Chapter 7:

Historic Resources

A. INTRODUCTION

This chapter considers the potential of the proposed Fordham University Lincoln Center Master Plan to affect historic resources. Historic resources include both archaeological and architectural resources. Located on the superblock bounded by Columbus and Amsterdam Avenues and West 60th and West 62nd Streets, Fordham University's Lincoln Center campus—the project site—is currently occupied by a number of buildings dating from 1961 through 1993, which house the Liberal Arts College (the College); School of Law; Graduate Schools of Business, Education and Social Service; and a dormitory. The proposed action would remove the current Law School building and erect a number of academic, dormitory, and residential buildings on the project site. Without the proposed action, Fordham would convey portions of the project site to a private developer for the construction of three residential buildings as-of-right under current zoning.

The study area for archaeological resources is the area to be disturbed for project construction, i.e., the project site itself. The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) was contacted for its preliminary determination of the site's archaeological sensitivity. In comments dated July 9, 2007, LPC determined that the project site has no archaeological significance; the <u>New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP) concurred with LPC in a letter dated December 22, 2008</u> (see Appendix B). Therefore, this chapter focuses on architectural resources.

Study areas for architectural resources are determined based on the area of potential effect for construction-period impacts, such as ground-borne vibrations, and on the area of potential effect for visual or contextual effects, which is usually a larger area. The architectural resources study area for this project is defined as being within an approximately 600- to 800-foot radius of the project site because of the size of the proposed development, and to account for the density of the surrounding buildings, which include numerous tall buildings that limit visibility in the area (see Figure 7-1). Within the study area, architectural resources analyzed include State and National Register (S/NR) properties or S/NR-eligible properties, National Historic Landmarks (NHLs), New York City Landmarks (NYCLs) and Historic Districts, and properties determined eligible for landmark status. In addition, other properties in the study area were evaluated for their potential S/NR or NYCL eligibility.

As described below, it is not expected that the proposed action would have significant adverse impacts on any of the architectural resources located in the study area. There are no properties on the project site that are architecturally significant. The proposed action would implement a Construction Protection Plan to protect resources such as the Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts and the Church of St. Paul the Apostle, which are located within 90 feet of proposed construction activities. The proposed action would not block significant views of any resource, significantly alter the visual setting of any resource, or introduce incompatible contextual elements to any resource's setting.



---- Study Area Boundary

Lincoln Center for the Perfoming Arts Historic District Boundary

Amsterdam Houses

Known Architectural Resource

Figure 7-1 Historic Resources

FORDHAM LINCOLN CENTER

(4)

While full development of the proposed Master Plan would result in significant adverse shadow impacts on Damrosch Park and the "Grove" (a new landscape feature that is not a part of the original plan for Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts), these shadow impacts would result from adverse effects to vegetation that is not part of a historic landscape and does not contribute to the visual prominence or context of the architectural resource. Therefore, this would not be considered a significant adverse impact on historic resources.

The proposed action would have an unavoidable significant adverse shadow impact on the stained glass windows of St. Paul the Apostle Church. The proposed potential mitigation measure—artificial lighting of those windows in the summer when sunlight would otherwise reach these north-facing windows—does not seem particularly practical. Therefore, in the absence of mitigation, this would remain an unavoidable adverse impact.

B. PROJECT SITE DEVELOPMENT HISTORY

Fordham University's Lincoln Center campus was developed as part of the Lincoln Square Urban Renewal Project in the mid- to late 1950s. The Lincoln Square Urban Renewal Area covered 53 acres—17 blocks between 60th and 70th Streets between West End Avenue and Broadway—and provided for the establishment of the Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts. At the time, it was the largest such project ever attempted. The redevelopment area consisted of the Lincoln Square and San Juan Hill neighborhoods, which were predominantly developed with tenement housing.

The Lincoln Center campus provided Fordham University with the opportunity to consolidate a number of its Manhattan facilities, including its schools of Law, Business, Social Service, Education, and General Studies, which were located at Broadway near Duane Street and on East 39th Street. Fordham's building program was to be phased in in a number of stages, commencing with the Law School and its library, followed by the graduate schools of Business, Education, and Social Service, and finishing with future growth to include additional classrooms and libraries.

The Law School, erected in 1961 on West 62nd Street, was the first building on the Lincoln Center campus. In 1969, the Leon Lowenstein Center was built along West 60th Street to house the College and its graduate Schools of Business, Education, and Social Service.

In 1984, Fordham University expanded its Law School with an addition that provided the law school with a new cafeteria, an amphitheater, and additional lecture halls and library space. In 1993, Fordham University built a new student dormitory, McMahon Hall, near the southwest corner of its campus on West 60th Street.

C. EXISTING CONDITIONS

PROJECT SITE

The original Law School designed by Voorhees, Walker, Smith, Smith & Haines is an L-shaped, limestone-clad building with ribbon windows (see Figure 7-2). The 1980s addition, designed by Wank Adams Slavin and Associates, faces Columbus Avenue. It consists of a four-story brick wing with a curved façade, joined to the original Law School building by a four-story glass atrium. A penthouse was also added to the existing Law School building. The Law School building is set behind a paved parking lot and a landscaped area on Columbus Avenue.



Fordham University School of Law, West 62nd Street



Fordham University, Leon Lowenstein Center, West 60th Street

Figure 7-2 Project Site The Lowenstein Center, designed by Slingerland & Booss, is a 12-story, steel-framed, precast concrete-clad building set on a one-story podium. The building rises as a slab without setbacks and with numerous narrow window openings giving its north and south façades a grid-like appearance (see Figure 7-2). McMahon Hall is a 20-story, simply articulated brick-clad building on West 60th Street west of the Lowenstein Center.

The three buildings are joined in a campus setting by landscaped areas that include the landscaped plaza on top of the podium and a terrace between the podium and the street level along West 62nd Street. The top of the podium, designed by M. Paul Friedberg, has paved walkways, trees, and grassy areas with sculptures. Along Columbus Avenue, the podium is set back by approximately 85 feet.

None of the buildings on the project site meet the minimum 50-year-old age requirement for listing on the S/NR. Although the Lincoln Square Urban Renewal Project played a pivotal role in the redevelopment of the Upper West Side of Manhattan, the buildings on Fordham University's Lincoln Center campus do not in themselves possess an exceptional significance that would render them eligible for such listing. The Law School and the Lowenstein Center are over 30 years old, and therefore meet the minimum age requirement for NYCL designation. However, the Law School has been significantly altered through the addition of an additional floor and the fourstory addition; the Lowenstein Center does not possess significant architectural or historical qualities that would qualify it for NYCL designation.

Consequently, the project does not contain architectural resources that would qualify for S/NR listing and NYCL designation.

STUDY AREA

KNOWN ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES

Two historic complexes and <u>six</u> individual architectural resources are located in the project study area (see Table 7-1 and Figure 7-1).¹

The Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts Historic District (S/NR-eligible) is located between West 66th and 62nd Streets, Amsterdam Avenue, Broadway, and Columbus Avenue. The Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts was a key element of the Lincoln Square Urban Renewal Project. It was designed by an architectural team, headed by Wallace K. Harrison, that included Alvar Aalto, Pietro Belluschi, Marcel Breuer, Philip Johnson and Sven Markelius. The historic district consists of the following original components of Lincoln Center, which were built between 1959-1969:

- Juilliard School of Music, on the northeast corner of Lincoln Center;
- North Plaza, along West 65th Street;
- Vivian Beaumont Theater and the New York Public Library for the Performing Arts, on the northwest corner of Lincoln Center;

¹ Two potential architectural resources were identified in the DEIS, the Cova Building at 1841-1843 Broadway on the corner of West 60th Street and the Hotel Empire at 44-50 West 53rd Street. In a letter dated December 18, 2008, OPRHP determined the Cova Building to be S/NR-eligible and the Empire Hotel to not be S/NR-eligible. Though LPC subsequently has indicated that the Hotel Empire appears to meet S/NR eligibility criteria, OPRHP's determination of the building's lack of S/NR eligibility serves as the basis for determining that this building does not constitute a historic resource under CEQR and the State Environmental Quality Review Act (see Appendix B).

Arcintectural Resources within the Project Study Area						
Map Ref. No. ¹	Name	Address	NYCL	Pending NYCL	S/NR	S/NR- eligible
Designated and Eligible Architectural Resources						
1	Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts Historic District	Between West 66th and 62nd Streets, Amsterdam Avenue, Broadway and Columbus Avenue				x
2	Amsterdam Houses	Between West 64th and 61st Streets and Amsterdam and West End Avenus				х
3	The Sofia Apartments	33-43 West 61st Street	Х		Х	
4	Church of St. Paul the Apostle complex	8-10 Columbus Avenue 415 West 59th Street		х	х	
5	William J. Syms Operating Theatre	400 West 59th Street	х			<u>X</u> ²
6	West 59th Street Recreation House/West 60th Street Public Bath	533 West 59th Street/232 West 60th Street				х
7	John Jay College of Criminal Justice	899 Tenth Avenue				х
<u>8</u>	Cova Building	<u>1841-1843 Broadway</u>				<u>Х</u> ²
² Deterr NYCL: I Pending S/NR: S	sponds to Figure 7-1. nination of Eligibility made by ORPH New York City Landmark. 9 NYCL: Site has been calendared f Landmarks Preservation Com State and National Registers of Histo Eligible for listing on the S/NR.	or a public hearing or heard for nission.	r designatic	on by the New	York Cit	

Table 7-1 Architectural Resources Within the Project Study Area

- Avery Fisher Hall, on the northeast corner of Lincoln Center;
- Metropolitan Opera House, on the west side of Lincoln Center;
- Josie Robertson Plaza and Revson Fountain, on the east side of Lincoln Center fronting on Columbus Avenue;
- Damrosch Park and Guggenheim Bandshell, on the southwest corner of Lincoln Center along West 62nd Street; and
- David H. Koch New York State Theater <u>(Koch Theater)</u>, on the southeast corner of Lincoln Center.

Within the study area, three performing arts buildings are oriented around a central plaza. Josie Robertson Plaza was envisioned by Lincoln Center's architects as the performing arts center's central plaza, with the Metropolitan Opera House, Avery Fisher Hall, and the Koch Theater fronting on it (see Figure 7-3). The plaza is raised above street level and faces Columbus Avenue. Philip Johnson designed the paving for the plaza, which used travertine and black stone to create a circular, geometrical pattern around the plaza's central element, the Revson Fountain.

The Metropolitan Opera House, designed by Wallace K. Harrison, faces east toward Columbus Avenue and is the focal building of the performing arts complex. On its front façade five



View west from Columbus Avenue of Josie Robertson Plaza bounded by the New York State Theater (left), the Metropolitan Opera House (center) and Avery Fisher Hall (right)



View west on 62nd Street of the New York State Theater 1b

Figure 7-3 Known Architectural Resources in the Study Area Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts concrete-shelled arches are positioned in front of the glass wall of the lobby. Thin vertical spines of travertine form a screen in front of the hall's glass walls on the north and south façades.

Facing south is Avery Fisher Hall (originally Philharmonic Hall), which is set back from Columbus Avenue by approximately 50 feet. Designed by Max Abramovitz, its principal façade is clad in travertine and a steel and glass curtain wall; a portico supported by travertine-clad columns extends along the full height of the façade.

The Koch Theater is across the plaza from Avery Fisher Hall on the northwest corner of Columbus Avenue and West 62nd Street. It was designed by Philip Johnson and is a neoclassical style building clad in travertine; only the north façade of the building that fronts onto Josie Robertson Plaza is glazed. The south, west, and east façades are windowless and present primarily blank façades to West 62nd Street (and the project site), Damrosch Park, and Columbus Avenue (see Figure 7-3). It is also set back approximately 50 feet from Columbus Avenue. <u>As</u> described below in "The Future Without the Proposed Action—2014," the area between the Koch <u>Theater and Columbus Avenue is currently being reconstructed to depress the roadway below</u> grade so that Josie Robertson Plaza can be extended out toward Columbus Avenue. It is surrounded by construction fences. Landscaping and seating are expected to be provided near West 62nd Street as part of this major renovation effort.

Just west of the Koch Theater on West 62nd Street is Damrosch Park, which is anchored by the Guggenheim Bandshell. <u>Intended</u> to host outdoor performances, it was designed by New York City Parks Department architects—Darling, Innocenti, and Ebel—in collaboration with Dan Kiley. The park features a paved area with a number of planters (see Figures 5-3 and 5-4 in Chapter 5, "Open Space"). The Guggenheim Bandshell, an onion-domed structure designed by Eggers & Higgins, is located along Amsterdam Avenue. The bandshell faces east and is located above a below-grade parking garage with access on West 62nd Street (see Figure 7-4). <u>As</u> described in Chapters 5 and 6, "Open Space" and "Shadows," respectively, Damrosch is occupied by a large tent for much of the year (see Figure 5-5 in Chapter 5, "Open Space"). Not a part of the original plan for the performing arts complex and not a permanent structure, the tent houses the Big Apple Circus from October to January. From March though the end of May and in September to early October, private events are held in tents on the plaza in Damrosch Park. Beginning in September 2010, these events will include Fashion Week.

The North Plaza is directly West of Avery Fisher Hall and was designed by Dan Kiley in consultation with Eero Saarinen and Gordon Bunshaft, who also collaborated in the design of the Vivian Beaumont Theater and the New York Public Library for the Performing Arts. The principal element of the plaza is a reflecting pool that contains a Henry Moore sculpture, "Reclining Figure." Lining the plaza is a building with a primary curtain wall glass façade that houses the Vivian Beaumont Theater and the New York Public Library for the Performing Arts.

The **Amsterdam Houses** (S/NR-eligible) occupy the superblock between Amsterdam Avenue, West 64th Street, West 61st Street, and West End Avenue. The New York City Housing Authority began planning for this residential complex in 1941. Completed in 1948, the Amsterdam Houses consist of 10 six-story "T" and "H" plan buildings and three 13-story cruciform brick towers. Designed by architects Grosvenor Atterbury, Arthur C. Holden, and Harvey Wiley Corbett along with landscape architects Gilmore D. Clarke and Michael Rapuano, the simply detailed brick buildings are set in an open, classically inspired plan (see No. 2 of Figure 7-5). The complex reflects the post-World War II era need to create affordable housing for low-income families and returning veterans. The complex has been somewhat altered through the widening of paths and the replacement of original windows.



Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts, view northeast on West 62nd Street of the Guggenheim Band Shell and Damrosch Park



View west of the Amsterdam Houses from approximately West 62nd Street 2



Sofia Apartments/aka Sofia Warehouse 33-43 West 61st Street

Across Columbus Avenue, the former **Kent Automatic Parking Garage**, now known as the Sofia Apartments (NYCL, S/NR) at 33-43 West 61st Street is a 26-story Art Deco Building. Designed by Irwin S. Chanin in 1931, it is clad in orange brick with polychrome terra cotta ornament located principally at the building's entrances and setbacks (see No. 3 of Figure 7-5). The building pioneered a new automated parking system whereby cars were mechanically pulled from the elevator into an allocated parking space. The system ultimately proved unsuccessful and the building was converted to a conventional parking garage and later a storage facility. In 1984, it was converted into luxury condominiums (the Sofia Apartments).

The Church of St. Paul the Apostle complex (S/NR, pending-NYCL), consisting of the church and its rectory, is located on the block south of the project site. The church, which occupies the southwest corner of Columbus Avenue and West 60th Street, was designed in the Gothic Revival style by Jeremiah O'Rourke and built between 1876 and 1885. It consists of a basilica form and is clad in grey and pink granite, with limestone used to trim the windows. The primary east (Columbus Avenue) facade contains the front wall of the nave, which is flanked by two towers (see No. 4a of Figure 7-6). The main entrance is reached by two sets of stairs and consists of a Gothic style portal. Above this is a modern bas-relief of the conversion of St. Paul, created for the 100th anniversary of the founding of the Paulist Fathers in 1958, and executed by sculptor Luman Martin Winter. The towers, which are identical, are capped with belfry-like structures with paired, Gothic-arched openings. The north and south facades contain pointed, arched window openings at the aisle and clerestory elevations; the arches at the aisle level are filled with brick (recoated over the years to appear like granite) as is the westernmost clerestory arch on both the north and south sides of the nave (see No. 4b of Figure 7-6). The lower-level blind arches are separated by stone piers. At the clerestory level, the stained-glass windows are covered with protective panels. The interior of the church is large and sumptuously decorated. It is well lit by both natural light through the clerestory windows and modern skylights over the side aisles as well as artificial light (see Nos. 4c and 4d of Figure 7-7).

The rectory, which was built in the mid-20th century, faces south onto West 59th Street. A sixstory brick-clad building, it is designed in the Tudor Gothic style, with pointed arch openings, crenellation, and with cast stone ornament including window and door surrounds, string courses, window tracery and copings (see <u>No. 4e of Figure 7-8</u>). The rectory has a modified "E" -shaped plan, with matching projecting pavilions flanking a courtyard and recessed central entrance porch that contains the building's main entrance. The entrance porch consists of a Gothic-arched portal with an elaborate surround, including a statue niche above the entrance. Above this is a round stained-glass window with stone tracery.

At the southwest corner of Columbus Avenue and West 59th Street, the **William J. Syms Operating Theatre** (NYCL, <u>S/NR-eligible</u>) is the only remaining building dating from Roosevelt Hospital's late 19th century development. It was designed by W. Wheeler Smith, who worked with surgeon Charles McBurney to create the most advanced operating facilities for the hospital. <u>Built in 1890-92, it was one of the first operating theaters equipped for aseptic surgery.</u> It is a small building designed in the Romanesque Revival style and clad in red brick (see No. 5 of Figure 7-<u>8</u>). It is set back from the surrounding streets by gardens. A central pavilion of two and one half stories, capped by a semi-conical roof, is flanked by one-story wings. A large, round-arched opening—the building type of its period, and it is also significant in the area of health and medicine as the site of numerous advances in modern surgical practice.



Church of St. Paul the Apostle, 8-10 Columbus Avenue 4a



Church of St. Paul the Apostle - north facade clerestory windows and apse 4b

Figure 7-6 Known Architectural Resources in the Study Area Church of St. Paul the Apostle Complex



Church of St. Paul the Apostle interior - view of north clerestory windows over side aisle 4c



Church of St. Paul the Apostle interior - view of south clerestory windows over side aisles and entrance 4d

Figure 7-7 Known Architectural Resources in the Study Area Church of St. Paul the Apostle Complex



Church of St. Paul the Apostle rectory, 415 West 59th Street



William J. Syms Operating Theatre, 400 West 59th Street 5

Figure 7-8 Known Architectural Resources in the Study Area

West of the project site, the West 59th Street Recreation House/West 60th Street Public Bath (S/NR-eligible) at 533 West 59th Street and 232 West 60th Street is a throughblock structure that was constructed in two phases (see Nos. 6a and No. 6b of Figure 7-9). Designed by Werner & Windolf, the bath was constructed in 1906 by the City of New York. Public bathing facilities were originally built for hygienic reasons, because indoor plumbing was still a rarity in most working-class tenement areas. At the turn of the century, when the city had to abandon its floating baths on the East and Hudson Rivers due to water pollution, an effort was made to provide public indoor bathing and recreational facilities. The early bath houses usually contained shower and bath facilities and were often built by charitable organizations in the densest slums of the city. While the earlier bathhouses were conceived for hygiene, later facilities were built to serve recreational needs as well. Later expansions of the facility created an extension to West 59th Street and an outdoor pool to the east. The West 59th Street Recreation House is a narrow two-story Tudor Revival-style building that connects to the bath structure. The West 60th Street Public Bath is a two-story Beaux-Arts style brick building with large, round-arched windows at the second story and a stone pedimented surround supported on Doric columns at the building's West 60th Street entrance.

On Tenth Avenue, the **John Jay College of Criminal Justice** occupies the west blockfront between West 59th and 58th Streets, southwest of the project site (S/NR-eligible). Constructed between 1904 and 1906 as the DeWitt Clinton High School for boys, the college building is a five-and-a-half story brick-and-limestone structure in the Dutch Colonial style (see No. 7 of Figure 7-<u>10</u>). The H-plan of the school consists of two wings with stepped gables flanking a central courtyard. The building was designed by Charles B.J. Snyder, who served as Superintendent of School Buildings between 1891 and 1923. Snyder was a specialist in school design, who developed innovative solutions to school construction and health and safety issues, including the introduction of steel framing to allow for cheaper and faster construction and the "H-plan" which allowed greater light and air. During the 1980s, significant changes, including replacement of the windows and substantial additions—including a glass atrium in the courtyard, a penthouse, and a seven-story addition to the west, were made to the building during an expansion project.

The **Cova Building** (S/NR-eligible) occupies the northwest corner of West 60th Street and Broadway <u>a block east of the campus</u>. This 12-story office building was built in stages between 1922 and 1924 by Alexander Cohen, who founded the Columbus Circle pharmacy. This pharmacy eventually moved into the ground floor of the building in 1939 (though now the ground floor is occupied by a Starbucks coffee shop). The building has a chamfered corner and is set on a three-story base (see No. 8 of Figure 7-10). Intricate terra cotta ornament adorns the base, including double-height Corinthian pilasters, shields, and rosettes, and a dentillated cornice. The shaft is articulated by thin, vertical, brick piers. Between these are paired replacement aluminum windows; metal panels with Art Deco-inspired ornament divide the windows. The building is capped by a cornice that is formed by the vertical brick piers and copper panels. It is significant as an intact example of early 20th century commercial design.

D. THE FUTURE WITHOUT THE PROPOSED ACTION-2014

PROJECT SITE

In the future without the proposed action, it is anticipated that the existing three buildings on the project site will remain and that three new residential buildings will be developed. New as-of-



West 60th Street Public Bath, 232 West 60th Street 6a



View northeast of the West 59th Street Recreation House facade, 539 West 59th Street

Figure 7-9 Known Architectural Resources in the Study Area

2.23.09



John Jay College of Criminal Justice, 899 Tenth Avenue, formerly DeWitt Clinton High School



Cova Building, 1841-1843 Broadway 8

right development will consist of an approximately 395-foot-tall building west of the law school in the area of the landscaped terrace on West 62nd Street; an approximately 45- to 265-foot-tall building at the northwest corner of the campus (southeast corner of Amsterdam Avenue and West 62nd Street) adjacent to the 36-story condominium, The Alfred; and an approximately 45- to 285-foot-tall building at the southwest corner of the campus (southeast corner of Amsterdam Avenue and Avenue and West 61st Street).

The project site is located close enough (within 90 feet of projected construction activities) to Lincoln Center to potentially cause inadvertent construction-related damages. Specifically, the sites of the two projected as-of-right buildings on West 62nd Street, are located approximately 80 feet from portions of Damrosch Park and the New York State Theater.

The new development will add to the area's mix of historic and modern and short and tall structures (see Chapter 8, "Urban Design and Visual Resources"). Views to and from Lincoln Center will be altered by two as-of-right buildings on West 62nd Street. It is expected that views south to the project site from Damrosch Park, which take in Fordham's landscaped terrace on West 62nd Street, will be replaced by a view of the new approximately 395-foot-tall as-of-right building next to the Law School. Also visible will be the new approximately 265-foot-tall as-of-right building north of The Alfred. Conversely, views from Fordham's landscaped terrace on West 62nd Street to Lincoln Center, including the Guggenheim Bandshell, Damrosch Park, the south (side façade) of the Metropolitan Opera House and the south (rear) façade of the Koch Theater, will be eliminated.

Views north to Lincoln Center from Amsterdam Avenue's east sidewalk will be somewhat altered by the No Build Scenario. Views of the south side of the Metropolitan Opera House, consisting of a portion of its glazed wall and stone screen, as well as the side of the Guggenheim Bandshell are presently visible from West 60th Street due to the setback of The Alfred Condominium from Amsterdam Avenue. It is expected that development of the approximately 265- and 285-foot-tall as-of-right residential buildings will obstruct these views.

It is not expected that the as-of-right development will affect views to the Amsterdam Houses. This residential complex is located across a 100-foot-wide avenue, and presently exists in a mixed context of smaller, older structures and very tall, newly erected condominiums.

STUDY AREA

<u>S/NR-eligible properties could be listed and the Church of St. Paul the Apostle complex could be designated a New York City Landmark.</u>

Historic resources that are listed on the State and National Registers or that have been found eligible for listing are given a measure of protection from the effects of federally sponsored or federally assisted projects under Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. Although preservation is not mandated, federal agencies must attempt to avoid adverse impacts on such resources through a notice, review, and consultation process. Properties listed on the Registers are similarly protected against impacts resulting from state-sponsored or state-assisted projects under the State Historic Preservation Act. Private owners of properties eligible for, or even listed on, the Registers using private funds, can, however, alter or demolish their properties without such a review process. Privately owned properties that are NYCLs, in New York City Historic Districts, or pending designation as Landmarks are protected under the New York City Landmarks Law, which requires LPC review and approval before any alteration or demolition permit can be issued. Publicly owned resources are also subject to review by LPC prior to the start of a project; however, LPC's role with other city agencies is advisory only.

As described in Chapter 2, "Land Use, Zoning, and Public Policy" there are a number of projects that will be completed in the surrounding area by the 2014 Build year. Three of these would directly affect historic resources.

Lincoln Center, immediately north of the project site, is undergoing a major redevelopment. This project will result in the reconstruction of West 65th Street between Broadway and Amsterdam Avenue, an expansion of the Julliard School, and renovation of Alice Tully Hall. These alterations have been approved by OPRHP and, therefore, it is not expected that the historic character of Lincoln Center will be adversely impacted. <u>The portion of the redevelopment of Lincoln Center taking place closest to the Fordham campus is the reconstruction of the area between the Koch Theater and Columbus Avenue. The roadway that continues past Avery Fisher Hall will be depressed below grade to allow Josie Robertson Plaza to be extended east toward Columbus Avenue and to provide pedestrian access from the Columbus Avenue sidewalk to Lincoln Center unimpeded by vehicular traffic. As part of this redesign, a landscaped seating area, known as the Grove will be created east of the Koch Theater near West 62nd Street.</u>

John Jay College of Criminal Justice plans to expand and to occupy the full block bounded by Tenth and Eleventh Avenues, and West 59th and 58th Streets. The new addition will be built on the west end of the block, adjacent to the 1980s addition to the original 1904-1906 building. The planned expansion will likely have little visual effect on the original building, since that historic structure fronts onto Tenth Avenue and the new development will be built along Eleventh Avenue adjoining the recently built addition. OPRHP has reviewed this proposed action and has issued a determination of no adverse effect.

There are no other <u>known</u> developments planned in the architectural resources study area by 2014 that will directly affect or be built adjacent to architectural resources.

E. PROBABLE IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION-2014

PROJECT SITE

Similar to future plans without the proposed action, development would focus along West 62nd Street and Amsterdam Avenue. West 62nd Street would be developed with an approximately 155- to 319-foot-tall (maximum height) academic and dormitory building, which would include the new Law School (see Figure 1-2 of Chapter 1, "Project Description"). On Amsterdam Avenue, there would be an approximately 10- to 22-story (maximum height of 319 feet tall) dormitory and academic building south of West 61st Street and two private residential buildings of approximately 573 and 661 feet in height (maximum height) (at the campus's southwest and northwest corners, respectively). Alternatively, the southwest corner of the site could be developed as a single approximately 600-foot-tall building (maximum height) with residential uses above academic/dormitory uses (see Figure 1-3).

Since there are no architectural resources located on the project site, there would be no impacts to architectural resources.

STUDY AREA

As described under the No Build Scenario, the project site is located within 80 feet of Lincoln Center. To avoid adverse construction-related impacts on Lincoln Center from the proposed construction of a residential building and two academic/dormitory buildings along West 62nd Street, Fordham University, in coordination with licensed professional engineers, would develop and implement a Construction Protection Plan. This plan would be developed in consultation with LPC <u>and OPRHP</u> and implemented to avoid damage to the historic Lincoln Center structures from project demolition and construction. It is not expected that the proposed action could have adverse physical effects on any of the other known architectural resources in the study area, as they are all located beyond 90 feet of the project site.

Development of the first phase of the campus plan on West 62nd Street would occur in roughly the same area on the project site as would the two as-of-right buildings that could be built under the No Build Scenario. As such, the Master Plan development would not have any additional impacts beyond those described above for the No Build Scenario, namely that these new buildings would be visible from Damrosch Park and that the development would remove locations on the project site where Lincoln Center is currently visible. However, these effects would not be expected to adversely affect the context of Lincoln Center for a number of reasons. First, Lincoln Center exists in a built context that includes tall buildings, and the new development would be in keeping with existing building heights. Second, Lincoln Center and the Fordham University campus are separated by a wide street that carries two-way traffic. There is also no significant visual relationship between the north side of the street and south side of the street. Third, Lincoln Center is primarily oriented toward Columbus Avenue, with the West 62nd Street streetscape composed of the secondary façades of its structures, including the rear façade of the Koch Theater, south side façade of the Metropolitan Opera House, side façade of the Guggenheim Bandshell, and entrances to the subterranean parking garage under the site. Last, the principal public views to Lincoln Center from 62nd Street and Columbus Avenue would remain unchanged. Views north on Amsterdam Avenue would be expected to be obstructed by the new development on the project site in the same manner as described above under the No Build Scenario.

The proposed buildings located along West 62nd Street would also create new shadows on Damrosch Park in the Lincoln Center campus. <u>However, as noted in Chapter 6, "Shadows,"the extent of shadow would generally be small and the viability of vegetation would not be substantially affected. Just as this incremental shadow would not be considered a significant adverse shadow impact, it would also would not be a significant adverse historic resources impact.</u>

The proposed first phase of development would also result in new buildings on Amsterdam Avenue. The proposed residential building at the northwest corner of the campus would be in the same location as the approximately 265-foot-tall residential building that could be built under the No Build Scenario, and the academic building and residential building that would be built in Phase I on the southwest corner of the campus would be in the same location as the approximately 285-foot-tall as-of-right residential building. While the proposed Phase I residential buildings on Amsterdam Avenue would be taller than those that are expected to be built in the No Build Scenario, they would not obstruct views or otherwise adversely affect the context of the Amsterdam Houses. As described above, these buildings are set within and oriented to a classically derived plan. Construction across Amsterdam Avenue on the Fordham

campus would not affect this plan. This residential complex already exists in a mixed context of short and tall buildings, including The Alfred, which is adjacent to the project site.

Since development by the 2014 analysis year would be focused on West 62nd Street and Amsterdam Avenue, it would not alter the setting of, or views to, the Sofia Apartments and the <u>Cova Building</u> east of Columbus Avenue and the Church of St. Paul the Apostle complex and William J. Syms Operating Theatre south of 60th Street along Columbus Avenue. It would also not affect the setting of, or views to, the West 59th Street Recreation House/West 60th Street Public Bath, located west of Amsterdam Avenue and John Jay College of Criminal Justice on Amsterdam Avenue at West 59th Street. The West 59th Street Recreation House is located approximately 400 feet west of Amsterdam Avenue and already exists in a context of tall residential buildings, including the two 33- and 35-story buildings located east of it. John Jay College of Criminal Justice is located three blocks away and is also located in a context that includes tall buildings.

F. THE FUTURE WITHOUT THE PROPOSED ACTION—2032

No further as-of-right development is anticipated on the project site between 2015 and 2032, and conditions are expected to continue as described above for the future without the proposed action in 2014.

There are no projects expected for completion between 2015 and 2032 in the historic resources study area. Therefore, it is not anticipated that there will be any additional changes to historic resources in the absence of the proposed action other than those described for the 2014 analysis year.

G. PROBABLE IMPACTS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION-2032

PROJECT SITE

Full build-out of the Master Plan would entail the demolition of the existing Law School building and result in a total of nine new buildings on the project site (see Figures 1-4 and 1-5 of Chapter 1). In addition to the Phase I development, four new buildings would be built: two structures on Columbus Avenue, of 382 feet in height and of 470 feet in height (maximum heights) that would provide classroom space on the lower floors with dormitory space above, an approximately 342-foot-tall (maximum height) academic and dormitory building on West 62nd Street in roughly the location of the Law School building, and an expansion of the Quinn Library in a new 161.5-foot-tall (maximum height) building at the center of the superblock.

Since there are no architectural resources located on the project site, there would be no impacts to architectural resources.

STUDY AREA

Development of the academic and dormitory building on West 62nd Street would occur within 80 feet of Lincoln Center. As described above, Lincoln Center would be included in a Construction Protection Plan and the demolition of the Law School and construction of the academic/dormitory building would follow the procedures set forth in that plan. In addition, the Church of St. Paul the Apostle would be added to the list of buildings which require protective measures as specified in the Construction Protection Plan. This historic building is located across West 60th Street, an 80-foot-wide street, from the site of the proposed dormitory and

academic building at the southeast corner of the project site. As such, it is located within the area of potential construction-related impacts. The full build-out of the Master Plan would not result in any adverse physical impacts to any other architectural resources in the study area.

Completion of the Master Plan would create a cluster of tall buildings on the project site that would join the large number of high-rise buildings in the study area. The approximately 9- to 55-story (161.5- to 661-foot-tall) buildings would be in keeping with the existing built context of the study area. This includes buildings with small and large footprints and of heights that typically range from 13 to 49 stories. In addition, several of the architectural resources, including Lincoln Center, the Amsterdam Houses, and the Sofia Apartments are themselves bulky and/or tall buildings. The <u>six</u> individual resources, Lincoln Center, and the Amsterdam Houses are either located adjacent to or across the street from tall residential or office buildings in the area.

It is also not expected that the proposed action would significantly impair views to architectural resources in the study area, though development would somewhat reduce views to the Church of St. Paul the Apostle and Lincoln Center on Columbus Avenue. The proposed dormitory and classroom building at the southeast corner of the project site would reduce views to the north (West 62nd Street) façade of the church. The Columbus Avenue façade of this building would be set back from the street line, allowing for views to the church across West 60th Street (see Figure 1-5 of "Project Description"). Both Columbus Avenue dormitory and classroom buildings would block views of the church's north (West 60th Street) facade in views south from West 65th Street; the setback of the Lincoln Center buildings and those of the existing structures on the project site allow for views of the eastern portion of the church's side façade. However, the loss of these views would be principally from Columbus Avenue's west sidewalk. Views at an angle from the east sidewalk would still take in a portion of the north façade. As described above, the north facade consists of the pointed arch window openings at the aisle and clerestory levels of the church; the lower openings are bricked and the upper openings enclosed with protective panels. Public views of the main Columbus Avenue façade would remain unchanged, as would views of the church on West 60th Street and in views north on Columbus Avenue. Therefore, the reduction of the visibility of the Church of St. Paul the Apostle's secondary, north façade in views south from Columbus Avenue would not be expected to result in significant adverse contextual impacts on this resource.

Due to the setback of the existing buildings on the project site from Columbus Avenue, views north on Columbus Avenue's west sidewalk from West 60th Street include a portion of the south (rear) façade of the Koch Theater. However, as described above, this façade is primarily a blank, stone surface. Views from other locations in the study area, including views north from Columbus Avenue's east sidewalk, would continue to provide views of this façade. Therefore, development on the project site is not expected to result in significant adverse contextual impacts to the Koch Theater.

The full build out would not adversely affect the setting of the other historic resources. The Sofia Apartments are located across Columbus Avenue, a wide street, with the remainder of the historic resources located at least one block away from the project site with intervening tall buildings. Due to their distance from the project site, the new development would not block views to these resources or otherwise affect their visual or historic context.

While full development of the proposed Master Plan would result in significant adverse shadow impacts on Damrosch Park and the "Grove" (a new landscape feature that is not a part of the original plan for Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts), these shadow impacts would largely result from adverse effects to vegetation that is not part of a historic landscape and does not

contribute to the visual prominence or context of the architectural resource. Therefore, this would not be considered a significant adverse impact on historic resources. A more detailed description of conditions with the proposed action can be found in Chapter 6, "Shadows" and potential mitigation measures to address shadow impacts are discussed in Chapter 21,"Mitigation."

The proposed action would have an unavoidable significant adverse shadow impact on the stained glass windows of St. Paul the Apostle Church. See Chapter 21, "Mitigation," and Chapter 23, "Unavoidable Adverse Impacts," for additional discussion of this impact.

Overall, it is not expected that the full build-out of the Master Plan would result in any significant adverse contextual impacts to known architectural resources in the study area.