1	NEW YORK CITY
2	TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION
3	PUBLIC HEARING
4	x
5	
6	Held Remotely Via Zoom Videoconference
7	December 11, 2024.
8	10:05 a.m.
9	
10	BEFORE:
11	DAVID DO
12	COMMISSIONER AND CHAIR
13	
14	BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS:
15	COMMISSIONER SARAH KAUFMAN
16	COMMISSIONER THOMAS SORRENTINO
17	COMMISSIONER KENNETH MITCHELL
18	COMMISSIONER ELISA VELAZQUEZ
19	COMMISSIONER PAUL BADER
20	COMMISSIONER KENNETH Y.K. CHAN
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1 2 S P E A K E R S: 3 JOE RAPPAPORT 4 JEAN RYAN 5 ANNA HUMPHREY 6 JOSE ALTAMIRANO 7 MICHAEL SIMON 8 EMAN RIMAWI-DOSTER 9 AVIK KABESSA 10 EVAN YANKEY 11 DAN BRATSHPIS 12 KEITH GREENBAUM 13 JEREMY MOSKOWITZ 14 ANDREW GREENBLATT 15 CIRA ANGELES 16 SCOTT WOLLNEY 17 KAMAL AHMED 18 MIKE ROSE 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

1	MODERATOR: Good morning. Today's public
2	hearing is about to begin. This hearing is being
3	conducted remotely via Zoom and is being
4	simulcasted to the TLC's website, livestream, and
5	Facebook accounts. All persons wishing to testify
6	were asked to sign up in advance of the hearing.
7	All registered speakers are joining the meeting
8	via Zoom.
9	If you are speaking today, your audio and
10	video were automatically muted. When your name is
11	called, the moderator will activate your account
12	and you will have control of your camera and
13	microphone. When ready, please state your name
14	and affiliation and then proceed with your
15	testimony.
16	Public testimony will be limited to three
17	minutes per speaker. Any additional comments may
18	be submitted in writing to the Commission. When
19	your testimony is complete, your audio and video
20	will be muted by the moderator.
21	A special note for our registered speakers,
22	please ensure that your display name in the Zoom
23	meeting matches the name that you used when you
24	signed up to speak. This will enable the
25	moderator to confirm that you are present in the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

4

1 meeting. 2 Closed captioning is available for today's 3 meeting. Thank you for your attention. I will 4 now yield the floor to our Commissioner and Chair, 5 David Do. MR. DO: Good morning. The time is now 6 7 10:06 a.m. and welcome to this public hearing on TLC's proposed rule packages. Mandated response 8 times for the for-hire vehicle 9 wheelchair-accessible vehicles and enhanced 10 insurance requirements for for-hire vehicles. 11 Ι 12 am Commissioner David Do and I'm joined today by 13 Commissioners Kaufman, Chan, Bader, Sorrentino and Mitchell. 14 15 This is our last hearing of the year. And 16 before we start, I'd like to wish everyone a safe 17 and happy holiday season. This time of year brings increased risks of people being killed or 18 19 injured by drivers who are under the influence. 20 So if you're heading out for some merry-making, don't take chances behind the vehicle, take a TLC 21 22 vehicle. 23 All of our drivers receive vision zero 24 focused training and they want your business. Ιf 25 you have a safe ride, tips are appreciated. On a

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	related note, I'd like to point out that as of
2	November 6th, we've had a new New York State DMV
3	point system in effect. Penalties for a whole
4	host of violations, including driving under the
5	influence, fleeing from the scene of a crash, or
б	speeding in a work zone and passing a stopped
7	school bus, are now much stiffer.
8	While these regulations apply to everyone,
9	I'd like to point out that TLC drivers are already
10	amongst the safest on the road. They drive for a
11	living and are too often victims of bad actors.
12	It is my hope that these rules make their
13	workplace safer.
14	Lastly, I'd like to reflect on what an
15	impactful year it's been. We've had some
16	challenges, most notably was lockouts. I want to
17	ensure everyone that we have been moving on a
18	rule-making process to discourage future lockouts
19	as fast as possible. Adjusting minimum pay rules
20	is not something we undertake lightly. It is a
21	deliberative process that requires legal and data
22	consultations and consultation with stake-holders.
23	We hope to introduce a package before the
24	end of the year. We will now be doing that in the
25	coming year, along with rules for in-vehicle

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	advertising, increased upfront tip payments and,
2	of course, our annual driver pay assessment.
3	I don't want to mention driver pay without
4	noting that our fantastic data team, who you will
5	hear from in a second, now has a driver pay
6	feature up on-line. I'd like to thank them for
7	their hard work and I encourage everyone who is
8	interested in TLC metrics to log on to our
9	website.
10	Now on to scheduled business. Today's
11	proposal to amend our insurance coverage rules for
12	for-hire vehicles is intended to better ensure
13	that drivers, passengers, pedestrians, cyclists,
14	and other roadway users are adequately and quickly
15	compensated, in the event of a crash involving a
16	TLC-licensed vehicle by an admitted product to New
17	York City.
18	The proposal also aligns with New York
19	State laws, including the VTL, which is the
20	Vehicle and Traffic Law, the DMV, and the DFS
21	regulations which require that insurance companies
22	providing coverages are authorized to do business
23	in New York by the Superintendent of Insurance.
24	The requirement offers added protections to
25	vehicle owners. If a New York-authorized

б

Γ

7

1	insurance company becomes insolvent, the guarantee
2	funds step in to provide a safety net and pay
3	covered claims. Key proposed changes, enhanced
4	insurance carrier requirements to facilitate the
5	prompt payment of claims and improved tracking of
6	required coverage, these changes call for a more
7	comprehensive reporting to TLC, such as submitting
8	the VIN and certificate of liability.
9	Additionally, these amendments clarify that
10	TLC's minimum No-Fault and liability coverage
11	requirements for TLC-licensed vehicles must be met
12	through a single primary policy, simplifying
13	coverage monitoring and claims processing.
14	The proposed amendments would apply to all
15	carriers providing coverage to TLC licensees.
16	These rules will continue to allow American
17	Transit to renew and issue new policies, as well
18	as they follow the DFS rules and procedures.
19	We appreciate the New York State Department
20	of Financial Services collaborative approach and
21	look forward to continuing to work with them,
22	state law-makers, to support the long-term
23	stability of the taxi and for-hire insurance
24	industry.
25	And then I would also like to recognize

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 Commissioner Velazquez. I'm sorry I missed you at 2 the top. 3 At this point, I want to introduce data analyst Carolyn Liu, who will now give a short 4 5 presentation of why we are proposing faster response times for FHV wheelchair accessible 6 7 vehicles. Carolyn. 8 MS. LIU: Thank you, Commissioner Do. Let 9 me share my screen. 10 Hi, everyone. My name is Carolyn Liu. Ι am a data analyst in the policy divisions data 11 12 analytics unit. Today I will be walking everyone 13 through these slides on the current FHV WAV 14 landscape and a bit on the analysis we performed to inform the proposed rules regarding the central 15 16 dispatched wait times. 17 So, first, executive summary. The current rules of 80 percent of FHV WAV wait times is under 18 19 10 minutes and 90 percent under 15 minutes are 20 already being met. In 2023, 90 percent of WAV rides came within 10 minutes for Lyft and 88 21 22 percent for Uber. And so far in 2024, that is up 23 to October of 2024, the companies have either 24 provided a similar level service as they did the 25 previous year, or slightly better in Lyft's case.

Γ

1	There has been a positive trend in the
2	percent of WAVs arriving in under 10 minutes. We
3	started at around 60 percent in 2019 and have
4	risen to almost 90 percent this year. So this
5	brings us to our proposed threshold of 90 percent
6	of WAV trip services completed in under 10
7	minutes. This will encourage companies to improve
8	accessibility, prevent backsliding, and exceed
9	typical bus headways.
10	So a bit on the FHV WAV lead. The FHV WAV
11	fleet has grown tremendously over the last five or
12	six years. In January of 2019, there were only
13	339 vehicles in service, and as of October 2024,
14	there are over 7,600, and so far in 2024, over
15	8,500 drivers performed high-volume FHV trips.
16	This chart here shows the yearly WAV trip share
17	for FHVs and you can see for every year since 2020
18	there's been year over year growth. And so far,
19	2024 has seen the highest share of FHV trips
20	completed in a WAV at just over 90 percent.
21	So, the rest of the slides show annual
22	trends for wait-time thresholds. Here, we are
23	looking at the percentage of WAV wait times for
24	the 15-minute threshold and we can see that Uber
25	has exceeded the 90 percent under 15-minute

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

10

	10
1	thresholds for every year since 2020. Lyft caught
2	up in 2022. And, so far for this year, over 97
3	percent of WAV trip services have been fulfilled
4	in under 15 minutes.
5	This slide just shows similar to the
б	previous slides, just for the 10-minute threshold.
7	Both companies have been able to meet and exceed
8	the current 80 percent in under 10-minute
9	requirement since 2022. And Lyft, over the last
10	two years, has actually been able to exceed the 90
11	percent threshold, while Uber is hovering just a
12	little bit below at the high 80s.
13	This final chart shows the industry wait
14	times for different thresholds. 10 minutes in
15	dark purple. Light purple is the 15 minute one.
16	As an industry, for every year since 2020, over
17	just about 90 percent, or at least over 90 percent
18	have been serviced in under 15 minutes.
19	And for the 10-minute threshold, back in
20	2019, just over 60 percent of WAV trips were
21	fulfilled in under 10 minutes. And over the last
22	two years the industry has kind of been rapidly
23	approaching that 90 percent threshold.
24	And that concludes my presentation. Thank
25	you. I'm happy to take any questions.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 COMMISSIONER DO: Commissioners, are there 2 any questions? 3 MS. KAUFMAN: I have a quick question, which is, have you seen the total number of WAV 4 5 trip requests increase as well or simply the share of total trips has remained stable, while the 6 7 percentage has increased? 8 MS. LIU: I would need to look back at the 9 data for that. I don't have the numbers for that 10 on hand right now. 11 MS. KAUFMAN: Thank you. 12 COMMISSIONER DO: Are there any other 13 questions from commissioners? 14 Great. Okay, hearing none, I will ask Sherryl to now go through our public hearing. 15 16 MS. ELUTO: Good morning. When I call your 17 name, you can un-mute your microphone and begin 18 your testimony. Each speaker will be allotted 19 three minutes. This time limit will be strictly 20 enforced. A 30-second warning will be provided and then you will need to conclude your testimony 21 22 when your time is up. 23 Today's rule proposals were published in 24 the City Record and posted on our website on 25 October 31st. The public comment period ends

	12
1	today. The video of this hearing and copies of
2	all written comments will be provided to the
3	Commissioners, prior to the vote on these rules at
4	the next before the next Commission meeting.
5	With that, we will begin our public
б	hearing. First, we are going to do the FHV WAVs
7	proposal and I will call on our first speaker and
8	that is Joseph Rappaport.
9	Mr. Rappaport, you can begin. You need to
10	un-mute
11	MR. RAPPAPORT: Yes. Yes. Yes.
12	MS. ELUTO: There we go.
13	MR. RAPPAPORT: Hold on. Thank you for the
14	opportunity to testify. I'm Joe Rappaport, the
15	Executive Director of the Brooklyn Center for
16	Independence of the Disabled, or BCID. We are a
17	core member of the Taxis For All campaign, which
18	has advocated for wheelchair accessible yellow and
19	for-hire service since 1996.
20	We support the TLC's proposal to reduce the
21	wait time for for-hire providers. As my
22	colleagues, Evan Yankey, and Cathy Collins, and
23	perhaps others, will testify today, we urge that
24	you codify more stringent requirements over time
25	so that service is truly equivalent.

1	We appreciate the progress you and the
2	providers have made so far, however. We also want
3	to use this opportunity to urge you to further
4	change your yellow taxi accessibility rules so
5	that the fleet becomes 100 percent accessible, not
6	50 percent, to compromise the Taxis For All
7	campaign made 11 years ago, almost to the day.
8	We urge you to work with us and with
9	drivers, particularly with drivers, to develop a
10	funding mechanism for a smooth transition to 100
11	percent over the next few years. That way, no one
12	will be left behind if they are looking for a
13	yellow taxi.
14	And, finally, we urge you also to hold off
15	on abandoning the current accessible dispatch
16	system. Some of you may remember the late Edith
17	Prentiss, who headed the Taxis For All campaign
18	for several years. Edith pushed and pushed, as
19	only Edith could, for accessible dispatch, because
20	she knew that without 100 percent accessibility in
21	the yellow taxi fleet, and far from complete Uber
22	and Lyft accessibility, wheelchair users would
23	always have difficulty getting a ride. Drivers
24	would pass them up illegally. And in some
25	neighborhoods in the city, including Washington

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	Heights, where Edith lived, it would be hard to
2	get an accessible taxi.
3	Edith was right. Now, when Uber and Lyft
4	don't show up, when Access-A-Ride gets lost, or
5	when someone just wants to use Yellow Cab to get
6	home on a rainy day, accessible dispatch works for
7	them. One huge advantage of accessible dispatch
8	is that it's easy to use. We urge you to keep it
9	in place, until any replacement is as easy and
10	effective for all disabled riders.
11	Thank you for the opportunity to testify
12	and we look forward to hearing more and for your
13	passage of these rules. Thank you.
14	MS. ELUTO: Thank you. Our next speaker up
15	is Jean Ryan.
16	MS. RYAN: Hello, I am Jean Ryan. Can you
17	hear me and see me?
18	MS. ELUTO: Yes.
19	MS. RYAN: Thank you. I am Jean Ryan, a
20	wheelchair user, President of Disabled in Action
21	of Metropolitan New York, as well as a long-time
22	member of Taxis for All campaign. And I agree
23	with what Mr. Rappaport said about accessible
24	dispatch. It's extremely important to people and
25	we need to have a way to contact people, if their

ride doesn't show up. It can't just be an app. 1 Being able to call for or use an app to get 2 3 spontaneous transportation in a for-hire vehicle is life changing and something that no wheelchair 4 user takes for granted after many years of working 5 6 toward it. However, it is not very spontaneous if 7 we have to, almost always, wait longer for a WAV than upright people do. It's highly frustrating. 8 9 Changing the rules to require that 90 10 percent of WAV trips have to come in 10 minutes or 11 less is an improvement, but we want parity. What 12 about that other 10 percent? What about when a WAV is totally not available by app or phone? 13 How 14 are those stats recorded? People in Eastern 15 Queens and Eastern Brooklyn, in particular, can 16 not get an Uber or Lyft in a timely manner. After 17 an hour of trying, I never could get an Uber from 18 Staten Island back to Brooklyn. I was stranded. 19 The Lyft app told me no vehicles were 20 available on 42nd Street. How are those trips, or 21 non-trips, recorded, when we try to get a ride and 22 can't get one at all? 23 We need consistency. It's not good if we 24 don't know when -- if we can get a ride and if we

can get back too. The timeframe should be

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

25

1 tightened up even more, so that every time we want 2 a ride, we can get one wherever we are. 3 Also, it's good that the actual arrival 4 time will be recorded now. Because what the app 5 says and what actually happens are seldom the same. Sometimes I have to wait three times longer 6 7 than what the app said it would take for the 8 vehicle to come. 9 I also object to Uber's app making 10 wheelchair users cross the street to get to the vehicle much of the time. That is not safe, nor 11 12 is the inability of most drivers to secure a 13 safely -- or a wheelchair --14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds 15 remaining. 16 MS. RYAN: -- with securements and a 17 seatbelt. It's almost impossible to get a driver 18 to put our seatbelt on for us. They don't know. 19 They said they left it at home or it's in the 20 garage. 21 Thank you. Bye. 22 MS. ELUTO: Our next speaker is Anna 23 Humphrey. 24 MS. HUMPHREY: Thank you for the 25 opportunity to speak today. My name is Anna

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 Humphrey and I am the transportation community 2 organizer for the Center for Independence of the Disabled in New York. 3 4 I am here to voice our strong support for 5 the proposed amendments to the TLC's wheelchair accessible vehicle wait-time requirement. Access 6 7 to reliable on-demand transportation is a right that should be equally available to all New 8 9 Yorkers, regardless of physical ability. Since the implementation of wait-time benchmarks in 10 2019, we've seen significant improvement with wait 11 12 times for WAVs drastically reduced, yet as noted, 13 WAV users still experience longer wait times than those who use non-accessible for-hire vehicles. 14 15 This discrepancy is unacceptable and stands in the 16 way of equal access. 17 The proposed update, which would require WAV dispatchers to meet a stricter standard of 18 19 serving 90 percent of WAV requests in under 10 20 minutes is a necessary step to close this service gap, although the goal should always be 100 21 22 percent. 23 The increased availability of nearly 6,000 24 WAVs in recent years is proof that was the right 25 regulatory framework; accessible vehicle service

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	can be significantly enhanced. The stricter
2	response times will incentivize dispatchers to
3	continue prioritizing wheelchair-accessible trips,
4	ultimately leveling the playing field for riders
5	with disabilities.
6	We all deserve the right we all deserve
7	the dignity of reliable timely service and these
8	proposed challenges are essential to making that
9	reality for the disability community.
10	I urge the TLC to adopt this rule to ensure
11	that all riders, regardless of ability, have equal
12	access to transportation services in New York
13	City. Thank you.
14	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
15	Our next speaker is Jose Altamirano.
16	MR. ALTAMIRANO: Can you hear me?
17	MS. ELUTO: Yes.
18	MR. ALTAMIRANO: Perfect. Good morning,
19	Commissioners. My name is Jose Altamirano and I
20	am here as President of the Livery Base Owners
21	Association, which represents over 250 livery
22	bases. These bases are predominantly small,
23	family-owned businesses that play a critical role
24	in connecting underserved communities, especially
25	immigrants and first-generation American essential

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 services and opportunities. We are part of the 2 Uber WAV program. 3 I am here today to express our concern 4 about the proposed changes to increase the WAV 5 trip dispatch compliance threshold from 80 to 90 percent. While we support the efforts to improve 6 7 customer experience, this rule, as currently drafted, risks proposing dis -- disproportionate 8 9 and unsustainable costs on small livery bases. 10 The current 80 percent compliance requirement 11 already demands significant investment in dispatch 12 technology, driver recruitment, and service 13 coordination. 14 For smaller bases, many which operate with limited resources, meeting this threshold is a 15 16 continuous challenge. Increasing the threshold to 17 90 would amplify these challenges exponentially. Change does not account for factors beyond the 18 base of WAVs providers control, such as traffic 19 20 congestion, unpredictable driver availability, and the need to accommodate last-minute passenger 21 22 requests. 23 In neighborhoods where transit options are limited, demand fluctuates. Analyzing bases 24

falling short of even stricter thresholds would

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

25

_	20
1	jeopardize their financial stability and reduce
2	their ability to serve these communities.
3	As the Commission knows, this WAV program
4	receives no subsidy grants or funding of any kind
5	from the City of New York or the State of New
6	York. We urge the Commission to consider the
7	broader implications of this rule. By raising the
8	compliance threshold, you risk exacerbating the
9	economic strain on small businesses who use the
10	WAV providers, reducing service availability for
11	vulnerable populations and ultimately undermining
12	the diversity and accessibility of our city's
13	transportation ecosystem.
14	The city's pedestrian-focused city planning
15	also affects this timing. A few months ago, the
16	FDNY testified in front of City Council that their
17	emergency vehicles were not able to reach
18	emergencies on a timely basis due to the city's
19	implementation of bike lanes and bus lanes,
20	causing the streets to get smaller and more
21	congested and harder to navigate.
22	Therefore, we recommend maintaining the 80
23	percent threshold, which strikes a reasonable
24	balance between service improvements and the
25	operational realities of livery bases. This

21

1	approach will ensure the bases using the WAV
2	program can continue providing safe, reliable and
3	affordable transportation, while avoiding
4	unintended harm to the communities they serve.
5	Or, at the very least, to raise from the current
б	80 percent threshold to 85 percent, allowing the
7	economic strain to be more sustainable and
8	organic.
9	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds
10	remaining.
11	MR. ALTAMIRANO: Thank you for the
12	opportunity to testify today. I am happy to
13	answer any questions the Commission may have.
14	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
15	COMMISSIONER BADER: Can we ask a question?
16	MS. ELUTO: Sure.
17	COMMISSIONER BADER: Hello, sir. I
18	appreciate your testimony. I presume that you saw
19	the data that was recently put up online, relative
20	to the current rate of response time, which is, in
21	some places exceeds the 90 percent and in other
22	places it is very, very close to the 90 percent.
23	So, in essence, what we are really doing is
24	codifying what currently exists; is that not true?
25	MR. ALTAMIRANO: It is true, Commissioner.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	However, you're putting a rule in effect and it's
2	almost like penalizing the program for being
3	successful. So, if the program is being
4	successful, it's already doing better than what
5	you expected and now you are raising it to a
6	point, you know, where now this is a new
7	expectation that will have to definitely meet, by
8	any standard, which means that now there is a
9	financial obligation to meet or go over.
10	Because that is how businesses work, right?
11	We don't want to reach a position where we go
12	under the percentages that are required. So now
13	we have to, kind of, over you know, go a little
14	over and that, obviously, cost money, cost
15	training, drivers cost more vehicles.
16	You know, I think this program has been
17	doing an amazing job over the years and we're
18	asking for something to be a little more moderate,
19	you know, if we are doing such a good job.
20	COMMISSIONER BADER: But you're aware that
21	we are dealing here with a population, for a
22	variety of reasons, life is not simplified for
23	them, right? So we are dealing with a population
24	here that has enough difficulty in getting around
25	and the goal here is only to try to make it even

1easier for a population, which has had this2problem for many, many, many years.3So, for us all all of us here in the4community, in a variety of ways, both in the5government side and on the public side, to try to6raise the standard for people who are starting7with some difficulty, I think isn't that what8community service, isn't that what government is9all about, to try to make it easier for those who10need the help the most?11MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,12Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very13well and I was very saddened to hear that she14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue25is, right. The government is trying to do this,		
3So, for us all all of us here in the4community, in a variety of ways, both in the5government side and on the public side, to try to6raise the standard for people who are starting7with some difficulty, I think isn't that what8community service, isn't that what government is9all about, to try to make it easier for those who10need the help the most?11MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,12Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very13well and I was very saddened to hear that she14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	1	easier for a population, which has had this
4community, in a variety of ways, both in the5government side and on the public side, to try to6raise the standard for people who are starting7with some difficulty, I think isn't that what8community service, isn't that what government is9all about, to try to make it easier for those who10need the help the most?11MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,12Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very13well and I was very saddened to hear that she14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	2	problem for many, many, many years.
5government side and on the public side, to try to6raise the standard for people who are starting7with some difficulty, I think isn't that what8community service, isn't that what government is9all about, to try to make it easier for those who10need the help the most?11MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,12Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very13well and I was very saddened to hear that she14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	3	So, for us all all of us here in the
 raise the standard for people who are starting with some difficulty, I think isn't that what community service, isn't that what government is all about, to try to make it easier for those who need the help the most? MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent, Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very well and I was very saddened to hear that she passed away. We worked with her for many years. This is definitely true, what you're saying. But, like you said, "government". What you are doing as in the commissioner is putting this completely in private hands, because the government is not giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is participating and, obviously, paying into it. 	4	community, in a variety of ways, both in the
7 with some difficulty, I think isn't that what 8 community service, isn't that what government is 9 all about, to try to make it easier for those who 10 need the help the most? 11 MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent, 12 Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very 13 well and I was very saddened to hear that she 14 passed away. We worked with her for many years. 15 This is definitely true, what you're saying. But, 16 like you said, "government". What you are doing 17 as in the commissioner is putting this completely 18 in private hands, because the government is not 19 giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic 19 help in this situation, so we are doing this 20 help in this situation, so we are doing this 21 privately, all right. This is all being funded 22 privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is 23 participating and, obviously, paying into it. 24 So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	5	government side and on the public side, to try to
 community service, isn't that what government is all about, to try to make it easier for those who need the help the most? MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent, Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very well and I was very saddened to hear that she passed away. We worked with her for many years. This is definitely true, what you're saying. But, like you said, "government". What you are doing as in the commissioner is putting this completely in private hands, because the government is not giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is participating and, obviously, paying into it. 	6	raise the standard for people who are starting
 all about, to try to make it easier for those who need the help the most? MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent, Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very well and I was very saddened to hear that she passed away. We worked with her for many years. This is definitely true, what you're saying. But, like you said, "government". What you are doing as in the commissioner is putting this completely in private hands, because the government is not giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded participating and, obviously, paying into it. So, I mean, that is part of what the issue 	7	with some difficulty, I think isn't that what
10need the help the most?11MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,12Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very13well and I was very saddened to hear that she14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	8	community service, isn't that what government is
InMR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,12Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very13well and I was very saddened to hear that she14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	9	all about, to try to make it easier for those who
Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very well and I was very saddened to hear that she passed away. We worked with her for many years. This is definitely true, what you're saying. But, like you said, "government". What you are doing as in the commissioner is putting this completely in private hands, because the government is not giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is participating and, obviously, paying into it. So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	10	need the help the most?
 well and I was very saddened to hear that she passed away. We worked with her for many years. This is definitely true, what you're saying. But, like you said, "government". What you are doing as in the commissioner is putting this completely in private hands, because the government is not giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is participating and, obviously, paying into it. So, I mean, that is part of what the issue 	11	MR. ALTAMIRANO: I agree 100 percent,
14passed away. We worked with her for many years.15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	12	Commissioner. I actually was I knew Edith very
15This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,16like you said, "government". What you are doing17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	13	well and I was very saddened to hear that she
16 like you said, "government". What you are doing as in the commissioner is putting this completely in private hands, because the government is not giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is participating and, obviously, paying into it. So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	14	passed away. We worked with her for many years.
17as in the commissioner is putting this completely18in private hands, because the government is not19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	15	This is definitely true, what you're saying. But,
18 in private hands, because the government is not 19 giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic 20 help in this situation, so we are doing this 21 privately, all right. This is all being funded 22 privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is 23 participating and, obviously, paying into it. 24 So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	16	like you said, "government". What you are doing
19giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic20help in this situation, so we are doing this21privately, all right. This is all being funded22privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is23participating and, obviously, paying into it.24So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	17	as in the commissioner is putting this completely
help in this situation, so we are doing this privately, all right. This is all being funded privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is participating and, obviously, paying into it. So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	18	in private hands, because the government is not
21 privately, all right. This is all being funded 22 privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is 23 participating and, obviously, paying into it. 24 So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	19	giving us any funding, any subsidies, any economic
22 privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is 23 participating and, obviously, paying into it. 24 So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	20	help in this situation, so we are doing this
 participating and, obviously, paying into it. So, I mean, that is part of what the issue 	21	privately, all right. This is all being funded
24 So, I mean, that is part of what the issue	22	privately, so anyone that's part of this WAV is
	23	participating and, obviously, paying into it.
25 is, right. The government is trying to do this,	24	So, I mean, that is part of what the issue
	25	is, right. The government is trying to do this,

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

I

1	but it is doing it through private matters. We
2	are trying to do it in a way, as we run our
3	businesses, in a way that makes sense. And yes,
4	we definitely want to continue to improve, to get
5	better, but that is why we said, you know, if we
б	go from 80 to 85, and then we continue to improve
7	as we go along again.
8	But again, we are doing this privately, not
9	through any help of the government, which is why
10	our concern is an economic strain.
11	COMMISSIONER BADER: We are through the
12	licensing process, the Commission licenses these
13	vehicles and allows the industry to make money by
14	picking up people on the street, so it's not like
15	it's independent, they are certainly connected,
16	okay.
17	COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you so much,
18	Commissioner Bader. Thank you, Jose, I appreciate
19	your time.
20	MS. ELUTO: Our next speaker up is Michael
21	Simon.
22	MR. SIMON: Hello, Commission, and thank
23	you for the opportunity to share my thoughts on
24	the subject and my thoughts, in general. Alderman
25	of many years ago said, when they decided to sell

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

	23
1	medallions, there's too many cars, too many cabs,
2	let's do something about it. So they said, okay,
3	from now on, if you want to be a taxi you have to
4	have a medallion. If you don't have a medallion,
5	you can't pick up people in the City of New York
6	who are hailing a car on the street. That's what
7	medallion is for, then and now, because of the new
8	E-hail, you unleash incredible numbers and
9	contributed large part in congestion, the very
10	thing that the medallion was meant to prevent.
11	There is no indication in the law as to how
12	to do street hail.
13	MS. ELUTO: Sir
14	MR. SIMON: How to do
15	MS. ELUTO: Sir, sir, do you have comments
16	on the rule proposal, which involves FHV, it's not
17	taxis.
18	MR. SIMON: Okay, well, my testimony is
19	relevant, because the apps are using our
20	street-hail rights, as well in WAV vehicles.
21	That's why this is relevant. Everything about
22	this meeting is relevant to taxis, because it
23	really affects the taxis, how you implement the
24	WAV requirements for the app cars.
25	But I will get to this to that subject

Γ

1	right now, more precisely. Why should app cars be
2	allowed to discriminate? Open up the apps, Uber,
3	wait time between Uber X and Uber WAV, you can see
4	that it takes longer for the disabled to get an
5	Uber WAV. That seems like discrimination to me.
б	Apps should have equal waiting times for the
7	disabled passengers and non-disabled passengers.
8	That's what you're doing to yellow.
9	Equitable treatment should be for all competitors,
10	otherwise, it's disadvantageous to yellows and
11	will continue their downward spiral. Not because
12	of the requirement to be WAVS, but because it's
13	not being applied equally.
14	Okay, I have a lot to say about the E-hail
15	being the street hail and only cars that have
16	medallions only cabs can do E-hails because an
17	E-hail is a street hail. Thank you very much.
18	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
19	Our next speaker is Eman Rimawi-Doster.
20	MS. DOSTER: Yes, thank you. Thank you so
21	much. Good morning.
22	Good morning, my name is Eman Rimawi-Doster
23	and I'm the Senior Community Organizer with New
24	York Lawyers for the Public Interest and
25	Disability Justice Department. We are in support

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	of this improvement on the rules. We would like
2	to use this as a platform to highlight the need
3	for zero-emission WAVs and for the role of the TLC
4	they often play in creating the market for those.
5	Accessibility and environmental
6	sustainability are paramount in the future of our
7	city. We recently met with the TLC and they asked
8	us to come to this wonderful City Hall hearing
9	about TLC improvements and accessibility, but we
10	also have concerns about them wanting to cut the
11	call center.
12	We also want to improve driver training.
13	Issues persist with drivers not properly securing
14	wheelchairs. I sometimes fluctuate between using
15	a wheelchair and a walker, because of the nature
16	of my lupus and being a double amputee. Are
17	trainings produced for these folks, are people
18	with disabilities actually involved in these
19	trainings? Sometimes seatbelt buckles are tucked
20	underneath in the seats, which can be difficult
21	for people to get or, as Jean Ryan said, sometimes
22	the buckles aren't even provided at all.
23	Uber and Lyft demand that passengers
24	sometimes cross the street to meet them, putting
25	people with disabilities in danger of inaccessible

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 road crossings. I've had to do that multiple 2 times. 3 We encourage the TLC to engage vehicle 4 manufacturers, like Toyota, to develop accessible 5 New York City is an enormous market, which EVs. could entice manufacturers to develop the first 6 7 widely-used accessible EVs in the U.S. 8 Lastly, we applaud the TLC for improving 9 the requirements that dispatchers serve at least 10 90 percent of the WAV vehicles and WAV requests in 11 under 10 minutes, an improvement on the former 12 numbers of 80 percent in 10 minutes and 90 percent 13 in 15 minutes. We support the increase and 14 reporting requirements and we support all the 15 changes that you guys are making to make the city 16 more accessible. 17 I want to echo what Joe, and Jean, and Anna 18 said about the importance of this and also that 19 ADA compliance is definitely important for 20 disabled New Yorkers. And as more people get more 21 disabled, and our population is aging, we need to 22 have more accessible vehicles for everyone. 23 Thank you so much. I appreciate being able 24 to talk. 25 MS. ELUTO: The next speaker is Avik

1 Kabessa. Mr. Kabessa, can you un-mute your mic 2 and begin. 3 MR. KABESSA: Sorry. Good morning, Commissioners. My name is Avik Kabessa. 4 I'm the 5 CEO of Carmel, board member of the Livery Roundtable, and chairman of the New York State 6 7 Livery Workers' Compensation Fund. 8 Carmel services 184 cities around the U.S. 9 and, as such, I can say here before you that there 10 is no other city in the U.S., no other city comes even close to answering 90 percent WAV requests 11 12 within 15 minutes and 80 percent within 10 13 minutes, like we currently do in New York City. 14 In other words, we are already the shining city on the hill when it comes to WAV service. 15 As 16 far as what the Commissioner said about we are 17 doing it already, the data I have seen that was 18 presented today shows that we are not doing 90 19 percent in 10 minutes, we are doing 97 in 15 20 minutes and 87, 10 minutes. So, again, we already 21 hold the highest record, as far as the U.S. 22 There is nothing wrong with wanting to push 23 our own record. But being number one already can 24 allow us to consider a harm such push may cause. 25 As you know, the transitional for-hire sector is

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

I

1	complying with the current WAV rule by paying into
2	the approved WAV dispatch program. The amount we
3	pay is directly correlated to the number of WAV
4	needed on the road to achieve that requirement.
5	Adapting the proposed rule will mean increasing
6	the number of WAVs and with it, increasing the
7	cost of traditional bases.
8	It is no secret, traditional bases are in a
9	dire financial state, so increasing our overall
10	will result in greater harm than the pleasure of
11	breaking our own amazing record.
12	Therefore, we respectfully request, Livery
13	Roundtable respectfully requests that you vote
14	against the WAV proposal. But if you still want
15	to push the envelope, we ask that you do it in
16	moderation. And as Jose from the Livery Base
17	Owner Association said, maybe just move it from 80
18	to 85.
19	We are proud. We are the best in the
20	nation and we don't have to cause unintended
21	consequences, harm to the traditional sector.
22	Thank you very much and I can answer any
23	questions.
24	MS. ELUTO: All right, thank you.
25	Our next speaker is Evan Yankey.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 MR. YANKEY: Good morning, everybody. My 2 name is Evan Yankey and I'm the Advocacy Director 3 for Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled and we are here today to testify in 4 5 support of efforts to reduce wait times for wheelchair accessible for-hire vehicles. 6 7 The proposed new rules would require dispatchers to serve 90 percent of wheelchair 8 9 accessible vehicle requests in under 10 minutes 10 and require companies to do better recording on their times. 11 12 More than a year ago, we met with Chairman 13 Do to talk about this and we are pleased that TLC 14 is moving forward. But we think another way of 15 moving forward is to codify a tightening of these 16 rules over time, so that response times are, in 17 fact, equivalent to non-wheelchair accessible 18 vehicle response times, as is required by your own 19 rules. 20 Users who depend on these vehicles fear being stranded in fear of access to vehicle 21 22 accessibility during peak usage times or when 23 traveling in transportation deserts. With the 24 data we saw today on for-hire vehicles achieving 25 successes in wait time reductions, we remain

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

	52
1	concerned for people in the 10 percent who are not
2	receiving equivalent wait times and may be
3	disproportionately impacted based on their
4	location or needs.
5	People with disabilities in New York City
6	can not always rely on being in a for-hire vehicle
7	rich neighborhood when they need accessible
8	transportation. Unless response times include
9	even further than the proposed rule, people with
10	disabilities will continue to face service risks
11	that make it harder to travel around and maintain
12	employment in the city.
13	We know that you will be hearing from other
14	people with disabilities and organizations today
15	who support further tightening of response times
16	and we urge you to listen to them. Thank you.
17	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
18	Mr. Yankey was our last speaker on this
19	rule proposal, so now we are going to move to the
20	other rule proposal, the restrictions on insurance
21	regulations.
22	The first speaker up will be Dan Bratshpis.
23	I don't think he's in the
24	MR. BRATSHPIS: My name is Dan Bratshpis.
25	I run the third largest TLC insurance program in

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Γ

1	New York City. Since my time is limited, I won't
2	read from the detailed document you are going to
3	receive from me, which outlines why parts of these
4	proposed rules are bad policy at the worst
5	possible time. Instead, I want to take a step
6	back and examine how we really got here.
7	The New York City TLC industry represents
8	20 percent of all liquidations in the entire State
9	of New York, and that isn't even taking into
10	account the future liquidations that we are going
11	to see, given all the recent press. So think
12	about that for a minute. Across all the different
13	types of insurance transacted in the huge State of
14	New York, this agency's insurance requirements
15	will cause more than one out of five bankruptcies
16	that the citizens of New York will have to bail
17	out.
18	The public motor vehicle guarantee fund,
19	meant to protect the TLC policy holders, currently
20	has a net balance of a whopping 7 and half million
21	dollars, while we have a billion dollars of
22	unfunded liabilities from the insolvent carriers
23	that TLC accepts to this day. Each TLC licensee
24	will be held responsible for over \$10,000 per
25	vehicle in unfunded claims expenses and this

1	number is growing because this Commission has
2	allowed insolvent carriers to satisfy your
3	insurance requirements. This is just wild.
4	The industry will continue to be plagued by
5	mismanaged and insolvent insurance carriers until
б	real financial standards are put in place by the
7	regulators. These responsibilities lie both with
8	the Department of Financial Services and the New
9	York City TLC. Every other New York City
10	governmental department places financial standards
11	on its insurance requirements, except the TLC.
12	To fix a pothole on Broadway, you need to
13	bring an A and Best-rated insurance policy, but to
14	transport a family in a cab, you allow insolvent
15	carriers to protect them. The proposed rules
16	today will not solve this catastrophe. It will
17	push stable insurance companies like ours out of
18	the market.
19	There are two parts to the proposed rules
20	you're debating when it comes to insurance. One
21	is to prohibit insolvent carriers from writing TLC
22	insurance and the second is to push out surplus
23	lines insurers. I've been told that the
24	Commission intends to scrap the insolvent carrier
25	rules altogether. In other words, you are going

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	to continue allowing insolvent carriers to protect
2	the citizen, pedestrians, tourists in New York
3	City, all while unfunded liability gets bigger and
4	bigger. And you're proposing to kick out the only
5	A and Best-rated financially stable insurance
6	program in the City of New York, effectively
7	leaving one solvent carrier in the market.
8	The TLC has as much a responsibility here
9	as the DFS to solve
10	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds
11	remaining.
12	MR. BRATSHPIS: The department should
13	address three core areas. One, stop allowing
14	insolvent carriers to operate in our city by
15	setting minimum financial standards. Having one
16	dollar of capital is not good enough to protect
17	the citizens of New York. It's absurd that we
18	even need to debate this.
19	Two, we need to attract financially stable
20	insurance carriers into the market by continuing
21	to allow pricing flexibility through surplus lines
22	and the free trade zone, just as the TLC has
23	allowed for 40-plus years.
24	And three, set coverage requirements so
25	that there is no gaps in the rules, in the same

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 way that California does, insuring that coverage 2 is maintained 24/7, 365. 3 MS. ELUTO: Thank you. Our next speaker is Keith Greenbaum. 4 5 MR. GREENBAUM: Good morning, Chairman Do, members of the Commission. My name is Keith 6 7 Greenbaum. I am here today speaking on behalf of Hereford Insurance Company. Hereford is a New 8 9 York State domicile admitted insurance company. 10 We have provided insurance services to the 11 for-hire market in New York City for 30 years. 12 The company is based out of Queens and employs 13 approximately 250 employees. We work with more than 100 New York-licensed insurance brokers 14 across the state. Hereford is a responsible and 15 16 disciplined insurance company and is proud to have 17 successfully supported this vital industry with 18 insurance coverage throughout the last 30 years. 19 That said, we very much recognize the 20 issues within the broader TLC insurance 21 environment. We agree that New York City and New 2.2 York State must focus on solutions to these 23 Such solutions should minimize disruption issues. 24 to the streets of New York and create a stable, 25 competitive, and healthy insurance marketplace for

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	the for-hire industry. That is why we support the
2	intent of the rules as proposed.
3	We view the proposed rules as providing
4	elaboration for clarification of the
5	already-existing rules. We agree with
6	comprehensive reporting, clarifying the TLC
7	minimum limits be met through a primary policy and
8	that insurers providing this coverage be licensed
9	and authorized by the New York Department of
10	Financial Services, also referred to as being an
11	admitted carrier. The value of being an admitted
12	carrier is substantial. Admitted carriers are
13	subject to strict compliance with state rules and
14	regulations that nonadmitted carriers are not
15	subject to.
16	Admitted carriers are required to have
17	premium rates, rules, and policy forms approved by
18	the DFS, through an established approval process.
19	These consumer protections protect against unfair
20	premium charges, deceptive policy terms, and
21	unfair claims handling.
22	Significantly, policies issued by state
23	admitted carriers are protected by the state's
24	guarantee fund. Therefore, if an admitted
25	insurance company can not pay a claim, the fund

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

will step in.

1

2 Hereford, by virtue of being an admitted 3 carrier, pays an annual three percent liability premium assessment to New York State's guarantee 4 5 fund. Nonadmitted carriers do not pay into the fund and its policy holders and claimants are not 6 7 afforded the benefits of the guarantee fund. Allowing nonadmitted carriers to write this 8 9 business would not only jeopardize the riding 10 public, but it would harm the admitted insurance 11 market and create a new, unstable and unsecured 12 insurance market in an already vulnerable 13 marketplace. 14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds 15 remaining. 16 MR. GREENBAUM: In today's environment, 17 insuring that licensees are covered by licensed 18 companies, subject to the laws and regulations of 19 the state and financially covered by the state's 20 quarantee fund is common sense. This industry needs to solve its problems with reasonable 21 2.2 regulation, not deregulation. Accordingly, the 23 rules proposed would clarify and protect this 24 industry from creating more problems, which, 25 frankly, this industry could no longer afford.

1 I appreciate your time. I am available for 2 any questions. Thank you. 3 COMMISSIONER BADER: So, sir, Mr. Greenbaum, thank you very much. We've heard 4 testimony. Was that testimony on both sides of 5 this issue regarding the first part relative to 6 7 the solvency? Some people are saying it is not strict enough, that there should be a stricter 8 9 criteria, based on a credit rating. 10 I am interested in what your thoughts are 11 about that and what you think the impact would be, 12 if we made it stricter on the economic financial side. 13 MR. GREENBAUM: I think that the DFS is --14 I don't think that the solution to the crisis is 15 16 -- is -- the DFS needs to do a good job regulating 17 its insurance companies. That is its sole purpose 18 and I think that it is now committed to doing so 19 and that the DFS is the appropriate entity to 20 regulate insurance companies and their purpose is 21 to license responsible insurance companies. 22 Now, if there's been a failure in the past, 23 then that needs to be corrected. But it's 24 ultimately their responsibility and they are well 25 suited to comply with that responsibility.

40

	10
1	COMMISSIONER BADER: Okay. So, on the
2	other side, in the past, there has been some
3	surplus providers, as you are aware, that have
4	provided lots of insurance for in the industry
5	over the years and it hasn't really created
6	problems, as far as we know. So why is it that
7	you would want to change that and no longer allow
8	those providers to continue to insure?
9	MR. GREENBAUM: I'm sorry, I don't
10	understand the question.
11	COMMISSIONER BADER: In other words, you
12	support the proposal to get rid of the surplus
13	providers, correct?
14	MR. GREENBAUM: No. We were under the
15	understanding, based on the opening dialogue, that
16	that language is being changed simply to we
17	didn't really comment on that piece of the
18	legislation. We were under the impression that is
19	being modified.
20	COMMISSIONER BADER: So, you are aware, of
21	course, that almost 60 insurance for TLC is
22	handled by one company that has real solvency
23	problems, correct? So we don't know exactly, we
24	all agree that the state is doing what they can to
25	deal with that issue. We all hope that works out

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

41

1 beneficially. 2 I don't like to have -- it's not a good 3 situation where 65 percent of the policies are written by a company that is the weakest 4 5 financially of all the insurance companies. How do you think that should be dealt with? 6 7 MR. GREENBAUM: I agree with that. I think that the solution is baked into adequate pricing, 8 9 appropriate and reasonable regulation, and enforcement of the existing rules. And I think 10 that this is a collaboration between the city, the 11 12 state, and the stakeholders. 13 And I think that priority number one is to 14 minimize disruption to the streets of New York City. Priority number two is to stop the bleeding 15 16 of any additional insolvency through adequate 17 actuarially determined rates. And then to 18 incentivize and encourage other carriers into this 19 marketplace with a healthy competitive 20 marketplace. COMMISSIONER BADER: So, I'll give you one 21 more question. If, hypothetically, come March, 22 23 when a lot of these policies are up for renewal,

provide, do you think that the rest of the

this large carrier is not able to adequately

24

25

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

	4.
1	insurance industry in the area would be able to
2	pick up that slack?
3	MR. GREENBAUM: I think that could
4	definitely be considered disruptive to the streets
5	of New York City and that is not our objective.
6	COMMISSIONER BADER: Okay, thank you.
7	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
8	Our next speaker is Jeremy Moskowitz.
9	MR. MOSKOWITZ: Thank you.
10	Commissioner, thank you, and I want to say
11	that I, when we speak one-on-one, I appreciate it
12	that you always I feel listened to and heard.
13	With that said, these insurance rules show
14	to me that the Commission's understanding of the
15	current insurance crisis is uninformed,
16	irresponsible, and ill-timed.
17	We've seen what happens when TLC makes
18	quick rule changes without proper research,
19	process planning, or consultation with the
20	important stakeholders. The chaotic and
21	surprising release of the EV licenses is proof of
22	that.
23	I want to take a second to emphasize that
24	rental is critical to this industry. Thousands of
25	drivers, and our partners at the IVG see that.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Γ

1	For tens of thousands of first-generation New
2	Yorkers, they need a solution that allows them to
3	go abroad for two or three months, without paying
4	fixed costs like insurance, and interest, et
5	cetera. Even the safest driver can get rear-ended
6	and their car is in the shop for a
7	month-and-a-half and they need to rent.
8	Others, who have fallen on hard times,
9	don't have the credit to finance a vehicle and
10	they use rental to succeed in this industry.
11	Back to insurance. Rather than trying to
12	prevent ATIC or Park Insurance from happening
13	again, rather than finding a real solution to the
14	New York City TLC insurance crisis, you are
15	passing a rule that only exacerbates it for those
16	of us who are operating responsibly, as
17	Commissioner Bader just mentioned.
18	This would have a direct increase on rental
19	prices in New York and an unnecessary increase.
20	I'd rather spend pass that savings to drivers
21	or invest in newer hybrid and EV vehicles.
22	I think this is a one-way street, so I
23	can't really ask this question, but I'd like to
24	know how being a fully admitted policy helped Park
25	Insurance, which screwed many of us, how being a

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

l

1	fully admitted policy helped the DFS oversee ATIC,
2	for the last 30 years, as they operated a
3	completely irresponsible, but fully admitted,
4	policy that some would call, not me, but others
5	would call, maybe, a Ponzi scheme. How has New
6	York State, DFS, oversight helped here?
7	We have an excess, or surplus policy, as
8	the Commissioner mentioned. Our main policy is
9	fully admitted by New York State and our excess
10	policy is completely responsible. I have three
11	times as many actuaries looking at my loss runs
12	and my insurance policies loss runs than DFS has
13	looking at any of the other insurance policies in
14	the market.
15	My policy has an A-rating from the only
16	national gold standard rating agency, A and Best.
17	That means the insurance policies backed by an
18	insurer with a proven record of billions of
19	dollars in assets. And since our insurance
20	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds
21	remaining.
22	MR. MOSKOWITZ: in Vermont, with the
23	actuaries that I have mentioned that look at every
24	little corner, I have tens of millions of dollars
25	in assets in addition to that protecting our

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 insurance policy. It is not even a competition to compare my insurance to ATIC, and Maya, and 2 3 others. 4 You've already had this, my proposal, in 5 writing, that this excess policy should be allowed with an A and Best rating. And if the TLC 6 7 continues with this rule, without a clear study 8 and conversation with stakeholders on how this 9 specific rule helps prevent future ATIC or Park 10 Insurance, or you can't articulate how my insurance is more risky, then I will feel 11 12 compelled to go to the City Council to create that 13 conversation publicly for all of us for safer 14 streets. Thank you. 15 MS. ELUTO: Thank you. 16 Our next speaker is Jose Altamirano. 17 MR. ALTAMIRANO: Good morning, 18 Commissioners. My name is Jose Altamirano. I'm 19 the President of Livery Base Owners Association, 20 and the owner of El Barrio's Car Service, a livery base in East Harlem, considered northern 21 2.2 Manhattan. LBO represents 20 percent of the FHV 23 sector. 24 We understand it's important to TLC's goal 25 to ensure that all vehicles operating under its

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Γ

1	jurisdiction maintain adequate insurance coverage.
2	We are currently in the midst of an insurance
3	crisis in the FHV industry and welcome updated
4	laws and regulations to ensure that our affiliated
5	vehicles can operate safely while allowing the
6	drivers to earn a living. While we support the
7	proposed regulation, we strongly urge the
8	Commission to implement these changes in a way
9	that does not place additional administrative or
10	financial burden on FHV bases, which are already
11	facing significant challenges.
12	It is critical to highlight that drivers in
13	the livery sector, and the rest of the FHV
14	industry, are independent contractors, not
15	employees. Bases send them jobs, which they
16	accept at their discretion. Drivers are
17	responsible for their vehicles, including
18	maintaining appropriate insurance coverage.
19	Our concern is that the proposed
20	requirements for a policy detailed submission and
21	compliance monitoring may be interpreted as a duty
22	of the livery base, rather than the vehicle owner.
23	While we assist our drivers with administrative
24	matters, from time to time, we must ensure that
25	these new matters do not shift responsibility and

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

cost onto our member bases.

1

2 Financial pressures could discourage new 3 drivers from entering the livery sector and drive existing drivers out, further reducing our already 4 5 limited service availability for the passengers we serve. We respectfully recommend the following, 6 7 prior to adopting the proposed rule: Clarify base responsibilities, ensure that any administrative 8 9 changes explicitly state that the bases are not 10 responsible for directly managing or monitoring 11 individual driver insurance compliance, support 12 for small businesses, provide resources, such as training or technology support, to help bases 13 14 assist drivers in adapting to the new requirements without incurring additional costs, engage 15 16 stakeholders, which is maintaining an open 17 dialogue for FHV bases and drivers to assess the 18 impact these changes and adjustments implements as 19 needed. 20 We are committed to working with the TLC to achieve its safety and compliance goals, while 21 2.2 balancing these priorities with the operational 23 realities of bases like ours.

24We can ensure a thriving equitable25transportation ecosystem for all New Yorkers.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

	48
1	Thank you for your consideration.
2	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
3	And our next speaker is Andrew Greenblatt.
4	MR. GREENBLATT: Hi, good morning. Good
5	morning, Commissioner Do and the Taxi and
6	Limousine Commission members. My name is Andrew
7	Greenblatt and I am the policy director of the
8	Independent Drivers Guild, known as the IDG.
9	Thank you for this opportunity to testify
10	regarding the proposed regulations relating to
11	insurance requirements for FHVs.
12	First, I'd like to apologize for the sparse
13	attendance today of IDG drivers. At this very
14	moment, hundreds of IDG drivers are participating
15	in a caravan that is calling for a fair pay
16	increase, an end to blackouts, and a solution to
17	this insurance crisis.
18	This meeting is just about the insurance
19	issues, so I will talk just about that. Today I
20	am going to comment on two of the proposals. The
21	first would require drivers to ensure that the
22	insurance they are required to have comes from,
23	quote, a solvent and responsible company. The
24	second will require that all coverage, quote, must
25	be provided by a single primary policy.

	19
1	First, the proposals require drivers to
2	determine if their insurance is solvent and
3	responsible or pay the fine would be nothing short
4	of regulatory malpractice. The State of New York
5	financial services Department of Financial
6	Services can not adequately determine this with
7	their team of accountants, actuaries, and lawyers,
8	all with subpoena power. It is unreasonable to
9	believe that any driver could effectively make
10	this determination, much less every driver.
11	Furthermore, the state has recently
12	disclosed that insolvent companies cover close to
13	70 percent of the existing market and if that were
14	forced to go away in one fell swoop, it would be
15	very disruptive to the existing market.
16	Second, the so, just to be clear on
17	this, we oppose this rule change completely and in
18	the strongest possible terms.
19	The second proposal would require drivers
20	to have a single insurance policy, rather than a
21	primary and secondary and our response to that is
22	more nuanced. The current regulations allow for
23	the \$50,000 and the excess \$150,000 to be from a
24	secondary carrier. What this allows today is for
25	the secondary carrier to skirt consumer

1	protections and contributions to the guarantee
2	fund.
3	We agree that all carriers should play by
4	the same rules, concerning consumer protections
5	and the guarantee fund, but we disagree that the
6	Commission that the Commission, the best way to
7	do this is to forbid any companies from creating
8	split coverage. Instead, we
9	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds
10	remaining.
11	MR. GREENBLATT: demand non-admitted
12	carriers can allow insurance companies and brokers
13	to continue experimenting with split coverage,
14	hoping to lower bills and to bring much new needed
15	much needed new companies into the market.
16	I would be happy to take any questions.
17	And I would really encourage Commissioner Bader to
18	re-ask me the same question as to what to do about
19	American Transit. My time is up.
20	COMMISSIONER DO: Andrew, on your first
21	point, I think I've made it clear that we are
22	going to make those changes to insure that there
23	is still competition and the appropriate carriers
24	in the market to fulfill and renew all policies
25	that are currently out there.

1 And then onto your second point, if you can 2 clarify, both the primary and secondary should be 3 an admitted product? MR. GREENBLATT: Yeah, so to be admitted, 4 5 there is all kinds of consumer protections that the state requires and also that they toss in the 6 7 three percent into the guarantee fund. I think that's right, like you shouldn't be able to charge 8 9 less because you are doing less. So as long as 10 they are meeting the same requirements, and they could get admitted, let that go ahead. 11 12 There is this loophole right now, I think 13 you are trying to close that loophole and say, 14 well, since the primary has to be admitted, by fusing the two together will make sure this 15 16 un-admitted secondary goes away, the problem isn't 17 that there is a secondary, the problem is that it's un-admitted. So solve that narrower problem. 18 19 Don't get rid of what could lead to 20 experimentation and more insurance companies 21 entering the market, which we so desperately need. 22 COMMISSIONER DO: Okay, we'll take a look 23 at both points. But I think on the solvent versus 24 insolvent question, we are definitely going to 25 make that change.

1 MR. GREENBLATT: Yeah, it just shouldn't be 2 on the backs of the drivers. They can't figure 3 this out. 4 COMMISSIONER DO: I agree with you, Andrew. 5 So, overall, if we make those changes, IDG 6 will be in support? 7 MR. GREENBLATT: We reserve the right to see what you come up with, but yeah, those are the 8 9 two things that are talking points. 10 COMMISSIONER DO: I appreciate it. 11 Commissioner Bader, do you want to ask your 12 question again? I don't think this is just 13 appropriate time to look at the broader. I think 14 we are very --15 MR. GREENBLATT: It is one shot. 16 COMMISSIONER DO: I don't want to bring 17 more into this conversation than just the narrow 18 aspect of what we are addressing here today. Is 19 that okay, Commissioner Bader? 20 COMMISSIONER BADER: Yes, that's fine. Т understand that. I mean, right, we have more to 21 22 qo on this. There will be more discussions on 23 this going forward and we will hear more from IDG 24 and the other interested parties going forward, 25 before we have to make the final decision,

53

1 certainly. 2 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you, Andrew. Ι 3 appreciate your time today. 4 MR. GREENBLATT: Thank you for the 5 opportunity. MS. ELUTO: Next speaker is Cira Angeles. 6 7 MS. ANGELES: Good morning. My name is Cira Angeles on behalf of Livery Base Owners 8 Association and CEO of L.A. Riverside Brokerage. 9 Our organization works closely with bases drivers, 10 helping them navigate complexities of maintaining 11 12 insurance coverage in an increasingly challenging 13 environment. 14 We fully support and commend the TLC for its ongoing efforts to protect drivers, 15 16 passengers, and businesses in the industry to the 17 proposed rules. The DFS, or Department of 18 Financial Services, through admitted carriers, has 19 helped sort of stabilize the TLC marketplace. 20 Admitted carriers become insolvent, if states 21 guarantee -- the states guarantee fund can step in 22 to pay claims, providing an essential safety net 23 for policy holders and claimants. On the other 24 hand, if a non-admitted carrier goes bankrupt, 25 policy holders have no such protection from the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 state quarantee fund. Currently, there 2 are several insolvent companies operating as 3 admitted carriers. If these companies were not admitted carriers, the crisis in the TLC insurance 4 market will be far worse. It will be 5 catastrophic, to say the least. 6 7 Non-admitted companies could simply exit the marketplace, leaving hard-working drivers 8 9 without coverage and facing the financial burden of unclaimed accident claims. Take, for example, 10 11 American Transit, recently in the news with 12 decades of insolvency. But despite the situation, they have been supported by the State Insurance 13 14 Fund, showcasing the value of the regulatory 15 protection team. This highlights why the TLC 16 proposed rules is a practical and necessary 17 measure. 18 Non-admitted companies lack the security 19 and oversight needed to protect drivers, bases, 20 and passengers. It is critical not to be misled 21 by claims. The hybrid insurance structures offer 2.2 equal protection because they do not. If a 23 company with such structure leaves the market, 24 drivers are left without the support of the state 25 guarantee fund.

I

1	Drivers often face challenges understanding
2	the complexities of these insurance policies and
3	this makes them vulnerable to predatory
4	non-admitted companies that prioritize market
5	share and profit over claims and supporting policy
6	holders.
7	In today's challenged insurance market,
8	such a mandate can leave nearly all drivers out of
9	compliance. Attractive systematic issues within
10	the oversight of the insurance industry in
11	fostering the collaborative environment is the way
12	forward. That is why the
13	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds
14	remaining.
15	MS. ANGELES: is working closely with the
16	DFS, Commissioner Do, and the industry to bring
17	solutions and ensure no compromises are made and
18	prevent companies from entering a highly regulated
19	industry without proper oversight.
20	Once again, we commend and congratulate the
21	TLC for introducing this common sense rule. We
22	remain committed to measures that are pro driver
23	and prioritize consumer protections. Thank you.
24	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
25	Our next speaker is Scott Wollney. Mr.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 Wollney, un-mute your mic. MR. WOLLNEY: I'm sorry. Can you hear me 2 3 now? 4 MS. ELUTO: Yes. 5 Thank you very much for the MR. WOLLNEY: 6 opportunity to testify. My name is Scott Wollney. 7 I was the president and CEO of a group of insurance carriers who, for many years, provided 8 9 commercial auto insurance for, approximately, 15 10 percent of TLC plated vehicles in New York City. 11 We are currently not operating in the New York 12 market. 13 I express my appreciation for the actions 14 taken by the TLC to prevent a potential crisis that threatens to displace tens of thousands of 15 16 drivers from their jobs and creating increased 17 wait times for passengers who rely on their 18 services. 19 We believe there is an opportunity to 20 reenter the New York City market with a meaningful 21 amount of new capacity to support future business, 22 provided that the changes under consideration 23 result in an environment that enables healthy and 24 fair competition among responsible insurance 25 carriers and providers with collaboration between

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 the various public and private constituents in 2 this important industry. 3 Consistent application of reasonable and 4 appropriate rules is essential. This will provide 5 drivers and operators with access to coverage that 6 legitimately protects them, along with passengers 7 and the public. Providing clarity regarding insurance requirements in the near term will 8 9 enable interested parties to organize the capacity 10 necessary. 11 It will take time and I encourage the 12 Commission to include a reasonable phase-in period 13 before any changes take effect. Comprehensive solutions are needed, including these key points 14 15 which are further detailed in my written comments. 16 Implementing telematics and the onboard video 17 surveillance will foster safety and reduce claim 18 expenses. Delivering comprehensive data and 19 safety profiles to the industry in a timely manner 20 will improve driver training and link insurance costs to actual risks. Reforming No-Fault 21 22 thresholds will align insurance requirements with 23 actual risk levels and ensure a fairer insurance 24 system for all parties involved. And undertaking 25 a comprehensive study to examine the root causes

1 contributing to the current industry challenges 2 will identify the best long-term solutions. 3 The current proposed rule-making references solvency and responsibility. In order to attract 4 5 the passing from solvent and responsible carriers, helping to control underlying expenses relating to 6 7 factors such as potential fraud and inflated claim 8 costs is important. 9 Carriers will need to be able to provide 10 coverage at an appropriate price to support the risks they are covering, which will also require 11 12 support from the New York Department of Financial 13 Services. Any near term approach that limits 14 competition results in a coverage vacuum will 15 immediately impact tens of thousands of individual 16 drivers in the five boroughs. Insurance prices 17 will necessarily go up, but the impact can be 18 mitigated. 19 Any proposed regulations must be 20 implemented in a manner that allows for a sufficient period for DFS to take appropriate 21 2.2 action --23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds 24 remaining. 25 MR. WOLLNEY: -- and for the industry to

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

-	
1	work together to solve the problem.
2	I am currently operating and managing a
3	general agency that is actively writing public
4	automobile insurance in approximately 20 states,
5	but not New York, based on historic challenges.
6	We are extremely interested in deploying our
7	experience in infrastructure to assist, however,
8	time will be necessary to fully resolve this
9	crisis.
10	An aligned and collaborative approach among
11	the industry and regulators will help shorten this
12	timeline and protect drivers and operators in this
13	important industry.
14	Thank you for your time today. I'd be
15	happy to participate in future discussions
16	regarding potential solutions.
17	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
18	Our next speaker is Kamal Ahmed.
19	MR. AHMED: Good morning, everyone. This
20	is Kamal Ahmed. I represent my Bangladeshi
21	drivers community that accounts for almost 20
22	percent of entire 200,000 TLC drivers. Today I
23	will speak on the amendment requirements. It
24	presents FHV drivers of supporting limited
25	problems. More expenses, less opportunity. I

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

I

1	never hear any initiative that really benefits the
2	drivers. The drivers who does extra amount of
3	work for the sake of their family and end up, as
4	we call, bad drivers. We can not call them bad
5	drivers because of their circumstances.
б	Drivers are the worst victim of rampant
7	insurance fraud. For example, American Transit
8	Insurance Company, that has 60 percent market
9	sharing in the industry. This company plans to
10	fire around three hundred million fewer dollar as
11	a fraud claim this year. So this company produces
12	25,000 American bills every month. We are aware a
13	lot of medical billing fraud.
14	So my question is, who is paying the bills,
15	the fraud, the claim, is it the driver or the
16	insurance company?
17	Ultimately the drivers are the ones
18	suffering as a result of the laws. And amid the
19	situation, DFS, they suggest to increase the rest
20	of insurance, but that doesn't help. It is going
21	to be heating up again. So insurance risk will
22	trigger more fraud billing or medical billing.
23	My question is, is there any amendment are
24	going to be enacted to curtail the fraud in this
25	FHV industry? And also, in my community, the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	Bangladeshi drivers community will see any
2	regulatory measures that will help increase the
3	livelihood of the drivers.
4	And thank you so much for giving me this
5	opportunity.
б	MS. ELUTO: Thank you.
7	Our next speaker up is Avik Kabessa.
8	MR. KABESSA: Good morning, Commissioners.
9	My name is Avik Kabessa. I'm the CEO of Carmel,
10	board member od the Livery Roundtable, and the
11	Chairman of the New York State Livery Workers'
12	Compensation Fund.
13	The Livery Roundtable represents 200 livery
14	bases and we strongly support the proposed rule on
15	insurance. Admitted carriers are pro claims
16	are protected by the state through the guarantee
17	fund, in case they go out of business.
18	Non-admitted carriers claims are not. So in this
19	case, consumers are left with no safety net and
20	will go after the driver for payment.
21	To add an insult to an injury, only the
22	admitted carriers are paying into the guarantee
23	fund. Non-admitted do not. Admitted carriers are
24	regulated to act in the best interest of the
25	public, non-admitted are not.

	02
1	Let's face it. We all like to pay less for
2	insurance. Non-admitted carriers oppose the
3	proposed rule, looking to bypass regulation,
4	contribution to the guarantee fund, and offer
5	cheap rates. To the non-admitted carriers who
б	spoke today, first, I want to correct you and tell
7	you that I was personally present in many events
8	where Commissioner Do has done intensive due
9	diligence on the issue.
10	And with it, I have only one question to
11	them. If you are such an A-rated carrier and so
12	superior to the current admitted carriers, why not
13	become an admitted carrier and show them how it's
14	done?
15	Some drivers may also oppose the proposed
16	rules so they can buy cheap insurance. Who
17	wouldn't? But with no regulation, no
18	accountability, and no one to secure claims when,
19	God forbid, an accident happens, cheap becomes
20	very, very expensive.
21	The one thing we will ask the Commissioner
22	to remove is the solvency condition. Solvency is
23	the fluid situation. DFS has the power to force
24	an admitted carrier to take action to prevent
25	and/or reverse insolvency. So admitted carrier

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 may move in and out of solvency. 2 If we adopt the solvency condition, it will 3 run chaos on drivers stepping in and out of compliance with this TLC requirement. 4 The DFS 5 ability to deal with insolvency or risk of insolvency of an admitted carrier but not with a 6 7 non-admitted carrier further strengthens the fact that non-admitted carrier should not be allowed. 8 9 From what I understand, Commissioner Do, 10 you are amenable to remove it, that requirement, so thank you for that. Therefore, we strongly urge 11 12 the Commissioner to vote in favor --13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds 14 remaining. 15 MR. KABESSA: -- of the proposal, as I 16 said, omitting the solvency requirement. 17 Thank you very much and I am here to answer 18 any question. 19 MS. ELUTO: Thank you. 20 Our next and final speaker is Mike Rose. MR. ROSE: Good morning, Commissioners. 21 My 2.2 name is Michael Rose. I am the President of 23 Chauffeur Transportation Association of New 24 Jersey, formerly the Limousine Association of New 25 Jersey. Thank you for the opportunity to testify

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 today. The members of the Chauffeur Transportation 2 3 Association of New Jersey provide prearranged chauffeured driven transportation to corporations 4 5 and private clients throughout the region, especially New York City. Members must be fully 6 7 licensed and insured and adhere to all applicable 8 safety laws for our services. 9 We play by the rules, but the proposed rules at issue will create unnecessary financial 10 burden to our members licensed by the New York 11 City Taxi and Limousine Commission. The TLC has 12 13 proposed amendments to its vehicle insurance 14 requirements that could significantly impact the 15 for-hire licensees, particularly those drivers who 16 reside in New Jersey and are members with TLC 17 bases. The proposed rules stipulate critical 18 19 conditions regarding the names on the insurance 20 policies and the vehicle registrations, 21 potentially creating complications for many 2.2 operators. One of the core proposed changes, 23 35RCNNY59A/12C7 mandates that the name of the 24 policyholder on the insurance must match exactly 25 with the name of the vehicle registered. This

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

	03
1	presents a considerable challenge for FHV
2	licensees in New Jersey, and other states, since
3	the regulations in these states differ from those
4	in New York, concerning leased vehicles.
5	The effect of this rule is to prevent New
6	Jersey-based TLC drivers from leasing their
7	vehicles. This creates an incredible financial
8	burden on these drivers who currently lease their
9	New Jersey-registered vehicles. For a driver, the
10	cost to buyout a lease can exceed \$30,000 for a
11	sedan or SUV. For a TLC base, that could cost
12	easily more than a million dollars to buy up those
13	leases. But that is what this rule would require.
14	If American Transit Insurance closes its
15	doors, the expected higher insurance cost will be
16	a double hit to these drivers and our member bases
17	by the New York City TLC. New York allows a
18	leased vehicle to be registered in the lessee's
19	name. However, New Jersey Law 3934 necessitates
20	that the lessor of a leased vehicle be the
21	individual or company listed on the vehicle
22	registration. As a result, FHV licensees who
23	reside in New Jersey, and other states with
24	similar leased vehicle registration requirements,
25	would be precluded from leasing vehicles. Only

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 FHV licensees residing in New York could lease 2 vehicles. 3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 30 seconds 4 remaining. 5 MR. ROSE: This proposed rule change contradicts the definition of owner in a New York 6 7 City administrative code. According to New York City administrative code 19-502, an owner includes 8 9 a lessee of any such vehicle or vehicles under a 10 written lease. Currently, many FHV companies and 11 individual drivers who reside in New Jersey lease 12 vehicles and the registration for those vehicles 13 does not reflect their name or the name of the 14 company that holds the FHV license. 15 Until now, the FHV has allowed the city's 16 regulations and recognize a lessee as the owner of 17 the vehicle for FHV licensing purposes. If this rule change is implemented, residents of New 18 19 Jersey and Connecticut with FHV licenses, who 20 lease vehicles, will have to make the difficult choice either to purchase or finance vehicle 21 22 outright to comply with the new regulations or 23 surrender their licenses. This could lead to 24 significant financial strain for many 25 driver/owners and fleets, possibly pushing current

1	operators out of the market, without any clear
2	regulatory benefit to the TLC.
3	The backdrop of these changes, with the
4	ongoing insurance crisis
5	COMMISSIONER DO: That's
6	MR. ROSE: for our for-hire industry,
7	prevents our operators from continuing to serve
8	the riding public.
9	Thank you for your time.
10	COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you, Mike. And
11	we'll look into your written comments as well.
12	MR. ROSE: Thank you.
13	COMMISSIONER DO: We don't want unintended
14	consequences to a rule proposal, so we will take a
15	look at it with our team, to make sure that some
16	of the points that you've raised are looked at.
17	MR. ROSE: Thank you, Commissioner. Those
18	written comments were submitted, so thank you very
19	much for your consideration.
20	MS. ELUTO: Since this was our last
21	speaker, Commissioner Do, do you wish to close out
22	the hearing?
23	COMMISSIONER DO: Well, thank you everyone
24	for your comments. We are going to take a look at
25	all of them and propose the final version of these

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

68

	000
1	rules that make some of the changes that we heard
2	today and we will move forward. But thank you so
3	much for all of the Commissioners, for also being
4	here today, and for their input as well.
5	Before I close, I think Commissioner Bader
6	has a comment.
7	COMMISSIONER BADER: I do. It's really a
8	question. It's really a question, because a
9	couple of people testified without identifying
10	themselves, so maybe we could Scott Wollney
11	said he used to handle insurance and provide
12	insurance policies. What company is he with; do
13	we know?
14	COMMISSIONER DO: Sherryl, do you still
15	have the list up?
16	MS. ELUTO: She disappeared, I'm sorry, but
17	we can find that out for you.
18	COMMISSIONER BADER: Okay. And the same
19	thing for Jeremy Moskowitz. They did not identify
20	themselves as to what organization or entity they
21	represented, so
22	MS. ELUTO: That one is for
23	COMMISSIONER BADER: They should also be
24	known to identify themselves before they start
25	speaking, so that we know who they represent.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

-	
1	That would be certainly helpful.
2	COMMISSIONER DO: We can do that.
3	And so Jeremy Moskowitz, I have been
4	speaking with on this issue at length and they own
5	Voyager Rentals and Leasing.
б	COMMISSIONER BADER: Okay, thank you.
7	COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you, Commissioner.
8	If there is nothing else, thank you all for
9	participating. The time is now 11:22 and I will
10	close this public hearing. Thank you, everybody.
11	(TIME NOTED: 11:22 a.m.)
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1 2 CERTIFICATE 3 4 5 STATE OF NEW YORK) ss: COUNTY OF NASSAU) 6 7 8 I, Michele Simone, a shorthand reporter within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify 9 10 that the within is a true and accurate transcript of the 11 statement taken on 12/11/2024. 12 I further certify that I am not related 13 to any of the parties to this action by blood or by 14 marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the 15 outcome of this matter. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set 16 17 my hand this 31st day of December 2024. 18 19 20 Michele Simone 21 22 23 24 25

\$10000 33:24	accessaride 14:4	actuaries 44:11,23 49:7
\$150000 49:23	accessibility 9:8 13:4,20,22	ada 28:19
\$30000 65:10	20:12 27:5,9 31:22 (8) accessible 8:6 12:18 13:5,15,19 14:2,6,7,23 17:6,25 28:4,7,16,22 31:6,9,17 32:7 (19)	adapting 30:5 47:14
\$50000 49:23		add 61:21
& 2		added 6:24
10minute 10:6,8,19	accident 54:10 62:19	addition 44:25
15minute 9:24,25	accommodate 19:21	additional 3:17 41:16 46:9 47:15 (4)
30second 11:20	according 66:7	
31st 11:25 70:17	accordingly 38:22	additionally 7:9
35rcnny59a12c7 64:23	account 3:11 19:18 33:10	address 35:13
40plus 35:23	accountability 62:18	addressing 52:18
42nd 15:20	accountants 49:7	adequate 41:8,16 46:1
		adequately 6:14 41:24 49:6
6th 5:2	accounts 3:5 59:21	adhere 64:7
80s 10:12	accurate 70:10	adjusting 5:19
abandoning 13:15	achieve 30:4 47:21	adjustments 47:18
ability 17:9 18:11 20:2 63:5	achieving 31:24	, and the second s
(4)	across 33:12 36:15	administrative 46:9,23 47:8 66:7,8 (5)
able 10:7,10 15:2 20:17 28:23 41:24 42:1 51:8 58:9 (9)	act 61:24	admitted 6:16 36:9
about 3:2 10:17 14:23 15:12,12 19:4 23:9 25:2,21 26:14 27:9,10 28:18 29:16	action 14:20 58:22 62:24 70:13 (4)	37:11,11,12,16,23,24 38:2,10 43:24 44:1,3,9 51:3,4,11,14 53:18,20 54:3,4 61:15,22,23 62:12,13,24,25 63:6 (30)
31:13 33:12 39:11 48:18,19 50:18 (20)	actions 56:13	adopt 18:10 63:2
	activate 3:11	-
abroad 43:3	actively 59:3	adopting 47:7
absurd 35:17	actors 5:11	advance 3:6
accept 46:16	actual 16:3 57:21,23	advantage 14:7
accepts 33:23		advertising 6:1
access 17:6,16 18:12 31:21 57:5 (5)	actually 10:10 16:5 23:12 27:18 (4)	advocacy 31:2
	actuarially 41:17	advocated 12:18

		,
affects 20:15 25:23	allows 24:13 43:2 49:24 58:20 65:17 (5)	amongst 5:10
affiliated 46:4		amount 30:2 56:21 60:2
affiliation 3:14	almost 9:4 13:7 15:7 16:17 22:2 40:21 59:21 (7)	amplify 19:17
afford 38:25	along 5:25 24:7 57:6	amputee 27:16
affordable 21:3	already 5:9 8:20 19:11 22:4	analysis 8:14
afforded 38:7	29:14,17,20,23 38:12 45:4 46:10 47:4 (12)	analyst 8:4,11
after 15:5,16 61:20	alreadyexisting 37:5	analytics 8:12
again 24:7,8 29:20 43:13 52:12 55:20 60:21 (7)	also 6:18 7:25 13:2,14 16:3,9 20:15 27:10,12 28:18 37:10	analyzing 19:24
against 30:14 37:19	51:6 58:11 60:25 62:15 68:3,23 (17)	andor 62:25
against 30.14 37.19 agency 44:16 59:3	altamirano 2:6	andrew 2:14 48:3,6 50:20 52:4 53:2 (6)
agency's 33:14	18:15,16,18,19 21:11,25 23:11 45:16,17,18 (11)	angeles 2:15 53:6,7,8 55:15 (5)
aging 28:21	although 17:21	
ago 13:7 20:15 24:25 31:12	altogether 34:25	anna 2:5 16:22,25 28:17 (4)
(4)	always 13:23 15:7 17:21 32:6	annual 6:2 9:21 38:3
agree 14:22 23:11 36:21 37:5 40:24 41:7 50:3 52:4 (8)	42:12 (5)	another 31:14
ahead 51:11	am 8 4:7,12 8:11 14:16,19 17:1,4 18:20 19:3 21:12 36:7	answer 21:13 30:22 63:17
ahmed 2:17 59:18,19,20 (4)	39:1,10 48:7,20 59:2 63:17,22 69:11 70:12,14 (22)	answering 29:11
alderman 24:24	amazing 22:17 30:11	anyone 23:22
align 57:22	amenable 63:10	apologize 48:12
aligned 59:10	amend 6:11	app 15:1,2,13,19 16:4,7,9 25:24 26:1 (9)
aligns 6:18	amendment 59:23 60:23	applaud 28:8
allotted 11:18	amendments 7:9,14 17:5	applicable 64:7
allow 7:16 29:24 34:14 35:21	64:13 (4)	application 57:3
40:7 49:22 50:12 (7)	american 7:16 18:25 50:19 54:11 60:7,12 65:14 (7)	applied 26:13
allowed 26:2 34:2 35:23 45:5 63:8 66:15 (6)	amid 60:18	apply 5:8 7:14
allowing 21:6 35:1,13 38:8 46:5 (5)	among 56:24 59:10	appreciate 7:19 13:1 21:18 24:18 28:23 39:1 42:11 52:10

53:3 (9)	around 9:3 22:24 29:8 32:11	39:1 (5)
appreciated 4:25	60:10 (5) arrival 16:3	avik 2:9 28:25 29:4 61:7,9 (5)
appreciation 56:13	arriving 9:2	avoiding 21:3
approach 7:20 21:1 58:13 59:10 (4)	articulate 45:10	aware 22:20 40:3,20 60:12 (4)
approaching 10:23	ask 11:14 21:15 30:15 43:23 52:11 62:21 (6)	away 23:14 49:14 51:16
appropriate 39:19 41:9 46:18 50:23 52:13 57:4 58:10,21 (8)	asked 3:6 27:7	b 10
approval 37:18	asking 22:18	back 10:19 11:8 15:18,25 33:6 43:11 (6)
approved 30:2 37:17	aspect 52:18	backdrop 67:3
approximately 36:13 56:9 59:4	assess 47:17	backed 44:17
apps 25:19 26:2,6	assessment 6:2 38:4	backs 52:2
arated 62:11	assets 44:19,25	backsliding 9:8
arating 44:15	assist 46:23 47:14 59:7	bad 5:11 33:4 60:4,4 (4)
are 3:7,9,25 4:19,25 5:7,9,11 6:14,22 8:5,19 9:14,22 11:1,12 12:6,16 13:12 15:14,20 16:2,5 18:8,22 19:1,23 21:23	association 18:21 30:17 45:19 53:9 63:23,24 64:3 (7) atic 43:12 44:1 45:2,9 (4)	bader 19 4:13 21:15,17 22:20 24:11,18 39:3 40:1,11,20 41:21 42:6 43:17 50:17 52:11,19,20 68:5,7,18,23 69:6 (23)
22:5,12,19,21,23 23:6,16,20 24:2,8,11,15 25:6,19 26:25 27:6,16,17,19 28:15 29:14,16,18,19 30:8,19,19	attendance 48:13 attention 4:3	bail 33:16 baked 41:8
31:4,13,16 32:1,19 33:2,4,10 34:6,19,25 37:12,14,16,23 38:6,17 39:7,10,24 40:3,20	attract 35:19 58:4 attractive 55:9	balance 20:24 33:20
41:3,23 43:14,16 46:2,10,14,16 47:9,20 48:14,22 50:21,25	audio 3:9,19	balancing 47:22
51:9,10,13,24 52:8,9,14,18 54:2,24 55:17,22 56:11 57:14,15 58:11 59:6	authorized 6:22 37:9	bangladeshi 59:20 61:1 bankrupt 53:24
60:6,12,17,23 61:15,16,18,19,22,23,25 62:11	auto 56:9	bankruptcies 33:15
63:10 64:16 67:16,24 (124) area 42:1	automatically 3:10 automobile 59:4	barrio's 45:20
areas 35:13	availability 17:23 19:20 20:10 47:5 (4)	base 18:20 19:19 30:16 45:19,21 46:22 47:7 53:8 65:11 (9)
aren't 27:22	available 4:2 15:13,20 17:8	based 32:3 36:12 39:9 40:15

		1
59:5 (5)	better 6:12 8:25 22:4 24:5 31:10 (5)	brooklyn 12:15 15:15,18 31:3 (4)
bases 18:22,22 19:9,14,24 20:25 21:1 30:7,8 46:10,15 47:1,9,13,17,23 53:10 54:19	between 20:24 26:3 27:14 41:11 56:25 (5)	buckles 27:19,22
61:14 64:17 65:16 (21)	beyond 19:18	burden 46:10 54:9 64:11 65:8 (4)
basis 20:18	bigger 35:3,4	bus 5:7 9:9 20:19
bcid 12:16	bike 20:19	business 4:24 6:10,22 38:9
because 13:19 16:4 22:10 23:18 25:7,19,22 26:11,12,16 27:15 34:1 51:9 54:22 60:5	billing 60:13,22,22	56:21 61:17 (6) businesses 18:23 20:9 22:10
68:8 (16)	billion 33:21	24:3 47:12 53:16 (6)
become 53:20 62:13	billions 44:18	buy 62:16 65:12
becomes 7:1 13:5 62:19	bills 50:14 60:12,14	buyout 65:10
before 4:16 5:23 12:4 29:9 52:25 57:13 68:5,24 (8)	bit 8:14 9:10 10:12	bye 16:21
begin 3:2 11:17 12:5,9 29:2	blackouts 48:16	bypass 62:3
(5)	bleeding 41:15	c 70:2,2
behalf 36:7 53:8	blood 70:13	cab 14:5 34:14
behind 4:21 13:12	board 14 29:5 61:10	cabs 25:1 26:16
being 3:2,3 4:18 8:20 15:2 22:2,3 23:21 26:13,15 27:16	boroughs 58:16	california 36:1
28:23 29:23 31:21 32:6 37:10,11 38:2 40:16,19	both 10:7 23:4 34:7 39:5 51:2,23 (6)	call 7:6 11:16 12:7 15:2 27:11 44:4,5 60:4,4 (9)
43:24,25 68:3 (23) believe 49:9 56:19	bratshpis 2:11 32:22,24,24 35:12 (5)	called 3:11
below 10:12	breaking 30:11	calling 48:15
	6	came 8:21
benchmarks 17:10	bring 34:13 50:14 52:16 55:16 (4)	camera 3:12
beneficially 41:1	brings 4:18 9:5	campaign 12:17 13:7,17
benefit 67:2	broader 20:7 36:20 52:13	14:22 (4)
benefits 38:7 60:1		can 9:17,24 11:17 12:9 14:16
best 30:19 44:16 45:6 50:6 58:2 61:24 (6)	broadway 34:12 brokerage 53:9	15:15,24,25 16:2 18:1,16 21:2,15 26:3,16 27:20 29:1,9,23 30:22 32:6 37:25
bestrated 34:13 35:5	brokers 36:14 50:12	40:24 43:5 46:5 47:24 49:6 50:12 51:1 53:21 55:8 56:2 58:17 60:4 62:16 65:10 68:17

	December II, 2024	,,,
69:2 (38)	ceo 29:5 53:9 56:7 61:9 (4)	cheap 62:5,16,19
can't 15:1,22 25:5 43:23 45:10 52:2 (6)	certainly 24:15 53:1 69:1	choice 66:21
capacity 56:21 57:9	certificate 7:8	cira 2:15 53:6,8
capital 35:16	certify 70:9,12	circumstances 60:5
captioning 4:2	cetera 43:5	cities 29:8
car 25:6 43:6 45:20	chair 12 4:4	citizen 35:2
caravan 48:15	chairman 29:6 31:12 36:5 61:11 (4)	citizens 33:16 35:17
carmel 29:5,8 61:9	challenge 19:16 65:1	city 1 6:17 11:24 13:25 18:13 20:5,14,16 25:5 27:7,8 28:5,15
carolyn 8:4,7,10	challenged 55:7	29:10,10,13,15 32:5,12 33:1,7 34:9,9 35:3,6,14 36:11,21 41:11,15 42:5 43:14 45:12
carrier 7:4 34:24 35:7 37:11,12 38:3 41:24 49:24,25 53:24 62:11,13,24,25 63:6,7,8	challenges 5:16 18:8 19:17 46:11 55:1 58:1 59:5 (7)	41.11,13 42.3 43.14 43.12 56:10,20 64:6,12 65:17 66:7,8 (40)
(17)	challenging 53:12	city's 20:12,14,18 66:15 (4)
carriers 7:15 33:22 34:2,5,15,21 35:1,14,20	chan 20 4:13	claim 37:25 57:17 58:7 60:11,15 (5)
37:12,14,16,23 38:5,8 41:18 50:3,12,23 53:18,20 54:3,4 56:8,25 58:5,9 61:15,18,22,23 62:2,5,12 (34)	chances 4:21 change 13:4 19:18 40:7 49:17 51:25 66:5,18 (7)	claimants 38:6 53:23 claims 7:3,5,13 33:25 37:21
cars 25:1,24 26:1,15 (4)	changed 40:16	53:22 54:10,21 55:5 61:15,18 62:18 (12)
case 8:25 61:17,19	changes 7:3,6 19:4 28:15 42:18 46:8 47:9,18 50:22 52:5	clarification 37:4
catastrophe 34:16	42.18 40.8 47.9,18 50.22 52.5 56:22 57:13 64:22 67:3 68:1 (15)	clarify 7:9 38:23 47:7 51:2 (4)
catastrophic 54:6	changing 15:4,9	clarifying 37:6
cathy 12:22	chaos 63:3	clarity 57:7
caught 10:1	chaotic 42:20	clear 45:7 49:16 50:21 67:1 (4)
cause 29:24 30:20 33:15	charge 51:8	clients 64:5
causes 57:25	charges 37:20	close 17:20 21:22 29:11 49:12
causing 20:20	chart 9:16 10:13	51:13 67:21 68:5 69:10 (8)
center 12:15 17:2 27:11 31:3 (4)	chauffeur 63:23 64:2	closed 4:2
central 8:15	chauffeured 64:4	closely 53:10 55:15

	December II, 2024	
closes 65:14	commissioners 14 4:13 11:1,13 12:3 18:19 29:4 45:18	comply 39:25 66:22
code 66:7,8	61:8 63:21 68:3 (11)	complying 30:1
codify 12:24 31:15	committed 39:18 47:20 55:22	comprehensive 7:7 37:6 57:13,18,25 (5)
codifying 21:24	common 38:20 55:21	
collaboration 41:11 56:25	communities 18:24 20:2 21:4	compromise 13:6
collaborative 7:20 55:11 59:10	community 17:1 18:9 23:4,8 26:23 59:21 60:25 61:1 (8)	compromises 55:17 concern 19:3 24:10 46:19
colleagues 12:22	companies 6:21 8:23 9:7 10:7	concerned 32:1
collins 12:22	31:10 34:17 38:18 39:17,20,21 41:5 49:12 50:7,12,15 51:20 54:2,3,7,18 55:4,18 66:10 (23)	concerning 50:4 65:4
come 15:10 16:8 27:8 41:22 52:8 (5)	company 7:1 36:8,9,12,16	concerns 27:10
comes 29:10,15 34:20 48:22	37:25 40:22 41:4 48:23 54:23 60:8,9,11,16 65:21 66:14	conclude 11:21
(4)	68:12 (17)	concludes 10:24
coming 5:25	compare 45:2	condition 62:22 63:2
commend 53:14 55:20	compelled 45:12	conditions 64:19
comment 11:25 40:17 48:20 68:6 (4)	compensated 6:15	conducted 3:3
	compensation 29:7 61:12	confirm 3:25
comments 3:17 12:2 25:15 57:15 67:11,18,24 (7)	competition 45:1 50:23 56:24 58:14 (4)	congested 20:21
commercial 56:9	competitive 36:25 41:19	congestion 19:20 25:9
commission 2 3:18 12:4 20:3,6 21:13 24:12,22 34:1,24 36:6	-	congratulate 55:20
46:8 48:6 50:6,6 57:12 64:12 (17)	competitors 26:9 complete 3:19 13:21	connected 24:15
commission's 42:14	completed 9:6,20	connecticut 66:19
	•	connecting 18:24
commissioner 12,15,16,17,18,19,20 4:4,12	completely 23:17 44:3,10 49:17 (4)	consequences 30:21 67:14
8:1,8 11:1,12 21:15,17,25 22:20 23:12,17 24:11,17,18 29:16 39:3 40:1,11,20 41:21	complexities 53:11 55:2	consider 20:6 29:24
42:6,10 43:17 44:8 48:5 50:17,20 51:22	compliance 19:5,10 20:8 28:19 37:13 46:21 47:11,21	considerable 65:1
50:17,20 51:22 52:4,10,11,16,19,20 53:2 55:16 62:8,21 63:9,12	55:9 63:4 (10)	consideration 48:1 56:22 67:19
67:5,10,13,17,21,23 68:5,7,14,18,23 69:2,6,7,7 (63)	complications 64:21	considered 42:4 45:21

In Re Public Hearing NYC - Taxi & Limousine Commission December 11, 2024

	December 11, 2024	77
consistency 15:23	correct 40:13,23 62:6	criteria 39:9
consistent 57:3	corrected 39:23	critical 18:23 42:24 46:12 54:20 64:18 (5)
constituents 57:1	correlated 30:3	cross 16:10 27:24
consultation 5:22 42:19	cost 22:14,14,15 30:7 47:1 65:10,11,15 (8)	crossings 28:1
consultations 5:22		C
consumer 37:19 49:25 50:4 51:5 55:23 (5)	costs 19:9 43:4 47:15 57:21 58:8 (5)	current 8:13,17 10:8 13:15 19:10 21:5,20 30:1 42:15 49:22 58:1,3 62:12 66:25 (14)
consumers 61:19	could 13:19 15:17 28:6 38:25 42:3 47:2 49:9 51:11,19 54:7 64:14 65:11 66:1,23 68:10 (15)	currently 19:7 21:24 29:13 33:19 46:2 50:25 54:1 56:11
contact 14:25	council 20:16 45:12	59:2 65:8 66:10 (11)
continue 7:16 18:3 21:2 24:4,6 26:11 32:10 34:4 35:1	county 70:6	curtail 60:24
40:8 50:13 (11)	·	customer 19:7
continues 45:7	couple 68:9 course 6:2 40:21	cut 27:10
continuing 7:21 35:20 67:7	cover 49:12	cyclists 6:13
continuous 19:16		dan 2:11 32:22,24
contractors 46:14	coverage 6:11 7:6,10,13,15 35:24 36:1,18 37:8 46:1,18 48:24 50:8,13 53:12 54:9 57:5	danger 27:25
contradicts 66:6	58:10,14 (19)	dark 10:15
contributed 25:9	coverages 6:22	data 5:21 6:4 8:3,11,11 11:9 21:19 29:17 31:24 57:18 (10)
contributing 58:1	covered 7:3 38:17,19	david 11 4:5,12
contribution 62:4	covering 58:11	day 13:7 14:6 33:23 70:17 (4)
contributions 50:1	crash 5:5 6:15	•
control 3:12 19:19 58:6	create 36:24 38:11 45:12 64:10 (4)	deal 40:25 63:5 dealing 22:21,23
conversation 45:8,13 52:17		
coordination 19:13	created 40:5	dealt 41:6
copies 12:1	creates 65:7	debate 35:18
core 12:17 35:13 64:22	creating 27:4 38:24 50:7 56:16 64:21 (5)	debating 34:20
corner 44:24	credit 39:9 43:9	decades 54:12
corporations 64:4	crisis 39:15 42:15 43:14 46:3	december 70:17
	48:17 54:4 56:14 59:9 67:4 (9)	deceptive 37:20

decided 24:25	differ 65:3	19:5,11 30:2 (8)
decision 52:25	different 10:14 33:12	dispatched 8:16
definitely 22:7 23:15 24:4 28:19 42:4 51:24 (6)	difficult 27:20 66:20	dispatchers 17:18 18:2 28:9 31:8 (4)
definition 66:6	difficulty 13:23 22:24 23:7 dignity 18:7	displace 56:15
deliberative 5:21	diligence 62:9	display 3:22
delivering 57:18	dire 30:9	disproportionate 19:8
demand 19:24 27:23 50:11	direct 43:18	disproportionately 32:3
demands 19:11	directly 30:3 47:10	disruption 36:23 41:14
department 7:19 26:25 34:8,10 35:12 37:9 49:5 53:17	director 12:15 31:2 48:7	disruptive 42:4 49:15
58:12 (9)	dis 19:8	diversity 20:12
depend 31:20	disabilities 18:5 27:18,25	divisions 8:11
deploying 59:6	32:5,10,14 (6)	dmv 5:2 6:20
deregulation 38:22	disability 18:9 26:25	document 33:2
deserts 31:23	disabled 12:16 14:10,20 17:3 26:4,7 28:20,21 31:4 (9)	does 19:18 36:1 46:9 60:2 66:13 (5)
deserve 18:6,6	disadvantageous 26:10	doesn't 15:1 60:20
desperately 51:21	disagree 50:5	doing 5:24 21:23 22:4,17,19
despite 54:12	disappeared 68:16	23:16,20 24:1,8 26:8 29:17,18,19 39:18 40:24 51:9
detailed 33:2 46:20 57:15	disciplined 36:16	(16)
determination 49:10	disclosed 49:12	dollar 35:16 60:10
determine 49:2,6	discourage 5:18 47:2	dollars 33:21,21 44:19,24 65:12 (5)
determined 41:17	discrepancy 17:15	domicile 36:9
develop 13:9 28:4,6	discretion 46:16	done 62:8,14
dfs 6:20 7:18 35:9 37:18 39:14,16,19 44:1,6,12 53:17	discriminate 26:2	doors 65:15
55:16 58:21 60:19 62:23 63:4 (16)	discrimination 26:5	doster 26:20
dialogue 40:15 47:17	discussions 52:22 59:15	double 27:16 65:16
didn't 40:17	dispatch 13:15,19 14:6,7,24	downward 26:11

drafted 19:8	24:10 39:12 (5)	enacted 60:24
drastically 17:12	ecosystem 20:13 47:25	encourage 6:7 9:7 28:3 41:18 50:17 57:11 (6)
drive 5:10 47:3	edith 13:16,18,19 14:1,3 23:12 (6)	end 5:24 48:16 60:3
driven 64:4		ends 11:25
driver 6:2,3,5 16:17 19:12,20	effect 5:3 22:1 57:13 65:5 (4)	
27:12 43:5 47:11 49:9,10 55:22 57:20 60:15 61:20 65:9	effective 14:10	enforced 11:20
(16)	effectively 35:6 49:9	enforcement 41:10
driverowners 66:25	efforts 19:6 31:5 53:15	engage 28:3 47:15
drivers 4:19,23 5:9 6:13 9:15 13:9,9,23 16:12 22:15 27:13	ehail 25:8 26:14,17	enhanced 4:10 7:3 18:1
42:25 43:20 46:6,12,16,23 47:3,4,14,17 48:8,13,14,21	ehails 26:16	enormous 28:5
49:1,19 52:2 53:10,15 54:8,19,24 55:1,8 56:16 57:5	either 8:23 66:21	enough 22:24 35:16 39:8
58:16 59:12,21,22,24	el 45:20	ensure 3:22 5:17 6:12 18:10
60:2,2,4,5,6,17 61:1,3 62:15 63:3 64:15 65:6,8,16 66:11	elaboration 37:4	21:1 45:25 46:4,24 47:8,24 48:21 55:17 57:23 (13)
(57)	elisa 18	entering 47:3 51:21 55:18
driving 5:4		
<u> </u>	else 69:8	entice 28:6
due 20:18 62:8		
<u> </u>	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20	entire 33:8 59:22
due 20:18 62:8	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2	entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24	entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6	entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6)	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29)	entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22	 entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23 earn 46:6	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22 emergencies 20:18	<pre>entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22 (4)</pre>
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23 earn 46:6 easier 23:1,9	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22 emergencies 20:18 emergency 20:17	<pre>entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22 (4) equally 17:8 26:13</pre>
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23 earn 46:6 easier 23:1,9 easily 65:12	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22 emergencies 20:18 emergency 20:17 emphasize 42:23	 entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22 (4) equally 17:8 26:13 equitable 26:9 47:24
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23 earn 46:6 easier 23:1,9 easily 65:12 east 45:21	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22 emergencies 20:18 emergency 20:17 emphasize 42:23 employees 36:13 46:15	<pre>entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22 (4) equally 17:8 26:13</pre>
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23 earn 46:6 easier 23:1,9 easily 65:12 east 45:21 east 45:21 eastern 15:14,15 easy 14:8,9	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22 emergencies 20:18 emergency 20:17 emphasize 42:23 employees 36:13 46:15 employment 32:12 employs 36:12	 entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22 (4) equally 17:8 26:13 equitable 26:9 47:24
due 20:18 62:8 during 31:22 duty 46:21 e 10,10 2:2,2 70:2,2 (6) each 11:18 33:23 earn 46:6 easier 23:1,9 easily 65:12 east 45:21 east 45:21	eluto 11:16 12:12 14:14,18 16:22 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20 25:13,15 26:18 28:25 30:24 32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6 55:24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (29) eman 2:8 26:19,22 emergencies 20:18 emergency 20:17 emphasize 42:23 employees 36:13 46:15 employment 32:12	<pre>entire 33:8 59:22 entity 39:19 68:20 envelope 30:15 environment 36:21 38:16 53:13 55:11 56:23 (5) environmental 27:5 equal 17:16 18:11 26:6 54:22 (4) equally 17:8 26:13 equitable 26:9 47:24 equivalent 12:25 31:17 32:2</pre>

80

essential 18:8,25 53:22 57:4 (4)	existing 41:10 47:4 49:13,15 (4)	falling 19:25
established 37:18	exists 21:24	family 34:14 60:3
et 43:4	exit 54:7	familyowned 18:23
		fantastic 6:4
ev 42:21 43:21	expectation 22:7	far 8:22 9:14,18 10:2 13:2,21
evan 2:10 12:22 30:25 31:2 (4)	expected 22:5 65:15	29:16,21 40:6 54:5 (10)
even 16:1 19:25 22:25 27:22	expenses 33:25 57:18 58:6 59:25 (4)	fast 5:19
29:11 32:9 33:9 35:18 43:5		faster 8:5
45:1 (10)	expensive 62:20	favor 63:12
event 6:15	experience 17:13 19:7 59:7	fdny 20:16
events 62:7	experimentation 51:20	fear 31:20,21
every 9:17 10:1,16 16:1 34:9 44:23 49:10 60:12 (8)	experimenting 50:13	feature 6:6
	explicitly 47:9	
everybody 31:1 69:10	exponentially 19:17	feel 42:12 45:11
everyone 4:16 5:8,17 6:7 8:10,12 28:22 59:19 67:23 (9)	express 19:3 56:13	fell 49:14
everything 25:21	extra 60:2	few 13:11 20:15
evs 28:5,7	extremely 14:24 59:6	fewer 60:10
	·	fhv 8:6,13,18 9:10,10,15,19
exacerbates 43:15	f 10 70:2	12:6 25:16 45:22 46:3,10,13 47:17 59:24 60:25 65:1,22
exacerbating 20:8	face 32:10 55:1 62:1	66:1,10,14,15,17,19 (24)
exactly 40:23 64:24	facebook 3:5	fhvs 9:17 48:11
examine 33:6 57:25	facilitate 7:4	field 18:4
example 54:10 60:7	facing 46:11 54:9	figure 52:2
exceed 9:8 10:7,10 65:10 (4)	fact 31:17 63:7	final 10:13 52:25 63:20 67:25
exceeded 9:25	factors 19:18 58:7	(4)
exceeds 21:21	failure 39:22	finally 13:14
except 34:11	fair 48:15 56:24	finance 43:9 66:21
excess 44:7,9 45:5 49:23 (4)	fairer 57:23	financial 7:20 20:1 22:9 30:9 34:6,8,10 35:15 37:10 39:12
		46:10 47:2 49:5,5 53:18 54:9
executive 8:17 12:15	fallen 43:8	58:12 64:10 65:7 66:24 (20)

December 11, 2024 81		
financially 35:5,19 38:19 41:5 (4)	forced 49:14	furthermore 49:11
(4) find 68:17	forhire 4:9,11 6:12 7:23 12:19,21 15:3 17:14 29:25	fusing 51:15
finding 43:13	31:6,24 32:6 36:11 37:1 64:15 67:6 (16)	future 5:18 27:6 33:10 45:9 56:21 59:15 (6)
fine 49:3 52:20	former 28:11	gap 17:21
fire 60:10	formerly 63:24	gaps 35:25
first 8:17 12:6,7 28:6 32:22	forms 37:17	garage 16:20
39:6 48:12,21 49:1 50:20 62:6 (11)	forward 7:21 14:12 31:14,15	general 24:24 59:3
firstgeneration 18:25 43:1	52:23,24 55:12 68:2 (8)	get 14:2,5
five 9:11 33:15 58:16	foster 57:17	15:2,16,17,21,22,24,25 16:2,10,17 20:20 24:4 25:25
fix 34:12	fostering 55:11	26:4 27:21 28:20 40:12 43:5 51:11,19 (22)
fixed 43:4	framework 17:25	gets 14:4 35:3
fleeing 5:5	frankly 38:25	getting 13:23 22:24
	fraud 58:7	
fleet 9:11 13:5,21	60:7,11,13,15,22,24 (7)	give 8:4 41:21
fleets 66:25	free 35:22	given 33:11
flexibility 35:21	front 20:16	giving 23:19 61:4
floor 4:4	frustrating 15:8	go 11:15 12:12 22:9,11,13 24:6,7 43:3 45:12 49:14 51:11
fluctuate 27:14	fulfill 50:24	52:22 58:17 61:17,20 (15)
fluctuates 19:24	fulfilled 10:3,21	goal 17:21 22:25 45:24
fluid 62:23	fully 43:24 44:1,3,9 53:14 59:8 64:6 (7)	goals 47:21
focus 36:22	fund 29:7 33:18 37:24,25	god 62:19
focused 4:24	38:5,6,7,20 50:2,5 51:7 53:21 54:1,14,25 61:12,17,23 62:4	goes 51:16 53:24
folks 27:17	(19)	going 12:6 32:19 33:2,10 34:25 48:20 50:22 51:24
follow 7:18	funded 23:21	52:23,24 60:20,24 67:24 (13)
following 47:6	funding 13:10 20:4 23:19	gold 44:16
forbid 50:7 62:19	funds 7:2	good 3:1 4:6 11:16 15:23 16:3 18:18 22:19 26:21,22 29:3
force 62:23	further 13:3 32:9,15 47:4 57:15 63:7 70:12 (7)	18:18 22:19 20:21,22 29:3 31:1 35:16 36:5 39:16 41:2 45:17 48:4,4 53:7 59:19 61:8

63:21 (22)	handling 37:21	heating 60:21
got 33:6	hands 23:18	heights 14:1
government 23:5,8,16,18,25	happening 43:12	held 6 33:24
24:9 (6)	happens 16:5 42:17 62:19	hello 14:16 21:17 24:22
governmental 34:10 granted 15:5	happy 4:17 10:25 21:12 50:16 59:15 (5)	help 23:10,20 24:9 47:13 59:11 60:20 61:2 (7)
grants 20:4	hard 6:7 14:1 43:8	helped 43:24 44:1,6 53:19 (4)
great 11:14	harder 20:21 32:11	helpful 69:1
greater 30:10	hardworking 54:8	helping 53:11 58:6
greenbaum 2:12 36:4,5,7	harlem 45:21	helps 45:9
38:16 39:4,14 40:9,14 41:7 42:3 (11)	harm 21:4 29:24 30:10,21	her 23:14
greenblatt 2:14 48:3,4,7 50:11 51:4 52:1,7,15 53:4 (10)	38:10 (5) has 6:5 9:1,11,19,25 10:10,22 11:6,7 12:18 22:16,24 23:1	here 9:16,22 17:4 18:20 19:3 22:21,24,25 23:3 29:9 31:4 33:6 35:8 36:7 44:6 52:18
group 56:7	33:20 34:1 35:8,22 40:2,22 44:5,12,15 49:11 51:14 53:18	63:17 68:4 (18)
growing 34:1	60:8 62:8,23 64:12 66:15 68:6 (31)	hereby 70:9
grown 9:11	hasn't 40:5	hereford 36:8,8,15 38:2 (4)
growth 9:18	having 35:15	hereunto 70:16
guarantee 7:1 33:18 37:24 38:4,7,20 50:1,5 51:7 53:21,21	he 68:11,12	hi 8:10 48:4
54:1,25 61:16,22 62:4 (16)	he's 32:23	high 10:12
guild 48:8	headed 13:17	higher 65:15
guys 28:15	heading 4:20	highest 9:19 29:21
hail 25:12 26:15,17	headways 9:9	highlight 27:2 46:12
hailing 25:6	healthy 36:25 41:19 56:23	highlights 54:15
half 33:20	hear 6:5 14:17 18:16 23:13	highly 15:8 55:18
hall 27:8	52:23 56:2 60:1 (7)	highvolume 9:15
hand 11:10 53:24 70:17	heard 39:4 42:12 68:1	hill 29:15
handle 68:11	hearing 3 3:2,2,6 4:7,15 11:14,15 12:1,6 14:12 27:8	historic 59:5
handled 40:22	32:13 67:22 69:10 (15)	hit 65:16

82

	December 11, 2024	83
hold 12:13 13:14 29:21	identify 58:2 68:19,24	inability 16:12
holders 33:19 38:6 53:23,25 55:6 (5)	identifying 68:9	inaccessible 27:25
holds 66:14	idg 48:8,13,14 52:5,23 (5)	incentivize 18:2 41:18
holiday 4:17	illegally 13:24	include 32:8 57:12
home 14:6 16:19	illtimed 42:16	includes 66:8
hope 5:12,23 40:25	immediately 58:15	including 5:4 6:19 13:25 46:17 57:14 (5)
hoping 50:14	immigrants 18:25	increase 11:5 19:4 28:13
host 5:4	impact 39:11 47:18 58:15,17 64:14 (5)	43:18,19 48:16 60:19 61:2 (8)
hour 15:17	impacted 32:3	increased 4:18 6:1 11:7 17:23 56:16 (5)
hovering 10:11	impactful 5:15	increasing 19:16 30:5,6,9 (4)
how 15:13,20 22:10 25:11,14,23 33:6 41:6	implement 25:23 46:8	increasingly 53:12
43:24,25 44:5 45:8,10 62:13 (14)	implementation 17:10 20:19	incredible 25:8 65:7
however 13:2 15:6 22:1 59:7	implemented 58:20 66:18	incurring 47:15
65:19 (5)	implementing 57:16	independence 12:16 17:2 31:3
huge 14:7 33:13	implements 47:18	independent 24:15 46:14
humphrey 2:5 16:23,24 17:1 (4)	implications 20:7	48:8
hundred 60:10	importance 28:18	indication 25:11
hundreds 48:14	important 14:24 28:19 42:20 45:24 57:2 58:8 59:13 (7)	individual 47:11 58:15 65:21 66:11 (4)
hybrid 43:21 54:21	impossible 16:17	industry 7:24 10:13,16,22
hypothetically 41:22	impression 40:18	24:13 33:7 34:4 36:17 37:1 38:20,24,25 40:4 42:1,24 42:10 46:2 14 52:16
i'd 4:16 5:1,9,14 6:6 43:20,23 48:12 59:14 (9)	improve 9:7 19:6 24:4,6 27:12 57:20 (6)	43:10 46:3,14 53:16 55:10,16,19 57:2,19 58:1,25 59:11,13 60:9,25 67:6 (31)
i'll 41:21	improved 7:5	inflated 58:7
i'm 4:12 8:1 10:25 12:14 26:23 29:4 31:2 40:9 45:18	improvement 15:11 17:11 27:1 28:11 (4)	influence 4:19 5:5
56:2 61:9 68:16 (12)	improvements 20:24 27:9	inform 8:15
i've 28:1 34:23 50:21	improving 28:8	infrastructure 59:7

	December 11, 2024	±0
initiative 60:1	interest 26:24 43:4 61:24	53:6,7 54:16,20 55:11,12,15,25 56:6,19 57:4 58:8 59:3,18,20
injured 4:19	interested 6:8 39:10 52:24 57:9 59:6 70:14 (6)	60:14,14,15,20,23,23 61:7,9 62:22,22 63:20,22 65:5,13
injury 61:21	interpreted 46:21	66:18 68:12,22 69:8,9 70:10 (195)
input 68:4	into 23:23 30:1 33:9 35:20	island 15:18
insolvency 41:16 54:12 62:25 63:5,6 (5)	38:5 41:8,18 50:15 51:7 52:17 61:22 67:11 (12)	isn't 23:7,8 33:9 51:16 (4)
insolvent 7:1 33:22 34:2,5,14,21,24 35:1,14 49:12	introduce 5:23 8:3	issue 7:17 23:24 39:6 40:25 62:9 64:10 69:4 (7)
51:24 53:20 54:2 (13)	introducing 55:21	issued 37:22
instead 33:5 50:8	invehicle 5:25	ISSUEU 57.22
insult 61:21	invest 43:21	issues 27:13 36:20,23 48:19 55:9 (5)
insurance 4:11 6:11,21,23 7:1,4,23 32:20,25 33:13,14	investment 19:11	its 34:11 38:6,21 39:17,17 45:25 47:21 53:15 64:13 65:14
34:3,5,11,13,17,20,22 35:5,20	involved 27:18 57:24	(10)
36:8,9,10,14,16,18,20,25 37:25 38:10,12 39:17,20,21 40:4,21 41:5 42:1,13,15	involves 25:16	ivg 42:25
43:4,11,12,14,25 44:12,13,17,19 45:1,2,10,11	involving 6:15	january 9:12
46:1,2,18 47:11 48:11,17,18,22 49:2,20 50:12 51:20 53:12	irresponsible 42:16 44:3	jean 2:4 14:15,16,19 27:21 28:17 (6)
54:4,13,21 55:2,7,10 56:8,9,24 57:8,20,22,23 58:16 59:4	is 3:2,2,3,10,19 4:2,6,15 5:12,20,20 6:7,12,19	jeopardize 20:1 38:9
60:7,8,16,20,21 61:15 62:2,16	8:10,18,22 10:11,15 11:4,22	
64:13,19,24 65:14,15 67:4 68:11,12 (97)	12:8,25 14:8,9,15 15:4,6,11,13 16:11,12,22,25 17:7,15,20,24 18:15,19 19:15	jeremy 2:13 42:8 68:19 69:3 (4)
insure 40:8 50:22	21:20,22,23,24,25 22:3,6,8,10,22,25	jersey 63:24,25 64:3,16 65:2,19,23 66:11,19 (9)
insured 64:7	23:8,15,17,18,21,22,24,25,25 24:1,5,9,10,20	jerseybased 65:6
insurer 44:18	25:7,11,18,21,22 26:17,19,22 28:5,19,21,25 29:4,10,22,25	jerseyregistered 65:9
insurers 34:23 37:8	30:3,8,25 31:2,14,15,18 32:24 33:1 34:1,3,21,22 35:16,25	job 22:17,19 39:16
insuring 36:1 38:17	36:2,4,6,8,12,15,16 37:1,12 38:20	jobs 46:15 56:16
intended 6:12	39:7,14,15,16,17,18,19,20	0
intends 34:24	40:6,16,18,21,24 41:4,8,11,13,15,24	joe 2:3 12:14 28:17
	42:5,8,15,21,24 43:6,22	joined 4:12
intensive 62:8	44:8,10 45:1,11,16,18 46:12,19 47:16 48:3,6,15,18	joining 3:7
intent 37:2	49:2,8,21,24 50:7,19,23 51:5,12,17,17 52:12,15,18	jose 2:6 18:15,19 24:18 30:16

In Re Public Hearing NYC - Taxi & Limousine Commission December 11, 2024

45:16,18 (7)	lanes 20:19,19	legitimately 57:6
joseph 12:8	language 40:16	length 69:4
jurisdiction 46:1	large 25:9 41:24	less 15:11 49:10 51:9,9 59:25 62:1 (6)
just 9:20 10:5,6,11,17,20 14:5 15:1 30:17 34:3 35:22 43:17 48:18,19 49:16 52:1,12,17 (18)	largest 32:25 last 4:15 9:11 10:9,21 32:18	lessee 66:9,16
justice 26:25	36:18 44:2 67:20 (8)	lessee's 65:18
k 2:2	lastly 5:14 28:8	lessor 65:20
	lastminute 19:21	let 8:8 51:11
kabessa 2:9 29:1,1,3,4 61:7,8,9 63:15 (9)	late 13:16	let's 25:2 62:1
kamal 2:17 59:18,20	law 6:20 25:11 65:19	level 8:24
kaufman 15 4:13 11:3,11 (4)	lawmakers 7:22	leveling 18:4
keep 14:8	laws 6:19 38:18 46:4 60:18 64:8 (5)	levels 57:23
keith 2:12 36:4,6	lawyers 26:24 49:7	liabilities 33:22
kenneth 17,20	lbo 45:22	liability 7:8,10 35:3 38:3 (4)
key 7:3 57:14		license 39:21 66:14
kick 35:4	lead 9:10 51:19 66:23	licensed 37:8 38:17 64:7,11
killed 4:18	lease 65:8,10 66:1,10,11,20 (6)	(4)
kind 10:22 20:4 22:13	leased 65:4,18,20,24 (4)	licensee 33:23
kinds 51:5	leases 65:13	licensees 7:15 38:17 64:15 65:2,22 66:1 (6)
knew 13:20 23:12	leasing 65:6,25 69:5	licenses 24:12 42:21 66:19,23
know 15:24 16:18	least 10:17 21:5 28:9 54:6 (4)	(4)
22:6,13,16,19 24:5 29:25 32:13 40:6,23 43:24 68:13,25 (14)	leave 55:8	licensing 24:12 66:17 lie 34:7
known 48:8 68:24	leaves 54:23	life 15:4 22:22
	leaving 35:7 54:8	
knows 20:3	left 13:12 16:19 54:24 61:19	light 10:15
la 53:9	(4)	lightly 5:20
lack 54:18	legal 5:21	like 4:16 5:1,9,14 6:6 7:25 22:2 23:16 24:14 26:5 27:1
landscape 8:14	legislation 40:18	28:4 29:13 34:17 41:2 43:4,23

47:23 48:12 51:8 62:1 (21)	longterm 7:22 58:2	managing 47:10 59:2
limit 11:19	longtime 14:21	mandate 55:8
limited 3:16 19:15,24 33:1 47:5 59:24 (6)	look 7:21 11:8 14:12 44:23 51:22 52:13 67:11,15,24 (9)	mandated 4:8
limits 37:7 58:13	looked 67:16	mandates 64:23
limousine 2 48:6 63:24 64:12 (4)	looking 9:23 13:12 44:11,13 62:3 (5)	manhattan 45:22manner 15:16 57:19 58:20
lines 34:23 35:21	loophole 51:12,13	manufacturers 28:4,6
link 57:20	loss 44:11,12	many 15:5 19:14 23:2,2,2,14 24:25 25:1,1 43:25 44:11 56:8
liquidations 33:8,10	lost 14:4	62:7 64:21 66:10,24 (16)
list 68:15	lot 26:14 41:23 60:13	march 41:22
listed 65:21	lots 40:4	market 27:4 28:5 34:18
listen 32:16	lower 50:14	35:7,20 36:11 38:11,12 44:14 49:13,15 50:15,24 51:21 54:5 22 55:47 56:12 20 (0)?
listened 42:12	lupus 27:16	54:5,23 55:4,7 56:12,20 60:8 67:1 (22)
little 10:12 22:13,18 44:24 (4)	lyft 8:21 10:1,9 13:22 14:3 15:16,19 27:23 (8)	marketplace 36:25 38:13 41:19,20 53:19 54:8 (6)
liu 8:4,8,10 11:8 (4)	lyft's 8:25	marriage 70:14
lived 14:1	made 13:2,7 39:12 50:21	match 64:24
livelihood 61:3	55:17 (5)	matches 3:23
livery 18:20,21 19:9 20:25 29:5,7 30:12,16 45:19,20 46:13,22 47:3 53:8	main 44:8 maintain 32:11 46:1	matter 70:15
61:10,11,13,13 (18)	maintained 36:2	matters 24:1 46:24,25
livestream 3:4	maintaining 20:22 46:18	may 3:17 13:16 21:13 29:24 32:2 46:21 62:15 63:1 (8)
living 5:11 46:6	47:16 53:11 (4)	maya 45:2
location 32:4	make 5:12 22:25 23:9 24:13 28:15 32:11 49:9 50:22	maybe 30:17 44:5 68:10
lockouts 5:16,18	51:15,25 52:5,25 66:20 67:15 68:1 (15)	me 8:9 14:17,17 15:19 18:16
log 6:8	makes 24:3 42:17 55:3	26:5 33:3 42:14 44:4 50:18 56:2 61:4 (12)
long 51:9	making 16:9 18:8 28:15	mean 23:24 30:5 52:21
longer 15:7 16:6 17:13 26:4 38:25 40:7 (6)	malpractice 49:4	meaningful 56:20

	December 11, 2024	87
means 22:8 44:17	million 33:20 60:10 65:12	morning 3:1 4:6 11:16 18:18 26:21,22 29:3 31:1 36:5 45:17
meant 25:10 33:19	millions 44:24	48:4,5 53:7 59:19 61:8 63:21 (16)
measure 54:17	minimize 36:23 41:14	
measures 55:22 61:2	minimum 5:19 7:10 35:15 37:7 (4)	moskowitz 2:13 42:8,9 44:22 68:19 69:3 (6)
mechanism 13:10	minute 10:15 33:12	most 5:16 16:12 23:10
medallion 25:4,4,7,10 (4)		motor 33:18
medallions 25:1 26:16	minutes 3:17 8:19,19,21 9:2,7 10:4,14,18,21 11:19 15:10 17:20 28:11,12,13	move 30:17 32:19 63:1 68:2 (4)
medical 60:13,22	29:12,13,19,20,20 31:9 (22)	moving 5:17 31:14,15
meet 10:7 17:18 22:7,9 27:24	misled 54:20	
(5) meeting 3:7,23 4:1,3 12:4	mismanaged 34:5	ms 8:8 11:3,8,11,16 12:12 14:14,16,18,19 16:16,22,24 18:14,17 21:14,16 24:20
19:15 25:22 48:18 51:10 (9)	missed 8:1	25:13,15 26:18,20 28:25 30:24
member 12:17 14:22 29:5 47:1 61:10 65:16 (6)	mitchell 17 4:14	32:17 36:3 42:7 45:15 48:2 53:6,7 55:15,24 56:4 59:17 61:6 63:19 67:20 68:16,22 (40)
	mitigated 58:18	
members 36:6 48:6 64:2,6,11,16 (6)	moderate 22:18	much 5:7 16:11 24:17 26:17,21 28:23 30:22 35:8 36:19 39:4 49:10 50:14,15
mention 6:3	moderation 30:16	56:5 61:4 63:17 67:19 68:3 (18)
mentioned 43:17 44:8,23	moderator 3:1,11,20,25 (4)	multiple 28:1
merrymaking 4:20	modified 40:19	-
met 7:11 8:20 27:7 31:12 37:7 (5)	moment 48:14	must 7:11 36:22 46:24 48:24 58:19 64:6,24 (7)
metrics 6:8	money 22:14 24:13	muted 3:10,20
	monitoring 7:13 46:21 47:10	my 5:12 8:9,10 10:24 12:21
metropolitan 14:21	month 60:12	16:25 18:19 24:23,24 25:18 26:22 27:16 29:4 31:1 32:24
mic 29:1 56:1	monthandahalf 43:7	33:1 36:6 44:11,12,15 45:2,4,10,18 48:6 50:19 53:7
michael 2:7 24:20 63:22	months 20:15 43:3	56:6,13 57:15 59:20 60:14,23,25 61:9 63:21 70:17
michele 70:8		(37)
microphone 3:13 11:17	more 7:6 12:24 14:12 16:1 20:20 21:7 22:15,18 26:1 28:16,20,20,22 31:12 33:15	name 3:10,13,22,23 8:10 11:17 16:25 18:19 26:22 29:4
midst 46:2	36:13 38:24 41:22 45:11 49:22	31:2 32:24 36:6 45:18 48:6
mike 2:18 63:20 67:10	51:20 52:17,21,22,23 59:25 60:22 65:12 (28)	53:7 56:6 61:9 63:22 64:23,25 65:19 66:13,13 (24)
	I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	

names 64:19 narrow 52:17	50:14,15 56:10,11,20,21 58:12 59:5 61:11 63:23,24 64:3,6,11,16	11:10,15 14:3 16:4 22:5,6,8,12 25:3,7 26:1 32:19 39:18,22 51:12 56:3 66:15 69:9 (25)
narrower 51:18	65:2,4,5,9,17,17,19,23 66:1,6,7,11,18,22 70:5,9 (87)	nuanced 49:22
nassau 70:6	newer 43:21	number 11:4 29:23 30:3,6 34:1 41:13,15 (7)
nation 30:20	news 54:11	numbers 11:9 25:8 28:12
national 44:16	next 12:4,4 13:11 14:14 16:22 18:15 24:20 26:19 28:25 30:25	o 10
nature 27:15	36:4 42:8 45:16 48:3 53:6 55:25 59:18 61:7 63:20 (19)	object 16:9
navigate 20:21 53:11	no 13:11 15:4,19 20:4 25:11	objective 42:5
near 57:8 58:13	29:10,10 30:8 35:25 38:25 40:7,14 53:25 55:17 61:19	obligation 22:9
nearly 17:23 55:8	62:17,17,18 70:14 (19)	obviously 22:14 23:23
necessarily 58:17	nofault 7:10 57:21	october 8:23 9:13 11:25
necessary 17:20 54:16 57:10 59:8 (4)	nonaccessible 17:14	od 61:10
necessitates 65:19	nonadmitted 37:14 38:5,8 50:11 53:24 54:7,18 55:4 61:18,23,25 62:2,5 63:7,8 (15)	off 13:14
need 11:8,21 12:9 14:25 15:23 19:21 23:10 27:2 28:21	nondisabled 26:7	offer 54:21 62:4
32:7 34:12 35:18,19 43:2,7 51:21 58:9 (17)	none 11:14	offers 6:24
needed 30:4 47:19 50:14,15	nontrips 15:21	often 5:11 27:4 55:1
54:19 57:14 (6)	nonwheelchair 31:17	omitting 63:16
needs 32:4 38:21 39:16,23 (4)	nor 16:11	onboard 57:16
neighborhood 32:7	northern 45:21	once 55:20
neighborhoods 13:25 19:23	notably 5:16	ondemand 17:7
net 7:2 33:20 53:22 61:19 (4) never 15:17 60:1	note 3:21 5:1	one 10:15 13:11 14:7 15:22 16:2 29:23 33:15 34:20 35:7,13,15 40:22 41:13,21
new 1 5:2,2 6:16,18,23,25	noted 17:12 69:11	49:14 52:15 62:10,18,21 64:22 68:22 (21)
7:17,19 14:21 17:3,8 18:12 20:5,5 22:6 25:5,7 26:23	nothing 29:22 49:3 69:8	oneonone 42:11
28:5,20 29:6,13 31:7 32:5 33:1,7,9,14,16 34:8,9 35:2,6,17	noting 6:4	ones 60:17
36:8,11,14,21,21,24 37:9 38:4,11 41:14 42:5 43:1,14,19	november 5:2	oneway 43:22
44:5,9 46:25 47:2,14,25 49:4	now 4:4,6 5:7,24 6:5,10 8:4	

ongoing 53:15 67:4	others 12:23 43:8 44:4 45:3 (4)	packages 4:8
online 6:6 21:19	(4) otherwise 26:10	paramount 27:6
only 9:12 13:19 22:25 26:15,16 35:4 38:9 43:15	our 3:21 4:4,15,23 6:2,4,8,11	parity 15:11
44:15 61:21 62:10 65:25 (12)	9:5 11:15,24 12:5,7 14:14 16:18,22 17:4 18:15 19:3	park 43:12,24 45:9
onto 47:1 51:1	20:12 24:2,10,20 25:19 26:19 27:6 28:21 29:23 30:9,11,25	part 19:1 23:22,24 25:9 39:6 (5)
open 26:2 47:16	32:18 35:14 36:4 42:5,8,25 44:8,9,19,25 45:16 46:4,19,23	participate 59:15
opening 40:15	47:1,4 48:3 49:21 53:10 55:25 59:6,18 61:7 63:20 64:8,11	participating 23:23 48:14
operate 19:14 35:14 46:5	65:16 67:6,7,15,20 (62)	69:9
operated 44:2	ours 34:17 47:23	particular 15:15
operating 43:16 45:25 54:2 56:11 59:2 (5)	out 4:20 5:1,9 33:15,17 34:17,22 35:4 36:12 40:25	particularly 13:9 64:15
operational 20:25 47:22	47:4 50:25 52:3 55:8 61:17 63:1,3 67:1,21 68:17 (20)	parties 52:24 57:9,24 70:13 (4)
operators 57:5 59:12 64:22 67:1,7 (5)	outcome 70:15	partners 42:25
opportunities 19:1	outlines 33:3	parts 33:3 34:19
opportunity 12:14 13:3 14:11	outright 66:22	pass 13:24 43:20
16:25 21:12 24:23 48:9 53:5 56:6,19 59:25 61:5 63:25 (13)	over 9:11,14,14,18,20 10:2,9,16,17,20,21 12:24 13:11	passage 14:13
oppose 49:17 62:2,15	18:21 22:9,13,14,17 31:16 33:24 40:5 55:5 (22)	passed 23:14
options 19:23	overall 30:9 52:5	passenger 19:21
order 58:4	oversee 44:1	passengers 6:13 26:7,7 27:23 47:5 53:16 54:20 56:17 57:6 (9)
organic 21:8	oversight 44:6 54:19 55:10,19 (4)	passing 5:6 43:15 58:5
organization 53:10 68:20	own 29:23 30:11 31:18 69:4	past 39:22 40:2
organizations 32:14	(4)	paul 19
organize 57:9	owner 30:17 45:20 46:22 66:6,8,16 (6)	pay 5:19 6:2,3,5 7:2 30:3
organizer 17:2 26:23	owners 6:25 18:20 45:19 53:8	pay 5.19 0.2,3,5 7.2 30.3 37:25 38:5 48:15 49:3 53:22 62:1 (12)
other 6:14 11:12 15:12 21:21 29:10,10,14 32:13,20 34:9,25	(4)	paying 23:23 30:1 43:3 60:14
40:2,11 41:18 44:13 52:24 53:23 65:2,23 (19)	p 2:2	61:22 (5)
	package 5:23	payment 7:5 61:20

payments 6:1	physical 17:9	28:21 (4)
pays 38:3	pick 25:5 42:2	populations 20:11
peak 31:22	picking 24:14	position 22:11
pedestrianfocused 20:14	piece 40:17	positive 9:1
pedestrians 6:13 35:2	place 14:9 34:6 46:9	possible 5:19 33:5 49:18
penalizing 22:2	places 21:21,22 34:10	possibly 66:25
penalties 5:3	plagued 34:4	posted 11:24
people 4:18 14:24,25 15:8,14	planning 20:14 42:19	potential 56:14 58:7 59:16
23:6 24:14 25:5 27:17,21,25 28:20 32:1,5,9,14 39:7 68:9	plans 60:9	potentially 64:21
(18)	plated 56:10	pothole 34:12
per 3:17 33:24	platform 27:2	power 49:8 62:23
percent 8:18,19,20,22 9:2,3,4,5,20,25	play 18:23 27:4 50:3 64:9 (4)	practical 54:16
10:3,8,11,17,17,20,23 13:5,6,11,20 15:10,12 17:19,22	playing 18:4	prearranged 64:3
19:6,10 20:23 21:6,6,21,22 23:11 28:10,12,12 29:11,12,19 21:8 22:1 22:8 28:2 41:2 45:22	please 3:13,22	precisely 26:1
31:8 32:1 33:8 38:3 41:3 45:22 49:13 51:7 56:10 59:22 60:8	pleased 31:13	precluded 65:25
(50)	pleasure 30:10	predatory 55:3
percentage 9:23 11:7	point 5:1,3,9 8:3 22:6 50:21	predominantly 18:22
percentages 22:12	51:1 (7)	premium 37:17,20 38:4
perfect 18:18	points 51:23 52:9 57:14 67:16 (4)	prentiss 13:17
performed 8:14 9:15	policies 7:17 37:22 41:3,23	present 3:25 62:7
perhaps 12:23	44:12,13,17 50:24 55:2 64:20 68:12 (11)	presentation 8:5 10:24
period 11:25 57:12 58:21	policy 7:12 8:11 33:4,19	presented 29:18
persist 27:13	34:13 37:7,17,20 38:6 43:24 44:1,4,7,8,10,15 45:1,5 46:20	presents 59:24 65:1
personally 62:7	48:7,25 49:20 53:23,25 55:5 (25)	president 14:20 18:20 45:19
persons 3:5	policyholder 64:24	56:7 63:22 (5)
phasein 57:12	ponzi 44:5	press 33:11
phone 15:13	population 22:21,23 23:1	pressures 47:2

	-	
presume 21:18	product 6:16 51:3	proud 30:19 36:16
prevent 9:8 25:10 43:12 45:9 55:18 56:14 62:24 65:5 (8)	profiles 57:19	proven 44:18
prevents 67:7	profit 55:5	provide 7:2 41:25 47:12 57:4 58:9 64:3 68:11 (7)
previous 8:25 10:6	program 19:2 20:3 21:2 22:2,3,16 30:2 32:25 35:6 (9)	provided 8:24 11:20 12:2
price 58:10	progress 13:1	27:22 36:10 40:4 48:25 56:8,22 (9)
prices 43:19 58:16	prohibit 34:21	providers 12:21 13:2 19:19
		20:10 40:3,8,13 56:25 (8)
pricing 35:21 41:8	prompt 7:5	providing 6:22 7:15 21:2
primary 7:12 37:7 48:25 49:21 51:2,14 (6)	proof 17:24 42:21	37:3,8 53:22 57:7 (7)
prior 12:3 47:7	proper 42:18 55:19	public 3 3:1,16 4:7 11:15,25 12:5 23:5 26:24 33:18 38:10
priorities 47:22	properly 27:13	57:1,7 59:3 61:25 67:8 69:10 (17)
	proposal 6:11,18 12:7,20	(17)
prioritize 55:4,23	25:16 30:14 32:19,20 40:12 45:4 49:19 63:15 67:14 (13)	publicly 45:13
prioritizing 18:3	proposals 11:23 48:20 49:1	published 11:23
priority 41:13,15	propose 67:25	purchase 66:21
private 23:18 24:1 57:1 64:5		purple 10:15,15
(4)	proposed 4:8 7:3,14 8:15 9:5 17:5,17 18:8 19:4 30:5 31:7	purpose 39:17,20
privately 23:21,22 24:8	32:9 33:4 34:15,19 37:2,3 38:23 46:7,19 47:7 48:10	purposes 66:17
pro 55:22 61:15	53:17 54:16 58:3,19 61:14 62:3,15 64:9,13,18,22 66:5	push 29:22,24 30:15 34:17,22
problem 23:2 51:16,17,18 59:1 (5)	(34)	(5)
problems 38:21,24 40:6,23	proposing 8:5 19:8 35:4	pushed 13:18,18
59:25 (5)	protect 33:19 34:15 35:1,16 37:19 38:23 53:15 54:19 59:12	pushing 66:25
procedures 7:18	(9)	put 16:18 21:19 34:6
proceed 3:14	protected 37:23 61:16	putting 22:1 23:17 27:24
process 5:18,21 24:12 37:18 42:19 (5)	protecting 44:25	queens 15:15 36:12
processing 7:13	protection 53:25 54:15,22	question 11:3 21:15 40:10 41:22 43:23 50:18 51:24 52:12
	protections 6:24 37:19 50:1,4	60:14,23 62:10 63:18 68:8,8
produced 27:17	51:5 55:23 (6)	(14)
produces 60:11	protects 57:6	questions 10:25 11:2,13 21:13

		, <u>,</u>
30:23 39:2 50:16 (7)	reasonable 20:23 38:21 41:9 57:3,12 (5)	region 64:5
quick 11:3 42:18	reasons 22:22	registered 3:7,21 64:25 65:18 (4)
quickly 6:14		
quote 48:23,24	receive 4:23 33:3	registration 65:22,24 66:12
r 10 2:2 70:2	receives 20:4	registrations 64:20
rainy 14:6	receiving 32:2	regulate 39:20
raise 21:5 23:6	recent 17:24 33:11	regulated 55:18 61:24
raised 67:16	recently 21:19 27:7 49:11 54:11 (4)	regulating 39:16
		regulation 38:22 41:9 46:7 62:3,17 (5)
raising 20:7 22:5	recognize 7:25 36:19 66:16	
rampant 60:6	recommend 20:22 47:6	regulations 5:8 6:21 32:21 37:14 38:18 46:4 48:10 49:22
rapidly 10:22	record 11:24 29:21,23 30:11 44:18 (5)	58:19 65:3 66:16,22 (12)
rappaport 2:3 12:8,9,11,13,14 14:23 (7)	recorded 15:14,21 16:4	regulators 34:7 59:11
rate 21:20	recording 31:10	regulatory 17:25 49:4 54:14 61:2 67:2 (5)
rates 37:17 41:17 62:5	recruitment 19:12	related 5:1 70:12
rather 43:11,13,20 46:22 49:20 (5)	reduce 12:20 20:1 31:5 57:17 (4)	relating 48:10 58:6
rating 39:9 44:16 45:6	reduced 17:12	relative 21:19 39:6
reach 20:17 22:11	reducing 20:10 47:4	release 42:21
	_	relevant 25:19,21,22
read 33:2	reductions 31:25	reliable 17:7 18:7 21:2
ready 3:13	reenter 56:20	rely 32:6 56:17
real 34:6 40:22 43:13	references 58:3	remain 31:25 55:22
realities 20:25 47:23	referred 37:10	remained 11:6
reality 18:9	reflect 5:14 66:13	
really 21:23 25:23 33:6 40:5,17 43:23 50:17 60:1	reforming 57:21	remaining 16:15 21:10 35:11 38:15 44:21 50:10 55:14 58:24 63:14 66:4 (10)
68:7,8 (10)	regarding 8:15 39:6 48:10 57:7 59:16 64:19 (6)	remember 13:16
rearended 43:5	regardless 17:9 18:11	remotely 6 3:3
reask 50:18	10gur 1105 1777 10711	Temotory 0 515

	December 11, 2024	93
remove 62:22 63:10	reside 64:16 65:23 66:11	51:8,12 52:7,21 (15)
renew 7:17 50:24	residents 66:18	rights 25:20
renewal 41:23	residing 66:1	rimawidoster 2:8 26:19,22
rent 43:7	resolve 59:8	risen 9:4
rental 42:24 43:10,18	resources 19:15 47:12	risk 20:8 57:23 60:21 63:5 (4)
rentals 69:5	respectfully 30:12,13 47:6	risks 4:18 19:8 32:10 57:21 58:11 (5)
replacement 14:9	response 4:8 8:6 18:2 21:20 31:16,18 32:8,15 49:21 (9)	risky 45:11
reporter 70:8		
reporting 7:7 28:14 37:6	responsibilities 34:7 47:8	riverside 53:9
represent 59:20 68:25	responsibility 35:8 39:24,25 46:25 58:4 (5)	road 5:10 28:1 30:4
represented 68:21	responsible 33:24 36:15	roadway 6:14
represents 18:21 33:7 45:22	39:21 44:10 46:17 47:10 48:23 49:3 56:24 58:5 (10)	role 18:23 27:3
61:13 (4)		root 57:25
request 30:12	responsibly 43:16 rest 9:21 41:25 46:13 60:19	rose 2:18 63:20,21,22 66:5 67:6,12,17 (8)
requests 11:5 17:19 19:22 28:10 29:11 30:13 31:9 (7)	(4) restrictions 32:20	roundtable 29:6 30:13
require 6:21 15:9 17:17 31:7,10 48:21,24 49:1,19 58:11 65:13 (11)	result 30:10 56:23 60:18 65:22 (4)	61:10,13 (4) rule 4:8 11:23 18:10 19:7 20:7 22:1 25:16 30:1,5 32:9,19,20 42:18 43:15 45:7,9
required 7:6 22:12 31:18 37:16 48:22 (5)	results 58:14	47:7 49:17 55:21 61:14 62:3 65:5,13 66:5,18 67:14 (26)
requirement 6:24 10:9 17:6	reverse 62:25	rulemaking 5:18 58:3
19:10 26:12 30:4 63:4,10,16	rich 32:7	
(9)	rid 40:12 51:19	rules 5:12,19,25 6:11 7:16,18 8:15,18 12:3 13:4 14:13 15:9
requirements 4:11 7:4,11 12:24 25:24 28:9,14 33:14 34:3,11 35:24 46:20 47:14	ride 4:25 13:23 15:1,21,24 16:2 (6)	27:1 31:7,16,19 33:4 34:15,19,25 35:25 37:2,3,5,13,17 38:23 41:10 42:12 50:4 52:17 54:16 57:4
48:11 51:10 57:8,22 59:23 64:14 65:24 (20)	riders 14:10 18:4,11	42:13 50:4 53:17 54:16 57:4 62:16 64:9,10,18 68:1 (38)
requires 5:21 51:6	rides 8:21	run 24:2 32:25 63:3
research 42:18	riding 38:9 67:8	runs 44:11,12
reserve 52:7	right 11:10 14:3 17:7,24 18:6 22:10,23 23:21,25 26:1 30:24	ryan 2:4 14:15,16,16,19,19 16:16 27:21 (8)

	December 11, 2024	94
s 2:2,2	screen 8:9	serve 20:2 21:4 28:9 31:8 47:6 67:7 (6)
saddened 23:13	screwed 43:25	
safe 4:16,25 16:11 21:2 (4)	season 4:17	service 8:24 9:13 12:19,25 17:20,25 18:7 19:12 20:10,24 23:8 29:15 32:10 45:20 47:5
safely 16:13 46:5	seatbelt 16:17,18 27:19	(15)
safer 5:13 45:13	seats 27:20	serviced 10:18
safest 5:10 43:5	second 6:5 34:22 42:23 48:24 49:16,19 51:1 (7)	services 7:20 9:6 10:3 18:12 19:1 29:8 34:8 36:10 37:10
safety 7:2 47:21 53:22 57:17,19 61:19 64:8 (7)	secondary 49:21,24,25 51:2,16,17 (6)	49:5,6 53:18 56:18 58:13 64:8 (15)
said 14:23 16:7,19 23:16		serving 17:19
24:5,25 25:2 27:21 28:18 29:16 30:17 36:19 42:13 63:16 68:11 (15)	seconds 16:14 21:9 35:10 38:14 44:20 50:9 55:13 58:23 63:13 66:3 (10)	set 35:24 70:16
		setting 35:15
sake 60:3	secret 30:8	several 13:18 54:2
same 16:6 35:25 50:4,18 51:10 68:18 (6)	sector 29:25 30:21 45:23 46:13 47:3 (5)	share 8:9 9:16,19 11:5 24:23 55:5 (6)
sarah 15	secure 16:12 62:18	
satisfy 34:2	securements 16:16	sharing 60:9
savings 43:20	securing 27:13	she 13:20 23:13 68:16
saw 21:18 31:24	security 54:18	sherryl 11:15 68:14
say 26:14 29:9 42:10 51:13	sedan 65:11	shift 46:25
54:6 (5)		shining 29:14
saying 23:15 39:7	see 9:17,24 14:17 26:3 33:11 42:25 52:8 61:1 (8)	shop 43:6
says 16:5	seems 26:5	short 8:4 19:25 49:3
scene 5:5	seen 9:19 11:4 17:11 29:17 42:17 (5)	shorten 59:11
scheduled 6:10		shorthand 70:8
scheme 44:5	seldom 16:5	shot 52:15
school 5:7	sell 24:25	should 15:25 17:8,21 26:1,6,9
scott 2:16 55:25 56:6 68:10	send 46:15	35:12 36:23 39:8 41:6 45:5 50:3 51:2 63:8 68:23 (15)
(4)	senior 26:23	shouldn't 51:8 52:1
scrap 34:24	sense 24:3 38:20 55:21	show 9:21 14:4 15:1 42:13

62:13 (5)	slide 10:5	sorrentino 16 4:13
showcasing 54:14	slides 8:13 9:21 10:6	sorry 8:1 29:3 40:9 56:2 68:16 (5)
shows 9:16 10:5,13 29:18 (4)	slightly 8:25	
side 23:5,5 39:13 40:2 (4)	small 18:22 19:9 20:9 47:12	sort 53:19
sides 39:5	(4)	sparse 48:12
sign 3:6	smaller 19:14 20:20	speak 3:24 16:25 42:11 59:23 (4)
signature 70:20	smooth 13:10	speaker 3:17 11:18 12:7
signed 3:24	so 4:20 8:17,22 9:4,10,14,18,21 10:2 12:25	14:14 16:14,22 18:15 21:9 24:20 26:19 28:25 30:25
significant 17:11 19:11 46:11 66:24 (4)	13:2,4 16:1 21:23 22:3,12,23 23:3,20,22,24 24:14,17 25:2 26:20 28:23 29:20 30:9 31:16 32:19 33:11 35:24 39:3,18	32:18,22 35:10 36:4 38:14 42:8 44:20 45:16 48:3 50:9 53:6 55:13,25 58:23 59:18 61:7 63:13,20 66:3 67:21 (32)
significantly 18:1 37:22 64:14	40:1,6,20,23 41:21 43:22 48:19 49:16 51:4,9,18,21 52:5	speakers 3:7,21
similar 8:24 10:5 65:24	60:11,14,21 61:4,18 62:11,16,25 63:11 67:14,18	speaking 3:9 36:7 68:25 69:4
simon 2:7 24:21,22 25:14,18 (5)	68:2,10,21,25 69:3 (63)	(4)
simone 70:8	sole 39:17	special 3:21
simplified 22:22	solution 39:15 41:8 43:2,13 48:16 (5)	specific 45:9
simplifying 7:12	solutions 36:22,23 55:17	speeding 5:6
simply 11:5 40:16 54:7	57:14 58:2 59:16 (6)	spend 43:20
simulcasted 3:4	solve 34:16 35:9 38:21 51:18 59:1 (5)	spiral 26:11
since 9:17 10:1,9,16 12:19	solvency 39:7 40:22 58:4	split 50:8,13
17:9 33:1 44:19 51:14 65:2 67:20 (11)	62:22,22 63:1,2,16 (8)	spoke 62:6
	solvent 35:7 48:23 49:2 51:23	spontaneous 15:3,6
single 7:12 48:25 49:20	58:5 (5)	ss 70:5
sir 21:17 25:13,15,15 39:3 (5)	some 4:20 5:15 13:16,24 21:21 23:7 39:7 40:2 44:4	stability 7:23 20:1
situation 23:20 41:3 54:12 60:19 62:23 (5)	62:15 67:15 68:1 (12)	stabilize 53:19
six 9:12	someone 14:5 something 5:20 15:4 22:18	stable 11:6 34:17 35:5,19 36:24 (5)
skirt 49:25	25:2 (4)	stakeholders 5:22 41:12
slack 42:2	sometimes 16:6 27:14,19,21,24 (5)	42:20 45:8 47:16 (5)

		-
standard 17:18 22:8 23:6 44:16 (4)	25:6,12 26:15,17 27:24 43:22 (9)	successful 22:3,4
standards 34:6,10 35:15	streethail 25:20	successfully 36:17
stands 17:15	streets 20:20 36:24 41:14 42:4 45:14 (5)	such 7:7 19:19 22:19 29:9,24 36:23 47:12 53:25 54:23 55:8 58:7 62:11 66:9 (13)
start 4:16 68:24		
started 9:3	strengthens 63:7	suffering 60:18
starting 23:6	strict 37:13 39:8	sufficient 58:21
state 3:13 5:2 6:19 7:19,22	stricter 17:18 18:1 19:25 39:8,12 (5)	suggest 60:19
20:5 29:6 30:9 33:8,13 36:9,15,22 37:13,22 38:19	strictly 11:19	suited 39:25
40:24 41:12 44:6,9 47:9	·	summary 8:17
49:4,11 51:6 54:1,13,24 61:11,16 70:5,9 (31)	strikes 20:23	superintendent 6:23
state's 37:23 38:4,19	stringent 12:24	superior 62:12
	strong 17:4	-
statement 70:11	strongest 49:18	support 7:22 12:20 17:4 19:6 26:25 28:13,14 31:5 32:15
staten 15:18	strongly 46:7 61:14 63:11	37:1 40:12 46:6 47:11,13 52:6 53:14 54:24 56:21 58:10,12
states 53:20,21 59:4 65:2,3,23		61:14 (21)
(6)	structure 54:23	supported 36:17 54:13
stats 15:14	structures 54:21	supporting 55:5 59:24
step 7:2 17:20 33:5 38:1	study 45:7 57:25	
53:21 (5)	subject 24:24 25:25 37:13,15	sure 21:16 51:15 67:15
stepping 63:3	38:18 (5)	surplus 34:22 35:21 40:3,12 44:7 (5)
stiffer 5:7	submission 46:20	
still 17:13 30:14 50:23 68:14	submitted 3:18 67:18	surprising 42:21
(4)	submitting 7:7	surrender 66:23
stipulate 64:18		surveillance 57:17
stop 35:13 41:15	subpoena 49:8	sustainability 27:6
stopped 5:6	subsidies 23:19	sustainable 21:7
strain 20:9 21:7 24:10 66:24	subsidy 20:4	suv 65:11
(4) stram 20.9 21.7 24.10 00.24	substantial 37:12	
stranded 15:18 31:21	succeed 43:10	swoop 49:14
street 15:20 16:10 24:14	successes 31:25	system 5:3 13:16 57:24

In Re Public Hearing NYC - Taxi & Limousine Commission December 11, 2024

systematic 55:9	thank 4:3 6:6 8:8 10:24 11:11	thoughts 24:23,24 39:10
t 70:2,2	12:13 14:11,13,14,19 16:21,24 18:13,14 21:11,14 24:17,18,22	thousands 42:24 43:1 56:15
take 4:21,21 10:25 16:7 33:5 42:23 50:16 51:22 54:10 57:11,13 58:21 62:24 67:14,24 (15)	26:17,18,20,20 28:23 30:22,24 32:16,17 36:3 39:2,4 42:6,7,9,10 45:14,15 48:1,2,9 53:2,4 55:23,24 56:5 59:14,17 61:4,6 63:11,17,19,25	58:15 (4) threatens 56:15 three 3:16 11:19 16:6
taken 56:14 70:11	67:9,10,12,17,18,23 68:2 69:6,7,8,10 (64)	35:13,24 38:3 43:3 44:10 51:7 60:10 (10)
takes 15:5 26:4	their 5:12 6:7 14:25 20:1,2,16 26:11 31:11 32:3 39:20,24	threshold 9:5,24
taking 33:9	43:6 46:16,17 49:2,7 56:16,17 60:3,5 65:6,8 66:13,23 68:4	10:6,11,19,23 19:5,15,16 20:8,23 21:6 (12)
talk 28:24 31:13 48:19	(25)	thresholds 9:22 10:1,14 19:25 57:22 (5)
talking 52:9	them 6:6 7:21 13:24 14:7 22:23 27:10,24 32:16 34:15	thriving 47:24
taxi 2 7:23 13:4,13,21 14:2 25:3 48:5 64:12 (9)	43:2 46:15 53:11 55:3 57:6 60:4 62:11,13 67:25 (18)	through 7:12 8:13 11:15 24:1,9,11 35:21 37:7,18 41:16
taxis 12:17 13:6,17 14:22 25:17,22,23 (7)	themselves 68:10,20,24	53:18 61:16 (12)
team 6:4 49:7 54:15 67:15 (4)	there's 9:18 25:1 39:22	throughout 36:18 64:5
technology 19:12 47:13	therefore 20:22 30:12 37:24 63:11 (4)	tightened 16:1
		tightening 31:15 32:15
telematics 57:16	these 5:8,12 7:6,9,16 8:13 12:3 14:13 18:7,22 19:17 20:2	time 4:6,17 11:19,22 12:21,24
tell 62:6	24:12 27:17,18 31:15,20 33:3 34:7 36:22 37:19 41:23 42:13	16:1,4,11 21:20 24:19 26:3 31:16,25 33:1,5 39:1 46:24,24
tens 43:1 44:24 56:15 58:15 (4)	46:8,25 47:18,22 54:3 55:2 57:14 65:3,8,16 67:3,25 (35)	50:19 52:13 53:3 57:11 59:8,14 67:9 69:9,11 (28)
term 57:8 58:13	thing 25:10 62:21 68:19	timeframe 15:25
terms 37:20 49:18	things 52:9	timeline 59:12
testified 20:16 68:9	think 22:16 23:7 31:14 32:23 33:11 39:11,14,15,18	timely 15:16 18:7 20:18 57:19 (4)
testify 3:5 12:14,23 14:11 21:12 31:4 48:9 56:6 63:25 (9)	41:6,7,10,13,25 42:3 43:22 50:21 51:7,12,23 52:12,13 68:5 (23)	times 4:9 8:6,16,18 9:23 10:14 16:6 17:12,13 18:2 26:6
testimony 3:15,16,19 11:18,21 21:18 25:18 39:5,5 (9)	third 32:25	28:2 31:5,11,16,18,22 32:2,8,15 43:8 44:11 56:17 (23)
Abor 15.0 16 7 17 10 00 4	thomas 16	t imin - 20.15
than 15:8 16:7 17:13 22:4 30:10 31:12 32:9 33:15 36:14 43:11,13 44:12 46:22 49:20 52:17 65:12 (16)	those 15:14,20 17:14 23:9 27:4 40:8 43:15 50:22 52:5,8 64:15 65:3,12 66:12 67:17 (15)	timing 20:15 tip 6:1

tips 4:25	training 4:24 22:15 27:12 47:13 57:20 (5)	41:15 43:3 48:20 51:15 52:9 (9)
tlc 4:21 5:9 6:8 7:7,15 18:10 27:3,7,9 28:3,8 31:13 32:25	trainings 27:17,19	types 33:13
33:7,19,23,23 34:9,11,21 35:8,22 36:20 37:6 40:21 42:17 43:14 45:6 47:20	transacted 33:13	typical 9:9
53:14,19 54:4,15 55:21 56:10,14 59:22 63:4 64:12,16	transcript 70:10	uber 8:22 9:24 10:11 13:21 14:3 15:16,17 19:2 26:2,3,3,5
65:6,11,17 67:2 (44)	transit 7:17 19:23 50:19 54:11 60:7 65:14 (6)	27:23 (13)
tlc's 3:4 4:8 7:10 12:20 17:5 45:24 (6)	transition 13:10	uber's 16:9
tlclicensed 6:16 7:11	transitional 29:25	ultimately 18:4 20:11 39:24 60:17 (4)
today 3:9 4:12 8:12 12:1,23 16:25 19:3 21:12 29:18	transport 34:14	unacceptable 17:15
31:4,24 32:14 34:16 36:7 48:13,19 49:24 52:18 53:3	transportation 15:3 17:1,7 18:12 20:13 21:3 31:23 32:8	unadmitted 51:16,18
59:14,22 62:6 64:1 68:2,4 (25)	47:25 63:23 64:2,4 (12)	unclaimed 54:10
today's 3:1 4:2 6:10 11:23 38:16 55:7 (6)	travel 32:11	under 4:19 5:4 8:18,19 9:2,6,25 10:4,8,18,21 17:19
together 51:15 59:1	traveling 31:23	22:12 28:11 31:9 40:14,18 45:25 56:22 66:9 (20)
told 15:19 34:23	treatment 26:9	underlying 58:6
too 5:11 15:25 25:1,1 (4)	tremendously 9:11	undermining 20:11
top 8:2	trend 9:1	underneath 27:20
toss 51:6	trends 9:22	underserved 18:24
total 11:4,6	trigger 60:22	understand 40:10 45:24
totally 15:13	trip 9:6,16 10:3 11:5 19:5 (5)	52:21 63:9 (4)
tourists 35:2	trips 9:15,19 10:20 11:6 15:10,20 18:3 (7)	understanding 40:15 42:14 55:1
toward 15:6	true 21:24,25 23:15 70:10 (4)	undertake 5:20
toyota 28:4	truly 12:25	undertaking 57:24
tracking 7:5	try 15:21 22:25 23:5,9 (4)	unfair 37:19,21
trade 35:22	trying 15:17 23:25 24:2 43:11 51:13 (5)	unfunded 33:22,25 35:3
traditional 30:7,8,21	tucked 27:19	unidentified 16:14 21:9 35:10 38:14 44:20 50:9 55:13 58:23
traffic 6:20 19:19	two 10:10,22 34:19 35:19	63:13 66:3 (10)

December 11, 2024 99		
uninformed 42:15	used 3:23 68:11	view 37:3
unintended 21:4 30:20 67:13	user 14:20 15:5	vin 7:8
unit 8:12	users 6:14 13:22 16:10 17:13 31:20 (5)	violations 5:4
unleash 25:8	using 21:1 25:19 27:14	virtue 38:2
unless 32:8	vacuum 58:14	vision 4:23
unmute 11:17 12:10 29:1	value 37:11 54:14	vital 36:17
56:1 (4)		voice 17:4
unnecessary 43:19 64:10	variety 22:22 23:4	vote 12:3 30:13 63:12
unpredictable 19:20	various 57:1	voyager 69:5
unreasonable 49:8	vehicle 4:9,21,22 6:16,20,25 15:3 16:8,11 17:6,25 28:3	vtl 6:19
unsecured 38:11	31:9,18,21 32:6 33:18,25 43:9 46:22 64:13,20,25	vulnerable 20:11 38:12 55:3
unstable 38:11	65:18,20,21,24 66:9,17,21 (30)	wait 8:16,18 9:23 10:13 12:21
unsustainable 19:9	vehicles 4:10,11 6:12 7:11 8:7 9:13 15:19 17:14 20:17 22:15	15:7 16:6 17:11,13 26:3 31:5,25 32:2 56:17 (14)
until 14:9 34:5 66:15	24:13 25:20 28:10,22 31:6,20,24 43:21 45:25	waiting 26:6
up 3:6,24 6:6 8:22 10:2 11:22 13:24 14:4,14 15:1 16:1 21:19	46:5,17 56:10 65:4,7,9,25 66:2,9,12,12,20 (31)	waittime 9:22 17:6,10
24:14,20 25:5 26:2 32:22 41:23 42:2 50:19 52:8 58:17	velazquez 18 8:1	walker 27:15
60:3,21 61:7 65:12 68:15 (27)	vermont 44:22	walking 8:12
update 17:17	version 67:25	want 4:24 5:16 6:3 8:3 13:2
updated 46:3	versus 51:23	15:11 16:1 22:11 24:4 25:3 27:12 28:17 30:14 33:5 40:7
upfront 6:1	very 15:6 21:5,22,22 23:12,13	42:10,23 52:11,16 62:6 67:13 (21)
upright 15:8	25:9 26:17 30:22 36:19 39:4 48:13 49:15 52:14 56:5	wanting 27:10 29:22
urge 12:23 13:3,8,14 14:8 18:10 20:6 32:16 46:7 63:11	62:20,20 63:17 67:18 (19)	wants 14:5
(10)	via 6 3:3,8	warning 11:20
us 9:5 13:8 16:18 23:3,3,19 27:8 28:7 29:8,10,21,24	victim 60:6	washington 13:25
43:16,25 45:13 (15)	victims 5:11	wav 8:13,18,20
usage 31:22	video 3:10,19 12:1 57:16 (4)	9:6,10,10,16,20,23 10:3,20 11:4 15:7,10,13 17:13,18,19
use 13:3 14:5,8 15:2 17:14 20:9 27:2 43:10 (8)	videoconference 6	19:2,4 20:3,10 21:1 23:22 25:20,24 26:3,5 28:10,10

29:11,15 30:1,2,3,14 (36)	whereof 70:16	without 6:3 13:20 42:18 43:3 45:7 47:15 54:9,24 55:19 67:1
wavs 9:2 12:6 17:12,24 19:19 26:12 27:3 30:6 (8)	wherever 16:2	68:9 (11)
way 13:11 14:25 17:16 24:2,3 31:14 36:1 46:8 50:6 55:11 70:14 (11)	which 6:19,21 11:4 12:17 17:17 18:21 19:14 20:23 21:20 22:8 23:1 24:9 25:16 27:20 28:5 33:3 38:24 43:25	witness 70:16 wollney 2:16 55:25 56:1,2,5,6 58:25 68:10 (8)
ways 23:4	46:10,15 47:16 51:21 57:15 58:11 (24)	won't 33:1
we'll 51:22 67:11	while 5:8 10:11 11:6 19:6 21:3 33:21 35:3 46:5,6,23	wonderful 27:8
we're 22:17	47:21 (11)	words 29:14 34:25 40:11
we've 5:2,15 17:11 39:4 42:17 (5)	who 4:19 6:4,7 8:4 13:17 17:14 20:9 23:6,9 25:6 31:20 32:1,15 43:8,16 56:8,17	work 5:6 6:7 7:21 13:8 22:10 36:13 59:1 60:3 (8)
weakest 41:4	60:2,14 62:5,16 64:15 65:8,22 66:11,19 68:25 (27)	worked 23:14
website 3:4 6:9 11:24	whole 5:3	workers' 29:7 61:11
welcome 4:7 46:3	whopping 33:20	working 15:5 47:20 55:15
well 7:17 11:5 14:21 23:13 25:18,20 39:24 51:14 67:11,23	why 8:5 24:5,9 25:21 26:1	workplace 5:13
68:4 (11)	33:3 37:1 40:6 54:15 55:12 62:12 (11)	works 14:6 40:25 53:10
what 5:14 14:23 15:11,12 16:4,5,7 21:23,24 22:4	widelyused 28:7	worse 54:5
23:7,8,15,16,24 25:6 26:8 28:17 29:16 39:10,11 40:24 42:17 49:24 50:18 51:19	wild 34:3	worst 33:4 60:6 would 7:14,25 11:8 13:22,24
52:8,18 63:9 65:13 68:12,20 (32)	will 3:11,12,16,20,24 4:3 5:24 6:4 7:16 8:4,12 9:7	14:1 16:7 17:17 19:17,25 27:1 31:7 38:9,10,23 39:11 40:7
wheelchair 8:6 12:18 13:22 14:20 15:4 16:10,13 17:5	11:14,18,19,20,21 12:2,5,7,23 13:12 16:4 18:2 21:1 22:7 25:25 26:11 30:5,10	42:1 43:18 44:4,5 48:21 49:3,14,19 50:16,17 65:13,25 69:1 (30)
27:15 31:6,8 (11) wheelchairaccessible 4:10	32:10,13,22 33:15,16,24 34:4,16,16 38:1 45:11 48:19,24 51:15 52:6,22,23	wouldn't 62:17
18:3	54:5,5 57:4,8,11,17,20,22 58:2,9,11,14,17 59:8,11,23	write 38:8
wheelchairs 27:14	60:21 61:1,2,20 62:21 63:2 64:10 65:15 66:20 67:14 68:2	writing 3:18 34:21 45:5 59:3 (4)
when 3:10,13,18,23 11:16,22 14:3,4,5 15:12,21,24 24:25 29:15 31:22 32:7 34:20 41:23 42:11,17 62:18 (21)	69:9 (75) wish 4:16 67:21	written 12:2 41:4 57:15 66:10 67:11,18 (6)
where 14:1 19:23 22:6,11	wishing 3:5	wrong 29:22
41:3 62:8 (6)	within 8:21 29:12,12 36:20 55:9 70:9,10 (7)	x 4 26:3

yankey 2:10 12:22 30:25 31:1,2 32:18 (6)	3:9,10,11,12,13,14,19,19,22 4:3,24 11:16,17,18,21,22 13:4	200000 59:22
yeah 51:4 52:1,8	14:12 21:18 24:19 29:1 31:18 34:2 39:1,10 48:1 50:20 51:1 52:11 52:2 56:1 50:14	12112024 70:11
year 4:15,17 5:15,24,25 8:25 9:4,17,18,18 10:1,2,16 31:12	52:11 53:3 56:1 59:14 67:9,11,19,24 (36)	
60:11 (15)	zero 4:23	
yearly 9:16	zeroemission 27:3	
years 9:12 10:10,22 13:7,11,18 15:5 17:24 22:17	zone 5:6 35:22	
23:2,14 24:25 35:23 36:11,18 40:5 44:2 56:8 (18)	zoom 6 3:3,8,22 (4)	
yellow 12:18 13:4,13,21 14:5	247 36:2	
26:8 (6)	250 18:21 36:13	
yellows 26:10	339 9:13	
yes 12:11,11,11 14:18 18:17 24:3 26:20 52:20 56:4 (9)	365 36:2	
yet 17:12	1005 8	
yield 4:4	1006 4:7	
yk 20	1122 69:9,11	
york 1 5:2 6:17,18,23 7:19	1996 12:19	
14:21 17:3 18:12 20:5,6 25:5 26:24 28:5 29:6,13 32:5	2019 9:3,12 10:20 17:11 (4)	
33:1,7,9,14,16 34:9,9 35:2,6,17 36:9,11,21,22,24 37:9 38:4	2020 9:17 10:1,16	
41:14 42:5 43:14,19 44:6,9 49:4 56:10,11,20 58:12 59:5	2022 10:2,9	
61:11 64:6,11 65:4,17,17 66:1,6,7 70:5,9 (57)	2023 8:20	
yorkauthorized 6:25	2024 11 8:22,23 9:13,14,19 70:17 (7)	
yorkers 17:9 28:20 43:2 47:25 (4)	3934 65:19	
yorklicensed 36:14	6000 17:23	
you're 4:20 22:1,20 23:15	7600 9:14	
26:8 34:20 35:4 (7)	8500 9:15	
you've 45:4 67:16	19502 66:8	
your	25000 60:12	