

# Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act New York City Regional Plan

Inventory of Sector-Based Workforce Strategies 2018

Regional Board: New York City Workforce Development Board January 2018

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	
I. History and Vision	1
II. Defining Sector-Based Workforce Strategies	2
I. Executive Summary	3
II. Key Sectors	4
III. Sector-specific approaches	6
Healthcare	
Technology	7
Food Service	9
Industrial	10
Construction	11
Retail	12
IV. Training the Workforce for Today and Tomorrow	14

# **BACKGROUND**

# I. History and Vision

New York City has been a national leader in sector-strategies for decades. Aligning employment services and trainings with employer demand and sector has been common practice in New York City's Workforce1 Career Center system – the local name for One-Stop Career Centers – for close to ten years. Communities across the country are emulating New York City's work building strong partnerships with industry to develop a talent pipeline that drives economic and community prosperity.

In 2014 New York City (NYC) convened the Jobs for New Yorkers Task Force. Charged with creating a strategy to expand access to career-track jobs, improve job quality, and foster a more cohesive workforce development system, the Task Force included businesses, organized labor, educational institutions, service providers, philanthropy, and government. Five months of intensive discussions yielded key recommendations to transform New York City's workforce development system expressed in the City's report: <a href="Career Pathways: One City Working Together">Career Pathways: One City Working Together</a>.

This report serves as the City's guiding strategy and framework – including the strategies for working closely with businesses to meet their needs and supporting individuals along an established route to stable employment with family-sustaining wages. The NYC Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Regional Plan is aligned with both the City's Career Pathways report and the New York State Combined WIOA Plan.

# II. Defining Sector-Based Workforce Strategies

The Regional Plan identifies a number of sector-based workforce strategies that are active in New York City. In accordance with the New York State Department of Labor's Technical Advisory 16-5, the NYC Workforce Development Board is using a very specific definition of sector-based workforce strategies, defined as initiatives that:

- Address the needs of employers by focusing intensively on the workforce needs of a specific industry sector over a sustained period, often concentrating on a specific occupation or set of occupations within that industry;
- Address the needs of workers by creating formal career paths to good jobs, reducing barriers to employment, and sustaining or increasing middle-class jobs;
- Bolster regional economic competitiveness by engaging economic development experts in workforce issues and aligning education, economic, and workforce development planning;
- Engage a **broader array of key stakeholders** through partnerships organized by workforce intermediaries; and
- Promote systemic change that achieves ongoing benefits for the industry, workers, and community.<sup>1</sup>

This definition is more comprehensive than definitions that reflect a simple alignment of training programs to sector or occupation. Consequently, this inventory is not an exhaustive list of all *sector-aligned* programs in New York City; rather, it provides an overview of initiatives that satisfy all elements of the above definition.

New York City has a number of these initiatives outside of government, and rather than attempting to curate a comprehensive list, we defer to the work of the Aspen Institute, the New York City Center for Economic Opportunity, and the New York City Employment and Training Coalition, and the City's Labor-Management partnerships in the work they have previously done identifying entities that lead sector-based workforce strategies. Space would not permit us to provide meaningful detail on each of these entities. Moreover, New York City's Workforce Development Board has crafted a strategy that organizes these entities by sector and works with and across them to achieve local and state-wide objectives.

With its partners, the NYC Workforce Development Board will continue to evaluate and update these strategies to respond to changes in the local economy and to build on emerging best

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> National Governors Association Center for Best Practices, National Economic Development and Law Center, and Corporation for a Skilled Workforce. *State Sector Strategies: Regional Solutions to Worker and Employer Needs*. 2006.

practices in service delivery to support a vibrant and equitable economy with career opportunities for all New Yorkers.

# INVENTORY OF SECTOR-BASED WORKFORCE STRATEGIES

# I. Executive Summary

In support of Mayor de Blasio's vision for a workforce development system informed by, and aligned with, the needs of strategic industries across New York City, the Department of Small Business Services (SBS) will pursue several policy and operational initiatives to provide New Yorkers high-quality, in-demand sector-based training and employment services.

The City of New York developed Industry Partnerships with the goal of supporting the economic vitality of New York City through quality job opportunities for New Yorkers and quality talent for local businesses. Each industry partnership focuses on a particular sector and is designed to work collaboratively with a diverse set of stakeholders – including employers, community-based organizations (CBOs), organized labor, philanthropy, government, training providers and educational institutions – to support systems change.

In order to improve the quality, scale, and impact of industry-aligned training and employment services, the City of New York will leverage the expertise of its Industry Partnerships and work together with the local Workforce Development Board, the Regional Economic Development Council, NYSDOL, and key employer, education, and community stakeholders in order to advance the ambitious but achievable objectives of increased economic success for businesses, workers, and the City.

The success of any sector-based workforce development strategy depends upon the availability of education and training providers equipped to deliver high quality, industry-aligned preparation to job seekers with the resources at hand to pursue it.

To address both of these priorities, the City of New York will implement new and enhanced initiatives in the coming year with the goals of: 1) expanding access to sector-based in-demand training for qualified job seekers and 2) improving provider quality with an emphasis in key sectors.

# II. Key Sectors

New York City's economy is vast and multi-faceted. New York City's workforce development strategy reflects that diversity, and in the coming year the local area will support employment and training initiatives in a wide variety of sectors. However, particular focus will be given to six sectors:

- Healthcare
- > Technology
- Industrial/Manufacturing
- Foodservice
- Construction
- Retail

Together the six sectors account for approximately half of all jobs in New York City. These sectors were selected through an analysis of scale, opportunity, and impact. The City selected the sectors using data pertaining to tax revenue, recent job growth, forecasted job growth, total employment, job multipliers, wages, and wage distribution indicators. These sectors currently offer the strongest prospects for economic mobility and mutual "employer-worker" benefits through job quality improvements.

The City's analysis revealed that **healthcare and technology** are both characterized by high growth, higher-wage, middle-skill occupations and solid job multipliers, with every direct job created in healthcare generating an additional 0.4 jobs, and each new job in technology adding 1.4 additional jobs. In addition, a systematic skills gap in hiring impedes growth in both of these sectors.

The industrial/manufacturing and construction sectors have lower growth projections, but these jobs tend to offer relatively high income while not requiring a high level of formal education. In addition, the City makes or influences a large investment in these sectors, and thus they represent a unique way to leverage the purchasing power of the City for the good of policy and the City's workers.

Finally, the **retail and food service** sectors are among the largest in New York City. They represent the entry-way to a lifetime of work for many of the City's residents, including young adults and foreign-born New Yorkers. Because service plays such a key role in business profit and competitive advantage in both sectors, human capital is critical.

A table with detailed labor market data for all six sectors is included here for reference:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Health Care & Social Assistance	647,060 (16.02%)	63,154 (11.04%)	\$49,519
Technology	326,000 (7.9%)	39,000 (13.6%)	\$82,160
Construction	132,557 (3.13%)	15,277 (14.02%)	\$74,086
Food Service & Accommodation	342,004 (8.16%)	72,169 (28.71%)	\$31,427
Industrial	517,430 (13.47%)	-5,286 (-1.01%)	\$70,831
Retail	344,084 (8.73%)	45,756 (15.24%)	\$38,903

Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

New York City will leverage all of its workforce assets, including Industry Partnerships, occupational trainings, and the Workforce1 Career Center system to support work in these critical sectors.

# III. Sector-specific approaches

#### Healthcare

Phase of Development: Expanding

# Workforce Landscape:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Health Care &	647,060	63,154	\$49,519
Social Assistance	(16.02%)	(11.04%)	

Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

<u>Industry Partnership:</u> New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare (NYACH)

<u>Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities</u>: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

#### Industry Partnership Strategy:

The healthcare industry partnership, the New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare (NYACH), has developed a Partners Council, which establishes a common agenda and set of activities. The Council includes the Greater New York Hospital Association (GNYHA), the Community Health Care Association of New York State (CHCANYS), the Southern New York Association (SNYA), the Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute (PHI), 1199 SEIU Training and Employment Funds, and the City University of New York (CUNY).

In addition, three sub-sector specific workgroups focus on ambulatory care, long-term services and supports, and inpatient care. These workgroups include representatives of organizations that have proven leadership in their respective subsectors, those that have partnered with NYACH on earlier work, and those who are recognized in NYC for leading at the intersection of healthcare delivery and workforce development.

#### **Training Strategy:**

NYACH works with its Partners Council and its individual employers on the subcommittees to ensure that training solutions are appropriately informed to reflect the changing workforce and training needs of local healthcare employers as a result of the federal Affordable Care Act and New York State's Medicaid Redesign. Recent industry-informed programs have focused on occupational training for Medical Assistant, Certified Recovery Peer Advocate, Health Coach, and a Medical Coding Training and Apprenticeship Program in partnership with 1199SEIU Training and Education Fund.

In the coming year, SBS and NYACH will evaluate and scale successful programs as well as launch a series of new initiatives.

# **Technology**

Phase of Development: Expanding

## Workforce Landscape:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Technology	326,000 (7.9%)	39,000 (13.6%)	\$82,160

Source: 2016 NYC Tech Ecosystem: HR&A Study Update report released November 2017; \*HR&A NYC Tech Ecosystem 2009-2013 report released 3/14

Industry Partnership: NYC Tech Talent Pipeline (TTP)

<u>Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities</u>: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

#### **Industry Partnership Strategy:**

Launched by Mayor de Blasio in May 2014, the NYC Tech Talent Pipeline (TTP) works with more than 150 stakeholders to define employer needs, develop training and education solutions to meet these needs, and deliver homegrown talent for 21st century jobs across the five boroughs. These efforts are guided by an Advisory Board of 28 CEOs, CTOs, CIOs, and senior

executives representing the city's top tech employers and a collective workforce of 40,000 New Yorkers.

Together with employers, government partners, philanthropy, training providers, educational institutions and community organizations, launched 10 industry-informed new and expanded training programs, realigned curricula for 16 academic and training programs, and informed the development of the Mayor's historic Computer Science for All initiative. TTP has also formed an Academic Council, consisting of 16 NYC post-secondary institutions who have pledged to continue to work with the City and employers to further develop career pathways for New Yorkers in tech. In 2017, Council members and industry partners together launched a new initiative to respond to the Mayor's new goal of doubling the number of CUNY tech bachelors awarded by 2022.

#### **Training Strategy:**

TTP works towards three primary objectives in its training strategy: 1) a diversity of New Yorkers are aware of tech careers, can enter training, and successfully connect to tech employment; 2) New York City businesses can hire and retain qualified local tech talent; and 3) there are sufficient educational and training providers to deliver qualified New Yorkers into tech jobs. In 2017 TTP expanded its Web Development Fellowship to new training providers, helped to build capacity of accelerated tech training providers by releasing *Key Practices for Accelerated Tech Training*, and continued to expand investments to ensure that NYC colleges are reliable sources for tech talent.

In the coming year, SBS and TTP will evaluate and scale successful programs as well as launch a series of new initiatives.

#### **Food Service**

Phase of Development: Expanding

#### Workforce Landscape:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Food Service & Accommodation	342,004 (8.16%)	72,169 (28.71%)	\$31,427

Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

<u>Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities</u>: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

<u>Industry Partnership:</u> NYC Food and Beverage Hospitality Council

#### Industry Partnership Strategy:

One of the largest sectors of employment in NYC with sustained growth, food service in New York City is of critical importance but is faced with a sizable labor shortage of qualified talent in the kitchen and very high turnover. This Industry Partnership convened the NYC Food and Beverage Hospitality Council which is an alliance of over 30 leading NYC industry professionals and businesses to promote the sustained growth of the local food and beverage industry. To address the challenges facing the industry, the Council's goals include:

- Address the industry's skills gap and labor shortage by promoting training opportunities that will also open the door to greater upward mobility for workers;
- Help small business navigate the regulatory environment; and
- Monitor industry trends and define operational changes businesses can implement to meet various challenges

#### **Training Strategy:**

To begin to address the back-of-house labor shortage and create opportunities for young adults, the Council has created and launched StageNYC. Pronounced "stazhje," this program is a partnership with the hospitality industry that will help meet the restaurant sector's growing demand for qualified culinary employees while creating new career pathways for New Yorkers.

The program will cover technical skills and life skills aimed at young adults, aged 18-24, for careers in the restaurant industry. Participants will receive paid, on-the-job training with an industry partner in order to gain hands-on experience. The culmination of both skills and experience training will provide participants with the tools needed to successfully fill positions in a growing industry.

To date, two initial cohorts have completed training and the Council and SBS are evaluating a way to refine the program and continue to scale it.

#### **Industrial**

Phase of Development: Expanding

## Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Industrial	517,430 (13.47%)	-5,286 (-1.01%)	\$70,831

Source: NYSDOL 2009 and 2013 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

<u>Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities</u>: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

<u>Industry Partnership:</u> Industrial Industry Partnership

# **Industry Partnership Strategy:**

While jobs in the Industrial sector have contracted over the past two decades in New York City, recent data demonstrates that over the last five years the city's manufacturing sector has actually grown in various sub-sectors\*. There are not high educational barriers in this sector (compared, for example, with tech or healthcare), yet many New Yorkers lack an awareness of jobs in this sector. Employers have reported a challenge in finding and attracting entry-level

candidates. Furthermore, data shows that due to an aging workforce, expert roles are staying vacant for longer and retirement ages are increasing dramatically.

The Industrial Partnership will convene an advisory board with business leaders from the manufacturing, transportation, and wholesale trade sectors in order to create a unified voice and define similar needs and challenges of businesses across industry. Individually these sectors are a relatively small in NYC, but together form a significant part of the economy. The Board will work to design solutions to support the up-skilling of current entry level workers, the transition of deep technical skill/knowledge from one generation of worker to another, and how define ways in which firms in the industrial sectors can use innovation to grow and thrive in NYC.

#### Training Strategy:

Based on business demand, SBS has historically supported entry-level training in occupations, such as Commercial Driving, Woodworking, and Cable Installation. This occupational training will continue and in 2018 this Industry Partnership will launch a program for entry level CNC Machinists with local manufacturers in support of the *New York Works, Creating Good Jobs* report. This initiative a new employer-training partnership model that allows New Yorkers to get the hands-on experience they need while placing them in a career-ladder profession.

\* Source: https://nycfuture.org/pdf/Making It Here July 2016.pdf

#### Construction

**Phase of Development**: Expanding

#### Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Construction	132,557 (3.13%)	15,277 (14.02%)	\$74,086

Source: NYSDOL 2009 and 2013 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach,

emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

<u>Industry Partnership:</u> BuildNYC2030 Construction Industry Partnership

Industry Partnership Strategy:

Job growth in construction continues to outpace most other sectors in New York City and

represents an opportunity for many mid-level jobs at family-sustaining wages without high

requirements for educational attainment. The Construction Industry Partnership has created an

advisory board of construction firms and unions representing organized labor and other local stakeholders. The advisory board will help shape solutions for the following workforce

challenges in the sector: equity of access to career pathways in the unionized skilled trades;

safety and gainful employment over the life of a career in construction. The Industry

Partnership will also work with sector stakeholders to attract a greater diversity of workers,

including younger workers, women, and other low income New Yorkers.

In addition, the Construction Industry Partnership will advise and guide the Hire NYC

Development initiative. Hire NYC is New York City's commitment to leverage its purchasing

power and investments generally, in the case for construction and real estate developments to

provide better access to jobs associated with these projects for New Yorkers. HireNYC will provide free, high-quality recruitment services to vendors and businesses filling open positions

through City contracts and development projects.

Training Strategy:

In the coming fiscal year, the Construction Industry Partnership will continue its work to focus

on an employer-defined common set of core skills needed for workers seeking entry into the sector. This will contribute to fundamental elements of an aligned system that is accessible to

all New Yorkers with clear entry points into career pathways.

Retail

Phase of Development: Pre-Launch

12

#### Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Retail	344,084 (8.73%)	45,756 (15.24%)	\$38,903

Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

<u>Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities</u>: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

#### <u>Industry Partnership Strategy:</u>

The scope of the retail partnership includes national/international chains with a wide range of products (department or general merchandise stores), national/international specialty chains (appliances and electronics, office supplies, etc.), small specialty chains, and small independent specialty stores. This requires a diverse set of strategies. To engage decision-makers and leaders at the national/international levels, New York City will partner with other large cities and leverage our collective buying power to establish a national council. This group will focus on workforce issues in the retail sector, including working with employers, industry associations, workers, and advocacy groups, to establish a clear and accurate picture of employer demand, job experience required, and career pathways. It will also identify and support hiring/staffing practices in the retail sector that result in a benefit to the business and improve job experience and maximize income for workers.

Since many entry level jobs in retail are part-time and minimum wage, job quality will be central to the retail industry partnership approach. As an example of how this strategy may be implemented, the Workforce1 Career Center system has been working with retailers and businesses in other sectors to encourage living-wage jobs by only referring qualified candidates to jobs paying at least \$13.65 per hour for part-time work.

#### **Training Strategy:**

The training strategies in retail will include creating formal paths for advancement, supporting equity of access to advancement opportunities, and a model for understanding skills applicable inside and outside of the sector. Lastly, a significant aspect of the training will focus on

"professional identity" training, such as handling absences professionally, negotiating for hours/salary, and presenting employment history most effectively.

# IV. Training the Workforce for Today and Tomorrow

The NYC Department of Small Business Services (SBS) and the Industry Partnerships work with a diverse set of stakeholder partners as well as the latest labor market data, analyses and forecasting to identify sector-specific workforce challenges that can be addressed with industry-informed training programs. These training programs are piloted by SBS and its Workforce1 system, the City University of New York (CUNY) and its colleges, other for-profit and not-for-profit training providers, community-based organizations, unions, and key employer partners to test their effectiveness as solutions to these challenges. The evaluation of outcomes from these programs are also used to identify opportunities for scaling and sustaining successful models that align with the unique mission and vision of each Industry Partnership and provide the greatest systematic impact for New Yorkers with barriers to employment or advancement and high-road employer partners alike.

Stakeholders are engaged in a variety of ways to shape these training program models. Some of these ways include, but are not limited to, confirming labor market trends, selecting occupational or programmatic focuses, aligning and enhancing curriculum and instructional models with current and future hiring needs, developing robust participant assessments, serving as hosts for interviews, internships or site visits, supporting industry exposure for participants, committing to hiring graduates, and serving as an advocate of programs and participants.

The training program models designed by Industry Partnerships and implemented by SBS are often certification-based trainings in growing or changing occupations offered in a cohort format or through an Individual Training Grant with a single training provider, but they may also include internships and externships, on-the-job training, incumbent workers training (through SBS' Customized Training Program), or other work-based learning approaches depending on the sector-based challenge. Across all models developed by the Industry Partnerships and SBS, those that are most successful often include some, if not all, of the following elements:

 Industry-informed assessments and curriculum and adult-centered instructional models in both technical and professional skill building,

- Paid work-based learning elements built into the program for participants to gain relevant professional experiences that allow them to earn while they learn,
- Early commitments to screen and hire graduates by employer partners, often prior to participant enrollment in training programs,
- Recruitment and business development support from the Workforce1 system, Industry Partnership, and/or other partners,
- Continuous academic, candidacy, and supportive services for participants during training and through attachment to the workforce,
- Employment-focused standards for successful training completion, including receipt of all industry-recognized certifications or Human Resource requirements for job entry,
- Performance-based contracts that incentivize high levels of completion and employment (i.e. 90 percent completion and 75 percent connection to employment with three months for provider's to obtain full reimbursement),
- Feedback loops from industry to SBS, the Industry Partnerships, and other partners on the competitiveness and readiness of graduates and new hires to succeed in the careers for which they are being trained to enter and advance, and
- Buy-in from all partners to the value of the Industry Partnerships and training programs
  to ensure sustainability of practice and continuous improvement beyond local, state,
  federal, and private investment.

#### Additional Program Development and Strategic Planning

In addition to supporting expanded and enhanced versions of the training programs that were offered in fiscal year 2017, in 2018 SBS and the Industry Partnerships will design and launch new trainings in food service and accommodations, media and entertainment, and retail. A key focus within the sector-based trainings in 2018 will be aligning work with other City agencies aimed at serving young adults, foreign-born New Yorkers, and other individuals facing barriers to employment or advancement. SBS is continuing to work with its partners to offer high school equivalency and career development services to out-of-school, out-of-work youth and English-language (and other culturally-specific) instruction for New Yorkers as they pursue training, certification, and employment in all of the Career Pathways sectors.