

Community Board 1, Queens – Board Meeting Minutes

January 15, 2019

Meeting Opens with Chairperson, Marie Torniali at 6:30 p.m. – Pledge of Allegiance followed.

Chairperson Marie Torniali welcomed and introduced Councilman Costa Constantinides.

Councilman Costa Constantinides wished everyone well for the New Year. He thanked the Chair, District Manager and the Community Board Members for all of their work. The Councilman discussed the incident that occurred at the Con Edison site on 27th December and said we should all be grateful no one was injured and no residences were damaged. He stated that Astoria has lived with this impact each day and shared that Con Edison supplies 55% of the electric for the City from right here in Western Queens. He said on a cold day like this, you can see then white smoke coming out of the stacks. Every single day those pollutants come out and emanate chemicals that we breathe in which cause Asthma. He said every single day those pollutants go into our lungs and we feel those impacts. Our neighborhood is impacted higher than the average. Emergency Rooms and hospitalizations for Asthma are higher than the rest of the boroughs average. We need the City to study how we close down the power plants out of our neighborhood by using wind power and solar power save the energy and disbus a green grid is the future. Councilman Constantinides said there are 50,000 buildings in the City of New York and are about 30% responsible of the emissions of City of New York out of 1 million. Urged the community to testify at the City Council Hearing on February 11th on what happened on December 27th. He introduced legislation to retrofit these buildings these large buildings are the biggest challenge by year 2030 40% reduction and by year 2050 80% reduction. Corey Johnson, Speaker of the Council has co-sponsored the bill and about 35 co-sponsors right now. We hope to pass the bill by April in time for Earth Day to be on the front lines against Climate Change. 55% of our neighborhood is in a flood zone. Our neighborhood will be impacted by Climate Change, the largest borough. Neighborhoods that we know like Rockaways and Coney Island will disappear from the map if do not act on Climate Change. This is the work I am doing on the Environmental Committee of the Council. Ali Forney is on your agenda they are a group that does fine work for the LGTB youth of our community. I will not tell you how to vote just know they help the youth and the city council supports them. The City Council provided over \$5 million to bring support of housing to get these young people what they need. I wanted to address you who are here to talk about Amazon. He stated he is opposed to the deal. Opposed to a corporation getting \$3 billion that does not need it and not good on unions. The Councilman said there are better ways to make investments for example money going towards our N/W train line. Should you have any questions please reach out to him and thanked everyone.

Chairperson Marie Torniali welcomed and introduced Comptroller Scott Stringer.

Comptroller Scott Stringer said they had 2 victories today. The Governor's Budget, announced first victory that their rent and credit campaign benefits and increase in credit score for people who pay their rent on time will get the same benefits as a person paying their mortgage on time. This will help people to establish good credit. The second victory today is for the people that are in non-stabilized buildings are making months and months of security deposits for apartments and for someone who has been homeless cannot afford 3 months' rent security deposit, we will propose legislation to limit it to a 1 month deposit. Community based planning is a good thing that has been going on for hundreds of years making good strong solid communities. I want to make this clear, I did not sign the Amazon letter, this multi-billion dollar deal is outrageous. The tax benefits and tax breaks needs to be addressed. They sent a letter to the EDC with 18 questions and they replied that they will respond. Contact his office with any questions and concerns.

Chairperson Marie Torniali thanked him and introduced the first item on the agenda. She said this is a continuation of a public hearing held on January 9, 2019.

City Planning Application: C180530 ZMQ and N180529 ZRQ, 47-15 34th Avenue

Mr. Frank St. Jacques from Akerman LLP representative for the ULURP process speaking on behalf of Ashley Young LLC and John Young LLC. Two actions: Zoning Map Amendment change maps to R7X C24 to R6B C24 zoning districts and the second one is to designate the area to a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing (MIH) - zoning tax text amendment. Joined by David West, Architect, Hill West and Michael Curely, Philip Habib & Associates, the environmental consultants, as well as, Bishop Mitchell Taylor, Urban Upbound who is working with them on the project.

PowerPoint presentation (see handout) by Frank St. Jacques of Akerman on behalf of their client to map MIH Option 2 which requires 30% of the residential floor area to permanently income restricted average AMI 80% the proposed development is a 14 story mixed residential commercial community facility building approximately 201 units of 61 would be income restricted MIH. The project is on 2 block fronts between 46th Street to 48th Street along 34th Avenue and Northern Boulevard. Any development that occurs within the MIH area would be subject to the MIH requirements. The building is 14 stories, 145 feet; base height of 10 stories, 105 feet. There is a 6 story portion, 65 feet and a 4 story portion, 45 feet and is approximately 180,000 square feet; the floor area ratio is 6.0. A landscape portion above for parking.

Mr. St. Jacques introduced David West, Hill West Architects.

Mr. David West introduced himself and stated he is from the architect firm and speaker for project. He also made his presentation from the PowerPoint. He discussed massing of the building (design of step down to blend into community) he shared that the height is 14 stories feet above the ground.

Mr. St. Jacques mentioned that they would be providing Urban Upbound about 1,500 square feet for an office on the ground floor of the building within the community facility area. He then introduced Bishop Taylor.

Bishop Mitchell Taylor said he is the Pastor of the Center of Hope International in Long Island City and Co-Founder of Urban Upbound and here in the capacity of Inside Track representing Ashley Young. He said several things sparked him with this project one the developer is providing a substantial amount of affordable housing and the affordability proposed at the last meeting can be steeper, the fact that the service jobs in the building will be 32BJ Union jobs and the aspect that Urban Upbound will be able to afford office space. Bishop Taylor said it makes it very appealing to the community. Strongly urges the Board to consider all of the benefit to this project.

Marie Torniali, Chairperson introduced Elizabeth Erion, Co-Chair, Land Use & Zoning Committee.

Elizabeth Erion, Co-Chair, Land Use & Zoning Committee - Stated that this is a continuation of the Public Hearing held in the local community on January 9th. She also shared that 3 speakers that testified in favor of the project, 8 people spoke in opposition of the project. Ms. Erion told everyone that there is a report in the folders.

Felix Figueroa - Testifying on behalf of 32BJ Union, they represent more than 80,000 workers in NYC. He spoke about the work and economics of the workers of 32BJ. He spoke in favor of the project and for the working families and the commitment of Ashley Young LLC. He shared that they are committed to good paying jobs.

Mark Papish - Spoke in opposition to the project. The majority of the units for 1 bedrooms or studios at 80% of the AMI for a family of 3 the family should be able to make at least \$75,000 a year to get into a unit in Woodside. The building is completely out of character for the neighborhood. You also have to win a lottery which the ratio is 1 out of 653 people.

Gloria Moloney – Her big concern is that the building is too big does not fit into the community, too many apartments for this area. Her other concern is all the empty parcels on Northern Boulevard. The need is to make sure that all these parcels are not going to be over built to match the building.

A Woodside Houses resident stated they are in support of this project and lives in the area for over 60 years. These are affordable apartments and asked to allow community to grow.

Maximilian Dileo - A resident of this neighborhood spoke. He shared that he has lived there all his life born and raised and owns property between 46th & 47th Streets. He opposes this project. He feels that there is no way shape or form this building should be put there. When you speak about jobs like 32BJ it is only a handful of jobs and going to rent out spaces to retail. This will set a precedent for the neighborhood this is a bad idea that will disable this area it just does not fit.

Senior Pastor, Reverend Patrick Young from the First Baptist Church - Stated they are about 15 minutes from this proposed project and would like to express his support of this rezoning. This building project will create new affordable and housing opportunities that are greatly needed in this neighborhood. It will provide units for people who are congregants and live in the area. These apartments would be welcome to people some of who have no heat in the winter where they are currently living. It will also provide services to the people of Woodside Houses that are direly needed. They will bring opportunities for good job and the developer has committed to provide 1500 square feet of community facility space for Urban Upbound.

Donnelly Rodriguez – Stated he was born and raised in Astoria makes \$40,000 a year and has been applying for these apartments for years and has yet to get a response the odds are a miniscule. The reality is that you must have a good credit score also. The majority of the neighborhood are working class and do not have a great credit scores. Most don't have that kind of a score so they will not even get through the application process. The reality is this building is not for the working class people of Astoria. This will displace all the working class people in New York City.

Corinna Hayne – Spoke in support of the proposed rezoning lives in the Long Island City area all of her life. This is a growing area, we need to embrace change and growth. Urban Upbound has a lot of services job placement financial literacy and has helped her improve her credit score, all services are free. I believes in this changing and growing community that we try to embrace change and this opportunity to improve and upgrade your lifestyle.

Pastor of the Community Church of Astoria – Supports of the proposal of this rezoning. It will create new affordable housing opportunities that are greatly needed in the neighborhood. The developer committed to working with 32BJ Union. In addition committed to providing 1500 square feet of community facility space for Urban Upbound to bring its comprehensive employment and financial services to the community.

Victor Coles – Stated he grew up in Long Island City area he sees this project as to helping people speaks to building the future and the surrounding area he speaks to Urban Upbound and the services let change happen it is going to happen. Give it a chance, Urban Upbound provides a worth of support.

Mark – Stated he was born and raised in this borough Queens resident and is 56 years old – He stated he remembers when the Citi Corp building went up and felt it was out of place and now in 2019 there are so many skyscrapers. This project is very important not only to him but also to others who need it looking for places to live in.

Rebecca – Spoke on behalf of the CUNY School of Law Center for Urban Environmental Reform, stated she has lived in the neighborhood for over 20 years. On 21st Street, 7 stories tower, imagine 14 stories what will mean to this residential neighborhood it will change it entirely. A nuisance is a thing of out of place, this project is the thing out of place. Welcome sensible development and affordable. \$54,000 is the median income in this neighborhood. 26% of people make less than \$25,000. They will not be able to live in this building. They cannot afford this it does not serve the people who live here. Urge you to rethink this project and keep it a living and working community.

Resident in support to rezone the area. In support of the new project, it will bring in union jobs and excited that Urban Upbound is part of this new venture.

Theodore Miller – Stated he lives in Queens all his life and does community services. He is not in support of this building but in support of economic change it can bring to this neighborhood. Urban Upbound can help improve the community and bring it all together.

Karen Armstrong – Stated she lived in the neighborhood for over 30 years. She mentioned the 207 page environmental study assessment of neighborhood character is not warranted and that the land uses in the area are primarily residential accounting for 82% of the tax laws. She states Northern Boulevard has been rerouted already and there is a traffic issue that already exists. Urges a traffic analysis to be requested.

Sharon Walker – Stated she is a resident of Long Island City – If this project is affordable for all thinks it is a good idea but is not sure.

Linda – Said she is a lifelong resident of Queens in support of the rezoning it is a chance for success with Urban Upbound. When children go off to college and when they return you want to remain close to your family but it is not affordable but this will give the opportunity, it is needed.

Jimmy Townsend – He stated he lived in the area his whole life went to IS 10 went to Bryant High School worked at Toys R Us support of this rezoning we should be open minded moving towards the future. Urban Upbound are taking a chance with the youth and the residents that live in the area that needs jobs and places to live. Give them a chance.

Anabel Flores – Stated she is a resident of Astoria and Woodside for 27 years. Opposed to the new building. The building is out of character and who is it affordable to? Asks Urban Upbound to look into another space although she recognizes that they provide amazing services. She supports the people who spoke before her. We can't just further gentrifying Astoria and Woodside.

Arthur Tyler – Stated he is a lifelong resident moved here in 1952 we need more space can't provide space can't park in Astoria very hard takes him 45 minutes to over 1 hour. Now 200 families in a building can easily have 300 cars and if the building does not provide that many spaces it can be a negative and need at least 10% spaces for visitors. 6 out of 200 are going to be 3 bedrooms, it is not enough.

Patrick – Said he lives on Broadway for 8 years in a rent stabilized apartment if that was not the case he would not be living here. For anyone who is for this development to look a little deeper if you think it is affordable you are being frivolous 140 units for Amazon employees that is more subway riders on the crumbling subway system and no parking there either.

Adam Charles – Stated he lives 5 houses North of the project which is a rather large project (around corner is a Church) religious institution the magnitude of this building can be a real detriment to the community from the traffic standpoint and the parking standpoint the subway decomposing 240 units only 75 parking spaces it is unacceptable. A building of this size should have a shadow study.

Joanna Armstrong – Said she is a resident on Roosevelt Island for 26 years is in support of the rezoning project will create more opportunities.

Aaron White – Stated the Community effect/impact in the environmental study for this project the developer submitted a list of pending residential developments that would impact the area 11 other projects the largest located at 3411 Steinway but made no mention of the 44-01 Northern Boulevard Major World development corner of 44th Street project just 3 blocks West and a new middle school at 38-04 48th Street .3 miles away across on Northern Boulevard which will bring a projected 720 students and that slated to be completed 2022 not to mention the new High School 3 blocks East at the corner of 51st and Northern proposed to be a 1000 student campus and does not include 289 room hotel planned for the corner of Steinway Street and Northern just 6 blocks away or mention of the project which is still in the early stages at Steinway Square that will spread out from 41st, 42nd Street and Steinway Street to 35th Avenue to Northern Boulevard. It can include up to 4000 residential units and it is just 5 blocks from this proposed complex. It will have an enormous impact on the subway line.

Ms. Hantzopoulos - Resident said she spoke at the last hearing – She is opposed to this completely. She stated the about the 140 non-affordable apartments they are at market value the chances of getting an apartment are slim to none near impossible walking down a 1 bedroom is going for \$3000 a month here in Astoria. The further gentrification of the community we need to stop this stop it now.

Woodside Houses Resident – Stated she is in support of this project. There are a lot of people for it and a lot people against it. Who is this affordable for? She stated this will happen anyway so be open minded to work towards something positive.

Resident from Woodside Houses (inaudible) – In support of project.

Jean Chappell – In support of the rezoning project because it makes sense. Lives in Woodside Houses for over 30 years. It brings jobs and opportunities to the area.

Claudia Cogar – Stated she lives in Astoria Houses is in support of the affordable housing in North Western Queens. Stated she is a Community Leader for over 60 years in the community. She supports growth of North Western Queens.

Antonios Benetatos, President of the Dutch Kills Civic Association – Said, “What is the purpose of zoning?” The reason why zoning was created is to maintain the character of the area. Affordable Housing should be that the baseline should be 40% not 60% make 61% of the units instead of 51% of the units. He said, “Put in more really affordable housing.”

James Mongeluzo – Stated he is speaking on the affordability issue. What affordable means and what the AMI means. They are averaging affordability to the average person in the region not calculating not just in New York City not just the neighborhood not just the zip code. This is not affordable for the people in the area. 70% for people make a lot more money and can afford it and that is not the people that live here not the community. Supporting and promoting further gentrification.

Adelaida Tamayo – Stated she is speaking against this building. She is a resident of Queens and has been applying for affordable housing for years. She makes about 40K and cannot apply for this building. It is not affordable housing for the working class. This is building is pandering to rich Amazon employees.

Chair Torniali turned meeting over to Liz Erion Co-Chair of Land Use & Zoning Committee

Liz Erion Co-Chair, Land Use & Zoning Committee – Ms. Erion noted that the Community Board Office received five (5) emails in opposition to the project. She stated that the Land Use Committee had the presentation on December 4th and at that time came up with many of the recommendations and statements that were heard this evening with respect to affordability, accommodating the families, the fact that the physical characteristics of the building are out of context and out of scale with surrounding development therefore recommendation was adopted to disapprove this project many reasons why and they will be noted and given to City Planning. They are that the number of studios and 1 bedroom units should be reduced and 2 and 3 bedrooms should be increased within building distribution. The residential floor area should be increased to at least 35% affordable. The MIH Option 1 should be selected to accommodate a wider range of income levels that are closer to the median income of the surrounding area. The C2 commercial overlay descriptor should be changed to a C1 to encourage local service uses rather than a wide variety commercial uses there. The depth of the commercial overlay should be reduced to 100 feet along 34th Avenue and the building height should be reduced from 14 stories to no higher than between 8 to 10 stories to more closely reflect the areas density and the built context. These are the reasons why the recommendations were to disapprove the project.

Motioned by Gerry Caliendo; Seconded by Nancy Silverman

Bob Piazza, Board Member – Expressed that this is not really affordable. It will not stay affordable, we learned years ago when the City was giving tax breaks to large developers and in return they were getting affordable housing. Years later, the City found out they were not staying affordable, there was no control and no one watching it.

Nancy Silverman, Board Member – Expressed that she wanted to echo Public Speakers and the Board Members who expressed at the Land Use Committee meeting and at the Public Hearing concerns about affordability. Often not clear there is no guarantee Woodside Houses are going to any of these apartments or that she will get any of these apartments she lives 6 blocks from there, it is a lottery, although she is eligible. They also think they are going

to be hundreds of jobs, union jobs. We should applaud this developer. However you do not get a union a job just coming out of a regular job, you have to be in the union, a union member. This is a big misunderstanding.

Rod Townsend, Board Member – Thanked the developers for listening to them at the Public Hearing. He told them that they have sharpened their pencils but they have not gone far enough, they need to keep on sharpening their pencils. We are not anti-development but we need homes and more affordable homes.

Richard Khuzami, Board Member – Since the last rezoning in 2010 we have been asking for the areas not rezoned to be zoned to give the community a chance to look at the areas and have input on how these areas are rezoned. Northern Boulevard has one spot zoning going on right now, this is not the way that the community can get input.

Yawne Robinson, Board Member – Asked the developer to rethink about this community in the essence of the available units for 2 and 3 bedrooms this is a growing community which means there will be more families take that into consideration also with the schools and community services in the area not saying she is against it but she does have questions and concerns. Parking density, traffic analysis the fact that a few months ago discussed there are 60,000 homeless families in Queens that are displaced and going to homeless shelters needs to be brought back to the table. She is not opposing change but can we have more units that represent the families that are coming in.

Antonella Di Saverio, Board Member – She said we need to be mindful of proposed density but have to look at the infrastructure sewer systems look at transportation and look how congested and the quality of life on how it is now those things have not been brought up we need to think about that we can build all we want we are going to suffer the damages down the line.

Eric Mouchette, Board Member – Stated that one of the key statements that was made during the presentation was that things were done for this building to fit in the neighborhood. Curious what exactly was done? those blocks are nice looking, red brick buildings nicely matched and yellow brick buildings 2 to 3 stories max how does a 14 story building with 201 units fit into the neighborhood? It perplexes me.

Evie Hantzopoulos, Board Member – Many of us want something good for people for people who deserve better whether they are lacking affordable housing now do not have jobs people are struggling to make ends meet they want better opportunities. We need to it look at this project for what it is for. It took 4 meetings for the developer to do anything that we have been asking for. The first time they met with the zoning committee we brought up these issues we asked for truly deeply affordable housing not 80% not even 60% to reflect the average median income of the area which is about 55,000 and for Woodside Houses which is 22,000 average median income. We have asked the developers have they explored any other subsidies which they can build 100% affordable housing and still make their money. As a community we cannot let things happen to us we have to be proactive and fight back ask our City Council members to advocate more for lower AMI figure out what we can do to preserve the housing that is there. They brought someone in from the community that does good work to try to rally support for this project because there was so much opposition.

Vanessa Jones-Hall, Board Member – She said she is not against change not against the neighborhood that is up and coming but her concerns are that we have a lot of working families in shelters out of fairness they need a place to call home. Where are they to go? It is only right that we give it a thought a lot of these buildings of Astoria and Long Island City, they are not considering these people. So many people are losing places to live. We are so overwhelmed in this area. We have had meetings upon meetings the people complaining about the shelter but where are they to do as for Urban Upbound she supports them they do good work and stated she is member. She wishes they were getting more space than what is being offered. A better deal can be made.

Motion made by Nancy Silverman, Seconded by Andre Stith to disapprove City Planning Application: C180530 ZMQ and N180529 ZRQ

Roll call by Ed Babor, Executive Secretary – In favor: 31; Disapproved/Against: 4; 1 Abstain for cause

Motioned carried to disapprove the application

Chairperson Marie Torniali introduced the second item on the agenda.

Board of Standards and Appeals Application: 2018-172 BZ, Ali Forney Center, 46-09 31st Avenue

Elizabeth Erion, Co-Chair, Land Use and Zoning Committee – She stated that this is a continuation of a public hearing held on January 9, 2019. At the time there were 12 speakers who spoke in favor. We will give you a review of the Committee's recommendation after the presentation and the speakers.

Barak Wrobel, Representative, Holland & Knight, PowerPoint presentation (see handout) - Greeted everyone and said he is there with the applicant Ali Forney in partnership with the Episcopal Diocese of Long Island. They are presenting an application before the Board of Standards and Appeals requesting certain relief from regulations applicable for development in an R5 zoning district, the property is located at 31st Avenue and 47th Street, Astoria, Queens, an R5 district is a transitional district from a low to mid density district. The proposal is for construction of a 21 unit permanent supportive housing facility it is currently occupied by the St. Andrews Church and it's a rectory. The rectory of church will be demolished to facilitate the project. The supportive housing facility will be operated by Ali Forney the largest providers for supportive housing for homeless youth in New York City and throughout the country, specifically LGBT youth. He said they want to preserve the integrity of the existing beautiful church on the site.

He introduced Kami Altman of Magnusson Architecture and Planning PC to talk about the architecture on the site.

Ms. Altman mentioned that Christine Hunter is the Architect for the project. She said she was going to explain why they are requesting waivers and explaining the architecture. St. Andrews is a very diverse area I.S. 10, New York School of Urban Ministry and health care facilities and residential buildings. She said the rectory has been vacant for a number of years so that particular building will be demolished. The church building is beautiful, designed by the same architecture firm who designed the Cathedral of St. John the Divine in Manhattan as well as Princeton University. It is not a landmark but there are a lot of details that as architects they appreciate and they nicely complement the neighborhood. The building is only using 8800 square feet of the floor area they are actually allowed to have 15000 square feet on this site. The height regulations only able to take advantage of a little over half of that and only be able to provide 9 units as opposed to 21 units which is the proposed project. The front yard be required to have a 10 foot front yard setback which makes the building stand out more the proposal continue the existing fabric by aligning the building with the row of houses and the adjacent lot. The side yard setback which will push the building towards the existing church it will close off the west elevation of the existing church and block a lot of the windows there but natural light into the building another issue is the existing exiting from the cellar of the church would have to exist through the building which could also be problematic. The proposed scheme offers 21 studio units, 15000 square feet floor area allowed set back from the existing church create an entry garden to celebrate the church it has 3 prominent sides as well as create a little inviting garden. Another variance sought is eliminating the side yard and aligning the front street wall with the existing row houses on the west side of the property. On the right side shows 6 units and the left side set back the building about 15 feet and end up with 3 units and a small lounge space in the front. This was a preliminary sketch to fit in scale wise and not be overwhelming to the rest of the neighborhood or overwhelm the architecture of the church as well as the typical row houses in the neighborhood. They are being very careful not to have the street wall any higher than the peak of the church so it is lower at that point also the trellis on the side they are building a garden between the church and the rectory they want to recreate that into a vertical garden. Another variance is building height which is adding one more story by sinking the building by ½ a story.

Mr. Wrobel continued, in conclusion, they did an amazing job developing a building that utilizes the floor area on the site and reserves the integrity of the existing church and for the most part it preserves the character of the neighborhood and to match the existing buildings although it does require a waiver retaining the existing side yard condition it also requires a waiver and the height of the buildings are minimally higher than that which is permitted 35 at the base 45 at the maximum about 5 feet above the 30-40 permitted and the outer court which is a great amenity not fully compliant with outer court dimensions. For the Board to grant these waivers they have to find that basically the site presents some practical difficulties in complying with the full letter of the bulk/restrictions the church does present those difficulties they also have to find that the waivers do not disrupt the essential character of the neighborhood and believe it not a disruption does preserve the character and hopefully compliments it. The waivers are minimally necessary and believe they provide the relief necessary to develop this site and provide the

most effect out of this project 21 units of supportive permanent housing for LGBT youth in New York City. Asked if anyone had any questions.

Marie Torniali, Chairperson - Asked if anyone had any comments before she passed it on to Elizabeth Erion.

Elizabeth Erion, Co-Chair, Land Use and Zoning Committee – Stated they had 12 speakers that spoke in favor of the proposal the Committee met prior to this meeting this evening and unanimously recommended that the application be approved. They are asking minimum relief.

Chair, Marie Torniali asked if anyone from the public would like to speak for or against.

Anabel Flores – She said she supports this development. She works with non-profit and has referred clients to Ali Forney in the past they have a shelter site in Brooklyn they provide holistic services, counseling, housing and to LGBT community.

Mr. Fay – Urging CB1 to endorse and support the request for variance to provide 21 units for most vulnerable homeless LGBT young people and community. We want to send them a message to say we want to help you get back on your feet and get on with your life.

MacCartney Morris - Greeted everyone stated he is an Astoria resident lives about 10 blocks from the proposed site and said it would be his honor to have the Ali Forney Center as his neighbor they are an organization doing amazing work in this city you should support them and welcome them to Astoria they have gone out of their way to make this building fit within the existing neighborhood. I urges everyone to support them.

Elizabeth Erion, Co-Chair, Land Use and Zoning Committee – Stated that the Community Board has to look at the BSA five (5) findings for the variance to be granted said they mentioned most of them but did not hear how you would meet the first finding which has to do the lot itself to be developed as of right. Please address that.

Mr. Wrobel – He said the practical difficulties that the zoning lot presents in developing is the presence of the church itself and its historic character despite the fact it is not a landmark church. The studies show that an as of right proposal would but up against the church destroy the integrity and of less in character of the neighborhood because it would not conform to the yard. Those are the physical difficulties that present hardship, for the zoning envelope.

Elizabeth Erion, Co-Chair – Mentioned to the Board that she was submitting a letter for the record from Councilman Constantinides absolutely in support of this project from late November/early December.

Ms. Erion reiterated that the Land Use Committee recommendation that they unanimously supported approval of this BSA application.

Motioned by Nancy Silverman; Seconded by Rose Anne Alafogiannis

Bob Piazza, Board Member - He said he is in favor of the project. He said he walked around the buildings and the church and further down the block where there is a new church. He said they would have to do a lot of work to make it a landmark, it would be a nice thing.

Mr. Wrobel – There are no parties or loud music permitted in the operation of supportive housing facilities.

Andy Aujla, Board Member – He said, “Confirm how long the terms of the lease is with Ali Forney.”

Mr. Wrobel – He said it is a partnership constructing and operating it together not sure of the duration.

Andy Aujla – He asked if Ali Forney is operating it for the length of time.

Mr. Wrobel – He responded that there is a 30 year regulatory agreement with HPD and then an opportunity to extend for another 30 years.

Chair, Marie Torniali called for the vote to approve the BSA application: 2018-172 BZ, Ali Forney Center

Roll Call by Ed Babor, Executive Secretary

Vote: In favor: 31; Against: 0; Abstention for cause: 1

Chair Torniali said the Motion carried

Chairperson Marie Torniali introduced Joe Nocerino of the Borough President's Office.

Mr. Nocerino announced that on January 25th the State of the Borough at LaGuardia Community College it is a small venue please respond as soon as possible. February 1st Budget items. Complimented the Board for how they handle their Land Use items. February 11 Borough Board Budget vote. Board Members up for renewal please fill out New Form 4 pages on the Borough President's website have it Notarized the deadline is February 8th.

Bhavneet Anand, Executive Director from Assemblyman Brian Barnwell's Office – She said there were flyers for 2 events that they are hosting Mammogram Mobile unit on February 27th from 9 am to 5 pm call their office to RSVP do not need to have health insurance to receive this service. They will also have a Department of Finance event to help people to file for tax exemptions for renters, homeowners and senior citizens on Tuesday, January 29th from 1 to 3 pm at Woodside Library.

Maria Barlis, Community Liaison from Senator Jessica Ramos' Office – Stated that their office is open for constituent services as of yesterday. She shared that the swearing-in ceremony is at the Elmcort on Northern Boulevard at 6 pm, next Friday, January 25th. Looks forward to working with everyone.

Chair Marie Torniali announced that there is a list of speakers that signed in and introduced the first speaker.

Marian Cicoello, New York City Business Solutions Center in Queens – She stated they are based in Jamaica they offer free services to small businesses they provide free legal consultation for small businesses as well as access to financing and courses such as QuickBooks. She said she was there to talk about the Love your Local Initiative Program, it is a Grant program from NYC Small Business Services. It is up to \$90,000 for a small business, you need to be a retail storefront and be 3 years in business and the deadline has been extended to February 3, 2019 this is the second round of applications. They did not have a Queens awardee the first round and would like one. Announced there are flyers with information and that there is a link for applying.

Fulton – Resident who lives in LIC, said he opposes Amazon coming to the community. It will bring about 25,000 new employees, 75,000 more residents and higher housing prices.

Andrew McKeon – He said he is one of 40 Union Members there tonight, Steam Fitters Local 638 and is a Queens resident there as a proud supporter of the Amazon plan to build headquarters in Long Island City which will bring jobs to Union brothers and sisters discusses positive effect including a new school.

Thomas – Stated he is a lifelong resident of Queens who opposes the Amazon deal in Long Island City. Works with Labor Unions and Small Business owners who also oppose the deal, who are working to educate the community on this horrendous deal made in the dark by the Governor and the Mayor. There will be skyrocketing rents. Amazon deal is going to bypass Community Board 2 review. Community Board 2 composed a letter to the Governor of the State and the City citing the communities concerns including Amazon's complicity with ICE their poor labor practices as well as skyrocketing rents and displacement. Asking Community Board 1 to compose a letter of opposition. They are bypassing ULURP and Land Use review.

Tony Benetatos, President, Dutch Kills Civic Association – Stated that the Amazon deal is opposed by Dutch Kills Civic Association. He said that the Economic Development Corporation will field questions from the public at a general meeting on February 14th at the Growing up Green Charter School at 7 pm and can get information by following Dutch Kills on Twitter and Facebook as well.

Elizabeth – Stated she is a resident of Community Board 1 and asked to please focus on affordable housing, police community relations, transit and saying No to Amazon. We cannot afford more displacement.

Patrick Bush – Stated that he has been living here for 8 years and is opposing the Amazon deal. Thinking about universal rent control, and urges it as well as that we should push Albany for more rent control.

James Montenegro – Announced if anyone is interested in the Queens Marathon he is with the Queens Distance Runners and has more information if needed. He is also against Amazon – There will be further gentrification and being pushed further east. The infrastructure cannot support it.

David Yang – Stated he is a lifelong Queens resident and also Co-founder of “Pursuit” they are a Non-profit organization, they offer a 4 year fellowship trained to become software engineers. Students come in making roughly \$18,000 a year and come out making \$85,000 year and working with the best tech companies.

Depak Borhara, Community Engagement Manager, Pursuit – He said he is with Pursuit as well they have 10-12 month program in coding offer 36 months career support said he left materials with more information.

Mr. Rodriguez, Justice for All Coalition, CUNY School of Law and Astoria native – Stated that Amazon does not care for Queens. The national cost of living shot up 115% increase in Seattle in addition, 41% homelessness in Seattle that is unacceptable. This is a working class city. Even the Union employees will not be able to afford our city. Say No to Amazon!

Aaron Soriano – Stated he came Brooklyn, CB1 working with an architect and trying to build a Timber Bridge which will be parallel to the Pulaski Bridge. Trying to build community support and talking to elected officials.

David, Outreach Specialist from Neighborhood Housing Services (NHS) – Said he has flyers for first time home buyers, free mortgage assistance and in partnership Council for Equal Opportunity with Elmcort to bring jobs for the community and the Airport. They have a new satellite office at Elmcort in East Elmhurst thanks to Senator Peralta and Assemblyman Aubry. Asked the community to visit the site.

Chair, Marie Torniali asked if anyone would like to speak that did not sign up.

Kergie (resident) - Stated that she is born and raised in Queens – Asking CB1 in the fight against Amazon, please do not let it become a Silicone Valley.

Margaret Rodgers - Asked to say No to Amazon and reminding the community that it is not a done deal.

Claudia Cogar, stated she is from the Astoria Houses and is President of the Association for the residents. NYCHA have suffered for decades. Stated that they are in favor of Amazon. Stated that she will be sending a letter.

Lifelong resident of Queens (name inaudible) – Stated she is opposed to the Amazon deal would like to restate that it is not a done deal. Continue to stand strong together, we can win.

Matthew Dane, Public Events Manager of NY Restoration Project – Stated they are actively seeking a new host for a program and stated he is leaving flyers at the table and if you have questions please see him.

Chair, Marie Torniali asked for a Motion to adopt the December 2018 minutes.

Motion by Ed Babor; Seconded by Vanessa Jones-Hall

**In the essence of saving time the Chairperson and District Manager did not give reports.*

Committee Reports:

Andy Aujla, Chair, Consumer Affairs Committee – Stated that there was no Committee meeting this month and announced that there is a spreadsheet in the folders and requested that the few that had stipulations be approved. Announced that the most contentious ones are coming in to the February meeting.

Motion by Ed Babor; Seconded by Nancy Silverman - Unanimous

Nancy Silverman, Chair, Parks/Recreation/Cultural Committee – She discussed the Draft of the Letter for the Halletts Cove Playground design plan in the folders.

Motioned by Rod Townsend; Seconded by Evie Hantzopoulos - Unanimous

Evie Hantzopoulos, Chair, Housing Committee – She discussed a letter that the Committee is working on that will morph into a policy statement. She stated that they will be meeting on February 5th to work on the letter and they will have a guest speaker, Samuel Stein a Professor at Hunter College in Urban Studies, is an Author and will give a presentation on zoning and Mandatory Inclusionary Housing. Welcomes the Board Members.

Rod Townsend, Co-Chair, Community Economic Development Committee – He stated that they met with EDC of New York State to discuss Amazon. They asked questions and made challenges. They got a commitment from them to report back on a frequent basis and will meet with them again, possibly next month.

Chair Marie Torniali asked for a Motion to Adjourn

Motioned by Rod Townsend; Seconded by Yawne Robinson

Meeting Adjourned: 9:30 p.m.

COMMUNITY BOARD 1, Queens

DATE 1/15/19

Full Board Meeting

Community Board Member	Yes	No	Abs.	Community Board Member	Yes	No	Abs.
Rose Anne Alafogiannis	✓			Nancy Konipol	✓		
George Alexiou			E	Jerry Kril	✓		
Daniel Aliberti			E	Melanie La Rocca	✓		
Loren Amor	✓		E	Frances Luhmann-McDonald			E
Avninder Aujla	✓			Hannah Lupien	✓		
Edward Babor	✓			Antonio Meloni	✓		
Jose Batista	✓			Prabir Mitra	✓		
Ann Bruno	✓			Eric Mouchette	✓		
Giselle Aida Burgess		✓		Stella Nicolaou	✓		
Edwin Cadiz	✓		E	Norma Nieves-Blas	✓		E
Gerald Caliendo	✓			Mary O'Hara	✓		
Jean Marie D'Alleva			E	Robert Piazza	✓		
Antonella Di Saverio	✓			RoseMarie Poveromo	✓		
Katerina Duarte	✓			Yawne Robinson	✓		
Katie Ellman	✓			Thomas Ryan	✓		
Elizabeth Erion	✓			Manuel Salce		✓	
Mackenzi Farquer	✓			Rodolfo Sarchese			E
Dean Feratovic			E	Nancy Silverman	✓		
Evie Hantzopoulos	✓			Dominic Stiller	✓	✓	
Amy Hau	✓			Andre Stith	✓		
Helen Ho	✓			Danielle Tharrington			E
Pauline Jannelli	✓			Marie Torniali	✓		
Vanessa Jones-Hall	✓			Rod Townsend	✓		
George Kalergios	✓			Judy Trilivas	✓		
Richard Khuzami	✓			Kathleen Warnock			E
Number Board Members Present <u>36</u>							
Present <u>36</u>				Absent <u>3</u> Excused <u>11</u>			
April 18							