

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

NEW YORK CITY  
TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION  
PUBLIC HEARING

-----X

January 9, 2025  
10:03 a.m.

HELD VIA ZOOM VIDEOCONFERENCE

B E F O R E:  
DAVID DO  
COMMISSIONER AND CHAIR

Court Reporter: Elbia Brumit

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 A P P E A R A N C E S :

2

3 T L C C O M M I S S I O N E R S :

4 C O M M I S S I O N E R D A V I D D O

5 C O M M I S S I O N E R T H O M A S S O R R E N T I N O

6 C O M M I S S I O N E R S A R A H K A U F M A N

7 C O M M I S S I O N E R E L I S A V E L A Z Q U E Z

8 C O M M I S S I O N E R K E N N E T H Y . K . C H A N

9 C O M M I S S I O N E R P A U L B A D E R

10 C O M M I S S I O N E R K E N N E T H C . M I T C H E L L

11 C O M M I S S I O N E R A N D R E A B I E R S T E I N

12 G E N E R A L C O U N S E L S H E R R Y L E L U T O

13

14 P R E S E N T E R S :

15 E V A N H I N E S , D E P U T Y C O M M I S S I O N E R O F O P E R A T I O N

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MODERATOR: Good morning.  
Today's public hearing is about to begin. This hearing is being conducted remotely via Zoom and is being simulcasted to the TLC's website, live stream and Facebook account.

All persons wishing to testify will ask to sign up in advance of the hearing. All registered speakers are joining the meeting via Zoom. If you are speaking today, your audio and video are automatically muted. When your name is called, the moderator will activate your account and you will have control of your camera and microphone. When ready, please state your name and affiliation and then proceed with your testimony.

Public testimony will be limited to three minutes per speaker. Any additional comments may be submitted in writing to the Commission. When your testimony is complete, your audio

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

4

1 and video will be muted by the  
2 moderator. A special note for our  
3 registered speakers, please ensure  
4 that your display name in the Zoom  
5 meeting matches the name that you used  
6 when you signed up to speak. This  
7 will enable the moderator to confirm  
8 that you are present in the meeting.

9 Closed Captioning is available  
10 for today's meeting. Thank you for  
11 your attention. I will now yield the  
12 floor to our Commissioner and Chair,  
13 David Do.

14 COMMISSIONER DO: Good morning,  
15 everyone. Welcome to today's public  
16 hearing on TLC's proposed rule  
17 packages. One, increasing the upfront  
18 taxi improvement fund payments for  
19 conversion to wheelchair accessible  
20 vehicles. And two, our second hearing  
21 on the interior advertising provider  
22 licenses for for-hire vehicles.

23 Today, I am joined by  
24 Commissioner Sorrentino, Mitchell,  
25 Velazquez, Kaufman, Chan, Bader and

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Bierstein.

First off, I'd like to wish everyone a happy new year. It's been an eventful full week of what promises to be an incredible busy year. For those who didn't catch it, there was some social media video of the first vehicle tolled passing into the congestion zone, and that was at Broadway. And that first vehicle was a TLC's licensed EV. There are, understandably, mixed feelings about the new tolls. But we are hoping that that's a good omen. If traffic moves faster and peoples utilize other options instead of their own vehicles to move in and out of the zone, that can mean more trips to TLC drives. We fought for an exemption for TLC vehicles, which have already been subject to various MTA tolls. We got it down to 75 cents for taxicab trips and a dollar 50 for FHV. Which through arrangements with the technology service providers can be

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

6

1 passed onto passengers, much lower  
2 rates than were initially proposed.

3 We'll be watching the situation  
4 very closely to see how that impacts  
5 trips and driver earnings. Getting  
6 more money into the pockets of  
7 hard-working New Yorkers has always  
8 been a priority of Mayor Adams, and  
9 both of the proposed rules we'll be  
10 discussing today is meant to do just  
11 that.

12 I'd like to thank our TLC  
13 policy, finance and legal teams for  
14 putting their hard work in on these  
15 proposals. A great deal of detail  
16 analysis goes into rulemaking. Along  
17 with a lot of back and forth with  
18 stakeholders. We take public comments  
19 incredibly seriously and the hearing  
20 reflects that.

21 We held a public hearing on the  
22 proposed rules for interior  
23 advertising back in August, got a lot  
24 of feedback, and we went back to the  
25 drawing board to incorporate a lot of

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 your comments. We are going to do  
2 that again today, so without further  
3 ado, here's what's on the table.

4 Our first proposal is the  
5 implementation of Local Laws 53 and 56  
6 of 2024, which amended the New York  
7 City's Administrative Code in relation  
8 to interior advertising in for-hire  
9 vehicles and compensation derived from  
10 such advertising revenue by for-hire  
11 vehicle drivers. The proposed rules  
12 will establish a formal procedure for  
13 the licensing and supervision of  
14 businesses that are approved with  
15 electronic tablets and software for  
16 interior advertising, including  
17 appropriate penalties for violations  
18 of these rules.

19 Today's proposal also  
20 establishes a framework to assess and  
21 access the gross revenue generated by  
22 each license provider through each  
23 device. TLC will be able to examine  
24 the compensation received by drivers  
25 and adjust the rate of compensation as

1 necessary. Also proposed are  
2 technical requirements for approved  
3 tablets and software to ensure a  
4 comfortable passenger experience.

5 Our second proposal today is  
6 intended to improve wheelchair  
7 accessible taxicab service by changing  
8 how the Taxi Improvement Fund is  
9 administered. Some of you may recall  
10 we were originally looking into this  
11 back in May, but it wasn't feasible at  
12 the time because we were seeking more  
13 clarity from the court on steps we  
14 would have to take regarding the Taxis  
15 For All litigation, which requires  
16 fifty percent of city's taxicab fleet  
17 to be wheelchair accessible.

18 We asked the Court for more time  
19 out of concern that rushing through  
20 WAV conversions would negatively  
21 impact a sector already hit hard by  
22 the medallion crisis and a global  
23 pandemic. The judge declined our  
24 request and in September, we were  
25 ordered to make 100 percent of all



In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 taxi Hack-Ups wheelchair accessible.  
2 And we moved quickly within our roles  
3 to do just that. So that, one,  
4 50 percent of our active fleet would  
5 be accessible by March, and two, with  
6 further goal post required all --  
7 excuse me, requiring half of all  
8 issued medallions to be accessible by  
9 2028. We are absolutely committed to  
10 increasing accessibility, and this is  
11 a federal court order. We must  
12 comply. And we have a very narrow  
13 path forth.

14 So how do we do this? One  
15 hundred percent WAV hack-ups isn't  
16 just possible with the current system  
17 of TIF distributions. We need to give  
18 owners of fleet more money upfront,  
19 which means more options. At the same  
20 time, we have to keep the TIF fund  
21 solvent. As the number of WAVs  
22 increases, so does the drag on the  
23 fund under the current distribution  
24 system, making the fund itself  
25 unsustainable. So we proposed

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 eliminating the maintenance payments  
2 so that owners and the one-dollar  
3 incentive payment to drivers in  
4 exchange for increasing the grant  
5 payment for WAV conversions from  
6 14,000 to 35,000.

7 I can also say, and I want to be  
8 very clear on this, for existing grant  
9 recipients who have received the  
10 \$14,000, will provide quarterly  
11 operational payments of up to 4,000  
12 per year over a four-year consecutive  
13 period. This can total up to \$30,000  
14 as long as a vehicle meets minimum  
15 qualifications, including trips. This  
16 will help make WAV taxis more  
17 affordable for owners and encourage  
18 owners to put more WAVs on the road.  
19 We believe this is necessary for TLC  
20 to comply with the federal court order  
21 and to bring stability to the TIF fund  
22 and the industry.

23 To walk us through this, I will  
24 now ask Evan Hines, our Deputy  
25 Commissioner for Operations, People

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

11

1 and Innovation give a short  
2 presentation on the proposed changes  
3 to our TIF rules.

4 Evan?

5 MR. HINES: Thank you,  
6 Commissioner. Just a second. Sorry  
7 about that.

8 Okay. So as the commissioner  
9 mentioned, my name is Evan Hines. I'm  
10 Deputy Commissioner for Operations,  
11 People and Innovation at the Taxi &  
12 Limousine Commission. The TIF program  
13 falls under my purview, and I'm going  
14 to give an overview of Taxi  
15 Improvement Fund changes proposed.

16 The Court decision, the Taxi For  
17 All court decision will have a  
18 negative, very negative impact on the  
19 fund if the current TIF program  
20 remains as is. It just would not be  
21 sustainable to keep the 14,000-dollar  
22 Hack-Up payment, the 1,000-dollar  
23 quarterly operational payments and the  
24 one-dollar per-trip driver payment.  
25 On this slide, you can see, we would

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 go by the end of this calendar year,  
2 \$6 million in the hole. We would be  
3 negative 6,000,000 and it would  
4 continue to increase to over  
5 \$100 million in the red comes by  
6 December 31, 2029.

7 So seeing that, we knew we had  
8 to find a new self-sufficient model  
9 and in developing the model, we wanted  
10 to keep in mind the following  
11 objectives. We did not want to  
12 increase the one-dollar trip TIF  
13 surcharge that's currently charged to  
14 passengers. Any new model should not  
15 require City funding. We wanted to  
16 increase the Hack-Up grants to offset  
17 owners' costs with converting to WAV  
18 vehicles. We want to incentivize  
19 compliance with the Taxis For All  
20 federal court order by giving as large  
21 of a grant as possible. And we wanted  
22 the program to continue even after we  
23 meet the court order's 50 percent to  
24 have attractive incentives to keep the  
25 WAV levels at or above 50 percent

1 going forward.

2 So the program that we  
3 recommended, that we are recommending  
4 is in the rural package today that's  
5 proposed would increase Hack-Up grants  
6 from the current \$14,000 to \$35,000.  
7 How we came up with \$35,000, it's  
8 nearly the estimated difference  
9 between a WAV and non-WAV vehicle, and  
10 the highest amount that we'd be able  
11 to afford. And again, the large  
12 upfront grant demonstrates that TLC is  
13 making our best efforts to achieve  
14 50 percent of WAV vehicles.

15 The new program will eliminate  
16 the ongoing operational grants to  
17 owners. The reason why we have to do  
18 that is operational payments will  
19 skyrocket from \$15 million today to  
20 \$27 million annually. That  
21 \$27 million accounts for 75 percent of  
22 annual TIF revenue that we receive.  
23 35,000-dollar Hack-Up grant is equal  
24 to the current 14,000-dollar Hack-Up  
25 grant and just over five years or 21

1           quarters of operational payments that  
2           owners would have received in the old  
3           program. This 21,000-dollar increase  
4           is guaranteed cash upfront rather than  
5           potential quarterly payments that  
6           requires a minimum number of trips as  
7           is the program today.

8                       We also determined that we would  
9           need to eliminate the ongoing trip  
10          grants to drivers. Driver payments  
11          would balloon from \$11.2 million today  
12          to \$26 million, which would account  
13          for 72 percent of annual TIF revenue.  
14          Bear in mind that the incentive --  
15          these incentives were put in place  
16          when only six percent of authorized  
17          medallions were WAVs. Today,  
18          44 percent of active medallions were  
19          WAVs and by the end of 2028, there  
20          will be 50 percent of authorized  
21          medallions.

22                      That's the presentation. And if  
23          there are any questions?

24                      COMMISSIONER DO: Commissioners,  
25          are there any questions for Evan?

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

15

1 COMMISSIONER BADER: Yes.

2 I'm just -- I'm looking at the  
3 revenue. I understand that -- I don't  
4 see where -- where we are getting  
5 any -- where do you anticipate there  
6 being revenue to offset the additional  
7 costs?

8 MR. HINES: The -- it's -- it's  
9 not -- it's not solely the increase in  
10 revenue. It's by decreasing the other  
11 types of grants. We are able to give  
12 the larger grant for the Hack-Up.

13 COMMISSIONER BADER: Right.  
14 Okay. So we are reducing the -- the  
15 payment schedule now that we've been  
16 giving out in addition to the  
17 14,000 -- 14,000 upfront, right?

18 MR. HINES: Yes.

19 COMMISSIONER DO: We are  
20 eliminating the operational payments,  
21 Commissioner, which is about a  
22 thousand dollars per -- per quarter  
23 over a certain period, plus the driver  
24 payments, which is a dollar per trip.

25 And just -- just to do the math,

1 right, currently, we are at 44 percent  
2 of the -- of the active fleet. But  
3 the authorized fleet brings that  
4 number to -- closer to 6700. And with  
5 more wheelchair accessible vehicles,  
6 every dollar that we bring in leaves  
7 us immediately. And so there is not a  
8 lot of extra dollars to go towards  
9 other parts of the program.

10 And so this program is to make  
11 it more sustainable. And so we have  
12 done the analysis, and we believe the  
13 35,000-dollar upfront payment makes  
14 this program more sustainable.

15 Evan, is there anything to add?

16 MR. HINES: No. That's --  
17 that's -- you've covered it. That's  
18 correct.

19 Any other questions from any  
20 Commissioners?

21 (No response.)

22 COMMISSIONER DO: Okay. Thank  
23 you, Evan. I'll turn it over to  
24 Sherryl to start today's public  
25 hearing.



1 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Good  
2 morning. When I call your name, you  
3 can unmute your microphone and begin  
4 your testimony. Each speaker will be  
5 allotted three minutes to speak. The  
6 time limit will be strictly enforced.  
7 A 30-second warning will be provided,  
8 and then you will need to  
9 conclude your testimony when your time  
10 limit is up.

11 Today's rule proposals were  
12 published in the city record and  
13 posted on our website on December 10,  
14 2024. The public comment period ends  
15 today. The video of this hearing and  
16 copies of all written comments will be  
17 provided to the Commissioners prior to  
18 the vote on these rules at the next  
19 Commission meeting.

20 With that, we will begin our  
21 public hearing. And the first one  
22 will be on the FHV interior advertiser  
23 provider license proposal.

24 Our first speaker will be  
25 Michael Chow, followed by Andrew

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

18

1 Greenblatt, followed by Brad Sayler.

2 So first speaker, Michael Chow  
3 of Dart Technologies. You can unmute.  
4 I've seen you've unmuted your mic, and  
5 you can begin.

6 MR. CHOW: Is the video on?

7 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: I don't see  
8 you. I hear you, but I don't see you.

9 MR. CHOW: Chair Do and members  
10 of the board of Commissioners, my name  
11 is Michael Chow, founder and CEO of  
12 Dart Technologies, a tech NYC start-up  
13 member headquartered in Manhattan and  
14 software provider of passenger media  
15 solutions for mobility operators.

16 On behalf of Dart Technologies,  
17 we reiterate our support from August  
18 14th for simplifying non-core  
19 requirements preventing providers and  
20 drivers from offering the best  
21 passenger experience possible. Our  
22 Local Laws 33 and 56 were intended to  
23 foster a vibrant market place of  
24 solutions. An arbitrary 15 percent  
25 advertising airtime requirement

1 stifles innovation and reduces  
2 provider viability by mandating  
3 operational complexity that neither  
4 serve drivers nor passengers as key  
5 stakeholders.

6 Any airtime requirement not only  
7 systemically burdens all providers  
8 with integration challenges, but some  
9 optimally limit the experience to  
10 TLC's predefined ad formats and aspect  
11 ratios available.

12 For instance, Dart delivers an  
13 optional media amenity via a  
14 standalone iPad app. Unlike the  
15 traditional taxi TV model with its  
16 single linear loop, our opt-in  
17 platform offers a premium inflight  
18 entertainment airline-style  
19 experience, featuring multiple content  
20 channels to explore and navigate on  
21 will. Based on mood such as Calm and  
22 Headspace for meditation.

23 This earned engagement approach  
24 prioritizes passenger choice over  
25 forced viewing a scheduled

1 interruptions in the form of  
2 third-party ad breaks.

3 We urge the Commission to  
4 reconsider such a requirement as  
5 overly prescriptive rules risk  
6 anchoring the industry and past  
7 paradigms. Instead, an outcome  
8 oriented approach will allow providers  
9 flexibility in supporting drivers,  
10 delivering five-star passenger  
11 satisfaction and ultimately a win-win  
12 for all stakeholders.

13 Thank you, board of  
14 Commissioners, for considering our  
15 perspective.

16 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

17 Our next speaker up will be  
18 Andrew Greenblatt from IDG.

19 MR. GREENBLATT: Hi, good  
20 morning, Commissioner Do and the Taxi  
21 & Limousine Commission members. My  
22 name is Andrew Greenblatt, and I'm the  
23 policy director of the Independent  
24 Drivers' Guild, also known as the IDG.  
25 I want to thank you for the

1 opportunity to testify today regarding  
2 the proposed regulations related to  
3 interior advertising. And I would  
4 particularly like to thank  
5 Councilmember Arias, for championing  
6 this important issue.

7 Back in August of this summer,  
8 we generally supported these new  
9 proposed regulations. We think they  
10 will bring a lot of income to drivers  
11 and we support them now. At that  
12 time, we recommended two important  
13 changes.

14 The first had to do with just  
15 how the drivers would be able to  
16 electronically sign the contracts. At  
17 the time, we asked the Commission to  
18 make a change to require any provider  
19 to make such contract then available  
20 to drivers in case there was any  
21 disputes, they would have a copy of  
22 their electronic contract. That  
23 change has now been included in the  
24 proposed regulations and we thank the  
25 Commission for that.

1                   The second and more important  
2                   change we talked about had to do with  
3                   tipping. In the original regulations,  
4                   it forbid any tipping to be done  
5                   through the tablets. Around the  
6                   country, what happens is providers  
7                   tend to partner with one of the app  
8                   providers, and then they can process  
9                   tips for those passengers. So if you  
10                  are partnered with Uber, you can  
11                  process tips for Uber passengers, with  
12                  Lyft passengers. It didn't require  
13                  any sort of credit card information to  
14                  be processed through the tablet.

15                  We recommended first looking  
16                  into whether or not there was some way  
17                  to process credit card payments  
18                  through the tablets. We looked into  
19                  it. We know you looked into it. We  
20                  spoke to providers and everybody  
21                  agrees that that would be too  
22                  complicated. We submitted secondary  
23                  testimony after the hearing where we  
24                  agreed that that wasn't a possibility  
25                  and instead urged that you allow

1 tipping to be done the way it's done  
2 in the rest of the country.

3 We've gotten reports from both  
4 the providers and drivers around the  
5 country that more than half of their  
6 revenue comes from the increase in  
7 tips that this provides. That change  
8 was made in the new proposed  
9 regulations, which would allow tipping  
10 to happen for passengers if they're  
11 passengers of a company that is  
12 affiliated with either Uber or Lyft.

13 So again, no credit card  
14 information being processed --

15 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
16 remaining.

17 MR. GREENBLATT: Thank you.

18 But you can still tip. With  
19 those two changes, we can now  
20 wholeheartedly support this important  
21 new proposal. We believe it will put  
22 money into the pockets of drivers who  
23 desperately need it, while providing  
24 entertainment for passengers.

25 Thank you very much for

1 listening to drivers and making these  
2 changes.

3 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
4 Andrew.

5 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Our next  
6 speaker is Brad Sayler from T-Mobile  
7 Advertising Solutions.

8 MR. SAYLER: Good morning. My  
9 name is Brad Sayler, and I serve as  
10 the head of Rideshare Media for  
11 Octopus Interactive, a subsidiary of  
12 T-Mobile USA.

13 Since 2018, Octopus has provided  
14 interior advertising screens to over a  
15 hundred thousand rideshare drivers  
16 nationwide, with more than 10,000  
17 drivers currently operating in and  
18 around New York City.

19 I would like to start by  
20 thanking the Commission for the most  
21 recent revisions to the proposed  
22 rules. These revisions addressed the  
23 majority of our concerns, and we just  
24 have a few final critical matters that  
25 we'd like to share today.



1                   As we previously highlighted, it  
2                   appears that certain rules pertain  
3                   more closely to taxi technology  
4                   systems and technology system  
5                   providers than they pertain to  
6                   interior advertising systems. It is  
7                   important to note that advertising  
8                   systems do not collect TSP data or  
9                   process payments, and therefore do not  
10                  expose personal information or payment  
11                  data or otherwise result in similar  
12                  risks.

13                  As a result, we believe the  
14                  interior advertising rules should  
15                  instead align with the simple yet  
16                  effective rules for rooftop  
17                  advertising fixture providers, as  
18                  rooftop displays are much more similar  
19                  to interior advertising systems.

20                  In particular, we continue to  
21                  have concerns over the extensive  
22                  insurance provisions and the  
23                  overreaching indemnification  
24                  requirements of the proposed rules.  
25                  These burdensome rules are not

1 commensurate with the risk posed by  
2 interior advertising display.  
3 Further, the system documentation and  
4 auto requirements will present a large  
5 costly hurdle for a product that  
6 presents very little technical risk.  
7 Instead, we propose using rules that  
8 align more closely with those  
9 governing rooftop advertising fixture  
10 providers.

11 Finally, as currently drafted,  
12 the rules regarding the use of  
13 passenger and device data would make  
14 operating in the city entirely  
15 impractical. For example, realtime  
16 vehicle location is an essential data  
17 point for ad serving, including for  
18 TLC provided content, and presents no  
19 privacy concern if not associated with  
20 a specific passenger.

21 On the other hand, when specific  
22 passengers can be identified, such as  
23 through Uber and Lyft data, then using  
24 certain passengers or ride information  
25 should be allowed if the passenger is

1 given a mechanism to control their  
2 privacy settings. This remains  
3 unclear in the revised rules.

4 Thank you, and we look forward  
5 to continuing the dialogue with the  
6 Commission.

7 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

8 That concludes the hearing on  
9 interior advertising.

10 Now we are switching gears to  
11 the Upfront TIF Payments proposal.

12 Our first speakers will be Peter  
13 Mazer, then Michael Simon and Anna  
14 Humphrey. So first up, Peter Mazer  
15 from the Metropolitan Taxicab Board of  
16 Trade.

17 MR. MAZER: Good morning,  
18 Chairman Do and members of the  
19 Commission. My name is Peter Mazer,  
20 and I am general counsel to  
21 Metropolitan Taxicab Board of Trade.  
22 We are a 70-year-old trade  
23 association, representing the owners  
24 and operators of licensed medallion  
25 taxicabs.

1                   We submitted extensive written  
2                   comments with respect to these rules,  
3                   and we ask that they be made a part of  
4                   the record. We are encouraged that  
5                   the TLC is recognizing the significant  
6                   financial hardship that the medallion  
7                   owners are facing through the  
8                   requirement that they -- excuse me --  
9                   requirement that they place expensive  
10                  WAV vehicle into service.

11                  The proposed increase will help  
12                  offset the cost of the vehicle, but we  
13                  regret that the Commission is forced  
14                  to eliminate the regular payments,  
15                  maintenance payments as well as the  
16                  payments to drivers. We encourage the  
17                  Commission to explore other options  
18                  where these payments can be made and  
19                  restored to our drivers and owners  
20                  that they can be made whole.

21                  I am encouraged by what I heard  
22                  this morning from the chairperson,  
23                  that the Commission is going to avoid  
24                  the situation where we have owners who  
25                  placed vehicles into service recently

1 and received a 14,000-dollar grant and  
2 would be placed at a competitive  
3 disadvantage if they were not allowed  
4 to continue to receive the maintenance  
5 payments. We hope that those  
6 maintenance payments will continue, as  
7 well as the payments to drivers at the  
8 time that these vehicles were placed  
9 into service. They anticipated that  
10 those payments would be -- would  
11 continue to be received.

12 We are particularly concerned  
13 about one particular -- one aspect of  
14 the rules, which would eliminate,  
15 allow us and only to receive funds  
16 only once every seven years. This  
17 brings a significant disadvantage to  
18 lease-to-own operators, most of whom  
19 operate on a three-year cycle where  
20 vehicles are placed into service and  
21 their vehicles are funded over a  
22 three-year period. At the end of the  
23 three-year period, the vehicle then  
24 is -- ownership is transferred to the  
25 driver, who would then leave the

1 agent. The agent then will no longer  
2 have a medallion, would no longer --  
3 would have the medallion but would not  
4 have the vehicle and would not be able  
5 to receive grant money. We encourage  
6 the Commission to reduce that  
7 seven-year period to only four years.

8 We are also concerned about the  
9 fact that the Commission can --

10 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
11 remaining.

12 MR. MAZER: Thank you.

13 That the Commission can deny  
14 applications, and there is no avenue  
15 for review. We urge that the -- that  
16 a process be developed so that we --  
17 there can be review of a chairperson's  
18 decision if a medallion owner is  
19 deemed ineligible for a grant.

20 These and other concerns that  
21 are in the rules are on contained in  
22 our written comments, and we urge the  
23 Commission to review them and we thank  
24 you for your consideration this  
25 morning.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

31

1 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

2 Our next speaker up is Michael  
3 Simon.

4 MR. SIMON: Hello, Commissioner.  
5 Can you hear me?

6 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Yes.

7 MR. SIMON: Thank you. All  
8 right.

9 I'm a medallion owner and, you  
10 know, I got my grant. This is what's  
11 going to -- this is how I'm going to  
12 say it. As a medallion owner, our  
13 exclusive street hail right, which was  
14 our livelihood, was taken away. It  
15 wasn't like you can just change the  
16 rules and that it was bad for you. It  
17 didn't go like that. It was  
18 different. The big mistake happened  
19 when the City allowed E-hail apps to  
20 use their own cars. The app should  
21 have been restricted to be used only  
22 in yellows.

23 What was the deal? Give the  
24 medallion owners the powerful tools to  
25 fight off competition called street

1 hail rights, and we'll, in return,  
2 will accomplish your goals. The  
3 current one being all WAV. You give  
4 us back our exclusives, I guarantee  
5 you, in no time, you will meet your  
6 disability goals. Medallions will  
7 come out of storage in mass. The  
8 whole taxi fleet will be WAVs.

9 When medallions were created,  
10 there was no sense that competition  
11 was being taken away. In fact, the  
12 sense was there was too much  
13 competition. To every medallion,  
14 there were thousands more looking for  
15 fares. Cabs competed against each  
16 other.

17 You need to define street hail.  
18 Give me a second, please -- you need  
19 to define street hail in your rules  
20 and exactly what a medallion buyer  
21 gets when he's buying a medallion. A  
22 street hail means a car on the street  
23 being available to be hailed. A  
24 street hail is not just putting up a  
25 rider's hand. App customers do that.



1 The medallion owner brought the right  
2 to street hail. He brought the right  
3 to have his car be used to respond to  
4 persons hailing it. It was a right to  
5 a street hail. No one but medallion  
6 owners are allowed to do that.

7 When you issued the green cabs,  
8 you had the right idea. There was no  
9 service in those areas so instead of  
10 increasing the number of medallions,  
11 you created a new category in those  
12 underserved areas. The green cab.  
13 That was the right thing to do.

14 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
15 remaining.

16 MR. SIMON: But in the  
17 congestion zone, allowing anyone with  
18 a hail app and a car deregulated an  
19 industry that was made to control  
20 congestion. Let me get onto asking  
21 you for a favor, please.

22 Can you arrange that medallion  
23 owners be able to place orders to  
24 restore the medallion number on their  
25 license plates? This request -- this

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

34

1 request affects no one but us.  
2 Medallion owners take pride in their  
3 medallion. Medallion -- the medallion  
4 number is much more impressive on  
5 their license plate --

6 TIMEKEEPER: Time has expired.

7 MR. SIMON: -- than the tanners  
8 on the hood. We don't want out  
9 license plates looking like TC plates.  
10 Medallion numbers on the plate gives  
11 us much prestige.

12 Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
14 Michael. We'll talk with the State  
15 DMV on that.

16 MR. SIMON: Thank you very much.

17 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Next up is  
18 Anna Humphrey from the Center for  
19 Independence for the Disabled.

20 MS. HUMPHREY: Good morning,  
21 members of the Commission. My name is  
22 Anna Humphrey, and I'm the  
23 transportation community organizer for  
24 CIDNY, the Center for Independence of  
25 the Disabled in New York. Thank you

1 for your chance to speak to you today  
2 about this proposed rule.

3 As a disability advocate, I know  
4 how critical it is for people with  
5 disabilities to have access to  
6 reliable and affordable  
7 transportation. Wheelchair accessible  
8 vehicles are essential for  
9 independence, so I fully support  
10 increasing their availability.

11 However, I'm concerned about the  
12 plan to eliminate per-trip payments  
13 for WAV drivers and operational  
14 payments for medallion owners. Taking  
15 away these payments could discourage  
16 drivers from operating WAVs, leading  
17 to longer wait times and fewer rides  
18 for people who need them most. We  
19 can't afford to let this happen in a  
20 city that serves -- strives to be  
21 inclusive and accessible.

22 Moreover, addressing this  
23 spending problem by taking money away  
24 from drivers is not the right  
25 solution. It's up to the City and the

1 Commission to provide the necessary  
2 funds for accessibility, rather than  
3 placing the burden on drivers  
4 themselves.

5 I encourage the Commission to  
6 find a funding solution that supports  
7 medallion owners while still giving  
8 drivers reasons to provide quality WAV  
9 service, and allowing the accessible  
10 dispatch service to remain accessible  
11 for people with disabilities who need  
12 it. Ultimately, we need policies that  
13 not only increase WAVs, but also  
14 ensure that they're available and  
15 reliable for those who depend on them.

16 Thank you for your time and for  
17 considering how these rules can better  
18 serve New Yorkers with disabilities.

19 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
20 Anna.

21 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

22 Our next speaker is Jean Ryan of  
23 Disabled In Action.

24 MS. RYAN: Good morning. I am  
25 Jean Ryan, President of Disabled In

1 Action of Metropolitan New York, and  
2 I'm a wheelchair user.

3 We have been working towards  
4 accessible taxis and for-hire vehicles  
5 since 1996, 29 years ago. Because we  
6 need to get places spontaneously like  
7 everyone else. We live everywhere,  
8 and we go everywhere. We are okay  
9 with the changes to the taxi  
10 improvement fund, eliminating  
11 maintenance, payments to owners and  
12 increasing the grant to buy a vehicle  
13 from 14,000 to 35,000 if it means that  
14 the numbers of WAVs will be 50 percent  
15 or more. We ultimately want  
16 100 percent of taxis, and we've always  
17 been clear about that.

18 But what good are wheelchair  
19 accessible vehicles if you won't pick  
20 us up? I and other wheelchair users  
21 can put out our hand and available  
22 cabs will just pass us by on the  
23 street and at the airport. I appeal  
24 to drivers' humanity. Learn how to  
25 use the securement system, have the

1 right straps, pick us up and stop  
2 driving off or lying to us that your  
3 ramp is broken.

4 We supported the TWA for years  
5 to no avail. I know you are good  
6 people trying to make a living. Why  
7 eliminate a source of income and be  
8 empty instead of picking us up?

9 Thank you.

10 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

11 Next speaker is Sharon Shapiro.

12 Do we have Ms. Shapiro?

13 MS. SHAPIRO: Hi. Hi. I -- I  
14 want to say that we support the  
15 proposal. However -- by the way, I am  
16 from Brooklyn Center for Independence  
17 of the Disabled. We are concerned  
18 that you are going to fund your  
19 proposal by taking away the zone  
20 dispatch system that people like me,  
21 with extremity/dexterity issues, rely  
22 upon.

23 I and many people who are -- who  
24 are visibly disabled or elderly are  
25 not able to use apps in order to book

1 a ride, or do follow-up on when  
2 they'll be there, be at the location.

3 So we urge the TLC to maintain  
4 the dispatch system as it exists,  
5 giving us the opportunity to talk with  
6 a trained attendant about when we need  
7 a ride and what's happening with the  
8 ride. Because I cannot use a -- a  
9 digital cellphone when I'm out on the  
10 street. People who are aging into  
11 disability also have trouble using  
12 apps, and we need the TLC to  
13 accommodate those of us who are unable  
14 to use apps.

15 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
16 remaining.

17 MS. SHAPIRO: Okay. Thank you.  
18 Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
20 Sharon. And let me just say that we  
21 are looking at a phone option with a  
22 live operator as part of the new  
23 accessible dispatch program. And so  
24 we will take your comments on that and  
25 include them as part of the

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

40

1 Commissioners' review on how we can  
2 improve service for all people with  
3 disabilities. Thank you so much,  
4 Sharon.

5 MS. SHAPIRO: Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

7 Our next speaker is Richard  
8 Chow.

9 MR. CHOW: Hello. Good morning,  
10 can you hear me?

11 COMMISSIONER DO: Yes, we can  
12 hear you.

13 MR. CHOW: Okay. Yeah, thank  
14 you. Good morning, Commissioner Do  
15 and everyone. My name is Richard  
16 Chow. I'm an owner/driver. I'm a  
17 member of the New York Taxi Worker  
18 Alliance. Last week -- last  
19 two weeks, business are very slow,  
20 especially January 5th, the starting  
21 of collecting congestion zone. We  
22 lost a lot of loss trip and a lot also  
23 IMP surcharge dollar trip.

24 So we collect the state  
25 surcharge 50-cent congestion, job 250.



In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 Congestion release zone, 50-cent. So  
2 50 cents surcharge should be removed  
3 and given to IMP surcharge, dollar 50.

4 So state, city and federal  
5 government responsibility to find the  
6 fund, set up the grant and give it to  
7 the WAV programming. Especially cost  
8 of living, cost of maintenance,  
9 inflation is very high, expensive.  
10 That will be help a lot of WAV owner.  
11 So driver cannot find single fare in  
12 more than one hour with cab Toyota  
13 Sienna cost 90,000-dollar, loss of the  
14 operation cost. So TLC keep paying,  
15 especially operation one dollar per  
16 trade, 1,000-dollar maintenance fee,  
17 grant for the current WAV owner. To  
18 five to 10-year, they receive the  
19 higher hack-up grant.

20 So grant money, \$35,000. Three  
21 years later, drivers cannot --  
22 accident, cannot work, die or very  
23 sick age of retirement, should not  
24 paid back to hack-up grant. So allow  
25 medallion, within seven years of

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

42

1                   hack-up to just -- hack-up to receive  
2                   the new hack-up grant. Keep the  
3                   minimum period WAV must be keep on the  
4                   low four-year, not five-year.

5                   So make the grant automatic, no  
6                   application process, and allow the  
7                   owner to request the payment through  
8                   the dealer. And so WAV owner --

9                   TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
10                  remaining.

11                  MR. CHOW: Yeah. So we need  
12                  more time to get the -- the fund state  
13                  surcharge, 50-cent, go to the trip  
14                  fund, support the hard-working  
15                  owner/driver. Disability person to  
16                  easier to find the cab handicap on  
17                  time visit to the doctor office.

18                  Thank you for listening. Thank  
19                  you.

20                  COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

21                  Our next speaker is Richard  
22                  Chipman from Westway Medallion Taxi.

23                  MR. CHIPMAN: Good morning. My  
24                  name is Richard Chipman, and I'm the  
25                  president of Westway Medallion Sales.

1 I'm a licensed New York City taxi  
2 medallion broker, and I've been in the  
3 industry for 46 years. I'm fourth  
4 generation in my family in the taxi  
5 industry.

6 First, if a medallion owner  
7 decides to sell their medallion prior  
8 to the seven years, the new owner  
9 would not be entitled to the 35,000.  
10 This would force a medallion owner to  
11 sell their medallion on a  
12 35,000-dollar discount if they want to  
13 sell before their seven years are up.  
14 If the medallion owner sells prior to  
15 five years, they'd be required to pay  
16 back part of the 35,000 along with  
17 having to discount their medallion.  
18 This is not good for the stability of  
19 the medallion market. This is also  
20 not good for the city because the city  
21 gave city-back guarantees for  
22 medallion loans, and this will have a  
23 huge impact on the average price of  
24 the medallion.

25 For owner/drivers, buying a

1 medallion is already a daunting  
2 decision, and these rules make it an  
3 even bigger liability. Locking owners  
4 into keeping their medallion for  
5 seven years or face large penalties is  
6 a huge burden. The TLC should avoid  
7 causing this massive hit to medallion  
8 pricing by changing the rule to allow  
9 TIF to be received before every seven  
10 ears if the medallion is sold to a new  
11 owner.

12 If the city does not give the  
13 new medallion owner the 35,000-dollar  
14 TIF payment, they'd be creating a  
15 class of medallion that nobody is  
16 going to want. If their car has been  
17 in a bad accident and needs to be  
18 replaced, the owner will get a  
19 5,000-dollar fine. If it takes them  
20 longer than ten days to get the new  
21 car on the road. In many instances,  
22 it could be impossible to replace the  
23 car that quickly. Owners should have  
24 30 days to replace a car, and if the  
25 car needs to be replaced, they should

1 not have to pay back any portion of  
2 the TIF money received. This would be  
3 a double hit for the owner, losing a  
4 car and having to pay back money.

5 Taking away the operational  
6 payment from owner/drivers who  
7 purchased a wheelchair accessible  
8 vehicle prior to the new rule proposal  
9 is not fair. These individuals are  
10 counting on their income to cover  
11 expenses to operate their vehicles.  
12 They should be grandfathered into the  
13 old rule or there should be some type  
14 of true-up in payments to them.

15 At the time of a closing, the  
16 TLC needs to let us know, as brokers,  
17 exactly how much to collect from the  
18 old owner and this would have to be a  
19 real number with the clearance. If  
20 the TLC makes a mistake, the new owner  
21 should not be held responsible for any  
22 clawbacks.

23 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
24 remaining.

25 SPEAKER: Presently, when we

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 sell a medallion, we are told that the  
2 medallion is clear and no money is  
3 owed. Frequently, money is actually  
4 owed and the new owner is held  
5 responsible. What we need is a real  
6 clearance when we sell a medallion,  
7 and the TLC needs to implement a  
8 system to prevent medallions from  
9 being sold until they're 100 percent  
10 sure no money is owed. Most medallion  
11 buyers put their life savings into the  
12 purchase, and it is not right to hold  
13 them responsible for the TLC's  
14 mistakes. TIF money and the new rule  
15 proposal follows the medallion  
16 number --

17 TIMEKEEPER: Time has expired.

18 MR. CHIPMAN: Two seconds.

19 The rule should be that the TIF  
20 money follows the VIN number. In the  
21 event a medallion is sold and the car  
22 is put to use another medallion, there  
23 should be no penalty to the medallion  
24 owner. I believe that the new rules  
25 should be going forward and not

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

47

1 retroactive. A person who purchased a  
2 WAV prior to this new rule and wants  
3 to sell should not have to pay back  
4 any money that they received for TIF.

5 All medallions going forward  
6 should be entitled to receive \$35,000  
7 for their vehicles regardless when  
8 they received TIF prior.

9 Thank you, and -- had to rush,  
10 but I did my best. If anyone has any  
11 questions, feel free to ask.

12 COMMISSIONER DO: All right.  
13 Thank you. And good to see you.

14 MR. CHIPMAN: All right. Same  
15 here. Sorry I didn't get to formally  
16 say hello to everybody. I just had my  
17 three minutes, so enjoy. Thank you  
18 for letting me speak.

19 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.  
20 Next up, Giuseppe Floccari. Mr.  
21 Floccari?

22 MR. FLOCCARI: Hi, good morning,  
23 everyone. My name is Giuseppe  
24 Floccari. I am actually a TLC  
25 accessible dispatch dispatcher.

1                   As we are here today to discuss  
2                   TIF, as we all know, this supports  
3                   medallion owners to place wheelchair  
4                   accessible taxicabs into service. We  
5                   all know that it ensures all customers  
6                   to have equitable access to taxis,  
7                   transportation services. I'm  
8                   obviously a person in a wheelchair and  
9                   do use the accessible dispatch  
10                  program.

11                  For the last seven years, I've  
12                  been able to help use my customer  
13                  service skills and advocacy hat to  
14                  assist people with disabilities. As  
15                  of February, I will no longer be able  
16                  to assist my community in one of the  
17                  biggest challenges that we face day in  
18                  and day out.

19                  People of the five boroughs are  
20                  not only grateful, but they're  
21                  appreciative of the chance to be able  
22                  to travel back and forth to doctors'  
23                  visits and go to the movies and  
24                  whatever else they're used to on a  
25                  daily basis. Accessible dispatch is



In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1           able to do that for them, whether it  
2           is going to the Yankee game or the  
3           Mets game or, sadly, anyone's funeral,  
4           things of that nature. I will repeat,  
5           accessible dispatch is the gateway for  
6           people to speak not only to people in  
7           the office, but we are able to calm  
8           them down and assist them with their  
9           transportation needs.

10                    It's truly appalling that the  
11           TLC itself wants to take away the very  
12           nature and essence of what community  
13           activists are able to do for one  
14           another in one word, just plain  
15           ableism. I'm here to make sure that  
16           medical transportation management  
17           works with the TLC to remain the New  
18           York office and we, the dispatchers,  
19           remain on board as employees and are  
20           able to dispatch license yellow and  
21           green cabs to the entire community.

22                    Thank you, all.

23                    COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
24           Giuseppe.

25                    COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

50

1 Our next speaker, Eman  
2 Rimawi-Doster from the Disability  
3 Justice Program.

4 MS. RIMAWI-DOSTER: Hi, can you  
5 hear me?

6 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Yes.

7 MS. RIMAWI-DOSTER: Okay.  
8 Wonderful.

9 Thank you so much and good  
10 morning. My name is Eman  
11 Rimawi-Doster. I'm a senior community  
12 organizer with New York Lawyers for  
13 the Public Interest. We think that  
14 the TIF payment should be made, but it  
15 shouldn't be funded by canceling and  
16 shutting down accessible dispatch.  
17 The TLC and the city should find money  
18 to pay for this elsewhere. Why punish  
19 disabled New Yorkers who work at  
20 accessible dispatch and also who are  
21 visiting our city.

22 Please don't kill accessible  
23 dispatch. There are over one million  
24 disabled New Yorkers living in our  
25 city, and that's a lot of potential

1 customers. The city constantly talks  
2 about the importance of getting  
3 disabled New Yorkers to work. But  
4 this is ultimately cutting off  
5 disabled people from their jobs and  
6 cutting off people from the service of  
7 the accessible dispatch. That is not  
8 equity, and that is not right.

9 Thank you so much.

10 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you.

11 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

12 Our next speaker is Bhairavi  
13 Desai from NYTWA.

14 MS. DESAI: Good morning,  
15 Chairman Do and members of the  
16 Commission. My name is Bhairavi  
17 Desai. I'm the executive director of  
18 the New York Taxi Workers Alliance.

19 Just to put this in context,  
20 trips today are 73 percent of what  
21 they were pre-COVID. Taxi trips today  
22 are 35 percent of what they were in  
23 March 2014, when the city first  
24 entered into the settlement. And so  
25 the economic reality of this industry

1 has shifted dramatically since the  
2 settlement was -- you know, was first  
3 established.

4 I want to say for the record, I  
5 think everybody from the courts to the  
6 city, certainly the TLC knows this,  
7 the Taxi Workers Alliance has been a  
8 strong supporter of this settlement,  
9 even going back to 10 years ago, 11  
10 years ago now. When we were the first  
11 industry voice to come out in support  
12 and worked with the city to come up  
13 with policies, including the TIF  
14 program in order to allow this  
15 transition to happen.

16 But we are really concerned that  
17 today, while we understand that the  
18 TLC is under this tremendous mandate  
19 from the court, which we all want to  
20 meet, understand we need to meet it,  
21 we have to meet it, we cannot do it at  
22 the expense of some of these financial  
23 programs. Which really are a lifeline  
24 to the industry.

25 Number one, you know, the TLC,

1           it sounds like from what you've said,  
2           Chairman Do, that those who have  
3           received the 14,000 Hack-Up grant  
4           would continue to receive the  
5           operational grant. That can't be just  
6           for four years. That really should be  
7           for the term of that vehicle.

8                     For the drivers to reduce -- to  
9           no longer receive a dollar per trip  
10          payment is a substantial wage cut. We  
11          are talking about a loss of income of  
12          3,000 to \$4,000 per year. The city,  
13          the state and the federal government  
14          have to step up. They have to find a  
15          way to supplement the TIF. We  
16          understand that TIF is not solvent,  
17          but there are ways, whether it's  
18          redirecting the 50 cents from the MTA  
19          surcharge, its issuance of a city bond  
20          or other federal programs. There is a  
21          way to supplement the TIF funding so  
22          that we don't cut --

23                     TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
24                     remaining.

25                     MS. DESAI: -- this lifeline of

1 a program.

2 We cannot allow the, you know,  
3 we cannot allow for drivers who are  
4 not able to continue operating that  
5 vehicle to have to pay back a  
6 restitution to the TLC. They may have  
7 to let go of the vehicle because of  
8 injury, major accident, illness,  
9 retirement, God forbid death. In this  
10 instance, the TLC will still claw back  
11 that money. That simply cannot  
12 happen. We will be following up  
13 with --

14 TIMEKEEPER: Time has expired.

15 MS. DESAI: -- more detailed  
16 demands and proposals as well,  
17 including the elimination of the  
18 seven-year cycle, which will be a  
19 tremendous detriment to some of the  
20 issues that Mr. Chipman raised  
21 previously.

22 Thank you.

23 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

24 Our next speaker is Max  
25 Greenbaum from All Taxi Management.

1 MR. GREENBAUM: Good morning,  
2 TLC Commissioners. Commissioner Do, I  
3 appreciate the TLC's and your  
4 approachability to discuss our  
5 concerns and seriously consider our  
6 modifications to the proposed rules to  
7 benefit the drivers, owners and  
8 agents. I do value the relationship.

9 My name is Max Greenbaum. I'm  
10 the vice president of All Taxi  
11 Management, a taxi agent licensed by  
12 the TLC since 1988. All Taxi was an  
13 early adopter of the Driver Owned  
14 Vehicle leasing model, also known as  
15 DOV. This model gives medallion  
16 drivers the opportunity to purchase  
17 and own their own vehicle throughout  
18 the medallion lease over three to  
19 four years. Thereby reducing their  
20 lease payment for the medallion once  
21 the vehicle is paid off.

22 This model supports the  
23 long-term health of the medallion  
24 ecosystem and is often referred to as  
25 a steppingstone to becoming a

1 medallion owner.

2 Commissioner Do, thank you for  
3 previously stating that the TLC will  
4 continue to honor the existing  
5 operational payments for vehicles  
6 which were previously hacked up as  
7 WAVs. While we understand the TLC's  
8 intention to ease the burden of  
9 purchasing a costly WAV, we believe  
10 adjustments to the proposed rules are  
11 necessary.

12 Specifically, we recommend  
13 removing the five-year pro-rata  
14 clawback funds on top of a  
15 5,000-dollar fine, should the vehicle  
16 not remain in service for five years.  
17 To ensure that the DOV model can  
18 continue and encourage owners to place  
19 newer vehicles into service, the TLC  
20 must change the grant eligibility from  
21 once every seven years to once every  
22 four years. If these rules are passed  
23 as proposed, the DOV leasing model  
24 will be eliminated.

25 The whole idea behind the DOV



1 model is the driver/owner flexibility.  
2 The TLC is taking this away by  
3 mandating the vehicle remain in  
4 service for seven years before grant  
5 eligibility. This will also have a  
6 negative impact on the value of the  
7 medallion by creating a new class of  
8 medallions, eligible for the grant and  
9 not eligible. For any medallion that  
10 already received the grant within the  
11 seven years, it would be devalued by  
12 at least \$35,000.

13 The TLC also must source the  
14 funds to allow the drivers to continue  
15 receiving a dollar per trip. The MTA  
16 and New York State should re-purpose  
17 the 50-cent MTA surcharge for TIF  
18 driver payments.

19 Lastly, we strongly urge the TLC  
20 to reconsider allowing rehacks in  
21 limited cases. Particularly for  
22 vehicles already operating under the  
23 previous TLC rules.

24 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
25 remaining.

1 MR. GREENBAUM: -- to prevent  
2 further financial loss for  
3 driver/owners who have already  
4 invested in this industry. To be  
5 clear, I'm not advocating for any new  
6 non-WAVs to enter the market or for  
7 any additional vehicle extensions  
8 until the fifty percent mandate is  
9 met. I'm simply requesting that the  
10 vehicles that have already been  
11 approved and are already in service be  
12 allowed to be rehacked in limited  
13 circumstances to avoid losing all  
14 equity in the vehicle.

15 Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
17 Max.

18 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

19 Next speaker is Vinod Mahotra  
20 (phonetic). Mr. Mahotra, come off  
21 mute.

22 MR. MAHOTRA: Good morning, all  
23 Commissioners. My name is Vinod  
24 Mahotra. I'd like to speak on vehicle  
25 TIF program. Which TLC is going

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 change grant money, maintenance money  
2 and incentives. Commissioner Do, does  
3 not matter to give us grant, 35,000 or  
4 25,000. After some while, every  
5 vehicle needs repairs, which very  
6 expensive for WAVs. If you cut the  
7 maintenance fees, incentives to  
8 drivers, it will create mess, chaos  
9 for us. Because if we are short for  
10 the repair money, it will cost vehicle  
11 stall on the roads. Lack of funds.

12 So please just increase the  
13 grant money, which is around 25 to 28  
14 thousand commit for you. Other  
15 things, please let the -- if you like  
16 see us giving better service, look, to  
17 just recently eliminate the retirement  
18 for the base. No, you are going stop  
19 the maintenance fees incentives, which  
20 is not matching at all. So please  
21 increase the grant money only. Leave  
22 the rest -- rest things unchanged  
23 because car prices are too high at the  
24 moment. So even please give some more  
25 grant to the current existing owners,

1 which help us.

2 So we have no business, other  
3 business, better time for getting  
4 passenger, almost for 50 minutes.  
5 You've seen us all the time crossing  
6 empty. As you all know, apps took all  
7 our business. Even they took our taxi  
8 disabilities, which we love most to  
9 give them service. All -- all jobs  
10 being dispatched to the app cars. So  
11 we get very -- we get very rare app  
12 jobs. App controls most fares. We  
13 have to do E-hails. Sometimes, e-hail  
14 tips is like eight dollars standards,  
15 after 4.75, get -- get back to the  
16 city, we get only four to six dollars.  
17 We spent almost fifteen to  
18 twenty minutes on average, those  
19 trips. How you think we can survive?

20 If you give the grant money --  
21 if you give the grant money to the  
22 dealers, it will stop our bargain with  
23 the dealers, end up high prices. When  
24 I bought the car, my dealer, I start  
25 to bargain with him just for

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

61

1 500-dollar --

2 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
3 remaining.

4 SPEAKER: He told me why do you  
5 worry about that? TLC is going to  
6 give you money, look, going to give  
7 the up-front money to the dealers, so  
8 they end up very high prices.

9 And I want to share one thing.  
10 I bought the one car, Sienna from the  
11 Mobility Works. They give me very  
12 good deal, good price. So even union,  
13 they found very good --

14 TIMEKEEPER: Time has expired.

15 MR. MAHOTRA: -- ramp fixers.  
16 So please try to contact with them. I  
17 bought the car like only 65,000 Sienna  
18 that time, two years ago. So same  
19 time, I don't know what happened to  
20 stop them, Mr. Richard. That's -- my  
21 broker know him. So he give us car  
22 like under 59,000, plus tax, it's only  
23 like \$63,000.

24 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you so  
25 much for your comments.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

62

1 MR. MAHOTRA: Thank you. Thank  
2 you. So I can get contact with you if  
3 you need more help. Thank you. We  
4 need to find the cheap, cheap cars.  
5 It can help you and ourselves also.  
6 Thank you so much.

7 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

9 Our next speaker is Resheta  
10 Bunting of the One Heart One Vision.

11 MS. BUNTING: Good morning,  
12 everyone, and happy New Year. Thank  
13 you for having me here. So my name is  
14 Resheta Bunting, and I am the  
15 president and founder of One Heart One  
16 Vision and the vice president of the  
17 National Federation of the Blind of  
18 New York State.

19 Is my camera on?

20 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Yes.

21 MS. BUNTING: Okay. Because I'm  
22 using a screen reader.

23 So I am a blind advocate. And I  
24 want to say that we are in full  
25 support of the TIF program, but I'm

1 not going to just reiterate and keep  
2 speaking about what people have spoken  
3 about this morning. I do want to  
4 thank you so much for having a -- at  
5 least thinking about an accessible  
6 phone line for us.

7 As a blind advocate, we access a  
8 lot of information. We socialize, we  
9 work, we shop through the phones,  
10 especially when you think of the  
11 number of individuals who are newly  
12 blindness -- who are new to blindness.  
13 When you think of the ever-increasing  
14 seniors, I have one in my home,  
15 particular my dad, he has glaucoma due  
16 to age, and the number of seniors who  
17 are new to blindness. So they do need  
18 these phone lines to travel.

19 So I'm just imploring and asking  
20 that -- and I want to thank you for  
21 having that, having us in mind when  
22 you do have -- when you are thinking  
23 about the -- the TIF program and  
24 continuing -- and continuing an  
25 accessible phone line. So thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

2 Our next speaker is Evan Yankey  
3 from Brooklyn Center for Independence  
4 of the Disabled.

5 MR. YANKEY: Good morning,  
6 everyone. My name is Evan Yankey, and  
7 I'm the advocacy director for Brooklyn  
8 Center for Independence of the  
9 Disabled. I'm here today to testify  
10 on the proposed rule to change how the  
11 taxi improvement fund is administered.  
12 As other advocates have said today, we  
13 support increasing upfront payments to  
14 drivers. We'd also ask the TLC to  
15 continue providing and to further  
16 increase incentive payments for  
17 drivers for picking up passengers  
18 requesting a wheelchair accessible  
19 vehicle.

20 My testimony today will be  
21 focused on the section of the rule  
22 before you that states the rule will  
23 be, quote, removing the option to use  
24 TIF funds for purposes beyond the cost  
25 purchasing accessible vehicles such as



1 driver training and the accessible  
2 vehicle dispatch program.

3 As we have made clear to this  
4 Commission previously, it is our  
5 position that removing the accessible  
6 vehicle dispatch program is an unfair  
7 attack on the specific section of the  
8 disability community who depends on  
9 this service to travel in their  
10 communities. The current accessible  
11 vehicle dispatch program allows users  
12 to call a single telephone number and  
13 receive support from a trained staff  
14 person like Giuseppe, who spoke today,  
15 who is experienced at talking to  
16 people with disabilities.

17 It allows taxis to be dispatched  
18 with the fewest steps possible for  
19 requesters. This benefits people with  
20 disabilities who cannot use smartphone  
21 apps, but it also benefits people with  
22 speech differences who may need  
23 patience to be understood on the  
24 phone. It benefits people with  
25 barriers to find motor control or low

1 vision, as Resheta just mentioned, and  
2 others who need the request to take  
3 the fewest amount of steps possible.

4 We know from the TLC's other  
5 published rules that there's an  
6 intention to give responsibility for  
7 accessible dispatch to e-hail  
8 providers. And as Commissioner Do  
9 mentioned, to maintain a phone call  
10 option. We are here to say this is  
11 not enough, and will exclude people  
12 with disabilities who will not be able  
13 to navigate an e-hail provider system  
14 for accessible dispatch.

15 There is no requirement in the  
16 new rules to have a dedicated or  
17 trained customer service staff  
18 answering phones, and callers with  
19 disabilities will face having to make  
20 themselves understood to a generic  
21 pool of customer service reps. There  
22 is no requirement in the new rules to  
23 limit the number of steps it takes to  
24 achieve dispatch, and people with  
25 disabilities may face onerous and

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1           lengthy phone menu options before they  
2           can get their vehicles dispatched.

3                     The current system works, and it  
4           is used by people who will face  
5           significant barriers with the proposed  
6           alternatives. The current system also  
7           employees people with disabilities,  
8           some of whom spoke here today.

9                     TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
10          remaining.

11                    MR. YANKEY: While we have been  
12          told that the TLC considers the number  
13          of users of accessible dispatch small,  
14          we know that people use this system  
15          when they have no other options, when  
16          subways or Access-A-Ride fail, when  
17          they are on a transit desert, when  
18          they have a medical or work emergency.  
19          Removing this option will put people  
20          whose other options have already  
21          failed in an even worse situation.

22                    We urge you to find ways to pay  
23          drivers and to pay them fairly. They  
24          deserve it. But it cannot be at the  
25          cost of this essential service that so

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

68

1 many depend on. Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

3 Our next speaker is Wain Chin.

4 MR. CHIN: Hello? Hello? Can  
5 you hear me?

6 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Hello.

7 Yes.

8 MR. CHIN: Good morning,  
9 Commissioner. My name is Wain Chin.  
10 Also a member of New York Taxi Workers  
11 Alliance. I am all for, you know,  
12 increase the funding for a new WAV  
13 vehicle, and also keep the 1,000  
14 medallion for the WAV owner that  
15 currently have the car already.

16 And also, you know, keep  
17 one dollar for the driver and, you  
18 know, the city should work with the  
19 state legislator to get more funding  
20 such as, you know, 50-cent surcharge  
21 from the MTA to use as a TIF funding  
22 to -- to -- you know, so that way you  
23 can raise more money for -- to keep  
24 the program, you know.

25 And -- and also, you know, we --

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

69

1 the rule -- the current rule that the  
2 TLC proposing, it will help the  
3 owner -- in case the owner become  
4 disabled or get serious accident or --  
5 or getting old, cannot drive anymore,  
6 then transfer the medallion. Then,  
7 you know, they have to pay back.  
8 That's not fair, you know. So that --  
9 in that case, you know, they should  
10 have some exemption on that rule.

11 Also, you know, also -- also,  
12 you know, the -- they should make the  
13 grant easier for the new -- to provide  
14 new car ready from the dealer so the  
15 TLC should, you know, work with the  
16 dealer to -- to pay the dealer so we  
17 can get easier transition, you know,  
18 for the WAV we get. Instead the owner  
19 have to put upfront money, you know,  
20 it's not easy for the owner. So the  
21 TLC work with the dealer to -- to --  
22 to make the process easier, you know,  
23 for the owner. So -- so I -- I'm all  
24 for, you know, taxi for all New  
25 Yorker, including the disability

1 community because my father being the  
2 disabled, my late father being  
3 disabled person, you know, I know how  
4 you get around, I mean, it's not easy  
5 to get transport for disabled people.  
6 And I am all for that, you know, so we  
7 support that.

8 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
9 remaining.

10 MR. CHIN: So we -- we -- we  
11 support the TLC trying to get the  
12 hundred percent wheelchair  
13 accessible -- so to make it happen, we  
14 need support from TLC, and the city  
15 and state, too. So get more funding  
16 from the state and get -- get the --  
17 get the 50-cent to taxi funding.  
18 Okay. Thank you so much.

19 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.  
20 Our next speaker is Cathleen Collins  
21 of the Brooklyn Center for  
22 Independence of the Disabled.

23 Ms. Collins, you can unmute your  
24 mic. Yes.

25 MS. COLLINS: I'm sorry about

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 that. And actually, I'm not with the  
2 Brooklyn Center for Independence of  
3 the Disabled.

4 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: I'm sorry.

5 MS. COLLINS: That's okay. No  
6 problem.

7 I'm just speaking on my own  
8 behalf as a disabled person, a native  
9 New Yorker who is a congenital  
10 quadruple amputee who uses a  
11 wheelchair and who has lived in New  
12 York City for over 65 years.

13 I agree with the comments  
14 submitted by many of the disability  
15 organizations here today, especially  
16 that this increase in the amount  
17 provided to taxicab owners to convert  
18 their taxicabs to wheelchair  
19 accessible vehicles is a good start.  
20 Additionally, I would urge the New  
21 York City Taxi & Limousine Commission  
22 to increase the amount to -- to  
23 provide to convert their vehicles to  
24 wheelchair accessible vehicles since  
25 according to the New York City Taxi &

1 Limousine Commission's own data, the  
2 total cost for a wheelchair accessible  
3 vehicle is between 79,000 and 99,000,  
4 approximately.

5 Also, the one-dollar per trip  
6 incentive should not be eliminated  
7 since people with disabilities are  
8 refused rides, and this incentive at  
9 least tries to put us on a leveled  
10 playing field with other New Yorkers  
11 trying to hail a taxicab. Further, I  
12 urge the TLC to increase the incentive  
13 to say two-dollars during non-peak  
14 hours and five dollars during peak  
15 hours in the morning and evening, as  
16 well as late at night and during  
17 inclement weather when it's really  
18 difficult for us to get a cab.

19 We need funding also for proper  
20 training of the drivers, and this  
21 should not be cut. What I'm seeing  
22 here seems like we are going to -- we  
23 are just moving the money around and  
24 we are not actually getting more  
25 funds.



1                   Finally, the accessible dispatch  
2                   program needs to be continued as is  
3                   because it works and the amount spent  
4                   on it is insignificant in comparison  
5                   to the overall budget of New York  
6                   City, which last year was  
7                   approximately \$112 billion. It seems  
8                   that the TLC needs more funding to  
9                   make taxicabs accessible. That such  
10                  fund should be capped from such things  
11                  as the city's general funds since WAV  
12                  taxicabs are for everyone, and they  
13                  make New York City a more attractive  
14                  city to visit and establish a business  
15                  in.

16                  New York City needs to be ahead  
17                  of the curb to compete in the  
18                  competitive world of tourism and  
19                  commerce. Investment in accessible  
20                  transportation that is affordable too  
21                  is a productive investment which will  
22                  reap many benefits to New York City.  
23                  Accessible affordable transportation  
24                  is a --

25                                   TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

74

1 remaining.

2 SPEAKER: Thank you.

3 -- is a civil right that New  
4 York City needs to properly fund and  
5 actively support. Thank you for  
6 giving me this opportunity to speak to  
7 you today. Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

9 Next speaker, Bhupinder Baidwan.  
10 Mr. Baidwan, unmute your microphone.  
11 You are still muted. We can't hear  
12 you.

13 MR. BAIDWAN: Now you hear me?

14 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Yes. There  
15 you go.

16 MR. BAIDWAN: Thanks.

17 Good morning. My name is  
18 Bhupinder Baidwan. I drive since  
19 1988. So I buy that wheelchair car  
20 2022. You know, then I got  
21 14,000-dollar for vehicle -- from the  
22 city or maybe state. Because I  
23 have -- you know, please don't do like  
24 35,000. Maybe like 22 or \$25,000.  
25 And don't remove like 1,000-dollar per

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

75

1           quarterly and one dollars. You know,  
2           because now the wheelchair accessible  
3           car, very expensive, like go to  
4           \$90,000.

5                         Maybe next year that -- maybe  
6           next year, that's going to more. You  
7           know, because the dealers, they are  
8           greedy, you know. They charge more,  
9           more because they know that taxi  
10          driver buy definitely this car because  
11          this is not private car. Because this  
12          is job, you know. So I have request,  
13          please don't move one dollar and  
14          1,000-dollar. Even like we pay tax,  
15          like 50-cent and one dollar, 50 --  
16          two-dollar, 50-cent and one dollar.  
17          Like 4-dollar to the city or state,  
18          you know.

19                        So that's why we loose my  
20          visions, too, you know. So I have  
21          request to the TLC chairperson and to  
22          everyone, please don't remove that  
23          one-dollar and \$1,000. Thank you.

24                                 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

25                                 Our next speaker, Joseph

1 Rappaport, Brooklyn Center for  
2 Independence of the Disabled.

3 MR. RAPPAPORT: Good morning. I  
4 don't know if my camera is working.

5 I'm Joe Rappaport, executive  
6 director of the Brooklyn Center for  
7 Independence of the Disabled. We are  
8 a member of the Taxis For All  
9 campaign, and we appreciate the chance  
10 to speak.

11 The Taxis For All Campaign has  
12 long advocated for 100 percent  
13 accessibility in the yellow taxi and  
14 for-hire vehicle fleets. Only that  
15 way will wheelchair users be able to  
16 take advantage of the same  
17 transportation flexibility that  
18 non-wheelchair users now have. We  
19 support efforts to increase the  
20 payments to accessible vehicle  
21 purchasers, that we leave it to the  
22 medallion owners and drivers to  
23 comment about whether the one-time  
24 35,000-dollar payment is a fair  
25 approach by the TLC. And we are also

1 concerned about the elimination of the  
2 payment to drivers.

3 We should understand how we got  
4 here. I want to briefly review this.  
5 The TLC has been largely a reluctant  
6 partner in the endeavor to increase  
7 accessibility, and this proposal  
8 unfortunately is no different. First,  
9 we had to sue to get any commitment  
10 whatsoever for accessibility from the  
11 TLC.

12 Then, the TLC, after that  
13 agreement was made, failed to meet its  
14 obligation to 50 percent accessibility  
15 in the medallion fleet in spite of  
16 extensions we agreed to. And finally,  
17 last year, we had to go back to  
18 federal court to get the TLC to agree  
19 to meet its legal obligation. And  
20 here we are.

21 This new regulation should help  
22 achieve the 50 percent goal. But it  
23 too shows the TLC's reluctance to meet  
24 its actual obligations to disabled New  
25 Yorkers, to make sure everyone can get

1 a cab, especially if they have a  
2 disability that makes it hard for them  
3 to use an app.

4 We strongly oppose the  
5 Commission's proposal to remove the  
6 option to use taxi improvement funds  
7 for driver training and for accessible  
8 dispatch, which serves disabled people  
9 who may have dexterity issues or a  
10 language disability, as Sharon Shapiro  
11 testified. This may lead to the  
12 elimination of the very effective  
13 accessible dispatch program, the  
14 subject of your next hearing.

15 The TLC says this is the only  
16 way it can increase the payment to  
17 vehicle purchasers without tapping  
18 other city funds. You should look  
19 into that option, as Kathy Collins  
20 suggested. Driver training and  
21 accessible dispatch are absolutely  
22 essential. The TLC is essentially  
23 stealing from one program --

24 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
25 remaining.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

79

1 MR. RAPPAPORT: -- that  
2 benefits -- sure. That benefits  
3 disabled New Yorkers to support a  
4 different program that benefits  
5 disabled New Yorkers. That's  
6 ridiculous and wrong. We urge  
7 Commissioners to reject any change in  
8 funding for accessible dispatch, and  
9 keep the program growing at this time  
10 until we can be certain that any new  
11 program works as well. Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.  
13 Our next speaker is Nina  
14 Godashi.

15 MS. GODASHI: Hi, can you hear  
16 me?

17 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Yes.

18 MS. GODASHI: Hi. My name is  
19 Nina Godashi. I am wheelchair taxi  
20 driver. I drive for 15 years. First  
21 of all, I want to start, you forced me  
22 to buy wheelchair. I didn't buy  
23 wheelchair medallion. And that is  
24 unfair to the yellow cabs. We bought  
25 medallion, which is not wheelchair.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

80

1 You forced me to do that, and that is  
2 unfair and we cannot fight about that.

3 And today, the car -- you want  
4 to give \$35,000, it's very good, that  
5 idea, to give to the yellow cabs  
6 \$35,000 since the car is \$80,000. And  
7 after that, if you would like to cut  
8 the one dollar, that is not fair  
9 because that car need maintenance.  
10 The maintenance for this car, it's  
11 very high. American Transit  
12 Insurance, want hike, 35 percent this  
13 year. Tires, I need tires which is  
14 250 to 300-dollar and every  
15 six months, I need new tires.

16 Mechanic, because I don't have  
17 to buy only the tires, I have to pay  
18 the mechanic. Shocks, which is --  
19 because the cab in the back is very,  
20 very heavy, the shocks go all the  
21 time, they have a problem. Springs,  
22 they need all the time. Mechanic,  
23 gas, I need 30 to \$35 a day and since  
24 Toyota RAV need \$7 a day, we loose  
25 customers because customers, they



In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 don't like these cars to get in my  
2 car. I don't know, every single day,  
3 I lose maybe three, four customers  
4 because they cannot -- the ladies, old  
5 ladies, they cannot get to these cars  
6 and I'm loosing money every day.

7 And when I bought the new car  
8 from dealer, the car left me in  
9 Verazano Bridge, one-week car. And I  
10 have to go back and forth to mechanic.  
11 The Toyota, they don't take  
12 responsibilities because you changed  
13 the car, they said, and we have to go  
14 through BraunAbility, which is not  
15 fair. And we lose days, we lose  
16 money.

17 And the price of the medallion  
18 today, from 170, they -- two years  
19 ago, three years ago, they give to us  
20 170. Today, the price of medallion is  
21 60,000. You know what? My friend  
22 want to sell the medallion, and he  
23 wants to retire because he's sick and  
24 he cannot sell the medallion because  
25 nobody wants to buy wheelchair

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

82

1 medallion. No drivers want to drive,  
2 and you are going to cut this money,  
3 the one-dollar --

4 TIMEKEEPER: Thirty seconds  
5 remaining.

6 MS. GODASHI: And that is not  
7 going to be yellow cabs. I guarantee  
8 you that. It's not going to be a  
9 yellow cab in New York City to -- to  
10 give service to the people disabled.  
11 We do that with happiness and dignity.  
12 But we are not going to be able to do  
13 that if you cut what -- you should not  
14 cut the 35,000. You should give it to  
15 the driver, the 35,000 and you should  
16 not cap this money. Otherwise, we are  
17 going to go to bankruptcies, suicide,  
18 the tray 18 (phonetic).

19 So please, I please you, if you  
20 want to help these drivers to retire,  
21 please --

22 TIMEKEEPER: Time has expired.

23 MS. GODASHI: -- this money.

24 Thank you very much. And have a nice  
25 day.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

83

1 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

2 Our next speaker, Manjinder  
3 Singh.

4 Mr. Singh? Yes. Mr. Singh,  
5 unmute your microphone.

6 MR. SINGH: Yes.

7 Good morning, Chair Commissioner  
8 and other Commissioners. Majority  
9 people is against your proposal  
10 because it's not good for us. But of  
11 course, it's good for you because you  
12 work for the city. 35,000-dollar you  
13 giving to them is only -- only the  
14 inflation. And the -- the -- remember  
15 2010, you gave the 14,000-dollar, the  
16 car cost about 30,000, 30,  
17 40,000-dollar less. So whatever you  
18 giving us, 35,000-dollar, it's the  
19 inflation.

20 And why you cutting the \$1,000  
21 dollar and one-dollar? This is not  
22 fair. So even the disability people,  
23 I heard your whole like meeting with  
24 the people. They -- everybody is  
25 against it. I urge you all not to cut

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 the one-dollar, not to cut the  
2 1,000-dollar. But give the driver to  
3 35,000-dollar and should be -- is the  
4 limited time in case he want to  
5 retire, anything like that. He should  
6 not back the 5,000-dollar.

7 And I want other thing, five of  
8 you, before you pass any rule, you  
9 should give -- because you are the  
10 public listener. So give us the  
11 comment, why are you passing this  
12 rule? Very important. You will say,  
13 aye, aye, aye, is the leadership, you  
14 know. We want to heard, why you want  
15 the -- last time, I testimony and the  
16 one is the guy is Commissioner, I  
17 don't know what is -- I really  
18 appreciate it. He said public comment  
19 is very important for him. And --  
20 and -- and he want to like listen to  
21 the public.

22 I want to five of you do the  
23 same thing, to -- you know, to like do  
24 the same thing before you pass any  
25 law. Thank you very much. My

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

85

1 testimony.

2 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.  
3 Our final speaker, Kuber  
4 Sancho-Persad. You can unmute your  
5 microphone and begin.

6 MR. SANCHO-PERSAD: Hello, good  
7 morning, Commission.

8 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Good  
9 morning.

10 MR. SANCHO-PERSAD: I come here  
11 to speak about the proposed rule to  
12 raise the TIF fund from 14,000, TIF  
13 initial payment of 14,000 to 35,000,  
14 which I think is a great idea. But  
15 the removal of the thousand dollars  
16 per quarterly payment is not a good  
17 idea because as you heard from other  
18 drivers, the car's really hard to  
19 maintain. It does break down easily.

20 It also -- is also prone to more  
21 wear and tear on shocks, tires and  
22 more, to the suspension. It does need  
23 these repairs. It also -- because  
24 most of those cars are gas, just gas,  
25 except for the Sienna Hybrid, that

1           these cars usually burn more fuel for  
2           the day. Usually burn about 35 to \$40  
3           a day. Whereas compared to -- it  
4           maybe could burn seven to \$10 a day.  
5           So it end up -- if we eliminate the  
6           dollar from regular drivers who lease,  
7           they would not make enough money to  
8           the -- to make enough for gas, cover  
9           for the daily expenses.

10                    If existing drivers who already  
11           got the \$14,000 should continue to get  
12           the quarterly payment until everything  
13           is paid off. And we should also look  
14           in to see if we extend the payments  
15           instead of being four years to being  
16           the full lifetime of the vehicle.

17                    It should not end the  
18           accessibility dispatch program. It's  
19           a really good program. And yup, I  
20           think that's my comments for today.  
21           Thank you for my -- thank you for the  
22           time.

23                    COMMISSIONER ELUTO: Thank you.

24                    MR. SANCHO-PERSAD: Have a nice  
25           day. Thank you.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1 COMMISSIONER ELUTO: You, too.

2 Well, thank you. That concludes  
3 our public hearing. I'll turn it to  
4 Commissioner Do.

5 COMMISSIONER DO: Thank you,  
6 everyone, for their comments. I  
7 appreciate our drivers, our disability  
8 advocates, our garage fleets and  
9 everyone else for making their  
10 comments today. This is something  
11 that, you know, is a very difficult  
12 thing that we have to do, and we have  
13 to balance all the comments that we  
14 have heard today and make some  
15 changes.

16 However, at the core of this,  
17 it's a solvency issue and it's an  
18 issue that is rearing its ugly head to  
19 all of us, but in the near future, as  
20 you saw through Evans's presentation.  
21 This is something that, again, is hard  
22 to do but we must do. But we'll go  
23 through, listen to all the comments  
24 today and make some adjustments. I  
25 don't want to raise the expectations

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission  
January 9, 2025

1           that we'll make drastic changes to  
2           this because every change that we do  
3           make will involve an additional cost.  
4           So we have to do an analysis of how  
5           much and if the TIF fund can support  
6           any of the changes.

7                         And so with that, if there are  
8           no comments from any other  
9           Commissioners, I'll close today's  
10          hearing.  Okay?

11                         (No response.)

12                         COMMISSIONER DO:  Seeing none, I  
13          will close today's hearing.  Thank  
14          you, everyone, for their comments  
15          today.

16                         (TIME NOTED:  11:29 a.m.)

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF NASSAU)

I, Elbia Brumit, a Notary Public within  
and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the  
within-entitled matter, and that the within  
transcript is a true record of such proceedings to  
the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am not related  
to any of the parties to this action by blood or  
marriage; and that I am in no way interested in  
the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set  
my hand this 17th day of January, 2025.

  
ELBIA BRUMIT

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

<p><b>\$10</b> 86:4</p> <p><b>\$100</b> 12:5</p> <p><b>\$1000</b> 75:23 83:20</p> <p><b>\$112</b> 14:11 73:7</p> <p><b>\$14000</b> 10:10 13:6 86:11</p> <p><b>\$15</b> 13:19</p> <p><b>\$25000</b> 74:24</p> <p><b>\$26</b> 14:12</p> <p><b>\$27</b> 13:20,21</p> <p><b>\$30000</b> 10:13</p> <p><b>\$35</b> 80:23</p> <p><b>\$35000</b> 13:6,7 41:20 47:6 57:12 80:4,6 (7)</p> <p><b>\$40</b> 86:2</p> <p><b>\$4000</b> 53:12</p> <p><b>\$6</b> 12:2</p> <p><b>\$63000</b> 61:23</p> <p><b>\$7</b> 80:24</p> <p><b>\$80000</b> 80:6</p> <p><b>\$90000</b> 75:4</p> <p><b>&amp; 3</b> 11:11 20:21 71:21,25 (5)</p> <p><b>1000dollar</b> 11:22 41:16 74:25 75:14 84:2 (5)</p> <p><b>10year</b> 41:18</p> <p><b>14000dollar</b> 11:21 13:24 29:1 74:21 83:15 (5)</p> <p><b>14th</b> 18:18</p> <p><b>17th</b> 89:18</p>	<p><b>21000dollar</b> 14:3</p> <p><b>300dollar</b> 80:14</p> <p><b>30second</b> 17:7</p> <p><b>35000dollar</b> 13:23 16:13 43:12 44:13 76:24 83:12,18 84:3 (8)</p> <p><b>40000dollar</b> 83:17</p> <p><b>4dollar</b> 75:17</p> <p><b>5000dollar</b> 44:19 56:15 84:6</p> <p><b>500dollar</b> 61:1</p> <p><b>50cent</b> 40:25 41:1 42:13 57:17 68:20 70:17 75:15,16 (8)</p> <p><b>5th</b> 40:20</p> <p><b>70yearold</b> 27:22</p> <p><b>90000dollar</b> 41:13</p> <p><b>ability</b> 89:12</p> <p><b>able</b> 7:23 13:10 15:11 21:15 30:4 33:23 38:25 48:12,15,21 49:1,7,13,20 54:4 66:12 76:15 82:12 (18)</p> <p><b>ableism</b> 49:15</p> <p><b>about</b> 3:3 5:12 11:7 15:21 22:2 29:13 30:8 35:2,11 37:17 39:6 51:2 53:11 61:5 63:2,3,5,23 70:25 76:23 77:1 80:2 83:16 85:11 86:2 (25)</p> <p><b>above</b> 12:25</p> <p><b>absolutely</b> 9:9 78:21</p> <p><b>access</b> 7:21 35:5 48:6 63:7 (4)</p> <p><b>accessaride</b> 67:16</p> <p><b>accessibility</b> 9:10 36:2 76:13 77:7,10,14 86:18 (7)</p>	<p><b>accessible</b> 4:19 8:7,17 9:1,5,8 16:5 35:7,21 36:9,10 37:4,19 39:23 45:7 47:25 48:4,9,25 49:5 50:16,20,22 51:7 63:5,25 64:18,25 65:1,5,10 66:7,14 67:13 70:13 71:19,24 72:2 73:1,9,19,23 75:2 76:20 78:7,13,21 79:8 (48)</p> <p><b>accident</b> 41:22 44:17 54:8 69:4 (4)</p> <p><b>accommodate</b> 39:13</p> <p><b>accomplish</b> 32:2</p> <p><b>according</b> 71:25</p> <p><b>account</b> 3:8,16 14:12</p> <p><b>accounts</b> 13:21</p> <p><b>achieve</b> 13:13 66:24 77:22</p> <p><b>action</b> 36:23 37:1 89:14</p> <p><b>activate</b> 3:16</p> <p><b>active</b> 9:4 14:18 16:2</p> <p><b>actively</b> 74:5</p> <p><b>activists</b> 49:13</p> <p><b>actual</b> 77:24</p> <p><b>actually</b> 46:3 47:24 71:1 72:24 (4)</p> <p><b>ad</b> 19:10 20:2 26:17</p> <p><b>adams</b> 6:8</p> <p><b>add</b> 16:15</p> <p><b>addition</b> 15:16</p> <p><b>additional</b> 3:23 15:6 58:7 88:3 (4)</p> <p><b>additionally</b> 71:20</p> <p><b>addressed</b> 24:22</p>
--	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

91

<p><b>addressing</b> 35:22</p> <p><b>adjust</b> 7:25</p> <p><b>adjustments</b> 56:10 87:24</p> <p><b>administered</b> 8:9 64:11</p> <p><b>administrative</b> 7:7</p> <p><b>ado</b> 7:3</p> <p><b>adopter</b> 55:13</p> <p><b>advance</b> 3:10</p> <p><b>advantage</b> 76:16</p> <p><b>advertiser</b> 17:22</p> <p><b>advertising</b> 4:21 6:23 7:8,10,16 18:25 21:3 24:7,14 25:6,7,14,17,19 26:2,9 27:9 (17)</p> <p><b>advocacy</b> 48:13 64:7</p> <p><b>advocate</b> 35:3 62:23 63:7</p> <p><b>advocated</b> 76:12</p> <p><b>advocates</b> 64:12 87:8</p> <p><b>advocating</b> 58:5</p> <p><b>affects</b> 34:1</p> <p><b>affiliated</b> 23:12</p> <p><b>affiliation</b> 3:19</p> <p><b>afford</b> 13:11 35:19</p> <p><b>affordable</b> 10:17 35:6 73:20,23 (4)</p> <p><b>after</b> 12:22 22:23 59:4 60:15 77:12 80:7 (6)</p> <p><b>again</b> 7:2 13:11 23:13 87:21 (4)</p> <p><b>against</b> 32:15 83:9,25</p>	<p><b>age</b> 41:23 63:16</p> <p><b>agent</b> 30:1,1 55:11</p> <p><b>agents</b> 55:8</p> <p><b>aging</b> 39:10</p> <p><b>ago</b> 37:5 52:9,10 61:18 81:19,19 (6)</p> <p><b>agree</b> 71:13 77:18</p> <p><b>agreed</b> 22:24 77:16</p> <p><b>agreement</b> 77:13</p> <p><b>agrees</b> 22:21</p> <p><b>ahead</b> 73:16</p> <p><b>airlinestyle</b> 19:18</p> <p><b>airport</b> 37:23</p> <p><b>airtime</b> 18:25 19:6</p> <p><b>align</b> 25:15 26:8</p> <p><b>alliance</b> 40:18 51:18 52:7 68:11 (4)</p> <p><b>allotted</b> 17:5</p> <p><b>allow</b> 20:8 22:25 23:9 29:15 41:24 42:6 44:8 52:14 54:2,3 57:14 (11)</p> <p><b>allowed</b> 26:25 29:3 31:19 33:6 58:12 (5)</p> <p><b>allowing</b> 33:17 36:9 57:20</p> <p><b>allows</b> 65:11,17</p> <p><b>almost</b> 60:4,17</p> <p><b>along</b> 6:16 43:16</p> <p><b>already</b> 5:20 8:21 44:1 57:10,22 58:3,10,11 67:20 68:15 86:10 (11)</p>	<p><b>also</b> 7:19 8:1 10:7 14:8 20:24 30:8 36:13 39:11 40:22 43:19 50:20 55:14 57:5,13 62:5 64:14 65:21 67:6 68:10,13,16,25 69:11,11,11 72:5,19 76:25 85:20,20,23 86:13 (32)</p> <p><b>alternatives</b> 67:6</p> <p><b>always</b> 6:7 37:16</p> <p><b>am</b> 8 4:23 27:20 28:21 36:24 38:15 47:24 62:14,23 68:11 70:6 79:19 88:16 89:13,15 (15)</p> <p><b>amended</b> 7:6</p> <p><b>amenity</b> 19:13</p> <p><b>american</b> 80:11</p> <p><b>amount</b> 13:10 66:3 71:16,22 73:3 (5)</p> <p><b>amputee</b> 71:10</p> <p><b>analysis</b> 6:16 16:12 88:4</p> <p><b>anchoring</b> 20:6</p> <p><b>andrea</b> 2:11</p> <p><b>andrew</b> 17:25 20:18,22 24:4 (4)</p> <p><b>anna</b> 27:13 34:18,22 36:20 (4)</p> <p><b>annual</b> 13:22 14:13</p> <p><b>annually</b> 13:20</p> <p><b>another</b> 46:22 49:14</p> <p><b>answering</b> 66:18</p> <p><b>anticipate</b> 15:5</p> <p><b>anticipated</b> 29:9</p> <p><b>anymore</b> 69:5</p>
---	---	---

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

92

<p><b>anyone</b> 33:17 47:10</p> <p><b>anyone's</b> 49:3</p> <p><b>anything</b> 16:15 84:5</p> <p><b>app</b> 19:14 22:7 31:20 32:25 33:18 60:10,11,12 78:3 (9)</p> <p><b>appalling</b> 49:10</p> <p><b>appeal</b> 37:23</p> <p><b>appears</b> 25:2</p> <p><b>application</b> 42:6</p> <p><b>applications</b> 30:14</p> <p><b>appreciate</b> 55:3 76:9 84:18 87:7 (4)</p> <p><b>appreciative</b> 48:21</p> <p><b>approach</b> 19:23 20:8 76:25</p> <p><b>approachability</b> 55:4</p> <p><b>appropriate</b> 7:17</p> <p><b>approved</b> 7:14 8:2 58:11</p> <p><b>approximately</b> 72:4 73:7</p> <p><b>apps</b> 31:19 38:25 39:12,14 60:6 65:21 (6)</p> <p><b>arbitrary</b> 18:24</p> <p><b>are</b> 3:11,13,14 4:8 5:11,13 7:1,14 8:1 9:9 13:3 14:23,25 15:4,11,14,19 16:1 22:10 25:18,25 27:10,22 28:4,7 29:12,20,21 30:8,21,21 33:6 35:8 37:8,18 38:5,17,18,23,24,24 39:10,13,21 40:19 43:13 45:9 46:1 48:1,19 49:7,13,19 50:20,23 51:20,22 52:16,23 53:11,17 54:3 56:10,22 58:11 59:9,18,23 62:24 63:11,12,17,22 66:10 67:17 72:7,22,23,24 73:12 74:11</p>	<p>75:7 76:7,25 77:20 78:21 82:2,12,16 84:9,11 85:24 88:7 (93)</p> <p><b>areas</b> 33:9,12</p> <p><b>arias</b> 21:5</p> <p><b>around</b> 22:5 23:4 24:18 59:13 70:4 72:23 (6)</p> <p><b>arrange</b> 33:22</p> <p><b>arrangements</b> 5:24</p> <p><b>ask</b> 3:10 10:24 28:3 47:11 64:14 (5)</p> <p><b>asked</b> 8:18 21:17</p> <p><b>asking</b> 33:20 63:19</p> <p><b>aspect</b> 19:10 29:13</p> <p><b>assess</b> 7:20</p> <p><b>assist</b> 48:14,16 49:8</p> <p><b>associated</b> 26:19</p> <p><b>association</b> 27:23</p> <p><b>attack</b> 65:7</p> <p><b>attendant</b> 39:6</p> <p><b>attention</b> 4:11</p> <p><b>attractive</b> 12:24 73:13</p> <p><b>audio</b> 3:13,25</p> <p><b>august</b> 6:23 18:17 21:7</p> <p><b>authorized</b> 14:16,20 16:3</p> <p><b>auto</b> 26:4</p> <p><b>automatic</b> 42:5</p> <p><b>automatically</b> 3:14</p> <p><b>avail</b> 38:5</p>	<p><b>availability</b> 35:10</p> <p><b>available</b> 4:9 19:11 21:19 32:23 36:14 37:21 (6)</p> <p><b>avenue</b> 30:14</p> <p><b>average</b> 43:23 60:18</p> <p><b>avoid</b> 28:23 44:6 58:13</p> <p><b>away</b> 31:14 32:11 35:15,23 38:19 45:5 49:11 57:2 (8)</p> <p><b>aye</b> 84:13,13,13</p> <p><b>b</b> 15</p> <p><b>back</b> 6:17,23,24 8:11 21:7 32:4 41:24 43:16 45:1,4 47:3 48:22 52:9 54:5,10 60:15 69:7 77:17 80:19 81:10 84:6 (21)</p> <p><b>bad</b> 31:16 44:17</p> <p><b>bader</b> 2:9 4:25 15:1,13 (4)</p> <p><b>baidwan</b> 74:9,10,13,16,18 (5)</p> <p><b>balance</b> 87:13</p> <p><b>balloon</b> 14:11</p> <p><b>bankruptcies</b> 82:17</p> <p><b>bargain</b> 60:22,25</p> <p><b>barriers</b> 65:25 67:5</p> <p><b>base</b> 59:18</p> <p><b>based</b> 19:21</p> <p><b>basis</b> 48:25</p> <p><b>bear</b> 14:14</p> <p><b>because</b> 8:12 37:5 39:8 43:20 54:7 59:9,23 62:21 70:1 73:3 74:22 75:2,7,9,10,11 80:9,16,19,25 81:4,12,23,24 83:10,11 84:9 85:17,23 88:2 (30)</p>
--	--	--

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

93

<p><b>become</b> 69:3</p> <p><b>becoming</b> 55:25</p> <p><b>before</b> 43:13 44:9 57:4 64:22 67:1 84:8,24 (7)</p> <p><b>begin</b> 3:4 17:3,20 18:5 85:5 (5)</p> <p><b>behalf</b> 18:16 71:8</p> <p><b>behind</b> 56:25</p> <p><b>being</b> 3:4,6 15:6 23:14 32:3,11,23 46:9 60:10 70:1,2 86:15,15 (13)</p> <p><b>believe</b> 10:19 16:12 23:21 25:13 46:24 56:9 (6)</p> <p><b>benefit</b> 55:7</p> <p><b>benefits</b> 65:19,21,24 73:22 79:2,2,4 (7)</p> <p><b>best</b> 13:13 18:20 47:10 89:12 (4)</p> <p><b>better</b> 36:17 59:16 60:3</p> <p><b>between</b> 13:9 72:3</p> <p><b>beyond</b> 64:24</p> <p><b>bhairavi</b> 51:12,16</p> <p><b>bhupinder</b> 74:9,18</p> <p><b>bierstein</b> 2:11 5:1</p> <p><b>big</b> 31:18</p> <p><b>bigger</b> 44:3</p> <p><b>biggest</b> 48:17</p> <p><b>billion</b> 73:7</p> <p><b>blind</b> 62:17,23 63:7</p> <p><b>blindness</b> 63:12,12,17</p>	<p><b>blood</b> 89:14</p> <p><b>board</b> 6:25 18:10 20:13 27:15,21 49:19 (6)</p> <p><b>bond</b> 53:19</p> <p><b>book</b> 38:25</p> <p><b>boroughs</b> 48:19</p> <p><b>both</b> 6:9 23:3</p> <p><b>bought</b> 60:24 61:10,17 79:24 81:7 (5)</p> <p><b>brad</b> 18:1 24:6,9</p> <p><b>braunability</b> 81:14</p> <p><b>break</b> 85:19</p> <p><b>breaks</b> 20:2</p> <p><b>bridge</b> 81:9</p> <p><b>briefly</b> 77:4</p> <p><b>bring</b> 10:21 16:6 21:10</p> <p><b>brings</b> 16:3 29:17</p> <p><b>broadway</b> 5:10</p> <p><b>broken</b> 38:3</p> <p><b>broker</b> 43:2 61:21</p> <p><b>brokers</b> 45:16</p> <p><b>brooklyn</b> 38:16 64:3,7 70:21 71:2 76:1,6 (7)</p> <p><b>brought</b> 33:1,2</p> <p><b>brumit</b> 21 89:7</p> <p><b>budget</b> 73:5</p> <p><b>bunting</b> 62:10,11,14,21 (4)</p> <p><b>burden</b> 36:3 44:6 56:8</p>	<p><b>burdens</b> 19:7</p> <p><b>burdensome</b> 25:25</p> <p><b>burn</b> 86:1,2,4</p> <p><b>business</b> 40:19 60:2,3,7 73:14 (5)</p> <p><b>businesses</b> 7:14</p> <p><b>busy</b> 5:5</p> <p><b>buy</b> 37:12 74:19 75:10 79:22,22 80:17 81:25 (7)</p> <p><b>buyer</b> 32:20</p> <p><b>buyers</b> 46:11</p> <p><b>buying</b> 32:21 43:25</p> <p><b>c</b> 2:1,10 89:1,1 (4)</p> <p><b>cab</b> 33:12 41:12 42:16 72:18 78:1 80:19 82:9 (7)</p> <p><b>cabs</b> 32:15 33:7 37:22 49:21 79:24 80:5 82:7 (7)</p> <p><b>calendar</b> 12:1</p> <p><b>call</b> 17:2 65:12 66:9</p> <p><b>called</b> 3:15 31:25</p> <p><b>callers</b> 66:18</p> <p><b>calm</b> 19:21 49:7</p> <p><b>came</b> 13:7</p> <p><b>camera</b> 3:17 62:19 76:4</p> <p><b>campaign</b> 76:9,11</p> <p><b>can</b> 5:18,25 10:7,13 11:25 17:3 18:3,5 22:8,10 23:18,19 26:22 28:18,20 30:9,13,17 31:5,15 33:22 36:17 37:21 40:1,10,11 50:4 56:17 60:19 62:2,5 67:2 68:4,23 69:17 70:23 77:25 78:16 79:10,15</p>
---	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

94

<p>85:4 88:5 (42)</p> <p><b>can't</b> 35:19 53:5 74:11</p> <p><b>canceling</b> 50:15</p> <p><b>cannot</b> 39:8 41:11,21,22 52:21 54:2,3,11 65:20 67:24 69:5 80:2 81:4,5,24 (15)</p> <p><b>cap</b> 82:16</p> <p><b>capped</b> 73:10</p> <p><b>captioning</b> 4:9</p> <p><b>car</b> 32:22 33:3,18 44:16,21,23,24,25 45:4 46:21 59:23 60:24 61:10,17,21 68:15 69:14 74:19 75:3,10,11 80:3,6,9,10 81:2,7,8,9,13 83:16 (31)</p> <p><b>car's</b> 85:18</p> <p><b>card</b> 22:13,17 23:13</p> <p><b>cars</b> 31:20 60:10 62:4 81:1,5 85:24 86:1 (7)</p> <p><b>case</b> 21:20 69:3,9 84:4 (4)</p> <p><b>cases</b> 57:21</p> <p><b>cash</b> 14:4</p> <p><b>catch</b> 5:6</p> <p><b>category</b> 33:11</p> <p><b>cathleen</b> 70:20</p> <p><b>causing</b> 44:7</p> <p><b>cellphone</b> 39:9</p> <p><b>center</b> 34:18,24 38:16 64:3,8 70:21 71:2 76:1,6 (9)</p> <p><b>cents</b> 5:22 41:2 53:18</p> <p><b>ceo</b> 18:11</p>	<p><b>certain</b> 15:23 25:2 26:24 79:10 (4)</p> <p><b>certainly</b> 52:6</p> <p><b>certify</b> 89:8,13</p> <p><b>chair</b> 17 4:12 18:9 83:7 (4)</p> <p><b>chairman</b> 27:18 51:15 53:2</p> <p><b>chairperson</b> 28:22 75:21</p> <p><b>chairperson's</b> 30:17</p> <p><b>challenges</b> 19:8 48:17</p> <p><b>championing</b> 21:5</p> <p><b>chan</b> 2:8 4:25</p> <p><b>chance</b> 35:1 48:21 76:9</p> <p><b>change</b> 21:18,23 22:2 23:7 31:15 56:20 59:1 64:10 79:7 88:2 (10)</p> <p><b>changed</b> 81:12</p> <p><b>changes</b> 11:2,15 21:13 23:19 24:2 37:9 87:15 88:1,6 (9)</p> <p><b>changing</b> 8:7 44:8</p> <p><b>channels</b> 19:20</p> <p><b>chaos</b> 59:8</p> <p><b>charge</b> 75:8</p> <p><b>charged</b> 12:13</p> <p><b>cheap</b> 62:4,4</p> <p><b>chin</b> 68:3,4,8,9 70:10 (5)</p> <p><b>chipman</b> 42:22,23,24 46:18 47:14 54:20 (6)</p> <p><b>choice</b> 19:24</p> <p><b>chow</b> 17:25 18:2,6,9,11 40:8,9,13,16 42:11 (10)</p>	<p><b>cidny</b> 34:24</p> <p><b>circumstances</b> 58:13</p> <p><b>city</b> 2 12:15 17:12 24:18 26:14 31:19 35:20,25 41:4 43:1,20,20 44:12 50:17,21,25 51:1,23 52:6,12 53:12,19 60:16 68:18 70:14 71:12,21,25 73:6,13,14,16,22 74:4,22 75:17 78:18 82:9 83:12 (39)</p> <p><b>city's</b> 7:7 8:16 73:11</p> <p><b>cityback</b> 43:21</p> <p><b>civil</b> 74:3</p> <p><b>clarity</b> 8:13</p> <p><b>class</b> 44:15 57:7</p> <p><b>claw</b> 54:10</p> <p><b>clawback</b> 56:14</p> <p><b>clawbacks</b> 45:22</p> <p><b>clear</b> 10:8 37:17 46:2 58:5 65:3 (5)</p> <p><b>clearance</b> 45:19 46:6</p> <p><b>close</b> 88:9,13</p> <p><b>closed</b> 4:9</p> <p><b>closely</b> 6:4 25:3 26:8</p> <p><b>closer</b> 16:4</p> <p><b>closing</b> 45:15</p> <p><b>code</b> 7:7</p> <p><b>collect</b> 25:8 40:24 45:17</p> <p><b>collecting</b> 40:21</p> <p><b>collins</b> 70:20,23,25 71:5 78:19 (5)</p> <p><b>come</b> 32:7 52:11,12 58:20</p>
--	---	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

<b>January 9, 2025</b>		
<b>85:10 (5)</b>	<b>communities 65:10</b>	<b>consider 55:5</b>
<b>comes 12:5 23:6</b>	<b>community 34:23 48:16 49:12,21 50:11 65:8 70:1 (7)</b>	<b>consideration 30:24</b>
<b>comfortable 8:4</b>	<b>company 23:11</b>	<b>considering 20:14 36:17</b>
<b>commensurate 26:1</b>	<b>compared 86:3</b>	<b>considers 67:12</b>
<b>comment 17:14 76:23 84:11,18 (4)</b>	<b>comparison 73:4</b>	<b>constantly 51:1</b>
<b>comments 3:23 6:18 7:1 17:16 28:2 30:22 39:24 61:25 71:13 86:20 87:6,10,13,23 88:8,14 (16)</b>	<b>compensation 7:9,24,25</b>	<b>contact 61:16 62:2</b>
<b>commerce 73:19</b>	<b>compete 73:17</b>	<b>contained 30:21</b>
<b>commission 3 3:24 11:12 17:19 20:3,21 21:17,25 24:20 27:6,19 28:13,17,23 30:6,9,13,23 34:21 36:1,5 51:16 65:4 71:21 85:7 (25)</b>	<b>competed 32:15</b>	<b>content 19:19 26:18</b>
<b>commission's 72:1 78:5</b>	<b>competition 31:25 32:10,13</b>	<b>context 51:19</b>
<b>commissioner 17 2:4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,15 4:12,14,24 10:25 11:6,8,10 14:24 15:1,13,19,21 16:22 17:1 18:7 20:16,20 24:3,5 27:7 31:1,4,6 34:13,17 36:19,21 38:10 39:19 40:6,11,14 42:20 47:12,19 49:23,25 50:6 51:10,11 54:23 55:2 56:2 58:16,18 59:2 61:24 62:7,8,20 64:1 66:8 68:2,6,9 70:19 71:4 74:8,14 75:24 79:12,17 83:1,7 84:16 85:2,8 86:23 87:1,4,5 88:12 (82)</b>	<b>competitive 29:2 73:18</b>	<b>continue 12:4,22 25:20 29:4,6,11 53:4 54:4 56:4,18 57:14 64:15 86:11 (13)</b>
<b>commissioners 2:3 14:24 16:20 17:17 18:10 20:14 55:2 58:23 79:7 83:8 88:9 (11)</b>	<b>complete 3:25</b>	<b>continued 73:2</b>
<b>commissioners' 40:1</b>	<b>complexity 19:3</b>	<b>continuing 27:5 63:24,24</b>
<b>commit 59:14</b>	<b>compliance 12:19</b>	<b>contract 21:19,22</b>
<b>commitment 77:9</b>	<b>complicated 22:22</b>	<b>contracts 21:16</b>
<b>committed 9:9</b>	<b>comply 9:12 10:20</b>	<b>control 3:17 27:1 33:19 65:25 (4)</b>
	<b>concern 8:19 26:19</b>	<b>controls 60:12</b>
	<b>concerned 29:12 30:8 35:11 38:17 52:16 77:1 (6)</b>	<b>conversion 4:19</b>
	<b>concerns 24:23 25:21 30:20 55:5 (4)</b>	<b>conversions 8:20 10:5</b>
	<b>conclude 17:9</b>	<b>convert 71:17,23</b>
	<b>concludes 27:8 87:2</b>	<b>converting 12:17</b>
	<b>conducted 3:5</b>	<b>copies 17:16</b>
	<b>confirm 4:7</b>	<b>copy 21:21</b>
	<b>congenital 71:9</b>	<b>core 87:16</b>
	<b>congestion 5:9 33:17,20 40:21,25 41:1 (6)</b>	<b>correct 16:18</b>
	<b>consecutive 10:12</b>	<b>cost 28:12 41:7,8,13,14 59:10 64:24 67:25 72:2 83:16 88:3</b>

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025		
(11)	<b>customer</b> 48:12 66:17,21	<b>define</b> 32:17,19
<b>costly</b> 26:5 56:9	<b>customers</b> 32:25 48:5 51:1 80:25,25 81:3 (6)	<b>definitely</b> 75:10
<b>costs</b> 12:17 15:7	<b>cut</b> 53:10,22 59:6 72:21 80:7 82:2,13,14 83:25 84:1 (10)	<b>delivering</b> 20:10
<b>could</b> 35:15 44:22 86:4	<b>cutting</b> 51:4,6 83:20	<b>delivers</b> 19:12
<b>councilmember</b> 21:5	<b>cycle</b> 29:19 54:18	<b>demands</b> 54:16
<b>counsel</b> 2:12 27:20	<b>dad</b> 63:15	<b>demonstrates</b> 13:12
<b>counting</b> 45:10	<b>daily</b> 48:25 86:9	<b>deny</b> 30:13
<b>country</b> 22:6 23:2,5	<b>dart</b> 18:3,12,16 19:12 (4)	<b>depend</b> 36:15 68:1
<b>county</b> 89:5	<b>data</b> 25:8,11 26:13,16,23 72:1 (6)	<b>depends</b> 65:8
<b>course</b> 83:11	<b>daunting</b> 44:1	<b>deputy</b> 2:15 10:24 11:10
<b>court</b> 21 8:13,18 9:11 10:20 11:16,17 12:20,23 52:19 77:18 (11)	<b>david</b> 16 2:4 4:13	<b>deregulated</b> 33:18
<b>courts</b> 52:5	<b>day</b> 48:17,18 80:23,24 81:2,6 82:25 86:2,3,4,25 89:18 (12)	<b>derived</b> 7:9
<b>cover</b> 45:10 86:8	<b>days</b> 44:20,24 81:15	<b>desai</b> 51:13,14,17 53:25 54:15 (5)
<b>covered</b> 16:17	<b>deal</b> 6:15 31:23 61:12	<b>desert</b> 67:17
<b>create</b> 59:8	<b>dealer</b> 42:8 60:24 69:14,16,16,21 81:8 (7)	<b>deserve</b> 67:24
<b>created</b> 32:9 33:11	<b>dealers</b> 60:22,23 61:7 75:7 (4)	<b>desperately</b> 23:23
<b>creating</b> 44:14 57:7	<b>death</b> 54:9	<b>detail</b> 6:15
<b>credit</b> 22:13,17 23:13	<b>december</b> 12:6 17:13	<b>detailed</b> 54:15
<b>crisis</b> 8:22	<b>decides</b> 43:7	<b>determined</b> 14:8
<b>critical</b> 24:24 35:4	<b>decision</b> 11:16,17 30:18 44:2 (4)	<b>detriment</b> 54:19
<b>crossing</b> 60:5	<b>declined</b> 8:23	<b>devalued</b> 57:11
<b>curb</b> 73:17	<b>decreasing</b> 15:10	<b>developed</b> 30:16
<b>current</b> 9:16,23 11:19 13:6,24 32:3 41:17 59:25 65:10 67:3,6 69:1 (12)	<b>dedicated</b> 66:16	<b>developing</b> 12:9
<b>currently</b> 12:13 16:1 24:17 26:11 68:15 (5)	<b>deemed</b> 30:19	<b>device</b> 7:23 26:13
		<b>dexterity</b> 78:9
		<b>dialogue</b> 27:5



In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

97

<p><b>didn't</b> 5:6 22:12 31:17 47:15 79:22 (5)</p> <p><b>die</b> 41:22</p> <p><b>difference</b> 13:8</p> <p><b>differences</b> 65:22</p> <p><b>different</b> 31:18 77:8 79:4</p> <p><b>difficult</b> 72:18 87:11</p> <p><b>digital</b> 39:9</p> <p><b>dignity</b> 82:11</p> <p><b>director</b> 20:23 51:17 64:7 76:6 (4)</p> <p><b>disabilities</b> 35:5 36:11,18 40:3 48:14 60:8 65:16,20 66:12,19,25 67:7 72:7 (13)</p> <p><b>disability</b> 32:6 35:3 39:11 42:15 50:2 65:8 69:25 71:14 78:2,10 83:22 87:7 (12)</p> <p><b>disabled</b> 34:19,25 36:23,25 38:17,24 50:19,24 51:3,5 64:4,9 69:4 70:2,3,5,22 71:3,8 76:2,7 77:24 78:8 79:3,5 82:10 (26)</p> <p><b>disadvantage</b> 29:3,17</p> <p><b>discount</b> 43:12,17</p> <p><b>discourage</b> 35:15</p> <p><b>discuss</b> 48:1 55:4</p> <p><b>discussing</b> 6:10</p> <p><b>dispatch</b> 36:10 38:20 39:4,23 47:25 48:9,25 49:5,20 50:16,20,23 51:7 65:2,6,11 66:7,14,24 67:13 73:1 78:8,13,21 79:8 86:18 (26)</p> <p><b>dispatched</b> 60:10 65:17 67:2</p> <p><b>dispatcher</b> 47:25</p>	<p><b>dispatchers</b> 49:18</p> <p><b>display</b> 4:4 26:2</p> <p><b>displays</b> 25:18</p> <p><b>disputes</b> 21:21</p> <p><b>distribution</b> 9:23</p> <p><b>distributions</b> 9:17</p> <p><b>dmv</b> 34:15</p> <p><b>doctor</b> 42:17</p> <p><b>doctors'</b> 48:22</p> <p><b>documentation</b> 26:3</p> <p><b>does</b> 9:22 44:12 59:2 85:19,22 (5)</p> <p><b>dollar</b> 5:23 15:24 16:6 40:23 41:3,15 53:9 57:15 68:17 75:13,15,16 80:8 83:21 86:6 (15)</p> <p><b>dollars</b> 15:22 16:8 60:14,16 72:14 75:1 85:15 (7)</p> <p><b>done</b> 16:12 22:4 23:1,1 (4)</p> <p><b>double</b> 45:3</p> <p><b>dov</b> 55:15 56:17,23,25 (4)</p> <p><b>down</b> 5:22 49:8 50:16 85:19 (4)</p> <p><b>drafted</b> 26:11</p> <p><b>drag</b> 9:22</p> <p><b>dramatically</b> 52:1</p> <p><b>drastic</b> 88:1</p> <p><b>drawing</b> 6:25</p> <p><b>drive</b> 69:5 74:18 79:20 82:1 (4)</p>	<p><b>driver</b> 6:5 11:24 14:10 15:23 29:25 41:11 55:13 57:18 65:1 68:17 75:10 78:7,20 79:20 82:15 84:2 (16)</p> <p><b>driverowner</b> 57:1</p> <p><b>driverowners</b> 58:3</p> <p><b>drivers</b> 7:11,24 10:3 14:10 18:20 19:4 20:9 21:10,15,20 23:4,22 24:1,15,17 28:16,19 29:7 35:13,16,24 36:3,8 41:21 53:8 54:3 55:7,16 57:14 59:8 64:14,17 67:23 72:20 76:22 77:2 82:1,20 85:18 86:6,10 87:7 (42)</p> <p><b>drivers'</b> 20:24 37:24</p> <p><b>drives</b> 5:18</p> <p><b>driving</b> 38:2</p> <p><b>due</b> 63:15</p> <p><b>during</b> 72:13,14,16</p> <p><b>e</b> 15,15 2:1,1 89:1,1 (6)</p> <p><b>each</b> 7:22,22 17:4 32:15 (4)</p> <p><b>early</b> 55:13</p> <p><b>earned</b> 19:23</p> <p><b>earnings</b> 6:5</p> <p><b>ears</b> 44:10</p> <p><b>ease</b> 56:8</p> <p><b>easier</b> 42:16 69:13,17,22 (4)</p> <p><b>easily</b> 85:19</p> <p><b>easy</b> 69:20 70:4</p> <p><b>economic</b> 51:25</p> <p><b>ecosystem</b> 55:24</p> <p><b>effective</b> 25:16 78:12</p>
---	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

98

<p><b>efforts</b> 13:13 76:19</p> <p><b>ehail</b> 31:19 60:13 66:7,13 (4)</p> <p><b>ehails</b> 60:13</p> <p><b>eight</b> 60:14</p> <p><b>either</b> 23:12</p> <p><b>elbia</b> 21 89:7</p> <p><b>elderly</b> 38:24</p> <p><b>electronic</b> 7:15 21:22</p> <p><b>electronically</b> 21:16</p> <p><b>eligibility</b> 56:20 57:5</p> <p><b>eligible</b> 57:8,9</p> <p><b>eliminate</b> 13:15 14:9 28:14 29:14 35:12 38:7 59:17 86:5 (8)</p> <p><b>eliminated</b> 56:24 72:6</p> <p><b>eliminating</b> 10:1 15:20 37:10</p> <p><b>elimination</b> 54:17 77:1 78:12</p> <p><b>elisa</b> 2:7</p> <p><b>else</b> 37:7 48:24 87:9</p> <p><b>elsewhere</b> 50:18</p> <p><b>eluto</b> 2:12 17:1 18:7 20:16 24:5 27:7 31:1,6 34:17 36:21 38:10 40:6 42:20 47:19 49:25 50:6 51:11 54:23 58:18 62:8,20 64:1 68:2,6 70:19 71:4 74:8,14 75:24 79:12,17 83:1 85:2,8 86:23 87:1 (36)</p> <p><b>eman</b> 50:1,10</p> <p><b>emergency</b> 67:18</p> <p><b>employees</b> 49:19 67:7</p> <p><b>empty</b> 38:8 60:6</p>	<p><b>enable</b> 4:7</p> <p><b>encourage</b> 10:17 28:16 30:5 36:5 56:18 (5)</p> <p><b>encouraged</b> 28:4,21</p> <p><b>end</b> 12:1 14:19 29:22 60:23 61:8 86:5,17 (7)</p> <p><b>endeavor</b> 77:6</p> <p><b>ends</b> 17:14</p> <p><b>enforced</b> 17:6</p> <p><b>engagement</b> 19:23</p> <p><b>enjoy</b> 47:17</p> <p><b>enough</b> 66:11 86:7,8</p> <p><b>ensure</b> 4:3 8:3 36:14 56:17 (4)</p> <p><b>ensures</b> 48:5</p> <p><b>enter</b> 58:6</p> <p><b>entered</b> 51:24</p> <p><b>entertainment</b> 19:18 23:24</p> <p><b>entire</b> 49:21</p> <p><b>entirely</b> 26:14</p> <p><b>entitled</b> 43:9 47:6</p> <p><b>equal</b> 13:23</p> <p><b>equitable</b> 48:6</p> <p><b>equity</b> 51:8 58:14</p> <p><b>especially</b> 40:20 41:7,15 63:10 71:15 78:1 (6)</p> <p><b>essence</b> 49:12</p> <p><b>essential</b> 26:16 35:8 67:25 78:22 (4)</p>	<p><b>essentially</b> 78:22</p> <p><b>establish</b> 7:12 73:14</p> <p><b>established</b> 52:3</p> <p><b>establishes</b> 7:20</p> <p><b>estimated</b> 13:8</p> <p><b>ev</b> 5:11</p> <p><b>evan</b> 2:15 10:24 11:4,9 14:25 16:15,23 64:2,6 (9)</p> <p><b>evans's</b> 87:20</p> <p><b>even</b> 12:22 44:3 52:9 59:24 60:7 61:12 67:21 75:14 83:22 (9)</p> <p><b>evening</b> 72:15</p> <p><b>event</b> 46:21</p> <p><b>eventful</b> 5:4</p> <p><b>everincreasing</b> 63:13</p> <p><b>every</b> 16:6 29:16 32:13 44:9 56:21,21 59:4 80:14 81:2,6 88:2 (11)</p> <p><b>everybody</b> 22:20 47:16 52:5 83:24 (4)</p> <p><b>everyone</b> 4:15 5:3 37:7 40:15 47:23 62:12 64:6 73:12 75:22 77:25 87:6,9 88:14 (13)</p> <p><b>everything</b> 86:12</p> <p><b>everywhere</b> 37:7,8</p> <p><b>exactly</b> 32:20 45:17</p> <p><b>examine</b> 7:23</p> <p><b>example</b> 26:15</p> <p><b>except</b> 85:25</p> <p><b>exchange</b> 10:4</p>
---	---	---

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

99

<p><b>exclude</b> 66:11</p> <p><b>exclusive</b> 31:13</p> <p><b>exclusives</b> 32:4</p> <p><b>excuse</b> 9:7 28:8</p> <p><b>executive</b> 51:17 76:5</p> <p><b>exemption</b> 5:19 69:10</p> <p><b>existing</b> 10:8 56:4 59:25 86:10 (4)</p> <p><b>exists</b> 39:4</p> <p><b>expectations</b> 87:25</p> <p><b>expense</b> 52:22</p> <p><b>expenses</b> 45:11 86:9</p> <p><b>expensive</b> 28:9 41:9 59:6 75:3 (4)</p> <p><b>experience</b> 8:4 18:21 19:9,19 (4)</p> <p><b>experienced</b> 65:15</p> <p><b>expired</b> 34:6 46:17 54:14 61:14 82:22 (5)</p> <p><b>explore</b> 19:20 28:17</p> <p><b>expose</b> 25:10</p> <p><b>extend</b> 86:14</p> <p><b>extensions</b> 58:7 77:16</p> <p><b>extensive</b> 25:21 28:1</p> <p><b>extra</b> 16:8</p> <p><b>extremitydexterity</b> 38:21</p> <p><b>f</b> 15 89:1</p> <p><b>face</b> 44:5 48:17 66:19,25 67:4 (5)</p>	<p><b>facebook</b> 3:7</p> <p><b>facing</b> 28:7</p> <p><b>fact</b> 30:9 32:11</p> <p><b>fail</b> 67:16</p> <p><b>failed</b> 67:21 77:13</p> <p><b>fair</b> 45:9 69:8 76:24 80:8 81:15 83:22 (6)</p> <p><b>fairly</b> 67:23</p> <p><b>falls</b> 11:13</p> <p><b>family</b> 43:4</p> <p><b>fare</b> 41:11</p> <p><b>fares</b> 32:15 60:12</p> <p><b>faster</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>father</b> 70:1,2</p> <p><b>favor</b> 33:21</p> <p><b>feasible</b> 8:11</p> <p><b>featuring</b> 19:19</p> <p><b>february</b> 48:15</p> <p><b>federal</b> 9:11 10:20 12:20 41:4 53:13,20 77:18 (7)</p> <p><b>federation</b> 62:17</p> <p><b>fee</b> 41:16</p> <p><b>feedback</b> 6:24</p> <p><b>feel</b> 47:11</p> <p><b>feelings</b> 5:12</p> <p><b>fees</b> 59:7,19</p> <p><b>few</b> 24:24</p> <p><b>fewer</b> 35:17</p>	<p><b>fewest</b> 65:18 66:3</p> <p><b>fhv</b> 5:23 17:22</p> <p><b>field</b> 72:10</p> <p><b>fifteen</b> 60:17</p> <p><b>fifty</b> 8:16 58:8</p> <p><b>fight</b> 31:25 80:2</p> <p><b>final</b> 24:24 85:3</p> <p><b>finally</b> 26:11 73:1 77:16</p> <p><b>finance</b> 6:13</p> <p><b>financial</b> 28:6 52:22 58:2</p> <p><b>find</b> 12:8 36:6 41:5,11 42:16 50:17 53:14 62:4 65:25 67:22 (10)</p> <p><b>fine</b> 44:19 56:15</p> <p><b>first</b> 5:2,7,10 7:4 17:21,24 18:2 21:14 22:15 27:12,14 43:6 51:23 52:2,10 77:8 79:20 (17)</p> <p><b>five</b> 13:25 41:18 43:15 48:19 56:16 72:14 84:7,22 (8)</p> <p><b>fivestar</b> 20:10</p> <p><b>fiveyear</b> 42:4 56:13</p> <p><b>fixers</b> 61:15</p> <p><b>fixture</b> 25:17 26:9</p> <p><b>fleet</b> 8:16 9:4,18 16:2,3 32:8 77:15 (7)</p> <p><b>fleets</b> 76:14 87:8</p> <p><b>flexibility</b> 20:9 57:1 76:17</p> <p><b>floccari</b> 47:20,21,22,24 (4)</p> <p><b>floor</b> 4:12</p>
--	---	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

100

<p><b>focused</b> 64:21</p> <p><b>followed</b> 17:25 18:1</p> <p><b>following</b> 12:10 54:12</p> <p><b>follows</b> 46:15,20</p> <p><b>followup</b> 39:1</p> <p><b>forbid</b> 22:4 54:9</p> <p><b>force</b> 43:10</p> <p><b>forced</b> 19:25 28:13 79:21 80:1 (4)</p> <p><b>forhire</b> 4:22 7:8,10 37:4 76:14 (5)</p> <p><b>form</b> 20:1</p> <p><b>formal</b> 7:12</p> <p><b>formally</b> 47:15</p> <p><b>formats</b> 19:10</p> <p><b>forth</b> 6:17 9:13 48:22 81:10 (4)</p> <p><b>forward</b> 13:1 27:4 46:25 47:5 (4)</p> <p><b>foster</b> 18:23</p> <p><b>fought</b> 5:19</p> <p><b>found</b> 61:13</p> <p><b>founder</b> 18:11 62:15</p> <p><b>four</b> 30:7 53:6 55:19 56:22 60:16 81:3 86:15 (7)</p> <p><b>fourth</b> 43:3</p> <p><b>fouryear</b> 10:12 42:4</p> <p><b>framework</b> 7:20</p> <p><b>free</b> 47:11</p>	<p><b>frequently</b> 46:3</p> <p><b>friend</b> 81:21</p> <p><b>fuel</b> 86:1</p> <p><b>full</b> 5:4 62:24 86:16</p> <p><b>fully</b> 35:9</p> <p><b>fund</b> 4:18 8:8 9:20,23,24 10:21 11:15,19 37:10 38:18 41:6 42:12,14 64:11 73:10 74:4 85:12 88:5 (18)</p> <p><b>funded</b> 29:21 50:15</p> <p><b>funding</b> 12:15 36:6 53:21 68:12,19,21 70:15,17 72:19 73:8 79:8 (11)</p> <p><b>funds</b> 29:15 36:2 56:14 57:14 59:11 64:24 72:25 73:11 78:6,18 (10)</p> <p><b>funeral</b> 49:3</p> <p><b>further</b> 7:2 9:6 26:3 58:2 64:15 72:11 89:13 (7)</p> <p><b>future</b> 87:19</p> <p><b>game</b> 49:2,3</p> <p><b>garage</b> 87:8</p> <p><b>gas</b> 80:23 85:24,24 86:8 (4)</p> <p><b>gateway</b> 49:5</p> <p><b>gave</b> 43:21 83:15</p> <p><b>gears</b> 27:10</p> <p><b>general</b> 2:12 27:20 73:11</p> <p><b>generally</b> 21:8</p> <p><b>generated</b> 7:21</p> <p><b>generation</b> 43:4</p> <p><b>generic</b> 66:20</p>	<p><b>get</b> 33:20 37:6 42:12 44:18,20 47:15 60:11,11,15,15,16 62:2 67:2 68:19 69:4,17,18 70:4,5,11,15,16,16,17 72:18 77:9,18,25 81:1,5 86:11 (31)</p> <p><b>gets</b> 32:21</p> <p><b>getting</b> 6:5 15:4 51:2 60:3 69:5 72:24 (6)</p> <p><b>giuseppe</b> 47:20,23 49:24 65:14 (4)</p> <p><b>give</b> 9:17 11:1,14 15:11 31:23 32:3,18 41:6 44:12 59:3,24 60:9,20,21 61:6,6,11,21 66:6 80:4,5 81:19 82:10,14 84:2,9,10 (27)</p> <p><b>given</b> 27:1 41:3</p> <p><b>gives</b> 34:10 55:15</p> <p><b>giving</b> 12:20 15:16 36:7 39:5 59:16 74:6 83:13,18 (8)</p> <p><b>glaucoma</b> 63:15</p> <p><b>global</b> 8:22</p> <p><b>go</b> 12:1 16:8 31:17 37:8 42:13 48:23 54:7 74:15 75:3 77:17 80:20 81:10,13 82:17 87:22 (15)</p> <p><b>goal</b> 9:6 77:22</p> <p><b>goals</b> 32:2,6</p> <p><b>god</b> 54:9</p> <p><b>godashi</b> 79:14,15,18,19 82:6,23 (6)</p> <p><b>goes</b> 6:16</p> <p><b>going</b> 7:1 11:13 13:1 28:23 31:11,11 38:18 44:16 46:25 47:5 49:2 52:9 58:25 59:18 61:5,6 63:1 72:22 75:6 82:2,7,8,12,17 (24)</p>
---	--	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

101

<p><b>good</b> 3:2 4:14 5:14 17:1 20:19 24:8 27:17 34:20 36:24 37:18 38:5 40:9,14 42:23 43:18,20 47:13,22 50:9 51:14 55:1 58:22 61:12,12,13 62:11 64:5 68:8 71:19 74:17 76:3 80:4 83:7,10,11 85:6,8,16 86:19 (39)</p> <p><b>got</b> 5:21 6:23 31:10 74:20 77:3 86:11 (6)</p> <p><b>gotten</b> 23:3</p> <p><b>governing</b> 26:9</p> <p><b>government</b> 41:5 53:13</p> <p><b>grandfathered</b> 45:12</p> <p><b>grant</b> 10:4,8 12:21 13:12,23,25 15:12 29:1 30:5,19 31:10 37:12 41:6,17,19,20,24 42:2,5 53:3,5 56:20 57:4,8,10 59:1,3,13,21,25 60:20,21 69:13 (33)</p> <p><b>grants</b> 12:16 13:5,16 14:10 15:11 (5)</p> <p><b>grateful</b> 48:20</p> <p><b>great</b> 6:15 85:14</p> <p><b>greedy</b> 75:8</p> <p><b>green</b> 33:7,12 49:21</p> <p><b>greenbaum</b> 54:25 55:1,9 58:1 (4)</p> <p><b>greenblatt</b> 18:1 20:18,19,22 23:17 (5)</p> <p><b>gross</b> 7:21</p> <p><b>growing</b> 79:9</p> <p><b>guarantee</b> 32:4 82:7</p> <p><b>guaranteed</b> 14:4</p>	<p><b>guarantees</b> 43:21</p> <p><b>guild</b> 20:24</p> <p><b>guy</b> 84:16</p> <p><b>hacked</b> 56:6</p> <p><b>hackup</b> 11:22 12:16 13:5,23,24 15:12 41:19,24 42:1,1,2 53:3 (12)</p> <p><b>hackups</b> 9:1,15</p> <p><b>hail</b> 31:13 32:1,17,19,22,24 33:2,5,18 72:11 (10)</p> <p><b>hailed</b> 32:23</p> <p><b>hailing</b> 33:4</p> <p><b>half</b> 9:7 23:5</p> <p><b>hand</b> 26:21 32:25 37:21 89:18 (4)</p> <p><b>handicap</b> 42:16</p> <p><b>happen</b> 23:10 35:19 52:15 54:12 70:13 (5)</p> <p><b>happened</b> 31:18 61:19</p> <p><b>happening</b> 39:7</p> <p><b>happens</b> 22:6</p> <p><b>happiness</b> 82:11</p> <p><b>happy</b> 5:3 62:12</p> <p><b>hard</b> 6:14 8:21 78:2 85:18 87:21 (5)</p> <p><b>hardship</b> 28:6</p> <p><b>hardworking</b> 6:7 42:14</p> <p><b>has</b> 6:7 21:23 24:13 34:6 44:16 46:17 47:10 52:1,7 54:14 61:14 63:15 71:11 76:11 77:5 82:22 (16)</p>	<p><b>hat</b> 48:13</p> <p><b>having</b> 43:17 45:4 62:13 63:4,21,21 66:19 (7)</p> <p><b>he</b> 33:2 61:4,21 63:15 81:22,24 84:4,5,18,20 (10)</p> <p><b>he's</b> 32:21 81:23</p> <p><b>head</b> 24:10 87:18</p> <p><b>headquartered</b> 18:13</p> <p><b>headspace</b> 19:22</p> <p><b>health</b> 55:23</p> <p><b>hear</b> 18:8 31:5 40:10,12 50:5 68:5 74:11,13 79:15 (9)</p> <p><b>heard</b> 28:21 83:23 84:14 85:17 87:14 (5)</p> <p><b>hearing</b> 4 3:3,4,11 4:16,20 6:19,21 16:25 17:15,21 22:23 27:8 78:14 87:3 88:10,13 (17)</p> <p><b>heart</b> 62:10,15</p> <p><b>heavy</b> 80:20</p> <p><b>held</b> 11 6:21 45:21 46:4 (4)</p> <p><b>hello</b> 31:4 40:9 47:16 68:4,4,6 85:6 (7)</p> <p><b>help</b> 10:16 28:11 41:10 48:12 60:1 62:3,5 69:2 77:21 82:20 (10)</p> <p><b>here</b> 47:15 48:1 49:15 62:13 64:9 66:10 67:8 71:15 72:22 77:4,20 85:10 (12)</p> <p><b>here's</b> 7:3</p> <p><b>hereby</b> 89:8</p> <p><b>hereunto</b> 89:17</p> <p><b>hi</b> 20:19 38:13,13 47:22 50:4 79:15,18 (7)</p>
---	--	--

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

102

<p><b>high</b> 41:9 59:23 60:23 61:8 80:11 (5)</p> <p><b>higher</b> 41:19</p> <p><b>highest</b> 13:10</p> <p><b>highlighted</b> 25:1</p> <p><b>hike</b> 80:12</p> <p><b>him</b> 60:25 61:21 84:19</p> <p><b>hines</b> 2:15 10:24 11:5,9 15:8,18 16:16 (7)</p> <p><b>his</b> 33:3</p> <p><b>hit</b> 8:21 44:7 45:3</p> <p><b>hold</b> 46:12</p> <p><b>hole</b> 12:2</p> <p><b>home</b> 63:14</p> <p><b>honor</b> 56:4</p> <p><b>hood</b> 34:8</p> <p><b>hope</b> 29:5</p> <p><b>hoping</b> 5:13</p> <p><b>hour</b> 41:12</p> <p><b>hours</b> 72:14,15</p> <p><b>how</b> 6:4 8:8 9:14 13:7 21:15 31:11 35:4 36:17 37:24 40:1 45:17 60:19 64:10 70:3 77:3 88:4 (16)</p> <p><b>however</b> 35:11 38:15 87:16</p> <p><b>huge</b> 43:23 44:6</p> <p><b>humanity</b> 37:24</p> <p><b>humphrey</b> 27:14 34:18,20,22 (4)</p> <p><b>hundred</b> 9:15 24:15 70:12</p>	<p><b>hurdle</b> 26:5</p> <p><b>hybrid</b> 85:25</p> <p><b>i'd</b> 5:2 6:12 58:24</p> <p><b>i'll</b> 16:23 87:3 88:9</p> <p><b>i'm</b> 11:9,13 15:2,2 20:22 31:9,11 34:22 35:11 37:2 39:9 40:16,16 42:24 43:1,3 48:7 49:15 50:11 51:17 55:9 58:5,9 62:21,25 63:19 64:7,9 69:23 70:25 71:1,4,7 72:21 76:5 81:6 (36)</p> <p><b>i've</b> 18:4 43:2 48:11</p> <p><b>idea</b> 33:8 56:25 80:5 85:14,17 (5)</p> <p><b>identified</b> 26:22</p> <p><b>idg</b> 20:18,24</p> <p><b>illness</b> 54:8</p> <p><b>immediately</b> 16:7</p> <p><b>imp</b> 40:23 41:3</p> <p><b>impact</b> 8:21 11:18 43:23 57:6 (4)</p> <p><b>impacts</b> 6:4</p> <p><b>implement</b> 46:7</p> <p><b>implementation</b> 7:5</p> <p><b>imploring</b> 63:19</p> <p><b>importance</b> 51:2</p> <p><b>important</b> 21:6,12 22:1 23:20 25:7 84:12,19 (7)</p> <p><b>impossible</b> 44:22</p> <p><b>impractical</b> 26:15</p> <p><b>impressive</b> 34:4</p>	<p><b>improve</b> 8:6 40:2</p> <p><b>improvement</b> 4:18 8:8 11:15 37:10 64:11 78:6 (6)</p> <p><b>incentive</b> 10:3 14:14 64:16 72:6,8,12 (6)</p> <p><b>incentives</b> 12:24 14:15 59:2,7,19 (5)</p> <p><b>incentivize</b> 12:18</p> <p><b>inclement</b> 72:17</p> <p><b>include</b> 39:25</p> <p><b>included</b> 21:23</p> <p><b>including</b> 7:16 10:15 26:17 52:13 54:17 69:25 (6)</p> <p><b>inclusive</b> 35:21</p> <p><b>income</b> 21:10 38:7 45:10 53:11 (4)</p> <p><b>incorporate</b> 6:25</p> <p><b>increase</b> 12:4,12,16 13:5 14:3 15:9 23:6 28:11 36:13 59:12,21 64:16 68:12 71:16,22 72:12 76:19 77:6 78:16 (19)</p> <p><b>increases</b> 9:22</p> <p><b>increasing</b> 4:17 9:10 10:4 33:10 35:10 37:12 64:13 (7)</p> <p><b>incredible</b> 5:5</p> <p><b>incredibly</b> 6:19</p> <p><b>indemnification</b> 25:23</p> <p><b>independence</b> 34:19,24 35:9 38:16 64:3,8 70:22 71:2 76:2,7 (10)</p> <p><b>independent</b> 20:23</p> <p><b>individuals</b> 45:9 63:11</p>
---	---	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

103

<p><b>industry</b> 10:22 20:6 33:19 43:3,5 51:25 52:11,24 58:4 (9)</p> <p><b>ineligible</b> 30:19</p> <p><b>inflation</b> 41:9 83:14,19</p> <p><b>inflight</b> 19:17</p> <p><b>information</b> 22:13 23:14 25:10 26:24 63:8 (5)</p> <p><b>initial</b> 85:13</p> <p><b>initially</b> 6:2</p> <p><b>injury</b> 54:8</p> <p><b>innovation</b> 11:1,11 19:1</p> <p><b>insignificant</b> 73:4</p> <p><b>instance</b> 19:12 54:10</p> <p><b>instances</b> 44:21</p> <p><b>instead</b> 5:16 20:7 22:25 25:15 26:7 33:9 38:8 69:18 86:15 (9)</p> <p><b>insurance</b> 25:22 80:12</p> <p><b>integration</b> 19:8</p> <p><b>intended</b> 8:6 18:22</p> <p><b>intention</b> 56:8 66:6</p> <p><b>interactive</b> 24:11</p> <p><b>interest</b> 50:13</p> <p><b>interested</b> 89:15</p> <p><b>interior</b> 4:21 6:22 7:8,16 17:22 21:3 24:14 25:6,14,19 26:2 27:9 (12)</p> <p><b>interruptions</b> 20:1</p> <p><b>into</b> 5:8 6:6,16 8:10 22:16,18,19 23:22 28:10,25 29:9,20 39:10 44:4 45:12 46:11 48:4 51:24 56:19 78:19</p>	<p>(20)</p> <p><b>invested</b> 58:4</p> <p><b>investment</b> 73:19,21</p> <p><b>involve</b> 88:3</p> <p><b>ipad</b> 19:14</p> <p><b>is</b> 3:3,4,5,15,25 4:9 6:10 7:4 8:5,8 9:10 10:19 11:9,20 13:4,12,18,23 14:4,7 15:21,24 16:7,10,15 17:10 18:6,11 20:22 22:6 23:11 24:6,9 25:6 26:16,25 27:19 28:5,13,23 29:24,24 30:14,18 31:2,10,11 32:24 34:4,17,21 35:4,24 36:22 38:3,11 40:7,15 41:9 42:21,24 43:18,19 44:1,5,10,15 45:9 46:2,2,3,4,5,10,12,21,22 47:23 48:25 49:2,5 50:10 51:4,7,8,12,16 52:18 53:10,16,20 54:24 55:9,21,24 57:1,2 58:8,19,23,25 59:13,20 60:14 61:5 62:9,13,19 64:2,6,11 65:4,6,15 66:10,15,22 67:4 68:3,9 70:20 71:9,19 72:3 73:2,4,20,21,24 74:3,17 75:11,12 76:4,24 77:8 78:15,22 79:13,18,23,25 80:1,6,8,13,18,19 81:14,20 82:6 83:9,13,21,24 84:3,13,16,16,17,19 85:14,16,20 86:13 87:10,11,18,21,21 89:11 (171)</p> <p><b>isn't</b> 9:15</p> <p><b>issuance</b> 53:19</p> <p><b>issue</b> 21:6 87:17,18</p> <p><b>issued</b> 9:8 33:7</p> <p><b>issues</b> 38:21 54:20 78:9</p> <p><b>its</b> 19:15 53:19 77:13,19,24 87:18 (6)</p> <p><b>itself</b> 9:24 49:11</p> <p><b>january</b> 7 40:20 89:18</p>	<p><b>jean</b> 36:22,25</p> <p><b>job</b> 40:25 75:12</p> <p><b>jobs</b> 51:5 60:9,12</p> <p><b>joe</b> 76:5</p> <p><b>joined</b> 4:23</p> <p><b>joining</b> 3:12</p> <p><b>joseph</b> 75:25</p> <p><b>judge</b> 8:23</p> <p><b>just</b> 6:10 9:3,16 11:6,20 13:25 15:2,25,25 21:14 24:23 31:15 32:24 37:22 39:20 42:1 47:16 49:14 51:19 53:5 59:12,17 60:25 63:1,19 66:1 71:7 72:23 85:24 (29)</p> <p><b>justice</b> 50:3</p> <p><b>kathy</b> 78:19</p> <p><b>kaufman</b> 2:6 4:25</p> <p><b>keep</b> 9:20 11:21 12:10,24 41:14 42:2,3 63:1 68:13,16,23 79:9 (12)</p> <p><b>keeping</b> 44:4</p> <p><b>kenneth</b> 2:8,10</p> <p><b>key</b> 19:4</p> <p><b>kill</b> 50:22</p> <p><b>knew</b> 12:7</p> <p><b>know</b> 22:19 31:10 35:3 38:5 45:16 48:2,5 52:2,25 54:2 60:6 61:19,21 66:4 67:14 68:11,16,18,20,22,24,25 69:7,8,9,11,12,15,17,19,22,24 70:3,3,6 74:20,23 75:1,7,8,9,12,18,20 76:4 81:2,21 84:14,17,23 87:11 (51)</p> <p><b>known</b> 20:24 55:14</p>
--	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

104

<b>knows</b> 52:6	<b>legal</b> 6:13 77:19	<b>lines</b> 63:18
<b>kuber</b> 85:3	<b>legislator</b> 68:19	<b>listen</b> 84:20 87:23
<b>lack</b> 59:11	<b>lengthy</b> 67:1	<b>listener</b> 84:10
<b>ladies</b> 81:4,5	<b>less</b> 83:17	<b>listening</b> 24:1 42:18
<b>language</b> 78:10	<b>let</b> 33:20 35:19 39:20 45:16 54:7 59:15 (6)	<b>litigation</b> 8:15
<b>large</b> 12:20 13:11 26:4 44:5 (4)	<b>letting</b> 47:18	<b>little</b> 26:6
<b>largely</b> 77:5	<b>leveled</b> 72:9	<b>live</b> 3:7 37:7 39:22
<b>larger</b> 15:12	<b>levels</b> 12:25	<b>lived</b> 71:11
<b>last</b> 40:18,18 48:11 73:6 77:17 84:15 (6)	<b>liability</b> 44:3	<b>livelihood</b> 31:14
<b>lastly</b> 57:19	<b>license</b> 7:22 17:23 33:25 34:5,9 49:20 (6)	<b>living</b> 38:6 41:8 50:24
<b>late</b> 70:2 72:16	<b>licensed</b> 5:11 27:24 43:1 55:11 (4)	<b>loans</b> 43:22
<b>later</b> 41:21	<b>licenses</b> 4:22	<b>local</b> 7:5 18:22
<b>law</b> 84:25	<b>licensing</b> 7:13	<b>location</b> 26:16 39:2
<b>laws</b> 7:5 18:22	<b>life</b> 46:11	<b>locking</b> 44:3
<b>lawyers</b> 50:12	<b>lifeline</b> 52:23 53:25	<b>long</b> 10:14 76:12
<b>lead</b> 78:11	<b>lifetime</b> 86:16	<b>longer</b> 30:1,2 35:17 44:20 48:15 53:9 (6)
<b>leadership</b> 84:13	<b>like</b> 5:2 6:12 21:4 24:19,25 31:15,17 34:9 37:6 38:20 53:1 58:24 59:15 60:14 61:17,22,23 65:14 72:22 74:23,24,25 75:3,14,15,17 80:7 81:1 83:23 84:5,20,23 (32)	<b>longterm</b> 55:23
<b>leading</b> 35:16	<b>limit</b> 17:6,10 19:9 66:23 (4)	<b>look</b> 27:4 59:16 61:6 78:18 86:13 (5)
<b>learn</b> 37:24	<b>limited</b> 3:21 57:21 58:12 84:4 (4)	<b>looked</b> 22:18,19
<b>lease</b> 55:18,20 86:6	<b>limousine</b> 3 11:12 20:21 71:21 72:1 (5)	<b>looking</b> 8:10 15:2 22:15 32:14 34:9 39:21 (6)
<b>leasetown</b> 29:18	<b>line</b> 63:6,25	<b>loop</b> 19:16
<b>leasing</b> 55:14 56:23	<b>linear</b> 19:16	<b>loose</b> 75:19 80:24
<b>least</b> 57:12 63:5 72:9		<b>loosing</b> 81:6
<b>leave</b> 29:25 59:21 76:21		<b>lose</b> 81:3,15,15
<b>leaves</b> 16:6		<b>losing</b> 45:3 58:13
<b>left</b> 81:8		



**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

105

<p><b>loss</b> 40:22 41:13 53:11 58:2 (4)</p> <p><b>lost</b> 40:22</p> <p><b>lot</b> 6:17,23,25 16:8 21:10 40:22,22 41:10 50:25 63:8 (10)</p> <p><b>love</b> 60:8</p> <p><b>low</b> 42:4 65:25</p> <p><b>lower</b> 6:1</p> <p><b>lyft</b> 22:12 23:12 26:23</p> <p><b>lying</b> 38:2</p> <p><b>made</b> 23:8 28:3,18,20 33:19 50:14 65:3 77:13 (8)</p> <p><b>mahotra</b> 58:19,20,22,24 61:15 62:1 (6)</p> <p><b>maintain</b> 39:3 66:9 85:19</p> <p><b>maintenance</b> 10:1 28:15 29:4,6 37:11 41:8,16 59:1,7,19 80:9,10 (12)</p> <p><b>major</b> 54:8</p> <p><b>majority</b> 24:23 83:8</p> <p><b>make</b> 8:25 10:16 16:10 21:18,19 26:13 38:6 42:5 44:2 49:15 66:19 69:12,22 70:13 73:9,13 77:25 86:7,8 87:14,24 88:1,3 (23)</p> <p><b>makes</b> 16:13 45:20 78:2</p> <p><b>making</b> 9:24 13:13 24:1 87:9 (4)</p> <p><b>management</b> 49:16 54:25 55:11</p> <p><b>mandate</b> 52:18 58:8</p> <p><b>mandating</b> 19:2 57:3</p> <p><b>manhattan</b> 18:13</p>	<p><b>manjinder</b> 83:2</p> <p><b>many</b> 38:23 44:21 68:1 71:14 73:22 (5)</p> <p><b>march</b> 9:5 51:23</p> <p><b>market</b> 18:23 43:19 58:6</p> <p><b>marriage</b> 89:15</p> <p><b>mass</b> 32:7</p> <p><b>massive</b> 44:7</p> <p><b>matches</b> 4:5</p> <p><b>matching</b> 59:20</p> <p><b>math</b> 15:25</p> <p><b>matter</b> 59:3 89:10,16</p> <p><b>matters</b> 24:24</p> <p><b>max</b> 54:24 55:9 58:17</p> <p><b>may</b> 3:23 8:9,11 54:6 65:22 66:25 78:9,11 (8)</p> <p><b>maybe</b> 74:22,24 75:5,5 81:3 86:4 (6)</p> <p><b>mayor</b> 6:8</p> <p><b>mazer</b> 27:13,14,17,19 30:12 (5)</p> <p><b>me</b> 9:7 28:8 31:5 32:18 33:20 38:20 39:20 40:10 47:18 50:5 61:4,11 62:13 68:5 74:6,13 79:16,21 80:1 81:8 (20)</p> <p><b>mean</b> 5:18 70:4</p> <p><b>means</b> 9:19 32:22 37:13</p> <p><b>meant</b> 6:10</p> <p><b>mechanic</b> 80:16,18,22 81:10 (4)</p> <p><b>mechanism</b> 27:1</p>	<p><b>medallion</b> 8:22 27:24 28:6 30:2,3,18 31:9,12,24 32:13,20,21 33:1,5,22,24 34:2,3,3,3,10 35:14 36:7 41:25 42:22,25 43:2,6,7,10,11,14,17,19,22,24 44:1,4,7,10,13,15 46:1,2,6,10,15,21,22,23 48:3 55:15,18,20,23 56:1 57:7,9 68:14 69:6 76:22 77:15 79:23,25 81:17,20,22,24 82:1 (69)</p> <p><b>medallions</b> 9:8 14:17,18,21 32:6,9 33:10 46:8 47:5 57:8 (10)</p> <p><b>media</b> 5:7 18:14 19:13 24:10 (4)</p> <p><b>medical</b> 49:16 67:18</p> <p><b>meditation</b> 19:22</p> <p><b>meet</b> 12:23 32:5 52:20,20,21 77:13,19,23 (8)</p> <p><b>meeting</b> 3:12 4:5,8,10 17:19 83:23 (6)</p> <p><b>meets</b> 10:14</p> <p><b>member</b> 18:13 40:17 68:10 76:8 (4)</p> <p><b>members</b> 18:9 20:21 27:18 34:21 51:15 (5)</p> <p><b>mentioned</b> 11:9 66:1,9</p> <p><b>menu</b> 67:1</p> <p><b>mess</b> 59:8</p> <p><b>met</b> 58:9</p> <p><b>metropolitan</b> 27:15,21 37:1</p> <p><b>mets</b> 49:3</p> <p><b>mic</b> 18:4 70:24</p> <p><b>michael</b> 17:25 18:2,11 27:13</p>
---	--	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

106

<p>31:2 34:14 (6)</p> <p><b>microphone</b> 3:18 17:3 74:10 83:5 85:5 (5)</p> <p><b>million</b> 12:2,5 13:19,20,21 14:11,12 50:23 (8)</p> <p><b>mind</b> 12:10 14:14 63:21</p> <p><b>minimum</b> 10:14 14:6 42:3</p> <p><b>minutes</b> 3:22 17:5 47:17 60:4,18 (5)</p> <p><b>mistake</b> 31:18 45:20</p> <p><b>mistakes</b> 46:14</p> <p><b>mitchell</b> 2:10 4:24</p> <p><b>mixed</b> 5:12</p> <p><b>mobility</b> 18:15 61:11</p> <p><b>model</b> 12:8,9,14 19:15 55:14,15,22 56:17,23 57:1 (10)</p> <p><b>moderator</b> 3:2,15 4:2,7 (4)</p> <p><b>modifications</b> 55:6</p> <p><b>moment</b> 59:24</p> <p><b>money</b> 6:6 9:18 23:22 30:5 35:23 41:20 45:2,4 46:2,3,10,14,20 47:4 50:17 54:11 59:1,1,10,13,21 60:20,21 61:6,7 68:23 69:19 72:23 81:6,16 82:2,16,23 86:7 (34)</p> <p><b>months</b> 80:15</p> <p><b>mood</b> 19:21</p> <p><b>more</b> 5:18 6:6 8:12,18 9:18,19 10:16,18 16:5,11,14 22:1 23:5 24:16 25:3,18 26:8 32:14 34:4 37:15 41:12 42:12 54:15 59:24 62:3 68:19,23 70:15 72:24 73:8,13 75:6,8,9 85:20,22 86:1 (37)</p>	<p><b>moreover</b> 35:22</p> <p><b>morning</b> 3:2 4:14 17:2 20:20 24:8 27:17 28:22 30:25 34:20 36:24 40:9,14 42:23 47:22 50:10 51:14 55:1 58:22 62:11 63:3 64:5 68:8 72:15 74:17 76:3 83:7 85:7,9 (28)</p> <p><b>most</b> 24:20 29:18 35:18 46:10 60:8,12 85:24 (7)</p> <p><b>motor</b> 65:25</p> <p><b>move</b> 5:17 75:13</p> <p><b>moved</b> 9:2</p> <p><b>moves</b> 5:14</p> <p><b>movies</b> 48:23</p> <p><b>moving</b> 72:23</p> <p><b>ms</b> 34:20 36:24 38:12,13 39:17 40:5 50:4,7 51:14 53:25 54:15 62:11,21 70:23,25 71:5 79:15,18 82:6,23 (20)</p> <p><b>mta</b> 5:21 53:18 57:15,17 68:21 (5)</p> <p><b>much</b> 6:1 23:25 25:18 32:12 34:4,11,16 40:3 45:17 50:9 51:9 61:25 62:6 63:4 70:18 82:24 84:25 88:5 (18)</p> <p><b>multiple</b> 19:19</p> <p><b>must</b> 9:11 42:3 56:20 57:13 87:22 (5)</p> <p><b>mute</b> 58:21</p> <p><b>muted</b> 3:14 4:1 74:11</p> <p><b>my</b> 11:9,13 18:10 20:21 24:8 27:19 31:10 34:21 40:15 42:23 43:4 47:10,16,23 48:12,16 50:10 51:16 55:9 58:23 60:24 61:20 62:13,19 63:14,15 64:6,20 68:9 70:1,2 71:7 74:17 75:19 76:4 79:18 81:1,21</p>	<p>84:25 86:20,21 89:12,18 (43)</p> <p><b>n</b> 2:1</p> <p><b>name</b> 3:15,19 4:4,5 11:9 17:2 18:10 20:22 24:9 27:19 34:21 40:15 42:24 47:23 50:10 51:16 55:9 58:23 62:13 64:6 68:9 74:17 79:18 (23)</p> <p><b>narrow</b> 9:12</p> <p><b>nassau</b> 89:5</p> <p><b>national</b> 62:17</p> <p><b>nationwide</b> 24:16</p> <p><b>native</b> 71:8</p> <p><b>nature</b> 49:4,12</p> <p><b>navigate</b> 19:20 66:13</p> <p><b>near</b> 87:19</p> <p><b>nearly</b> 13:8</p> <p><b>necessary</b> 8:1 10:19 36:1 56:11 (4)</p> <p><b>need</b> 9:17 14:9 17:8 23:23 32:17,18 35:18 36:11,12 37:6 39:6,12 42:11 46:5 52:20 62:3,4 63:17 65:22 66:2 70:14 72:19 80:9,13,15,22,23,24 85:22 (29)</p> <p><b>needs</b> 44:17,25 45:16 46:7 49:9 59:5 73:2,8,16 74:4 (10)</p> <p><b>negative</b> 11:18,18 12:3 57:6 (4)</p> <p><b>negatively</b> 8:20</p> <p><b>neither</b> 19:3</p> <p><b>new</b> 2 5:3,13 6:7 7:6 12:8,14 13:15 21:8 23:8,21 24:18 33:11 34:25 36:18 37:1 39:22 40:17 42:2 43:1,8 44:10,13,20 45:8,20 46:4,14,24 47:2 49:17</p>
--	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

107

<p>50:12,19,24 51:3,18 57:7,16 58:5 62:12,18 63:12,17 66:16,22 68:10,12 69:13,14,24 71:9,11,20,25 72:10 73:5,13,16,22 74:3 77:21,24 79:3,5,10 80:15 81:7 82:9 89:3,8 (70)</p> <p><b>newer</b> 56:19</p> <p><b>newly</b> 63:11</p> <p><b>next</b> 17:18 20:17 24:5 31:2 34:17 36:22 38:11 40:7 42:21 47:20 50:1 51:12 54:24 58:19 62:9 64:2 68:3 70:20 74:9 75:5,6,25 78:14 79:13 83:2 (25)</p> <p><b>nice</b> 82:24 86:24</p> <p><b>night</b> 72:16</p> <p><b>nina</b> 79:13,19</p> <p><b>no</b> 16:16,21 23:13 26:18 30:1,2,14 32:5,10 33:5,8 34:1 38:5 42:5 46:2,10,23 48:15 53:9 59:18 60:2 66:15,22 67:15 71:5 77:8 82:1 88:8,11 89:15 (30)</p> <p><b>nobody</b> 44:15 81:25</p> <p><b>noncore</b> 18:18</p> <p><b>none</b> 88:12</p> <p><b>nonpeak</b> 72:13</p> <p><b>nonwav</b> 13:9</p> <p><b>nonwavs</b> 58:6</p> <p><b>nonwheelchair</b> 76:18</p> <p><b>nor</b> 19:4</p> <p><b>notary</b> 89:7</p> <p><b>note</b> 4:2 25:7</p> <p><b>noted</b> 88:16</p>	<p><b>now</b> 4:11 10:24 15:15 21:11,23 23:19 27:10 52:10 74:13 75:2 76:18 (11)</p> <p><b>number</b> 9:21 14:6 16:4 33:10,24 34:4 45:19 46:16,20 52:25 63:11,16 65:12 66:23 67:12 (15)</p> <p><b>numbers</b> 34:10 37:14</p> <p><b>nyc</b> 18:12</p> <p><b>nytw</b> 51:13</p> <p><b>o</b> 15</p> <p><b>objectives</b> 12:11</p> <p><b>obligation</b> 77:14,19</p> <p><b>obligations</b> 77:24</p> <p><b>obviously</b> 48:8</p> <p><b>octopus</b> 24:11,13</p> <p><b>off</b> 5:2 31:25 38:2 51:4,6 55:21 58:20 86:13 (8)</p> <p><b>offering</b> 18:20</p> <p><b>offers</b> 19:17</p> <p><b>office</b> 42:17 49:7,18</p> <p><b>offset</b> 12:16 15:6 28:12</p> <p><b>often</b> 55:24</p> <p><b>old</b> 14:2 45:13,18 69:5 81:4 (5)</p> <p><b>omen</b> 5:14</p> <p><b>once</b> 29:16 55:20 56:21,21 (4)</p> <p><b>one</b> 4:17 9:3,14 17:21 22:7 29:13,13 32:3 33:5 34:1 41:12,15 48:16 49:13,14 50:23 52:25 61:9,10 62:10,10,15,15 63:14 68:17 75:1,13,15,16 78:23 80:8 84:16 (32)</p>	<p><b>onedollar</b> 10:2 11:24 12:12 72:5 75:23 82:3 83:21 84:1 (8)</p> <p><b>onerous</b> 66:25</p> <p><b>onetime</b> 76:23</p> <p><b>oneweek</b> 81:9</p> <p><b>ongoing</b> 13:16 14:9</p> <p><b>only</b> 14:16 19:6 29:15,16 30:7 31:21 36:13 48:20 49:6 59:21 60:16 61:17,22 76:14 78:15 80:17 83:13,13 (18)</p> <p><b>onto</b> 6:1 33:20</p> <p><b>operate</b> 29:19 45:11</p> <p><b>operating</b> 24:17 26:14 35:16 54:4 57:22 (5)</p> <p><b>operation</b> 2:15 41:14,15</p> <p><b>operational</b> 10:11 11:23 13:16,18 14:1 15:20 19:3 35:13 45:5 53:5 56:5 (11)</p> <p><b>operations</b> 10:25 11:10</p> <p><b>operator</b> 39:22</p> <p><b>operators</b> 18:15 27:24 29:18</p> <p><b>opportunity</b> 21:1 39:5 55:16 74:6 (4)</p> <p><b>oppose</b> 78:4</p> <p><b>optimally</b> 19:9</p> <p><b>optin</b> 19:16</p> <p><b>option</b> 39:21 64:23 66:10 67:19 78:6,19 (6)</p> <p><b>optional</b> 19:13</p> <p><b>options</b> 5:16 9:19 28:17 67:1,15,20 (6)</p> <p><b>order</b> 9:11 10:20 12:20 38:25</p>
---	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

108

<p>52:14 (5)</p> <p><b>order's</b> 12:23</p> <p><b>ordered</b> 8:25</p> <p><b>orders</b> 33:23</p> <p><b>organizations</b> 71:15</p> <p><b>organizer</b> 34:23 50:12</p> <p><b>oriented</b> 20:8</p> <p><b>original</b> 22:3</p> <p><b>originally</b> 8:10</p> <p><b>other</b> 5:15 15:10 16:9,19 26:21 28:17 30:20 32:16 37:20 53:20 59:14 60:2 64:12 66:4 67:15,20 72:10 78:18 83:8 84:7 85:17 88:8 (22)</p> <p><b>others</b> 66:2</p> <p><b>otherwise</b> 25:11 82:16</p> <p><b>our</b> 4:2,12,20 6:12 7:4 8:5,23 9:2,4 10:24 11:3 13:13 17:13,20,24 18:17,21 19:16 20:14,17 24:5,23 27:12 28:19 30:22 31:2,12,14 32:4 36:22 37:21 40:7 42:21 50:1,21,24 51:12 54:24 55:4,5 60:7,7,22 62:9 64:2 65:4 68:3 70:20 75:25 79:13 83:2 85:3 87:3,7,7,8 (56)</p> <p><b>ourselves</b> 62:5</p> <p><b>out</b> 5:17 8:19 15:16 32:7 34:8 37:21 39:9 48:18 52:11 (9)</p> <p><b>outcome</b> 20:7 89:16</p> <p><b>over</b> 10:12 12:4 13:25 15:23 16:23 19:24 24:14 25:21 29:21 50:23 55:18 71:12 (12)</p> <p><b>overall</b> 73:5</p> <p><b>overly</b> 20:5</p>	<p><b>overreaching</b> 25:23</p> <p><b>overview</b> 11:14</p> <p><b>owed</b> 46:3,4,10</p> <p><b>own</b> 5:16 31:20 55:17,17 71:7 72:1 (6)</p> <p><b>owned</b> 55:13</p> <p><b>owner</b> 30:18 31:9,12 33:1 41:10,17 42:7,8 43:6,8,10,14 44:11,13,18 45:3,18,20 46:4,24 56:1 68:14 69:3,3,18,20,23 (27)</p> <p><b>ownerdriver</b> 40:16 42:15</p> <p><b>ownerdrivers</b> 43:25 45:6</p> <p><b>owners</b> 9:18 10:2,17,18 13:17 14:2 27:23 28:7,19,24 31:24 33:6,23 34:2 35:14 36:7 37:11 44:3,23 48:3 55:7 56:18 59:25 71:17 76:22 (25)</p> <p><b>owners'</b> 12:17</p> <p><b>ownership</b> 29:24</p> <p><b>p</b> 2:1,1</p> <p><b>package</b> 13:4</p> <p><b>packages</b> 4:17</p> <p><b>paid</b> 41:24 55:21 86:13</p> <p><b>pandemic</b> 8:23</p> <p><b>paradigms</b> 20:7</p> <p><b>part</b> 28:3 39:22,25 43:16 (4)</p> <p><b>particular</b> 25:20 29:13 63:15</p> <p><b>particularly</b> 21:4 29:12 57:21</p> <p><b>parties</b> 89:14</p> <p><b>partner</b> 22:7 77:6</p>	<p><b>partnered</b> 22:10</p> <p><b>parts</b> 16:9</p> <p><b>pass</b> 37:22 84:8,24</p> <p><b>passed</b> 6:1 56:22</p> <p><b>passenger</b> 8:4 18:14,21 19:24 20:10 26:13,20,25 60:4 (9)</p> <p><b>passengers</b> 6:1 12:14 19:4 22:9,11,12 23:10,11,24 26:22,24 64:17 (12)</p> <p><b>passing</b> 5:8 84:11</p> <p><b>past</b> 20:6</p> <p><b>path</b> 9:13</p> <p><b>patience</b> 65:23</p> <p><b>paul</b> 2:9</p> <p><b>pay</b> 43:15 45:1,4 47:3 50:18 54:5 67:22,23 69:7,16 75:14 80:17 (12)</p> <p><b>paying</b> 41:14</p> <p><b>payment</b> 10:3,5 11:22,24 15:15 16:13 25:10 42:7 44:14 45:6 50:14 53:10 55:20 76:24 77:2 78:16 85:13,16 86:12 (19)</p> <p><b>payments</b> 4:18 10:1,11 11:23 13:18 14:1,5,10 15:20,24 22:17 25:9 27:11 28:14,15,16,18 29:5,6,7,10 35:12,14,15 37:11 45:14 56:5 57:18 64:13,16 76:20 86:14 (32)</p> <p><b>peak</b> 72:14</p> <p><b>penalties</b> 7:17 44:5</p> <p><b>penalty</b> 46:23</p> <p><b>people</b> 10:25 11:11 35:4,18 36:11 38:6,20,23 39:10 40:2 48:14,19 49:6,6 51:5,6 63:2</p>
---	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

109

<p>65:16,19,21,24 66:11,24 67:4,7,14,19 70:5 72:7 78:8 82:10 83:9,22,24 (34)</p> <p><b>peoples</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>per</b> 3:22 10:12 15:22,22,24 41:15 53:9,12 57:15 72:5 74:25 85:16 (12)</p> <p><b>percent</b> 8:16,25 9:4,15 12:23,25 13:14,21 14:13,16,18,20 16:1 18:24 37:14,16 46:9 51:20,22 58:8 70:12 76:12 77:14,22 80:12 (25)</p> <p><b>period</b> 10:13 15:23 17:14 29:22,23 30:7 42:3 (7)</p> <p><b>person</b> 42:15 47:1 48:8 65:14 70:3 71:8 (6)</p> <p><b>personal</b> 25:10</p> <p><b>persons</b> 3:9 33:4</p> <p><b>perspective</b> 20:15</p> <p><b>pertain</b> 25:2,5</p> <p><b>pertrip</b> 11:24 35:12</p> <p><b>peter</b> 27:12,14,19</p> <p><b>phone</b> 39:21 63:6,18,25 65:24 66:9 67:1 (7)</p> <p><b>phones</b> 63:9 66:18</p> <p><b>phonetic</b> 58:20 82:18</p> <p><b>pick</b> 37:19 38:1</p> <p><b>picking</b> 38:8 64:17</p> <p><b>place</b> 14:15 18:23 28:9 33:23 48:3 56:18 (6)</p> <p><b>placed</b> 28:25 29:2,8,20 (4)</p> <p><b>places</b> 37:6</p>	<p><b>placing</b> 36:3</p> <p><b>plain</b> 49:14</p> <p><b>plan</b> 35:12</p> <p><b>plate</b> 34:5,10</p> <p><b>plates</b> 33:25 34:9,9</p> <p><b>platform</b> 19:17</p> <p><b>playing</b> 72:10</p> <p><b>please</b> 3:18 4:3 32:18 33:21 50:22 59:12,15,20,24 61:16 74:23 75:13,22 82:19,19,21 (16)</p> <p><b>plus</b> 15:23 61:22</p> <p><b>pockets</b> 6:6 23:22</p> <p><b>point</b> 26:17</p> <p><b>policies</b> 36:12 52:13</p> <p><b>policy</b> 6:13 20:23</p> <p><b>pool</b> 66:21</p> <p><b>portion</b> 45:1</p> <p><b>posed</b> 26:1</p> <p><b>position</b> 65:5</p> <p><b>possibility</b> 22:24</p> <p><b>possible</b> 9:16 12:21 18:21 65:18 66:3 (5)</p> <p><b>post</b> 9:6</p> <p><b>posted</b> 17:13</p> <p><b>potential</b> 14:5 50:25</p> <p><b>powerful</b> 31:24</p> <p><b>precovid</b> 51:21</p> <p><b>predefined</b> 19:10</p>	<p><b>premium</b> 19:17</p> <p><b>prescriptive</b> 20:5</p> <p><b>present</b> 4:8 26:4</p> <p><b>presentation</b> 11:2 14:22 87:20</p> <p><b>presenters</b> 2:14</p> <p><b>presently</b> 45:25</p> <p><b>presents</b> 26:6,18</p> <p><b>president</b> 36:25 42:25 55:10 62:15,16 (5)</p> <p><b>prestige</b> 34:11</p> <p><b>prevent</b> 46:8 58:1</p> <p><b>preventing</b> 18:19</p> <p><b>previous</b> 57:23</p> <p><b>previously</b> 25:1 54:21 56:3,6 65:4 (5)</p> <p><b>price</b> 43:23 61:12 81:17,20 (4)</p> <p><b>prices</b> 59:23 60:23 61:8</p> <p><b>pricing</b> 44:8</p> <p><b>pride</b> 34:2</p> <p><b>prior</b> 17:17 43:7,14 45:8 47:2,8 (6)</p> <p><b>prioritizes</b> 19:24</p> <p><b>priority</b> 6:8</p> <p><b>privacy</b> 26:19 27:2</p> <p><b>private</b> 75:11</p> <p><b>problem</b> 35:23 71:6 80:21</p> <p><b>procedure</b> 7:12</p>
---	---	--

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

110

<p><b>proceed</b> 3:20</p> <p><b>proceedings</b> 89:9,11</p> <p><b>process</b> 22:8,11,17 25:9 30:16 42:6 69:22 (7)</p> <p><b>processed</b> 22:14 23:14</p> <p><b>product</b> 26:5</p> <p><b>productive</b> 73:21</p> <p><b>program</b> 11:12,19 12:22 13:2,15 14:3,7 16:9,10,14 39:23 48:10 50:3 52:14 54:1 58:25 62:25 63:23 65:2,6,11 68:24 73:2 78:13,23 79:4,9,11 86:18,19 (30)</p> <p><b>programming</b> 41:7</p> <p><b>programs</b> 52:23 53:20</p> <p><b>promises</b> 5:4</p> <p><b>prone</b> 85:20</p> <p><b>proper</b> 72:19</p> <p><b>properly</b> 74:4</p> <p><b>proposal</b> 7:4,19 8:5 17:23 23:21 27:11 38:15,19 45:8 46:15 77:7 78:5 83:9 (13)</p> <p><b>proposals</b> 6:15 17:11 54:16</p> <p><b>propose</b> 26:7</p> <p><b>proposed</b> 4:16 6:2,9,22 7:11 8:1 9:25 11:2,15 13:5 21:2,9,24 23:8 24:21 25:24 28:11 35:2 55:6 56:10,23 64:10 67:5 85:11 (24)</p> <p><b>proposing</b> 69:2</p> <p><b>prorata</b> 56:13</p> <p><b>provide</b> 10:10 36:1,8 69:13 71:23 (5)</p>	<p><b>provided</b> 17:7,17 24:13 26:18 71:17 (5)</p> <p><b>provider</b> 4:21 7:22 17:23 18:14 19:2 21:18 66:13 (7)</p> <p><b>providers</b> 5:25 18:19 19:7 20:8 22:6,8,20 23:4 25:5,17 26:10 66:8 (12)</p> <p><b>provides</b> 23:7</p> <p><b>providing</b> 23:23 64:15</p> <p><b>provisions</b> 25:22</p> <p><b>public</b> 4 3:3,21 4:15 6:18,21 16:24 17:14,21 50:13 84:10,18,21 87:3 89:7 (15)</p> <p><b>published</b> 17:12 66:5</p> <p><b>punish</b> 50:18</p> <p><b>purchase</b> 46:12 55:16</p> <p><b>purchased</b> 45:7 47:1</p> <p><b>purchasers</b> 76:21 78:17</p> <p><b>purchasing</b> 56:9 64:25</p> <p><b>purposes</b> 64:24</p> <p><b>purview</b> 11:13</p> <p><b>put</b> 10:18 14:15 23:21 37:21 46:11,22 51:19 67:19 69:19 72:9 (10)</p> <p><b>putting</b> 6:14 32:24</p> <p><b>quadruple</b> 71:10</p> <p><b>qualifications</b> 10:15</p> <p><b>quality</b> 36:8</p> <p><b>quarter</b> 15:22</p> <p><b>quarterly</b> 10:10 11:23 14:5 75:1 85:16 86:12 (6)</p>	<p><b>quarters</b> 14:1</p> <p><b>questions</b> 14:23,25 16:19 47:11 (4)</p> <p><b>quickly</b> 9:2 44:23</p> <p><b>quote</b> 64:23</p> <p><b>r</b> 15 2:1 89:1</p> <p><b>raise</b> 68:23 85:12 87:25</p> <p><b>raised</b> 54:20</p> <p><b>ramp</b> 38:3 61:15</p> <p><b>rappaport</b> 76:1,3,5 79:1 (4)</p> <p><b>rare</b> 60:11</p> <p><b>rate</b> 7:25</p> <p><b>rates</b> 6:2</p> <p><b>rather</b> 14:4 36:2</p> <p><b>ratios</b> 19:11</p> <p><b>rav</b> 80:24</p> <p><b>reader</b> 62:22</p> <p><b>ready</b> 3:18 69:14</p> <p><b>real</b> 45:19 46:5</p> <p><b>reality</b> 51:25</p> <p><b>really</b> 52:16,23 53:6 72:17 84:17 85:18 86:19 (7)</p> <p><b>realtime</b> 26:15</p> <p><b>reap</b> 73:22</p> <p><b>rearing</b> 87:18</p> <p><b>reason</b> 13:17</p> <p><b>reasons</b> 36:8</p> <p><b>recall</b> 8:9</p>
--	---	--

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

111

<p><b>receive</b> 13:22 29:4,15 30:5 41:18 42:1 47:6 53:4,9 65:13 (10)</p> <p><b>received</b> 7:24 10:9 14:2 29:1,11 44:9 45:2 47:4,8 53:3 57:10 (11)</p> <p><b>receiving</b> 57:15</p> <p><b>recent</b> 24:21</p> <p><b>recently</b> 28:25 59:17</p> <p><b>recipients</b> 10:9</p> <p><b>recognizing</b> 28:5</p> <p><b>recommend</b> 56:12</p> <p><b>recommended</b> 13:3 21:12 22:15</p> <p><b>recommending</b> 13:3</p> <p><b>reconsider</b> 20:4 57:20</p> <p><b>record</b> 17:12 28:4 52:4 89:11 (4)</p> <p><b>red</b> 12:5</p> <p><b>redirecting</b> 53:18</p> <p><b>reduce</b> 30:6 53:8</p> <p><b>reduces</b> 19:1</p> <p><b>reducing</b> 15:14 55:19</p> <p><b>referred</b> 55:24</p> <p><b>reflects</b> 6:20</p> <p><b>refused</b> 72:8</p> <p><b>regarding</b> 8:14 21:1 26:12</p> <p><b>regardless</b> 47:7</p> <p><b>registered</b> 3:11 4:3</p> <p><b>regret</b> 28:13</p>	<p><b>regular</b> 28:14 86:6</p> <p><b>regulation</b> 77:21</p> <p><b>regulations</b> 21:2,9,24 22:3 23:9 (5)</p> <p><b>rehacked</b> 58:12</p> <p><b>rehacks</b> 57:20</p> <p><b>reiterate</b> 18:17 63:1</p> <p><b>reject</b> 79:7</p> <p><b>related</b> 21:2 89:13</p> <p><b>relation</b> 7:7</p> <p><b>relationship</b> 55:8</p> <p><b>release</b> 41:1</p> <p><b>reliable</b> 35:6 36:15</p> <p><b>reluctance</b> 77:23</p> <p><b>reluctant</b> 77:5</p> <p><b>rely</b> 38:21</p> <p><b>remain</b> 36:10 49:17,19 56:16 57:3 (5)</p> <p><b>remaining</b> 23:16 30:11 33:15 39:16 42:10 45:24 53:24 57:25 61:3 67:10 70:9 74:1 78:25 82:5 (14)</p> <p><b>remains</b> 11:20 27:2</p> <p><b>remember</b> 83:14</p> <p><b>remotely</b> 3:5</p> <p><b>removal</b> 85:15</p> <p><b>remove</b> 74:25 75:22 78:5</p> <p><b>removed</b> 41:2</p> <p><b>removing</b> 56:13 64:23 65:5 67:19 (4)</p>	<p><b>repair</b> 59:10</p> <p><b>repairs</b> 59:5 85:23</p> <p><b>repeat</b> 49:4</p> <p><b>replace</b> 44:22,24</p> <p><b>replaced</b> 44:18,25</p> <p><b>reported</b> 89:9</p> <p><b>reporter</b> 21</p> <p><b>reports</b> 23:3</p> <p><b>representing</b> 27:23</p> <p><b>reps</b> 66:21</p> <p><b>repurpose</b> 57:16</p> <p><b>request</b> 8:24 33:25 34:1 42:7 66:2 75:12,21 (7)</p> <p><b>requesters</b> 65:19</p> <p><b>requesting</b> 58:9 64:18</p> <p><b>require</b> 12:15 21:18 22:12</p> <p><b>required</b> 9:6 43:15</p> <p><b>requirement</b> 18:25 19:6 20:4 28:8,9 66:15,22 (7)</p> <p><b>requirements</b> 8:2 18:19 25:24 26:4 (4)</p> <p><b>requires</b> 8:15 14:6</p> <p><b>requiring</b> 9:7</p> <p><b>resheta</b> 62:9,14 66:1</p> <p><b>respect</b> 28:2</p> <p><b>respond</b> 33:3</p> <p><b>response</b> 16:21 88:11</p> <p><b>responsibilities</b> 81:12</p>
---	---	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

112

<p><b>responsibility</b> 41:5 66:6</p> <p><b>responsible</b> 45:21 46:5,13</p> <p><b>rest</b> 23:2 59:22,22</p> <p><b>restitution</b> 54:6</p> <p><b>restore</b> 33:24</p> <p><b>restored</b> 28:19</p> <p><b>restricted</b> 31:21</p> <p><b>result</b> 25:11,13</p> <p><b>retire</b> 81:23 82:20 84:5</p> <p><b>retirement</b> 41:23 54:9 59:17</p> <p><b>retroactive</b> 47:1</p> <p><b>return</b> 32:1</p> <p><b>revenue</b> 7:10,21 13:22 14:13 15:3,6,10 23:6 (8)</p> <p><b>review</b> 30:15,17,23 40:1 77:4 (5)</p> <p><b>revised</b> 27:3</p> <p><b>revisions</b> 24:21,22</p> <p><b>richard</b> 40:7,15 42:21,24 61:20 (5)</p> <p><b>ride</b> 26:24 39:1,7,8 (4)</p> <p><b>rider's</b> 32:25</p> <p><b>rides</b> 35:17 72:8</p> <p><b>rideshare</b> 24:10,15</p> <p><b>ridiculous</b> 79:6</p> <p><b>right</b> 15:13,17 16:1 31:8,13 33:1,2,4,8,13 35:24 38:1 46:12 47:12,14 51:8 74:3 (17)</p> <p><b>rights</b> 32:1</p>	<p><b>rimawidoster</b> 50:2,4,7,11 (4)</p> <p><b>risk</b> 20:5 26:1,6</p> <p><b>risks</b> 25:12</p> <p><b>road</b> 10:18 44:21</p> <p><b>roads</b> 59:11</p> <p><b>roles</b> 9:2</p> <p><b>rooftop</b> 25:16,18 26:9</p> <p><b>rule</b> 4:16 17:11 35:2 44:8 45:8,13 46:14,19 47:2 64:10,21,22 69:1,1,10 84:8,12 85:11 (18)</p> <p><b>rulemaking</b> 6:16</p> <p><b>rules</b> 6:9,22 7:11,18 11:3 17:18 20:5 24:22 25:2,14,16,24,25 26:7,12 27:3 28:2 29:14 30:21 31:16 32:19 36:17 44:2 46:24 55:6 56:10,22 57:23 66:5,16,22 (31)</p> <p><b>rural</b> 13:4</p> <p><b>rush</b> 47:9</p> <p><b>rushing</b> 8:19</p> <p><b>ryan</b> 36:22,24,25</p> <p><b>s</b> 2:1</p> <p><b>sadly</b> 49:3</p> <p><b>said</b> 53:1 64:12 81:13 84:18 (4)</p> <p><b>sales</b> 42:25</p> <p><b>same</b> 9:19 47:14 61:18 76:16 84:23,24 (6)</p> <p><b>sanchopersad</b> 85:4,6,10 86:24 (4)</p> <p><b>sarah</b> 2:6</p>	<p><b>satisfaction</b> 20:11</p> <p><b>savings</b> 46:11</p> <p><b>saw</b> 87:20</p> <p><b>say</b> 10:7 31:12 38:14 39:20 47:16 52:4 62:24 66:10 72:13 84:12 (10)</p> <p><b>sayler</b> 18:1 24:6,8,9 (4)</p> <p><b>says</b> 78:15</p> <p><b>schedule</b> 15:15</p> <p><b>scheduled</b> 19:25</p> <p><b>screen</b> 62:22</p> <p><b>screens</b> 24:14</p> <p><b>second</b> 4:20 8:5 11:6 22:1 32:18 (5)</p> <p><b>secondary</b> 22:22</p> <p><b>seconds</b> 23:15 30:10 33:14 39:15 42:9 45:23 46:18 53:23 57:24 61:2 67:9 70:8 73:25 78:24 82:4 (15)</p> <p><b>section</b> 64:21 65:7</p> <p><b>sector</b> 8:21</p> <p><b>securement</b> 37:25</p> <p><b>see</b> 6:4 11:25 15:4 18:7,8 47:13 59:16 86:14 (8)</p> <p><b>seed</b> 17:8</p> <p><b>seeing</b> 12:7 72:21 88:12</p> <p><b>seeking</b> 8:12</p> <p><b>seems</b> 72:22 73:7</p> <p><b>seen</b> 18:4 60:5</p> <p><b>selfsufficient</b> 12:8</p>
---	--	--



**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

113

<p><b>sell</b> 43:7,11,13 46:1,6 47:3 81:22,24 (8)</p> <p><b>sells</b> 43:14</p> <p><b>senior</b> 50:11</p> <p><b>seniors</b> 63:14,16</p> <p><b>sense</b> 32:10,12</p> <p><b>september</b> 8:24</p> <p><b>serious</b> 69:4</p> <p><b>seriously</b> 6:19 55:5</p> <p><b>serve</b> 19:4 24:9 36:18</p> <p><b>serves</b> 35:20 78:8</p> <p><b>service</b> 5:25 8:7 28:10,25 29:9,20 33:9 36:9,10 40:2 48:4,13 51:6 56:16,19 57:4 58:11 59:16 60:9 65:9 66:17,21 67:25 82:10 (24)</p> <p><b>services</b> 48:7</p> <p><b>serving</b> 26:17</p> <p><b>set</b> 41:6 89:17</p> <p><b>settings</b> 27:2</p> <p><b>settlement</b> 51:24 52:2,8</p> <p><b>seven</b> 29:16 41:25 43:8,13 44:5,9 48:11 56:21 57:4,11 86:4 (11)</p> <p><b>sevenyear</b> 30:7 54:18</p> <p><b>shapiro</b> 38:11,12,13 39:17 40:5 78:10 (6)</p> <p><b>share</b> 24:25 61:9</p> <p><b>sharon</b> 38:11 39:20 40:4 78:10 (4)</p> <p><b>sherryl</b> 2:12 16:24</p>	<p><b>shifted</b> 52:1</p> <p><b>shocks</b> 80:18,20 85:21</p> <p><b>shop</b> 63:9</p> <p><b>short</b> 11:1 59:9</p> <p><b>should</b> 12:14 25:14 26:25 31:20 41:2,23 44:6,23,25 45:12,13,21 46:19,23,25 47:3,6 50:14,17 53:6 56:15 57:16 68:18 69:9,12,15 72:6,21 73:10 77:3,21 78:18 82:13,14,15 84:3,5,9 86:11,13,17 (41)</p> <p><b>shouldn't</b> 50:15</p> <p><b>shows</b> 77:23</p> <p><b>shutting</b> 50:16</p> <p><b>sick</b> 41:23 81:23</p> <p><b>sienna</b> 41:13 61:10,17 85:25 (4)</p> <p><b>sign</b> 3:10 21:16</p> <p><b>signature</b> 89:21</p> <p><b>signed</b> 4:6</p> <p><b>significant</b> 28:5 29:17 67:5</p> <p><b>similar</b> 25:11,18</p> <p><b>simon</b> 27:13 31:3,4,7 33:16 34:7,16 (7)</p> <p><b>simple</b> 25:15</p> <p><b>simplifying</b> 18:18</p> <p><b>simply</b> 54:11 58:9</p> <p><b>simulcasted</b> 3:6</p> <p><b>since</b> 24:13 37:5 52:1 55:12 71:24 72:7 73:11 74:18 80:6,23 (10)</p>	<p><b>singh</b> 83:3,4,4,6 (4)</p> <p><b>single</b> 19:16 41:11 65:12 81:2 (4)</p> <p><b>situation</b> 6:3 28:24 67:21</p> <p><b>six</b> 14:16 60:16 80:15</p> <p><b>skills</b> 48:13</p> <p><b>skyrocket</b> 13:19</p> <p><b>slide</b> 11:25</p> <p><b>slow</b> 40:19</p> <p><b>small</b> 67:13</p> <p><b>smartphone</b> 65:20</p> <p><b>so</b> 7:2 9:3,14,22,25 10:2 11:8 12:7 13:2 15:14 16:7,10,11 18:2 22:9 23:13 27:14 30:16 33:9 35:9 39:3,23 40:3,24 41:1,4,11,14,20,24 42:5,8,11 47:17 50:9 51:9,24 53:21 59:12,20,24 60:2,10 61:7,12,16,18,21,24 62:2,6,13,23 63:4,17,19,25 67:25 68:22 69:8,14,16,20,23,23 70:6,10,13,15,18 74:19 75:12,19,20 82:19 83:17,22 84:10 86:5 88:4,7 (81)</p> <p><b>social</b> 5:7</p> <p><b>socialize</b> 63:8</p> <p><b>software</b> 7:15 8:3 18:14</p> <p><b>sold</b> 44:10 46:9,21</p> <p><b>solely</b> 15:9</p> <p><b>solution</b> 35:25 36:6</p> <p><b>solutions</b> 18:15,24 24:7</p> <p><b>solvency</b> 87:17</p> <p><b>solvent</b> 9:21 53:16</p>
--	--	---

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

114

<p><b>some</b> 5:7 8:9 19:8 22:16 45:13 52:22 54:19 59:4,24 67:8 69:10 87:14,24 (13)</p> <p><b>something</b> 87:10,21</p> <p><b>sometimes</b> 60:13</p> <p><b>sorrentino</b> 2:5 4:24</p> <p><b>sorry</b> 11:6 47:15 70:25 71:4 (4)</p> <p><b>sort</b> 22:13</p> <p><b>sounds</b> 53:1</p> <p><b>source</b> 38:7 57:13</p> <p><b>speak</b> 4:6 17:5 35:1 47:18 49:6 58:24 74:6 76:10 85:11 (9)</p> <p><b>speaker</b> 3:22 17:4,24 18:2 20:17 24:6 31:2 36:22 38:11 40:7 42:21 45:25 50:1 51:12 54:24 58:19 61:4 62:9 64:2 68:3 70:20 74:2,9 75:25 79:13 83:2 85:3 (27)</p> <p><b>speakers</b> 3:11 4:3 27:12</p> <p><b>speaking</b> 3:13 63:2 71:7</p> <p><b>special</b> 4:2</p> <p><b>specific</b> 26:20,21 65:7</p> <p><b>specifically</b> 56:12</p> <p><b>speech</b> 65:22</p> <p><b>spending</b> 35:23</p> <p><b>spent</b> 60:17 73:3</p> <p><b>spite</b> 77:15</p> <p><b>spoke</b> 22:20 65:14 67:8</p> <p><b>spoken</b> 63:2</p> <p><b>spontaneously</b> 37:6</p>	<p><b>springs</b> 80:21</p> <p><b>ss</b> 89:4</p> <p><b>stability</b> 10:21 43:18</p> <p><b>staff</b> 65:13 66:17</p> <p><b>stakeholders</b> 6:18 19:5 20:12</p> <p><b>stall</b> 59:11</p> <p><b>standalone</b> 19:14</p> <p><b>standards</b> 60:14</p> <p><b>start</b> 16:24 24:19 60:24 71:19 79:21 (5)</p> <p><b>starting</b> 40:20</p> <p><b>startup</b> 18:12</p> <p><b>state</b> 3:18 34:14 40:24 41:4 42:12 53:13 57:16 62:18 68:19 70:15,16 74:22 75:17 89:3,8 (15)</p> <p><b>states</b> 64:22</p> <p><b>stating</b> 56:3</p> <p><b>stealing</b> 78:23</p> <p><b>step</b> 53:14</p> <p><b>steppingstone</b> 55:25</p> <p><b>steps</b> 8:13 65:18 66:3,23 (4)</p> <p><b>stifles</b> 19:1</p> <p><b>still</b> 23:18 36:7 54:10 74:11 (4)</p> <p><b>stop</b> 38:1 59:18 60:22 61:20 (4)</p> <p><b>storage</b> 32:7</p> <p><b>straps</b> 38:1</p> <p><b>stream</b> 3:7</p>	<p><b>street</b> 31:13,25 32:17,19,22,22,24 33:2,5 37:23 39:10 (11)</p> <p><b>strictly</b> 17:6</p> <p><b>strives</b> 35:20</p> <p><b>strong</b> 52:8</p> <p><b>strongly</b> 57:19 78:4</p> <p><b>subject</b> 5:21 78:14</p> <p><b>submitted</b> 3:23 22:22 28:1 71:14 (4)</p> <p><b>subsidiary</b> 24:11</p> <p><b>substantial</b> 53:10</p> <p><b>subways</b> 67:16</p> <p><b>such</b> 7:10 19:21 20:4 21:19 26:22 64:25 68:20 73:9,10 89:11 (10)</p> <p><b>sue</b> 77:9</p> <p><b>suggested</b> 78:20</p> <p><b>suicide</b> 82:17</p> <p><b>summer</b> 21:7</p> <p><b>supervision</b> 7:13</p> <p><b>supplement</b> 53:15,21</p> <p><b>support</b> 18:17 21:11 23:20 35:9 38:14 42:14 52:11 62:25 64:13 65:13 70:7,11,14 74:5 76:19 79:3 88:5 (17)</p> <p><b>supported</b> 21:8 38:4</p> <p><b>supporter</b> 52:8</p> <p><b>supporting</b> 20:9</p> <p><b>supports</b> 36:6 48:2 55:22</p> <p><b>surcharge</b> 12:13 40:23,25</p>
---	--	--

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

115

<p>41:2,3 42:13 53:19 57:17 68:20 (9)</p> <p><b>sure</b> 46:10 49:15 77:25 79:2 (4)</p> <p><b>survive</b> 60:19</p> <p><b>suspension</b> 85:22</p> <p><b>sustainable</b> 11:21 16:11,14</p> <p><b>switching</b> 27:10</p> <p><b>system</b> 9:16,24 25:4 26:3 37:25 38:20 39:4 46:8 66:13 67:3,6,14 (12)</p> <p><b>systemically</b> 19:7</p> <p><b>systems</b> 25:4,6,8,19 (4)</p> <p><b>t</b> 89:1,1</p> <p><b>table</b> 7:3</p> <p><b>tablet</b> 22:14</p> <p><b>tablets</b> 7:15 8:3 22:5,18 (4)</p> <p><b>take</b> 6:18 8:14 34:2 39:24 49:11 66:2 76:16 81:11 (8)</p> <p><b>taken</b> 31:14 32:11</p> <p><b>takes</b> 44:19 66:23</p> <p><b>taking</b> 35:14,23 38:19 45:5 57:2 (5)</p> <p><b>talk</b> 34:14 39:5</p> <p><b>talked</b> 22:2</p> <p><b>talking</b> 53:11 65:15</p> <p><b>talks</b> 51:1</p> <p><b>tapping</b> 78:17</p> <p><b>tax</b> 61:22 75:14</p> <p><b>taxi</b> 3 4:18 8:8 9:1 11:11,14,16</p>	<p>19:15 20:20 25:3 32:8 37:9 40:17 42:22 43:1,4 51:18,21 52:7 54:25 55:10,11,12 60:7 64:11 68:10 69:24 70:17 71:21,25 75:9 76:13 78:6 79:19 (34)</p> <p><b>taxicab</b> 5:22 8:7,16 27:15,21 71:17 72:11 (7)</p> <p><b>taxicabs</b> 27:25 48:4 71:18 73:9,12 (5)</p> <p><b>taxis</b> 8:14 10:16 12:19 37:4,16 48:6 65:17 76:8,11 (9)</p> <p><b>tc</b> 34:9</p> <p><b>teams</b> 6:13</p> <p><b>tear</b> 85:21</p> <p><b>tech</b> 18:12</p> <p><b>technical</b> 8:2 26:6</p> <p><b>technologies</b> 18:3,12,16</p> <p><b>technology</b> 5:25 25:3,4</p> <p><b>telephone</b> 65:12</p> <p><b>ten</b> 44:20</p> <p><b>tend</b> 22:7</p> <p><b>term</b> 53:7</p> <p><b>testified</b> 78:11</p> <p><b>testify</b> 3:9 21:1 64:9</p> <p><b>testimony</b> 3:20,21,25 17:4,9 22:23 64:20 84:15 85:1 (9)</p> <p><b>than</b> 6:2 14:4 23:5 24:16 25:5 34:7 36:2 41:12 44:20 (9)</p> <p><b>thank</b> 4:10 6:12 11:5 16:22 20:13,16,25 21:4,24 23:17,25 24:3 27:4,7 30:12,23 31:1,7 34:12,13,16,25 36:16,19,21 38:9,10 39:17,18,19</p>	<p>40:3,5,6,13 42:18,18,20 47:9,13,17,19 49:22,23,25 50:9 51:9,10,11 54:22,23 56:2 58:15,16,18 61:24 62:1,1,3,6,7,8,12 63:4,20,25 64:1 68:1,2 70:18,19 74:2,5,7,8 75:23,24 79:11,12 82:24 83:1 84:25 85:2 86:21,21,23,25 87:2,5 88:13 (89)</p> <p><b>thanking</b> 24:20</p> <p><b>thanks</b> 74:16</p> <p><b>their</b> 5:16 6:14 21:22 23:5 27:1 29:21 31:20 33:24 34:2,5 35:10 43:7,11,13,17 44:4,16 45:10,11 46:11 47:7 49:8 51:5 55:17,19 65:9 67:2 71:18,23 87:6,9 88:14 (32)</p> <p><b>them</b> 21:11 30:23 35:18 36:15 39:25 44:19 45:14 46:13 49:1,8,8 60:9 61:16,20 67:23 78:2 83:13 (17)</p> <p><b>themselves</b> 36:4 66:20</p> <p><b>there's</b> 66:5</p> <p><b>thereby</b> 55:19</p> <p><b>therefore</b> 25:9</p> <p><b>these</b> 6:14 7:18 14:15 17:18 21:8 24:1,22 25:25 28:2,18 29:8 30:20 35:15 36:17 44:2 45:9 52:22 56:22 63:18 81:1,5 82:20 85:23 86:1 (24)</p> <p><b>they'd</b> 43:15 44:14</p> <p><b>they'll</b> 39:2</p> <p><b>they're</b> 23:10 36:14 46:9 48:20,24 (5)</p> <p><b>thing</b> 33:13 61:9 84:7,23,24 87:12 (6)</p> <p><b>things</b> 49:4 59:15,22 73:10 (4)</p>
--	---	---

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

116

<p><b>think</b> 21:9 50:13 52:5 60:19 63:10,13 85:14 86:20 (8)</p> <p><b>thinking</b> 63:5,22</p> <p><b>thirdparty</b> 20:2</p> <p><b>thirty</b> 23:15 30:10 33:14 39:15 42:9 45:23 53:23 57:24 61:2 67:9 70:8 73:25 78:24 82:4 (14)</p> <p><b>thomas</b> 2:5</p> <p><b>those</b> 5:6 22:9 23:19 26:8 29:5,10 33:9,11 36:15 39:13 53:2 60:18 85:24 (13)</p> <p><b>thousand</b> 15:22 24:15 59:14 85:15 (4)</p> <p><b>thousands</b> 32:14</p> <p><b>three</b> 3:22 17:5 41:20 47:17 55:18 81:3,19 (7)</p> <p><b>threeyear</b> 29:19,22,23</p> <p><b>through</b> 5:24 7:22 8:19 10:23 22:5,14,18 26:23 28:7 42:7 63:9 81:14 87:20,23 (14)</p> <p><b>throughout</b> 55:17</p> <p><b>tif</b> 9:17,20 10:21 11:3,12,19 12:12 13:22 14:13 27:11 44:9,14 45:2 46:14,19 47:4,8 48:2 50:14 52:13 53:15,16,21 57:17 58:25 62:25 63:23 64:24 68:21 85:12,12 88:5 (32)</p> <p><b>time</b> 8:12,18 9:20 17:6,9 21:12,17 29:8 32:5 34:6 36:16 42:12,17 45:15 46:17 54:14 60:3,5 61:14,18,19 79:9 80:21,22 82:22 84:4,15 86:22 88:16 (29)</p> <p><b>timekeeper</b> 23:15 30:10 33:14 34:6 39:15 42:9 45:23 46:17 53:23 54:14 57:24 61:2,14 67:9 70:8 73:25 78:24 82:4,22 (19)</p>	<p><b>times</b> 35:17</p> <p><b>tinnners</b> 34:7</p> <p><b>tip</b> 23:18</p> <p><b>tipping</b> 22:3,4 23:1,9 (4)</p> <p><b>tips</b> 22:9,11 23:7 60:14 (4)</p> <p><b>tires</b> 80:13,13,15,17 85:21 (5)</p> <p><b>tlc</b> 2:3 5:18,19 6:12 7:23 10:19 13:12 26:18 28:5 39:3,12 41:14 44:6 45:16,20 46:7 47:24 49:11,17 50:17 52:6,18,25 54:6,10 55:2,12 56:3,19 57:2,13,19,23 58:25 61:5 64:14 67:12 69:2,15,21 70:11,14 72:12 73:8 75:21 76:25 77:5,11,12,18 78:15,22 (52)</p> <p><b>tlc's</b> 3:6 4:16 5:11 19:10 46:13 55:3 56:7 66:4 77:23 (9)</p> <p><b>tmobile</b> 24:6,12</p> <p><b>today</b> 3:13 4:23 6:10 7:2 8:5 13:4,19 14:7,11,17 17:15 21:1 24:25 35:1 48:1 51:20,21 52:17 64:9,12,20 65:14 67:8 71:15 74:7 80:3 81:18,20 86:20 87:10,14,24 88:15 (33)</p> <p><b>today's</b> 3:3 4:10,15 7:19 16:24 17:11 88:9,13 (8)</p> <p><b>told</b> 46:1 61:4 67:12</p> <p><b>tolled</b> 5:8</p> <p><b>tolls</b> 5:13,21</p> <p><b>too</b> 22:21 32:12 59:23 70:15 73:20 75:20 77:23 87:1 (8)</p> <p><b>took</b> 60:6,7</p> <p><b>tools</b> 31:24</p> <p><b>top</b> 56:14</p>	<p><b>total</b> 10:13 72:2</p> <p><b>tourism</b> 73:18</p> <p><b>towards</b> 16:8 37:3</p> <p><b>toyota</b> 41:12 80:24 81:11</p> <p><b>trade</b> 27:16,21,22 41:16 (4)</p> <p><b>traditional</b> 19:15</p> <p><b>traffic</b> 5:14</p> <p><b>trained</b> 39:6 65:13 66:17</p> <p><b>training</b> 65:1 72:20 78:7,20 (4)</p> <p><b>transcript</b> 89:11</p> <p><b>transfer</b> 69:6</p> <p><b>transferred</b> 29:24</p> <p><b>transit</b> 67:17 80:11</p> <p><b>transition</b> 52:15 69:17</p> <p><b>transport</b> 70:5</p> <p><b>transportation</b> 34:23 35:7 48:7 49:9,16 73:20,23 76:17 (8)</p> <p><b>travel</b> 48:22 63:18 65:9</p> <p><b>tray</b> 82:18</p> <p><b>tremendous</b> 52:18 54:19</p> <p><b>tries</b> 72:9</p> <p><b>trip</b> 12:12 14:9 15:24 40:22,23 42:13 53:9 57:15 72:5 (9)</p> <p><b>trips</b> 5:18,22 6:5 10:15 14:6 51:20,21 60:19 (8)</p> <p><b>trouble</b> 39:11</p> <p><b>true</b> 89:11</p>
--	---	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

117

<p><b>trueup</b> 45:14</p> <p><b>truly</b> 49:10</p> <p><b>try</b> 61:16</p> <p><b>trying</b> 38:6 70:11 72:11</p> <p><b>tsp</b> 25:8</p> <p><b>turn</b> 16:23 87:3</p> <p><b>tv</b> 19:15</p> <p><b>twa</b> 38:4</p> <p><b>twenty</b> 60:18</p> <p><b>two</b> 4:20 9:5 21:12 23:19 40:19 46:18 61:18 81:18 (8)</p> <p><b>twodollar</b> 75:16</p> <p><b>twodollars</b> 72:13</p> <p><b>type</b> 45:13</p> <p><b>types</b> 15:11</p> <p><b>uber</b> 22:10,11 23:12 26:23 (4)</p> <p><b>ugly</b> 87:18</p> <p><b>ultimately</b> 20:11 36:12 37:15 51:4 (4)</p> <p><b>unable</b> 39:13</p> <p><b>unchanged</b> 59:22</p> <p><b>unclear</b> 27:3</p> <p><b>under</b> 9:23 11:13 52:18 57:22 61:22 (5)</p> <p><b>underserved</b> 33:12</p> <p><b>understand</b> 15:3 52:17,20 53:16 56:7 77:3 (6)</p> <p><b>understandably</b> 5:12</p> <p><b>understood</b> 65:23 66:20</p>	<p><b>unfair</b> 65:6 79:24 80:2</p> <p><b>unfortunately</b> 77:8</p> <p><b>union</b> 61:12</p> <p><b>unlike</b> 19:14</p> <p><b>unmute</b> 17:3 18:3 70:23 74:10 83:5 85:4 (6)</p> <p><b>unmuted</b> 18:4</p> <p><b>unsustainable</b> 9:25</p> <p><b>until</b> 46:9 58:8 79:10 86:12 (4)</p> <p><b>up</b> 3:10 4:6 10:11,13 13:7 17:10 20:17 27:14 31:2 32:24 34:17 35:25 37:20 38:1,8 41:6 43:13 47:20 52:12 53:14 54:12 56:6 60:23 61:8 64:17 86:5 (26)</p> <p><b>upfront</b> 4:17 9:18 13:12 14:4 15:17 16:13 27:11 61:7 64:13 69:19 (10)</p> <p><b>upon</b> 38:22</p> <p><b>urge</b> 20:3 30:15,22 39:3 57:19 67:22 71:20 72:12 79:6 83:25 (10)</p> <p><b>urged</b> 22:25</p> <p><b>us</b> 10:23 16:7 29:15 32:4 34:1,11 37:20,22 38:1,2,8 39:5,13 45:16 59:3,9,16 60:1,5 61:21 63:6,21 72:9,18 81:19 83:10,18 84:10 87:19 (29)</p> <p><b>usa</b> 24:12</p> <p><b>use</b> 26:12 31:20 37:25 38:25 39:8,14 46:22 48:9,12 64:23 65:20 67:14 68:21 78:3,6 (15)</p> <p><b>used</b> 4:5 31:21 33:3 48:24 67:4 (5)</p> <p><b>user</b> 37:2</p>	<p><b>users</b> 37:20 65:11 67:13 76:15,18 (5)</p> <p><b>uses</b> 71:10</p> <p><b>using</b> 26:7,23 39:11 62:22 (4)</p> <p><b>usually</b> 86:1,2</p> <p><b>utilize</b> 5:15</p> <p><b>value</b> 55:8 57:6</p> <p><b>various</b> 5:21</p> <p><b>vehicle</b> 5:8,10 7:11 10:14 13:9 26:16 28:10,12 29:23 30:4 37:12 45:8 53:7 54:5,7 55:14,17,21 56:15 57:3 58:7,14,24 59:5,10 64:19 65:2,6,11 68:13 72:3 74:21 76:14,20 78:17 86:16 (36)</p> <p><b>vehicles</b> 4:20,22 5:16,20 7:9 12:18 13:14 16:5 28:25 29:8,20,21 35:8 37:4,19 45:11 47:7 56:5,19 57:22 58:10 64:25 67:2 71:19,23,24 (26)</p> <p><b>velazquez</b> 2:7 4:25</p> <p><b>verazano</b> 81:9</p> <p><b>very</b> 6:4 9:12 10:8 11:18 23:25 26:6 34:16 40:19 41:9,22 49:11 59:5 60:11,11 61:8,11,13 75:3 78:12 80:4,11,19,20 82:24 84:12,19,25 87:11 (28)</p> <p><b>via</b> 11 3:5,12 19:13 (4)</p> <p><b>viability</b> 19:2</p> <p><b>vibrant</b> 18:23</p> <p><b>vice</b> 55:10 62:16</p> <p><b>video</b> 3:14 4:1 5:7 17:15 18:6 (5)</p> <p><b>videoconference</b> 11</p>
---	---	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

118

<p><b>viewing</b> 19:25</p> <p><b>vin</b> 46:20</p> <p><b>vinod</b> 58:19,23</p> <p><b>violations</b> 7:17</p> <p><b>visibly</b> 38:24</p> <p><b>vision</b> 62:10,16 66:1</p> <p><b>visions</b> 75:20</p> <p><b>visit</b> 42:17 73:14</p> <p><b>visiting</b> 50:21</p> <p><b>visits</b> 48:23</p> <p><b>voice</b> 52:11</p> <p><b>vote</b> 17:18</p> <p><b>wage</b> 53:10</p> <p><b>wain</b> 68:3,9</p> <p><b>wait</b> 35:17</p> <p><b>walk</b> 10:23</p> <p><b>want</b> 10:7 12:11,18 20:25 34:8 37:15 38:14 43:12 44:16 52:4,19 61:9 62:24 63:3,20 77:4 79:21 80:3,12 81:22 82:1,20 84:4,7,14,14,20,22 87:25 (29)</p> <p><b>wanted</b> 12:9,15,21</p> <p><b>wants</b> 47:2 49:11 81:23,25 (4)</p> <p><b>warning</b> 17:7</p> <p><b>wasn't</b> 8:11 22:24 31:15</p> <p><b>watching</b> 6:3</p> <p><b>wav</b> 8:20 9:15 10:5,16 12:17,25 13:9,14 28:10 32:3 35:13 36:8 41:7,10,17 42:3,8 47:2 56:9 68:12,14 69:18</p>	<p>73:11 (23)</p> <p><b>wavs</b> 9:21 10:18 14:17,19 32:8 35:16 36:13 37:14 56:7 59:6 (10)</p> <p><b>way</b> 22:16 23:1 38:15 53:15,21 68:22 76:15 78:16 89:15 (9)</p> <p><b>ways</b> 53:17 67:22</p> <p><b>we'd</b> 13:10 24:25 64:14</p> <p><b>we'll</b> 6:3,9 32:1 34:14 87:22 88:1 (6)</p> <p><b>we've</b> 15:15 23:3 37:16</p> <p><b>wear</b> 85:21</p> <p><b>weather</b> 72:17</p> <p><b>website</b> 3:7 17:13</p> <p><b>week</b> 5:4 40:18</p> <p><b>weeks</b> 40:19</p> <p><b>welcome</b> 4:15</p> <p><b>well</b> 28:15 29:7 54:16 72:16 79:11 87:2 (6)</p> <p><b>went</b> 6:24</p> <p><b>westway</b> 42:22,25</p> <p><b>what</b> 5:4 22:6 28:21 31:23 32:20 37:18 46:5 49:12 51:20,22 53:1 61:19 63:2 72:21 81:21 82:13 84:17 (17)</p> <p><b>what's</b> 7:3 31:10 39:7</p> <p><b>whatever</b> 48:24 83:17</p> <p><b>whatsoever</b> 77:10</p> <p><b>wheelchair</b> 4:19 8:6,17 9:1 16:5 35:7 37:2,18,20 45:7 48:3,8 64:18 70:12 71:11,18,24 72:2 74:19 75:2</p>	<p>76:15 79:19,22,23,25 81:25 (26)</p> <p><b>when</b> 3:14,18,24 4:6 14:16 17:2,9 26:21 31:19 32:9,21 33:7 39:1,6,9 45:25 46:6 47:7 51:23 52:10 60:23 63:10,13,21,22 67:15,15,16,17 72:17 81:7 (31)</p> <p><b>where</b> 15:4,4,5 22:23 28:18,24 29:19 (7)</p> <p><b>whereas</b> 86:3</p> <p><b>whereof</b> 89:17</p> <p><b>whether</b> 22:16 49:1 53:17 76:23 (4)</p> <p><b>which</b> 5:20,23 7:6 8:15 9:19 14:12 15:21,24 23:9 29:14 31:13 52:19,23 54:18 56:6 58:25 59:5,13,19 60:1,8 73:6,21 78:8 79:25 80:13,18 81:14 85:14 (29)</p> <p><b>while</b> 23:23 36:7 52:17 56:7 59:4 67:11 (6)</p> <p><b>who</b> 5:6 10:9 23:22 28:24 29:25 35:18 36:11,15 38:23,23 39:10,13 45:6 47:1 50:19,20 53:2 54:3 58:3 63:11,12,16 65:8,14,15,20,22 66:2,12 67:4 71:9,10,11 78:9 86:6,10 (36)</p> <p><b>whole</b> 28:20 32:8 56:25 83:23 (4)</p> <p><b>wholeheartedly</b> 23:20</p> <p><b>whom</b> 29:18 67:8</p> <p><b>whose</b> 67:20</p> <p><b>why</b> 13:17 38:6 50:18 61:4 75:19 83:20 84:11,14 (8)</p> <p><b>will</b> 3:10,16,17,21 4:1,7,11 7:12,23 10:10,16,23 11:17 13:15,18 14:20 17:4,6,7,8,16,20,22,24 19:21</p>
---	---	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission**

**January 9, 2025**

119

<p>20:8,17 21:10 23:21 26:4 27:12 28:11 29:6 30:1 32:2,5,6,8 37:14,22 39:24 41:10 43:22 44:18 48:15 49:4 54:10,12,18 56:3,24 57:5 59:8,10 60:22 64:20,22 66:11,12,19 67:4,19 69:2 73:21 76:15 84:12 88:3,13 (68)</p> <p><b>winwin</b> 20:11</p> <p><b>wish</b> 5:2</p> <p><b>wishing</b> 3:9</p> <p><b>within</b> 9:2 41:25 57:10 89:7,10 (5)</p> <p><b>withintitled</b> 89:10</p> <p><b>without</b> 7:2 78:17</p> <p><b>witness</b> 89:17</p> <p><b>won't</b> 37:19</p> <p><b>wonderful</b> 50:8</p> <p><b>word</b> 49:14</p> <p><b>work</b> 6:14 41:22 50:19 51:3 63:9 67:18 68:18 69:15,21 83:12 (10)</p> <p><b>worked</b> 52:12</p> <p><b>worker</b> 40:17</p> <p><b>workers</b> 51:18 52:7 68:10</p> <p><b>working</b> 37:3 76:4</p> <p><b>works</b> 49:17 61:11 67:3 73:3 79:11 (5)</p> <p><b>world</b> 73:18</p> <p><b>worry</b> 61:5</p> <p><b>worse</b> 67:21</p> <p><b>would</b> 8:14,20 9:4 11:20,25 12:2,3 13:5 14:2,8,11,12</p>	<p>21:3,15,21 22:21 23:9 24:19 26:13 29:2,10,10,14,25 30:2,3,3,4 43:9,10 45:2,18 53:4 57:11 71:20 80:7 86:7 (37)</p> <p><b>writing</b> 3:24</p> <p><b>written</b> 17:16 28:1 30:22</p> <p><b>wrong</b> 79:6</p> <p><b>x</b> 1,5</p> <p><b>yankee</b> 49:2</p> <p><b>yankey</b> 64:2,5,6 67:11 (4)</p> <p><b>yeah</b> 40:13 42:11</p> <p><b>year</b> 5:3,5 10:12 12:1 53:12 62:12 73:6 75:5,6 77:17 80:13 (11)</p> <p><b>years</b> 13:25 29:16 30:7 37:5 38:4 41:21,25 43:3,8,13,15 44:5 48:11 52:9,10 53:6 55:19 56:16,21,22 57:4,11 61:18 71:12 79:20 81:18,19 86:15 (28)</p> <p><b>yellow</b> 49:20 76:13 79:24 80:5 82:7,9 (6)</p> <p><b>yellows</b> 31:22</p> <p><b>yes</b> 15:1,18 31:6 40:11 50:6 62:20 68:7 70:24 74:14 79:17 83:4,6 (12)</p> <p><b>yet</b> 25:15</p> <p><b>yield</b> 4:11</p> <p><b>yk</b> 2:8</p> <p><b>york</b> 2 7:6 24:18 34:25 37:1 40:17 43:1 49:18 50:12 51:18 57:16 62:18 68:10 71:12,21,25 73:5,13,16,22 74:4 82:9 89:3,8 (24)</p> <p><b>yorker</b> 69:25 71:9</p>	<p><b>yorkers</b> 6:7 36:18 50:19,24 51:3 72:10 77:25 79:3,5 (9)</p> <p><b>you've</b> 16:17 18:4 53:1 60:5 (4)</p> <p><b>your</b> 3:13,15,16,17,19,20,25,25 4:4,11 7:1 17:2,3,4,9,9 18:4 30:24 32:2,5,19 35:1 36:16 38:2,18 39:24 55:3 61:25 70:23 74:10 78:14 83:5,9,23 85:4 (35)</p> <p><b>yup</b> 86:19</p> <p><b>zone</b> 5:9,17 33:17 38:19 40:21 41:1 (6)</p> <p><b>zoom</b> 11 3:5,12 4:4 (4)</p> <p><b>250</b> 40:25 80:14</p> <p><b>475</b> 60:15</p> <p><b>1000</b> 68:13</p> <p><b>1003</b> 8</p> <p><b>1129</b> 88:16</p> <p><b>1988</b> 55:12 74:19</p> <p><b>1996</b> 37:5</p> <p><b>2010</b> 83:15</p> <p><b>2014</b> 51:23</p> <p><b>2018</b> 24:13</p> <p><b>2022</b> 74:20</p> <p><b>2024</b> 7:6 17:14</p> <p><b>2025</b> 7 89:18</p> <p><b>2028</b> 9:9 14:19</p> <p><b>2029</b> 12:6</p> <p><b>3000</b> 53:12</p>
--	---	--

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Hearing NYC - Taxi &  
Limousine Commission

January 9, 2025

120

**4000** 10:11

**6700** 16:4

**10000** 24:16

**14000** 10:6 15:17,17 37:13  
53:3 85:12,13 (7)

**25000** 59:4

**30000** 83:16

**35000** 10:6 37:13 43:9,16  
59:3 74:24 82:14,15 85:13 (9)

**59000** 61:22

**60000** 81:21

**65000** 61:17

**79000** 72:3

**99000** 72:3

**6000000** 12:3