

Sugar Hill Rezoning EIS

CHAPTER 14: UNAVOIDABLE ADVERSE IMPACTS

A. INTRODUCTION

Unavoidable significant adverse impacts occur when a proposed action would: (a) result in significant adverse impacts for which there are no reasonably practicable mitigation measures to eliminate the impact; and (b) for which there are no reasonable alternatives to the Proposed Action that would meet the purpose and need for the action, eliminate the impact, and not cause other or similar significant adverse impacts.

As described in Chapter 12, “Mitigation,” the potential impact to historic architectural resources would not be fully mitigated.

B. HISTORIC (ARCHITECTURAL) RESOURCES

Unavoidable Direct Impact

As described in Chapter 5, “Historic Resources,” the building on the Proposed Development Site is identified as a contributing structure to the Sugar Hill Historic District listed on State and National Registers of Historic Places (S/NRs). Construction of the Proposed Development would necessitate demolition of this structure, which would constitute a significant adverse impact on architectural resources. As described in Chapter 12, “Mitigation,” measures to partially mitigate the impact of the demolition of this historic resource – which include archival photographic documentation and the possible removal of decorative exterior terra cotta elements on the existing building to be incorporated into the design of the Proposed Development or utilized in the interior public spaces of the new building (if feasible) – have been developed in consultation with the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). The HABS documentation was prepared and submitted to OPRHP, which accepted and signed off on it in a letter dated July 8, 2010, and the applicant has also agreed to undertake applicable construction-related mitigation measures, consult with OPRHP regarding the design of the new building, and conduct a survey of the decorative exterior terra cotta elements on the existing building. However, despite the measures described here and further outlined in Chapter 12, this impact would not be completely eliminated. Therefore, it would constitute an unavoidable significant adverse direct impact on this historic resource as a result of the Proposed Action.

Unavoidable Indirect Impact

The Proposed Development also has the potential to result in an unavoidable contextual impact to historic resources. As discussed in Chapter 5, “Historic and Cultural Resources,” the Proposed

Development would result in a significant adverse indirect contextual impact to historic resources, as its modern massing, façade materials, and fenestration would differ from the historic rowhouses and apartment buildings prevalent in the historic district. However, as the Proposed Development would not obstruct important views to the Sugar Hill historic district, which would continue to be visible from all streets throughout the study area, nor would the Proposed Action alter the street grid so that the approach to the historic district changes, it would not result in a significant adverse impact to visual resources. As such, the Proposed Development results in a significant adverse indirect contextual impact to historic resources.

Because the design of the proposed building is still evolving, the applicant will continue to consult with the OPRHP regarding the new building's final design. As part of that process, further measures may be identified to partially mitigate this significant adverse indirect impact, and as a result, some of the building's treatment or design elements, such as its cantilever, fenestration, and façade materials and color, may be modified. However, if design changes that are feasible or practicable given the applicant's goals and objectives are not identified to fully mitigate this impact, it would constitute an unmitigable significant adverse impact on this historic resource as a result of the Proposed Action.