

## BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE MINUTES

Michele Parker and Christian Cordova, Co-Chairpersons

June 13, 2018

*Business & Consumer Issues Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met at the District Office, 250 West 87<sup>th</sup> Street. The meeting was called to order at 7:00 pm by Co-Chairperson Michele Parker.*

**Present:** Michele Parker, Christian Cordova, Linda Alexander, Joshua T. Cohen, Paul Fischer, Doug Kleiman and Seema Reddy. **Board Member:** Polly Spain. **Absent:** Andrew Rigie.

The following matters were discussed:

***New application to the SLA for a 500 Foot Hearing two year liquor license:***

1. **2756 Broadway** (West 106<sup>th</sup> Street) Awesome Beer & Burger LLC d/b/a To be Determined. Disc Jockey, garden/patio and sidewalk café.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Michael Ferrari, Attorney
- Paul Lee, Owner. Also owner of the restaurant, West End Hall (restaurant that is there now).
- Ownership is changing now, and renaming the restaurant to Clinton Hall. New corporate entity. There are 5 other affiliated entities throughout the city, but those are separate entities – Seaport, Arthur Ave, Williamsburg, W51st St., 90 Washington St.
- Telly Hatzigeorgiou, also a partial owner of the restaurant (current and future)
- Method of Operation – as submitted. Restaurant primarily with unique beer menu.
- Postings were done on restaurant itself and 6-7 other were posted locally within buildings

CB7 Comments:

- Clarification to hours – should be clear about interior hours vs. outdoor café hours
- There is a sidewalk café in front and a backyard garden café. #12 on Method of Operation are hours are for the garden.
- Five Lamps was the previous restaurant in the space. There was an issue for the permit in the backyard. Issue was that there is an egress in the backyard that goes to 106<sup>th</sup> Street. There were violations from the NYFD about the conditions of the egress. Now it has been legalized – egress had to be rebuilt, cleaned and re-inspected.
- It seems that there might not have been a Certificate of Occupancy for the rear space. But the attorney does not recall any problem with the use of the space. The rear yard space is owned by the landlord. As part of the lease, the landlord allows use of the restaurant and rear yard space. The rear yard space's permitted occupancy is for 72 people.
- There are noise concerns because the rear yard is within the donut of the block. This was an issue when the restaurant was last in front of the CB. Sound dampening umbrellas were put up, but they have since fallen apart. New ones are on order. Other sound attenuation measures have been taken according to the owner.
- Nothing has changed (aside from the broken umbrellas) from the operation of the previous restaurant.
- Landlord complained about a sound issue briefly, but that has been corrected. Otherwise, no complaints from the neighbors.
- The garden isn't open yet due to cleaning and maintenance.
- DJ used on special occasions, NOT outside. Live music possible inside, NOT outside. No music in backyard at all (including no DJ). Music to be allowed only on inside of restaurant.

**Community Board 7/ Manhattan**

- Ceiling inside the restaurant has some acoustic damping.
- Deliveries: mostly Seamless, Uber Eats
- Interior Hours: 10am-3am Sunday through Wednesday; 10am-4am on Thursday through Saturday
- Rear Garden Hours: until 10pm on Sunday through Wed; until 11pm on Thursday through Saturday. On the weekends, space would open at 10am for brunch
- **Modifications to application:**
  - **Clarify #8 – to be interior only**
  - **Clarify #10 – to be interior only**
  - **Clarify #12 – should clarify it refers to garden only. And will open no earlier than 10am**
  - **Add Sidewalk Café hours – 10am – midnight, 7 days/wk**
- Revised method of operation and revised application will be submitted by the applicant before the full board meeting.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **disapprove unless the following changes to the method of operation are implemented by Full Board meeting on 7/17/2018** was adopted:*

- **Clarify #8 – to be interior only**
- **Clarify #10 – to be interior only**
- **Clarify #12 – should clarify it refers to garden only. And will open no earlier than 10am**
- **Add Sidewalk Café hours – 10am – midnight, 7 days/wk**

VOTE: 6-1-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

***New application to the SLA for a two year liquor license:***

2. **417 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80<sup>th</sup> Street) BL 417 Amsterdam LLC d/b/a Bluestone Lane.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Hari Kalyan, General Counsel for Bluestone Lane ([hari.kalyan@bluestonelane.com](mailto:hari.kalyan@bluestonelane.com))
- 15 locations in city, 35 locations nationwide.
- Premium coffee and cafes, 12 liquor licenses nationwide (5 of which are in NYC)
- Transfer from Pretto café.
- Alcohol is 5% of business; 65% coffee, 30% food.
- Seating capacity Cof O is for 74 max.
- There is counter service and wait service. All locations are cashless.
- No deliveries
- Alcohol not served until noon on Sunday.
- Renovations starting now. But not a substantial renovation. Expected opening is September 2018.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

***Unenclosed Sidewalk Café Renewals:***

3. **269 Columbus Avenue** (West 73<sup>rd</sup> Street.) Renewal application #1423787-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 72nd & Columbus Restaurant, LLC d/b/a AG Kitchen, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Scott Chilvers, Manager
- Deliveries are done by relay. So no bikes are part of the restaurant.

- Garbage is picked up on the side street.
- Sidewalk café checklist was signed by the applicant at the meeting.
- 8 tables, 16 chairs are allowed, but it is rarely fully seated

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

4. **422 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80<sup>th</sup> Street.) Renewal application #2036391-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Beer Shop, LLC d/b/a Beer Shop NYC, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 4 tables and 8 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Bob Callahan, attorney
- Renewal of sidewalk café application: 4 tables, 8 seats.
- No deliveries. No bikes

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

5. **429 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80<sup>th</sup> – 81<sup>st</sup> Streets.) Renewal application #1421365-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Vai UWS, LLC d/b/a VAI, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 16 tables and 32 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Jake Butler, Controller of the Restaurant Group
- Margaret Taylor, Business Development Manager with the Restaurant Group
- Renewal application for sidewalk café with **11 tables and 26 seats**. No changes.
- No deliveries

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

6. **718 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 95<sup>th</sup> Street.) Renewal application #1277777-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Iano Corp. d/b/a Acqua, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 16 tables and 32 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Bob Callahan, Attorney
- 16 tables, 32 seats.
- Renewal application, no changes.
- Use 3<sup>rd</sup> parties (Seamless, etc.) for deliveries. No bikes

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0.

***Enclosed Sidewalk Café Renewals:***

7. **180 Columbus Avenue** (West 68<sup>th</sup> Street.) Renewal application ULURP# N180102ECM/ DCA #13399-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by COBP, Corp. d/b/a IL Violino, for a four-year consent to operate an enclosed sidewalk café with 15 tables and 36 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- No one showed up.

CB7 Comments:

- Letter received on April 30, 2018. But it didn't make it to our CB7 agenda on time.
- The applicant had posted a notice that there was a DCA meeting today, June 13, 2018

*After due deliberation the resolution to **disapprove** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

8. **44 West 63<sup>rd</sup> Street** (Columbus Avenue.) Renewal application ULURP# N180110ECM/ DCA #1229629-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by ERS Enterprises, Inc. d/b/a PJ Clarke's, for a four-year consent to operate an enclosed sidewalk café with 22 tables and 46 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Bob Callahan, Attorney
- Renewal application. 22 tables, 46 seats
- Bike deliveries are done.
- There are credit card minimums.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

***New Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés:***

9. **247 Columbus Avenue** (West 71<sup>st</sup> – 72<sup>nd</sup> Streets.) New application #6375-2018-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Joe & The Juice New York, LLC d/b/a Joe & The Juice, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 1 tables and 3 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant:

- Tobias Boegh, Retail Manager
- Application for 1 table with 3 chairs. It's already in operation. (should not be there until application is approved)
- 18 locations in NYC
- There were some violations. But they have been paid and resolved.
- Postings were done but posted too low.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

10. **938 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 106<sup>th</sup> Street.) New application #9936-2018-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Seinfeld Squared, LLC d/b/a Dive 106 for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 10 tables and 23 seats.

- Steve Wygoda, Architect
- Nicholas Seinfeld & Lee Seinfeld, Owners

**Community Board 7/ Manhattan**

- Father and Son business.
- Revised drawing will show 10 tables and 20 seats – pull back café to 9'. Revised drawing will be submitted to the office and to DCA.
- Walking deliveries maybe in the future. But no bicycle deliveries.

Public Comments:

- Gerry Khermouch, live at 300 Riverside. He came to talk in support of the many Dive Bars.
  - Dive Bar is a great family friendly amenity to the neighborhood. He represents a Beer Business weekly. Dive Bar gets credit for taking the UWS to be on the cutting edge of craft beer! They are a generous host to UWS Home Brew Club, in addition to doing a great job with quality beer in the neighborhood. The bars become a draw from the tristate area for bar connoisseurs!

CB7 Comments:

- Approval will be subject to receipt of revise plans.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 7-0-0-0. N-CM VOTE: 1-0-0-0

11. Discussion of the committee's section of the [District Needs Statement](#) for FY 2020.

CB7 Comments:

- Committee members to review and return their comments to the BCI Chairs.

12. BID updates

CB7 Comments:

- Seema to send update to committee with LS BID updates
  - Traffic changes are being made on W60th St. and W62nd St.
  - Assessment increases to be done for LS BID, in keeping with other increases across the city
  - LS BID Board to form a sub group to investigate possible expansion of the BID area to include portions of W57th Street (at the request of Nordstrom)
- Paul with Columbus/Amsterdam Ave BID: A list of all restaurants in the area on their website, along with links.

13. New Business

CB7 Comments:

- Polly Spain to create a show, called "Community Board 7 Connects," to increase the visibility and transparency of the community board's work for the community for the MNN Network! It will be a series of 8 shows, perhaps starting with the BCI Committee.

14. Summer walk about with uptown BID

*The meeting ended at 9:00 pm.*

## HEALTH & HUMAN SERVICES COMMITTEE

Catherine DeLazzero and Madge Rosenberg, Co-Chairpersons

Tuesday, June 26<sup>th</sup>, 7:00 PM

**Present:** Catherine DeLazzero, Madge Rosenberg, Robert Espier and Sheldon J. Fine. **Board Member:** Doug Kleiman. **Absent:** Audrey Isaacs and Katie Rosman.

### PLANS FOR THE COMING YEAR

Katie & Catherine will organize panel on sexual assault in September (and start preparing in August). Doug Kleiman's friend Jim Clemente is a former profiler and expert on sexual assault. Doug will ask him to participate.

We should explore with YEL issues that impact students in District 75 schools.

Katie will research needs of our community based on 311 calls.

### DISTRICT NEEDS

Affordable Housing

SHELDON FINE says that WSFSSH's 108 St. housing may be done in as little as two years. It will include a new Valley Lodge, a transitional shelter for 50 years old and older where lives are stabilized. There will be a larger building for seniors and families plus a health center and art rooms. WSFSSH will continue its low ratio between staff and clients. All of the construction will be done in one phase.

ROBERT ESPIER explains that affordable housing is disappearing in our district as middle income Mitchell Lama housing & HDHC affordable housing are being turned into market rate apartments. Original 1960's homesteaders with help from HUD money channeled through the city are now seniors, and the city's 30 year subsidies are ending.

Doug Kleiman and Robert live in Mitchell Lama buildings; Doug's a rental and Robert's a coop. Each landlord or coop board decides whether to stay in the program. Lots of HDHC people want to go market rate.

For ML rental original investment came from developer with City subsidies for 30 years. As tenants die or move to assisted living apartments return to market rate, eroding ML housing stock. Coops are offered buy outs, selling the mortgage and going private, offering less housing for seniors.

Robert will give us a paragraph for including in DNS.

Shelly says there is a need to advocate for 55-62 year olds being forced to leave apartments. Many lose jobs at this age but cannot yet collect Social Security and are evicted & then some become homeless. They need city rent subsidy until SS kicks in so that they can pay rent.

Shelly will send us a paragraph for DNS.

Suicide attempts and overdoses on UWS. We need statistics to see if this is on the increase.

DOUG KLEIMAN suggests a look into lack of accessibility to Riverside Park. - Maybe an electric van into the park or some other means of entry.

The Health & Human Services Committee will not meet in July. Approved 4 - 0.

**Community Board 7/ Manhattan**

## **PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**

**Ken Coughlin and Klari Neuwelt, Co-Chairpersons**

**Monday, June 18<sup>th</sup>, 7:00PM**

*Committee Members present:* Klari Neuwelt, Co-chair; Ken Coughlin, Co-chair; Natasha Kazmi; Steven Brown. *Committee members absent:* Susan Schwartz. *Non-Committee Board members present:* Roberta Semer, CB7 Chair.

*The meeting was called to order at 7:04 p.m. by the co-chairs.*

### **1. Presentation by the Department of Parks & Recreation on temporary public art installation by artist Sarah E. Brook in Riverside Park South beginning in August.**

Elizabeth Masella, NYC DPR Public Art Coordinator, and Sarah E. Brook, the artist, presented and responded to questions and comments.

The sculpture, which consists of a bench component interwoven into standards with colored mesh hanging panels, will be installed in Riverside Park South at 66<sup>th</sup> Street in August, 2018, replacing the temporary art work currently at that location. It will be anchored into the ground with two feet of concrete. It is intended to evoke “transformation and self-realization”. Twenty-five short poetry snippets by persons invited by the artist to submit them will be inscribed. Special events will be organized around this installation, including a poetry reading and picnic on September 22. No resolution by the Board is requested.

### **2. Presentation by Central Park Conservancy on public tours and other programs in Central Park.**

Andrea Buteau, Central Park Conservancy Director of Public Programs, presented and responded to questions and comments. The CPC has a robust program of programs and tours. Many of the tours are free; some have a charge, typically \$10 for CPC members and \$15 for non-members. Some are handicapped-accessible, and almost all are on easy terrain. This year, CPC is emphasizing new evening tours and tours of the North Woods area. It has added tours in French and Spanish this summer, and it will be adding other languages in the future. The CPC is also featuring many family programs (including some of the tours), particularly a group of programs organized under its Discovery Club. With the Discovery Club, after families join and participate in a certain number of activities, they receive a gift for their children.

Committee members contributed ideas as to how the CPC can enhance the publicity for its activities and made other suggestions regarding CPC programs.

### **3. Discussion with American Museum of Natural History about temporary storage and relocation of the Times Capsule in Theodore Roosevelt Park in connection with Gilder Center project.**

Dan Slippen, AMNH, and Joe James, landscape architect, presented and responded to questions and comments.

The *New York Times* Capsule is a time capsule incorporating a sculpture by Santiago Calatrava that was installed outside the Museum’s west (Columbus Avenue) entrance in 2001, to be opened in 3000. Because the footprint occupied by the capsule will be incorporated into the Gilder Center, the time capsule must be stored during the Gilder Center construction period and then reinstalled in a new location. The Museum proposes to move the time

capsule to a location near its south façade, adjacent to the entrance to the Rose Center. Calatrava and the *New York Times* have approved the new location. The new location was also discussed and favorably received by the Park Working Group that worked with the Museum and DPR in planning changes to Theodore Roosevelt Park to accommodate the Gilder Center. (Neuwelt, who was a member of that group, confirmed this.)

The time capsule will be installed on a green planted surface, behind a low fence to protect it from children using it for unintended active recreation, which has happened to it in its current location. An identifying plaque will be set into the pavement outside of the fence. The new location must be approved by the Public Design Commission.

The Committee passed a resolution approving the new location, 4-0-0-0; non-Committee Board members 1-0-0-0.

There was then a brief discussion of the Gilder Center Construction Task Force, of which CB7 is Co-Chair, which is starting to meet as construction commences.

#### **4. Update on Committee Discussions:**

Neuwelt stated that almost all updates were bad news relating to insufficient funding for DPR projects supported by CB7. Further discussion was deferred to the following month.

#### **5. Discussion of the committee's section of the District Needs Statement for Fiscal Year 2020.**

Board Chair Roberta Semer led the discussion. Committee members were invited to submit comments or proposed changes regarding last year's DNS to Semer. Potential new members of the committee will also be solicited for comments, particularly with regard to environmental issues.

*The meeting was adjourned at about 8:45 p.m.*



## Transportation Committee Meeting Minutes

June 12, 2018

Capt. Palmer & Sgt. Montgomery, of the 20th pct, spoke about traffic/accident statistics. They said traffic was improving. There were 155 collisions this year, compared to 137 last year - a 13% increase. There was also sideswiping & rear-ending incidents. Injuries to pedestrians were on a downward trend, likely due to slower speeds of vehicles. The committee asked where the incidents occurred, & if there were any trends. On the issue of street cleaning of 82nd Street between Columbus & Amsterdam Avenues (precinct block), Capt. Palmer said the signs need to be changed to reflect when the actual cleaning will take place. The signs currently read no parking 11 AM-12:30 PM. He would like them changed to read: No Parking 11 AM-12 PM, Th/Fr. Each side would be cleaned once per week. When cars from the precinct are moved, they will be located both in the precinct parking lot, as well as double-parked. The new system will go into effect as soon as DOT can change the signs. NYPD & DOS will be discussing the best way to schedule the cleaning.

Resolution: CB7 supports the efforts of the NYPD-20th Pct. & the Dept. of Sanitation in their efforts to achieve a new working schedule to allow West 82nd Street between Columbus & Amsterdam Avenues to have the street cleaned.

Comm: 6-0-0-0. NCB : 3-0-0-0

Ken Coughlin asked about enforcement of bicyclists @ 72nd St & Columbus Ave., and why so many summonses have been issued. The police said there are many incidents reported there, as well as much pedestrian activity. There have been 37 tickets written, 4 for running red lights, 1 for not being in the bike lane, and 29 for going the wrong way. Doug asked if cyclists are required to use the bike lane if one is provided. Sgt. Montgomery said yes, while Ken said no.

### Shun-Lee Bike Corral

Chris Giordino of the 64th/65th St. Block Association spoke in favor of the corral. Mark asked if there was a rush hour no parking restriction. Although the corral is for Shun Lee, anyone would be allowed to use it. Most of the north side of 65th Street is a loading zone, so no traffic lanes are being taken for the corral. The committee voted to approve the corral.

Comm: 6-0-0-0. NCB : 3-0-0-0

### Greenmarket

Cathy Chambers of GrowNYC appeared for the Greenmarket. The application requested an additional day - Wednesdays - just for the summer & fall season, on the sidewalk along Columbus Avenue, between 79th-81st Streets. Cathy said the Museum was fine with the proposal. The market would be 1/3 the size of the Sunday market. The committee voted to approve the request.

Comm: 6-0-0-0. NCB : 3-0-0-0

### Secondary street naming for Gary Lincoff

Vivian, from the NY Mycological Society spoke in favor of the application to secondarily name the NW corner of 95th Street & Central Park West for Gary Lincoff. She said he lived on 95th Street for over 40 years. However, he lived on the Columbus/Amsterdam block - not the park block. Several residents of the park block spoke in opposition to having their corner secondarily named for Mr. Lincoff, not that he wasn't a wonderful man with many accomplishments. The guidelines adopted by the transportation committee state that any secondary street names must be on the block the honoree lived. The committee tabled the proposal, pending receiving signatures from the 100 block of West 95th Street, where Gary Lincoff actually lived.

**Car-Free Central Park**

Questions were raised about signage advising motorists in advance of the closure of the Central Park drives to vehicles, which begins June 26th. Colleen, from DOT, stated there will be many signs, and DOT is examining exactly where & how many will be placed. DOT will monitor traffic on streets adjacent to the park, such as Central Park West, Fifth Avenue, etc.

**Cycling enforcement - Riverside Drive**

At the request of Rich Robbins, Ken Coughlin raised the issue of unfair enforcement of cyclists at 100th St/Riverside Drive. A police car was stationed in the area, and issued quite a few summonses to bikers who did not stop at the crosswalk to allow pedestrians safe passage. Questions were raised about whether vehicles other than bikes were also stopped. As information was needed to continue the discussion, the issue was tabled until the July meeting, when we hope to get a representative from the 24th Pct. to attend.

**Pilot Program - loading zones**

Howard brought up the issue of installing loading zones - on Central Park West & West End Avenue, to alleviate the double-parking going on all over the West Side. Double parking is causing increased congestion in many Manhattan neighborhoods. Questions were raised about whether removing all this parking would make residents angry, and whether private vehicles would sit in the new loading zones (as was the case on West End Ave a few years ago) and not have the desired effect, with trucks continuing to double park. A map was drawn up, of Central Park West & West End Avenue, to have committee members inspect various sections to ascertain conditions on the avenues. Committee members will bring their findings to the July meeting.

**New Business****W. 65th-66th Block Association**

Wanla Cheng brought up the issue of Extell's construction on the block, the effect it is having on traffic, how many vehicles have Press plates, which the police will not ticket, and what will happen when construction really begins, with a huge crane coming to the block. Buses (& other vehicles) are having huge problems getting through the block, which are both transverse-leading streets, with traffic to & from the east side being affected. It was decided that we will try to get the 20th precinct, as well as representatives from ABC, and DOT to attend the July meeting, to try to work out another place for the press parking, as well as better enforcement.

**Astor reconstruction**

David Zelman brought up the issue of construction at the Astor, on West 75th Street, and how many spaces are being taken by the contractor.

## Youth, Education & Libraries Committee Minutes

Thursday, June 21, 2018

The Youth, Education & Libraries Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met on Thursday, June 21, 2018, at the District Office, 250 West 87<sup>th</sup> Street, in the District. The meeting was called to order by co-chairs Blanche Lawton and Mark Diller. Committee members Steve Brown, Catherine DeLazzer, Paul Fischer, Amy Hyman, Natasha Kazmi, Sara Lind, Ira Mitchneck, Polly Spain, and non-Committee Board members Roberta Semer (chair), Cindy Cardinal, Madge Rosenberg, participated. The following matters were discussed and actions taken.

### 1. Separation of children from their families as part of immigration enforcement

- Families are being forcibly separated from their children by representatives of the Immigration and Customs Enforcement service when suspected of entering the United States without proper documentation or authorization.
- The children separated from their families are often infants and very young children.
- Many of the children are forced to travel long distances to facilities that are hired or enlisted to help care for them in lieu of their parents, and are frequently accompanied on those journeys by guards and immigration officials who are not fluent in the child's native language.
- The executive order signed by the President on June 20, 2018, purports to end the practice of separating children from their families, but does nothing to reunite the more than two thousand children already so separated, and by criminalizing the undocumented border crossing, merely postpones rather than ends the separation of children from their families.
- Such disregard for the lives of children and families at a time when they are most vulnerable is utterly inconsistent with the values expressed in CB7's Core Principles and the values that are the foundation for our local, City, State and federal Constitution, statutes, ordinances and common law.
- Resolution: To oppose the forced separation of children from their families as part of immigration enforcement.

After due deliberation, the resolution was adopted.

VOTE: Committee: 9-0-0-0

Non-Committee Board Members: 2-0-0-0.

### 2. Consideration of Community School District 3's changes to the Middle School Choice Admissions Process in response to the Department of Education's adoption of "Ranking-Blind" Admissions.

- Admission to middle schools in CSD3 is through a "choice" process in which 5<sup>th</sup> grade students rank their preferences on an application form, and schools use screening rubrics of their own design to determine to whom to make offers of admission. The Department of Education recently adopted a change, to be effective with the admissions cycle for the 2019-2020 academic year. Under the prior system, middle schools would have access to the ordinal ranking of each student's preference for each middle school. Many of the most sought-after middle schools would only consider applicants who ranked that middle school as a 1<sup>st</sup> choice.
- Under the new procedure, called "ranking-blind" admissions, adopted by the central Department of Education without community review or input, the students' ranked preferences will not be made available to the schools.
- One concern raised by the "ranking-blind" admissions process is that it will empower the highest achieving students to apply to more than one of the four most coveted and highest-performing schools,

**Community Board 7/ Manhattan**

with the potential result that the existing segregation and isolation of students in CSD3 middle schools based on achievement, special needs, socio-economic status, race or ethnicity would be exacerbated.

- Of the 14 CSD3-based and 2 Citywide middle schools in the portion of CSD3 that overlaps with CB7's Community District 7, the students in 10 of those programs consistently score below grade level on State standardized tests. Those same 10 middle school programs have disproportionately high concentrations of students with documented special needs, students who qualify for free/reduced price lunch, and students who identify as African-American or Hispanic. The 4 CSD3-based and 2 Citywide middle school programs, to varying degrees, have student cohorts that do not approach the District averages for these demographics.
- The achievement gap does not begin in middle school but much earlier, and true equity in education requires quality Pre-K, Kindergarten, and Elementary School education as well.
- The long-term goal must be for all elementary and middle schools in our District and beyond to be high-performing, offer true equity of educational opportunity, and end the cycle of identifying only a handful of schools as "coveted" or "sought-after."
- CSD3, after extensive outreach to and meaningful consultation with the Community Education Council ("CEC3"), principals, parents, other educators, the District Leadership Team, and other stakeholders, has adopted a further amendment to the middle school choice process with the intention of counter-acting the anticipated exacerbation of segregation of students by needs, performance and demographics.
- CEC3 alone convened more than 25 meetings between January and June 2018 at which potential scenarios then under consideration to address these inequalities were presented or discussed.
- The further amendment adopted by CSD3 for the admissions cycle for the 2019-20 year will reserve at least 25% of seats at every middle school program for students who (a) score below grade level on the 4<sup>th</sup> grade State English Language Arts and Math standardized tests; (b) qualify for free/reduced price lunch; and (c) have report card grades in English Language Arts and Math that are below grade level.

#### Committee and Board Member Comment:

- Addressing the performance gap among students is essential. Poverty correlates closely with poor performance on state standardized tests as well as with long-term performance outcomes for students.
- Concern for the students being left behind at the schools with lower performance statistics.
- Consideration should be given as to whether the needs of students at schools whose students do not score at or above grade level should be a part of budget priorities expressed by CB7 in the District Needs Statement.
- Support for the CSD3 plan as an agent of change, and will promote positive and pro-active consideration of these needs.
- It is essential that there be more than four middle schools in the community at which students perform at or above grade level. Angry that this problem persists and that no better solution has emerged.
- Should hold principals more accountable for schools whose average student performance is below grade level.
- Need resources for students being relocated, and especially for students at schools with low historical student performance on standardized tests.

- Concern that the set-aside response to the ranking-blind admissions will be little more than a band-aid on an important issue.
- Cannot sit back and let ourselves off the hook for low performance.
- Cannot wait another 5 years to address these issues – these issues long pre-dated this controversy.
- District must ensure that all schools have the resources needed so that children can succeed.
- Concern as to how schools are being labeled “good” or “failing.”
- This problem is a continuation of performance issues that first arise long before middle school.
- Need a better measure of performance and success.
- Must provide resources for the children who will be in transition under the set-aside plan, as well as those not offered seats in the higher-performing schools.
- Must also ensure that supports are in place for all parents to enable them to support their children more effectively.
- Middle school is too late in the game to address these concerns.
- Goal is integration. Should support all students – the 25% who are offered seats and the 75% who will not be offered these seats.
- Teachers thrive on the challenge of differentiating instruction to meet the needs of all students.
- Integration improves outcomes for all students – both high- and lower-performing.
- Need to develop a detailed information on the resources needed to address these concerns.
- Must continue to address the historic segregation in District 3.
- Resolution should call for mechanisms to address the needs of all students.
- Resolution to support the District 3 response while expressing the foregoing concerns.

After deliberation, the resolution was adopted.

VOTE: Committee Members 9-0-0-0

Non-Committee Board Members 2-0-0-0

### 3. **District Needs Statement.**

- YEL will focus on those aspects of student performance and the programs needed to address the issues identified in the middle school discussion, as well as the corresponding aspects of performance and programming at the elementary school level, with a view toward providing equitable and adequate resources to meet the needs of all students.
- YEL will also focus on the resources needed to capitalize on opportunities to meet community needs such as the unbuilt basement space at the Bloomingdale Branch Library.
- Committee members will review and comment upon the most recent draft of the DNS in advance of the July YEL meeting.

Adjourned: 8:45 pm.