## **NEW YORK CITY WATER BOARD**

## NYC Water Board Public Hearing

June 3, 2021

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	[START RECORDING]
3	MR. OMAR NAZEM: Yes, we're good to go.
4	MR. ADAM BOSCH: Great. So thank you to
5	everyone who's joining us thisthere we go. So
6	thank you to everyone who is joining us this
7	afternoon to hear the presentation as well as
8	those who are going to be providing testimony,
9	whether that's verbal testimony or written
10	testimony. This of course is a public hearing
11	of the New York City Water Board on wholesale
12	water rates to take effect beginning July 1st of
13	2021. During the COVID-19 pandemic, we've been
14	holding the board's events in a virtual
15	conference call format to facilitate access in
16	light of the pandemic. And we would ask that e
17	everyone place their phone on mute to limit the
18	background noise and make sure that people who
19	are giving presentations can be heard clearly.
20	I have placed several documents into the
21	official record, including a notice that
22	appoints me as the hearing officer, verified
23	copies of the public notices that were placed in
24	the proper newspapers, a copy of the rate
25	consultants' report on the regulated wholesale
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	rate, and copies of the written testimony
3	received by the board so far. The rate
4	consultants' report is available on the board's
5	website, as is a copy of the presentation that
6	you're going to be hearing today. This meeting
7	is being recorded, and once prepared, an audio
8	recording and transcript of the meeting will be
9	made available on the board's website, which is
10	nyc.gov/nycwaterboard. For members of the
11	public who are having difficulty hearing, there
12	is a real-time text captioning feature available
13	to follow up with the meeting. You need to copy
14	and paste a URL linking to the streamtext.net
15	website. That URL is long, so I'm not going to
16	read it. But you can access it for copy and
17	paste by visiting the Water Board homepage now
18	while we're getting sorted here at the beginning
19	and clicking the meeting materials link, again
20	under the announcement section. So that's on
21	the Water Board webpage, clicking the meeting
22	materials link under the announcement section.
23	You will also find the URL provided on the
24	public announcement posted on the board's
25	website. The agenda for today includes two
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	sections. So first the Department of
3	Environmental Protection is going to make a
4	presentation. And then members of the public
5	will have an opportunity to make a statement and
6	give their testimony. To get it started, I'm
7	going to hand it over to Joseph Murin.
8	Executive Director Murin, are you ready?
9	MR. JOSEPH MURIN: Yes, thank you, Adam.
10	MR. BOSCH: All right.
11	MR. MURIN: Before I start, I would like to
12	recognize that three of our board members, Adam
13	Freed, Jonathan Goldin, and Arlene Shaw are on
14	the call, and I would offer them the
15	opportunity, if they wish to, make a statement
16	before we start the presentation.
17	MS. EVELYN FERNANDEZ-KETCHAM: Good morning,
18	Joe. This is Evelyn; I'm also here.
19	MR. MURIN: Okay, Evelyn Fernandez-Ketcham,
20	thank you, Evelyn.
21	MS. FERNANDEZ-KETCHAM: Thank you.
22	MR. FREED: This is Adam Freed. I guess
23	I'll just channel our chair who's not here and
24	just to thank any members of the public who are
25	joining us today to provide testimony and remind
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	folks that the rate proposal that was set forth
3	is just that, by DEP staff. It is a proposal,
4	and we come to this with a very open mind and
5	actively and attentively listen to the testimony
6	and pour through anything that's given to us in
7	writing as we consider the proposal before us
8	and consider that fully in any final decision we
9	take at the rate adoption that will come later
10	this month. So just want to thank everyone for
11	participating in what we view as a really
12	critical and important part of this process.
13	MR. MURIN: Great, thank you, Adam. Any
14	other board members wish to add anything?
15	Hearing nothing, I'll start the presentation.
16	So I'm on the PowerPoint that as Omar noted, is
17	on the website. And I'm starting on slide one,
18	which is the purpose of today's presentation.
19	Today's public presentation addresses proposed
20	water rates to be charged effective July 1 <sup>st</sup> ,
21	2021 for water sold by the city of New York to
22	communities of water districts located in the
23	counties of Westchester, Putnam, Orange, and
24	Ulster. A public hearing is conducted by the
25	New York City Department of Environmental
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	Protection and the New York City Water Board in
3	any year in which there is a proposal to raise
4	water rates. The general public has an
5	opportunity to speak today following DEP's
6	presentation. Pre-registered speakers will
7	speak first; then the hearing will be opened up
8	to the public. All members of the public with
9	comments, questions, or concerns should feel
10	free to present testimony or to send questions
11	to the Water Board at (718) 595-3591 or
12	nycwaterboard@DEP.nyc.gov before 4:00 pm on June
13	11th.
14	Moving to slide two, headed DEP strives to
15	be a good wholesale water supply partner, DEP
16	acts as a backstop for communities facing water
17	quality or water contamination issues and makes
18	available the city's water system as an
19	alternative source of water supply to
20	communities experiencing water safety issues.
21	DEP pays more than \$165 million per year on
22	water system real property located outside of
23	the city. The agency is often among the largest
24	taxpayers in the communities where water system
25	assets are located. Due to its size and
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	relationship with the city of New York, the
3	city's water system can issue debt for capital
4	construction purposes on market-competitive
5	terms providing an efficient way to finance
6	capital construction for the benefit of all rate
7	payers. The Water Board retained a consultant
8	at the expense, added expense for a multi-year
9	engagement to provide detailed suggestions to
10	wholesale water customers on techniques for
11	reducing water consumption and identifying lost
12	revenue. I'd also note that we have at this
13	time \$20 million investment in a new Microsoft
14	Dynamics UMAX billing system launching before
15	the end of 2021, including new billing system
16	that will work for the wholesale customers as
17	well.
18	Moving on to slide three, update on DEP's
19	operations in the last year, water supply
20	reliability and water quality north of the city
21	were maintained to high standards during the
22	COVID-19 pandemic. DEP is following CDC
23	guidelines regarding workplace safety protocols.
24	After reaching a peak of 80% of office employees
25	in remote work format, the DEP workforce began
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	returning to work sites the week of May $3^{ m rd}$ . On
3	a typical day at current rate, 70% of DEP's
4	personnel are onsite. Some pandemic measures
5	remain in place, including restrictions and
6	deferrals of certain administrative actions as
7	well as new digital business processes
8	introduced to the agency during the pandemic.
9	Pandemic-related incremental costs to the water
10	supply system have been modest to date, although
11	the outlook may include higher inflation.
12	Moving on to slide number four, DEP is a large
13	construction manager with significant water
14	supply projects. On this slide, you'll see a
15	chart showing the agency's fiscal year 2022
16	through fiscal year 2031 capital budget,
17	totaling \$20.4 billion. Of that, the bulk of
18	those funds are related to wastewater capital
19	programs such as the wastewater treatment plants
20	in city and sewer and replacement extensions in
21	the city as well. There is a significant
22	portion, approximately a third of that, that
23	also goes to water capital programs, many of
24	those being upstate assets. Approximately one-
25	sixth of sale proceeds from issuing bonds is
	Ubiqus 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	used for water supply projects north of the
3	city. Major initiatives underway include
4	significant ongoing progress on the Delaware
5	Aqueduct Bypass work, with the final stage
6	scheduled for completion in 2022 to 2023,
7	ongoing investments in the watershed under the
8	filtration avoidance determination across
9	multiple investment channels, and hiring and
10	training of DEP police and watershed security
11	personnel. Moving on to slide five, I'm going
12	to turn this over to Water Board treasurer Omar
13	Nazem.
14	MR. NAZEM: Hello, everyone. So slide five
15	and slide four I think work as a theme together.
16	The idea is to do something we've done in the
17	past but haven't done as much in recent years.
18	Perhaps we have we have frequently in recent
19	years. But just to kind of try and explain the
20	role of our upstate customers, our north of the
21	city customers, and wholesale water supply in
22	the context of the overall system, we do it not
23	to try and make the wholesale, this operation
24	seem small, but we do it just to kind of
25	emphasize the sort of scale and the heft of what
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	DEP does. I think some of that is sometimes
3	invisible for the city, and I think it's just
4	worth emphasizing just to kind of show the
5	engineering and technical skill, the customer
6	service skill, all the different functions we
7	have, which work together to provide I would
8	argue a level of technical engineering talent
9	even on water supply that you wouldn't see in a
10	sort of pure play on water supply only or a
11	smaller organization. It's intangible and hard
12	to measure, but we're really trying to make that
13	point on slides four and five, and that's why
14	we're showing both the capital in its entirety
15	and the revenues and water as a percent of the
16	total.
17	The trend line on slide five is sort of,
18	obviously water has been about the 9-10% level
19	total. It's just a supply for years. The
20	revenue's down to around the 2% plus or minus a
21	few points level. Financially, in broader
22	terms, to repeat myself, it is a relatively
23	modest portion of the total, but it is very
24	important. I think it works both ways in terms
25	of we were able to have a strong, quality water
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	supply source outside the city and parts of the
3	communities where assets are located. Those
4	communities are seeing the benefit of the
5	financial support of DEP. These are engineering
6	and technical skills on a scale that smaller
7	utilities often don't have. But that's what
8	we're trying to say on Slides 4 and 5. Slide 6
9	is data you've seen before in prior
10	presentations. We tried to just visually make
11	it a little interesting here, a little
12	different. What it shows on the sideways axis
13	is the change in total water consumption charged
14	the regulated rate year over year, and then on
15	the up-and-down axis, the Y-axis, how much we
16	increase rates in the year. It's interesting.
17	The main point I would draw attention to is what
18	the slide is titled. There were some reductions
19	in consumption in FY `18 and `19, definitely
20	'19, substantial reduction in consumption.
21	We're seeing thatnot reversible, but because
22	total consumption is still lower, we're seeing a
23	direction to change back toward where we had a
24	level increase in consumption in FY `20 and `21
25	to date. It's interesting because the down
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	years were prior to the pandemic, and the
3	increase years during the pandemic, which is a
4	little bit in a different direction of what you
5	would guess intuitively, but it is what we're
6	seeing. In terms of sort of additional
7	commentary on this, the conservation is still
8	we'd like to see more in terms of water
9	efficiencies and water reduction. While there
10	have been gains in terms of water efficiency
11	when you compare today to five years ago, that
12	is true on both the regulated and excess rate,
13	there's more we'd like to do. That was, of
14	course, part of the impetus of why we hired the
15	rate consultant, or the rate advisor alluded to
16	earlier, for its expense to a more consistent
17	issue in the communities. That's really what
18	the slide is talking about on 6. Joe, I'll give
19	it back to you for Slide 7.
20	MR. JOE MURIN: Thank you, Omar. So, Slide
21	7, that is background on water rates charged
22	north of the city. There are two rates: the
23	regulated rate sometimes referred to as the
24	entitled ratethe regulated rate is the rate
25	charged for quantities of water sold to a
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	community up to the total amount of water equal
3	to the community's population, multiplied by the
4	rate of per capita water consumption in New York
5	City, using decennial federal census data as the
6	population base. The excess rate, which is the
7	rate applicable to quantities of water not
8	eligible for sale at the regular rate. Since
9	population per capita has come both
10	variables, the threshold shifts over time and
11	are different from customer to customer. That
12	being said, we'll go now to slide 8, which is
13	the regulated rate has not changed in four of
14	the five last years. So, this is where we are
15	proposing a rate increase for fiscal year 2022
16	starting July 1st of this year of 8.82%. I want
17	to draw attention to the fact that over the past
18	five years there has only been one increase to
19	the upstate rate; that was 9.2% in 2020. All
20	those other years the upstate rate was held
21	steady, much of that due to being linked as well
22	with our modulating rates within the city. So,
23	there has been, as noted on the slide, the
24	average increase over those years is 1.78%, so
25	there is some degree of catch-up that we are
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	doing with this rate increase for this year.
3	Moving on to Slide 9, proposed rates take effect
4	July 1, 2021. The DEP is recommending to the
5	Water Board an increase for the regulated rate
6	of 8.82%, according to a rate per million
7	gallons of \$2,054.63. An increase of 8.82% to
8	the regulated rate will result in an increase of
9	just under \$1 per month to the water bill of
10	households using 70,000 gallons of water per
11	year, so that's even less than what we've seen
12	for in-city rate increases. Again, I will note
13	that that is the wholesale rate; that doesn't
14	take into consideration what rate may be
15	additionally charged by the provider of the
16	water in those communities, whether it's a
17	private or a municipal water supplier. DEP is
18	also recommending an increase for the excess
19	rate of 2.76%, in line with the proposed in-city
20	rate increase, according to a rate per million
21	gallons of \$5,355.07. Also of note, beginning
22	in 2019, prior to the start of the pandemic, we
23	began to see a limited number of [background
24	noise] customer become delinquent on their water
25	bills. Customers delinquency should reach
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	out to DEP or the Board so we can understand the
3	issues and work through any challenges. In the
4	short term, the cost of delinquencies is
5	absorbed by customers who are current on their
6	bills. Moving on to Slide 10. I've got to turn
7	this back over to Omar to go through this.
8	MR. OMAR NAZEM: This is really a very
9	really kind of a summary of a single table in
10	the longer report by our rate consultant,
11	Amawalk, which is on the Board's website, as
12	Adam mentioned. But this is reallyit showsI
13	don't know that there's a lot to say about it.
14	It shows the major line items that flow into the
15	calculation of the proposed regulated rate for
16	the coming year. I think the one thing I would
17	draw attention to is the phase, the very bottom
18	line above the black line across the middle, the
19	phase in the prior year expense is previously
20	undercharged. This is an issue withwe have a
21	basket of costs we've yet to recover through
22	revenues from prior year recalculations. These
23	are kind of held in a bay, to use a term, and
24	smoothed in under this fade methodology to
25	adhere to the practice of avoiding rate shock.
	Ubiqus 61 Breadway - Svita 1400 - New York NY 10006

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	We've been doing that for a number of years, and
3	that's consistent with past rate enforcements,
4	and a concept the industry folks on the phone
5	will be familiar with. There's some additional
6	catch-up, I would say, since we've gone for four
7	of five years without a rate increase, so the
8	basket is starting to look like something you
9	might want towe need to catchwe've been
10	catching up, I think is the message. In terms
11	of the line item and how it works mathematically
12	is no different than the past, it is just the
13	one thing on this page I want to draw your
14	attention to. Joe, I'll give it back to you.
15	MR. MURIN: Thank you, Omar. So, I will
16	note that the Water Board will be meeting, as
17	member Freed pointed out, this is not yet
18	decided. The Board will make a determination
19	based on the input they get from this or any
20	other hearings we're having. The Board meeting
21	is scheduled for Monday, June 14th. The
22	location will be a virtual meeting. The phone
23	number will be (347) 921-5612 with an access
24	code of 323706678, and it's at 9 a.m. on the
25	14th. And again, this information is all
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	available on the Water Board's website. That
3	being said, I'll turn the proceedings back over
4	to [crosstalk].
5	MR. BOSCH: Thank you. So, now I'm going to
6	begin the public testimony portion of the
7	hearing. I have one pre-registered speaker
8	signed up who I will call on first, and then
9	after that I'll make the hearing available to
10	anyone else who would like to speak. So, the
11	one person who was signed up to speak in advance
12	is Joel Dichter from Dichter Law. Joel, are you
13	there?
14	MR. JOEL DICHTER: I am here. Thank you
15	very much. Can you hear me okay?
16	MR. BOSCH: We can.
17	MR. DICHTER: Because I'm on speaker phone.
18	If you can't hear me, let me know and I'll pick
19	up the handset.
20	MR. BOSCH: You sound good. Go ahead.
21	MR. DICHTER: Great, thank you. I'd like to
22	thank the Water Board for this opportunity. My
23	name is Joel Dichter. I'm with Dichter Law, and
24	I have the privilege of representing a number of
25	state municipalities that are wholesale
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	customers for New York City Water Board, and I
3	drew before you today with regards to the rates
4	charged to customers north of New York City.
5	While we thank you for the opportunity today, we
6	believe an evidentiary proceeding would provide
7	the water board with a more complete record on
8	which to render an informed decision. The
9	upstate community municipalities are dependent
10	upon the city for their supply of water, and
11	entitled to receive a supply of water from the
12	New York City reservoir system pursuant to law
13	and also the terms of the permits issued by DEC
14	for the reservoir [background noise] built upon
15	the land, the wetlands of the upstate community.
16	Specifically, I'm appearing today on behalf of
17	the Village of Scarsdale, the cities of Yonkers,
18	White Plains, the town of Greenberg, SUEZ Water
19	Westchester, which there is a number of
20	municipalities in Westchester County, as well as
21	the Westchester Joint Waterworks, which is
22	portions of Harrison and Mamaroneck as well, and
23	New Rochelle. Over the years the upstate
24	community has experienced tremendous increases
25	in the rates charged by the water board for the
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	water provided on a wholesale basis. The
3	upstate rate report for fiscal year 2022
4	prepared by the Amawalk Group, proposed an
5	increased in entitlement rate for the first time
6	in excess of \$2,000 to \$2,057.98 per million
7	gallons. The proposal for fiscal year `22, on
8	the heels of a pandemic, where there was a 9 $\%$
9	increase above the current rates which, of
10	course, these communities will have to pass on
11	to their already trouble businesses and
12	residents as result of what the impact or the
13	shutdown from the COVID pandemic that they're
14	still trying to bring their way back from.
15	However, there really is, in fact, no cost
16	support for any increase at this time. The city
17	entitlement report prepared by Amawalk concludes
18	that the current rate of \$1,888 exceeds the
19	calculated rate for fiscal year `22, \$1,879,
20	based upon the budgeted cost of operation.
21	Therefore, no rate increase in the entitlement
22	rate is justified based on the cost of ongoing
23	operations to provide water to upstate
24	communities. For the so-called excess rates
25	before the Water Board, unlike the entitlement
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	rate established by the Water Board using a cost
3	study, the excess rate is simply equal to in-
4	city retail rates, even though the upstate
5	customers use no portion of the city's in-city
6	distribution system, lost water, and other costs
7	of operating the system within the New York
8	system. This year the proposed excess rate is
9	\$5,355 per million gallons, a 2.8% hike.
10	However, there is no additional cost to the city
11	for providing excess water in addition to
12	entitlement water. In fact, all the costs of
13	operating the system are recovered through the
14	entitlement rate. The excess rate at 2.6 times
15	the entitlement rate has no basis or support and
16	no rationale has been given for doing so. Nor
17	can it be justified as having needed an
18	increased rate on the basis of supply and
19	demand. There's a prolonged period of declining
20	demand both from the city and upstate.
21	Consequentially, the condition applies to meet
22	the needs of the cities in the upstate
23	communities for the foreseeable future. It is
24	not to say that the communities are in any way
25	looking to waste water. They, of course, want
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	to keep their costs down, and they're investing
3	in ways for water conservation, notifying of
4	customers of water conservation, and of course,
5	all have in place drought requirements in case
6	that is ever needed. Excess rate should not
7	become a mechanism just for the city to raise
8	surplus funds at the expense of their fellow New
9	York State residents and businesses, especially
10	at this time. Given that all the costs
11	upstate customers north of the city are
12	recovered by the Water Board through the
13	entitlement, it's time for the excess rate to
14	simply be eliminated, and the water provided to
15	the communities from the reservoirs built upon
16	their lands and watersheds provided at the
17	entitlement rate. We've affected over the
18	years, and Board members may be aware, we have
19	penalty for the numerous proceedings related
20	to review of this rate at the city retail rate.
21	We've tried to negotiate with the Water Board to
22	date and have been unable to reach an agreement;
23	we still hope to do so. But based on the trend
24	lines that we see, and these creeping demand, -
25	- supply, there really is no more need for the
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	excess rate to be any more than the entitlement
3	rate. I don't know if I have more time. I'll
4	continue, or I'll stop here. Let me know.
5	Shall I continue?
6	MR. BOSCH: Yeah, continue.
7	MR. DICHTER: Okay. I thought I only had
8	five minutes. I just wanted to make sure. We
9	agree that a cost-based entitlement rate is
10	appropriate and required. The city's own rate
11	report finds the current rate more than covers
12	its forecasted costs for fiscal year 22. Then
13	you may ask why is there a proposed increase.
14	The answer is that the Amawalk report
15	incorporates costs not related to fiscal year
16	'22 that Omar showed out, the reconciliation too
17	for the past four years, fiscal year 2017, 2020,
18	there was approximately \$68 million. Even
19	though it's spread out over four years, it's
20	been building every year, it's become a large
21	amount passed on to customers in the current
22	year. We believe this reconciliation was not
23	proper. In fact, this could have been done in
24	the fiscal years where there was no increases
25	and no budget to refuse, there were still
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	reconciliations put in place. How can you have
3	a reconciliation when there was no increase and
4	no budget to plot it against? To do so is
5	unlawful retroactive rate making and violates
6	the solid rate doc. Cost-based rate making has
7	affect rates for future periods and
8	adjustment for prior periods is improper. For
9	most boards the alleged cost in excess of
10	budgeting prior have nothing to do with
11	operating the system whatsoever. Rather, the
12	discretionary use of additional funds not
13	provided in the budget in order to deceive an
14	entire The cost state mandate
15	administrative code prevents the city from using
16	excess revenue for the year to retire debt and
17	pass it back on to customers to the upstate
18	community to a reconciliation in the future.
19	The funds not included in the budget, it
20	isn't a reconciliation at all. While there was
21	a prior agreement of the parties as to who was
22	doing the true , it was stated that it was
23	beyond the city's control, depends on rising
24	chemical costs. So, it was never intended to
25	permit the city for offsetting future increases
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	and raised rates in the future based on
3	discretionary spending above the budgeted
4	amount. Further, it's improper to burden
5	today's customers, who pay large sums of cash
6	using bonds for construction of the facility
7	that has a service life of 50 years or more.
8	Our analysis shows that from 2011 to 2020 the
9	city spent \$5.86 billion just using bonds
10	2025 projected to be only \$3.76 billion. And it
11	could take decades to recognize the savings, yet
12	current customers are bearing all of the
13	expense. This is not the [crosstalk]
14	MR. BOSCH: [interposing] Mr. Dichter, I
15	just want to advise, you've got one minute left.
16	Okay?
17	MR. DICHTER: Okay, thank you. This is
18	exactly the proper rate making methodology. The
19	cost should be borne by those who received the
20	benefit. We're not saying the city shouldn't
21	use funds to diffuse bonds, we're just saying
22	that the cost thereof should be spread across
23	all those who enjoy the savings nearby, rather
24	than putting the burden solely on today's
25	customers. Also, a couple other issues raised
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	that I'll get to very quickly in my one minute,
3	is that the city has built a filtration system
4	for the current system within the city's
5	boundary. Upstate customers have no access to
6	that reservoir system. There are no
7	interconnections, and if the filtration plant is
8	within the city bounds, they can't use that
9	water anyway. Nevertheless, there are still
10	costs, supposedly occurred in prior years, that
11	are included in the cost of upstate communities;
12	those costs should be removed. Similarly, there
13	are number of costs related to the Hillview
14	Reservoir that again the upstate communities do
15	use a little of that, but a very small
16	percentage, far less than the 10% of the overall
17	cost assigned to the upstate communities, and we
18	believe that that should be reduced, as well.
19	So, I'll just sum it up and say, if I can one
20	more30 secondsthat the current rate forecast
21	to cover all the cost of operations for fiscal
22	year `22, supposedly the increase is there for
23	unjustified rejected. There's no cost
24	savings rationale for an excess rate, but the
25	entitlement rate. The excess rate must be
	<b>Ubiqus</b> 61 Broadway – Suite 1400 – New York, NY 10006 Phone: 212-346-6666 * Fax: 888-412-3655

1	NYC WATER BOARD PUBLIC HEARING 6/3/21 12PM
2	limited as well, and all water provided to
3	upstate the same as the entitlement rate.
4	Thank you very much.
5	MR. BOSCH: Thank you, Mr. Dichter. Is
6	there anyone else who has called in and would
7	like to have the opportunity to give verbal
8	testimony during the hearing? Okay. Hearing
9	none, obviously there's still the opportunity to
10	give written testimony. I want to thank you,
11	thank all of our speakers. That will conclude
12	today's hearing, and the board will be returning
13	for its next business meeting on Monday, June
14	14th, at 9 a.m. to consider the proposed rates
15	and its budget for next year. So, thanks again
16	to everyone for participating, and we look
17	forward to hearing from you again soon.
18	MALE VOICE: Thank you.
19	[END RECORDING]
	Ubiqus

## CERTIFICATE

I, Gabrielle Atkinson, certify that the foregoing transcript of 12PM\_Water\_Board\_Meeting.mp3 was prepared using standard electronic transcription equipment and is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability. I further certify that I am not connected by blood, marriage, or employment with any of the parties herein nor interested directly or indirectly in the matter transcribed.

Signature: Gubill Col

Date: June 7, 2021

## CERTIFICATE

I, Anne Edelmann certify that the foregoing transcript of Wholesale-Rate-Public-Hearing.mp3 was prepared using standard electronic transcription equipment and is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability. I further certify that I am not connected by blood, marriage, or employment with any of the parties herein nor interested directly or indirectly in the matter transcribed.

Anne Edilmann

Signature:

Date: <u>June 7, 2021</u>