NYC Civic Engagement

Commission Meeting

1:30P – 2:37P

*Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) captioning is provided to facilitate*

*communication accessibility. CART captioning and this realtime file may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.*

**»» Hi Anastasia, hi Francis, how are you?**

**»» I'm well.**

**»» Today's meeting is only an hour long.**

**»» Yes, it's a short meeting today.**

**»» Hello Michael.**

**»» Good morning or good afternoon.**

**»» Good afternoon I almost said good morning back (LAUGHTER).**

**»» Just a question I thought I was on, was I not on the commission meeting in October?**

**» Francis Urroz: I think you were out, yeah.**

**»» I may have been traveling then.**

**»» Hi Mark!**

**»» Hello?**

**»» Hello.**

**»» Yes, calling from community board 7 this is civic engagement commission meeting today.**

**»» Yes, that's right.**

**»» Okay. I'm having a challenge, I prefer to see it online, can you send me the link.**

**»» Sure what's your e—mail.**

**»» Okay, will do.**

**»» We're waiting for quorum, right?**

**»» That's right.**

**»» Hello Sarah.**

**»» Hello everyone.**

**»» Hi!**

**»» Who was that, sorry.**

**»» Jose, sorry.**

**»» That's what I thought, hi Jose.**

**»» I see Jose. Michael, Mark, am I right we need two more Francis.**

**»» One more.**

**»» One more, okay. Holly just joined.**

**»» Okay.**

**»» There we go.**

**How short are we from a quorum.**

**»» I think we got one because Anthony is here.**

**»» We're good to go.**

**»» Awesome. Okay, thank you so much everyone. So, I'm going to call the meeting to order now.**

**Sarah Sayeed: And as we usually do, just quickly go through technical assistance again.**

**Before we get into the attendants. Everyone knows we'v enabled audio for all the Commissioners if you're not speaking please keep your self on mute. And please do keep your video cameras on. Unless you may have some good reason not to, we do prefer you have your video camera on. So, then everyone who is not a Commissioner to members of the public here with us welcome.**

**We do mute participants on entry the moderator who is Francis will enable audio for participants during public comment period. And we'll be calling on people in order they registered for public comment. Prior to the meeting. And you also have an opportunity to register comment during the meeting. If you can please do that by 2:00 p.m. That would be greatly appreciated.**

**By dropping your name in the chat, that you would like to comment in the public comment section. Or, if you're dialing in via phone during the meeting I don't have access to a computer monitor you can are text your name and affiliation to 6467632189 to offer public comment and we'll call on you the dial in participant by name in order that the text was received.**

**We do have captioning today and you can enable closed captioning under more options, which you will find by clicking on the ellipsis.**

**For some reason —— I'm not seeing that option when I click on that. I don't know Francis ——**

**Why that might be? But, maybe it's automatically enabled, not sure.**

**»» Yeah, the options should appear it is appearing on my screen under more, once you click it, it gives the chat QA closed options. Sorry closed captions not options.**

**»» It is the 3 dots next to the chat function. Because I still have three dots next to the reactions button. Which is showing me different things.**

**» Yes you can enable closed captioning that way. Great. So, I think now we can move into the next section. Which is just I want to make sure that everyone has received the agenda for today's meeting. Is there anyone on the call who has not gotten it? Everyone should have gotten an agenda, so we'll just move into the attendance, portion. Is Jack here, if you can please answer here that would be helpful. Murad Awewdeh? Eve Baron?**

**»» Here, good afternoon.**

**» Hi. Holly Bonner?**

**»» Here.**

**» Amy Breedlove?**

**»» Mark Diller?**

**»» I'm here, good afternoon.**

**» Donna Veronica Gill? Anthony Harmon?**

**»» Here.**

**» Jose Hernandez?**

**»» Here.**

**» Michael Nussbaum.**

**»» Here.**

**» Lilliam Perez?**

**»» Annetta Seecherran? Anastasia Somoza?**

**»» Here.**

**» Okay. Thanks everyone. And just for the record, going to say my name as well it is Sarah Sayeed I'm one of the 15 Commissioners who make up the civic engagement commission also happy to serve in the role of chair and executive director. And we do have because it's the holiday period starting and realize that everyone is busy. Lots of things going on people tend to close out things so we're going to have a shorter meeting today.**

**And we have a shorter public comment period as well. So, again if you would like to comment we would love to have you drop your name into the chat or text again. Or text on the number that I mentioned before which was 6467632189.**

**Our first order of business is just to approve the minutes from October 26.**

**»» So moved.**

**» Move to approve.**

**»» Is there a second?**

**»» Yes. Second.**

**» Okay. All in favor of approving the minutes?**

**»» I.**

**» Any opposed say nay?**

**» Okay I think we accomplished that relatively quickly. Minutes from October are now approved. In the program up dates we'll have part of this will be coming from the team and partly from me. So, we have some things to share with you new information and also just we are in the process of running a participatory budgeting process. In the neighborhoods right now also have some up dates for you about the future of PB.**

**In New York City which I think there are positive up dates will share that with you as well. So let's move now to just discussing the key up dates from the last election and this is the new information to share with you and going to turn it over to Francis to talk about this.**

**Francis Urroz: Hi everyone. Hope everyone's well! So, we finished doing our QA of the, utilization data from this past June 2021 primary. We just want to highlight a few key up dates. For this past election we served one hundred sites, 50 for, sorry 25 for early voting 75 for election day. The majority of our poll sites as you all know are located in Brooklyn. And offer Russian interpretation services so that is about 56% of the services provided. Offered Russian interpretation.**

**Some key notes to takeaways that we've seen —— steadily increasing service provision and —— I think we have published a lot of advertisements and have connected with communities to get more information out about the polish assistance program, we are noting some increases in trends and this fiscal year, we do have a charter mandate to review our methodology by September first 2022.**

**So, as you know we've been working with the mayor's office of data analytics from the selection of our poll sites once we receive our information from the board of elections. But they will also be working with us to review and identify trends from the last three elections of course as a data sample, three elections. Not the most biggest dataset, but I think we'll take what we've learned in the last three cycles and I think we're also in the process of gathering and requesting more data from the census to help us with the analysis and fine tune our data selection for the poll sites.**

**I just wanted to note that we did serve a total of 850 voters. Majority of voters are were served during the election day. We'll be sharing our post selection report to you directly we'll break down the number of voters served on early voting day since election day. But just wanted to poll if you have any questions on voter utilization for this past June, 2021 primary.**

**»» Francis if I may is this one assembly district in Brooklyn or one election district? What's the narrowness of this number, of these numbers? Francis Urroz: This is across all of the poll sites we served. So, city—wide total voters that were ——**

**»» Total these are the total voters for every polling site in New York City for the primary in June?**

**» For the poll sites that we offer services at. We only offered services in at one hundred poll sites.**

**»» This is a city—wide for those that you identified, seems very, very low, all right.**

**» It was very low, the turn out. Yes. And this is an increase actually from the number of voters we served for the June primary in the June primary, sorry, —— poll —— I just realized this is November 2021.**

**»» I was going to ask you about that.**

**»» So sorry.**

**» Sorry about that. Yes, —— yes, I don't know I guess my mind, the data.**

**»» This is the general election then.**

**» Sorry. Yes. Sorry about that. I can't believe I missed that. But yes this is the correction, this is a November 2021 general election numbers.**

**»» Can we get the samples of where you had the one hundred sites, I would like to see how they are in terms of dis —— districts because that will give you a better idea of where the makeup is and where it is good or where it is deficient.**

**» Yes. Right. So, we can share that I think we can share the where the election districts are and just a general map. Most of our poll sites are located in the south Brooklyn area. Providing Russian interpretation services but to my earlier point before I caused all of this confusion, this is actually an increase from June 2021's primary in the June primary we served I believe 674 voters. So, this is a slight very marginal uptick. But I think from our conversations we have been —— intending to dedicate more resources to community outreach and advertisements.**

**I just want to reiterate that we do have this charter mandate coming up on September 1,2022 our plans in the next couple of months, is just to work with mayor's office of data analytics to review the past three election cycles that we served just to backtrack we've served the November 2020 general election, the June 2021 primary, and the November 2021 general election. So, we'll just be analyzing trends, looking at if there were election districts poll sites that did not have any utilization, for any languages or throughout these elections we'll be making that analysis and sharing that information with you.**

**But in the meantime we can go ahead and share the distribution of election districts the poll sites were located.**

**»» Francis this is Mark, didn't we also provide some services in one or more of the special elections last, February, March, time frame?**

**» Francis Urroz: We did not.**

**»» We didn't.**

**» I think from our methodology, we decided that we would only offer services if the poll sites were located in those election districts prior. So none of the poll sites were located in those districts.**

**»» If I can just take a quick thought share a quick thought about the numbers you presented.**

**»» Mark Diller: Numbers you presented are an increase over the numbers from the June primary if I'm understanding you correctly. About 20 or so percent higher than they were in the June primary which was probably the first big push for us to have these translation services or interpretation services. At a time in which the overall voting turnout for the general election was well south of miserable. That is a technical term. So, the thought that occurs to me one of the realities I think we discussed a year ago at this time, was that we need some consistency with where we offer services because it has to build the awareness of it has to build. And I think that one conclusion that can fairly be drawn of course we would like to see the numbers times with a couple more zeros at end of them. I think one of the conclusions that can be fairly drawn from our own experience here, is that we're already seeing a little bit of that building taking place. And I would hope that our report would emphasize or at least include that observation. If it is shared by my fellow Commissioners.**

**» Thank you for that I was actually, I put into the chat the resolution that we had agreed on about this specials just for your reference and also really good point about the participation rate overall.**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: I was reading in an article yesterday this was record low turnout compared to the last 7 decades. Participation in the 23% of eligible voters actually cast their ballot in this municipal election so that is I think that is pretty, pretty bleak sort of environment in which we're trying to provide services and so it is reassuring that the numbers are increasing. As people become more aware of the services we do have an ongoing issue that we have to kind of I think grapple with about how so far a lot of our work has focused on making people aware of services and I think an opportunity to sort of expand how we're thinking about elections and even to start working with people before by creating a demand for civic engagement overall.**

**And hope that we can work on that in the coming year as well. Someone had Eve had a question. The new legislation to give non—citizens right to vote in local elections will impact our mandate methodology or process —— um, really good question. I think we need to right now the methodology is focused on citizens of voting age. So, if and when that happens when it goes into effect we'll need to reassess how we are selecting poll sites for sure. For municipal elections only so we might have to create two tracks of methodologies.**

**»» You are not going to be tracking it for this primary statewide elections?**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: What do you mean tracking what.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: You're saying municipal elections I understand the issue with the new group that is going to be voting for only municipal elections but for this coming primary in June statewide elections. I'm just wondering how we can reidentify the methodology by not just focusing on one community in Brooklyn, and trying to go city wide and look at each borough and select some of those poll sites so you get a better flavor here. I'm concerned with absentee ballots people filling out absentee ballot it's was very poor this past fall if it increases this statewide election there is no way you can judge those people that are filling in a ballot in terms of needing access for language.**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: Yeah, that is a fair and important point about absentee ballots CDC is not translating our job is just to provide interpretation services in the poll sites so we're not really —— working with the absentee ballots and we may —— in future durations of this methodology want to think about that. And we're not obligated to hold hearing by this deadline if we wanted to we could propose to do it here sooner. The reason why we think it is better to wait until September till this actual date is because it will give us three cycle is of elections that we served in. Or do we already have that now?**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: Are they the same poll sites though, Sarah.**

**» The poll sites are dependent upon one BOs listing we have to get their list and apply the methodology to it, which is based on the concentration of communities that live around the poll site. So, we choose the highest ranking concentrations to provide services and the proportion of the poll sites that serve for instance, Russian, compared to all poll site that's we have is really determined by the concentration of Russian speakers in the city. As you know, language communities tend to live in clusters. Right? So, it makes sense that a lot of the people who speak Russian are in a particular geography. That is how it usually works for all the languages. And because we're choosing our methodology is reliant on concentration, that's why the geographies are in a particular like borough for example.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: You're relying on the concentration focusing on one particular community, the Russian community in Brooklyn, let's say regal park, forest hills or the Asian American communicate knit flushing both Korean and Chinese.**

**»» Well we do have, we are serving Russian in Queens just the majority of Russian sites are in Brooklyn but we do have services in Russian. For the Asian languages we can't duplicate what the VOE is providing, if the VOE is serving, certain languages in queens which they do, we wouldn't provide the services from CEC.**

**»» Anyway to get the numbers from the board of elections? To see how they service people compared to where you are?**

**» Sarah Sayeed: What do you mean by numbers, like.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: On the board of elections has interpreters that every poll site in New York City. I would assume they have collected some data. It would be interesting to see if they are even capable which I question, but if they are having some data, from all of their poll sites on interpretations, it would be interesting to see where it is so that in terms of the future that you're looking at where you are going to be looking at your data compared to what the board of elections has.**

**»» Amy Breedlove: Michael, if I can just jump in Sara I hope you don't mind. I'm not representing the BOE, in any way, but I will tell you as a poll site coordinator, the interpreters are not keeping track of how many people they talk to you. So, I don't know of any analytics being collected at that level. As Sarah said they are distributed throughout the borough. So, there are places where they are not needed at all. But because it is borough wide they are there. So, I just want to give some clarity on that. I hope that helps.**

**»» I appreciate it Amy I would love for someone to direct the board of elections they are going to have enough time obviously with the registration coming up. But I would love for them to ask their interpreters that are not exactly over burdened most of the time during the election that they keep a record of how many people come up to them in each language and just submit some kind of document. Simple form ——**

**»» I would actually like the BOE to start talking more about the fact that they do interpretation. And that we do as well. Because we've talked about this in a lot of our commission meetings.**

**»» Amy Breedlove: BOE is still giving out some information that isn't always correct or promoting services that we provide or that they even provide. So, that's a big barrier to entry right there.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: As you all know the new registrants are going to need probably a lot of interpretation. And these numbers are going to drastically change across the board throughout the city. And if we don't express the urgency, no one else is, I just would like to see if we can put this up there in terms of priority to talk to the BOE during this coming year. With the new administration and the shake up that will happen at the BOE because believe me it is going to change going forward from where the administration and the state want to see it.**

**»» Just to chime in on our understanding is that the interpreters are required to fill out an interpreter journal.**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: That documents how the services are being utilized. So we have started that conversation with the Board of elections about some of that process. So, we'll definitely share with them that you're interested to see that data. We also try to really work with them on being aligned on messaging because as you've said, Amy, operations on the ground require BOE staff the poll sites together to know that we're there and why we're there. So, I think continuing to get aligned on what their staff is being told and what our staff is also told I think that is an ongoing process. And there's always ways to improve messaging. So, we can just continue to share with them that this is an ongoing concern that you all have. So, we'll definitely do that. I guess in the interest of time, if it's okay I would just like to move to the next slide.**

**I'm going to ask that you wait to up date this on this piece, is that right?**

**»» I'll go ahead and take this one.**

**»» Thank you Francis.**

**»» Francis Urroz: So, as Mark mentioned earlier, back in the summer we decided to continue with our current methodology and level of service. And provide just a bigger push on our media and outreach multi lingual outreach working with community and ethnic media. This time our approach was to focus more on connecting with community media that have greater reach in the communities that we're serving. So we placed print ads in community and ethnic media we can share that list with you. We placed as for our sites in Staten Island if you did take the ferry you may have seen our ads for poll sites services so all of these advertisements of course are in our target language.**

**We partner with the mayor's office of immigrant affairs their community outreach to have our materials so our flyers, know your rights, information that tabling events, we also had an event with the New York immigration coalition and try to get information out there to community based organizations that do serve our populations. We also had a few get out to vote events with democracy NYC and people's bus Brooklyn and the Bronx we also placed TV ads, we really try to focus our ads in the languages that we see have lower vote ore turnout so we worked —— to get ads in Haitian Creole in radio, partner with a few elected officials. This included faith—based organizations we connected with the past summer we really try to think more holistically about what more of a community—oriented approach to outreach could look like, we're still developing that piece Julie has been thinking about that more for the new calendar year how we can push our information, I think from the hearing that we attended in the campaign finance board, I think a few learnings from this past election related to language access has been focusing on the know your rights piece to get communities involved. So, we'll be working to develop that piece of information.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: What was the budget allocated for this.**

**»» Francis Urroz: I believe our budget for this, please correct me if I'm wrong, Leslie was around,145,000 dollars.**

**»» We can get you the ——**

**»» That's correct is 150.**

**» Thank you.**

**» What are you going to ask for next time? I mean do you have plans to ask to increase this?**

**»» Sarah do you want to address the new needs in expansion? For poll site?**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: We were able to do this actually. Because we received additional funding. To expand both the operations as well as to supports of the outreach for the poll sites. So, the services apologies. So, in the immediate future, all of that, the additional expansion of services and additional funding for outreach has been baselined. So, we in the immediate future, which I think we want to see how we can continue to keep the services as they are and do more outreach. We didn't think concretely, like this is we want to expand this by X in terms of media yet. We haven't done that thinking yet. And welcome you to share more information with us. We can also give you additional information, more detailed information about like where we ran the ads where we printed them by type of media. I'm sure that is available as well.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: I would love to see it.**

**»» Yep.**

**» Sarah Sayeed: Okay, are we good to move on?**

**»» Um—hum.**

**» This is Julie's ——**

**»» Hi everyone. Hope you all are doing well with the up coming holidays as well.**

**»» Julie Kim: Quick up date on the language assistance advisory committee. We are we have a December 15 scheduled with existing members. However, it has been a few months since we've convened with the upcoming new year on 2022. And just thinking through poll site, the language assistance advisory committee will be helping with thinking through our outreach and community engagement plans and how we can make sure we're reaching more people. In addition to what Francis was talking about with advertising and marketing.**

**So, we're working on recruiting new members to join the language assistance advisory committee, would really love your help and making sure that the application gets out there. I will put the link, in the chat. And I believe Dr. Sarah Sayeed has sent out the application and the graphic to all the Commissioners as well. But, two key main things that are coming up is, we're going to be having our meeting tomorrow. And then also once we have all of the applications in, once we have a robust and full committee, we hope to have a launch for the language assistance advisory committee making sure that we have all the members on the committee on our website. I think that with the lack and especially with the new legislation coming out language access is going to be a huge part and really important part of strategy and thinking through how we can better serve voters too. So, we're hoping that with the new revamp we can play a leading role in just thinking through some of this, for not just the poll site but the city at large as well. So, that is the update for the LAC.**

**» Thanks Julie before we go to participatory budgeting I just wanted to go back to the special elections question again. As a reminder in case there is already a special that has been declared in Manhattan in the 60th assembly. What we do is we according to our resolution, we compare the poll site locations to where we provided services in November. And we may provide services if there is an overlap. So, if for example, we serve this assembly district in the last general, we would consider serving them again. To resources and just want to let you know that we did that check. We compared we did not have any sites in the November election in the 68th assembly district. So there is no —— requirement for the civic engagement commission to service that election coming up in January.**

**Sarah Sayeed: That will be the same methodology we'll use if there are other specials that come up. The other point I wanted to let you know about, related to voter engagement is that we've been in talks with democracy NYC and administration about how to improve efficiency of operations between CEC and DNYC functions and we'll be following up with you with additional details very soon about that. Hoping for greater syncing there. So, just wanted to give you a heads up in that piece. We can go to the next slide.**

**So, you all we already told you this, again not new information, mayor has invested 1.3 million dollars to support recovery in the 33 Neighborhoods. We're working with the under the task force, racial inclusion and equity. Each of these Neighborhoods has a coalition lead, where they are working to strengthen the on the ground connectivity and cohesion of the Neighborhood to be more responsive in the event of a disaster. So, leveraging our other health emergency that could happen in the future. Leveraging that networking and that space we're running a participatory budgeting process in these Neighborhoods. Where each Neighborhood has 40,000 dollars to decide how to spend their funding. The Neighborhoods identified some of their priorities to include mental health gun violence prevention hunger and youth programming we can go to the next slide.**

**We have launched the process of we're calling it the people's money. That is already in play like we've done the first part to identify the needs in the Neighborhoods we did that. We did the needs assessment, we've developed the proposals each CBO was responsible for developing a proposal in their area. And we vetted the proposal so the ballots are now online and voting has begun. And we would greatly appreciate your involvement in helping us get out the vote for participatory budgeting.  The winners will be announced between January 25 to 30. And CEC has an extensive plan. Both in partnership with the organizations as well as partnership with city agencies and other entities to help raise the awareness about voting period and hopefully get people to participate. And then once the voting, winners are announced CBOs have until June 30 to implement their programs.**

**The winning projects —— can we go to the next slide.**

**»» Eligibility anyone who lives works attends school in one of these 33 Neighborhoods is eligible to vote in this process. Residents are 11 and older regardless of their immigration status can vote in this process. We have put together outreach kit we'll be sharing that with you that includes post cards flyers other graphic that's you can use to promote on social media. We'll also have a media campaign on this connecting with agency partners, briefings also planning on the ground canvassing operation in January. And looking to provide incentives to get volunteers involved, in helping get out the vote. So, we definitely want your support with this. Can we go to the next slide?**

**Thank you. We are giving people a variety of options for how to vote. Definitely our strongest preferred method is actually voting on our participate site. Where people can choose their Neighborhood and then pick their ballot and submit their vote there. If people have difficulty with that online interface we've also developed paper ballot that we're sharing with organizations. They can also call us and ask to vote by phone. We've created one of the challenges that people have shared with us organizations have shared with us is that voting on the participate platform requires people to have an account on the platform. Part of why it is set up that way is you remember the participate platform is based on open source platform that is used across the world. To participatory budgeting and other participatory processes. So, people need to create an account to vote. It helps protect the integrity of a ballot, people can only vote once if they vote through the platform it is assured. However we've heard that it will be difficult could be difficult for people to create an account, both for technical reasons as well as just people being opposed to sharing their information with the government agency. To set up the account so we tried to be responsive to that and created what we're calling assisted voting which is they can fill out a survey online.**

**That doesn't require them to create the account. So, we have to kind of merge all of these different data points together and we'll be working with our organizational partners to get data entered and merged to create the final tally for the winning projects. Are there any questions on this piece? On the participatory budgeting?**

**Michael Nussbaum: I will jump in have you reached out to the new counsel members the 35 who are coming in to alert ——**

**» yes. Thank you so much for asking that question.**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: We are doing a briefing actually happens to be today. That both new members as well as counsel members who are working in the districts, current council members working in the districts, that these 33 Neighborhoods fall into. We did invite them. So, we'll see who is available to attend today. But it is —— yes. Short answer to your question is yes. (LAUGHTER).**

**»» That's good, the other question is, has the transition from the incoming administration reached out to you and the staff?**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: Yes.**

**»» Michael Nussbaum: And?**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: We are we were all agencies, we're asked to give information about like the current state of play. So, we submitted that, we also have conversation coming up with one of the transition committees which is focused on civic engagement aligning like around the work of civic engagement across agencies I also am serving on that committee in my personal capacity. So, we haven't heard anything beyond that. But it is like an ongoing conversation, we'll have more updates to share with you.**

**» Thank you.**

**»» Yeah.**

**» Sarah Sayeed: I would like as a takeaway or next step or action step for each of you, if you could just think about one entity or organization even perhaps your own, where you could share out the participatory budgeting.  Ballots —— we would love you to do that. We'll make sure that you have the information to do that.**

**»» To do that the voting would need to be in, —— voting is limited to the Neighborhoods those Neighborhoods is it not.**

**»» It is.**

**» So, I'm going to take a wild guess mine is not one of them. And so, I'm not sure how effective outreach may be.**

**» You can still help by sharing with people in the neighborhoods I'm sure you know people all across the city. (LAUGHTER).**

**»» Voting in this process it's people who residents who —— work or go to school in one of the 33 Neighborhoods? Just quick clarification.**

**»» I saw the map, but do we have a list of those 33 Neighborhoods? Because a written list is a little easier than the map.**

**»» Yeah. Yeah, but we can send you both the Neighborhoods are listed in different places, one is on the actual TRIE website but on the PH for participate when they go to vote they have to actually select their Neighborhood. But you're right they have to know if they live in that Neighborhood to know whether they can participate. So that that step is checking if they live in the 33 Neighborhoods. So we can make sure you have that. —— question in the chat.**

**»» Sarah going forward 14 of the Commissioners do other things, you're the lead obviously. There is a lot of data a lot of communication press releases, other information that comes out of the commission. And I don't know what the policy is if it is not too burdensome. That the Commissioners should always receive whatever information that you have internally as well as externally, that we get it. I just site example of the statement that you made last week the city counsel vote on expansion of the voting issue that the Commissioners, at least I did not receive it, maybe it was sent out I apologize if it was, but I did not see anything in terms of statement from the commission. That when publish, that I as a Commissioner never saw. May be other informational material that I would love for you to share because we'll keep it internal not make it public, but what the staff and you do, I would love to be able to see that. And not just when we have these meetings.**

**»» Noted we can definitely have better communication with you about like media advice and other things that are happening. Just to clarify, we didn't offer any testimony is that what you mean?**

**»» No, there was a statement that I saw somewheres ——**

**»» Oh, it was posted on our social media. So you're right. Noted very, very important point. We should constantly keep you apprised on what we're putting out there. So, let's team let's make a note of that please. And follow through.**

**»» Particularly sharing data. And information. In between these meetings. Would just make a dialogue a lot more substantive.**

**» Um—hum. Yes. Thank you so much for that. That feedback. So, we definitely can improve in that area. I lost my train of thought. Are there any other questions on the participatory budgeting piece? Did we have it before I continue because I realize I'm going a little bit over. Did we have any requests to offer comment Francis?**

**»» No we have not.**

**» Okay. So —— I'm going to —— if we can go to the next slide I would like to give you a budget update of what we were given in the November plan. So, here we have some good news. We have an allocation for citywide expense PD beginning in FY 23 for FY 24 this is not a capital process. It is investment of 5 million dollars. And it will be run similar to what we're running in the Neighborhoods now.**

**Another great piece of news to go along with that we did receive funding for staff support to run this process. Across the city. And that includes additional lines that have been baselined into our budget more outreach lines outreach manager project management lines, as well as director of digital engagement. And additional funds to support the promotion the program translations evaluations et cetera. And also funds to support outreach. On the ground outreach. With CBO partners community boards et cetera. And this is also the funding that we had that we mentioned to you for poll site expansion, adding more poll sites and the lines that were added for outreach as a part of that have also been baselined to the CEC budget. And I should have right at my finger tips the total budget now. Which embarrassingly I don't unless someone else has it who is on the call.**

**The new total budget. But I can get that to you in the follow—up email I apologize for that over sight. No one else has it.**

**»» Sarah I would like to make a comment that we do have someone who would like to offer public comment.**

**»» Was this the last slide?**

**»» No, I was saying we have a participate who would like to offer public comment.**

**»» Yeah, no, I'm making sure ——**

**»» Yes, sorry. That is the last slide.**

**»» Now, we will enter the public comment period. So, can you please call on the person? By sharing their name and we can ask them to introduce themselves?**

**»» Yes. One second. Thank you so much.**

**»» So, Lucin Reynolds? You're unmuted.**

**»» Thank you. Hi, I'm district manage ore of Manhattan community one. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today.**

**»» We're having trouble hearing you could you speak up not sure if it is just me or ——**

**»» Is this better.**

**»» Yes.**

**»» Thank you okay, hi I'm —— district manager of Manhattan board one lower Manhattan I want to thank everyone for giving me a moment to speak today I want to call back on year 2020 CEC met with all of the district managers in the city to see what our needs were. One of our most pressing needs at the time, which is still a very pressing need today, is that around remote versus in person meetings. The expiration of the waiver of the in person quorum requirement for open meeting law is January 15. One thing to assume that legislature in the governor will come together to pass some sort of extension during omicron variant the need of 2020 is the needs today we're still in a world remote meetings are still the reality. And it will be the reality —— moving forward. Requesting that the CEC help us in advocating for the improved engagement that comes from adding remote meetings and as we move forwards a world where perhaps, meetings become the norm allowing those who are unable to leave the homes to engage civically with Government whether they have children or unable to have the mobility to do so, or maybe they don't have people who need to meet in person, don't have the technology we need to come to grips with this new world. That is why I think that it is better that we start thinking about how the CEC can, create opportunities for those who don't have access to technology, to better engage with a remote or hybrid meeting world to better include them. Ways they can be done, creating computer lab, computer labs out of libraries during the post library hours. To allow people to have a seat at a computer and log into a meeting they don't have the device or establishing other sorts of computer labs or opportunities around different districts that have high tech needs. But I think right now, the lack of such facilities is what is allowing opponents of open meetings law reform to point to business usual in New York and that all of the downsides only meeting in public without any of the other ability for people to join us remotely whether it is safety or ease of access. I think it would just be a shame. So, I'm asking the CEC to consider making this a priority moving forward. Both for the safety of Government employees, the public, and also for the access that people have come to enjoy in the new flood of faces we've seen during this pandemic, thank you!**

**»» Thank you so much for that. Are there any questions? Comments, regarding the comment that was just offered?**

**»» If I can jump in ——**

**»» Mark Diller: I'm grateful for that comment. Because the numbers of folks engaged through remote platforms since March of 2020, consistently out stripped the attendance in community board meetings when they were all required to be in person. With few exceptions usually involving highly controversial matters. I'm curious how other boards are handling this and what the timing is going to be like because we're already we're just over a month away from the deadline and whether anyone, whether Lucin or anyone else knows legislation to extend that deadline is anyway in the works in Albany or the legislators?**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: I personally don't know about that. Do you know? You have your hand raised.**

**»» For clarification, Mark isn't it executive order by the governor, I'm not sure it has to be through legislation.**

**»» I'm pretty sure it was an executive order through the governor then I'm pretty sure with legislature in effect overruled the governor's ability to make an executive emergency declaration. There were maybe 25 image declarations between March of 2020 and June of 2021. And then eventually, the state legislature, pulled that power back from the governor and then replaced it with their own. And therefore in September of —— if you remember, that emergency power expired give or take July 1 of this past year. And then so, a lot of boards including my own were unable to meet because the venues which we would have met in person wanted nothing to do with us. And including my alma mater by the way. So, then in late August, or early September, Lucin probably has dates better than me emergency bill was passed, but, it sunsets on January 15, so it was the state legislature, this time around. You're correct it started off with a governor emergency declaration which was paralleled by mayoral declarations here in the city. Since the open meetings law is state law not city ordinance, it is state legislation that has to amend or qualify that. And this is an area some controversy I heard folks say it is time to get back in person in effect we have to deal with that.**

**And there are advantages to being in person opposed to virtual. My personal view is that the hybrid is very important because we do reach so many more people when for the reasons Lucin was outlining when the practicalities of attending in person meeting are not feasible for families, people with mobility challenges any number of other folks.**

**»» Right, the state legislature is back in session in January, I assume January 15, is also for them to meet in person.**

**»» If you're asking if the state legislature has to meet in person, almost certainly the answer is yes. I don't think the bill extended to themselves.**

**»» That is what I'm saying, they are back in session in January?**

**»» Yep.**

**» I'm assuming from what you are saying too, that they will then meet in person?**

**»» They will. And the question is whether there's a bill they are going to take up. The reason I was asking about that by the way was if to be responsive to Lucin's request, it is usually more effective and easier for a commission like us to support the pending bill than to simply make a statement of support through abstract concept. If there AA simply or Senate bill that aligns with what our Commissioners believe assuming that there is some sort of consensus on that. That would be easier for us to do than to try to map out what it is that we think is going to happen next.**

**»» Sarah Sayeed: Thank you for that, Lucin did you have your hand raised and you took it down, sorry ——**

**»» I would just offer some information that Mark built in. I would only add that there are two bills currently. One is in state Senate, sponsored by Brad Moleton the other in the assembly, using new bill by my read is better suited for —— I think —— for what the needs are of both community board and others small Government throughout the state.**

**That don't have the massive support of telecom agency or on cite IT staff. So, that's those are —— two existing bills. And the original executive emergency order was actually part of pulled back because the governor needlessly ended his own emergency powers which caused raft of other issues especially with restaurants that were selling wine and having enormous amount of stock they were illegal for them to sell it at that point. So, caught us all by surprise we had to scramble and, Mark is correct it was impossible for us to find venues we're finding is also the case for January.**

**» Thank you for that. Thank you for raising this to us we'll definitely be monitoring what is happening with —— mill and continue to support the greatest participation possible. We want to encourage that. So, just want to thank you again for speaking today. And we are a little bit over time. So, I wondered if do we have anything else that anyone has pressing or things that you think that we should be discussing? In the January meeting, we have not yet set the date for 2022, am I right, Francis?**

**»» We have.**

**» Oh, we have. Okay. Sorry. So, is it staying with the —— same pattern we have now it will be Tuesdays.**

**»» Yeah, —— the fourth Tuesday of every month unless there's a holiday that falls on it or like the in June, there is an election happening. So, in that instance we would move it.**

**» Can you just go to the next slide so folks see that. I'm sorry. I forgot that was included.**

**»» Given the previous conversation January will be an in person meeting unless there is legislation that says that we can meet remotely.**

**» Sarah Sayeed: That's right. So, we have to figure that out. Okay. So, I think since we're over time, may I request for someone to make a motion to adjourn the meeting?**

**»» So moved.**

**»» Second.**

**»».**

**» Motion to adjourn has been seconded. All in favor? Say I.**

**»» I.**

**»» I.**

**»» I ——**

**» Any opposed?**

**»» I.**

**» Say nay. Okay. The motion passes I'm going to call this meeting to adjourn. We will get back to you where we'll be meeting for January as saying good bye want to wish everyone a happy holiday season if you celebrate and beautiful new year as well we look forward to staying in touch with you, based on more information emails to follow up from this meeting. Specifically to get your help on participatory budgeting.  As well. Thank you so much for everything!**

**»» Happy holidays everyone.**

**»» Take good care!**

**»» Thank you!**

*Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) captioning is provided to facilitate*

*communication accessibility. CART captioning and this realtime file may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.*