
Appendix A: Historic and Cultural Resources

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Project number: DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING / 77DCP445M
Project: 341-347 MADISON AVENUE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS
Date Received: 7/2/2020

AMENDED 7/17/20

Properties with no Architectural or Archaeological significance:

- 1) 343 MADISON AVENUE, BBL: 1012790023
- 2) 341 MADISON AVENUE, BBL: 1012790024
- 3) 47 EAST 44 STREET, BBL: 1012790025
- 4) 347 MADISON AVENUE, BBL: 1012790048

Comments:

The LPC is in receipt of the DSOW and EAS dated June 25, 2020. The text appears acceptable for architectural resources.

Pertaining to the archaeological tasks, the text now states that the Vanderbilt Corridor will be considered. This should be revised to note that the entire APE will be considered.

LPC DESIGNATED in the radius: GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL, 71-105 EAST 42 STREET; FRED FRENCH BUILDING, 551 FIFTH AVENUE; NEW YORK CENTRAL BUILDING, 230 PARK AVENUE; AND YALE CLUB, 50 VANDERBILT AVENUE.

LPC ELIGIBLE in the radius: HOTEL ROOSEVELT, 45 EAST 45 STREET; 6 EAST 45 STREET; METLIFE (FORMERLY PAN AM) BUILDING, 200 PARK AVENUE; 250 PARK AVENUE, "POSTUM BUILDING", 521 FIFTH AVE, LEFCOURT BUILDING WITHIN RADIUS.

S/NR LISTED in the radius: FRED FRENCH BUILDING, 551 FIFTH AVENUE AND GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL, 75-105 EAST 42 STREET.

S/NR ELIGIBLE in the radius: NEW YORK CENTRAL BUILDING, 230 PARK AVENUE; 45 STREET BRIDGES (PART OF PARK AVENUE VIADUCT); 250 PARK AVENUE, "POSTUM BUILDING"; ROOSEVELT HOTEL, 45 EAST 45 STREET; YALE CLUB, 50 VANDERBILT; 52 VANDERBILT AVENUE, AND VANDERBILT CONCOURSE BUILDING, 52 VANDERBILT AVENUE, 346 MADISON AVENUE, FORMER PAN AM BUILDING (NOW METLIFE BUILDING), 200 PARK AVENUE WITHIN RADIUS.

S/NR NOT DETERMINED properties in radius: 366 MADISON AVENUE WITHIN RADIUS.



7/17/2020

SIGNATURE
Gina Santucci, Environmental Review Coordinator

DATE

File Name: 35038_FSO_GS_07172020.docx



**Parks, Recreation,
and Historic Preservation**

ANDREW M. CUOMO
Governor

ERIK KULLESEID
Commissioner

December 23, 2020

Sara McIvor
MTA C&D
2 Broadway, B6.12
New York, NY 10004

Re: MTA
Demolition of 341-347 Madison Avenue
341 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10017
20PR06875

Dear Sara McIvor:

Thank you for requesting the comments of the Division for Historic Preservation of the Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). We have reviewed the submitted materials in accordance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law). These comments are those of the Division for Historic Preservation and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources. They do not include potential environmental impacts to New York State Parkland that may be involved in or near your project. Such impacts must be considered as part of the environmental review of the project pursuant to the State Environmental Quality Review Act (New York Environmental Conservation Law Article 8) and its implementing regulations (6NYCRR Part 617).

We note that 347, 343-345 and 341 Madison Avenue are not eligible for listing in the State or National Registers of Historic Places. We further note that nearby the Yale Club at 50 Vanderbilt Ave and the Vanderbilt Concourse Building at 52 Vanderbilt Ave are eligible for listing in the State and National Registers of Historic Places.

Since the three buildings proposed for demolition are non-historic buildings, we have no further comment regarding their proposed removal. We note that the two historic buildings along Vanderbilt Ave are directly adjacent to the buildings proposed for demolition. As such, it is the OPRHP's opinion the proposed project will have No Adverse Impact upon historic resources provided the following conditions are met:

1. A construction protection plan is put in place for all historic buildings within 90 feet of the proposed work. At a minimum this includes the Yale Club and the Vanderbilt Concourse Building noted above.
2. The Local Landmarks Preservation Commission shall review and approve the proposed new construction for replacement of the removed buildings. We provide this condition to ensure that the new construction will not negatively impact the Yale Club, the Vanderbilt Concourse Building and other nearby historic buildings such as Grand Central Terminal.

If you have any questions, I am best reached via e-mail.

Sincerely,

Beth Cumming
Senior Historic Site Restoration Coordinator
e-mail: beth.cumming@parks.ny.gov

via e-mail only

Division for Historic Preservation

P.O. Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189 • (518) 237-8643 • parks.ny.gov

Doon, Nancy

Subject: Fwd: 341-347 Madison Avenue

From: Cumming, Beth (PARKS) <Beth.Cumming@parks.ny.gov>
Sent: Thursday, December 31, 2020 1:36 PM
To: Mclvor, Sara
Subject: RE: 341-347 Madison Avenue

Hi Sara,

Philip Perazio reviewed the potential for archeo concerns and has no archeology concerns with this project. The provided CPP looks okay.

Happy New Year!

Beth

From: Mclvor, Sara <Sara.Mclvor@nyct.com>
Sent: Wednesday, December 30, 2020 10:25 PM
To: Cumming, Beth (PARKS) <Beth.Cumming@parks.ny.gov>
Subject: 341-347 Madison Avenue

Hi Beth,

Happy holidays. Thanks again for the quick turnaround with the Madison Avenue project. I had a few questions from me and the project team that I wanted to review with you.

1. The letter called for a Construction Protection Procedure to be created for the demolition of the 3 buildings to protect the adjacent historic resources. When we originally submitted the project for review, we included a written CPP. Did you see this and if so, was it lacking any information that we should provide to get it to a point that it's satisfactory?
2. We didn't see anything about archaeological concerns (or lack thereof) for the demolition process. Do we need to have it explicitly stated in a response letter or is it assumed that there's no issue with that if it's not called out in the response? Our project team was inquiring about it, so I thought I would check to be sure.

Thanks again and happy new year!

Sara

Sara J. McIvor, Historic Preservationist

MTA Construction & Development

Delivery Services Office: Environmental Services

2 Broadway, B6.12

New York, NY 10004

T 646.252.4081

F 646.252.4612

sara.mcivor@nyct.com



Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation

ANDREW M. CUOMO
Governor

ERIK KULLESEID
Commissioner

February 12, 2021

Faline Schneiderman
Historical Perspectives, Inc.
Westport, CT 06881

Re: MTA
Demolition of 341-347 Madison Avenue
341 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10017
20PR06875

Dear Faline Schneiderman:

Thank you for continuing to consult with the Division for Historic Preservation of the Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). We have reviewed the submitted materials in accordance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law) and our No Adverse Impact with conditions letter dated 12/23/2020. These comments are those of the Division for Historic Preservation and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources.

We have reviewed the provided Project Description and Historic Resources Chapter of the 343 Madison Avenue Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS). We are reviewing these chapters for potential impacts to the nearby historic resources. Based upon this review, we offer the following comments:

1. The provided documentation indicates a proposed additional scope of work that has not yet been reviewed by our office. Namely, 'off-site improvements that would improve passenger circulation at Grand Central...' Please provide plans/specifications/scope of work for this proposed additional scope. Grand Central Terminal is a National Historic Landmark and careful review of any work in or around the Terminal is required by our office.
2. Figure 1-3 of the Project Description indicates two unexpected conditions - the proposed new construction could be a supertall building and would cantilever over the existing Vent Shaft building on 44th Street. We offer a few comments specific to these unexpected conditions:
 - a. It is not appropriate to cantilever over the existing Vent Shaft building. Our office had carefully reviewed the façade design of this vent building for its compatibility with the next-door historic Yale Club building. Filling in this space above, is not appropriate. During our initial review, it was our understanding the project was located at the three noted addresses – 341-347 Madison Ave. This is a change in scope that could result in an Adverse finding for the Yale Club building. This condition is also proposed in Figure 1-6.
 - b. A supertall building could result in unexpected impacts to historic sun sensitive resources. Please provide a copy of the shadows chapter for our review.
3. Figure 1-5 of the Project Description indicates proposed Flushing Line Improvements at Lexington Ave and 42nd Street. We note this proposed work is nearby to the Chrysler and Chanin buildings; both of which are historic and listed in the State and National Registers of Historic. Please provide plans/specification/scope of work for this proposed additional scope.

4. In the Historic Resources Chapter, we note that the former Pan Am Building (now the MetLife building) is eligible for listing in the State and National Registers of Historic Places. Additional historic buildings may need to be added to this list once the shadows chapter has been reviewed.

Given the new Scope of Work items described in the DEIS, after receipt of the additional information requested, our office may revise our finding letter.

Documentation requested in this letter should be provided via our Cultural Resource Information System (CRIS) at <https://cris.parks.ny.gov/> Once on the CRIS site, you can log in as a guest and choose "submit" at the very top menu. Go to "Other Options" and choose "submit new information for an existing project". You will need this project number and your e-mail address.

If you have any questions, I am best reached via e-mail.

Sincerely,



Beth Cumming
Senior Historic Site Restoration Coordinator
e-mail: beth.cumming@parks.ny.gov

via e-mail only

cc: Sara McIvor – MTA, G. Santucci - LPC



**Parks, Recreation,
and Historic Preservation**

ANDREW M. CUOMO
Governor

ERIK KULLESEID
Commissioner

April 19, 2021

Sara Mclvor
Historic Preservationist
MTA C&D
2 Broadway, B6.12
New York, NY 10004

Re: MTA
Demolition of 341-347 Madison Avenue
341 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10017
20PR06875

Dear Sara Mclvor:

Thank you for continuing to consult with the Division for Historic Preservation of the Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). We have reviewed the submitted materials in accordance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law) and our No Adverse Impact with conditions letter dated 12/23/2020. These comments are those of the Division for Historic Preservation and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources.

We have reviewed the recently submitted additional information addressing the concerns outlined in our February 12, 2021 letter. Based upon that review, we offer the following:

1. We understand the proposed transit improvements will not impact historic resources. As such, we have no further concerns with these improvements. This addresses #1 and #3 of our February 12th letter.
2. In 2a of our February 12th letter we noted it is not appropriate to cantilever over the existing Vent Shaft building. We continue to have concerns with this proposed treatment and would like to continue discussions of a potential screen or other treatments to visually fill this void.
3. In 2b of our February 12th letter we expressed concerns with potential shadow impacts. We understand that NYC LPC has no further shadow concerns from their Environmental Review notes dated 10/22/2020. We accept their finding.

As a result of this review, our determination of December 23, 2020 remains unchanged. If you have any questions, I am best reached via e-mail.

Sincerely,

Beth Cumming
Senior Historic Site Restoration Coordinator
e-mail: beth.cumming@parks.ny.gov

via e-mail only

cc: G. Santucci - LPC



April 26, 2021

Olga Abinader
Director, Environmental Assessment and Review Division
NYC Dept. of City Planning
120 Broadway, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10271

Dear Ms. Abinader:

As you know, the New York State Department of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation has, by letter dated April 19, 2021 from Beth Cumming, Senior Historic Site Restoration Coordinator, confirmed its conditioned finding of no adverse effect on historic resources from the proposed 343 Madison Avenue project. The sole remaining condition to that finding is that MTA continue to consult with the Department concerning the potential for a screen or other treatment relating to the open area above the existing vent shaft on East 44th Street. This letter will confirm that MTA will engage in such consultation in connection with the proposed project. In addition, because the No-Action building on the site would have substantially the same configuration as the project with respect to the vent shaft, MTA would similarly consult with the Department with respect to that as-of-right building. If so requested by City Planning, references to both of those consultations would be included in the appropriate sections of the DEIS.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "RPaley".

Robert Paley
Director, Transit-Oriented Development

CC: Steve Kass, Esq.
Lou Oliva, Esq.
Helene Cinque