

FULL BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Beverly Donohue, Chair

April 4, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

The meeting can be viewed in its entirety at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oOxfDbrUW5k>

Present: Beverly Donohue, Chair; Barbara Adler, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Linda Alexander, Richard Asche, Alex Bell, Kristen Berger, Elizabeth Caputo, Courtney Clark Metakis, Joshua Cohen, Christian Cordova, Kenneth Coughlin, Page Cowley, Louisa Craddock, Mark Diller, Sheldon Fine (*arrived after 8PM*), Sonia Garcia, Miranda Goodwin-Raab, Audrey Isaacs, Tibita Kaneene, K Karpen, Natasha Kazmi, Doug Kleiman, Blanche Lawton, Sara Lind (*arrived 1 hour late*), Ira Mitchneck, Klari Neuwelt, William Ortiz, Michele Parker, Seema Reddy, Andrew Rigie, Madge Rosenberg, Melissa Rosenberg, Peter Samton, Susan Schwartz, Roberta Semer, Ethel Sheffer, Erana Stennett, Kristina Villarini, Benjamin Wu and Howard Yaruss. **Absent:** Kevin Corte, Robert Espier, Polly Spain, Anthony Thomas. **Board Office:** Max Vandervliet, Alexandra Crawford and Jessie Nieves.

Chair's Report:

Beverly Donohue, Chair, called the meeting to order at 6:31PM, and began the meeting with the following items:

- Asked the District Manager to explain how to sign up to speak at meetings, which he did.
- Announced last month and again tonight two new appointments for co-chairmanships: Josh Cohen as co-chair of BCI, and Tibita Kaneene as co-chair of Housing. She congratulated both of them.
- Announced Christian Cordova was leaving the board and thanked him for his years of service, including his behind-the-scenes tech work for the board.
- The Chair explained that last month the board was advised by Department of Homeless Services about a planned Safe Haven on West 83rd Street. The board voted to table the resolution offered in March as there was not enough information to vote it up or down. She and others then engaged in a month of fact-finding, and introduced a new resolution tonight, which was read into the record. The resolution that follows will be discussed and voted on at a public hearing on May 2, 2023.

The following information was taken into consideration:

- As a result of court actions between 1981 and 2008, homeless people in New York City have a permanent right to shelter. In January 2023, a record high 70,525 people slept in NYC Department of Homeless Services (DHS) shelters, an increase of 51% since the start of 2022.
- New Yorkers experiencing unsheltered homelessness are a uniquely challenging segment of the homeless population to engage. Efforts to aid this population require persistent and compassionate outreach, and dedicated services including: stabilization beds, safe havens, and drop-in-centers which are tailored to meet their needs.
- CB7/M's Capital Budget Priorities for several years have included a request for a safe haven which meets "best practices for the population being served" and provides housing for no more than 50 individuals in mostly single and double rooms.
- The New York City budget has allocated \$300 million a year beginning in FY23 to address unsheltered homelessness.
- DHS has selected 106-108 West 83rd Street as the site for a safe haven. Previously, this site was used by the DHS as a shelter annex for homeless men for over 10 years. The buildings are in the final stages of being refurbished for use as a safe haven.
- Community Board 7 was first informed of DHS's selection of the site in February 2023.
- DHS has selected Breaking Ground, an experienced non-profit service provider, to operate this safe haven in addition to five other safe havens it manages in other neighborhoods of the City.
 - The safe haven will be equipped with on-site services including: health and mental health services, case management specialists and other professional staff and resources to provide wraparound support to help stabilize the lives of individuals as they transition off the street and move on to permanent housing.
 - The planned staffing ratio is approximately 1 staff to every 2 residents.
 - Breaking Ground has agreed to organize a Community Advisory Board for the safe haven, including: representation from CB7, local elected officials, resident associations, NYPD 20th Precinct, schools and community based organizations.
 - It is the practice in Breaking Ground facilities that whenever residents re-enter the building they undergo a search to prevent the introduction of weapons, alcohol and drugs.
 - Breaking Ground has offered to maintain and publicize a phone line that the public may use if serious issues arise.

- Breaking Ground will coordinate with DHS's HOME-STAT outreach teams, managed by Goddard Riverside, a member of the Manhattan Outreach Consortium assigned to homeless outreach on the Upper West Side.
 - Street homeless individuals will have access to a bed in the safe haven only if referred by a HOME-STAT outreach team.
 - In many cases, outreach teams have extended contact with and understanding of the needs of those they refer.
 - Outreach teams reserve beds for those they refer and check that the client has no record of a criminal offense that requires residence restriction under New York State law.
- The site will prioritize services for vulnerable unsheltered homeless in the Community District and nearby areas of Manhattan.
- Breaking Ground data comparing the number of 311 street homeless complaints in nearby neighborhoods six months before the opening of a safe haven and six months following opening show a significant decline.
- The announced capacity of the safe haven is 108 residents to be served in a mix of single, double, triple and quadruple rooms. Men and women will reside on separate floors.
- A reduction of the planned capacity of the safe haven to 84 residents would permit all clients to be housed in single and double rooms.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/M **supports** the establishment of the planned Safe Haven at 106-108 West 83rd Street with Breaking Ground as its service provider subject to a significant reduction in the maximum number of beds below the current announced plan to serve 108 residents. Reducing the available beds to no more than 84 in single and double rooms would allow the safe haven to attract and serve its target population and minimize negative interactions among residents who may be struggling with addictions.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT CB7/M **requests** that cubicles be created to provide privacy for residents where single rooms are not available, as many residents are likely to have chosen street life after negative experiences in congregate shelters.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT CB7/M **strongly urges** DHS, Breaking Ground, the NYPD 20th Precinct and the PS 9, Center School, and Brandeis Campus communities to work together to develop safety protocols to ensure the safety of students, families, school personnel and the public in the immediate area.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT CB7/M **requests** that the DHS provide notice to community boards of the opening of a homeless facility in the district when construction permits for a site are filed and a minimum of 60 days before opening (rather than the 30 days notice that is current practice). The gathering of information to inform and engage the public and address concerns requires a longer lead time.

Be it further resolved that CB7/M **requests** that DHS consider close proximity to schools as a strong indicator of inappropriate location in the siting of safe havens.

District Manager's Report: Max Vandervliet, District Manager, announced the following:

- Updates concerning revised practices regarding our District Needs and working with the city. Both OMB and DCP are taking a different approach to be more flexible and work with us to achieve our needs. This should lead to better outcomes for us.
- Jessie will be reaching out to co-chairs regarding placing, retrieving and receiving Minutes of committee meetings and resolutions in our shared Google Drive, in an effort to help the board be more efficient.
- Our extension for remote meetings has not yet been extended past April 23, 2023.

Minutes from last month's Full Board meeting: The board approved the Minutes from the March 7, 2023 Full board meeting.

VOTE: 35-0-2-0.

Community Session: (started at 6:50PM live; 22:08 for YouTube viewing)

The following people from the public spoke during this portion of the meeting:

1. Nicole Metzger: Requested information about two temporary shelters she heard about from a "source" containing 500 beds, located between West 87th and 88th Streets.
2. Maxine DeSeta: Asked for consideration for residents re: redesign of West 103rd Street.
3. Megan Martin: Identified herself as Metzger's "source," having received information from CM Brewer re: the two shelters, which she is against and complained about the lack of transparency.

4. Allison Torsiglieri: Expressed support for the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
5. Jack Bernatovicz, Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts, announced upcoming programming and events.
6. Steve Anderson, UWS Coalition of Block Associations & Comm. Groups, requested a resolution for the Safe Haven be voted on prior to its opening.
7. Donna Grace: Lives on West 83rd Street and is against the Safe Haven on her block.
8. Sue Peters: Expressed concern about Jumbo 5G towers.
9. Rabbi Lauren Grabelle Herrmann from SAI: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
10. Anne Kemper: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
11. Cynthia Stuart: Works at Supportive Network and supports the Safe Haven.
12. Theodora Scarato: Works for Environmental Health Trust non-profit and discussed the dangers of 5G towers.
13. Maria Danzilo: Complained about lack of transparency re: West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
14. Caroline Schwab: Expressed support for the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
15. Wendy Blank: Is against the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
16. Pablo Zevallos: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
17. Chris O'Connor: Expressed concerns about perimeter plan for safety at PS9 because of the Safe Haven. Also discussed parking protocols at the 20th Precinct. *(He was referred to the Transportation Committee).*
18. Deborah Berkman: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
19. Vera Kolpakova: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
20. Erika Helgen: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
21. Gayle Meyer: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
22. Gayle Meyer: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
23. Gina Newman: Is against the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
24. Melanie Wesslock: Is against the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
25. Peter Arndtsen, Columbus-Amsterdam BID: announced upcoming events.
26. Roger Bernstein: Addressed bike issues re: 96th Street transverse.
27. Rotem Fix: Had questions about the new senior residence on 79th Street and lottery for low-income residents.
28. Lian Valera: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.
29. Karen Collins: Supports the West 83rd Street Safe Haven.

Community Session, Elected Officials: *(18:20 for YouTube viewing)*

The following people from the public spoke during this portion of the meeting:

1. Council Member Gale Brewer: Budget, sirens, leaf blowers, archiving, batteries.
2. Assembly Member Linda Rosenthal *(started at 1:23:25 for YouTube viewing)*: State budget due April 1st got a 1-week extension. Numerous other items.
3. Senator Brad Hoylman-Sigal *(started at 1:29:35 for YouTube viewing)*: Trump indictment re: bill for installing cameras in courts, 432 bills across country attacking LGBTQ, and bill to make NY a safe haven and protect doctors.
4. Borough President Mark Levine *(started at 1:35 for YouTube viewing)*: Received 960 applications to Community Boards in Manhattan. Applicants should contact his office if they have not yet received email re: interviews. Also discussed right to counsel, sheds, scaffolding, trees.
5. Ankeith, Office of Assembly Member O'Donnell.
6. Hannah Weinerman, Office of Congress Member Jerrold Nadler.
7. Julia Maenza Office of the Manhattan District Attorney.

Business Session: *(started at started at 8:17PM live; 1:35:40 for YouTube viewing)*

Transportation Committee, Andrew Albert and Mark Diller, Co-Chairpersons

1. **33 West 89th Street** (Columbus Avenue – Central Park West.) Petition for a New Revocable Consent EIN #13-3272914 to DOT to construct, maintain and use proposed stoop/steps and storage area, including trash enclosure.

VOTE: 37-0-0-0.

2. **Re: East-West Bike Network** *(links to the [fieldwork](#))*

Note that Susan Schwartz asked for an amendment to the resolution to change the word 'proposal' to 'study', which passed the board:

VOTE: 26-9-3-0.

Ken Coughlin later asked for an amendment to reverse the first one, which was voted on and failed:
VOTE: 15-19-4-0.

As these were procedural motions, they were not debated.

Community Session: Public speakers on above Resolution: (started at 2:03:49; for YouTube viewing)

- | | | |
|---------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|
| 1. Barak Friedman | 12. Kate Brockwehl | 23. Daniel Hanggi |
| 2. Nick Ross | 13. Sandra Voss | 24. Andrew Rosenthal |
| 3. Oliver Niu | 14. Asher Lasday | 25. Hindy Schachter |
| 4. Trevor Sheade | 15. Brennan Carley | 26. Meghan Brady |
| 5. Emily Povich | 16. Melodie Bryant | 27. Michael van der Kloor |
| 6. Alan Mooiman | 17. Erik Malzolf | 28. Sproule Love |
| 7. Justin Levine | 18. Laura Piraino | 29. Giuseppi Tellini |
| 8. Deborah Kerzhner | 19. Joshua Pinkerton | 30. Hans Mohrmann |
| 9. David Southorn | 20. Dale Hall | 31. David Vassar |
| 10. Carl Mahaney | 21. Emily Brady | 32. Andrea Pedersen |
| 11. Carol Maisonnet | 22. Janet Liff | |

The following facts and concerns were taken into account in arriving at our conclusions:

Community Board 7 prioritizes safety for everyone who travels within our community, including those walking, riding bicycles, using public transportation, and operating motor vehicles.

Safe, dedicated protected bike lanes are an important element of a sustainable urban plan because they increase safety for all street users and separate different modes of using our streets.

This resolution requests a study for the creation of a network of east-west protected bike lanes within CB7's District. The study aimed at a proposal to install east-west protected bike lanes is limited to the mapped streets on the Upper West Side. It is not intended to address any actual or potential roads, paths or other routes in or through any mapped public parks in or adjacent to Community District 7/Manhattan (such as Central, Riverside, Dante, Verdi Square, Theodore Roosevelt or Straus Parks).

Protected cycling networks provide significantly more safety than painted bike lanes.

The current east-west bike routes within Community District 7 include only painted bike lanes on 110th, 106th, 91st, 90th, 78th, and 77th Streets. Such painted lanes provide only a minimal level of protection and are often blocked by double-parked delivery and private vehicles.

Field surveys of the existing painted bike lanes as well as other potential alternatives for east-west protected bike lanes reveal that there are many competing uses for street space, including bus transit routes, residential and commercial loading zones, sites with potentially high-volumes of pedestrian or vehicular traffic, institutions with high volumes of access and egress or special needs populations, commercial uses such as Open Dining structures, and metered and alternate side parking.

While no one solution will likely work in every instance, it is essential that the existing north-south protected bike network be connected to an east-west network as an element of greater safety for all on our streets. Ideally an east-west protected bike route would be available approximately every 10 blocks on the Upper West Side.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7 Manhattan **requests** that the New York City Department of Transportation present to Community Board 7 a detailed study which CB7 will evaluate for further action for an all-ages-and-abilities network of fully protected east-west bike lanes with appropriate pedestrian refuges and protections approximately every 10 blocks between 60th and 110th Streets.

VOTE: 34-2-1-0.

Business & Consumer Issues Committee, Christian Cordova and Benjamin Wu, Co-Chairpersons

3. New applications to the SLA for two-year liquor licenses:

152 Columbus Avenue (West 66th – 67th) Maman Lincoln Center, LLC d/b/a Maman.

429 Amsterdam Avenue (West 80th – 81st) Maman UWS, LLC d/b/a Maman.

New and Temporary Retail Permit Applications

4. 2012 Broadway (West 68th – 69th Streets) New and Temporary Retail Permit application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license by HDMS Food, LLC d/b/a Zizi.

5. East 72nd Street at Park Drive a/k/a Central Park Lake. New and Temporary Retail Permit application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license by Legends Boathouse, LLC d/b/a TBD.

6. **710 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 94th – 95th) New and Temporary Retail Permit application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license by Chelsea House UWS I, Inc. dba To Be Determined.

7. **2756 Broadway** (West 106th) New and Temporary Retail Permit application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license by Broadway Lily, LLC d/b/a TBD.

Bundled VOTE for items 3-7: 30-0-0-0.

Preservation Committee, K Karpen and Madge Rosenberg, Co-Chairpersons

8. **254 West 88th Street** (Broadway - West End Avenue.) **Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a certificate of appropriateness for a rooftop addition and the elimination of an existing rear L extension and the creation of a full-width rear addition.**

This application is based on the following facts:

The subject building is 3-story plus basement townhouse constructed ca. 1884 in the Renaissance Revival style by architect Nelson M. Whipple. It is included in the Riverside Drive – West End Historic District. The front façade is primarily composed of rusticated stone on the second and third floors. The ground and parlor floors have been significantly altered with a stucco façade and a ground floor storefront infill that for years has housed a hardware and lumber retail operation. The stoop was removed pre-designation, and the main entrance is through a ground floor doorway.

Front Façade

- The building is being repurposed from mixed commercial and residential to entirely residential occupancy on all residential floors.
- The applicant's proposal as originally presented to CB7's Preservation Committee at its March 9, 2023 meeting called for replacement of the existing ground floor storefront infill with picture windows and a metal-frame doorway.
- Based on colloquy at that meeting, including review of a drawing of the building's historic façade that the applicant indicated had been previously unknown to them, the applicant agreed to the following modifications to the front façade plan (subject to LPC approval):
- The façade of the ground and parlor floors will be clad in rusticated stone in place of the existing stucco surface to match the historic stone surface still in place at the second and third floors of the building;
- The ground floor fenestration and main entrance door will change from the proposed picture windows and metal doorway to fenestration and a main entrance door that replicate to the greatest extent possible the rendering of the original condition of this building, as depicted in the drawing, which had been included in an advertisement for the sale of this building in 1891.

Rear Façade and Extension

- The existing condition is a brick façade on the main surface and an L-extension at the ground and parlor floors. The existing fenestration includes a column of paired 1:1 double-hung windows enclosed in large openings with curved brick detail above, and with smaller punched windows in a parallel column. There is corbelling brick detail at the rear roof line. The application proposes a full-width brick extension on the ground, parlor and second floors with the roof of the proposed extension forming a terrace above, a balcony extension with a stair to the garden, and a second balcony. The proposed rear façade maintains the current punched window configuration and brick detail, and it retains the corbelling at the roof line. The proposal also includes removal of existing rear yard sheds used by the former commercial tenant, making the rear yard open and able to be used.

Rooftop Addition

- The proposal also calls for a rooftop addition set back significantly from the front and rear facades. The proposed rooftop addition is not visible except through an alleyway between the subject building and its neighbor to the east, from which it is significantly visible. The proposed addition will align with the LPC-approved rooftop addition at the adjacent building to the west.
- The façade of the proposed addition will be clad in stucco, with a door leading to the roof at the rear and sliding doors leading to the roof at the front. The revised proposal for the front façade to which the applicant agreed during the Preservation Committee meeting, as well as the proposed full-width rear yard addition that retains the existing brick surface and punched windows with curved brick detail and also retains the brick corbelling at the rear roof line, and the modest rooftop addition, are respectively appropriate to the character of the Historic District. CB7 strongly recommends the addition of a tree in

the cleared rear yard, which would enhance the appropriateness of the overall proposal and would mitigate environmental concerns about the proposed entirely paved rear yard.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/Manhattan resolves to **approve** the proposed modifications to the front façade (as modified per agreement with the Owner at the March 9, 2023 at the Preservation Committee meeting), the proposed reconfigured rear yard addition, including its façade and terraces, and the modest rooftop addition as respectively appropriate to the character of the Historic District. CB7 further recommends that the applicant plant at least one mature tree in the rear yard area.

VOTE: 26-3-0-0.

There was no New Business and no Old Business. A motion was made and seconded to adjourn the meeting at 10:09PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Barbara Adler & Linda Alexander, Co-Secretaries
April 5, 2023*

HOUSING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Louisa Craddock and Tibita Kaneene, Co-Chairpersons

April 10, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

Present: Louisa Craddock and Tibita Kaneene, Co-Chairs; Miranda Goodwin-Raab, Ira Mitchneck, Seema Reddy, Melissa Rosenberg, Polly Spain and Howard Yaruss. **Chair:** Beverly Donohue. **Non-Committee Board Member:** Barbara Adler.

- I. **Announcement new Co-Chair of Housing Committee Tibita Kaneene**
- II. **Powerpoint Presentation and Discussion**
 - Larry Woods Thatcher Tiffany presented information about various housing programs called “N.Y. Supportive Housing Network, N.Y. Housing for All and N.Y. Supportive Housing.”
 - Several committee members asked questions about the programs, “as of right” “the rezoning of the segments of the Upper Westside, J5 Tax Credit
- III. **New and Old Business**
 - Roberta Seemer reminded the committee members to work on the District Needs Statement

Meeting ended at 7:26pm

*Minutes written and submitted by:
Polly Spain - Committee Member*

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Andrew Albert and Mark Diller, Co-Chairpersons

April 11, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

The Meeting can be viewed in its entirety on YouTube at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n2wEU_IOZd0

The Transportation Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met on Tuesday, April 11, 2023, via the Zoom platform. The meeting was called to order at 6:32 pm by co-Chairs Andrew Albert and Mark Diller. Participating were Committee Members Jay Adolf, Alex Bell, Elizabeth Caputo, Ken Coughlin, Doug Kleiman, Andrew Rigie, and Howard Yaruss, and non-Committee Board Members Barbara Adler, Bev Donohue (Board Chair), Seema Reddy, Susan Schwartz and Roberta Semer. Also participating were Max Vandervliet (District Manager) of the CB7 District Office.

The following matters were discussed and actions taken:

Re: Secondary Street Renaming in Honor of Desiree (Didi) Ford: Northeast Corner of West 94th Street at Amsterdam Avenue.

Presentation by Maria Nunziata.

- Didi Ford worked at the Riverpark Nursery School at 711 Amsterdam Avenue (adjacent to the proposed location) from 1969 until her retirement in 2012 (and continuing thereafter as a volunteer at the school).
- Ms. Ford progressed from an assistant teacher to master teacher to School Director.
- Her efforts touched the lives of over 1,000 children over her tenure.
- Ms. Ford advocated for inclusiveness in early childhood education, including supporting and encouraging families to accept their children's developing capabilities at each child's own pace. She was a champion of individuality and enriched the lives of children and their families.
- She infused music into all aspects of curriculum, reaching and nurturing the differing learning styles of the children in her charge.

Community and Committee Comments:

Max:

- Confirmed that the requisite petition signatures and materials required by CB7's secondary street renaming guidelines had been received prior to the meeting.
- Related the fond recollections of Ms. Ford by Alexandra Crawford of the Cb7 District Office Staff.

Ken:

- While respecting the contributions to the community by Ms. Ford, on-going concerns relate to the use of secondary street namings to memorialize such individuals.
- Also concern that there are many individuals deserving of recognition in our community, and secondary street renamings do so on a first-come/first-served basis.

Barbara:

- Secondary street renamings are an appropriate and enriching way to remember special people in our community.

Resolution to approve the secondary street renaming application: After deliberation, the resolution was adopted.

Vote: *Committee: 5-0-4-0; Non-Committee Board Members: 5-0-0-0.*

Re: 43 West 74th Street (Central Park West - Columbus Avenue). Application for a Revocable Consent for the restoration of a stoop entrance to a townhouse.

Presentation by Loren Cannon, RA

- Restoring the front facade of a townhouse, including replication of the stairs and stoop to the parlor floor of a townhouse.
- The correct procedure is for the Department of Transportation to issue a revocable consent to use a portion of the sidewalk for the stoop/stairs.
- The CB7 Preservation Committee and the Landmarks Preservation Commission have previously approved the design and materials for the proposed stair/stoop.

Resolution to approve the application for a revocable consent. After deliberation, the resolution was adopted.

Vote: *Committee: 8-0-0-0; Non-Committee Board Members: 5-0-0-0-0.*

Re: Discussion of the 96th Street/Broadway Head House and Subway Station.

Guest speaker: Gloria Christie, the Group Station Manager for this station.

- Ms. Christie is the Group Station Manager in charge of all stations on the No. 1 train line from 96th Street to 242nd Street/Van Cortlandt Park, as well as all stations on the A train line to 207th Street in Manhattan. MTA is committed to improving service at all aspects of the rider's experience.

Community and Committee Questions and Comments:

Alex:

- The 96 Street Station head house was beautiful and an innovative design when it was new, but it has aged.
- Images reflect rust on supporting beams and joists - with a concern for their function as well as aesthetics.
- The plaza leading from the head house to West 96th Street is often challenged with litter
A: The plaza is the jurisdiction of the Parks Department, not MTA.
- The architectural features of the head house resemble those used for the new No. 7 station at Hudson Yards – concern that the Hudson Yards station will similarly not age well.
Request: provide opportunities for CB7 Members and the public to volunteer to help beautify and correct some of the conditions observed.

Ms. Christie:

- Noting the problematic conditions.
- Grateful for the offer of volunteer help - while there may be limits on what types of work may be done by non-MTA employees, the willingness to collaborate and roll up sleeves is much appreciated.
- Station is painted on a pre-set schedule for maintenance and upkeep.

Jay:

- Q: Can anything be done about the sometimes oppressive heat on the station platforms during the summer?
- A: In years past, some stations had fans hanging from the rafters over the platform to provide at least minimal ventilation on hot days - provides some relief.
– will explore whether the fans are still functional or can be made operable.

Susan:

- Concern about rampant fare evasion. Appreciate the increased police and MTA presence at turnstiles, but apart from an observable presence, little ticketing or enforcement appears to be going on.

Alberto Rodan - Assistant Director - MTA Community Affairs

- Efforts are on-going.

Susan:

- Q: Compare dollar volume of MTA fare evasion to amounts lost due to obscured license plates.
- A: (Mark) Fare evasion is estimated to exceed \$500MM; lost revenue from obscured license plates estimated to be between \$75-100MM. Both are significant.

Doug:

- Fare evasion remains a significant issue both for the dollars lost and the morale of fare-paying riders.
- CB7 should include funding requests for the condition of the plaza and station in our District Needs Statement and Budget Requests.

Ken:

- Free public transit would facilitate greater ridership and add to achieving climate initiatives.
- Concern is how to pay for it.

Obscured License Plates Proliferating In the District.

Introduction:

- The use of devices to obscure license plates from being read by electronic means is proliferating in and around New York City.
- Obscuring license plates is done in a variety of ways, from placing opaque or polarized plastic covers over license plates, to manually scratching off the color from the embossed letters/numbers, to bending the plate so that it cannot be read from above or other angles.
- The result of these practices is that electronic readers such as red light, speed and bus lane cameras, as well as toll cameras on highways and bridges, cannot read a plate and generate a report to whom to send a ticket for an unpaid toll or fine.
- The same electronic reader technology is expected to play a part in Congestion Pricing when implemented.

Panel presentation and discussion among:

- NYS Senator Brad Hoylman-Sigal
- MTA Chief of Operations for Bridges and Tunnels Richard Hildebrand, joined by Joyce Mulvaney of the Operations Command, and Rose Pascone of MTA Public Affairs

- Eric Proshansky, Litigation Attorney with the New York City Law Department

Senator Hoylman-Sigal:

- Working on an equitable budget through negotiation.
- Appreciates the discussion of free transit – one means of offsetting the costs is hiding in plain sight – the unconscionable tax break given to Madison Square Garden.
- Estimates of dollars lost due to obscured or unreadable license plates ranges from \$75-100 Million.
- MTA is facing a \$600 Million deficit - closing that gap requires concerted efforts.
- Financing the MTA is a regional concern, not just a New York City issue.

Chief Hildebrand and Joyce Mulvaney:

- The purview of the Bridges and Tunnels Division of the MTA are the crossings under their command – the MTA has no oversight on other aspects of evasion of fines for red light or speed cameras.
- Through concerted enforcement efforts, the Operations Division has reduced the number of vehicles successfully evading tolls to approximately 1% of those crossing.
- The means by which Operations successfully targets toll evasion include methods that should not be disclosed.
- Bridge and tunnel tolls are a subset of the overall impact.
- MTA works closely with our law enforcement partners to capture the full impact of these measures.
- Fines for violating the law prohibiting the obscuring or removal of license plates were increased recently - MTA Operations endorsed and supported those efforts.
- In addition to toll or fare evasion, the obscuring of license plates can have an impact on Counter-Terrorism efforts.

Eric Proshansky:

- Attorney with the NYC Law Department. Works in the bureau that brings affirmative cases on behalf of the City (as distinguished from defending the City against cases brought with the City as defendant).
- City Hall has lent its voice to the call for methods to address the obscuring of license plates.
- Law Department has written cease and desist letters to large retailers located in the City demanding that they stop selling materials used to obscure license plates. This is a technique that has been employed with some success with other illegal products.
- The cease and desist letters have also been sent to retailers outside New York City, including websites, demanding that they not ship to addresses within the five Boroughs.
- Efforts have met with some success - local businesses have confirmed they will stop selling the materials, and many online retailers have confirmed the same.

Chief Hildebrand:

- Repeat violations of obscured license plate laws can result in the suspension of vehicle's registration, depending on the adjudication by the administrative law judge.
- Further increases of the penalties for violating the laws relating to obscured license plates are being proposed.

Eric Proshansky:

- With respect to internet retailers, the Law Department uses techniques similar to those to combat illegal or unlicensed cigarette sales.
- The methods include researching the internet registries for online sellers and using that information to locate the physical locations of these retailers as well as of the proprietors of those sellers.

Committee and Community Comments:

Jay:

- Key issue is the inability to enforce toll and fine evasion due to the undetectability of the violator.
- CB7 passed resolutions to enable enforcement of currently undetectable violators of other laws – calling for the registration and insurance by certain types of electronic bikes.
- Electronic bikes currently violate traffic laws and are similarly undetectable.
- Such registration could enhance fine collections and enrich City coffers.

Sen. Hoylman-Sigal:

- We don't yet have a handle on detectability of vehicles that are currently required to be registered before addressing expansion of registration to bikes.
- Concern includes the loss of funds from fines and penalties, as well as the loss of safety based on vehicles that are impervious to enforcement cameras.
- Concern that vehicles have the biggest safety impact on pedestrians, cyclists and other street users.

- As we build out cycling infrastructure, we must address safety from risks posed by all sources including cyclists. Making infrastructure work for all such as the network of cross-town bike lanes is an important step, but there is more to do.
- From a Statewide legislative perspective the time is not right for registration of bicycles.
- What does make sense is to address a loophole in the law that makes the penalties available for injuries to pedestrians struck by ebikes and scooters to be less than the same injury when caused by being struck by a car.
- That law should be changed so that the same injury results in the same penalty regardless of the nature of the vehicle that caused the injury.
- Introduced legislation in the Senate, with a parallel bill in the Assembly introduced by A-M Linda Rosenthal, to raise the insurance requirements for the companies that hire ebike delivery workers. The companies that are profiting from the work of the delivery people should be a part of the solution to safety concerns raised by their methods of delivery.
- Also co-sponsoring a bill with Senator Gounardes to empower citizen reporting of obscuring of license plates. Legislation is needed to enable individuals observing parked cars to record and report violations of the laws against obscured license plates.
- The bill is based on other City initiatives allowing for citizen reporting for violations such as the anti-idling regulations. It would be a new chapter for State enforcement.
- The incentive includes sharing a portion of the fines collected from such enforcement efforts with the citizens doing the reporting.
- Also supporting measures currently before the Legislature to increase the fines for violating the laws against obscuring or using fraudulent license plates. The current fines are insufficient to create a disincentive to use such techniques.

Doug:

- Concern for a friend and neighbor whose license plate was illegally duplicated, with the result that fines assessed against the duplicator were charged to her account.
- Defeats the purpose of license plates to identify the perpetrators of unsafe conduct.

Angela Gordon

- Victim of duplicated plates.
- On-going nightmare of challenging violations of which notice was not received because of the fraud.
- Safety as well as a personal credit problem.
- Concern for those who did not learn of the problem or who would not be able to dispute the violations as she has.

Alex:

- Q: Chief Hildebrand - with so many provisions of the VTL, how does the enforcement unit determine which activities to target for triage/limited enforcement resources?
- A: Chief Hildebrand - it begins with mission-driven initiatives for safety.
- MTA Enforcement looks for trends in violations as well as those matters that have the greatest impact on safety.
- Also limited by the availability of personnel for enforcement.
- In part enforcement responds to the squeaky wheel theory, but following safety trends overrides decisions. For example, if the units see an uptick in cell phone use by drivers, they will prioritize those unsafe habits for enforcement.

Howard:

- Concern that the criminal penalties for evading tolls and speed cameras and the like are lower than those for transit fare evasion.
- Not advocating for lowering transit consequences, but for increasing tolls and electronic detection to match.

Ken:

- Q: If an unreadable plate goes through a toll plaza, is the unreadability immediately detected?
- A: No - but MTA enforcement does have strategies to catch some of those situations in real time.

Proposed Resolution, Text on the website.

Ken:

- Per Chief Hildebrand, should add that the new legislation should empower MTA to confiscate the offending materials used to obscure the license plate.
– adopted.

Jay:

- Concern for late notice of draft of resolution.
- Should have been posted earlier.
- Inappropriate to vote on this now.

- Max:
- District Office asked for the text of the resolution yesterday.
- Mark:
- Wanted the resolution to grow organically from the panel discussion, but upon request the day before the meeting, drafted the proposal to provide language to which to react.
 - Not inappropriate, and in fact is consistent with the advice of the Borough President's office and with prior actions at CB7.
- Doug:
- Latest learning is that we have more flexibility than thought with respect to advance notice of resolutions.
- Alex:
- Q: Shouldn't the resolution include a call for enhanced enforcement of existing laws already on the books in addition to the requests for enhanced fines and enforcement opportunities?
 - A: (Mark) prefer to focus this resolution on addressing the structural needs to make this behavior not cost-effective. If fines amount to a slap on the wrist compared to the savings from evading tolls and fines, the law does not provide an effective disincentive.
 - A: (Andrew) This will be an even greater concern when the same technology is used in connection with Congestion Pricing.
- Doug:
- Add calls for confiscation of materials used to obscure license plates.
– accepted.
- Howard:
- Make penalties for evading tolls and fines equivalent to transit fare evasion.
- Ken:
- Agree.
– added.
 - Also should add support for bill about to be introduced that would address the use of out-of-state temporary tags that can be fraudulently created.
 - A: (Mark) - hard to offer support for a bill that hasn't been introduced.
- Jay:
- Should add a provision reciting that CB7 passed 2 resolutions calling for registration and insurance requirements for certain categories of e-bikes and scooters.
 - A: (Mark) - agree to add as a "whereas" clause.
 - Should be an additional "therefore" clause.
 - A: (Mark) - accepted as "whereas" since a call for penalties for enforcement against obscured license plates cannot relate to vehicles that are not yet required to have license plates.
 - Disagree - will add as a motion at full Board.
 - Also propose to remove references to call for bystander enforcement.
 - A: (Mark) not accepted as friendly.
 - Disagree - will add as a motion at full Board.

Question Called:

After deliberation, the resolution was adopted. Vote: *Committee: 7-1-0-0; Non-Committee Board Members 0-0-0-0.*

New Business

Howard:

- DoT owes CB7 responses on a list of resolutions dating back several years.
- CB7 worked hard on those matters and should receive a response.

NYPD Parking

- Concern for straight-in parking at the Precinct - limits sidewalk access.

Elizabeth:

- Concern for impact on the ability of Community Board to attract new members who are diverse in terms of gender, age and parenting status when Committee meetings run as long as this one.

Adjourn: 9:00 pm

BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Joshua Cohen and Benjamin Wu, Co-Chairpersons

April 12, 2023 at 6:30 PM via ZOOM

The Meeting can be viewed in its entirety on YouTube at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=S4MF8_SVzqg

Business & Consumer Issues Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met via the Videoconferencing application Zoom. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm by Co-Chairperson Joshua Cohen.

Committee Members Present: Joshua Cohen, Benjamin Wu, Christian Cordova, Doug Kleiman, Andrew Rigie (present for the first 15 minutes of the meeting; did not get to vote) and Anthony Thomas

Committee Members Absent: None

Non-Committee Members Present: Barbara Adler and Seema Reddy

Board Office: Maxwell Vandervliet

New and Temporary Retail Permit applications:

1. **975 Amsterdam Avenue (West 59th Street). New and Temporary Retail Permit application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license by 975 Amsterdam, Inc. d/b/a Spice.**

Presenting for the Applicant:

- The applicant did not show up.

*After due deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove without prejudice** was **adopted**.*

VOTE - Committee: 5-0-0-0. Non-Committee Board Members: 2-0-0-0.

2. **174 West 72nd Street (Amsterdam Avenue.) New applications to the SLA for two-year liquor licenses by 17 West 72nd Café, LLC d/b/a To Be Determined.**

Presenting for the Applicant: Carmel Galvin (Principal); Michael Nash (Principal) and Benjamin A. Korngut, Esq.;

- The location has been vacant for the last 10 years; prior to that it was an Irish Pub.
- Currently there are no residents adjacent to the location.
- The principals have over 20 years of combined experience managing and working in other restaurants and bars.
- The hours of operation will be 11 AM to 4 AM Mon-Sun.
- Will cater to hospitality industry people as well as other professionals and the local neighborhood by offering quality food especially in the 11 PM to 3 AM timeframe.
- No food deliveries, no outdoor seating and only recorded music in the background.
- Have received a lot of positive feedback from the industry.
- Their location did not qualify them to apply for a Temporary Retail Liquor License.
- Hope to be open by the end of the year.

Comments:

- Doug Kleiman – supports the application fully particularly since there is a dearth of quality food locations that open late at night.
- Barbara Adler, Benjamin Wu and Andrew Rigie also support the application.

*After due deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was **adopted**.*

VOTE - Committee: 5-0-0-0. Non-Committee Board Members: 2-0-0-0.

3. New business:

Comments:

- Doug Kleiman – reported that he and Benjamin Wu received an email from Kasirer requesting a meeting to discuss the 2330 Broadway (Wonder) Café Design. He is willing to meet with them and report back to the committee.
- Back in February the committee rejected a sidewalk café application for 2330 Broadway on the grounds that it amounted to a sidewalk café for private use with no access to the public at large. They provide food service for their residents.
- Christian Cordova indicated that because they are not a restaurant open to the public is not appropriate for them to have a sidewalk café under the Open Restaurants Program.

The meeting ended at 7:02 p.m.

BUDGET & STRATEGY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Roberta Semer and Anthony Thomas, Co-Chairpersons

April 18, 2023 at 4:00pm via Zoom

Present: Roberta Semer and Anthony Thomas, Co-Chairs; Blanch Lawton and Seema Reddy. **Board Office:** Max Vandervliet. **Presenters:** Cynthia Hornig and Council Member Gale Brewer, Jalissa Quigley (Council Member Shaun Abreu)

Meeting called to order at 4 pm

1. Jalissa Quigley said that Council Member Abreu is committed to improving the Happy Warrior playground, right-to-council to prevent evictions, and pre-k to 12th grade public school. Blanche Lawton led a discussion about The Bloomingdale's library's urgent need for the Children's section. The teen section recently opened. WSCHAH provides staff two days a week in Council Member Abreu's office. Funding is needed for food pantries and NY Community Fridges.
2. A discussion about possible budget cuts including libraries, public schools, SNAP benefits, and human services. Many 3-K and pre-K seats are open.
3. Cynthia Hornig explained the results from Participatory Budgeting. Council Member Brewer is committed to an accessible playground in the Joan of Arc Complex, the need to expand and enhance food assistance including SNAP benefits, broadband expansion in more NYCHA buildings. Council Member Brewer said that 78 million has been allocated for cameras and door locks for all elementary schools by next spring. She supports a public land trust to obtain more affordable housing. She also mentions a need for funds for the PS 191 playground, three playgrounds in Riverside Park, trees and tree guards, migrant child care, funding for seniors, schools and libraries.
4. Jalissa and Cynthia will get back to us with pending legislation.
5. Next steps: The Budget and Strategy committee will reach out to the committees to assist with their budget priorities and information from them for our District Needs Statement

The meeting adjourned at 5 pm.

STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Beverly Donohue, Chair

April 18, 2023 at 6:30PM via Zoom

The meeting can be viewed in its entirety on YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Rrb8Kjrkl7w>

Present: Beverly Donohue, Chair; Barbara Adler, Andrew Albert, Kristen Berger, Josh Cohen, Kevin Corte, Louisa Craddock, Sheldon Fine, Sonia Garcia, K Karpen, Natasha Kazmi, Doug Kleiman, Courtney Clark Metakis, William Ortiz, Seema Reddy, Susan Schwartz, Roberta Semer, Ethel Sheffer, Polly Spain; Benjamin Wu. **Absent:** Linda Alexander, Richard Asche, Mark Diller, Tibita Kaneene, Madge Rosenberg. **Non-Committee Board Members:** Ken Coughlin. Board Office: Maxwell Vandervliet and Jessie Nieves.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Beverly Donohue at 6:32 PM, who began as follows:

1. **Chair Update:**

- We are expecting new appointees from Borough President's office the first week in May, and will circulate to Board members our current committee assignments. Please notify the office (with a cc to the Chair) if you need corrections or if you want to change your committee. She will be capping committees at ten for new members. Transportation and Land Use are now grandfathered at eleven, but new members won't be added unless members leave.
- Members will be receiving an email regarding Zoom protocols for all Board members. This is intended to ensure we are courteous to the public and each other.
- The Chair received updated information from the BP's legal counsel regarding prior notice of resolutions for committee meetings. Richard Asche researched and provided two advisory opinion letters that the NYS Committee on Open Government sent to other organizations, and CB7, in turn, provided them to the BP's office. Based on them, the BP's legal counsel indicated that we have greater flexibility than her original guidance to us. She wrote: *"I fully agree that there is not a requirement that resolutions be drafted in advance of a public meeting. However, to the extent that a resolution is drafted and circulated to CB members in advance of a meeting, the CB ought to post such resolution in advance of the meeting upon request, in order to comply with section 103(e) of the Open Meetings Law"*.
- The weekend and day before the last full board, there were several requests for the office to circulate and post letters from Board members addressing a resolution on the agenda. The timing added to the overload that the office staff had to deal with to prepare for Full Board and was a huge amount of work behind the scenes. Going forward, time constraints will be enforced. Our bylaws allow for minority reports. Anyone who voted against a resolution in committee may submit a 'minority report' by Wednesday before the Full Board that will go out with the packet of Board materials on the Friday prior to the meeting. Any Board member who wishes to communicate to board members on an item after that date must do so without the help of the office staff.
- The **Full Board Meeting on May 2nd will start at 6:00** with a one-hour public hearing on the resolution for a Safe Haven at 83rd Street. Time will be limited, and we are posting a form within the next week on our website, so the public can submit written comments if they are concerned their views will not be heard in time. The resolution will also be posted early for the public to review.
- Yesterday, we received notice from FEMA of a Section 106 finding of an adverse effect to historic properties related to the 2-story plan from NYC Parks and EDC for a new dock house at the 79th Street marina. FEMA is seeking public comment. The dock house presentation, a comment form, and the FEMA letter will be posted to our website.

2. **District manager Update:** Max Vandervliet reported on the following:

- There is no word yet on whether the Open Meetings Law (OML) will be extended for another month, though he expects it likely will.
- Please reserve June 12th for a board get-together. Barbara, Linda and Max are working on finding a space, and are speaking to the AMNH about their Arthur Ross Terrace. No word yet, but save the date.
- The DM and our Strategy & Budget Committee, as well as both council member offices met just a few hours prior to this meeting, in preparation for budget priorities. This year, the OMB & DCP are taking a more proactive approach, sharing what some of their funding priorities are, in hopes of finding more common ground. A second

meeting in June will discuss what the board is planning to submit, and at that time, they'll provide recommendations on what has potential to receive funding and what projects do not.

- An update from co-chair of Strategy & Budget Roberta Semer: Roberta explained further that when we ask for *specific* items, we are more likely to get them. Her committee met with Council Member's Brewer's and Abreu's office and discussed very specific needs. They will be sending the committees and co-chairs guidelines for preparing their priorities, which must be submitted by June.

3. Chair Reports: (*begins at 14:28 into the YouTube presentation*) One chair from each of the nine standing committees gave a brief synopsis of what is coming up next month and the number of resolutions they are planning to bring to full board:

- **Housing Committee:** 0 resolutions to be presented at Full Board
- **Transportation Committee:** 3 resolutions to be presented at Full Board
- **Business & Consumer Issues Committee:** 2 resolutions to be presented at Full Board
- **Preservation Committee:** 2 resolutions to be presented at Full Board
- **Parks & Environment Committee:** 1 resolution to be presented at Full Board
- **Land Use Committee:** 1 resolution to be presented at Full Board
- **Youth Education Libraries Committee:** 1 resolution to be presented at Full Board
- **Health & Human Services Committee:** 0 resolution to be presented at Full Board
- **Public Safety Committee:** 0

Note that The Safe Haven resolution, which was postponed from last month's Full Board meeting will be voted on (with a public hearing preceding, as noted above).

4. Old Business: No old business.

5. New Business: Ken Coughlin raised the issue of what constitutes a Procedural Issue and what is not, a subject that was raised at last month's FB meeting; Beverly responded we must rely on our parliamentarian Richard Asche, and that she is also continuing to research Robert's Rules concerning this item; Susan Schwartz said the decision re when a procedural issue is a Chair's call; Barbara Adler raised a tech issue, concerning having gotten off a meeting prior to its ending, but viewing it later, still seeing her name there. Susan said the same thing happened to her at that meeting; and lastly, William Ortiz said to be sure to hit the 'Leave' button and shut down your computer when exiting Zoom.

With no further business, a motion to adjourn was seconded and the meeting ended at 7:08 PM

Respectfully submitted,
Barbara Adler & Linda Alexander, co-secretaries

SENIOR TASK FORCE MEETING MINUTES

April 20, 2023 at 10:00am via Zoom

Roberta Semer, Chair

Present: Roberta Semer, Chair, K Karpen, Madge Rosenberg, Daniela Breton (WSFSSH), Jennifer Cinclair (MMJCC), Marissa Falkoff and Samuel Sheldon (DOROT) Melissa Johnson-Bowen (Project Find), Lisa Beth Miller (Lighthouse), Johnathan Slon (LILY), Robin Strashun (Search and Care) and Shula Puder (Council Member Brewer).

1. Everyone introduced themselves.
2. Lisa discussed the virtual health fair that she attended last month. We discussed doing a virtual program where many of the organizations working with seniors will be able to present a brief presentation on the programs and services that they provide.
3. Shula Puder reported that they had a successful tech program for seniors in March and the next one will be in June in conjunction with DOROT, OATs and the Public Library.
4. Johnathan Slon reported that LILY has been working on several new initiatives including lunch programs for men, Spanish speaking program in West Harlem. He also spoke about the Geriatric Clinic at Mt Sinai/St Lukes, which needs funding.
5. Samuel Sheldon said that the intergenerational program has been successful. A new program will begin in June.
6. Jennifer Cinclair said that the JCC is holding an in-person health fair at the JCC with Mt Sinai.
7. Lisa Beth Miller spoke about the Lighthouse adult day care program and that space is still available. They are doing tele-support for children and parents and also tech support.
8. Robin Strashun discussed the need for doctors who accept Medicare, SNAP benefits and the the need to help seniors with access to pet food.

Next Meeting is Thursday, May 18th at 10:00 am

YOUTH, EDUCATION & LIBRARIES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Courtney Clark Metakis and Kristen Berger, Co-Chairpersons

April 20, 2023 at 7:00PM via Zoom

The Meeting can be viewed in its entirety on YouTube at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1Yj70XyLONo>

Present: Courtney Clark Metakis and Kristen Berger, Co-Chairs; Alex Bell, Audrey Isaacs, Ira Mitchneck, Michelle Parker and Seema Reddy. **Board Office:** Alex Crawford, Jessie Nieves and Max Vandervliet. **Guest Speaker:** Naveed Hasan, PEP

School-Related Updates

NH: PEP has to approve school relocations. One D3 thing is the merger that was proposed and approve merger of Lafayette and West Side Collaborative. Enrollment has been declining over the next 5 years and projected for next 10 years. For our District, projecting overall register declines based on pop declines of about 400. That's essentially losing an elementary school of kids every year. Schools budget comes from enrollment. A lot of discussion about whether that's appropriate or not. I happen to be a critic of that. As it is, if enrollment is declining becomes hard to run school with all the programming kids deserve. Then they come say you have to merge or close. People with kids can't afford to live here. Went to TX, FL, GA, and some to Long Island. We got data on that. Creates strong pressure on schools to be reconfigured.

Unfortunately, West Side Collaborative and Lafayette – not on the same page. Very different schools socio-economically and culturally, but was approved. Will be at 93rd street.

SR: Stats you mentioned, people having fewer kids over time, or study of people leaving.

NH: My understanding in this was done before COVID and asylum seeker families. A lot of things not in these studies. I've been recommending they commission the same company again. A lot more kids in the middle of the school year this year.

SR: Merger being forced by the DOE, or the schools request?

NH: My understanding is not the schools. This is the DOE, it's a fiscal decision. We've had 4 budget cuts for NYP Schools. Most recent are 2-3% each. Doesn't sound like much, but it's a lot when it comes to operating small schools. It's a problem in my opinion.

KB: West Side Collaborative. I heard concerns from that community about disappearing. In the past, not always true, but money helps. When we merged the middle school with Mott Hall II, we were able to leverage money earlier – got their Title 1 funding almost a year earlier than otherwise. Something we could advocate for?

NH: Think plan is to keep Title 1 status, so could suggest that – if they are intending to save money forever by consolidating admin costs, should sweeten the deal by allowing for extra money for staffing not just Title 1 money. Because WSC is saying – we already have Title 1 funding, what are we getting out of this. Thing that both communities are asking for is that both students continue to get the services they need thru staffing.

KB: asked concerns around special ed – OT/PT. Mandated so should go without saying, but not always the case.

NH: some people have been there since the beginning and have valid concerns. DOE is not being generous enough in my opinion. Lafayette was asking for more support for their language program, which the DOE never does. They asked for help on that to stabilize that program. CB7 could advocate for that.

KB: And electeds as well – because Gale was helpful on last merger.

NH: Move of West Side HS – I'm opposed. The new building is a commercial building. This is being done at request of downtown planning. We went to walkthrough in both building. Current building is custom built for transfer school, has a childcare center on first floor which is only legal place. New building is 6 -12 floors, so can't put childcare system there.

Inside their transfer high school, and then they have a full size, athletic facilities where they have challenged sports teams, including basketball, where they win regularly, which is one of the main ways they maintain their student population, attract and retain students who have gone through 3, 4, 5, different high schools, and finally landed a place that provides them with care and services, and gives them a place where they actually graduate. Having this school in the neighborhood, this school's presence there creates safety. It allows the kids who live in the neighborhood to have amenities they normally wouldn't have to make room for young women's leadership academy, but we can find facility that's more targeted to them vs. a transfer school. Gale Brewer and maybe 6,7 wrote a letter against this. We are pushing for them to stop, pull this permanently, and find a new home for young women's leadership school at one of the schools that, so Ascension is closing in the summer. Harlem Hebrew is closing in the summer, and there's another Catholic school up in Central Harlem.

KB: Just to clarify myself biased for the committee. There is currently a charter middle school in the Harlem Hebrew Building, or part of it, and my feeling from working in middle schools in the district is that, should a Charter Middle School expand, it would have negative enrollment repercussions for our district middle schools.

CM: Let's to asylum seekers, if you could, and the update us on the kids in our district.

NH: We got Project Open Arms money for those who arrived in NYC from August-January or Feb. So if you're probably school that kids then, and they're new to the shelter system as students in temporary housing. And there are more than 5 students in your school. There will be \$2,000 per student allocated to your school. So let's say you have 6 asylum seekers and they're all new in the shelter system and new in the public schools. That's \$12,000, and so on. So there are some schools that have hundreds of them 120, and they got an extra \$200,000, which is great because it helped really hire some staff to address the intersection of needs that all of these students have housing employment for the parents. Immigration related things everything, winter, close.

The spreadsheet is now sort of retired, because it was based on a school allocation memorandum. Budget, allocation and spending deadlines have come and gone.

I think it was a couple of weeks ago where the last time you could reallocate, not just to actually spend that money. So they're not adding any more money to school budgets, even though schools might still be getting a new asylum seeker students. We are funding about 420 asylum seekers, students in our district, 3 schools, but just based on a head count that we got from PTAs and school parent coordinators. There's at least 750 students in the district, so for part of that number, their presence here is not funded by the city. Hopefully, the school budgets can absorb that those needs. They will be fully funded as part of fair student funding if they are still at their schools, on October 31st, 2023.

NH: Needs for Budget Priorities: Depends on when they arrive. In the beginning they need rudimentary – clothes, etc. If the students have been here for more than that, start to get into where are they academically. Hasn't been addressed. Almost all of the students have interrupted formal education, need to get them designated as such, so they get the services to which they are entitled legally. Some students have missed years. DOE only looks at their year of birth, so then the whole class is unable to function. Some rumors I heard that it would be more helpful to place kids where they are developmentally. Thing is to address learning loss – this is the same situation as our kids.

Oh, I skipped over one thing – in the middle – social emotional stability. We really need Spanish speaking social workers and psychologists in the schools. Because we have waves of people arriving fairly regularly, we have to keep going back and doing it all over again. Meeting regularly on FAQ, elected officials, JCC, etc. Interrupted education, legal advice.

YN: PS 145 has dual language programs, but at MSC one of the challenges is the teachers don't have the materials for the kids. How do we provide?

NH: Because the \$ for dual language doesn't come from the DOE, it comes from school budget. So schools without it don't have the budget allocated for it. How do you change in the middle of the school year? Some schools are using parents

who can come in in middle of the day who speak Spanish. Now half are in schools that have no dual language or ENL with Spanish. So that's a lot of kids (from these families) in English-only speaking schools.

KB: Curious about the distribution. Worry HS students float because they don't have a natural district. Who's keeping an eye on HS students?

NH: Spoke to Ted Leather – seem to be sending all the HS kids to a school called New Arrivals, that school has doubled in size. I don't know if the space is there, but they were a Spanish transitional high school, and so they've been using the fact that high school students in New York tend to travel all around the city to really send the kids. They're running out of room, too. District 2 is just disproportionately affected by this issue, because the hotels in New York City are either near the airports or in midtown, and so midtown is all District 2 and Midtown West particularly is has I think 20 or 30 hotels being used as sanctuary shelters, and these are the shelters where they're placing family groups so all the students are living there. And so district 2 has 0 Spanish language programs. It's a gigantic district, with no multilingual programs and they're suddenly caught in a position where they need the most of them. Going forward, they actually, have a legal right to remain at their school and be provided with transportation. So we're trying to tell the DOE and this office department of social and homeless services to make sure that they keep this in mind when they're moving families around. And they've stopped. They actually had one big wave of families moving from a set of hotels August, September. And in October of November they moved everyone to Midtown, and I think they're sticking with midnight until either they run out of money or credit pay for the hotels. So anyone who had students before November first 2022 will see it in their June budget for next year, and then everybody. All the school principals will see it for the mid year adjustment that comes at the end of this calendar year.

Also an update to FSF which adds significant amount to students in temp housing, and also to schools with high level of poverty. The 2nd part will affect our Harlem schools in a good way, and then the first will hit soon.

CM: So, just to kind of summarize as we think about for the budget priorities, we're being asked to be very, very specific and targeted this year. I'm wondering whether we think this should be about asking for these things kind of generally, or are there schools in particular which we think will need very specific things? I'm thinking of this because of Jesse said about the schools that don't have the programs in place for things like requests for funding for materials. I'm wondering whether we want to be really specific in that, or whether it's we think it's okay to be general.

NH: So we can actually directly ask a lot of the school parent leaders that are working specifically on on the asylum seeker refugee issues. How many numbers of students they have, and what they still are unmet needs. I'm still worried about just buying material in Spanish for the schools that have no staff that can actually use it. If we could ask to address staffing needs?

CM: We've asked in the past, so we can do it.

NH: Yeah, yeah, so for schools like getting that Spanish speaking staff is the number one problem, not just teachers, but also like the social case workers with their case work as much as they're handling all of their family's issues around being in the situation.

IM: A lot of public agencies have hard time hiring, and once we find someone the bureaucracy of getting someone through the hiring system, you may be fortunate to have them in the middle of august. First problem is identifying people, 2nd is getting them on board. I know years ago the DOE recruited staff with Spanish capacity from overseas, is that a possibility or do the people we're looking for now exist in NYC it's just a matter of identifying them and getting them to shift over.

NH: Getting teachers, especially non-English speaking ones, into NYC schools has been a pain because licensing requirements and processes are really slow. Getting people from a foreign country is even harder. We have millions of

Spanish speakers in the country who are Spanish speakers, but you're still right – it's a 4-month period for background checks. Can we get service providers that speak Spanish or Ukrainian or Russian, to provide services that are not in-class services. Because a CBO will be much more time efficient. And using the CBOs, I honestly like as much as we can use private organizations to come in and do the work.

KB: I think the CBOs are a great idea, because even though they're not formal, academic, a lot of CBOs do offer tutoring, they do offer social emotional support. They do offer things like legal advice, so it is like a little kind of niche that they could fill, that it would be better if the students had that throughout their school day. But if they don't right now, that's a way to start to address it.

NH: If you can make one of the budget priorities to fund the CBOs that would be

Seema: Can we pre-identify CBOs?

NH: Yeah. So the first people you should contact is Andrew Heinrich and Bethany Thorne at Project Russo

KB: What about expanding the scope of some of the CBOs that are already in the schools like Harlem children's zone? If they added this to some of their services, that they provide, they're already in the school. They already have that relationship.

NH: Yeah, so I would love to do that specifically for addressing the academic instructional loss for the students. If we could go in and provide them with resources, like, you know, to provide Spanish speaking instruction. Maybe, let's say, and this would be a quick way to get Spanish teacher or not. It doesn't even have to be a teacher, someone that can help the students do homework. And then maybe some social emotional support, because that's usually one of the functions of the after school programs and all of the CBOs that are in schools is to provide a safe and healthy environment for the kids to be able to do actual academic work. So those 2 things I wouldn't put any legal work through the. And we know we have that list right. Every school has their set 1 or 2 or 3 depending on the number of co-located school in the building, of CBOs that work with them.

It's a 4 month background check and getting into the school period. So this is the time that we have to get started on that I'll pull like sort of come up with maybe an alternative solution like, let's say, we don't want teachers. Can we get service providers that speak Spanish or that speak Ukrainian or Russian to come into schools and provide services that are not directly in class services, because some of them would be very immediately beneficial, and it would be much faster right to get a CBO into a school that already has, like a Y.M.C.A.

if you can address, make one of the budget priorities actually identifying and recognizing and funding these cbo's, it would be the most impactful.

So the first people you should contact is Andrew Heinrich and Bethany Thorne at Project Rousseau. You've probably seen them at the Zoom Meetings. They have been doing amazing work, and inside our schools and inside our local churches, the synagogue where they go in and hold recently, and the consultation meetings for all the families to do legal services, they know all of the sort of dimensions that need.

KB: What about expanding the scope of some of the CBOs that are already in the schools like Harlem Children's Zone? If they added this to some of their services, that they provide, they're already in the school. They already have that relationship.

NH: Yeah, so I would love to do that specifically for addressing the academic instructional loss for the students. If we could go in and provide them with resources, like, you know, to provide Spanish speaking instruction maybe, this would be a

quick way to get Spanish teacher or not. It doesn't even have to be a teacher, someone that can help the students do homework, for example, and then maybe some so it's your emotional support to, because that's usually one of the functions of the after school programs and all of the CBOs that are in schools is to provide a safe and healthy environment for the kids to be able to do actual academic work.

Summer Rising Updates: This might be the last year based on Covid funding, expiring, but they finally got it down to a better way of admitting people students into the program. It's based on priority groups. So it'll be students that have a mandatory summer school go in first and then students that are in temporary housing, which pretty much will cover all of our asylum seekers and refugees. We'll get the second priority and then students, and then I think it's combined with this. If it's your home school, and if and if you're already involved in the app after school program of that school, that also gets you in.

New business

SR: Budget and Strategy meeting: one thing that came up Blanche was at that meeting, and she brought up the public library, both as a potential capital and operating budget priority. I was hoping to put that on your radar as well both in terms of the budget cuts, and then the capital project was potentially, I think, redoing the basement room has been in our DNS for quite some time.

CM: I think we definitely will need some library pieces in there given the cuts. The basement has been kind of an evergreen at this point. I think the one challenges the basement is that we haven't really decided what could be done with it, and so I worry a little bit about putting it in there without a clear call out for that. But again, I think that's something Roberta can probably help us think through.

IM: The other problem is if you don't have the operating funds, nobody will give you the capital funds. That's the problem because why build something you can't staff and right now they're basically cutting the operating funds on.

KB: But I believe there also is a smaller capital ask that was just like refurbishing and tidying up the top floor at Bloomingdale, which seems like a pretty, small, very straightforward ask, and doesn't require any staffing that's not already there. We know that the staffing is going to be an issue.

CM: I think the question and this may be something that we can't deal with until we get a little closer in the summer. You remember that we talked about the fact that last year we got the library info pretty late is what the actual like we've heard kind of the implication that they're going to have to cut hours or cut staff and cut programming, but I wonder if we won't have kind of the specifics. We might not have the specifics of that until we get a little further along, and in which case we can put some placeholders in, and then just kind of flag.

IM: There is a way of framing it, because, while you can put money in for operations and get it in 6 months and have the employees in 9 or months, or 12 months capital project, you fund, and it usually takes you a year to start it and it's actually your design is in 2 to 3 years to actually execute it so perhaps by the time you get this done, the city will be so flushed in money that it's coming off of trees. I don't think so, but it's a possibility so you could frame it in terms of anticipated need and in recognition of the long, schedule time, long-term schedule, and not capital funding that may be how we frame many of our capital requests this year. And one of the ways it often gets done.

Meeting adjourns: 8:04pm

HEALTH & HUMAN SERVICES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Sheldon Fine and Sonia Garcia, Co-Chairpersons

April 25, 2023 at 7:00 PM via Zoom

The Meeting can be viewed in its entirety on YouTube, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ul-iPBXTT8&t=3s>

Present: Sheldon Fine and Sonia Garcia, co-chairs; Audrey Isaacs and Ken Coughlin. **Non-Committee Board Member:** Board Office: Alex Crawford.

Shelly Fine, Co-Chair called the meeting to order, and he introduced committee members, non-committee board members and Alexandra Crawford.

Next, he introduced our presenters from the search and care organization:

Aaron Rooney, LCSW, Executive Director and Robin Strashun, Outreach Coordinator

First, they gave background information about their agency:

- Search and Care has a unique approach to help older adults live at home.
- Search and Care is a non-profit social service agency offering fee-free care management and supportive services.
- Search and Care's service area includes UWS, East Harlem, Yorkville, and Carnegie Hill:
 - On the West Side, Search and Care's service area is West 60th Street to West 110th Street (CPW-Riverside Drive)

Then they presented the following 7 Doors of Services that Search and Care provides:

Door 1: Care Management is the Primary Service:

- New referrals for any agency service from Dept for the Aging or community sources (social/human service, healthcare, faith, housing, elected officials) reviewed by Clinical Director and Social Workers.
- Criteria: Age 60+, reside in catchment area, non-means tested
- Social Workers and Care Managers create individual care plans, assist with benefits and entitlements, advocacy, and referrals for services both within Search and Care (e.g. Medical Escorts) as well as outside referrals (e.g. homecare)

Door 2: Money and Financial Matters

- In-home bill paying program.
- Engages retired financial pros ("Financial Navigators").
- Assists with paper organization, debt reduction, conflict resolution, reduces risk of financial exploitation.
- Explore stipendiary qualifications.

Door 3 : PET (Pets and Elders Together)

- The goal is keeping pet and owner together, and pets out of shelter system.
- When financially appropriate and available, stipendiary support from funders may be used to underwrite vet care, medication, grooming, food, equipment.
- Encourages Advance Pet Planning to help keep pets cared for in crisis.
- Owner educational workshops throughout the year.

Door 4: Medical Escorts

- Helps clients access vital medical care with chaperone assistance to/from appointments.
- The program includes day-before reminders.
- Reduces anxiety and helps clients remain compliant with medical care.
- Requires in-home assessment prior to service and Covid vaccinations/boosters.

Door 5: Silver Circles – Computer Connectivity

- Goal is to bring technology skills and tools to community adults who are 60+ (computer/tablet/cell phone);
- Provides one-on-one coaching specific to everyone's needs and interests.
- Agency can provide tablets with Wi-Fi plan as part of program for in-home use if client has constrained resources.

Door 6: Talkin' It Out – Mental Health

- By appointment, telephonic/virtual/in person sessions with our bilingual LMSWs to talk about any concerns clients are experiencing.
- Empathic listeners for isolated older adults
- De-stigmatizes mental health issues.

Door 7: Groups – Enrichment and Therapeutic

- Bringing older adults together – virtually – during the pandemic continues to be beneficial for learning, for calming, for connecting. These are some of the weekly and monthly groups that are held telephonically, via Zoom or in person:
 - Morning Meditation I Tea + Creativity I Medication Education
 - Tech Time Games I Newsroom I PET Pro Workshop I Search and Act
 - Music + Melody I La Hora De Cafecito I Vocal Ease
 - Decluttering with Millie I Advisory Group I Reading Room I Movement

In response to the question of what financial support was being sought from the city, the answer was that \$25,000 was needed to support the fee-free home assistance program.

Next, Mr. Fine introduced Greg Silverman, the CEO/Executive Director of the West Side Campaign Against Hunger (WCAH).

In his presentation he related the following information:

- West Side Campaign Against Hunger's (WCAH) mission is to alleviate hunger by ensuring that all New Yorkers have access with dignity to a choice of healthy food and supportive services.
- WCAH is one of the largest Emergency Food Providers (EFPs) in NYC and has been at the forefront of innovation for 43 years, developing the first customer-choice supermarket-style pantry in the United States.
- In October 2017, WCAH's operation expanded to include a Mobile Market Program (MMP), which focused on distributing nutritious food in new neighborhoods by partnering with community organizations and institutions to bring our customer choice model directly into areas with high rates of poverty and food insecurity.
- WCAH works with schools, local officials, and healthcare and social service providers that have established trusting relationships with the local community to add healthy food to the suite of services accessible at their location.
- In Manhattan Community District 7, WCAH maintains two active community distribution sites. The first is WCAH's 86th Street distribution, our headquarters, and largest distribution site, serving more than 32,000 New Yorkers annually. The second site is at Lincoln Square Neighborhood Center.
- WCAH customers at both sites can receive a 4-day supply of groceries once monthly. Last year, WCAH distributions in CB7 served nearly 35,000 unique individuals with over 1.5 million lbs. of healthy food, including a minimum of 50% fresh produce.
- Core to WCAH's mission, they are addressing the underlying root causes of food insecurity through advocacy and providing a comprehensive suite of services aimed at helping families on their journey to food security.
- All WCAH customers complete an intake assessment and are comprehensively screened for a range of benefits and services by our Social Service team. WCAH's Benefits Access Department provides enrollments for SNAP (food stamps), Public Assistance/Cash Assistance, Health Insurance programs, Housing Assistance such as Senior Citizen Rent Increase Exemption (SCRIE), Disability Rent Increase Exemption (DRIE), One Shot Deals, and transportation assistance such as Reduced Fare and Fair Fare Metro Cards.
- WCAH also has strong referral partnerships to help our customers gain access to WIC, shelter resources, financial counseling, tax preparation, educational and employment programs, immigration legal assistance, benefits, and housing advocacy.
- West Side Campaign Against Hunger's (WCAH) is also the host of The Roundtable: Allies for Food Access, a collective action group consisting of eight of the largest emergency food providers in New York City.
- One of the principal initiatives pursued was a purchasing pilot that tested new and expanded vendor relationships leading to 20% savings in food purchasing costs across the collective. Following the success of this pilot, the group has focused on expanding opportunities for costs savings through collective purchasing and increasing membership, adding Holy Apostles Soup Kitchen (HASK), Met Council, Part of the Solution (POTS), and The Campaign Against Hunger (TCAH).
- The Roundtable has improved food quality at pantries across the city through contract renegotiations, public policy advocacy, and peer-to-peer organizational engagement. The group has evolved over the last four years from discussing the cost of purchasing healthy foods to more strategic collaboration around warehouse space, bulk purchasing, and advocating for changing food and funding systems at the city and state levels.
- In response to the question of how CB 7 can advocate to address the problem of Food Insecurity, Mr. Silverman recommended the following:
 - Direct Support to and via WCAH: Support West Side Campaign Against Hunger efforts within Community District 7 catchment zone to distribute more healthy food and sign up more customers in need with essential food benefits by funding expanded community-based engagement. \$150,000
 - Support The Roundtable, Allies for Food Access: a dedicated network of emergency food providers collaborating to bring more resources to communities so none of our neighbors go hungry \$50,00

***** Please note, meeting minutes will be forthcoming. *****

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

K Karpen and Madge Rosenberg, Co-Chairpersons

April 13, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

The meeting can be viewed in its entirety: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=68GM3VufVcs&t=122s>

PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

Natasha Kazmi and Susan Schwartz, Co-Chairpersons

***joint with* TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE**

Andrew Albert and Mark Diller, Co-Chairpersons

April 17, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

The meeting can be viewed in its entirety: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfcEpHjOoU4>

LAND USE COMMITTEE

Richard Asche and Kevin Corte, Co-Chairpersons

April 19, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

The meeting can be viewed in its entirety: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LIBY_8eKijs

PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

William Ortiz and Polly Spain, Co-Chairpersons

April 26, 2023 at 6:30 PM via Zoom

The meeting can be viewed in its entirety: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=K2OLw4XKkGc>