

BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons

November 14, 2017

The meeting was called to order at 7:05 pm by Co-Chairperson Michele Parker.

Present: Michele Parker, Linda Alexander, Joshua T. Cohen, Christian Cordova, Paul Fischer and Seema Reddy. **Absent:** George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero and Marc Glazer.

The following matters were discussed:

New applications to the SLA for two year liquor licenses:

1. **425 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th Street.) Frank Mac's Place LLC, d/b/a Frank's (Formerly McAleer's Pub).

Presenting for the Applicant: Mike Paleudis (Attorney), Eileen McAleer, Karen M. Conti (both Owners)

CB7 Comments:

- New entity will purchase assets of McAleer's Pub, driven primarily by estate planning purposes
- Only thing really changing about the operation is the name. Otherwise, the place will continue to operate as it has in the past.
- There is live music now. Premises has been licensed for a long time. Attorney filed a FOIA request to confirm that live music has been legal. No records of complaints.
- No one from neighborhood came to speak.
- There is a café license that will be assigned and will have to be renewed at some point.
- TIPS trained servers will be brought in after the dark period.
- A manager will be hired to assist the owners.
- Posting was not up in the window of the premises – that will be remedied in advance of the board meeting. Although the posting was done extensively throughout the neighborhood.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted VOTE: 6-0-0-0*

2. **774 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 98th Street.) Rojita Management LLC, d/b/a Boru Boru.

Presenting for the Applicant: Daniel Zelkowitz (Owner), Eric Vargas Bromberg (Manager)

- Place is now closed for construction (gut renovation). Work will be done to try to deal with the vermin that has historically been problematic.
- Owner intends to apply for sidewalk café license in the future.
- Owner operated 5 locations of Tres Carnes, as well as a chain of restaurants in NJ, and NYC. Manager has had lots of high end restaurant experience.
- This will be a Kosher restaurant.
- Likely there will be delivery offered through a third party, in the future.
- Hours are: 11am-2am M-Th, Sun; 11am-4pm Fri; 7pm-2am Sat
- Basement is for storage
- To deal with noise attenuation, a thicker ceiling tile will be installed. Owner is willing to install soundproofing if there are noise complaints.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted VOTE: 6-0-0-0*

3. **938 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 106th Street.) Seinfeld Square LLC, d/b/a Dive 106.

Presenting for the Applicant: Thomas McCallen (Attorney), Lee Seinfeld, Nick Seinfeld, Howard Kaye (Principals)

CB7 Comments:

- Location was posted properly.
- Neighborhood bar with pub style menu. Dive Bar, Broadway Bar are other locations of the Principals
- Hours: 11am-4am, 7days/wk
- Sidewalk café – may consider for next year.
- No bicycle delivery. Only delivery by walking.
- Cosmetic renovation – not a gut renovation

- Basement is for storage only.
- No live music

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted VOTE: 6-0-0-0

Non-Committee Members Vote: N/A

4. 955 West End Avenue (West 107th Street.) Mocha Lounge Inc., d/b/a The West End on the Park.

Presenting for the Applicant: Katharina Tunnat (Owner), Eric Edlund (Owner), James Dipasquale (Attorney)

CB7 Comments:

- This is a new ownership. The current owner has operated the establishment without much attention to the neighbors.
- New owners live across the street and know of the potential for the restaurant.
- Live and amplified live music proposed – what is currently in the restaurant now.
- There is additional soundproofing being considered. But the specifics have not been decided. This is a big issue for the neighbors! Specifically the bass notes have been problematic to the neighbors.
- Owners have lived in neighborhood for 13yrs, and see a lot of potential in the space.
- One of the last few spaces on the UWS that have live music.
- Now, live music goes until 4am. In the future, operations are TBD
- Residents Speaking
 - Susan Malcolm – 300 W107: should look at how many times the police have been called in the last 5 years for noise complaints, rats, patrons lingering, etc.!
 - Quandra Prettyman – 300W107: lived there for almost 50yrs. Are the new owners looking to establish a new operation, sensitive to the neighbors?
 - Margaret Donahue – 301W107: she would like to see stipulations placed on the liquor license. They have been calling for the last 5 yrs. She was at a mediation at the local NYPD with the previous owner. He said his vision was to be a family style bistro, but he never abided by what he said. He misled the community and the community liaison at the NYPD precinct. It is not clear if anyone made any complaints directly to the SLA. Will the space be soundproofed?! The live band music was able to be heard clearly – even with windows closed. The exterior speakers were taken down.
 - Steve Norman – 301W107: He was also at mediation with police. John Forslund (one of the new owners) who represented the old owner was very disingenuous at the meeting. He made many representations – none of which were actually put into place. This is a residential neighborhood! The premises has a responsibility to the residents. 22yrs ago the location was a
 - Steve Rotterdam – 949WEA: have a wife and 2 daughters, residing in the bldg. since 1999.
 - Bar constantly plays loud music very late
 - Bar has done nothing to discourage large crowds of patrons from congregating outside on the sidewalk late into the night
 - When the scaffolding was there, all of the area was taken up by patrons smoking cigarettes and pot.
 - Talking, yelling, arguing and fighting among patrons. Police have often been called. 311 has also been called.
 - Bars employees and patrons consistently block the sidewalks.
 - College age students from Columbia are often seen – perhaps not legal drinking age
 - Strauss Park becomes an extension of the bar.
 - Owners have shown no effort to respect the neighbors or neighborhood.
 - Behind bldg, air shaft acts as a funnel for the sound – too loud!
 - Justine Blau – 300W107: Lived there since 1992. Problem is that the clientele attracted to the bar are troublesome – especially as the night gets later. It's so loud and disruptive to neighbors.
 - Alberto Gonzalez – 949WEA: live next door. Window is next to the bar. The cigarette smoke from patrons goes into his apartment. Sidewalk is full of garbage, always crowded. Have been there for 7yrs and calling 311 several times a week. Police come occasionally but doesn't solve the problem

- Elizabeth Riley – 949WEA: 2nd floor. Lived there for 44 yrs. From the moment the place opened, it has been problematic. Right now, she doesn't open up her windows at all. Smoke, noise, sleep disruptions are all problematic! There are even lude acts happening in Strauss Park. Hip hop music booming! From the bar, around 10pm is when the music gets loud, and then gets really bad around 1-3am! The patrons outside the bar are also problematic. No one polices it. There's no doorman policing this behavior. Horrible way to live! She used to call 5x/wk – but it takes forever to register the complaint. There is live music and recorded music and karaoke night! There were many other peaceful business in this location. But this business has been awful for the neighbors!
- Ken Roberts – 945WEA: lived there for 35years. There is frequently audible noise from club itself and from people leaving the club. This is a narrow street across from a small public park. There's a change in traffic direction here. A bicycle parking station has been added directly across, further narrowing the street. There is a tendency (increasing over the past year) of people leaving the club to congregate in the park and in the street at all hours of the night. This shouldn't be permitted. The basement well has been used inappropriately as a sidewalk café of sorts.
- Dan Zweig – 945WEA: Building is definitely in a residential zone. There seems to be a carve-out in the basement for a commercial use. But there is no commercial overlay for the building. The commercial use should not extend outside of the building – eg, the well area and the signage! The operators have historically used any opportunity to sneak around the regulations – esp with signage, lighting, awnings, the well, etc. Corner of the well becomes the smoking area!
 - Signage should be limited to the basement area and not above that on the façade. The premises has never had a hearing in front of the board in the past 30yrs!
 - Signage should not be allowed on the fence at the perimeter of the well.
 - Narrow sidewalk, residential zone – planters should be removed!
 - Smoking is encouraged. There should be no smoking.
 - Music is too loud! Still audible more than ½ a block away.
 - Deliveries – problematic on a narrow street. Trucks double parking on the street are problematic.
- Emma Hartung – 949WEA: Hopefully the rest of the district also has good living conditions
- Taylor Miller – 300W107: it's a real horror to live above this bar. Calling police and 311 doesn't help for more than a few minutes. The noise outside the bar is a problem – especially into the early morning hours. It goes on and on and on! From inside the building, the noise comes up the front and back. The noise echoes through the back of the building – so loud and so much vibration. The building was built 120yrs ago and was never built to accommodate a bar/lounge. Structural changes made by the previous owner have affected the whole masonry building.
- Jena Starke – 949WEA: They just moved in 1.5mos ago. On the 2nd floor, all of their windows face the alley/air shaft between the buildings. The sound that comes up is incredibly loud in the back.
- Cynthia Seibels – 300W107: The kitchen room of the premises lets into the back courtyard shared by the building. This could pose a security problem for the residents.
- Mary Ann Fole – 300W107: On the top floor, same complaints as others – loud noises outside, feels unsafe outside with all the loitering people, smell of pot, litter, bottles, garbage, etc.
- Teddy Gonzalez – offered some clarification information about the CofO changes...
-
- Research should be done to see if the business is legal already. Some historical research should ideally be done.
- Proposed stipulations
 - There should be some means of communication between the Owners and the neighbors
 - No smoking in the well.
 - No smoking inside the premises.
 - There should be someone posted outside every hour (as security) to make sure that people are moving along. People cannot be allowed to loiter. Also, people cannot be allowed to leave with drinks.

- There must be licensed NYS security guards checking people for licenses to make sure patrons are of age.
- Have a few signs asking patrons to respect the neighbors.
- Hours of operation do not make sense in a residential zone – should be limited to 2am or midnight.
- Remove planters and any illegal signage outside the well area. Signage should be kept a grade level – at the premises' level.
- Sidewalks must be kept clean of litter and garbage.
- No solicitors on the street.
- Windows and doors in the well should be kept closed by 9pm, weekdays; 10pm weekend nights?
- Sound proofing should be installed to mitigate noise and vibration to the neighbors.
- Awnings should be kept up as sound attenuation.

VOTE: no vote taken...

5. **158A West 72nd Street** (Amsterdam Avenue.) Ephesus Corp., d/b/a Seven Hills Mediterranean Grill.

Presenting for the Applicant: Teddy Gonzalez (consultant), Yonca E. Erdik (Owner)

CB7 Comments:

- Turkish restaurant. New Owner is purchasing the business. Same operation, same hours (until 1230am, 7 days/wk).
- Sidewalk café license desired.
- Owner-operated place
- Background music. There is a comedy club above the restaurant, and apartments above that.
- Deliveries will be done by bike. 2 bikes. We need a picture of the delivery people.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

New Unenclosed Sidewalk Café Application:

6. **2737 Broadway** (West 105th Street.) New application #15452-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Serafina 2735 Corp., d/b/a Serafina, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 33 tables and 69 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: No one came! No postings!

*After due deliberation the resolution to **disapprove** was adopted VOTE: 6-0-0-0*

FULL BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Roberta Semer, Chairperson

November 8, 2017

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Wednesday, November 8, 2017, at Mount Sinai West, 1000 Tenth Avenue (West 59th Street) in the District. Chair Roberta Semer called the meeting to order at 6:34 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

The following matters were discussed and actions taken:

Minutes from the October 3, 2017, Full Board meeting were **approved**.

VOTE: 21-0-0

Chair's Report: Roberta Semer:

- Congratulate our newly elected officials
- Thank you gift was presented to Mark Diller for his outstanding work as the CB7 Co-Secretary and a thank you for continuing to provide support to the board.
- The board held a meeting on 10/30 at Goddard Riverside to address the public over the 108th Street project. Over 240 community members were present and testimony was delivered by 100 people. Community members can submit written testimony to the CB7 office up until 11/21/17.
- The board will be holding a meeting on 11/20 at 6:30pm at Goddard Riverside to learn about the 108th Street project from WSFSSH and HPD, ask questions and engage in a discussion and vote on both the deposition of property and a change in zoning. There will be no public testimony at this meeting.
- There will be no Steering Committee this month due to the 11/20 meeting.
- There will be no Parks Committee this month. The meeting will be rescheduled for early December depending on what is on the agenda.
- On 10/14, there was a NYCHA Program Workshop head with CB7, 9-12 other organizations, and elected officials. They are looking to reschedule the workshop to ensure that NYCHA workers can be present. Reschedule will occur in early January during the week
- The Parks Committee has a new Co-Chair, Ken Coughlin.
- The Youth, Education, and Libraries Committee has a new co-chair, Mark Diller.
- Museum of Natural History Project is not before the board this month.

Community Session:

- Bob Fohnggho from the Ryan Center
 - Introduce himself and let the board know he will be attending meetings.
- Clement James from the FDNY
 - Assistant Director of Community Affairs
 - Stated that there are resources through the FDNY around fire safety and cooking safety.
- Camryn Hellwarth from Sprouts Cooking Club
 - Youth culinary cooking classes- winter cooking class series in December
 - www.sproutscookingclub.org
- Peter Arndtsen from Columbus-Amsterdam BID
 - There will be a history talk about northern part of Central Park at the Youth Hostel on Amsterdam and West 104th Street.
 - The monthly walking tours will continue throughout the Winter
- Jennifer Zarr from St. Agnes Branch
 - All branches will be providing free access to ABC Mouse which is a computer program that teaches 2-8 years old children literacy and other academic skills.
 - Book sale next Wednesday, November 15 from 1-5pm

- Edward Green from 124 West 79th Street
 - Opposition of the Museum Natural History
- Maria Fernandez from community
 - Stated that there is concern that the President of the United States will reduce public parks and allow for the parks to be used for private resources.
 - Stated that she felt the Museum of Natural History is allowing for the public park space to be reduced for their expansion.
- Cary Goodman from 34 West 86th Street
 - Stated that he is opposed to the Museum of Natural History expansion taking away a piece of the Theodore Roosevelt Park.
- William Raudenbush from the community
 - Stated that he wants the Theodore Roosevelt Park protected from the Museum of Natural History expansion.
 - Stated that he believe the expansion would be toxic for the environment.
 - Calls that the Museum release the Environmental Impact Study.
- Judith Calamandre from West 79th Street
 - Brought the NYTimes article, Thinking Inside the Footprint: Expansion doesn't have to mean a grand new architectural gesture. You could stick a huge gallery under a terrace, maybe (March 16, 2017).
 - Encouraging all CB7 members and community to read the article and think about other ways the museum can expand without taking public park space.
- Regina Karp from West 79th Street
 - Stated that she was opposed to Museum of Natural History Expansion
 - Stated that she would like to see the Community Board disbanded. She believes that Community Board positions should be elected not appointed.
- Faith Steinberg from Community United
 - Stated that the Community Board should be representative of the community and its needs.
 - She stated her opposition to Museum of Natural History expansion.
- Joshua Roseman from 170 West 74th
 - Brought the issue of mosquitos on 74th Street
 - Asks that the Community Board look into the issue
- Antionette Coniglio from the Community
 - Would like the Community Board to explore the idea of creating areas for dogs to defecate and urine
 - Believes creating areas for the dogs will decrease public health issues

Manhattan Borough President's Report, Diana Howard:

- Manhattan Borough President would like to thank the community for their support in being re-elected.
- There was an issue where Gristede's was not accepting WIC, due to reimbursement fees. MBH is working with parent company to ensure that they continue to accept WIC.
- MBH wrote a letter to the State Department about the cut of senior funding (\$100,000) for the Lincoln Square Neighborhood Senior Center and funding was restored.
- Community Board Applications will be out at the end of the month. MBH encourages all that are interested to complete and submit an application.
- Community Board Leadership Series are currently running. There will be a workshop on Open Data (11/14/17 at 6-8pm at 1 Centre Street).
- MBH had discussions with Westside Market and the landlord. MBH believes that these are normal lease negotiations and will continue to provide assistance if necessary

Reports by Elected Officials:

Helen Rosenthal, City Council:

- UWS took notion that you need to vote and had the highest district turnout city-wide.
- Another woman has been lost in City Council. Women representation has decreased over the last few years (21, 18, 15, 11 out of 51 members).
- Asking that the 8 City Council Members (all men) running for Speaker to review the role of women in city government and to work with the Woman's Caucus to advance the women's agenda.
- Regular news will be coming out again now that election is over.
- Women Suffrage Leaders were honored yesterday by erecting a Central Park statue honoring Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton. Hope the honoring of women and their accomplishments go beyond this dedication as there is still a long way to go in honoring women's contributions.
- Prospect Park will be adding a statue of Shirley Chisholm.
- Battling why the MTA is so expensive in construction. 4-10 times more money per mile to get construction completed than any other city on the planet. Method of doing construction- cut and cover- cheaper way to build a new tunnel and platform- MTA did not take this path.

Linda Rosenthal, NY State Assembly, (67th District):

- Congratulations to Community Board Officers for their election in their positions.
- Participated in a TedMed Talk in Palm Springs about Menstrual Equity. Discussions were centered around feminine products being taxed or lack of access to products for many citizens.
- Assembly Member Linda B. Rosenthal's Bill to add E-cigarettes to the Clean Indoor Air Act becomes law. According to a 2016 report of the U.S. Surgeon General, vaping among high school students grew by 900% between 2011 and 2015.
- Working on a bill to raise smoking age to 21 in New York State.
- Signing of Noah's Ark Bill into Law- allow pets to board public transportation with their guardians during natural disasters to evacuate to safety.
- A bill looking at tax credits to companies- sexual harassment/assault policies will be reviewed to allow tax credit
- Held a Town Hall calling for a Rent Freeze for Rent Controlled Tenants. Discusses the unjust and unsustainable rent increases rent-controlled tenants have experienced for years. Vast majority of rent-controlled tenants are seniors living on a low, fixed monthly income. Since 1970, MBR (Maximum Base Rent) system has saddled rent-controlled tenants rent increases as high as 22%; last year the MBR was set at an arbitrary 7/5%.
- Panel Discussion on the Child Victims Act will be held on Thursday, November 16, 2017 at 6-8pm. The location is John Jay College of Criminal Justice (524 West 59th Street). The discussion will explore how New York State is failing our children and what we can do to change it.
- Gus Dixon got a promotion and has moved over to legislative team.
- Aldo Ponterosso is the new Community Liaison to CB7.

Reports by Elected Officials' Representatives:

Sean Coughlin, Office of Council Member Corey Johnson (3rd District):

- Press conference at City Hall for the bill to allow for affordable markets- delete the commercial tax on markets
 - Dedicate space to fresh produce
- Medicare Enrollment Session- tomorrow 1-3:30pm Hudson Guild Senior Center

Alek Miletic, Office of Assembly Member Richard Gottfried (75th District):

- ACA Open Enrollment began on Nov 1st. Deadline January 31, 2018
- Reduced Fare MetroCard
- Access-a-Ride Survey on the website if you have comments (<http://bit.ly/2zetgNI>)

Tara Klein, Office of State Senator Brad Hoylman (27th District):

- Holding a Town Hall meeting on November 9 from 6-7:30pm at Fashion Institute of Technology. Discussions will explore “Vanishing New York: Small Business Crisis”.
- In September 2017, NYS Senator Hoylman released a student on Cooking Without Gas: How Unresponsive Utility Companies Hurt a Vital Sector of NYC’s Small Businesses.
- Demanding an end to “Weinstein-Style” Confidentiality Agreements. Introduced legislation to prohibit companies from requiring employees to waive their substantive and procedural rights in connection with claims of discrimination, retaliation, or harassment.

Daisy More, Office of State Senator Jose Serrano (29th District):

- State Senator Jose Serrano’s Community Report for November 2017 are located in the back
- Mobile Office hours: 11-2pm: tomorrow (11/9) at the Project Find Hamilton Senior

Brennan Ward, Office of State Senator Marisol Alcantara (31st District):

- First March Against Prostate Cancer was held.
- The Non-Rental Fees Transparency Act- This new law requires landlords of rent-regulated buildings to publish a full list of non-rental fees they are allowed to charge. This will prevent unscrupulous landlords from charging extra, illegal fees from their tenants.
- The Millennial Disasters Preparedness Act- This new law requires that the New York State government study the feasibility of implementing emergency alerts that are displayed while citizens are using a video streaming service.
- The Cosmetology Diversity Act- This new law changes the state’s cosmetology curriculum to include the hair of people of all ethnic backgrounds. It also establishes an advisory commission to make sure that these standards are accurate, and to revise the state cosmetology exam to include competence working with ethnic hair types.
- Westside Campaign Against Hunger: Thanksgiving Dinner is next week

Elie Peltz, Office of U.S. House Member Jerrold Nadler (10th District):

- Recognize the lives lost in incident Downtown last week. Congressman will continue to monitor investigation as it evolves.
- Congressman continues to speak his opposition to the GOP Tax Bill and will continue to be vocal about how it will affect the public.
- Recently, the House Republicans brought a bill to the floor that will ban abortion at 6 weeks. Congressman is concerned about this bill and will be vocal about fighting against it.
- Congressman held a press conference with port truck drivers and representatives from the International Brotherhood of Teamsters to announce the introduction of the Port Driver’s Bill of Rights Act and the Clean Ports Act of 2017. The bill ensures that all those who work at the port are treated fairly and earn a decent wage, and that those who live near ports do not bear the brunt of pollution and inefficient goods movement.

Jennifer Greer, Public Advocate Letitia James’ Office:

- Public Advocate James exposes 2017’s Worst Landlords on Tuesday, November 14th at 10am. Location is Foley Square.
- 5 landlords are in CB7 and own 10 buildings.

Gabrielle Dann-Allel, Mayor’s Community Affairs Unit:

- Held a Technical Briefing on Tax Reform and its effects on New Yorkers. Continue to advocate for NYers and their needs.
- Pay Sick Act will include sexual assault/harassment and will allow access to resources and services. This act is the first city in country.

James Gibaldi, Mayor’s Office

- Mental Health First Aid- free certification class- CBR style course

Business Session:

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Andrew Albert and Howard Yaruss, Co-Chairpersons

Resolution Re:

1. **Winter's Eve.** Application to the Department of Transportation by the Lincoln Square BID for curb lane, sidewalk and street closures for the November 27th, 2017 Winter's Eve.

Presentation by Andrew Albert:

- Looked at plan for closures- ask for approval

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.*

VOTE: 27-0-0

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

2. **70 West 71st Street d/b/a Pasha Turkish Restaurant** (Columbus Avenue.) Application #19-10006 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to legalize the installation of the awning and wall.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- Withdrawing resolution because of a non-appearance
- Will appear tomorrow at committee meeting
- Bring to December Meeting

*After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove the legalization of the installed rigid awning and end wall** was adopted.*

VOTE:

3. **464 Amsterdam Avenue d/b/a Hampton Chutney Co.** (West 82nd – 83rd Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a storefront.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- Slides shown to outline the proposed vs current storefronts.
- Proposed was appropriate

Question from Michelle Parker, CB member: Is there an awning in the new proposal.

Answer: No, there will not be one.

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve the new storefront** was adopted.*

VOTE: 25-0-3-0

4. **214 Riverside, Apt 508** (West 94th Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for window replacement.

Presentation by Mark Diller:

- Single apartment with 14 windows- wrap around
- Windows will not align with other windows in apartment building and within the apartment

Statement by M. Hunter, CB member: Building had replaced windows prior to historical certification. The Community Board asked the building to come up with a plan that addresses the building so that each individual residents does not have to come before board for window replacements.

Statement by J. Adolf, CB member: This would take several generations before the historical windows will be restored.

Statement by E. Sheffer, CB member: There is a concern that if each individual resident continues to be addressed individually rather than the building addresses the windows, then the building will lose its historical façade.

Mark Diller, CB member, responded with a statement that because the windows were put in the 1980s, they are beyond their useful life.

Question by M. Parker, CB member: Will the windows will be out of alignment vertically and horizontally?

Answer by Mark Diller: Yes, the lines will be off both vertically and horizontally.

*After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove the replacement windows** was adopted.*

VOTE: 16-6-4-0

5. **884 West End Avenue** (West 103rd Street.) Application #19-14525 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to install a barrier-free access ramp.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- At the first meeting this was presented there was more information needed to make the discussion.
- There was not enough information presented about the materials being used and about how the building was going to address the gap between the ramp and building which could be a space to collect debris.
- Applicant came back and gave information about materials. They will match the ramp to the stairs leading into building. Railing is black steel and matches entrance door frames. They will fill gap between the building ramp with a planter made of same materials.

Comment by S. Fine, CB member: Please vote yes. I live in the building and appreciate the efforts.

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve the installation of a barrier-free access ramp** was adopted.*

VOTE: 28-0-0-0

PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

Klari Neuwelt, Chairperson

Resolutions Re:

6. Department of Parks and Recreation on the proposed design for the Bull Moose Dog Run in Theodore Roosevelt Park.

Presentation by Klari Neuwelt:

- An original group to support the dog run was founded 1996. This group was disbanded and a new group called Bull Moose Dog Association was formed.
- The plan includes innovative ways to solve draining, surface, benches, fencing, and plants/trees by the Parks Department. The Parks Department did not investigate the noise issues of the run.
- Amendment: Parks Department has studied the noise issue and has found a potential noise reduction solution. They will come to next committee meeting to discuss. This is separate of the rest of the resolution.
- Raised 400,000 from City Officials: Manhattan Borough President and City Council Member.

Comment by L. Alexander, CB member: Member of the original association and the original plan was state of art but it has been years since then. She stated that in the past the Parks Department would lock the park at 10pm to ensure a reduction in noise and from community members using the park. What worked in the past was the community working together.

Questions by I. Mitchneck, CB member: Does the estimate of cost exist? There is concern that the hard numbers are not realistic and what is the gap between proposed and actual budget?

Answer: Money is outlined and \$400,000 coming from city officials. Total budget is 440,000.

Question by I. Mitchneck, CB member: What is the noise reduction strategy?

Answer: The next committee meeting will have a detailed discussion to further explore the noise issue for residents.

Question by M. Rosenberg, CB member: What is the timeline and will it be closed?

Answer: The dog run will be closed and the Parks Department will be asked to provide information about other dog runs in the area. This information should be posted. Construction could take a year but hoping less.

Comment by J. Adolf, CB member: The resolution needs to be updated so that the Parks Department will need to address the noise reduction plan. State that the resolution can be updated and approved only if sound is addressed.

Answer: Parks Department will address at the next committee meeting and committee feels rest of plan was great and no reason to hold up the approval based on sound reduction.

Comment by R. Asche, CB Member: Portion that relates to sound mitigation should be changed to "CB7 is approving this proposal in reliance on the representation of the Department of Parks and Recreation that it will present a plan for sound mitigation at the next CB7 Parks and Recreation committee meeting."

CB7 Comments:

- Elaine Boxer a resident of West 80th Street
 - Thanks the committee for their work to address the dog run renovation. Plan exceeded the expectations. Anxious for plan to go ahead.
- Steven Anderson/Amy Siegel from the Theodore Roosevelt Block Association
 - The dog run is in desperate need of repaired.
 - A plan to address the sound migration was never given to the user groups or residents of West 81st Street.
- Peter Strauss from 15 West 81st Street
 - This is a great plan and should not be held up by concerns about noise. This facility is unhealthy and needs repair.
- Laura Miner, a Volunteer at Dog Run for over 10 years
 - Thank you for plan and moving it forward.
 - The Association has wonderful pledges from the community. Unfortunately the timeframe for Parks Department was an issue in getting commitments from public.
 - She supports approve of the plan without sound migration plan.
- David Sturek from 126 W 80th Street
 - Stated that he believes that the plan should move forward and that they should worry about sound migration later.
- Robyn Epstein of TRPNA
 - Stated that if the materials used for the surface of the dog run remain the same as currently there then there will be future problems and issues.
 - Stated that she would like to be presented with the cost effectiveness of the surface materials.
- Janne Appelbaum of the Bull Moose Dog Run Association
 - We are ready and want to employ the support of the Parks Department and NYPD to help with noise and issues of unruly dogs.

14-10-0: Amendment Vote “CB7 is approving this proposal in reliance on the representation of the Department of Parks and Recreation that it will present a plan for sound mitigation at the next CB7 Parks and Recreation committee meeting.”

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 26-0-1

7. Conversion of former Tavern on the Green parking lot (West 66th Street and Central Park West) to park uses.

Presentation by Klari Neuwelt:

Question by A. Albert, CB member: Have you identified what type of vehicles in this lot?

Answer: There are no vehicles in the lot currently. This piece of property has not been used as a parking lot for several years. The property is used to put up the tent for the Marathon.

Question by G. Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, CB member: Has there been discussion with the restaurant to utilize the space?

Answer: There was a previous rumor in the NY Post that the restaurant had interest in the parking lot. After a discussion with the owners of the restaurant, we learned that no such proposal exists. The committee strongly believes that it is not appropriate for public park space be used for private vehicles.

Question by M. Rosenberg, CB member: Do they make money to rent this property to the New York Marathon?

Answer: Yes, marathon is a money maker.

Comment by R. Asche, CB member: Marathon needs infrastructure in the park regardless. It will not be a loss of revenue to the Parks Department.

Answer to Comment: There will be temporary ideas explored while capital plan is being mapped out for the property. Parks Department will continue to grant the Marathon this parking lot.

Question by M. Parker, CB member: How big is this space?

Answer: The property is about 2/3 of an acre. The lot is currently being used for recreation by community.

Comment by M. Rosenberg, CB member: All money goes into city budget.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 28-0-0

BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE

Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

8. Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés Renewals:

- **320 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 75th– 76th Streets.) Renewal application #2021276-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Cactus Pear LLC, d/b/a Playa Betty’s, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 18 tables and 54 seats.
- **473 Columbus Avenue** (West 83rd Street.) Renewal application #2048499-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by ACS Columbus, LLC, d/b/a Lokal, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.
- **2800 Broadway** (West 108th Street.) Renewal application #2025199-DCA to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 2800 Restaurant Corp, d/b/a Manchester Diner, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.

Presentation by Michele Parker:

- 8a: Two are renewal applications: 320 Amsterdam Ave and 2800 Broadway
- 8b: 473 Columbus Ave is a new application

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.*

VOTE: 8a: 26-0-0

8b: 26-0-0

STEERING COMMITTEE

Roberta Semer, Chairperson

Resolutions Re:

9. CB7 priorities for the NYC Capital Budget for fiscal year 2019.

Presentation by Mark Diller:

- Presenting for Mel Wymore
- Capital is worth \$35,000 dollars
- Expenses is daily operations
- Steering Committee in October discusses both capital and expenses. Chair of committee leads the steering committee to help focus on our core values and the budgets reflect that.
- Outlining priorities

Comment by K. Neuwelt, CB member: Process has worked over the last few years. Since we have to rank the priorities, there is always a chance that we are wasting priorities with less realistic items.

Answer to comment: Process has worked and the Steering Committee works collaboratively on the first 10 items.

Question by A. Riggie, CB member: Priorities are listed by rank from 1-10? How are the priorities determined and why are there more priorities in expense than capital?

Answer: Yes, they are ranked from 1 to 10, 1 being the highest priority. The Committees meet prior to the Steering Committee meeting and decide their own priorities and will present their priorities to the Steering Committee prior to final list is created. Each committee has the right to meet with the appropriate agencies to discuss their priorities as well. This document is what the CB7 expresses as our values.

Question by S. Fine, CB member: Wouldn't the committee's ranking and Steering Committee ranking the same?

Answer: There are times when Steering Committee ranks an item above the committee.

*Both Capital and Expense

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.*

VOTE: 24-0-0

10. CB7 priorities for the NYC Expense Budget for fiscal year 2019.

Presentation by Mark Diller:

- Outlining the expense priorities.

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.*

VOTE:

11. Leaves of absence for Elizabeth Caputo (November 1-January 31), Miki Fiegel (October 1-December 31), Lillian Moore (October 1 –December 31) and Mel Wymore (November 1-January 31).

Presentation by Roberta Semer:

- Added Elizabeth Caputo tonight

*After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.*

VOTE: 24-0-1

K. Coughlin: First meeting that we could not be covered by DNAInfo.

At end of meeting, we had a quorum.

The meeting was **adjourned** at 9:06 pm.

Present: Roberta Semer, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Linda Alexander, Richard Asche, Joshua Cohen, Christian Cordova, Kenneth Coughlin, Louisa Craddock, Mark Diller, Sheldon Fine, Paul Fischer, Meisha Hunter Burkett, Amy Hyman, Ira Mitchneck, Klari Neuwelt, Gabrielle Palitz, Michele Parker, Andrew Rigie, Richard Robbins, Suzanne Robotti, Madge Rosenberg, Melissa Rosenberg, Katie Rosman, Peter Samton, Susan Schwartz, Ethel Sheffer, Polly Spain, Howard Yaruss, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero **Absent:** Isaac Booker, Tina Branham, Steven Brown, Page Cowley, Catherine DeLazzero, Robert Espier, Sonia Garcia, Marc Glazer, Benjamin Howard-Cooper, Madelyn Innocent, Audrey Isaacs, Genora Johnson, Natasha Kazmi, Blanche E. Lawton, Jeannette Rausch, Seema Reddy **On Leave of Absence:** Elizabeth Caputo, Miki F. Fiegel, Lillian Moore, Mel Wymore

HEALTH & HUMAN SERVICES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Catherine DeLazzero and Madge Rosenberg, Co-Chairpersons

November 28, 2017 7:00 PM

Meeting called to order by Co-Chair Madge Rosenberg at 7:02 pm

1. Dr. Adam R. Stracher, Chief Medical Officer of Primary Care Weill Cornell & Associate Dean for Clinical Affairs (assisted by Lessia Daniele, Weill Cornell, Manager Gov & Comm Affairs)
 - a. Weill Cornell's Physician Organization supports Clinical Faculty Practices
 - b. Physician Organization & its member clinical faculty practices are separate from Sloan Kettering's hospitals & medical school & separate from Columbia-Presbyterian medical school & hospitals
 - c. 1500 faculty practitioners in the Physician Organization
 - d. 2 million outpatient visits to faculty practices in 100 practice locations
 - e. \$900 million in clinical revenue to faculty practices (which do not take Medicaid in this sector of Weill Cornell)
 - f. Physician Organization & the clinical faculty practices function as a single physician entity
 - g. Weill Cornell's UPW clinics are on Bway & 84 St (not urgent care; extended hours; multiple specialties); 72 bet CPW & Columbus (primary care)
 - h. All practices & patients are connected via internet: patient records, messages to & from physicians, billing
 - i. In addition there are Weill Cornell practices: physicians (previously in private practice) who run their own offices but are employed by Weill Cornell & get support
 - j. Weill Cornell needs to expand to service current level of patients, to meet needs of hospital (caring for inpatients, doing research), & to compete with other hospital/medical organizations
 - k. All commercial insurance payers (including Medicare) paying for value not fee for services
 - i. Consolidation of payers
 - ii. Consolidation of health providers
 - iii. Competing for patients & their loyalty
 - iv. Physicians increasingly employed by health systems (not in their own practices)
 - v. Patients have more to info re quality of care provided by physicians & systems
 - l. Weill Cornell investing in systems for types of patients
 - i. Looking at types of patients (e.g., diabetic patients) to manage their care; not waiting for patients to reach out to physician
 - ii. Predict patients who will need care and reaching out to them in advance
 - iii. Measure quality of care – right amount – not too much or too little
 - iv. Providing education to patients/community
 - v. Visits via video rather than in person for urgent care; post-op visits; post-discharge visits
 - m. Hospitals & main campus have clinics funded by Medicaid and other means so free to patients (including where medical students providing the care)
 - n. Use data to assess where patients coming from & what patients are looking for in terms of care & times/days seeking service & what are the up & coming neighborhoods which will need facilities
 - o. In addition, when provide educational seminars throughout the City, learn about needs of the neighborhoods in which providing seminars
2. Charles Shorter, Executive Director, Ryan Community Health Network

Ryan Center has a clinic on W 83rd Street in a residence set up for intergenerational families

 - i. Residents, receiving Medicaid, had to switch to managed care providers; no longer able go to clinic in this residence
 - ii. Too few patients coming to clinic at residence; therefore closing the clinic
 - iii. Residents get care elsewhere
 - iv. Ryan Center has to do a closure plan and submit to NYS: part of closure plan is requirement Ryan Center has notified CB7

Present: Madge Rosenberg, Robert Espier, Sheldon Fine, Audrey Isaacs. Non-Board Committee Member Fern Fleckman
Absent/Excused: Co-Chair Catherine DeLazzero; Committee Members Christian Cordova; Sonia Garcia; Genora Johnson

Meeting adjourned at 8:30 pm Minutes prepared by Audrey Isaacs

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MINUTES

Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

November 9, 2017

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm.

Present: Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons, Meisha Hunter Burkett, Louisa Craddock, Mark Diller and Peter Samton.

The following matters were considered and actions taken:

70 West 71st Street, d/b/a Pasha Turkish Restaurant. Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to legalize the installation of an awning and a wall on the sidewalk.

Presentation by Volkan Duman, Owner/Manager

- The restaurant has received two violations:
 - for a framed awning with poles. This type of awning is not permitted and was built without a permit. Mr.Duman said sign Company did not inform him of acceptable types of awning or that he had to file with LPC.
 - for a wooden wall that separates garbage and cardboard recyclables from the restaurant located at a right angle to the building at the east end of the restaurant;
- There is a low cement kneewall behind which encloses a stepped-down sidewalk café with open vertical black metal fencing on top of the low wall at a height of about two feet. The poles of the framed awning are within the metal fence on top of the low wall.
- Mr Duman stated that the wooden partition wall was erected before he bought the restaurant four years ago.
- The awning covers the sidewalk café but does not extend over the sidewalk.
- Original awning was a 32 foot, 3 inch long, retractable awning. Its extended length compromised its structural integrity, caused it to bend. Adjacent buildings have framed awnings but without sidewalk poles.

Meisha: One of the principles of preservation is reversibility – we should seek the gentlest, most effective method.

Gabby: It looks appropriate. The rods are okay within this context.

Mark: There is the problem of the holes in the walls if the present awning frame is removed.

Peter: Angle irons could be covered over. Where the awning clips meet the wall can be covered with awning material.

Jay: Notwithstanding that, it would be fine. Despite the wall.

Gabby: Removing the awning frame would do more damage. It is minimally appropriate.

Mark: I think it's okay because there is separation from the sidewalk. You can never have columns and guide wires on the street. The wall is a bad solution to a problem that should not exist.

It was agreed that the building owner should be responsible for the wall violation.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Preservation Committee of Manhattan Community Board 7 approves the framed awning as minimally appropriate, with the strong recommendation that the applicant consider concealing the metal clips attached to the wall. The applicant is requested to send a copy of the wall violation to the CB7 office.

Committee: 5-1-0-0.

100-102 West 72nd Street, aka 248-256 Columbus Avenue, Apt # 5E and #5F. Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to legalize the installation of windows without a permit.

Presentation by Kit Middleton, Architect

- In 1940's, all windows were one over one.
- In 1980's, all windows were changed to horizontally sliding windows with a fixed transom.
- There are now no double-hung windows in the building. There is no master plan.
- There is no violation. Current architect (not original architect) wants to legalize existing conditions resulting from recent renovation. The windows were never filed separately.

- Propose to replace two sets of windows to match the existing bronzed anodized aluminum windows. Also, an additional set of windows would be replaced to match the existing windows except that the transom would have an architectural grill concealing an HVAC unit instead of clear glass. One window, divided between two apartments, would not be replaced.

Gabby: The only issue is whether, as a new application, it is reasonably appropriate.

Mark: Confirmed that transom would remain one pane, not cut in two.

Peter: It is a bad thing if the AC unit sticks out. There is a benefit of keeping AC behind louvers. This was changed to meet the post-1980's replacements. Nothing changed.

Meisha: Many of these windows should be replaced in 5-10 years. Would add a motion to consider developing a master plan.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Preservation Committee of Manhattan Community Board 7 approves the new windows.

Committee: 4-1-1-0.

Calendared December 12, 2017

**MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC HEARING
THE PROPOSED WEST 108TH STREET WSFSSH DEVELOPMENT
OCTOBER 30, 2017**

Community Board 7/Manhattan convened a public hearing on the proposed West 108th Street West Side Federation of Senior and Supportive Housing (WSFSSH) Development on Monday, October 30, 2017 at Goddard Riverside, 593 Columbus Avenue. The meeting is the public hearing required by the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure, and is held under the joint aegis of the CB7 Land Use, Health & Human Services, Transportation and Housing Committees.

The meeting was called to order at 5:31 pm by CB7 Chair Roberta Semer and Land Use co-chair Page Cowley, after the secretary of the meeting confirmed the presence of a quorum of more than 20% of the members of CB7.

Applications to the Department of Housing Preservation & Development by West Side Federation of Senior & Supportive Housing for:

- **The disposition of property located at 103-107, 137-143, and 151-159 West 108th Street to facilitate the development of affordable housing and community facility space, and**
- **A change in zoning from R8-B to R8-A.**

1. Presentation by the Department of Housing Preservation & Development – Kevin Parris, Deputy Director, Manhattan Planning, HPD.

Kevin Parris – HPD

- Actions required:
- Rezoning – from an R8-B District to R8-A to allow the desired height of the building
-- plan is to build an 11-story structure that would be taller than permitted under R8-B, but not to build to the maximum height allowed by R8-A
- Enroll the site as one eligible for the Mandatory Inclusionary Housing (MIH) zoning.
- Obtain the designations and approvals required for the disposition of City-owned property.

2. Presentation by WSFSSH – Paul Freitag, Executive Director, WSFSSH.

Paul Freitag – Executive Director of WSFSSH:

- This year marks the 40th anniversary of the founding of WSFSSH.
- WSFSSH currently operates 26 buildings with more than 2,000 residential units located on the Upper West Side and in the South Bronx.
- The comprehensive nature of the WSFSSH mission – to serve both housing and social service needs of its residents/clients is the key to its success.
- After 40 years, the need for affordable housing is greater than ever.
- More than 20,000 seniors are on WSFSSH waiting lists for affordable housing units.
- The proposed West 108th Street project (the "Project") will be a 100% permanently affordable development.
- When all phases are completed, there will be 275 permanently affordable apartments, including studios, 1-, 2-, and 3-bedroom units.
- The Project also calls for the expansion of Valley Lodge, which is a transitional shelter for homeless seniors that has been in place on West 108th Street (in between the two western-most garages) for decades.
- The Project will be built in 2-phases, with 194 affordable units and approximately 110 Valley Lodge shelter beds included in phase 1, and approximately 81 permanently affordable units in phase 2.
- Phase 1 will comprise the two western-most existing parking garages as well as the demolition and reconstruction of the existing Valley Lodge. Phase 2 will build on the site of the current eastern-most garage.

- Eligibility for the affordable units as permanent housing will be based on AMI (Area Median Income), with certain units accepting tenants with incomes at 60% of AMI, and others at 30% of AMI.
- In the lottery for the allocation of affordable units, there will be a 50% preference for residents of CB7's District.
- The program benefits offered at the facility will serve the greater community.
- WSFSSH is partnering with the Institute for Family Health.
- The Project when built will include a 5,000 square foot health care facility that will be affordable to all.
- The completed building will incorporate rest rooms for Anibel Aviles Playground, enabling the hiring of Playground Associates at this location.
- The facility will provide storage to Bloomingdale Family Services, enabling it to enrich programs for children.
- The facility will also provide ambulance storage and meeting space to the Central Park Ambulance team.
- The flexible meeting spaces to be included in the facility will be accessible directly from the street and made available to community groups.
- The existing condition is an unusual block compared to the mostly residential neighboring blocks.
- Currently 3 City-owned parking garages dominate the north side of the block, with the Anibal Aviles playground.
- The south side of the block includes MS 54 and large playgrounds mapped as public parks.
- The existing garages extend nearly to the rear lot line.
- Phase 1 is on western end of the block, consisting of the sites of two garages and the current Valley Lodge.
- Phase 2 is on east side of Aviles Playground. Construction to be delayed 5 years to keep that garage open longer.
- The Phase 1 building will rise to 11 stories after a setback at floor 7.
- The building will include a rear yard that will be landscaped.
- The design of the façade is articulated to reduce massing along the street.
- The proposed height of the Phase 1 building is contextual to the existing apartment building on the corner of Amsterdam Avenue, with a set-back step-up in the center.
- The ground floor fenestration will include a large amount of transparency to allow views in/out.
- The facility will enliven a block currently dominated by blank facades and garage entrances.
- All residents will use a single lobby staffed 24/7 by WSFSSH staff.
- Goal is to create a building that would match the scale of the area, but still meet needs.
- The needed FAR is 5.3 instead of the 7.2 that would be permitted under R8-A. A land disposition agreement will enforce this limitation.
- WSFSSH conducted outreach and incorporated the feedback of some 30 organizations into the final proposal.

Carol Rosenthal – Fried Frank Harris Shriver & Jacobson – counsel to WSFSSH

- The project was certified by the Department of City Planning on 10/16/17.
- The ULURP window for CB7 is 60 days, during which CB7 has the opportunity to make a recommendation on the project. Following CB7's ULURP period, the Borough President's office has 30 days in which to consider the project and make a recommendation, followed by the City Planning Commission (CPC) for 60 days.
- The ULURP process concludes with a vote of the City Council, expected late in the first quarter of 2018.
- The CPC hearing will also serve as a hearing on the DEIS.

Paul Freitag – consultants available at the hearing to assist in answering questions include:

- Bill Stein – Dattner Architects
- Leo Tidd - Louis Berger Associates – Construction Consultants
- Deborah Shapiro – AKRF (consultant for the DEIS)
- Phillip Habib and Norabelle Greenberger from Phillip Habib & Assocs – Land Use Consultants.

3. CB7 members questions of fact.

NONE

4. Community questions and comments.

Jerry Kowalski - resident of Valley Lodge.

- Practiced law in large New York City law firms. Authored a legal textbook.
- At one time had an affluent lifestyle. Since fell on hard times.
- Never addicted to any substance.
- Grateful to Valley Lodge, current housing. Previously was homeless and on the Street.

Michael Hiller, Esq. – on behalf of Save Manhattan Valley, a community group

- [Additional time to speak ceded time from Merryl and Jill Freedman]
- Attorney whose typical practice is representing individuals against developers and the City.
- Believes that the Law is an instrument of social change.
- Currently represents more than 3,000 people who oppose this project.
- Project may appear to be progressive and humanitarian, but is dangerous.
- There are over 3,000 alternate sites available for this project, including 1 within CB7's District.
- The City initially declined to require an environmental examination of the site.
- Hiller and Save Manhattan Valley engaged the firm GHD to examine the site and provide a report.
- Upon completion of GHD's report, the City agreed to undertake an Environmental Assessment of the site.
- Without GHD's report, would not have known about the presence of polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) at the site.
- AKRF prepared the DEIS, and was hired by developer. AKRF arrived at opinion that the developer wanted.
- DEIS should be the subject of a multi-level review.
- Areas of concern that should be reviewed include:
 - -- toxic substances, especially for a project across the street from a public school and a playground.
 - -- shadow impacts.
- Note that the developer's Habib report concludes that the project would not create significant incremental shadows or alter the public use of the playground.
- Yet page 4-7 of the Habib Report reveals incremental shadows on the Aviles Playground for 7 hours over 62.4% of the playground in autumn and spring; 9 hours in winter and summer.
- This significant impact was documented from the developer's consultant, not Save Manhattan Valley ("SMV").
- The City and the Community Board should to look into the 3,000 alternative sites for this project.

Geraldine Miller – Former resident of Valley Lodge

- Used to live at City-run shelters. Formerly homeless – would does not wish the City shelters on anyone.
- Valley Lodge provides dignity and care to homeless persons.
- There are just 4 beds to a room instead of hundreds in a gym.
- Valley Lodge teaches financial management, including Social Security benefits. Now lives at the Marseilles.
- Positive real life impact. Most Seniors cannot afford to live in New York City, and not because of problems.

Carmen Quinones – Douglass Houses (NYCHA campus)

- It is a shame to place this project on this site when there are so many other spaces available.
- The City-owned garages were originally intended to provide "temporary" parking – 65 years is enough.
- Concern that parking at the Douglass Houses lots is used by affluent people from Riverside Drive.
- Affordable housing is a right, especially when so many are suffering and living on the street.

- Housing is a right, parking is not. "Enough is enough."

Sarah Kolodny – Upper West Side resident for over 40 years.

- The erosion of affordable housing has been dramatic over recent years.
- Currently parks a car at the project site – parking is affordable and convenient.
- But the choice between affordable parking and affordable housing is a "no-brainer."
- WSFSSH has a stellar track record of facilities management and providing appropriate supportive services for its residents. Can't imagine a better organization. Exciting to see this happen.

David Broxton – former Valley Lodge client.

- Had a terrible fall due to alcohol and drugs – "WSFSSH saved my life."
- Cannot compare parking to housing and services. One cannot complain about the prevalence of the homeless on the street and then deny development of affordable housing.
- The future residents of this project are real people with real needs who happen to have fallen on hard times.
- "Can't just make us disappear."

Ron Hoffman – Resident of Manhattan Valley since 1983.

- Career as a special ed teacher, including as a volunteer with Samaritan Village on West 106th Street.
- The neighborhood above West 96th is a segregated community.
- Opposes this project because of the environmental changes above West 96th Street.
- Manhattan Valley is a poverty area. This project will increase that poverty by more than 2%.
- Collegiate was supposed to build affordable housing on West 61st, but struck a deal with CB7 to move the affordable housing north of 96th Street. Should build affordable housing in the intended affluent area.

Kelley Williams – Executive Director of the Strykers Bay Neighborhood Council.

- Been in the fight for affordable housing since moving to the area with her mother in 1962.
- Could not afford the rent at that time in the supposedly affordable Urban Renewal buildings.
- Remembering John Kowal, who fought for affordable housing on West 91st Street in 1970s.
- Environmental issues will be dealt with so people can live safely.
- WSFSSH and Manhattan Valley Develop Corp. rescued this neighborhood.
- This is a choice between cars and homes – and is a no-brainer.

Albert Bergeret – New York Gilbert & Sullivan Players.

- Does not oppose affordable housing.
- But a reasonable and responsible balance in urban planning is needed.
- This proposal will "drive the neighborhood down."

Francis Curran – Manhattan Valley resident and parishioner at Holy Name/St. Gregory.

- There are 200,000 people on a waiting list for affordable housing. That says all that is needed.

David Dubin – Lived in this neighborhood since 1967.

- There should be a way to do both – meet housing needs and parking for those who need parking for their health or their occupation.
- There are many other places where this project could be built. Many are listed on the SMV website "savemanhattanvalley.org"
- Without these garages there will be 3.5 miles of cars searching for parking. Traffic will cause fatalities.

Laura Mascuch – Supportive Housing Network of New York.

- WSFSSH is a founder of the supportive housing model.
- Laura Jervis took action by taking SROs and converting them into supportive housing with services.

- The highly successful Euclid Hall was years ago the subject of opposition, and now has 3000 supportive units.
- One-third of individuals in City Shelters are over the age of 55. It is the perfect timing for this project.
- WSFSSH is the "gold standard" for supportive housing.

Marshall Castro – Upper West Side resident.

- Now lives in a senior building on West 106 Street. Lovely neighborhood – very diverse.
- No objection to this development.
- Now reaching the peak of Baby Boomers becoming seniors – needs for senior housing will become even greater.
- Those with a concern about quality of life must avoid a knee-jerk response to affordable housing tenants.

Mark Meridy - Exec Director of DOROT.

- DOROT is dedicated to improving the lives of older adults.
- Personally parks on the street.
- DOROT's mission is to alleviate the social isolation of seniors.
- The project will greatly improve the senior community.
- There is a crisis in affordable senior housing – we must take action.
- Since 1983, DOROT has provided transitional shelter beds plus supports to seniors.
- Helped hundreds settle into new homes. Seniors have too few places to turn in times of need.
- A typical wait for affordable housing is over 5 years. Way too long. 200,000 seniors on the list.
- WSFSSH is a responsible and highly regarded community partner.

Ronald James – Lives in Manhattan Valley.

- Seeing this community become less affordable.
- Known Valley Lodge residents as neighbors – many laid off during the recession and became homeless.
- Valley Lodge helped many get back on their feet and obtain affordable housing.
- Asking CB7 to support the project.

Alistair Drummond – Pastor of West End Presbyterian Church on West 105th Street.

- We have a moral obligation to support WSFSSH as a neighbor.
- There is a moral imperative to support those facing rent insecurity in our City in an era of rapidly rising rents.
- Median home prices have grown 19% in a very short time.
- This project will include 195 units of permanently affordable housing, which is truly remarkable.
- The project will also provide community resources to Anibal Aviles playground, healthcare and meeting spaces.
- WSFSSH has a record as a dependable neighbor and partner.
- We must model empathy.

Patricia Ireland - Manhattan Valley resident for more than 20 years on West 108 Street and Amsterdam Avenue.

- Q: The lottery will reserve 50% of the family units for CB7 residents. How many of those will be from Valley Lodge ?
- A: Valley Lodge residents will get first crack at the project's permanently affordable units, since all are elderly residents of CB7's District.
- Concerned about this misrepresentation of a benefit available to CB7 residents.
- Concern about "indecent politics" of the City. When this project was first proposed, WSFSSH sought only a building to replace Valley Lodge. It was HPD that proposed a bigger project.
- It is inappropriate for HPD to sign off on itself, on its own projects. There is a lack of integrity.
- This project is being financed with dirty money from Collegiate.

Maureen McDermott – neighbor.

- Seen affordable housing disappear as Columbia expands and others sell off.
- As people move or die, students move in, and the neighborhood becomes de facto dorms for Columbia.

- It is already too easy for landlords to deregulate apartments.
- There are 5 new buildings proposed for sites owned by the Union Theological Seminary and Jewish Theological Seminary near Columbia, claiming apartments offered at \$2MM to \$5MM as “reasonable.”
- We desperately need affordable housing.
- WSFSSH knows this community well. The project will serve the best interests of the community at large.

Elizabeth Kellner – Lived in Manhattan Valley for 41 years.

- Takes pride in Manhattan Valley – was a pioneer many years ago.
- Uses the parking garages, but can relocate the car.
- The legacy of Manhattan Valley is one of recovery from the effects of and abandonment of buildings by owners, with many buildings seized into City ownership.
- The City gave buildings to WSFSSH and to the Bridge.
- Manhattan Valley already has the highest concentration of supportive housing.
- Takes umbrage at Collegiate relocating the affordable housing it should have built downtown to this neighborhood.
- Opposes the project out of concern for people who can’t afford parking and need cars for work. It is not just about parking, as the neighborhood HDFCs and Section 8 housing units have needs too.

Micki Navarro

- Worked as a housing specialist and director of supportive housing centers.
- Every day meets people in need of supportive and affordable housing. At one program alone there are 2,000 on a waiting list for affordable housing.
- There are no sites to which to refer those needing affordable housing.
- WSFSSH will create an opportunity to live in dignity and respect.

Neda Esfan – resident of Manhattan Valley.

- Works as a math and special ed teacher.
- The question is not about the need for affordable housing, but about compromise – where else can this be located?
- The garages hold cars on which neighborhood lives depend.
- Must find a compromise that takes into account what is being lost, and works for all sides.
- SMV is fighting for the quality of life of residents.
- This problem is not that simple.

Michele Samarel

- Parent of 6th grader at MS 54.
- Concern about safety of our children.
- The Parks Department just demolished a handball court wall, creating a lot of dust and debris.
- Wants to know what studies have been done to ensure the health and safety of students, and how protect children in the yard.
- How can we ensure that school building windows can be open during construction.
- A: CB7 Chair: CB7 will hold a separate meeting with the school.
- A: Phillip Habib – DEIS – is online along with construction analysis.
- A: WSFSSH is addressing toxin remediation.

Steven Franco – WSFSSH Security officer.

- Sees first hand WSFSSH's work with residents. Supports the project.

David Taylor – Rutgers Presbyterian Church.

- Supports the project.

- Has supported WSFSSH since the 1980s re Euclid Hall. Those who opposed were concerned that the formerly homeless residents would make the neighborhood unsafe.
- Once the project was approved, it was hard to tell the homeless residents from the general population.
- WSFSSH has a strong management style, and runs a tight ship.

Jerome Kramer – PTA of MS 54.

- The school has been left out of this discussion way more than it should have been.
- The needs of the faculty and staff and 850 kids are significant.
- The school and playground are directly across the street from the project and should not be ignored.
- South side of the street is 1000 kids and teachers.
- Also, the big yard is used continuously after hours and on weekends.
- Should not proceed with construction without assurances that it will be done in the best and safest way.
- School and PTA has offered to be a partner, but have not gotten responses.
- It is disturbing news to hear that there will be a special meeting for the school, and yet as the president of the PTA this is the first to hear of it. All involved must do better by the children and the school.

Cliff Flanders – Manhattan Valley Resident.

- New neighborhood is hospitable and welcoming of many races, ages, sexual orientations.
- Proud to share the neighborhood with Red Oak, Valley Lodge and other supportive facilities.
- No one really believes parking is more important than housing.
- Highlights that the homeless deserve our compassion and support despite being a source of fear.

Arlene Mehlman – SMV.

- Do not understand why this is an "either/or project."
- Should have considered a multi-level parking garage as one part of the overall proposal.
- 750 cars formerly parked in the garages and now circulating for parking will be dangerous.
- Many still need cars for work, visiting aged parents etc.
- Not afraid of homeless – works with homeless populations directly.

Karen Jorgensen – Director of Valley Lodge since 1988.

- Proud of the WSFSSH program, which serves 92 residents.
- Also gets calls daily from those facing eviction, or who are staving off eviction with last of savings.
- Many Valley Lodge residents worked their whole lives but are now forced into the shelter system. Cannot afford apartments on open market while living on Social Security.
- WSFSSH – has only 1 shelter. The other 26 buildings provide permanently affordable housing.

Mirsa Morales – Red Oak resident.

- Fought to save buildings with affordable housing.
- Worry that working class people who pay taxes but who retire on a fixed income will not be able to afford rents required to stay in neighborhood that was home for 50-plus years.
- Need more affordable homes. Must support project.

Glen Levit

- Giving up 700 parking spots for teachers and others who need cars to work is problematic.
- Not realistic to build more low-income housing – that is the way to destroy a neighborhood.

Phil Katzman

- Not against low income housing – happy to be in a liberal voting district and a diverse area.
- Will have a difficult time staying in the neighborhood without a car. Middle class neighbors need parking.
- Should build the affordable housing elsewhere.

- As a teacher who needs a car to go to work, cannot circle the block for an hour looking for parking.

Jean Jaworek – Northwest Central Park Multiblock Association.

- Concerned about the breach in the zoning. This project was originally proposed at a lower profile that did not require a breach in the zoning.
- The City pushed WSFSSH to break the zoning, which would be an important community event.
- Not an ogre – doesn't hate affordable housing. A compromise is needed re the of the project.
- Parking is important to the economic viability of the community (not a parker – but empathizes).

Sue Radmer

- Supports the project.
- Lived in Morningside Heights for 40 years. Parent of children attending PS 165 and MS 54.
- School was window into the great diversity in our community.
- Appreciates WSFSSH and all the interests that must be addressed.
- Need for secure affordable housing continues unabated.
- Upper West Side residents and Manhattan Valley and Morningside Heights residents do not stoop to "NIMBY."
- The claim that the project will rob the area of light and air is a "false flag."

Siobhan Dolan – SMV.

- This is a multi-dimensional issue – hesitant to put a human face on the piles of metal in the garages.
- As nurse who carries large equipment and handouts, must drive to Nassau County and needs a car.
- Was a presence in her late mother's life because of access to an affordable car.
- Project will violate existing zoning and the Fair Share doctrine.
- Proud that Manhattan Valley has 50% of the supportive housing in our District, but should not add to it.
- All 3 garages had contain carcinogens. Parents of students across the street have a right to be nervous.

Deborah Cardona – MS 54 faculty.

- Teacher and resident. Concern that HPD, a City agency, is duping the residents by pushing this project.
- A taller building will force people out of the community. Drawing a parallel to similar development proposals in Washington Heights and Inwood.
- The parking garages are surrounded by brown fields. Developing them will compromise the community.

Floraminde Balmaseda – Red Oak resident.

- Lived in ManhattanValley since 1952. Seen many changes.
- People have been pushed out of the area by higher rents.
- There is no choice here – must protect housing for people over cars. The homeless need security.

Xiomara Pedraza – Enterprise Community Partners Inc.

- Supports this project to provide supportive housing.
- Enterprise invests in affordable housing, but needs continue to grow.
- 19% of seniors now live below the poverty line.
- Affordable housing construction for seniors has not kept pace with demand.
- There is a shortage of available sites for new construction. Fewer still near public transit.
- New project would provide dignity and security.

David Soles-Cohen – neighbor for 32 years.

- Big believer in this type of housing.
- HPD has not been fair to the neighbors in the community.
- Many people rely on cars for work. If can't park in garage, will have to leave the community.
- This is not a case of cars vs people – it is people vs people.

- There is a way to build that would preserve 500 parking spaces – HPD does not want to hear it.
- Embarrassing for the City not to listen to the needs of its established residents.
- City usually builds on vacant lots.

Lorna Lyons – Valley Lodge resident.

- Relocated to Valley Lodge with hopes to reunite the family.
- Successful career in urban planning.
- There are valid concerns re changes in zoning.
- The opponents' claim is that the fix is in – this will be the first time that the fix benefits the poor!

Emily Horowitz – Manhattan Valley resident for 17 years.

- Not about people vs cars – resents that implication.
- Slippery slope in making the neighborhood home to high-rises.
- As a Cancer survivor, concerned about carcinogens – especially with children across the street.
- Needs a car to get to work – need parking. Of course seniors need housing.
- This is not an "either/or."
- Not fair that taxpaying middle class are being punished – should build garage as part of the project.

Thomas Lopez-Pierre – candidate for City Council in the September 2017 primary.

- Lived in Manhattan Valley for 19 years in a Manhattan Valley Development Company Building.
- Undercurrent of classicism and racism around this issue.
- Supports WSFSSH – which is committed to affordable housing and has improved this community.
- This project could be a Trojan Horse for other projects that we don't want.
- Concern that we have a Mayor who abuses the development review process.

John Moscow – neighbor.

- Born and raised in this neighborhood.
- Attended PS 165 and School of Musical Education.
- The City of New York is a living organism.
- Pushing for too much of one thing requires one to give up another.
- Eliminating the garages tells residents that they can't get to work, and tells store owners that they can't come to work. Not as simple as finding another place for the car.
- This is not an emotion or rhetorical issue. We need a proper balance among all of the people involved.

Arthur Pier – SMV.

- Resident of community.
- Issue is framed as "either/or" for parking/housing.
- Taking 700 cars and dumping them on the street without a plan to relocate them, and replacing businesses that pay taxes to the City with a non-profit, is not optimal.
- There is plenty of open spaces in the neighborhood in which to create an alternative.
- Douglass Houses can be used for parking, including building a new parking facility above the existing lots. Don't have to tear anything down.
- Doesn't make sense to tear down these buildings.

Jeff Twine – Upper West Side Recycling.

- Resident for 45 years. Supports finding a compromise that looks at all options.
- There is enough room for both parking and affordable housing.
- Concerned about the toxic brown field issue.
- Citibike also takes up parking spaces, and should be re-examined in this context.

- "Someone is making a lot of money on this project."

Lynn Max – Riverside Drive resident since 1977.

- Supports this project.
- It was a privilege to work with Laura Jervis to provide services to Valley Lodge.
- One WSFSSH building is 2 blocks from her home and is a testament to the skills and dedication of the WSFSSH staff that its residents are so well integrated into community.
- City should have done better at Hudson Yards.

Steven Paluso – General Counsel of Central Park Medical Unit.

- The Unit provides free medical service to Central Park users.
- West 108 Street garages have stored the ambulances for years, free of charge.
- WSFSSH was able to change their plan to accommodate their ambulances and provide meeting spaces.
- Organization cannot formerly opine on this project, but appreciates the accommodations made by WSFSSH.

Judy Steed

- Lived at Valley Lodge for 7 months – had a great experience. Finest staff and supportive services.
- Please let more people have this experience.

Stephen O’Gallagher

- This is all about money. Shocked by the divide between rich and poor in the United States.
- There are plenty of places to park cars.
- If those with the highest incomes leave the City, the tax base erodes. We need a balance.
- Doesn’t want to leave the City, but if parking is eliminated, will leave City and take tax dollars.

Mary Lou Steppacher.

- Member of the Metropolitan Council on Housing.
- Knows and supports Karen Jorgensen at Valley Lodge.
- Seniors’ incomes keep going down; costs keep going up.
- The formerly middle class now need affordable housing.

Thomas Powel – Location Photographer and neighbor.

- Operates a commercial photography business in the neighborhood.
- Needs a commercial vehicle for business, which cannot be parked on the street.
- Losing the garage will require losing his business, putting 10 employees out of work.
- There should not be an argument within the community between these groups and interests – should take this issue to City Hall to resolve this on an equal basis.
- Not objecting to low-income housing, just the loss of livelihoods.

Elisa Wallman – Institute for Family Health.

- Part of a Health Center network in the community.
- The Institute offers training and primary health care centers.
- Worked with WSFSSH since 1999 to coordinate services, including 1000 primary care visits to Valley Lodge per year. Commitment of staff is real.
- Thrilled to be a part of this project, including 5,000 SF of space to serve resident and community health needs.

Stan Reissman – SMV and West 108 Street resident.

- Valley Lodge is a great place – seen first hand the need for placements to affordable housing.
- Does not want to be forced out of the neighborhood of 35 years.

- Needs car for work and family.

William Breedlove – Fifth Ave Presbyterian Church.

- Lives on West 102 Street – supports the project.
- As a residential real estate agent, knows the challenge to find affordable housing.
- Valley Lodge partnered with 5th Ave Presbyterian and West End Presbyterian churches to assist the churches to house 10 homeless people at a time.
- Homelessness damages lives and harms our community. Goal of community is inclusion.
- Must have a commitment to those experiencing rent insecurity.

Andrea Cianfrani – Live On NY.

- Serving seniors who drive the economy to help them stay in the communities they helped to build.
- 200,000 seniors on waiting lists for affordable housing.
- WSFSSH has long history of supporting this population successfully.

- Edward Ubiera – policy director of Local Initiative Support Corp.
- 40 year presence in NYC – financing affordable housing through groups like WSFSSH.
- 30 year history with WSFSSH. Supports the project.
- Affordable housing is a Citywide imperative. Currently 1 in 5 seniors lives in poverty.

Marc Greenberg – Interfaith Assembly on Homelessness and Housing.

- Supports the project – understands the concerns expressed and hopes for compromise.
- Committed to finding housing for those in need and helping people stay in their homes.
- Cannot find a more committed group than WSFSSH.
- "These affordable housing units will be life-savers."

Dan Cohen – Friends of Anibal Aviles Playground

- Supports project.

Cassie Madden

- Supports the project for the reasons given.

Margaret Lew

- Lives and parks on West 107 Street.
- Most developers build structures that are out of scale with the area or the needs of the community.
- How great to have a developer interested in the needs of the community.
- "Cars are not the future." Take steps to re-envision the community.

Marvin Nierenberg MD – Valley Lodge.

- Sympathy for those on each side of this issue. Has had to move a car from one garage to another.
- Part-time psychiatrist at Valley Lodge – can vouch for WSFSSH's integrity and staff.
- Valley Lodge never turns over – people stay on for years.
- The benefits of the project exceed its costs. With compromise, all issues can be worked out.

Donald Smith

- Resident of Valley Lodge since April 2017. Had lived there before, and was helped by the staff to find housing in 2013. Lost that apartment due to unabated mold.
- Physical ailments limit potential for jobs.
- Has lived in other shelters and supportive housing – none had WSFSSH's respect for the dignity of seniors.

Sandra Roche – Bloomingdale Family Program.

- Supports project and affordable housing.
- From work in a Head Start program, can see the loss of decent living conditions. Entire families living in a single room; multiple families sharing a kitchen.
- Supports the project for its affording seniors the ability to retire in community that is "home" rather than shipping seniors off to some other, unfamiliar community.

Marion Phyllis Cunningham

- Supporting the WSFSSH project – seen their projects in the community grow over the last 40 years.
- SMV was created 40 years ago – worked on many community issues over the years.
- Seen displacement of many tenants – we need WSFSSH to stabilize the area.
- Should call on WSFSSH to do the best they can to save parking.

Peter Arndtsen – Columbus-Amsterdam BID.

- This project asks us to look into the future.
- This neighborhood has looked to the future for years. It was home to the first Cancer Hospital a century ago. It created a senior center that is the model for DFTA (Department for the Aging).
- This is a diverse community, and all lives are the richer for it.
- The world is changing – NYC's population is increasing and is aging.
- Cars make the community less livable. Need to prepare for the future.

Stephen Lopez – Former Valley Lodge resident.

- Gratitude to Valley Lodge. Helped to move into permanent affordable housing.
- "Please do not compare me to cars."

Carl Joseph Scalise – West 109 Street - rear yard neighbor of garages.

- Has seen this neighborhood decline and return over the years.
- Orbach Group is invading by buying up apartment buildings that are not affordable.
- Environmental impact of this project will be minimal due to DoB (Department of Buildings) regulations.
- Fumes from cars are more problematic than the demolition of garages.
- Opposition to project is motivated by politics and NIMBY.

Michael Bialek – Hebrew Home for the Aged.

- Director of real estate for Hebrew Home in Riverdale.
- Lives near the proposed 668 foot supertall building proposed at 200 Amsterdam Avenue.
- Working for 42 years on projects for affordable housing and healthcare - those needs continue.
- Long waiting lists for affordable units – what was a significant need 42 years ago has grown exponentially.
- Mayor will announce a goal to build more affordable units for seniors in the coming years.

Susan Nutt – Upper West Side resident.

- As an architect, supports the project's benefits to the community, including the community center, the meeting rooms, the ambulance storage, and the rest room for the playground.
- Fewer cars means more breathable air.
- New residential buildings with services will enliven the block.
- Beautifully designed, contextual building, and steps back to reduce the impact on sunlight.

Bruce Kaufmann – Woodland Valley resident.

- Like most who park on the street, has lots of stories.
- Supports the project.

- Became involved by chance with Valley Lodge – know a resident and an alumnus (and Karen Jorgensen). Very effective in changing lives and creating a future those who thought they did not have one.
- Lack of affordable housing is a threat to the future prosperity of NYC.

Laura Jervis – WSFSSH and Rutgers Presbyterian Church.

- The former Cathedral Parkway Urban Renewal plan included West 108th Street. Through it the City took title to the garages and to Valley Lodge long ago. This area was always planned to be housing.
- City at one time considered and rejected a plan to preserve the garages.
- The Urban Renewal plan wanted the site for housing because there is a need for housing and because many families were displaced from other parts of the neighborhood (as an effort to mitigate the harm to families who were poorly treated in other urban renewal projects).

Linda Prudhomme

- Opposed to the variance. Supported the original proposal for a 7-story building.
- Change in building design from 7 to 11 stories – 75 feet instead of 120 feet.
- CB7 voted for R8-B zoning in response to Extell's oversized development on Broadway at West 100th Street.
- No single variance has been granted since that CB7 effort.
- Dangerous precedent that could open floodgates to other requests for taller and taller buildings.

Robert Prudhomme

- Opposed to the variance – sorry to part company with a project they otherwise support.
- Not fair to push this mass onto the block. Zoning changed 10 years ago represents a "solemn commitment that is inconsistent with current project." Should not do an about-face.
- Not clear why lifting the zoning protections is appropriate, and will create incentive for others.
- Does not meet criteria for granting variance.

Laura Kaplan-Weisman – Doctor at Valley Lodge.

- Should prevent homelessness rather than build more shelters.
- As physician, believes in preventive care.
- Struck by the diversity of residents. Many on hard times due to a plethora of reasons from dementia to hard luck to economic downturn. Supportive services are caring and effective. Staff goes above and beyond.

Nathan Gebert – lives directly behind Valley Lodge.

- Will lose light and air, and parking on the street will be harder with the garages gone.
- Will be inconvenienced, but supports the project.
- "By sharing we only make our City better."

Holly Sedghi

- Supports the project.
- Living in a walk-up, understands need for senior housing.
- Must make sure those in need understand how to participate in the housing lottery.
- Income eligibility rules will exclude many in need.
- What happens to those who have significant need but do not qualify?

David Isaacson – neighbor.

- Supports the project. We need the housing.
- Concern for counter-argument re parking – Manhattan is the transit borough. Affordable parking is not a priority.

The meeting ended at 8:47 pm, after all those who signed up to speak had been invited to be heard.