# **FULL BOARD MEETING MINUTES**

Mark Diller, Chair January 7, 2020

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Tuesday, January 7, 2020, at Fordham University in the district. Chair Mark Diller called the meeting to order at 6:32 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

# Chair's Report: Mark Diller

Minutes from the previous Full Board meeting were approved.

Vote: 34-0-1-0

Cindy Cardinal: DNS: Will be coming to each committee meeting in February. Enhance and expand understanding of new format. Discuss what the format looks like online to make submission better. Revisit idea of support for our request. Statements of need from Stakeholder groups or data to support request.

Plastic bag fee going into effect.

Entrance to Riverside Park by Marine Transfer Station will be closed because FEMA finally came through to fix damage to seawall caused by Hurricane Sandy. Pedestrians and cyclists will be sharing a very narrow bike path.

Parks and Environment will be Fourth Monday in both January and February.

Reminder to reapply for Board members whose term is up in 2020.

#### Census Report

New York likely to lose at least one seat for the House of Representatives, so we need to have a Complete Count to ensure we don't lose two.

April 1 is the 2020 Census Day. For people who don't respond, we will be hiring people to go knock doors. Hiring 500,000 people in the state of New York. This is the time to really start hiring. Pay is \$28/hour. Job is April to July.

Roberta Semer: Update on Senior Resource Fair. Fantastic event with lots of seniors and community programs.

#### **Community Session:**

#### Jennifer Zarr, NYPL

Invited by Blanche to give presentation. NYPL now owns three bookmobiles used to support communities impacted by long-term closures. Bloomingdale scheduled to reopen in May, but bookmobiles will be in that community over the next few months. Can sign up for card, browse small collection of books, pick up reserved items, return and renew books, manage account, speak with Librarian. @nyplbookmobile

## Courtney Clark Metakis, NY Moms for Safer Streets

Mothers concerned about safety. Represent over 2000 concerned citizens troubled by increases in crime and other indicators that put character of neighborhood at risk. Engaged extensively with elected officials. Crime is down in some categories but up in others. Robberies, youth violence, violence in Central Park, openly engaging in drug use, defecating on streets, etc. Encampment in front of Lowes.

#### Sara Lebwohl, NY Moms for Safer Streets

CB has touched on these issues in DNS. Solutions to provide services to homeless individuals who will accept it. New spaces for youth to gather safely and productively. Resources for precincts. Hold elected officials accountable for promises to give more resources. Encourage Board to develop a plan to address these issues for the good of the neighborhood.

#### Zachary Campbell, AMNH

Activities on schedule. Number of construction vehicles remains the same, approximately 10-20/day. Crane operation scheduled for next week to replace chilled water equipment in the museum complex to aid in energy efficiency efforts.

# Thomas Caffrey, Committee for Environmentally Sound Development

Speaking about 200 Amsterdam Ave. Committee has been suing the developer for two years over what they consider to be an illegal and illegitimate zoning lot. Concerned about the precedent this might set. Will be asking City DOB to withhold CO for the property.

#### Steve Harris, Ansonia

73<sup>rd</sup> Broadway Encampment under the scaffolding. The people are very aggressive. Have to walk my wife into the building so that she does not have to go through this aggressive gauntlet. Please take seriously comments about this issue.

## David Zelman

Resident parking. Manhattan Day School on Fridays lets school out at 2:00 but you still can't park there until 5:00. Astor has taken up at least 40 parking spots. Laureate has parking in front of their building because the City put up a No Parking sign. We don't need commercial ventures taking up space that could be used by the community. Both Gale and Helen have said they are trying to pass a law that will put numbers on stores and buildings around the city.

#### Peter Arndtsen, Columbus Amsterdam BID

2020 Jan/Feb Events Calendar available. Ewaste collection; walks and talks, etc.

## Adam Budish, Head of the Board of The Alexandria

Growing concerns about encampment and street vendors. Dangerous and chaotic situation in the community. Sidewalk congestion making it difficult for families and seniors to travel safely down the street. Vendors take up more sidewalk space taking public right of way. Block access to storefronts, contributing to growing number of vacant storefronts. Request that this issue be dealt with at the Committee level so that we can all work together.

#### Edward Lewitt, Ansonia

Growing concerns about homeless individuals on our streets. Have called 311 and 911 on a number of occasions. Asking for additional aid for these people, need proper mental health treatment. Concerned about growing aggressiveness of some of these individuals. Petition with over 110 signatures.

# Chris Giordano, 64-67 Street Block Association

Zoning challenge to Extell supertall. Hearing at BSA on 1/28. Only 22% of the Void space will actually be used for mechanicals. DOB examiners have admitted that they don't question the use of the space when it says "mechanical space". The tallest piece of equipment in the space is 85 inches. So everything should fit within 12 feet of vertical rise. Please come and support at the hearing on 1/28. Site has been quiet for six months. Might be a redesign, etc.

Booker T Washington Middle School on 1/14 there will be a Hate Crimes forum.

#### David Lipsky

Lifelong resident of West Side. Commercial vacancies. What is the economic benefit of keeping stores vacant? Suggest that we have a forum with people in real estate business to educate on why some of these spaces still remain vacant.

98<sup>th</sup> Street. City Sanitation has been doing middle of the night pickups of garbage and recyclables. It's a lot of noise. Doing this because traffic is so bad during the day. Bike lanes, double-parked vehicles, etc.

Linda: BCI Committee will be hosting a forum on the issue of the empty storefronts

#### **Deputy Inspector Malin**

2019 was going very well – down by 14% as of September 1<sup>st</sup>. 43 robberies in the first nine months of the year, then 42 in last three months of the year. Mostly juvenile packs of kids going after other kids. Nine residential burglaries in December, between 80-86, Broadway and CPW.

Crime down by 2.8%, but the last quarter has been particularly bad.

We dedicate resources to each pattern as it emerges.

Homeless individuals. 73<sup>rd</sup> and Broadway – these guys are really aggressive and nasty. Cleared it out four times in the past 30 days, twice with whole homeless task force. Twice with just officers.

Traffic: Goal to eliminate any fatalities involving vehicular traffic, try to maintain uninterrupted flow of traffic. Focus on enforcement, education and engineering. Increase enforcement in collision-prone areas. Visiting senior centers and high schools to talk about crossing the street safely. Teaming up with agencies to talk about how to improve safety.

#### Manhattan Borough President's Report

Newsletter available.

BP supports CMOM and understands that the community has some concerns. We will work together to address these concerns.

CB application deadline is January 21st.

Census Complete Count Committee. Reach out to Aldrin Bonilla to get involved.

#### Reports by Elected Officials:

# Brad Hoylman, State Senator (27<sup>th</sup> District):

Legislative Session starting tomorrow

Chair of Judiciary Committee – working on consolidating courts (we have 11 trial court systems)

Legislation to ban "ghost guns"

Two bills

- Bill to ban PFAS/PFOS (chemicals found in nonstick cookware) in firefighting foam (it contaminates groundwater)
- Post-exposure prophylaxis (PEP) for sexual assault survivors for free in New York

Proposing bill to repeal tax exemption for private yachts or aircraft

Congratulations to Linda Rosenthal for work on banning flavors for JUULs

Bill to ban profiling of transgender women and particularly transgender women of color

Jay Adolf: What about appropriations for NYCHA? It takes three parties to pass the city budget. City representatives need to stand firm and insist that this gets into the budget. Will you take this stance going forward?

The money has been released (with the new monitor) and we have to fight for more money.

Update on Child Victims Act: One year lookback. Introducing a bill to extend that another year because it can take time for people to work up the courage to file these claims, but so many have been filed that we think there are more. Also looking to pass the Adult Survivors Act.

Elizabeth: Does the case have to be related to New York?

Yes, there must be a nexus with New York (usually that the crime was committed here).

Doug: What about cases where there's no deep pocket as the defendant

Looking at legislation for mandatory pro bono; working with Bar Association to figure out ways to deal with this.

## **Reports by Elected Officials' Representatives:**

## Erica Overton, Office of Assembly Member Linda Rosenthal (67<sup>th</sup> District):

AM is on her way to Albany. Caitlyn Letterii went to Grad School.

Legislation with Communication Workers of America to protect call center jobs from being shipped overseas. If call center ships 30% or more of jobs overseas it loses all of its tax benefits.

MTA Capital Plan: Lack of details (e.g., where are the accessible stations and how will that happen?). Want to be sure all of these things actually happen.

# Office of State Senator Jose Serrano (29th District):

Here to listen to concerns.

# Hannah Weinerman, Office of U.S. House Member Jerrold Nadler (10th District):

House voted to impeach Trump. Pelosi has not sent the articles to the Senate. Do not know Nadler's role yet.

Medicare Part B enrollment began on January 1<sup>st</sup> until March 31<sup>st</sup>. Can call office for assistance.

Tax Season approaching. Free tax filing services: VITA and Tax Counseling for the Elderly

# Julian Delaporte, Office of New York City Council Member Helen Rosenthal (6th District):

Monthly Housing clnic tomorrow night 6:30 at Bernie Wohl Center, talk to a lawyer for free. First Wednesday at each month.

# *Briee Peyre, Office of Assembly Member Richard Gottfried (75th District):*

16 and 17 year olds can register to vote

Unrestricted access to birth certificates for adopted individuals once they turn 18

Changes to cash bail

Remove tow pound from Pier 76 on the Hudson River (not clear where it will be moved to)

Gottfried working with CB7 to fight Extell supertall – part of the lawsuit against Extell

## *Erik Guello, Office of New York City Council Member Mark Levine (7th District):*

Here to listen to comments about CMOM. CM is supportive of CMOM but wants to hear from community concerns.

Calling for the city to end financial ties between the city and the Trump organization

Working with Riverside Park Conservancy to secure funding for the park, particularly for infrastructure and repair issues.

#### Phillip Ellison, Office of Public Advocate Jumaane Williams:

Manhattan Borough Advocate. Jumaane is a former community organizer and advocate and is planning to be a watchdog and hold folks accountable. Jumaane will use his office as a bully pulpit. First Deputy Public Advocates focused on issue areas. Community organizers and Community Engagement Team all around the city.

Placard Abuse. Bill around fraudulent placard abuse.

#### **Business Session:**

# Preservation Committee, K Karpen and Michele Parker, Co-Chairpersons Resolution Re:

1. **361 Central Park West, Children's Museum of Manhattan** (West 96<sup>th</sup> – West 97<sup>th</sup> Streets.) Application to Landmarks Preservation Commission for a one-story rooftop addition with terraces, new rooftop mechanical equipment, elevator

and stair bulkheads; removal of stained glass windows; lowered entries for barrier free access on 96<sup>th</sup> Street and Central Park West; and relocation of historic wood doors.

Presentation from CMOM and Consultants. Sylvia Smith, Senior Partner at FX Collaborative.

Restoring and preserving the granite shell.

Still proposing to remove stained glass windows. They will be donated to the National Building Arts Center. Keeping and restoring one of the windows and displaying it within the museum to be used as an education piece.

Moved some of the mechanicals to lower the impact of the rooftop addition. Centered to be more in line with the original design of the building. Restore more of the original clay tile roof.

Substitute Resolution: New resolution read by Michelle Parker.

#### **Public Comment Period**

## Pastor Terry Starks, Fresh Start New Beginning

Pastored that church, then moved to Georgia. Leadership of the Church declined to sell the church to him. We are here to preserve this landmarked church. Within six months this church will be at capacity. CMOM should have done their homework because we fought condominiums in this church before.

#### Matthew Messinger, Board of CMOM

Thanks to community. Excited to preserving this building and staying in this community that we've been in for so long. Building itself will be a fantastic teaching tool for the museum.

## Lynda Starks

Board does not look like the community that belongs to this church. Ate, slept, and lived at this church. We change lives. We took 75 children and flew them to LA. Took busloads of adolescents to DC. We change lives. CMOM has been on 83<sup>rd</sup> street for over 30 years. CMOM never tried to reach Harlem, Brooklyn, the Bronx, etc. We're about life changes. Churches are not obsolete. These are people's lives you're making decisions about.

Jay Adolf Point of Order. To say that these folks were not treated with civility is an absolute inaccuracy.

#### Andrew Aanzig, President of Coop Board of West 96th.

We welcome CMOM to the neighborhood and are mostly excited about the repurposing of the building. We were very concerned about the roof structure and thought it was too large. Glad it's been rolled back. Still concerned about the overall height. Reduction in the height would be appropriate. Don't think clear glass for replacement is a good idea. Recommend translucent glass. Transportation issue for future consideration — it's a very hazardous corner.

# Charles Warren, Architect

Long letter sent to the Board. Museum needs to learn to play nice and that means don't hasten the process to such a degree that the community cannot see the plan and comment on it. The roof does not work. This is not how to treat one of the great landmarks of New York City.

#### Sean Khorsandi, Landmark West

Firmly believe this team can solve this problem with a winning design that serves the museum and the landmark alike. This may set a bad precedent for other religious facilities along the corridor. This would set a new level of liberal interpretation. Rooftop is uncharacteristic bulk. Support CMOM, but feel proposed alterations are too significant and need to be revised more.

#### Peter Arndtsen,

Welcome CMOM taking this over. Incredible opportunity where they will invest in the neighborhood. This will open this building to the public that has been closed for so many years.

#### Antonia Rossello

Letter from Curator of Department of Decorative Arts of the Met regarding the stained glass windows of the church. Removal of stained glass windows would have severe negative impact.

#### Patsy Yang, President of Board of 370 CPW

Suggest that we need a new visual. Construction coordination requested.

# Debra Blank, 7 West 96th Street

CMOM's plans are an affront to the architectural integrity. The roof will be obliterated. Roof should be approved. Base of the steeple must be observable from surrounding streets.

## Arnold Blank, 7 West 96<sup>th</sup> Street

CMOM is steamrolling us by not showing us their plans until the last minute and presenting these barely visible pictures. Never expected that the building would be vandalized when we moved into our apartment. Neighbors are making reasonable requests that will not jeopardize the project.

#### Deborah White, Fresh Start New Beginning

1965 Landmarks law enacted to protect landmarks. Protect aesthetic and architectural nature of properties. CMOM's proposed changes are inappropriate. Architectural vandalism.

## Luis Andres Salazaar, CPW Neighbors Association

Enthusiastic when the building was purchased by CMOM. The proposal is insensitive and intrusive. Rooftop additions are massive and inappropriate. Destroy the landmark.

# Margaret Neuer, 7 West 96th Street

Support CMOM. Two issues: Roof should be maintained as it is. Windows should not be removed.

# Carol Edkins, 7 West 96th Street

Concerned re: birds within the chimney that may be removed. Wants to preserve the property...against the roof top addition.

## Rod Chay 7 West 96<sup>th</sup> Street

Concerned about preserving stained glass window and roof. Believes the process is being rushed.

Supports museum, but against rooftop addition etc.

Les Francis- 361 CPW with Fresh Start New Beginnings Christian

"Church is a church" Wants the church to remain

## Jaclyn Steinbach- 7 West 96th Street

Believes that min.

#### Ceren Bingol, Architect

I've spent a lot of time building museums and understand what this takes .I'm concerned about the rooftop. I know how museums get greedy for more space.

## Susan Simon, CPW Neighbors Association

Fought the developers who sought to impose an ill-conceived design. Happy to have CMOM, but we thought they would leave intact the architecture. This church is not adequately understood or appreciated. We've been given only this evening to review these design changes. What is the rush? Stained glass windows are monumental. The windows would be a draw for people and an educational opportunity.

Mary Jane Terrell, Central Park Neighbors Association

Distressed that CMOM is doing what we fought to keep the developer from doing – disfiguring the monument. CMOM is not thinking of the long-term effect on their neighbors.

Aymeric Leper, 361 CPW

Not a good idea to put kids on a roof. Sad that CMOM is violating the building by adding a two-story building

Mark: Turning the building back into a church building is not one of the issues that is before us. We are charged with determining the appropriateness of the changes to a landmarked building. We do not have the power to say what we think should be in the building. It is not within our power to force CMOM to sell the building. Board discussion should focus on the resolution.

Michelle: Discussion of asking LPC for more time.

Richard: Don't know whether LPC will adjourn the hearing. Suggest that we adhere to the original resolution and add a wherefore clause that we ask LPC to adjourn the hearing for 60 days to give us more opportunity to work with CMOM and the community. This is a new proposal that we're seeing for the first time tonight.

Jay Adolf: Took a year of negotiation with LPC on how they handle requests. There may be exceptions, but generally what happened was that there were many instances where applications would come before Committee and then go to LPC before they came to the full board. In this instance, application went to the committee and to the full board.

Peter: To wait another two months is not the way to do it. There are some issues that we should talk about. Stained glass: think it's possible to keep the stained glass. Modifications to the roof have gone in the right direction but they may have to go further.

Ethel: Disapproval from the committee; since then, the application was given the opportunity to consider some of the criticisms of the committee, they chose not to come back to the committee, but they did begin to address some of the criticisms of the committee. What we now have is a choice if it's adequate to vote on the substitute resolution which would approve this with the assumption that the board feels that what was shown is good enough to have an approval. Or, vote the substitute motion down and go with the committee's disapproval. Second choice is to ask to have delay at LPC. Major questions about the drawings that were shown. Would like to see this appropriately approved.

Lolita: We need more time looking into this.

Madelyn: Disapprove until something better for everyone is worked out.

Louisa: I would like to hear more options

Paige: I will disapprove

Jay: Windows are my objection. Committee passed a resolution of disapproval and offered applicants an opportunity to not present that disapproval to the board but they declined. There's no indication that there are going to be any more revisions. Sending the windows to St Louis is a non-starter. This building is a church building. Only thing that's really left is the windows.

Natasha: Would approve the revised resolution. In favor of CMOM coming to this new home. A lot of meaningful and impactful programing. First and probably only exhibit on Muslim culture in a children's museum that is now traveling around the country.

Ira: Want to support CMOM. I abstained at committee, but now I'm disapproving because the changes shown on the roof and seemed to make it worse.

Andrew Albert: No assurance that Landmarks will delay it and not just approve, and then we're just removed from the process of trying to make the process and the project better.

Mark: A disapproval would just be a disapproval.

Rich Robbins: Overwhelming opposition, especially based on the process. Ask CMOM to run this through the right process. Not good to see the changes a few minutes before the vote. Would applicants consider delaying?

Jeanette: What's before us today is a landmark building. CMOM purchased this building knowing it's a church. These are huge and drastic changes.

Richard Asche: Decided not to approve this project. What are the programmatic needs that compel these changes? Are there less-intrusive ways of achieving what the museum wants. Would ask the chairs to add a clause to the motion asking that the hearing be adjourned. We want to see this building occupied and fixed up.

Steve: Will disapprove and encourage them to work with committee to work this out.

Mark: Other religious institutions have been torn down. Long-vacant building could fall into continued disrepair. Governmental approval cannot hinge on forcing any private institution to retain religious iconography. Rooftop: persuaded that it is minimally appropriate.

Sara: Second Mark and support CMOM.

Andrew: Applicant will be going to Landmarks. I was not at the Committee meeting, but they have come back with a substitute resolution. Museum is really important to our neighborhood and we should keep it here.

Doug: Still listening. Grieving over the loss of the church. Don't want to belabor the process. Don't want to keep a vacant building in the neighborhood. Measure Twice and Cut Once. Might need a delay to measure twice.

Shelly: Custodian of a synagogue that people wanted to tear down. Fought it against all opposition and survived. Against religious institutions that have a home in the community being altered negatively in any way. 166 Playground had a meeting the night before the board meeting that it was the first time they saw the design. Lawsuits from a year and a half that resulted from that. Very bad decision on the board's part.

Catherine: Would disapprove. Advocate explicitly to preserve the character of the building. History is long. There may be multiple users in the building's future, so it's important to be careful about making changes. Thank you to the people from the church who came.

Meg: Struggling with this decision. Second much of what the Chair said. Some issues with the process and timing, if we are taking an opinion, I support this. And agree with Chair's statement that a government entity requiring that an institute retain religious iconography is not acceptable. Might not be a welcoming space for people of other religions.

Didn't see tonight the picture of the original roof. It was such an integral part of the building.

Cindy: Would disapprove.

Douglas: Unclear how proposed modifications have impacted the appropriateness of the design. Would disapprove.

Susan: Disapprove. Cannot fathom how we can let this happen in the name of preservation. Feel for the members of the church. Don't think this is religious iconography – this is part of the integrity of a landmarked building.

Ken: Would vote to approve the substitute resolution. Applicant has shown flexibility in modifying the roof. Second or third most dangerous intersection on the UWS and there will now be many children there. Would want to see provision in the resolution calling on DOT to implement safety reforms.

Klari: This is an individual landmark, which gets heightened scrutiny and has heightened standard. One stained glass window will be preserved and restored and kept in the window. Disagree with Mark on the First Amendment argument. Minimally appropriate vs. Reasonably appropriate – Friendly amendment. Intend to vote to disapprove because of the windows and because of the roof. Rights to light and air determined by zoning code. Roof is so big and so bad and so inappropriate. Windows shouldn't go.

Friendly amendment accepted: Minimally appropriate instead of reasonably appropriate.

Polly: Voting to disapprove.

Paul: Good addition to the community. Vote to approve.

Ethel: Not as concerned about the removal of the stained glass windows as I thought I would be – this would be the case for almost any adaptive reuse that was not religious in nature. Would urge that the large window be kept in place and preserved – it's exceptionally beautiful and would not interfere with the use of the building. Process: applicant made some changes that were seen by the co-chairs yesterday. CMOM refused to work more with the committee. Maybe the applicant could continue to make changes to the plan that are responsive to serious community concerns. The way the roof is treated is of prime importance. Firmly believe that they could modify this. If we ask LPC jointly with the applicant to have more time, they should give it to us.

Peter: Three parties: CMOM, Landmarked Church, excellent architect. We ought to be able to come away with a resolution. Need more changes to the roof. Move the walkway to the back of the roof. But to just disapprove it is sort of a cop-out. Need to encourage the architects and museum to come together for a proper solution.

Christian: We have told people to keep windows all the time.

Linda: I have reported on a lot of adaptive reuses. This seems like a fairly sensitive adaptive reuse. For over a decade we have watched a beautiful structure lie fallow and deteriorate. Now it's to be resurrected and put to good use by a beloved institution. I will approve the substitute resolution.

Barbara: Would have voted in favor, but don't understand how we can possibly vote tonight. LPC has enough respect for us so that if we sent a letter and told them that we need 60 days more, I can't imagine they wouldn't say yes.

Josh: Disapprove.

Michelle: We can't tell LPC what to do. We will not be successful asking them for more time. We have to go to them next Tuesday with our resolution. Want you to vote for the substitute resolution. We don't have any right to demand a private institution keep religious iconography. I think they've handled that well – goes with their educational mission. Beyond our purview to demand programmatic changes in a private institution. Happy with the changes to the rooftop – retains 16 feet of the rooftop. The current elevators are not usable and cannot be brought up to code.

K: Aware that this is not a perfect solution, but it's a way of preserving a beautiful building and CMOM has come a long way

The Substitute Resolution fails

Vote: 13-22-3-0

Richard: Propose amendment to add a clause asking that LPC give us more time.

Jay: Would CMOM even consider amending the plans

Paige: This process has been peculiar. This has become a contorted discussion.

Richard: Withdraws amendment.

Original Resolution. Voting to Disapproval

Klari: Resolution needs to somehow reflect that what we heard tonight. Friendly amendment: the new whereas clauses with the original disapproval

The Resolution to Disapprove was adopted.

Vote: 25-13-1-0

# Business & Consumer Issues Committee, Linda Alexander and Christian Cordova, Co-Chairpersons Resolutions Re:

New application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license:

2. 429 Amsterdam Avenue (West 81st Street) TBD Hospitality, LLC, d/b/a To be Determined.

The Resolution to Approve was adopted.

VOTE: 30-1-0-1

#### Renewal Unenclosed Sidewalk Café:

3. **2309 Broadway** (West 83<sup>rd</sup> – 84<sup>th</sup> Streets.) Renewal application #2057394-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by The Pickle People, LLC, d/b/a Maison Pickle, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 3 tables and 15 seats.

The Resolution to Approve was adopted.

**VOTE: 32-0-0-0** 

## New Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafe:

4. **519 Columbus Avenue** (West 85<sup>th</sup> Street.) New application # 12306-2019-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by The Consulate NYC, LLC, d/b/a The Consulate, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 21 tables and 42 seats.

The Resolution to Approve was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-0-0

5. **Multi-block street fairs.** Applications to the Street Activity Permit Office for multi-block street fairs in 2020.

The Resolution to Approve was adopted.

**VOTE: 32-1-1-0** 

# Preservation Committee, K Karpen and Michele Parker, Co-Chairpersons

**Resolutions Re:** 

6. **56 West 85<sup>th</sup> Street** (Columbus Avenue – Central Park West.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a small extension with a greenhouse at the yard level.

Resolution was split: 6 will be rear-yard addition and 13 will be "greenhouse"

The Resolution to Approve the rear-yard addition was adopted.

VOTE: 30-0-0-0

13. The Resolution to Approve the "greenhouse" was not adopted.

VOTE: 10-18-2-0

7. **4 West 90<sup>th</sup> Street** (Central Park West.) Application LPC-19-41331 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to legalize the installation of windows and a door and painting the façade without Landmarks Preservation Commission permits.

The Resolution to (a) Approve and (b) Disapprove was adopted.

VOTE: 28-0-0-0

# Transportation Committee, Howard Yaruss, Chairperson

#### **Resolutions Re:**

8. **West 97**<sup>th</sup> **Street Greenmarket** (Amsterdam-Columbus Avenues.) Application by Greenmarket/ GrowNYC to the Mayor's Street Activity Permit Office for a permit to hold a greenmarket on Fridays on West 97<sup>th</sup> Street. Friendly Amendment: offering hours whenever they want.

The Resolution to Approve was adopted.

VOTE: 30-0-0-0

9. **3 Riverside Drive** (West  $72^{nd} - 73^{rd}$  Streets.) Petition #81-4711846 for a new revocable consent by Sullivan Group Design, LLC, to construct, maintain and use a proposed snowmelt system, stoop and walled-in area with gate, hatch, stair and planted area on and under the east sidewalk of Riverside Drive.

The Resolution to (a) Approve the snow melt was not adopted

**VOTE: 14-11-5-0** 

The Resolution to (b) Disapprove the gating in area was adopted.

**VOTE: 30-0-0-0** 

10. Policy for consideration of requests for curbside access to residential buildings.

Jay: You should withdraw the resolution. This committee requested a study of curbside space and said that they need the study because they don't know what to do with the curbside space.

Howard: The request for a study is to get the city to take a look at the general rules regarding curbside space. We need to have a policy for when to take these requests.

Meg: Transportation Committee is going to continue to receive requests, so we need to have standards.

Rich: It's a totally separate issue.

Steve: Is it a minimum standard to consider, or this is the requirement. Why is it looked upon favorably? Every single building can come forward and say this. This will open up a bonanza. This is a very minimal standard to take something away. If this was the minimum standard, I would still think it should be more, but it would be better than "favorably."

Howard: 11% of people in New York are disabled, 6% are over 75, 27% have children. Half of the people in a building have trouble accessing the curb: so who should get priority – the many people in the building or one vehicle.

Steve: Every building with a doorman wants a parking spot in front of it.

Rich: If every building wants this, a building is made up of people so then clearly a lot of people want this.

William: I don't like the idea of free parking being removed in New York City or on the UWS. This will create a pattern for the future.

Jeanette: There need to be more standards added to this. What if there's a loading zone nearby.

Ken: The board will still have a chance to vote on any of these. This is a safety issue. People have trouble accessing the curb. So is the priority many people's safety or one parked car.

Susan: This is premature. It's great that you responded to the request. Maybe it needs more work. Street naming standards came back to the full board many times.

## The Resolution was not adopted.

**VOTE: 9-16-2-0** 

11. Support for the Improving Helicopter Safety Act of 2019.

The Resolution was adopted.

VOTE: 22-0-1-0

# Health & Human Services, Sheldon Fine, Chairperson

**Resolutions Re:** 

## 12. Rejection and Condemnation of Anti-Semitism

In light of recent events, the committee passed this resolution and brought it directly to the board.

The Resolution was adopted.

Vote: 41-0-0-0

# STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Mark Diller, Chair January 21, 2019 6:30 PM

Meeting began at 6:30 PM.

- 1. Full Board Meeting Management February Agenda
  - a. Transportation resolution
    - i. Mark: Because it already came to Full Board and was heard at several committee meetings: 50 minutes for public comment (alternating, like last time). Make a list of people who spoke in December and give priority to those that haven't had the chance to speak. Someone put flyers on cars saying that CB7 is eliminating on-street parking: this may lead to a new and sizeable audience attending the meeting and wishing to speak. Additionally, Rodeph Shalom has an earlier curfew than other venues, which would limit our time.
    - ii. Shelly: We should publicize time limit and priority to those that haven't spoken on agenda/social media so that everyone is aware before they attend the meeting.
    - iii. Michele: People ceded time to people that hadn't signed up at the last meeting.
    - iv. Mark: Only one person can cede time to someone (ten people can't cede time to one person). Both sign up slips must also be given at once.
    - v. Cindy: Should we take written submissions and then have them printed for board members?
    - vi. Linda: Back when the dog-run was a controversial issue for the board, the Chair had the pro and con sides choose three people each to speak, which helped with time.
    - vii. Mark: Some people don't feel comfortable being spoken for on behalf of a group or don't identify with a group
    - viii. Susan: There's a lot of frustration, we should alternate (Mark agrees). Taking written comments would be good. What about flyering information about the meeting?
    - ix. Mark: We should have flyers of the resolution handed out.
    - x. Seema: We should put it on the screen
    - xi. Andrew: Reiterate that people should look at the sign and stick to the time limit.
    - xii. Doug: Reemphasizing what Andrew said we need to make sure speakers are limited on time so that as many people as possible can talk.
    - xiii. Klari: It's not practical to divide people into pro and con groups.
    - xiv. Shelly: It's important to identify what the resolution is about before people speak so people only address the current resolution.
  - b. Other potential meeting management issues
  - c. Abbreviating chair's report and other ways to shorten the meeting
    - i. Mark: The Chair's report will be shortened (mainly what the community needs to know, for things the Board needs to know, an email will be sent the night before). Will also remind people to pick up copies of the resolution as they enter.
    - ii. Steven: Be crystal clear about speaking time so we aren't criticized. Have we ever thought about doing the big issues last? The committees with less controversial resolutions always go last. If we put the controversial committees last, the audience could also thin out the crowd.
    - iii. Seema: If the resolution isn't too long, we could also read it aloud. Likes Steven's idea: many people come focusing on a single issue and don't have an experience of the Board (and then leave after the first issue). Having the controversial issue (the Transportation resolution, in this case), go later could allow people to get an understanding of the Board and the other issues it addresses.
    - iv. Cindy: If we do the Transportation resolution later in the meeting we should publicize a time at which we will discuss it so that we respect the public's time.
    - v. K: The preservation committee's part of the meeting should be quite short.

- vi. Melissa: We can do small business items first so we get half the agenda done before 7:30 and that way people who have to leave early can still vote.
- vii. Mark: We can move Transportation to 7:30 PM
- viii. Meg (new Transportation Committee Chair): Sounds good. This gives people an opportunity to learn about the Board and experience other committees.
- ix. Klari: We should have the entire agenda before the Transportation resolution.
- x. Susan: Was there any discussion on putting limits on elected officials?
- xi. Mark: We already put limits on elected officials' staff in terms of speaking -- I'm not comfortable putting limits on elected officials. Connecting our community with their elected leaders face to face is part of what CB7 does.
- xii. Melissa: A back-channeling of the message that we're short on time to the electeds would be good.
- xiii. Mark: Will send agenda to elected officials who normally speak and let them know what issues are on the table that night.
- xiv. Andrew: What if there was a universal document the Chair could read out before the meeting that explains who we are, what we do, how we do it, and what the role of the public is at the meeting.
- xv. Mark: Committee chairs should send Penny and Mark a rough estimate of the time they estimate their agenda item will take. We'll try out having the Transportation resolution at the end of the meeting/around 7:30 PM.

#### d. Senator Hoylman Capital Funding:

- i. Mark: Senator Hoylman has secured capital funding for his District that he intends to spend in equal amounts of \$250K in each of the 6 Community Board Districts that touch his Senate District. He is providing us the opportunity to recommend funding for projects in places where CB7 and his district overlap.
- ii. Cindy: One of our budget priorities was making schools in our district more accessible. What about P.S. 452.?
- iii. Ken: Have we looked at what was rejected from Participatory Budgeting. Also: is Hoylman the only one with this money?
- iv. Mark: I'm not sure. It is his discretion to let CB7 recommend how to spend part of it.
- v. Klari: The problem with \$250K is that you basically can't do anything with that money involving the Parks Department. We also shouldn't add this money to an existing project because then it doesn't do anything.
- vi. Mark: Should we find 1-2 projects that can be funded in its entirety with this? (there is consensus). Cindy, Roberta, and Mark will work on this and find 1-2 projects to select that we can either vote on at the Full Board meeting on Feb. 4th or decide on by February 1st (the official deadline).

# 2. Curb Resolution – Small Group Meetings

- a. Mark: Hosting focus group discussions (small group meetings) will allow folks on all sides of the Transportation issue to discuss the issue in a calm, respectful way. Meetings will happen at Helen's office and will include members of her staff. These meetings won't violate the Open Meetings Law (no decisions are being made).
- b. Melissa: How is it decided who gets to be in the room and who doesn't?
- c. Mark: At the last Transportation meeting in December, there was a separate sign-up sheet if people wanted to be a part of the groups.
- d. Madelyn: Why are these happening at one elected official's office.
- e. Mark: Helen Rosenthal was already planning to do this. It's good that these meetings aren't happening at the Board office so it doesn't drive the wrong message.
- f. Madelyn: Some elected officials aren't as involved in the process we have at the Board-- it might be nice to include more elected officials with these Town Halls

- g. Steven: How small is small (Mark: 10-12 people). It's important that we encourage a diverse group. The Transportation Committee was criticized for not being as diverse as people wanted it. It's necessary that we have a diverse process so we don't have an overwhelmingly partisan viewpoint.
- h. Klari: We've been referring to the issue as "the parking issue" -- it's a resolution about curbside space. We fall into the trap by calling it "the parking issue."
- i. Cindy: How is it expanding the number of people who are heard by only including people who attended the last Transportation Committee meeting in these focus groups.
- j. Mark: This is an attempt to address the issue of folks going to a meeting, dividing into their corners, and going back and forth without getting anywhere. This is an attempt to have a less formal dialogue that bridges these perspectives.
- 3. "Transportation Mobility Review Board"
  - a. Proposal relating to the need for 2 Manhattan members
    - i. Mark: At Borough Board, someone brought up the Transportation Mobility Review Board, Mark advocates for there being 2 Manhattan representatives (one outside and one inside the Congestion district).
    - ii. Shelly: Moves a resolution from Steering that we should recommend to the Borough Board that there be two representatives (1 in and 1 outside the Congestion Pricing District) that are either appointed or absorbed into the Transportation Mobility Review Board.
      - 1. The vote was 17-0-0 in favor.
- 4. Updates on Committee Chairs and Assignments
  - a. Mark:
    - i. Meg Schmitt new co-chair of Transportation committee
    - ii. K and Michele are the new co-chairs of Preservation
    - iii. We are reviving the Bylaws Taskforce, which Susan will be chairing (the first meeting is on February 12th, 5:30 PM, with refreshments)
- 5. Committee and Task Force reports
  - a. Klari (Parks): We will have no resolution at the Full Board. Hopes that K and Michele will give an update on the CMOM situation.
  - b. Shelly (Health and Human Services):
    - i. Doug: Spoke to CEO of Amsterdam House (nonprofit rehabilitation center outside of our District) about how they're in dire need of funding. They will be speaking at the Full Board
  - c. Melissa (Housing): The Joint Land Use/Housing Meeting was postponed until next month (there will be a presentation from Moses Gates). On a separate note, we should rethink the NYCHA Taskforce and how we get more residents involved
  - d. Mark: Land Use in March will be discussing RPA (Regional Planning Association) -- let's make sure we publicize this.
  - e. Seema (Land Use): We are in the Morningside Heights encatchment area so we will be hearing that at the next meeting. There is also a Coastal Resiliency text amendment that will be referred to us soon. It's a city-wide zoning text amendment that doesn't affect us much but we must still vote on. This will likely come up in February
  - f. Klari (Parks): We can make the Coastal Resiliency meeting joint because it affects Parks.
  - g. K (Preservation): Not much pushback expected or time required at Full Board (both resolutions were approved unanimously in committee). CMOM hasn't gone to LPC yet. We provided them with an opportunity to come back to us, and they turned us down.
  - h. Mark: It's good practice that if both Co-Chairs vote against the resolution (as K and Michele did), someone else will present it at the Full Board meeting.
  - i. Meg (Transportation): There were some resolutions that we passed that aren't on the agenda for the February Board (i.e. M11 bus route). A Joint Parks/Transportation Resolution was also passed concerning safe, direct cross-town routes for Central Park. In February, Transportation will be discussing forming guidelines for loading zones. There will also be a speaker on crash-avoidance technology.

- j. Roberta: Several other Boards have passed Resolutions concerning guidelines for loading zones. We should look into those (CB4 and 6).
- k. Cindy (District Needs & Budget Priorities): At each Committee Meeting we'll explain the online form for submitting the Needs and Priorities to put our requests into context.
- I. Linda (Business): Hosting a 90 minute Town Hall on small business issues on March 23/24 with a 30 minute Q&A. The panel will include a large and small landlord in the district and a large and small retailer in the District. Doug will also sit on the panel. Andrew will moderate. The Town Hall will be put on the website so people can be informed and submit questions in advance.
  - i. Melissa: Get data from City Planning to contextualize discussion?
  - ii. Linda: Yes. Just re-iterating that we don't want this to be a political event.
- m. Steven (YEL): We have a resolution in support of Lafayette Academy (middle school looking to expand into a high school with an IB program). A couple of meetings ago a few people spoke about G&T programs and the SDAG report. We'll be discussing the SDAG report further at our next meeting.
- n. Susan: It would be nice to have a moment of silence for George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, a longtime member of the Board who recently passed away. (Mark agrees, if family is okay with it)
- o. Madelyn (NYCHA Taskforce): Disappointed that the Democratic State Assembly didn't provide funding to NYCHA. We need to have elected officials come before us and explain themselves. Mayor Bloomberg and de Blasio have beautified the city and done nothing for NYCHA. NYCHA residents matter, their votes count.
- p. Mark: The Governor released the budget today, maybe we should discuss that.
- q. Shelly: We should invite all elected officials in State Assembly/Senate and ask them to explain why they did or didn't support NYCHA funding and then pass a resolution.
- r. Roberta: We should look at the budget first before we write a letter.
- s. Melissa: A letter about this should be involved Housing and should be phrased gently. It would also be nice to hear more tenants at meetings.
- 6. New business
  - a. NA

**Present:** Mark Diller, Linda Alexander, Steven Brown, Cindy Cardinal, Louisa Craddock, Sheldon J. Fine, Julian Giordano, K Karpen, Doug Kleiman, Klari Neuwelt, Michele Parker, Seema Reddy, Andrew Rigie, Melissa Rosenberg, Meg Schmitt and Roberta Semer. **Board Members:** Ken Coughlin, Madelyn Innocent, Audrey Isaacs, Jeannette Rausch and Susan Schwartz. **Absent:** Elizabeth Caputo, Christian Cordova, Page Cowley, Catherine DeLazzero, Blanche Lawton, Sara Lind and Howard Yaruss.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:00 PM

# **BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE MINUTES**

Linda Alexander and Christian Cordova, Co-Chairpersons January 8, 2020

Business & Consumer Issues Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met at the District Office, 250 West 87<sup>th</sup> Street. Co-Chairperson Christian Cordova called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm.

The following matters were discussed:

# New application to the SLA for a two-year liquor license:

- 1. **225 Columbus Avenue** (West 70<sup>th</sup> Street) Stephen Locke Corp to be formed d/b/a To be Determined. Presenting for the Applicant: Manny Colon
  - Transitioning from one owner to the other.
  - New business name will be determined.
  - Manny will continue to be involved.
  - Posted meeting notices previous Monday.

#### **CB7 Comments:**

• Will have applicant post meeting notice before February Full Board meeting.

After due deliberation the resolution to approve was adopted

Committee: 8-0-0-0

## Renewal Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés:

 2. 267 Columbus Avenue (West 72<sup>nd</sup> – 73<sup>rd</sup> Streets.) Renewal application #1072082-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Classic Food, Inc., d/b/a Sido, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 3 tables and 6 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Emile Aleh

- Showed photos of notice postings.
- No changes to the existing operation.

After due deliberation the resolution to approve was adopted

Committee: 8-0-0-0

3. **475 Columbus Avenue** (West 83<sup>rd</sup> Street.) Renewal application #1382144-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by IL Rifugio, Inc., d/b/a Tarallucci E Vino, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Lucca di Pietro

- Showed photos of notice postings.
- No changes to the existing operation.

After due deliberation the resolution to approve was adopted

Committee: 8-0-0-0

4. **2450 Broadway** (West 90<sup>th</sup> – 91<sup>st</sup> Streets.) Renewal application #0940252-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Carmine's Broadway Feast, Inc., d/b/a Carmine's, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed café with 7 tables and 22 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Paul Palagian

- Showed photos of notice postings.
- No changes to the existing operation.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted

Committee: 8-0-0-0

5. **1018 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 110<sup>th</sup> Street.) Renewal application #2050848-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Madrel, LLC, Inc., d/b/a Marlow Bistro, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 30 tables and 58 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Pete Janosik, SWAarchitecture.com

- Had photos of notice postings and design layout.
- No changes to the existing operation.

#### **CB7 Comments:**

Will have applicant post meeting notice before February Full Board meeting.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted

Committee: 8-0-0-0

#### 6. New business.

- A neighbor of Guyer's, Shira Spiewak attended the BCI meeting. Within the past few months, Ms. Spiewak has sent the board office and committee several smart phone videos of unapproved karaoke events and late night bar service exceeding the venue's current method of operations, She said the noise level is so high, she has to sleep with earplugs and added the bar's management has ignored her complaints. Moreover, Guyer's owner, Cindy Guyer, was expected to come to BCI to discuss am application to change the bar's method of operations, did not show.
- BCI Store Vacancy Town Hall:
  - o Proposed venue: Goddard Riverside.
  - Proposed dates: March 23 or March 24<sup>th</sup>
  - Panel to include invested parties, ideally comprising a small UWS property owner and a large UWS property owner; local retail business owner, local restaurant owner, and retail expert, such as a consultant or broker.
  - o 90 minutes duration including a ½ hour for a Q & A session.
  - o Andrew Rigie to moderate; Doug Kleiman becomes fifth panelist as the retail expert.
  - Prospective panelists, suggested by the committee:
    - Retailers: Owners of West Side Kids, Darryl's Boutique, Zabar's
    - Restaurateurs: Danny Abrams (Mermaid Inn, Pizzeria Sirenetta), Lee Seinfeld (Dive Bar, Dive 75),
       Jeff Kadish (Calle Ocho);
    - Property Owners: Alex Brodsky, William Friedland, David Zabar. George Beane

**Present:** Linda Alexander, Christian Cordova, Barbara Adler, Joshua Cohen, Paul Fischer, Doug Kleiman, Michele Parker, Seema Reddy, Andrew Rigie. **Absent:** William Ortiz

The meeting ended at 8:05 pm.

# **HEALTH & HUMAN SERVICES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**

#### Catherine DeLazzero and Sheldon Fine, Co-Chairpersons

Marseilles Residence, 230 West 103rd Street (Just West of Broadway) January 28, 2020 7:00 PM

# Topic: EFFECTS OF MEDICAID AND MEDICARE REIMBURSEMENT LEVELS ON SUSTAINABILITY OF NURSING HOMES SERVING OUR COMMUNITY

Co-Chair Shelly Fine presented an overview of the issue, including the facts that six million families in New York State are covered by Medicaid and that there is a crisis looming on nursing home and homecare reimbursement for fully covered Medicaid recipients.

Amsterdam Nursing Home and The New Jewish Home have serve our community with excellent care for many decades and both are non-profit homes.

He called on Doug Kleiman who alerted us to the funding problems he discovered from his father's stay in a nursing home.

Then Shelly introduced our two presenters:

**William Pascocello,** Senior vice president and Administrator of Amsterdam Nursing Home Corporation (wjpascocello@amsterdamnh.org) and

**Ann Ritter,** Senior Director Institutional Relations and Program Development, the New Jewish Home (ARitter@jewishhome.org)

#### Mr. Pascocello presented the following information:

- Budget discussions are going on now in Albany
- There is already a \$1.7 million gap in payments with another three months to go in the fiscal year.
- Amsterdam Nursing Home has a \$5 million deficit. It has not had an increase in reimbursement in 13 years although costs have increased.
- Medicaid is 50% federal funds and 50% state and city funds.
- The funding stream for Medicaid long term care is underfunded by the Medicaid
- Redesign Team (MRT) and has had no increase in 21 years.
- Higher services fees for higher acuity make up for shortfalls in Medicaid payments
- However, Amsterdam Nursing Home is in a very deep hole, losing \$170 per day for each Medicaid patient.
- Medicare and private HMOs help make up the gap, but the gap is too big.

#### Ann Ritter of the New Jewish Home presented the following information and recommendations:

- The New Jewish Home is a 24/7 skilled nursing facility, an adult day center, a rehabilitation facility, a long term care facility and a care management agency.
- They New Jewish Home trains doctors, nurses, as well as young people in gerontology.
- Three out of four of their clients are on Medicaid.
- The Home loses money on every Medicaid patient.
- The 3/31/20 Medicaid Redesign Team (MRT) report needs to represent patients and providers.
- The MRT is appointed by the governor. It now includes Denis Rivera from the Health and Hospital Workers Union and the head of Northwell Health.
- No non-profit nursing home/long term care providers are currently on the MRT.
- Unionization makes for stability but is expensive.
- There is a need for active examination of the situation of non-profits in order to provide needed funding streams.
- In the last 5 years 45 non-profit homes have closed. Private providers take over many of these.

#### Committee member Robert Espier informed us that:

- Non-profits give four hours of besides nursing per day.
- For profit providers give 2 1/2 hours.
- Home care hours for Medicaid patients is insufficient.
- Medicaid is already underfunded and governor is asking for reductions.

#### Committee discussion.

How do we target relief for providers with better outcomes?

We can work with the Homes and with Leading Age NY that represents providers of service to the aging.

The Governor is asking for 1% reduction in payments or about \$600 million.

CB7 should advocate for long term care facilities inclusion on the MRT.

Our resolution should be sent to the Governor, City Councilman Levine (Chair of the Council Health Committee) Manhattan Community Boards, all of our local State Assembly Members and State Senators and Majority and Minority leaders and the New York City Age-Friendly Commission

Co-Chair Shelly Fine formulated the following resolution:

**RESOLUTION IS APPROVED, Committee:** 5-0-0-0. Non-committee Board members: 2-0-0-0.

**Present:** Catherine DeLazzero, Shelly Fine, Robert Espier, Lolita Ferrin and Madge Rosenberg. **Chair:** Mark Diller

Non-Committee Board Members: Doug Kleiman. Absent: Audrey Isaacs and Meg Schmitt.

# **Transportation Committee**

Howard Yaruss and Meg Schmitt, Co-Chairs Joint With

# **Parks and Environment Committee**

Elizabeth Caputo and Klari Neuwelt, Co-Chairs

#### **Minutes**

Tuesday, January 14, 2020

**Committee Members Present:** Howard Yaruss, Meg Schmitt, Elizabeth Caputo, Klari Neuwelt, Roberta Semer, Barbara Adler, Cindy Cardinal, Richard Robbins, Julien Giordano, Susan Schwartz, Ken Coughlin, Sara Lind.

**Non-committee Board Members Present:** Mark Diller, Jay Adolf, William Ortiz, Paul Fisher, Audrey Isaacs

# 1. Excessive salting of streets:

Howard has noted increased salting on the streets, often as much as an inch thick. After a brief discussion about the ill effects of too much salt in the air, the committee decided to write a letter to the Department of Sanitation, to ask about the recent conditions before taking any additional actions.

## 2. Consideration of safe, direct crosstown routes for pedestrians, cyclists, and others through Central Park:

A moment of silence was held for Dr. Daniel Cammerman, who was killed while riding his bike on the 96<sup>th</sup> Street transverse through Central Park.

There were numerous public speakers on this issue:

- Colleen Chattergoon from DOT said she was mostly there to listen but was working with the Central Park
  Conservancy (CPC) to provide safer access. Endorsed the idea of a task force as best way to get things
  done.
- Carolina Greenleaf from Central Park Conservancy (CPC) said they've been working with DOT to make safer routes. In response to a remark, said they recently installed several dismount signs as the number of wheeled devices (including scooters, skateboards, bikes, etc.) has dramatically increased, and they're prohibited on pedestrian paths.
  - Noted that park was never designed for today's uses.
- Deputy Inspector Naoki Yaguchi Central Park Precinct said they have not been ticketing bikes that ride
  on the bridal path but would do so if asked.
- Andy Rosenthal was the first public speaker, and had a photo of Dr.
   Cammerman: Said he was very angry because he had proposed a path 10 years ago that could have saved Dr. Cammerman had it been implemented.
  - Saw no reason why no safe crosstown routes had been developed in all this time.
- Richard Fine: An East/West passage that is safe is essential. Has gotten no responses from CPC personnel despite reaching out.
- Reid Rubey: Rides through the park often, and on the transverses. We need a safe path.
- Lisa Sladkus: Noted the differences between the park paths (surface routes) as opposed to the transverses, which go under the park.
- Paul Schcreiber: Doesn't want transverses to be one-way because 55,000 daily commuters who use them with buses and cars will be inconvenienced.
- Brian Smith, an eastsider, said they want safe routes too. Pointed out that riding down protected Columbus to 72<sup>nd</sup> across the park and then uptown on protected 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue provides a safe route however inconvenient.

- Brian Hoberman: Take 96<sup>th</sup> St. transverse and says there's no sign priority directing to 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue.
- John: Drives car for 2 miles every day to cross park only because he doesn't feel safe on the transverses.
- Deborah Robb: Feels fortunate to have the safe path at 72<sup>nd</sup> St. near her. Would like to see a safe path all the way from there to the greenway.
- Claire Bowen; Very difficult to cross the park, so she takes the bus carrying helmet, then picks up CitiBike.
- Allison Fisher: Bikes everywhere. Finds transverses very scary, especially at night.
- Becky Batchelor: Lives on west side, works on east side. Takes 96<sup>th</sup> St. transverse daily. Detours south to 72<sup>nd</sup> St. path for a safe route then heads back uptown once on east side.
- Carl: Asked to leave transverse alone because most people use them either on buses or cars.
- Howard Gold: Many rely on buses or cars to get across. Suggested another option.

#### **Board Members comments:**

- Ken Coughlin: The easy solutions he sees are:
  - permit cyclists to use the 96th Street path from the East Drive to Fifth Avenue end the status of the 96th Street shared-use path as a well-kept secret through better signage and wayfinding & repave path; remove the dismount signs on the bridle path south of the Reservoir; create new shared-use paths across the park at 85th Street and in the '60s. Harder solutions: make cycling on the transverses feasible and safe, perhaps by combining the space currently allocated to sidewalks to create protected bike lanes.
- Sara Lind: As pedestrian would never walk across the transverses- too frightening.
- Elizabeth Caputo: Wants to make sure that emergency vehicles are not held up having to go from east to
  west or vice versa. Suggested another meeting with photos to illuminate discussion and possible
  creation of task force.
- William Ortiz: Inexperienced riders should be in protected lane. Ideally create a separate path for bikers.
- Klari Neuwelt: Remembered years ago when same issue came up it was determined that there weren't
  enough users to make changes as there are now. Suggested no resolution tonight, but schedule another
  joint committee meeting.
- Susan Schwartz: Says the large packs of bikes at 72<sup>nd</sup> entering the park makes crossing into the park extremely harrowing often, and should be looked at.
- Roberta Semer: As walker through the park, better signage is needed.
- Mark Diller: Transverses were built in 1050's. Not built for commuter route. Buses must remain 2-way. Suggested easiest solution was a shared path, middle option to evaluate individual paths for pedestrians and one for wheeled vehicles; third option most difficult, to see what can be done with the transverses.
- Barbara Adler: Not a biker. Finds transverses very scary to walk though, doesn't think anyone should be walking or biking through them. Must create safe surface paths to cross the park on bikes.
- Jay Adolf: Would like to see dedicated bike lanes, dedicated pedestrian lanes east to west. Questioned where money would come from. [Klari: believes some city funding + money from CPC could be used. Ms. Greenleaf concurred.]
- Richard Robbins: Feels strongly that a short-term action to prevent further tragedy is best, and that DOT, CPC, NYPD and CB7 should all work together in a task force.
   Proposed the resolution that appears below.

#### Resolution:

Whereas, a short-term action is needed to prevent another tragedy, like the recent death of Dr. Daniel Cammerman, who was killed while crossing Central Park on route by bicycle to his office:

Therefore, Community Board 7 requests the following take place as soon as possible.

- Clearer signage where wheeled vehicles CAN go to cross park;
- Stricter enforcement of motor vehicles speeding on the transverses, not limited to but including the use of-"Your speed" signs;
- Consideration of other short-term solutions to enhance safety;
- A cross-agency task force with a representative from each agency (DOT, DPR, CP & NYPD) be set-up;
- The task force is to come back to the Transportation and Parks & Environment Committees no later than March with proposed solutions.

**VOTE**: Joint committee members: 13-0-1-0. Non-Committee Members: 5-0-1-0.

Committee chairs will further detail the wording of the resolution after the meeting.

Note that the Transportation Committee proceeded at this point with transportation-only agenda items; Parks and Environment committee members adjourned.

- 3. 370 West End Avenue (W.77<sup>th</sup>-78<sup>th</sup> Sts.) Petition for a new revocable consent to construct, maintain and use three planted areas: Applicant didn't show up. Tabled for next month.
- **4. Street Co-Naming Guidelines:** CB7's last two last two committee and full board-approved\_street co-naming applications were turned down by the City Council\_as they didn't meet city guidelines, therefore CB7 will adopt the standards used by the Council and use them in conjunction with CB7's existing guidelines/requirements (which require additional documentation of community support) when considering applications.

Vote: Committee Members: 10-0-0-0; Non-Committee Members: 3-0-0-0

**5. Improving the M11 Bus Route:** One of the least dependable buses, due to traffic caused by the Lincoln tunnel traffic. A letter from CB4 to Ed Pincar, Manhattan Borough Commissioner of DOT, complained about the slowness of the M11 bus. Ken Coughlin suggested we write a resolution in support of the letter.

#### Resolution:

Whereas, The M11 bus has received several Pokey awards for being the slowest bus, as well as an 'F' rating in the last three report cards due to traffic due to Lincoln Tunnel traffic, with ratings issued by the Bus Turn around Coalition, traveling at only 4.9 miles per hour, and being unreliable. Therefore, Community Board 7 requests that the route be studied by the DOT, jointly with the MTA, to address methods to address the poor performance.

Vote: Committee members: 9-0-0-0; Non-Committee Members: 3-0-0-0

## New Business:

**Lisa Orman** said the 97<sup>th</sup> & West End Avenue corner still hasn't gotten the expected remedies, and that half the bollards were down. Colleen Chattergoon said she hopes to get granite block soon. She also said that they're hoping Summer Streets can extend across 72<sup>nd</sup> Street shared path into Riverside Park from the Brooklyn Bridge all the way to the George Washington Bridge, which would really open up Summer Streets the UWS.

**Barbara Adler,** (committee member) said she is working with Deputy Inspector Malin, Sergeant Fernandez, and Captain Sarubbi-Barcia to confiscate the illegal "Police Surgeon" placards on three cars in her neighborhood, all with the same number. The placards can be purchased online for \$250 a piece, and although totally illegal, look real enough to scare

away most traffic enforcement personnel. If anyone else sees these, report them to the police. **Doug Kleiman** said there are other fakes around as well.

Beverly Molot, (community member), noted that the southbound M5 bus stop at W104 was being moved to W103rd Street, and she objected saying it wasn't as safe a location to wait for the bus. Andrew Albert said it had to have been a Parks initiative, not Transit or DOT. He will follow up with Transit on this issue.

The Transportation Committee will revisit possible standards/critieria for reviewing loading zone requests at its February committee meeting.

**Paul Fisher** (non-committee CB7 member) requested a bus shelter to be added to the bus stop located at W110th St and Manhattan Avenue, servicing the M6 and M7. Committee members took information for follow up with the MTA.

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 PM.

# **Parks & Environment Committee Meeting**

Monday, 01/27/2020 @ 7:00 p.m.

<u>Committee Members present:</u> Klari Neuwelt("KN") – co-chair; Elizabeth Caputo ("EC") – co-chair; Barbara Adler ("BA"); Ken Coughlin ("KC"); Natasha Kazmi ("NK"); Susan Schwartz ("SS"); Committee Members Absent: Doug McGowan; Jennifer Nitzky; <u>Non-Committee Members Present:</u> Mark Diller ("MD")

The meeting was called to order at 7:02pm.

#### Item # 1: Discussion of meeting time going forward for the P&E Committee:

Open discussion by CB7 members: Currently the Land Use, Transportation, and P&E Committees are the only CB7 committees that have meetings starting at 7:00 p.m. Most members of the committee preferred the 6:30 p.m. start, or had the flexibility for it. One notable exception was Doug McGowan , who was not present at the meeting but had informed KN that he would prefer the later start so that he could have dinner with his family before attending the meetings.

#### Non-CB7 Community Discussion:

Daniel Atha, Upper West Side Naturalists Group: The Group would be flexible between a 6:30 and 7:00 p.m. start. Riverside Park Manager (Geoff Martin) and other NYC agency representatives: Agency representatives generally would prefer a 6:30 p.m. start because they usually come to our meetings from work.

The unanimous decision by the P&E Committee was to implement the 6:30 p.m. start time for the next few meetings and revisit the issue, if necessary, after a few months.

# Item # 2: Discussion about current capital projects in Riverside Park ("RP"):

Speakers: Margaret Bracken, Riverside Park Landscape Architect.

KN: Riverside Park South Phases 5 and 6 are very complicated and will not be discussed today, neither will any bike issues related to RP.

#### 1. Bus stops – scheduled completion May 2020:

MB: This has been funded with DOT money. The stops within CB7 are on  $100^{th}$ ,  $103^{rd}$ , and  $106^{th}$  streets. These are two-thirds completed, will be ADA-compliant when done. Photos of the stops were shown.

KC: Referring to a CB7 resident's concerns at the last Transportation Committee meeting, mainly regarding perceived safety issues at the 103<sup>rd</sup> street bus stop. The concerns relate to the resident's claim that where the stop is being moved to is not as well-lit and does not have coverage by doormen from nearby buildings.

MB: This stop is being moved from the south side of 104<sup>th</sup> to north side of 103<sup>rd</sup> street. So the move is very small, not one whole block. A continuous pavement is also being made, so safety will be better. In general, isolated and shady conditions are very typical of RP bus stops. Reasons for moving this particular stop: (i) to line up northbound and southbound bus stops, and (ii) right now buses have to stop in the sidewalk, a potential safety hazard. MB also reminded us that this was not a Parks Department design; it was in fact created by the traffic engineers of the Department of Transportation.

#### 2. Skate Park – scheduled completion by May 2020:

MB: The progress has been a bit slow. Photos that showed a messy worksite were shared. However, MB clarified that this phase of underground work, installing new catch basins, etc, is what takes longest. California Skate Parks, the subcontractor, is at the site every day. Completion is expected on time and on budget by 05/2020.

<u>Community Member Comment - Ian Clarke:</u> The skateboard community is very excited about this park. However, since 05/23/2020 is the 10th anniversary of the skate park in Chelsea, please do not hold the opening day that day.

#### 3. Field House - completion pending:

MB: The Field House will be open this summer. It will be a wonderful public space with ADA-compliant restrooms on the north side. These will be accessible from the interior and exterior of the building year-round. The south side has gala space, offices, and storage space. The building is not expected to be open to the public continuously, only when planned programming conducted by both DPR and/or Conservancy is in progress.

KN: Requested an update on the 2010 design project that was conducted by Parsons architecture students. Was supposed to be completed in a year.

MB: The Parsons project was too complex and the infrastructure needs, especially sewage, etc, were just too great to be feasible in the short time span.

<u>Community Member Comment – Ira Gershenhorn:</u> Is the glass in the Field House bird safe? How will the restrooms be heated? The beautiful porcelain fixtures might be at risk for vandalism.

MB: Yes, the glass is bird safe. Bathrooms will be heated by electricity from the grid. Designers did not think vandalism was a major risk.

- <u>4. Field House Recreation Area expected completion March 2020:</u> Privately funded courtyard area to the west of the Field House. Paver layout going on right now.
- 5. Joan of Arc completed October 2019: Completed six months ahead of schedule.

<u>Community Member Comment – Daniel Atha ("DA"):</u> Displeased with the increase in the amount of lawn and it being fenced in.

MB: The amount of lawn has in fact been reduced and is not fenced in.

- <u>6. 76th Street Recreation Area completed September 2019</u>: Completed seven months ahead of schedule. PB project through CM Helen Rosenthal.
- 7. 102<sup>nd</sup> Street Stairs: CB7 recently approved the design. In final stages of planning and funding.

## 8. 83rd Street Ramp – Completed December 2019:

MB: Privately funded. The tunnel has been improved with new paint and new landscaping.

<u>Community Member Comment – Ira Gershenhorn:</u> The renovated tunnel is now a superfast highway for bikes. In addition, the asphalt used is impermeable and will result in flooding.

MB: Catch basins, which have proven effective elsewhere, have been installed. Also, the old permeable pavement still exists underneath the new impermeable one. Also, DPR's view is that permeable pavements do not work all the time as a means of avoiding flooding.

KN: Was the contractor a private contractor engaged by the Riverside Park Conservancy, which managed the project? MB: Yes. KN: On days when the work was being done, water was streaming out of the adjacent fire hydrant at full blast for hours and being wasted. MB: The contractor used the hydrant to power wash the walls in the tunnels. Apparently this hydrant is broken and doesn't turn off. KN: This hydrant is now not flowing, but I have repeatedly brought this hydrant, and two others to the south that have been leaking water, to the attention of Riverside Park staff. Geoff Martin: He has tried to get EPC to fix the hydrants.

<u>9. 105th Street Fitness Equipment:</u> Privately funded. Equipment like chin-ups and safety bars have been installed, with a safety surface underneath.

## 10. Phase 1 Riverside Park South – Award Cycle:

KN: This project involves improvements to the first section of Riverside Park South, which was finished a couple of decades ago. In connection with the ULURP process concerning proposed changes at the southern end of the Riverside South site, the City Council and then-CM Brewer awarded \$2.5 million to DPR, which is being used for this project.

MB: Work for this project was started in 2013. It is now in its third bid cycle and DPR is "on the verge of awarding the contract". No start date has been set as yet. The multiple bid cycles are a result of past bids coming in very high, requiring DPR to return to the drawing board to conduct significant value engineering. In addition, the small skate park originally

planned for this site was moved uptown, providing some funding and physical space relief. Other reasons for the delay include the Public Design Commission's ("PDC") request to review this phase along with the complicated phases 5 and 6 together. The project has a price tag of \$6MM, comprised of funds from the City Council and the Mayor's office. The planned shade structure over Pier I was too expensive and contributed to the bidding issues; it was eventually dropped from the design.

Community Member Comment – Andy Rosenthal ("AR"): Shared a (not current) drawing from DPR's web site showing Phase 1. According to this design, a short portion of the bike path is immediately north of Field A and the pedestrian path is separated from it by a green area. In addition, a new pedestrian path will be created to connect to the dog run east of the Little League Field. According to AR, once bikers discover this new pedestrian path, which is essentially a short cut to 72<sup>nd</sup> street, they will definitely cut across, thereby creating a safety hazard for everyone. MB explained that the new pedestrian path would have to be widened a lot to accommodate bikers, and this could only be achieved by eliminating the dog run in that area. In addition, the area also has a staircase for pedestrians at 73nd Street, which will be accessible by this path. Allowing bikers into this area would increase the potential for pedestrian/biker conflict.

While AR strongly advocated changes to the design, DPR's position is that since the agency is very close to awarding the contract, no major changes are possible at this late stage.

KN: Troublesome that even with about \$1.4 million transferred from a compostable toilet project at the RCTA tennis court area (which did not appear ever to be likely to get full funding) to make up what was then the bidding shortfall, and other infusions of diverted funds, the price of this project spiked to \$6 million, even with the shade structure was removed from the scope.

<u>11. FEMA Reconstructions – expected completion October 2020:</u> This work refers to the reconstruction of three areas that were severely impacted by Hurricane Sandy in 2012. Funds earmarked for all three projects: \$1.6MM.

- 59<sup>th</sup> Street: Is presently under construction and will be finished in four months. Collapse of existing hard edge and replacing hexagonal bricks and the riprap.
- Cherry Walk: Presently not under construction. Will require a four-month closure of the Cherry Walk. Project is repair of the rip rap and a few small areas where the pavement has subsided. As part of a separate project, DPR will address repaving issues along the entire Cherry Walk using "state of good repair" funds. There is no current time frame for that project, and it can't be done at the same time as the FEMA project. KC: How will cyclists be routed during the FEMA work closure of the Cherry Walk? MB: That is an issue for John Herrold and DOT.
- Fort Washington: Currently under construction. This site is not within CB7's area.

12. Drainage Study and Reconstruction of Drainage Infrastructure: This refers to the recent \$11.5MM Mayoral award to conduct a drainage study of Riverside Park and then reconstruct some of the most critical areas. The need for this effort is due to the fact that the drainage system of RP dates back to the 1930s and is overdue for repair. While the Study will address the entire RP, most issues are expected to be uncovered north of 103<sup>rd</sup> street. Certainly, issues have been identified around 97<sup>th</sup>, 115<sup>th</sup>, and 116<sup>th</sup> streets. \$3.5MM of the funds are earmarked for the Study itself, while \$8MM are set aside for the reconstruction.

KN: The low-lying area just south of the Holocaust Memorial and north of 79<sup>th</sup> Street is a good example, among many, of areas that pond after rain and fill with ice in freezing weather. Will such areas be addressed? MB: Such areas may be included in the study, but the amount of money available in this project is unlikely to be sufficient to repair/reconstruct most such areas.

<u>Community Member Comment – Daniel Atha ("DA"):</u> Green infrastructure should be considered first to resolve drainage issues in our parks. This would benefit both the wildlife and the environment.

MB: Unfortunately, the drainage solution will have to be multi-pronged because of the sheer volume of water in RP.

## Item # 3: Update on Committee Discussions:

The Lasker Rink proposal sailed through the Landmarks Preservation Commission. It was also presented at the Public Design Commission, but there was no quorum present for a vote. The meeting was adjourned at 8:50 p.m.

# YOUTH, EDUCATION AND LIBRARIES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Blanche Lawton and Steven Brown, Co-Chairpersons January 16, 2020 6:30 PM

The Youth, Education & Libraries Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met on Thursday, January 16, 2020 at the District Office, 250 West 87<sup>th</sup> Street, floor HC, in the District. The meeting was called to order at 6:35 pm by cochairs Blanche Lawton and Steven Brown. Committee members Catherine DeLazzero, Lolita Ferrin, Paul Fischer, Julian Giordano, Doug McGowan and Ira Mitchneck, and non-committee Board member Mark Diller participated.

The following topics were discussed.

# Discussion with Virgil de Voldère and Ellen Malterre regarding the potential for expanding Lafayette Academy into an International Baccalaureate program serving grades 6-12.

- The inspiration for the collaboration between parents and Principal Brian Zager included experiences at PS 84 in the early 2000s.
- At PS 84, Principal Robyn Sundik established Dual Language programs, first in Spanish, and later based on expressions of interest from 100 families, in French.
- PS 84's building was also the first home of the Dual Language Middle School in District 3, serving a Spanish-English Dual Language program.
- It is no accident that PS 84 is among the most integrated programs in District 3.
- Parents' interest in Lafayette followed the same visionary spirit as at PS 84.
- Parents and students recognized that there were few opportunities to continue French Dual Language studies in Middle School in District 3, and even fewer such opportunities in High School in the District.
- Principal Zager was not afraid of taking low-performing students and fostering achievement, including through a Dual Language approach.
- In so doing, he has fostered an incredible community that is beautifully diverse.
- Video describing the curriculum and approach of Lafayette Academy.
- Dual Language immersion is the way of the future the importance of dual language studies and the awareness of other cultures and means of expression cannot be overemphasized in creating readiness for careers and for participation in our world.
- Dual Language programming as employed at Lafayette Academy Diversity embraces a dual immersion approach.
- French is taught not as a stand-alone subject, but also as an alternate means of expression.
- Teaching in all content areas, including academic subjects, is done in both languages. Students rapidly develop dual fluency.
- Research has shown that students who pursue dual language immersion studies have a higher graduation rate, and go on to higher wages and achieve a higher social status going forward.
- Embedded in the dual language immersion approach is a fundamental respect for and appreciation of other cultures. This leads to greater respect and greater facility with the world around us.
- International Baccalaureate:
- Lafayette seeks to transition into an International Baccalaureate program.
- To do so, the school must expand through high school grades.
- There are several IB programs in New York City, but only 2 in District 3: a public school program at PS 242 in Harlem, and a private school program at the Dwight School.
- Generally speaking, IB programs tend to have a high percentage of affluent children the Harlem experience runs counter to this trend).
- The goal of Lafayette Academy is to bring this resource to a more diverse student body.
- Lafayette Academy MS 256 is the continuation and re-envisioning of the form Middle School for Athletic and Academic Excellence, which was home to a disproportionate number of students performing on State tests below grade level.

- Principal Zager embraces and is experiencing achievement success in this environment.
- The IB experience is premised on trusting the student.
- It was created in the 1950s and is employed to help students value who they are, and be valued for who they are. The IB curriculum establishes no hard mold to which to conform, and has a flexible and constantly-evolving curriculum.
- The curriculum proceeds from an exploration of who we all are, and who the student is, as people.
- There is no overwhelming focus on standardized tests students are more mature when valued and respected, and that environment produces achievement greater than intensive cramming.
- IB doesn't just address academic skills. It values "soft" skills empathy, perseverance, identification with others all of which are at the core of what are known in business as "executive functions."
- These executive functions are one of the keys to succeed in college and beyond.
- IB requires each senior to formulate, pursue and present a year-long independent personal project. The project must reflect an interdisciplinary approach.
- Students who complete an IB diploma and personal project in general are empowered to approach college selection and application with confidence.
- The experience of self-confidence, empathy and empowerment common to IB graduates is shared with students from all over the world, and creates an atmosphere of mutual respect.
- IB is a diploma program. Students' work is graded against a wider array of objectives, and emphasizes interdisciplinary study and analysis.
- The essence of the IB approach is to devise ways to stimulate inquiry teachers don't actually answer the questions, but help students formulate them.
- "How do we build knowledge." "How do we understand the world around us." These questions lead to deep conversations.
- IB was founded on a humanistic approach based on the Charter of Basic Human Rights developed in 1950s into a curriculum.
- Colleges know the value of IB graduates.
- To achieve IB certification, the IB institute in London must evaluate and approve a school as a participant. Highly advanced and intensive certification process.
- Takes appx 2-4 years to attain the certification.
- Teachers need to be trained and certified. The training is offered through the IB Institute.
- IB inspectors come to the school to review the work of teachers and students.
- IB students must satisfy Regents requirements for a NYS diploma, and greater and additional requirements for the IB diploma (e.g. the senior independent project).
- Successful IB students may be offered the opportunity to enter college as a Sophomore.
- Contrast: AP grants credit in a specific subject; IB credit as a student year.
- Principal Zager has met with UNIS, Boerum Hill High School, Clinton High School (all IB-certified). Lafayette Academy is ready to start the process of seeking certification.
- The expectation is that Lafayette Academy would build additional dual language offerings.
- Interest from French and Italian consulates, Russian families all indicates that support will be available.
- The District 3 Superintendent and the Executive Superintendent is supportive of the expansion to a 6-12, and the IB certification effort..
- Creating a 6-12 program which will include a priority for high school admissions for continuing middle school students will be a de facto District 3 preference for a D3 high school.
- Unable to secure a D3-priority high school in any other manner.
- Goal to expand to HS for 2021 at the earliest.
- Steps needed to expand to 9<sup>th</sup> grade and begin phasing in the high school include:
   (a) securing space needed for adding grades 9-12 to Lafayette Academy (considered not feasible in its current space within the Joan Of Arc building), and

- (b) securing the funding needed for teacher training, curriculum development and other professional supports needed to satisfy the IB requirements.
- There are currently 2 sections per grade at Lafayette Academy.
- Lafayette Academy would need to work on adapting the existing middle school curriculum. First part would be to adapt the curriculum training

#### Committee and Public Comments and Questions:

#### Ira Mitchneck:

- Q: Does the French Consulate support the program?
- A: Yes the French Consul in New York was in the school's video!
  - -- the Consulate has been very supportive with resources.
- The French Consulate is aware of District 3 dual language excellence through previous interactions and support of PS 84.

#### Doug McGowan:

- Q: Is there sufficient space within JoA to expand as needed?
- A: Not considered likely as Lafayette Academy is co-located with 2 other public schools (MS 333 and the Community Action School, so current space is already complicated.

#### Julian Giordano:

- Grew up in Belgiujm attended dual language schools.
- Inability to attend a dual language middle school in District 3 means that his French language skills have eroded.

#### **Catherine DeLazzero:**

- Q: What approach is taken to curriculum in the dual language context.
- A: Elementary classes are organized to include class half native speakers of the target language, and half non-speakers.
- A: Programs create community learning to read and write in the target language is a builder of common bonds.
- A: At HS level students are no longer learning the language the goal is to study art, culture, history, science, math etc. and read/write in the target language.

#### **Blanche Lawton:**

- Q: Curriculum in compliance with NYS Standards?
- A: Yes the curriculum meets (and exceeds) all applicable standards.
- A: What challenge does Lafayette face?
- A: Dearth of materials in foreign language. For example, most elementary schools use the Teachers College Reading/Writing Program. To support dual language study the teachers must translate these works themselves.

#### **Lolita Ferrin:**

- Q: Application process?
- A: MS choice as with all other D3 middle schools.
- A: Students finish all Regents requirements by 11<sup>th</sup> grade then must choose whether to seek IB diploma. Takes a huge commitment.
- Capstone project should have a community or international basis element of being of service to a wider audience.

#### Mark Diller:

• Q: What funding is needed?

- A: The minimum initial investment in training and curriculum development is approximately \$80K. Once certified, on-going training and work would require approximately about \$50K per year.
- Current teachers at Lafayette are excited by the prospect of Lafayette.

#### Joe Negron (KIPP Schools):

- Q: What the process for expanding?
- A: Seeking seats now to be ready when new Russian and Italian programs are ready for MS.

## Caroline (D3 Parent)

- Q: What is the entry point for applying?
- A: Lafayette students can be accepted as mono language students, but can be offered admission to the dual language program when the student achieves competence in the second language.

#### Larry (D3 Parent):

- From personal experience, the IB program is a great option.
- Enter mono and keep on that track.

## Mesha Allen (Ryan Health Center)

• Wished had this chance as a kid.

#### Steven Brown

- Diversity using differing electives and different cohorts in language proficiency to mix students to build integration.
- PS 84 has been recognized and won an award for a diversity prize.

Resolution: To express support for the dual language program for Lafayette Academy, and for its proposed expansion to a 6-12 program with adequate space and funding to pursue IB certification.

VOTE: 8-0-0-1

#### **Future meetings:**

- Potential speaker from SDAG to discuss its recommendations in the two reports.
  - -- YEL Committee to study the reports and build a program or panel discussion.
- PTA funding addressing the proposal that the PTAs in District 3 that raise prodigious amounts of funding should he required to share a portion of such proceeds.

#### Presentation by Mesha Allen of the Ryan Health Center:

- Serving as an Americorps Member community liaison at Ryan Health Center.
- Black History month-themed book drive. Reading and donating books that include characters of color.
- Table at Women/children's center with books available.
- Reach Out And Read child receives a book for every well child visit.

**Present:** Blanche Lawton, Steven Brown, Catherine DeLazzero, Lolita Ferrin, Paul Fischer, Julian Giordano, Douglas McGowan and Ira Mitchneck. **Chair:** Mark N. Diller. **Absent:** Amy Hyman and Natasha Kazmi. *Adjourned:* 8:45 pm.