

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

NYC CEC 032321 1045a

[Captioner standing by]

>> Hello everyone.

>> I have to figure out how I'm going to get the cash first. I will, yes.

Yes. I know.

>> You might want to mute yourself.

>> Hello?

>> Hello?

>> Hello?

>> Hello.

>> It's Donna Gill.

>> How are you doing Donna?

>> Am I too early? I got five minutes.

>> Yeah.

>> I'm on the phone. Only because I'm out in the streets.

But I will just keep myself on mute until I need to respond, okay?

>> Can you hear me? I'm on now, it is Michael.

>> Yes.

>> Okay.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

Thank you Francis.

>> You're welcome.

>> How are you Chuck?

>> Mike, can you hear me?

>> I hear you loud and clear.

>> I'm having trouble getting my video to work. Why.

>> I had the same problem, but.

>> It keeps saying find video, I do it and somehow it goes somewhere else. Why am I not on the video. Mute, settings.

Camera. That will help.

>> Good afternoon everyone.

Dr. Sayeed, we have quorum.

>> So Mike, what did you do to get the video to work that I can't figure out.

>> I would like to say I had my granddaughter who is 10 help me, but she didn't. I don't know, I touched a button I guess.

>> I hit the link that Francis sent us from the e-mail, and it gets me on, but I'm not sure why it is not on video.

>> I didn't use Zoom. I went on the webinar.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Oh, that's what I did. Oh, webinar.

>> I went the WebEx connection, not Zoom.

>> Video system, let's try the video system.

>> Chuck, you know what you look like, so it is okay.

>> I understand. But you know. I look good today. I want everybody to see me.

Video system.

>> Come on Chuck.

>> What did I do wrong.

>> You can do it Chuck. Come on.

>> Touch the screen Chuck and at the bottom it will say stop or go to the video. Touch the screen and at the bottom you should have a line that says stop video. You may come on.

>> No.

>> No.

>> Francis am I supposed to use the video system link instead?

>> No.

>> No. All right.

I did, I took it from your e-mail and I took the first link you wrote.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Uh-huh.

>> And for convenience I'm including the log in details. I hit the hyperlink and there I am, but no picture.

>> Might be the settings on your laptop or computer.

>> I hate to show my age and be a simpleton. I log out and come back and more often than not that solves it. I'm at a loss to tell you why, but for what it is worth.

>> You shut down the computer or log out of the meeting.

>> One time I logged out of the meeting and the other time I closed it down and came back in.

>> All right. See you guys. I'll be back.

>> See you.

>> Well Mark you got rid of him.

Do we still have a quorum in case he doesn't come back?

>> We do, we do.

>> Okay.

>> People will be making notes and sending me the same message later.

>> Something I said or just the way I said it.

>> I see her now.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Hello everyone. Can you hear me now?

>> Yes.

>> Okay. I apologize for that bumpy start.

I hope that we all have, we have a quorum. I'm assuming we do, so I'm unless Francis you want to flag for me that we don't.

>> We do.

>> I'm going to start. I'll call the meeting to order. I want to welcome and thank you for joining today and I will go through technical instructions for anyone who is new. We will enable audio for Commissioners for the duration of the meeting. Mute yourself to avoid background noise, and you may use the raise hand icon or speak directly into your mic if you would like to contribute to the meeting.

And to all participants, you are muted on entry, and the moderator will enable audio for participants during the public come period. We're asking that if you have registered for public comment you will be called on in the order that you registered for comment. And if you did not previously register, you may still register during the meeting, the registration period is open until 3:00 p.m.

And the other instruction is if you're dialing in via phone during the meeting and don't have access to a computer, you can text your desire to offer

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

comment. There is a number here. (646)763-2189.

When you text your, that number, you will be put on the queue for public comment and we will call on the dial in participants about I name and in order that the text was received. You can enable closed captioning under more options which is the three dots on your screen.

And you may click on the option for closed captioning there.

So, just to know for myself, has anyone signed up for comments in advance, Francis?

>> Not at this time.

>> No. Okay.

Thank you.

So, I think we can stop screen sharing for a moment.

Well, okay. Yeah. And then we will go back to that. I wanted to just start off by asking if everyone received the materials for today's meeting.

Okay. And we can start with attendance.

So I'm actually going to, for this segment I want to welcome a new Commissioner we have. Michael, main role pointy. I would love for to you introduce yourself to everyone and then I will go through the attendance and you will be able through that way be able to connect names to faces and say

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

hello to everyone. So I'm going to turn it over to you. Michael.

>> Thank you. Thank you Dr. Sayeed. I really feel honored to have been appointed by the mayor yesterday and begin serving. I have been an advocate and supporter of the civic engagement commission when it was first proposed. As a publisher, I endorse and actively engaged making sure it got passed as one of the charter amendments. Few people may know me on the commission, but I go back unfortunately or fortunately for over 50 years of civic engagement in New York City. I'm a New York City born and bred resident educated in the public school system, queens college and graduate school at NYU. I was a teacher in the late 60s and early 70s, vocational education program and I worked at UFT during that time when the 18-year-olds got the vote and ran for the united federation of teachers voter education and registration programs when they got the vote and we registered over 30,000 new students during the early years prior to the 1972 presidential election. I have been involved in many things. Significant ones have been publishing where I was involved with ownership of over 30 papers in New York and Washington and long island for many years until we sold the last of our papers three years ago.

But more important, I'm involved in civic activities, particularly focused on discrimination issues, particularly when I was president of the American Jewish

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

Congress for the region and we fought against hate crimes and advocated for the passage in New York state of the legislation. We led me also in the 80s to produce and involve in a significant movie that is applicable to today, Paul who killed Vincent Chin. It was the first federally charged hate crime in America in the mid-80s and I was the pro producer of that movie and involved prior with the Asian community which is timely today to get the federal government and the district attorney general at the time Bradford Reynolds under Reagan to prosecute the first crime against an Asian American, Vincent who was murdered in Detroit on the Eve of his wedding. I think that is an important movie people should see. It was a documentary the way it was nominated for an academy award in 87. I have been involved in government at the local level as well as in the is it I and I'm happy to join the commission and please take advantage of my resources and age of historical understanding on what the Civic Engagement Commission is doing because years ago the community boards were all under the jurisdiction of the mayor and we created the district service cabinet and engaging the community involved in decision making. This is a joyful occasion of participating once more. I thank you and the Mayor for the appointment.

>> Welcome.

>> That's the short end of it.



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Welcome aboard.

>> Thank you.

>> Dr. Sayeed is having technical difficulties. She will be restarting her WebEx and computer. I'm going to call attendance today. I can see, all right. So we will start with Amy Breedlove.

>> Here.

>> Thank you. Chuck.

>> Here. By the way, Mark your assistance helped. Dr. Sayeed, shut down and restart. I don't know what I did but it worked.

>> Mark.

>> Limited though I am I'm here.

>> Eve.

>> Here.

>> Oh, there she is.

>> Jose.

>> Here.

>> Thank you.

>> Lilliam.

>> Here.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Anastasia.

>> I'm here.

>> Murad.

>> Annetta. Donna.

>> I'm here. Welcome Michael.

>> Okay. Anthony.

Lori. I think that is everyone.

I'm going to get Dr. Sayeed a few more minutes.

>> Francis can I ask a quick question? I heard today that the Mayor has told all city employees that they're coming back to the office on May 3<sup>rd</sup>, is that correct.

>> That is correct. I wonder if Leslie is in the meeting. I believe she, Leslie Brown or Chief of Staff will be facilitating that.

>> I'm on Francis.

>> You're good, do you want to speak to it.

>> Just that we have been given guidance by the department of city wide administrative services and restart task force so all agencies are going through that guidance to determine the best way to come back. And informing, you know, agency staff of the intention to restart. So considerations around both

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

space, sort of the both space equity considerations and impact on like operational programming.

>> So does that mean the possibility may exist our may meeting at the end of the month may be in person?

>> I don't believe that decision has been made yet. I would defer to Dr. Sayeed on how we're moving forward on that.

In all likelihood considering the space in our office and we don't have a hearing room, I would think we may continue in the same module woo we're in now to be consistent with social distancing guidelines.

>> If I made add would not we're not legally employees. This is a large group to includes a public session. I work in a hospital setting --

[MULTIPLE SPEAKERS]

>> We can follow guidelines, I imagine it will remain virtual.

>> Our gatherings are limited to a certain number of people in a room.

>> Uh-huh correct.

>> Occupancy limitations are a consideration for us to return to any space we're in. That is accurate.

>> I want to express a concern I have today. I don't know when if when we schedule this meeting we were aware of the special elections that are

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

happening today in my own district here in The Bronx. I'm very upset that this is now something --

>> Hi everyone, can you hear me?

>> We can hear you. We can't see you.

>> Can someone say something so I can see if we can hear you.

>> I'm speaking.

>> I can't hear. I'm sorry about this. I probably have to call into the meeting.

In the meantime, oh, people are speaking. Thank you for someone sending me a text. Okay. I will put myself on mute. Have you taken attendance Francis, please nod your head. I think the next thing was for you to present the language access plan. So why don't you go ahead and do that and (indiscernible) we will need to vote on this so it can be posted or shared with Moya and posted online. We will take a vote after your presentation.

>> I guess I'll raise my concerns later but it is very disturbing because this time I could be engaging and making sure people are out to vote. It is extremely low turnout. I'm really worried and, you know, our efforts right now should be to do our best to ensure our civic society is exercising their right to vote. This should not happen again is my recommendation.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Thank you Lilliam. I think we can return to the topic once Dr. Sayeed has joined by phone. Give me a second while I share the screen.

>> This is Leslie brawn, I want to clarify that to your point Lilliam we're not having public meetings at this time. I just did get clarification on that. I want to make sure that is clearly stated to folks. Thank you for that question.

>> Leaving some time for questions. Then we will move to the discussion on the task force and racial equity and inclusion. So Dr. Sayeed will go into details what that looks like and the CEC's responsibilities. The updates I have shared, let me make sure everyone is on mute. Thank you.

Okay.

Just making sure that the commission is taking into account the vendors and technologies that are used in the provision of language services. Now the Mayor's office (indiscernible) is responsible for ensuring that all city agencies and Mayoral offices have a language access plan in place. For the fiscal year 2021 they have made updates on requiring agencies to explain how they're adhering to plain language requirements, how the provisional language services are incorporated into agency procedures, and the interesting piece of well not interesting, a focal component of the language access plan this year is emergency preparedness. Getting a better understanding of how mayoral offices

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

and city -- virtual outreach so we are going to talk about that. But I want to emphasize the language access plan, updates are focused on the vendors we utilize and the types of technology. So I'm going to stop sharing and reshare the language access plan.

To start off, the goals for last year, last fiscal year we set goals on the protocols for internal staff how to request translation services and interpreter situations for outreach events including ASL. We established and voted on a plan on how to implement (indiscernible) we created a tool kit ensures the timeline that all staff should follow when conducting outreach to limited English proficient communities. We have contracted interpretation and translation vendors this year. Looking towards this year, we're actually in the process of contracting Eriksen Translation. Eriksen Translation is a local NWBE vendor. This is different from the city wide contracted services that the city has for agencies. We're moving in this direction because of the vendor's knowledge of local New York dialects. This was especially helpful to the Mayor's office of immigrant affairs when doing public service announcements for the Poolside program. We were able to identify services that were more aware of the dialects spoken in the Yiddish community. That was helpful. Interpretations were not plain language and the vendor has the experience in working with New York,

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

local New York City populations. Training CEC staff, staff were trained during team meetings and encouraged to attend our language access meetings, so if there are upcoming events that are required translation or interpretation or just a bigger planning on how we're going to provide an interpretation, they're invited to join those meetings. This has been important trying to provide interpretation services in the virtual space. Understanding the requirements and technology that is needed and factoring also just ample time for us to assess how they can join by computer or cell phones, so the Mayor's office, we have been working with their office of immigrant affairs to provide a tool kit. This tool kit for how to do interpretation in the virtual space will also be provided to community wards. We have relied heavily on the community ethnic media to target community populations for our poll side program. We contracted NWBE to target based on zip codes advertisements for our poll site which we will continue to do as we go on. Our focus for poll side and language provision will be targeted to community organizations, especially those communities that make up a larger population of our services such as Haitian, Creole and Russian.

So the LOP population remains the same. What is changing, the Mayor's office of immigrant affairs wants more information on the types of vendors of the agency is using. For translation services, we for the first half of the fiscal year,

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

we actually work with the Mayor's office language services team to create PSAs and have those translated. The reason we did that, with them in partnership with them is due to their quality assurance procedure. We like to have a review process when we receive translations from vendors we work with MOIA -- ensuring that the words we are using actually make sense and I know this sounds silly when we say make sense, but terms like civic engagement may not have a direct translation. The Mayor's office language services staff helps us to assess whether that information is accurate. Another step we are talking for translation services is creating, we mentioned this before, a style guide. Creating a list of program language terms and services and translating that to a point where we standardize all translations by using the same terms. The vendor uses that as a point of reference to translate all materials. Interpretation services, we contracted the city is contracted vendor language line to provide interpretations over the phone, so all CEC staff have language line available. This service was also made available to community boards.

The service was made available as you know for free, it is available 24/7 in over 200 languages. For the poll site language assistance program, our interpretations contracted vendor is actually the big word. The big word provided interpreters for the poll site program. The way we targeted information



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

or the dissemination of (indiscernible) we utilized the poll site zip codes to target community LOP communities in those languages. We turned out advertisements in Russian, Arabic based on the zip codes.

Now language access and agency communications, this is more operations. How does the agency put out information to the community on their websites or CEC website or about public meetings. We're looking specifically at this year to changing making sure our press releases as we are trying to build community knowledge around our programming making sure that our press releases are translated. This is something we did not do the last fiscal year. We're looking to changing the practice and translating press releases as we move forward. Currently contract we're working to finalize by the end of March is smart link. Smart link translation service is a localized translation tech company.

To explain further when someone visits the CEC site, our government site, usually the translation that is available is done through a Google widget. Google has I mentioned before is not the most accurate translation. It is sometimes will translate things verbatim or literal translations of words that does not really work. So smart link is a company that creates a localized page. If I speak Cantonese and I click on Cantonese, it will create a completely separate page in Cantonese using the translations from our vendor. So it does not rely on Google

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

but creates a page that is accurately translated and translates, it is easy for New Yorkers who do not have access to a desktop and mobile device to use that piece.

So smart link, we will make our digital translations better and it is technology we're looking to integrate into participate NYC.

Connect to one another and provide feedback -- so this technology Smartling is something that we're really excited to have in our, as a part of the resources for language translation. I encourage, I will send a follow up. I will send more information about what Smartling looks like. It is difficult to talk about without seeing it in action. I will send a few links for you to review the technology we're using to translate. Plain language is very important for we try to ensure any collateral we create is from the star plain language so translations are more accurate. We follow the federal government's guidelines on plain language, and we attend the Mayor's office of immigrant affairs annual language access training to make sure we're up to date with the requirements and the best practices for translation.

An important aspect of this information is or part of plain language is standardizing our process. Ensuring we're using the tools that will make it easier for vendors to translate materials. A piece of that is Adobe creative cloud and

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

having consistent communications with the vendors if there are any changes to make based on community feedback. We utilize language assistance advisory committee to offer feedback on the information that we're translating.

Pre- and post-translation.

Policy and procedures. You know, how are we making it accessible for New Yorkers to know about our public meetings. We follow the city's open meeting law, so posting on the city records, the commission website, connecting to community ethnic media, providing, connecting with resources and free press to advertise our meetings.

Notification of free interpretation signage. The commission as you know provides translation and interpretation services in additional languages, Italian and Yiddish on included. This past fiscal year, we have been working collaboratively with our partner mayoral office to provide information in other languages.

And just to backtrack on the Smartling piece. We're going to focus on providing this localized translation in our 12 languages, but we will continue to provide the Google widget for additional languages.

So emergency preparedness. This is at the start of the pandemic we consulted with our counsel on best way to proceed with, you know, conducting

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

virtual meetings. What constitutes civic engagement in the virtual space. How do we ensure folks are able to participate. Part of that, you know, has been working with the department of health and mental hygiene to ensure the work we do on the ground and work we do with partner agencies reflects the city's guidance on best practices. We're also trying to integrate the emergency aspect of communicating vital information to our communities by integrating it into the scope of our translation vendors. Prior to fiscal year 2021 we didn't have the fast turnaround or the rapid response element into our translation vendors. Now that we're reviewing our contracts, we are, we have asked in the scope of work that they include a fast turnaround of less than 24 hours for critical information where integrating that into our budget as it is a higher cost to receive translations in less than 24 hours. It something that Eriksen has done well and has been responsive to the needs of our Mayor's office of immigrant affairs and our poll site needs in the prior year. This is as Dr. Sayeed will explain further, we're hoping to utilize a rapid response translation services of our vendor if the initiatives that will be rolling out in coming months. Any questions?

Nope? Okay. I'm going to move on just to --

>> Have one question if I may.

>> Yes.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> You mentioned the 12 critical languages that are being used. I don't know who decides that. But when an ethnic community gets to be large and impactful in the area to add another language how is that process? I used Chinese because we have a lot Cantonese and Mandarin but (indiscernible) we have a large -- Asian population from China. You know, it may not understand certain Cantonese but they would Mandarin.

>> The city conducted a data evaluation on the topmost spoken languages. So they determined using both census data and Department of Education data and landed on 10 official languages. Our additional two languages are based on our poll site methodology that we utilize to assess what additional languages we would provide interpretation services for our poll site program. I will invite Gagan Kaur how we use methodology to come to that number.

>> Absolute. Thank you. Just as Francis stated we come to the 10 languages -- and Department of Education data to determine the top ten CEC serves Yiddish and Italian because in terms of concentration of speakers out rank the lowest ranked city wide language. On the census data Italian and Yiddish have more speakers than the lowest ranked language which is why we serve Italian and Yiddish. To serve additional languages, they just need to meet the

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

same metric which is outlined in the chapter 76 of the city charter. If other languages have more speakers which limited English proficiency, than we would additional serve that language as well. When it comes to different dialects of certain languages, we currently provide interpretation in Chinese for Cantonese and Mandarin, but if we were to understand that the data and American community survey outlines additional outlines dialects that have additional speaker, we would add interpretation in those additional dialects of Chinese as well.

>> Thank you.

>> Of course, thank you.

>> Thank you Gagan.

>> Quickly, the last piece I want, implementation plan logistics is integrating the localized translation. So Smartling. Integrating into our government website we have gone through the long process of cyber computer integrating the localized translation so we're hoping to have that like I said completed. We just finished the cybersecurity review for our Smartling and will proceed to creating a plan on how we will manage the translations and a lot of the operations piece that goes on in the background of implementing a new technology such as Smartling into our city website. We're also looking into like I

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

said integrating into our civic digital portal, so participate NYC. That is going to be very important as we try to encourage more participation from LOP communities.

Another point that Gagan has been working on. How do we for the remainder of the fiscal year (indiscernible) workshops with LEP communities with important community based organization. We have had an -- we're in the process of translating our PowerPoint, so all the collateral we use, it is important that we present information in a translated language, so there is understanding and follow up. So Gagan has been working on the outreach materials for voting education and will share a calendar of workshops offered in the Haitian Creole, Russian, Polish and we're looking to offer them also in Yiddish. This, our, we have provided these languages based on the poll site partners that we have worked with, and seeing where we could do more to ensure that there is more, participation from the Haitian Creole community, Russian community and Yiddish community.

Gagan, do you want to add anything to that piece?

>> I think the one piece I would add is that we are partnered with democracy NYC and Mayor's office of immigrant affairs. They have done additional workshops in other languages such as Spanish and Urdu, so, Bangla.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

We look at other resources from city partners. In addition we're recording these workshops and meetings so they may be used as a resource after the workshops are conducted. The workshops will be, or meetings will be multi-link wall. We will have con executive or simultaneous interpretation so when folks watch the content, they're able to understand the content in English and the target language as well. We're excited about in a.

>> Thank you Gagan.

So I'll open the floor for question.

>> No that's for later.

>> Yes. I just noticed. I want to say something in the emergency preparedness. We have incorporated safety measures including PPE for interpreters so that is something we work with the department of health to ensure interpreters and staff who work during elections are aware and provided with the right conditions to work.

Okay.

>> Thank you Francis. Can everyone hear me okay?

>> Yes.

>> Yes.

>> Amazing. Okay. Great. I think I'm, I had to switch my device all



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

together.

So I hope this works all right. We are going to need to vote on this plan.

So you saw the edits made and the additions so I was wondering if we could move forward with that vote.

Is there a motion to approve the updates to the language access plan?

>> There didn't seem to be any questions or discussion so I move to approve the amendment as so put forth.

>> Second.

>> All in favor?

>> Aye.

>> Any opposed?

>> Aye.

>> That was muted aye I'm in favor.

>> Okay. Thank you. Thank you. I think everyone approved, so we can go forward and consider the language access plan approved.

For sending to MOIA and pending their approval to post to the website. I realized something in this snafu that happened with my computer stuff. We didn't approve the minutes and we were going to present something on the coalitions that we're working on. The task force for racial inclusion and equity is

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

next on the agenda, so I would like to propose that since Jordan stock dale, the director, is here with us to help with that presentation, that we can start with that and we will come back to the minutes, if that is okay with everyone.

>> Sure.

>> I don't know if we need to vote on a change to the agenda.

>> No.

>> Parliamentary procedure wise.

>> (indiscernible).

>> Okay.

Thank you. So we're going to talk next about the coalitions as I mentioned. The task force for racial inclusion and equity is a task force we have talked about in the past and prior meetings. This was a task force formed early on to address the inequitable impact COVID-19.

All the different programmatic strengths of agencies to create a more equitable response to the pandemic.

I previously served as a cochair for the COVID healthcare response subcommittee with Dr. Tory and Easterling and I'm serving as cochair of the stakeholder engagement subcommittee with Jordan stock dale.

He will be walking, helping me walk through the presentation. That we

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

have which about this and one of the several initiatives of the task force actually and it is a project to build neighborhood and strengthen neighborhood coalition work. I'm going to turn to Jordan to introduce himself and we will share an overview of the project.

>> Hi everyone. My name is Jordan stock dale. For those that don't know, (indiscernible) focuses on reducing racial disparities. We do that through investing and comanaging programs across education, work for development, health, and criminal justice reform.

So as Dr. Sayeed mentioned, the task force on racial inclusion and -- receive the supports they need and the task force developed this idea of the neighborhood coalitions.

So the diagram you see shows how the task force relates with coalitions and who will comprise the coalitions. The neighborhood coalitions were designed to elevate and organize communities and assist them in solving community problems. Specifically those related to the ongoing pandemic.

And they will consist of community members, boards, 10ent and block associations, task force members from racial inclusion and equity task force, different community based organizations, health providers, criminal justice infrastructure which includes cure violence providers, map, local businesses,

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

bids, it's a big tent that we're pulling together to help solve these problems.

They will be -- these coalitions will be led by a CVO or MWBE which will be the lead community organization that you can see in the diagram.

>> We can go to the next slide. So the vision for the neighborhood coalitions is prime Mayorly to serve as a space where there is vaccine test and trace education. We want to support communities most impacted and we would also like this to be a space where we connect community members to appointments for vaccines as well.

Even bigger picture, you know, in strengthening neighborhood coalition work which we know is already happening, the city is looking to further support neighborhood cohesion community building resilience and COVID-19 recovery which will be helpful not just for COVID-19 as well as, you know, but also other, other pandemics and health issues and emergencies hopefully we won't have too many of them but the idea is to strengthen that grassroots connectivity. We can go to the next slide.

So, the way that we are considering the implementation or working on the implementation is there will be 33 neighborhood coalitions. In the 33 impacted communities that have been identified by the task force.

And the coalitions will be supported by a city wide administrator which will

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

be an MWBE who will coordinate with the task force and CYMI will work -- stronger engagement from task force member agencies. What we're trying to do by creating this kind of mechanism is to have more timely resource and service coordination with the city.

And coalition leaders from the neighborhood level will be asked to attend trainings, webinars and meetings connected with the focus year. And they will meet with us, CEC and YMI to share best practices and resources and collectively problem solve on a monthly basis and they will work together to make sure they're meeting their deliverables.

We can go to the next slide.

Jordan, I think this is you.

>> I was speaking on mute.

As Dr. Sayeed mentioned, so the coalitions will focus on vaccine education and test and trace education. As well as community resource mapping and service coordination. And finalizing or doing the needs assessments. And second focus areas will be civic education and rank choice voting education and they will help develop plans with the coalitions for hyper local education.

Can we do the next slide?

Okay. Again, this shows phase one and phase two priorities.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

Again, in phase one, the coalitions will be asset mapping, conducting a needs assessment to see what the actual communities feel they need during vaccine education test and trace education we discussed and in phase two which will start at the beginning of the next fiscal year, the coalitions will be able to select from a long list of different potential focus areas that they believe are priorities for their own communities. That could be connecting young people to programming, food response, mental health service services, and the list goes on.

This is also me Dr. Sayeed?

>> No, I'm just having technical issues today.

So sorry. So, I think we were, I don't know if we went over the slide where, I think you mentioned this.

>> I think you went back on mute.

>> Sorry.

I think we talked already about the previous slide. I don't know if we went through just that we want to support and have a big tent as you mentioned and bring in as many entities as possible. For the timeline, I think this is you as well Jordan. I'm so sorry. This is you, the timeline.

>> Okay. Sorry. We have a few different versions of this presentation,

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

going back and forth here. For the timeline, the we announced the competition for which is the RFI request for information from various CBOs and MWBEs and conducted an information session, 130 organizations attended. In mid-March, we will issue a solicitation for an MWBE -- so there will be 1MWBE to manage the whole process in tandem with the city. That will be helpful on the contracting end which we needed assistance.

Late March, the coalition coordinators will begin. Sorry. They have already started applying. We talked about that. Early April, we will select the administrator who will subcontract to CBEs of the coalition coordinators. And then we will begin issuing the emergency contracts in April, May on a rolling basis.

So that the CBEs can begin doing the work. In June will be when phase one deliverables will be due.

And then July neighborhood coalitions will begin phase two which is actually selecting the various focus areas that they want their own coalitions to work on.

This is a sample of a meeting schedule of the for the initiative. Month one, we expect different (indiscernible) needs assessment, participate in vaccine education and test and trace briefing as well as begin to outline outreach plan.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

Month two -- test and trace education plan with city health representatives. That is important to note because we don't want the coalitions to feel they are doing this on their own. They are working with, you know, city agencies including the CDC to develop these plans.

Month three, we're finalizing the community assess mapping. We begin to codevelop the plan, rank choice voting education plan, of course, with this body, and we are continuing to share vaccine education and test and trace information. And then month four which is the last month of the fiscal year for this initiative we would be sharing deliverables, selecting, sorry, finalizing needs assessment. FY22 deliverables that we have discussed, distribute the community asset map so folks in the community know where resources are for the local community as well as for the city.

>> For the application as was mentioned, this application was posted, I'm losing track of time. I think I last week and the applications were expressions of interest are due on the 29<sup>th</sup>. Similarly, they are. FP for the MWBE city wide administrator was posted and applications are also due. We're asking for neighborhood coordinators to RFI spells this out but to as part of their applications to submit their qualifications, the neighborhoods they would be working in, proposed coalition membership with a minimum of eight coalition



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

members. And budget for phase one of the project, and then phase two funding of the funding will involve another budget submission depending on the priorities set by the named. And they also need to submit their 501C3.

These coalitions coordinators will act, will be selected in tandem in conjunction with the city wide administrator. It is like a two phase process where they submit expressions of interest and then we go back and forth with the city wide administrator to finally select the neighborhood coalitions.

I think that might be last slide on this. Yeah. So we can take down the PowerPoint and just open it up for questions and discussion on this initiative.

And Jordan, I know you have to head out soon, so I appreciate you joining today and please I don't, you know, like hopefully we can get some questions for you to help answer.

>> Yeah. For sue. Thank you.

>> So whoever has a question, yeah. Chuck, I see one, and maybe we can use the chat to stack if you have questions.

Chuck, you're on now.

>> You have to unmute Chuck.

>> Sorry. I guess stage one somewhere around 2 million budget for all these zip codes. Whose budget is that coming from. Obviously not ours

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

because it exceeds our allocations and the other question is what is our role as far as advisory and input. Is there anything ongoing we have to do with this process?

>> You want to start us off, Jordan?

>> Sure. The majority of the money is from OMB and the task force itself.

It is all CTO, city tax levy. Young men's initiative, we're allocating a certain amount this fiscal and next fiscal year to support, but yeah, it is mostly from the task force itself.

>> And the commission's role.

>> Yeah. On the commission's role as I mentioned CEC has been part of the task force for racial inclusion and equity for some time as ask YMI been. Agencies are taking on different initiatives for the city for the task force. CEC's role has been along with YMI to help shape this project. And then more specifically once the implementation starts, we will hold monthly convenes with coalition coordinators to share best practices and support their work as they're doing the implementation. And obviously working in tandem with the city wide administrator but that is, this is an opportunity for the commission and for YMI to have, we're the interface basically between the task force and coalitions for the

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

city.

>> What I'm getting it, we're not lead, we're participant and advisory part to this.

>> Um, I would say that we are lead implementers working with the MWBE.

And as soon as like a more granular scale, we would not have, for example, staff going to, like CEC staff. We might go to some of the meetings, but the coalitions are meant to be on the ground, like with the leadership of a local oh. It is not a coalition that the city is running per se.

But we're trying to support the organizing that is happening on the ground to support vaccine outreach and implementation.

>> Thank you.

>> Yeah. Just also note that the, as Dr. Sayeed said, the task force members will also help with the management and there will be agency leads for each of the coalitions and so they will assist, you know, they will tend to meet things and assist with ensuring each of the coalitions receive the resources they need or information they need to be successful.

>> Right.

We're calling it adopt a hub. So we're looking at agency partners to attend

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

meetings as well.

But in addition to that, there is, you know, there will be set into a communication process whereby if there are resource needs and problems that that need to be addressed by city resources, we will have a communication process to hear about those and relay those to agency partners at the same time.

>> One more quick one. The task force will choose the MWBE?

>> Yes and that would be, that shows the entity will be answerable to the task force.

>> Yes.

>> Thank you.

>> Next on the chat, have I Mark Diller.

>> Thanks, of course, Chuck that was a lot of the questions I was going to ask, so thank you Chuck.

I guess my only other question is it seems like this is a decision to pursue this process in this way that is already been made and now we're being briefed on and talked, inquired to about sort of the details of it. That is correct, right? The reason I'm asking is I am, I guess my overriding concern is that this is another example of a couple things I seen city government where a need is

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

identified and a push to create a new entity to address it is being formulated when existing infrastructure can be adapted to use it. In this context, I'm a hammer. Everything I look at looks like a nail. As a member of a community board and you talk about the need for district needs statement and assessment of needs and coordination effort, that struck me as what community boards are supposed to be doing. At a fundamental level I regret if this is a decision that is already made, I regret the decision was made the way it was. We're adding layers and probably expense but adding layers and then called upon to talk to one another. I am reminded of a software develop -- first inclination when a project was over budget or behind schedule was to take team members off the team. The reason they're behind is because they are spending time talking to one another when they could be writing code. That is the spirit with which I approach this issue.

I just regret if it is a decision that is already made that we're adding layers where perhaps existing infrastructure could have done the same or better.

Other than that, I may have other questions but that is my overriding concern for you.

>> Just to start us off on that, just to respond to that quickly. It is true this is a decision and program that is going to be implemented. I think your

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

concerns about how this new infrastructure interferes with the existing one is critical and important.

To reassure you that has been part of the conversation we have having internally all along is that we want to make sure that we are tying this structure to existing initiatives that are taking place on the ground including community boards and including other initiatives and other city agencies. Right. That is another sort of potential area where you could say there would be a lot of overlap.

That will be really crucial in implementation to make sure we're doing that. As far as the specific comment on, for example, the needs statements that community board submit, I do believe this is another opportunity to bring more people in to that process. Right. And to make people more aware of it. In doing a needs assessment as part of the COVID response what we would like to see is and share with the neighborhood coordinators the different resources that already exist in terms of communities identifying priorities. So CB me statements would be included as well as DUICD who does neighborhood assessments and other city agencies might be doing similar things. We would share that with the named coordinators and ensure that community boards are connected into this space. It was important for us as a CEC to make sure community boards are

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

connected to this initiative as well.

>> This is Donna, I have no way of raising my hand. I want to go next.

>> Go for it. Okay Dana, you can go next. I see Eve has a comment as well and Mark may have questions, but Donna go ahead.

>> Hold on one second. Are you hearing me?

>> Yes we can hear you.

>> I see this as a duplication of services already there in some communities.

My question is how is this created before you have actually done the needs assessment because you don't know the needs of the community. And like Mark being on a community board we have heard nothing about the task force on racial inclusion and members keep asking what is it, what are they doing.

We haven't heard anything about it.

Any policy or programs that have been set up, but now we have this which is sorta like an overarching reach in the community even though you are using resources from the community like MWBEs or community based organizations. They are already doing this, most of them. Now we have the city doing this, spending money on things that have already been done. For COVID we been in this for a year. For this to start up now communities had to have taken care of

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

themselves all along and have had -- I'm sorry.

(Background noise).

I'm sorry, I'm outside and had to create mechanisms like this by themselves, so is this a way to now fund those organizations by giving them city money and creating a city structure or something that is already happening? I'm so sorry. I'm still outside.

(Background noise).

New York is very noisy.

So that is my, you know, I'm looking at that and that way because I see it as a duplication of services.

Certain agencies that may or may not be doing this work are going to apply and they may or may not get the job because they have all of the things necessary for the job, but, you know, there is 501C3 and all this, but they're not necessarily a good fit to do this job. They haven't been doing it but they will change the resources to do it because now there is money in it. The different zip codes, you know, those communities are really suffering and they don't need an extra layer of people coming in even if it is not people in their community because there are people in the community not necessarily helping them to begin with.



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

I understand this is already done but I need take a closer look at it and to -  
- how do we monitor that it is happening, what is supposed to be happening when the Mayor is going to be leaving.

>> Thank you for that. I genuinely want to say I'm appreciative having these conversations with you all. Points of you that you raise are crucial for us to think about. I think that the way we're seeing this project is that it is the intention is to support the people who are doing this work on the ground already.

The effort is to try to support that work as well as build on it in order to make sure that we're addressing the equity gaps for COVID-19. Jordan. I want to be thoughtful of your time. I don't know when you need to leave, but if you want to add anything here, I welcome you to do that.

>> I would just say the city has funded CBEs to do work throughout the pandemic.

Young men's -- food distribution so the city has done some work throughout the pandemic. I think the concerns raised are really important. The initiative is not in every place for a reason. It is in neighborhoods most impacted by the coronavirus. I think there are significant disparities in the vaccine uptake rate that run along social economic lines and race and class and those are things

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

we need to be mindful of. If we can organize communities across different silos to ensure everyone is vaccinated, the world is a better place.

>> In an initiative like this and particularly for anyone who has done, probably a lot of you have done coalition building work on the ground. I think there is (indiscernible) that we have of coalition building and lots of opportunities for things to get complicated. So part of what we're going to need to do and implementing this program is to be as mindful as we can be. And support the local organization as much as we can.

This initiative does extend into the next fiscal year and past this administration as well and we need to think about how it is, you know, how it is going and depending on that to try to continue to support the coalitions over time. We've also been talking with our agency partners including New York City emergency management and department of health and mental hygiene because they have coalitions that they have been supporting for emergency management and response and community resilience as well. And trying to sort of weave all these efforts together and work together to build these coalitions out further.

Can we Mark, did you have another question or should I go to the next person? The queue?

>> I will want to speak again but go through others first and then see if

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

they don't also have the same thoughts or whatever.

>> Thank you so much. Eve is next.

>> Thank you for the presentation. I appreciate that. I think there is a lot of complexity to this.

I do feel like New York City is different from other cities because we have a wealth, a huge network of community --

(Background noise).

-- to date.

I guess my questions were around kind of reach for capacity because, you know, I do think that community based organizations are very important in conducting this city government more deeply, you know to communities and community board necessarily can. Just because they have (indiscernible) affinity areas that deal with more immigrant issues, you know, but I see this as a space where they should be working together. Community based organizations and community board boards. With that in mind, I think there is a capacity issue. There may be interesting 501C threes who don't necessarily know how to do a needs assessment or have the capacity to do the application itself. I'm hoping there is built into the whole system some support for creating the application.

And then it struck me when we were talking about this that there is clear

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

languages to the comprehensive planning initiative going on now. These are precisely the same issues the comprehensive planning initiative is trying to deal with, understanding where the gaps are in investment across (indiscernible) and then drawing resources to those.

I feel like the work of this named coordinators could be attached to that.

>> That's a really great point. We do want the CBOs to work with the community boards in this space, and on the needs assessment, and other the capacity building for the CBOs. For the applicants and selection, given we're operating on a short timeline to respond to an emergency, we are asking that the applicant have a 501C3. Right. That applicant could be a fiscal sponsor of another organization. You know, that is maybe really strong and doesn't have it but we want the applicant to be able to manage the contract with, you know, on this program.

We're going to be supporting them with tools for how to do the needs assessment, and stakeholder mapping. It will be borrowing from material that other agencies are using in this area.

And also on the planning work, I think we can keep talking about how we can connect the dot in that.

I'm looking at the clock. Do we have anyone that signed up for public

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

comment Francis?

>> No not yet.

>> Okay.

So, the next person in the queue was Michael.

>> This is for Jordan. When I look at the time frame, particularly month three, in terms of rank choice voting, month three is May or June, I don't know how you implement a program for the voting in June to begin the program when you have an election coming up city wide whether it be days or weeks later. I'm just concerned about the whole concept of implementing RCV and making it truly participatory when the last couple elections and the one that is going on today knowing that special elections will always have a low turnout city wide election obviously (indiscernible) many people, even though (indiscernible) times may only be 20 percent of the population. How do you really be able to get concept of what you're aiming for with the board of election have little faith in to be able to count the votes in a timely manner. The last election, the 31<sup>st</sup> and rockaways took weeks and that was a small election in one district. You're going to have it city wide. Is your time frame reasonable or realistic and what can we do to make it better.

>> Month three is May for what we're counting. Let me quickly answer

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

that in a couple of ways. Number one, the vaccine education test and trace is paramount, save lives, more important than the election, even though the election is incredibly important. Out of the gate, we have to do vaccination education.

Two, we're allocating, we haven't announced this publicly but \$175,000 towards rank choice voter education. That is happening city level. 100,000 outreach, \$75,000 on education and that is one component of several other agencies doing their work.

And so that is another route.

Talking about this here, this initiative in May the coalitions will begin formalizing their plan and CBOs are charged with training a specific number of people on what rank choice voting is. And the members of the group in general are of the coalitions are people with their own constituents. This is the important piece. You have cure violence groups that go back to their members and tell them the process. Same with community boards, same with some of the other, I can't think of all the members, but they have a group of constituents. What folks learn spreads throughout the community at a quicker pace.

Dr. Sayeed, I know you had --

>> 175,000 is like throwing a handful of sand against auto tsunami.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

Probably going to be tens of millions. I would like to see whether it be this agency or others collectively ask the business community and even labor to put together an independent ad campaign to educate the people of New York. 175,000 the way you're dividing it up could be spent some place else. You can ask the business community and other organizations to contribute to a city wide education campaign that could be (indiscernible) by some reasonable ad agency or group. You will get the message out in a multiple of languages, 175,000 is not enough to print the message where you want to go. Let alone activate it. I wonder if there is another way to support what you're doing by expanding the coalition of participants and the financial resources that could be made available if the Mayor and others ask the business community and others to participate.

>> Michael, thank you so much for that. I think we definitely agree there is a need for city wide, you know, education in this space, for sure. I think I totally agree with you, what we're doing here is really a drop in the bucket. If you think about the coalitions, you know, we put out the RFI and the RFP and we are not expecting 33 coalitions to onboard all at the same time. It is going to be a highly tailored schedule that will vary across communities.

So, we're going to have to really, if there is an art, I guess it's an art and science metaphor but really tailoring the work of the coalitions specifically.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

We want to prioritize the vaccine education and making sure people are getting access to appointments and getting vaccinated. We are going to make a strong push on the RCV. This is in tandem with the funding Jordan was discussing as well as other initiatives.

Just recently we did a roundtable with the URDU speaking community to promote RCV education. We will work on that with other language communities. In addition to that, there are other non-city, city agencies will get involved in this space trying to share materials with their communities.

MOIA is active here and will be working with other NITRA and DIFTA and others as well. There are non-city efforts happening. You know. Rank the vote, other funders are involved in this space as well to try to promote more education. I think there is a lot of room for us to do more.

For sure.

And I think that the issue is like how do we coordinate who is the entity that coordinates it all together.

You know, like what is happening from the philanthropy sector, business, city, and then education as well.

And we didn't mention at all the campaign finance board, you know and the board of elections. They're doing their education work as well. I think CFB



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

is the primary entity here. What we're looking to do is bring training from CFB into the coalition space and connecting them to the trainer work that CFB is doing so coalitions leads and partners CBEs would have access to the training and can then in turn share with their communities.

So I'm going to keep going on the questions. The next one is from Amy Breedlove.

>> I would like to yield time to Commissioner Perez who has to leave to get in her comments.

>> Okay.

>> I have 30 seconds. I have an important meeting at 3:30. A few concerns, one, I think you were not on when I was expressing my concerns that today is election day. Although it is not city wide, we need to be respectful of the fact one of the main goals is to engage with individuals to vote that are usually disenfranchised. For that reason, I propose we never schedule meeting or activities on election days. Two related to the last discussion, I will say, I'll concur with Jose, I'm from The Bronx and I continue to see duplication of efforts waste of funding doing things where so many experts are trying to do that work. Public active, the City of New York continues to message on COVID, continues to message with experts on hesitancy vaccination, I mean, you name it. There is

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

so many going on in that space. We need to focus, I think this body again I continue to want to find where we can really have an impact. I think if we jump on anything and everything that is formed as a reaction to an issue or matter that occurs, we will I have in a very, we -- things are always going to happen. I think we need to reevaluate our priorities. And concentrate on things that are things we can have an effect on. Elections is huge for me.

Rank voting is a big concern. I'm going to vote today. I live in a very multi culturally community. I only got one mailer about how to vote. One week before the election in English only full of words, without graphs. And it is, I'm just really, really upset. You can hear it in my voice. And to Michael's point, welcome Michael, we have a real important elections for the next generation of the city residents and we will be electing our next leader and people don't know how to vote yet. Talk about (indiscernible) the role of the group, there is not -- it is not what I want to be serving on this commission for. I apologize. I want to continue this concerns and conversation but I have to jump. I hope I'm putting my frustration out to you. And please help me figure out how we can better represent our communities. I'm here for the community that continues to be poor, disenfranchised sick, you name it. Sorry I have it run. I wanted to be sure I express myself.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> Thank you Lilliam for being here. And for sharing those concerns.

We will revisit the calendar and make sure not to hold meetings on elections. I think definitely want to continue to have this CEC be a place that, you know, elevates the communities that have been most at the margins in terms of engagement.

We really have to keep talking about this and we can talk more offline with you as well and maybe think about ways to build this topic into future conversations.

>> Thank you.

>> So thank you. Thank you for sharing.

>> Thanks.

>> And then Chuck, I don't know if Chuck is still here, he had to leave.

He put a question into the chat about our minutes but I'll get to that after, Francis do we have anyone signed up for public comment.

>> No we do not.

>> I'm going to keep going on the questions if that is okay. And they be reserve time at the end to approve the minutes.

>> Can I go now.

>> Yes please.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> So I mean this is great work and clearly it is needed. Thank you for that. I want to just agree and enforce a lot of what my fellow Commissioners have brought up in terms of process and duplication of efforts. I also want to bring in about metrics and how you're looking at success and I see that there are four stages of payment.

This is like the approximate. PP loans. There was so much conflicting information about what they needed to do to be in compliance that a lot of effort was wasted and at the end of that most banks just washed their hands of it and said don't worry about it. Just walk away, take your money, don't worry about it.

I'm concerned about how far we're going to measure success as we move through it.

If we are not meeting success, what resources need to be allocated quickly to help CBEs get work done on the ground. I fear we're going to plug along, the money goes out and the good work is not done because it is a lot of work to do in a quick time frame.

>> On the, this program though it is -- this is how the city contracts with entities. It is following procurement processes. What is different is that we are trying to do this in a really, really short time frame.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

That is because of the emergency we're in. And it is an ambitious time frame and there is room for concern there. I think that is totally right. But the procurement process is normal. It is what we do with most CBOs.

>> My concern is really to go to the point about metrics and how you gauge success as you move along the program. And be able to quickly react and throw resources in when you see that, you know, it is not necessarily working or you see a lag so what needs to happen in order to move this along successfully.

>> There will be an advance of 10,000 as part of the signing of the contract. And what we will be looking at is deliverables, specific deliverables will include an asset map or stakeholder map of a directory. Within the package is a plan to do the vaccine outreach as well as participating in a training about vaccine outreach as well.

So, we do think that that initial deliverable is something that is certainly hopefully achievable and then we can build on that for the needs assessment and other parts after. The initial round is 20K and there is another 40 that will be determined by the priorities set by the neighborhoods. Just as a note, what we're intending to do and why it is several more than one budget submission is we really want to give communities an opportunity to through this program to voice what their priorities are and allocate funding based on what community's

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

voice as their priorities. It is an effort to make it more preparatory.

>> Dr. Sayeed.

>> I think we started to think about the metrics but that needs to be developed.

>> If the priority is the vaccine outreach and that is what Jordan is saying and the funding is limbed, not to water down the activities by the local groups having to do multiple tasks, why not take advantage of the time frame which is the vaccine and exposure between now and the summer is the greatest. Why not just cut off the RCV program and have everyone just focus on the vaccine to make, and lower the disparity of the vaccinations and focus on those communities if that is the critical time frame and if the FEC and board of elections and who knows what, you know, candidates need to spend their own money, really, if they want to educate the voter to vote for them. We should not be spending money on that if the vaccine is the priority. I don't know if it is too late to segregate that but just a suggestion based on the conversation, what is more important than something else. I screwed up every last thought. It's the way my mind goes I look at the priority. Vaccine Jordan you're telling me that is it and I think people understand that and department of health did a lot of money that was spent to TV to educate people about wearing a mask and

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

getting vaccinated and people are turned off that we're spending money on voting.

At least from the budget that you're expressing and the priorities and I still believe that somebody else should take on that responsibility.

>> Yeah. Thanks. Jordan.

>> No I think that's an interesting point. The vaccine is most important. I think to other Commissioners points we need to get information out about RCV and we're trying to do a lot in a short period of time but you bring up a good point.

Yeah.

>> Next on the queue, we went to Lilliam, we did Jose would you like to share your comments and concerns or questions?

>> I was just -- I live in one of the zip codes that is targeted for this. Even still to this very day there is still not enough information out there (indiscernible) plastered on the wall but no direct outreach to the people who live in the buildings. They expect people to walk by, stop and look at the information on the walls. And there is, there is nothing more, like you should have that personal, you know, contact with a person that is going to explain these things to you in your language. And make you feel more comfortable

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

about the vaccine, the coronavirus, the social distancing and stuff like that.

Since the beginning of the pandemic, my neighborhood has been looked over and that is why we have some of the highest rates of infection. We were the last to get the information and as far as the equity and vaccines, I think the entire process the governor laid out and it was ableistic and carrying more about the economy than the people who could die from the vaccine. I'm a person with a preexisting condition, I have a disability and compromised lungs.

You know, it started out fine, but somewhere things got lost when they started allowing restaurant workers and taxi drivers to get vaccines before people with preexisting conditions. I went to get my vaccine and soldiers were turning people away when on the news it says you can go to Yankee stadium and make an appointment and that changed and no one informed the people. Miscommunication and everyone is dropping the ball instead of encouraging people to get the vaccine. They discouraged them and that person was turned away and probably not going to go back to try and get one.

Just comments and concerns that, and disappointment over the entire process.

>> Thank you for that. Can you remind me which neighborhood you live in? Sorry.



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> I live in the, where is it.

I can tell you exactly, I'm right here.

>> Oh, you don't, you don't need to look at the --

>> My haven Mel Rose section.

>> Okay.

Yeah. I appreciate you sharing the gaps that you are seeing on the ground. And I think that is one way that everyone can help with this program, to continue to share what you're seeing on the ground, and we definitely need to, I mean, we're hoping this coalition work will strengthen the city's responsiveness and our ability to reach communities in a better way through partnering more deeply with the folks on the ground who are doing this work.

I'm sure there is, there will, it will not, we're going to do a lot of learning as we're doing this. So thank you for that.

Are there any other questions because I think we covered everyone who might have had -- Mark, I know you had, Mark you had a question before?

>> I'm not sure it's a question.

I could probably (indiscernible) lifelong -- without making it on to the show.

So I guess the question participate of it is what I didn't see included in the

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

silos that are trying to be united through this effort and, of course, my overarching concern is we're creating another silo rather than spanning them.

Council members and their constituent service staff, I'll perceive from what I understood Michael to be saying, I don't want to put words in your mouth, but this is a great deal of money to be had here. So efficiency turns out to be really important. The test and trace core already talks to community boards. I will talk about council member constituent service staff. Especially in my district, which is not one of the ones on the target list, nor should it be, I'm with you on that part of the priorities, if you want to understand how to reach folks who are not as likely to be reached through electronic media, for example, you go to the council member and the president staffs housing outreach folks already on the ground. So I see in the chat that there are coordination efforts being highlighted and that is great, I'm just wondering where the council member staff had sent to all that since they're already a source of well-informed granular information about who is who and who is where. And --

>> That is really important. I think we don't have anything saying that council members may not be. There was an existing part of how this coalition idea has developed is that there was a similar sort of coalition set into place up in Harlem and elected officials were part of that. In the stakeholder mapping

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

and asset mapping activity that we will be asking the coalitions to do, it is partly to map the elected officials that are responsible for that neighborhood.

And help connect the residents to those elected officials as well.

The stakeholder and asset map directory is supposed to be shared with the residents of the neighborhood. And drawing upon, you know, all the different entities as much as possible to create a big tent is something that we're going to work with the coalition coordinators to do.

>> Okay. In the same vein of not reinventing wheels that are already round and rolling, the get food program developed broad reach into places where a lot of us don't have direct contact.

So they were reaching home bound folks, they were reaching folks most vulnerable. Oftentimes, through networks of volunteers that it never ceased to amaze me dollars were spent to provide food for folks who would otherwise go hungry during the pandemic. There was an infrastructure created, the truck arrives at a facility where I went to help unload it but without a bunch of folks, many of whom are senior citizens taking the food off as delivered and bringing it to neighbors because that is who they trust to open the door to them. Again, the idea there is capacity that I don't see, maybe it is here and I don't see it.

But if we're trying to get the most efficient link to the most serious issues

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

of the next step, heavy reliance on those already on the ground and covering that ground seems to be the only way to accomplish it.

So I don't know if that is the Food Czar or the get food program or the new COVID Czar but I'm sort of worried we're adding a layer to talk to other layers that exist. I already made that point. Thanks.

>> If I may, Mark, you can put words in my mouth any time but I had the last word when I put ink on to paper. As long as I can control that. This organization is amazing. All the decades I have been involved in civic engagement, there are so many people doing -- I would not worry about duplication of services. We can't do in, uh, on different layers. From the Upper East Side to Lower East Side to Asian community or just a small nuclear community that has an ethnic grouping. Those people are doing something within their community. My point earlier for Jordan and for the discussion of spending money that is a trickle, that doesn't have an impact, versus prioritizing what we're going to do and vaccines to me is the priority.

And I'm just commenting on that because I would love to, of course, out a way to shake loose a leadership in the city if they're interested in rank choice voting, okay. Educating. There are many civic associations that are interested in making sure people are educated on that. But they don't have the capacity to

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

deliver a vaccine where the city can do that and we can help with that by identifying local communities.

The vaccines are something you don't have to explain. You just have to implement. Rank choice voting is such political confusion to so many people that are used to voting one way or another. As was said earlier by a Commissioner who left, she hasn't decided how to vote. Whether she is going to rank. The politicians --

>> Sorry Michael. I'm really sorry. I have to kinda interrupt here because I think people are starting to leave and I want to make sure that we take the time to vote on approve the minutes from the last meeting.

Before we lose the quorum.

>> I move to approve.

>> Second.

>> Okay. All in favor.

>> Aye.

>> Any opposed.

>> Aye.

>> Okay. I'm assuming that was an aye for approval. We are going to approve the minutes.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

So there was a note in the chat about the minutes itself which said did we spend two hours just approving minutes at the last meeting. I want to remind everyone that the way we record the minutes is to record attendance and votes. We don't typically on the minute talk about what we discussed. So that is why it is written that way. Just as a reminder.

So okay. Now that we have done that, we do have about seven minutes left. So I know that the participatory budgeting team did want to share with you the end of the voting process, so I don't know if Danielle and Wendy, are you still on the call and could you, you might need to shorten your presentation. I would like to turn it over to you.

>> Isn't it we feed?

>> Sure. We're still here. And can take --

>> Thank you.

>> Condensed update to get you all out of here by 4:00.

So good afternoon everyone I'm Wendy from Civic Engagement Commission. We're happy to provide an update on our process. It is our money, demonstration project colored by youth empowering young people ages nine to 24 to decide how \$100,000 of our money should be respect. Last time we presented we provided a quick demo of our platform, the platform we use to

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

facilitate the process.

So today we want to provide a quick recap of the process core activities and highlight results because we just completed the voting phase at the end of February and have our results in of the process.

So just a, I know we're short on time, a recap, we started with a needs assessment. We thought it was important to talk to young people about what they need to we can be mindful when project ideas come up that we're aligned. Project ideas can be aligned with what young people are saying they need. In terms of strategy to agency partners, community based organizations, including DYCD young men's initiative probation, office of immigrant affairs -- so that was a great opportunity for us to develop relationships with agencies and reach CBO provider community and get their assistance in reaching out to LGBTQ youth run away homeless youth, youth with disabilities and as part of that outreach we had 80 organizations signed up to be part of the process and participate in some way whether it is getting the word out through networks or participating in virtual idea generation sessions or submitting a proposal. That is how we tackled outreach and also providing social media kits for CBOs to share out the information and process as we went along.

This process was youth led. We had fellows assist with this process and

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

codesigned the process we're still in slide one, um, still in slide one sorry whoever has control. I think we will skip that slide. Anyway so 32 sessions withheld across the city. Youth PB fellows took that information, condensed it, produced a report and we invited CBOs to respond and present project proposals. We received 49 proposals that was more than we anticipated having and they all met the criteria we established in collaboration with the youth when we designed the process. The project requirements including making sure they addressed the needs that young people identified.

And those include mental health, education, career and advocacy hearing that young people, mental health matters and young people not feeling prepared for their futures ask just wanting to be heard.

So those project proposals had to address in some way those needs. We also required that all projects serve at least one high need community which we identified and overlaps with the task force racial and inclusion named neighborhoods.

We didn't further have a delegate committee. We didn't narrow them down further. Anything that met the criteria was on the ballot. We were concerned it was a big ballot. It is large for New York City. They were able to sort by project and borough and they plowed through. They were not



DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

intimidated from what I could tell. Not to be underestimated. We had 2,028 -- we required they at least vote for two, they vote for an average of four.

We are now in implementation mode.

We announced the awards and so I'll ask Danielle to talk us through maybe Danielle you don't need to go into the project and borough based information just share who won. And this talk quickly about how we're going to support the organizations through the implementation phase.

>> Yeah. Absolutely. Francis. My name is Daniela. I'm going to walk you through quickly through the winning projects for this process. So the top five projects with the most votes obviously won the process.

We had a mix of organizations well established organization as South Asian youth action and organizations that never worked with the city before.

It was a good representation of, you know, different civic organizations that serve communities across the city.

The green space project is an education in schools project. They're aiming to build a garden rooftop, a garden in a high school rooftop in Brownsville. The second project is recycling and climate change, another green project aimed at recycling and cleanup activities along with as climate justice education. Third project that won, young musicians in training. From quest youth organization.

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

They are a career readiness organization so they're matching young people that are interested in careers in music with well established artists across the city.

Peer mentoring for high school and college students. This was south Asian youth action project. After-school program matching college students with current New York City high school students. And finally the final project, girls' circle is a mental health project that creates an online space for youth of color, particularly women and girls and will serve a community in The Bronx.

You can see the projects are well spread out. We have two projects in Brooklyn, two in The Bronx and one in Queens. You can see the respective votes. Projects were a mix of CBO led and proposals and then other CBOs worked with their youth members or they had youth leadership counsels in their organizations help to create the project. So it was a good mix of co-collaboration between organizations and youth.

You can go to the next slide Francis.

>> I know our time but I want to note we want to support, we want to make sure there is account ability. There has been a lot of discussion in reflecting upon the city council process. People need to know -- we also think it is important particularly since we have organizations who are relatively newer or entirely voluntarily run. That we work with them and -- we want to be able to

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

have the more established organizations support the smaller organizations and vice versa. We are excited to pull them together as a cohort, host monthly meetings, support each other in the process. Trouble shoot, collaborate, share practices, think of creative ways to property back. So it is not just about metrics, it is about experience and telling that in multimodal ways.

And then we will be excited to pilot of feature that is on our platform that is transparent and shows progress and progress bars and be able to work with that so when we're in a position where we're rolling out city wide we have some facility with that feature.

So I think we're at time. We encourage you to choke out the projects. It's a neat mix of creative ideas and maybe see the video. We have fellows talking about the process, what it meant, what they learned from it, hearing it from young people is more interesting than hearing Danielle and I talk about it for sure. The links are on the side. I hope you can take a minute to hear their voice and hear them talk about the process.

>> Thank you Daniela and Wendy. I'm sorry we cut your presentation short and we didn't get to share a moment together to watch that video. We will send the link around so people have it.

And since we're at time, I want to just say again we will look at the

DISCLAIMER: This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

calendar for check the meeting dates for, and make sure we're not doing meetings on election day.

And in order to close the meeting, I do need to have a motion to adjourn the meeting.

>> So moved.

>> Second.

>> Okay. The motion to adjourn has been seconded and is there any discussion? I'm assuming not and all in favor please say Aye.

>> Aye.

>> Opposed? Any opposed? Okay. Hearing none opposed. We will adjourn the meeting. Thank you so much.

>> Thank you.

>> Bye.

>> Bye-bye.