BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE

George Zeppenfeldt and Michele Parker, Co-Chairpersons January 10, 2018

Business & Consumer Issues Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met at the District Office, 250 West 87th Street. The meeting was called to order at 7:00 pm by Co-Chairperson Michele Parker.

Present: Michele Parker, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Linda Alexander, Joshua Cohen, Christian Cordova and Paul Fischer. **Absent:** Marc Glazer and Seema Reddy.

The following matters were discussed:

New application to the SLA for a two year liquor license:

1. 283 Amsterdam Avenue (West 73rd Street) D&S Dining Group, d/b/a To be Determined.

Presenting for the Applicant: Andrew Loscalzo, Andrew@salumeriarosinyc.com

This is a long-standing restaurant, Salumeria Rosi. The reason for the application is that the LLC is being transformed from father to son. Nothing is changing.

CB7 Comments:

- George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero did the site visit and the postings were fine.
- Michele Parker asked whether anyone from the public wanted to comment. There were none.
- Jerry Cordova asked if there were bike deliveries: applicant uses delivery services, such as Uber Eats.
- George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero expanded the discussion on bike deliveries.

After due deliberation the resolution to approve was adopted

VOTE: Committee Approves the Application: 6-0-0-0. Non-Committee Members Vote: N/A

Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés Renewals:

2. 2161 Broadway (West 76th - 77th Streets.) Renewal application #2026488-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 2161 Broadway Bakery, LLC, d/b/a Maison Kayser, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 12 tables and 23 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Steve Wygoda, architect

CB7 Comments:

- Michele Parker, who did the site visit and said the postings were fine, also pointed out there have been problems with the applicant's sandwich board being positioned outside the footprint of the unenclosed sidewalk café. Applicant's representative will speak to his client to ensure the matter is corrected next spring.
- Michele Parker asked whether anyone from the public wanted to comment. There were none

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted

VOTE: Committee Approves the application: 6-0-0-0. Non-Committee Members Vote: N/A.

3. 975 Amsterdam Avenue (West 108th Street.) Renewal application #2017694-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 975 Amsterdam, Inc., d/b/a Spice, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Andrew Caraballo, representative, Andrew@cblservices.com and Manager Paul Wrangpetch in attendance, as well.

CB7 Comments:

- Michele Parker asked if there had been any changes to the original footprint. *Applicant said it was the same.*
- Jerry Cordova asked about bike delivery and storage.
- Michele Parker asked whether members of the public wanted to comment. There were none.

• George Zeppenfeldt-Cistero requested larger, more prominent signage be attached to bike delivery vests.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted

VOTE: Committee Approves Application 6-0-0-0. Non-Committee Members Vote: N/A

New Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés:

4. 249 Columbus Avenue (West 71st - 72nd Streets) New application #19989-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by CMR Rest Corp, d/b/a Ella NYC, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 19 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Robert Callahan, representative kellymlk136@gmail.com and Joaquin Martinez, manager

The restaurant already has a approved sidewalk café, the corporate name and DBA have been changed. Same ownership, no changes to the footprint of the sidewalk café.

CB7 Comments:

- George Z-C asked about the impact of the CitiBike dock in front of the restaurant. Applicant said it has been helpful but the sidewalk shed has hurt business, significantly.
- George Z-C asked about bike delivery: Applicant uses delivery service called Relay.
- Michele Parker asked whether anyone from the public wanted to comment. There were none.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted

VOTE: Committee Approves Application 6-0-0-0. Non-Committee Members Vote: N/A

5. **424** Amsterdam Avenue (West 80th - 81st Streets) New application #19629-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Brington, LLC d/b/a Caledonia, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 3 tables and 6 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: James Dipasquale, attorney for the applicant, <u>James@ds-lawoffices.com</u> CB7 Comments:

- Michele Parker reviewed the postings and said they were fine.
- Michele Parker asked whether anyone from the public wanted to comment. There were none.

After due deliberation the resolution to approve was adopted

VOTE: Committee Approves Application: 6-0-0-0. Non-Committee Members Vote: N/A

6. New Business #1

BCI has been asked to identify community groups and organizations that may contribute information and data to the committee's sections of the FY2020 DNS and budget priorities.

CB7 Comments:

• BCI is already actively working with the area's three business improvement districts, chambers of commerce and several community groups to discern District Needs and Budget Priorities.

New Business #2

CB7 Comments: Paul Fisher would like Council Member Helen Rosenthal to contribute discretionary funds to the 2018 CB7 Holiday Party.

New Business #3

A discussion of the sidewalk shed (scaffolding) and their damage to retail in the area, as well as throughout the City.

• George C-Z suggested we recommend to affected local businesses that they contact their local officials.

• Linda Alexander outlined the issues and recommended the establishment of a task force or oversight committee with members from MBP, Mayor's office and/or City Council, relevant agencies, such as D.O.B., D.C.A. and LPC, and property owners to determine solutions for streamlining façade repair certifications. The goal is to determine more expeditious ways to shorten the duration of the installations, and alleviate the problems caused by long-term sidewalk sheds/scaffolding that camouflage and present sight obstructions to their businesses.

The meeting adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

FULL BOARD MEETING

Roberta Semer, Chairperson January 2, 2018

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Tuesday, January 2, 2018, at Congregation Rodeph Sholom, 7 West 83rd Street (Central Park West) in the District. Chair Roberta Semer called the meeting to order at 6:40 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

The following matters were discussed and actions taken:

Approve minutes with some revisions. Minutes from the December 5, 2017, Full Board meeting were **approved**. *VOTE: 24-0-5-0*.

Chair's Report: Roberta Semer:

- Welcome back Miki Fiegel.
- Meisha Burkett is moving to CB9 and will be leaving CB7.
- Thanks to Mark Diller on his work on the District Needs Survey.
- DNS committee continues to work and will be asking the committees to build outside relationships with partners.
- Thanks Gaby Plitz. Sends email a week before the meeting to remind a person that the meeting is coming and who is taking minutes.
- Tomorrow Chairman and Communication Committee will be live twitting at #StreetClutter
- NYCHA Taskforce had a joint meeting with CB9 and they are looking for develop several more forums.
- 13. Robert Espier asked for a leave of absence.

After deliberation, the resolution to approve Robert Espier's leave of absence was adopted.

Vote: 27-0-2-0

Community Session:

- Barbara Brumaru, Ryan Center
 - o The WIC Program awareness at the Ryan Center Please make referrals
- Jennifer Zarr, St. Agnes Library
 - New Community Conversation Initiative that allows dialogue between community members January 13th at 11:30am. Councilmember Rosenthal will be leading the conversation.
- Winfred Armstrong, Park West Village
 - Building a Jewish Home on 97th Street.
 - Environmental Challenge of Noise and Dust- First Judge ruled in favor and went to the Court of Appeals in Albany and the case was lost.
 - There is a second legal case around zoning issues. Decision has not been reached at this time.
- Peter Andtsen, Amsterdam-Columbus BID
 - Youth Hostel Author talk FLYER
 - Community Walk coming up on January 28th at 1pm.

Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President:

- Focused on Riker's Island. Taskforce with all stakeholders and CB. What do we do with the Tombs?
- Technology bring more data to the CB.
- Grocery Store Bill- hopefully will be passed.
 - O Question: Will it need to be re-introduced with new council?

- Answer: Yes but it is automatic.
- CB 2018 applications are available online.
- Recruitment for Young People on January 19th at 1 Centre Street
- PS 163 appeal was denied. Ongoing discussion.
- Capital and Cultural Money is available.
- January 11 at Uptown JCC- talk about how to eliminate waste.
- Seniors can get SCREM...
- Land Use will be a focus.
- Will join the live twitter tomorrow evening.

Reports by Elected Officials:

Helen Rosenthal, New York City Council Member (6th District):

- Lincoln Plaza Cinema: All elected officials have written letters to get them to address the issue.
- Housing Clinics are continuing. First Wednesday of the Month- succession rights
- Small Business Clinic on January 31st- small business financing
- Reporting on Relief Mission on Puerto Rico on January 11th at JCC
- Question: What is the status for the sidewalk bridge? <u>Answers:</u> Has to be reintroduced and still
 negotiating behind the scenes.
- Question: Cory Johnson will probably be the new Speaker. Answer: The vote will be tomorrow.
- Question: Many candidates ran for the Speaker, what happens in the committees? <u>Answer:</u> It is the Speakers decision. They will be announced in two weeks.
- Question: Prospect Park is completely car free. <u>Answer:</u> We can do it in Manhattan. Asked DOT to collect the data.
- Question: What is the answer to the cost of building subways? <u>Answer:</u> 200 ghost employees are part of the problem. Author of the article will bring more light to the issue and it will be further explored.

Jerrold Nadler, U.S. House Member (10th District):

- Going back to Washington next week.
- Tax Bill passed and this brings a pressure to the States to lower taxes at the cost of programs/benefits. More burdens will be placed on States and will have to be dealt with.
- Won election to ranking member of the Judiciary Committee. Key position when dealing with Civil Liberties, Anti-trust, Immigration, Intellectual Property, Music Licensing.
- Need to pass:
 - o DACA
 - Budget
 - Medically Care for Children

Questions:

- Can net neutrality be changed?
 - Answer: FCC can change it and it should be changed. Need Democratic majority in order to change it.
- What do you know to be true in the investigations?
 - Answer: All we know about the Special Council investigation is that two people have been indicated and plead guilty. There is no evidence of bias and all we know is the court proceedings.
- How can you advise the CB to do about the consensus.
 - Answer: How can the Governor help to ensure that we get proper numbers in NYS. WE have a large number of immigrants in this State and they may not want to be counted due to ICE

concerns. We have a few years to fix it and we should be worried. CB can work to help the State, City, and Federal Governments to properly fund.

- How can you encourage more people to run for positions?
 - Answer: Recruitment is the key to providing viable candidates. Seeing more minorities, Vets, females are running for positions on the Democratic side. Looks from numbers of people running that there will be more women in the House than previously.

Reports by Elected Officials' Representatives:

Aldo Ponterosso, Office of Assembly Member Linda Rosenthal (67th District):

- Newsletter is in the back of the room.
- Lincoln Plaza Cinema. They will be closing and will continue to discuss how it can stay open.
- In touch of NYCHA in regards to lead inspection. Awaiting a response.

Alek Miletic, Office of Assembly Member Richard Gottfried (75th District):

• Health Legislation is coming forth this year.

Tara Klein, Office of State Senator Brad Hoylman (27th District):

- A Free Vision Screening: 1/29 9-11:30am
- Net Neutrality: How can NYS battle this.

Daisy More, Office of State Senator Jose Serrano (29th District):

- January Committee Report was not ready and will be emailed.
- More@nysenate.gov
- State Senate Bill Hotline number: 18003429860

Jane Arrendell, Office of State Senator Marisol Alcantara (31st District):

Brennan Ward, Office of State Senator Marisol Alcantara (31st District):

- Session starts tomorrow.
- Minority Women Owned Business- amount of money they can get is up.
- Continuing to fight funding for immigrant service, voting reform, Sweat Bill, eliminate income tax on people who make less than 50,000 per year.

Michael Stinson, NYC Comptroller Scott M. Stringer's Office:

- 450 million to support Affordable Housing citywide.
- Making Rent Count. New Yorkers have the opportunity to have rent count toward credit scores.
- Snow removal issues please call

Jennifer Greer, Public Advocate Letitia James' Office:

Please report Heat Issues to me at 212-669-2179

Gabrielle Dann-Allel, Mayor's Community Affairs Unit:

- December 22nd: Signed the Commercial Rent Tax Legislation into Law. Saved about 2700 businesses throughout the city.
- Street Outreach Service- 7 days a week now and 250 safe haven beds added.

Business Session:

LAND USE COMMITTEE

Richard Asche and Page Cowley, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

1. **2030 Broadway 2nd Floor, a/k/a 154 West 70th Street**. Application to the Board of Standards and Appeals #2017-201-BZ by the Law Offices of Marvin B. Mitzer, LLC for a special permit to operate a Physical Culture Establishment operated by CorePower Yoga, LLC, d/b/a CorePower Yoga, on the second floor.

Presentation by Richard Asche:

• For historical reasons, we need to approve. The studio has been in operation for quite some time and will be installing showers and we need to approve.

After deliberation, the resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-1-1

2. **600 Columbus Avenue, Columbus Townhouse** (West 89th – 90th Streets.) Application M 920493(K) ZAM to the Department of City Planning by Columbus Townhouse Associates requesting a modification of the previously approved large-scale residential development (CP-18505) as subsequently modified, within the former West Side Urban Renewal Area, involving an increase in the amount of community facility floor area and a decrease in the amount of commercial floor area through an enlargement and the conversion of existing floor area on the first and second floors, of an existing 27-story mixed-use building.

Amend from 27 stories to 14 stories.

Presentation by Richard Asche:

- Shift from commercial space to non-profit space. This application is to change the ratio and fill in existing spaces. Idea is to increase nonprofit space.
- Richard Wellbell- architect- no changes to outside of the building.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 37-0-0-0

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Andrew Albert and Howard Yaruss, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

3. **West 97**th **Street Greenmarket** (Amsterdam-Columbus Avenues.) Application by Greenmarket/GrowNYC to the Mayor's Street Activity Permit Office for a permit to hold a greenmarket on Fridays on West 97th Street.

Presentation by Andrew Albert:

Renewal for Greenmarket.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

4. **72 West 69**th **Street** (Columbus Avenue.) Application EIN#84-1275621 to the Department of Transportation for a revocable consent to construct, maintain and use an exterior wheel chair lift and metal platform with steps and metal railing.

Presentation by Andrew Albert:

• Saw graphics of this and it is a must approve for the new tenants.

CB7 Comments:

• Gaby Palitz: Is it part of the railings?

Answer: Already approved by Preservation. Needed two committee votes.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

5. Playground in the Joan of Arc Complex.

Presentation by Howard Yaruss:

• Calling the playground to use as a playground. As it is now being used as a parking lot.

CB7 Comments:

- Richard Robbins: Withdrew application to close the street to allow the children to go outside during construction.
- George: How many cars use the space? Answer: half of playground is taken over by cars.
- Catherine DeLazzero: What are the expectations with the resolution? Answer: Communication with representatives. DOE is urged to do what they can to get the land back to the children.
- Shelly Fine: Population of special needs in this school. They are not getting the necessary physical education.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve urging School District 3 to eliminate teacher parking on the playground in the Joan of Arc complex and return it to playground use for PS 333 students** was adopted.

VOTE: 37-0-0-0

14. Riverside Drive Stop Signs

Presentation by R. Robbins:

As you come out of the park, there is confusion about whether or not the pedestrian can walk safely.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

Klari Neuwelt, Chairperson

Resolution Re:

- 6. **Riverside Park.** Department of Parks and Recreation proposals on:
 - **A.** The reconstruction of the stair leading to the Joan of Arc Monument at West 93rd Street and Riverside Drive.

Presentation by Ken Coughlin:

- Visual Presentation is made.
- 475,000 dollars and funded by Councilmember Rosenthal.
- Adding park benches and restoring stairs and railings.
- Parks Department will be talking with DOT to help improve safety as you exist on 92nd.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve the proposed design for the reconstruction of the stairs and other improvements at the Joan of Arc Monument** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

- **B.** The installation of fitness equipment South of Neufeld Playground at West 76th Street. Presentation by Klari Neuwelt:
- Funded by Councilmember Rosenthall- 250,000 dollars.
- Existing basketball courts currently.
- Add fitness equipment to be used by adults and adolescents. Replace backstops on basketball courts. Will be adding a bottle filler station. Add bike racks and benches. Increase lighting fixtures.

CB7 Comments:

- Richard Asche: Any access gates on the north or west side? Answer: Existing gates are on the east and they are open. Plenty of space to move throughout without interfering with basketball courts.
- Sonia Garcia: What type of equipment? Answer: Chin bars, benches, etc.
- Jeanette Rausch: Can we change this equipment to more user friendly (Fit Zone) as used by Trust for Public Land? Answer: Fairly generic type of equipment
- Friendly Amendment to Resolution: Request to look at the possibility to use Fit Zone as the equipment.
 - Response: We do not typically micro-manage the decisions of the Parks Department. There are
 questions about budget. We can raise the question with them. The equipment matches the
 community that uses the park.
 - o For the amendment: no harm to ask for better equipment. Fit Zone has supportive pieces such as arm rests to help with physical activity.
 - Response from Helen Rosenthal: The equipment will have to be explored because part of Participatory Budget.

After deliberation, the resolution to approve the proposed design for this site was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons Resolutions Re:

7. **2751** Broadway, aka **930** West End Avenue, Smoke Jazz and Supper Club (West 106th -105th Streets.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to install a handicapped accessible ramp with railing on Broadway.

Presentation by Gabrielle Palitz:

- Need a handicap ramp to allow for access to their club.
- Simple ramp with railings.
- Automatic button to push to open the front door.
- Soften the edges of the ramp and railings- applicant agreed.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve the new handicapped-accessible ramp with steel railing as modified** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

8. **11 Riverside Drive** (West 73rd – 74th Streets.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a window replacement program.

Presentation by Gabrielle Palitz:

- Building as had window replacements over the years. Building is looking to replace all the windows minus
 the few that are newer. Replacements will be the same as what exists. There are a couple of modifications
 to the original design.
- Many window AC units. Modification to standardize how an AC is installed into the window. Pieces can be taken out and installed seasonally.
- Public Speaker: David Telman
 - o 2/3 have window mounting AC and 1/3 have through the wall.
 - There is an issue that all AC are different in the windows and the resolution asks for standardized and this is not possible.

CB7 Comments:

- Peter Samton: When you look at the picture, the windows are different. The ac units should line up and should not stick out. Answer: We all agree and the building has agreed to consider that.
- Polly: Idea is great but the plan is flawed. Answer: There is a master plan to install thru-wall ac units. The cost to resident is high and this allows them to have the ac in their windows.
- Ken: Is it possible to go below 12000 BTU? Answer: Yes you can but it can hold up to 12000BTU.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve the new window replacement program, subject to the requested specification clarifications** was adopted.

VOTE: 28-4-3-0

9. **206 West 79th Street** (Amsterdam-Broadway.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for legalization of the storefront.

Presentation by Gabrielle Palitz:

Applicant did not attend the meeting.

After deliberation, the resolution to disapprove the application to legalize the storefront design was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-0-0

10. **577 Columbus Avenue** (West 88th Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a storefront replacement.

Presentation by Gabrielle Palitz:

- Storefront was closed in during the 1980s.
- Change where the entrance is located. North end of the storefront.
- Committee asked that the limestone be restored.

CB7 Comments:

• Michelle Parker: Is it occupied? Answer: Yes

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve the proposed storefront replacement design as modified** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE

Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons Resolutions Re:

11. **2737 Broadway** (West 105th Street.) New application #15452-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Serafina 2735 Corp., d/b/a Serafina, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 33 tables and 69 seats.

Presentation by Christian Cordova:

• 29 restaurants all over the city

CB7 Comments:

• Mark Diller: Only on Broadway? Answer: Yes

After deliberation, the resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-1-0

12. **Multi-block street fairs.** Public hearing on applications to the Street Activity Permit Office for multi-block street fairs in 2018.

A.

DATE	SPONSOR NAME	LOCATION	PRODUCER
4/15/18	Veritas, Inc.	Bway, West 96 th -102 nd E	Mort & Ray
4/15/18	Duke Ellington Blvd. Neighborhood Association	Bway, West 102 nd -106 th E	Mort & Ray
4/15/18	24th Precinct Community Council	Bway, West 102 nd -106 th E	Mort & Ray
4/29/18	Lincoln Square Neighborhood Center	Col, West 66 th – 72 nd	Clearview Festival
5/06/18	Broadway Mall Center	Bway, West 86th- 93rd E	Mort & Ray
5/13/18	Committee for Environmentally Sound Development	Bway, West 60 th -65 th E	Clearview Festival
5/20/18	West Manhattan Chamber of Commerce	Amst, West 77 th –88 th	WMCC
5/27/18	Coalition for a Livable West Side	Bway, West 72 nd -82 nd W	Mort & Ray
5/27/18	Safe Haven West Side Basketball League	Bway, West 82 nd -86 th W	Mort & Ray
6/03/18	Project Open at Lincoln Center Towers	Bway, West 65 th -72 nd W	Mort & Ray
6/03/18	Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition	Bway, West 65th -72nd W	Mort & Ray
6/10/18	West Side Federation of Neighborhood & Block Assoc.	Bway, West 73 rd -82 nd E	Mort & Ray
6/10/18	The Broadway Mall Association	Bway, West 82 nd -86 th E	Mort & Ray
8/19/18	Goddard Riverside	Amst, West 79th -86th	Clearview Festival
9/16/18	West Manhattan Chamber of Commerce	Col, West 68 th –86 th	WMCC
10/14/18	Bloomingdale Area Coalition	Bway, West 96 th –106 th W	Mort & Ray
10/21/18	NAACP Mid-Manhattan Branch	Bway, West 86 th – 90 th W	Mort & Ray
10/21/18	Symphony Space	Bway, West 90 th – 96 th W	Mort & Ray

Presentation by Christian Cordova:

•

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted. VOTE:

В.

6/09/18 Valley Restoration, LDC Col, West 96th –106th Mardi Gras Festival

Presentation by Christian Cordova:

•

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE:

Take one vote:

32-0-1-0

The meeting was **adjourned** at 8:54pm.

Present: Roberta Semer, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Linda Alexander, Richard Asche, Christian Cordova, Kenneth Coughlin, Page Cowley, Louisa Craddock, Catherine DeLazzero, Mark Diller, Miki F. Fiegel, Sheldon Fine, Paul Fischer, Sonia Garcia, Amy Hyman, Madelyn Innocent, Audrey Isaacs, Genora Johnson, Natasha Kazmi, Ira Mitchneck, Klari Neuwelt, Gabrielle Palitz, Michele Parker, Jeannette Rausch, Seema Reddy, Andrew Rigie, Richard Robbins, Suzanne Robotti, Madge Rosenberg, Melissa Rosenberg, Katie Rosman, Peter Samton, Susan Schwartz, Polly Spain, Howard Yaruss, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero

Absent: Isaac Booker, Tina Branham, Steven Brown, Joshua Cohen, Marc Glazer, Benjamin Howard-Cooper, Blanche E. Lawton, Ethel Sheffer

On Leave: Elizabeth Caputo, Robert Espier, Lillian Moore, Mel Wymore

PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

Klari Neuwelt, Chairperson January 22, 2018

Committee Members present: Klari Neuwelt, Co-Chair ("KN"); Steven Brown ("SB"); Ken Coughlin, Co-Chair ("KC"); Susan Schwartz ("SS"). Absent: Natasha Kazmi. Non-Committee Members Present: Mark Diller ("MD").

The Co-Chairs called the meeting to order at 7:00.

Procedural Updates

KN – Announced meeting February 26 meeting date and new processes for Co-Chair review of meeting minutes.

- 1. Report by Committee Co-Chair Ken Coughlin on Borough President's January 11 "Trash Talk" program.
 - Goal is to have 0 landfill waste by 2030.
 - Presentation of Seven Projects
 - 1. Reduce waste in school cafeterias
 - 2. Fixers Collective group advocating fixing things rather than throwing them away
 - 3. Harlem Grown introduces Harlem youth to urban farming
 - 4. We Hate to Waste goals are to get neighbors to swap and borrow things
 - 5. Lower Eastside Ecology Center e-waste facility
 - 6. Department of Sanitation discussed recycling of organic waste
 - 7. NY Lawyers for the Public Interest advocates reforms of the deadly and inefficient commercial waste hauling system
 - KC reported that SWAB has concerns regarding a proposed change to single-stream recycling

Community and Committee Session

- Peter Wright
 - Gave feedback on garbage collecting and the issue that China may not continue to buy as much plastic
- KN
- o Garbage disposals are actually more efficient and environmentally sound method for disposing of organic waste than sending to landfills by DOS.
- Encouraged committee members to go to more relevant public programs for which Co-Chairs circulate notices and report back to committee.
- 2. Theodore Roosevelt Park: Discussion with Department of Parks & Recreation of possible noise abatement measures for dog run.

Primary presentation for DPR by Whitney Talcott & Cecilia Choi. Parks staff members attending included Leslie Peoples, Manhattan Design Director; Katherine Bridges, Senior Landscape Architect; Whitney Talcott, Landscape Architect; Cecilia Cho, Landscape Architect Intern; and Steven Simon, Chief of Staff Manhattan.

Background of Project

Dog Run Project

- Approved November 8, 2017 by CB7 Full Board Meeting.
- Reconstruct dog run to address existing deteriorated condition.
- Provide ADA-accessible seating areas.
- Solve drainage problem.
- Reconfigure the small dog area.
- Protect existing mature trees.
- Total Budget: \$440,000
 - City Council District 6 (Helen Rosenthal and Gale Brewer) - \$350,000 FY17
 - Borough President Gale Brewer - \$ 90,000 FY18
- Currently funded,
- Project Size: 0.29 acres.

SOUND MEASUREMENTS

The decibel (dB) is the universal unit of sound measurement and is measured with a meter that registers sound pressure and displays these readings on a sound level scale.

One challenge of measuring sound in the city is that there is a high level of ambient sound, or background noise, in an area. For example, Times Square has high ambient sound levels, making it harder to distinguish the source of a sound. The same sound in a residential neighborhood may be easier to measure because there is less ambient sound.

Sounds of the City

Sound levels vary depending on one's distance from the noise source.

Below are some frequently heard sounds and corresponding decibel levels.

When designated as "dB(A)," as seen below, the measurement is weighted in the "A" scale to simulate human hearing.

A scale to simulate number hearing.

•	Whisper	30 dB(A)	4)	
---	---------	-----------	----	--

- Normal Conversation/Laughter 50 65 dB(A)
- Vacuum Cleaner at 10 feet 70 dB(A)
- Washing Machine/Dishwasher 78 dB(A)
- Midtown Manhattan Traffic Noise 70 85 dB(A)
- Dog Barking 70-90 db(A)

Observed Existing Sound Levels in Bull Moose Dog Run

- Dog Run60-70 db (A)
- W 81st sidewalk65 db (A)

ANIMAL NOISES

Animal noise that is unreasonable and plainly audible from within nearby residential property may call for enforcement action if the noise occurs:

- After 7:00 am and before 10:00 pm for a continuous period of 10 minutes or more
- After 10:00 pm and before 7:00 am for a continuous period of 5 minutes or more

Sound Attenuation Options

Direct sound and reflective sound are the major issues

Alternate Strategies to Sound Attenuation

- Dog bark monitoring by owner
- Rules enforcement by Parks Enforcement Patrol (PEP)
- Closing the dog run at night

Sound Mitigation Options Proposed for Dog Run

- Sound Attenuation Panels on the north Museum wall or free-standing in front of the wall
- Sound Attenuation Wall

Park Concerns

- Wall was not option for several reasons including size -- would need a 20' high wall
- Installing sound attenuation panels will have a limited effectiveness
- Public funding for sound attenuation panels is not available within the current project budget
 Approvals needed would include
 - o Parks Commissioner Silver
 - Department of Buildings
 - American Museum of Natural History
 - Landmarks Preservation Commission

Sound Attenuation Study

- Anticipated Expenses for sound attenuation project if feasible currently estimated at \$240,000
 - Sound Attenuation Panels Installed
 - Required Engineering
 - Sound Engineer
 - Structural Engineer
 - DOB expeditor

Proposed study as possible next step, but noted that this is not funded and not part of the project.

Committee discussion

- KN
- Pointed out that CB7 previously, in October, approved the plans that DPR had presented, with a
 FB amendment to the Committee's proposed resolution saying that CB7 was doing so in reliance
 on DPR's commitment to return to the Committee to discuss its progress in investigating sound
 abatement measures. This is that return visit.
- Is there anything about sound mitigation investigation or installation that would delay the plan that we approved?
 - WT/CC it depends on solution. No delay if went with panels on Museum wall. If panels were free-standing, would need to retrofit and would lose about 600 square feet of space.
- Asked if the level of noise is consistent with normal street noise volumes and dog parks
 - WT/CC Yes
- KC
- O How much would study cost?
 - WT/CC 2,000 5,000 dollars, but DPR couldn't do it because it has to have construction funds in place in order to do a study.

- Peter Wright (Friends of TR Park, Glenn Seagal, community member): We would fund a study.
- Would vegetation work as to reduce sound?
 - WT/CC no, it is there, and it does not work
- SS
- o How long would study take?
 - SSimon since sound attenuation in a dog run has never been done, there is no way to really know
- Pointed it out that there are apps that record decibels noise and could be handy to evaluate noise problem
- MD
 - Questioned if the noise could be mitigated at all and if so, how much would be mitigated
 - SSimon agreed with statement
 - Pointed out that the study should be coordinated with Parks to have study done by a trusted vendor
 - SSimon couldn't guarantee anything as there is no precedent for a study of this nature. Pointed out that there is skepticism that anything would really work to mitigate sound
- SB
- o Is there any precedent for mitigating the sound, is it DPR's responsibility?
 - SSimon although they always take sound into consideration, to his knowledge they
 have not done this in the past. DPR tries to site dog runs away from residential buildings
 where possible.

Community Session

- Peter Wright (Friends of Roosevelt Park)
 - o Stated that reducing the decibels level is the essence of this issue
 - Suggested privately funding this study to find answer to this question
 - Said that his group would pay for the study
 - A reduction of only 5 decibels or so wouldn't be worth doing. Consultants have said that meaningful noise reduction is questionable.
- Robyn Epstein
 - Wants to work with Parks as a concerned neighbor

С

- Steve Anderson 81st St. Block Assn.
 - O Disappointed thought that noise mitigation was part of the plan
 - Expressed disappointment with the overall presentation and the lack of enthusiasm from the presenter and Parks in general
 - Stated that Parks is not following up on past commitments and the recent resolution that specifically stated they need to take care of noise
 - KN Pointed out that CB7's past resolution and recent resolution approving the DPR plans were not contingent on Parks mitigating sound
 - o Reemphasized that the noise is unbearable in their apartments
 - Asked for a PEP officer to help
 - SSimon agreed to send PEP officers
- Janne Applebaum (Bull Moose Dog Run Assn)

- She is one of only two of former seven leaders of dog run association Jane Beale is the other, but could not attend this evening
- Mentioned there were other ideas and projects that they thought would help such as Astroturf
 - KN would Astroturf help?
 - WT- didn't think so wouldn't address direct or indirect sound
- She is the main "PEP officer" patrolling the dog run
 - KN suggested PEP writing a few summonses would help
 - KN Are there PEP officers now?
 - SSimon there should be, and he will send some periodically
 - KN would not support substantial use of PEP officer time at this location to detriment of other PEP officer duties. CB7 has a budget priority item asking for more PEP officers in our district, but targeted times could be very helpful.
 - Community members suggest to Simon focusing PEP enforcement at 6:00 p.m. and 7:30 a.m.
- KN
 - What is the update on adding stone screenings to surface on an interim basis pending the full renovation, which DPR had agreed to pursue at our prior meeting on the dog run renovation?
 - SSimon said he will get update he is waiting for an estimate to take the Commissioner
- Glenn Seagal 81st St. Block Assn
 - Lives across the Park
 - Pointed out the sound issue started when the Museum added the Planetarium addition with the north wall after the dog run had been in existence for some time. Wanted to try and find a realistic solution
 - Asked for meeting with all stakeholders and Parks to see if there was a solution and if it made sense to do a study.
 - SSimon said it may be possible he will need to check but it can' be with DPR
 Planning staff because not in their budget
 - SB stated that he hoped that that all parties would be reasonable. Pointed out the Parks people were good people, but it made no sense to have a meeting and just to yell at them. That would not be productive.
 - Glenn Seagal Agreed
- Peter Wright, Glenn Seagal and Steve Anderson discussed that it was most likely that one of their groups or they would all chip into to pay for the study, but they wanted to discuss it first
- KN Summarize the discussions: PEP officers will be strategically deployed; additional gravel for the short term is being pursued by DPR; the stakeholders will try to meet with DPR before deciding to go ahead with and fund a study (SSimon needs to confirm this); meanwhile, the plans as approved by the CB7 FB will go ahead.
- Katherine Bridges, DPR: We were waiting for the discussion at this meeting. The LPC hearing is tomorrow, and we are going ahead with the hearing and the plans that were approved by CB7.
- SSImon raised the point that anything regarding this issue would need to be approved by other levels of Parks, including his boss
 - MD investigation of sound abatement at the dog run should be coordinated with any proposal for opening part of the TR Roosevelt Park north lawn, which is under consideration.
- 3. Central Park: Presentation by the City Parks Foundation on plans for a project to upgrade the SummerStage venue by Heather Lubov ("HL") (City Parks Foundation)

Background of Project

City Parks Foundation is dedicated to invigorating and transforming parks into dynamic, vibrant centers of urban life through sports, arts, community building and education programs for all New Yorkers. Located in more than 350 parks, recreation centers and public schools across New York City. Founded in 1989, they reach 425,000 people each year.

SummerStage is New York City's largest free, outdoor performing arts festival. For 32 seasons, SummerStage has presented artists of the highest quality across multiple disciplines and genres, with a focus on both iconic and emerging artists who reflect the interests of New York's diverse communities with approximately 100 shows every season.

Reasons for Renovations:

- To ensure future generations of New Yorkers enjoy SummerStage in Central Park
- To ensure they can continue to attract world-class performers
- Current stage is nearly 20 years old and can no longer hold the weight of some productions (light, sound, and screens)
- Improve efficiency and safety of electrical distribution within the venue

Venue Upgrade projects proposed alterations:

- New Foundations (6)
 - Improved visual impact
 - Smaller profile
- Replace Columns (2)
 - Increased weight capacity
 - Smaller profile
- New Electrical Trench & Access Points (9)
 - Improved visual impact
 - Reduced trip hazards
 - More efficient use of electricity

Additional directions on project

- It will be a new stage
 - New stage will be 20 % larger
 - Lighting will move on stage
- Looking to upgrade their entire experience to more modern design and allow better flow and site lines
- Capacity will be the same 5500

Committee Session

- KN
- o How much?
 - HL Overall project is \$5 million
 - \$50,000 from Council Member Helen Rosenthal
 - \$150,000 from Borough President Gale Brewer,
 - \$2.9 million total from NYC capital funds, including Council Member and Borough President funding
 - \$5 million total budget still need to raise \$1 million

- Remaining expected from private funds
- Rose Christ, lawyer/government affairs consultant: clarified money raised
- o When?
 - HL Goal is summer of 2019
- Are they governed by same process as DPR?
 - HL No, we have a process that allows more flexibility.
- KC
- o Are there any concerts that are not free?
 - HL Mostly free but have a few paid each year
- O Why not keep stage up all year?
 - HL Not permitted
- Pointed out lack of bicycle parking
 - HL It was acknowledged, and they are working on. Also, they are trying to include some solar power.
- SS
- Do they coordinate with other shows like Met concerts?
 - HL- No
- O Where do you store stage?
 - HL- Containers off-site
- MD
 - o Is the new stage accessible?
 - HL- New ramps will be ADA compliant

Resolution to approve the proposed renovations:

VOTE:

Committee Members: 4-0-0-0

Non-committee Board Members: 1-0-0-0

4. Update on Committee discussions

- KN Spoke with Margaret Bracken about January FB amendment, accepted by Co-Chairs as friendly, to resolution regarding fitness equipment at 76th Street that asked DPR to investigate using a particular brand of equipment. Margaret said that DPR has an approved list of three manufacturers of fitness equipment, vetted for durability, reliability, etc. She was not familiar with the particular company that the proponent of the amendment had favored. Also, every DPR project of this type is vetted by DPR's Accessibility Coordinator. Some of the equipment chosen for this site is accessible, and it is not DPR's policy to require 100% accessible equipment for every project.
- The Committee discussed generally the issue of FB members who have not attended committee
 meetings proposing amendments to resolutions without having familiarity with the issues, and concern
 about generally respecting committee work.
- KN We have been trying to get an update from DOT on its plan to install lighting on the Cherry Walk, but the DOT staff person has not responded.
- KN We have learned that the "Rosenthal Bypass" project funded by Council Member Rosenthal's Participatory Budgeting process was rejected as a capital project by OMB, but that the issue appears to be being resolved, and that a bid will be accepted for that project, together with the two other capital projects that Margaret Bracken discussed with us last month, with the input of \$200,000 of funds

transferred from another project as explained by DPR at our last meeting, and that the project is expected to go forward. The "Brewer Money" project for enhancements at the northern end of Riverside Park South, for which bids came in too high close to two years ago, still has not gone out to bid again with the infusion of the additional \$1.2 million transferred from the "Green Outlook" project. Per Margaret, it should go out to bid again soon.KC – Discussion of continuing campaign for a "Car Free Central Park" in light of events, including Prospect Park becoming completely car-free and the naming of a new chair of the City Council's Parks Committee, Barry Grodenchik.

5. Identify community groups and organizations that can contribute information and data to the committee's sections of the FY2020 DNS and budget priorities by Mark Diller

Mark Diller asked the committee to think offline about continuing to seek ways to maximize community input for the FY2020 DNS and budget priorities. Pointed to the robust process the committee went through with the "Brewer Money" project by including significant outreach from all stakeholders. Encouraged the committee to replicate that process.

The meeting was adjourned at about 9:45.

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Jay Adolph and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons January 11, 6:30 PM

Present: Gabby Palitz and Jay Adolf Co-Chairs, Mark Diller, Miki Fiegel and Peter Samton. **Absent:** Susan Schwartz.

- 1. **206 West 79th Street** (Amsterdam-Broadway.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for legalization of the storefront. *Applicant cancelled.*
- 2. Identify community groups and organizations that can contribute information and data to the committee's sections of the FY2020 DNS and budget priorities.

The committee discussed community groups and organizations that can contribute information and data to the FY2020 DNS. The following groups have interests that are in line with the Preservation Committee's mission:

- Landmark West!
- West End Preservation Society
- Historic District Commission
- Landmark Conservancy

The committee would wish to discuss the ideas and needs identified by these groups. For example. Landmark West! has a wish list which might make for a productive discussion.

Additionally, the committee discussed working cooperatively with Parks Committee when their agenda coincides with Preservation goals.

Budget priorities: It would be helpful to have an additional staff person or intern who can work with applicants and CB staff to find a way to disseminate information regarding applications to the committee prior to the meeting so that this information would reach a wider audience.

Respectfully Submitted, Miki Fiegel

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Andrew Albert and Howard Yaruss, Co-Chairpersons January 9, 2018

Present: Andrew Albert, Howard Yaruss, Isaac Booker, Miki Fiegel, Joshua T. Cohen, Richard Robbins and Suzanne Robotti. **Absent:** Ken Coughlin and Marc Glazer.

The meeting was called to order at 7:02pm by the Co-Chairs

1. NYPD 20° and 24° Precincts discussion on traffic stats, e-bikes, and pedestrian safety.

Captain Manuel from the 24th Precinct reported on the end of year numbers comparing 2017 to 2016. Pedestrian-related collisions were down compared to 2016. The police are happy with the trend. More summonses than last year. They have found that focusing on moving violations (as compared to parking) has made pedestrian-related incidents lower.

- Andrew requested and was promised a list of intersections that are the most collision heavy.
- Miki requested attention to the perceived speeding on WEA in the evening.
- Richard asked if speeding tickets have increase with the new lower speed limit. Answer: Each officer has
 discretion at how much over the speed limit to write a ticket (e.g. 2 miles over or 10). What is the average
 speed the ticket is written for? Captain Manuel offered to look into it. How many officers are trained to
 give speeding tickets? More than before, new trainings have just been conducted. At least 12-15 officers
 trained.
- Isaac thanked the officers for all the data brought to the meeting. Isaac would like the police department to know that he sees many cars running red lights on the 96th street corridor.
- Dave (community member) how many tickets were given to commercial vs private vehicles? They will get that info
- Judy Goldberg (community member) Do you have a breakdown on bike incidents types of collisions, delivery vs private bikes? They don't know, but they've increased the number of bike summonses.
- Howard asked how many injuries occurred with bikes involved. 229 pedestrian injuries total harmed by all vehicles.
- Miki claimed she has seen at 96th and Broadway the traffic enforcement agents stand around. Captain Manuel will check it out.
- Captain Manuel noted that eBikes are a priority. The police confiscated 38 last year, hope to take more. eBikes vary and some are more illegal than others. The Legal Bureau is going along on sting operations to make sure summonses are written correctly so they hold up in court. Not seeing a lot of collisions. But ebikes are a motorized vehicle, their high speeds are dangerous for pedestrians.
- Howard asked for clarification on the definition of an ebike. It's considered motorized scooter-type vehicle. Are resources being diverted from car enforcement to eBike enforcement? No.
- Margaret Harbock (community member) asked how the police will know if they are successful? What is your metric? Year over year improvements.
- Jeff (community member) biggest complaint in his building are bikes on the sidewalk. Can the police act on complaints on a delivery service that has lots of eBikes?
- Sgt. Montgomery from the 20th Precinct reported on the year's numbers comparing 2017 to 2016. Of the 201 accidents, 139 collisions with taxis. High rate of injuries to cab and black car passengers. The precinct has more officers this year than last. Confiscated 51 eBikes. It's not illegal to own an eBike, just to ride it. They pay the \$500 and get it back right away. They are only off the street for 2-3 hours in some cases.
- Of 86 pedestrian collisions only 5 involved bikes. 58 bike accidents, only 1 was an eBike. 17 bike accidents were bike only (bikes hit each other or a biker hits a pothole).

- Rich noted that there are hundreds of injuries caused by cars. If it was some other cause of harm (food poisoning for example) it would be unacceptable. We want to lower the pedestrian harm rate. What is it that we can do to help you? What street design changes, calls for enforcement, more training?
- Roberta sees a lot of people walking carelessly across streets. Is there anything we can do to get people
 to pay attention? Sgt. Montgomery tracks the intersections in her area and looks for clusters of pedestrian
 accidents or near misses and sends out traffic safety officers.
- Celeste Carlucci wonders if the police could work with the department of aging to get more help for the seniors. The seniors are afraid of bikes and bike lanes.
- Colleen from DOT, we have employees that go out to educate seniors. She will work with Celeste on where to send their people.
- Josh (community member) there was a recent truck accident. Was the truck seized? The answer is no, Josh wants to point out that police are seizing eBikes that aren't causing harm
- Dave Olshevsky, (community member) the officers have offered to bring info back, when do they do that?
- Margaret (community member) double checked stats
- Miki asked how many cars a day go through high volume areas. Unknown
- Richard noted that it seems everyone hates eBikes and everyone wants to get rid of them. But only one
 eBike was involved in an accident.
- **2. 908 Amsterdam Avenue** (West $104^{\circ} 105^{\circ}$ Streets.) Application #B02782 to NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission by New App Car & Limo, Inc. for renewal of their For Hire Base Station license.

Appropriate signage was not posted because the company did not get enough notice to post. They agreed to post before the Full Board and there will be a vote at Full Board.

VOTE: 6-0-0-0. Non Committee Board Members 4-0-0-0.

3. D. Zelman concerns about containers stored on roadways.

David Zelman gave a presentation on contractor trucks and containers stored on roadways. During construction trucks take over the free, on street parking, taking it away from local resident use. Example, the Astor renovation construction crew has taken 20 parking spots for entire time of construction.

- Question to Colleen (DOT), when a contractor requests space does the DOT check? Yes, when permits are
 issued, they make an in-person site visit to inspect.
- Hand written sign, "No parking, driveway" put up by the contractors at the Astor.
- Manhattan Day school, closes at 2:30 on Fridays, but there is not parking until 5. Other schools have parking only until 4pm. The school agreed, but then changed their mind. Why are they getting this concession? Colleen from DOT said they would not change the parking laws for Fridays only.
- Trader Joe's parks its trucks on 72nd street right in front of the bus stop. So buses must pull out to the third lane to get around the trucks. Dangerous to pedestrians.

4. Discussion on congestion pricing.

Congestion Pricing will potentially bring in an additional \$1.3 billion to the cash-starved MTA. It is likely that the "congestion zone" would be Manhattan south of 60th Street. All vehicles entering the zone would be subject to a fee, which can vary by hour and type of vehicle. However, vehicles traversing the periphery of the zone, for instance, a car crossing the Brooklyn Bridge and utilizing the ramp to the FDR Drive and exiting north of 60th Street would not be subject to the fee. For-hire vehicles, many of which are creating the large amount of congestion as they cruise for passengers, would be subject to a fee, as yellow cabs are. Many questions remain on the final proposal, which can be discussed at the meeting.

- Michele how much input will CB7 have? Answer: We'll have a resolution at the proper time
- Rich they are talking about drawing the line in our district. That could have a major impact on our district. Fix NYC, can they come in to get our comments?

- Mark Diller it will be voted on as part of the state budget, so our only chance to vote on anything will be the next committee meeting.
- Aldo from Assemblymember Rosenthal's office -- Linda has not taken a position on congestion pricing yet, she will wait until the bill is proposed.
- Josh would like to see the line drawn as far north as possible. Andrew noted that 96th is the most likely northern location.
- Rich states resident parking will be necessary if this comes into play or we will become a parking lot.
- Dawn since 96th street is too crowded, please pick a different street or use the money to fix the station,
- Mark 72nd street subway is the narrowest platform in the system. That would be a bad station to be near the border thereby absorbing the additional riders.

Rich proposed a Resolution on congestion pricing:

- We're in favor of congestion pricing
- The boundary as far north as possible, carefully considering impact on neighborhood and transit system
- Lock on \$ raised for congestion pricing to go to the MTA
- Include community in issues of final proposal that will impact communities on the border.

VOTE 6-0-0-0. Non Committee Board Members 2-0-2-0

2nd resolution

For hire services should pay per ride into the congestion pricing - bring the for hire cars into parity with the yellow cabs. An actual pass through to the consumer

VOTE 5-0-1-0. Non-Committee Board members 2-0-2-0

5. Identify community groups and organizations that can contribute information and data to the committee's sections of the FY2020 DNS and budget priorities.

Proposed by Roberta and Mark, it's a request to help the committee prepare for the 2019 DNS. The goal is to expand the number of community groups that we gather feedback and further information on the community issues before our committee.

6. New Business

- Su requested that we review and finalize the street naming guidelines in the upcoming meeting. We determined to send comments to Roberta and vote upon on the next committee meeting.
- Susan Schwartz finished her presentation on biking statistics. Discussion ensued. Susan requested a resolution that a traffic study on bikes be conducted.

POSTPONED

• **25 West 94** Street (Central Park West.) Application to the Department of Transportation by Mark Mancuso for a fenced in area including a wheelchair accessible Ramp, trash receptacle and planter box.