

**COMMUNITY BOARD 7/MANHATTAN*****Minutes of Full Board Meeting******November 6, 2013***

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Wednesday, November 06, 2013, at Congregation Rodeph Sholom in the District. Chair Elizabeth R. Caputo called the meeting to order at 6:49 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

Minutes from previous full board meeting were **approved**: 25-0-0.

Chair's Report: Elizabeth R. Caputo

- Thanked outgoing Chair Mark Diller for his work on the Board and presented him with a gift from the Board.
- Congratulated the Pedestrian Safety Working Group, chaired by Ethel Sheffer, on completion of the study of the West 95th-97th Street corridor and report on improvements that will be submitted to DOT.
- Congratulated the Business and Consumer Affairs Committee on a successful "B2B" event, which brought together a variety of businesses and community members to discuss hiring and buying local. This event serves as a model for other Community Boards across the City of New York.
- Announced a number of events, and introduced Community Board 7's new planning fellow, Ella Ver, who will be creating a large database of information and maps of the delivery of services for youth in the community.

Community Session

Noah Gotbaum

- Mr. Gotbaum discussed his support for bike lanes in principal, but against the study of a new bike lane on Amsterdam Ave. He advocated for a study to "fix" the bike lane on Columbus Ave.

Sharon Pope—New York Society for Ethical Culture

- Ms. Pope announced that on Thursday, November 7, 2013, her organization would host a discussion on affordable housing for senior citizens. On Friday, November 8, 2013, the organization would host an event discussing ethics in the theater.

Oscar Llodra

- Mr. Llodra, an eleven-year-old boy, spoke in favor of a bike lane on Amsterdam Avenue, indicating that he commutes by bicycle to school every day.

Rebecca Donsky—New York Public Library

- Ms. Donsky announced the Library's November activities, including a new "tween" craft program and a separate family craft program.

Robert Jee



- Mr. Jee expressed concern with music and patron noise emanating from Café Tallulah at 71st and Columbus Ave. The noise issue has been constant since the café's opening. Mr. Jee has had conversations with the owners, but the issue has not been abated and the music continues after hours. Mr. Jee was referred to the co-chairs of the Business and Consumer Issues Committee so that his issue could be addressed.

Jane Thompson

- Ms. Thompson discussed sliver buildings, and her hope that the sliver building next to her apartment would be finished by December 2013. Ms. Thompson encouraged disapproval of sliver buildings in the future. Ms. Thompson also raised an issue with 311, which has apparently stopped noting the time when a call occurs. Noting the time of a call would be useful to have for complaints regarding construction, since the hour of the day often dictates whether or not there is a violation. Ms. Thompson also noted that there have been many health issues resulting from the construction of the sliver building, and that she wants a rule that if construction workers are wearing masks, then residents of surrounding buildings should be informed of the potentially hazardous conditions.

Olive Freud—Committee for Environmentally Sound Development

- Ms. Freud expressed concern with the decrease in light and increase in shadows as a result of taller buildings in the community.

Pamela Motisi—68th St. Block Association

- Ms. Motisi expressed support for a food market to open at the old Food Emporium site. Ms. Motisi and the 68th St. Block Association are organizing to achieve this goal, including a petition drive, and requested that Community Board 7 write a letter supporting their position. Would like food market at old food emporium site.

Bruce Vapnitsky—68th St. Block Association

- Mr. Vapnitsky also expressed support for a food market to open at the old Food Emporium site. To date, the 68th St. Block Association has collected over 1,000 signatures in support of their position. The Company that assumed the lease of the vacant store front has indicated that issues related to union activity may be effecting its ability to rent the space. To date, no food market has expressed interest in the space. Mr. Vapnitsky also requested that Community Board 7 write a letter supporting the group's position. Mr. Vapnitsky and his organization were referred to the Business and Consumer Issues Committee for follow-up.

Lei Xi—NTD Television

- Ms. Xi announced a traditional Chinese culture show that would be occurring at Lincoln Center. Ms. Xi also spoke to disparaging comments made by a community member at the previous month's Community Board member regarding Falun Gong. Ms. Xi explained Falun Gong as a Buddhist practice that has been subject to oppression in China, that some performers in the show were practitioners of Falun Gong, and that she appreciated the ability to speak openly about the issue in the United States.



Brian Sullivan—Department of Parks and Recreation

- Mr. Sullivan announced activities at the Gertrude Ederle Recreation Center at 232 W. 60th Street.

Peter Arndsten—Columbus Amsterdam BID

- Mr. Arndsten announced upcoming BID events as well as the opening of a new restaurant at 109th Street and Columbus Ave. He expressed his support for a safer Amsterdam Avenue.

Nesh Palay—Strauss News

- Ms. Palay introduced herself as a reporter who covers the Upper West Side and welcomed sources and stories.

Penny Dow—Children's Village

- Ms. Dow encouraged both foster parenting as well as participation in a new short-term fostering program run through her organization.

Richard Barr—

- Mr. Barr expressed interest in converting the staging area for the 86th Street crosstown bus into the first stop for the bus route, as the first and second stops are currently too close together.

Mark Venaglia—

- Mr. Venaglia announced a reception for his artwork on December 4, 2013. He is a recent transplant from Los Angeles and wants to ensure that there is a place for artists on the Upper West Side.

Manhattan Borough President's Report- Rebecca Godlewicz

- A flu shot clinic will be held at the Borough President's Office on Friday, November 15, 2013.
- The process for recruiting new Community Board members for appointment on April 1, 2014, has begun. Borough President Stringer is committed to facilitating a smooth transition in the recruiting and appointments process with Borough President-elect Gale Brewer.

Reports by Legislators:

Jerrold Nadler – Congressman, 10th District of New York

- Congressman Nadler congratulated the newly-elected city officials, and then provided an update on the Affordable Care Act, the difficulties faced during the government shutdown and an update on the ongoing budget process, including the continued funding of the Federal government.

Gale A. Brewer – City Council Member, 6th District

- Council Member Brewer announced a number of upcoming hearings:
 - On November 12, 2013, the Transportation Committee will hold a hearing on electric vehicle legislation.
 - On November 13, 2013, there will be a hearing on political contributions via text messages.
 - On November 20, 2013, at 1:00 p.m., the Committee on Technology will hold a hearing on open data, specifically seeking ideas on how newly-available data can be used.



- On November 21, 2013, the Government Operations Committee will hold a hearing on instant runoff voting.
- The City Council will soon vote on webcasting certain meetings at agencies with a commission or board, such as City Planning and the Taxi and Limousine Commission.
- Encouraged the continued implementation of the transportation plan for the Upper West Side, and indicated support for getting Bike Share on the Upper West Side, encouraging increased use of bike lanes and ensuring that merchants are satisfied with the bike lanes.

Daniel O'Donnell – Assembly Member, 69th District

- He announced that he is the newly appointed Chair of the Corrections Committee.
- He also announced two bills. The first, 6059A, would protect students' privacy by regulating the information that could be collected from students. The second, 6058A, would require that the sale of school property would have to go through the ULURP process.

Dick Gottfried – Assembly Member, 75th District

- Assembly Member Gottfried began by congratulating the City's newly-elected officials.
- Expressed his disappointment in the passage of the casino referendum and further expressed his worry that it will result in the siting of casinos in localities that may otherwise not want such a business within its borders.

Reports by Legislative Representatives:

Josh Cole, Senator Brad Hoylman's Office

- Mr. Cole introduced himself as a new staff member for Senator Hoylman.
- Senator Hoylman questioned the lack of public hearings in New York City with the Board of Regents regarding education reform, but recently learned that three to four forums will be announced in the coming months. Senator Hoylman is generally concerned about the over-testing of children and its effect on learning.

David Baily, Senator Adriano Espaillat's Office

- Mr. Baily announced the Department of Transportation's rejection of a slow zone proposal for northern Manhattan and that, one day after the rejection, a hit and run accident occurred in the proposed slow zone. Senator Espaillat is hopeful for reconsideration of the ruling.
- Mr. Baily requested that community members submit events for the Senator's community events email.

Erica Overton, A-M Linda Rosenthal's Office

- Ms. Overton announced a health care forum that would occur on November 7, 2013.
- On November 6, 2013, Assembly Member Rosenthal testified on behalf of NYCHA residents in opposition to the Department of Housing Preservation and Development's succession rights.
- Ms. Overton also announced the Assembly Member's participation in protests against Monsanto (who is lobbying against her bill regarding labeling genetically modified organisms) and Spectra.

*Business Session***Parks & Environment Committee****Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Starkey, Co-Chairpersons**

1. **Riverside Park South.** Department of Parks & Recreation's proposed design for the West 72nd Street area of Riverside Park South.

- Ms. Neuwelt, co-chair of the Parks & Environment Committee provided overview of the project and the resolution for consideration. Offered a friendly amendment to the resolution to include credit to C-M Brewer and Speaker Quinn for their efforts to secure \$2.5 million in funding for this project.
- Human and pet users of Riverside South Park will benefit from this development.

After discussion and deliberation, the resolution to approve the preliminary design was adopted.

VOTE: 38-0-0-0

Transportation Committee**Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons**

2. **West 95th Street.** Request by the Friends of West 95th Street to the Department of Transportation for the installation of Bishop's Crook lampposts on West 95th Street between Central Park West and Columbus Avenue.

- Co-Chair provided overview of the issue, noting that BP Stringer sponsored this improvement.
- David Lopez from Friends of West 95th Street as a representative of the block association of West 95th Street testified regarding the project. Two years ago he became aware of City efforts to fix street furniture, i.e lampposts. New lampposts use same amount of electricity, while providing more light. Approached BP Stringer's office which enthusiastically agreed to support this effort and secure funding from DoT. The block association has held meetings about this and it has widespread support. The lampposts will be installed in the same places and without disruption.
- Q: Do these lampposts utilize LED lighting?
 - o A: Yes it is the same number of fixtures, same number of lights, but will provide more light.
- Q: Will this be implemented district-wide or is this a block association specific request?
 - o A: Mr. Lopez' understanding is that this must be sponsored by a community organization in order to obtain support.
 - o A: A Co-Chair of the Transportation Committee further clarified that individual elected officials in the district have taken it up proactively as well.
 - o A: A board member noted that the participatory budgeting process could be helpful in the future for implementing such requests.

After discussion and deliberation, the resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 38-0-1-0

3. **Amsterdam Avenue Redesign, 59th-110th Streets.**



- Since the Co-Chairs did not sponsor the resolution for consideration, consistent with the bylaws, the members who offered the resolution presented the resolution. The co-chairs gave the floor to Members Robotti & Semer.

Members Robotti & Semer Presentation:

Changed the therefore be it resolved to “study” instead of “plan” ...

THEREFORE, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT Community Board 7 asks the New York City Department of Transportation to present a study for the redesign of Amsterdam Avenue that improves safety, aesthetics, and efficiency for all users. The study should incorporate a reduction in the number of motor vehicle travel lanes, a protected bicycle lane, pedestrian islands, and dedicated loading zones and left turn lanes. The study should include a plan for extensive outreach, education, signage, and enforcement.

- The tremendous number of cars speeding up Amsterdam was the impetus for the proposed changes, which are safety focused. The goal of the resolution is to encourage DoT to consider all possibilities to make this a safe street.
- Bike lanes with the lane next to it would allow emergency vehicles to access such lanes if necessary. Moreover, bicycles are more nimble and bikers can dismount quickly and safely to allow safe passage via the bicycle lanes for emergency vehicles.
- Amsterdam Avenue has been identified as the least safe area on the UWS. It should be a residential street. If DoT determines there should be a bike lane, it should be studied. The goal of the resolution is to encourage public discussion.

Board Member Questions/Comments on Resolution:

- Q: What is the reference to the word “plan” in the resolution?
 - o A: All such references will be changed to study.
- Q: What would be the environmental impact of “steady” the lights on travel time on Amsterdam.
 - o A: This was a concern at the committee level as well and the resolution seeks to address this. Further travel times improved on Columbus Avenue because there was a consistent speed on the block as opposed to the start and stop that now happens on Amsterdam.
- Q: What is the source for the 35% cut in travel time statistic?
 - o A: These data are from streetstat.org with input from DoT based on their one year study.
- A concern was raised about the language relating to this measure ensuring that all riders will be safe as a result of this change.
- A concern was raised regarding conflicts of interest and affiliations in this discussion, especially as it relates to the requirements of CB7’s bylaws. In this specific instance, two board members should disclose that they are members of Transportation Alternatives. Moreover, such member raised a concern about the process for initiating this resolution and ensuring proper opportunity for public comment.
 - o It was clarified what constitutes a conflict of interest under City Charter is if you have a financial interest or are an employee.



- It was further clarified that when speaking about something there should be disclosure, but when voting only if you or your family will receive pecuniary gain that the member should disclose such interest and vote accordingly.
- Q: Whether information about the effects or concerns raised with the Columbus Avenue implementation should be disclosed as a part of the consideration process?
 - A: It was clarified again that if a board member is speaking on an item and have an affiliation that meets the threshold standard for disclosure, then the member has an obligation to disclose. If voting, then should also disclose that affiliation before voting. But only if such member or their family receives personal or financial gain, then must vote stating such conflict.
- A concern was expressed about the failure to disclose conflicts. Urged members with conflicts to disclose such conflicts.
- It was reiterated that members should disclose conflicts.

Public Testimony:

- Carolyn Jacobs – ceded her time.
- Emily Margolis – Spoke to two firefighters about whether there has been change in travel times as a result of Columbus Avenue bike lane installation. Such firefighters noted that yes they have seen a change in travel times. They further noted that the FDNY is opposed to installation of bike lanes on Amsterdam Avenue.
- Thomas DeVito, Transportation Alternatives organizer – Provided background about Transportation Alternatives. Amsterdam Avenue has worst traffic on UWS and most accidents. Over the last eight months or so, there has been a movement to educate and inform the debate about how to improve safety on Amsterdam Avenue. Presented 1,800 petition signatures urging a complete street on Amsterdam Avenue. Contacted 231 owners and managers, 204 of which signed their support, including Goddard Riverside.
- Brian Hoberman, resident at West 97th Street and Amsterdam and member of TA – Amsterdam is most dangerous street on UWS because it is a six lane street. No reason should not support safety study by DoT. This is not just about bicycle lanes, but has other traffic calming effects. Traffic moving slower should not be the lead concern, saving lives should be the foremost concern.
- Diane Keefe – not present
- Richard Barr – This is the truck route to the George Washington Bridge and it will remain that way. This is ridiculous. Argued that parking design is a recipe for disaster. Supports making City more navigable for bicycles, but on this avenue it would not work. For someone hearing or vision impaired, it would be a potential hazard to step out on the curb. Also if need a tenant to load or unload at curb, this is no longer possible.
- Eric Whelan, Environment New York field organizer & 108th Street & Amsterdam resident – Applauds redesign of Amsterdam Avenue. Superstorm Sandy anniversary reminds us that we need to do more to curb global warming pollution. 1.4M people in NYS suffer from asthma. Should do everything can to reduce pollution and ensure more healthy in our own community. Should also protect children and retirees as they cross Amsterdam. Should reclaim space for own neighborhood.
- Ian Alterman – CM Brewer's e-bike legislation would make it illegal to own e-bikes or motor assisted bikes. This bill includes a forfeiture clause. On this issue, neither in favor of or opposed to this. The board can consider in its vote: (i) statistics, which can be cherry picked; (ii) number of bodies in a room, but this also may not represent support; and (iii) most importantly, the board should consider the issues of all stakeholders.



- David Foell, 160 West 77th Street resident since 1989 – Supports proposal. Responded to criticism in public debate that reduction from 6-4 lanes would cause unacceptable gridlock. New York Times article on September 4, 2013 noted that study of DoT pedestrian plazas, new bike lanes, etc. based on data from taxicabs showed that average speed of cars in the zones there was an increase in speed of 7%. This shows why should support this issue.
- Detta Ahl, MHHC – There continue to be 300 traffic deaths in NYC. The injuries are also troubling. Supports safer street redesign, even though multi-mobile. Recently was in a car on Riverside Drive when there was gridlock and then the street opened up and the driver sped. This is dangerous. This gave her a snapshot of Amsterdam Avenue. The community deserves better than being a cut through for traffic. DoT can be creative about how best to make to improve the street, so should enable them to do so.
- Juliette Leak, Park West Village – Major concerns about this. Was recently in an accident while in Charlotte, NC. If she would have been here under similar circumstances given the gridlock on Columbus Avenue, she may not have made it to the hospital in time.
- Mendy Haskel – Lives on 107th and Amsterdam – rides bicycle to work on Amsterdam raceway. It should not be a discussion about survivable streets. Cyclists are alarmed by the cars aggressively pursuing.
- George Beane, Columbus Avenue BID - 5 years ago BID commissioned a study on safe and livable streets and presented this data to CB7 Transportation Committee. A year later the Upper West Renaissance conducted a similar study. These data are old. Traffic accidents have dropped and that is important. He seeks out protected bike lanes when he rides. Wants Columbus and Amsterdam to be cyclist friendly for when BikeShare comes further north. Urged board to vote in favor of this.
- Joseph Schiff - Has lived on West 81st Street between Amsterdam and Columbus for 25 years. Has noticed more noise and smoke pollution in recent years. The shortened light at West 81st Street has created more pollution. He has studied the Columbus bicycle lanes use and believes it is grossly underutilized and causes confusion on Columbus.
- Catherine Ursino, Park West Village – Submitted petition signatures in to the record. Opposed to this implementation. Lives in a “super block” from 97th – 100th Streets. If put a bike lane on Amsterdam Avenue, it will slow down traffic even more. Concerned about first responders ability to assist the community. Seniors are at risk in crossing streets and advocacy around this issue has been lacking from senior centers. Saddened by board’s failure to disclose conflicts. Urged board to vote no, because this is a piecemeal study.
- Alex Herzan, UWS resident for over 30 years –Thanked board for street redesign on Columbus Avenue. Feel strongly that Amsterdam Avenue is a four lane highway, which is very intimidating for anyone, especially those with disabilities or children.
- Arnold Schickler, Seniors for Safe Streets – Avid cyclist and pedestrian at 80 years old. Can do and have to do better on Amsterdam Avenue. Took five years of study to implement Columbus Avenue bike lane. Should not obstruct this process. Allow DoT to study the issue.
- Richard Fine – Appreciates the need for safer street on Amsterdam. Would create a safe north-south flow for traffic and cyclists.
- David Solnick, architect, member of CB4, member of Checkpeds – This organization prioritizes redistribution of public ways. Have not fully advocated for needs of children. Has a protected bike lane that enables him and his children to ride safely off of the sidewalk, which is legal for children under 12. If CB7 has concerns, then should make those concerns known in the resolution. But should use the DoT experience to date, since this is a later proposal to ensure get the best implementation possible.



- Lawrence Levy – Thanked board for considering this topic. Someone told him this is a lifestyle question. His children live one mile from their school via Amsterdam. Although his children want more autonomy, Amsterdam is too dangerous to enable them to walk or cycle safely. The key is a common sense approach to ensure that DoT has the tools it needs to balance all the interests. This deserves study.
- Willow Stelzer – Reiterated prior speakers support for DoT study. Noted that emergency responders do in fact utilize bike lanes in traffic, so this should not be a reason to prevent study.
- Penny Heyman Schwartz – Reiterated that board members should disclose conflicts. Asked whether Transportation Alternatives allowed petitioners to express objection to this. There is no enforcement of the rules of the road and cyclists are worst offenders. Not opposed to bike lanes. Represents Age Friendly New Yorkers – she is a seasoned adult. Bike lanes in some instances discourage seniors from using the road. Should implement this legally, appropriately. Transportation Alternatives has put forward a biased sample.
- Louis Klaber, Transportation Alternatives – Semi-retired UWS resident. Rides her bicycle downtown on the greenway, which is carbon neutral. Protected bike lanes make biking safer and easier for pedestrians.
- The Chair reemphasized meeting decorum, including members of the public not passing notes to board members because this is disruptive. Instead, suggested that they bring their concerns to the room when they speak. Also, asked speakers to please express that their support or opposition to prior speakers comments given time constraints with space at meeting location.
- Tom Birchard, owner of Veselka Restaurant – Second Avenue safe street redesign has slowed down traffic, but has also cut travel time. Amsterdam Avenue is very analogous and should be implemented.
- Jan Levy, 115 CPW – On Columbus Avenue south of 72nd Street there is street cone and dirt pit, which does nothing for traffic. Installation of walk through is not helpful. Wonders what it cost to implement this. 72nd Street is a very pedestrian heavy thoroughfare with strollers, deliverers, elders, etc. and implementing of the southbound bike lanes has not helped with crossing 72nd Street. Mail trucks cannot get through.
- Paul Reale, educator and sustainability consultant – Rules of the road have already been established for cars, trucks and buses. Need to get better about implementing bikes in that mix, which is why studying it is key. The Netherlands has done a great job in this regard. A vote for incorporating bicycles in to Upper West Side traffic is a vote for a better UWS.
- Nicholas Sealler – He is here on behalf of Steven Alan. Bike lanes have improved business for Steven Alan store and he is therefore thankful and supports expansion.
- Gene Aronowitz, Brooklyn, NY – Considers himself an expert on what older people feel when crossing the street. 36% of pedestrian fatalities are of older people. Not being concerned when crossing Amsterdam Avenue is justified. AARP has supported complete streets and all will benefit greatly if studied further.
- Paul Lindberg – not present
- Piglet Evans – Cut fifteen minutes from her commute via Columbus Avenue bike lane. On way home has to ride up Eighth Avenue and through Columbus Circle. Would take advantage of Amsterdam Avenue if there were a bike lane. Cycles to run her errands and engage the community. Avoids Broadway because there is too much traffic, even with the safe M104 drivers. As a mom, emphasized need to end childhood deaths.
- Nadia Zonis, West 80s Neighborhood Association – Presented letter from group urging DoT to study making Amsterdam Avenue a complete street.



- D. Maria Watson - Echoed Ian's comments to consider this thoughtfully. Should also seriously consider placement of lanes. Major concern is a legislative one as Amsterdam and Columbus Avenues are designated as truck routes and emergency routes in City law. Should consider this designation when making any changes. Provided an anecdote that it took 50 minutes to get from Columbus and 97th Street to 57th Street, and this is unacceptable. Agree that there is a need to accommodate bikers, but not at such a high cost.
- Joseph Enoch, Columbus & 90th Street – Amsterdam is the equivalent of having a highway running through the neighborhood and should not be complacent about this. The congestion studies are clear on this issue that this will reduce congestion. This is in the community's best interest and board should vote for a safer Amsterdam Avenue.
- Andrew Rosenthal, member of TA – Urged board to listen to science and not be biased in their vote. Personally attacked a board member, which he subsequently apologized for.
- Chair Caputo urged everyone to be respectful in their discussion of this issue.
- Chris Henry, UWS resident – There is ample capacity on Amsterdam Avenue to accommodate this. This study is the opportunity to get this right. A southbound safe street needs a northbound pair. The status quo is unacceptable and does a disservice to the community.
- Liz Patek, UWS resident – Participated in pedestrian webinar before the CB7 meeting that highlighted that NY is held in high regard because of its complete street redesign. Such redesigns create predictability. Without a redesign, users do whatever is safest for their individual needs. Urged the board to support this resolution.
- Kevin Monk, 68th and Riverside Blvd – Father of two children who emphasized children's safety. To address the concern that trucks utilize Amsterdam Avenue as a truck route, DoT should encourage trucks to use Lincoln Tunnel to exit the city and connect with northbound highways.
- Sonya Duffy – Excited about expansion of Columbus Avenue bike lane. Disappointed that there is no northbound route. Greenway and Central Park close at 1a.m., and they both present legitimate safety concerns at night.
- Jodi McLoughlin, West 81st Street – Recently became a cyclist due to existence of safe streets. Signage, bike lanes, etc. make it easier for everyone to behave well. Urged the board to move forward with bike lanes.
- Virgil de Voldere, La Petite Ecole preschool founder – Urged board to consider the impact on children's safety. Brings support from parents at P.S. 163 and 166. The lack of northbound bike route is important.
- Chair Caputo reminded the audience that the Board has the space until 11 p.m. and in the interest of time and resolution of the issue, all written comments will be reflected in the record if a member of the public decides to submit testimony for the record instead of providing oral testimony.
- Mary Beth Kelly, resident of UWS since 1970s and member of TA – Lost her husband to a traffic death because the ambulance could not get through congestion. TA was an outlet for her grief. Noted Mayor-elect de Blasio supports TA and Vision Zero.
- Jake Wood – not present
- Alexander Medwedew – Glad that changed language from plan to study. His issue is whether the study becomes a plan and how that study should become a plan. Suggested that non-commercial avenues should be studied. Should consider in the study: enforce existing regulations; build 3-d model of avenues; study traffic patterns and how pedestrian use the streets, not just cars; monitor Columbus Avenue redesign; and mass transit solutions for commuters among other things.
- Ruth Rogers – was recently told to use the bike lane on Amsterdam but it lacks one. Loss father to speeding car, and it can happen to anybody.



- The Board Parliamentarian made a motion to complete public statements in ten minutes and to suspend further discussion on this issue until the December full board meeting to ensure debate.

After discussion and deliberation, the motion to complete public statements and defer consideration of the resolution asking DoT to study Amsterdam Avenue redesign until the December full board meeting was adopted.

VOTE: 28-11-0-0

- Liz Dean, Irving Farm Coffee Roasters – Has locations throughout the City, and they have thrived with bike lanes. Supports DoT studying how best to implement safe streets on Amsterdam Avenue.
- Reed Rubey – Urged CB7 to pass resolution. After breaking leg, understands concerns. As a bike racer, scared to death of Amsterdam. Acts like a cowboy when on Amsterdam similar to the cars he surpasses. Disappointed the board did not take action tonight.
- Christina Bergner – not present
- Thomas Casey, TA – not present
- Katherine Rice – Read letter from two members of West Side Federation for Senior and Supportive Housing supporting complete street redesign. Seniors are most adversely impacted by unsafe streets. Seniors although representing 12% of population, they represent 36% of fatalities. Seniors and toddlers are the most vulnerable populations.
 - o President of such organization who is also a community board member noted that the organization has no official position.
- Peter Frishauf – Read statement from Mayor-elect de Blasio urging safer streets. Noted that we do not tolerate unsafe foods or other things, so why should the community and leaders support unsafe streets. Noted Ariel Russo's parents support for this and that her death could be prevented.
- Gerry Rhermouch – not present.
- Mark Seaman – not present.
- Alan Flacks – There have been great points made that should be considered. Complained because "The microphone was seized and turned off."
- Chair Caputo noted that at the December full board meeting this agenda item will take precedence and be given full consideration. That said, there will be no public comment at the December meeting.

Preservation Committee

Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

4. **2 West 64th Street** (Central Park West.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for construction of an ADA Ramp.
5. **48 West 73rd Street** (Columbus Avenue.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for an access ramp leading to the building entrance.
6. **294 Columbus Avenue, aka 100 West 74th Street**, d/b/a Bocca Di Bacco. Application #14-7673 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to replace storefront infill and install louvers, lighting and signage.
7. **250 West 77th Street, dba Belleclaire Hotel** (Broadway – West End Avenue.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for replacement and restoration of the storefronts, new signage and lighting.
8. **107 West 82nd Street** (Columbus Avenue.) Application #14-7673 to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a rooftop addition.



- The co-chairs provided an overview of the facts relating to resolutions 4, 5, 6, and 8. After providing such information and seeing no questions from board members, they proposed that the applications be bundled for voting purposes.

Regarding applications 4, 5, 6, 8, which are all motions to approve they are being bundled. After discussion and deliberation, the motion to approve was adopted.

Vote: 36-0-1-0

Item 7 – 250 West 77th Street, dba Belleclaire Hotel (Broadway – West End Avenue.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for replacement and restoration of the storefronts, new signage and lighting.

- The redesign is comprehensive, encompassing Westside Market on Broadway between West 76th and 77th Street and around to 77th street. For a variety of reasons, the committee believed the project was not reasonably appropriate and voted to disapprove.
- Q: Will the applicants definitely come back to the committee for approval or will it go directly to LPC?
 - o A: They did not make a commitment to come back.
- Q: Since there are multiple owners with various terms, why are they not proposing a master plan, which has been utilized in similar cases in the past?
 - o A: This proposal is in effect a new master plan.
- Q: Whether the co-chairs obtained a copy of the original master plan submitted to LPC?
 - o A: A copy was not obtained.

After discussion and deliberation, the motion to disapprove the application was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-2-0

Business & Consumer Issues Committee

Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons

9. Applications to the SLA for a two-year liquor licenses:

- **West 66th Street & Central Park**, Emerald Green Group LLC, d/b/a Tavern on the Green.
 - o The Committee voted nearly unanimously to approve, but learned after the fact that it was before another committee where a member of the public complained that the menu pricing was too high. This issue is not subject to the Committee's jurisdiction so it did not affect the Committee's vote.
 - o Operations issues are separate from the SLA consideration.
 - o Peter Hurwitz testified that Tavern was going to install dirty burning stoves in close proximity to Central Park and playgrounds. There should not be such a stove here.
 - o It was suggested that the chairs of the committee and the Chair of the Board should issue a letter to the owner raising concern about this point. Their facilities are state of the art and since this was not germane to the liquor license, they could not hold up authorization.

After discussion and deliberation, resolution number 9b motion to approve the liquor license was adopted.

VOTE: 31-1-2-1



- **489 Columbus Avenue** (West 83rd Street) Shree Laximi Indian Cuisine Inc, d/b/a To be Determined.

Background regarding the item number 9a was provided. After giving the board members and the public opportunity to comment, **the resolution to approve item 9a was adopted.**

VOTE: 37-0-0-0

10. **414 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th Street.) New application DCA# 1471611 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 4SK-414 Amsterdam Avenue LLC, d/b/a Pinkberry, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 5 tables and 11 seats.

Project background on this application was provided. This is a new application for an unenclosed café.

After discussion and deliberation, the resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 33-1-0-0

11. Unenclosed Café Renewal Applications:

- **229 Columbus Avenue** (West 70th-71st Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1186113 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Flej, Inc., d/b/a Pomodoro Rosso, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.
- **355 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 77th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1246104 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by DLS Chicken Corp., Chirping Chicken, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 32 seats.
- **424 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1400049 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by G&J Café, Inc., d/b/a Café Con Leche, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 6 tables and 18 seats.
- **428 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th – 81st Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1039396 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Amsterdam Avenue Brother Jimmy's LLC, d/b/a Brother Jimmy's, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 12 tables and 20 seats.
- **473 Columbus Avenue** (West 83rd Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1008999 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Club America, Inc., d/b/a Assaggio, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 7 tables and 14 seats
- **513 Columbus Avenue** (West 84th -85th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1384479 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by 513 Columbus, LLC, d/b/a Cotta, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 23 tables and 44 seats.
- **1018 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 110th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1133929 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Skipwell Corp., d/b/a Bistro Ten Eighteen, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 12 tables and 26 seats.

- The co-chairs gave an overview of the facts relating to these resolutions and proposed bundling them.
- Q: Were there any changes to the existing cafes?
 - A: Nothing has changed, and they have been renewed several times.

After discussion and deliberation, the resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 38-0-0-0



12. **467 Columbus Avenue** (West 82nd -83rd Street.) Renewal application DCA#1384273 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Canteen 82, Inc., d/b/a Blue Caravan, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 9 tables and 18 seats.

- The applicant did not attend the committee meeting. The resolution is to disapprove the application without prejudice.

After discussion and deliberation, the resolution to disapprove without prejudice was adopted.

VOTE: 37-0-0-0

13. **441 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 81st Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1283643/ ULURP# N120344ECM to the Department of Consumer Affairs by JPS Ventures, Inc. d/b/a St. James Cafe, for a two year consent to operate an enclosed sidewalk café with 5 tables and 16 seats.

- Outlined the facts regarding the Committee's consideration and support for this existing enclosed café.

After discussion and deliberation, the resolution to approve the existing enclosed café was adopted.

VOTE: 34-3-1-0

Steering Committee

Mark Diller

14. CB7 priorities for the NYC Capital Budget for Fiscal Year 2015.

15. CB7 priorities for the NYC Expense Budget for Fiscal Year 2015.

- The importance of submitting capital and expense priorities that were generated from committees and steering committee was reiterated.
- A motion was offered to bundle resolution numbers 14 and 15 and was unanimously adopted.
- The Transportation Committee will provide specific figures that will be incorporated in to the final resolutions before submission.

After discussion and deliberation, a resolution to approve was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-3-0

The board chair commended the co-secretaries for their hard work at this meeting.

A motion to adjourn was moved and properly seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 10:48 p.m.

Present: Elizabeth Caputo, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Linda Alexander, Isaac Booker, Christian Bray, Louis Cholden-Brown, Kenneth Coughlin, Page Cowley, Mark N. Diller, Robert Espier, Miki Fiegel, Sheldon J. Fine, Paul Fischer, DeNora Getachew, Marc Glazer, Phyllis E. Gunther, Matthew Holtzman, Meisha Hunter, Joanne Imohiosen, Madelyn Innocent, Brian Jenks, Genora Johnson, Lee Ping Kwan, Marisa Maack, Lillian Moore, Klari Neuwelt, Gabrielle Palitz, Michele Parker, Nick Prigo, Anne Raphael, Suzanne Robotti, Madge Rosenberg, Helen Rosenthal, Evan Rosing, Roberta Semer, Ethel Sheffer, Eric Shuffler, Barbara Van Buren, Mel Wymore, Howard Yaruss, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero and Dan Zweig.



On-Leave: Elizabeth Starkey. **Absent:** Richard Asche, Laura Atlas, Blanche E. Lawton, Haydee Rosario, Jaye B. Smalley and Thomas Vitullo-Martin.



Minutes of Community Board 7 Transportation Committee
Andrew Albert and Dan Zweig, Co-Chairpersons
7:00 P.M. on November 12, 2013 at the offices of Community Board 7

The Chairpersons brought the committee to order. There were three items on the committee's agenda:

1 – An application by the Lincoln Square BID to the Mayor's Street Activity Permit Office for curb lane and street closures on December 2, 2013 for the Winter's Eve Festival at Lincoln Square -

Monica Blum of the Lincoln Square BID gave a presentation regarding the details of this event. On motion duly made and seconded, the committee approved the proposed curb lane and street closures: Committee: 7-0-0-0. Non-committee: 2-0-0-0

2 – Discussion of recommendations in the West Side Manhattan Transportation Study - The committee discussed this study regarding improving traffic operations and safety and discussed which intersections in the community were considered most dangerous and were, therefore, among other considerations, most in need of improvement. The committee concluded that they would focus first on reviewing the following locations from the study, make current site visits, and prepare related requests for Department of Transportation action:

West 65 Street and Columbus Avenue/Broadway	West 79 Street and Amsterdam Avenue
West 66 Street and Columbus Avenue	West 79 Street and Broadway
West 66 Street and West End Ave	West 79 Street and West End Avenue
	West 79 Street and Riverside Drive

3 – Resolution to limit speeds in residential areas - The committee discussed a proposal in the City Council to limit the speed to 20 miles per hour on streets that are less than 60 feet wide in areas zoned for residential purposes and to require that signs noting this new speed limit be posted at all appropriate locations as determined by the Transportation Department. It was noted at the meeting that the street width should say less than OR EQUAL TO 60 feet to include the typical residential side streets of the Upper West Side. After discussion, on motion duly made and seconded, the committee resolved to support this proposal. Committee: 7-0-0-0 Non-committee: 2-0-1-0.

Andrew Albert gave a presentation on developments regarding the transit system.

There was mention of a request for planters in the safety area on 70th St near 205 West End Ave.

There was mention that Citi Bikeshare had 94,000 members.

The meeting was then duly adjourned.

Present: Andrew Albert,

Dan Zweig, Ken Coughlin, Anne Raphael, Suzanne Robotti, Roberta Semer and Howard Yaruss. **Chair:** Elizabeth Caputo. **Board Members:** Christian Bray and Mark N. Diller. **Absent:** Mark Glazer, Lee P. Kwan and Lillian Moore.



Business & Consumer Issues Committee Meeting Minutes
Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons
November 13, 2013

Meeting was called to order at 7pm.

Applications to the SLA for two-year liquor licenses:

1. 964 Amsterdam Avenue (West 107th Street) La Piccola Cucina.

Did not appear

Committee vote to disapprove without prejudice. VOTE: 7-0-0-0

Non committee board member 1-0-0-0

Mark Diller requested that the SLA be alerted about the license applicant who did not show.

2. 511 Amsterdam Avenue (West 85th Street) EE Bar LLC, d/b/a Bar eNe

Bar eNe (Slightly Oliver) represented by Donald Bernstein, Victor & Bernstein, P.C. 212-486-6000.
erin@bar-ene.com

Change of ownership, change of interior. Will be applying for a café permit, 26 seats, will return for that. Background music only. Hours 1am/2am weekends. Posted in the neighborhood. No community comment

Committee votes to approve: 6-0-0-0

Non committee board members 1-0-0-0

Unenclosed Café Renewal Applications:

3. 340 Amsterdam Avenue (West 76th Street.) Renewal application DCA# 1413323 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Amsterdam Ale House, Inc., d/b/a Amsterdam Ale House, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 11 tables and 32 seats.

Did not appear

Motion to disapprove without prejudice. VOTE: 7-0-0-0

Non committee board member 1-0-0-0

4. 417 Amsterdam Avenue (West 80th Street.) Renewal application to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Gilli, Inc., d/b/a Gill Restaurant, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 10 tables and 19 seats.

Did not appear

Motion to disapprove without prejudice. VOTE 7-0-0-0

Non committee board member 1-0-0-0

5. 427 Amsterdam Avenue (West 80th-81st Streets.) Renewal application to the Department of Consumer Affairs by J of K, Corp., d/b/a Momoya, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 9 tables and 17 seats. Represented by Marc Glazer, committee member who is recusing himself from the vote. 212-362-9360, marc.b.glazer@gmail.com

Postings complete. Delivery bikes, photos OK.

Committee vote to approve 7-0-0-1

Non committee board members 1-0-0-0



6. 467 Columbus Avenue (West 82nd -83rd Street.) Renewal application DCA#1384273 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Canteen 82, Inc., d/b/a Blue Caravan, for a two-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 9 tables and 18 seats. Owner Alan Lee, 203-550-9077. Alanlee64@gmail.com

Postings complete. Delivery bikes, photos OK

Committee vote to approve: 8-0-0-0

Non committee board member 1-0-0-0

Enclosed Café Renewal Application:

7. 366 Columbus Avenue (West 77th Street.) Renewal application ULURP# N120250ECM/ DCA# 1282506 to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Shake Shack 366 Columbus, LLC, d/b/a Shake Shack, for a two-year consent to operate an enclosed sidewalk café with 12 tables and 34 seats. Matt Meyer, GM 646-747-8772, mmeyer@shakeshack.com and Zachary Koff, VP Operations, 646-747-7352. zkoff@shakeshack.com. @ShakeShack

Postings Ok. No delivery. Street management issues – people blocking corners and on the street. There is a flea market nearby adding to the sidewalk blockage. GM said 2 people assigned full time. Suggestions from the committee – move the two giant trash bins to around the corner and to add movable stanchions and ropes to manage the line.

Noted that it is a good example of why we discourage outdoor cafes – it makes the sidewalk overly narrow. However, the history of the enclosed café is long, first enclosed café on upper west side, perhaps in the city. Removing it in an historic district would be a nightmare. It has been continuously occupied.

Shake Shack partners with the Museum of Nat History. Shake Shack patrols the benches on their side of the sidewalk. Museum of Nat History empties garbage bins constantly, on demand Shake Shack power washes the sidewalk.

Committee vote to approve: 8-0-0-0

Non committee board member 1-0-0-0

8. Debriefing from BCI members of the obstacles faced in outreaching to colleges.

Discussion among the committee. Committee members expressed uncertainty who to speak to and what to say. Monroe College, who came, could they give us a testimonial that we can put on Facebook? More face-to-face requests to attend. People are reluctant to go to a new event. We need quotes and support from those who have been to previous events. The location was a problem, the hostel was too funky.

9. Multi-block street fair application schedule:

- 11/22 applications must be submitted to CB7;
- 12/11 BCI will review and vote;
- 1/7 FB will vote.

Formation of a sub-committee to review the applications before the 12/11 committee meeting.

Suggested date: Sunday, Dec 1st at 3:30 pm for one hour. Volunteers: Su, Anne, Marc, Michele

10. New Business

- a. Matt Holtzman, committee member proposed resolution to create a policy to limit retail stores' retention of data that is scanned from IDs. Some stores will scan IDs and keep them on file. There is no policy city-state-nationwide to require stores to destroy data after an appropriate period of time. Committee discussion:
 - i. It would be best to attempt to get this voted on as early in the year as possible for consideration at the state level as the state agenda will fill early in the year.



- ii. The January agenda for Full Board is usually open and will have time for discussion. This should get it out in time for state agenda.
 - iii. By going to the legislators first a bill might be developed and then we would be voting support of a bill versus a resolution from our committee.
- b. Paul Hollenbaugh owner of the Abbey Pub. 914-629-1695. HollenbaughP@gmail.com
Attorney Mark Weinstein, not present.
 - i. Underage drinking violation (underage auxiliary office was a plant) in the beginning of March. First offence. Signed a stipulation with a fine of \$7,500 and the SLA fined same amount. Requires a doorman on Thursday, Friday, Sat nights. ID scanner required.
 - ii. On October 30th NYPD arrested a male drug dealer in the restaurant. While there NYPD noted the scanner was not at the door as required and the doorman's license for security had expired. Special Operations/NYPD padlocked the door on October 30th.
 - iii. With the door padlocked, the keys are with the police and have to be retrieved for all service people.
 - iv. No complaints from the community. Rep D. O'Donnell wrote a letter of support for the bar. Melissa Mark-Viverito's office sent him to CB7.
 - v. Requesting a letter to the legal bureau – corporate counsel requesting the bar re-open. Has paid first round of fines. Behind on rent and needs to start paying new fines.
 - vi. Committee determined to request Penny facilitate a meeting with the Captain of the 24. Elizabeth and Michele should be included. Mark Diller offered to help facilitate.
- c. Follow-up on noise complaint by neighbors of Café Tallulah. First brought up at October BCI meeting. Seeking soundproofing of the shared party wall. Robert Jee, 917-941-2939. Jeedoi@hotmail.com
 - i. Would like to add to complaint that there is noise from the ventilation system.
 - ii. Michele and George will meet with the owners of Tallulah and make sure complainant is notified of the meeting so as to attend.
- d. Shaen Begleiter, Shaen68@aol.com, Celia Paretsky, apartment3nyc@aol.com. West 68th Street Block Association
 - i. Petition with 1,500 signatures for the current owners of the building that previously housed the Food Emporium to lease to a new supermarket in order to serve the community needs. Both West 67th and West 69th Street Block Association are supporting.
 - ii. The lease was sold to Madison Capital and the Food Emporium closed.
 - iii. The supermarket serviced the entire region from West 60th to West 70th. The Food Emporium was the only full scale/service store. The remaining specialty stores are limited in hours, products and service.
 - iv. Gale Brewer's office supports and will write a letter.
 - v. Block Association anticipates that there will be problems with rent level expectations and holdover union deals for two years. Union agreement at sale requires a re-hire of all employees if a market moves in.
 - vi. Block Association has not approached any supermarket chains.



- vii. Block Association requests a letter in support of a supermarket. Their intent is to meet with Madison Capital.
- viii. Board discussion: Small Mom and Pops have disappeared; it's evolution. Fresh Direct serves and is progress. The question is does the community need a market not will the attempt to get a store be successful. Is the community better served with small markets and small stores in that space? I don't think we have a lot of say-so, Madison Capital will want to maximize their investment. I believe that the outreach should be to the supermarkets like Wegman's and encourage them to come into the space. Should be two-fold, write the letter but encourage dialog.
- ix. The committee agreed to have Michele write a letter to be signed by the Board Chair and Committee Chair.

- e. Chirping Chicken has a few new lighted bikes that are great. A big improvement.

Meeting was adjourned at 9:10pm

Present: Michelle Parker, Linda Alexander, Paul Fisher, Marc Glazer, Matthew Holtzman, Brian Jenks, Anne Raphael, Suzanne Robotti and Eric Shuffler. **Absent:** George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero and Joanne Imohiosen.



**Preservation Committee Meeting Minutes
Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons
November 14, 2013**

The Preservation Committee of Community Board 7 met on Thursday, November 14, 2013, at the District Office, 250 West 87th Street, New York, NY 10025. The meeting was chaired by committee chairs Gabrielle London Palitz and Jay Adolf, and was called to order promptly at 6 pm. The following matters were discussed and actions taken.

344 West 72nd Street (the Chatsworth) and 340 West 72nd Street (the Chatsworth Annex).

Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for façade restoration, window replacement, new entry doors, expansion of the Chatsworth 13th floor penthouse, and addition of one story to the North Tower of the Chatsworth and one story to the Annex.

Presentation by: Bill Higgins (Preservation Consultant); Laurie Golub (HFZ Capital); Richard DeMarco (architect); Paul Selver (Land Use Counsel).

Laurie Golub

- HFZ restored similar buildings, 823 Park Avenue, 11 East 68th
- Also in CB7
- Proud to restore
- Founder was involved in restoration of the Belnord
- Comprehensive restoration plan

Bill Higgins

- Will not present all slides in interest of streamlining/time.
- Proposal includes the Chatsworth (1904) and Annex (1906); connecting 1-story connection which functions as entry to the Annex.
- Project includes restoration work that will be reviewed at Staff level.
- Public meeting items – rooftop additions; replacement of wood with aluminum windows on upper floors; changing 1st floor windows into doors.
- Individual landmarks since 1984, now also in the expanded West End Avenue-Collegiate historic district. Also RSP is a landmark.

Existing

- Chatsworth and Annex have lost their copper cresting – will be restored.
- Restoration will include copper, stone copings, terra cotta, metal elements, staining – all intend to correct. Includes areas of damaged/missing limestone.

Window Replacement

- Lower 3 floors – elaborate windows will be replaced in wood to match original.
- Middle section of the building – replace windows with aluminum.

Entrances out of windows

- Proposing to convert 3 windows on 1st floor to create entrances to apartments. Maisonette
- Retain window width – lengthen to create doors.
- 71st façade – also take 1 1st-floor window and convert to a door.



- Replace gate on mews-way on 71st Street – with one that can be operated for pedestrians or for vehicles.
- Annex – convert 1 window to door, and create bridge over areaway with handrails.
- Wood doors (pairs) 2x3.
- So new maisonette will be ADA.

Rooftop Additions - Chatsworth

- Existing 13th floor is space within the mansard.
- Proposal to extend existing construction back on the 13th floor in undulated configuration.
- Proposal to add a 14th floor above the extension on the 13th floor in same undulated configurations.
- Appx half the north part of the roof; also another mechanical addition on the south part of the roof.
- Leaves approx. 12-13 foot terrace space between penthouse and cornice atop the mansard.
- Height of 14th floor is 11'8"

Rooftop Addition – Annex

- Enclosing existing small penthouse to one lot line to lot line, also appx half the Annex roof area.
- Leaves appx 10 foot terrace space between penthouse and cornice.
- East elevation of addition wraps around the water tank – which will not move.

Materials

- Chatsworth - Brick in the back. On the 13th floor – north meets the mansard; 14th has metal elevation.
- Annex – brick in the rear; same metal on the front.
- Metal – original idea to sheath the front in copper to match the existing building.
- Re-thought with LPC Staff – move away from copper to distinguish from the façade – hence more modest material.
- More modest material now proposed (silver in color).
- Metal cladding starts at the decorative chimney on the Chatsworth and Annex; wraps around. On Annex metal wraps around on the east side (but not the west, which faces the access way).
- South Chatsworth chimney on west side must be raised.

Photoshop presentation of visibility of the proposed addition.

- Acknowledges that additions are visible.
- Visible from within Riverside Park (both from north and northwest)
- Initial mock-up includes the railing as part of the mock-up.
- Cresting of the mansard will partially obscure the addition.
- Greatest visibility of Annex from northwest – in context of non-ornamental side elevation in areaway.
- Chatsworth addition not visible from immediately across West 72nd Street; Annex visible even from there.

Answers to Committee Questions:



- Windows with oculus – will be the same shape/dimension.
- Using aluminum above for energy performance – wood will be double-glazed but not as energy efficient as aluminum.
- Using wood for the interesting shapes; using aluminum for the simple rectangular 1:1 windows.
- [sheet 22] – 10th floor windows – all special windows will all be wood.
- 71st Street façade restoration scope – not as ornamental – not as full a vocabulary of terra cotta as on 72nd Street façade.
- Same scope on 71st façade, just not as much to restore.
- Q: Windows into doors – antithetical to restoration motivation.
A: windows frequently changed into doors for ADA reasons – keeping width but making it longer.
A: acknowledging change – but believes is appropriate and allows building to “evolve”.
- No more windows into doors in future.
- Roof access for tenants not possible because need 2 means of egress.
- Railings on top floor roof for safety, not to make it usable as a terrace.
- [p 44] Concern that inner court on the Chatsworth roof appears too narrow – extending the building upward require making court wider.
- Visibility from the Park is the 14th floor; portions of the 13th floor addition is visible from along West 72nd.
- Q: Possible to set front of 14th Floor back further to make it not visible from the Park?
A: Set back 14th floor 20’ from street face – to appear as a secondary façade/backdrop piece.
Q: does not address feasibility
A: Reasonable adjustment to factor in the investment in the property.
A: 14th floor cannot get any shallower without being too narrow to exist at all.
A: Appropriateness does not equate to complete non-visibility.
- Q: Relocating the north water tower?
A: No – will wrap around.
- No bulkheads – hatch access only.
- Hatch access not included in drawings – not part
- Q: Annex – from RSD and 73rd visibility – more than just a couple of feet of the elevation -- surprised the pictures of the mock-up were not included in the presentation.
- Q: Proposed square footage? No. units
A: 2200 SF on 13th; 3500 on 14th Floor on Chatsworth
A: will maximize density
A: Annex adding 2100 SF – allowed another 42,000 SF.



- More general issue – many proposals for many large, visible additions to buildings in the District -- opposition at CB7 and LPC, then no further public access.
 - Request that the applicant to commit to coming back to the community board if the application is disapproved and later revised.
- A: Paul Selver – cannot commit without speaking to the principals.

Chatsworth Tenants Reps:

Lisette Reisman

- Building has seen many construction projects.
- Concern about 10 year construction master plan – exposure to lead, asbestos, PCBs.
- Concern that HFZ has not been transparent – asking for presentation materials for months, saw only 2 days ago.
- Concern that HFZ has been ignoring tenants' safety and rights (example includes repointing exposing lead into apartments without warning).
- Drawings tonight different than what was presented 2 nights ago.
- More bays of the 14th floor should be visible but are not reflected as such.
- No discussion of ADA wheelchair accessibility for the existing tenants – yet making maisonettes accessible. Wheelchair bound neighbors must use inferior rear entrance.
- Unanswered questions re materials on p 34-35, 38-40. Lack of clarity of materials.

Robert Steingut

- Resident since 1988 – proud of uncompromising integrity of building.
 - Concerns re lack of transparency and lack of help.
 - Discovered asbestos after developer performed an abatement. Treated tenants' environmental consultant's report with disdain and did not perform additional remediation.
 - Visibility of addition has not been adequately documented.
 - Visible from deep within RSP, RSD at West 75-76, West 73 & 74.
 - Also visible from WEA along West 72nd Street.
 - Also visible sections of the rear sections from West 71st Street.
 - Not an appropriate way to crown a West Side landmark.
-
- Doors in the front of the building – railings in the front of the building are original – should not break apart – can access the apartments from the main lobby. Should not violate the integrity of the railing and the windows.

Paul Selver

- LPC standard for photos is a 50mm lens – some of the images presented by Tenants Ass'n.
- FAR is as-of-right

John Favazzo – Li Saltzman

- Did not see a zoning diagram or analysis – request.
- Sees discrepancy 11K SF being added vs 7500SF



- Discrepancies between existing and proposed – heights of 13th and 14th floor vary widely from slide to slide.
- DoB objections – should know what the status of objections are.

Candace Burnett – Steering Committee – Tenants Ass’n

- All residents need a dignified entrance. Should design an accessible walkway for all, not just the maisonette tenants.
- Currently 5 steps are a real barrier to neighbors and even an older doorman.
- Wheelchairs only accessible through rear trash access doors.
- Maisonette door would eliminate 3 of 5 steps, but would NOT be ADA accessible.

Batya Lewton – Coalition for a Livable West Side

- Opposes rooftop and rear yards additions.

Josette Amato – WEPS

- Disagrees with windows into doors
- Restoration always comes with a “but” – rooftop.

Olive Freud – Coalition For Environmentally Sound Development

- Do not want more over-development; West Side already too dense.
- Do not want more shadows.
- Trump buildings cast shadows on Eleanor Roosevelt statue – now must go further into Park to enjoy the sun.

Jonathan Cohen 315 W 70th

- Looks out at the Chatsworth Annex – has a modest River view not blocked from Trump buildings.
- Losing air and light direct from the River.
- Q: Water towers
A: staying where they are now.
A: new addition on south tower are mechanicals including cooling HVAC

Charles Mintz – 315 West 70th

- How can water towers function when addition is on the same level?
- Visible from West 71st – why not addressed. Back of building is also a landmark.

Clifford Richner – 330 West 72nd

- Not addressing visibility from anywhere but the street – obstructing views from higher floors.
- Concern re mechanicals functioning.
A: no elevator extension because the addition is a duplex.
A: water pressure pumps already in use for upper floors – will use for additions.

Maurice Reder

- Concerned about A/C tower on the West 71st Street addition.
A: cooling tower proposed on top of existing roof structure – includes a noise baffling barrier.



Yoval Bronffman – Chatsworth resident

- Concern – security – additional doors that doorman will not supervise. Increasing access to entire building.

Randall Vaughan – former owner

- Family owned for 70 years. Brought building back to life. Now a great building.
- Supports the additions – will be tasteful.
- Happy to whom he sold and what they will do.

Committee Discussion:

- Concerned about visibility of a line or strip above the mansard – a distinct and complete roofline that should be maintained.
- Concern about converting windows into doors – inappropriate.
- Restoration scope appropriate.
- Window replacement appropriate with Mr. Higgins’ clarification about upper floors.
- Ground floor window and door modifications are appropriate – but need clarification of materials, and salvage-reuse of materials where possible.
- Rooftop: 1984 designation: “Elaborate essay in the grand French Beaux-Arts tradition” provide an arresting anchor at the foot of Riverside Drive.
- Changing roofline is not appropriate.
Q: Would the applicant be willing to reconfigure the upper addition – especially for the Chatsworth – the chimney and mansard are sculptural and should be maintained.
- Q: From zoning perspective could all FAR be built on Annex?
A: (Paul Selver) from zoning perspective, plenty of FAR available on the Annex
A: would obviously be hugely visible.
- Would prefer to keep the mansard intact. 37 Warren Street as an example.
- Would prefer to see nothing on top of mansard
- Local Law 58 – don’t need to make main entrance ADA accessible.
- Would prefer to see an accessible entrance to buildings.
- Likes the new door in the Annex – makes the façade read as sensible.
- Marketing – maisonette doors not protected by awning.
- Agree that addition on the Chatsworth – mansard integrity.
- Visibility does not preclude rooftop additions.
- Detail of mansard – desecrate too strong, but too much of an intrusion.
- Not thrilled with the design – even on Annex.
- Recognize the virtue of having modern additions differ from original. Would prefer something with a little more detail.
- Economic motivation for additions does not preclude appropriateness.



- Conversion of windows to doors – proposed design is appropriate. Would like to see more detail about materials.
- Disappointed in presentation – inaccuracies, omissions.
- Sightlines inaccurately represented.
- Model would have been a useful tool here.
- Would have expected to see materials samples.
- Restoration work is beautiful and laudable.
- Window replacement are appropriate.
- Conversion of doors appropriate.
- Should make ADA accessible at front door.
- Visibility – grand vista coming down RSD and in RSP – can't see this addition on top of the mansard – totally inappropriate.
- Will compromise the roofline and integrity of the façade.
- Annex – scroll work will partially obscure.
- Completely agree re rooftop additions.
- Walking west on West 72nd from WEA – the grand chimney is iconic and is an essential part of the approach to Riverside Park.
- View of the Annex is dominated by the addition – so inappropriate rooftop additions on both buildings.
- No materials explained re West 71st rooftop addition, which is enormously visible.
- No shadow study here – many residents of many buildings will be affected. Limited sunlight will be occluded for many neighbors.
- Cannot make an inappropriate addition into an appropriate.

Resolution: 4 parts

- A: Façade and cornice restoration and window replacement except for conversion of windows into doors (including cornices and crests) – approval
VOTE: 5-0-0-1; non-committee Board: 2-0-1-0
- B: Conversion of windows into doors – approval with recommendation to make main entrance ADA accessible.
VOTE: 2-3-0-1 FAILS
B: Resolution to disapprove conversion into doors
VOTE: 3-2-0-1; non-committee board 2-1-0-0
- C: Chatsworth rooftop addition – Resolution to disapprove
VOTE: 5-0-0-1; non-committee Board : 3-0-0-0
- D: Annex rooftop – Resolution to approve
VOTE: 1-3-1-1 FAILS
D: Annex rooftop – Resolution to disapprove
VOTE: 3-1-1-1; non-committee Board 3-0-0-0.

48 West 68th Street (Columbus Avenue – CPW).

Application to replace windows.



Presentation by Elyse Marks and Tiffani Simple, Howard L. Zimmerman Architects

Calendared at LPC 11/26/13

- 11-story mixed use structure in the UWS-CPW historic district
- Proposing to replace windows as closely as possible with existing conditions.
- Window layout on the visible facades – same color as current materials.
- Windows will be set back from the masonry the same distance as the existing windows.
- Existing windows in poor condition – reason for replacement. Existing windows bleed air and water, and often break.
- Smaller panes of glass allow for easier replacement.
- Majority of windows being replaced will have additional mullions, making them easier to operate and easier to replace panes if broken.
- Additional mullions will reduce glazing by less than 4%.

Committee Discussion

- Proposed windows are an improvement.

Doris Shandell – tenant

- Live on ground floor – sliding glass door. Cannot open because so heavy.
- Wind blows right through the panes of existing glass – thrilled with replacement.

Resolution to approve:

VOTE: 5-0-0-0; non-committee board 1-0-0-0.

105 West 72nd Street (Columbus).

Application to install an ADA compliant ramp at the main entrance.

Presentation by Nick Melone, Melone Architects

- 5 steps at the entrance – 1 exterior and 4 interior.
- Single entrance – no service, no back entrance.
- Commercial tenants flank the main entrance.
- Currently uses a temporary ramp to the main lobby, and from there it is barrier-free.
- Single ramp on the exterior; then chair lift on the interior.
- Height of exterior stair is 6” on west side; 4” on east. Chose east to make ramp shorter.
- Materials are granite to match the original. Granite piers are not original – proposal is to eliminate the piers, and hug the ramp closer to the building.
- Metal railings simple – echoes grilling on windows above with alternating thick and thin pickets.
- A: handrail is required by Code
- Could propose a handrail without the picket rail.
- Looked other options – could not slope the sidewalk without blocking the store entrance.
- Could not lower the entranceway



- Section 1010.8 requires handrails greater than 6" – since this is just 6", could get away without a railing.\
- Handrail without pickets. Brass to match accents in the building.
- Applicant agreed to change to alternate proposal.
- Resolution to approve revised proposal – open brass handrail with granite ramp
VOTE: 5-0-0-0; non-committee Board members 1-0-2-0

128 West 72nd Street (d/b/a Manahem Barber Shop (Columbus-Amsterdam)).

Application to change storefront infill.

Presentation by Dmytro Chornobryvets Architects

- Two storefronts infill the building. Application relates to the smaller, narrower storefront – currently a barbershop.
- Trying to restore/maintain symmetry that informed historic infill.
- Apartment entrance on the right third of the ground floor façade is aluminum frame in dark brown color.
- Trying to achieve matching color scheme by painting existing fabric and infilling panel above the transoms with dark-colored sign with historic lettering.
-- if not possible, will need to replace entire infill.
- Precedent of Amaryllis florist on Amsterdam at West 73rd which has historic bevel details made out of aluminum infill.
- Proposing diamond-pattern grille for transom.
- Building in trim to break up large glass panel so it matches the door and creates a second transom.
- Proposal includes an illuminated barber pole attached to store infill – will not touch remaining infill.
- Resolution to approve
VOTE: 5-0-0-0; non-committee board 2-0-0-0.
- Calendared 11/26/13

313 Columbus Avenue (West 75th Street).

Application to replace storefront infill.

Presentation by Jeff Vandenberg

- Stuccoed front entrances to group of 3 stores. Poor condition.
- Pilaster covers old cast iron column inside existing window.
- Proposal to eliminate the solid stucco division between door and smaller window, and replacing with storefront wide butt-glazed side windows and center door all of the same dimension.



- Intention is to remove the plaster around the cast iron and expose original column – depending on the condition of the cast iron.
- Sign above the infill – approved by Staff. Black aluminum panel with projecting lettering.
- Tall (9') door – concern for the hinges that make it hard to operate.
- Suggestion of normal-height door similar to one two storefronts south.
A: Rickson hinges – ADA compliant (although there is a step)
- A: If fire code requires, can paint with intumescent paint.
- A: Did not consider making an at-grade entrance – owner concerned about modification that would invade lower floor.
- Concern – the 9' door is not on pedestrian scale.
- Suggestion that the landlord have a master plan for framing.

Approval

VOTE: 3-1-1-0; non-committee Board : 1-1-0-0

351 Amsterdam Avenue (West 76th Street).

Presentation by Andrew Caracciolo

- Store infill on the north side of building; residential entrance on the south.
- Proposal to move entrance to residences to the north side, and extend the store the full depth.
- Existing condition is aluminum panels with security roll-down gates.
- Proposal to install cast-iron columns and a lintel across the top of store and residence entrance.
- Proposal includes exposing brick to surround the entire entrances.
- Similar to new infill in the store to the south (former Time Out).
- Canvas awning over residential door.
- Moving and expanding residential entrance creates handicap accessibility.
- Concern – spare look more reminiscent of SoHo or Village than UWS.
- Concern – canvas awning suggests a hotel, not UWS
- Rear addition – between the wall of the townhouse on West 77th Street (abuts the west wall of the rear yard extension of 170 West 77th).
- Would match rear yard infill to lot line already approved for neighboring store (former Time Out).
- No lot line windows on the extension on 170 West 77th.
- Materials are stucco – very limited exposure.
- Recommendation to include sound insulation
- Board Discussion
- Storefront infill is not appropriate to UWS.



- Storefront OK – piers coming down of brick make it more appropriate.
- Similar to storefront infill approved recently by CB7
- Changes opposition to support.
- Also panels on front on lower dimension of façade.

Resolution to approve without the canopy, and with sound insulation in rear.

VOTE: 5-0-0-0; non-committee board 0-0-1-0

357 West End Avenue (West 77th Street).

Application to replace top floor windows on corner building.

Presentation by Brian Volkomer of Historical Windows of New York

- Approved at Staff for all windows except for top floor windows.
- Tax photos show diamond glass pattern.
- Research into original construction suggests that all windows in grouping of set of buildings were all 1:1 – suggesting that the diamond pattern is not original.
- Considered mimicking diamond pattern – but very expensive.
- Would match rest of building and all of its neighbors.

Resolution to approve

VOTE: 4-1-0-0; non-committee Board 0-0-1-0

101 West 78th Street (Columbus Avenue).

Application for façade modification and rooftop addition.

Presentation by Bill Higgins

- Mr. Higgins and Tom O'Hara (architect) are new to the project.
- Comments from the LPC and CB7 and neighbors – led to significant redesign of the proposal.
- Issues identified – too much visibility, too big a footprint; materials of the addition; design of the addition in contrast to the rhythms of the building below; and concerns about the handicap access requiring conversion of windows into doors.
- Developer responded to comments by changing architects and assistance.
- Height of the bulkhead reduced by 8' (from 32' to 24')
- Second floor of habitable space on addition eliminated. Was 11' high.
- For structural reasons, addition first floor must increase 7" to 11'
- Setbacks on the south increased from 7'11" to 15'
- Setbacks on the east increased from 6'7" to 13'8"



- Proposal includes to reinstate the balustrade that was included in the original building along the south and east rooflines. First proposal was to reinstate the balustrade only at the corners.
- Balustrade obscures part of the habitable space. Re-designed the shape and dimensions of the balustrade elements.
- Barrier-free lift moves to be a stair lift to the below-grade areaway. Lift is thus not visible from the ground level.
- HVAC tucked on north side of the building roof behind the addition, except 4 compressors pushed back to the bulkhead.
- Design of the addition was sheet metal – vaguely followed an early 20th C design that was never built.
- Proposal is to build out of limestone.
- Window openings now relate more to the rhythms of fenestration below. Larger openings align with the group of 3 bays below on east and the south façade.
- Cornice – question of whether the original was lighter color. Attempting to match creamy New Brunswick sandstone on the stone trim for the arched top floor windows.

Tom O'Hara – architect

- Reduced mock-up now in place.
- Indiana limestone – classical color and design.
- Studied balustrade elements to arrive at new design.
- Visibility – from across Columbus, across West 78th, and 1 block away – not visible.
- From West 74th Street – addition is visible (claim is minimal).
- Dark brick color that blends into the color of the building to the north.
- Windows in the penthouse – matte black.
- ADA lift – no mechanical element above.
- Courtesy that applicant came back to community board even though not required.

Board Questions:

- Ping: proportions of balustrade in tax photo appear entirely different.
- A: measured footprints of former balustrade elements (nothing else left).
- Gabby: Why no double-hung on addition?
- A: Intentional – simplify and use modern windows to distinguish from original fenestration below.
- Glass rail – non-reflective – purpose is to be non-obstructive. Did not want to impose too much design.



- Ping: judging the balustrade based on the vertical elements below.

Public Comment

Mack Jeffrey – President 386 Columbus Board of Managers

- Objections raised last time have not been addressed.
- Acknowledges elimination of 2nd floor and change.
- Still highly visible addition – not a small bungalow peering over the edge.
- Bulkhead width 30-32' wide – windowless structure. About 1/3 the width of the entire building. Will protrude into view from south and east.
- Sight lines taken from across street – need visibility from the points of maximum visibility

Jerry Ohlinger – tenant

- Using balustrade and façade of penthouse – doesn't have anything to do with the building below.
- Bulkhead – visible from many angles and long distances.

Deborah Bull

- Q: ADA lift
A: fold-down stair lift that brings patron from grade to areaway, and from there enter the building cellar level. Would be barrier free once reach the areaway ("moat").

Avra Petrides

- Massive structure – immense bulkhead.
- Nothing elegant in cream color.

Merrill Cates – resident (Tenants' Committee)

- Proposal alters floor plans of apartments 74 and 75.
- A: Not changing the layouts of existing tenants.
- A: Our responsibility to protect tenants.
- Tenant access to roof will go away.
- A: Glass tempered – withstand hurricane winds.

Loren Brenowitz – West 78th Corp.

- ADA lift
A: fold-down chair lift runs along a rail like a banister along stair to the entry door in the areaway. Stairs in the areaway will be regarded to be barrier-free.
- Agrees with concerns about the bulk – incredibly large. Unless terra cotta, would not blend in.

Robert Bull – tenant at 101 West 78th

- ADA access -
A: new elevator will bring lift users from cellar to the main lobby and all the way to the penthouse.

Susannah Hyler – tenant at 101 West 78th

- Shaft on eastern side – abuts the bulkhead
A: Cannot close off if required for LR's and BR's.
A: not closing off. Shaft would get taller by a story, but remains.



A: Adding sprinklers to entire building – requires a bigger water tank – therefore bigger Bulkhead.

Board Discussion

- A: Chose limestone intentionally – did not want to mimic red brick as poor replication of the building below. Better to distinguish new and old.
- Pleased by presentation and attention to distinguishing first proposal.
- Appreciate methodical approach to concerns.
- New design answers concerns about first ADA access – appropriate and significant improvement.
- Urge that historic photo be included – and match.
- Cornice and balustrade are in principle are welcome and laudable – urges careful consideration of historic photos together with physical footprint. Will bring a culmination to building that was lacking.
- Addition eliminating the 9th floor a tremendous effort at scaling back visibility.
- Placement of mechanicals and compressors sensitive.
- Visibility – seeing glass railing – not reflective and not offensive.
- Subscribes Meisha's views.
- Shared the concern about the bulkhead, but the sprinkler explanation is sufficient. Necessity requires this dimension.
- Agrees generally
- Visibility is more than just glass. Now a clean shape.
- Having the balustrade a light color – the penthouse will blend in.
- Not making statement.
- Reasonably appropriate.
- Still concerned about visibility.

Resolution to approve:

VOTE: 3-0-1-0, non-committee Board 0-1-0-0

Not calendared.

2267 Broadway d/b/a Claire's (West 81st-82nd).

Application for the installation of a wood and glass storefront and signage.

Presentation by Mary B Dierickx, preservation consultant, and Brad Dickson

- Building built in 1900 – multiple small stores.
- Claire's mid-block. Non-historic storefront. Hodge-podge of stores.
- No stone piers behind façade – steel column.
- 1905-1910 had cornice over the ground floor stores. Cornice now missing.
- Proposal to install wood and glass in 4 bays – 3 with windows and 1 with doors.



- Door is slightly recessed from plane of the façade.
- Taller glass with awnings – separate awnings for each bay of door and 3 window groups.
- Under awning will be transom with spindle glass.
- Awning – purple (corporate logo color).
- Wood with large-ish plinth beneath windows with box detail below windows and at base of pilasters.
- Unifying existing store and neighboring barber shop being consumed by Claire's.
- Blade sign – conforms to LPC rules. 24"x36" and not extending more than 40".
- Committee comments:
- Would have referenced the storefront cornice to unify the infill with the neighboring stores.
A: molding at the top of the infill defines the line where the cornice had been.
A: no remnant left of former cornice. Smaller and simpler design while continuing the line.

Resolution to approve with recommendation that consider installing a stronger cornice reference:

VOTE: 4-0-0-0; non-committee 1-0-0-0.

Calendared 12/10/13

332 West 87th Street (Broadway – RSD).

Application for a rooftop addition.

Presentation by Greg Rothstein

- Ownership changed as construction started. Had received approval for a rear yard addition that was full-width and to the existing extension height – 3rd floor.
- Public hearing because includes both rooftop addition and rear yard extension.
- Wedged between tall building and grouping of townhouses with rooftop additions. Existing rooftop additions are more significant.
- Proposed rooftop addition is set back from parapet in front 12'8" just beyond existing chimneys.
- Chimney to west should have been raised previously – now proposing to add a flu from the cellar to avoid raising existing chimney to top of 10 story building.
- Front elevation 10' – mock-up ordered taken down by LPC because of concern for wind.
- Ladders on the front and back.
- Materials – stucco all the way around. Aluminum windows – brown with brown metal railing.
- Q: front façade needs restoration.
A: Application for restoration is in process.
- Concern – effort to expand rear and roof – contrasts with the neglect of the front façade.

Community Comments

David Kent 334 West 87th

- Windows open onto the roof of the proposed rooftop where addition is proposed.
- Losing light in 10 apartments on three floors along the eastern edge of the 10-story building.
- Broker advised that value will drop by more than 6% due to loss of light and air.



- Rear elevation of rooftop addition rises 18' to obstruct windows. Distance to addition is 13'6". Parapet is brick wall.
- A: Windows on internal courtyard – can be built nearby.
- Shu-We Chen 334 West 87th
- Also has windows that will be blocked in terms of light and air.
- Felt vibrations when mock-up was removed. Saw complaint from 2011 that raised concern over vibrations and instability of the neighboring.

A: Rebuilt rear walls when doing additions – found very poor conditions. So instability has been addressed.

A: Actually only a portion of western rear wall was rebuilt.

A: Per LPC rules, will hire special inspector to ensure structural stability.

- Committee: Concern that modest demolition of mock-up resulted in vibration that caused perceptible vibration in neighboring building.

Octavio Salasa – 334 West 87th Street

- First apartment ever owned.
- Wife is a food stylist – window being blocked is kitchen which will impact livelihood.

Tony Rowe – 334 West 87th Street

- Apartment below the extension. Drilled into his walls – vibrations shaking his furnishings.
- West wall of the existing building has cracking and black tar paper.

Gale Spreeder – 334 West 87th

- Not new issue – on-going issues with the applicant building.
- 334 has been diligent good neighbors; 332 not so.
- Construction not pleasant to neighbors. Placed trash and construction debris in front of their building.

Letter from Noah Gotbaum – 330 West 87th

- Supports the application – cites courtesy of the applicant.

Letter from Sharon Pett - 330 West 87th

- Also supports.

Committee Questions and Comments:

- Apartments in applicant building are occupied. Lowering height of ceiling –
A: when apartment becomes vacant.
- A: will recommend to owner to restore the front façade.
- Concern that representations of floor levels as drawn in presentation materials is not as built in mock-up or seen by neighbors.



- Also modest building is being asked to do too much.
- Concern that there is an awful lot going on with a modest building. Commissioners have at times observed that total massing of rooftop plus rear yard can be overburdening.
- Here, where rear yard addition has already been built, only chance to affect would be to scale back the rooftop addition.
- Also concern about stability of existing walls (especially given neglect of front façade).
- Scale back rooftop makes sense.
- Length of rooftop addition is 37' – possibility of scaling back.
- Courtyards are a part of the donut-like environment. Light and air equally valid.
- Concerns of light and air are valid.
- Concern also for precedent.

In lieu of approval or disapproval – resolution to convey a report

- Given lack of care and attention to the restoration of the building's existing condition and structure we cannot approve;
- Lack of plan for building as a whole;
- Unable to evaluate accuracy of the proposal as depicted vs testimony of neighbors;
- Mention of dimensions of bulk being added a building in this condition.

Resolution to report concerns without approval or disapproval.

VOTE: 4-0-0-0; non-committee 0-1-0-0

Adjourn 12:45 am

Present:

Preservation: Jay Adolf, Gabrielle Palitz, Mark N. Diller, Miki Fiegel, Meisha Hunter and Lee P. Kwan.

Absent: Blanche E. Lawton.

Parks: Klari Neuwelt **Chair:** Elizabeth Caputo. **Board Member:** Christian Bray.



Parks & Environment Committee Meeting Minutes
Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Starkey, Co-Chairpersons
November 18, 2013

Meeting Start: 7:05 pm

Item 1: Damrosch Park.

Cleo Dana updated the committee on Damrosch Park. She said the Big Apple Circus, taking a cue from Fashion Week, has “invaded every inch of the park” and is now parking huge empty trailers along the park’s north edge. She requests that CB7 tell Lincoln Center that it is aware that the park is being used as a parking lot and request the trailers be moved to another area where there are now empty trailers. She suggested committee members visit the area to see the scene. Elizabeth Caputo reported that Fashion Week will no longer be using the park, although it is unclear how soon that will be.

Item 2: Central Park Conservancy proposal to reconstruct the Fort Clinton and Nutter’s Battery overlooks (joint with Preservation Committee).

Lane Addonizio of the Conservancy gave a fascinating presentation on the two overlooks, situated on bluffs above the Harlem Meer, which were used as forts during the Revolutionary War and the War of 1812. The planned work is the next phase of the larger \$22 million “Met to Meer Landscape Project.” The overall idea of the reconstructions is to better integrate the overlooks with the surrounding landscape. Cost will be about \$500,000, with funding coming from both the City and the Conservancy. Work will likely commence in March 2014 and be completed within three months.

Resolution to approve the final design for the planned work:

Committees: 8-0-0-0. Non-Committee Board Members: 3-0-1-0.

Item 3: Department of Parks and Recreation public art proposal for three sculptures by artist/musician Herb Alpert in Dante Square, Jan.-April 2014.

Jonathan Kuhn, the DPR Director of Art and Antiquities, along with Gary Zarr and Rex Unger of the marketing/communications firm of Phil & Co., presented a proposal to install three bronze, 17-foot tall totem-like sculptures by musician and artist Herb Alpert in Dante Square from Jan. 25 to April 15, 2014. The sculptures will be mounted either on circular metal plates secured to the existing paving stones or on concrete, which would require the temporary removal of some paving stones. Responding to concerns, Zarr assured the committee that the sculptures will not represent a climbing nuisance.

Resolution to “welcome the project”:

Committees: 7-0-0-0. Non-Committee Board Members: 3-0-1-0.

Item 4: Discussion of how the NYC Clean Heat Initiative program is working in our neighborhood.

Kenneth Camilleri, an operations manager for NYC Clean Heat, brought the committee up to date on progress on the city’s efforts to reduce and eventually eliminate the use of #4 and #6 heating oil, so-called “heavy” heating oils, in our district and throughout the city. Although about 160 buildings in our district have switched to cleaner-burning #2oil, natural gas, or geothermal power, the Upper West Side is still the biggest emitter of particulate matter, which is a byproduct of burning heavy oil. CB7 is one of the top four CBs in the city for burning #4 and #6, in large part due to the age and size of its residential building stock. The remaining 430 buildings in the district that have not yet converted are emitting 54 tons of particulate matter into the air each year, and Camilleri asked for the CB’s help in reaching out to building



owners and explaining the environmental and economic benefits of switching to cleaner-burning fuel. He pointed to significant drops in pollution from heavy heating oils citywide as a result of the conversion program. For example, nickel emissions are down 35 percent, and it is estimated that the air quality gains so far have prevented 780 deaths. Community member Bob Wyman urged Camilleri and the city to do more to promote conversions to non-fossil fuel-based power sources.

Item 5: Update on free kayaking at 72nd Street.

In connection with the Hudson River Park Trust's current Request for Proposals for licensees to run kayak operations at four locations in Hudson River Park, CB7 wrote a letter to the Trust saying that the availability of free kayaking on the Hudson at 72nd Street has been a great benefit to our community. Because of, among other things, restrictions in the RFP on a single organization being licensed for multiple sites, it appears that the Downtown Boathouse, the group that has operated the 72nd Street site, will not be able to bid for the Pier 96 (56th Street) site. A new not-for-profit organization, Manhattan Community Boathouse, has been formed, and it anticipates submitting a proposal for the Pier 96 site, with the hope that if it is awarded that concession it will be able to take over running the free kayaking program at 72nd Street.

Item 5: Updates on committee business

CB7 has been advised by DPR that there have been about 18 bids for Riverside Park's Sea Rail contract; DPR is now interviewing the lowest bidders. Also that the Riverside Park FEMA money to repair Superstorm Sandy damage is moving through the pipeline toward being used in the park, though there is currently no date for the work.

A member of the community raised concerns that the new Tavern on the Green restaurant operator plans to cook its food in an environmentally unfriendly "fire-driven Argentine restaurant style." Committee co-chair Klari Neuwelt will try to find out how the operator plans to cook its food. Community member Oive Freud said that the CB should do more to fight the construction of several planned residential towers – two of which will be nearly as tall as the Empire State Building – that will cast shadows over the southern part of Central Park. It was suggested that she bring the issue to the CB's Land Use committee.

Meeting adjourned at 9:30 pm.

Present:

Parks: Klari Neuwelt, Isaac Booker, Elizabeth Caputo, Ken Coughlin, Phyllis E. Gunther, Meisha Hunter, Joanne Imohiosen and Evan Rosing. **On leave:** Elizabeth Starkey. **Preservation:** Lee P. Kwan. **Chair:** Elizabeth Caputo. **Board Members:** Christian Bray and Barbara Van Buren.



Steering Committee Meeting Minutes
Elizabeth Caputo, Chair
November 19, 2013
6:30 pm at CB7 Offices

Quorum present. Elizabeth Caputo called the meeting to order at 6:33 p.m.

Bylaws.

- Dan Zweig spoke about who will present a motion that is spearheaded by someone other than the chair/co-chairs of a committee. Proposed striking relevant line from the bylaws.
- S. Robotti would like to maintain the practice of having one who voted in favor of the resolution to speak first.
- General discussion of how to address the issue; either maintain the bylaws as they are and accept the board chair's interpretation, or amend the bylaws to clarify the concerns raised.
- Mr. Zweig suggested that since we've had a discussion and a shared understanding of what they bylaws mean, he is fine with it staying as it is.

December FB Agenda Planning

- Ms. Caputo - the December 3 full board meeting will begin December meeting with Amsterdam Avenue redesign followed by the Chatsworth and 101 West 78th Street and Land Use.
- No public comments on Amsterdam Redesign, just Board discussion.
- adjustment to agenda to remove one issue presentation under land use, as no vote will be needed.
- No resolution from Housing.
- Move YEL before preservation but after Land Use.

November FB Follow-up – Conflict of Interest Policy

Ms. Caputo passed around conflict of interest policy as a reminder for the Board members and the Committee Co-Chairs/Chairs. Discussion about the interplay of the conflict of interest policy in the NYC Charter & Code and the bylaws of Community Board 7. Request to confirm that the bylaws on the website match the bylaws that were approved during the last set of minutes.

Website – Committee Descriptions and Outreach

Ms. Caputo reintroduce committee descriptions that were previously on CB7's website and asked for updates that will be posted. Committees' members will also be posted.

Committee Reports

Housing – we expect a renewed interest in housing issues with the deBlasio administration and we are reviewing the Board's housing resolutions from 1990 through 2013.

HHS – we are interested in the deBlasio administration's interest in the homeless. We also want to focus on accessibility in the community.

Preservation – the hot issues are the rooftop additions proposed in several areas.

BCI – We are expanding and are working further on the B2B meetings. In the near future we want to explore seasonal jobs for youths and will work with YEL before the summer job season. A consumer



issue coming up on privacy. Linda Alexander is working to reach out to cultural organizations. We have identified a need for workshops targeted to new businesses to familiarize them with procedures and rules.

Transportation – we are making onsite inspections of the intersections identified in DOT’s study of the UWS. . We are meeting about Stranger’s Gate to move the bus stop. The M86 between B’way and West End bus stop needs to be re-instated. Reviewing Museum of Natural History’s new school bus plan. The 81st Street folks need follow up on previous meetings. We need to review truck loading zones to avoid double parking and new M60-SPS route that will save time going to JFK. Also reviewing bulb outs to shorten pedestrian crossings.

Parks & Environment – good joint meetings with YEL and Preservation. We are making progress in converting boilers from #6 oil to #2 or dual fuel.

YEL – The Beacon school building us will continue to be a project. PS 166 yard is an ongoing frustration. Working with BCI on how to get businesses to hire youths in the summer.

Task Force Updates:

- Pedestrian Safety Study (95th -97th Streets, CP Park to the River) – ready to submit report to NYC DOT.
- Beacon Building/ Public School Site Redevelopment – A new community education council was elected last spring and is taking up this issue. Expectation that CB7 and CEC can work together. The YEL will host the working group and draft out future goals this Thursday.
- New Task Force Proposal – Roberta semer is interested in chairing a new task force. She will present to Steering in January.

Fund for the City of New York planning fellow work.

Developing preliminary presentation for YEL group, focused on access to youth programs and services.

Outreach for Board Applications – Recruitment

Ms. Caputo reported that new applications for community board membership are out. Asked that we recruit people who may be interested in the Board, specifically those who may be interested in under-staffed committees. Applications due on 2/1/2014. Appointments will occur in April 2014.

Request for Leave of Absence

Tom Vitullo-Martin has also requested a 3 month leave of absence retroactive to November 1, 2013.

Vote to approve the leave of absence: Committee: 12-0-0-0. Non-Committee Board Member: 1-0-0-0.

Upcoming Non-Board Community Event Invitation

We have received a request to add our name as sponsor of an event (party) for typhoon relief. Since there was no consensus, the Steering Committee chose to table the issue.

Present: Elizabeth Caputo, Jay Adolph, Andrew Albert, Louis Cholden-Brown, Mark Diller, DeNora Getachew, Brian Jenks, Marisa Maack, Klari Neuwelt, Gabrielle Palitz, Michele Parker, Nick Prigo, Suzanne Robotti, Madge Rosenberg, Barbara Van Buren, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero and Dan Zweig.
Board Member: Paul Fisher. **On-Leave:** Elizabeth Starkey. **Absent:** Richard Asche, Page Cowley, and Marc Glazer.



**Minutes of the Land Use Committee
Richard Asche and Page Cowley, Co-Chairpersons
November 20, 2013**

Joint with Parks & Environment Committee, Klari Neuwelt and Elizabeth Starkey, Co-Chairpersons

1. Riverside South, Sixth Modification to Restrictive Declaration.

Klari Neuwelt, Co-Chairperson of the Parks and Environment Committee provided the committee with background information.

Nick Molinari, Director of Planning from the NYC Department of Parks and Recreation explained the application and process as follows:

- We are being asked to opine on a modification of the Riverside South Special Permit and the Restrictive Declaration.
- The modification changes the plan from a seven phase process to a six phase process.
- Currently Phase 5 plans are being considered by the state.
- The bidding date is projected to take place in February, 2014 and selection by October, 2014.
- Construction is expected to begin in January, 2015 and to be completed in January, 2017.

Marcia Kesner, a Planning and Development Specialist from Kramer Levin Naftalis & Frankel explained the phasing plan:

- Phase 5 and parts of Phase 6 will be merged into the new Phase 5.
- In order to build the new Phase 5, \$12 million in dedicated Federal funds will be applied to the project.
- The text change will allow the Parks Department to do the work of the new Phase 5.

Resolution: To approve Application #M20358 (F) ZSM to the Department of City Planning by Hudson Waterfront Associates, L.P., to modify the Riverside South Restrictive Declaration with respect to the construction of the Park and the design of the remaining Park Phases.

Vote to approve the application:

Committee: 4 - 0 - 2 - 0

Non -Committee Board Members: 2 - 0 - 0 - 0

2. Riverside South. Informational presentation

Ethan Goodman, Director of New York Planning and Project Management for Fox Rothschild LLP gave our committee an informational presentation on an application to the Department of City Planning by Hudson Waterfront Associates, L.P. and the Collegiate School for modifications to the Riverside South Special Permit and Restrictive Declaration to allow the development of site K2 as a single purpose nine-story K-12 school.

The project will be repurposing K2 from a residential to community purposes
55 units of affordable housing will be built before the construction of the school.



Tom Gluck of Gluck+ presented the massing and preliminary architectural drawings of the project. The planned school is within the development envelope permitted by the zoning

Committee members expressed concerns about traffic patterns, traffic volume, types of vehicles that will be bringing students and plans for staggered hours of students' arrival and departure for different levels of the school.

3. 110 West 73rd Street (Columbus Avenue.) Arte Café

The committee found no problem with the plan to expand the restaurant to a basement use across a district boundary line as describe by the applicant.

Resolution: To approve the Application #269-13-BZ to the Board of Standards and Appeals by Marvin B. Mitzner, LLC on behalf of Robert Malta, to permit the expansion of the Arte Café restaurant, a conforming use, across a district boundary line onto the subject premise.

Vote to approve the application:

Committee: 5 - 0 - 0 - 0

Non -Committee Board Members: 2 - 0 - 0 - 0

4. 175 West 90th Street, Heywood Tower (Amsterdam Avenue.)

The application presented was for street level commercial space to be extended to the southern end of the Amsterdam Avenue building frontage in conformance with Large Scale Residential Development guidelines. The application included neither expansion nor repurposing. All of the community residents present expressed support for the modification.

The committee provided information to the applicant about acceptable extension of the frontage area.

Resolution: To approve Application #M920493 (G) ZAM to the Department of City Planning by Heywood Towers Associates, requesting a modification of the previously approved Large Scale Residential Development (CP-18505, West Side LSRD) within the former West Side Urban Renewal Area, involving the conversion of the existing accessory residential floor area on the ground floor to commercial use, in an existing 20-story mixed use building at the above referenced location.

Vote to approve the application:

Committee: 5 - 0 - 0 - 0

Non -Committee Board Members: 2 - 0 - 0 - 0

Present: Richard Asche, Sheldon J. Fine, Brian Jenks, Roberta Semer and Ethel Sheffer. **Chair:** Elizabeth Caputo. **Parks & Environment:** Klari Neuwelt. **Board Member:** Mark N. Diller. **Absent:** Page Cowley, DeNora Getachew, Helen Rosenthal and Howard Yaruss.

**Youth, Education & Libraries Committee Meeting Minutes****Marisa Maack, Chair****November 21, 2013**

Vanesa Samuda – recreation specialist with the Gertrude Ederle Recreation Center on West 60th Street gave a short presentation on the offerings at the rec center and their desire to reach out to teens on programming other than basketball. She will continue to come to CB 7 meetings to leave materials and do outreach.

Beacon School Working Group

YEL Committee was joined by members of the working group as they discussed their proposal for the school site.

There was 1 public comment on this topic, Ann Binstock representing the D3 Presidents' Council advocated for a middle school and high school with D3 priority for the site and as a PS 87 parent association officer asked for a focus on creating strong general education middle school seats.

Discussion was extensive on the Working Group recommendations of ages served, admissions model and curriculum.

There was an emphases on how to both be welcoming and serve students from the entire district through the creation of a strong general education program.

The unanimous consensus was that the type of leader selected would be critical and continued community input through that selection process, much like a C-30 process, would be critical.

There was consensus by YEL to adopt the Working Group proposals after our discussion and revisions. However, a resolution vote was postponed so as to bring the proposal before CEC and get their input so there is general agreement and we speak with one voice.

Agreed to a pre-meeting before Full Board to vote on a resolution.

GreenFlea

Rachel Laiserin, a member of the GreenFlea Board of Directors, brought a request for support of a one-year extension of the market's current contract.

She explained the current director and founder, Judith Gehrke, is retiring just as the contract expires and GreenFlea must go through another RFP. The Board believes it will be difficult for a new director to operate under someone else's RFP. They believe it is essential to future success that they have the time to find a new Executive Director and then go through the RFP process.

There was some discussion of needing to hear from other applicants but since the RFP has not yet been issued, there is no requirement to hear from all applicants.

Decided on a resolution rather than letter to show strong support for the market and its unique role in providing needed funds to neighboring school parent associations.

Resolution approved: committee members 4-0-0, non committee members 3-0-0

Meeting adjourned 9:00pm

Present: Marisa Maack, Isaac Booker, Paul Fisher and Eric Shuffler. **Chair:** Elizabeth Caputo. **Board Members:** Mark N. Diller and Christian Bray. **Absent:** Blanche Lawton and Helen Rosenthal.