

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**NEW YORK CITY WATER BOARD**  
**Water Board Meeting**  
**June 19, 2020**  
**8:30 AM to 9:30 AM**

1 [START NYC Water Board Meeting 6.19.2020]

2 MR. AL RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Mr. Chairman, we  
3 have a quorum.

4 CHAIRMAN ALFONSO CARNEY: Thank you very  
5 much, Al. Just to make sure that I'm clear on  
6 who's on the phone: Demetrius, you're there,  
7 Adam, you're there, John, you're there, and  
8 Jukay, you're on the phone as well. Am I  
9 correct?

10 DR. DEMETRIUS CAROLINA: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay.

12 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. Those are the people  
13 who responded.

14 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay. Thank you. Thank  
15 you very much, Al. We welcome the members, and  
16 staff, and anyone who is, who is joining us  
17 today to listen to these deliberations. I  
18 welcome you to this phone call. It was probably  
19 done with a great deal of stress by Omar Nazem  
20 and people who work with him, but it always  
21 turns out to be--these calls have turned out to  
22 be very substantive, and we get good  
23 participation from the members as well. Very  
24 pleased about that. This meeting is now known,  
25 I guess, as the rate adoption meeting. It's

1 interesting that we call it, because we do a  
2 bunch of other things sometimes at this  
3 particular meeting. But glad to have all of you  
4 on the call. An aside, this meeting happens to  
5 have fallen this year on a day that is called  
6 Juneteenth, a contraction of June and 19th. No  
7 doubt, all or most of you are aware. You know  
8 something about the significance of this date.  
9 But, for the record, I thought I would put  
10 something in just to make a point since the  
11 governor has made the decision--made the  
12 decision the day before yesterday--to make this  
13 a holiday for state employees. And this is  
14 quick. As most of you or all of you know, the  
15 Emancipation Proclamation was signed on the 1st,  
16 I'm sorry, was enacted on the 1st of January,  
17 1863. On Juneteenth 1865, a formal declaration  
18 was read aloud in a square in, of all places,  
19 Galveston, Texas, making it clear that enslaved  
20 people in that state had been free since the 1st  
21 of January, 1863. So this is nearly two and a  
22 half years later. The Texas, I think, was the  
23 last state to do this. I'm not absolutely  
24 certain, but I believe Texas was the last state  
25 to clearly emancipate its enslaved folk. What's

1 significant about that is, for me at least, is  
2 that this proclamation in Texas resulted in  
3 freedom for a quarter of a million people,  
4 250,000 folk, a fact which a lot of people don't  
5 know, but which ought to become public  
6 knowledge. People should talk about that.  
7 Juneteenth is a--it's celebrated in 48 states, I  
8 think, state holidays. New York is not one of  
9 them yet, but we will be. It'll happen soon.  
10 That, I just wanted to get that into the record,  
11 and to point out something else that I was  
12 grateful to get some help on. I called, on  
13 Wednesday, called staff on Wednesday to find out  
14 whether we could validly hold a meeting today,  
15 since the governor had declared this a holiday  
16 for state employees. And I want to thank  
17 everybody who worked on the answers. But I  
18 know, Omar, you did, and, Al, I know you did as  
19 well. Turns out the answer is yes, it's a state  
20 holiday--it's a holiday for state employees. It  
21 is not a city holiday. And so organizations  
22 like ours can validly conduct business today,  
23 which is a good thing. Let's review the bidding  
24 here. Let's get a sense of where we are. On  
25 the 22nd of May, DEP made a rate proposal to

1 this Board. It proposed that, for several  
2 reasons which were, in, I think, every case,  
3 connected to the public health crisis, that the  
4 Board not increase the rates for the coming  
5 fiscal year. It was also proposed that we not  
6 assess for the coming fiscal year a 10%  
7 surcharge, which would have been assessed on  
8 certain multi-family properties. And so those  
9 were the two basic DEP proposals to this Board.  
10 On the 15th of June, there was a public hearing,  
11 and testimony was taken. I think there were  
12 five members of the public or six members of the  
13 public, some of whom may be on this phone, who  
14 actually offered written testimony. And I think  
15 all but one of those organizations actually came  
16 and presented their testimony orally as well.  
17 I've read the testimony, I have made notes.  
18 Very, very thoughtful comments from a lot of,  
19 from several people, very interested people,  
20 people who are concerned about water quality  
21 and, in many respects, also concerned about  
22 affordable housing and the cost to those good  
23 folk, who sometimes, in their views, are not  
24 heard as easily. I wasn't able to attend the  
25 hearing even by phone, and I regret that. I

1 apologize to the Board and the staff. But I've  
2 asked Adam Freed, who was there and chaired the  
3 meeting, to summarize some of that material and  
4 just give us a quick sense of what was said  
5 there and what the, the substantive aspect of  
6 the proposals as briefly as you can, Adam.  
7 After Adam does all of that, after each of the  
8 proposals that he discusses, I'm going to ask  
9 the members who are on the phone to introduce  
10 themselves first, and then if you have comments  
11 or questions--you've all had a chance to read  
12 the testimony. So if you do have comments, then  
13 please make them now. That is, after each of  
14 Adam's, after his review of each of the  
15 testimony offered. And with that, Adam, if  
16 you're ready, we can do it.

17 MR. ADAM FREED: Great. Thank you. And,  
18 for the record, this is Adam Freed. And thank  
19 you, Chair, for asking for this. I'd also like  
20 to thank you for your comments regarding  
21 Juneteenth, and hope that next year it's also a  
22 city-recognized holiday as we continue to evolve  
23 in the recognition of the significance of the  
24 day and other issues surrounding it. I wanted  
25 to touch on five comments that were received

1 really substantively throughout the testimony,  
2 both the written and orally. I also want to  
3 thank the Water Board's staff and DEP for  
4 responding in great detail to the Board. We  
5 received a packet with detailed responses to  
6 each of the points that were raised in the  
7 testimony. I hope that those Board members on  
8 the call have had a chance to review those, and  
9 all Board members, as there is a lot of detail  
10 and information in the responses there. The  
11 first comment or substantive area was related to  
12 the rate appeals process, and a number of  
13 requests were made on how to make it more  
14 accessible not only for residents and customers,  
15 but also for people who advocate on their  
16 behalf. Acknowledge that the Water Board and  
17 DEP has amended its policies to accept email  
18 submissions for rate disputes and ensure that  
19 those can be submitted in a timely manner, and  
20 also, as we've had challenges with notarization  
21 and signing legal documents throughout COVID-19,  
22 amending that for e-verification for notarized  
23 documents and continuing to allow technology to  
24 catch up while also maintaining the integrity of  
25 the process. So a set of documents around that

1 were received. Second area was concern raised  
2 about the multiplier used to determine the sewer  
3 rate. This is something that we, as a Board,  
4 have discussed and something that we continue to  
5 look forward, look into as we modernize our  
6 customer billing system. I'll talk a little bit  
7 more about that as we get into NRDC's comments,  
8 but it was raised by a resident, asking about  
9 how the sewer rates are applied to their bill.  
10 The third area of both NRDC and SWIM Coalition  
11 talked about the expansion of affordability  
12 provisions within the water rates, particularly  
13 related to COVID-19 and the economic crisis that  
14 is facing not only New York City, but the rest  
15 of the country, talking about the need to avoid  
16 water shutoffs, as handwashing is a health and  
17 safety issue, and certainly the first and  
18 foremost way of preventing the spread of  
19 Coronavirus. I note that water shutoffs have  
20 not occurred in many years in New York City,  
21 that it is something that the Water Board and  
22 the water system is able to do for nonpayment,  
23 but not something that they have practiced,  
24 particularly in direct response to the health  
25 and safety concerns that come from that, that,



1 throughout the past year, as we've extended  
2 many of the provisions in the rate and also  
3 policies, including freezing rates this year, to  
4 take into account the affordability challenges  
5 that many New Yorkers and customers face within  
6 the water system. But we have the need to  
7 balance the financial condition space now with  
8 the avoidance of future shocks in this system,  
9 and I think that's something we continue to  
10 balance. And I want to thank DEP for focusing  
11 on that. The fourth area is something that you  
12 know is close to my heart, a call for a separate  
13 stormwater charge. The NRDC and the SWIM  
14 Coalition have come repeatedly, asking for DEP  
15 to look into this. This is something that I  
16 want to make sure we echo in my comments, and as  
17 we continue to modernize the customer service  
18 system, as we think about GIS systems that can  
19 be in place to look at a separate stormwater  
20 charge and one that can be tied to a - - area.  
21 There's a lot of good testimony around that from  
22 both of those members. I would urge the Board  
23 to continue to look into that. I would also ask  
24 DEP to come back. They provided us some detail  
25 on that, but I would love to make sure we can

1 get a briefing on that this summer in great  
2 detail, and also ask for monthly updates similar  
3 to what they've done in the past for OpX and  
4 other large-scale projects. If we could get a  
5 proactive update on that, both around the  
6 modernization of the customer service and  
7 billing systems, around the GIS and associated  
8 studies, and also around public engagement  
9 related to this stormwater charge to make sure  
10 that we can stay actively engaged in that  
11 process. And then the fifth comment was around  
12 expansion of the Multi-Family Water Assistance  
13 Program. The University Neighborhood Housing  
14 Program has been a consistent voice through our  
15 rate-making process and testimony. They were  
16 seeking an expansion of that program, wanted to  
17 know that we've significantly expanded  
18 affordability programs in the past few years,  
19 something that we continue to look into, and  
20 find opportunities to do so in future years.  
21 Again, the need to balance the needs of the  
22 financial system and the fiscal integrity of the  
23 entire water system with our normal fixed costs  
24 with the economic crisis we're facing is  
25 something that's been contemplated, and this

1 resulted in the freezing of the rates for this  
2 year. So that was the tone and tenor of the  
3 comments that we received. I'll pause to see if  
4 other members have issues that they'd like to  
5 raise or comments on that.

6 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: If you are going to  
7 comment, remember to introduce yourself for the  
8 record.

9 DR. DEMETRIUS CAROLINA: Demetrius Carolina.  
10 I want to thank Chairman Carney. Certainly, I  
11 want to thank Adam for that great summarization  
12 of what took place, and, certainly, for DEP and  
13 for the members of our wonderful Water Board.  
14 Just wanted to echo that the sentiments of Adam  
15 in terms of sustainability, modernization,  
16 affordability of the Water Board of New York  
17 City, and it was just a great meeting. So,  
18 thank you.

19 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Sorry I couldn't be there,  
20 Demetrius. From the testimony that I've read,  
21 it's clear that people were being very, very  
22 thoughtful. These were not casual comments;  
23 these were comments that we designed to make it  
24 clear that there are improvements that we can  
25 undertake. The question is whether we can

1 afford them and when, and if so, when we can  
2 afford them. But thank you for that comment.  
3 Are there others who would like to comment?

4 MR. JONATHAN GOLDIN: This is Jonathan  
5 Goldin. I would like to also just express my  
6 personal thanks to DEP for all its hard work and  
7 under less than optimal conditions, to say the  
8 least. Our team at DEP has done a great job  
9 under these tough circumstances. And I also  
10 wanted, specifically, to thank you, Chairman  
11 Carney, for your leadership and, Adam, for the  
12 effective summary that you provided. I agree  
13 that we got incredible thoughtful comments this  
14 year, and I also wanted to thank UNHP and NRDC,  
15 and the American Utility Consultants, and Mr.  
16 Martay [phonetic] and the SWIM Coalition, and  
17 the Rent Stabilization Association, all of whom,  
18 obviously, thought long and hard and carefully  
19 about the issues that they were raising. And I  
20 hope that they take heart in knowing that the  
21 Board has, is considering those comments  
22 carefully, is getting input from staff on those  
23 issues, where we were able to make an immediate  
24 theme, namely, in connection with the email  
25 submission that's been incorporated. And I

1       applaud DEP for making that theme on an  
2       expedited basis so that we could have that in  
3       the version we're going to vote on today. I  
4       also just want to say that I'm very happy that  
5       we have been able to, subject to the Board's  
6       approval, maintain a zero percent rate increase.  
7       I'm, personally, very supportive of the  
8       proposal, and I'm delighted that, in these  
9       circumstances, we don't have to impose a greater  
10      economic burden on our customers, especially  
11      given that we can do that in a way that is  
12      economically prudent, fiscally prudent. And  
13      part of that relates to how carefully managed  
14      the funds of the system are, and so the Water  
15      Authority is to be commended for that. With  
16      respect to the comments, I think, Adam, you did  
17      a great job summarizing them, so thank you. I,  
18      too, would ask that we continue to keep a few of  
19      the issues that were raised on the agenda and  
20      make sure that they are a subject of Board focus  
21      and ongoing staff attention. In particular, the  
22      affordability issues and the expansion of the  
23      Home Water Assistance Project and other efforts  
24      to help customers going through tough times,  
25      especially right now, and when it can especially

1 be used, but in general, it's an important  
2 thing for us to consider, and then, on a larger  
3 scale, the reconsideration of the more equitable  
4 rate structure that may be more progressive and  
5 that handles stormwater charges in a way that  
6 may be more fair. And I think there are a  
7 couple of other points that point to, that we  
8 should be focusing on how to plan not only to be  
9 fiscally prudent in the current environment, but  
10 also make sure that we can try and avoid large  
11 increases as we go forward. And in that  
12 connection, try and ensure a measure of  
13 predictability with respect to the system's  
14 obligations to the city so that we can set rates  
15 in a way that enables us to be confident that we  
16 can meet the obligations of the water system as  
17 we're required to do. I also very much  
18 appreciate the comments around Juneteenth. And  
19 I think that in future years, hopefully, as  
20 others noted, that we would not be conducting  
21 business on this day and would respect it as an  
22 important day. Obviously, it's not something  
23 that was on the, as Chairman Carney noted, was  
24 an issue in New York State, at least from a  
25 legal perspective, and so it certainly made

1 sense for us to proceed this year. But it's  
2 something we should take into account for future  
3 years. So, thank you.

4 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Thank you for those  
5 comments, Jon. Thank you for all of your  
6 comments. I don't disagree with anything. I  
7 don't think I disagree with anything anybody  
8 said. I would probably--I wasn't there to hear  
9 the testimony, but I've read the NRDC testimony.  
10 And it was not just thoughtful; it was, in many  
11 respects, in every respect, I thought, accurate.  
12 We're facing a hugely difficult financial crunch  
13 in New York City. They certainly have an  
14 interest, as we all do on this Board, in knowing  
15 how to budget reliably. They make the point in  
16 their testimony that--and they make it extremely  
17 well--that we had to deal this year with a  
18 request from the city, who's in dire financial  
19 circumstances, for some portion of the rental  
20 payment. It was half, I think. I don't know  
21 what we do as a Board to address that. It makes  
22 planning very difficult. It is important to  
23 note that that decision not to request the  
24 rental payment was made in 2016. So we had  
25 several years of having the city stand down. I

1 believe I have a sense of the financial crisis  
2 that the city is facing now, and I believe that  
3 it's appropriate to reach out where you can and  
4 make a decision, revert on a decision that...  
5 They got back to us, and they have made it clear  
6 that they needed the money, wanted the money,  
7 and they got it. I think going forward, we have  
8 an obligation to think hard and seriously about  
9 how we can know in advance whether or not this  
10 sort of thing may happen. The Coronavirus--and  
11 I'm assuming that that's a lot of the reason for  
12 the city's decision--was completely  
13 unpredictable. And the city had given relief,  
14 as I pointed out in previous years, but, I  
15 guess, I'd like to have the Board discuss at  
16 some point going forward during the summer--if  
17 we're going to meet during the summer--or if  
18 we're not going to meet during the summer, in  
19 the fall, how we might shore up our ability to  
20 rely on what the city's going to need and want  
21 to do. Not taking issue with the city's  
22 decision to do it this year, but, because I  
23 understand it, or at least I think I do. But it  
24 would be great to have a discussion about how  
25 better to--we need more predictability. And it



1 would be great if we could do that, get that.  
2 That said, thank you all very much for your  
3 comments. I am very grateful for them.

4 MR. FREED: Mr. Chair, before we move on.  
5 This is Adam Freed.

6 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Yeah.

7 MR. FREED: I would just ask, given, I  
8 think, the significance and importance of those  
9 issues, both the stormwater charge and ways of  
10 thinking about future rate changes, and the  
11 rental payment, if we could schedule a meeting  
12 for July or August to make sure we can get those  
13 onto the agenda and begin the process of regular  
14 updates to the Board on that rather than waiting  
15 for the fall.

16 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: I don't disagree with  
17 that, Adam. If staff believes... People have  
18 summer plans. We don't normally meet in the  
19 summer, but it would be great if we could.  
20 These teleconference calls seem to work; we get  
21 great attendance. So if it's doable, Joe or  
22 Omar, you'll have to let us know. Why don't we  
23 just make a point that the Board would like to  
24 do that, say, in August?

25 MR. JOE MURIN: Mr. Chair. Sorry. Yes, Mr.

1 Chair, this is Joe Murin, Chief Financial  
2 Officer for the Department of Environment  
3 Protection. So, yes, we hear the request and we  
4 will work with--Omar and myself will work with  
5 the Board to see what we could schedule for  
6 preferably August. I may say that we may want  
7 to even think perhaps September. I think what  
8 we want to also be able to be cognizant of,  
9 particularly around the issue raised regarding  
10 the rental payment as to what the, what the  
11 respective financial condition's going to be for  
12 both the city as well as the system. I think  
13 we're still getting a lot of data in, and it's  
14 not yet clear that... We're probably as--we had a  
15 presentation from the budget director and the  
16 first deputy mayor the other night about the  
17 city's fiscal situation. And as you noted, Mr.  
18 Chair, it is very, very grim, and I think it's  
19 also equally very dire, for lack of a better  
20 word, at the state level as well. So that's  
21 going to have a lot of implications across the  
22 city. We are right now not as in, I think, a  
23 bad a situation, but we don't know what's going  
24 to happen during the fall. So I think we want  
25 to be able to have a better sense of where

1 collections and payments are going to be at  
2 and also the consumption decline that we talked  
3 to when we had the Board presentation. So I  
4 think August or September probably could work.  
5 And we could talk about both the financial  
6 situation of the system as well as the status of  
7 the rate study, I think a status update on the  
8 billing system, which is also, I think, we noted  
9 has been slightly delayed due to the COVID  
10 situation, and then also about what that may  
11 mean if there is any prospect of--I don't expect  
12 it--of the rental payment being requested for  
13 fiscal year '21 as well.

14 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay.

15 MR. FREED: And, this is Adam Freed again.  
16 Joe, appreciate the comments. And if it turns  
17 out we want to wait on the fiscal conversation  
18 for the fall, for September, I just urge us to  
19 not have that be the delay on the stormwater  
20 charge associated studies. And it seems like  
21 within ten weeks in August, we should be able to  
22 schedule a time for that pending everyone's  
23 availability. So just urge us to try to do that  
24 if we need to.

25 MR. MURIN: Okay. And I'll--

1 MS. ARLENE SHAW: [Interposing]

2 [Crosstalk]

3 MR. MURIN: Oh, I'm sorry. Go ahead, Mr.  
4 Chair.

5 MS. SHAW: No, go ahead, Joe. That was  
6 Arlene. Go ahead.

7 MR. MURIN: Oh, I'm sorry, Arlene. And I  
8 know that Deputy Commissioner Angela Licata is  
9 also on the call, and she's going to be the one  
10 leading her and her staff on the rate study. So  
11 I would defer to her in terms of letting guide  
12 us in terms of what may be the most opportune.  
13 Right now, the study is, the contract has been  
14 submitted to the controller's office, and we're  
15 awaiting registration of that contract. So now,  
16 Arlene, I'll turn now to you.

17 MS. SHAW: Arlene Shaw. I just wanted to...  
18 Everyone's said all the things that I wanted to  
19 say, but I just want to reiterate the Chair's  
20 comments around understanding the rental payment  
21 and what happens if that will go forward, and I  
22 just want to emphasize the things Adam was  
23 talking about as well. I think these are all  
24 important points that we need to make sure that  
25 we stay on top of and they don't get lost in

1 the - - .

2 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Thank you very much,  
3 Arlene. I absolutely agree with you. And I  
4 agree with you, Adam. If there are things we  
5 can get done sooner rather than later, that is  
6 at the end of the summer rather than in  
7 September, then let's try to do it then. Let's  
8 have that telephone conference call if that's  
9 what it's going to be, because it's a lot easier  
10 to do it. Staff may have difficulty collecting  
11 all the information that you, and Arlene, and I,  
12 and Jon, and Demetrius might want to, and Jukay  
13 might want to have. But the fact is that it's,  
14 it is available information and can be collected  
15 in part, at least, and it's the part... I don't  
16 want for staff to wait until it's collected all  
17 the information we've talked about on this call.  
18 If there is information that can be, can be  
19 gathered sooner, then let's have that conference  
20 call. It won't be a long one, but, I guess, it  
21 has to be noticed and all the other things that  
22 this public organization has to do. So just  
23 give us a sense. You can give me a call or call  
24 the members and say, We're able to get X, Y, and  
25 Z. Let's have the meeting in August. We can't

1 get A, B, and C until late September, but we  
2 can get it all, get all of it in separate parts.  
3 Let's do it that way.

4 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Understood, Mr.  
5 Chair. We'll follow through on that.

6 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: And let me say before I  
7 forget, and I will forget, it is extraordinary  
8 the degree to which you all have been able to  
9 maintain the information gathering for this  
10 Board, submissions to this Board, electronic  
11 submissions, paper submissions, FedEx packages.  
12 And the information is high quality information.  
13 I want to commend you all. I should have done  
14 this at the end of the meeting, but I was afraid  
15 I'd forget. Since we're having a discussion  
16 that relates to the quality of the work, thank  
17 you all very much for what you do for this  
18 Board. It's been fabulous. It's just been  
19 [crosstalk]--

20 MR. FREED: [Interposing] Here, here.

21 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: All right. Let's get on  
22 with the agenda. The first item is the  
23 approval, I'm sorry, the approval of the minutes  
24 of the 22 May meeting. They were in your  
25 packets, digital packets or paper packets. Has

1 everybody had a chance to review the minutes?

2 Are there any questions or corrections?

3 MR. FREED: Mr. Chair, this is Adam Freed  
4 again.

5 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Yes.

6 MR. FREED: I'd just like to note and  
7 propose an amendment to the minutes. We  
8 actually had a fairly robust discussion during  
9 that meeting about the reinstatement of the  
10 rental payment by the city, the need to balance  
11 the economic realities that we are facing today  
12 from COVID and the economic downturn with - -  
13 year cost increases and--

14 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: [Interposing] Yes.

15 MR. FREED: --trying to prevent--

16 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: [Interposing] Yes.

17 MR. FREED: --double-digit rate increases,  
18 as well as a request for an update of DEP's  
19 efforts for the separated stormwater charge  
20 rate. And just would like to see those  
21 discussion points reflected in the minutes.

22 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: It's fair. I don't know  
23 who does our minutes, but Adam has just made  
24 three points that were not included in the  
25 minutes with a lot of vigor. Can we get that

1 done?

2 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes, Mr. Chairman. This is  
3 Al Rodriguez. We'll make sure those, the  
4 minutes are amended...

5 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay.

6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: ...to that effect.

7 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Those are fairly  
8 substantive amendments. Would you recommend  
9 then that we delay voting on the--

10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: [Interposing] Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: --of the minutes as  
12 written?

13 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes, sir. I would recommend  
14 that we amend the minutes and distribute them  
15 prior to the next meeting..

16 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Terrific. Thank you.

17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: ...for approval at that point.

18 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: At the next meeting.

19 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes, sir.

20 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay. That's fine.  
21 That's fine. The next agenda item is the  
22 adoption of the Board's minutes for fiscal 2021.  
23 Is anybody going to make a brief presentation on  
24 the budget? We've all seen it; we've all read  
25 it. Is the plan to include some discussion of



1 it in this meeting from staff to the Board?

2 MR. OMAR NAZEM: This is Omar Nazem. No,  
3 Alfonso. The numbers are substantially  
4 identical from what we had shown in the  
5 PowerPoint from May 22nd.

6 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Right, right.

7 MR. NAZEM: That May 22nd PowerPoint just  
8 for the public is available right now on the  
9 Water Board's website, as well as there being a  
10 more streamlined budget document on the website.  
11 If anyone wants to view either of those  
12 documents, it's, again, NYC.gov\NYCWaterBoard.  
13 Those are viewable for the public. Besides  
14 that, we have no comments since they're  
15 essentially the same numbers we showed back in  
16 May.

17 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay. Are there any  
18 questions then for Omar or Joe? Hearing none,  
19 may I have a motion, please, to approve the  
20 budget as presented?

21 DR. CAROLINA: Demetrius Carolina. So move.

22 MR. FREED: Adam Freed. Second.

23 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Adam, thank you. All in  
24 favor, please indicate with aye.

25 MR. GOLDEN: Aye.

1 MR. JUKAY HSU: Aye.

2 DR. CAROLINA: Aye.

3 MS. SHAW: Aye.

4 MR. FREED: Aye. Adam Freed.

5 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Thank you.

6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Point of order, Mr.

7 Chairman.

8 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Yes, sir.

9 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Could I make a suggestion  
10 that you conduct a roll call of each of the  
11 members that are present on the, on the call?

12 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: And I will do that if you  
13 prefer, but my plan was to do what I just did  
14 and then to ask whether there's any opposition.  
15 I would then say that the--

16 MR. RODRIGUEZ: [Interposing] Okay.

17 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: --the resolution was  
18 approved..

19 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I think that--

20 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: ...unanimously.

21 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I think that works, too.

22 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay.

23 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Just because we're on the  
24 phone, I think that--

25 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: [Interposing] I know, I

1 know. But I think asking whether there's  
2 opposition actually solves the--

3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: [Interposing] Yes, yes.

4 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: --the [crosstalk].

5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I agree.

6 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay. Is there any  
7 opposition to this resolution? Hearing none,  
8 the resolution passes unanimously. The last  
9 agenda item is the adoption of the Board's rate  
10 schedule. Is there, is there any discussion,  
11 any further discussion? Hearing none, may I  
12 have a motion, please, to approve the rate  
13 schedule resolution?

14 MR. FREED: This is Member Freed. So moved.

15 MR. GOLDIN: So moved.

16 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Thank you, Adam.

17 MR. GOLDIN: This is Jon Goldin. Second.

18 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Jon, thank you. Thank you  
19 both very much. All in favor, indicate with  
20 aye.

21 DR. CORNELIUS: Aye.

22 MR. GOLDIN: Aye.

23 MR. FREED: Aye.

24 MS. SHAW: Aye.

25 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Okay.

1 MR. HSU: Aye.

2 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Are there any opposed?  
3 Then, then the rate schedule is adopted  
4 unanimately. I want to thank you all very much.  
5 Is there any further business to come before  
6 this Board at this teleconference meeting?  
7 There being none, may I have a motion, please,  
8 to adjourn?

9 MR. GOLDIN: So moved. Jonathan Goldin.

10 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Thanks, Jon. Second?

11 DR. CAROLINA: Demetrius Carolina.

12 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: And as there is no  
13 opposition, we are adjourned.

14 MR. FREED: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: The pleasure's mine.  
16 Thank you all for attending.

17 MR. GOLDIN: Thank you.

18 MS. SHAW: Great day.

19 MR. GOLDIN: Thank you, everyone.

20 MR. HSU: Be well.

21 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: You all take care of  
22 yourselves. Be safe.

23 MS. SHAW: Bye-bye, everybody.

24 CHAIRMAN CARNEY: Bye-bye.

25 AUTOMATED VOICE: This meeting is no longer

1 being recorded or transcribed.

2 [END RECORDING]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

1  
2           The prior proceedings were transcribed from  
3 audio files and have been transcribed to the  
4 best of my ability. I further certify that I am  
5 not connected by blood, marriage or employment  
6 with any of the parties herein nor interested  
7 directly or indirectly in the matter  
8 transcribed.

9  
10           Signature Melissa Strickland

11           Date         June 23, 2020        

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25