

# Joint Bidding – Bid Data Analysis

April 30, 2024

As DDC continues to bid out projects with Joint Bidding, the data show more bids at lower cost than projects without Joint Bidding.

DDC bids projects with and without Joint Bidding. Projects with underground work like water and sewer lines generally have utility interferences and utilize Joint Bidding. Some surface-level improvement projects do not disturb utility lines, so Joint Bidding isn't needed. A small subset of projects has utility interferences that cannot be identified in advance, requiring DDC to utilize "Section U" of its construction contract instead of Joint Bidding. These projects rely on the 'old model' of direct, closed-door negotiations between contractors and utility companies after the street is opened.

To understand the impact of Joint Bidding on bid response and prices, DDC analyzed a year's worth of bid data. We found that projects utilizing Joint Bidding receive more bids and at lower bid amounts than projects without utility interference or those utilizing "Section U." **That means more competition and lower costs to taxpayers.**

	# Projects	Average		Low Bid vs. Estimate
		Bidders	Bidders Below Estimate	
JB4/5*	21	8.6	4.2	-13.2%
Sec U/None**	26	7.0	1.5	+9.6%
Overall	47	7.7	2.7	-5.9%

\*DDC launched JB 5.0 in January 2024; data includes projects bid under JB 4.0 and JB 5.0

\*\* "Section U" denotes projects with utility interferences that do not use Joint Bidding, such as projects with multiple locations under a single contract. "None" denotes projects without utility interferences.

The data, shown in detail on the following pages, indicate that JB projects receive an average of 8.6 bidders, compared to 7 bidders for projects without Joint Bidding. More significantly, the JB projects have more than twice as many bidders whose price falls below the engineer's estimate. **The net result is that JB projects come in an average of 13% below estimate – totaling \$65 million below the engineer's estimate over the past year.** By contrast, the data show non-JB bids coming in almost 10% above the estimate.

DDC's April 2024 bid results illustrate the trend:

- HWXP136D - Reconstruction of Grand Concourse Phase 5, Bronx: NY Asphalt Inc. is low bidder at \$43M. Engineer's Estimate \$46M.
- HWP2020KC - Complex Ped Ramp Installations, Brooklyn: J. Anthony Enterprise is low bidder at \$13.6M. Engineer's Estimate \$11.5M.
- HWCSCH4D - Safe Routes to Schools, Bronx: JR Cruz is apparent low bidder at \$23M. Engineer's Estimate was \$25.6M.
- HWPR20KMC - Complex Upgrades Pedestrian Ramps, Brooklyn & Manhattan: P&T II Contracting Corp is apparent low bidder at \$29.3M. Engineer's Estimate \$31.5M.
- HD-161DPL - Gateway Site Improvements: Bove Industries, Inc. is apparent Low bidder at \$10.4M. Engineer's Estimate \$12.9M.
- RED395AC - Installation Distribution WMs, Brooklyn & Staten Island: Huicatao Corp. is low bidder at \$16.9M. Engineer's Estimate \$23.7M.

- HWPR20MXC - Complex Pedestrian Ramp Upgrades, Bronx & Manhattan: Oliveira Contracting Inc. is low bidder at \$22.2M. Engineer's Estimate \$24.3M
- HWPR20MKL - Complex Upgrades Pedestrian Ramps, Landmarks in Manhattan & Brooklyn: MFM Contracting is apparent low bidder at \$13.7M. Engineer's Estimate \$16.1M
- HWS23QMWB - Installation of Sidewalks, Curbs & Ped Ramps (DDC Mentoring Project), Queens: CAG Construction Corporation bid was \$1.38M. Engineer's Estimate was \$800K. *CAG completed DDC's HWPMWBEQ pilot ped ramp contract last year. (non JB)*

### Project Bids by Utility Type – 4/2023-4/2024

Recent projects bid by utility type with bid results							
Project ID	Utility Type	Bid Date	Estimate	Low Bid	Low Bid vs Estimate	Bidders	Bidders Below Est
HD-161DPL	Sec U	4/10/2024	\$12,922,650.00	\$10,375,000.00	80.3%	12	8
HWCSCH4D	JB5	4/4/2024	\$25,549,507.54	\$22,955,814.60	89.8%	11	6
HWP2020KC	JB5	4/3/2024	\$11,531,008.33	\$13,568,367.45	117.7%	3	0
HWS23QMWB	None	4/3/2024	\$800,000.00	\$1,382,525.28	172.8%	8	0
RED395AC	JB5	4/3/2024	\$23,669,095.32	\$16,856,838.00	71.2%	11	10
HWXP136D	JB5	4/1/2024	\$45,948,463.00	\$42,967,297.53	93.5%	7	3
HED581	JB5	3/28/2024	\$14,755,855.26	\$13,111,866.75	88.9%	9	2
MED669	JB5	3/25/2024	\$101,925,669.61	\$85,830,966.00	84.2%	9	6
HWPR19MC1	JB5	3/20/2024	\$21,644,662.74	\$20,941,794.00	96.8%	10	1
HWPR20MCL	JB5	3/18/2024	\$12,442,702.44	\$14,464,912.76	116.3%	5	0
SANDHWSIB	JB5	3/11/2024	\$4,396,159.94	\$3,337,455.84	75.9%	10	7
HWS2023Q	None	2/22/2024	\$11,771,000.00	\$9,982,202.25	84.8%	10	2
EC-GUN24 (Rebid 1)	None	2/1/2024	\$9,517,630.00	\$14,276,250.00	150.0%	2	0
EC-LC24 (Rebid 1)	None	1/31/2024	\$12,429,142.00	\$13,874,094.00	111.6%	2	0
QED-1056	JB4	1/31/2024	\$14,404,314.61	\$12,785,432.72	88.8%	14	5
HWS2023R	None	1/19/2024	\$3,274,000.00	\$2,695,191.30	82.3%	4	2
HWS2023K	None	1/18/2024	\$9,142,000.00	\$8,369,924.00	91.6%	10	2
HWS2023M	None	1/16/2024	\$4,095,000.00	\$4,577,339.43	111.8%	7	0
HWS2023X	None	1/12/2024	\$4,951,000.00	\$4,324,964.49	87.4%	8	3
HWCURB10	None	1/11/2024	\$1,849,825.00	\$1,970,721.90	106.5%	7	0
HWPR23KQ	None	12/12/2023	\$13,174,915.00	\$16,994,710.00	129.0%	9	0
HWPR23QX	None	11/15/2023	\$13,174,915.00	\$16,261,334.00	123.4%	9	0
HWPR23Q1	None	11/9/2023	\$13,174,915.00	\$17,248,925.85	130.9%	8	0
HWPR23KR	None	11/8/2023	\$13,174,915.00	\$17,849,125.00	135.5%	8	0
HWPR23K1	None	10/26/2023	\$13,174,915.00	\$16,496,924.00	125.2%	9	0
HWP2024S	None	10/25/2023	\$4,419,198.33	\$5,865,575.50	132.7%	10	0
HWPR23MQ	None	10/24/2023	\$13,174,915.00	\$17,969,924.00	136.4%	7	0
HWK2048	None	10/13/2023	\$5,952,557.00	\$5,695,000.00	95.7%	10	3
EC-SEKN24	Sec U	9/28/2023	\$9,380,435.00	\$7,944,721.03	84.7%	7	5
EC-SEQN24	Sec U	9/27/2023	\$11,629,330.00	\$9,272,210.73	79.7%	6	4
EC-SEKS24	Sec U	9/22/2023	\$10,403,490.00	\$10,975,271.05	105.5%	4	2
EC-SER24	Sec U	9/20/2023	\$7,009,570.00	\$6,817,073.65	97.3%	6	4
EC-SEX24	Sec U	9/18/2023	\$7,809,625.00	\$7,305,227.50	93.5%	4	2
EC-SEQS24	Sec U	9/13/2023	\$14,972,950.00	\$13,839,188.44	92.4%	6	2
HWP19CWLM	JB4	8/16/2023	\$11,591,946.82	\$11,138,346.65	96.1%	5	1
WTM4SPRW	None	8/15/2023	\$4,670,204.65	\$4,138,480.00	88.6%	9	1
SER200251 (Rebid 1)	JB4	8/1/2023	\$15,671,926.73	\$13,958,235.60	89.1%	4	4
SELCDDC11	Sec U	7/6/2023	\$4,044,000.00	\$5,715,223.00	141.3%	1	0
SEQNS003	JB4	5/3/2023	\$38,517,561.00	\$25,626,959.50	66.5%	16	14
GKOH15-02	JB4	4/27/2023	\$34,456,731.00	\$32,617,725.77	94.7%	14	2

HWPR19MC2	JB4	4/26/2023	\$11,839,138.56	\$11,719,329.69	99.0%	6	1
QED1059	JB4	4/21/2023	\$22,453,411.00	\$14,716,637.09	65.5%	14	11
HWTRR1	JB4	4/5/2023	\$13,511,117.27	\$12,100,444.00	89.6%	6	2
RED394	JB4	4/4/2023	\$20,889,129.00	\$17,085,532.00	81.8%	10	7
HWPR19QRC	JB4	2/23/2023	\$5,945,138.00	\$4,867,332.00	81.9%	4	2
HWPR20MKL	JB5	4/17/2024	\$16,113,997.14	\$13,725,000.00	85.2%	8	4
HWPR20MXC	JB5	4/15/2024	\$24,268,446.71	\$22,193,221.44	91.4%	5	1

### Project Bidders by Utility Type – 4/2023-4/2024

#	Bidder	JB 4/5	Sec U + None	Total
	Total Project Opportunities	21	26	47
1	A.L.A.C. CONTRACTING CORP.	3	0	3
2	ADC CONSTRUCTION LLC	0	3	3
3	AKELA CONTRACTING LLC / CIVETTA COUSINS JV, LLC-JV	2	0	2
4	ALLSTATE SALES GROUP INC.	0	3	3
5	APACHE ENVIRONMENTAL & DEVELOPMENT LLC	0	1	1
6	BOVE INDUSTRIES, INC.	2	1	3
7	C.A.C. INDUSTRIES, INC.	14	19	33
8	CAG CONSTRUCTION CORPORATION	0	1	1
9	D&G ELITE CONSTRUCTION INC.	0	2	2
10	DEBOE CONSTRUCTION CORP.	5	1	6
11	DEBORAH BRADLEY CONSTRUCTION & MGMT. SVCS. INC	0	1	1
12	DIFAZIO INDUSTRIES., INC.	17	19	36
13	EN-TECH CORP.	0	1	1
14	EN-TECH INFRASTRUCTURE LLC	0	2	2
15	FERREIRA CONSTRUCTION CO INC.	1	0	1
16	GALVIN BROS., INC./MADHUE CONTRACTING, INC.	1	2	3
17	GIANFIA CORP	8	10	18
18	HALCYON CONSTRUCTION CORP.	5	0	5
19	HONEY CONSTRUCTION NY INC	0	1	1
20	HUICATAO CORP	9	5	14
21	INTER CONTRACTING CORP.	4	0	4
22	INTER LAPERUTA JV	2	0	2
23	J. ANTHONY ENTERPRISES, INC.	7	13	20
24	J. D'ANNUNZIO & SONS, INC.	1	0	1
25	J. PIZZIRUSSO LANDSCAPING CORP.	12	8	20
26	JCC CONSTRUCTION CORP.	1	0	1
27	JOHN P. PICONE INC.	1	0	1
28	JRCRUZ CORP.	21	22	43
29	KCM CONTRACTING INC	0	1	1
30	LAWS CONSTRUCTION CORP.	6	10	16
31	MASPETH SUPPLY CO, LLC	3	4	7
32	MAX BUILDERS INC	0	1	1
33	MFM CONTRACTING CORP.	6	5	11
34	NEW YORK CONCRETE CORP.	1	0	1

35	NY ASPHALT INC	2	0	2
36	OLIVEIRA CONSTRUCTION INC.	4	7	11
37	ON TOP RENOVATION INC.	0	1	1
38	P & T II CONTRACTING CORP.	16	6	22
39	PERFETTO CONTRACTING CO. INC.	11	1	12
40	PERFETTO ENTERPRISES COMPANY, INC.	15	7	22
41	PIONEER ASPHALT PAVING CONTRACTORS LLC	0	1	1
42	POWER CONCRETE CO., INC.	0	5	5
43	QUINTAL CONTRACTING CORP	0	1	1
44	RE-EARTH OF STROUDSBURG INC.	0	3	3
45	RESTANI CONSTRUCTION CORP.	3	2	5
46	ROAD WORK AHEAD, INC.	0	8	8
47	SASCO CONSTRUCTION SERVICE LLC	0	1	1
48	SHAZI CONSTRUCTION CO., INC	0	1	1
49	SPINIELLO COMPANIES	0	2	2
50	STEVEN DUBNER LANDSCAPING, INC.	0	1	1
51	SUN GENERAL CONSTRUCTION INC	0	1	1
52	TRIUMPH CONSTRUCTION CORP.	13	3	16
53	TULLY CONSTRUCTION CORP.	3	0	3
54	VALES CONSTRUCTION CORP.	0	10	10
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>199</b>	<b>197</b>	<b>396</b>