



COMMUNITY BOARD 7/MANHATTAN
December 3, 2013 Minutes of the Full Board Meeting

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Tuesday, December 3, 2013, at St. Luke's Roosevelt Hospital Center, in the District. Chair Elizabeth R. Caputo called the meeting to order at 6:37 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

Minutes from previous full board meeting were **approved**: 24-0-1-0.

Chair's Report: Elizabeth R. Caputo

- Wished everyone a happy holiday season
- Provided update from September full board meeting regarding JHL and Park West Village. CB7 transmitted comments in October. Individuals have requested a second public hearing regarding the draft EIS. Encouraged the public to be in touch with CB7 office if have any questions or concerns.
- Will launch a cultural institutions subcommittee of the BCI Committee. Linda Alexander and Joanne Imohiosen will lead those efforts.
- Proposed merger of Mt. Sinai and Continuum Partners merger is still in progress. There will be a borough wide meeting between all Manhattan community boards on December 5, 2013 where the hospitals will come brief the community boards on the proposed merger.
- Encouraged individuals to apply to join the community board. Welcome those who are interested, have relevant experience and can satisfy the time commitment to apply by visiting mbpo.org for more information. Applications are due February 1, 2014. Decisions are made by April 1, 2014. Reminded current CB7 members remember to renew their memberships as well.
- Continuing weekly office hours at CB7 on Friday afternoons. Will be there every week in December except between week of holidays.
- Reminded board members and the community to like on Facebook, follow on Twitter, etc.
- Reminded board members about disclosure requirements as required in bylaws. Asked that disclose affiliation with any issue that is material. A conflict is something that requires recusal from voting. Err on the side of caution and disclose. This issue will be further addressed in months ahead.

Community Session

- Olive Freud – Committee for Environmentally Sound Development – there should be rezoning to ensure that the development proposed does not remove light and cast shadows.
- Steve Harris – Beacon Theater Marquee – lives at Ansonia with his wife. Got the Beacon Theatre to turn off their lights at midnight, which helped a lot, but flashing continued. Post-election the lights are back and the flashing at higher intensity. Beacon Theatre's position is that at legal limit with the lights.



- Magally Gomila – St. Agnes’ Branch Library, 127 Amsterdam Avenue- free English classes twice a week, which runs until April. Have diverse children’s programming.
- Jane Thompson – 736 WEA – raising consciousness about safety issues facing residents. The north wall looks better. Now that scaffolding is erected, there are new problems. The construction workers were throwing boards down, which was reported and has ceased. Blue safety netting fell down, and this poses a safety issue. Dust is a major issue still.
- Dr. Jeff Levine – Vetcierge – launching veterinary service on the UWS that will do house calls.
- Martin Wallace – PTA at PS 84 – concerned about primaries being held in schools. After redistricting, there school had more Election Districts than in the past. Children were displaced. Nick Prigo will assist.
- Sharon Pope – NY Society for Ethical Culture – 3 programs 12/5/13 Empowering Ethical Elders suggested donation is \$5; 12/6/13 intergenerational potluck dinner and screening of movie Bully; every Sunday have platform that begins at 11 a.m. Wished everyone happy holiday season.
- Richard Barr – 203 W. 86th Street – when discussion began about connecting Riverside Boulevard with Riverside Drive there was concern about effect on traffic at 79nd northbound entrance. Suggested a feasibility study of connecting the boulevard and the drive and reopening the 72nd Street entrance via a ramp or otherwise.
- Abraham Potsirilos – North Meadow Handball Player – wants to reclaim north meadow recreation center. Need to restore the park to its recent design by eliminating gas and oil on the courts. Have signed petitions. Co-Chair of Parks & Environment Committee offered to have this considered at a future committee meeting.
- Brenda Levin – representing HFZ Capital – believes the Chatsworth application should be approved as appropriate. Applying for rooftop addition and replacing windows, etc. The proposed one-story addition is setback 20 feet. Its location makes it difficult to be invisible. Design does not impose on the streetscape. Respectfully requested the board consider the proposal. Noted that the architect of the proposal is available for limited time to answer any questions.
- Stu Lahan – JASA Club 76 – have relied heavily on discretionary funding to date. Facing a fiscal cliff already. Spoke to HHS Committee, which has been supportive. Appreciates continued support.
- Peter Andsten – Columbus – Amsterdam BID – restaurant guide and events calendar are available. Monday, December 9, 2013 at Church of St. Paul & St. Andrew a concert will be held to raise money for the food pantry (brownpapertickets.com).

Manhattan Borough President's Report- Rebecca Godlewicz

- Reminded members of the public that application for community board membership is available on website. Will send application to members who need to renew.
- Thanked the board for working well together over the last two years.

Reports by Legislators:Gale A. Brewer – City Council Member, 6th District

Council Member provided a number of updates including:

- The City Council passed a bill that permits for the installation of “humps” on streets around schools in order to slow traffic.
- The City Council passed the Council Member’s bill requiring the webcasting of every City agency with a board or commission. The Council also passed bills allowing political donations to be delivered via text message. The maximum donation is \$99 and they are hopeful that it will encourage younger people to become involved in the political process. The City Council also passed a bill requiring the Board of Elections (“BOE”) to create sample ballots for every election, since the BOE has failed to do so in recent history.
- Raised her concern that, with the installation of the Collegiate School in Riverside South, there will be an issue in keeping the 55 units of affordable housing that were supposed to be sited where the school will be built.
- Heywood Tower, a former Mitchell-Lama building, is need of a community room.
- The Department of Housing Preservation and Development (“HPD”) is asking Mitchell-Lama residents to downsize, i.e., a resident of a one-bedroom is being asked to move into a studio, or a family of two in a two-bedroom is being asked to move into a one-bedroom. Only those people who are sick are not required to move. The Council Member expressed her disapproval of this development.
- There is a need for more athletic fields on the West Side, so the Council Member is working with the Parks Department to create additional fields.
- There was a hearing on the open data law and all databases should be available at nyc.gov/data soon.
- Finally, the Council Member is pushing to pass a bill providing for instant runoff voting for the City of New York, which would go to the voters in a referendum if passed by the City Council.

State Senator Brad Hoylman, 27th Senate District

- Scan band will provide mammograms to women over 40.
- Submitted testimony to DHCR regarding proposed rent increases for rent regulated tenants. Said increases should be reinvested in the community.
- Working to reign in Santacon to ensure that safety concerns are addressed. NYPD will have notice and information about the route.
- Commended the board for their hard and thoughtful work on the bike lane issues.
- Moreland Commission report came out on 12/2/13. They came up with some very important suggestions: public financing with small contributions, limiting contributions to party house accounts, etc. Believes that state elected officials should be full-time, which would eliminate many conflicts.
- Said next time would see board in an official capacity would be in July.



- A board member thanked Senators Hoylman and Serrano for showing up in person for the West End Avenue Historic District vote.

Reports by Legislative Representatives:

David Baily, Senator Adriano Espaillat's Office

- Promoting affordable care act. There are local navigators that can assist individuals with enrollment. Co-hosted an event with Hispanic Federation, etc to enroll individuals. Provided statistics on enrollment, noted that NY is doing well with enrollment.

Paul Sawyer, A-M Linda Rosenthal's Office

- Legislative update available for distribution.
- Bill would clarify that rent controlled apartments are not an asset for bankruptcy purposes.
- Will be hosting another town hall on 12/23/13.
- Preservation applications – landlords present rooftop additions that raise concerns and those concerns have been mildly addressed, but then sent directly to Landmarks instead of going back to CB. A-M would like Landmarks restart the process.

Dominic Lee, A-M Daniel O'Donnell's Office

- Monthly legal clinic on 12/19/13 at 6:30 p.m. – call to make an appointment.
- As chair of corrections committee, holding a hearing on 12/4/13 to discuss reforming correctional reform.

Andres Pasmir, State Senator Jose Serrano

- Senator testified against any expansion of the Apthorp.
- Working with A-M Rosenthal on ACA to inform constituents.

Business Session

The full texts of the following resolutions are available at www.nyc.gov/mcb7.

Transportation Committee, Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons

1. **Amsterdam Avenue Redesign, 59th-110th Streets.** Board discussion on the resolution. Public testimony was concluded at the November 2013 full board meeting - no additional public testimony was heard.

Roberta Semer and Su Robotti provided an overview of the issues considered at the November full board meeting and opened the floor for discussion.

Mel Wymore offered an alternative resolution from a group of board members that was read in to the record.

A motion was made to substitute the resolution with the proffered resolution. This was properly seconded.



Per Robert's Rules of Order, it was clarified that a substitute motion can be made at any point and it will remain on the table. The discussion of the original motion is discussed. Then there is discussion on the substitute motion upon completion of that discussion. Then there is a vote on the substitute motion. There cannot be a vote on the substitute resolution until debate is concluded on the original motion.

The supporters of the original motion believed that the substitute motion is clearer.

At the end of the November meeting, the Transportation Committee co-chairs drafted a substitute motion that was also available for discussion. This substitute motion addresses concerns with deliveries on Amsterdam Avenue, etc. It also addresses the need to diversify options, DoT should study all northbound avenues which was promised long ago. This resolution will be offered at the appropriate time.

Dan Zweig offered an amendment that could improve any proposed amendment. It was clarified that this amendment could be offered as each resolution is considered. By way of background, a member of the public testified at the November meeting that local FDNY is opposed to protected bike lanes. Recommends that any portion of a study in relation to protected bike lanes on Amsterdam Avenue shall include positions of FDNY, NYPD and DSNY. This was accepted as friendly.

Motion was made to close discussion on the original resolution. This was properly seconded.

- A question was asked about who worked on the substitute motion. It was disclosed that Ethel Sheffer and Lee Ping Kwan worked on this.
- A question was asked about applicability of adopted friendly amendment.
- It was suggested that business community's input should also be incorporated with the FDNY, NYPD and DSNY in the proposed amendment.
- A concern was raised that the board has never conducted a vote on discussion on substitute motion.

Motion to discuss new substitute resolution was **adopted**: 27-2-0-0.

- An amendment was offered that any portion of a study in relation to protected bike lanes on Amsterdam Avenue shall include position of FDNY, NYPD, DSNY and the business community. This was accepted as friendly.
- It was clarified that 3rd whereas clause should refer to 73rd Street, not 71st Street.
- It was recommended eliminating the 5th whereas clause because it is not factual.
 - The response was that this has been the practice and is a valid concern.
- An amendment was proposed change the 6th whereas be changed to include vehicular speeding as well as pedestrian safety improvements on Amsterdam Avenue that could be addressed immediately.
 - It was accepted as friendly except for the bulb outs. Bulb out is part of design. Do not want to tell DoT how to construct this. Should not include elements of design if we want DoT to study how, if at all, this will proceed.
 - Bulb outs narrow the width of the roadway. Regardless of whether we decide to include a bike lane on Amsterdam, including bulb outs will still make the avenue safer. Supporters of the bike lane allege that it will make it more expensive to implement a bike lane with the bulb outs.



- If a countdown timer is implemented, then why do you need bulb outs? It was responded that it slows traffic.
 - A motion was offered on the component of the proposed amendment that relates to the bulb outs. This was seconded.
 - A suggestion was made that bulb outs be temporarily installed. This was accepted as friendly.
 - How do bulb outs interfere with use of the street? They have some impact.
- Does the “be it further resolved” clause intend to cover study of all north bound avenues? It was clarified to cover “all other avenues.” The goal was intended to ensure study to cover all vulnerable users on all streets.

The resolution has 3 goals:

- (1) Comprehensive study of Amsterdam Avenue,
 - (a) Measures have to be taken to help pedestrians and others in the near term.
- (2) Amsterdam Avenue has a number of pedestrian, truck delivery and bus transportation issues that must be taken into account when such a study is conducted.
- (3) Go forward with the study.

The text of the substitute resolution and the proposed friendly amendments were recapped.

Another amendment was offered: “BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/Manhattan reaffirms its earlier resolution from April of 2013 asking for pedestrian safety efforts with increased enforcement of moving vehicle violations and red light cameras.” This was accepted as friendly.

There is a great deal of doubt about DoT statistics relating to Columbus Avenue. Proposed a new whereas clause and resolve: “WHEREAS, prior measurement and observation of the use, effectiveness, safety, and accessibility of the Columbus Avenue redesign have yielded uncertainty regarding its overall success in any of those areas.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7 asks the New York City Department of Transportation to continue to measure and evaluate the usage by all vehicles, traffic impact, and overall safety of the Columbus Avenue redesign as to its overall degree of use, effectiveness, safety, accessibility for the mobility-challenged, and access for emergency vehicles.”

- Did the sponsor of the amendment edit the language? Yes, he did.
- A point of order was raised about disclosing affiliations.
- Ken Coughlin disclosed that he has been a member of the board of Transportation Alternatives for 15 years.

The Transportation co-chairs’ offered a further resolved clause: “BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7 asks the New York City Department of Transportation to study District 7’s avenues with an eye toward formulating a plan for increased safety on all avenues. Community Board 7 also asks the Department of Transportation to study and propose a possible redesign of Amsterdam Avenue, with the potential inclusion of a protected bike lane or, if not feasible, a better alternative northbound choice.” This was seconded.



- Is DoT study of Avenues sequential or simultaneous? It does not specify that it is sequential, but it is intended.
- Amsterdam Avenue is not more dangerous than Columbus Avenue based on stats from precinct council.
 - It was responded that this claim is false and Amsterdam Avenue needs to be made safer.
- We are all on the same page in wanting safer UWS. Should move forward.
- Encouraged all to support and called the question.

The resolution, as amended, was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-5-0

2. **Winter's Eve at Lincoln Square.** Application by the Lincoln Square BID to the Mayor's Street Activity Permit Office for curb lane and street closures on Monday, December 2, 2013.

The co-chairs introduced the resolution for the event that had occurred on the previous Monday.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-0-0

3. **Intro 0535-2001.** Speed limit in residential areas on residential streets. The resolution would support City Council legislation that would reduce speeds on streets that are 60 feet or narrower to 20 mph.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0

Preservation Committee, Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

4. **344 West 72nd Street, The Chatsworth and 340 West 72nd Street, The Chatsworth Annex** (Riverside Drive.) Application #14-9984 & #14-9985 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for façade restoration, window replacement, new entry doors, expansion of the Chatsworth 13th floor penthouse, and addition of one story to the North Tower of The Chatsworth and one story to The Annex.

The co-chairs introduced the resolutions, which were voted on separately as 4A, 4B, 4C and 4D.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** (4A) was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-0-1

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove** (4B) was adopted.

VOTE: 32-2-1-1

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove** (4C) was adopted.

VOTE: 37-0-0-1

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove** (4D) was adopted.

VOTE: 33-1-1-1



5. **101 West 78th Street, The Evelyn** (Columbus Avenue.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for façade modification, elimination of one story, and improved fenestration.

This is a revised application that addressed previously expressed concerns that the proposal was not appropriate to the historic character of the building.

Public Comment:

- Avra Petrides (resident of the Evelyn), gave remarks in opposition to the resolution on behalf of Landmark West. The proposed addition would alter the historic character of the building and thus should be opposed. It is necessary that we protect the cultural heritage of the neighborhood.
- Merrill Cates (resident of the Evelyn), spoke in opposition to the resolution, stating that the proposal would result in alterations to existing apartments.
- Thomas Kuck spoke in opposition to the resolution, highlighting the benefit the unaltered structure has on neighborhood tourism and real estate prices.
- Janet Fisher spoke in opposition to the resolution, especially the proposed bulkhead on the top of the building, although she appreciates the changes made in the latest proposal. She wondered whether the placement of mechanical devices on the rooftop would create a noise hazard. She also raised concern over a proposed glass railing and the potential glare from the installation.
- Harvey Rosen (neighbor) spoke in opposition to the resolution, stating that he had concerns about the proposed fenestration and the height of the structure.
- Mac Jeffrey, President of Columbus House board of managers, spoke in opposition, stating that the bulkhead containment structure remained a problem and that it would be too high.
- Suzanna Hyler provided testimony on behalf of her neighbor, Jerry Olinger, a resident of the Evelyn, speaking in opposition to the resolution.
- Loren Brenowitz, VP West 78th Corp., also spoke in opposition to the resolution, highlighting the beauty of the block in its current state and concern with the proposed height of the addition.

Board Deliberation:

- Members spoke to the concerns expressed during public comment, and also complemented the fact that the process resulted in a revised proposal that sought to sate those who were concerned about the development.
- The height of the structure and the sightline, especially on an individual landmark, was concerning.
- The idea of ranking landmarks in NYC, as is done in Europe, was proposed so that professionals in the development filed would have guidance as to what changes would be appropriate for a specific building.

After deliberation, the resolution **to approve was not adopted.**

VOTE: 5-20-13-0



- Klari Neuwelt proposed a substitute resolution that would split the resolution into three parts: 5A (disapproval of the rooftop addition); 5B (disapproval of the water tower enclosure); and 5C (approval of restorative work).
- The Co-Chairs of the Committee corrected alleged misstatements made during public comment, including the alleged sightline of the addition, as well as the allegation that apartments may be altered as a result of the addition—neither assertion was true.

The Board discussed Substitute Motion (5A-C on voting sheet):

There was discussion re: the slippery slope of approving rooftop additions. Also, allegations made during public comment were described as not true, including the sightline of the addition, as well as the allegation that apartments may be altered as a result of the addition. The Board discussed the possibility that it would become an inconsequential advisory board if it was not careful in its approach to approving projects one by one.

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove** (5A) was adopted.

VOTE: 19-6-4-0

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove** (5B) was adopted.

VOTE: 19-2-6-0

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** (5C) was adopted.

VOTE: 24-0-2-0

Youth, Education & Libraries Committee

Marisa Maack, Chairperson

6. Working Group proposal to the DOE on the utilization of Beacon school space.

Ms. Maack read the additions to the resolution, which are reflected in the final resolution.

This resolution is premised upon the following facts:

Beacon High School, located at 61st st between Amsterdam and West End Ave, will be relocating to a new site and the building will be available for District 3 school use starting Fall 2015.

The Office of Portfolio Planning (OPP) of the Department of Education (DoE) attended the May 2012 Youth, Education & Libraries Committee and requested community input into the use of the Beacon school site. They subsequently attended several District 3 Community Education Council meetings with the same request.

The Beacon School Working Group was established in Spring 2013 and consisted of members of Community Board 7, Community Board 10, a District 3 K-8 public school principal, representatives of the Citywide Council of English Language Learners, Citywide Council on Special Education, District 3 Community Education Council members, District 3 President's Council and a Parent Association President of a local public high school.

The Beacon Working Group held two public hearings; one on May 16 at Goddard Riverside and one on June 13 at PS 76 at 220 W 121st where comment was heard from over 50 people and several elected representatives. They also toured the building, assessed its facilities and studied the DoE footprint specifications of various school models.

The Beacon High School site is a leased building that is currently slated to accommodate 810 high school students. It is severely overcrowded with over 1000 students and will be moving to a larger,



newly developed site designed to its specifications with capacity for 1200 high school students with a citywide admissions policy.

Unlike many other school districts in the city, District 3 does not have a high school that gives priority admissions to students from the district. Many students from the area must travel far to attend high schools of their choice.

OPP has presented data and publicly acknowledged at a D3CEC meeting in November 2013 that there are currently not sufficient public D3 middle school seats to accommodate the anticipated demand from known future residential development, (let alone unknown future as-of-right development), current students attending D3 elementary charter schools that are allowed to apply to D3 middle school seats and/or an even slight fluctuation in the traditional retention of elementary students into middle school beginning with the current 4th grade public school students (2015 incoming 6th grade class).

Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal has confirmed conversations with the Beacon building owners that they are amenable to an extended lease with DoE and working with the School Construction Authority to make necessary renovations to the space to better accommodate students.

The following resolution is based on the recommendations of the Beacon Working Group and in consultation with the D3CEC.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7/Manhattan requests the school site located at 227 W 61st become a district 3 school with the following characteristics and stipulations:

- The model and format of the school must be established (and preferably the leader selected) in time to be included in the relevant middle school and high school directories used in the first (main) round of admissions for those grades for admissions for September 2015. The anticipated deadline for inclusion in the appropriate directory is Spring 2014.
- Grades to be served are 6-12, with primary points of admissions at grades 6 (for middle school) and 9 (for high school).
- Appropriate arrangements for configuration of the space to separate the middle school and high school grades.
- The middle school portion of the school is to be a District 3 school available in the D3 middle school choice process that gives priority to D3 students; the high school must also offer an admissions priority to District 3 residents and students.
- Students wishing to continue from middle school through high school at this school are to receive priority in high school admissions.
- The school must be organized and run to be equally accessible to and welcoming of students from throughout District 3. To accomplish this fundamental goal, the following attributes and elements are essential:
 - The school should be a Portfolio Based Screened school that shall consider a multitude of factors for admissions and does not incorporate a minimum test score requirement.
 - The final decision on the new school proposal, including its model and key attributes, must be made in an open collaboration with meaningful and on-going input from the community through the Community Education Council, the President's Council, the District Superintendent and District Family Advocate, Community Board 7 and elected representatives.
 - The school should be configured to make the maximum possible use of its handicap-accessible features, which would require the renovation of at least one rest room to complete the accessible compliance required for full inclusion.
 - The curriculum must be aligned to welcome students with special needs.



- The school must have appropriate facilities and capacity to serve English Language Learners.
- The school must offer a strong general education core curriculum that allows for an
 - Advanced Regents degree for high school students
 - An option for Regents courses in math and science by at least 8th grade.
 - Foreign language study at every year level.
 - Art and music instruction and/or participation available within the curriculum and not solely through after-school programs.
- Capital improvements must be made to the Beacon Building to ensure that its facilities are appropriately accessible to students at middle school grades/ages as well as high school grades/ages. Renovations must include enlarging the cafeteria and creating an outdoor recess area and should also include enlarging the gym and creating an auditorium area.
- The scope of the renovations must be determined in advance through a collaborative process involving the CEC, President's Council, District Superintendent and District Family Advocate, Community Board 7 and electeds. We request that, to the extent that is possible, renovation plans begin summer 2014 to take advantage of as many summer months as possible and insure completion by Fall 2015.
- There must be a written agreement of a lease extension by the building owner guaranteeing a 20 year lease at the end of the current term.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 27-1-0-0

7. GreenFlea Market, Columbus Avenue, West 76th-77th Streets.

The GreenFlea is seeking an extension of its contract with the Department of Education for one year so that it may have time to hire a new executive director and apply for a longer contract in the future.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 29-0-1-0

Land Use Committee

8. Richard Asche and Page Cowley, Co-Chairpersons.

Joint with Parks & Environment Committee, Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Starkey, Co-Chairpersons

Riverside South, Sixth Modification to Restrictive Declaration. Application #M20358 (F) ZSM to the Department of City Planning by Hudson Waterfront Associates, L.P., to modify the Declaration with respect to the construction of the Park and the design of the remaining Park Phases. This would involve \$12mm more than what the developer already had to contribute.

Public Comment:

Olive Freud of the Committee for Environmentally Sound Development spoke in opposition to the resolution. She does not believe that taxpayer money should be spent to improve a park in front of a developer's home. She also expressed concern over congestion issues.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 26-0-1-0



9. **110 West 73rd Street** (Columbus Avenue.) Application #269-13-BZ to the Board of Standards and Appeals by Marvin B. Mitzner, LLC on behalf of Robert Malta, to permit the expansion of the Arte Café restaurant, a conforming use, across a district boundary line onto the subject premise. The expansion would not affect what would be seen on the street.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 28-0-0-0

10. **175 West 90th Street, Heywood Tower** (Amsterdam Avenue.) Application #M920493 (G) ZAM to the Department of City Planning by Heywood Towers Associates, requesting a modification of the previously approved Large Scale Residential Development (CP-18505, West Side LSRD) within the former West Side Urban Renewal Area, involving the conversion of the existing accessory residential floor area on the ground floor to commercial use, in an existing 20-story mixed use building at the above referenced location.

Public Comment:

Avery Sevy, the owner of the building, pledged to support the tenant's association and provide a place for monthly meetings.

Board Deliberation:

The space being converted from residential floor area to commercial use is not currently used for any purposes and was never used for residences.

After deliberation, the resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 28-0-0-0

Preservation Committee (continued), Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

11. **48 West 68th Street** (Columbus Avenue – Central Park West.) Application #14-9165 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to replace windows.

12. **105 West 72nd Street** (Columbus Avenue.) Application # 14-7844 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to install an ADA compliant ramp at the main entry.

13. **128 West 72nd Street, d/b/a Manahem Barber Shop** (Columbus – Amsterdam Avenues.) Application #14-8840 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for storefront replacement.

14. **313 Columbus Avenue, d/b/a The Shade Store** (West 75th Street.) Application #14-7291 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to replace storefront.

15. **351 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 76th – 77th Street.) Application to #13-7800 the Landmarks Preservation Commission to construct a rear addition and replace storefront infill.

16. **357 West End Avenue** (West 77th Street.) Application #14-7431 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to replace windows.

17. **2267 Broadway, d/b/a Claire's** (West 81st – 82nd Street.) Application #15-0972 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for the installation of a wood and glass storefront with signage.

Resolutions 11-17 were bundled.

The Board discussed the material that would be used for the replaced windows.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted. VOTE: 29-0-0-0



18. **332 West 87th Street** (Broadway – Riverside Drive.) Application #14-8841 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a rooftop addition.

There was no vote at committee, so no vote was required at this meeting. The Committee sent a letter to the Landmarks Preservation Commission indicating that the current application should be withdrawn and resubmitted for consideration.

No vote was taken.

Public Comment:

Gale Treicher, the co-op board president, stated that she was worried that the building may not be able to handle the rooftop addition and that there has been falling debris. Also, the building currently has ongoing violations that need to be resolved.

Business & Consumer Issues Committee

Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons

Applications to the SLA for two-year liquor licenses:

19. **511 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 85th Street.) Application to the State Liquor Authority for a two-year liquor license by EE Bar LLC, d/b/a Bar eNe.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 23-0-0-0

20. **964 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 107th Street.) Application to the State Liquor Authority for a two-year liquor license by La Piccola Cucina.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 25-0-0-0

21. Unenclosed Café Renewal Applications:

- **427 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th-81st Streets.) Renewal application to the Department of Consumer Affairs by J of K, Corp., d/b/a Momoya, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 9 tables and 17 seats.
- **467 Columbus Avenue** (West 82nd -83rd Street.) Renewal application DCA#1384273 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Canteen 82, Inc., d/b/a Blue Caravan, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 9 tables and 18 seats.

The Board asked that the size of the restaurant be shared with the Board when considering resolutions related to outdoor cafes.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 24-0-0-0

22. **340 Amsterdam Avenue (West 76th Street.)** Renewal application DCA# 1413323 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Amsterdam Ale House, Inc., d/b/a Amsterdam Ale House, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 11 tables and 32 seats.



23. **417 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th Street.) Renewal application to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Gilli, Inc., d/b/a Gill Restaurant, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 10 tables and 19 seats.

- Resolutions 22 and 23 were bundled. Neither applicant appeared at committee.

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove without prejudice** was adopted.

VOTE: 24-0-0-0

Enclosed Café Renewal Application:

24. **366 Columbus Avenue** (West 77th Street.) Renewal application ULURP# N120250ECM/ DCA# 1282506 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Shake Shack 366 Columbus, LLC, d/b/a Shake Shack, for a two-year consent to operate an enclosed sidewalk café with 12 tables and 34 seats.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 19-4-0-0

Parks & Environment Committee

Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Starkey, Co-Chairpersons.

Joint with the Preservation Committee, Gabrielle Palitz and Jay Adolf, Co-Chairs

25. **Central Park.** Central Park Conservancy proposal to reconstruct the Fort Clinton and Nutter's Battery Overlooks, located in the northwestern corner of the Park just south of the Harlem Meer. The overlooks mark the site of fortifications built during the Revolutionary War and War of 1812

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 25-0-0-0

26. **Dante Square.** Department of Parks & Recreation public art proposal with artist/musician Herb Alpert for Dante Square for January - April of 2014.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 25-0-0-0

Steering Committee

Elizabeth Caputo, Chair

27. Request for a leave of absence.

Thomas Vitullo-Martin requested a leave from November 1, 2013 through February 1, 2014.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 25-0-0-0

The meeting was adjourned at 10:35 p.m.

Present: Elizabeth Caputo, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Linda Alexander, , Laura Atlas, Isaac Booker, Kenneth Coughlin, Page Cowley, Mark N. Diller, Robert Espier, Miki Fiegel, Sheldon J. Fine, Paul Fischer, DeNora Getachew, Marc Glazer, Phyllis E. Gunther, Matthew Holtzman, Meisha Hunter, Joanne Imohiosen, Brian Jenks, Genora Johnson, Lee Ping Kwan, Blanche E. Lawton, Marisa Maack, Lillian



Moore, Klari Neuwelt, Gabrielle Palitz, Michele Parker, Nick Prigo, Anne Raphael, Suzanne Robotti, Madge Rosenberg, Evan Rosing, Roberta Semer, Ethel Sheffer, Eric Shuffler, Barbara Van Buren, Mel Wymore, Howard Yaruss, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero and Dan Zweig. **On-Leave:** Elizabeth Starkey and Thomas Vitullo-Martin. **Absent:** Richard Asche, Christian Bray, Louis Cholden-Brown, Madelyn Innocent, Haydee Rosario, Helen Rosenthal and Jaye B. Smalley.



**Transportation Committee Meeting Minutes
Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons
December 10, 2013**

The meeting was called to order at 7:03 P.M. by Co-Chair Andrew Albert

WEST SIDE TRAFFIC STUDY

66th/Broadway

The Committee discussed the recent tour of several locations in DOT's West Side Traffic Study and recommendations. The committee inspected the SE corner of 66th Street & Broadway, where DOT has recommended curb extensions to ease the crowded conditions at the subway entrance/exit. The committee viewed heavy pedestrian counts both entering & leaving the station, spilling into the street, as the stairways to/from the station are virtually at the edge of the sidewalk. The committee agrees with DOT's recommendations for this location.

65th/Columbus Ave

The committee observed dangerous interaction between pedestrians and motor vehicles at this location. There were several instances of near misses, and aggressive motorists coming very close to pedestrians and even a dog. The committee noticed an absence of a pedestrian countdown timer at this location, as well. The committee recommends an LPI at this location (leading pedestrian interval) where pedestrians can cross 65th Street safely and unimpeded by any vehicular movement. A dedicated left-turn arrow—either leading or lagging for southbound Columbus Avenue vehicles turning left (east) onto 65th Street would also help at this location.

66th St/Broadway - uptown side next to mall

The committee observed heavy ponding at this location, and recommends some "pitch" be added in the western-most uptown lane adjacent to the plantings to address this problem.

66th St/Broadway - downtown side

The committee observed a condition where pedestrians have a red signal, but no southbound traffic is allowed to move, which doesn't make sense. Either this could result in more pedestrian crossing time, or something may be wrong with the timing of the lights. DOT should look into this.

66th St-Amsterdam-West End Avenue

The committee observed a very wide street, with a number of parking lot entrances and exits on the block. The block has become, due to its width, something of a speedway, with vehicles racing to make the light at West End Avenue. DOT recommends narrowing this block with either painted areas or islands, and the committee agrees with this. The committee also recommends changing the timing of the light at West End Avenue so vehicles don't have an incentive to race down the street, similar to 97th & Columbus Avenue. The possibility of bulb-outs on both the NE & SE corners of 66th & West End Avenue, would help address the speeding issue.

Resolution: CB7 recommends the following action from the NYC Department of Transportation for the following locations:

- CB7 agrees with DOT's recommendation for curb extensions at the SE corner of 66th Street &



Broadway.

- CB7 recommends DOT install some degree of "pitch" for the innermost uptown lane of Broadway to avert the heavy ponding condition that sometimes occurs here.
- CB7 recommends DOT investigate the odd traffic/pedestrian light timing for the east/west crossing with downtown Broadway traffic.
- CB7 recommends DOT immediately install countdown pedestrian timers for the 65th Street crossing at Columbus Avenue. CB7 also recommends the installation of a leading pedestrian interval(LPI) at this location. Lastly, CB7 also recommends the installation of either a leading or lagging left-turn arrow for vehicles travelling south on Columbus Avenue making the eastbound (left) turn onto West 65th Street.
- CB7 agrees with DOT's recommendation of narrowing 66th Street between Amsterdam & West End Avenues. CB7 also recommends changing the timing of the traffic signal at West End Ave to make it impossible for cars speeding down the block to make that light. CB7 also asks DOT to explore the possibility of bulb-outs on both the NE & SE corners of 66th & West End Avenues.

Vote: Comm: 6-0-0-0

NCB: 1-0-0-0

Symphony Space

Ed Budz, Director of Theatre Operations, appeared before the Committee. Symphony Space is requesting CB7 approve a change in the parking meters for two blocks of Broadway - both sides - between 93-95 Street - from one hour to two hours. Mr. Budz explained that often people must leave the theatre to go out and feed the meters. A discussion of how many customers use mass transit to get to the theatre vs. how many people drive to Symphony Space took place. Mr. Budz says the theatre has explained to theatregoers how easy it is to get to the theatre by mass transit, but many still drive. A discussion of the relatively low cost of parking on city streets took place. The issue of whether a change like Symphony Space is requesting should be done in a vacuum, or whether this issue should be a district-wide discussion took place, with many agreeing that this issue affects businesses all throughout the district. It was also brought up that the hours of meter operations varies by where you are in CD7 - south of 96th Street, meters must be fed until 10 PM, while north of 96th Street, it is 8 PM. It was decided to lay the issue over until the January meeting, where more of the district could be notified, and the issue debated more fully. It was also discussed that the Columbus Avenue B.I.D. had asked DOT to change their meters to 2 hour meters, and this was done.

Hampton Jitney

Patrick Conden of Hampton Jitney, appeared before the committee. He explained that the application for a boarding location on Broadway between W69th & W70th Street was as a result of a large number of requests by Westsiders for the service. The pickup would operate 5 days a week - year-round - at 5:15 P.M. When asked how long buses would sit there, he said it was all dependent on how many customers would be boarding. If relatively few - the bus would be there under 10 minutes. If more people boarding - longer. This would be an origin point stop, and would be the only stop on the West Side in District 7. Because The Nevada, 2020 Broadway, the building that the stop is in front of, could not make the meeting due to a variety of factors, and because the board's opportunity to voice an opinion on this matter expires at the end of December, the committee chose to disapprove the location without prejudice. We will hear the item at our January meeting.



Resolution: CB7 diaspproves Hampton Jitney's request for a boarding location on Broadway between West 69th & West 70th Street, without prejudice.

Vote: Comm: 6-0-0-0

NCB: 1-0-0-0

New Business

Marc Glazer spoke about his son giving a speech on the newsbox issue to newly-elected Public Advocate Letitia James. He spoke about a resolution that he will draft with an attorney, about changing the wording of Local Law 36. The proposed change will be circulated before the next transportation committee meeting.

Ian Alterman mentioned the frequent occurrences of cars being parked in bus stops. He said cameras on the front of buses should be used to photograph license plates of offending cars. It was mentioned that there is a pilot program to do this on some SBS bus routes, but that state legislation was needed to allow the MTA to actually issue fines to those drivers. David Zelman wondered why is it when film crews take over one side of a street, alternate-side parking isn't suspended on the other side, so more people can continue to park their cars?

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00 P.M.

Present: Andrew Albert, Ken Coughlin, Mark Glazer, Anne Raphael, Roberta Semer and Howard Yaruss.

Board Member: Mark N. Diller. **Absent:** Dan Zweig, Lee P. Kwan, Lillian Moore and Suzanne Robotti.



Business & Consumer Issues Committee Meeting Minutes
Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons
December 11, 2013

Two-year liquor license application to the SLA:

1. **964 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 107th Street) La Piccola Cucina. Represented by Renan A. Mazzorra. No outdoor café, one bicycle, Northern Italian Cuisine. Open 7 days, 12:00 -12:00 operating hours.

Committee votes to approve 7-0-0-0 1-0-0-0

Unenclosed Café Renewal Applications:

2. **340 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 76th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1413323 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Amsterdam Ale House, Inc., d/b/a Amsterdam Ale House, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 11 tables and 32 seats. Represented by Jacob Robinawich. Applicant to repost prior to full board

Committee votes to approve 7-0-0-0 1-0-0-0

3. **417 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th Street.) Renewal application to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Gilli, Inc., d/b/a Gill Restaurant, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 10 tables and 19 seats. Represented by Monica Delecon 212 362 1180. No delivery.

Committee votes to approve 7-0-0-0 1-0-0-0

4. **249 Columbus Avenue** (West 71st -72nd Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1103658 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by CMR, Corp., d/b/a Café Ronda, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 19 seats.

Committee votes to approve 7-0-0-0 1-0-0-0

5. **267 Columbus Avenue** (West 72nd - 73rd Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1072082 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Classic Food, Inc., d/b/a Sido, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 3 tables and 6 seats. Applicant did not show. Committee votes to

Disapprove Without Prejudice 7-0-0-0 1-0-0-0

6. **480 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 83rd - 84th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1307588 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 480 Rest Amsterdam, Inc., d/b/a Soldier McGee, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 7 tables and 14 seats.

Committee votes to approve 7-0-0-0 1-0-0-0

RESOLUTION TO REGULATE THE USE OF ID Scanners in New York

Committee Votes to approve 8-0-0-0 2-0-0-0

7. **Multi-block street fairs.** Public hearing on applications to the Street Activity Permit Office for multi-block street fairs in 2014.

DATE	SPONSOR NAME	LOCATION	PRODUCER	VOTE COMMITTEE BOARD MEMBER
04/27/14	Veritas, Inc.	Bway, 96-102 E	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
04/27/14	Duke Ellington Blvd. Neighborhood Association	Bway, 102-106 E	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
05/04/14	Broadway Mall Center	Bway, 86-93 E	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
05/11/04	Lincoln Square Neighborhood Center	Col, 66– 72	Clearview Festival	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
05/18/14	West Manhattan Chamber of Commerce	Amst, 77–89	WMCC	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-1.
05/25/14	Coalition for a Livable West Side	Bway, 72-82 W	Mort & Ray	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
05/25/14	Safe Haven West Side Basketball League	Bway, 82-86 W	Mort & Ray	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
06/01/14	Project Open at Lincoln Center Towers	Bway, 65-72 W	Mort & Ray	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
06/08/14	WS Federation of Neighborhood & Block Assoc.	Bway, 73-82 E	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
06/08/14	The Broadway Mall Association	Bway, 82-86 E	Mort & Ray	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 2-0-0-0.
07/19/14	Valley Restoration, LDC	Amst, 96–106	Mardi Gras Festival	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 7-0-0-0.
07/27/14	Committee for Environmentally Sound Development	Bway, 60-65E	Clearview Festival	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-0.
08/24/14	Goddard Riverside	Amst, 79-86	Clearview Festival	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-0.
09/21/14	West Manhattan Chamber of Commerce	Col, 68–86	WMCC	C: 7-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-1.
09/28/14	Bloomingdale Area Coalition	Bway, 96–103 W	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-0.
10/19/14	NAACP Mid-Manhattan Branch	Bway, 86 – 90 W	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-0.
10/19/14	Symphony Space	Bway, 90 – 96 W	Mort & Ray	C: 8-0-0-0. BM: 1-0-0-1.

E = East Side / W= West Side

Present: Michelle Parker, Linda Alexander, Paul Fisher, Marc Glazer, Matthew Holtzman, Joanne Imohiosen and Anne Raphael. **Absent:** George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Brian Jenks, Suzanne Robotti and Eric Shuffler.

Community Board 7 - Business & Consumer Issues Committee

Resolution #:

TITLE: Resolution to regulate the use of ID scanners in New York State

AUTHOR: Matthew Holtzman, Member CB7

REFERRED TO: Business & Consumer Issues Committee

Whereas, instances of identity theft increased from 6.4 to 8.6 million U.S. households during 2005 - 2010,

Whereas, the machine-readable stripe of an ID card contains sensitive data, including a cardholder's home address, date of birth, height, hair color, eye color, weight, license number and medical history, among others,

Whereas, 76% of identity theft was attributable to the theft of personal identification, wallets and computers as of 2010,

Whereas, businesses previously employed ID scanners to verify cardholder identities or card authenticity, some have begun collecting and transmitting cardholder information to third parties for data-mining and marketing purposes, and law enforcement officials are promoting such trends,

Whereas, the practice of unregulated ID scanning, retention and commercial transmission of cardholder data poses significant privacy risks and makes consumers more vulnerable to identity theft, particularly if the protocols for securing and transmitting such data are not kept current,

Now, therefore, Community Board 7 calls on the New York State Assembly, Senate and the Governor to enact appropriate legislation:

(1) to require business owners employing such ID scanning devices to limit their use to appropriate cases as outlined in Hawaii Senate Resolution §487J, and

(2) to require business owners to display appropriate signage at the point of sale indicating their use of such ID scanner devices, as well as their retention and transmission policies governing such usage.