

COMMUNITY BOARD 7/MANHATTAN

FULL BOARD MEETING MINUTES

October 6, 2020 at 6:30pm

Mark N. Diller, Chairperson

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Tuesday, October 6, 2020, via Zoom. Chair Mark Diller called the meeting to order at 6:33 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

Present: Mark Diller, Chair; Louisa Craddock, Doug Kleiman, Courtney Clark Metakis, Julian Giordano, Josh Cohen, William Ortiz, Sara Lind, K Karpen, Seema Reddy, Beverly Donohue, Madelyn Innocent, Andrew Rigie, Melissa Rosenberg, Andrew Albert, Jay Adolf, Roberta Semer, Linda Alexander, Douglas McGowan, Barbara Adler, Jeanette Rausch, Susan Schwartz, Natasha Kazmi, Rosa Arenas, Meg Schmitt, Ken Coughlin, Rich Robbins, Michele Parker, Ethel Sheffer, Amy Hyman, Audrey Isaacs, Blanche Lawton, Elizabeth Caputo, Howard Yaruss, Ira Mitchneck, Klari Neuwelt, Madge Rosenberg, Peter Samton, Polly Spain, Richard Asche, Robert Espier, Sheldon Fine, Steven Brown and Paul Fischer.

Public Service Announcement:

Jason Haber: Aiming to give out turkeys to feed 5,000 people this Thanksgiving with Goddard Riverside. If anyone wants to volunteer in a safe way, email jason@jasonhaber.com. No donations are taken, but you can help. The date is Tuesday, September 24th.

Business Session:

Preservation Committee, K Karpen and Michele Parker, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

1. **26 West 95 th Street** (Columbus Avenue – Central Park West.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a rooftop addition, rear addition, cellar and rear yard excavation.

- Jeanette: Is there a constraint on the sidewalk width with the stoop going straight out?
- Michele: No. Not with a straight stoop. If there was an L-shaped stoop there would have been.
- Richard: If LPC considers a matter we consider at committee before our Full Board meeting, we should be notified so that we can individually weigh in if we want.
- Rich: I am against enlargements of brownstones. It impacts the row of houses and the donut in the back, and it greatly impacts neighbors. There's no reason to enlarge brownstones. I'm voting against this.
- **The resolution to approve was adopted. VOTE: 40-5-0-0.** The vote was taken using the virtual "raise hand" feature of the Zoom platform.

Directed by the City Charter mandate that Community Boards review matters prior to consideration by the Landmarks Preservation Commission, the Preservation Committee reviews the "appropriateness" of proposed changes to individually designated landmarks as well as to properties listed within the Upper West Side's Historic Districts.

Business & Consumer Issues Committee, Linda Alexander and Christian Cordova, Co-Chairpersons

Resolution Re:

New applications to the SLA for two year liquor licenses:

2. **373 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 78 th Street) T. Chubinidze d/b/a To be Determined.
3. **225 Columbus Avenue** (West 70 th Street) 225 Rest Corp d/b/a To be Determined.
4. **201 West 106 th Street** (Amsterdam Avenue) Luke Guy LLC, d/b/a Calaveras Corner.
5. **2 West 69 th Street** (Central Park West) APQ Mineral Springs LLC, d/b/a La Pain Quotidien.
 - **All four resolutions to approve were adopted. VOTE: 44-0-0-0.** The vote was taken using the virtual "raise hand" feature of the Zoom platform.

Alteration and Class Change Application:

6. **15 West End Avenue** (West 60 th Street) Ivory & White Markets d/b/a Morton Williams.
 - **The resolution to approve was adopted. VOTE: 41-1-0-0.** The vote was taken using the virtual "raise hand" feature of the Zoom platform.

Alteration License:

7. **2450 Broadway** (West 90 th Street) Carmine's Broadway Feast Inc d/b/a Carmine's. Alteration License to include next door lobby to serve delivery/outgoing drinks.
 - Doug: To clarify, they already have a full liquor license, they're just extending their space.
 - **The resolution to approve was adopted. VOTE: 42-0-1-0.** The vote was taken using the virtual "raise hand" feature of the Zoom platform.

Transportation Committee, Andrew Albert and Howard Yaruss, Co-Chairpersons

Resolution Re:

8. Asking for the DOT to not have a sponsor for a curb extension; specifically about the SW corner of 96 th and WEA.
- Jay: What will the extension look like?
 - Andrew Albert: There are a number of different treatments used by DOT. The result is a safer turn for pedestrians and a more visible curb for vehicles. The two lanes are maintained with the extension.
 - Roberta: In 2017, the Principal of the school wrote a letter to the Board about the safety issue. I urge everybody to vote for this. The school is willing to remove snow when school is in session, but they aren't willing to sign on as an official sponsor.
 - Michele:
 - Andrew Albert: The sponsor does heavy snow removal and other maintenance.
 - Ken: Curb extensions are crucial safety features, but they require a maintenance partner that also has insurance. It doesn't make sense that to make something safer, they need to get insurance, but to keep it dangerous, they don't need insurance. This is also a matter of equity. It's hard to find maintenance partners with insurance, especially in low-income neighborhoods.
 - Richard Asche: My concern is that the letter should be strong and indignant enough that it gets DOT's attention.
 - Rich: This is essential, we shouldn't need a sponsor. Friendly amendment: "Curb extensions are proven to save lives. We shouldn't need a community sponsor to install a critical safety measure at a very dangerous intersection directly in front of an elementary school."
 - Amy: Thank you everyone for supporting this, this is very important for students as PS 75.
 - **The resolution was approved. VOTE: 40-0-3-0.** The vote was taken using the virtual "raise hand" feature of the Zoom platform.
9. Amendment to CB7's Bylaws re-election procedures.
- Adam Herbst, Public: Will the community still be able to know in advance who the people up for the positions on the Board are?
 - Mark: Yes. We don't change anything else in the bylaws. Candidates are nominated at the meeting prior to when they are voted on (in this case, September).
 - Adam Rosenberg, Public: Wanted to make sure there's clarity to the public.
 - Mark: We will conduct the election in real-time and continue to make it clear to the public.
 - **The amendment was approved. VOTE: 42-0-1-0.** The vote was taken by roll call.

Approval of minutes from previous full board meeting

- The minutes were adopted by acclamation.

Election of Board officers for 2020 to 2021 Committee

Joshua Cohen, Chair, Elections

- The nominated candidates (Mark Diller, Chair; Andre Rigie, Vice Chair; Doug Kleinman, Vice Chair; Beverly Donohue, Co-Secretary; Julian Giordano, Co-Secretary) gave short bios.
- Elizabeth: How will you prioritize issues of race and gender on the Board going forward?
- Mark: We are trying to pull together an inward-facing bit of work on issues of race, equity, accountability, and transparency. We're working with the Borough President's Office to tailor something to our Board.
- Catherine: Can you be more explicit? You explained that there isn't funding for us to do anti-racist training as a Board, what are your plans for what to do to support diversity and inclusion?
- Mark: My intention is to convene a Diversity and Inclusion Taskforce that discusses this. There are a lot of details to work out, and I would like to do this with the Diversity and Inclusion Taskforce.
- Josh Cohen: (following voting) Mark Diller has been elected the Chair, Andrew Rigie the first Vice-Chair and Doug Kleiman the Second Vice-Chair, and Bev Donohue and Julian Giordano the Co-Secretaries.

Report from the NYPD 20th and 24th Precincts

Captain Zuber, 20th Precinct:

We're following trendlines when it comes to crime. The trends are following what we expect. As compared with the rest of the city, we are not seeing violent crime in the 20th Precinct.

Deputy Inspector Yaguchi, 24th Precinct:

There has been an inordinate number of shootings this summer (9) up by 8 from last year. We're not seeing the violence we did in July, but we're still seeing spots. Burglaries are up, commercial burglaries mainly during overnight hours, and residential burglaries are mainly package thefts. We are down in robberies.

Public Questions:

Maria Danzilo: Member of UWS for Safer Streets. 40 year resident of UWS. Asking the Community Board to take our issues seriously. Community Board 1 tried to stop the movement of homeless people into their neighborhood based on the issues experienced on the UWS. We feel that the Board is not hearing us or taking us seriously. The Lucerne has turned into a huge circus. There were two major crime incidents, including the assault of a person. The irony of having a ribbon-cutting ceremony at the same time as someone is being assaulted.

Jodi Markoff: Lived on UWS for 25 years. Never felt so unsafe until now. The police are doing a great job with what they have. I hardly see police, but I see homeless people on every corner. I've been approached aggressively many times. The UWS has not seen this condition in 25 years.

Captain Zuber: We've been working hard to address quality of life issues. When you see a crime, please call 911. This enables us to get the best possible response and document it for our analysis. We've seen drastic improvements, thanks to officers on the street and community members.

Inspector Yaguchi: Speak up at Community Council meetings, it helps us address issues.

Mark: Please use decorum in the chat.

Megan Martin: I was the eyewitness of an attack on Columbus between 70-71st street. I have never seen anything like this. This past weekend I saw four violent incidents. These incidents are not normal and we need to find solutions. Do we need more patrols, more plainclothes officers, more cameras? The NYPD is the greatest resource to keep community members safe.

Captain Zuber: In terms of the Rick Moranis assault, that seems to be a completely random attack. The attempted robbery of the cell phone store wasn't an attempted robbery. They went in to have a cell phone repaired and had an argument with the owner. Both of these investigations are ongoing. Not to minimize any victim, but when you look at the numbers, there is a hyper-awareness on the Upper West Side. The numbers are not drastically different and the types of crime aren't different. There's just a lot more awareness. This allows us to drill down on it and put our office where they're needed best. We are facing budget cuts, and we can't use overtime to put extra officers on the street or in different neighborhoods. We have a minimum manning list, and we never go below that number, so there are always sufficient officers working.

Megan Martin: Perception is reality. People who have lived in this neighborhood are noticing an uptick in crime. What can our community do? People don't feel safe.

Captain Zuber: We have points of contact in all business and apartment buildings to do video canvassing and get "wanted" posters out in almost real-time. We're seeing an uptick in package burglary. The community can get the information out there not to leave Amazon packages outside or in lobbies. Try to get them out of the hallways of the second/third floors. Keep the building secure: lock doors, don't buzz anyone in.

Peter Arndtsen: I hope that you can talk about guns and gangs and how that's being reduced. In addition, with fewer people out on the street, people with mental health issues are more of a presence. In many cases, these people disappear before police can reach them. We really appreciate having the open street space for restaurants.

Taylor Banning: Homelessness is not a crime. We should show respect when speaking about homeless individuals. Can the officers on the call share the tools they use and that their officers use to support the homeless?

Inspector Yaguchi: Our homeless outreach unit has been disbanded. Our officers got to know a homeless man encamped at 96th street. There was an incident in which he was shouting "I want to kill people" and we called an ambulance for him. He came back the next day and was able to talk to our officers because of the relationship they had formed, but he left

the next day. We understand that homelessness is not a crime. We're trying to deal with it by talking to them and getting help. We also reached out to Goddard Riverside for support.

Cristie Diamond: By what percentage are 311 quality of life complaints up, and can you speak about the broad categories of 311 complaints?

Captain Zuber: 311 is designed for non-emergency calls regarding any service throughout the city. Homelessness was the most drastic increase. I don't have specific numbers with me. In almost all precincts the number one complaint is noise, but in the 20th Precinct, it is now homelessness.

Sandra Smith: Captain Zuber, can you explain bail reform? What are police officers allowed to do regarding violent and non-violent crime? It seems that the same person can perpetuate the same crime over and over again.

Captain Zuber: Bail reform started 15-16 months ago in NYC. It felt that giving cash bail was unfair. It stopped people from being held in jail until they had their court date. We've seen a drastic increase in the number of recidivists.

Nicole Metzger: Has Helen Rosenthal reached out to either of you directly regarding your resourcing needs.

Captain Zuber: I do speak with Councilmember Helen Rosenthal a couple of times a week. Our staffing issues aren't decided relating to her. I believe the issue is 100% budget constraints.

Nicole Metzger: It's crucial we get additional funding for the NYPD.

Erica Gerson: I was born and raised on the UWS, have 4 children, and we regularly volunteer at and donate to homeless shelters. It is a fact that our community is overburdened with our fair share of shelters and beds. No community can do this alone. We have to do this in a way that is sustaining. It's a fact that people who are drug-addicted need to resort to crime to deal with their addiction. When we ask at the end of the crime if we will give our name and phone number, is it true that criminals can access that? Is it more difficult for our case if we don't share our contact information?

Inspector Yaguchi: I think the discovery rules have been fixed to protect the identity of the victims. It is not more difficult for our case if you don't share contact information.

Madelyn Innocent: I was wondering about mask-wearing. How are police enforcing mask-wearing? How should I approach people not wearing masks?

Inspector Yaguchi: You can let us know the stores you're having mask issues with and we can speak with the store owner and if it is a chronic issue we can report it to the Sheriffs.

Amy Hyman: There are many times that police officers are engaging with the public without wearing masks. Also, how have 911 calls increased over the summer?

Inspector Yaguchi: There was an increase in 911 calls over the summer.

Captain Zuber: We don't track 911 calls. Police also show up for calls for which there isn't a crime.

Sara Lind: Can you talk a little bit more about the rise in shootings?

Inspector Yaguchi: A lot of the players are repeats, and arrests have been made. I can't get into too much detail. We have identified the individuals that are involved, and many of them are the same. When the cases do go to trial, we're looking for a strong case to get them off the streets.

Courtney Metakis: Is there a strategy in place to address localized upticks? Data collection is very important. The city needs the data to track trendlines so I encourage everyone to download the 311 app.

Captain Zuber: We take the statistics and we deploy our officers accordingly. The former anti-crime officers are being renamed as the suppression team. A lot of people have shared they're afraid to call 911: if you're not sure, call 911. Our 911 operators know what to reroute to 311, but 311 will not upload things.

Jay Adolf: Open streets have created enormous problems. Do you have an opinion as to whether or not it's time to restore West End Avenue to its original configuration? It definitely helped during the pandemic to let people spread out. I agree that it does create a huge traffic issue, but that is a DOT decision.

Chair's Report

Mark Diller

- The November Full Board will be on Wednesday, November 4th.
- The October Housing meeting has been rescheduled to October 26th.
- I want to thank the election committee for charting this new territory.
- The Steering committee is on the 20th, and we will discuss issues that don't fit squarely into one committee at that meeting.
- Shout out to One Block UWS and Broadway Malls who have done cleanups.
- I'll end with 2020census.gov

Community Session:

We welcome all members of our community (residents, businesses, CBOs) who would like to speak on issues of interest to them. Members of the community are granted 90 seconds for remarks, and we will also accept a written copy for the record.

Manhattan Borough President's Report, Gale Brewer:

In terms of schools, there is a lack of devices. District 1 is missing 534 devices. We gave out masks, hand-sanitizer, and census information on the first day of school. With the extension of the census, we've sent out mailers to New Yorkers outside of the city to make sure they fill it out for New York. In October we're going to focus on the lowest-performing census tract in each Community Board. I am swamped with helicopter complaints. It's frustrating, we don't know from where or how many are tourists. After-hours variances are another issue. People are allowed to do development until midnight. Everybody's complaining about police officers not wearing masks. If you're told that you don't have to wear it when talking with your fellow officers, there's something weird about that. Adding on to Dick Gottfried's comment about the mechanical void loopholes, there is also a BSA challenge in the works. I worry about seniors and food. Senior centers are not open, so we wrote a long letter. The issue of open data is something we spend a lot of time on. I encourage you to check the open data report. It helps say what is going on in your community. We have a vacant storefront report coming up in February. I want to thank Mark Diller for the implicit bias training suggestions. We've hosted sessions with the Commission on Human Rights as well.

Reports by Elected Officials

Assemblymember Richard Gottfried, District 75

The positive ruling on the mechanical voids decision is really positive. There has been a lot of advocacy for people to vote by mail. People should certainly do that. I really want to encourage everyone who is willing and able to do so to vote in-person. It's really important that the West Sides' votes show up as part of the national total on the news networks on election night. Even if you submit an absentee ballot, you can still vote in-person and the BOE will disregard your absentee ballot.

Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal, District 67

There was an article in the New York Times about how bail reform has actually not affected the crime numbers. Bail was never meant to keep people behind bars because you are innocent until proven guilty. An NYPD report that has not been distributed also said that bail reform has not caused a spike in crime. I had a bill that went into effect yesterday regarding the "pink tax," which is now against the law. In terms of the mechanical voids, I hope you can read the decision by the judge, which so clearly states how illogical it is. I have a bill in Albany with Senator Jackson that would make the multiple dwelling law stricter. In MLK, the HVAC system hasn't worked properly in years. The Special Music School in the basement has no windows to circulate air. I'm in touch with the DOE and other stakeholders about how to fix this issue. My annual flu shot day is on Tuesday, October 20th from 10-3. If you're interested, please email or call my office. We're having a rat academy on November 17th. In Albany, we intend to tax billionaires in multi-millionaires. The President has now called

off talks on the stimulus deal, which we were waiting for to discuss the tax. Don't forget to vote! Go to [vote.nyc](https://www.vote.nyc) if you have questions about how to register.

Councilmember Helen Rosenthal, District 6

I've heard peoples' concerns and questions. I've spent a lot of time on the phone speaking up with many of you who talked tonight. I feel terrible that people feel so afraid to come out of their homes. Fill out your census! The issues my colleagues mentioned are all important. We'll have a shredding event coming up as well as an upcoming housing clinic (find more at helenrosenthal.com). Composting is back at the 79th street greenmarket. The 5 cent fee for plastic bags will begin soon. We've been handing out reusable bags if you need one, let my office know. Sadly, we had to kick out a member of the City Council due to the abuse of his staff. I just got off a panel discussion on maternal mortality and morbidity. If the HHS committee is interested in addressing the ridiculously high rates of black maternal mortality and morbidity.

Congressman Jerry Nadler, District 10

I hope everyone is remaining safe and healthy. Last week, the House passed an updated HEROES act, which expanded relief (stimulus checks, rent reliefs, SNAP benefits, etc.) and other important COVID-19 resources. Don't hesitate to reach out to my staff if we can be of any assistance.

State Senator Robert Jackson, District 31

I was listening to all of the conversations, and it was a good opportunity to hear an entire Board meeting, and my liaisons were on as well. We've been trying to up our census count, which we are low at. Friday is the last day to register to vote. We're surprised how many people aren't registered to vote. We're waiting to see what happens at the federal level in terms of the budget. Twenty percent of all education funding around the state has been held up. The most important thing is the federal government acting. In the meantime, I'm going out in the community trying to do what we can do to survive. We have an obligation under our state constitution to take care of the poor. We have to find a way to do that with dignity and respect for everyone, and juggling people all over the place isn't the way to do it.

State Senator Brad Hoylman, District 27

Earlier today was protesting with Helen Rosenthal about the fact that musicians on late-night television shows are not paid residuals when those shows broadcast on YouTube or other streaming platforms. My office instituted "Community Board budgeting," asking the Board on how to use the funding - thank you CB7 for your contribution. A lot of constituents have pointed out that police officers aren't wearing face masks, I sent a letter to the police commissioner calling this out. I hope we see more officers wearing face masks.

Reports by Elected Officials' Representatives (One-minute remarks):

Liam Galligan, State Assemblymember Danny O'Donnell's Office:

Hosting a free shedding on October 18th with Councilmember Rosenthal and Senator Jackson between 12pm-3pm. If having trouble with unemployment issues, reach out to us. Under bail reform updates in this year's budget, if you commit an offense while you have been released, regardless of the second offense, you will be subject to bail. Encourage everyone to read the code.

Michael Stinson, NYC Comptroller Scott Stringer's Office:

Congressman Espaillat and Comptroller Stringer sent a letter to the Department of Sanitation calling on the city to take immediate steps to address overflowing litter baskets and rat issues. They proposed recommendations to remedy these issues, including working with BIDs and business owners to add flexibility to business and broaden the clean curbs pilot program. The Comptroller also sent a letter to the DOE and Mayor asking for non-binary gender options in remote learning. Fill out the census, get a flu shot, and vote!

Public Comment:

Shams Da Homeless Hero

I've lived in the UWS for three years and now under Project Renewal at the Lucerne and I feel great about being in this community. I hope we can deal with the homeless crisis creatively. A couple of days ago we did an event to show the love and support the community has for those experiencing homelessness. Unfortunately, for the first time in my life, I saw hate and racism up close and personal. I'm the descendant of slaves and the product of over 400 years of overt and covert oppression. I didn't understand what was coming from the mouths of residents of the community. I wish I was able to talk to them and say that they aren't speaking on facts and I wish we could come together to clarify some of these things so

you could come to a greater understanding of what those experiencing homelessness are going through. I believe that a lot of people have legitimate concerns, and I'm an advocate for any community I'm in because I want to feel safe. I fight from within and without. Unfortunately, the city did us and the community a disservice by moving us here quickly without establishing any rapport with the community and the supportive services in the community. Naturally, there were going to be problems. And I've worked with people to find ways to remedy that. I wish the community would give us that chance and that they would talk to us, let us know their concerns, and find a way to work things out. Most of the things that have been attributed to us are unfactual and unwarranted and hate-filled and racist. The negative portrayal by the media put us in a situation where we could be targeted in a hateful and racist manner. Thanks to the open hearts initiative, we have experienced love from total strangers. I've told myself there's no reason to be angry. I'd like to see the community come together in a positive way. I would like to see us be able to come together and despite our differences, find a way to do things in the right way, hold the city, elected officials, and service providers accountable.

Amanda Fialk

Thank you Shams, I'm sorry that happened on Sunday. I think it's important to have dialogue in a respectful way. I've heard a lot about safety concerns on this call, but I didn't hear anything about safety concerns for Black and brown people or mentally ill people, and how they are impacted by policing. My husband and son are black, and I know that black people are killed at higher rates by the police. Additionally, a quarter of all police shootings have a victim with a mental illness diagnosis. Someone said that "perception is reality," which made me uncomfortable because I know that Black people are perceived as criminals and mentally ill people are considered dangerous.

Ryan Stoudt

I think what's going on recently is a culmination of other factors related to the decline of the neighborhood over the past few years. My question is when data turns into action because there is something going on here.

Helane Mandelker

How, as a community, do we work with different communities to address shoplifting since everything is now under lock and key?

Olivia Killingsworth

Somebody mentioned that the UWS for Safer Streets FB group has about 15,000 members but the UWS has 200,000 members. Regarding the point about the UWS doing its share to support the homeless. Pre-pandemic, we housed 1.9% of the shelter population while we have 2.2% of the city's population. Not all of the clients at the temporary shelters are drug addicts. Folks who are in recovery need stability. We should support legislation to increase the value of housing vouchers.

John Jun

DHS announced they were planning for a permanent shelter on the UWS. I've seen the UWS in the top ten of shelter beds in the city, and I want to know if the Community Board is going to be opposing this new shelter as we're already doing our fair share.

Melinda Thaler

Regardless of shelters, there are issues that we are facing. Community Board 1 has shared that they have not allowed sex offenders to be in shelters, in contrast to our leaders, who have said their hands are tied. We need to make sure that our elected representatives have the same tools to represent our community.

Zach Campbell, Community Liaison for the American Museum of Natural History

Excavation and foundation work on the Gilder Center continues. The delivery of a tower crane is anticipated to occur during one Saturday in October. Read more and sign-up for email updates at www.amnh.org/about/gilder-center.

Oz Ben-Ami

I'm really disappointed to hear discussion about pushing homeless members of our community to other places. These are people we're talking about. What can we do constructively to help people who have needs? Both as individuals and as a government?

Linda Breskin

There are some bad apples in every group. I hope the homeless receive better services. If someone commits a crime, how soon are they back on the street? I'm on UWS Safer Streets because I've witnessed masturbation and urination on my block. Can the cops do anything about public lewdness?

Rich Robbins: Not a discussion for now, but we should discuss a policy for removing people from meetings.

Mark Diller: Let's talk at steering and deputize someone to have that authority

The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 pm.

COMMUNITY BOARD 7/MANHATTAN
STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Mark Diller, Chair

October 20, 2020 at 6:30pm

Steering Committee Members Present: Mark Diller, Andrew Rigie, Doug Kleiman, Julian Giordano, Beverly Donohue, Christian Cordova, Linda Alexander, Sheldon Fine, Catherine DeLazzaro, Louisa Craddack, Melissa Rosenberg, Richard Asche, Elizabeth Caputo, Klari Neuwelt, Michele Parker, K Karpen, Andrew Albert, Howard Yaruss, Blanche Lawton, Steven Brown, Rebecca Semer

Other Board Members present: Barbara Adler, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Robert Espier, Ken Coughlan, Courtney Clark Metakis, Madelyn Innocent, Jeannette Rausch, Seema Reddy, Madge Rosenberg,

Board Staff present: Penny Ryan

Chair Mark Diller called the meeting to order. The first agenda item was the selection of separate lists of District-wide priority expense and capital budget requests for City Fiscal Year 2022, to begin next July. Mark explained the distinction between expense and capital budget eligibility -- capital budget items, financed with bond proceeds, must be projects of greater than \$50,000 in value and have a useful life of at least five years.

Expense budget priorities were discussed first. The Chair recommended four priorities and other Board members nominated programs from the lists each committee had submitted. While the initial goal was to identify 10 priority programs, the list grew to 17 as members supported additional items.

Several programs received extensive discussion.

- Restoring police overtime funding:
 - Christian Cordova supported the item as needed to address public safety in the district at a time when the City has cancelled a Police Academy class.
 - Ken Coughlan noted that the NYPD currently performs a wide range of tasks that could better be handled elsewhere. He suggested requesting mental health workers to support work currently done by the PD.
 - Melissa Rosenberg, agreeing with Ken, noted that the NYPD exceeds its overtime budget nearly every year and so their activities were unlikely to be constrained..
 - Richard Asche described police overtime as a technical issue that the Community Board lacks the expertise to evaluate and noted that overtime is easily abused.
 - Steven Brown expressed confidence that precincts 20 and 24 were well run and would use the funds wisely. He noted that support for NYPD overtime and support for reexamining the role of the NYPD were not mutually exclusive.
 - Members noted that, in the Zoom chat feature, a number of community residents strongly supported the inclusion of police overtime in the district priorities

- Because the discussion indicated a divided board on this issue, the Chair called for a vote. The vote was 12-9-0-0 to include NYPD overtime restoration as a priority request.
- Laptops for students in Community Board schools
 - Christian Cordova noted that while the Department of Education distributed thousands of iPads, schools could request one per child.
 - Blanche Lawton noted that principals who appeared before the YEL Committee felt that iPads were not adequate for distance learning and that students needed computers.
 - Louisa Craddock stated that the laptops were an immediate need because of the pandemic. It did not make sense to wait for FY 2022 to put the Board on record as strongly supporting the need for more devices.
 - Richard Asche viewed student laptops as the highest expense priority. He suggested departing from protocol and demanding devices and internet access be provided to all students.
 - Julian Giordano noted that without devices, students were falling a year and a half behind.
 - Steven Brown stated that the three principals appearing before the YEL committee had hundreds of students without devices. He suggested a need for a separate conversation on how to raise private funding to support laptop purchases.
 - Robert Espier suggested that the DOE explore hotspots for connectivity where students are using non-DOE devices.
 - Beverly Donohue suggested that laptop request be structured to include tech support personnel for the schools to ensure families can use the DOE's software.
 - Mark Diller suggested that, given the immediacy of the laptop need, the Board prepare a separate resolution for vote at November's Full Board meeting calling for additional laptop funding in the City's November Financial Plan for FY 2021. Therefore, the FY2022 Expense Priorities would not need to address this program.
 - Roberta Semer noted that the City's financial plan shows major deficits through FY2023, so requests for funding should be limited to the most urgent.
 - This suggestion was adopted and the separate resolution proposal was expanded to include two additional urgent items related to the Covid virus.
 - The vote to approve a separate resolution to recommend an amendment to the FY2021 budget was approved: Steering Committee Members: 15-0-0-0; Task Force Chairs 2-0-0-0, and non-Committee Board members 5-0-0-0.
 - Therefore the stand-alone resolution will be prepared for November's Full Board meeting requesting immediate funding for:
 - additional devices and wi-fi access for remote learning for students in District 3 who need them (with an emphasis on laptops or chromebooks since tablets/iPads are difficult to use for older grades)
 - Funding for rapid Covid testing to be made more available throughout the District
 - Funding Senior Centers so they can safely re-open, meet appropriate cleaning regimens, and provide meals and services.

Members then voted to recommend to the full Board the following list of expense budget items in the following priority order:

1. **Food Insecurity:** Funding for programs that address food insecurity, including West Side Campaign Against Hunger and Get Food NYC. More than one in ten people in Community District 7 are food insecure.
2. **Mental Health:** Funding for hospitals and healthcare facilities to provide training for medical providers in trauma-informed care and forensics (in order to care for children who are victims of sexual assault and abuse)
3. **NYCHA Broadband:** Funding to expand reliable broadband service to all residents in Housing Authority projects in the district.
4. **SYEP:** Increase funding for the number of positions available through the Summer Youth Employment Program and for extending the term and providing training for all SYEP youth employees
5. **NYPD Overtime:** Restore overtime allocation to NYPD as an effective way to supplement the ability of the police to respond to changing circumstances and create a presence when needed.
6. **After-school Programs:** Restore baseline funding for Compass, Beacon, SONYC and Cornerstone after-school and OST programs in public schools and in neighborhood CBOs in Manhattan Community District 7.
7. **Supportive Housing:** Funding to cover services and operational costs for supportive housing facilities in Community Board 7. Supportive housing is the most successful way to end homelessness for individuals and families, especially those living with physical and psychiatric disabilities.
8. **Homeless Outreach:** Funding for the Manhattan Outreach Consortium, a multiagency effort established by Goddard Riverside, to provide outreach to those experiencing street homelessness.
9. **Seven Day Trash Bin Service:** Funding to increase basket collection to seven days a week to control rodents, insects and other vermin, restoring the livability of our City during and post the Covid crisis.
10. **Restore the Community Board Budget:** Community Boards have not received a budget increase for non-personnel costs in more than 15 years, and, in a FY2021 budget cut, lost \$8,000 in funding.
11. **Permanent and Seasonal Park Workers:** Parks full-time workforce is responsible for park maintenance and cleanliness. Until the cut to the FY2021 budget, seasonal workers provided essential additional services toward maintaining the parks.
12. **Senior Centers:** There is a large percentage of seniors in the NYCHA developments in MCD7. Senior centers must be adequately funded, kept in good repair and maintained. DFTA must always ensure that they are properly staffed.
13. **PEP Officers:** Funds to hire additional park enforcement personnel for Riverside Park and Community District 7. Request is for an additional eight officers and a sergeant to increase safety and address vandalism, littering and other offenses.
14. **Technology for shelter and supportive housing residents:** Funding for access to wi-fi and cell service and staff to conduct training on technology use, needed for residents to communicate with medical and mental health providers and access care and workforce opportunities.
15. **Center for Innovation through Data Intelligence:** Funding for research on interagency approaches to addressing short- and long-term racial and economic disparities that impact Community District and city residents, particularly in health and education, in response to the Covid 19 pandemic and economic crisis.
16. **Solar Trash Compactors for Parks:** To control the rat population, install two trash compactors in Straus Park and 13-16 compactors deployed at various playgrounds in Community District 7.
17. **Dedicated enforcement staff for the anti-idling Law:** To reduce air pollution and respond to 311 complaints, provide the first routine enforcement of the anti-idling law.

Members of the Steering Committee voted 16 to 4 to approve the list as follows: Steering Committee Members: 16-4-0-0; Task Force Chairs 2-1-0-0; Non-Committee Board Members 4-2-0-0. The motion carried. By consensus, the Steering Committee directed the Chair and the District Manager to infill the lower priorities and propose them with the enumerated items for a full Board vote at the next Full Board meeting.

The meeting then turned to selecting Capital Budget priorities. Again, members suggested projects to include drawn from the lists submitted by all committees. While there was general consensus on projects to include as most critical, one project engendered an extensive discussion--the proposal to create a second Safe Haven shelter in the district to provide appropriate services to street homeless currently living on the Upper West Side.

- Catherine DeLazzaro introduced the project as a very high priority of the Health and Human Services Committee. It is difficult for homeless outreach teams to be successful if they do not have a desirable place to direct street homeless. Including this project provides an opportunity for the Board to be proactive on the homeless issue. She then turned the discussion over to Courtney Clark Metakis, who had spent a number of months doing interviews and researching the issue of street homeless.
- Courtney explained that the Safe Haven program is completely different from the general homeless shelter program. The facilities are much smaller and provide extensive services for mental health and substance abuse on site. The environment is designed to be welcoming to induce street homeless to come inside. The increase in street homeless in the district requires an additional facility.
- Linda Alexander noted that Urban Pathways runs the existing Safe Haven site in the district extremely well. It has been in place for a number of years with no issues.
- Sheldon Fine indicated that very few in the community are even aware that the Safe Haven site exists, which suggests they have been good neighbors.
- Mark Diller commented that he was not in favor of adding shelter beds at this time. While the project addresses an important need, with the temporary use of hotels as shelters unresolved and with the Department of Social Services (DSS) announcing a new shelter on the Upper West Side, he was concerned that the DSS was unlikely to provide the specific services required for street homeless and instead take the opportunity to expand also much needed general shelter beds in the district. Mark then offered an amendment asking DSS to repurpose existing shelter beds for a Safe Haven site.
- The steering Committee then voted on whether to include the Safe Haven proposal as written as part of the Capital projects list to be voted on at the November Board meeting.
- The motion to include the project passed, with the vote as follows: Steering Committee Members: 13-3-1-0; Task Force Chairs 1-2-0-0; Non-Committee Board Members 3-1-0-0.

The ordered listing of Priority Capital Projects, as follows, was then submitted to a vote:

1. **Preserve NYCHA as a source of deeply affordable housing:** Funding to repair and maintain Housing Authority projects in Community Board 7 and New York City.
2. **Health clinic for children who are victims of abuse:** Funding for a hospital unit or community health center in CB 7 to provide evidence-based mental health care, treatment and intervention for children who experience abuse (there is only one such clinic in NYC).

3. **Improved ventilation in public schools:** Funding for infrastructure improvements to air flow in schools and DOE's public reporting on air flow quality and remediation, with prioritization of the Martin Luther King Jr. Educational Complex.
4. **Safe Haven Shelter:** Funding for an additional Safe Haven Shelter in Community District 7 to most effectively address the rising number of those living on the street in the district.
5. **Replacing NYCHA front entrance doors:** Funding to replace front entrance doors at Frederick Douglass Houses and other locations. Repairs have been ineffective, such that complete replacement is now warranted.
6. **Comfort Station eliminated from Phase VI of the Riverside Park South Plan:** Funding for a comfort station with a Parks Department maintenance and operations facility at 62nd Street and the Hudson River. This phase of Riverside South construction will include a large multi-purpose playing field with no nearby comfort facility.
7. **NYCHA Broadband Service:** Funding for internet wiring, paired with expense budget priority #3, to provide free, high quality and safe broadband for all NYCHA households in Community Board 3 so they are able to access needed telehealth and social services as well as education and workforce opportunities.
8. **Renovation of the basement of the Bloomingdale Branch Library:** Funding to develop the vacant area for community needs such as a computer center, program spaces for literary classes, wellness and fitness classes and public meetings.
9. **Frederick Douglass Playground:** Funding to renovate the heavily used playground and pool area, adjacent to Douglass Houses and near several neighborhood schools.
10. **Handicapped accessibility for public schools:** Funding to make at least one-third of Community School District 3 schools handicapped accessible by the end of the 2020 to 2024 City Capital Plan.
11. **Create permanent affordable housing in SRO's threatened with conversion:** Funding for HPD's Neighborhood Pillars program to target select buildings in Manhattan Valley for purchase by nonprofit developers for renovation.
12. **Comfort station eliminated from Phase V plan for Riverside Park South:** Funding to restore construction of a comfort station with a small concession facility in Riverside South Park at 66th Street.
13. **Create or restore dock for free kayaking program in Riverside Park:** The program, offered by non-profit groups until 2015, was suspended when one of the pilings failed, making the dock unusable.
14. **Vehicles for Park Workers:** Funding to purchase 2 pickup trucks with snow plow, salt spreader and Tommy liftgate, 2 Toolcat multipurpose vehicles and a mini-packer for garbage collection
15. **Street-scape Safety Improvements:** Funding for street improvements to increase safety at many intersections by means of traffic islands, curb extensions and simple traffic guiding changes. Priority should be given to the improvements identified in Community Board 7's Nelson-Nygaard Study of the West 90's.

The motion to recommend this list to the full Board in November then passed with the following vote: Steering Committee Members 16-1-0-0; Task Force Chairs 1-2-0-0; Non-Committee Board members 5-1-0-0.

The meeting then moved on to other business. Mark Diller reminded committee chairs that District Needs Statement narratives were overdue, and requested that they be submitted by the end of the week.

Chris Giordano, representing the 64-67 Street Block Association, provided a land-use update on the court case involving the planned 775 foot high rise at 50 West 66th Street. Judge Arthur Engoron voided the City permit issued to Extell for construction arguing that the excessive use of mechanical voids could not be reconciled with the zoning laws.

Mark Diller led a discussion on how to prioritize the voices of local residents and business owners in the limited time for public participation in Zoom meetings of the Board. Members also discussed whether there should be constraints placed on public use of the chat feature on Zoom, as there have been instances of abusive personal language and obscenity written during meetings. The matter will be placed on the November agenda for the full Board meeting.

Members of the community were then invited to speak.

- Jenna Witten spoke in favor of repurposing an existing homeless shelter rather than requesting a new Safe Haven in the district.
- Erica Gerson expressed the view that additional overtime for the NYPD should be one of the top three expense budget needs of the district, since public safety should be the highest priority. Mark Diller responded that OMB parcels the Community Board budget requests out to agencies and that the NYPD would see this item as the only one coming from CB7.
- Megan Martin expressed frustration at how budget priorities are being set. She stated that, If the Board is not giving the highest priority to safety, it appears that they are not listening to the community. For transparency, she wants to see how individuals vote. She feels that public voices are not heard.
- Melinda Thaler asked the Board to advocate for increased accuracy of the State sex offender registry. The registry showed one offender as living close to a school in the district. Follow-up determined that the offender was not there. She also asked how the public could get information on the potential conflicts of interest of individual board members. Mark Diller explained how the City Conflicts of Interest Board operates, providing an Attorney of the Day to respond to any individual's question as to whether they have a conflict. Sheldon Fine added that each board member must declare any conflict and is ineligible to vote on that matter.

Doug Kleiman emphasized that the Board is committed to listen to the community.

The meeting was adjourned by consensus.

Business & Consumer Issues Committee Minutes
Linda Alexander and Christian Cordova, Co-Chairpersons
Wednesday October 14, 2020

Business & Consumer Issues Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met via the Videoconferencing application Zoom. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm by Co-Chairperson Christian Cordova.

Committee Members Present: Linda Alexander, Christian Cordova, Barbara Adler, Joshua Cohen, Doug Kleiman, Seema Reddy, Erana Stennett

Non-Committee Members Present: Mark Diller, Michele Parker

Committee Members Absent: Madelyn Innocent, Paul Fischer, Andrew Rigie

The following matters were discussed:

New applications to the SLA for Two Year Liquor Licenses:

1. **153 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 67th Street) 153 Amsterdam Rest. LLC d/b/a Damiana.

Presenting for the Applicant: Luis Skibar, Managing Member – LSkybar@gmail.com; Charles B Linn, Esq. – Charles@CharlesLinn.com (Attorney at Law)

CB7 Comments:

- This will be a Mexican restaurant on 67th and Amsterdam. Approx. 2,200sf. The hours of operation will be: Sunday to Thursday, 11am to 12 midnight; and Friday and Saturday, 11am to 1am. Background music only.
- The plans and revisions will include those from an acoustical engineer. The applicant had come to a previous BCI meeting where a neighbor complained about noise. They worked it out with her; she has heard no noise in past year and a half of construction. She approves their project.
- The applicant is a group of experienced operators with 7-8 restaurants including Toloache, Anchor, etc.
- They will be doing deliveries through third party services, e.g., Grub Hub and Seamless.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

Committee VOTE: 6-0-0-0

Non-Committee VOTE: 2-0-0-0

2. **480 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 83rd Street) 480 Amsterdam Restaurant Corporation d/b/a Barnacho.

Presenting for the Applicant: Anthony Cullinan– Tony.Cullinan@gmail.com

CB7 Comments:

- The owner's daughter and son work for him in the business. They are applying for a liquor license.
- Their 2nd Ave location is doing well! The outdoor seating is working well there.
- This restaurant is opening in the former JG Melon location.

- This will be a Tex-Mex restaurant, opening at 11am and ideally closing at 4am. Right now, they have a license that allows them to close at 2am in CB6, and 3am on weekends.
- Here they will be downstairs from a residence. 4am closing during the week seems late. They don't often stay open that late but would like to have that flexibility for special occasions. The restaurant usually closes at 1am on 2nd Ave, and 2am on Fridays and Saturdays.
- Committee members pointed out there are at least six other restaurants within a two-block radius that have 4am closing times.
- Barbara Adler and Erana Stennett both agree with a 4am closure. They suggest there be more public notice before the next full board meeting. Notification and postings have been done.
- Historically, we don't get public comment for most applications – only for those with specific interest.
- Joshua Cohen– most people are out by midnight because of the MTA closing. But concurs there are a lot of places with 4am licenses.
- Linda Alexander concurred the committee shouldn't penalize a new restaurant unduly.
- Applicant plans to only to have background music.
- The restaurant will open in mid-January as there is still some construction to do.

Public Comments:

- Jacob Hadjigeorgis (from Jacob's Pickles) – Now with the city's new restrictions, most restaurants typically close at 11pm, but usually, they stay open no later than 1am to 1:30am, commensurate with the late night activity on the UWS. Jacob pointed out the license allows him to stay open until 4am.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

Committee VOTE: 7-0-0-0

Non-Committee VOTE: 2-0-0-0

3. 286 Columbus Avenue (West 74th Street) Kissaki UWS LLC d/b/a To be Determined.

Presenting for the Applicant: Gary (Igor) Kanfer – Garry@Explorekissaki.com

CB7 Comments:

- Kissaki has several locations throughout NYC and the Hamptons. The restaurant group actually has expanded during the pandemic and has been featured several times in the press. They opened their first location in January 2020. Then closed in mid-March. They import fish directly from Japan.
- Gary owns a digital agency that builds brands. He did work for big brands and built the Kissaki brand for the partners. During the pandemic, Gary was able to build a unique take-out box that has contributed to the success of the brand. They have since strived and have opened four additional locations!
- The restaurant primarily offers Omakase tastings. An a la carte menu is available outside.
- They are now closing by 11pm because of the MTA. But would eventually like to have a 3am closing time. Committee suggested the application be amended to better reflect the eventual post-Covid operating hours.
- Doug Kleiman –
 - Have they bought out the previous owner? Originally, they were the managing operators before buying out the previous owner.
 - The Applicant should amend the application to reflect the desired hours.
- The applicant will resubmit a modified application, indicating closing at 3am before Full Board reflecting new hours, comprising 12pm – 2am, seven days a week.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted, pending receipt of a revised application with new operating hours before the full board meeting of CB7 on November 4th, 2020.*

Committee VOTE: 6-0-1-0

Non-Committee VOTE: 2-0-0-0

Alteration Application to add a bar at the cellar level:

4. 509 Amsterdam Avenue (West 85th Street) New York Beer Co LLC d/b/a Jacob's Pickles.

Presenting for the Applicant: Jacob Hadjigeorgis, President – Jacob@Jacobspickles.com

CB7 Comments:

- Jacob's Pickles manager Josepha helped pull everything together and has been a big part of application process.
- The downstairs space has been approved in the past, but the project was temporarily postponed because of the group's other restaurant expansions. Anticipating the need for more indoor seating, once restrictions have been relaxed, they plan to finish the downstairs space.
- There will be 10 tables approximately, under normal circumstances. For now, they will continue to be compliant with city regulations.
- Although the space is directly below Jacob's Pickles they will be adding additional sound proofing.
- Hadjigeorgis wants to have a 4am closing, consistent with the upstairs portion of the restaurant, which rarely stays open that late.

*After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted*

Committee VOTE: 6-0-0-1

Non-Committee VOTE: 2-0-0-0

5. New business.

- Stephanie Rupp (resident at 108th Street and Broadway) – first time attending a BCI meeting. She and her neighbors have noticed a Dunkin Donuts moving in across the street in the Manchester Diner space and are concerned. There are a lot of schools in the neighborhood – and concerned that lots of empty calories available. And not a great establishment to have across the street. She wants to learn.
- Linda Alexander pointed out that although DD is a popular brand, it is always dismaying to lose a privately-owned, local business to a chain. However, she added the community board does not have a say in who takes over space – especially since DD is not applying for a liquor license or outdoor café.
- Barbara Adler added there are so many vacancies in the neighborhood, it is nice to have any new businesses open.
- Mark Diller pointed out that DD donates a lot to local communities causes and that the Committee's purview is primarily the following:
 - Reviewing SLA liquor license applications, and sidewalk café permits.
 - Helping to keep local small businesses informed, particularly during the Covid restrictions.
 - Providing informational webinars and meetings for small businesses, such as how to access funding.
- Doug Kleiman added the new store will be a co-branded establishment, comprising Dunkin Donuts and Baskin Robbins. But he also pointed out that these are franchises, hence individually operated by small business owners.

- Peter Arndtsen enthusiastically invited everyone to come to Amsterdam Ave to see all the new restaurants opening!
- Ms. Rupp thanked the committee.
- Michele Parker reported that a woman who identifies herself as Gina, a member of the West 79th Street Block Association, has repeatedly harassed the owner of Blondies on 79th Street (between Broadway and Amsterdam Ave). Ms. Parker also disclosed her husband is the restaurant's accountant. Gina's issue seems to be something about noise and live music (even though there is not live music), etc.
 - Linda Alexander will contact the president of the 79th Street Block Association to discuss this issue and to find out who Gina may be.
- Mark Diller– re. Viand diner. They have a curbside dining enclosed area and a sidewalk use on the side street. They have tables against the wall and against the curb. People using the sidewalk are walking in between which is awkward.
 - The committee agreed this may be a violation but many places are doing this.
 - The committee also agree that this is a NYC Department of Transportation (DOT) issue and they are tasked to enforce table distancing.
 - Josh Cohen said DOT was out today at his establishments and others asking to see if postings were properly implemented and reviewing other compliance requirements. He added DOT was issuing warnings, which could lead to future fines if establishments are not in compliance.
 - Doug Kleiman – there are some people that are pushing the limits, endangering their customers and the public. It's going to get colder, and the issue may get better. But it doesn't feel right!
 - Linda Alexander pointed out the best measure is to report seating issues appearing to be in violation to 311.
 - Josh Cohen agreed there are some operators that just don't really care about compliance.
 - Erana Stennett suggested approaching proprietors we know and making them aware when they are not in compliance.
 - Linda Alexander added people can be really sensitive and reactive these days and sometimes is better to simply call 311.
 - Peter Arndtsen experience has been most people have been willing to make changes so far. It's not rough yet, but many people are pushing the limit.
- Intro 1116 is legislation originally introduced in 2019 by Councilmember Margaret Chin, expanding permits for food vendors and food trucks. The councilmember maintains it is a gateway to entrepreneurship for immigrants. But the bill as written offers no additional regulations, nor siting criteria, as there are with newsstands. Instead, food truck and cart vendors can park in front of restaurants, sundry shops, vegetable shops, etc. If passed, it will start as soon as Q1 2021, resulting in a glut of food carts and trucks, curbside and on sidewalks.
 - Barbara Adler added the new bill isn't different from what came up in 2018. She and Andrew Rigie were both very critical of the bill. This is the same one resurrected but with some differences. There is a special committee for vendors, but still no enforcement or siting criteria.
 - Christian Cordova pointed out some new aspects to the proposed legislation, such as advocating for an enforcement unit. Permits would be allocated by borough, and perhaps even specific neighborhoods. It also proposes a committee of vendors and small businesses to communicate.
 - The Committee decided it needs to better study the bill to provide the most effective response.
 - Barbara Adler added there is currently a huge problem with enforcement. She said it is a bad time to be doing this when brick-and-mortar shops are desperately trying to remain open.
 - Doug Kleiman enumerated more specific issues, including:

- One UWS grocery store pays approximately \$00K/mo in rent. The vegetable and fruit carts opening up in front of his store do not pay rent and are not subject to inspections to by the NYC Department of Health, etc. The food carts and trucks are already a challenge to rent-paying vendors.
- In addition, there is a huge black market for the licenses. All current licenses are supposed to get torn up and new licenses get issued to try to cut down on the black market.
- There has to be better regulation of these vendors, which is not included in the bill.
- Linda Alexander pointed out that if this legislation passes, then it is a free for all. Carts could crowd already obstructed sidewalks and food trucks will abut the curbside cafes. It will add so much street clutter.
- Christian Cordova suggested we review this in better detail at the November BCI meeting
- Barbara Adler agreed and added it is important for committee member Andrew Rigie to weigh in, as well.
- Mark Diller asked BCI to put the issue on the November agenda. Other CB's have handled this as a zoning issue and created no vendor zones, such as Fifth Avenue. He would like to invite the three UWS BIDs to participate, as well as the public for the discussion.
- Doug Kleiman would also like us to invite restaurant and affected retail owners to the meeting.

The meeting ended at 7:50 pm.

Parks & Environment Committee Meeting Minutes

October 19, 2020

Committee Members Present: Barbara Adler (BA), Elizabeth Caputo (EC), Ken Coughlin (KC), Natasha Kazmi (NK), Doug McGowan (DM), Chairperson Klari Neuwelt (KN), and Susan Schwartz (SS)

Other Board Members Present: CB7 Board Chair Mark Diller (MD), Paul Fischer (PF), Doug Kleiman (DK), Polly Spain (PS)

Meeting on Zoom was called to order at 6:30P.

Item 1. Discussion of Committee Plans and Operations

Broad ranging discussion led by KN about committee plans and operations, including Intention to have committee member NK become point person on sanitation and composting and KC take the lead on the issue of helicopter noise, and an increased focus on environmental issues, as per the name of the committee. NK gave a summary of NY CM Levine's Sanitation Town Hall that she attended this afternoon, which included discussion about e-waste recycling, composting and other sanitation matters. BA proposed a presentation on bioswales and rain gardens. The committee agreed to continue with 6:30P start time, in accordance with most other CB7 committees. We had a discussion about Big Belly trash cans, including a concern raised by PF that there are few of these about 96th Street (except in Riverside Park). MD explained that a Big Belly needs to have a local sponsor who can provide access to the trash can's key. PS raised a potential concern about discarded face masks in trash cans – Geoff Martin (Manager, Riverside Park) confirmed that no special handling precautions have been required to date for disposed face masks.

Item 2. Update on committee discussions.

Informal discussion about a variety of issues, with KC raising various biking concerns (both timing of the construction detour currently combining cyclists and pedestrians on the bike lane from 59th – 61st Street – Geoff Martin hopes it will end soon, but cannot confirm this, and a question about signage at the construction detour on the Greenway between 72nd Street and 76th Street – Geoff Martin will look into this) and DK raising concerns about the condition of park benches in Riverside Park between 73rd – 77th Streets. Some benches in this area appear to have splintered slats, which pose a danger to park users, and others are covered with moss or algae. Geoff Martin will look into these issues. DK also raised a concern about large social gatherings without apparent adequate social distancing and with alcohol, which is prohibited in the parks, and encounters with e-bikes on the grass in Riverside Park, as well. SS and NK both concurred about ongoing biking issues in Central Park – bikes on pedestrian paths, e-bikes in Central Park and bikes on the grass. We had a brief discussion about limitations of Parks Enforcement to enforce the laws and regulations and concern about COVID-19 risk from large social gatherings in the parks, especially among younger users and especially when combined with the use of alcohol. KN gave an update on Phase 5 of Riverside South, which Geoff Martin confirmed is expected to open this coming week. KC noted with frustration that a multi-agency task force that CB7 requested to consider safe cross routes for cyclists in Central Park has not yet been formed. KN noted that we have not been able to get a useful update on the Rotunda project or the Marina project.

The meeting was called to conclusion at 8:10P.

COMMUNITY BOARD 7/MANHATTAN

Health and Human Services Committee Minutes

Catherine DeLazzero and Sheldon Fine, Co-Chairs

Tuesday October 27, 2020

HHS Committee of Community Board 7/Manhattan met via Zoom. The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m.

Committee Members Present: Catherine DeLazzero, Sheldon Fine, Audrey Isaacs, Robert Espier, Marilyn Rosenberg, Rosa Arenas, Courtney Clark Metakis

Noncommittee Board members present: Mark Diller, Doug Kleiman, Louisa Craddock

Catherine DeLazzero, Co-Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody to the meeting that will focus on the issue of Food Insecurity. Shelly Fine, Co-Chair, praised Madge Rosenberg for her research and work on the issue and Catherine on her diligent work coordinating our committee's District Needs Statement and Priorities.

Mark Diller, Board Chair, reminded everyone that consideration of budget priorities is not on this agenda, However, there will be a pre-meeting to next Wednesday's Full Board meeting that will focus on Budget Priorities

Catherine introduced our guest speakers as follows:

- Stephanie Sears-Moshier, West Side Campaign Against Hunger
- Susan Matloff-Nieves, Goddard Riverside
- Rev. K Karpen, St Paul & St Andrew United Methodist Church
- Charles Platkin, Hunter College New York City Food Policy Center
- Pamela Koch, Laurie M. Tisch Center for Food, Education & Policy, Program in Nutrition, Teachers College

Catherine thanked Madge, and expressed excitement to have experts as guest speakers. She set the ground rules that each of the speakers were going to speak for about 10 minutes. Everyone should hold questions and comments until after everyone speaks. Members of the committee will begin asking questions followed by members of the community.

Shelly pointed out that Food Insecurity was designated as the number one priority for the Health and Human Services Committee as well as the Steering Committee. He shared his experience over past several months which was eye-opening. With the support of our elected officials, he was able to put together a Kosher Grab & Go Meal program at P.S. 75. Many doubted that there was a need. However, he organized a team of 19 meal deliverers who brought the meals Monday through Friday to the elderly and to parents who were supervising their children's remote learning. at home. Within first five weeks 30,000 meals were distributed. The program was so successful that Chancellor, Richard Caraza, the Food Czar, Catherine Garcia and the Borough President, Gayle Brewer came to site to see what was happening. People needed to access food because of financial circumstances including unemployment and because of their inability to get out to get food due to mobility issues, fears of entering stores during the pandemic and because they were parents who could not go out, feed children learning at home three meals a day and do work at home. The experiences of the delivery team members brought to light other struggles of the recipients of the meals. It was clear that food insecurity and poor nutrition was not only a pandemic issue, but a long term issue for many community residents who never received assistance before. Also, large numbers of those not requiring kosher meals were served by this program because they believed that it was healthier. At its height, over 236 households received deliveries and an additional 200+ people picked up the meals at the school location

The first speaker was Stephanie Sears-Moshier of West Side Campaign Against Hunger

Stephanie explained that West Side Campaign Against Hunger (WSCAH) organization been around for 40 years on Upper West Side and it now operates from the basement of the St. Paul & St. Andrew Church on corner of West 86th Street & West End Avenue. From that location WSCAH serves thousands of households of New Yorkers from five boroughs. They have developed a supermarket-style customer choice model for its food pantry. This model brought more dignity to experience of accessing a food pantry. The model that WSCAH created is recognized far and wide as the gold standard of what food pantry should look like across US.

However with Covid-19, WSCAH remodel to an outside pick up program.

In the previous fiscal year, they served about 11,000 households out of two programs - the 86th Street market and mobile market. WSCAH partners with Lincoln Square Neighborhood Center & the mobile market was designed to bring experience of West 86th Street on the road.

Priority has always been healthy nutritious food and always having fresh fruits and vegetables. WSCAH always have lean proteins and whole fresh dairy products.

Now during pandemic, everything happening on the street level. we're outside on street, Everything is pre-packed, but they haven't lost their commitment to healthy food and fresh produce. In the last fiscal year (July, 2019 - June 2020), WSCAH has actually doubled their reach through two programs and served about 21,000 households. They have distributed 2.1 million pounds of food and over a million pounds of fresh fruits and vegetables.

Anticipating busy winter, holidays coming up, WSCAH is going to have annual turkey challenge. The goal for this year is to give out 5,000 turkeys and holiday meals to New Yorkers in need. We have a community coalition. WSCAH welcomes anyone who is interested in participating and contributing to this endeavor. They are really proud to be a part of the UWS and serving New Yorkers in need during one of the most challenging times.

The second speaker was Susan Matloff-Nieves, of Goddard Riverside

Susan shared with us that people love to socialize with each other as they're picking up vegetables. Since the Upper West Side is not the most affordable neighborhood in the city and for our community members living on fixed incomes or at the poverty line it is particularly hard to be in position of finding affordable food. Staples cost more than supports may allow. If on food stamps, you get same food stamp allotment if living on West 95th Street as those living in South Bronx where food cost are scaled to the lower income population. Goddard Riverside is constantly dealing with hardships in the populations with which they work. Susan works with Goddard Riverside which runs 27 programs in Manhattan, mostly on UWS and West Harlem.

Susan explained that they work with the most vulnerable populations in the neighborhood, including elderly, young children, teenagers, homeless and people living with mental illness.

Even among people who are working and are living in affordable homes, they found during the pandemic what is usually a hardship for our population suddenly became a crisis. Goddard serves between 2,000 and 3,000 meals/day at congregate sites. However, when the city shut down, people were shut off from the food they provided through their centers - senior centers and after-school programs. Then people were faced with sudden cleaning out of shelves in stores, and the removal of affordable items. In some cases, people had food stamps cut off with no office open to get cases reopened. Phones were flooded by calls from people saying they had no food in their houses. Seniors were afraid to go out. Families were down to their last can of pears with four kids at home. They were running food all over neighborhood trying to get out emergency supplies to people.

Unemployment rates are very high. The biggest request was for food assistance, particularly from people abruptly unemployed, but hadn't accessed their unemployment benefits. There were also people who are undocumented who were not eligible for public benefits and who are hardworking and now can't access food stamps or other benefits, Goddard has been trying to fill that gap with food and direct relief assist.

Fresh produce is hard to come by; there are options but they not affordable. Even the green markets were not priced well for people in neighborhood on fixed income. Food in the fruit carts often utilized by people of limited means were a good option.. Otherwise they referred everyone to WSCAH..

Something that has become a food supply issue is that some stores are no longer delivering because of robberies of delivery people. Delivery people have demonstration at the police precinct. One example is at Amsterdam Houses (public housing at south end of the district).

Western Beef no longer delivers because of the robberies. This especially impacts older adults who can't drag heavy carts back from store or families with large household--have to make small trips or just do without heavy items. They have been trying to publicize where people can go for SNAP benefits. WSCAH offer sign up and in hospitals they are providing info to people in Emergency Room. T

Susan suggests that the Community Board can serve a role of providing information on its website. Any information dissemination about special events are helpful. Lincoln Center did food distribution.days. Mark sent the information to contacts which was very helpful. CB 7 can also have a role in fostering collaborations and making those marriages and matches as it encounter people who do good work. Also the Community Board has been helpful in the role of soliciting community help so people can support each other.

The third speaker was Charles Platkin of Hunter College New York City Food Policy Center

Charles Platkin is a nutrition professor at Hunter. The Hunter College NYC Food Policy Center (FPC) has been around since 2012 and does research involving community-based organizations. The Center produces a newsletter read by 15,000 people. They have monthly webinars now, whereas they used to have in-person conferences. On October 17th, they had their first webinar about restaurants with food tank (food policy think tank) restaurateurs that were very badly hit by the pandemic.

Since the third week of March they been working on a project that they call *foodscapes*. They go into a specific community and aggregate all relevant information into one report about what food pantries exist, what are the demographics and what are the disease rates. In November, 2019, they decided to research underserved communities first. They developed lists of every supermarket and every bodega. One example was that he got a call from a partner in East Harlem in third week asking what supermarkets were open or closed. He was able in an hour and half to make calls (have all telephone numbers and locations of every supermarket and give data and posted it.. People can't get out, don't want to go out and there are vulnerable individuals that are scared to go out. Many don't know if a food pntny is opened or closed, whether supermarkets are delivering, or whether they take SNAP. . They created 59 neighborhood food resource guides and with help of Hunger-Free America Shared Meals, had a lot of partners. The founder of Share Meals provided all the tech assistance. They are also doing a vend. machine project, They created an excel file for each neighborhood with every resource: food pantries, soup kitchens, open/closed, hours and times; farmers markets grocery stores, home delivered meals, and seniors grab-and-go distribution sites. They updated all data every day; with an army of volunteers to go out and others staying home and using the phone to call all facilities. They also updated from data that came from City Harvest.

FPC has produced livable 59 neighborhood food resource guides for NYC that become models for other communities around country,. Close to 80,000 people have viewed the guides since April 1st and used them as resource to find information. They are being used by organizations to provide websites with data; give the data to anyone who needs it. It is easy to put on wordpress sites.

Mr. Platkin said that he was fortunate to be contacted by Dr. Koch--her organization, Objective. was doing research and looking at the impact of Covid-19 on the food system in NYC and regional food systems from institutional perspectives and community perspectives, He indicated that. TFPC, HFPC & CFPC are not competitive. However there is a healthy competition for funding.

FPC did quality research interviews with New Yorkers and underserved communities. The number of New Yorkers that are food insecure has risen from 1.2 million to 2 million.

At the same time up to 70 % food pantries have closed at the worst time for a food pantry to be closed. There are differing views on closings, but his colleague, Nick Floydenberg, Director of CFC: contends that when food pantry closes, older people and others may not be comfortable. starting a new relationship in new food pantry.

Research shown that information is critical in dealing with food insecurity. Trying to fill that gap, needs to be remedied (long-term and sustainable). Food pantry closings are primarily in underserved communities.

Question: What populations in areas seem most affected and vulnerable to food insecurity--probably 10 to 15 neighborhoods underserved communities in the South Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens and parts of Manhattan and Staten Island -- have been hit horribly by Covid- 19 that are already food insecure. The research that the three centers have

done has created awareness around these problems. Community-based organizations contribute to significant gap filling. However, It's federal, city and state representatives need to focus on solving poverty and food security issues.

The fourth speaker was Pamela Koch, Laurie M. Tisch Center for Food, Education & Policy, Program in Nutrition, Teachers College

From TCFEP at Teachers College conducts research at the intersection of food/nutrition education and practice and policy, then translates it into resources for education policy makers and advocates. The real goal is through education to give people power to demand sustainable sources of food. She believes we can change status quo. To build on couple of things Charles said, Dr. Koch stated that what happened with Covid in NYC, exacerbated a lot of challenges and problems with food supply and food insecurity that already existed. There were 1.2 million people in NYC that were food insecure before. Now the number is up to 2 million people. It was actually a funder that said: "The three of you should work together to evaluate this because so much money is being put into it by government and by foundations to get food out to people and if you don't capture what's working/not working and what's needed and what could have been in place, it will be a completely lost opportunity.

We got funding to do this but it is a small amount of what is going into making sure people get enough food.

NYC FPO before Covid hit and still now is so much smaller than other cities' FPOs, We need a much stronger FPO that can oversee helping with food security, with diet quality, food retail and restaurants to be able to stay in business. It must help understand food, food workers and making sure they are cared for. We need a much stronger, larger FPO. if we are going to be able to do that.

PEBT or pandemic electronic benefits transfer: for all days schools that were closed. NYC schools were closed 74 days last school year and schools were sending home ipads and technology. for kids to learn. The federal government passed a five dollar and seventy cents per day for every child eligible for free meals. Since 2017 school meals have been available for free for every student in NYC, part of that to reduce stigma. Therefore it is not seen as program just for poor children. The program did bring in \$880 million into the New York State economy at time when we really needed. It has now been approved for another year.

Our fifth speaker was Rev. K Karpen of St Paul & St Andrew United Methodist Church

Rev. Karpen shared his screen with pictures of how his church is supporting the WSCAH during the pandemic. He said that WSCAH has always been a project of our compassionate neighborhood, - a place where people care about each other. From the start, the combined efforts of churches and synagogues in neighborhood-- eventually created a supermarket-style pantry--where people come and receive healthy food with dignity and also receive help in other areas of their lives. The community made a vow 20 years ago that whatever happened they would never run out of food. One week, where it ran short and they had to close pantry. People freaked out and said that it was never going to happen again, even if they had to mortgage church (they actually did at one point). Therefore, this consistency has led to dependability --people know if they come here, they will find an abundance of food - fresh food together with a good attitude towards them. Volunteers are the backbone of the program. There have also had a couple of different job training programs, including a culinary training program. However that is on hold with an onslaught of Covid-19. The operation moved outside for the safety of customers and many volunteers. While the requirement for food grew exponentially, WSCAH tried to maintain its commitment to healthy food and produce. There wasn't much refrigeration space, so a large refrigeration truck keeps the food fresh. They had to use different volunteers from NY Cares, because traditional volunteers were mainly senior citizens who were very much at risk.. The outside lines go around the block - not way they'd like to distribute food. It has been important to make sure that other needs: for food stamps and health insurance for children can be addressed.

With the huge increase of food, they needed to figure out a place to put it. First, they expanded the food pantry operation to the whole lower level of the church. A lot of fresh produce was donated as well as fresh baked goods donated from various bakeries in area. Next they decided that their 1200 large sanctuary, closed due to COVID, had pews that could be used for sorting bags of food so that they could be easily and quickly distributed on site and

throughout city. Younger volunteers are working at 20 satellite sites throughout the Bronx, and Upper Manhattan and WSCAH has taken on partners like NY Presbyterian Hospital and Make Road NY so they have been able to sort, pack and deliver food to those sites.

Catherine suggested that we can build on this and committee members' ideas and write a resolution in support of what is needed and recommendations that are outlined in the NY Food 2020 report produced by HC NYC FPC, TC Center for Food Ed and Policy and CUNY UFPI. She read the recommendations in the report that just came out on October 5th of this year as follows:

Strengthen and expand the Mayor's Office of Food Policy. The Office of Food Policy should exercise the same overarching, inter-agency power that the Food Czar team exercised. With clear authority, adequate funding, and staff who have deep understanding of food programs and policies, NYC could more nimbly respond to future crises.

For users, create and maintain a public dataset of all food pantries, soup kitchens, and other emergency food resources that includes up to date information on openings, closings, and hours of operation. NYC should provide simple technologies for emergency food providers to easily update their status.

Expand economic stimulus support, focusing on small food businesses that women, people of color, and immigrants own and operate.

Monitor retail, institutional food, and emergency food programs' impact on diet quality and address nutrition-related inequities which occur because of income and race.

Develop food plans for future emergencies that include concrete steps to support high quality diets.

Ensure that all local, state, and federal benefit programs for workers are accessible to all food workers, especially those with the lowest pay and least benefits.

In addition we might want to add ideas from speakers that we'll have in our minutes in a resolution.

Shelly: We earned a lot from our outstanding speakers and we should include their recommendations in our resolution, starting with strengthening and expanding the Mayor's Office of Food Policy.

He asked the speakers to address the following:

How were Seniors food security needs addressed during the Covid pandemic?

How are the special dietary needs of New Yorkers, such as diabetic, gluten-free, kosher, halal, etc., addressed in city food programs

Stephanie responded:

WSCAH spends a lot of time trying to deal with hundreds of meals to seniors, including meals on wheels, delivering 500 per Through Get Food NY seniors could request 3 meals a day for three day periods, Some received 9 servings of bean salad, They did not receive no salt high fiber ,eals, and there were no gluten free or diabetic friendly meals. Because of the urgency of getting food, senior diet meals were not required to comply with special dietary needs.

Shelly: At first the City insisted that senior centers (that were closed) had to register seniors for home delivered cooked meals. Working with Gale Brewer's office (Shula warren) and Mark Levine's office (Aya, Chief of Staff) we managed to register 220 households for prepared meal deliveries. Now individuals can call 311 and sign up themselves, particularly those who cannot come out of their homes. They can schedule for 5 days or for 2 weeks. However, when the time is expiring, you need to renew delivery or it ends. Registered people receive 9 meals for every 3 days.

Audrey:: Overwhelmingly impressed by the presentations. She suggested that we put the numbers in - 1.2 million food insecure increased to 2 million now. It is very important for Understanding the scope of problem.

Courtney; Concerned that delivery stopping because of thefts

Stephanie suggested that deliveries can be assisted by Invisible Hands and Corona Courier grocery runs.

Madge - Mayor's Office of Food Policy - is it short term or does it keep operating How does this office, work with DFTA and the Department of Health?

PK: Mayor's Office of Food Policy before the pandemic oversaw everything. It works with DFTA for senior meals. Under the pandemic, is an umbrella organization with a, broader role, Catherine Garcia was the temporary head for Covid pandemic.

Robert

I appreciate the Westside Campaign, family enrichment centers, grassroots, culinary program, senior food programs. In his building the NORC program was not necessary. The tenants did it themselves - neighbors are our primary resource.

Platkin Report is available in many languages and the community has had incredible voluntary support to help over 50,000 callers. They have volunteers who speak various languages.

Food insecure was 10% of community residents, and 15.4% in NYC as a whole

Shelly/Mark called for questions from the community.

Get Food NY program has a great 9 bean salad. Heard from different seniors, that there is better food from vendors participating in the 311 system. Question; Will the program continue beyond October 31st?

Stephanie: Home delivered meals, will be ongoing beyond November 1st.

Question: Is WSCAH funding mainly by the City?

K: Westside Campaign's lion share of the funding is from private citizens and organizations.

Charles: Funding from the city depends on how politicians deal with the new budgets. a lot politics, Next year we elect our next mayor and many city council members. The election will be critical, food for food policy.

Mark: 35 out of 51 council members are term limited and will be replaced by new council members..

Stephanie: CB7 has stepped forward and needs to speak loudly.

Charles: We need food advocates. Healthy food is a basic human right, and should be a priority with housing and education.

Casey: Resident of UWS who is very concerned about how are we working together, especially connecting public and private (restaurant) resources.

Stephanie: Dordash and drop in seniors are solutions that came thru the United Way.

CLL Pause, think, rethink restaurants, sharing staff investments, two signs of same coin: pivot them into long term solutions

Madge: Brilliant idea, Hunter college group, restaurants talk about getting funded for people who need it, so not to see restaurants disappear

CP Yes, talking about that. Caterers providing meals for seniors,

CL 3 BIDS are central places to go: The Lincoln Square BID, the Columbus Avenue BID and the Amsterdam-Columbus BID - donate 1-2 dollars; donate a meal

CP We need consistency, long term and not going away after vaccine - keep impact after

Question: How do you coordinate with hospital rehab facility, discharged have access to foods, not meeting needs discharged, do not have access to food, how are we partnering with health care facility to address nutritional needs of community?

Robert experience portfolio aging crisis, discharge visits what - what about food, signed me up for program 14 day food delivery free, sent 2 weekly packages, there is that service through Medicare Aetna, part of concern, regardless of assurances, gonna cover you, no charge, shock of life, diabetic healthy food, ample, well packaged, fridge/freezer, tried to subscribe, that was it, perm food security delivery, provider, social worker

Medicare advantage plan works: others do not have access who are underinsured (affordable care act) uninsured, illegal, underinsured, off of commercial plans, may or may not qualify for medicaid, not just discharge.

Audrey Issacs and Shelly are on the Mount Sinai West Community Advisory Board: hospitals social worker arrange for these services.

On the Resolution:

Drawing recent data from the Oct 5 report establishing facts, recommendations, incorporate insights speaker shared, long term planning/solutions, leaping in mind needs of different populations, recording of this meeting, follow up with

Shelly: Essential to expand and strengthen the Mayor's Office of Food Policy.

Madge: We need more facts so that we don't develop more bureaucracy.

Catherine: The Mayor's Office is one body to bring all agencies to work together with a policy perspective. It will strengthen policy making.

PK This would be something to oversee discharge plans, innovative services, strategic food security, diet quality, public health. Now it is too small - 2 people. Denver has 5, to create policy

MR The resolution should be specific - not just expansion of the Office

Catherine: that would be one recommendation. The office could create dataset, food pantries, emergency food providers, and monitor implementation.

Other concerns:

Safety of food delivery

Food plans on exiting hospitals

Quality kosher and halal meals

Reports provide framework

Take city-wide to share with other community boards what experts are suggesting

Madge: When can we vote?

Mark: We can vote on a framework.

Mark: What is the resolution?

It is based on the report recently produced by NY FOOD 2020 published Oct 5 Lori Tisch, Hunter College, CUNY Urban Food Policy providea updated data, 5-6 solutions citywide

Empowers the Mayor's Office of Food Policy
Providing for the city to provide more planning food policy and initiative
Add what was recommended tonight

Point of resolution, raise awareness and support the recommended solutions

Committee vote: 5--0-0
Noncommittee board member: Louisa Craddock supports framework
Doug K support framework, photos heartwarming
Mark votes yes
Non-Committee Board member vote: 3-0-0

Maria D. - Thank you very much for this meeting, been waiting for this issue, It would be helpful to see the language,

Catherine: responded we will produce language, our meeting happens at end of month only have a few days. We will have to turn around really fast.

Next item - we will plan for future meetings.
Based on what's come up, next month learning about options to meet the needs of the
Those experiencing street homelessness at our November meeting

At our December meeting we will consider best practices for responding to children who are victims of abuse, in collaboration with Safe Horizon and NYC Alliance Against Sexual Assault.

In January we focus on Rosa's ongoing research on economic and racial health disparities.

Shelly requested that committee members look over DNS and send Catherine and Shelly suggestions for other topics to complete our meeting plans through June.

Open public comment:

Erica Gerson: Frustrated by not having a resolution to respond to at the meeting

Shelly responded that some resolutions come out of meeting, not in advance. The framework was outlined, discussed, and voted on.

EG Encouraged draft resolutions

Catherine: We do the best we can in limited time and appreciate constructive suggestions.

Thanks to everyone.

Motion to adjourn: Unanimous