

20240226 NYC CIVIC ENGAGEMENT COMMISSION

10:00 - 12:00 PM EST

REALTIME CAPTIONS are provided live Stenographically in order to facilitate communication accessibility. This realtime file may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

[Standby for Realtime Captions.]

>> SARAH SAYEED: I want to welcome everyone, people who are here in person, as well as joining us remotely. And I also want to thank everyone on the team for contributing, particularly Abby for opening us set this up and our partners, the video vendor and also our Captioner. Thank you, so much for joining us.

Just want to caution that we are live streaming. Part of the open meeting guidelines to let people spue our meetings is to live stream. However, we are in a space where we have not been met before and this room actually has no wifi.

So we are working off a super strong wifi, however, we're not sure about how this connection stability will work for the duration of the meeting.

If for some reason, the call drops, we will try to get it back and if we can't, we will, in correspondence to the open meeting guidelines, post the record ongoing our site after the meeting. We will also join the meeting by phone.

If the video isn't working you can join by audio. For those who have commissioners should have the number where you could dial into if the video doesn't work.

For anyone who is here, as a member of the public, welcome.

We look forward to connecting with you. Please for those online and in person, we welcome you to join the civic engagement mailing list. You can go to the website [NYC.gov/civic engagement](https://nyc.gov/civic-engagement). Tab: Get involved and sign up for the news letter and you'll be able to stay in touch with our activities.

We have reserved the last 30 minutes of the minutes for public comment. That is not required in a public meeting setting. However, we wanted to open up the meetings to members of the fob comment. So, we've done that from the beginning. I'm hoping to we can do something along those lines today, however we got started late, so I just wanted to acknowledge that we may not stick to a full 30 minutes.

Either a member of the team [phone dings] bomb.

Or online, you can also email us as info@civicengagement.NYC.gov.

I'll take attendance to make sure we have a coworker and you might hear all the commissioners that are present.

[roll call]

>>: Hi, I'm here virtually on WebEx.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Thank you.

My name is Sarah Sayeed and I am the chair Executive Director Of the civic engagement commission. We have a lot of things to share with you today about all of the great work of the team. We are going to be showing two videos, we have guest speakers who are from our participatory budgeting implementation partners. We have represents [listing names] Unidad y Fe, South Queens Women's March and common point and we will be hearing from the executive director on racial equity which was created by voters in last election in November.

So the first thing we have on the agenda is to on review and approve the minutes that were emailed. We have a printed out holder for you. Wanted to ask, if there are any additions or corrections as they're presented. Just for awareness for those who were not here last time, we covered the resolution relating to remote appearance due to ordinary circumstances whereby commissioners are authorized to use video conferencing to conduct public meetings subject to certain requirements. This was a resolution that we adopted last meeting. There are any additions or collections direct examination minutes as presented?

>> MARK DILLER: Seeing none, I move to approve.

>> MITCHELL WU: Second.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Any and all in favor?

Any oppose? We are unanimously approving the minutes.

>> MARK DILLER: Madam Chair, sorry to interrupt. I wanted to apologize in advance, there's a rolling of outdoor dining at the end of the week. I'll be called to another meeting and I apologize I'll have to leave early. It has nothing to do with what anybody says. It's the schedule. I apologize.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Thank you for clarifying in advance. Now, just to go over some technology -- I guess I was supposed to do that. I messed that up.

Let's see. We are asking commissioners to mute your mics when you are not speaking, and also online participants, please mute your microphones when you are not speaking. We will call participants if they have registered for public comment. The order that they registered. If not, if you're here, and you want to offer public comment, you could speak with Abigail [phone dings] would you raise your hand.

[Indicating.]

Okay. Moving on to program updates.

Start with the program updates. We want to thank everyone on the team who has been working incredibly hard over the last couple of months. More spec specifically there are moments where it's been all hands on deck moments including doing things like entering data or supporting our borough assembly meetings and creating this new deck that we'll share an overview with you, like a civic 101 deck. I truly want to thank everyone on the team for all of the incredible contributions and insights brought to the work including being present at some of the assembly committee meetings organized and being on track.

In the first update we have the language assistance program. We are now getting ready to prepare for the April 2nd presidential binary. This involves working with vendors to help set up materials

that are going to be delivered to the site. We also hired temps who help us and material we give out to the interpreters, every site has a box of materials so that they can set up the operations.

There's a lot of Li logistics we have to set up and all that have is happening now. [computer dings] and we also have gone through a slight renaming of the profile.

[computer dings]

Do we know what that sound is?

The poll site language assistance program has now been named the voter language assistance program. Slight shift in the name.

We have worked on getting a logo for the program.

That would be helpful when branding our table cloths and other materials that we gave out to voters and interpreters. Then we also are working with language assistance add advisory committee. We went through a process of opening up the application and we had 35 applicants -- we have 11 returning members and new members.

>>PHONE: They have trouble hearing you. Can you make sure the mic is on.

>> SARAH SAYEED: We had new applicants on the advisory committee. We will have 11 new returning members and eight new members. The first meeting of the new cohort of black members will take place on the 29th in the next two days from today.

That is about language assistance and the elections track and then we also have language access for participant budgeting. J. P. on our team is helping to organize all the trans translations need to happen for the ballots.

And so actually before that, we worked with interpreters during the assembly process as well. For anyone who needed interpreters, we provided them in the committee meetings, and we had different boroughs is the use of Spanish and Arabic interpreters, which is great.

Foregone through a process of projects that were suggested during the idea generation phase. We have gone through the process of vetting those projects and narrowing it down projects that will be anticipating on the ballot that will then be -- people will be able to vote on that.

What we do in this period is get those ballot forms ready and part of getting that ready is actually translating the ballots, so that they're ready for people to fill out who speak other languages. We will trans translate into all of the local law languages, the ballots.

That's another language access update.

And then I'm going to now turn over to Benjamin, to come up and sure with us, both updates on the community boards as well as the board assembly committee.

>> BENJAMIN: Hello. I think there's a slide [background noises] (Borough Assembly Process)

This is sort of a simple run down to some of the workshops we've done since January, February.

Some of our attendance numbers. We did a great series of housing workshops and partnerships -- [inaudible] and then the first time I've been there, our own language access workshops open to all -- we've had good attendance and I think it's exciting for people to show up. HPD has become a regular partner.

Workshops with them.

Affordable housing workshops with them.

We'll be doing some upcoming conflict resolution workshops, independent budget workshops, and some others to be announced. So, I think we've learned good things this time. Pretty consistent about 45% registration or attendance biased registration online. So, been consist within that, trying to keep that up. We have adopted a new time, doing the meetings at noon as well as 6:30, which seems to be popular significance people like that spend a bunch of hours machine learning city services.

I think feedback essays and responses have been positive. Thankfully for us -- ten boards that we've outreach to those TAO also across the city to find out how to get the word out to them and get their members in.

So we look forward to the rest of this season and then starting again in the fall.

Thank you.

>> MARK DILLER: Just wanted to note that the one February 13th session in the evening, that was not as well attended. That was the night when the Office of Emergency management sent around a good morning severe weather, and so that's no reflection on your participation. Listening to OEM.

>> BENJAMIN: Thank you. Yes, there are a lot of things we at that conflict and some of them we don't have control. Great. Yeah, this is some of the upcoming workshops we have. As I said, looking forward to doing and continuing to get the word out. Next slide.

I'll speak to these. You can see that we are in the second cycle of participatory budgeting, the people's money process. We just completed the assembly meetings which we have a slide on coming up. We may be getting into the voting period May 1st - June 12th. Everybody in the city 11 years or older can vote regardless of any status. Citizenship or incarceration or otherwise. So, we're looking forward to that. We're in the process of implementing the 46 projects which you'll hear more about later.

Next slide.

For the assembly meetings there's really a great innovation we've done in this participatory budgeting process. Quite typically essentially in the city council process and others, the evaluation of the projects you spend a lot of time doing community outreach across the city getting thousands of ideas from thousands of people, but you ready need to decide what those projects are ending up on the ballot. That's done in a small controlled group.

Maybe a group of volunteers or something that is not as public facing as the vote and the idea session, but we have brought in these model to create our borough assemblies, where we use to or so people randomly selected from across these borough -- each is 25 people to spend a

concentrated amount of time. So, you see we have over 1100 applicants. Amazing people want to be a part this. We ended up with 106 spread across the boroughs. Six meetings, four-hour in the beginning and ended up being three hours because of the weather in the opening meeting -- but then four meetings that were two and a half hours and then another three and a half meeting in the end. Subject matter experts to understand a little bit about their boroughs. Helped us end up with a final ballot.

So, we have over 430 ideas across the boroughs and narrowed down to 46 ideas end up on the ballots. Ten of every and Staten Island which has six. And some of the feedback we got there has been consistent same as we did last year. It was an honorary part of the team. One of the best experiences they've had so far and it was an empowering experiencing. They're all really excited about being part of this and moving forward. We look forward to having them. I think they're now really powerful spokesmen and having a say.

We have a short video.

[Music]

>> BENJAMIN: We did a video like that for each borough. Exciting to see. they were posted throughout the process.

[VIDEO NOT CAPTIONED.]

>> BENJAMIN: Thank you. I was fortunate enough to go to at least one meeting in every borough accept Staten Island -- you watch people talking about the projects and what's important to them in their neighborhood and working together. They've never met each other. Maybe occasionally, but never met their other members and they worked so well together. Dedicated to finding what their community needs to put those projects on the ballot. Amazing to see.

>> SARAH SAYEED: How many people was it?

>> BENJAMIN: 106.

>> SARAH SAYEED: So New Yorkers owe a great, thanks working together and narrowing down the - New Yorkers, owe the about her row assembly committees is great, thanks because they're the ones responsible forging hundreds of ideas and narrowing them down ask. public will be able to vote on a narrower set of ideas. Thank you, so much Benjamin for those updates.

Next we are going to hear from the star of that advancement [laughter] Hayden John who is also a new member full-time employee of the civic engagement commission. Providing -- responsible for managing our intrigued partnerships program and working with the full staff on that work stream. Hayden will provide an update what we are doing with the trade coalitions.

>> HAYDON: (TRIE and GOTV) The CC partners with community-based organizations throughout 33 high priority neighborhood in New York City that were hardest hit by COVID. To promote civic engagement primarily through three areas including: Coalition building, participatory building and civic engagement. I'll give updates on each of those areas.

Each TRIE partner in 33 TRIE neighborhood responsible for queens a Coalition of A minimum of three organizational partners and additional TA stakeholders to support the deliverables. Most recently,

they met to -- talking points at the borough assembly meetings and the next meeting we have up is to building plan.

Participatory budgeting. Phase one, they hosted idea -- throughout the city. And phase two priority needs for their neighboring at their respected borough meetings to help -- phase three, working with their coalition partners as well as activating volunteers in their neighboring to reach a goal of 2,000 ballots per TRIE neighborhood with an empty Trie votes.

Civic education. This spring their partners will pilot a new workshop girlfriend the CC team led by Anthony and Dan coordinators that aim to divine civic engagement in terms of power, love and justice. Sharing examples of specific engagement coalition building, movement building and participatory budgeting. Thirdly, to call participants to action through opportunities to volunteer and participatory budgeting.

Lastly, without sharing the whole deck we wanted to highlight a few -- how his workshop seeks to frame civic engagement for the audience. Next slide thank you.

Here we are showing an example of the spectrum of civic engagement and modified this and will include some more examples. Essentially, what this graphic is showing is that civic engagement is at surface level about taking action.

It includes low touch to high touch actions from individual to collective from donating a local organization or checking in on your neighbor as a civic engagement action all the way to running for office, which takes more than just one person. It includes organizing and building communities and all of those different civic engagement involves a spectrum of activities.

Using power, love to achieve justice. We have another video to show that we are including in our civic engagement deck. Next up from: "Where do we go from here?" A speech from Martin Luther King, Jr. Please play the video while we discuss.

[VIDEO CAPTIONED.]

>>: Thank you. So, just to -- one of those quotes turn back to the slide.

I'm going to read this one more time "Power without love reckless and abusive and love without power is sentimental and anemic. Power at its as best as love implementing the demands of justice and justice at its as best as power correcting everything that stands against love."

So we pull this Steamboat frame it with this formula of power plus love equals justice. Really, what we hope the participants get is that power without love will be misused and love without power is not enough to create meaningful change.

I'll leave with you how [computer dings] we are sharing -- defining civic engagement with our workshops which is civic engagement consists of all the ways that people seek justice for their community, because of their love for community. Thank you. I'll pass it to Lexi for implementation updates.

>> SARAH SAYEED: As Lexi is coming up, I wanted to say that I think one of the features that makes our work unique in the civic engagement space our -- we are taking on the concept of power. I feel like pear is not something that we actively talk about enough. Yet, it is implicit in all the work we're

doing. And I think it's important for to us create spaces where that conversation can be engaged and we're kind of dipping our toes in the water.

I know last time we talked a lot about: How do we think about sustainability for these projects? Touch on that today as well as provide you an update. So, Lexi, Spencer, will be doing that and also be joining our team soon hopefully.

>> LEXI: If I could go to the next slide, please that would be great.

I'm Lexi. So, thank you, all for having me here. Great to see you all here. I spoke about the project implementation at the last meeting and theme pick that up and talk about the work that's been happening since we met.

While we are, as Benjamin mentioned, in the middle of our current second cycle of the participatory budget processing we are also in the middle of implement implementing the winds projects that came out of the last process of cycle one.

I'll start with a high level overview again of some of the different types of projects in we have funded. The focus is of those projects and then I'm going to give some updates about the work that has been taking place since then.

So in total, as we've mentioned before that, year, funding 46 different projects across five feet boroughs with 13 of those focusing on boroughs as a whole or voted on through borough ballots and 33 of those focusing on the TRIE neighboring that are part of the initiative through the -- racial inclusion and equity.

As you can see of these 46 projects the top issue areas that we surfaced that were brought to light by community members and voters through the process, were mental health and job training.

So we see a large focus on projects that specifically address mental health and job training. Although, we have a lot of different projects in focus on different areas, some include education, food insecurity, health and wellbeing, housing assistance, parenting, education, and antiviolence, immigrant rights, sanitation and some projects that are purely about fostering intergenerational and relationships.

Next slide, please.

In order to implement these projects we are working with a total of 44 community-based organizations. It's a lot, but some of these cases we're working with on the screen there and we'll have some people later here to talk about the work they're doing which is exciting.

As you can see those are some of the organizations we're working with at the borough or the neighborhood throstle implement these projects.

Since ee we last met our partner organizations have been conducting a lot of different activities to contribute toward the completion of these projects. We won't get to go through every single thing every organization has done, but I want to go through some of the work and highlight some of the activities that are part of the organizations have done on these projects.

Just to go through quickly some those of, for example, include restorative justice circles for PS21 students for Brooklyn. Asylum, storytelling workshops, intergenerational tech classes in the Bronx. Financial literacy workshops at Bronx lab high school. Food access expansion anyone wood and Washington heights. Mental health, First Aid training and gender-based at Richmond Hill and -- culinary entrepreneurship for youth to get certificates and learn culinary skills and more. The last one is in Queens.

We'll have some of our partners who have implemented some of the work here and more talk about that.

We also did want to bring to light and have a discussion and conversation around sustainability including what we're doing currently to promote and encourage the sustainability of these projects, as well as, what we can continue anonymous future. To help ensure that these projects continue and can be implemented in different ways beyond the first cycle of this participatory budgeting process.

Next slide.

First, also, I wanted to highlight where you all can go visit on the website to get more updates about each of the projects. We have a page for project implementation on our website: Participate.NYC.gov. Few different ways, any way that you go, that takes to you any information about phase four or project implementation will take to you a page where you can read about each project, organizations that are implementing them and what they plan to do for those projects. I encourage you to learn more about the different work.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Lexi, I want to add in here why this is important in terms of being able to go online, because it is part of partner add to go to transparency of the participatory budgeting program. If you all recall, beginning of starting our participatory budgeting work we invested different platforms that would allow to us share the progress of the process, as it was happening. And one of the reasons why we selected the open-source platform is because it lets us provide these updates. We are going to be working with all of our partners and with the team to get this process set up. This also involves things like user testing for people who are interfacing with this substitute make sure things are understandable. So, there's a lot of work that goes into seeing these projects on the site.

Again that's just another hate the esteem involved in lifting this up.

>> LEXI: Thank you, so much for explaining a little bit more about the platform.

The next thing after this that we'll talk about is sustainability. I want to start with some of the different things we're doing to promote sustainability and then to introduce some questions that we have around what we can further do. So, like I said, while these projects are currently only going through the first cycle of the participatory budgeting process.

However, these projects is providing either a program, or service that was identified by a community as extremely important, or something that was necessary to be implemented this had a community. That's sort of why we want to make sure that this is at the forefront of all the

conversations that we have about what these projects mean and how we can continue them and work toward guaranteeing them to be more sustainable in the future.

Some of the ways we are currently working towards promoting sustainability is project design as well as monitoring and evaluation.

To talk about what we mean by this and the information on the screen, one way particularly for project design, that we see in avenue toward promoting sustainability is involving community members in the actual design in the planning processes that go into each of these projects.

So that can be done, for example, through needs assessments and what that does is foster a sense of ownership, responsibility, and allows people to be involved in these projects in a way that are responsive and relevant to local priorities and make it so that these projects are viewed as important and necessary in the community. That's something that we're doing by asking all the organizations that we work with to conduct these assessments and get people involved in the planning process for each project.

That is also part of this larger idea or this larger process of monitoring and evaluation working with each organization.

I know we have our partner Professor Mark Johnson from the New York school and public engagement to talk about what we're doing in terms of promoting monitoring and evaluation and by providing monitoring and evaluation capacity building workshops to each of the organizations.

What we're hoping to do is to foster partnerships to integrate projects into existing structures and to make them -- the organizations stronger and give them the capacity to conduct monitoring evaluation on these projects as well as projects in they do in the future to see how you can build in sustainability and projects that you're doing. Also to help create an avenue for them to do advocacy for each project. Monitoring and evaluation a lot about how you measure success and why it is important.

What we want to do so take what we know about these projects whether they're specifically use that as an advocacy tool for them to have. Each organization to work showcase basically to continue their work.

So what we'll have is some final reporting and hoping to that can be used as an advocacy tool for organizations to promote their work and showcase the success of different projects as well as the need for them in the community.

Next slide, please.

Just some other ideas of what we can do to sustain the sustainability is knowledge, sharing, partnership opportunities and capacity building around areas other than what we've discussed. We wanted to open it up to conversation if anyone has questions, thoughts, ideas from the commissioners, of course, if you would like to join in here. If there's anything glaring that you would like that add or that you think could be a good way for to us think about monitoring and evaluation going forward on this cycle on the projects as well as in the future while they do process.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Do commissioners have any suggestions or thoughts about sustainability? We can also make it an ongoing conversation if you don't have anything coming to top of mind. I think we need to do -- try look at ways we can share out the projects with our agency partners as well as potential sources of support in the philanthropy sector getting more on their radar with the successes of our programs.

>>PHONE: If you would want to form a subcommittee on this I'm theme join that, but I think it's -- as you said, a bigger conversation than just making a comment at this time.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Sounds good. Eve, did you want to say something?

>> EVE BARON: I would be happy to join that subcommittee, but the extent that the budget aligned with the council members and borough presidents.

>> LEXI: So figuring out ways to bring these tonight them as well and to get them involved absolutely thank you. That's a great -- yeah. Like Sarah said, we can continue this conversation in the future and also going to have some of our organizations here to talk about the work that they're doing and talk about how they view the sustainability of their projects. So, I did next just quickly, I think we will start with one organization so that the staff member ask join and speak and then she will have to leave. I will pass it to South Queens Women's March and talk about the project which is called: Mental health for South caribbean and South Asian Families.

She is joining us remotely. She has a PowerPoint presentation as well, which we can pull up.

Thank you.

>>PHONE: Hi, everybody, I'm -- [indiscernible] -- and I'm the executive Director of South Queens Women's March.

>>: AMINTA KARINE: Mental health for Indo-Caribbean youth and families, south Asian families -- for the people's money.

Next slide.

We are hyper local intersectional -- [indiscernible] -- justice organization and working hard to invite women, girls and gender expansive folks with the tools they need to survive and drive.

Visible projects. Civic engagement work girls in political power [fast speaking]

Healing and wellness workshops in our community.

Next slide.

So we are super grateful to the New York City civic engagement commission because we started in and out [inaudible] organization as a result of their partnership from last year now and able to do so much to mobilize from the ground up to coalition building and ideas about the election.

So next slide.

[broken speech] lots of different community members who for the first time were getting -- in their neighboring and such and such beautiful opportunity with folks across various backgrounds and

statuses, et cetera to think about what would be the project best suited for projects in our community -- next slide.

We also had -- an opportunity to build a coalition which from organizations like ours is a learning experience, but loud us to do partnerships with communities, organizations, civic -- et cetera and ultimately, this coalition reviewed the ideas that were submitted and came up with some ideas as far as what would be featured ballots. Next slide.

[fast speaking]

We did lots of outreach and when I talk about civic engagement one of those hurdles is -- [indiscernible] -- some people in our community are undocumented. They wanted to be civically engaged, but don't have the ability to vote. So, people's money allowed the opportunity for us to engage with all of those folks who are disappointed tabling and asking them to get involved. It was so moving see how many people showed up to exercise their civic duties in this way -- over thousands of people and often struggled with getting folks our community in complete paperwork of this forms because of the -- due to the status and statements around government. Specifically learning experience us and thousands of individuals -- next slide.

So we try ultimately, the winning project was mental health for South Asian -- and swore grateful for CDC to rule out these workshops and conducted also social media and houses of worship [reading] [broken speech] -- resource this project and we would have not been able to do that without -- next slide.

These are some photos and quotes. I won't get into them. Time is of the essence, but theorize quotes from our facilitators and workshops done so far in various locations across the zip codes including in our this is our workshop and gender -- [broken speech]

Resources for services they offer. We have had many moving experiences throughout this process thus far including committee members who have never been able to -- mental health and first time making a conscious decision by coming to our workshops which are facilitated by South Asian and ^Indo-Caribbean -- next slide.

This is just another one of our presenters. Social worker who identifies as -- [indiscernible] -- and did a workshop for us did a workshop a couple of weeks ago.

In addition to our content based Asian specific workshops we also foster this in -- manners, you'll see on the left self-defense course we held with someone -- unfortunately, it's something that we need to have -- so we have this workshop.

[fast speaking] as well fostering wellness and you'll see a zumo workshop.

Obviously, people voted and this was demonstrated -- project for a reason and part of why we believe the Women's March is needed because there is, in fact, a high incident of domestic violence in our community. A lot of the reason why Women's March was -- is because of high profile tragic incidents of domestic violence had a happened in suicide -- in the communities. And we're seeing in show up as a theme in post essays given to participants of these workshops. Don't feel they have a fly's access mental health services and resources. They don't know where they can begin to sign up to get therapy and they don't know without insurance if they can afford to do so.

Additional trauma that comes with the -- [indiscernible] -- that communities have experience and there's cultural stigma around mental health in the feedback we're getting.

Goes to show how important these works have been. Next slide.

So again, we would not be able to do this New York Cities civic engagement commission Z. we've seen such and such wide -- in the community and, again, I want to thank you for giving me this suffice on is their work and to resource us.

Lex implete thank you we appreciate all the work that you've done.

>> LEXI: I think next we will pass to Linda.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Linda are you in a crunch and it if you're good we'll move to two other partners and move to Linda, that which she can have her time afterwards.

>> LEXI: Next I will pass to Corina.

>>: CORINA LUI: Good morning, I'm the Director of -- located in Jamaica -- Queens, Common Point Queens has been an organization for a long time, but we're proud to have opened up our newest location, um, it's right behind Queens Hospital located on Parson's Boulevard. We have implemented with this budget, our young culinary entrepreneurship training program.

The purpose and impact is to enhance long-term financial security to approximately 150 youth, age 14-24 in the Jamaica -- Saint Albans area.

The purpose of the program is total of 8 weeks where you've had the opportunity engage for 12 cooking classes as well as four business classes.

At the end of the program, those eight weeks, they get certifications of completing the program as well as start-up kits and their 200 hour stipend. They get to work closely with our executive chef understanding the culinary language as well as some basic knife skills and getting opportunity to cook different meals. Second half of the program they do have the opportunity to participate in four business classes with an individual who now worked at meta formally known as the -- influence and partnership committee and understanding branding and marketing and working to find an alternative path. Nowadays we do see a lot of youth there are looking for addition area options during that 14-24 phase.

We start so far in November about to complete second time cohort in week and we have hosted 77 youth so far and still have a lot more cohorts to continue on.

Not only engage in enrichment activity, but the certification is an -- interested in the culinary field. Aside from that, um, I think I shared everything of what we have going on. Um, next steps is really finding additional ways of how we're going to continue on with the next cohort as we do have now a Spanish speaking executive chef hopefully to expand an opportunity and open it up to the Spanish speaking community to participate as well. Thank you.

>> LEXI: Wonderful. Thank you, so much, Corina. It was great hearing about that. And now another to speak about the work they're doing.

>>: Good morning, I'm here representing a team -- and I would like that speak about the project that was implemented in our New Haven community and the theme we have been working together to -- along with other organization building partnership to be bring back resources -- [indiscernible] - - such as Medicaid and how they can apply for why health insurance and focus on giving them information about how they can that I recall side of the story, TPS, DACA and other -- they can apply for.

We have an outreach coordinator that works with other organizations such as Sena, quality of life foundation, and this week, we actually have them come to the -- give the public information on how they can do their taxes. We also did storytelling workshop where our, um, team members gave the public information how they could write a better affective story and just help the communities serve them. We see a great impact at this project.

Sorry, I'm a little nervous.

This project has brought forward the community for meeting current immigrants and newly arriving immigrants in the community. This project has given them, I think, a great help. Even if it's just from basic information such as helping them apply and schedule their New York City ID to giving them information on TPS, or DACA that they can apply for. We see the importance because they don't have the tools to apply for some of these, um, basic things that might be basic to us. New York City ID might be a piece of cake, but to others that just newly arrived to New York City and don't know where to ask or go to finding resources can give them a voice. Doors to help them find work and with the great help that you guys have given us working together, I believe this project has given the community a way that's significant. Thank you for letting me speak about the work that we have been doing. Thank you.

>> LEXI: Thank you to you will of you. I appreciate you telling the story of your projects, talking about what you have done so far, where your projects will go in the future. Yes, thank you.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Thank you, so much. Do any of the commissioners have questions or comments?

>> NATELY: Thank you, so much. My question, which -- a recently decision in court and gave it the initiate I have to noncitizen voting in New York City. Where we were expecting folks who were not citizens to have access to vote locally to work towards, on a local level, obviously not federal elections.

While mis-information and dis-information remains a huge challenge in general, it is my understanding that immigrants do pay taxes, consist of promoters, pay property taxers, income taxes when they have wages that are issued in check form or the like. They pay sales taxes when they go shopping.

Once, again, it's my understanding, when we afford civic engagement to all folks who are residents of our city, it is because they are participating in community. They're taking buses, they're using schools. Is there -- I guess I don't need to ask if anybody has faced these challenges on these narratives, but is there any unified initiative in the works for to us able to address that specifically that, immigrants do contribute to our communities. As a result, whether this court case ends where it ends or not, that immigrants contribute monetarily in other ways throughout society. That's

exactly why we want to rereciprocate with their ability to participate. It's complicated, I'm sorry. If I just opened fruit for thought that's okay too. I'll take my hand down while that's pondered here.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Image you're making a valid point that probably as a team, we could lift up a little bit more. Do any of the partners want to say anything about that?

Our commissioner was talking about how even though people who are not citizens may not be able to vote, they are still very active participants in our committee by paying taxes in particular and those taxes also are part of the registry for the city and the city leverages those tax dollars to fund all of our public programs through participatory budgeting, we are returning voice, and the money, back to communities, because they helped create the budget to do the work. Any of the other commissioners want to add anything?

>> MARK DILLER: Thanks. Thank you for the presenters. It highlights, again, the importance of the work that you're doing and now tying back together with the slide on sustainability. Because the need that you're addressing probably won't be solved in here. So, finding a way that the revenues that Natelly was talking about, the engagement that she was talking about funnels into the work that staff does engaging with our partners, needs continue.

I don't have a good solution right now, but atlas sustainability subcommittee. Maybe would be a good thing take for the most part, because it's obvious that the revenue that supports this year's activities needs to be replaced or supplemented. Thank you for that presentation, and underscoring the importance of translating the influx of dollars to our city to sustaining programs that meet the vulnerable folks that you all serve. Thanks.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Okay, if there are no further comments we'll tanoaks our next and final presenter before we have a small window for comment in the end. I understand there's one person signed up. We'll be sure to do that.

Next, we wanted to hear from Linda Tigani, who is with the New York City Commission on Racial Equality. He can't see an important focus for the commission. We've been working with the task force -- in our 33 neighboring for several years now. So, I wanted to make sure we heard from Linda about the work that she is planning ahead with the commission.

>> LINDA TIGANI: Thank you. Thank you for making time hear from the commission. I'm excited to both share our mission and vision and also sort of forecast a little bit what we're going to be doing in the la next few months. Feel free raise any questions as we go forward.

What are some key terms or ideas that are pushing me towards the work I'm doing, share a little bit about the leadership of CORE, talk through what are the mandates according to New York City charter. Preview what's next.

Before we get started, I wanted to share that right now you are meeting all of CORE. We are a one woman show at the moment, but slowly building. I'll talk about the office.

All was this was not ever our vision to be a one woman show, but I'll do any best to answer all of your questions and share a lot of what you will see of what's next. So, ways in which we are currently interpreting the mandates. I expect that will change as more commissioners come on board as well as staff.

Bank accounts our history. You may remember in March 2021 former mayor Blasio -- the justice commission.

Pandemic once in a lifetime New Yorker experiencing a parallel pandemic, which is mental health and experiencing an uprising of racial violence as well as protests to address racial and equity injustice from finance housing. The city was also in a moment where it was time to renew our charter, to take a look to see, what if anything we wanted to change. The lens that our former mayor chose was to use a lens in a lot of ways to respond to the current moment both in New York City and around the nation.

He pulled together vice-chair and they looked at power and access to opportunity and New Yorkers approximately two years: What do we want to engage our New York City constitution understanding that that means shifting power across the different elected offices in the way which government works.

Our city came up with three ballot measures that were proposed. Then passed in November 2022. The commission on racial equality is one of the ballot measures. As a quick reminder, we add a preamble to the New York City constitution. We said we wanted to measure the true cost of colligative have that updated every two years.

The third included a few different pieces, once that the New York City was to open up -- agency and office will have a racial equality plan and there will be a citywide racial equality plan and a commission on racial equality. The commission is an independent body that was designed and intended to advance racial equality in New York City government and increase community voice in government decision making. Next slide.

In order to do this work, I wanted to share a little bit about what guides me in my work and how this relates to our New York City charter. The first ballot measure was to add a preamble. The city hasn't had one since the 1600s so a preamble is now included that essentially touches on these foundational values. Justly values all talents and contributions ensures the condition of driving for every person and engage embraces vigilance, remedy and reconstruction.

I highlighted a particular image that speaks to me, which is really to say that the work on the commission of racial equality comes out of the context and history that former mayor created with the commissioners, but also stands upon the hundreds of thousands of people that take to the city every year to raise a particular injustice and propose recommendations, solutions and strategies to government. If this is not you, that work did not start during the pandemic. People have been taking to the streets during the entire lifetime of New York City and this work really rests on their shoulders. Not only honor them, but also for the children of future generations of New York City. So, for me, that passage, particularly honoring the contributions of New York City who have suffered in the name of freedom and acknowledged and if you go to the, struggled and dreamed for a better life and esteem together, we stand on their shoulders.

This also, I think ties into the most recent conversation in this particular meeting about our recent New Yorkers now remembrance. For me, this is also about them and their work and that the people who take to the streets are all New York City regardless of their documentation status, inadjus

have applied to many groups cross-racial ethnic, gender and economic lines. I think they do work with them and for them as well as those who came before us and those after.

Next slide.

I'm not going to dive too deep into this one, but I wanted to make sure you all knew that our New York City charter has key definitions that equity and racial equality, not only defines our outcome and work, but a process. The commission on racial equality is dully focused on the outcome of the policies and programs and initiatives, but also the process that it took to get there. What is it that we need to change in our policies and procedures so that the outcomes will be equable?

Some of the common misunderstandings of beginning community conversations is: What do we mean by insert reward, racial equality -- the charter offers guiding light that. I want -- segregated data this. A huge conversation during COVID that unveiled all the ways in which many different communities during the pandemic when you got more granular to the data. Understanding that dag grey serrated data -- it is also a place where New York City are seeking to be seen ask. example I use often is the city's ability, willingness to both collect data as well as report on data for indigenous community members.

As New York City, we are home to the largest urban indigenous community. So, it's my commitment that through CORE should bees we'll work with our government partners -- so these are some of the CORE concepts that will be guiding our work.

Leadership of CORE. Who is Linda? I wanted to offer a little insight into who I am. This is a new office, an extremely important commitment I wanted to share a little bit of where I come from and how I got here. I've been in government five years and networking various offices all focused in advancing interagency equity initiatives that center family, and children wellbeing, personally this is what centered me.

Any Rachael or human suffering in my lifetime -- I would love for my children and children not to have these fights. Second time is advancing my people's fight to free ourselves and our oppressors. This language comes from several leaders that have trained me as well as folks who center self-determination, self respect in my Wonk ons that go my day-to-day work is not only for myself, but my community, but also the people who I am in battle around power and injustice.

People do not come to the table seeking to fact that injustice. We're recognizing in dialogue and community, we can release the oppressive conditions that impact everyone.

Then, centering and you happen lifting lived experiences community in institutional transformation. So this is about how our community members experience a policy. It is not how it is where I haven't it is not what the intention is, but when social policy issued, how do they experience the rules, the inclusion, the criteria, the exclusion criteria? What does that sound like and feel to them?

That's what it takes to drive my work. These principles I've developed over time when I was a youth justice worker -- maybe at some points I was -- in that organization, but I started with justice and in my 20s worked in the organizing community and parallel to my work as a researcher -- social worker and mental health worker and then I have a particular work for research and evaluation. That's the last photo.

I'm not the only one running the commission. We will have 14 other commissioners as the executive director. I sit as the chair of the commission, but we will have seven commissioners appointed by the mayor. Five appointed by the speaker and each will be representing a borough for both the mayor and the speaker one of their commissioners will be designated to represent the voices of people under 25.

We will have one commissioner appointed by the ad indicate and one by the controller. I wanted to highlight language that's unique to the commission.

We are able to move forward as a commission with commissioners that are currently in office. This is another way in which the city is moving to advance, really, the work of racial equality and oftentimes commissions are installed because of appointments, because it takes a long time.

The cohort is able to move forward with our current commissioners, I'm excited to say we have a number of them on board and diving into the work.

Lastly, we will soon not be a one woman show. In the first year expanding to be a team of seven. I've outlined organizational charts so you understand where we're overcoming emphasis in the first year. Communication, organizing and engagement which is why we have two staff dedicated to their area of work. Research and policy, general counsel will be one person teams in the first year.

We will all be presenting similarly to the way in which you operate here. We will have staff front our commissioners. The commissioners are going to guide and inform the work of each of these lanes whether it be our community engagement plan or communication strategy, and most particularly the research and policy evaluation that we're going to be doing.

The next year we'll bring on five more people. Next.

The work of the commission is going to steepen over time. I'll walk through some of our CORE mandates. The first is identify and propose community equity priorities this. May sound similar to the work that CE C does. We'll be working with hyper local groups. Ten innocent councils, community words, CECs and faith-based organizations to develop the cities first community equity priority list.

Those priorities will then guide the city's racial equality planning. Once they're done we will hand them over to the -- what the mayor's team and speakers team and say this is what the residents say are their particular priorities. The agencies will go out in response to those priorities. Once the plans are published they'll be a preliminary and family plan published. CORE is legally required to publically respond. In the response and if you look into the charter, it provides more detail. We will provide recommendation, strategies and metrics for agencies to consider in their plan.

As well as an analysis of their plan. Once the plans are set, our Director of Research is policy is going to lead the efforts to track and publically report on compliance with the racial equality and planning process. We do not have a specific cadence in the charter, but we want to that I this -- within each equity priority they'll be plenty of city agencies that can contribute to advancing equity in our work.

We are thinking of different anyways which to produce data both qualitative and quantitative data that sits in community participatory action research, that is quick, can be used by community

organizations for their own policy and advocacy work. Essentially user friendly so folks not only understand what is happening on the city level, but can engage.

The last mandated, which I will say is the most exciting for community organizations and also unique as a city. CORE is going to be set up to receive complaints about how agency conduct may have the effect of exacerbating racial disparity and then make recommendations where appropriate.

CORE itself is a body that does not exist anywhere else in the nation. There's no other municipality that has an accountability body such as CORE. This is also the first time that we will have a single fillets New York City where complaints about policy can be direct. So, this is separate from CCRB or CCHR that takes complaints about individuals. We are looking at policy that -- health and equity or housing and equity or within social service. Then we're going to be working with the agency, as we are good government partners, to think through: What are the ways we can address it?

Next slide.

Understand lining our mandates is really about community organization and our commitment to both being good government partners to our agencies and mayoral offices, but also to community members. The first thing what I joined was go out to all the RJC partners that led the NYC Commission, and say thank you for their work. It's because of their work with, we have racial equality written into our constitution. This is what I've had so far and not the exhaustive list.

Learning what actions can CORE tie build trust with those partners were clear when I met them. They said they don't know you. But making sure you follow through as a way to build trust. Two things that community has asked for, in order to meet -- rather launch the last mandated around complaints. We'll launch focus groups with benefit navigators, community staff to better understand: What are they hearing? As well as focus groups in the community members so that when we define what a complaint is because that's not defined in the charter. What is a workflow process? We wanted to do what makes sense to the community, language and process works for them?

The next that we update them, racial justice partners were clear this they are committed to seeing the implementation of the commission and they want -- we will be doing community briefings separate from our commission meetings to go through some finer detail with them.

Next I wanted to share about how we're seeking to advance a citywide engagement strategy. Our commissioners specifically requested that we take a hyper local approach.

So we'll work with local governance groups notation community-based organizations -- neighborhood network through CEC to participate in the community equity priority of process. We'll offer a public comment commitment survey, so people can go online however they hear from us, social media, and tell us what their priorities are and have the opportunity to respond.

The last is -- that is working idea -- we want to launch a people's policy table where we bring community members in the room with agency staff, government staff, to co-create policy together. To co-design both agency policy as well as citywide policy.

We are working to draft community equity priorities and I'm partnering with The Office of Economic opportunity to frame our priorities in an antipoverty framework, really understanding this both racism ask CORE for poverty exist and poverty impacts a broad range of community across the street, and allows to us dive deeper into neighboring where there are demographic profiles may have shifted, but there are still blocks within neighboring that are experiencing deep and extreme poverty. Antipoverty analysis will help us get New York Times only a broader range of ethnic groups across the city, but focus on a range of age groups as well.

Next slide.

In order to get this work done, we are, in addition to naming working with community-based organizations, we have partnered with institute for state and local governance. They're hoping to provide key landscape analysis helping us understand how our other municipalities are -- not the first, but we are doing this in a unique way.

Methods, models and systems to archive community feedback. One of the consistent pieces of feedback we get from the community is, we come to the table every time you ask, but we do not see or hear -- where does our feedback go?

I want to explore community feedback archive on our website on is that not only CORE can use it, but that organizations and advocacy groups can also convolution. That I think ties into the way in which we'll be sharing data both our analysis as well as tracking and publically reporting compliance of the plans.

Lastly, they will offer support to come to the feedback sessions that hosting across the city.

Finalize this once we have completed our analysis. This second part launching the frost accept complaints. Right now anyone -- send CORE a complaint.

However, we want to make sure this process is intentional and that it is trans parent authentic. To do that we want to conduct focus groups. Hopefully launch that work in April or late April.

So that we can develop a community informed definition of what a complaint is. Then on the government side, we will be coordinating with other departments CCRB or C CHR as well as 311 to figure out -- how do complaints come into community.

This is for you to have handy. This grounds our work to complete the mandated so relationships we'll build understanding that CORE is an advancement in the practice of local democracy. And then there's always the opportunity -- we've explored this with a few organizations -- to build out resources and tool kits to standards some of the anyways which we can integrate racial equality work into government processes. One example is to create a guide book for government on how to collect and report on indigenous community members.

That could be one particular tool that could be used by any city agency that would help to standards data collection. That's one example of an idea that has been raised. We are taking ideas from community members.

Eventually, we'll have a policy platform and potentially a legislative agenda, but all that have will come after the priorities ensuring anything we put out to the public is first and foremost, seen, approved, co-designed by community members who are coming to the table.

I want to offer a little bit of a distinction between CORE mayor's Office of Community and justice. We have many offices including CDC that addresses equity in a direct fashion and work with the community.

But the main take away here is that CORE is an accountability body. We are -- community government to the table as the partners and fair partners in commitment to advance the practice of local democracy. Mayor's Office of Equity and racial justice has -- many offices within. Their focus is really to set citywide strategies and goals. They're the technical assistance partners to agencies. So, our team works with agencies in two different ways.

Next slide.

What's next at CORE? We are going to continue onboarding new commissioners and staff. Excited to say four new staff members in the next six weeks come on board. Continue with community and faith-based organizations. If there's a group you would like me to meet or present at, let me know. We will finalize our racial equality priorities and begin to develop and process those focus groups.

I have a final request from the charter thorax request from city council on the mayor's team, I'm excited to say that we are seen as good partners. City council has included us in some proposed legislation. Particularly around truth healing and -- falls nicely within the bucket of accountability and I'm excited to move forward with that work. Thank you, so much. I'm happy to answer any questions.

>> SARAH SAYEED: We can Nancy questions for five minutes.

>>PHONE: I've had my hand up, but having hearing her speaker's I really need to say that the mission of this commission is to provide civic engagement for all New Yorkers. So, while I understand the spirit of New Yorkers who pay taxes, to be represented no matter what their status is, I do want to caution that I don't think that this commission should get in on, you know, those who pays for services should get them. I think the mission of our commission is that all New Yorkers deserve civic engagement and participation in their government. CORE's work is definitely up holding that and working towards that as well. Linda should be. Thank you, so much for your work.

I'm wondering if -- a lot of the things you said about racial equality and poverty and indigenous members of our city if you are planning to educate -- which a lot of us are not fully up to smart citted speed-to-on some of those issues and language, vocabulary and narratives. One of the things just came out is one in four New York City children live in poverty. So, this is extreme. We have ratcheted down our voting to 11-year-olds and want more children to participate and make a lasting civic engagement participation.

It's not necessarily a question, but it is a comment that I would like the commission to seriously consider not taking up tax paying as something that we uphold or report.

>> LINDA TIGANI: Thank you, so much. Essentially everyone in the way they contribute to New York City is included at the table. We would never create any exclusion criteria based off of that.

I would also neat around language vocabulary and narrative, particularly around a fight against poverty -- for children as well as our adults near New York City -- I think that's an interesting note, like, having a training of sorts. I think some that have will happen as we release the draft equity priorities. Being able to up charts and equity -- not only what poverty means.

Also: What does it look like? Poverty no longer looks the way that we think it does and there are lots of people that may be experiencing extreme poverty, may not meal or maybe the risk of losing their housing. We need ways that are both trauma-informed as well as leading with compassion to bring people into the conversation. So, that's a lot of the work we want to do.

They'll will be a separate narrative shrinkage developed around both equity priorities, but the way in which we work with the community.

And how do we build -- racial equality. I would say this gives me an opportunity raise a current challenge, which is that we are not talking about racial equality in the way that we were after George Floyd was murdered. Oftentimes when people take to the streets after Anna egregious injustice whether due a fatally or housing collapse or a -- a spotlight on what you raised, right? The amount of children living in poverty. I want to get to a place where we're having this conversation without egregious injustice having to occur.

First, our [fast speaking]

As well as agencies to say because near a unique position as an independent commission, folks can come to us and say -- Linda can you do this? Can CORE lead these conversations? Can CORE bring people to the table or do a presentation or training? I'm essentially open to all of it. We will only have a staff of seven in the first year, but do as much as we can to build a coalition of the willing across New York City to reach those goals.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Thank you, Linda.

>> MITCHELL WU: Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Linda, for the presentation.

I was excited to hear about the goals and the values driving these goals.

I do want to speak on a piece about education coming from the SILC engagement side of things. We do have a lot of lofty goals, which is great. In the piece about just, like, doing the committee research part, looking at the different racial equity priorities. You did mention focus on the hyper loge. I also appreciate the fact that you talked about -- the community organizing components of the team, right.

So the recommendation that I would have now is -- if you're going to the local neighboring talking about their priority issues -- I would like that incorporate moments of educating them on the civic engagement process as well. Long-term goals about -- policy changes. When people call these listening sessions they might -- results these are all these things we have. In the schools, et cetera. but they might think after we share these things l- might be solutions overnight; right? But if you are talking about these longer policy changes and all these other things, it might take a longer process. If your team can be mindful about civic engage in knowledge of that process might be helpful for these communities you're working with.

I like the idea of standardizing data disaggregation and intake forms. Particular gaps.

>> LINDA TIGANI: I recently presented CORE to a group and the first thing they said to me is that I never learned some about government. That speaks to your comment. I think we need more and I'm committed to bring more civic engagement education into our work. Absolutely.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Thank you, so much. We're looking forward to working with CORE and partner with you as we move forward in this. Thank you.

So before we end today, we have one person who doted make a comment. That's Jerry W.

>> HAYDON: Hi, I'm Jerry W. I'm on meeting board six. This is adrenaline. I'll stack two questions, but they're not complex. First was with discussion on workshops that Benjamin brought up. I'm wondering about scope. For example, housing -- will be confined to city agencies. Off the top of my head, I can think of fixed -- initiative lending so much to the discussion of people who need a base line. The second time question was -- I know we're having budgetary challenges flight, but is there a long-term vision to increase the percentage for participatory budgeting? For example, Lisbon is 5% of the budget. Thank you.

>> SARAH SAYEED: I can take a crack at answering both of those. And let me know team or commissioners if you want add anything.

On the question of community board trainings, we have in the past, worked with partners outside of city agencies to deliver trainings and can continue to explore that. For some of our trainings that's still the case. I think we are also trying to do our due diligence to bring other agencies to speak to community board members as well as when we work with agencies, it doesn't cost us. So, there is kind of a budget issue in terms of how much funding we have to give to partners to provide training.

We're happy to take your recommendations. Be in touch with us on that. As far as a long-term longer term vision for growing the participatory budgeting budget -- commissioners feel free chime in -- part of what we're looking at this year is -- you heard from the implementation partners. I think showing proof of concept, that it works, people are involved, invested and when people have a voice thermic actually see results in their communities as part of the story. That we know we need to tell to get to that point. I don't know if commissioners want to add anything. To the last question.

>> MARK DILLER: Thanks for that.

The push pull need to address the budget gaps with the -- we heard compelling testimony today about the work that's not being done by government that's being built in by community and partners. We have given them a taste of what it could be like, but -- ourselves resources to continue their work.

So, hopefully what we're doing is empowering at home find partners who can. The first goal is before you expand is -- the flow of losses. So, I think the most important thing now is in hard times to recognize -- assuming these are hard times -- not to loose ground and then to look to make the growth part of the process.

Community boards in their district need statements and statements of budget priorities which are also mandated coup can be one of many voices in that regard. Participatory budgeting is a small

opportunity in our city right now. Community boards are addressing the entire budget not just the PB side of it. And so it would be appropriate for outreach to community boards to take up that issue and to highlight, for them, the work they say being done, that they can then express as priorities for the upcoming budget. We're fixed on 2025, so we're talking about fiscal '26 at this point, but that would be an opportunity address that mean and growth opportunity.

>> SARAH SAYEED: Anyone else? Anyone on the video call? Okay.

Hearing no other comments or questions, since we're a little bit over time, I was just wondering -- one thing I wanted to know -- we'll be sending out a poll for arranging the next meeting. We won't be able to -- trying to be thoughtful about everyone's schedules. One of our commissions has a class at this time, so next time around we will rotate the meeting time. We will send a poll for that.

I would love to -- if there's nothing else to chat about can you hear a motion to adjourn the meeting.

>> MARK DILLER: So moved.

>>PHONE: Second, it.

>> SARAH SAYEED: So the motion to adjourn has been seconded. And everyone in favor say aye. Anyone want to stay here for the rest of the day? If the motion passes I'll call this needs adjourn. Looking forward to seeing you next time. Thank you.

[Realtime event is concluded by:

Shanti Lira, Realtime Stenographer.]