries & smoke detector not working	YES		
	4/13/2016	All present and functioning	Fire safety sign missing, CO detector removed by resident, smoke detector malfunctioning	YES		
	4/5/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing, smoke detector not working	YES		
	3/25/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
<u># of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 21</u>						
<u># inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 10 (47%)</u>						

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Fire Safety Notice painted over and window guards loose in living room	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector missing, smoke detector not installed	N/A			
		N/A	GFCI outlet not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector not installed and GFCI outlet not working	N/A			
		N/A	GFCI outlet painted over	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Hard-wired smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	Hard-wired smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	Hard-wired smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 36							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 20 (56%)							
#72006 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 4/22/16)							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
	3/1/2016	Resident not home	Fire safety notice missing and front door problems	NO			
	4/1/2016	Resident not home	CO detector not working	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 2							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
		N/A	CO detector not working	N/A			
			GFCI outlet not working				
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	No window guards in room 2 (grandchildren)	N/A			
		N/A	CO and smoke detectors not working	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			

		N/A	CO detector and smoke detector not working	N/A			
			Fire Safety Notice missing				
		N/A	Smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector missing batteries	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 19							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 12 (63%)							
#74912 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 4/22/16)							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
	3/29/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/1/2016	All present and functioning	Fire safety notice missing	NO			
	3/17/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/16/16, 4/20/16	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	03/17/16, 03/18/16	All present and functioning	Smoke detector not working	YES			
	3/18/16, 4/4/16	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/29/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/9/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing	YES			
	3/14/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/1/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 10							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 2 (20%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector not making sound	N/A			
		N/A	Fire Safety Notice painted over	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 13							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 5 (38%)							
#5483 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 4/22/16)							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
	03/24/16, 04/21/16	All present and functioning	CO detector not working, smoke detector missing	YES			
	4/19/2016	Resident not home	CO detector not working	NO			
	3/28/2016	All present and functioning	Window guards missing from two bedrooms	NO			
	3/13/2016	Resident not home	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/28/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing & smoke detector not working	YES			

	03/28/16, 04/14/16, 04/20/16	Unsatisfactory apartment door	Co detector not working, smoke detector incorrectly mounted	YES			
			No fire safety notice				
	3/26/2016	All present and functioning	Smoke detector not working	YES			
			Loose window guards				
	4/20/2016	Fire safety notice missing, GFCI not working	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/21/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not working	YES			
	1/16/16, 4/25/16	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/19/2016	No indication MW checked the safety devices	CO detector removed by resident, smoke detector missing	NO			
			GFCI not functioning				
	04/14/16, 04/20/16	All present and functioning	Smoke detector not working	YES			
			GFCI painted over				
	4/12/2016	No indication MW checked the safety devices	All present and functioning	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 13							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 6 (46%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
		N/A	CO detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	CO and smoke detectors not working	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 15							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 11 (73%)							
#9545 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection 5/4/16)							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors			
No W.O. matches were made regarding this maintenance worker, who predominantly worked on public spaces/common areas and the apartments that the OIG visited for him were all Tenant Not Home.							
#78258 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection 5/4/16)							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
	3/31/2016	All present and functioning	Smoke detector not in proper housing	YES			
	3/27/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
			Apartment door handle jammed				
	4/1/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/21/2016	Resident not home at time of MW visit	Broken smoke detector	NO			
	3/21/2016	All present and functioning	Missing CO detector	YES			
	3/14/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/30/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			

	3/23/2016	Resident not home at time of MW visit	No fire safety notice, CO detector not working, smoke detector incorrectly mounted, apartment door damaged	NO			
	3/15/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not working	YES			
	3/17/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not working	YES			
	3/10/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not working and smoke detector damaged	YES			
	3/13/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector taken down by resident	NO			
	3/15/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/23/2016	All present and functioning	Hardwired smoke detector doesn't work, battery powered one does	YES			
			Apartment door handle loose				
	3/14/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	3/29/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not functioning correctly	YES			
			Apartment door jammed				
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 16							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 7 (44%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
		N/A	Apartment door problem	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector and one of two smoke detectors not working	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke and CO detectors missing	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector not functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector not functioning	N/A			
			Fire Safety Notice painted over				
		N/A	CO detector not functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector not functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector not functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO and smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	CO and smoke detector not working	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector not functioning and Fire Safety Notice missing	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 31							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 22 (71%)							
DEVELOPMENT TOTALS:							
TOTAL # OF WORK ORDER MATCHES: 62							
TOTAL # DISCREPANT REPORTS OF FUNCTIONING SMOKE AND/OR CO ALARMS: 25 (42%)							
TOTAL # OF BUTLER HOUSES APARTMENTS INSPECTED BY OIG: 114							
TOTAL # OF APARTMENTS WITH SAFETY DEFICIENCIES AT BUTLER HOUSES: 70 (61 %)							

APPENDIX C: Stapleton Houses

#79730 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/10/16)

<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found Between NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Detectors and DOI</u>
<i>redacted</i>	4/14/2016	All present and functioning	Fire safety notice was chipping off and was worn	Observations NO
	4/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO
	4/21/2016	No indication on W.O. that employee checked the safety devices	GFCI not working	NO
	4/19/2016	All present and functioning	Missing fire safety notice	NO
	4/20/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO
	4/18/2016	All present and functioning	Missing fire safety notice	NO

of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 6

inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:

<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>
		N/A	CO detector not working and smoke alarm not mounted properly	N/A
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A
		N/A	CO detector missing	N/A
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A
		N/A	CO detector missing, smoke detector not working, fire safety notice missing	N/A
		N/A	Smoke detector not working	N/A
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A

of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 16

of apartments with safety deficiencies: 8 (50%)

#16985 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/10/16)

<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>
	4/11/2016	No indication on W.O. that employee checked the safety devices	All present and functioning	NO
	4/2/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO
	4/21/2016	All present and functioning	Tenant recently removed CO detector and apartment door lock frequently gets stuck	NO
	4/20/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO
	4/8/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO

of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 5

inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:

<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A
		N/A	Window guard in second bedroom loose (resident has 5 year old)	N/A

of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 7

of apartments with safety deficiencies: 2 (29%)

#74272 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/10/16)

<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>
	4/12/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector and smoke detector both not working	YES
	4/10/2016	All present and functioning	Tenant recently removed smoke detector and GFCI not working	NO
	4/11/2016	Tenant not home when MW attempted repair	CO detector was missing batteries	NO
			Window guard missing in one of the bedrooms, GFCI outlet painted over	
	4/8/2016	No indication on W.O. that employee checked the safety devices	Smoke detector missing (resident unsure of when detector disappeared)	NO
	4/11/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector was incorrectly mounted	NO

of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 5

inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 1 (20%)

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:

<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>
		N/A	GFCI painted over	N/A
		N/A	CO detector and GFCI outlet not working	N/A
		N/A	CO detector and smoke detector not functioning	N/A
			GFCI outlet painted over and resident says outlets spark and 2 fires occurred last month and they have called fire department	N/A

of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 8

of apartments with safety deficiencies: 8 (100%)

DEVELOPMENT TOTALS:

TOTAL # OF WORK ORDER MATCHES: 16

TOTAL # DISCREPANT REPORTS OF FUNCTIONING SMOKE AND/OR CO ALARMS: 1 (6%)

TOTAL # OF STAPLETON HOUSES APARTMENTS INSPECTED BY OIG: 31

TOTAL # OF APARTMENTS WITH SAFETY DEFICIENCIES AT STAPLETON HOUSES: 18 (58%)

Appendix D - LaGuardia Houses						
#18533 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/06/16)						
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found Between NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/ CO Detectors and DOI Observations</u>		
redacted	4/22/2016	All present and functioning except fire safety notice left blank	No fire safety notice, smoke detector present but not functioning (NYCHA designee replaced the fire safety notice at the time of the OIG visit)	YES		
	4/29/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	04/25/16, 04/27/16	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/22/2016	Resident Not Home	Fire safety notice missing (NYCHA designee replaced the fire safety notice at the time of OIG visit)	NO		
	4/26/2016	Fire safety notice marked as unsatisfactory with corrective action requested	As per tenant, CO detector and smoke detector taken down by MW for unknown reasons	YES		
	4/25/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/26/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/25/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/24/2016	Resident Not Home	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/27/2016	Fire safety notice, CO detector & smoke detector all marked as needing corrective action	All present and functioning	NO		
	4/25/2016	Resident Not Home	All present and functioning	NO		
	04/18/16, 04/25/16, 04/27/16	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO		
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 12						
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 2 (17%)						
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:						
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>		
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A		
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A		
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A		
		N/A	Fire Safety Notice missing (NYCHA designee replaced fire safety notice at the time of OIG visit)	N/A		
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A		

		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke and CO detector not mounted properly	N/A			
		N/A	GFCI outlet not working	N/A			
		N/A	Combination Smoke/CO detector not mounted properly and GFCI outlet painted over	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 21							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 7 (33%)							
#53529 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/06/16)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 0 (0%)							
#20727 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/06/16)							
No W.O matches were made regarding this maintenance worker, who predominantly worked on public spaces/common areas and this worker worked as a helper on							
occasion.							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>			
		N/A	Smoke detector needs new batteries	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (100%)							
#5010 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/10/16)							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms</u>			
	4/15/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/5/2016	No indication that MW checked the safety devices	Fire safety notice missing (resident refused a new one during OIG visit)	NO			
	04/01/16, 04/14/16	All present and functioning	Fire safety notice painted over (resident refused a new one during OIG visit)	NO			
	4/22/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/25/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector not mounted by tenant	NO			

	4/25/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing, 3 smoke detectors present but not functioning (All issues were rectified by MW at time of OIG visit)	YES			
	4/5/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/25/2016	No indication that MW checked the safety devices	All present and functioning	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 8							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 1 (13%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 9							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 4 (44%)							
#79456 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/10/16)							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
	4/13/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/11/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/1/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing and smoke detector not functioning (both replaced by MW at time of OIG visit)	YES			
	4/4/2016	All present and functioning	Fire safety notice missing (replaced by MW during OIG visit)	NO			
	4/4/2016	Resident Not Home	CO detector missing, 3 smoke detectors present but not functioning (resident refused new safety devices at time of OIG visit)	NO			
	4/20/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/5/2016	Resident Not Home	All present and functioning	NO			
	4/5/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing, smoke detector missing and GFCI outlet not functioning - (resident refused new safety devices at time of OIG visit)	YES			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 8							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 2 (25%)							

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
Location	Date of W.O.	NYCHA employee reported	OIG finding	Discrepancies Found With NYCHA Reports of Functioning Smoke/CO Alarms			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO and smoke detectors were not working (NYCHA designee installed new combination smoke/CO detector during inspection)	N/A			
		N/A	Smoke detector needed new batteries (OIG replaced batteries) and CO detector was not mounted properly (OIG installed)	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 11							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 6 (55%)							
DEVELOPMENT TOTALS:							
TOTAL # OF WORK ORDER MATCHES: 28							
TOTAL # DISCREPANT REPORTS OF FUNCTIONING SMOKE AND/OR CO ALARMS: 5 (18%)							
TOTAL # OF LAGUARDIA HOUSES APARTMENTS INSPECTED BY OIG: 43							
TOTAL # OF APARTMENTS WITH SAFETY DEFICIENCIES AT LAGUARDIA HOUSES: 18 (42%)							

Appendix E - Carver Houses							
#13983 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/19/16)							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
redacted	5/18/2016	Resident not home	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector and fire safety notice missing	YES			
	5/18/2016	CO detector unsatisfactory and corrective action taken for window guard	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	Corrective action taken for smoke detector, window guards, and fire safety notice	All present and functioning	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 4							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 1 (25%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
		N/A	GFCI not working, CO detector has no battery	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 6							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 2 (33%)							
#12014 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/19/16)							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
	5/19/2016	Installed new smoke detector and fire safety notice. Also noted that GFCI not working properly.	CO detector had no batteries installed, GFCI painted over.	YES			
	5/18/2016	Missing 2 window guards but resident refused repair (no kids in apartment)	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	3 bedroom apt with 1 smoke detector that does not work	YES			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 4							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 2 (50%)							

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
<u># of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 5</u>							
<u># of apartments with safety deficiencies: 2 (40%)</u>							
<u>#50043 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/19/16)</u>							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
	5/18/2016	Replaced smoke detector	CO detector not working (tenant removed batteries that morning)	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
<u># of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 3</u>							
<u># inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)</u>							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
<u># of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 4</u>							
<u># of apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (25%)</u>							
<u>#9278 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 05/19/16)</u>							
<u>No work order matches for this maintenance worker</u>							
<u>#4504 - Caretaker "J" - W.O. matches (OIG inspection 05/19/16)</u>							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
	5/18/2016	New CO detector is needed, but not in stock at the development	CO detector missing; only 1 smoke detector for 4-bedroom apartment	NO			
<u># of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 1</u>							
<u># inaccurate reports of functioning smoke and CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)</u>							
<u># of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1</u>							
<u># of apartments with safety deficiencies: 0 (0%)</u>							

#77944 - floater painter - W.O. matches (OIG inspection 05/19/16)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
<u># of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1</u>							
<u># of apartments with safety deficiencies: 0</u>							
DEVELOPMENT TOTALS: TOTAL # OF WORK ORDER MATCHES: 12 TOTAL # INACCURATE REPORTS OF FUNCTIONING SMOKE AND/OR CO ALARMS: 3 (25%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE: <i>These WO's were not completed at the time of OIG inspection. As such, there is no assigned maintenance staff.</i>							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector not working, smoke detector missing	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
<u># of unassigned apartments inspected by OIG: 4</u>							
<u># of unassigned apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (25%)</u>							
TOTAL # OF CARVER HOUSES APARTMENTS INSPECTED BY OIG: 21 TOTAL # OF APARTMENTS WITH SAFETY DEFICIENCIES AT CARVER HOUSES: 6 (29%)							

Appendix F - Jefferson Houses							
#58313 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
<u>Location</u>	<u>Date of W.O.</u>	<u>NYCHA employee reported</u>	<u>OIG finding</u>	<u>NYCHA employee inaccurately reported functioning smoke/CO detectors</u>			
redacted	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 2							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
NONE							
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 2							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 0 (0%)							
#63314 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector present but not working, smoke detector missing	YES			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 1							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 1 (100%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
NONE							
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (100%)							
#5026 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	smoke detector missing	YES			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 2							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 1 (50%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
None							
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 2							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (50%)							
#5592 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
	5/19/2016	Tenant Not Home	CO detector and smoke detector present but not working	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 1							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)							

ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	Fire safety notice missing	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector and smoke detector present but not working; fire safety notice missing	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 3							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 3 (100%)							
#67523 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection 5/19/16)							
No W.O. matches were made regarding this maintenance worker, who predominantly worked on public spaces/common areas/move-outs.							
#60014 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection 5/19/16)							
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	smoke detector missing, fire safety notice missing	YES			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	As per TOR, NYCHA performed safety checks 4 days prior and TOR confirmed all are functioning. TOR refused OIG entry into apartment.	NO			
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector present but missing batteries; only 1 smoke detector present for a 3 BR apt; door handle not operating properly	YES			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 6							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 2 (33.3%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	CO detector present but no batteries; fire safety notice torn	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 8							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 3 (38%)							
#71215 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
No W.O matches were made regarding this maintenance worker, who predominantly worked on public spaces/common areas/move-outs.							

#15754 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	Apartment has one functioning combination smoke/CO detector, but hardwired smoke alarm in hallway not working	NO			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 2							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 0 (0%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 4							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 0 (0%)							
#71432 - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	All present and functioning	NO			
	5/18/2016	Window guards need corrective action but no children under 10 in apartment	1 functioning smoke detector found in a 3 BR apt, CO detector had no batteries (repaired by OIG)	YES			
	5/19/2016	All present and functioning	fire safety notice missing, GFCI painted over	NO			
	5/18/2016	All present and functioning	CO detector missing, fire safety notice missing	YES			
# of W.O. matches for this maintenance worker: 4							
# inaccurate reports of functioning smoke/CO alarms by this maintenance worker: 2 (50%)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	CO detector missing, fire safety notice missing, GFCI outlet not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	GFCI not working	N/A			
		N/A	All present and functioning	N/A			
		N/A	GFCI not working	N/A			
# of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 9							
# of apartments with safety deficiencies: 6 (67%)							

#65366 - carpenter - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	Smoke detector missing batteries, missing fire safety notice, GFCI not working	N/A			
<i># of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1</i>							
<i># of apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (100%)</i>							
#55357 - painter - W.O. matches (OIG inspection on 5/19/16)							
ORIGINAL WORK ORDERS NOT AVAILABLE:							
		N/A	GFCI painted over	N/A			
<i># of this maintenance worker's apartments inspected by OIG: 1</i>							
<i># of apartments with safety deficiencies: 1 (100%)</i>							
DEVELOPMENT TOTALS:							
TOTAL # OF WORK ORDER MATCHES: 18							
TOTAL # INACCURATE REPORTS OF FUNCTIONING SMOKE AND/OR CO ALARMS: 6 (33%)							
<i>TOTAL # OF JEFFERSON HOUSES APARTMENTS INSPECTED BY OIG: 31</i>							
<i>TOTAL # OF APARTMENTS WITH SAFETY DEFICIENCIES AT JEFFERSON HOUSES: 16 (52%)</i>							