

# CITY COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

Annabel Palma, Commissioner/Chair



## WHAT WE DO

The New York City Commission on Human Rights (CCHR) enforces the New York City Human Rights Law (NYCHRL), educates the public about their rights and responsibilities under the NYCHRL, and encourages positive community relations. The NYCHRL prohibits discrimination in employment, housing, and public accommodations and is one of the most comprehensive antidiscrimination laws in the country. CCHR achieves its this mission through its law enforcement, community outreach, media, and legislative and policy work. CCHR's Law Enforcement Bureau (LEB) impartially investigates alleged violations of the law; negotiates and resolves matters; provides early intervention in cases of ongoing discrimination, retaliation, as well as to ensure accommodations; and, where appropriate, tries cases before an independent administrative law judge. Mediation services are offered through the independent Office of Mediation and Conflict Resolution. CCHR's Community Relations Bureau (CRB) educates the public on New Yorkers' human rights and cultivates deep community relationships through roundtable discussions, workshops, trainings, and other sustained engagements. CRB also collaborates with the small business community, including chambers of commerce, merchant associations, and business improvement districts to facilitate compliance with the NYCHRL. CCHR's Office of the Chair is the agency's policy, legislative, and adjudicatory hub. The Office convenes public hearings and stakeholder discussions, interfaces with sister agencies, publishes reports and public-facing materials on key issues, publishes legal guidance and promulgates rules, issues final decisions and orders, and develops media campaigns.

## FOCUS ON EQUITY

The Commission's commitment to equity, diversity, and inclusion continues to be the cornerstone of the agency's work. Meeting New Yorkers where they are is essential to accessible government and the agency's work. CCHR continues to innovate, adapt, and leverage its resources to expand outreach and intake services, in order to maximize opportunities to engage New Yorkers and eliminate barriers to reporting discrimination or bias when it occurs. Hybrid events, which involve providing both physical and virtual services, and the new expansion of intake into borough offices are two ways the agency is expanding its reach and accessibility.

The agency's focus on equity and engagement is at the core of recent public education and outreach campaigns on Human Rights Law protection. Following recent amendments to the Human Rights Law requiring employers to post salary ranges in job advertisements—which aims to level the playing field and advance pay equity—CCHR developed a multi-media campaign in the top ten limited English proficiency languages spoken by the population of New York City.

CCHR also used this campaign to build on related work to educate New Yorkers on protections for sexual and reproductive health decisions as well as required accommodations for pregnancy and lactation, which are even more vital in the wake of recent Supreme Court decisions. The agency also engaged with small business owners in all boroughs to provide accessible tools and guidance in ten languages on how to comply with new and longstanding employment protections.

Amplifying CCHR's commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion, the Commission participated in interagency conversations to elevate that the City of New York has, and cultivates, a diverse workforce. One such event, "LGBTQ+ CityTalk: Proudly Diverse," was a public facing event, focused on bringing together LGBTQ+ employees that work for the city, which examined the ways equal employment opportunities & diversity and inclusion inform agencies work, and provided an opportunity to speak about CCHR's anti-discrimination protections in employment.

The agency additionally organized events in local communities, including an African Heritage Month celebration and a Hispanic Heritage month event. Internally for staff, the agency held periodic virtual community check-ins, and the employee engagement committee hosted several events recognizing and honoring NYC's cultural diversity. Over recent years, the Commission has created new avenues to strengthen relationships with Native Americans and Indigenous Peoples, sharing information and learning more about how our agency can respond to community's needs. One such example was the translation of CCHR's "Know Your Rights" video content into K'iche and Mixtec. At the end of 2021, the Commission held a Native American and Indigenous Leaders Roundtable with community representatives, and published a Land Acknowledgement, drafted in collaboration with the Lenape Center. Since that time, CCHR has been creating opportunities for more robust city government engagement with NYC's Indigenous peoples and conducting an informal needs assessment to inform agency work.

## OUR SERVICES AND GOALS

---

### **SERVICE 1 Enforce the NYC Human Rights Law.**

Goal 1a Investigate, prosecute and resolve complaints of discrimination, discriminatory harassment, and bias-based profiling in a timely and efficient manner.

---

### **SERVICE 2 Educate the community on the NYC Human Rights Law.**

Goal 2a Increase community awareness of the NYCHRL through know-your-rights presentations aimed at the general public; know-your-obligations presentations aimed at housing providers, employers and small businesses; and other initiatives.

## HOW WE PERFORMED

- In the first four months of Fiscal 2023, the Law Enforcement Bureau (LEB) fielded 3,773 inquiries from the public, slightly lower than the record number of inquiries received for the same period last year. During the same period, 85 complaints were filed, 19 percent fewer than during the same period last year. Due to many factors and dynamic circumstances still evolving from the City's emergence from the COVID-19 pandemic, it is not possible to definitively assess the cause for that decline at this time.
- In the first four months of Fiscal 2023, 290 new matters were initiated, 79 percent more than the same period last year. New matters are those inquiries that, in turn, require follow-up from Commission staff, which might result in, for example, a resolution before filing a complaint or the filing of a complaint. Additionally, there was a 38 percent decline in open matters and 21 percent decline in open complaints.
- During this reporting period, LEB completed 125 pre-complaint resolutions—matters resolved on consent of all parties prior to the filing of a complaint—a 127 percent increase from the same period last fiscal year. Pre-complaint resolution is an ongoing, multi-administration effort, and the increase from Fiscal 2022 may be attributed to the increased demand for these services signaled by the post-pandemic record number of inquiries as well the increase in new matters being opened. Pre-complaint resolutions result from the Commission's efforts to triage inquiries and matters at an early stage to route appropriate matters resolution before the filing of a complaint and/or referral to sibling agencies and community resources.
- During this reporting period, LEB completed 56 modifications for accessibility for people with disabilities, 50 more than reported in the same period last fiscal year and an 88 percent increase from all of Fiscal 2022, which may result from the same observed increases in inquiries and new matters noted above.
- During this reporting period, LEB closed 188 cases, which is more than the number of cases that were filed in the same period, a trend that has been maintained since Fiscal 2019. The number of pending complaints that are less than a year old declined by 59 percent. The average age of the complaint caseload increased by 12 percent but remains the second lowest in the past five fiscal years. CCHR relies on attorneys to close cases and handle complaints and is currently experiencing a shortage of attorneys in line with citywide hiring and retention trends.
- In the first four months of Fiscal 2023, CRB served 52,193 people, compared to 23,636 from the same period last fiscal year, a 120 percent increase, reflecting CRB's ongoing work with community partners to engage and educate hard-to-reach communities. In this reporting period, CRB held 663 conferences, workshops, and training sessions, compared to 390 during the same period last fiscal year, a 70 percent increase. Additionally, CRB held 77 youth-based training sessions in the first four months of Fiscal 2023, 47 more than during the same period last fiscal year. These increases in public-facing events and training sessions are due in part to recent strides made in CRB's ongoing efforts to educate the public on longstanding human rights protection, and in part to CRB's strategic outreaches around new changes to human rights laws.
- CCHR engaged in 54 affirmative and proactive public interventions specifically targeting root causes of bias and hate incidents, a 17 percent increase from the same period last fiscal year. CCHR uses a holistic approach that focuses on prevention, solidarity, and community building.
- In the first four months of Fiscal 2023, the average number of days to completion for an Office of Mediation and Conflict Resolution (OCMR) case was 113, which has been steadily declining since CCHR first began tracking this in 2018.

## SERVICE 1 Enforce the NYC Human Rights Law.

**Goal 1a** Investigate, prosecute and resolve complaints of discrimination, discriminatory harassment, and bias-based profiling in a timely and efficient manner.

Performance Indicators	Actual			Target		4-Month Actual	
	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY23	FY24	FY22	FY23
Inquiries received	10,015	9,055	11,942	*	*	4,162	3,773
Matters initiated	1,307	881	449	*	*	162	290
Pre-complaint resolutions	406	214	196	*	*	55	125
Modifications for accessibility for people with disabilities	72	46	27	*	*	6	56
★ ● Complaints filed	525	643	318	*	*	105	85
Complaints closed	1,066	895	667	*	*	253	188
– Complaints closed (%) - no probable cause determination	1%	0%	0%	*	*	0%	0%
– Complaints closed (%) - probable cause determination	23%	22%	13%	*	*	14%	32%
– Complaints closed (%) - administrative cause	51%	48%	56%	*	*	63%	40%
– Complaints closed (%) - settlement	25%	30%	31%	*	*	23%	28%
Complaints successfully mediated	43	47	45	*	*	14	10
Complaints referred to the Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings	20	13	4	*	*	1	1
Value of damages for complainants (\$)	\$6,549,397	\$8,069,100	\$6,166,414	*	*	\$2,418,235	\$1,031,133
Value of civil penalties imposed (\$)	\$969,750	\$1,678,000	\$878,500	*	*	\$155,000	\$241,500
Open matters	2,398	2,411	1,555	*	*	2,327	1,446
Open complaints	1,165	1,012	773	*	*	899	708
★ Average age of complaint caseload (days)	515	427	503	↓	↓	447	501
Complaints pending by age - less than one year	416	546	268	*	*	431	175
Average days to completion for an Office of Mediation and Conflict Resolution case	183	154	124	*	*	NA	113
★ Critical Indicator   ● Equity Indicator   "NA" Not Available   ↑↓ Directional Target   * None							

## SERVICE 2 Educate the community on the NYC Human Rights Law.

**Goal 2a** Increase community awareness of the NYCHRL through know-your-rights presentations aimed at the general public; know-your-obligations presentations aimed at housing providers, employers and small businesses; and other initiatives.

Performance Indicators	Actual			Target		4-Month Actual	
	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY23	FY24	FY22	FY23
Conferences, workshops and training sessions	1,481	1,683	1,794	1,500	1,500	390	663
Youth-based training sessions conducted	300	293	169	250	250	30	77
People served	99,858	102,121	107,136	95,000	95,000	23,636	52,193
Bias/Hate Prevention and Intervention	467	383	104	*	*	46	54
★ Critical Indicator   ● Equity Indicator   "NA" Not Available   ↑↓ Directional Target   * None							

## AGENCY CUSTOMER SERVICE

Performance Indicators	Actual			Target		4-Month Actual	
	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY23	FY24	FY22	FY23
Customer Experience							
Letters responded to in 14 days (%)	99.0%	98.0%	100.0%	*	*	100.0%	100.0%
E-mails responded to in 14 days (%)	100.0%	99.0%	99.0%	*	*	100.0%	100.0%
Completed customer requests for interpretation	1,550	1,519	1,373	*	*	449	499
Average wait time to speak with a customer service agent (minutes)	3	0	0	*	*	0	2
CORE customer experience rating (0-100)	100	100	98	*	*	NA	NA
★ Critical Indicator   ● Equity Indicator   "NA" Not Available   ↑↓ Directional Target   * None							

## AGENCY RESOURCES

Resource Indicators	Actual			Sept. 2022 MMR Plan	Updated Plan	Plan	4-Month Actual	
	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY23	FY23 <sup>1</sup>	FY24 <sup>1</sup>	FY22	FY23
Expenditures (\$000,000) <sup>2</sup>	\$12.2	\$11.9	\$11.2	\$15.2	\$13.9	\$12.8	\$4.4	\$3.8
Personnel	128	120	101	146	126	126	110	104
Overtime paid (\$000)	\$0	\$4	\$1	\$15	\$15	\$15	\$1	\$0
<sup>1</sup> January 2023 Financial Plan. <sup>2</sup> Expenditures include all funds      "NA" - Not Available								

## SPENDING AND BUDGET INFORMATION

Where possible, the relationship between an agency's goals and its expenditures and planned resources, by budgetary unit of appropriation (UA), is shown in the 'Applicable MMR Goals' column. Each relationship is not necessarily exhaustive or exclusive. Any one goal may be connected to multiple UAs, and any UA may be connected to multiple goals.

Unit of Appropriation	Expenditures FY22 <sup>1</sup> (\$000,000)	January 2023 Financial Plan FY23 <sup>2</sup> (\$000,000)	Applicable MMR Goals <sup>3</sup>
Personal Services - Total	\$9.2	\$11.5	
001 - Personal Services	\$5.3	\$4.6	All
003 - Community Development	\$3.9	\$6.9	All
Other Than Personal Services - Total	\$2.0	\$2.5	
002 - Other Than Personal Services	\$0.5	\$0.6	All
004 - Community Development	\$1.6	\$1.9	All
Agency Total	\$11.2	\$13.9	

<sup>1</sup>Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR) for the Fiscal Year ended June 30, 2022. Includes all funds.    <sup>2</sup>Includes all funds.    <sup>3</sup>Refer to agency goals listed at front of chapter.    "NA" Not Available    \* None

## NOTEWORTHY CHANGES, ADDITIONS OR DELETIONS

- New indicator 'Average days to completion for an Office of Mediation and Conflict Resolution case' was added to goal 1a.

## ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- The Social Indicators and Equity Report, EquityNYC:  
<http://equity.nyc.gov/>

For more information on the agency, please visit: [www.nyc.gov/cchr](http://www.nyc.gov/cchr).

