

**MODIFICATION OF THE  
CATALUM SPDES PERMIT  
DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT**



**Lead Agency:**

**New York State Department of Environmental Conservation**

**Applicant:**

**New York City Department of Environmental Protection**

**December 2020**

This page intentionally left blank

**Modification of the Catalum SPDES Permit  
Draft Environmental Impact Statement**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**ACRONYMS..... AC-1**

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ..... ES-1**

**ES 1. INTRODUCTION..... ES-1**

**ES 2. EIS PROCESS ..... ES-5**

**ES 3. BACKGROUND OF MODIFICATION OF THE CATALUM SPDES PERMIT..... ES-5**

**ES 4. OVERVIEW OF THE PROPOSED ACTION..... ES-10**

**ES 5. PROPOSED ACTION IN THE LOWER ESOPUS CREEK STUDY AREA ..... ES-13**

**ES 6. PROPOSED ACTION IN THE KENSICO RESERVOIR STUDY AREA ..... ES-33**

**ES 7. ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS SUMMARY ..... ES-39**

**ES 8. PROPOSED REVISED OPERATING PROTOCOL, PROPOSED REVISED MONITORING  
        PLAN, AND ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS ..... ES-43**

**1. INTRODUCTION.....1-1**

**1.1 REGULATORY DRIVERS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION.....1-4**

**1.2 BACKGROUND.....1-6**

        1.2.1 Overview of the Water Supply System and System Operations..... 1-6

        1.2.2 Operation of the Catskill Water Supply System ..... 1-6

        1.2.3 Emergency Authorizations for Alum Application ..... 1-12

        1.2.4 Alum Application and Ashokan Release Channel Use..... 1-13

**1.3 TURBIDITY CONTROL MEASURES.....1-19**

        1.3.1 Catskill Aqueduct Stop Shutter Improvements..... 1-19

        1.3.2 Catskill and Delaware Aqueducts Interconnection at Shaft 4..... 1-20

        1.3.3 Croton Water Filtration Plant..... 1-20

        1.3.4 Operations Support Tool..... 1-20

**2. PURPOSE AND NEED .....2-1**

**3. PROPOSED ACTION.....3-1**

**3.1 OPERATION OF ASHOKAN RESERVOIR IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE IRP .....3-1**

**3.2 DELAY OF DREDGING AT KENSICO RESERVOIR .....3-1**

**4. ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK.....4-1**

**5. EIS METHODOLOGY .....5-1**

**5.1 OPERATIONS SUPPORT TOOL MODELING OF ASHOKAN RESERVOIR OPERATIONS .....5-1**

**5.2 LOWER ESOPUS CREEK MODELING METHODOLOGY .....5-3**

5.2.1 Analysis Approach.....5-3

5.2.2 Analysis Conditions for Lower Esopus Creek.....5-6

5.2.3 Total Flow Estimation .....5-10

5.2.4 Hydrologic Engineering Center River Analysis System.....5-10

**5.3 IMPACT ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY .....5-11**

5.3.1 Water Resources and Water Quality.....5-11

5.3.2 Public Policy, Land Use, and Zoning .....5-23

5.3.3 Socioeconomic Conditions .....5-24

5.3.4 Open Space and Recreation .....5-30

5.3.5 Critical Environmental Areas .....5-31

5.3.6 Historic and Cultural Resources .....5-31

5.3.7 Aesthetic (Visual) Resources.....5-31

5.3.8 Natural Resources.....5-34

5.3.9 Hazardous Materials .....5-38

5.3.10 Infrastructure and Energy .....5-39

5.3.11 Transportation.....5-39

5.3.12 Air Quality .....5-39

5.3.13 Noise .....5-40

5.3.14 Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Climate Change .....5-40

5.3.15 Public Health.....5-40

**6. PROPOSED ACTION IN LOWER ESOPUS CREEK STUDY AREA.....6-1**

**6.1 LOWER ESOPUS CREEK STUDY AREA .....6-1**

6.1.1 Geology and Soils.....6-2

6.1.2 Surface Water Inputs to Lower Esopus Creek.....6-9

6.1.3 Groundwater Inputs to Lower Esopus Creek.....6-12

6.1.4 Summary of Valley Reach Characteristics .....6-12

**6.2 OPERATION OF ASHOKAN RESERVOIR IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE IRP .....6-14**

**7. POTENTIAL IMPACTS AND BENEFITS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION ON LOWER ESOPUS CREEK .....7-1**

**7.1 WATER RESOURCES AND WATER QUALITY .....7-1**

7.1.1 Flow Regime and Water Quality In Lower Esopus Creek.....7-1

7.1.2 Summary of Effects of The Proposed Action on DEP Water Supply Reliability.....7-45

7.1.3	Summary of Effects of the Proposed Action on Flow Regime and Water Quality in Lower Esopus Creek.....	7-47
7.1.4	Parameters Evaluated for the Technical Area Assessments – Flow Regime and Water Quality.....	7-49
<b>7.2</b>	<b>PUBLIC POLICY, LAND USE, AND ZONING .....</b>	<b>7-80</b>
<b>7.3</b>	<b>SOCIOECONOMIC CONDITIONS .....</b>	<b>7-103</b>
<b>7.4</b>	<b>OPEN SPACE AND RECREATION .....</b>	<b>7-127</b>
<b>7.5</b>	<b>HISTORIC AND CULTURAL RESOURCES .....</b>	<b>7-140</b>
<b>7.6</b>	<b>AESTHETIC (VISUAL) RESOURCES .....</b>	<b>7-154</b>
<b>7.7</b>	<b>AQUATIC RESOURCES .....</b>	<b>7-168</b>
<b>7.8</b>	<b>WETLANDS AND FLOODPLAIN FORESTS.....</b>	<b>7-193</b>
<b>7.9</b>	<b>TERRESTRIAL AND WILDLIFE RESOURCES .....</b>	<b>7-211</b>
<b>7.10</b>	<b>HAZARDOUS MATERIALS .....</b>	<b>7-224</b>
<b>7.11</b>	<b>INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENERGY .....</b>	<b>7-227</b>
<b>8.</b>	<b>PROPOSED ACTION IN THE KENSICO RESERVOIR STUDY AREA .....</b>	<b>8-1</b>
<b>8.1</b>	<b>KENSICO RESERVOIR PROJECT DESCRIPTION .....</b>	<b>8-1</b>
8.1.1	Background.....	8-1
8.1.2	Project Overview .....	8-2
<b>8.2</b>	<b>KENSICO RESERVOIR DREDGING ANALYSIS.....</b>	<b>8-4</b>
8.2.1	Delay of Dredging .....	8-4
8.2.2	Environmental Considerations of Dredging .....	8-6
8.2.3	Schedule.....	8-16
<b>8.3</b>	<b>POTENTIAL IMPACTS AND BENEFITS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION ON KENSICO RESERVOIR STUDY AREA .....</b>	<b>8-17</b>
8.3.1	Water Resources and Water Quality.....	8-17
8.3.2	Aquatic (Fish and Benthic) Resources.....	8-26
8.3.3	Wetlands .....	8-46
8.3.4	Terrestrial and Wildlife Resources .....	8-52
8.3.5	Public Policy, Land Use, and Zoning .....	8-59
8.3.6	Open Space and Recreation .....	8-65
8.3.7	Critical Environmental Areas .....	8-68
8.3.8	Historic and Cultural Resources .....	8-70
8.3.9	Aesthetic (Visual) Resources.....	8-73
8.3.10	Hazardous Materials .....	8-79
8.3.11	Infrastructure and Energy .....	8-82
8.3.12	Transportation.....	8-84

8.3.13 Air Quality .....8-85

8.3.14 Noise .....8-88

**9. PROJECT-WIDE IMPACT ASSESSMENT: PUBLIC HEALTH .....9-1**

**10. CUMULATIVE IMPACTS .....10-1**

**11. MITIGATION AND UNAVOIDABLE ADVERSE IMPACTS.....11-1**

**12. GROWTH INDUCEMENT .....12-1**

**13. IRREVERSIBLE AND IRRETRIEVABLE COMMITMENT OF RESOURCES.....13-1**

**14. ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS.....14-1**

**14.1 APPROACH .....14-3**

**14.2 ANALYSIS OF ALTERNATIVES.....14-4**

14.2.1 Ashokan Reservoir Alternatives ..... 14-4

14.2.2 Catskill Aqueduct Alternatives ..... 14-11

14.2.3 Kensico Reservoir Alternatives ..... 14-15

14.2.4 Summary Comparison of Alternatives..... 14-20

**14.3 ASHOKAN RESERVOIR ALTERNATIVE 6 – REVISED OPERATING PROTOCOL.....14-23**

14.3.1 Analysis Framework ..... 14-23

14.3.2 Variations to the Interim Release Protocol ..... 14-23

14.3.3 Effect of Ashokan Reservoir Alternative 6 on DEP Water Supply Reliability ..... 14-30

14.3.4 Effect of Ashokan Reservoir Alternative 6 on Lower Esopus Creek ..... 14-34

14.3.5 Proposed Revised Operating Protocol ..... 14-36

**14.4 PROPOSED REVISED MONITORING PLAN .....14-41**

**APPENDICES**

Appendix A - Proposed Revised Operating Protocol and Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan.....A-1

Appendix B - Socioeconomic Survey Questionnaires.....B-1

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure ES-1.	Water Supply System Overview .....	ES-2
Figure ES-2.	Water in Ashokan Reservoir.....	ES-7
Figure ES-3.	Ashokan Reservoir, Ashokan Release Channel, and Spillway .....	ES-9
Figure ES-4.	Overview of the Interim Ashokan Release Protocol (IRP).....	ES-12
Figure ES-5.	EIS Analysis Framework: Lower Esopus Creek.....	ES-15
Figure ES-6.	Lower Esopus Creek General Study Area .....	ES-18
Figure ES-7.	Sub-watersheds by Valley Reach of Lower Esopus Creek.....	ES-20
Figure ES-8.	Modeled Occurrence and Average Annual Flow of Releases in the Future With the Proposed Action.....	ES-22
Figure ES-9.	Potential Difference Between the Future Without and With the Proposed Action for Lower Esopus Creek .....	ES-27
Figure ES-10.	Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	ES-35
Figure ES-11.	Modeled Range of Average Settled Thickness of Alum Floc During WFF Program.....	ES-36
Figure ES-12.	Proposed Revised Operating Protocol CSSO Curve Shape.....	ES-44
Figure ES-13.	Proposed Monitoring Sites Along Lower EsopusCreek Included in the Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan .....	ES-47
Figure 1-1.	Water Supply System Overview .....	1-3
Figure 1-2.	Ashokan Reservoir, Ashokan Release Channel, and Spillway .....	1-8
Figure 1-3.	Schematic of the Catskill/Delaware Water Supply System .....	1-9
Figure 1-4.	Conceptual Alum Application and Settling Process .....	1-10
Figure 1-5.	Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	1-11
Figure 1-6.	Historical Application of Alum at Kensico Reservoir .....	1-14
Figure 1-7.	Summary of Turbidity Control Studies.....	1-15
Figure 1-8.	Historical Use of the Ashokan Release Channel .....	1-17
Figure 1-9.	Stop Shutter Schematic .....	1-19
Figure 1-10.	Overview of DEP’s Operations Support Tool .....	1-21
Figure 3-1.	Overview of the Interim Ashokan Release Protocol (IRP).....	3-2
Figure 5.2-1.	Observed Streamflow at the Coldbrook Gage (USGS 013625000) Over the Period of Record, For the Last 30 Years, and for Wet, Normal, and Dry Years .....	5-5
Figure 5.3-1.	Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Stream Geomorphology Cross Sections.....	5-15
Figure 5.3-2.	Typical Stream Valley Slope-Break Features and Channel-forming (CF) Terraces .....	5-17
Figure 5.3-3.	Illustrative View of Bank Pin Configuration and Example of Bank Pins in Lower Esopus Creek.....	5-20
Figure 5.3-4.	Lower Esopus Creek Survey Photos.....	5-26

Figure 6.1-1. Lower Esopus Creek General Study Area .....6-3

Figure 6.1-2. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Bedrock Formations .....6-5

Figure 6.1-3. Lower Esopus Creek Surficial Geology .....6-7

Figure 6.1-4. Sub-watersheds by Valley Reach of Lower Esopus Creek.....6-10

Figure 6.1-5. Observed Annualized Streamflow for Lower Esopus Creek at Mount Marion, Water Year 1971–2012 (Pre-IRP) .....6-11

Figure 6.1-6. Observed Annualized Streamflow for Lower Esopus Creek at Mount Marion, Water Year 2013–2018 (IRP) .....6-11

Figure 7.1-1. Modeled Annualized Ashokan Reservoir Spills for the Future Without the Proposed Action and the Future With the Proposed Action .....7-3

Figure 7.1-2. Modeled Occurrence of Spill Turbidity Levels by Type of Year in the Future Without the Proposed Action.....7-4

Figure 7.1-3. Modeled Occurrence of Spill Turbidity Levels by Type of Year in the Future With the Proposed Action.....7-4

Figure 7.1-4. Modeled Annualized Releases in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action ....7-5

Figure 7.1-5. Modeled Occurrence and Average Annual Flow of Releases in the Future With the Proposed Action.....7-6

Figure 7.1-6. Modeled Average Release Turbidity in the Future With the Proposed Action .....7-7

Figure 7.1-7. Modeled Comparison of Turbidity Levels between the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....7-8

Figure 7.1-8. Modeled Annualized Streamflow for the Future Without and Future With the Proposed Action at the Spillway Confluence.....7-10

Figure 7.1-9. Modeled Annualized Streamflow for the Future Without and Future With the Proposed Action at Mount Marion .....7-10

Figure 7.1-10. Modeled Streamflow for the 50<sup>th</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> Percentile Water Year at the Spillway Confluence .....7-12

Figure 7.1-11. Modeled Streamflow for the 50<sup>th</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> Percentile Water Year at Mount Marion.....7-12

Figure 7.1-12. Modeled Streamflow Duration Curves along Lower Esopus Creek (Mount Marion Period of Record).....7-13

Figure 7.1-13. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Lomontville for 2018-2019.....7-14

Figure 7.1-14. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Mount Marion for 2018-2019.....7-15

Figure 7.1-15. Box Plots of All Observed Turbidity Level Data Collected at the Release Channel (2013-2019), Lomontville (2016-2019), and Mount Marion (2013-2019).....7-16

Figure 7.1-16. Water Quality Data Collection Sites.....7-17

Figure 7.1-17. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Mount Marion (2016-2017).....7-19

Figure 7.1-18. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Mount Marion (2018-2019).....7-20

Figure 7.1-19. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Lomontville (2018-2019).....7-21

Figure 7.1-20. Observed Temperature Profile Along Lower Esopus Creek.....7-23



Figure 7.1-21. Observed Dissolved Oxygen for Points Along Esopus Creek, 2011–2018.....7-24

Figure 7.1-22. Observed pH for Points Along Esopus Creek, 2011–2018.....7-24

Figure 7.1-23. Observed Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 100-Year Recurrence Intervals .....7-25

Figure 7.1-24. Modeled Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 100-Year Recurrence Intervals .....7-26

Figure 7.1-25. Modeled Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 10-Year Recurrence Intervals .....7-27

Figure 7.1-26. Modeled Flood Magnitudes for Various Streamflow Events Along Lower Esopus Creek .....7-27

Figure 7.1-27. 2016 FEMA FIS Locations along Lower Esopus Creek.....7-29

Figure 7.1-28. Turbidity Levels in Ashokan Reservoir .....7-33

Figure 7.1-29. Modeled Flow Rates and Turbidity Levels Along Lower Esopus Creek for the April 2005 Tubidity Level Event .....7-39

Figure 7.1-30. Modeled Flow Rates and Turbidity Levels of Spills and Releases for the March 2011 Turbidity Level Event .....7-41

Figure 7.1-31. Modeled Flow Rates and Turbidity Levels of Spills and Releases for the September 2011 Turbidity Level Event .....7-43

Figure 7.1-32. Flow Regime and Water Quality Parameters Evaluated for the Proposed Action in Lower Esopus Creek .....7-50

Figure 7.1-33. 100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....7-52

Figure 7.1-34. 100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....7-53

Figure 7.1-35. 100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....7-54

Figure 7.1-36. 100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....7-55

Figure 7.1-37. Modeled Velocity of Streamflow by Valley Reach in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....7-56

Figure 7.1-38. Modeled Depth of Sreamflow by Valley Reach in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....7-56

Figure 7.1-39. Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 1A – Vicinity of the Ashokan Center .....7-57

Figure 7.1-40. Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 1B – Vicinity of Hurley Mountain Road Bridge (Lomontville Gage).....7-58

Figure 7.1-41. Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 2C – Vicinity of Fording Place Road.....7-58

Figure 7.1-42. Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 3D – Vicinity of Leggs Mill Road (Lake Katrine).....7-59

Figure 7.1-43. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Photograph Documentation of Conditions: Background Streamflow and 600 MGD Releases .....7-63

Figure 7.1-44. Observed TSS and Turbidity Levels Along Lower Esopus Creek .....7-66

Figure 7.1-45. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Stream Geomorphology Cross Sections.....7-70

Figure 7.1-46. Observed Total Bank Retreat by Cross-Section over Seven Years of Monitoring, 2012 to 2018 .....7-71

Figure 7.1-47. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Local Near-bank Conditions Affecting Erosion.....7-73

Figure 7.1-48. Lower Esopus Creek Localized Factors Affecting Retreat.....7-79

Figure 7.2-1. Lower Esopus Creek FEMA Special Flood Hazard Area.....7-81

Figure 7.2-2. Lower Esopus Creek Coastal Management Zone .....7-83

Figure 7.2-3. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designation in Town of Olive.....7-87

Figure 7.2-4. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in the Town of Marbletown.....7-88

Figure 7.2-5. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in the Town of Hurley and City of Kingston .....7-89

Figure 7.2-6. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in Town of Ulster .....7-91

Figure 7.2-7. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in Town of Saugerties.....7-92

Figure 7.2-8. Lower Esopus Creek Zoning Districts in Town of Olive, Town of Marbletown, and Town of Hurley .....7-93

Figure 7.2-9. Lower Esopus Creek Agricultural District Overlay.....7-94

Figure 7.2-10. Lower Esopus Creek Zoning Districts in the Town of Ulster and City of Kingston.....7-96

Figure 7.2-11. Lower Esopus Creek Zoning Districts in Town of Saugerties and Village of Saugerties.....7-98

Figure 7.3-1. Lower Esopus Creek 12-Census Tracts .....7-105

Figure 7.3-2. Lower Esopus Creek Businesses and Farms within the Socioeconomic Study Area..7-111

Figure 7.4-1. Lower Esopus Creek Open Space and Recreational Resources.....7-130

Figure 7.5-1. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-144

Figure 7.5-2. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-145

Figure 7.5-3. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-146

Figure 7.5-4. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-147

Figure 7.5-5. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-148

Figure 7.5-6. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-149

Figure 7.5-7. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed in National/State Register of Historic Places .....7-151

Figure 7.5-8. Lower Esopus Creek The Ashokan-Turnwood Covered Bridge during Typical (Background) Streamflow and 600 MGD Release .....7-152

Figure 7.6-1. Lower Esopus Creek (Western Portion) Visual Resources .....7-157

Figure 7.6-2. Lower Esopus Creek (Eastern Portion) Visual Resources.....7-158

Figure 7.7-1. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Fish and Macroinvertebrate Sampling Stations.....7-169

Figure 7.7-2. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Fish and Macroinvertebrate Sampling Stations.....7-170

Figure 7.7-3. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Observed Submerged Aquatic Vegetation Beds ....7-178

Figure 7.8-1. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forests – Upstream of Spillway  
Confluence.....7-195

Figure 7.8-2. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forests – Downstream of Spillway  
Confluence.....7-196

Figure 7.8-3. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forest – Downstream of Spillway  
Confluence.....7-197

Figure 7.8-4. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forest – Downstream of Spillway  
Confluence.....7-198

Figure 7.8-5. Vegetative Community Changes Documented Wetlands Upstream of the Spillway  
Confluence.....7-202

Figure 7.8-6. Vegetative Community Changes Documented Wetlands Downstream of the  
Spillway Confluence.....7-204

Figure 7.8-7. Emerald Ash Borer (EAB) in New York State.....7-207

Figure 7.9-1. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek  
Study Area.....7-213

Figure 7.9-2. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek  
Study Area.....7-214

Figure 7.9-3. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek  
Study Area.....7-215

Figure 7.9-4. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek  
Study Area.....7-216

Figure 7.10-1. Lower Esopus Creek Bulk Storage Tank Sites.....7-225

Figure 8.1-1. Kensico Reservoir Project Location .....8-3

Figure 8.2-1. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Modeled Range of Average Settled Thickness of  
Alum Floc during WFF Program.....8-5

Figure 8.3-1. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Surface Water Locations and Water Quality  
Sampling Stations .....8-18

Figure 8.3-2. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Alum Floc Deposition Area .....8-22

Figure 8.3-3. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Flood Zones.....8-24

Figure 8.3-4. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Benthic Locations Sampled in Both 2007 and 2014 ....8-29

Figure 8.3-5. Length Frequency Distribution and Year Class of Brown Trout Collected in Kensico  
Reservoir via Boat Electrofishing Sampling Efforts in 1990, 1991, 1993, and 2001  
along with Gill Net Surveys Conducted in 1991, 2001, and 2010.....8-36

Figure 8.3-6. Length Frequency Distribution of Lake Trout Collected in Kensico Reservoir via  
Boat Electrofishing Sampling Efforts in 1990, 1991, 1993, and 2001 along with  
Gill Net Surveys Conducted in 1991, 2001, and 2010.....8-38

Figure 8.3-7. Total Abundance of Benthic Invertebrates (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys .....8-41

Figure 8.3-8. Taxa Richness of Benthic Invertebrates (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys .....8-41

Figure 8.3-9. Shannon Diversity Index (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys .....8-42

Figure 8.3-10. Percent Abundance of Chironomids (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys .....8-42

Figure 8.3-11. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Wetlands.....8-50

Figure 8.3-12. Kensico Reservoir Study Area National Land Cover Data.....8-55

Figure 8.3-13. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Land Use Designations.....8-62

Figure 8.3-14. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Zoning Districts.....8-63

Figure 8.3-15. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Open Space and Recreational Resources .....8-67

Figure 8.3-16. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Critical Environmental Area .....8-69

Figure 8.3-17. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Historic and Cultural Resources.....8-72

Figure 8.3-18. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Visual Resources.....8-74

Figure 8.3-19. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Spill Sites .....8-80

Figure 8.3-20. Kensico Reservoir Noise Study Area .....8-90

Figure 14.2-1. Ashokan Reservoir Alternatives .....14-5

Figure 14.2-2. Existing East Basin Dividing Weir and Diversion Wall.....14-8

Figure 14.2-3. Catskill Aqueduct Alternatives .....14-13

Figure 14.2-4. Kensico Reservoir Alternatives .....14-16

Figure 14.3-1. Alternate CSSO Curves for Ashokan Reservoir .....14-25

Figure 14.3-2. Observed Storage Levels at Ashokan Reservoir (2013-2019).....14-25

Figure 14.3-3. Maximum Release Level Comparison.....14-26

Figure 14.3-4. Maximum Release Level Comparison – Flood Recurrence .....14-27

Figure 14.3-5. Shandaken Diversions for the Future Without and With the Proposed Action and the 85% Delaware CSSO Curve with 10/15 MGD Community Release ROP.....14-33

Figure 14.3-6. Flow Duration Curves at the Spillway Confluence, 1971–2017.....14-35

Figure 14.3-7. Streamflow at the Spillway Confluence .....14-35

Figure 14.3-8. Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 100-Year Recurrence Intervals .....14-36

Figure 14.3-9. Occurrence and Average Magnitude of Various Release Types Between the Future With the Proposed Action and the Proposed ROP .....14-38

Figure 14.3-10. Occurrence of Release Turbidity Levels by Type of Year with the IRP .....14-39

Figure 14.3-11. Occurrence of Release Turbidity Levels by Type of Year with the ROP.....14-39

Figure 14.4-1. Monitoring Sites Along Lower Esopus Creek Included in the Water Quality Monitoring Plan Incorporated into the IRP ..... 14-43

Figure 14.4-2. Proposed Monitoring Sites Along Lower Esopus Creek Included in the Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan ..... 14-44

## LIST OF TABLES

Table ES-1.	Valley Segments and Reaches of Lower Esopus Creek .....	ES-17
Table ES-2.	Lower Esopus Creek Watershed by Valley Reach Sub-watershed.....	ES-19
Table ES-3.	Median Contribution of Flows from Ashokan Reservoir to Lower Esopus Creek Background Streamflow in the Future With the Proposed Action .....	ES-23
Table ES-4.	Potential Environmental Considerations by Resource Area for Activities Associated with Dredging.....	ES-37
Table ES-5.	Summary of Alternatives Assessment .....	ES-40
Table ES-6.	Proposed Revised Release Protocol.....	ES-45
Table ES-7.	Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan .....	ES-46
Table 4-1.	Components of the Proposed Action Evaluated in the EIS .....	4-2
Table 4-2.	Infrastructure and Operational Assumptions in the EISS .....	4-2
Table 5.1-1.	OST Model Assumptions for the EIS .....	5-2
Table 5.2-1.	Emissions Scenarios Considered for the EIS .....	5-5
Table 5.2-2.	Observed Lower Esopus Creek Data Sources Used in the EIS .....	5-7
Table 5.2-3.	Hydrologic Inputs to Lower Esopus Creek Models.....	5-10
Table 5.3-1.	Summary of Questionnaire Distribution.....	5-29
Table 5.3-2.	Types of Aesthetic and Visual Resources Considered for Assessment .....	5-32
Table 6.1-1.	Valley Segments and Reaches of Lower Esopus Creek .....	6-2
Table 6.1-2.	Lower Esopus Creek Watershed by Valley Reach Sub-watershed.....	6-9
Table 6.2-1.	Median Contribution of Flows from Ashokan Reservoir to Lower Esopus Creek Background Streamflow in the Future with the Proposed Action .....	6-16
Table 7.1-1.	Magnitude and Duration of Spills in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action .....	7-3
Table 7.1-2.	Average Number of Days Per Year of Modeled Turbidity Levels of Flows between the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....	7-9
Table 7.1-3.	Observed Average Water Temperatures in Ashokan Reservoir and Lower Esopus Creek by Season.....	7-22
Table 7.1-4.	Flood Frequency Estimates for the 100-year Recurrence Interval.....	7-28
Table 7.1-5.	FEMA FIS Summary of Discharges .....	7-28
Table 7.1-6.	Summary of Spills, Influent Turbidity Levels, and Ashokan Turbidity Levels for Alum Events (Observed) .....	7-30
Table 7.1-7.	Modeled Spills, Influent Turbidity Levels, and Ashokan Turbidity Levels for the Future Without and With the Proposed Action for Historical Alum Events .....	7-35
Table 7.1-8.	DEP Water Supply Reliability Metrics for the Future Without and Future With the Proposed Action Over the OST Simulation Period .....	7-47
Table 7.1-9.	Localized Factors Influencing Bank Retreat.....	7-78

Table 7.3-1.	Demographics within the 12 Census Tracts.....	7-104
Table 7.3-2.	Housing Stock Adjacent to Lower Esopus Creek by Type.....	7-106
Table 7.3-3.	Housing Prices Within the Study Area .....	7-107
Table 7.3-4.	Businesses Within the Study Area with the Potential to be Economically Dependent on Lower Esopus Creek.....	7-110
Table 7.3-5.	Average Annual Rate of Change in Nominal Market Value of a Single-Family Home.....	7-114
Table 7.3-6.	Summary of Resident Questionnaires Distributed and Received .....	7-115
Table 7.3-7.	Summary of Reported Seasonal Activity Days for Residents Adjacent to Lower Esopus Creek (n=105) .....	7-117
Table 7.3-8.	Summary of Expected Change in Residents' Participation in Recreational Activities Along Lower Esopus Creek Associated with Various Streamflow Water Quality and Conditions for Residents Adjacent to Lower Esopus Creek (n=105) .....	7-121
Table 7.3-9.	Summary of Business Questionnaires Distributed and Responses Received .....	7-124
Table 7.4-1.	Open Space and Recreational Resources in the Study Area.....	7-128
Table 7.4-2.	Days (On Average) Lower Esopus Creek Streamflow would be Above Specific Flows in July and August in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....	7-134
Table 7.4-3.	Expected Change in Days Respondents Would Participate in Fishing due to Lower Esopus Creek Conditions (n=97).....	7-137
Table 7.5-1.	Historic Resources Within the Study Area .....	7-140
Table 7.6-1.	Visual Resources Within the Study Area.....	7-155
Table 7.7-1.	Spatial and Temporal Distribution of Fish and Macroinvertebrate Sampling Stations.....	7-168
Table 7.7-2.	Richness and Biological Impact Assessment Scores, Stream Macroinvertebrate Sampling, 2009 to 2017 .....	7-172
Table 7.7-3.	Presence/Absence of Fish Species Collected During Electrofishing Surveys .....	7-175
Table 7.7-4.	Presence/Absence of Fish Species Collected During Electrofishing Surveys .....	7-176
Table 7.7-5.	Suitable Turbidity Levels for Fish Species and Life Stages and Days Per Year Exceeded (Upstream of the Spillway Confluence).....	7-183
Table 7.7-6.	Suitable Turbidity Levels for Fish Species and Life Stages and Days Per Year Exceeded (Downstream of the Spillway Confluence) .....	7-187
Table 7.7-7.	HSI Matrix for Upstream, Future Without (No IRP) and Future With (IRP) the Proposed Action Hydrological Conditions (Wet, Normal and Dry Years) .....	7-191
Table 7.7-8.	HSI Matrix for Downstream, Future Without (No IRP) and Future With (IRP) the Proposed Action Hydrological Conditions (Wet, Normal and Dry Years).....	7-192
Table 7.8-1.	Summary of Delineated Wetlands Upstream of the Spillway Confluence .....	7-194
Table 7.8-2.	Summary of Dominant Wetland Vegetation Documented Upstream of the Spillway Confluence between 2006 and 2018.....	7-200

Table 7.8-3.	Summary of Delineated Wetlands Downstream of the Spillway Confluence .....	7-202
Table 7.8-4.	Summary of Dominant Wetland Vegetation Documented Downstream of the Spillway Confluence Between 2012 and 2018 .....	7-203
Table 7.8-5.	Summary of Downed and Leaning Trees within the Floodplain Upstream of the Spillway Confluence (Valley Reach 1A).....	7-207
Table 7.9-1.	National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek Study Area .....	7-212
Table 7.9-2.	Assessment of Threatened, Endangered, Special Concern, and Rare Species that Potentially Occur in the Study Area .....	7-219
Table 8.2-1.	Potential Environmental Considerations by Resource Area for Activities Associated with Dredging .....	8-6
Table 8.2-2.	Summary of Historical Alum Application Events from April 5, 2005 to Present .....	8-9
Table 8.2-3.	Estimated Total Sediment Volume .....	8-11
Table 8.2-4.	Construction Schedule .....	8-16
Table 8.3-1.	Kensico Reservoir Sampling Turbidity Results from January 1, 2017 to December 31, 2017 .....	8-20
Table 8.3-2.	2017 TSS and Turbidity Summary Statistics for Kensico Watershed Streams N12 and N5-1.....	8-21
Table 8.3-3.	2016 Turbidity Summary Statistics for Kensico Reservoir Sampling Sites 4.1BRK and 5BRK .....	8-21
Table 8.3-4.	Benthic Invertebrates Collected and Identified During Sampling of 41 Locations at CATIC Cove in 2007 and 2014 .....	8-31
Table 8.3-5.	Benthic Community Index Values for Samples Collected at CATIC Cove in 2007 and 2014.....	8-32
Table 8.3-6.	Fish Species Collected During NYSDEC Surveys of Kensico Reservoir .....	8-35
Table 8.3-7.	Breakdown of Cowardin Wetlands and Deepwater Habitats and Area within the Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	8-48
Table 8.3-8.	Total Area by Cowardin Wetland and Deepwater Habitat Types within the Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	8-49
Table 8.3-9.	National Land Cover Data for the Kensico Reservoir Study Area .....	8-53
Table 8.3-10.	Upland Vegetation Inventory Observed During 2014 and 2015 Site Visits.....	8-54
Table 8.3-11.	NYSDEC Monitored Concentrations of Criteria Air Pollutants in the Region .....	8-87
Table 14.1-1.	List of Alternatives Evaluated .....	14-2
Table 14.2-1.	Summary of Alternative Analysis.....	14-20
Table 14.3-1.	IRP Community Release Rules.....	14-24
Table 14.3-2.	Maximum Release Level Comparison.....	14-27
Table 14.3-3.	Maximum Release and Alum Days .....	14-28
Table 14.3-4.	IRP Turbidity Levels .....	14-28
Table 14.3-5.	ROP Turbidity Levels.....	14-29



Table 14.3-6.	Probability of Refill .....	14-31
Table 14.3-7.	Stop Shutters, Shaft 4 and Percent Alum Days.....	14-34
Table 14.4-1.	Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan .....	14-42

This page intentionally left blank

**ACRONYMS**

**AQI** – Air Quality Index  
**ARWG** – Ashokan Release Working Group  
**AST** – Aboveground Storage Tank  
**ATP** – Alum Treatment Plan  
**BANCS** – Bank Assessment for Non-Point Source Consequence of Sediment  
**BEHI** – Bank Erosion Hazard Index  
**BGPA** – Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act  
**BMP** – Best Management Practices  
**CATIC** – Catskill Influent Chamber  
**CEA** – Critical Environmental Areas  
**CEQR** – City Environmental Quality Review  
**CF** – Channel-forming  
**CFS** – Cubic feet per second  
**CMP** – Coastal Management Plan  
**CMZA** – Coastal Management Zone Area  
**CRIS** – Cultural Resource Information System  
**CSSO** – Conditional Seasonal Storage Objective  
**CWA** – Clean Water Act  
**cy** – Cubic yards  
**CZMA** – Coastal Zone Management Act  
**dB** – Decibels  
**dB(A)** – A-weighted Decibel Scale  
**dbh** – Diameter at breast height  
**DEIS** – Draft Environmental Impact Statement  
**DEM** – Digital Elevation Model  
**DEP** – New York City Department of Environmental Protection  
**EAB** – Emerald Ash Borer  
**ECL** – Environmental Conservation Law  
**EIS** – Environmental Impact Statement  
**EPA** – U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
**EPT** – Ephemeroptera/Plecoptera/Trichoptera  
**FAA** – Federal Aviation Administration  
**FAD** – Filtration Avoidance Determination

**FEIS** – Final Environmental Impact Statement  
**FEMA** – Federal Emergency Management Agency  
**FFMP** – Flexible Flow Management Plan  
**FIRM** – Federal Insurance Rate Map  
**FIS** – Flood Insurance Study  
**ft/s** – Feet per second  
**GB** – General business  
**GOSR** – Governor's Office of Storm Recovery  
**gpm** – Gallons per minute  
**HB** – Highway Business  
**HBI** – Hilsenhoff's Biotic Index  
**HC** – Highway commercial  
**HDR** – High-density residence  
**HRDC** – Hudson River Tunnel Drainage Chamber  
**HSI** – Habitat Suitability Indices  
**HUD** – U.S. Department of Housing & Urban Development  
**IB** – Inner Berm  
**IPaC** – Information for Planning and Consultation  
**IQR** – Interquartile Range  
**IRP** – Interim Ashokan Release Protocol  
**JTU** – Jackson Turbidity Units  
**KEC** – Kensico-Eastview Connection  
**Ldn** – Day-night average sound level  
**LEHD** – Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics  
**LEWP** – Lower Esopus Watershed Project  
**LWRP** – Local Waterfront Revitalization Program  
**MBTA** – Migratory Bird Treaty Act  
**MDR** – Medium-density Residence  
**MGD** – Million Gallons per Day  
**mg/kg** – Milligrams per Kilogram  
**mg/L** – Milligrams per Liter  
**MHI** – Median Household Income  
**NAAQS** – National Ambient Air Quality Standards  
**NALMS** – North American Lake Management Society  
**NBS** – Near-Bank Stress

**NC** – Neighborhood Commercial  
**NCO** – Number of non-chironomid and oligochaetes taxa  
**NOAA** – National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
**NRCS** – Natural Resources Conservation Service  
**NTP** – Notice to Proceed  
**NTU** – Nephelometric Turbidity Units  
**NWI** – National Wetland Inventory  
**NWS** – National Weather Service  
**NY** – New York  
**NYC** – New York City  
**NYCRR** – New York City Rules and Regulations  
**NYRCR** – New York Rising Community Reconstruction  
**NYMA** – New York Metropolitan Area  
**NYNHP** – New York Natural Heritage Program  
**NYS** – New York State  
**NYSDEC** – New York State Department of Environmental Conservation  
**NYSDOH** – New York State Department of Health  
**NYSDOS** – New York State Department of State  
**NYSOPRHP** – New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation  
**O&W** – Ontario and Western  
**OLI** – Office/Light Industrial  
**OM** – Office Manufacturing  
**OST** – Operations Support Tool  
**PEJ** – Potential Environmental Justice  
**PPM** – Part per Million  
**PW** – Planned Waterfront  
**RI** – Recurrence Interval  
**ROP** – Revised Operating Protocol  
**RWBT** – Rondout West Branch Tunnel  
**SAV** – Submerged Aquatic Vegetation  
**SBU** – Stream Biomonitoring Unit  
**SC** – Silt-clay  
**SDWA** – Safe Drinking Water Act  
**SEQRA** – State Environmental Quality Review Act  
**SFHA** – Special Flood Hazard Area

**SHPO** – State Historic Preservation Office  
**SPDES** – State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System  
**sq mi** – Square miles  
**SWTR** – Surface Water Treatment Rules  
**TAGM** – Technical and Administrative Guidance Memorandum  
**TSS** – Total Suspended Solids (or Sediment)  
**µg/L** – micrograms per liter  
**U.S.** – United States  
**USACE** – U.S. Army Corps of Engineers  
**UEC** – Upper Effluent Chamber  
**USDA** – U.S. Department of Agriculture  
**USFWS** – U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
**USGS** – U.S. Geological Survey  
**UST** – Underground Storage Tank  
**UV** – Ultraviolet Light  
**WD** – Waterfront Overlay District  
**WFF** – Water for the Future  
**WFP** – Water Filtration Plant  
**WWQMP** – Watershed Water Quality Monitoring Plan