	Page 1
1	CRC Meeting
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	Moderated by Chair Carlo Scissura
7	Thursday, July 25, 2024
8	2:04 p.m.
9	
10	
11	Brooklyn Public Library Central Library
12	10 Grand Army Plaza
13	Brooklyn, NY, 11238
14	
15	
16	
17	Reported by: Thea Popko
18	JOB NO: 6784142
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

	Page 2
1	APPEARANCES
2	List of Attendees:
3	Carlo Scissura, Chair
4	Hazel Dukes, Vice Chair
5	Diane Savino, Executive Director
6	Ken Ngai, Secretary
7	Edward Kiernan, General Counsel
8	Jackie Rowe-Adams, Commissioner
9	Gerald Seabrooks, Commissioner
10	Kyle Bragg, Commissioner
11	Lorraine Grillo, Commissioner
12	Christopher Lynch, Commissioner
13	Stephanie McGraw, Commissioner
14	Max Rose, Commissioner
15	Ruben Diaz, Jr., Commissioner
16	Reverend Herbert Daughtry, Sr., Commissioner
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

	Page 3
1	PROCEEDINGS
2	MR. SCISSURA: Good afternoon,
3	everyone.
4	MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: Good afternoon.
5	MR. SCISSURA: Good afternoon. It's
6	first of all, welcome to the final meeting of the 2024
7	New York City Charter Review Commission. I am Carlo
8	Scissura, Chair of the Commission.
9	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 1: Hold on, guys.
10	Are we ready?
11	MR. SCISSURA: We're ready.
12	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 2: We're ready.
13	MR. SCISSURA: Sorry. We'll wait.
14	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 1: I'm starting
15	literally in 15 seconds.
16	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 2: Oh, okay.
17	Hold on.
18	(Off the record.)
19	MR. SCISSURA: Okay. We'll do that
20	again.
21	Good afternoon, everybody.
22	MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: Good afternoon.
23	MR. SCISSURA: Welcome to the final
24	meeting of the excuse my cough of the 2024 New
25	York City Charter Review Commission. My name is Carlo

Page 4 1 I've been thrilled and honored to serve as 2 the chair of this Commission and, I will state, my third charter commission, which is exciting. 3 And let me thank all of you for joining 4 5 us today. Before I introduce our commissioners to 6 7 say a few words, let me thank my dear friend Linda Johnson, president and CEO of the Brooklyn Public 8 9 Library, for hosting us today. Yes. If you haven't 10 had a chance, you should walk around the building after there's been some incredible renovations and it 11 12 looks phenomenal. 13 In just a moment, I'm going to ask each 14 of the commissioners to introduce themselves and say a 15 few words about their thoughts on the process, their 16 feelings on the report, the ballot proposals, and 17 anything else you'd like to add. Let me start by sharing my thoughts on 18 19 the work of the Commission over the last few months 20 and on the proposed final product that we shared on 21 Tuesday and that we are going to consider today. 22 First of all, let me clarify because I 23 think there was some confusion. What was shared on 24 Tuesday was a proposed final report. It is not final

until the commissioners vote on it.

25

So I know there

were some questions about that.

It has been, I think, an amazing process, an amazing journey. As I've said, I've done three of them, and each one has been different. Each one has brought unique perspectives. Each one has brought different cast, so to speak.

I can tell you this has been the most diverse commission I have served on. And diversity, not just in the way we look or who we pray to, but diversity in our experiences. Diversity in how we came to being civic leaders and community leaders, diversity in where we come from, diversity in how we think about the future of New York.

But I think in all of our diversity, we share one common goal. And that is we want New York City to thrive. We want New York City to be safe, and we want it to be a fair and equitable place for all people to be.

And that, to me, if you ask what is the most striking part of this Commission, is just that.

And I am very honored that I got to lead such a diverse group of thinkers, of people, of strategists, and I think of New Yorkers.

And New York equals diversity. New York equals talent. New York equals people with big

	Page 6
1	visions, big ideas, people who have gone through, as
2	we say, the spin cycle of life. And somehow we manage
3	to get up, dry off, and come back.
4	And so I want to take a moment to
5	applaud my fellow commissioners because you are all
6	amazing.
7	Let me now talk about the staff. You
8	know, this this group of individuals were given a
9	task a few months ago. And a daunting task. A task
10	of putting together a series of hearings and meetings,
11	of listening to the diverse voices that I just talked
12	about, and of coming together and pulling in a how
13	many pages is this?
14	A lot. Two hundred a lot of pages.
15	Right?
16	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 2: Yeah.
17	MR. SCISSURA: A report that reflects
18	not just what we're going to vote on tonight. That
19	almost is the easy part of this. The harder part is
20	really identifying and memorializing all the things
21	that we heard, all the things that New Yorkers came to
22	us with.
23	And to me that is a big testament to
24	the talent and and the focus of the staff that has
25	been assembled. Yes, and they deserve a round

	Page 7
1	applause.
2	So our executive director, Diane
3	Savino. Thank you.
4	Our general counsel, Ed Kiernan.
5	You've been on my left for all of this.
6	Chief of Staff Robert where are you,
7	Robert? Robert Cataldo. You're here somewhere.
8	MS. MCGRAW: He's working as usual.
9	MR. SCISSURA: Senior Counsel Marc
10	Heinrich.
11	Communications Director Frank Dwyer. I
12	know Frank is back there.
13	Our counsel team: Sabrina Hassan, Ivy
14	Chiu, and James Bristow.
15	Our senior advisors Bonnie Tsang, Ryan
16	Merola, Michael Clarke, Krista Ashbery, Jonas Neri,
17	Pablo Ponce De Leon, and Alex Tymkiv.
18	I got to say is Ryan here?
19	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 3: Not yet.
20	MR. SCISSURA: Not yet.
21	I've just got to say one thing about
22	Ryan. He was our intern on the first charter
23	commission that I did in 2010. So life has a good way
24	of coming around.
25	Special thanks to LeeAnn Wharton, Kary

	Page 8
1	Hudson, Chloe West, Jasmine Wright Greene, Eden Ayala,
2	and Hamza Suhail.
3	And last but not least, a special
4	thanks to the New York City Law Department for their
5	counsel throughout the process. In particular,
6	Spencer Fisher, Martha Alfaro, Benjamin Miller, Rachel
7	Kane, Ian Sinclair, and Ashley Iodice.
8	Let me now have the honor and the
9	privilege to ask each of the commissioners present to
10	introduce themselves and share any thoughts they may
11	have before we proceed with the vote.
12	I will say, when I was asked to do this
13	and I was told who my vice chair would be, I said,
14	"Finally, I get to work closely one-on-one with a lady
15	who I think epitomizes New York City national
16	leadership." If Dr. Hazel Dukes is with you, man, is
17	she with you.
18	MR. SCISSURA: But but if she is not
19	with you
20	MS. MCGRAW: If she ain't with you
21	MR. SCISSURA: Oh, boy. You better run
22	for cover. Our vice chair, Dr. Hazel.
23	DR. DUKES: Thank you so much, Mr.
24	Chairman. And I really echo your sentiment about the
25	diversity representing this charter commission

members. I have the pleasure of knowing many of them and have worked with them in different capacities.

I am 92 years of age. And yesterday, on CBS, when they interviewed me to talk about the process of the Democratic Party -- I've served 15 years on the National Democratic Committee. I was there when I nominated -- second the nomination of Shirley Chisholm. So you know how excited I am about what's taking place in America today.

But let me say about why I took time out of my busy schedule and have spent evenings and afternoons like today: Because I love New York City. While I was not born here, I've been here most of my life. My dad was a Pullman porter, and I arrived when I was 11 years of age. So I do call it home. But I never forget Montgomery, Alabama, where I was born.

And so let me say today, to those of you, stopped from your sun and enjoying your summer afternoon, this has been a part of my living to make sure that all people, regardless of race, creed, or color, or sexual orientation -- I have given 47 years of my life fighting for the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People who just celebrated its 115th convention.

So I have always, as I said yesterday

	Page 10
1	on CBS, been about bringing people together,
2	regardless of what you believe in and what faith, we
3	all bleed red.
4	And I love America. So much
5	opportunities. And when I look back over my life and
6	look at the history, to see how far we come and how
7	far we have to go, where we can respect all people.
8	As Martin Luther King said, "If you the
9	street sweeper, be the best." That's all I've asked
10	people to do. I've never asked for anything more than
11	respect and love for one another.
12	So it's been my privilege, Mr.
13	Chairman, to work with you.
14	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you.
15	DR. DUKES: For the time that you've
16	given, and for three times of this. I don't think
17	I well, I won't be around for any more.
18	MR. SCISSURA: I don't know that I will
19	either.
20	MS. MCGRAW: No, you don't know.
21	DR. DUKES: But you have done a
22	marvelous job of keeping us together, keeping us
23	steady.
24	And to the staff, you have been
25	wonderful. In giving us information, keeping us on

	Page 11
1	the right track, I want to say thank you, too, for
2	that.
3	To all of you who have come today,
4	thank you for being a part of wanting to hear and
5	raise your voice. This is what democracy is all
6	about. Each man, and woman, and boy, and girl should
7	have a right to participate in their surroundings,
8	where they live, where they go to school. It's all in
9	our hands. So thank you for coming out today.
10	Thank you, my fellow colleagues, who
11	have been with us out in Staten Island, and places
12	that I know Diane come from there. So she knows
13	that I know all about Staten Island.
14	So thank you again. And to those of
15	you come out this afternoon, welcome.
16	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. Thank you,
17	Vice Chair Dukes.
18	DR. DUKES: Thank you. Yes, yes.
19	MR. SCISSURA: Our secretary.
20	MR. NGAI: Good afternoon, everybody.
21	I just wanted to take a moment and thank everyone here
22	on the Commission: the chair, the executive director,
23	the vice chair.
24	It's been a a bit of a journey for
25	us. We traveled throughout all the boroughs. And the

	Page 12
1	important thing that what we were doing was
2	listening to the people. People had a lot to say.
3	And we listened, and listened carefully.
4	We developed these proposal amendments
5	that I think are logical, are fair. And I think
6	there's nothing better than to put it on the ballot in
7	November so that the people of the city can decide.
8	And for that, I just want to thank everyone, you know,
9	working diligently and very, very diligently, you
10	know.
11	So with that being said, I want to turn
12	it back over to the chair. And thank everybody.
13	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. Thank you,
L 4	Mr. Secretary.
15	Commissioner Bragg, this is our second
16	rodeo together, so I appreciate your service and your
17	friendship.
18	MR. BRAGG: Thank you, Chair.
19	I'm Kyle Bragg. Born not more than a
20	half mile from here, or maybe a mile, here in Crown
21	Heights. This is my second charter commission.
22	I've I had the privilege of serving with Carlo in
23	2018, I believe it was.
24	This has been an incredible journey.
25	First it's been incredible 'cause I got to work

with -- closely with people who, like myself, love the city, and have been active in help making sure that the city becomes better in their everyday life, and their -- and their work, and their professions, and just as citizens who want to make sure that the government works for all of us.

Then coming and going through all the boroughs -- which I don't normally get the opportunity to travel all our boroughs. I did as a kid when I used to barnstorm basketball throughout New York City.

But to go to Staten Island, to the Bronx, to Manhattan, to Queens, come back here to Brooklyn, and to hear from people who experience government and experience the city in different ways, based on the area in which you live, I think was very enlightening and very important.

It's been said over and again, that hearing from the citizens of this city about how government -- how they engage government, how government engage them, and how to make sure that government works and operates to the best of its abilities for everyone, makes this process so very important. And for me, so very enriching.

So we also, I think, during this -- the course of this -- of this Commission, we've heard a

	Page 14
1	lot about, you know, the timing of the Commission.
2	What's what's moving fast but shouldn't move so
3	fast. And it's not that we paid attention
4	you'll see that in our final report. Because we do
5	understand that some things need more time and
6	consideration.
7	But I I would say upfront that what
8	we will what will be put forth today in this final
9	Commission report is something that has been thought
10	through very carefully. It's been put forth because
11	we've heard from our brothers and sisters in the city
12	about what's important to them and what's needed in
13	this moment.
14	So thank you for your time and
15	consideration. Again, I want to thank the entire
16	staff for their work. I want to thank my fellow
17	commissioners for their dedication, their commitment,
18	and being you know, taking a lot of a lot of
19	grief sometimes as volunteers to do what's right by
20	this city. Thank you.
21	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, Commissioner.
22	Commissioner Lorraine Grillo.
23	MS. GRILLO: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I
24	appreciate it.
25	I'm not going to repeat everything

	Page 15
1	because you've heard from the top people that I can
2	think of. But I will say this. First of all,
3	I it's been an honor to serve with each and every
4	one of you. It's been a pleasure to get to know each
5	and every one of you.
6	And I will tell you to this audience
7	and to anyone who's listening these folks are truly
8	dedicated to the city of New York. There are a couple
9	of resolution proposals on the table that are
10	particularly important to me, but I'm not going to get
11	into them until we start to discuss them.
12	So I just want to say thanks and thanks
13	again to the staff. They're fabulous.
14	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, Commissioner
15	Grillo.
16	Commissioner Lynch.
17	MR. LYNCH: Good afternoon. Good
18	afternoon, everyone.
19	DR. DUKES: Good afternoon.
20	MR. LYNCH: This is my borough,
21	Brooklyn. So I would like to say I appreciate
22	the given the opportunity being appointed to be one
23	of the commissioners on this board. And it was a
24	wonderful experience, as traveling throughout the five
25	horoughs and just hearing what regular citizens have

Page 16 1 to say, and their opinions, and their concerns were 2 about in their communities and their boroughs. 3 A lot of issues that they come up, they 4 were pretty consistent. Some of them were new. 5 given the opportunity to hear from the citizens, it was a very -- it was a great experience just to hear 6 and be given the opportunity to hear firsthand. 7 Because as for myself, I would always say that no one 8 9 spoke to me. No one heard my voice, no one heard my 10 opinion. 11 So given the opportunity to sit here on 12 this Commission and to hear your opinions from 13 everyone, and to be able to present my vote on what we 14 have heard, what we have accumulated based on the 15 input that we've heard, I'm elated to be a part of 16 this procedure. 17 And once again, what I also like to 18 say, thank you to my fellow commissioners and being on 19 this Commission and working hard, diligently working 20 hard to travel through the five boroughs. Thank you 21 again and look forward to -- to serving on future 22 commissions. 23 MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, sir. 24 Commissioner McGraw. 25 MS. MCGRAW: Yes. Hello. Good

Page 17 1 afternoon, everyone. 2 MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: Good afternoon. 3 MS. MCGRAW: Yes, it -- it has been 4 such a pleasure and a joy. They said the joy's in the 5 journey, to be able to go around the five boroughs, you know. And I like to thank God, of course. You 6 7 know, he gave us two ears and one mouth. And on this journey and being one of 8 9 the commissioners, we were able to listen. Because 10 sometimes the greatest gift you can give to someone is 11 just to listen to them. And that's what we did. 12 we heard the voices, we heard the people. 13 I'm a citizen. I was born here in 14 Brooklyn. I have served this great city of New York 15 for over 20 years. And to be on this journey with the 16 chair, co-chair, and to be with my sisters and my 17 brothers, to serve our people, to hear our people, is

And diversity is our strength. You know, we are a city where there are over -- in every part of the world, anywhere in the world, you can find at least one or two of those nationalities in this country. This is the richest country. The diversity of the people. And to be here to hear the people.

such an honor and a pleasure.

Because freedom is about hearing --

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

	Page 18
1	listening to your voice, speaking your voice, and
2	being heard. So it has been an honor to be here as
3	one of the commissioners.
4	You know, real quick, remember when Ed
5	called and said, "Ms. McGraw."
6	I said, "Well, you can call me
7	Stephanie."
8	"I'm on my way. I got to swear you
9	in."
10	I'm like, "I got to be sworn in?"
11	It was such a big deal. All of my
12	staff, we were there right? at my office. I'm
13	being sworn in. But it is not only that, you know, we
14	understand that some of these positions, people are
15	sworn into duty.
16	But I've been ordained to do this work
17	for our people, for the people of New York. And it
18	has been a pleasure and honor honor pleasure and
19	an honor. And I'm so grateful to meet all these
20	amazing commissioners from different walks of life we
21	all have.
22	And that's what makes us so special,
23	our different walks of life. But we have all come
24	together on one accord, to make this city a better
25	city. Not just for me, but for all of us. So for

	Page 19
1	that, I'm very grateful and thankful to be of service
2	to New York City. Thank you.
3	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you very much.
4	By the way, I didn't know you were from
5	Brooklyn.
6	MS. MCGRAW: No. No, I was born in
7	Brooklyn.
8	MR. SCISSURA: I didn't know that.
9	Commissioner Rose.
10	MR. ROSE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
11	You know, it's really great to be here
12	at this library. This was the library I went to
13	growing up. Back in my day, Diane Savino, when you
14	had to research things directly from the book, was
15	Google. Right, Diane? Since I know you always turn
16	to me for guidance.
17	But look, it it has been an
18	incredible honor to be a part of this. Thank you all
19	for being here today. 'Cause this is all about
20	listening to the people.
21	I I would just say here that the
22	significance of what we're voting on today,
23	there there's, I think, a beautiful element of it
24	that's not final. Right? We're we're voting on
25	questions to be submitted to the people. And there

	Page 20
1	there's no, I think, more eloquent expression of
2	democracy than that.
3	It's impossible to make everyone happy
4	whenever you're trying to act in areas of
5	significance. And to those, irrespective of where you
6	fall on any of the issues we're considering, we would
7	urge you to continue to stay extraordinarily engaged
8	over the coming months to make sure that the people's
9	voices continue to be heard, which is what we
10	principally care the most about.
11	So thank you all today. And again, to
12	my fellow Commissioners, it's been an extraordinary
13	honor.
14	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you very much,
15	Commissioner Rose.
16	Commissioner Rowe-Adams, I have to say,
17	if we were giving an award out for who kept I could
18	speak for me me energized at every meeting, it
19	would be Jackie Rowe-Adams. So thank you
20	for I I have to, I mean this. Thank you for
21	adding a breath of fresh air at every meeting. Thank
22	you.
23	MS. ROWE-ADAMS: Oh, thank you. Wow.
24	That was good.
25	So just you know, I almost I

	Page 21
1	just just listening to my colleagues, I was getting
2	emotional because in this short time, we became a
3	family. And we became a family of the city and of the
4	community.
5	But I want to take the time and thank a
6	man that really care about the city, our very own
7	Mayor Eric Adams. Because he heard the voice of the
8	people.
9	And the people said, "We need some
10	hearings. We need to get a chance to let our voices
11	be heard. We need to get get give to give us
12	a chance that we could know what's going on in our
13	city."
14	And that's what he did. So thank you,
15	Mayor Eric Adams, for that.
16	I'm honored. I'm honored because I've
17	learned so much myself. You think you learned stuff.
18	But I've learned a lot being on this Commission. And
19	one of the things that I learned a lot of things
20	that I learned is people in their communities and in
21	their district's care.
22	If you think they don't care, you
23	some of you at each borough should have been to some
24	of these hearings. I was impressed because they care
25	and they care about how they live. They care about

Page 22 1 the sanitation, they care about education, they care about public safety. And I learned that. And I'm 2 3 grateful. 4 So I want to thank my colleagues, all 5 the other commissioners. I mean, we did a daunting job -- a daunting job. It -- some days, it was hard. 6 7 But we came up with solutions, and we came up with things that's going on the ballot that I really know 8 9 that the community and the city would appreciate and 10 love. 11 So what are the things, just when they 12 go on a ballot, we have to spread the word and push 13 it, and make sure we get the things that we need. So 14 thank you everyone. And the staff was just 15 magnificent. The leadership -- Carlo, you've been 16 great. 17 MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. 18 MR. ROWE-ADAMS: The co-chair, I mean, 19 fantastic. I love -- this is my mentor. And I want 20 to say, this has really been a reunion, like --21 especially with Diane Savino. 22 You know, she was a senator, but she 23 also was a party leader. She was one of the leaders 24 of DC 37. And that's how I met her. And she was the, 25 as the kids could say, she was the bomb-dot-com

	Page 23
1	at at DC 37.
2	So it's been a honor and a pleasure to
3	be here. And all and the bishop. Everyone,
4	everyone.
5	So thank you, community, thank you,
6	city, for caring about what goes on in your city. And
7	you know, I always said, that's the song that Marvin
8	Gaye sang: "What's Going On?" And now, you know.
9	Thank you.
10	MR. SCISSURA: Was I right in my intro?
11	All right. Thank you very much.
12	Commissioner Seabrooks.
13	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes, thank you. Good
14	afternoon to all of you that are here today.
15	First, I want to thank God for just
16	allowing me to serve, and thank our great mayor of the
17	city of New York to get a chance to hear the concerns
18	of New Yorkers. And I think that this committee has
19	done a wonderful job.
20	I want to thank the chairman. I want
21	to thank, guess what, the staff. Because if anything
22	from this and especially my sister Jackie kept me
23	informed through trying times.
24	What I've learned is that people in
25	this city don't want to be bitter. They just want to

	Page 24
1	be better. And we want to serve to give people that
2	opportunity where their voice is heard. And they're
3	short of equality.
4	So thank this committee. Thank you.
5	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, Commissioner.
6	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Thank you.
7	MR. SCISSURA: Commissioner Diaz, Jr.
8	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Boogie Down Bronx.
9	MR. DIAZ: That's right. Let me see
10	here.
11	Good good afternoon, everyone.
12	Greetings from the Boogie Down Bronx. It's good to be
13	here in BK.
14	I just want to say thank you, Mr.
15	Chairman, to to just reiterate all of the accolades
16	that have been given to Diane Savino and and all of
17	the staff, which is critical in getting us all of the
18	materials that we need to get us all of the the
19	testimonies that were given throughout over a dozen,
20	dozen and a half hearings throughout the city of New
21	York.
22	We were able to do so in a way where we
23	did a.m. meetings, and we did p.m. meetings. And we
24	went to every single borough. And everyone who wanted
25	to be heard was heard. And there were nights where

even when folks didn't sign up, Mr. Chairman, you or whoever took your seat in your absence, still made sure that whoever was either present or on the Zoom was heard.

No one -- no one who wanted to speak,
no one who wanted to be heard on their testimony,
whether it was germane to the city charter or not, was
denied that audience by this Commission. That's
number -- I wanted to make that abundantly clear

To the -- the audience here, present -physically present or out in -- in Zoom, or whoever's
going to hear this afterwards, any time that you have
to run an entity, whether it's your household, whether
it's a business, or wherever we work, you have to have
a set of rules or bylaws.

And this wonderful corporation, this wonderful entity called New York City, its bylaws, its rules, its Constitution is the New York City Charter.

And this process of us reviewing the charter is something that every single individual who did not get paid a nickel, who's up here took extremely serious with a heavy weight and how we review this charter. And so much was brought to us in so many different areas in terms of budgeting, public safety.

We've had wonderful debates and
conversations about the balance or the imbalance of
power, from the mayor's office to the city council.
And so how do we protect that balance? And how do we
do it in a way where it's not there's not an
imbalance from one over the other?

That's the way that you govern the city, and you do it in the right way. As a recovering politician, as a former Bronx Borough president, this -- this gave me the opportunity to revisit and to read, believe it or not -- and it's on my -- on my cell phone, on my Favorites -- the New York City Charter.

I hadn't done so since I was at Borough Hall, and I've been out of Borough Hall now two years. And so what we see with the City Charter is that, while it's magnificent, some of the things in there are things that were written in a different time, in a different era, with different people, different complexion of people in a different zeitgeist or the mood of the city.

And so this -- this exercise only gives us but one -- but -- but a few things that we are going to review and put on the ballot. The point is that New Yorkers moving forward, the -- the Charter

Page 27 1 Revision Commission is something that needs to 2 continue. 3 And, and not only the members of the commissions who are selected by this mayor, or the 4 5 next mayor, and beyond, should hold it seriously. But so should New Yorkers. We should all collectively 6 7 revisit and review, how is it that we can make the charter stronger. 8 9 Especially with the -- the way that 10 times have changing, the way that technology is changing, the way that the complexity of the city is 11 12 changing. Thank 13 And so for me, I feel honored. 14 you, Mr. Chairman, for -- and -- and I thank the mayor 15 for giving me the opportunity as a recovering 16 politician to come back and do something with so much 17 weight that allows me to give back, not only to my borough, but to the city of New York. Thank you. 18 19 MR. SCISSURA: Thank you very much. 20 I -- I should add, Ruben, you and I got 21 to know each other on my first commission, when you 22 were serving as borough president. So it's -- it's 23 really been an honor to have you on. 24 Okay. We are also joined by 25 Commissioner Reverend Daughtry. If you'd like to give

	Page 28
1	us a welcome, Commissioner.
2	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Welcome to
3	everybody.
4	MR. SCISSURA: So the purpose of
5	today's meeting is to discuss the ballot questions
6	that, if adopted today by the Commission, will be put
7	before the voters at the November 2024 general
8	election, as well as the proposed final report that
9	reflects the full body of the commissioners' work.
10	So the report, as I said earlier, is
11	very comprehensive. It not only talks about the
12	ballot proposals that we are going to vote on today,
13	but really gives a rundown of what happened in the
14	last two months. And I I urge you all to read it.
15	I also want to clarify again that,
16	after today, these proposals, if they are voted on
17	today, go to the public. The public will decide on
18	November 5th what changes happen. We don't decide it.
19	No one decides it. New York voters will decide it,
20	period. So any confusion, I hope that that is as
21	clear as can be.
22	This is true power to the people, true
23	voices to the New Yorkers. And you will all decide
24	what you want to do.
25	The proposed legislation hallet

language, and proposed final report were all sent to the Commissioners in advance of today's meeting for their careful review. The proposed legislation, ballot language, and proposed final report are now available to the members of the public on the Commission's website.

By law, this Commission reviewed the entire city charter. And I think, as Ruben said earlier, it is a lot that is in this charter.

The Commission set out to explore ways to improve the way city government interacts with New Yorkers, with the goal of improving quality of life, adding transparency to ensure fiscal responsibility, and ensuring that all voices are heard on critical public safety measures.

We have done this through an extensive and thoughtful process that included outreach to communities throughout the five boroughs of New York City.

Just to put it in perspective, we held
12 public hearings, including issue farms on
elections, public safety, and fiscal responsibility in
all five boroughs. Over 700 New Yorkers have attended
our hearings, and almost 250 have presented testimony
on a variety of topics, either in person or via Zoom.

Page 30 1 And one of the differences from my last 2 two commissions was the availability of Zoom. 3 that's been great. 4 So let me reiterate, 12 public 5 hearings, five boroughs, over 700 New Yorkers attending, almost 250 presenting testimony. On top of 6 7 that, we have received over 2,000 emails, 2,000-plus, submitting testimony for the Commission's 8 9 consideration. That is true advocacy on the part of 10 New Yorkers. 11 And let me thank the members of the 12 public and subject matter experts who came and 13 testified, who gave us their opinions, and who shared 14 some of their knowledge. 15 At our meeting on June 26th, the 16 Commission discussed several proposals related to 17 public safety, fiscal responsibility, government 18 contracting, and government modernization. 19 And we voted on a resolution directing 20 the staff of the Commission to prepare the final 21 report containing these proposals. The Commission also discussed recommendations for future charter 22 23 revision commissions. 24 So what does that mean? We heard a

We heard so many great ideas, so many critical

lot.

things that can help government in the future. But we can't do it all. We just cannot do it all.

So in our report you will see a whole section on issues and ideas that we believe require and deserve future -- future consideration by the next charter commissions. Those include election reform, procurement process improvements, and genuine support for community boards.

These proposals have been drafted, including the ballot questions and abstracts. And the report was prepared by the staff. Commissioners have reviewed the draft proposals and the proposed final report. And again, I say thank you to the staff. It is a truly comprehensive report.

Let me now invite our executive director Savino to read each of the five ballot proposals before we vote on the ballot proposals in the final report.

So the way we are going to do it is we will vote on each proposal individually, and then we will vote on the report and a final resolution. There will be a motion on each ballot question. And after the motion is seconded, discussions can be held. Now discussions are not required, but commissioners have a right to discuss.

	Page 32
1	Yeah, sorry. I think I was reading
2	your
3	MS. SAVINO: No, no.
4	MR. SCISSURA: So I'm good.
5	Okay. After after the discussion, I
6	as the chair will ask for a roll call vote on each
7	ballot question. I think the roll call is critical so
8	that we can really get everybody's vote on the record.
9	After each of the votes on the five ballot questions,
10	we will then have a roll call vote on the final
11	report. Sounds like a lot, and it is.
12	Finally, I will call for a roll call
13	vote on the Commission resolution that delegates the
14	staff to staff the responsibility for filing these
15	materials with the city clerk and taking other
16	technical actions to make sure that proposals appear
17	on the ballot on November 5, 2024. And importantly,
18	that voters are educated about the proposal.
19	Diane Savino.
20	MS. SAVINO: Thank you. Thank you,
21	Chair.
22	So we're going to move forward with
23	ballot proposal number 1. The title is Cleaning
24	Public Property. This proposal would amend the city
25	charter to expand and clarify the Department of

	Page 33
1	Sanitation's power to clean streets and other city
2	property and require disposal of waste in containers.
3	Voting Yes will expand and clarify the
4	Department of Sanitation's powers to clean streets and
5	other city property, and require disposal of waste in
6	containers. Voting no leaves laws unchanged.
7	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. I will now
8	entertain a motion to vote on the first ballot
9	proposal. Do I have a motion?
10	MR. DIAZ: Mr. Chairman?
11	MR. SCISSURA: Yes, sir.
12	MR. DIAZ: Can I ask a question?
13	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Move the motion.
14	MR. SCISSURA: Let me do the motion,
15	and then we're going to open it for this.
16	So Jackie Rowe-Adams moves.
17	Do we have a second?
18	DR. DUKES: Second.
19	MR. SCISSURA: Second from our vice
20	chair.
21	Now we will go to discussion.
22	Let me call on Jackie Rowe-Adams first.
23	MS. ROWE-ADAMS: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
24	I just want to make sure that we add a clarification
25	to the sanitation section about vendor enforcement and

	Page 34
1	cleaning of parks.
2	Parks, NYPD, and other agencies will
3	continue to perform their critical responsibilities
4	here. Sanitation will help enforce vending in the
5	parks. But Parks will continue to have responsibility
6	over vending in parks and the cleaning of parks.
7	Nothing about this change is intended to impact Parks'
8	staffing levels.
9	And that is so important to me 'cause I
10	am a Park former "parky."
11	MR. SCISSURA: Oh, right.
12	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: So no. So we will
13	not it is not intended to impact park's staffing
14	levels. So I just want to make that clear.
15	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you for that
16	clarification.
17	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
18	MR. DIAZ: Commissioner Diaz.
19	MR. DIAZ: Just on that note, that's
20	I just want to make sure that we've had a lot of
21	discussions over this, but the people sitting here or
22	the people listening now may not.
23	I just I just think that it merits
24	just saying why this is this why do we take this
25	up? What what is the issue that we are trying to

Page 35 1 resolve? And that's it. Just -- I just think it 2 should be put out there. 3 'Cause Jackie Rowe-Adams says it's not 4 intended to do this or that with Parks. But, you 5 know, so -- so I just think people need a little bit of clarity why we want to do this. I -- and I'm not 6 7 saying that because I'm oppose it. I'm just saying -- 'cause we all want 8 9 cleaner streets and we want -- we all want -- but just 10 what's the issue? What, what is resolving it, and why 11 do we need to have this clarification for sanitation 12 in the city charter? 13 MS. SAVINO: Thank you Commissioner 14 Diaz. 15 For those of you who have been able to 16 take a look at the report, you'll see that, along with 17 the ballot question, there's also an abstract which 18 gives a history of the Department of Sanitation and 19 its responsible -- and how it's responsible for the 20 cleanliness of New York streets and disposable waste. 21 The current city charter though, grants 22 DSNY -- the DSNY commissioner the power to adopt 23 regulations relating to the use of sidewalks for 24 disposable refuse and to issue violations for failure

to comply with some regulations punishable by fine,

Page 36 1 imprisonment, or civil penalty. 2 The charter currently does not 3 expressly set forth any requirement for containerization. Which, as you know, the city right 4 now is actively engaged in moving to containerization 5 of waste in an effort to, if nothing else, rid this 6 7 city of rats. 8 There are other issues that have come 9 up over -- there -- there are sections of city 10 property that we refer to as no man's lands. No 11 agency is responsible for cleaning them. 12 are -- sometimes they are highway medians. They are 13 these little triangles of property that no city 14 agency -- it -- can -- can clean. 15 And Sanitation is not actually allowed 16 It is the one agency that has the charter 17 mandate to clean. But in these properties, they're 18 not allowed to. So this charter cleanup, no pun 19 intended, will grant the mayor --20 MR. SCISSURA: That was good, by the 21 way. 22 MS. SAVINO: -- the ability to 23 designate the department citation to perform cleanliness services in those sections --24 25 MR. ROWE-ADAMS: But --

Page 37

1	MS. SAVINO: to do vending
2	enforcement in the parks. Right now, PEP officers,
3	as as Commissioner Rowe-Adams talked about, will
4	continue to do that. The Sanitation will have
5	concurrent authority to additionally do that, the same
6	way the NYPD does issue some street mandate.
7	MR. DIAZ: Thank you for that. And
8	the the reason why is 'cause if you understand
9	the history of the city, while we all complain now
10	about whether or not things are dirty or not, we have
11	a history of of uncleanliness dating back over 100,
12	150 years.
13	And the city tries, and and people
14	complain, and and elected officials throughout all
15	that time at you know, try to do constituent
16	services. And sometimes the public may say, "Well,
17	number 1, you're not doing anything about it. Or
18	number 2, why do we need this as an option?"
19	You know, "Isn't it, like, duh isn't
20	it, you know, sort of apparent that we can do this?"
21	Quite often the public may not know
22	that there are things that hinder an agency from doing
23	the public good. And so this this ballot question
24	once and for all puts clarity to that as to whose
25	jurisdiction is over what so that elected officials

	Page 38
1	and city agencies can do what the public deserves.
2	That's why.
3	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. Thank you.
4	Is there any additional discussion?
5	Okay. I will now call the question,
6	and you can answer yes or no. Correct? Simple.
7	Vice Chair Dukes?
8	DR. DUKES: Yes.
9	MR. SCISSURA: Secretary?
10	MR. NGAI: Yes.
11	MR. SCISSURA: I'm just going to call
12	your last names, by the way. Going to be a
13	little Bragg.
14	MR. BRAGG: Yes.
15	MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?
16	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.
17	MR. SCISSURA: Diaz.
18	MR. DIAZ: Si.
19	MR. SCISSURA: Grillo.
20	MS. GRILLO: Yes.
21	MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?
22	MR. LYNCH: Yes.
23	MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?
24	MS. MCGRAW: Yes.
25	MR. SCISSURA: Rose?

	Page 39
1	MR. ROSE: Yes. Yes.
2	MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?
3	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
4	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?
5	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.
6	And I vote Yes.
7	The question passes unanimously. Thank
8	you.
9	And it is a count of twelve in favor,
10	zero opposed, zero abstention. The proposal to put
11	forth a ballot proposal relating to cleaning public
12	property has passed.
13	We will now vote on ballot proposal
14	number 2. And first hear the ballot and the proposal
15	read by our executive director.
16	MS. SAVINO: Thank you Commissioner.
17	So ballot proposal number 2, title,
18	Additional Estimates of the Cost of Proposed Laws and
19	Updates to Budget Deadlines. This proposal would
20	amend the city charter to require fiscal analysis from
21	the council before hearings and votes on laws. It
22	would authorize fiscal analysis from the mayor and
23	update budget deadlines.
24	Voting yes for amending the city
25	charter to require additional fiscal analysis prior to

	Page 40
1	hearings, and vote on local laws, and update budget
2	deadlines. Voting no leaves these laws unchanged.
3	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you.
4	I will now entertain a motion to vote
5	on the second ballot proposal. Do I have a motion?
6	Commissioner Grillo? Thank you.
7	May I have a second?
8	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes, second.
9	MR. SCISSURA: Commissioner Adams.
10	Do we have any discussion?
11	And I just want to clarify, today is
12	a it is not a public hearing. Our last public
13	hearing was on Monday. Today is a meeting of the
14	commissioners that is done publicly. We cannot do
15	anything not publicly.
16	MS. MCGRAW: I have a discussion.
17	MR. SCISSURA: Yes, Commissioner
18	McGraw.
19	MS. MCGRAW: Yeah. One of the concerns
20	that I'd like to see, the amazing work that we have
21	done here and and gave up our time to put all of this
22	on the ballot. How do we educate the public about
23	what we're putting on there, and where do they go?
24	Because a lot of times, I'll put the
25	rank rank choice voting for right? That was

	Page 41
1	something that was that was proposed by a charter
2	commission. Correct? Yeah?
3	MR. SCISSURA: Many years yeah,
4	several years ago.
5	MS. MCGRAW: Yeah? Okay. Many years
6	ago. Right? So this is great.
7	And all the work that we have done, all
8	of us, our commitment, our time to put this
9	information on, how do we now really go hard and
10	inform the public?
11	Because for many years, and I'm just
12	going to be transparent, I never even turned over to
13	ballot. The the you know, when you go to vote.
L 4	Right? So that, that's something I just want to bring
15	up for discussion.
16	MR. SCISSURA: I appreciate it, and
17	it's something worth discussing further in the future.
18	And I think one of the one of the tasks that we
19	will vote on is to give direction to educate the
20	public on what is going on.
21	MS. MCGRAW: Yeah, perfect.
22	MR. SCISSURA: Is there any other
23	discussion on the second ballot question motion?
24	Okay. I will call the question.
25	Dukes?

	Page 42
1	DR. DUKES: Yes.
2	MR. SCISSURA: Ngia?
3	MR. NGAI: Yes.
4	MR. SCISSURA: Bragg?
5	MR. BRAGG: Yes.
6	MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?
7	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.
8	MR. SCISSURA: Diaz?
9	MR. DIAZ: Si.
10	MR. SCISSURA: Grillo?
11	MS. GRILLO: Yes.
12	MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?
13	MR. LYNCH: Yes.
14	MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?
15	MS. MCGRAW: Yes.
16	MR. SCISSURA: Rose?
17	MR. ROSE: Yes.
18	MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?
19	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
20	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?
21	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.
22	MR. SCISSURA: And I vote yes.
23	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.
24	MR. SCISSURA: Twelve in favor, zero
25	opposed, zero abstentions to put forth a ballot

	Page 43
1	proposal relating to additional estimates of the cost
2	of proposed laws and updates to budget deadlines has
3	passed.
4	I would say this. I urge anyone who
5	has questions on this to read the report section on
6	this. It is a very technical item that is not as
7	profound as it sounds. And that's why I say, read the
8	wording, and you will see exactly what it says.
9	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: I
10	did after you read it
11	DR. DUKES: Mr. Chairman, I would like
12	to say that we did have experts
13	MR. SCISSURA: Oh, absolutely.
14	DR. DUKES: to come in from city
15	agencies. And the controller of the City of New York
16	came in. And they we listened and we heard that
17	report. It is complex.
18	MR. SCISSURA: Correct.
19	DR. DUKES: As Ms. McGraw said. But
20	you have to read this. And this is what we spent our
21	sun, not at the beach.
22	MR. SCISSURA: Exactly. And we
23	list and we and we list all of the folks who
24	came in to testify.
25	DR. DUKES: Right.

	Page 44
1	MR. SCISSURA: We will now vote on
2	ballot proposal number 3, and hear the ballot and the
3	proposal read by our executive director.
4	MS. SAVINO: Thank you, Commissioner.
5	Ballot proposal number 3, the title is
6	More Input on Public Safety Legislation. This
7	proposal would require additional procedure this
8	proposal would require additional public notice and
9	time before the city council votes on laws respecting
10	the public safety operations of the police,
11	correction, and fire departments.
12	Voting yes will require additional
13	notice and time for the council votes on laws
14	respecting public safety operations of the police,
15	correction, or fire department. Voting no leaves laws
16	unchanged.
17	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you.
18	So let me just speak for a minute about
19	this. Since the proposed final report and the ballot
20	proposals were released on Tuesday, we've heard many
21	comments from the public and others regarding this
22	specific proposal.
23	Taking into consideration the responses
24	we have received, I have directed the staff to draft
25	an amended proposal that would limit the requirements

	Page 45
1	placed on the city council by retaining the mayor's
2	and commissioner's ability to hold public hearings on
3	critical public safety legislation, as is permitted
4	currently by state law.
5	The revised charter language amendment
6	and ballot question or abstract were shared with the
7	commissioners at the beginning of this meeting. I
8	would like and by the way, it is on it's on the
9	website now, and you could read the updated proposal.
10	I would like to make a motion to
11	substitute the new charter language and abstract, and
12	to have them considered for a vote in place of those
13	contained in the proposed final report.
14	Is there a second to my motion?
15	DR. DUKES: Second.
16	MR. SCISSURA: Is there any discussion
17	on the motion?
18	Commissioner Diaz?
19	MR. DIAZ: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, are you
20	saying that the the your amendment version comes
21	as a result a result of you listening to city
22	council members coming before this commission?
23	MR. SCISSURA: We listened to a lot of
24	people, including members of the city council.
25	MR. DIAZ: And you took that into

	Page 46
1	MR. SCISSURA: Including including
2	other folks that we spoke to and
3	MR. DIAZ: And and the amendment
4	I'm sorry sir. But the amendment specifically speaks
5	to some of the concerns of the community and the city
6	council?
7	MR. SCISSURA: I believe it does.
8	MR. DIAZ: In the favor of those
9	concerns?
10	MR. SCISSURA: I think we took it to
11	their concerns, and we made some changes.
12	MR. DIAZ: Okay. Thank you. Thank
13	you.
14	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: can say
15	what those changes are
16	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 2: You can read
17	them.
18	MR. SCISSURA: So they they are in
19	the report.
20	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: you
21	can't don't know what
22	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 5: Well, we don't
23	know we don't know any
24	MR. SCISSURA: Okay. So let me
25	reiterate, these changes are in the report that is

	Page 47
1	public. It is on the website.
2	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: before two
3	days ago. Can you just tell us what
4	MR. SCISSURA: Yes.
5	MS. SAVINO: Who is this?
6	MR. SCISSURA: Do we have it here?
7	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 6: But you're not
8	voting on what she just read. Right? Is that what
9	you're saying?
10	MS. SAVINO: No, what what I read
11	was the ballot question. That will not change.
12	MR. DIAZ: It's not updated. That's
13	not updated.
14	MS. SAVINO: Right. We'll the
15	the ballot question. Right. What I read will not
16	change. What will change is, if you had looked at the
17	final report, the final proposed report that was
18	online, that proposal has changed
19	MR. DIAZ: Thank you. That
20	MS. SAVINO: to reflect.
21	Can we just finish the let me just
22	finish the point
23	That proposal has changed to reflect
24	the information that we received, and we've made some
25	changes. So, can I

	Page 48
1	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Are you sure
2	the
3	MS. SAVINO: Excuse me.
4	MR. SCISSURA: And we are going to read
5	it now.
6	MS. SAVINO: We're we're not taking
7	questions from the audience. But we're going to read
8	it out to you.
9	DR. DUKES: Who is that? Who is it?
10	MS. SAVINO: This amendment will
11	establish additional procedural requirements before
12	the council votes on proposed local laws respecting
13	the public safety operations of three city agencies,
14	the police department, the department of correction,
15	or fire department.
16	Prior to a vote by the full council or
17	a covered on a covered public safety proposal, the
18	council would be required to give an additional notice
19	to the public, the mayor, and the commissioner of each
20	effected agency at least 30 days in advance of such
21	vote.
22	The mayor and affected agencies could
23	use the period between such notice and such vote to
24	hold one or more additional public hearings on the
25	proposal in order to solicit additional public input

	Page 49
1	The mayor could waive the additional procedures
2	imposed by this amendment.
3	That is a marked difference from the
4	earlier proposal, which had up to almost 90 days. It
5	first would've triggered a 45-day notice for the
6	intent of the introduction of the bill. And then
7	another 45 day notice. We have struck that first
8	notice.
9	Nothing changes, whatever the council
10	does now, the introduction of bills stays the same.
11	It would only be for the notice of the vote would
12	trigger a 30-day notice to the mayor
13	DR. DUKES: That's right.
14	MS. SAVINO: and and the
15	agencies, and allow for a public hearing. So that is
16	a substantial change from what you had seen earlier on
17	the proposed on the on the proposed direct
18	report.
19	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, Executive
20	Director Savino.
21	Max Rose, you had a question?
22	MR. ROSE: Yeah. I think it's just
23	important to clarify something. So I'll just ask the
24	question. Is there anything in this that restricts
25	the ability of the city council to enact public

	Page 50
1	safety-related legislation? Or does it just
2	MR. SCISSURA: Absolutely not.
3	MR. ROSE: It it just pauses it
4	briefly, or
5	MR. SCISSURA: No, it all it does is
6	say when the council is going to propose this
7	legislation, it adds a 30-day period where there can
8	be hearings.
9	MR. ROSE: So it delays for all
10	intents and purposes, it delays legislation by 30 days
11	to further inform the
12	MR. SCISSURA: Well, I I would
13	respectfully disagree with the word delay. I would
14	say it adds a 30-day window for a public hearing to
15	happen.
16	MR. ROSE: Right. And but it
17	doesn't restrict the underlying legislation?
18	MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: No. No.
19	MR. SCISSURA: No, nothing.
20	So all we are doing is saying there
21	should be a notice with 30 days
22	MS. MCGRAW: For hearings.
23	MR. SCISSURA: to potentially have a
24	hearing.
25	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 5: From the

Page 51 1 agency, or from the city council? 2 MS. SAVINO: Again, this is not a --3 REVEREND DAUGHTRY: No questions --4 MR. SCISSURA: It's -- it's all in the 5 report that is publicly. Yes. 6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 5: I can't read. 7 MR. BRAGG: In regards to this -- in regards to this proposal: Any proposal that helps to 8 9 give more discourse an opportunity to be heard from 10 citizens of this city on -- on proposed legislation is 11 good work. And it's important that the -- that the 12 citizens of the city have opportunity to express their 13 concerns about legislation. 14 MR. ROSE: Got you. 15 And if this -- if this MR. BRAGG: 16 proposal promotes more discourse, more conversation, 17 more opportunity for citizens to express their 18 opinions -- because, as I said in my opening 19 statement, government -- citizens of city, engage 20 government differently depending on which community 21 you live in and -- and the -- and the work of -- of 22 the government or the agencies that -- that you engage 23 with. 24 And so I think having the opportunity 25 to allow citizens to express their -- their concerns,

	Page 52
1	or their or their approval, or their or their
2	opinions about about proposed legislation is a good
3	thing. It can't be a bad thing to to create
4	greater discourse. Thank you.
5	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. Yeah.
6	Commissioner Daughtry.
7	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: except the
8	fact that an agency can also lobby for this lost in
9	the
10	MR. SCISSURA: Commissioner Daughtry.
11	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes. I'm I'm
12	thank you. I'm still unclear.
13	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: will get
14	what they want.
15	MS. SAVINO: Do we know who this person
16	is?
17	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Are we saying that
18	the public, plus the commission, the council have
19	reviewed the changes, and what we are presenting is
20	the final is the substance of their input or having
21	had opportunity to discuss it? And they agree with
22	what we are presenting as the final document to be
23	presented to the public?
24	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. So I'm going
25	to alarify it one more time just so that everyone

	Page 53
1	ensures that at least that the Commission
2	understands. And it is in the proposed draft report,
3	final report. And it is online.
4	So once there is a a desire by the
5	council to have legislation, there is a 30-day notice
6	that is given. During that 30-day notice, there could
7	be hearings, or the mayor and others may choose not
8	to. And then the council will vote on their proposal
9	as they always do.
10	There is no change to anything. It is
11	not limiting the council. It is not making any
12	changes, other than adding a 30-day opportunity for
13	people's voices to be heard.
14	Is there any other discussion?
15	DR. DUKES: No.
16	MR. SCISSURA: Okay. I will now call
17	the question.
18	Dukes?
19	DR. DUKES: Yes.
20	MR. SCISSURA: Ngai?
21	MR. NGAI: Yes.
22	MR. SCISSURA: Bragg?
23	MR. BRAGG: Yes.
24	MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?
25	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.

	Page 54
1	MR. SCISSURA: Diaz?
2	MR. DIAZ: Si.
3	MR. SCISSURA: Grillo?
4	MS. GRILLO: Yes.
5	MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?
6	MR. LYNCH: Yes.
7	MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?
8	MS. MCGRAW: Yes.
9	MR. SCISSURA: Rose?
10	MR. ROSE: Yes.
11	MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?
12	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
13	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?
14	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.
15	MR. SCISSURA: And I vote yes.
16	By a count of twelve in favor, zero
17	opposed, and zero abstentions, the proposal to put
18	forth a ballot proposal relating to more input on
19	public safety legislation has passed.
20	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.
21	MR. SCISSURA: We will now vote on
22	ballot proposal number 4, and hear the ballot and
23	proposal read by our executive director.
24	MS. SAVINO: Thank you. Ballot
25	proposal number 4, titled Capital Planning. This

Page 55 1 proposal would amend the city charter to require more 2 detail in the annual assessment of city facilities, 3 mandate that facility needs inform capital planning, 4 and update capital planning deadlines. 5 Voting yes would require more detail when assessing maintenance needs of city facilities, 6 7 mandate that facility needs informed capital planning, and update capital planning deadlines. Voting no 8 9 leaves laws unchanged. 10 MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. So let me 11 just give a little clarification on this question 12 because there seems to have been some confusion. The 13 additional information collected here would be for all 14 city facilities, as we say in the capital planning 15 abstract on page 102 of the draft final report. 16 The City for the statement of needs 17 will collect "information related to maintenance needs 18 like the condition, function, and estimated useful 19 life of all City facilities to the extent 20 practicable." 21 So what does this do? It will make the 22 statement of needs a more comprehensive document 23 covering many more facilities than it currently does. 24 Why did we do it? Why is this So we chose to modify the statement of 25 important?

Page 56 1 needs to be more inclusive of all city facilities. 2 These changes give the public information about all 3 public facilities to show how funding decisions are 4 made. 5 By contrast, if the change had been made in the 10-year capital strategy, it would only 6 7 have been information on funded projects, and not on the entire city pipeline. And I think that is 8 9 important for the public. 10 So I will now entertain a motion to 11 vote on the fourth ballot proposal. Do I have a 12 motion? 13 MR. SEABROOKS: Motion. 14 MS. GRILLO: Second. 15 MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, Commissioner 16 Seabrooks. 17 May I have a second? 18 MS. GRILLO: Second. 19 MR. SCISSURA: Commissioner Grillo, 20 thank you. 21 MR. ROSE: -- have one last --22 MR. SCISSURA: Yeah, we're going to 23 have a discussion now. 24 MR. ROSE: Who -- who was in support of this, who brought this to -- that might have already 25

	Page 57
1	been mentioned, but
2	MR. SCISSURA: Well, there was one of
3	the controller's action items. Right?
4	MR. ROSE: Right. So this was this
5	was a priority of Brad Landers?
6	MR. SCISSURA: It was one of them.
7	MR. ROSE: Okay.
8	MR. SCISSURA: A piece of it. And then
9	it made sense.
10	MR. ROSE: Great.
11	MR. SCISSURA: Okay. I will now call
12	the question.
13	Dukes?
14	DR. DUKES: Yes.
15	MR. SCISSURA: Ngai?
16	MR. NGAI: Yes.
17	MR. SCISSURA: Bragg?
18	MR. BRAGG: Yes.
19	MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?
20	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.
21	MR. SCISSURA: Diaz?
22	MR. DIAZ: Si.
23	MR. SCISSURA: Grillo?
24	MS. GRILLO: Yes.
25	MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?

	Page 58
1	MR. LYNCH: Yes.
2	MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?
3	MS. MCGRAW: Yes.
4	MR. SCISSURA: Rose?
5	MR. ROSE: Yes.
6	MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?
7	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
8	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?
9	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.
10	MR. SCISSURA: And I vote yes.
11	By a count of twelve in favor, zero
12	opposed, zero abstentions, the proposal to put forth a
13	ballot proposal relating to capital planning has
14	passed.
15	We will now vote on ballot proposal
16	number 5, and hear the ballot and the proposal grant
17	by our executive director.
18	MS. SAVINO: Thank you. Ballot
19	proposal number 5, titled Minority and Women-Owned
20	Business Enterprise, Film Permits, and Archive Review
21	Boards. This proposal would amend the city charter to
22	establish the Chief Business Diversity Officer, the
23	CBDO; authorize the mayor to designate that the office
24	had issues film permits; and combine archive boards.
25	Voting yes would establish the CBDO to

	Page 59
1	support MWBEs, authorize the mayor to designate the
2	office that issues film permits, and combine and
3	combine two boards. Voting no will leave the laws
4	unchanged.
5	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. I will now
6	entertain a motion to vote on the fifth ballot
7	proposal. Do I have a motion?
8	MR. BRAGG: Motion.
9	MR. SCISSURA: Bragg.
10	Do I have a second?
11	MS. GRILLO: Second.
12	MR. SCISSURA: Is there any discussion
13	on this?
14	I will I will just say that I am
15	very excited, particularly about the Chief Diversity
16	Officer becoming a real part of the charter and to
17	really assist firms across the city.
18	Is there any other discussion on this?
19	Yes, Commissioner Bragg.
20	MR. BRAGG: I I would just say that
21	the might you know, make a motion to accept this
22	proposal, that this is a necessary first step. That
23	there must be more work done to create equity amongst
24	MWBEs in this city. And it gives someone the
25	authority to make sure that that happens.

	Page 60
1	But is we did not have enough time
2	to address that in this Commission, but I think this
3	is a very good preliminary step into moving in that
4	direction. Thank you.
5	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: But you tried
6	to get off the ballot? Is that why you let
7	MR. SCISSURA: I will now is there
8	any other discussion
9	MS. MCGRAW: Yeah, I just wanted to
10	say
11	MR. SCISSURA: I will now call the
12	question
13	Dukes?
L 4	DR. DUKES: Yes.
15	MR. SCISSURA: Oh, I'm sorry. Did you
16	have a question?
17	MS. MCGRAW: No, not a question.
18	Throughout this whole experience, you know, we heard a
19	lot of testimony about making sure that we have a fair
20	and just city and that there is diversity. So I'm
21	excited to hear that we are having these discussions
22	because there was a lot of testimony
23	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 5: and
24	where the hearings
25	MS. MCGRAW: a lot of testimony in

	Page 61
1	creating this for our city. So I'm excited.
2	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you. We have had,
3	I think two-plus hearings on MWBE, on a Chief
4	Diversity Officer, and on all of that. And we had
5	three.
6	Thank you, Ryan. By the way, I
7	mentioned that you were our intern on my first
8	charter.
9	We have heard testimony from MWBE
10	firms, from leadership on MWBE, from Michael Garner,
11	and from others. This is, as someone who in my
12	professional career works with MWBE firms every day,
13	as did Commissioner Grillo and others, this is a
14	significant step forward, as Kyle Bragg said, to
15	ensuring the fairness and the competition for firms
16	that are MWBE.
17	And I think it is all of our hope that
18	we will continue and that the City in the future will
19	create a true agency to coordinate it all. But this
20	is an important step forward.
21	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 5: and on the
22	polite [ph]
23	MR. SCISSURA: I will now call the
24	question.
25	Dukes?

	Page 62
1	DR. DUKES: Yes.
2	MR. SCISSURA: Ngai?
3	MR. NGAI: Yes.
4	MR. SCISSURA: Bragg?
5	MR. BRAGG: Yes.
6	MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?
7	REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.
8	MR. SCISSURA: Diaz?
9	MR. DIAZ: Si.
10	MR. SCISSURA: Grillo?
11	MS. GRILLO: Yes.
12	MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?
13	MR. LYNCH: Yes.
14	MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?
15	MS. MCGRAW: Yes.
16	MR. SCISSURA: Rose?
17	MR. ROSE: Yes.
18	MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?
19	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
20	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?
21	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.
22	MR. SCISSURA: And I vote yes with a
23	capital Y, capital E, and capital S.
24	By a count of twelve in favor, zero
25	opposed, zero abstentions, the proposal to put forth a

Page 63

ballot proposal relating to minority and women-owned
business enterprises, MWBEs; film permits; and archive
review boards has passed.

I'm now going to ask for -- and by the way, thank you, commissioners. 'cause these -- these are important questions that continue to move the city forward.

And, and I just want to stress again, for those of you that have not, please read the section on future ideas. Because there is so much more work to be done, and it is our hope that future commissions will look at all of this.

I'm now going to ask for a motion to accept and approve the final report as amended with the amendments that were presented at today's meeting, which contains the five proposals already voted on, summaries of the proposals, ballot questions, and abstracts, and the text amendments to the New York City Charter.

The report also includes an introduction with backgrounds on the Commission and its members, on the process, and as I said, as well as important recommendations for future charter revision commissions.

www.veritext.com

May I have a motion to approve the

		0.100 1.20
		Page 64
1	final report?	
2		MR. SEABROOKS: Motion.
3		MR. SCISSURA: Thank you, Seabrooks.
4		May I have a second?
5		MR. BRAGG: Second.
6		MR. SCISSURA: Bragg, thank you.
7		Is there any discussion on this?
8		I will now call the question.
9		Dukes?
10		DR. DUKES: Yes.
11		MR. SCISSURA: Ngai?
12		MR. NGAI: Yes.
13		MR. SCISSURA: Bragg?
14		MR. BRAGG: Yes.
15		MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?
16		REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.
17		MR. SCISSURA: Diaz?
18		MR. DIAZ: Si.
19		MR. SCISSURA: Grillo?
20		MS. GRILLO: Yes.
21		MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?
22		MR. LYNCH: Yes.
23		MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?
24		MS. MCGRAW: Yes.
25		MR. SCISSURA: Rose?
	I.	

	Page 65		
1	MR. ROSE: Yes.		
2	MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?		
3	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.		
4	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?		
5	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.		
6	MR. SCISSURA: And I vote yes, as well.		
7	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.		
8	MR. SCISSURA: By a count of twelve in		
9	favor, zero opposed, and zero abstentions, the final		
10	report has been approved.		
11	I will now seek a motion to approve a		
12	resolution that directs the staff to take the		
13	appropriate actions to deliver materials to the city		
14	clerk in order for the ballot questions to be placed		
15	before the voters and to take whatever action they		
16	deem necessary to educate the public about the ballot		
17	questions.		
18	Commissioner McGraw, in terms of your		
19	question, it is important that the public understand		
20	what these questions are. Commissioners were sent		
21	this resolution in advance and have had the chance to		
22	review it.		
23	Is there a motion to approve the		
24	resolution?		
25	DR. DUKES: Motion.		

		Page 66				
1		MR. SCISSURA: Commissioner Dukes.				
2		MS. MCGRAW: Second.				
3		MR. SCISSURA: Second, Commissioner				
4	McGraw.					
5		Is there any discussion on this?				
6		I will now call the question.				
7		Dukes?				
8		DR. DUKES: Yes.				
9		MR. SCISSURA: Ngai?				
10		MR. NGAI: Yes.				
11		MR. SCISSURA: Bragg?				
12		MR. BRAGG: Yes.				
13		MR. SCISSURA: Daughtry?				
14		REVEREND DAUGHTRY: Yes.				
15		MR. SCISSURA: Diaz?				
16		MR. DIAZ: Si.				
17		MR. SCISSURA: Grillo?				
18		MS. GRILLO: Yes.				
19		MR. SCISSURA: Lynch?				
20		MR. LYNCH: Yes.				
21		MR. SCISSURA: McGraw?				
22		MS. MCGRAW: Yes.				
23		MR. SCISSURA: Rose?				
24		MR. ROSE: Yes.				
25		MR. SCISSURA: Rowe-Adams?				

	Page 67
1	MR. ROWE-ADAMS: Yes.
2	MR. SCISSURA: Seabrooks?
3	MR. SEABROOKS: Yes.
4	MR. SCISSURA: And I vote yes.
5	By a count of twelve in favor, zero
6	opposed, and zero abstentions, the resolution has been
7	approved.
8	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.
9	MR. SCISSURA: Now before we wrap up, I
10	would like to make a motion to approve the minutes for
11	our meeting held on July 22, 2024, in Queens, which we
12	shared with all of you earlier this week.
13	May I have a and I made that motion.
14	Is there a second?
15	MS. GRILLO: Second.
16	MR. SCISSURA: Second. Who's second?
17	MS. GRILLO: Lorraine.
18	MR. SCISSURA: Lorraine Grillo.
19	I'm going to call a voice vote. All in
20	favor signify by saying aye.
21	MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: Aye.
22	MR. SCISSURA: Aye.
23	Any opposed, any abstentions?
24	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.
25	MR. SCISSURA: The motion passes twelve

	Page 68
1	to zero.
2	Not sure why anybody would boo minutes,
3	but why not?
4	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.
5	MR. SCISSURA: I would also like
6	to I would also like to ask the Commission for
7	unanimous consent to approve the meeting the
8	minutes of this meeting after they have been
9	distributed to you and that you have had an
10	opportunity to offer any correction or comments.
11	I will direct the staff to share the
12	minutes by email, and you will have the opportunity to
13	make any edits. After two weeks, we will incorporate
14	any revisions, and I will approve the minutes.
15	All in favor?
16	MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: Aye.
17	MR. SCISSURA: Any opposed, any
18	abstentions?
19	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Boo.
20	MR. SCISSURA: Thank you very much. I
21	want to, again, thank all of the commissioners and the
22	staff for their time and dedication.
23	I will reiterate it is up to the public
24	on November 5th to vote.
25	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 6: You didn't

	Page 69
1	tell us about any I don't know
2	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: We will vote
3	no down the ballot. Don't worry, baby. We got this.
4	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 6: Thank you.
5	MR. SCISSURA: Great. I look forward
6	to working with you, and share the work of the
7	Commission, and to educate the public about what we
8	have voted on and what will appear on the ballot.
9	I thank I thank the over 2,000 New
10	Yorkers who submitted testimony. I thank the over 700
11	New Yorkers who came to meetings meetings that have
12	been on websites, social media, public notices since
13	May. And I thank everyone again for their commitment.
14	I would like to ask for a motion to
15	adjourn today's meeting.
16	DR. DUKES: Motion.
17	MS. MCGRAW: to adjourn.
18	MR. SCISSURA: Second from Commissioner
19	McGraw.
20	All in favor?
21	MULTIPLE SPEAKERS: Aye.
22	MR. SCISSURA: Any abstentions, any
23	no's?
24	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 4: Yes.
25	MR. SCISSURA: Have a wonderful day.

	Page 70
1	The motion passes.
2	Have a wonderful rest of the summer.
3	(Whereupon, the meeting concluded at
4	3:20 p.m.)
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Page 71

CERTIFICATE	OF	DEPOSITION	OFFICER
-------------	----	------------	---------

I, THEA POPKO, the officer before whom the foregoing proceedings were taken, do hereby certify that any witness(es) in the foregoing proceedings, prior to testifying, were duly sworn; that the proceedings were recorded by me and thereafter reduced to typewriting by a qualified transcriptionist; that said digital audio recording of said proceedings are a true and accurate record to the best of my knowledge, skills, and ability; that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to the action in which this was taken; and, further, that I am not a relative or employee of any counsel or attorney employed by the parties hereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of this action.

Ele Ryl

18 THEA POPKO

Notary Public in and for the
State of New York

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

Page 72

I, LAURA K. MILLER, do hereby certify that this transcript was prepared from the digital audio recording of the foregoing proceeding, that said transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings to the best of my knowledge, skills, and ability; that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to the action in which this was taken; and, further, that I am not a relative or employee of any counsel or attorney employed by the parties hereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of this action.

13

12

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

Laun Will

LAURA K. MILLER

[1 - address] Page 1

	T	I	I
1	53:5,6,12	a	act 20:4
1 3:9,14 32:23	30630 71:17	a.m. 24:23	action 57:3
37:17	37 22:24 23:1	abilities 13:22	65:15 71:12,16
10 1:12 56:6	3:20 70:4	ability 36:22	72:8,12
100 37:11	4	45:2 49:25	actions 32:16
102 55:15	4 42:23 43:9	71:10 72:7	65:13
11 9:15	46:14,20 47:2	able 16:13 17:5	active 13:2
11238 1:13	48:1 52:7,13	17:9 24:22	actively 36:5
115th 9:24	54:20,22,25	35:15	actually 36:15
12 29:21 30:4	60:5 65:7 67:8	absence 25:2	adams 2:8
15 3:15 9:5	67:24 68:4,19	absolutely	20:16,19,23
150 37:12	69:2,24	43:13 50:2	21:7,15 22:18
2	45 49:5,7	abstention	24:6,8 33:13
	47 9:21	39:10	33:16,22,23
2 3:12,16 6:16	5	abstentions	34:12,17 35:3
37:18 39:14,17	_	42:25 54:17	36:25 37:3
46:16	5 32:17 46:22	58:12 62:25	39:2,3 40:8,9
2,000 30:7,7	50:25 51:6	65:9 67:6,23	42:18,19 54:11
69:9	58:16,19 60:23	68:18 69:22	54:12 58:6,7
20 17:15	61:21	abstract 35:17	62:18,19 65:2
2010 7:23	5th 28:18 68:24	45:6,11 55:15	65:3 66:25
2018 12:23	6	abstracts 31:10	67:1
2024 1:7 3:6,24	6 47:7 68:25	63:18	add 4:17 27:20
28:7 32:17	69:4	abundantly	33:24
67:11	6784142 1:18	25:9	adding 20:21
22 67:11	7	accept 59:21	29:13 53:12
25 1:7	-	63:14	additional 38:4
250 29:24 30:6	700 29:23 30:5	accolades	39:18,25 43:1
26458 72:14	69:10	24:15	44:7,8,12
26th 30:15	9	accord 18:24	48:11,18,24,25
2:04 1:8	90 49:4	accumulated	49:1 55:13
3	92 9:3	16:14	additionally
3 7:19 44:2,5		accurate 71:9	37:5
30 48:20 49:12		72:5	address 60:2
50:7,10,14,21		12.5	

[adds - ballot] Page 2

adds 50:7,14	alabama 9:16	applaud 6:5	attended 29:23
adjourn 69:15	alex 7:17	applause 7:1	attendees 2:2
69:17	alfaro 8:6	appointed	attending 30:6
adopt 35:22	allow 49:15	15:22	attention 14:3
adopted 28:6	51:25	appreciate	attorney 71:14
advance 29:2	allowed 36:15	12:16 14:24	72:10
48:20 65:21	36:18	15:21 22:9	audience 15:6
advancement	allowing 23:16	41:16	25:8,10 48:7
9:23	allows 27:17	appropriate	audio 71:8 72:3
advisors 7:15	amazing 5:2,3	65:13	authority 37:5
advocacy 30:9	6:6 18:20	approval 52:1	59:25
affected 48:22	40:20	approve 63:14	authorize
afternoon 3:2,4	amend 32:24	63:25 65:11,23	39:22 58:23
3:5,21,22 9:19	39:20 55:1	67:10 68:7,14	59:1
11:15,20 15:17	58:21	approved	availability
15:18,19 17:1	amended 44:25	65:10 67:7	30:2
17:2 23:14	63:14	archive 58:20	available 29:5
24:11	amending	58:24 63:2	award 20:17
afternoons	39:24	area 13:15	ayala 8:1
9:12	amendment	areas 20:4	aye 67:20,21,22
age 9:3,15	45:5,20 46:3,4	25:24	68:16 69:21
agencies 34:2	48:10 49:2	army 1:12	b
38:1 43:15	amendments	arrived 9:14	baby 69:3
48:13,22 49:15	12:4 63:15,18	ashbery 7:16	back 6:3 7:12
51:22	america 9:9	ashley 8:7	10:5 12:12
agency 36:11	10:4	asked 8:12 10:9	13:12 19:13
36:14,16 37:22	analysis 39:20	10:10	27:16,17 37:11
48:20 51:1	39:22,25	assembled 6:25	backgrounds
52:8 61:19	annual 55:2	assessing 55:6	63:21
ago 6:9 41:4,6	answer 38:6	assessment	bad 52:3
47:3	anybody 68:2	55:2	balance 26:2,4
agree 52:21	apparent 37:20	assist 59:17	ballot 4:16 12:6
ain't 8:20	appear 32:16	association	22:8,12 26:24
air 20:21	69:8	9:22	28:5,12,25
			29:4 31:10,16
			2731.10,10

[ballot - cause] Page 3

31:17,22 32:7	beyond 27:5	boy 8:21 11:6	busy 9:11
32:9,17,23	big 5:25 6:1,23	brad 57:5	bylaws 25:15
33:8 35:17	18:11	bragg 2:10	25:17
37:23 39:11,13	bill 49:6	12:15,18,19	С
39:14,17 40:5	bills 49:10	38:13,14 42:4	c 2:1 3:1
40:22 41:13,23	bishop 23:3	42:5 51:7,15	call 9:15 18:6
42:25 44:2,2,5	bit 11:24 35:5	53:22,23 57:17	32:6,7,10,12,12
44:19 45:6	bitter 23:25	57:18 59:8,9	33:22 38:5,11
47:11,15 54:18	bk 24:13	59:19,20 61:14	41:24 53:16
54:22,22,24	bleed 10:3	62:4,5 64:5,6	57:11 60:11
56:11 58:13,15	board 15:23	64:13,14 66:11	61:23 64:8
58:16,18 59:6	boards 31:8	66:12	66:6 67:19
60:6 63:1,17	58:21,24 59:3	breath 20:21	called 18:5
65:14,16 69:3	63:3	briefly 50:4	25:17
69:8	body 28:9	bring 41:14	capacities 9:2
barnstorm	bomb 22:25	bringing 10:1	capital 54:25
13:10	bonnie 7:15	bristow 7:14	55:3,4,7,8,14
based 13:15	boo 42:23	bronx 13:12	56:6 58:13
16:14	54:20 65:7	24:8,12 26:9	62:23,23,23
basketball	67:8,24 68:2,4	brooklyn 1:11	care 20:10 21:6
13:10	68:19	1:13 4:8 13:13	21:21,22,24,25
beach 43:21	boogie 24:8,12	15:21 17:14	21:25 22:1,1
beautiful 19:23	book 19:14	19:5,7	career 61:12
becoming	born 9:13,16	brothers 14:11	careful 29:3
59:16	12:19 17:13	17:17	carefully 12:3
beginning 45:7	19:6	brought 5:5,6	14:10
believe 10:2	borough 15:20	25:23 56:25	caring 23:6
12:23 26:11	21:23 24:24	budget 39:19	carlo 1:6 2:3
31:4 46:7	26:9,14,15	39:23 40:1	3:7,25 12:22
benjamin 8:6	27:18,22	43:2	22:15
best 10:9 13:21	boroughs 11:25	budgeting	cast 5:6
71:9 72:6	13:8,9 15:25	25:24	cataldo 7:7
better 8:21	16:2,20 17:5	building 4:10	cause 12:25
12:6 13:3	29:18,23 30:5	business 25:14	19:19 34:9
18:24 24:1		58:20,22 63:2	35:3,8 37:8
			33.3,0 37.0

[cause - come] Page 4

	1	1	
63:5	52:19 53:12	9:12 12:7 13:2	49:23 52:25
cbdo 58:23,25	56:2	13:3,10,14,18	clarity 35:6
cbs 9:4 10:1	changing 27:10	14:11,20 15:8	37:24
celebrated 9:23	27:11,12	17:14,20 18:24	clarke 7:16
cell 26:12	charter 3:7,25	18:25 19:2	clean 33:1,4
central 1:11	4:3 7:22 8:25	21:3,6,13 22:9	36:14,16,17
ceo 4:8	12:21 25:7,18	23:6,6,17,25	cleaner 35:9
certificate 71:1	25:20,23 26:13	24:20 25:7,17	cleaning 32:23
72:1	26:16,25 27:8	25:18 26:3,8	34:1,6 36:11
certify 71:3	29:8,9 30:22	26:12,16,21	39:11
72:2	31:6 32:25	27:11,18 29:8	cleanliness
chair 1:6 2:3,4	35:12,21 36:2	29:11,19 32:15	35:20 36:24
3:8 4:2 8:13,22	36:16,18 39:20	32:24 33:1,5	cleanup 36:18
11:17,22,23	39:25 41:1	35:12,21 36:4	clear 25:9
12:12,18 14:23	45:5,11 55:1	36:7,9,13 37:9	28:21 34:14
17:16,16 19:10	58:21 59:16	37:13 38:1	clerk 32:15
22:18 32:6,21	61:8 63:19,23	39:20,24 43:14	65:14
33:20,23 38:7	chief 7:6 58:22	43:15 44:9	closely 8:14
chairman 8:24	59:15 61:3	45:1,21,24	13:1
10:13 23:20	chisholm 9:8	46:5 48:13	colleagues
24:15 25:1	chiu 7:14	49:25 51:1,10	11:10 21:1
27:14 33:10	chloe 8:1	51:12,19 55:1	22:4
43:11 45:19	choice 40:25	55:2,6,14,16,19	collect 55:17
chance 4:10	choose 53:7	56:1,8 58:21	collected 55:13
21:10,12 23:17	chose 55:25	59:17,24 60:20	collectively
65:21	christopher	61:1,18 63:6	27:6
change 34:7	2:12	63:19 65:13	color 9:21
47:11,16,16	citation 36:23	civic 5:11	colored 9:23
49:16 53:10	citizen 17:13	civil 36:1	com 22:25
56:5	citizens 13:5,18	clarification	combine 58:24
changed 47:18	15:25 16:5	33:24 34:16	59:2,3
47:23	51:10,12,17,19	35:11 55:11	come 5:12 6:3
changes 28:18	51:25	clarify 4:22	10:6 11:3,12
46:11,15,25	city 3:7,25 5:16	28:15 32:25	11:15 13:12
47:25 49:9	5:16 8:4,15	33:3 40:11	16:3 18:23

	I	I	
27:16 36:8	40:6,9,17 44:4	23:5 31:8 46:5	consistent 16:4
43:14	45:18 48:19	51:20	constituent
comes 45:20	52:6,10 56:15	competition	37:15
coming 6:12	56:19 59:19	61:15	constitution
7:24 11:9 13:7	61:13 65:18	complain 37:9	25:18
20:8 45:22	66:1,3 69:18	37:14	contained
comments	commissioner's	complex 43:17	45:13
44:21 68:10	45:2	complexion	containerizati
commission 3:7	commissioners	26:20	36:4,5
3:8,25 4:2,3,19	4:6,14,25 6:5	complexity	containers 33:2
5:8,20 7:23	8:9 14:17	27:11	33:6
8:25 11:22	15:23 16:18	comply 35:25	containing
12:21 13:25	17:9 18:3,20	comprehensive	30:21
14:1,9 16:12	20:12 22:5	28:11 31:14	contains 63:16
16:19 21:18	28:9 29:2	55:22	continue 20:7,9
25:8 27:1,21	31:11,24 40:14	concerns 16:1	27:2 34:3,5
28:6 29:7,10	45:7 63:5	23:17 40:19	37:4 61:18
30:16,20,21	65:20 68:21	46:5,9,11	63:6
32:13 41:2	commissions	51:13,25	contracting
45:22 52:18	16:22 27:4	concluded 70:3	30:18
53:1 60:2	30:2,23 31:6	concurrent	contrast 56:5
63:21 68:6	63:12,24	37:5	controller
69:7	commitment	condition 55:18	43:15
commission's	14:17 41:8	confusion 4:23	controller's
29:6 30:8	69:13	28:20 55:12	57:3
commissioner	committee 9:6	consent 68:7	convention
2:8,9,10,11,12	23:18 24:4	consider 4:21	9:24
2:13,14,15,16	common 5:15	consideration	conversation
12:15 14:21,22	communicati	14:6,15 30:9	51:16
15:14,16 16:24	7:11	31:5 44:23	conversations
19:9 20:15,16	communities	considered	26:2
23:12 24:5,7	16:2 21:20	45:12	coordinate
27:25 28:1	29:18	considering	61:19
34:18 35:13,22	community	20:6	corporation
37:3 39:16	5:11 21:4 22:9		25:16

1. 4 1 71 0	1	1 6 21 12	14 (0.12
digital 71:8	discussions	draft 31:12	edits 68:13
72:3	31:23,24 34:21	44:24 53:2	educate 40:22
diligently 12:9	60:21	55:15	41:19 65:16
12:9 16:19	disposable	drafted 31:9	69:7
direct 49:17	35:20,24	dry 6:3	educated 32:18
68:11	disposal 33:2,5	dsny 35:22,22	education 22:1
directed 44:24	distributed	duh 37:19	edward 2:7
directing 30:19	68:9	dukes 2:4 8:16	effected 48:20
direction 41:19	district's 21:21	8:23 10:15,21	effort 36:6
60:4	diverse 5:8,22	11:17,18 15:19	either 10:19
directly 19:14	6:11	33:18 38:7,8	25:3 29:25
director 2:5 7:2	diversity 5:8,10	41:25 42:1	elated 16:15
7:11 11:22	5:10,12,12,14	43:11,14,19,25	elected 37:14
31:16 39:15	5:24 8:25	45:15 48:9	37:25
44:3 49:20	17:19,23 58:22	49:13 53:15,18	election 28:8
54:23 58:17	59:15 60:20	53:19 57:13,14	31:6
directs 65:12	61:4	60:13,14 61:25	elections 29:22
dirty 37:10	document	62:1 64:9,10	element 19:23
disagree 50:13	52:22 55:22	65:25 66:1,7,8	eloquent 20:1
discourse 51:9	doing 12:1	69:16	email 68:12
51:16 52:4	37:17,22 50:20	duly 71:5	emails 30:7
discuss 15:11	dot 22:25	duty 18:15	emotional 21:2
28:5 31:25	dozen 24:19,20	dwyer 7:11	employed
52:21	dr 8:16,22,23	e	71:11,14 72:8
discussed 30:16	10:15,21 11:18	e 2:1,1 3:1,1	72:11
30:22	15:19 33:18	62:23	employee 71:13
discussing	38:8 42:1	earlier 28:10	72:10
41:17	43:11,14,19,25	29:9 49:4,16	enact 49:25
discussion 32:5	45:15 48:9	67:12	energized
33:21 38:4	49:13 53:15,19	ears 17:7	20:18
40:10,16 41:15	57:14 60:14	ears 17:7 easy 6:19	enforce 34:4
41:23 45:16	62:1 64:10	easy 6:19 echo 8:24	enforcement
53:14 56:23	65:25 66:8		33:25 37:2
59:12,18 60:8	69:16	ed 7:4 18:4	engage 13:19
64:7 66:5		eden 8:1	13:20 51:19,22

engaged 20:7	estimated	explore 29:10	67:5,20 68:15
36:5	55:18	express 51:12	69:20
enjoying 9:18	estimates 39:18	51:17,25	favorites 26:12
enlightening	43:1	expression 20:1	feel 27:13
13:16	evenings 9:11	expressly 36:3	feelings 4:16
enriching	everybody 3:21	extensive 29:16	fellow 6:5
13:23	11:20 12:12	extent 55:19	11:10 14:16
ensure 29:13	28:3	extraordinarily	16:18 20:12
ensures 53:1	everybody's	20:7	fifth 59:6
ensuring 29:14	32:8	extraordinary	fighting 9:22
61:15	everyday 13:3	20:12	filing 32:14
enterprise	exactly 43:8,22	extremely	film 58:20,24
58:20	except 52:7	25:22	59:2 63:2
enterprises	excited 9:8	f	final 3:6,23
63:2	59:15 60:21	fabulous 15:13	4:20,24,24
entertain 33:8	61:1	facilities 55:2,6	14:4,8 19:24
40:4 56:10	exciting 4:3	55:14,19,23	28:8 29:1,4
59:6	excuse 3:24	56:1,3	30:20 31:12,18
entire 14:15	48:3	facility 55:3,7	31:21 32:10
29:8 56:8	executive 2:5	fact 52:8	44:19 45:13
entity 25:13,17	7:2 11:22	failure 35:24	47:17,17 52:20
epitomizes 8:15	31:15 39:15	fair 5:17 12:5	52:22 53:3
equality 24:3	44:3 49:19	60:19	55:15 63:14
equals 5:24,25	54:23 58:17	fairness 61:15	64:1 65:9
5:25	exercise 26:22	faith 10:2	finally 8:14
equitable 5:17	expand 32:25	fall 20:6	32:12
equity 59:23	33:3	family 21:3,3	financially
era 26:19	experience	fantastic 22:19	71:15 72:11
eric 21:7,15	13:13,14 15:24	far 10:6,7	find 17:21
es 71:4	16:6 60:18	farms 29:21	fine 35:25
especially	experiences	fast 14:2,3	finish 47:21,22
22:21 23:22	5:10	favor 39:9	fire 44:11,15
27:9	experts 30:12	42:24 46:8	48:15
establish 48:11	43:12	54:16 58:11	firms 59:17
58:22,25		62:24 65:9	61:10,12,15

[first - grillo] Page 9

8	0 1 1707		24.12.22.4
first 3:6 4:22	freedom 17:25	given 6:8 9:21	24:12 32:4
7:22 12:25	fresh 20:21	10:16 15:22	36:20 37:23
15:2 23:15	friend 4:7	16:5,7,11	51:11 52:2
27:21 33:8,22	friendship	24:16,19 53:6	60:3
39:14 49:5,7	12:17	gives 26:22	google 19:15
59:22 61:7	full 28:9 48:16	28:13 35:18	govern 26:7
firsthand 16:7	function 55:18	59:24	government
fiscal 29:13,22	funded 56:7	giving 10:25	13:6,14,19,19
30:17 39:20,22	funding 56:3	20:17 27:15	13:20,21 29:11
39:25	further 41:17	go 10:7 11:8	30:17,18 31:1
fisher 8:6	50:11 71:12	13:11 17:5	51:19,20,22
five 15:24	72:9	22:12 28:17	grand 1:12
16:20 17:5	future 5:13	33:21 40:23	grant 36:19
29:18,23 30:5	16:21 30:22	41:9,13	58:16
31:16 32:9	31:1,5,5 41:17	goal 5:15 29:12	grants 35:21
63:16	61:18 63:10,11	god 17:6 23:15	grateful 18:19
focus 6:24	63:23	goes 23:6	19:1 22:3
folks 15:7 25:1	g	going 4:13,21	great 16:6
43:23 46:2	g 3:1	6:18 13:7	17:14 19:11
foregoing 71:3	garner 61:10	14:25 15:10	22:16 23:16
71:4 72:4	garner 01.10 gaye 23:8	21:12 22:8	30:3,25 41:6
forget 9:16	general 2:7 7:4	23:8 25:12	57:10 69:5
former 26:9	28:7	26:24 28:12	greater 52:4
34:10	genuine 31:7	31:19 32:22	greatest 17:10
forth 14:8,10	gerald 2:9	33:15 38:11,12	greene 8:1
36:3 39:11	gerand 2.9 germane 25:7	41:12,20 48:4	greetings 24:12
42:25 54:18	getting 21:1	48:7 50:6	grief 14:19
58:12 62:25	24:17	52:24 56:22	grillo 2:11
forward 16:21	gift 17:10	63:4,13 67:19	14:22,23 15:15
26:25 32:22	girl 17.10 girl 11:6	good 3:2,4,5,21	38:19,20 40:6
61:14,20 63:7	give 17:10	3:22 7:23	42:10,11 54:3
69:5	21:11,11 24:1	11:20 15:17,17	54:4 56:14,18
fourth 56:11	27:17,25 41:19	15:19 16:25	56:19 57:23,24
frank 7:11,12	48:18 51:9	17:2 20:24	59:11 61:13
	55:11 56:2	23:13 24:11,11	62:10,11 64:19
	23.11 30.2		

[grillo - information]

	I	I	T -
64:20 66:17,18	18:2 20:9 21:7	hold 3:9,17	importantly
67:15,17,18	21:11 24:2,25	27:5 45:2	32:17
group 5:22 6:8	24:25 25:4,6	48:24	imposed 49:2
growing 19:13	29:14 30:24,25	home 9:15	impossible 20:3
guess 23:21	43:16 44:20	honor 8:8 15:3	impressed
guidance 19:16	51:9 53:13	17:18 18:2,18	21:24
guys 3:9	60:18 61:9	18:18,19 19:18	imprisonment
h	hearing 13:18	20:13 23:2	36:1
half 12:20	15:25 17:25	27:23	improve 29:11
24:20	40:12,13 49:15	honored 4:1	improvements
hall 26:15,15	50:14,24	5:21 21:16,16	31:7
hamza 8:2	hearings 6:10	27:13	improving
hands 11:9	21:10,24 24:20	hope 28:20	29:12
happen 28:18	29:21,24 30:5	61:17 63:11	include 31:6
50:15	39:21 40:1	hosting 4:9	included 29:17
	45:2 48:24	household	includes 63:20
happened 28:13	50:8,22 53:7	25:13	including 29:21
	60:24 61:3	hudson 8:1	31:10 45:24
happens 59:25	heavy 25:22	hundred 6:14	46:1,1
happy 20:3	heights 12:21	i	inclusive 56:1
hard 16:19,20 22:6 41:9	heinrich 7:10	ian 8:7	incorporate
	held 29:20	ideas 6:1 30:25	68:13
harder 6:19 hassan 7:13	31:23 67:11	31:4 63:10	incredible 4:11
hazel 2:4 8:16	hello 16:25		12:24,25 19:18
8:22	help 13:2 31:1	identifying	individual
hear 11:4 13:13	34:4	6:20 imbalance 26:2	25:20
	helps 51:8	26:6	individually
16:5,6,7,12	herbert 2:16		31:20
17:17,24 23:17	hereto 71:14	impact 34:7,13	individuals 6:8
25:12 39:14	72:11	important 12:1	inform 41:10
44:2 54:22	highway 36:12	13:16,23 14:12	50:11 55:3
58:16 60:21	hinder 37:22	15:10 34:9	information
heard 6:21	history 10:6	49:23 51:11	10:25 41:9
13:25 14:11	35:18 37:9,11	55:25 56:9	47:24 55:13,17
15:1 16:9,9,14	,	61:20 63:6,23	56:2,7
16:15 17:12,12		65:19	, -

[informed - life] Page 11

informed 23:23	items 57:3	kid 13:9	laura 72:2,15
55:7	ivy 7:13	kids 22:25	law 8:4 29:7
input 16:15	j	kiernan 2:7 7:4	
44:6 48:25	-	king 10:8	laws 33:6 39:18
52:20 54:18	jackie 2:8	know 4:25 6:8	39:21 40:1,2
intended 34:7	20:19 23:22	7:12 9:8 10:18	43:2 44:9,13
34:13 35:4	33:16,22 35:3	10:20 11:12,13	44:15 48:12
36:19	james 7:14	12:8,10 14:1	55:9 59:3
intent 49:6	jasmine 8:1	14:18 15:4	lead 5:21
intents 50:10	job 1:18 10:22	17:6,7,20 18:4	leader 22:23
interacts 29:11	22:6,6 23:19	18:13 19:4,8	leaders 5:11,11
interested	johnson 4:8	19:11,15 20:25	22:23
71:15 72:12	joined 27:24	21:12 22:8,22	leadership 8:16
intern 7:22	joining 4:4	23:7,8 27:21	22:15 61:10
61:7	jonas 7:16	35:5 36:4	learned 21:17
interviewed 9:4	journey 5:3	37:15,19,20,21	21:17,18,19,20
intro 23:10	11:24 12:24	41:13 46:21,23	22:2 23:24
introduce 4:6	17:5,8,15	46:23 52:15	leave 59:3
4:14 8:10	joy 17:4	59:21 60:18	leaves 33:6
introduction	joy's 17:4	69:1	40:2 44:15
49:6,10 63:21	jr 2:15 24:7	knowing 9:1	55:9
invite 31:15	july 1:7 67:11	knowledge	leeann 7:25
iodice 8:7	june 30:15	30:14 71:9	left 7:5
irrespective	jurisdiction	72:6	legislation
20:5	37:25	knows 11:12	28:25 29:3
island 11:11,13	k	krista 7:16	44:6 45:3 50:1
13:11	k 72:2,15	kyle 2:10 12:19	50:7,10,17
issue 29:21	kane 8:7	61:14	51:10,13 52:2
34:25 35:10,24	kary 7:25	1	53:5 54:19
37:6	keeping 10:22	_	leon 7:17
issues 16:3 20:6	10:22,25	lady 8:14	levels 34:8,14
31:4 36:8	ken 2:6	landers 57:5	library 1:11,11
58:24 59:2	kept 20:17	lands 36:10	4:9 19:12,12
item 43:6	23:22	language 29:1	life 6:2 7:23
		29:4 45:5,11	9:14,22 10:5

[life - merits] Page 12

13:3 18:20,23	16:3 21:18,19	making 13:2	41:21 42:14,15
29:12 55:19	29:9 30:25	53:11 60:19	43:19 50:22
limit 44:25	32:11 34:20	man 8:16 11:6	54:7,8 58:2,3
limiting 53:11	40:24 45:23	21:6	60:9,17,25
linda 4:7	60:19,22,25	man's 36:10	62:14,15 64:23
list 2:2 43:23	love 9:12 10:4	manage 6:2	64:24 65:18
43:23	10:11 13:1	mandate 36:17	66:2,4,21,22
listen 17:9,11	22:10,19	37:6 55:3,7	69:17,19
listened 12:3,3	luther 10:8	manhattan	mean 20:20
43:16 45:23	lynch 2:12	13:12	22:5,18 30:24
listening 6:11	15:16,17,20	marc 7:9	measures 29:15
12:2 15:7 18:1	38:21,22 42:12	marked 49:3	media 69:12
19:20 21:1	42:13 54:5,6	martha 8:6	medians 36:12
34:22 45:21	57:25 58:1	martin 10:8	meet 18:19
literally 3:15	62:12,13 64:21	marvelous	meeting 1:1 3:6
little 35:5 36:13	64:22 66:19,20	10:22	3:24 20:18,21
38:13 55:11	m	marvin 23:7	28:5 29:2
live 11:8 13:15	made 25:2	materials 24:18	30:15 40:13
21:25 51:21	46:11 47:24	32:15 65:13	45:7 63:15
living 9:19	56:4,6 57:9	matter 30:12	67:11 68:7,8
lobby 52:8	67:13	max 2:14 49:21	69:15 70:3
local 40:1	magnificent	mayor 21:7,15	meetings 6:10
48:12	22:15 26:17	23:16 27:4,5	24:23,23 69:11
logical 12:5	maintenance	27:14 36:19	69:11
look 5:9 10:5,6	55:6,17	39:22 48:19,22	members 9:1
16:21 19:17	make 9:19 13:5	49:1,12 53:7	27:3 29:5
35:16 63:12	13:20 18:24	58:23 59:1	30:11 45:22,24
69:5	20:3,8 22:13	mayor's 26:3	63:22
looked 47:16	25:9 27:7	45:1	memorializing
looks 4:12	32:16 33:24	mcgraw 2:13	6:20
lorraine 2:11	34:14,20 45:10	7:8 8:20 10:20	mentioned 57:1
14:22 67:17,18	55:21 59:21,25	16:24,25 17:3	61:7
lost 52:8	67:10 68:13	18:5 19:6	mentor 22:19
lot 6:14,14 12:2	makes 13:22	38:23,24 40:16	merits 34:23
14.1 10 10		40:18,19 41:5	
14:1,18,18	18:22	T0.10,17 T1.3	

[merola - okay] Page 13

merola 7:16	69:14,16 70:1	neither 71:10	notary 71:19
met 22:24	mouth 17:7	72:7	note 34:19
michael 7:16	move 14:2	neri 7:16	notice 44:8,13
61:10	32:22 33:13	never 9:16	48:18,23 49:5
mile 12:20,20	63:6	10:10 41:12	49:7,8,11,12
miller 8:6 72:2	moves 33:16	new 3:7,24 5:13	50:21 53:5,6
72:15	moving 14:2	5:15,16,23,24	notices 69:12
minority 58:19	26:25 36:5	5:24,25 6:21	november 12:7
63:1	60:3	8:4,15 9:12	28:7,18 32:17
minute 44:18	multiple 3:4,22	13:10 15:8	68:24
minutes 67:10	17:2 50:18	16:4 17:14	number 25:9
68:2,8,12,14	67:21 68:16	18:17 19:2	32:23 37:17,18
moderated 1:6	69:21	23:17,18 24:20	39:14,17 44:2
modernization	mwbe 61:3,9	25:17,18 26:12	44:5 54:22,25
30:18	61:10,12,16	26:25 27:6,18	58:16,19
modify 55:25	mwbes 59:1,24	28:19,23 29:11	ny 1:13
moment 4:13	63:2	29:18,23 30:5	nypd 34:2 37:6
6:4 11:21	n	30:10 35:20	0
14:13	n 2:1 3:1	43:15 45:11	o 3:1
monday 40:13	name 3:25	63:18 69:9,11	offer 68:10
montgomery	names 38:12	71:20	office 18:12
9:16	national 8:15	ngai 2:6 11:20	26:3 58:23
months 4:19	9:6,22	38:10 42:3	59:2
6:9 20:8 28:14	nationalities	53:20,21 57:15	officer 58:22
mood 26:21	17:22	57:16 62:2,3	59:16 61:4
motion 31:22	necessary	64:11,12 66:9	71:1,2
31:23 33:8,9	59:22 65:16	66:10	officers 37:2
33:13,14 40:4		ngia 42:2	officials 37:14
	need 14:5 21:9		UIII(Jais -)/.14
40:5 41:23	need 14:5 21:9 21:10.11 22:13	nickel 25:21	
45:10,14,17	21:10,11 22:13	nights 24:25	37:25
45:10,14,17 56:10,12,13	21:10,11 22:13 24:18 35:5,11	nights 24:25 no's 69:23	37:25 oh 3:16 8:21
45:10,14,17 56:10,12,13 59:6,7,8,21	21:10,11 22:13 24:18 35:5,11 37:18	nights 24:25 no's 69:23 nominated 9:7	37:25 oh 3:16 8:21 20:23 34:11
45:10,14,17 56:10,12,13 59:6,7,8,21 63:13,25 64:2	21:10,11 22:13 24:18 35:5,11	nights 24:25 no's 69:23 nominated 9:7 nomination 9:7	37:25 oh 3:16 8:21 20:23 34:11 43:13 60:15
45:10,14,17 56:10,12,13 59:6,7,8,21 63:13,25 64:2 65:11,23,25	21:10,11 22:13 24:18 35:5,11 37:18 needed 14:12 needs 27:1 55:3	nights 24:25 no's 69:23 nominated 9:7	37:25 oh 3:16 8:21 20:23 34:11 43:13 60:15 okay 3:16,19
45:10,14,17 56:10,12,13 59:6,7,8,21 63:13,25 64:2	21:10,11 22:13 24:18 35:5,11 37:18 needed 14:12	nights 24:25 no's 69:23 nominated 9:7 nomination 9:7	37:25 oh 3:16 8:21 20:23 34:11 43:13 60:15

15 10 01 70 7	• , ,•		, •
46:12,24 53:16	orientation	party 9:5 22:23	perspective
57:7,11	9:21	passed 39:12	29:20
once 16:17	outcome 71:15	43:3 54:19	perspectives
37:24 53:4	72:12	58:14 63:3	5:5
online 47:18	outreach 29:17	passes 39:7	ph 61:22
53:3	own 21:6	67:25 70:1	phenomenal
open 33:15	owned 58:19	pauses 50:3	4:12
opening 51:18	63:1	penalty 36:1	phone 26:12
operates 13:21	p	people 5:18,22	physically
operations	p 2:1,1 3:1	5:25 6:1 9:20	25:11
44:10,14 48:13	p.m. 1:8 24:23	9:23 10:1,7,10	piece 57:8
opinion 16:10	70:4	12:2,2,7 13:1	pipeline 56:8
opinions 16:1	pablo 7:17	13:13 15:1	place 5:17 9:9
16:12 30:13	page 55:15	17:12,17,17,24	45:12
51:18 52:2	page 55.15 pages 6:13,14	17:24 18:14,17	placed 45:1
opportunities	paid 14:3 25:21	18:17 19:20,25	65:14
10:5	park 34:10	21:8,9,20	places 11:11
opportunity	park 34.10 park's 34:13	23:24 24:1	planning 54:25
13:8 15:22	parks 34.13 parks 34:1,2,5	26:19,20 28:22	55:3,4,7,8,14
16:5,7,11 24:2	34:5,6,6,7 35:4	34:21,22 35:5	58:13
26:10 27:15	37:2	37:13 45:24	plaza 1:12
51:9,12,17,24		people's 20:8	please 63:9
52:21 53:12	parky 34:10 part 5:20 6:19	53:13	pleasure 9:1
68:10,12	6:19 9:19 11:4	pep 37:2	15:4 17:4,18
oppose 35:7		perfect 41:21	18:18,18 23:2
opposed 39:10	16:15 17:21	perform 34:3	plus 30:7 52:18
42:25 54:17	19:18 30:9	36:23	61:3
58:12 62:25	59:16	period 28:20	point 26:24
65:9 67:6,23	participate	48:23 50:7	47:22
68:17	11:7	permits 58:20	police 44:10,14
option 37:18	particular 8:5	58:24 59:2	48:14
ordained 18:16	particularly	63:2	polite 61:22
order 48:25	15:10 59:15	permitted 45:3	politician 26:9
65:14	parties 71:11	person 29:25	27:16
	71:14 72:8,11	52:15	

	Ι		
ponce 7:17	priority 57:5	proposal 12:4	28:17,17 29:5
popko 1:17	privilege 8:9	31:20 32:18,23	29:15,21,22
71:2,18	10:12 12:22	32:24 33:9	30:4,12,17
porter 9:14	procedural	39:10,11,13,14	32:24 37:16,21
positions 18:14	48:11	39:17,19 40:5	37:23 38:1
potentially	procedure	43:1 44:2,3,5,7	39:11 40:12,12
50:23	16:16 44:7	44:8,22,25	40:22 41:10,20
power 26:3	procedures	45:9 47:18,23	44:6,8,10,14,21
28:22 33:1	49:1	48:17,25 49:4	45:2,3 47:1
35:22	proceed 8:11	51:8,8,16 53:8	48:13,17,19,24
powers 33:4	proceeding	54:17,18,22,23	48:25 49:15,25
practicable	72:4	54:25 55:1	50:14 52:18,23
55:20	proceedings	56:11 58:12,13	54:19 56:2,3,9
pray 5:9	71:3,4,6,8 72:6	58:15,16,19,21	65:16,19 68:23
preliminary	process 4:15	59:7,22 62:25	69:7,12 71:19
60:3	5:3 8:5 9:5	63:1	publicly 40:14
prepare 30:20	13:22 25:19	proposals 4:16	40:15 51:5
prepared 31:11	29:17 31:7	15:9 28:12,16	pulling 6:12
72:3	63:22	30:16,21 31:9	pullman 9:14
present 8:9	procurement	31:12,17,17	pun 36:18
16:13 25:3,10	31:7	32:16 44:20	punishable
25:11	product 4:20	63:16,17	35:25
presented	professional	propose 50:6	purpose 28:4
29:24 52:23	61:12	proposed 4:20	purposes 50:10
63:15	professions	4:24 28:8,25	push 22:12
presenting 30:6	13:4	29:1,3,4 31:12	put 12:6 14:8
52:19,22	profound 43:7	39:18 41:1	14:10 26:24
president 4:8	projects 56:7	43:2 44:19	28:6 29:20
26:9 27:22	promotes 51:16	45:13 47:17	35:2 39:10
pretty 16:4	properties	48:12 49:17,17	40:21,24 41:8
principally	36:17	51:10 52:2	42:25 54:17
20:10	property 32:24	53:2	58:12 62:25
prior 39:25	33:2,5 36:10	protect 26:4	puts 37:24
48:16 71:5	36:13 39:12	public 1:11 4:8	putting 6:10
		22:2 25:24	40:23

a	45:9 46:16	regardless 9:20	reported 1:17
q	47:8,10,15	10:2	representing
qualified 71:7	48:4,7 51:6	regards 51:7,8	8:25
quality 29:12	54:23 63:9	regular 15:25	require 31:4
queens 13:12 67:11	reading 32:1	regulations	33:2,5 39:20
	ready 3:10,11	35:23,25	39:25 44:7,8
question 31:22 32:7 33:12	3:12	reiterate 24:15	44:12 55:1,5
35:17 37:23	real 18:4 59:16	30:4 46:25	required 31:24
38:5 39:7	really 6:20 8:24	68:23	48:18
41:23,24 45:6	19:11 21:6	related 30:16	requirement
47:11,15 49:21	22:8,20 27:23	50:1 55:17	36:3
49:24 53:17	28:13 32:8	71:11 72:7	requirements
55:11 57:12	41:9 59:17	relating 35:23	44:25 48:11
60:12,16,17	reason 37:8	39:11 43:1	research 19:14
61:24 64:8	received 30:7	54:18 58:13	resolution 15:9
65:19 66:6	44:24 47:24	63:1	30:19 31:21
questions 5:1	recommendat	relative 71:13	32:13 65:12,21
19:25 28:5	30:22 63:23	72:10	65:24 67:6
31:10 32:9	record 3:18	released 44:20	resolve 35:1
43:5 48:7 51:3	32:8 71:9 72:5	remember 18:4	resolving 35:10
63:6,17 65:14	recorded 71:6	renovations	respect 10:7,11
65:17,20	recording 71:8	4:11	respectfully
quick 18:4	72:4	repeat 14:25	50:13
quite 37:21	recovering	report 4:16,24	respecting 44:9
r	26:8 27:15	6:17 14:4,9	44:14 48:12
	red 10:3	28:8,10 29:1,4	responses
r 2:1 3:1	reduced 71:6	30:21 31:3,11	44:23
race 9:20	refer 36:10	31:13,14,18,21	responsibilities
rachel 8:6	reflect 47:20,23	32:11 35:16	34:3
raise 11:5	reflects 6:17	43:5,17 44:19	responsibility
rank 40:25,25	28:9	45:13 46:19,25	29:13,22 30:17
rats 36:7	reform 31:6	47:17,17 49:18	32:14 34:5
read 26:11	refuse 35:24	51:5 53:2,3	responsible
28:14 31:16	regarding	55:15 63:14,20	35:19,19 36:11
39:15 43:5,7	44:21	64:1 65:10	
43:10,20 44:3			

[rest - scissura] Page 17

most 70.2	24.11 26.4	muhan 2.15	50.10
rest 70:2	34:11 36:4	ruben 2:15	58:18
restrict 50:17	37:2 40:25	27:20 29:8	saying 34:24
restricts 49:24	41:6,14 43:25	rules 25:15,18	35:7,8 45:20
result 45:21,21	47:8,14,15	run 8:21 25:13	47:9 50:20
retaining 45:1	49:13 50:16	rundown 28:13	52:17 67:20
reunion 22:20	57:3,4	ryan 7:15,18,22	says 35:3 43:8
reverend 2:16	robert 7:6,7,7	61:6	schedule 9:11
27:25 28:2	rodeo 12:16	S	school 11:8
38:16 42:7	roll 32:6,7,10	s 2:1 3:1 62:23	scissura 1:6 2:3
51:3 52:11,17	32:12	sabrina 7:13	3:2,5,8,11,13
53:25 57:20	rose 2:14 19:9	safe 5:16	3:19,23 4:1
62:7 64:16	19:10 20:15	safety 22:2	6:17 7:9,20
66:14	38:25 39:1	25:25 29:15,22	8:18,21 10:14
review 3:7,25	42:16,17 49:21	30:17 44:6,10	10:18 11:16,19
25:23 26:24	49:22 50:3,9	44:14 45:3	12:13 14:21
27:7 29:3	50:16 51:14	48:13,17 50:1	15:14 16:23
58:20 63:3	54:9,10 56:21	54:19	19:3,8 20:14
65:22	56:24 57:4,7	sang 23:8	22:17 23:10
reviewed 29:7	57:10 58:4,5	sanitation 22:1	24:5,7 27:19
31:12 52:19	62:16,17 64:25	33:25 34:4	28:4 32:4 33:7
reviewing	65:1 66:23,24	35:11,18 36:15	33:11,14,19
25:19	round 6:25	37:4	34:11,15 36:20
revised 45:5	rowe 2:8 20:16	sanitation's	38:3,9,11,15,17
revision 27:1	20:19,23 22:18	33:1,4	38:19,21,23,25
30:23 63:23	24:6,8 33:13	savino 2:5 7:3	39:2,4 40:3,9
revisions 68:14	33:16,22,23	19:13 22:21	40:17 41:3,16
revisit 26:10	34:12,17 35:3		41:22 42:2,4,6
27:7	36:25 37:3	24:16 31:16	42:8,10,12,14
richest 17:23	39:2,3 40:8	32:3,19,20	42:16,18,20,22
rid 36:6	42:18,19 54:11	35:13 36:22	42:24 43:13,18
right 6:15 11:1	54:12 58:6,7	37:1 39:16	43:22 44:1,17
11:7 14:19	62:18,19 65:2	44:4 47:5,10	45:16,23 46:1
18:12 19:15,24	65:3 66:25	47:14,20 48:3	46:7,10,18,24
23:10,11 24:9	67:1	48:6,10 49:14	47:4,6 48:4
26:8 31:25		49:20 51:2	49:19 50:2,5
		52:15 54:24	

50.10.10.00	4 25 2	• (10	• 25.1
50:12,19,23	seat 25:2	series 6:10	sign 25:1
51:4 52:5,10	second 9:7	serious 25:22	signature 71:17
52:24 53:16,20	12:15,21 33:17	seriously 27:5	72:14
53:22,24 54:1	33:18,19 40:5	serve 4:1 15:3	significance
54:3,5,7,9,11	40:7,8 41:23	17:17 23:16	19:22 20:5
54:13,15,21	45:14,15 56:14	24:1	significant
55:10 56:15,19	56:17,18 59:10	served 5:8 9:5	61:14
56:22 57:2,6,8	59:11 64:4,5	17:14	signify 67:20
57:11,15,17,19	66:2,3 67:14	service 12:16	simple 38:6
57:21,23,25	67:15,16,16	19:1	sinclair 8:7
58:2,4,6,8,10	69:18	services 36:24	single 24:24
59:5,9,12 60:7	seconded 31:23	37:16	25:20
60:11,15 61:2	seconds 3:15	serving 12:22	sir 16:23 33:11
61:23 62:2,4,6	secretary 2:6	16:21 27:22	46:4
62:8,10,12,14	11:19 12:14	set 25:15 29:10	sister 23:22
62:16,18,20,22	38:9	36:3	sisters 14:11
64:3,6,11,13,15	section 31:4	several 30:16	17:16
64:17,19,21,23	33:25 43:5	41:4	sit 16:11
64:25 65:2,4,6	63:10	sexual 9:21	sitting 34:21
65:8 66:1,3,9	sections 36:9	share 5:15 8:10	skills 71:10
66:11,13,15,17	36:24	68:11 69:6	72:6
66:19,21,23,25	see 10:6 14:4	shared 4:20,23	social 69:12
67:2,4,9,16,18	24:9 26:16	30:13 45:6	solicit 48:25
67:22,25 68:5	31:3 35:16	67:12	solutions 22:7
68:17,20 69:5	40:20 43:8	sharing 4:18	song 23:7
69:18,22,25	seek 65:11	shirley 9:8	sorry 3:13 32:1
seabrooks 2:9	seems 55:12	short 21:2 24:3	46:4 60:15
23:12,13 39:4	seen 49:16	show 56:3	sort 37:20
39:5 42:20,21	selected 27:4	si 38:18 42:9	sounds 32:11
54:13,14 56:13	senator 22:22	54:2 57:22	43:7
56:16 58:8,9	senior 7:9,15	62:9 64:18	speak 5:6 20:18
62:20,21 64:2	sense 57:9	66:16	25:5 44:18
64:3 65:4,5	sent 29:1 65:20	sidewalks	speaker 3:9,12
67:2,3	sentiment 8:24	35:23	3:14,16 6:16
			7:19 42:23

43:9 46:14,16	staffing 34:8,13	substance	talent 5:25 6:24
46:20,22 47:2	start 4:18	52:20	talk 6:7 9:4
47:7 48:1	15:11	substantial	talked 6:11
50:25 51:6	starting 3:14	49:16	37:3
52:7,13 54:20	state 4:2 45:4	substitute	talks 28:11
60:5,23 61:21	71:20	45:11	task 6:9,9,9
65:7 67:8,24	statement	suhail 8:2	tasks 41:18
68:4,19,25	51:19 55:16,22	summaries	team 7:13
69:2,4,24	55:25	63:17	technical 32:16
speakers 3:4,22	staten 11:11,13	summer 9:18	43:6
17:2 50:18	13:11	70:2	technology
67:21 68:16	stay 20:7	sun 9:18 43:21	27:10
69:21	stays 49:10	support 31:7	tell 5:7 15:6
speaking 18:1	steady 10:23	56:24 59:1	47:3 69:1
speaks 46:4	step 59:22 60:3	sure 9:20 13:2	terms 25:24
special 7:25 8:3	61:14,20	13:5,20 20:8	65:18
18:22	stephanie 2:13	22:13 25:3	testament 6:23
specific 44:22	18:7	32:16 33:24	testified 30:13
specifically	stopped 9:18	34:20 48:1	testify 43:24
46:4	strategists 5:22	59:25 60:19	testifying 71:5
spencer 8:6	strategy 56:6	68:2	testimonies
spent 9:11	street 10:9 37:6	surroundings	24:19
43:20	streets 33:1,4	11:7	testimony 25:6
spin 6:2	35:9,20	swear 18:8	29:24 30:6,8
spoke 16:9 46:2	strength 17:19	sweeper 10:9	60:19,22,25
spread 22:12	stress 63:8	sworn 18:10,13	61:9 69:10
sr 2:16	striking 5:20	18:15 71:5	text 63:18
staff 6:7,24 7:6	stronger 27:8	t	thank 4:4,7 7:3
10:24 14:16	struck 49:7	table 15:9	8:23 10:14
15:13 18:12	stuff 21:17	take 6:4 11:21	11:1,4,9,10,14
22:14 23:21	subject 30:12	21:5 34:24	11:16,16,18,21
24:17 30:20	submitted	35:16 65:12,15	12:8,12,13,13
31:11,13 32:14	19:25 69:10	taken 71:3,12	12:18 14:14,15
32:14 44:24	submitting	72:9	14:16,20,21,23
65:12 68:11,22	30:8	12.7	15:14 16:18,20

[thank - two] Page 20

16:23 17:6	22:11,13 26:17	times 10:16	transparency
19:2,3,10,18	26:18,23 31:1	23:23 27:10	29:13
20:11,14,19,20	37:10,22	40:24	transparent
20:21,23 21:5	think 4:23 5:2	timing 14:1	41:12
21:14 22:4,14	5:13,14,23	title 32:23	travel 13:9
22:17 23:5,5,9	8:15 10:16	39:17 44:5	16:20
23:11,13,15,16	12:5,5 13:15	titled 54:25	traveled 11:25
23:20,21 24:4	13:24 15:2	58:19	traveling 15:24
24:4,5,6,14	19:23 20:1	today 4:5,9,21	triangles 36:13
27:13,14,18,19	21:17,22 23:18	9:9,12,17 11:3	tried 60:5
30:11 31:13	29:8 32:1,7	11:9 14:8	tries 37:13
32:20,20 33:7	34:23 35:1,5	19:19,22 20:11	trigger 49:12
33:23 34:15	41:18 46:10	23:14 28:6,12	triggered 49:5
35:13 37:7	49:22 51:24	28:16,17 40:11	true 28:22,22
38:3,3 39:7,16	56:8 60:2 61:3	40:13	30:9 61:19
40:3,6 44:4,17	61:17	today's 28:5	71:9 72:5
46:12,12 47:19	thinkers 5:22	29:2 63:15	truly 15:7
49:19 52:4,5	third 4:3	69:15	31:14
52:12,24 54:24	thought 14:9	together 6:10	try 37:15
55:10 56:15,20	thoughtful	6:12 10:1,22	trying 20:4
58:18 59:5	29:17	12:16 18:24	23:23 34:25
60:4 61:2,6	thoughts 4:15	told 8:13	tsang 7:15
63:5 64:3,6	4:18 8:10	tonight 6:18	tuesday 4:21
68:20,21 69:4	three 5:4 10:16	took 9:10 25:2	4:24 44:20
69:9,9,10,13	48:13 61:5	25:21 45:25	turn 12:11
thankful 19:1	thrilled 4:1	46:10	19:15
thanks 7:25 8:4	thrive 5:16	top 15:1 30:6	turned 41:12
15:12,12	thursday 1:7	topics 29:25	twelve 39:9
thea 1:17 71:2	time 9:10 10:15	track 11:1	42:24 54:16
71:18	14:5,14 21:2,5	transcriber	58:11 62:24
thing 7:21 12:1	25:12 26:18	72:1	65:8 67:5,25
52:3,3	37:15 40:21	transcript 72:3	two 6:14 17:7
things 6:20,21	41:8 44:9,13	72:5	17:22 26:15
14:5 19:14	52:25 60:1	transcriptionist	28:14 30:2
21:19,19 22:8	68:22	71:7	47:2 59:3 61:3

[two - website] Page 21

68:13	unique 5:5	vote 4:25 6:18	want 5:15,16
tymkiv 7:17	unique 5:5 update 39:23	8:11 16:13	5:17 6:4 11:1
	40:1 55:4,8		12:8,11 13:5
typewriting 71:7	,	28:12 31:17,20	14:15,16 15:12
/1./	updated 45:9	31:21 32:6,8	·
u	47:12,13	32:10,13 33:8 39:6,13 40:1,4	21:5 22:4,19 23:15,20,20,25
unanimous	updates 39:19 43:2	·	23:25 24:1,14
68:7		41:13,19 42:22	/
unanimously	upfront 14:7	44:1 45:12	28:15,24 33:24
39:7	urge 20:7 28:14	48:16,21,23	34:14,20 35:6
unchanged	43:4	49:11 53:8	35:8,9,9 40:11
33:6 40:2	use 35:23 48:23	54:15,21 56:11	41:14 52:14
44:16 55:9	used 13:10	58:10,15 59:6	63:8 68:21
59:4	useful 55:18	62:22 65:6	wanted 11:21
uncleanliness	usual 7:8	67:4,19 68:24	24:24 25:5,6,9
37:11	V	69:2	60:9
unclear 52:12	variety 29:25	voted 28:16	wanting 11:4
underlying	vending 34:4,6	30:19 63:16	waste 33:2,5
50:17	37:1	69:8	35:20 36:6
understand	vendor 33:25	voters 28:7,19	way 5:9 7:23
14:5 18:14	version 45:20	32:18 65:15	18:8 19:4
37:8 65:19	vice 2:4 8:13,22	votes 32:9	24:22 26:5,7,8
understands	11:17,23 33:19	39:21 44:9,13	27:9,10,11
53:2	38:7	48:12	29:11 31:19
unidentified	violations	voting 19:22,24	36:21 37:6
3:9,12,14,16	35:24	33:3,6 39:24	38:12 45:8
6:16 7:19	visions 6:1	40:2,25 44:12	61:6 63:5
42:23 43:9	voice 11:5 16:9	44:15 47:8	ways 13:14
46:14,16,20,22	18:1,1 21:7	55:5,8 58:25	29:10
47:2,7 48:1	24:2 67:19	59:3	we've 13:25
50:25 51:6	voices 6:11	W	14:11 16:15
52:7,13 54:20	17:12 20:9	wait 3:13	26:1 34:20
60:5,23 61:21	21:10 28:23	waive 49:1	44:20 47:24
65:7 67:8,24	29:14 53:13	walk 4:10	website 29:6
68:4,19,25	volunteers	walks 18:20,23	45:9 47:1
69:2,4,24	14:19		

websites 69:12	worked 9:2	25:17,18 26:12
week 67:12	working 7:8	27:18 28:19
weeks 68:13	12:9 16:19,19	29:18 35:20
weight 25:22	69:6	43:15 63:18
27:17	works 13:6,21	71:20
welcome 3:6,23	61:12	yorkers 5:23
11:15 28:1,2	world 17:21,21	6:21 23:18
went 19:12	worry 69:3	26:25 27:6
24:24	worth 41:17	28:23 29:12,23
west 8:1	would've 49:5	30:5,10 69:10
wharton 7:25	wow 20:23	69:11
whoever's	wrap 67:9	Z
25:11	wright 8:1	zeitgeist 26:20
window 50:14	written 26:18	zero 39:10,10
witness 71:4	y	42:24,25 54:16
woman 11:6	y 62:23	54:17 58:11,12
women 58:19	yeah 6:16 32:1	62:24,25 65:9
63:1	40:19 41:2,3,5	· ·
wonderful	41:21 45:19	65:9 67:5,6 68:1
10:25 15:24	49:22 52:5	zoom 25:3,11
23:19 25:16,17	56:22 60:9	29:25 30:2
26:1 69:25	year 56:6	29.23 30.2
70:2	year 50.0 years 9:3,6,15	
word 22:12	9:21 17:15	
50:13	26:15 37:12	
wording 43:8		
words 4:7,15	41:3,4,5,11	
work 4:19 8:14	yesterday 9:3 9:25	
10:13 12:25		
13:4 14:16	york 3:7,25	
18:16 25:14	5:13,15,16,24	
28:9 40:20	5:25,25 8:4,15	
41:7 51:11,21	9:12 13:10	
59:23 63:11	15:8 17:14	
69:6	18:17 19:2	
	23:17 24:21	