

Introduction

On October 16, 2023, the Office of Technology and Innovation (OTI) published the New York City (NYC) Artificial Intelligence (AI) Action Plan, an ambitious, pioneering effort to promote the responsible and innovative use of AI across city government.¹ The Action Plan included 37 actions across seven initiatives focused on supporting city agencies' efforts to understand and use AI tools, fostering appropriate governance across the city, and collaborating with external organizations, as well as the public, to track the evolving social and technological landscape for AI use, and seek feedback on the city's efforts.

Summary of Progress

In the two years since the Action Plan was first published, OTI has initiated or completed 35 out of the 37 Action Items listed. These efforts represent both activities to initiate new Action Items, and activities that build upon previous Action Items.

Our successes include:

1. Updates to existing policy documents, "AI Principles & Definitions" and "Generative AI Preliminary Use Guidance," in response to technological advances in the field of AI, and in further alignment with city priorities such as climate sustainability;
2. The drafting of AI risk management documents and policies such as an AI risk taxonomy, risk assessment policy, risk review process, and risk monitoring process, which we have piloted with several agency AI projects;
3. Initiated a set of research and planning activities to analyze and propose approaches to managing challenges and opportunities that agencies face when procuring AI systems.
4. The creation of new guidance on how City agencies should engage the public in discussing the use of AI for digital service delivery;
5. The development of new instructional material for all City personnel to establish basic literacy on AI, focusing not just on Generative AI, but addressing the City's definition of AI more broadly;
6. The launch of the AI Collaborative, expanding the former AI Special Interest Group beyond technologists to include other roles;
7. Collaborating with local researchers at New York University and The New School, in conjunction with the Department of Design and Construction's Town+Gown Consortium, to provide further policy research to further inform our own policy development;
8. Continuing to convene the AI Steering Committee to provide input on agency needs and concerns to further inform our own policy development;
9. Continuing to engage the AI Advisory Network on ad hoc bases to provide specific input onto further inform our own policy development;
10. Continuing to expand publicly available information about the city's AI tools, including through NYC Open Data, to encourage transparency and build trust; and

¹OTI, The New York City Artificial Intelligence Action Plan, October 16, 2023, <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/oti/downloads/pdf/reports/artificial-intelligence-action-plan.pdf>.

11. Continuing to conduct numerous conversations with local, state, federal, and international government bodies to share successes and challenges in AI governance.

We expect to publish the new or updated policy documents and training materials imminently.

Action Plan Changes

As with the first year's report, OTI has continually reflected on the constantly evolving technology and context in which AI may be used in support of City agencies' work. To allow for our work to remain timely and as useful as possible for agencies and the public, we are revising Action 6.4 (Develop AI-Specific Procurement Standards or Guidance) to "Initiate" within 24 months. Work to support these efforts is already underway, and OTI will continue to move this work forward ahead of next year's Progress Report.

Next Steps

The AI Action Plan is approaching completion. Even so, the AI Action Plan was never meant to be the final word in how the City intends to adopt AI and govern its use. Even in these past two years, the field of AI has continued to grow explosively. In particular, the technologies developed around certain uses of Generative AI, such as document retrieval and intelligent document processing, are beginning to mature. At the same time, new AI products, such as AI agents, continue to emerge, as do new risks around the use of AI that have surfaced and transitioned from theoretical novelties to being observed in the wild.

OTI has also learned more about interests in adopting AI across multiple City agencies, as well as concerns over such use, and has identified opportunities for aligning AI policy and use with other City priorities, goals, initiatives, and review processes. OTI continues to exchange information with other governments, sharing our experience as a world leader in AI governance, while learning more about best practices for use and regulation as they develop. Our plans for work continue to adapt to this shifting landscape.

In the next 12 months, OTI plans to:

1. Continue updating our existing policy documents to reflect new technological and regulatory developments;
2. Publish new use guidances around AI technologies and use cases of broad Citywide interest, such as machine translation, and machine transcription and notetaking;
3. Continue developing new opportunities for City staff to learn more about AI from external experts;
4. Further develop capabilities to support agency adoption of AI responsibly, particularly as described by Action Items 5.4 and 5.5; and
5. Continue formalizing the role of AI governance within existing City processes for reviews, procurements, operations, risk management, etc.

Status of All Actions

INITIATIVES/ACTIONS		STATUS
1.	Design and Implement a Robust Governance Framework	
1.1	Establish a City AI Steering Committee	Complete
1.2	Establish Guiding Principles and Definitions	Complete
1.3	Provide Preliminary Use Guidance	Complete
1.4	Create a Typology of AI Projects	Complete
1.5	Expand Public AI Reporting	Complete
1.6	Develop an AI Risk Assessment and Project Review Process	In Progress
1.7	Publish an Initial Set of AI Policies and Guidance Documents	Complete
1.8	Pursue Ongoing Monitoring to Review AI Tools in Operation	In Progress
2.	Build External Relationships	
2.1	Create an Agenda for External Engagement	Complete
2.2	Establish an External Advisory Network	Complete
2.3	Use AI Advisory Network to Solicit Targeted Input on the City's Efforts	Complete
2.4	Explore Opportunities for Structured Partnerships with External Groups	Complete
2.5	Support Information Sharing Across Governments	Complete
3.	Foster Public Engagement	
3.1	Hold Introductory Public Listening Sessions	Complete
3.2	Establish Plans to Integrate Public Input on Citywide Actions	Complete
3.3	Explore Public Education Resources and Partnerships	Complete
3.4	Create Guidance for Agencies on AI Public Engagement	In Progress
3.5	Design & Build Public-Facing Website	Complete
4.	Build AI Knowledge and Skills in City Government	
4.1	Explore and Pursue Opportunities to Foster Information Sharing Across Agencies and Teams	Complete
4.2	Identify High-Priority Agency Skills Needs	Complete
4.3	Assess the Landscape of Internal and External Resources to Support AI Knowledge-Building Efforts	Complete
4.4	Launch Initial Knowledge-Building Efforts	Complete
4.5	Explore Opportunities to Bring AI Talent into the City for Limited-Term Projects	Complete
4.6	Centrally Track and Share Emerging Tools, Use Cases, and Considerations	Complete

4.7	Encourage Alignment on AI Skills and Duties	In Progress
5.	Support AI Implementation	
5.1	Identify Opportunities for In-House Tool Development	Complete
5.2	Develop Project Lifecycles and Identify Bottlenecks	In Progress
5.3	Define OTI and Agency Roles in Support of Projects	In Progress
5.4	Scale, Reuse, and Repurpose Identified In-House Projects	To Come
5.5	Provide Implementation Support, Tracking, and Risk Analysis	To Come
6.	Enable Streamlined and Responsible AI Acquisition	
6.1	Conduct Agency Needs Assessment	Complete
6.2	Establish Directory of Procured AI Tools and Guidance on Appropriate Use	In Progress
6.3	Support AI Piloting	Complete
6.4	Develop AI-Specific Procurement Standards or Guidance	In Progress
6.5	Explore Creating New Contracts to Support Agency Needs	Complete
7.	Ensure Action Plan Measures Are Maintained and Updated, and Report Annually on the City's Progress	
7.1	Institute and Use Processes for Refreshing Key Aspects of the City's Plan on an Ongoing Basis	Complete
7.2	Publish an Annual AI Progress Report	Complete