APPENDIX: NOISE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SCA Playground Study 1992

1

CEQR TECHNICAL MANUAL

DECEMBER 2021 EDITION

·Allee King Rosen & Fleming. Inc.

Co. MILE LEE
Phone P
Fax #

ultants 696-0670

2/213-3191

TO: Julie Geisler

BE: SCA Playground Noise Study

FROM: James P. Cowan

Stephen J. Holley

DATE: October 23, 1992

Introduction

Between October 1 and 14, 1992, eight New York City public schools - consisting of early childhood (PS 52R), elementary (PS 299, PS 52R, PS 57, and PS 69), intermediate (IS 7, IS 72, and IS 75), and high (Tottenville High School) were monitored for noise emissions from playground activities. The purpose of this monitoring was to provide updated noise level values, that will accurately reflect existing school playground noise levels, for use in future environmental assessments of new school projects.

The levels currently used in environmental noise assessments are 75 GBA $L_{eq}(1)$ at the playground boundary, 73 dBA Log(1) 15 feet away from the playground boundary, 70 dBA Log(1) 30 feet away from the playground boundary, and a 4.5 dBA drop-off rate per doubling of distance for locations farther than 30 feet away. Additionally, $L_{10(1)}$ levels are presently assumed to be 2 dBA greater than $L_{00(1)}$ levels.

Noise Monitoring

Three sound level meters were used for the measurements. Two of the instruments were Larson Davis Labs (LDL) Model 700 meters (serial numbers 2216 and 1362) and the third was a Brucl & Kjaer (B&K) Type 4427 noise level analyzer (serial number 1167006). All of these instruments meet ANSI Standard S1.4-1983 tolerances for Type 1 specification. The LDL instruments were mounted on tripods at heights of 5 feet above the ground and the B&K 4427 was supported with its microphone fixed at a height of approximately 4 feet above the ground. All instruments were calibrated before and after each measurement session with an LDL Model CA250 Precision Acoustic Calibrator (serial number 1894) and the appropriate microphone adapter. Windscreens were used for all measurements. The weather conditions were clear to partly cloudy with winds under 10 miles per hour and temperatures in the 45 to 55 degree Fahrenheit range. All monitoring methods conformed with industry-accepted practices for measuring sound pressure levels.

Background noise levels, without playground activity, were recorded at each location. All school playgrounds monitored, except P.S. 299 in Brooklyn, were in Staten Island because the Staten Island schools provided the lowest background noise levels of any schools in the New York City area.

The lowest possible background noise levels were desirable for this study to ensure that all readings recorded were clearly generated by the playground

sources and not by other sources (e.g., vehicles, trains, airplanes, or manufacturing sources). As long as measured levels with playground activity exceed background levels without playground activity by more than 9 dBA, the measured levels are clearly indicative of those associated with the playground activity only.

With playground activity, noise levels were recorded at the playground boundaries and, wherever practical considering traffic and other extraneous sources, at distances away from the playground boundaries simultaneously. Simultaneous readings were used to estimate a drop-off rate of noise from the playground with distance.

Table 1, below, summarizes the monitored data by listing the most relevant L_{eq} and L_{10} values obtained. The complete set of monitored data is listed in Attachment A. The data is divided according to the type of school, (i.e., early childhood, elementary, junior high, or high) and activity (i.e., line-up, PE class, or recess).

It was originally planned that ten schools would be monitored; however, F.S. 52R was used for both its early childhood and elementary school sources and neither I.S 61 nor I.S. 24 could be monitored with reliable results for this study's purpose because of high background noise levels. Therefore, eight school sites are listed below.

Of all the data used in the analysis, the only monitored L_{eq} value that was less than 9 dBA greater than the background was the 60' recess reading at I.S. 72. This value was used only for drop-off rate analysis and the actual level due to playground noise alone, after the background noise is subtracted from the reading, is 1.7 dBA less than the recorded value (which was a composite of background and playground noise).

Analysis Methodology

New York City regulations, standards, and guidelines used for environmental noise assessments are based on hourly noise levels, specifically $L_{eq(1)}$ and $L_{10(1)}$ (where the number 1 in parentheses denotes a 1-hour value). However, each school monitored had different playground usage periods for activities such as morning lineups, physical education (PE) classes, or lunch recesses. To account for these different usage durations, noise levels during active playground use were recorded separately from the background levels and the two sets of data were combined into $L_{eq(1)}$ levels by utilizing the standard mathematical definition of the L_{eq} which is:

$$L_{eq(T)} = 10 \log \{ [(1/T)]_{t_0}^{t_0} p^2(t)dt]/p_{ref}^2 \}$$

where T is the measurement time period (1 hour in this case), p is the measured acoustic pressure, and p_{ref} is the pressure at the threshold of hearing $(2\times10^{-5} \text{ N/m}^2)$. All logarithmic references are to the base 10. Attachment B shows the specific use of this equation in the determination of the values quoted herein.

Table 1

MEASURED MOISE LEVELS (in dBA)

School	Grade	Activity	Distance From Playground (ft)	Duration (min)	L ₁₀	<u>L</u> ,q
Early Ci	ildhoo	d/Elementary	Schools:	•		
PS 52R	K-2	Recess	0	15	77.5	74.6
	K-2	Recess	30	15	67.5	65.3
	3-5	Recess	0	25	78.0	77.3
PS 299	K-5	Line-up	0	17	79.5	78.9
PS 57	K-5	Line-up	0	25	74.5*	77.9°
	4,5	Recess	0	20	72.0	71.8
PS 69	K-5	Line-up	0	20	71.5	68.4
	1,3	Recess	0	20	76.0	73.8
	1,3	Recess	20	20	70.8	68.2
	1,3	Recess	40	20	66.5	64.0
	2,5	Recess	0	21	77.0	73.4
	2,5	Recess	20	21	72.7	69.5 65.0
3	2,5	Recess	40	21	68.0	03.0
Intermed	liate 5	chools:				
IS 7	6-8	Line-up	0	. 10	79.0*	87.1*
13 /	6-8	Line-up	30	10	76.5	74.5
	8	PE Class	0	25	67.5	56.1
	. 8	PE Class	30	25	63.0	59.6
	. 7	Recess	0	30	78.0	74.8
IS 72	6-8	Line-up	0	. 15	73.5	70.9
	8	Recess	Q	17	78.0	76.9
	8	Recess .	. 30	17	73.8	70.8
	8 .	Recess	60	17	66.0	63.4
IS 75	6-8	Line-up	. 0	26	68.5	67.4
	6-8	Line-up	30	26	65.0	62.3
	8	PE Class	0	20	67.5	64.8
	8	PE Class	30	20	63.0	60.3
	8	Recess	0	15	69.5	68.2
	8	Recess	30	15	65.7	63.0
High Sch	cools:	,			e e	
Totten-	9-12	Line-up	0	20	76.5	73.5
ville HS		Recess	ŏ	20	71.5	69.7
ATTIE UP	9-12	Recess .	30	20	63.3	62.8

High level discrete events biased these measurements. These values were not used in the analysis.

Playground usage durations for the different school types and activities were developed based on field observations and verified by school principals and other school officials of the New York City Board of Education. These playground usage durations (which were the same or longer than the observed usage durations), rather than the measured durations, were used in the analysis to derive the recommended levels. Table 2 shows these usage durations by school type.

Table 2

DURATION OF OUTDOOR PLAYGROUND ACTIVITIES*

Early Childho	od/Elementary	Schools		des K-2/3-	5):		
7- 8 AM	30-Minute	Line-up					
8- 9 AM	30-Minute		or	30-Minute	PE	Class	
9-10 AM		•		40-Minute	PE	Class	
10-11 AM	30-Minute	Recess	OI	40-Minute	PE	Class	
11-12 PM	40-Minute		or	40-Minute	PE	Class	
12- 1 PM	40-Minute	Recess	OT	40-Minute	PE	Class	
1- 2 PM				40-Minute	PE	Class	
2- 3 PM				40-Minute	FE	Class	
And Andrew Annual Control of the Con	Schools (Grade	as 6-8):					
TIME	,	384 (CS-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-04-	AC	XIVITY			
6- 7 AM	15-Minute	Line-up					
7-8 AM	30-Minute	Line-up					•
8- 9 AM	30-Minute	Line-up	or	50-Minute	PE	Class	
9-10 AM				50-Minute	PE	Class	
10-11 AM	30-Minute	Recess	OT	50-Minute	PE	Class	
11-12 PM	40-Minute	Racess	OI	50-Minute	PE	Class	
12- 1 PM	40-Minute	Recess	OT	50-Minute	PE	Class	
1- 2 PM	30-Minute	Recess	or	50-Minute	PE	Class	
2- 3 PM				50-Minute	PE	Class	
High Schools	(Grades 9-12):						
TIME		•	AC	TIVITY			
6- 7 AM	15-Minute	Line • up		ř			
7- 8 AM	30-Minute	Line-up	OT				
8- 9 AM	30-Minute	Line-up	OT	50-Minute			
9-10 AM				50-Minute			
10-11 AM	45-Minute	Recess	or				11 10
11-12 PM	45-Minute	Recess	or				
12- 1 PM	45-Minute	Recess	or	50-Minute	PE	Class	
1- 2 PM				50-Minute	PE	Class	
2- 3 PM				50-Minute	PE	Class"	
	•						

Worst-case assumptions include the longest duration of activity that would normally happen during each hour. Note that during some hours a 40-minute lunch recess is indicated, this may not be a continuous recess but could include two 20-minute recess periods occurring within the same hour.

All calculations performed are in terms of $L_{\rm eq}$ values. Because L_{10} values cannot be combined mathematically the way $L_{\rm eq}$ values can be, L_{10} values can only be estimated through their relationship to the $L_{\rm eq}$ values.

Analysis Results

Table 3 shows the maximum hourly noise levels at the playground boundary for each type of school based upon the duration of outdoor playground activities shown in Table 2, above. Table 4, below, shows the maximum noise levels at the playground boundary for specific activities. There does not seem to be a clear relationship between noise levels measured and the number of students in the playground or the total number of students at any given school. The average difference between $L_{\rm eq}$ and L_{10} measured values was 2.2 dBA*.

Table 3

MAYTHUM HOURLY PLAYGROUND BOUNDARY SOISE LEVELS
FOR ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENTS**

Early Childhood Schools: (Grades R-2)

Elementary Schools: (Grade: 1-5):

TOF	Log(1) (dBA)	TUE	1-q(1) (ABA)
7- 8 AM	63.8	7- 8 AH	63.8
8- 9 AM	69.3	8- 9 AM	69.3
9-10 AM	62.9	9-10 AM	62.9
10-11 AM	69.3	10-11 AM	69.3
11-12 PM	71.5	11-12 PM	71.4
12- 1 PM	71.5	12- 1 FM	71.4
1- 2 FM	62.9	1- 2 PM	62.9
2- 3 FM	62.9	2- 3 PM	62.9

In calculating this everage, all measured differences less than 1.5 dBA were not used because they were associated with readings where extraneous peak levels from such sources as sirens, trucks, buses, and children yelling into the microphones contaminated the measurements.

Moise data from intermediate schools was used for PE class activities for all school types.

Table 3 (Continued)

MAXIMUM HOURLY PLAYGROUND HOUNDARY MOISE LEVELS FOR HEVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENTS"

Intermediate Schools:		High Schools:
(Grades 5-8) :	(Grades 9-12):
TIME	Imag(1) (dBA)	TDE

- 100		(1) (dha)	1148		Log(1) (QBA)
6- 7	AM 6	51.5	6- 7	AM	63.5
7-8	AM 6	34.9	7- 8	AM	68.2
8- 9	AM . 6	4.9	8- 9	AM	68.2
9-10 4	AH 6	4.3	9-10	AH	64.3
10-11	AM 6	8,9	10-11		67.6
11-12	PM 7	1.0	11-12	PH	67.6
12- 1 1	<u>™</u> 7	1.0	12- 1		67.6
1-21	7H 6	8.9	1- 2	PH	64.3
2- 3 I	M 6	4.3	2- 3	Ph	64.3

Table 4

MAXIMUM PLAYGROUND BOUNDARY NOISE LEVELS FOR SPECIFIC ACTIVITIES

Grades	Activity	Duration (min)	Lag(1) (dBA)
Early Childhood	Schools (Grades K-	-2):	4 9 8
K-2	Line-up	30	63.8
K-2	Recess	40	71.5
K-2	PE Class	40	62.9
Elementary Scho	ols (Grades E, and	1~5):	
K-5	Line-up	30	63.8
1-5	Recess	40	71.4
K-5	PE Class	40	62.9
Intermediate Sc	hools (Grades 6-8):	τ	
6-8	Line-up	30	64.9
6-8	Recess	40	71.0
6-8	FE Class	50	64.3
High Schools (G	rades 9-12):		
9-12	Line-up	30	68.2
9-12	Recess	45	67.6
9-12	PE Class	50	64.3

Noise data from intermediate schools was used for PE class activities for all school types.

Average drop-offs were 4.8 dBA at 20', 6.2 dBA at 30', 9.1 dBA at 40', and 15.2 dBA (the only reading) at 60'. Beyond 30 feet from the playground borders, drop-off rates were generally 6 dBA per doubling of distance from the noise source (in this case the playground boundary). This corresponds with generally accepted rule-of-thumb for other typical outdoor applications. However, if the new playground were to be located near any large reflective buildings, a lower drop-off rate per doubling of distance from the playground boundary could exist. In such cases, the actual drop-off rates can only be verified by field measurements, which should be performed, because of the complexity of the acoustical environment that is created by the buildings. However, if field measurements are not possible, a more conservative drop-off rate per doubling of distance from the playground boundary should be assumed (on the order of 4.5 dBA).

Recommendations

Based on the measurements and calculations derived from measurements in this study, the following values shown in Table 5, are recommended to be used as a preliminary estimate of the noise levels generated by students in a New York City school playground. Applying these levels to all operating hours for a new school would result in a conservative analysis, and are based on the maximum levels calculated for Table 4, above, to provide worst-case values.

Table 5

EECOMMENDED PLAYGROUND BOUNDARY HOISE LEVELS
FOR PRELIMINARY ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENTS

School Type	Lag(1) (dBA)
Early Childhood Center	71.5
Elementary School	71.4
Intermediate School	71.0
High School	68.2

If, after a preliminary analysis the potential for significant project impacts exists, a more refined analysis may be warranted. For this type analysis, noise levels for playground related noise should be added on an hour by hour basis. Appropriate levels for this purpose are shown above in Table 3, by school type.

 $L_{13(1)}$ levels should be estimated, whenever measured values are not available, as approximately 3.0 dBA higher than $L_{eq(1)}$ values. Unless the proposed playground is near (within 100 feet of) any large buildings, hourly noise levels can be expected to decrease by the following values at the specified distances from the playground boundary: 4.8 dBA at 20', 6.8 dBA at 30', and 9.1 dBA at 40'. The general rule of a 6 dBA drop-off per doubling of distance from the

playground boundary for all distances between 40 and 300 feet appears to be appropriate for analytical purposes. Atmospheric absorption, terrain, and metaorological conditions would affect noise levels beyond 300 feet away from the playground, and should be considered on a case-by-case basis. However, for most areas of New York City, background noise levels and building densities are high enough to make most playgrounds inaudible beyond distances of 300 feet away.

cc: Ed Applebome

SJE:wp JPG<SCA>/scaplay2.mem

ATTACEDIEST A

NOISE MEASUREMENTS WITH RESPECT TO PLAYGROUND BOUNDARY (in dBA)

Early Childhood/Elementary Schools (Grades K-2/3-5)

P.S. 52R - Dongan Hills Avenue between Mason and Nugent Avenues (10/1,2/92). 650 Students

Grade	Activity	Time	L	In_	Inc	Lso	_ <u></u>	T-13	حودثك
K-2	Recess @0'	11:45AM-12:00PM 12:10PM-12:25PM 12:10PM-12:25PM 12:35PM- 1:00PM	90.5 74.5	85.0 71.0	55.5 77.5 67.5 78.0	71.0 64.5	62.5 59.0	46.5 57.5 54.0 50.0	74.6 65.3

P.S. 299 - Maple Street between Albany and Kingston Avenues (10/1/92), 600 Students

Grade	Activity	Time	Low	1	Ins.	Irso_	Lo Lin	
K-5	Back+Lineup Lineup @0'	8:18AM- 9:18AM 8:18AM- 8:35AM	101.0	85.0 91.0	75.5 79.5	62.0 73.5	56.0 51.5 68.5 61.5	73,8 78.9

P.S. 57 - Oder Avenue between Palma Drive and Saunders Street, Lineup @ Palma Drive and Park Hill Avenue (10/6,8/92), 600 Students

Grade	Activity	Time	L	<u>J</u>	100	Loo	-Inc.	Imin	<u>I</u>
7 5	Timerin CO!	9:57PM-10:20AM 8:20AM- 8:45AM 11:25AM-11:45AM	105.0	86.0°	74.5	66.5	61.5	54.0	77.9

P.S. 69 - Keating Place between Rockland and Saxon Avenues (10/9,13/92), 1450 Students

Grade	Activity	Time	L	L	_ <u>L</u> 10_	_L50_	<u></u>	Pain	Liq
K-5 1,3 1,3 1,3 2,5 2,5 2,5	Background Lineup @0' Recess @0' Recess @20' Recess @40' Recess @40' Recess @20' Recess @20' Recess @20' Recess @20'	1:05PM- 1:15PM 8:20AM- 8:40AM 12:39PM-12:59PM 12:39PM-12:45PM 12:45PM-12:59PM 12:39PM-12:59PM 1:17PM- 1:38PM 1:17PM- 1:30PM 1:30PM- 1:38PM 1:17PM- 1:38PM	66.0 85.0 94.0 78.7 80.9 75.5 87.5 77.5 79.7	64.5 80.0 83.5 76.3 76.5 70.0 82.0 76.3 77.7	55.5 71.5 76.0 70.1 71.1 66.5 77.0 72.7 72.7 68.0	50.0 62.5 70.5 65.9 67.3 63.0 70.5 68.1 67.1 63.5	63.7	45.5 49.0 54.0 50.5 51.0	53.5 68.4 73.8 67.6 68.4 64.0 73.4 69.5 69.4 65.0

High level discrete events blased these measurements.

ATTACHMENT A (Continued)

NOISE MEASUREMENTS WITH RESPECT TO PLAYGROUND BOUNDARY (in dBA)

Intermediate Schools (Grades 6-8)

I.S. 7 - Irvington Street between Hylan Boulevard and Edith Avenue (10/6,9/92), 800 Students

Grade	Activity	Time	L	1-	Lon	Loo	Lo Lun	Log
8	Lineup @30' PE Class @30' PE Class @30'	10:50AM-11:05AM 7:25AM- 7:35AM 7:25AM- 7:35AM 11:05AM-11:30AM 11:05AM-11:30AM 9:30AM-10:00AM	114:0* 90.0 92.0 73.0	95.5° 86.5 76.0 67.5	79.0° 76.5 67.5 63.0	69.0 61.0	60.5° 54.5° 60.0 54.5 55.0 45.5	74.5 66.1 59.6

I.S. 72 - Travis Avenue between Ferndale Avenue and Merry Mount Street, Background @ Merry Mount Street between Travis and Saxon Avenues (10/9,13/92), 1685 Students

Grade	Activity	Time	L	12	<u> L</u> 10_	_Lso_	<u> </u>	Lain	700
6 - 8 8 8 8	Recess @0' Recess @30' Recess @30'	7:35AM- 7:55AM 7:15AM- 7:30AM 11:51AM-12:08PM 11:51AM-12:00PM 12:00PM-12:08PM 11:51AM-12:08PM	83.0 97.0 89.3 85.7	\$1.5 91.0 80.1 79.3	62.5 73.5 78.0 74.7 72.7 66.0	67.5 71.5 69.1 65.9	60.5 63.5 64.1 61.5	45.5 54.0 52.5 53.0	70.9 76.9 71.8 69.6

I.S 75 - Boulder Street between Woodrow Road and Castor Place (10/13,14/92), 1465 Students

Grade Activity Time L.	Li Lio Lio Lio Lion Log-	-
Background 10:56AM-11:08AM 63. 6-8 Lineup @0' 7:49AM-8:15AM 85. 6-8 Lineup @30' 7:49AM-8:15AM 75. 8 PE Class @0' 9:00AM-9:20AM 78. 8 PE Class @30' 9:00AM-9:20AM 74.	79.0 68.5 64.0 60.0 53.0 67.4 70.0 65.0 60.5 57.0 52.5 62.3 73.5 67.5 62.5 59.0 56.0 64.8 67.5 63.0 58.5 55.5 52.5 60.3	
8 Recess @0' 11:45AM-12:00PM 88. 8 Recess @30' 11:45AM-12:00PM 79.		

High level discrete events biased these measurements.

ATTACHOUT A (Continued)

HOISE MEASUREMENTS WITH RESPECT TO PLAYGROUND BOUNDARY (in dBA)

High Schools (Grades 9-12)

Tottenville High School - Luten Avenue between Deisius and Eylandt Streets (10/14/92), 3500 Students

Grad	e Activity	Time	L	1	Loo	_150_	Loo_ Lair	Loga
9-12 9-12 9-12	Racess @0'	8:40AM- 9:00AM 7:40AM- 8:10AM 12:20FM-12:40FM 12:20FM-12:40FM	89.5 92.0	81.5 79.5	76.5 71.5	71.5 65.5	65.0 60. 62.0 58.	0 73.5 5 69.7

ATTACHMENT B

CALCULATION OF $L_{eq(1)}$ PLAYGROUND NOISE LEVELS

The standard definition of L_{eq} , as quoted in the text, is:

$$L_{eq(?)} = 10 \log \{ [(1/T)]_{t_q}^{t_n} p^2(t)dt]/p_{ref}^2 \},$$
 (B.1)

where T is the measurement time period, p is the measured acoustic pressure, and p_{ref} is the pressure associated with the threshold of hearing, 2×10^{-5} N/m². All logarithmic references are to the base 10. If we assume that the acoustic pressure in each time period measured is constant and T is I hour, the total acoustic pressure part of equation (B.I) under the integral reduces to:

$$p(t) = p_1(t_1 - t_0) + p_2(t_2 - t_1) + ... + p_n(t_n - t_{n-1}),$$
 (B.2)

where n = 0,1,2,....

Also in this case, the $L_{\rm eq}$ takes on the standard sound pressure level (SPL) definition over each time period of interest, namely:

$$SPL = 20 log [p(t)/p_{ref}]$$
 (B.3)

Solving equation (B.3) for p(t), we get:

$$p(t) = p_{ref} 10^{SFL/20},$$
 (B.4)

as a function of time. When different constant SPLs are measured for different time periods within the total period of interest, they can be combined by converting the individual SPLs into their respective acoustic pressures (using equation (B.4)), multiplying them by their respective time contributions. combining the individual time-compensated pressure components into a total pressure value, and solving equation (B.3) with the total pressure as input.

As an example from the text, the monitored $L_{\rm eq}$ for the K-2 lunch recess at the boundary of the P.S. 52R playground was 74.6 dBA and the background $L_{\rm eq}$ was 53.6 dBA. Using the prescribed New York City Board of Education recess limit of 30 minutes (1-hour) for the recess duration, equation (B.4) can be solved for the playground and background pressures and analyzed as follows:

$$P_{\text{playground}} = 2 \times 10^{-5} \ 10^{74.6/20} = 0.10741$$
,
 $P_{\text{background}} = 2 \times 10^{-5} \ 10^{53.6/20} = 0.00957$,
 $T = 1$, $t_1 - t_2 = 4$, and $t_2 - t_3 = 4$.

$$T = 1$$
, $t_1 - t_0 = \frac{1}{2}$, and $t_2 - t_1 = \frac{1}{2}$.

 $p_{\text{total}}(t) = \frac{1}{2}(0.10741) + \frac{1}{2}(0.00957) = 0.05849$ Then,

Using this pressure value in equation (B.3), the result is $L_{eq(1)} = 69.3$ dBA.

Whenever more than one playground noise level was available for a certain school type, each Leg(1) was calculated for each individual case and the resultant values were logarithmically averaged using a method similar to that described above.