

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

PUBLIC MEETING

January 14, 2026

4:02 p.m.

-----X

HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE/
100 Church Street, 10th Floor
New York, New York 10007

B E F O R E:

PATRICK SMITH - INTERIM CHAIR

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ. - EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

COURT REPORTER:
Sabrina Brown Stewart

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of Minutes
3. Remarks from the Interim Chair
4. Remarks from the Executive Director
5. Presentation from the Outreach Department
6. Public Comment
7. Old Business
8. New Business
9. Adjourn to Executive Session

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

=====

1. Patrick Smith - Interim Chair
2. Rahul Agarwal - Board Member
3. AU Hogan - Board Member
4. John Siegal, Esq. - Board Member
5. Herman Merritt - Board Member
6. Joseph Fox - Board Member
7. Joseph A. Puma - Board Member
8. Frank Dwyer - Board Member
9. Kevin McGinn - Board Member

PRESENTER:

JAHl ROSE - Director of Public Engagement and
Partnerships
NYC Civilian Complaint Review Board

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

S P E A K E R:

=====

MARI MOSS - Mayor's Task force Member.....18

MICHAEL MEYERS - President, New York Civil Rights
Coalition.....22

ANDREW CASE - Supervising Attorney
LatinoJustice PRLDEF.....30

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

5

1 MS. ALVAREZ: Good afternoon, everyone.
2 Thank you so much for joining us. For those
3 utilizing ASL Interpretation Services, our
4 two interpreters today are Andria Lamberton
5 and Victor Rivera. Instructions on how to
6 pin their video will be found in the chat.
7 For those utilizing CART Closed Captioning
8 Services, a link to that will be provided in
9 the chat as well.

10 Thank you so much.

11 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you,
12 Yojaira.

13 Good afternoon, members of the public,
14 CCRB staff and colleagues. I'm Pat Smith,
15 mayoral appointee to the CCRB and the interim
16 chair. On my left is Jonathan Darche. He's
17 the executive director of the CCRB. I would
18 like to call the CCRB's January public board
19 meeting to order. And could our board
20 members, starting on my right, introduce
21 themselves.

22 Joseph.

23 MR. PUMA: Yes. Good afternoon,
24 everyone. My name is Joe Puma. I'm the City
25 Council representative on the Board from the

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

6

1 Borough of Manhattan, and I hail from the
2 Lower East Side.

3 MR. FOX: Hi. I'm Joe Fox. I'm the
4 police commissioner's rep.

5 MR. HOGAN: AU Hogan. I'm a City
6 Council designee from Queens.

7 MR. DARCHE: Hi. My name is Jon
8 Darche. I use he/him pronouns, and I'm the
9 executive director of the Agency.

10 MR. MERRITT: Herman Merritt, City
11 Council designee from Brooklyn.

12 MR. MCGINN: Kevin McGinn, police
13 commissioner representative.

14 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, mayoral
15 designee from Brooklyn.

16 MR. DWYER: Frank Dwyer, police
17 commissioner designee.

18 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you all.
19 Let's proceed to the adoption of the minutes.

20 Are there any changes or corrections to
21 the December minutes?

22 (No response).

23 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Is there a motion
24 to approve the December minutes?

25 MR. HOGAN: So moved.

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Is there a
2 second?

3 MR. MERRITT: Second.

4 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Any questions?
5 All those in favor of approving the minutes,
6 say aye.

7 (Chorus of ayes).

8 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Any opposed?

9 (No response).

10 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: I have one
11 overlooked, John Siegal, member is here on
12 the video screen through the magic of
13 television.

14 John, introduce yourself, please.

15 MR. SIEGAL: Yeah, good afternoon.
16 John Siegal. I'm a mayoral appointee.

17 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Good afternoon,
18 and thank you for attending this January
19 meeting of the New York City Civilian
20 Complaint Review Board. It's an exciting
21 time. A new year with a new mayor. We wish
22 Mayor Zohran Mamdani well and promise him the
23 full support of the CCRB as we continue our
24 mission to assure accountability by the men
25 and women of the New York Police Department

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 with justice and fairness for our police
2 officers and for the people they serve.

3 We are a human endeavor. And like any
4 human endeavor, we can do better. At the
5 December 2025 meeting of the CCRB, the
6 interim chair presented a proposal to do
7 better through changes to the recruitment,
8 training, and compensation of CCRB
9 investigators. In the coming weeks, I will
10 be appointing a committee to develop this
11 proposal more fully and to present it to the
12 full CCRB board for consideration. I look
13 forward to the committee's work.

14 If you care about the effectiveness of
15 the CCRB, you might want to read an audit
16 report released by the New York City
17 Controller on December 30, 2025. A special
18 interest is page 19 of that audit report.
19 Under the heading "board vacancies," the
20 audit report reads in part, "The auditor's
21 review of CCRB's complaint data shows that
22 while CCRB received, investigated, reported,
23 and prepared both fully investigated,
24 substantiated, and not substantiated cases in
25 under 14 months, the cases sat waiting to be

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 assigned to a board review panel for months
2 at a time. On average, it took 5.1 months
3 for CCRB to assign cases to a board review
4 panel. This meant that case processing was
5 stalled pending review and vote for months.
6 The fully seated board is required to have 15
7 board members. Based on CCRB records, the
8 board convened only three panels per month
9 during calendar year 2024 to review and vote
10 on both substantiated and not substantiated
11 cases." That was from the controller's
12 report.

13 That problem with board vacancies
14 continued through 2025 and exists today. At
15 present, there are 11 CCRB board members.
16 For most of the last four years, there have
17 been only three City Council appointees
18 instead of five. The Bronx has not had a
19 City Council appointee in at least
20 four years. We wish the New York City
21 Council speaker well and urge her to address
22 this issue. We need enough CCRB members to
23 convene three-member panels to review
24 allegations of police misconduct. We are all
25 involved in this process, justice in a timely

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

10

1 manner. Now, I would like to introduce our
2 Executive Director, Jon Darche.

3 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Chair Smith.

4 I want to start by acknowledging that
5 this coming Monday is Martin Luther King Jr.
6 Day, commemorating the civil rights leaders
7 indelible contribution to our country. It's
8 a profound opportunity at this moment to
9 reflect not just on how far we've come since
10 the day of Dr. King's work advancing civil
11 rights and equality for all people, but just
12 also on how far we have to go.

13 It is also the start of a new year here
14 at the CCRB with a new administration as
15 well. And in that spirit of both reflection
16 and forward thinking, I'm struck by how far
17 we've come as an agency since I first joined
18 back in 2013 and how much we can still grow.
19 In my tenure at CCRB, I was a part of the
20 creation of our Administrative Prosecution
21 Unit, a group of driven and intelligent
22 people who handle some of the most serious
23 cases of police misconduct this agency
24 investigates.

25 I think of our policy report on the

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 2020 protest here in New York City, and how
2 recommendations from that report have
3 influenced how our city handles its response
4 to civil movements. I also think about the
5 racial profiling and bias-based policing unit
6 formed in recent years to investigate
7 incidents of misconduct that may arise from
8 systemic issues of bias and discrimination.

9 I think of the work we've done to take
10 a trauma-informed approach to all aspects of
11 our agency's efforts, a primary goal of the
12 CCRB's development for the past two years
13 from more deeply considering how we interview
14 civilians to how we support our investigators
15 as they study issues and incidents that may
16 be particularly intense. We've taken real
17 steps to become a trauma-informed agency. I
18 think of the many young people who've come
19 through our agency as interns or as members
20 of the Youth Advisory Council. I also think
21 of the many more young people who will join
22 us in these programs in the coming months,
23 that inspires hope for the future of our city
24 and our agency.

25 This year, it is our goal to continue

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 our work on behalf of the people of New York
2 with even greater efficiency than in years
3 past. As part of that effort, the Agency
4 will once again seek full funding from the
5 City Council to provide the CCRB with the
6 full staff and resources it needs to
7 investigate cases in a timely and effective
8 manner. As Chair Smith referenced, we also
9 hope to have a full complement of board
10 members appointed to fill the vacancies that
11 persist. This will enable the Agency to
12 reduce the time it takes to fully investigate
13 complaints.

14 I'm especially looking forward to
15 connecting with our staff, our stakeholders,
16 our board members, and the public to learn
17 better how our agency can continue its
18 endeavor to be more efficient as it works on
19 behalf of all New Yorkers. As Chair Smith
20 indicated, we are always looking to improve
21 our work as an agency. As executive
22 director, my job isn't to have all the
23 answers, but rather to create the space for
24 us to find those answers together. I look
25 forward to doing that this year.

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

13

1 As a reminder, the deadline for
2 applications for the next Youth Advisory
3 Council was extended to this coming Friday,
4 January 16th. All New Yorkers ages 10 to 18
5 are eligible to apply. Additionally, our
6 office is open for walk-in complaints, but
7 it's also possible to file complaints online
8 at nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint or by telephone at
9 (800)341-2272 or dialing 3-1-1 or by tagging
10 the Agency on Twitter, Facebook, and
11 Instagram.

12 For those wishing to speak during the
13 public comment section of today's meeting, we
14 ask that you keep your questions and comments
15 to four minutes. If anyone wishes to file a
16 complaint today, we have two investigators on
17 hand ready to take any new complaints. The
18 investigators on call this afternoon are Emma
19 Stydahar and Rob Bryan. Yvonne Torres is
20 here from the Civilian Assistance Unit.

21 Thank you all for your presence here
22 today, and we'll now move on to our board's
23 formal business.

24 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Does anyone have
25 any questions for our executive director?

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

14

1 (No response).

2 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

3 Now we would reach out to Jahi Rose,
4 director of the Outreach Unit.

5 Please, Jahi.

6 MR. ROSE: Hello. Good afternoon. As
7 mentioned, my name is Jahi Rose. I am the
8 director of public engagement and
9 partnerships at the Civilian Complaint Review
10 Board. I go by he/him pronouns, and Happy
11 New Year, everyone.

12 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Happy New Year.

13 MR. ROSE: So, I'm going to provide a
14 brief overview of the Agency and a few
15 announcements.

16 So, the Civilian Complaint Review Board
17 is the nation's largest independent oversight
18 entity over the largest police force in the
19 country. The CCRB investigates, mediates,
20 and in some cases administratively prosecutes
21 allegations of misconduct alleged against
22 members of the New York City Police
23 Department. The Agency is governed by a
24 15-member board, some of which you're seeing
25 today on the dais; that includes five members

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 that are appointed by the New York City
2 Mayor, five appointed by the New York City
3 Council, three designated by the Police
4 Commissioner, one appointed by the New York
5 City Public Advocate, and the Chair is
6 jointly appointed by the Mayor and the City
7 Council.

8 The Agency investigates specific
9 allegations of police misconduct, which
10 include force, abuse of authority,
11 discourtesy, and offensive language. A
12 helpful acronym is FADO. As previously
13 mentioned, if you witness or experience
14 police misconduct, you can feel free to file
15 a complaint. The easiest way is to utilize
16 our agency's website, nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint,
17 or by calling the Agency's hotline at
18 1(800)341-CCRB or 1(800)341-2272.

19 Remember, if you see footage of
20 misconduct on social media or in the news,
21 you can feel free to file a complaint, even
22 if you were not there in person. The typical
23 handle for the CCRB is @CCRB_NYC. Other ways
24 to file complaints to our agency include
25 calling 3-1-1. You could also visit the

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 Agency's headquarters at 100 Church Street on
2 the 10th floor in Lower Manhattan. You could
3 also direct message or DM the CCRB on our
4 platforms which include Facebook, X or
5 Twitter, and Instagram. You could also send
6 a letter to the Agency at 100 Church Street,
7 10th Floor, New York, New York 10007.

8 You could also file a complaint in
9 person at a local police precinct. It does
10 not have to be the precinct within the
11 confines of where the interaction may have
12 taken place. You could leave that complaint
13 with a desk sergeant at the New York City
14 Police Department's precincts. You could
15 also request a self-addressed envelope with a
16 form and feel free to put that inside the
17 envelope, no postage needed, and you could
18 mail that directly to the Agency.

19 The CCRB has, as previously mentioned,
20 the Agency has a Youth Advisory Council. The
21 applications are live. The Youth Advisory
22 Council are a group of young people that are
23 in a committee. They are youth leaders in
24 their neighborhoods, and they're committed to
25 criminal justice issues and improving police

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

17

1 and community relations. All young people in
2 the City of New York ages 10 to 18 are
3 eligible to participate in Youth Advisory
4 Council. The new deadline is actually
5 January 30th. If you have questions
6 regarding the Youth Advisory Council, feel
7 free to contact yac@ccrb.nyc.gov.

8 If you'd like to request an outreach
9 presentation from the Outreach Unit, feel
10 free to e-mail us at outreach.nyc.gov.
11 Please remember to follow us on social media;
12 once again, that's Instagram, Twitter or X,
13 and Facebook.

14 Thank you very much, Chair.

15 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Jahi, thank you
16 very much.

17 Anybody have a questions?

18 (No response).

19 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

20 We move to the public comment portion
21 of the meeting. We will begin with those
22 joining us virtually who would like to make a
23 comment, followed by those who are joining us
24 in person. For those joining virtually,
25 please use the raise-your-hand feature.

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 Please keep your comments to four minutes.

2 Yojaira, would you please call on the
3 first person.

4 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair.

5 I just want to give folks just a
6 couple minutes in case they're looking to
7 raise their hand.

8 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Please, let's
9 remember to unmute when you're called.

10 (Whereupon, there was a brief
11 pause in the proceedings.)

12 MS. ALVAREZ: It looks like there are
13 no online participants, so we can move on to
14 in person.

15 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you very
16 much, Yojaira.

17 Okay. For those joining us in person
18 and are interested in making a public
19 comment, please line up behind the podium.
20 Please keep your comments to four minutes.

21 MS. MOSS: Hi. My name is Mari Moss.
22 I serve on the Community Action Board that
23 gives federal funding to nonprofit
24 organizations, and I also serve on the
25 Mayor's Task Force to end gender and

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 domestic-based violence. I wanted to start
2 by saying Happy Blessed New Year to everyone
3 here. And as we reflect on the legacy of
4 Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. whose unwavering
5 commitment to justice, equality, and humanity
6 continues to inspire our work. It is in this
7 spirit that I rise today to speak on several
8 urgent matters before this board.

9 First, I want to highlight the
10 importance of permanent leadership on this
11 board. Interim members, while serving
12 diligently, cannot replace the stability and
13 continuity that permanent chairs provide.
14 Individuals such as Arva Rice and Dr. Khalid,
15 Mohammad have served this board for extended
16 periods, and it is crucial that we recognize
17 the need for consistent committed leadership
18 to guide the Board effectively. I'm gravely
19 troubled by the recent removal of Public
20 Advocate Esmeralda Simmons from this board.
21 Her expertise, perspective, and dedication
22 have been invaluable, and her absence leaves
23 a gap in our collective oversight and
24 accountability.

25 Finally, I want to emphasize the urgent

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 need for partnership with the Mayor's Office
2 to address gender-based and domestic-based
3 violence in our city. It is unacceptable
4 that individuals -- mothers, fathers, and
5 other community members are subjected to
6 harmful tactics, such as the use of Tasers in
7 situations involving mental health crisis or
8 domestic violence. We must work together to
9 restore humanity, dignity, and safety in
10 these responses, ensuring that reinforcement
11 and protection prioritize care and
12 deescalation rather than harm.

13 Let us honor Dr. Martin Luther King
14 Jr.'s legacy by advancing justice, protecting
15 vulnerable communities, and ensuring that our
16 community oversight mechanisms are strong,
17 equitable, and rooted in compassion.

18 And I have one last question: Where
19 are the women on this board? What happened?
20 We get a new year and no women on the board.
21 Last year, I recommended that there be a
22 domestic violence liaison on this board that
23 could liaison with the Mayor's Office to end
24 gender and domestic-based violence, and I
25 don't see a single person on this board that

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 represents in that capacity, so I would like
2 to see that happen this year.

3 Thank you.

4 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you. I
5 would suggest you reach out to the City
6 Council speaker who has two appointments to
7 make to this board. Thank you.

8 Next speaker.

9 MR. DARCHE: Can I just add one thing?

10 Ms. Moss, either I or someone from the
11 executive team will reach out to the Mayor's
12 Office to end gender and domestic violence.
13 And your point about establishing a
14 relationship with them is well noted, and we
15 will follow up on it.

16 MR. DWYER: May I just add one thing?

17 I think all of us held Esmeralda in the
18 highest regard, and just for a nuance around
19 the historical record, you know, after
20 serving for a long time, she chose to do
21 other things. And just because you used the
22 word, "removal," I wouldn't want the minutes
23 to show forever that she was somehow removed
24 from the Board. She very much on her own
25 decided to move on.

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

22

1 MR. DARCHE: And June Northern is still
2 on the Board, but Ms. Northern could not be
3 here today, and Ms. Crawford is on family
4 leave.

5 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Ms. Crawford is
6 on family leave, Arva Rice resigned from the
7 Board, and Charlane Brown resigned from the
8 Board, so it's not for lack of trying.

9 Sir.

10 MR. MEYERS: I'm Michael Meyers. I'm
11 the president of New York Civil Rights
12 Coalition. I'm going to try and stay within
13 my four minutes, Mr. Executive Director.

14 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: I appreciate
15 that.

16 MR. MEYERS: I have to ask again, where
17 is the Police Commissioner? I'm assuming
18 that an invitation has been given to her to
19 come to this meeting to meet you face-to-face
20 and to meet members of the public who have
21 been waiting months, months for her to come.
22 Because the first thing she did as she was
23 appointed police commissioner, she said, "Oh,
24 I know Jonathan. Oh, I know the chair of the
25 CCRB, and I want to go to the meetings," but

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 I haven't seen her. And why not?

2 Has an invitation been sent to her from
3 either the Chair or the members of this board
4 or the executive director? If you sent an
5 invitation to the Police Commissioner to come
6 to this meeting, I want to see it. I want a
7 copy because I'm going to be writing to her
8 soon, and I want to make sure that I have the
9 facts. So, if you have invited her and she
10 has not responded or will not show up, I need
11 to know that immediately.

12 I agree with Ms. Moss, but I know where
13 the women are. I fought with Esmeralda
14 Simmons last month not to resign. When she
15 announced that she was resigning, I said,
16 "Please don't do that. We need you on this
17 board, especially you, Esmeralda," but I
18 couldn't convince her to stay on the Board.
19 Now, having said that, there are plenty of
20 women in the City of New York who can serve
21 on the Board of the CCRB, plenty. All of
22 them who are prominent, well-known,
23 well-spoken, intelligent people who can serve
24 diligently as members of the CCRB Board. And
25 everybody in elective office know who they

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 are. Why they haven't appointed them is
2 beyond me. I don't understand it.

3 I don't understand the new mayor that
4 he hasn't appointed the chair of the CCRB
5 yet. What are you waiting for, Mr. Mayor?
6 We need a full board, a CCRB that is full.
7 We don't need people saying we can't have a
8 meeting because we don't have a quorum. We
9 can't have a panel because we don't have
10 enough members. What kind of nonsense is
11 this? This is New York City, the largest
12 police department, I understand, in the
13 country. And we have a police commissioner
14 who says she wants to do the right thing.
15 I'm waiting to see it. I haven't seen it,
16 but I'm waiting.

17 And I want you to invite her formally
18 to this meeting. And I want to see either
19 her declination to come or her resignation,
20 because we need a police commissioner who is
21 accountable to the public. And if she's not
22 going to come to meetings, this is my
23 judgment, she's not accountable to the
24 public. I can't even see my own handwriting.
25 My eyeglass is so bad.

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

25

1 Now, the Mayor is supposed to appoint
2 the chair of the committee. We need a
3 permanent chair. I agree that the people who
4 were chairs were good chairs, and one of
5 them, the last one, was pushed out. I say,
6 "pushed out," because he resigned in
7 frustration. That's an embarrassment, and I
8 urge every member of this board to come to
9 his aid, to write to the Mayor, to urge the
10 Mayor not to accept his resignation. The guy
11 was a good chair.

12 Now, if we can't support the people who
13 are with us, the people we like, and the
14 people who they like you, who the hell is
15 going to support anybody on the CCRB board?

16 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Mr. Meyers, can
17 you conclude, please.

18 MR. MEYERS: I'm going to conclude.

19 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

20 MR. MEYERS: I must say I don't
21 understand this report. And as far as the
22 Bronx vacancy, I'm not a member of the Bronx.
23 I'm a member of Manhattan. But four years,
24 that's ridiculous. Why haven't you demanded
25 the person who appoints the people to the

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 board that I have a Bronx representative? I
2 don't understand that. I just don't
3 understand it.

4 Now, going back to your report, I have
5 to 'cause my time is up. Page 31,
6 Mr. Executive Director, and page 32, I see
7 formalized training, 97; and disciplinary
8 action, total of 245. No explanations.
9 Formalized training, what the hell is that?
10 Aren't people training when they go to the
11 Police Academy? How much training do they
12 need? Now, this is formalized training for
13 people who have been offensive, who have not
14 done their jobs right, who have been abusive.
15 What's that formalized training about? And
16 who makes that decision, the so-called police
17 commissioner?

18 And on page 32, I see Command
19 Discipline, 197; and Command Discipline B,
20 197; Command Discipline A, 432. What the
21 hell is command discipline? And who makes
22 that decision? And does that mean the police
23 commissioner is following your advice, your
24 guidance? Or is she going doing something on
25 her own as police commissioner? I want to

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 know who this police commissioner is.

2 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Mr. Meyers, thank
3 you. Jonathan Darche will answer your
4 questions now. Thank you very much.

5 MR. MEYERS: Yes.

6 MR. DARCHE: A Schedule A Command
7 Discipline and a Schedule B Command
8 Discipline are shortcuts to the full
9 disciplinary process that have been
10 negotiated between the police unions and the
11 New York City Police Department. The terms
12 of a Command Discipline A are a member of
13 service can have a penalty between a
14 reprimand and forfeiture of five vacation
15 days. And after a year, the Schedule A
16 Command Discipline comes off their record.

17 With regard to a Schedule B Command
18 Discipline, the command discipline stays on
19 their record for at least three years. After
20 three years, the member of service can ask
21 the Department to remove it from their
22 record, and then it's up to the Department's
23 discretion whether or not they leave it on
24 the member of service's disciplinary history.
25 And they can have a penalty between a

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 reprimand and forfeiture of ten vacation
2 days.

3 The formalized training is training
4 about the misconduct that was committed by
5 the member of service. The way that the
6 Agency chooses what discipline to recommend
7 for each member of service is based on the
8 New York City Police Department's discipline
9 matrix, which lays out mitigated,
10 presumptive, and aggravated penalties for all
11 of the allegations that the CCRB
12 investigates. And if you could just hold on
13 one second, I have the discipline notes right
14 here.

15 So, in 2025, the discipline rate for
16 all cases was -- the discipline rate for the
17 APU was 76 percent, approximately, which
18 means that in 76 percent of the
19 Administrative Prosecution Unit's cases that
20 were closed in 2025 resulted in discipline
21 for the member of service. That is up from
22 73 percent in 2023 and 2024. In 2025 when
23 the CCRB recommended non-charges discipline,
24 so formalized training, command discipline,
25 or -- formalized training or either type of

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

29

1 command discipline, the police department
2 disciplined those officers 85 percent of the
3 time. That is up from 57 percent in 2023 and
4 27 percent in 2024.

5 MR. MEYERS: Now, my other question.

6 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Can you explain
7 who decides discipline.

8 MR. DARCHE: So, when the CCRB
9 recommends discipline, we use the discipline
10 matrix. The Police Commissioner is the final
11 arbiter of all matters of discipline for the
12 NYPD.

13 MR. MEYERS: My other question, have
14 you asked the Police Commissioner to come to
15 meet with the Board?

16 MR. DARCHE: No, we have not,
17 Mr. Meyers.

18 MR. MEYERS: But what happened?

19 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Meyers, your
20 four minutes.

21 MR. MEYERS: These were my questions.

22 MR. DARCHE: Yes, but I answered the
23 question.

24 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: It's something
25 for the Board to consider, and we are still

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

30

1 feeling our way. I'm still feeling my way.

2 Thank you.

3 MR. MEYERS: This is unbelievable. Why
4 can't you ask the Police Commissioner to come
5 to your meetings?

6 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: We're done.

7 Thank you.

8 Do we have anybody else who would like
9 to speak?

10 MR. CASE: Hi, good afternoon. Andrew
11 Case, supervising attorney at LatinoJustice
12 PRLDEF, he/him pronouns. Welcome to a new
13 year, Chair Smith, members of the Board. As
14 you say, it's a great moment for -- welcome
15 to New York. It has been waiting for you.

16 I think it's great to talk about
17 improving the quality of the investigations,
18 but I will say the investigations conducted
19 by this agency are of extremely high quality.
20 I have the opportunity at the NYPD
21 monitorship to see investigations from the
22 Internal Affairs Department of the NYPD and
23 from this agency, and these investigations
24 are of much higher quality than those
25 conducted by Internal Affairs. But anything

1 can always be improved.

2 The one thing I would say is not
3 something that needs to be improved about
4 CCRB investigative -- investigations is the
5 threat of bias by the investigators as
6 alleged by the NYPD unions. And I just want
7 to contextualize all of this. In terms of
8 politics in the City and policing and so on,
9 you're a very, very important agency. But in
10 terms of structure and what's actually going
11 on here is that you are the HR department,
12 right?

13 You're the guys that go and look into
14 it when somebody says there's a problem with
15 someone at the job. And the unions never
16 like the HR department. Okay? The union --
17 the auto workers do not like the HR
18 department at Ford and GM. My sister is a
19 New York City public high school teacher, and
20 her union does not like the special
21 investigator for the New York City public
22 schools in the DOI, and they didn't like him
23 even when he was Richard Condon who was a man
24 of great integrity, a man who had no bias in
25 him whatsoever, who is a former member of

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 this board, a former police designee to this
2 board, a former commissioner of the New York
3 Police Department, lest anyone think that I
4 am biased against people because they work
5 for the police or because their police
6 commissioner, Richard Condon, was one of the
7 great members of this board and a very
8 thoughtful and unbiased man.

9 But what I will say is I absolutely
10 agree that the lag between the time the
11 investigation is closed by this agency and
12 the time this board has the ability to rule
13 on it -- five months is I think what I
14 heard -- is absolutely unacceptable. The
15 LatinoJustice is on the record saying that we
16 do not believe that this board is require to
17 review cases that are closed by this agency.
18 There is an Administrative Prosecution Unit.
19 These cases are tested at trial, at hearings.

20 And the process of having the board
21 review cases dates from when the board was a
22 board of civilians created by John Lindsay in
23 1967 because the investigations were done by
24 police officers, and there was concerns that
25 the investigations were biased in favor of

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1 the police and needed civilians to look at
2 them. We don't need civilians to look at the
3 investigations now. We don't need the Board
4 to slow down the investigations now. This
5 was a debate 20 years ago at the CCRB, and
6 the question is whether when the Board can
7 hear, review, investigate, and make findings
8 on cases. It's already delegated hearing,
9 it's delegated reviewing, it's delegated
10 investigating. Can it delegate and make
11 findings on it? It certainly can. And even
12 if this board doesn't want to delegate making
13 findings on cases to the investigators in all
14 cases, 64 percent of the cases in 2025 were
15 closed as unable to investigate.

16 And I don't know if you all still read
17 those cases and vote on them, but they did
18 20 years ago, and that's a total waste of
19 time. Once the Board has determined this
20 case is out of our jurisdiction, this person
21 has withdrawn their complaint, this person
22 has done that, I'll bet even though you
23 disagree about the merits in other cases, you
24 don't disagree about those, and you'd save
25 yourselves a ton of time by deferring those

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

34

1 to the Agency.

2 Thank you.

3 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Thank you very
4 much. Perfect timing, sir.

5 Do we have any other public comment for
6 the Board?

7 (No response).

8 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: We move on to old
9 business.

10 Is there any old business before this
11 board?

12 (No response).

13 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: We move on to new
14 business.

15 Is there any new business before this
16 board?

17 (No response).

18 INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Well, then,
19 hearing none, I'm going to move now that we
20 break into Executive Session. The agenda for
21 Executive Session is the executive director
22 will discuss pending personnel action, and
23 the general counsel will provide updates
24 regarding pending litigation.

25 Do we have a motion to adjourn to

In Re January Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
January 14, 2026

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Executive Session?

MR. HOGAN: So moved.

INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Do we have a
second?

MR. MERRITT: Second.

INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: All those in
favor?

(Hands raised).

INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Any opposed?
(No response).

INTERIM CHAIR SMITH: Okay. Thank you
very much, everyone. See you next month.

(TIME NOTED: 4:39 p.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness whose examination is hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn and that such an examination is a true record of the testimony given by such a witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of these parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am not in any way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand on this 25th day of January, 2026.

Sabrina Brown Stewart
Sabrina Brown Stewart