



THE CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 3

59 East 4th Street - New York, NY 10003

Phone (212) 533-5300

www.cb3manhattan.org - mn03@cb.nyc.gov

Alysha Lewis-Coleman, Board Chair

Susan Stetzer, District Manager

November 2019 Full Board Minutes

Meeting of Community Board 3 held on Tuesday, November 26, 2019 at 6:30pm at PS 20, 166 Essex Street.

Public Session:

Eirka Lim – Citizens Committee announcement on community groups for grants in New York City.

Michael Marino – Friends of Corlears Hook Park announcement of upcoming events.

Eric Diaz – Executive Director of Vision Urbana, Inc. updates to programming 1) Vision Urbana Food Pantry, 2) Vision Urbana Digital Literacy program, 3) 175 Delancey Street Older Adult Wellness Center and 4) 131 Broome Street programming.

Nancy Ortiz – Tenant Association President of Vladecks, Acknowledgment of several board members for Turkey drives

Jonathan Gardenhire – Local District Leader Acknowledgment of several board members

Grace Lee – Acknowledgment of several board members and sharing need to come together and serve even more residents every year for the holidays.

Robin Schatell – Update on the LES Festival

Ronny Vargas – Empire Cruises providing a free community boat, Cruise Toy Drive put in CB3 promo code for free event. December 21st on Saturday. Website is empirecruises.com

Karen Jorgensen – Supporting Land Use 5 – no luxury housing at Nativity Church. She is the director of a 92 bed transitional shelter for men and women ages 55 and over.

Harry Bubbins - East Village Preservation Society, is in support of Land Use Resolution #5 regarding Union Square South Hotel Special Permit.

Laura Sevell – Is in support of CB3 Land Use Committee vote on the Hotel Special Permit to Deny. Would like to thank everyone involved in the Nativity Church.

Valerio Orselli – On behalf of Cooper Square and Nativity Church, is in support of the CB3 Nativity Church Resolution.

Ed Delgado – A long time resident of the Lower East Side (over 50 years fighting for tenant rights), is in support of the CB3 Nativity Church Sale Resolution.

Mae Lee – Executive Director of the Chinese Progressive Association providing an update on the USCIS proposal to raise application fees and to eliminate fee waivers for the poor. It cost more than \$400 currently for a reduced fee waiver. USCIS is giving until December 16th for submitting comments.

Nora Breen – Is speaking against the rezoning application of Go Broome from Land Use committee. December 4th at the City Planning meeting is last chance to speak about this application.

Krystyna Piorkowska – Is against the Land Use #5 agenda item. Is also opposed to landmarks of churches as she expressed it increases the cost of living.

Public Officials:

Mayor Bill de Blasio, Gabrielle Dann-Allel:

Did Not Report.

Public Advocate Jumaane Williams:

Did Not Report.

Comptroller Scott Stringer, Michael Stinson:

Did Not Report.

Borough President Gale Brewer, Brian Lewis:

Office does not approve the current location of the garbage trucks at Pier 36 and Pier 42, that it is not a good location. Support building on the grand street guild developments only by way of first communicating and engaging residents. Reapplying for community board membership is coming up. There will be a prize for

community board who gets all their re-applications earliest. Capital grants program portal is opening up soon, available for NYCHA, parks, hospitals. Tourism grants for marketing funds is also available.

Congressmember Nydia Velazquez, Iris Quinones:

Congressmember Carolyn Maloney, Victor Montesinos:

The official stance is to find a new and lasting location for the garbage trucks away from the 10th street location.

Assemblymember Yuh-Line Niou, Shivani Gonzalez:

Mount Sinai Beth-Israel session 1 meeting was held with other Manhattan elected officials at PS 20. Townhall meeting was held where announcement of NYCHA funding of roughly \$150 million through FY19. Yuhline Niou attended a rally at Grand Street Guild to define affordability for residents.

Assemblymember Deborah J. Glick, Charlie Anderson:

Provided Assemblymember report. Thanked the CB3 members for the garbage truck relocation that finally happened at the dept of sanitation. The Assemblywoman acknowledges the current location on Pier 36 and shared her recommendation of 34th street on the west side for the garbage trucks. The garbage trucks may return back to 10th street before February 2020. Assemblymember office signed into law was legislation for bars and restaurants and SLA licenses to be made available online at a database for the public to review on stipulations the board has voted on. Capital dollars for colleges and universities (CUNY & SUNY) have been awarded. Acknowledged the Mount Sinai and Beth Israel transformation that will be affecting the Lower East Side. Is creating bills in support of transparency online for clinics to list total number of women health services, helping to identify "fake clinics" that provide only limited reproductive services and who are preventing women from information and access to services like Abortion and birth control.

Assemblymember Harvey Epstein, Mike Schweinsburg:

Provided turkeys to residents of the Lower East Side to various developments surrounding Loaisaida and Alphabet City housing developments. Tenant Rights workshops were held in the past month. Gompers houses is without gas for more than a month so the Assemblymember will be delivering meals to those residents.

State Senator Brian Kavanagh, Venus Galarza-Mullins:

Sanitation/garbage trucks current location is not approved by the Senator's office. City Harvest and Target are looking to find a solution for impacting the bike lane around Essex Crossing. Bill on credit worthiness has been signed into law.

State Senator Brad M. Hoylman, Caroline Wechselbaum:

Restoration of Honor Act signed into law which allows Veterans dishonorably discharged based on sexual orientation will now be entitled to NYS benefits. NY's progressive future meeting will be held at CUNY and the date will be announced (please follow the Senator's newsletter and website). Senator's office receives funding (SAM funding) to be given to municipal entities and government organizations. The Senator is interested in receiving feedback from the community boards to best determine allocations.

Councilmember Margaret Chin, Marian Guerra:

Legislative victory to enforce Placard abuse (for vendors) passed today which will create a 3 strike rule (no such rule has been in effect before this legislation). Knickerbocker village preserved its rent stabilization over the next 50 years. Proud to have been part of Tinker Justice, GOLES and GSG residents who urge Grand Street to come back to the table to enforce rent affordability for the new development going up on Grand Street Guild property.

Councilmember Carlina Rivera, Isabelle Jackson:

Introduced legislation to create office of active transportation (currently referred to Bike Mayor).

Councilmember Rivera office will contribute to the volunteerism at Gompers meal distribution. An HDFC fair will be held at the Loaisaida Center on 710 E 9th Street.

Members Present at First Vote:

David Adams	[A]	Herman Hewitt	[P]	Michael Perles	[P]
Yaron Altman	[P]	Trever Holland	[P]	Paul Rangel	[P]
Jesse Beck	[A]	Linda Jones	[P]	Carolyn Ratcliffe	[P]
Dominic Berg	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[P]	Damaris Reyes	[P]
Lee Berman	[P]	Tatiana Jorio	[P]	Richard Ropiak	[P]
Lisa Burriss	[A]	Meghan Joye	[A]	Thomas Rosa	[P]
Karlin Chan	[P]	Lisa Kaplan	[P]	Robin Schatell	[P]
Jonathan Chu	[P]	Olympia Kazi	[P]	Heidi Schmidt	[A]
David Crane	[P]	Joseph Kerns	[P]	Laryssa Shainberg	[P]
Felicia Cruickshank	[P]	Michelle Koppersmith	[P]	Clint Smeltzer	[P]
Paul DeRienzo	[A]	Mae Lee	[P]	Anisha Steephen	[P]
Eric Diaz	[P]	Alysha Lewis-Coleman	[P]	Sandra Strother	[P]
Alistair Economakis	[P]	Ellen Luo	[P]	Josephine Velez	[A]
Shirley Fennessey	[P]	Michael Marino	[P]	Rodney Washington	[P]
Ryan Gilliam	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[P]	Kathleen Webster	[P]
Debra Glass	[A]	Nancy Ortiz	[P]	Jacky Wong	[P]

Minutes:

Minutes of September 2019 were approved, as is.

40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Board Chairperson's Report:

Chairperson Alysha Lewis-Coleman

District Manager's Report:

District Manager Susan Stetzer

Nominating Committee:

The following members were elected to the following positions:

- Chairperson: Alysha Lewis-Coleman (37)
- First Vice Chairperson: Michael Marino (37)
- Second Vice Chairperson: Lisa Kaplan (37)
- Secretary: Eric Diaz (37)
- Assistant Secretary: Michelle Koppersmith (37)
- Treasurer: Herman Hewitt (37)

Committee Reports:

Executive Committee

no vote necessary

SLA & DCA Licensing Committee

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes
approved by committee

Alterations

- 2. Fat Buddha (Lo-Eng Inc), 212 Ave A (op/interior renovations) (item will not be heard at committee)
no vote necessary

New Liquor License Applications

- 3. Soothr (Soothr Limited), 204 E 13th St btwn 2nd & 3rd Aves (op)
withdrawn
- 4. 7 Eldridge Restaurant Group LLC, 7 Eldridge St (op)
withdrawn
- 5. Down and Out (Down and Out Brooklyn LLC), 503 E 6th St (op)
withdrawn
- 6. Rocco's, 212 Ave B btwn E 12th & E 13th Sts (wb)

VOTE: TITLE: Community Board #3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached

WHEREAS, 212 Ave B Corp., with a proposed business name of Rocco's, has applied for a wine beer license for the premises located at 212 Avenue B, between East 12th Street and East 13th Street, New York, New York; and

WHEREAS, this applicant is proposing to operate an Italian Mediterranean café with a certificate of occupancy of seventy-four (74) people, six (6) tables and twelve (12) seats and a counter with two (2) stools, an eight (8) foot bar with four (4) stools, hours of operation of 8:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. Sundays through Wednesdays and 8:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M. Thursdays through Saturdays, a prep area serving food during all hours of operation, a closed facade, no televisions and recorded background music; and

WHEREAS, according to the applicant, this premises has been vacant and used by the landlord for approximately twenty (20) years; and

WHEREAS, per the applicant, there are nine (9) licensed establishments within one (1) block of this location, including the business presently operated by the applicant; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has not held a liquor license but has experience managing a family-operated licensed coffee shop bar located at 222 Avenue B, New York, New York, which was approved by Community Board #3 for removal of its full on-premises liquor license as an existing Italian restaurant from 220 Avenue B, New York, New York, in June of 2008; and

WHEREAS, the applicant provided petition signatures, fifty-eight (58) of which are from area residents, in support of its application, and eighteen (18) residents, patrons and business collaborators appeared in support of this application, four (4) of whom spoke on behalf of the applicant as a longtime business owner who is respectful and supportive of the community; and

WHEREAS, given that this applicant is a longstanding community business owner who has operated without apparent complaints and given the evidence of community support for the addition of the proposed business with a wine beer license, Community Board #3 would approve this application with stipulations governing its method of operation; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board 3 recommends the denial of the application for a wine beer license for 212 Ave B Corp., with a proposed business name of Rocco's, for the premises located at 212 Avenue B, between East 12th Street and East 13th Street, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate as an Italian Mediterranean cafe, with less than a full-service kitchen serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 8:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. Mondays through Wednesdays and 8:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M. Thursdays through Saturdays,
- 3) it will not commercially operate any outdoor areas,
- 4) it will have a closed fixed façade with no open doors or windows except its entrance door will close by 10:00 P.M. or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, or during unamplified live performances or televised sports,
- 5) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music, and will not have DJs, live music, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board #3,
- 7) it will not seek a change in class to a full on-premises liquor license without first obtaining approval from Community Board # 3,
- 8) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 9) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 10) it will not have "happy hours,"
- 11) it will ensure that there are no wait lines outside and will designate an employee to oversee patrons and noise on the sidewalk,
- 12) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 13) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

7. Manousheh (Furn 403 Grand Corp), 403 Grand St btwn Suffolk & Clinton Sts (op)

VOTE: TITLE: Community Board #3 Recommendation To Deny Unless Stipulations Agreed To—Stipulations Attached

WHEREAS, Furn 403 Grand Corp., with a proposed business name of Manousheh, has applied for a full on-premises liquor license for the premises located at 403 Grand Street, between Suffolk Street and Clinton Street, New York, New York; and

WHEREAS, this applicant is proposing to operate a quick-serve restaurant bakery serving Lebanese cuisine with a certificate of occupancy of seventy-four (74) people, twelve (12) tables and twenty-five (25) seats and a counter with five (5) stools inside and four (4) tables and twenty-four (24) seats in a sidewalk café within its building line, a thirty (30) foot bar with fifteen (15) stools, hours of operation of 7:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M. all days inside and 7:00 A.M. to 10:00 P.M. all days outside, a prep area serving food during all hours of operation, a closed facade, one (1) television, recorded and live acoustic background music and happy hours to 7:00 P.M.; and

WHEREAS, the applicant stated that it is applying for a full on-premises liquor license to serve Arak, a traditional Lebanese liquor, to accompany the Lebanese fare it will be serving; and

WHEREAS, this premises has never been licensed and was previously operated as a 7-11; and

WHEREAS, there are three (3) full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location per the applicant but there are six (6) full on-premises liquor licenses within five hundred (500) feet of this location per the SLA LAMP map; and

WHEREAS, the applicant provided petition signatures, eighty-two (82) of which are from area residents, in support of its application and a representative of the Seward Park Housing Corporation, the lessor of the premises, appeared on behalf of the applicant; and

WHEREAS, the Seward Park around Canal East Residents Association submitted written support for this application, stating that it had entered into an agreement with the applicant that it would 1) stop the service of alcohol at 1:00 A.M. Sundays through Wednesdays and 2:00 A.M. Thursdays through Saturdays, 2) close its façade and any outdoor areas at 10:00 P.M., 3) not have wait lines, 4) play background music, consisting of recorded music and occasional live acoustic music, and not have DJs, and 5) ensure that smoking patrons remain in front of the business; and

WHEREAS, the applicant operates the same business located at 193 Bleecker Street, New York, New York, which had a wine beer license issued by the SLA on February 2, 2015; and

WHEREAS, given the history of this applicant operating the same business and given the evidence of community support for this application, Community Board #3 would approve this application for a full on-premises liquor license with stipulations governing its method of operation; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board #3 recommends the denial of the application for a full on-premises liquor license for Furn 403 Grand Corp. with the proposed business name of Manousheh, for the premises located at 403 Grand Street, between Suffolk Street and Clinton Street, New York, New York, unless the applicant agrees before the SLA to make as conditions of its license the following signed notarized stipulations that

- 1) it will operate a quick-serve Lebanese restaurant bakery, with less than a full-service kitchen serving food during all hours of operation,
- 2) its hours of operation will be 7:00 A.M. to 2:00 A.M. all days and it will stop serving alcohol at 1:00 A.M. Sundays through Wednesdays,
- 3) its hours of operation for its sidewalk café within its building line will be 7:00 A.M. to 10:00 P.M. all days,
- 4) it will have a closed fixed façade with no open doors or windows except its entrance door will close by 10:00 P.M. or when amplified sound is playing, including but not limited to DJs, live music and live nonmusical performances, or during unamplified live performances or televised sports,
- 5) it will play ambient background music only, consisting of recorded music as part of its general operations and occasional live acoustic music consisting of no more than two (2) Lebanese instruments, but will not have DJs, promoted events, scheduled performances or any event at which a cover fee will be charged,
- 6) it will not apply for any alteration in its method of operation or for any physical alterations without first appearing before Community Board #3,
- 7) it will not host pub crawls or party buses,
- 8) it will not have unlimited drink specials with food,
- 9) it may have a "happy hour" until 7:00 P.M. each night,
- 10) it will ensure that there are no wait lines outside and will designate an employee to ensure no loitering, noise or crowds on the sidewalk and will ensure that smoking patrons will remain in front of the business,
- 11) it will conspicuously post this stipulation form beside its liquor license inside of its business, and
- 12) it will provide a telephone number for residents to call with complaints and immediately address any resident complaints.

Items not heard at Committee

- 8. The Boiler Room (JB Max Inc), 86 E 4th St (corp change/op)
no vote necessary
- 9. The Queen Vic (The Watering Hole of 2nd Ave Corp), 68 2nd Ave (corp change/op)
no vote necessary
- 10. K'ook (Hkook Corp), 240 E 4th St (removal/wb)
no vote necessary
- 11. Bar by Ume LLC, 119 E 7th St (wb)
no vote necessary
- 12. Sauced Up (Golden Wings 786 LLC), 77 2nd Ave (wb)
no vote necessary
- 13. Pho Thanh Hoai (Pho New York Restaurant Inc), 73 Mulberry St (wb)
no vote necessary
- 14. Jiang Diner (309 East 5 NY Inc), 309 E 5th St (wb)
no vote necessary
- 15. M Noodle Shop (92 Rivington Street Inc), 92 Rivington St (wb)
no vote necessary
- 16. Vote to adjourn
approved by committee

37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Landmarks Committee

meeting was canceled

Land Use, Zoning, Public & Private Housing Committee

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes
approved by committee
- 2. ULURP #200061AZSM: Amendment to GO Broome Street Development application seeking waiver of required minimum distance of 80' between buildings above heights of 125'

VOTE: TITLE: ULURP #200061AZSM: Amendment to GO Broome Street Development application seeking waiver of required minimum distance of 80' between buildings above heights of 125'

WHEREAS, in September 2019, Community Board 3 voted to approve the GO Broome Street Development application with conditions; and

WHEREAS, those conditions included:

- Building at least 50% affordable units and designating additional units for families with moderate and middle incomes.
- Attracting former site tenants from all SPURA sites
- Ensuring any costs for amenities for tenants of affordable units be consistent with the percentage of reduced rent for those tenants
- Committing to enhance trees and open space within the project site and on surrounding sidewalks
- Studying scenarios to lower the overall building height and bulk. At minimum locating all mechanical and other services elsewhere on the site; and

WHEREAS, an amended application has since been filed with the Department of City Planning requesting an additional waiver in order to address a technical zoning compliance issue; and

WHEREAS, the additional waiver would address a requirement that buildings located above 125 feet in height and that together exceed a lot coverage of 40 percent must be spaced at least 80 feet apart; and

WHEREAS, the waiver is needed because the existing Hong Ning senior housing building at 50 Norfolk Street, which shares a lot with the proposed development, is 126.13 feet tall, and the proposed buildings plus the Hong Ning building exceed 40 percent lot coverage between 125 feet and 126.13 feet, but would not be at least 80 feet apart; and

WHEREAS, this creates 1.13 feet of non-compliant building height and minimum distance between building that requires a special permit for the modification of minimum distance between buildings pursuant to Zoning Resolution Section 78-312(f); and

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, given the additional information that we currently have with regard to there being yet another variance in this application, we reiterate to the developer that they redouble their efforts to comply with the recommendations made in September 2019 with regard to height, bulk and affordability.

3. Request for removal of deed restriction at Congregation Erster Lutowiska Machzike Hadass Synagogue (262 Delancey St) to facilitate residential development
withdrawn
4. ULURP #200102 ZMM: "Union Square South Hotel Special Permit" - Extend Special Union Square District south to approx. East 9th St and east to approx. 3rd Ave to create a new subdistrict and require a City Planning Commission Special Permit for new hotel development in that subdistrict

VOTE: TITLE: ULURP #200102 ZMM: "Union Square South Hotel Special Permit"

WHEREAS, the Department of City Planning is proposing a zoning map amendment and a text amendment to the New York City Zoning Resolution (ZR) Article XI, Chapter 8: The Special Union Square South District; and

WHEREAS, the stated goal of these actions is to achieve balanced growth in any area with complex and varied built forms, by providing additional discretion over land uses such as hotels, which are currently allowed as-of-right, and to ensure these uses are compatible with their surrounding context; and

WHEREAS, the land use actions in question would extend the special district south to include a new subdistrict—Subdistrict B—which, in Community District 3, would be bounded approximately by East 9th Street to the south, 13th Street to the north, 4th Avenue to the west, and 3rd Avenue to the east; and

WHEREAS, within Subdistrict B, new hotel development, conversions, or enlargements would require a City Planning Commission special permit, subject to ULURP and Community Board review, and would require the City Planning Commission to establish findings that such a hotel is so located as not to impair the essential character of, or future use or development of, the surrounding area; and

WHEREAS, the City's refusal thus far to recognize the historic significance of the current, albeit humble historic building stock that could be demolished as result of this action is disturbing. For example, CB3 strongly disagrees with the DCP's analysis that there would be no adverse impact on neighborhood character if 88 East 10th Street built in 1845 by Peter Stuyvesant were demolished; and

WHEREAS, the EAS fails to correctly identify a broad range of historic resources in the area, including landmarked buildings, buildings that are listed on the State and National Registers of Historic Places, buildings, which the LPC itself previously identified as historic resources in past EASes, and buildings of clear architectural and historical significance that CEQR requires be included in the EAS; and

WHEREAS, CB 3 agrees that it is important to ensure that future hotel developments are compatible with their surrounding context; and

WHEREAS, in December 2017, CB 3 passed a resolution requesting a change in zoning on 3rd and 4th avenues from 14th Street to 9th Street for a commercial downzoning to protect its primarily residential character; and

WHEREAS, CB 3 is not opposed to additional restrictions or special permit requirements for any new hotel development or expansion in this area, as long as the findings are more restrictive and clearly defined;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, Community Board 3 recommends disapproval of ULURP #200102 ZMM (Union Square South Hotel Special Permit), with the following conditions:

- 1) Revise the EAS to recognize 88 East 10th Street as a historic resource and to account for all State and National Register of Historic Places buildings;
- 2) Introduce a contextual downzoning from C6-2A to C1-7A on 3rd and 4th Avenue between 14th Street and 9th Street as described in a December 2017 CB 3 resolution;
- 3) Develop a more stringent set of City Planning Commission findings as a requirement of the proposed hotel Special Permit.

- 4) Landmark Preservation Commission should be urged to work with CB 3 to develop another historic district in the East Village and to identify potential individual Landmarks in order to preserve historic properties in the area.
5. Sale and re-use of Nativity Church (44 2nd Ave) and other religious properties in CD 3

VOTE: TITLE: CB 3 Request for meeting with Archdiocese of New York regarding future use of the former Church of the Nativity (44 2nd Avenue) and other de-sanctified properties in the Community District

WHEREAS, the sale of the former Roman Catholic Church of the Nativity at 44 2nd Avenue to facilitate redevelopment as market-rate residential units appears to be imminent; and

WHEREAS, Dorothy Day—the cofounder of the Catholic Worker and advocate for the poor, the destitute, and the homeless—was a parishioner of the Church of the Nativity and is currently being considered for sainthood by the Catholic Church for this work; and

WHEREAS, a number of nearby former Roman Catholic Church buildings and properties have already been sold for market-rate housing, including Mary Help of Christians on Avenue A, St. Patrick Old Cathedral School and Convent, and the Chapel of San Lorenzo Ruiz in Little Italy, amongst others, adding to displacement pressures in our community; and

WHEREAS, the Cooper Square Committee and Community Land Trust had several meetings with David Brown, the Director of Real Estate for the Archdiocese of New York, regarding the future use of the Church of the Nativity site, and submitted a proposal in 2018 offering \$18.5 million to partner with the Archdiocese on a senior low-income residential building, an offer that was ultimately rejected; and

WHEREAS, in addition to the Church of the Nativity, the Archdiocese of New York owns some 18 de-sanctified churches on the Lower East Side, Chinatown, Upper East Side, Harlem, and East Harlem that it is now seeking to sell for redevelopment; and

WHEREAS, in response, the Manhattan Borough President has created a Religious Facilities Task Force, which Community Board 3 sits on, in order to explore alternatives to the sale of former Church properties for market-rate housing; and

WHEREAS, the Borough President has invited the Archdiocese of New York to participate in the Religious Facilities Task Force but at this time they have not joined or participated in meetings; and

WHEREAS, in November 2018 the Cooper Square Community Land Trust attended a conference at the Vatican titled "Doesn't God Dwell Here Anymore?: Decommissioning Places of Worship and Integrated Management of Ecclesiastical Cultural Heritage," where they presented a paper titled "Reusing Landholdings of the Archdiocese of New York for Low-Income Housing"; and

WHEREAS, in addressing participants of this conference, Pope Francis asked for increased community participation in the decision making for the reuse of Catholic Church properties for the benefit of the poor and not for "sordid" (per Canonical law, contrary to Church teaching) or commercial uses, especially those which could result in secondary residential and commercial displacement; and

WHEREAS, Community District 3 has the 4th highest income inequality ratio out of all Community Districts in the City and continues to experience rising housing costs, with 36% of low-income households in the District identified as severely rent-burdened, according to the Furman Center (2017); and

WHEREAS, Community Board 3 has identified creation and preservation of affordable housing, especially for extremely low and very low income families, as a vital local matter and district priority, and has repeatedly heard from local residents that the high and rising cost of housing is forcing longstanding residents to move from the district or into overcrowded or rent-burdened living conditions; and

WHEREAS, prior to the sale of the Church of the Nativity property, former parishioners, neighborhood stakeholders, and CB 3 held a town hall meeting in May 2019 to gather community input on the re-use of Church properties in the area, including the Church of the Nativity site; and

WHEREAS, at this town hall meeting, community sentiment was overwhelmingly against the sale of the Church of the Nativity and other religious properties for market-rate housing; and

WHEREAS, in addition, community stakeholders have attempted to engage the Archdiocese about the significance of the Church of the Nativity site and the need for more affordable and senior housing in this community, including a CB 3 resolution in February 2019 urging the Church to declare a moratorium on the disposition of de-sanctified properties;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, Community Board 3 opposes the sale of The Church of the Nativity to develop luxury housing; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, Community Board 3 requests that the Archdiocese of New York meet with Community Board 3, elected officials, and local stakeholders to discuss the future use of the Church of the Nativity site for affordable housing or other community-serving use; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, Community Board 3 calls on the Archdiocese of New York to engage in good-faith planning and discussion with the Community Board, elected officials, and local stakeholders regarding the future use of other de-sanctified and underutilized Church properties in the District that may be considered for sale and redevelopment, and to prioritize those sites for community-serving uses that will not contribute to more residential and commercial displacement pressure.

- 6. Report from Two Bridges Community Rezoning Co-Application
no vote necessary
- 7. Report from Public Housing & Section 8 Housing Subcommittee
no vote necessary
- 8. Vote to adjourn
approved by committee

40 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (excluding Land Use items 2, 4, 5)
36 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED (Lane Use item 2)
37 YES 1 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (Land Use item 4)
35 YES 2 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (Lane Use item 5)

Transportation, Public Safety, & Environment Committee

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes
approved by committee
- 2. Working session to create a proposal for amended state legislation to close loopholes for intercity bus enforcement
no vote necessary
- 3. Vote to adjourn
approved by committee

37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Economic Development Committee

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes
approved by committee
- 2. East Village Special District - proposed zoning regulations
no vote necessary
- 3. Report from Arts & Cultural Affairs Subcommittee
no vote necessary
- 4. Vote to adjourn
approved by committee

37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, & Resiliency Committee

- 1. Approval of previous month's minutes
approved by committee
- 2. EDC: Brooklyn Bridge Esplanade final design
VOTE: TITL E: CB3 position on the Brooklyn Bridge Esplanade design updates

To Support design changes to the Brooklyn Bridge East River Esplanade Project

WHEREAS, The New York City Economic Development Corporation (EDC) has partnered with the landscape architecture and planning firm Starr Whitehouse to complete the Brooklyn Bridge

Esplanade project (formerly the "Brooklyn Bridge Beach" project) in the area running from Peck Slip to Catherine Slip, and

WHEREAS, CB3 had serious concerns with the design presented to the Parks committee in June 2019 including the reduction of open space and the relocation of the parking lot, and

WHEREAS, EDC has revised the design to address the major concerns,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that CB3 supports the design changes provided that:

- the project be designed in such a way to prevent illegal parking and placard abuse that currently plagues the area; and
- that educational placards dealing with fish safety be placed along the esplanade in three languages; and
- that the design include temporary and permanent art installations; and
- that the design include High Water Mark signs in three languages; and
- that the design include affordable concessions (temporary and permanent).

3. DDC: Update on ESCR project
no vote necessary
4. Parks Manager Update
no vote necessary
5. Vote to adjourn
approved by committee

37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED (excluding Parks item 2)

36 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 1 PNV MOTION PASSED (Parks item 2)

Health, Seniors, & Human Services / Youth, Education, & Human Rights Committee

1. Approval of previous month's minutes
approved by committee
2. Homeless outreach efforts in subways
no vote necessary
3. CAB reports
no vote necessary
4. Vote to adjourn
approved by committee

37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Vote to adjourn

37 YES 0 NO 0 ABS 0 PNV MOTION PASSED

Members Present at Last Vote:

David Adams	[A]	Herman Hewitt	[P]	Michael Perles	[P]
Yaron Altman	[P]	Trever Holland	[P]	Paul Rangel	[P]
Jesse Beck	[A]	Linda Jones	[P]	Carolyn Ratcliffe	[P]
Dominic Berg	[P]	Vaylateena Jones	[A]	Damaris Reyes	[P]
Lee Berman	[P]	Tatiana Jorio	[P]	Richard Ropiak	[P]
Lisa Burriss	[A]	Meghan Joye	[A]	Thomas Rosa	[P]
Karlin Chan	[P]	Lisa Kaplan	[P]	Robin Schatell	[P]
Jonathan Chu	[P]	Olympia Kazi	[P]	Heidi Schmidt	[A]
David Crane	[P]	Joseph Kerns	[P]	Laryssa Shainberg	[P]
Felicia Cruickshank	[A]	Michelle Koppersmith	[P]	Clint Smeltzer	[P]
Paul DeRienzo	[A]	Mae Lee	[P]	Anisha Steeppen	[P]
Eric Diaz	[P]	Alysha Lewis-Coleman	[P]	Sandra Strother	[A]
Alistair Economakis	[P]	Ellen Luo	[P]	Josephine Velez	[A]
Shirley Fennessey	[P]	Michael Marino	[P]	Rodney Washington	[P]
Ryan Gilliam	[P]	Alexandra Militano	[P]	Kathleen Webster	[P]
Debra Glass	[A]	Nancy Ortiz	[P]	Jacky Wong	[P]

Meeting Adjourned