

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

1 -----X

2 CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

3 PUBLIC MEETING

4 December 10, 2025

5 4:05 p.m.

6 -----X

7 HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE/
8 100 Church Street, 10th Floor
9 New York, New York 10007

10

11

12

B E F O R E:

13

PATRICK SMITH - INTERIM CHAIR

14

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ. - EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

15

16

17

18

COURT REPORTER:
Sabrina Brown Stewart

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

2

- 1 PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA
- 2 =====
- 3 1. Call to Order
- 4 2. Adoption of Minutes
- 5 3. Remarks from the Interim Chair
- 6 4. Remarks from the Executive Director
- 7 5. Presentation from the Outreach Department
- 8 6. Public Comment
- 9 7. Old Business
- 10 8. New Business
- 11 9. Adjourn to Executive Session
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

3

1 CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 =====

3 1. Patrick Smith - Interim Chair

4 2. Rahul Agarwal - Board Member

5 3. AU Hogan - Board Member

6 4. John Siegal, Esq. - Board Member

7 5. Herman Merritt - Board Member

8 6. Joseph Fox - Board Member

9 7. Joseph A. Puma - Board Member

10 8. Frank Dwyer - Board Member

11 9. June Northern - Board Member

12 10. Esmeralda Simmons, Esq. - Board Member

13 11. Kevin McGinn - Board Member

14

15 PRESENTER:

16 JAHl ROSE - Director of Public Engagement and
17 Partnerships

18 NYC Civilian Complaint Review Board

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

4

1	S P E A K E R:	
2	=====	
3	JENNIFER OCHOA - Queens Community Board 4.....	21
4	ANDREW CASE - Supervising Attorney	
5	LatinoJustice PRLDEF.....	23
6	MICHAEL MEYERS - President, New York Civil Rights	
7	Coalition.....	26
8	WES MAHONEY - New York Civil Liberties Union.....	31
9	NICK PINTO - Journalist, Hell Gate.....	33
10	HARRY MENA - Sunset Park Railroad.....	36
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

5

1 MS. ALVAREZ: Good evening, everyone.
2 Thank you so much for joining us. For those
3 utilizing ASL Interpretation Services, our
4 two interpreters today are Nathaniel
5 Langerman and Andria Lamberton. Instructions
6 on how to pin their video can be found in the
7 chat. For those utilizing CART closed
8 captioning services, a link to the streaming
9 service is provided in the chat as well.

10 Thank you so much.

11 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you, Yojaira.

12 Good afternoon, members of the public,
13 CCRB staff, and colleagues. I'm Pat Smith.
14 I'm mayoral appointee to the CCRB, named by
15 the mayor just this week as acting chair. On
16 my left is Jonathan Darche, executive
17 director of the CCRB. I would like to call
18 the CCRB's December board meeting to order.
19 Joining us is Kevin McGinn, the new board
20 member designated by the Police Commissioner.

21 Kevin, welcome. Can you please
22 introduce yourself.

23 MR. MCGINN: Good evening. My name is
24 Kevin McGinn. I've been appointed by the
25 Police Commissioner. It's an honor to be

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

6

1 here. A little bit about myself: I'm a
2 retired deputy inspector from the New York
3 City Police Department. I did 20 years. I'm
4 retired out of the 63 Precinct in Brooklyn,
5 and actually, Joe Fox was my chief when I
6 retired. He was my boss. So, I'm happy to
7 be here. I live in Staten Island. I'm a
8 lifelong New Yorker, lifelong Staten
9 Islander. My parents are actually native
10 Staten Islanders, which is rare these days.
11 So, it's a pleasure to be here. I'm excited
12 for this new adventure in my life, and thank
13 you for having me.

14 CHAIR SMITH: Also, is Esmeralda
15 Simmons, and this is her last meeting after
16 five years of very dedicated and profound
17 service with the CCRB.

18 Esmeralda, do you want to share a
19 little wisdom on your way out the door?

20 MS. SIMMONS: The CCRB is an extremely
21 important public agency. It's been my honor
22 and pleasure to serve on the Board. I have
23 been an advocate for this agency throughout my
24 entire career. And, therefore, it was truly a
25 culmination of that support for me to

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

7

1 serve as a board member. I will continue to
2 be a friend of the CCRB and advocate for its
3 ability to have final adjudicatory powers.

4 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you, Esmeralda.
5 Do we have a motion to commend Esmeralda for
6 five years of service?

7 MS. NORTHERN: So moved.

8 CHAIR SMITH: Do we have a second?

9 MR. HOGAN: No.

10 (Laughter).

11 CHAIR SMITH: And all those in favor.

12 (Chorus of ayes).

13 CHAIR SMITH: Motion carries. Thank you,
14 Esmeralda.

15 Will the other board members please
16 introduce themselves, starting with Joe.

17 MR. FOX: Joe Fox, police commissioner
18 designee.

19 MR. MERRITT: Herman Merritt, City
20 Council designee from Brooklyn.

21 MR. DARCHE: Jon Darche, executive
22 director.

23 MS. NORTHERN: June Northern, mayoral
24 appointee from Brooklyn.

25 MR. HOGAN: AU Hogan, City Council

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

8

1 designee from Queens, District 28.

2 CHAIR SMITH: And we have board members
3 on the screen. Can you introduce yourself,
4 please. Make sure you are unmuted.

5 MR. AGARWAL: Rahul Agarwal, mayoral
6 appointee.

7 MR. SIEGAL: And John Siegal. I'm a
8 mayoral appointee.

9 Let me just say I only met Esmeralda
10 Simmons when she joined this board and we've
11 been colleagues, but I've known her name for
12 a very long time, and I learned a great deal
13 from working with her on this board, and saw
14 the way that she was vigilant both about
15 investigating and making recommendations on
16 the disciplinary issues that we face, while
17 always being adamant about the fairness and
18 propriety of the process to those accused of
19 disciplinary infractions. So, I think she's
20 really been a model board member, and I know
21 I and others will miss her.

22 CHAIR SMITH : Thank you, John.

23 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you, John.

24 CHAIR SMITH: We turn to the minutes.

25 Are there any changes or corrections to

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

9

1 the November minutes?

2 MR. DARCHE: Is Joe Puma online?

3 CHAIR SMITH: No.

4 SPEAKER: He just got downgraded, but I
5 think he's trying to call back.

6 CHAIR SMITH: Okay.

7 MS. SIMMONS: Just got downgraded.

8 CHAIR SMITH: Joseph Puma, you with us?
9 (No response).

10 CHAIR SMITH: Naqi's got a thumbs up.
11 Joseph, are you with us?

12 MR. PUMA: Yes. Good afternoon. I'm
13 trying to get on camera here. There was a
14 technical problem. Hello, there I am.

15 Good afternoon, everyone. I'm Joseph
16 Puma, Manhattan City Council designee to the
17 board. Welcome, to Mr. McGinn, and a very
18 fond farewell to Esmeralda Simmons. I will
19 certainly miss working with you.

20 CHAIR SMITH: Joseph, thank you.

21 And Rahul, did we get you before on
22 screen?

23 MR. AGARWAL: Yes, you did.

24 CHAIR SMITH: I get old and stupid
25 sometimes, Rahul. Thank you. All right.

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

10

1 Let's turn to the minutes.

2 Are there any changes or corrections to
3 the November minutes?

4 MR. DARCHE: So, Mr. Chair, I believe
5 that we are now down to seven people in the
6 room, and they're the only ones who can vote,
7 so I think we should table the minutes until
8 next month.

9 CHAIR SMITH: Okay. Is there a motion to
10 table the minutes?

11 MS. SIMMONS: So moved.

12 CHAIR SMITH: Second?

13 MS. NORTHERN: Aye.

14 CHAIR SMITH: Any opposition?

15 (No response).

16 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you. The minutes are
17 tabled. Okay. And now, you got to hear from
18 me, unfortunately.

19 We come to the closing of the year and
20 wait with excitement, curiosity, high hopes,
21 and best wishes for the start of a new
22 mayoral administration. Be assured, however,
23 that the work that the New York City Civilian
24 Complaint Review Board, assuring
25 accountability with justice for the dedicated

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

11

1 men and women of the New York Police
2 Department will continue in earnest. Thanks
3 to the work of Jon Darche and his dedicated
4 staff, the New York CCRB is the goal standard
5 against which police review boards across the
6 nation are measured. We will maintain that
7 standard and make it better. We will work to
8 increase mutual respect between two groups of
9 men and women dedicated to serving the
10 people, the CCRB and NYPD.

11 Under our former interim chair,
12 Dr. Mohammad Khalid, this board has been
13 discussing, for a year, ways to improve on
14 the important work of our predecessors.
15 Later in this meeting, we will present a
16 proposal that moves these discussions into
17 action. Allow me to wish you all best of the
18 holiday season and to say, God bless us,
19 everyone. Now, it is my honor to introduce
20 the Executive Director, Jon Darche.

21 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Chair, if we could
22 also -- I think Mr. Dwyer snuck in. If we
23 could --

24 CHAIR SMITH: Oh, okay. Frank Dwyer,
25 can you --

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

12

1 MR. DWYER: I'm Frank Dwyer. I'm a
2 police commissioner designee.

3 CHAIR SMITH: Okay. And if I may, now
4 that we have a quorum of eight members, do we
5 have any changes or corrections to the
6 November minutes?

7 (No response).

8 CHAIR SMITH: Do we have a motion to
9 approve the minutes?

10 MS. NORTHERN: So moved.

11 MS. SIMMONS: Second.

12 CHAIR SMITH: Okay. All in favor.
13 (Chorus of ayes).

14 CHAIR SMITH: All right. Thank you.
15 The minutes are approved. Now, we go to our
16 executive director.

17 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Smith.

18 My name is Jon Darche. I use he/him
19 pronouns, and I'm the executive director of
20 the CCRB. I want to congratulate Pat Smith
21 on his appointment as interim chair. I'm
22 looking forward to working with you in this
23 new capacity as you take lead of the Agency.
24 I also want to take a moment to acknowledge a
25 departure from our board. Esmeralda Simmons

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

13

1 was the Public Advocate's first designee to
2 the Board. Esmeralda has long been a strong
3 advocate for police oversight. She's an
4 accomplished lawyer and a dedicated public
5 servant. Speaking personally, I've truly
6 valued your counsel and your guidance in the
7 time you've been with us. I think I speak
8 for all of us when I say we wish you the best
9 in what's next.

10 As the Chair mentioned, this time of
11 year always invite some reflection, and I am
12 pleased with what the CCRB has accomplished
13 over the past twelve months. In testimony to
14 the City Council earlier this year, the
15 Agency requested an increase to our budget,
16 as well as a 150-position increase in our
17 authorized head count. Though we received
18 only \$1.2 million of the \$16 million that we
19 requested and an increase of 20 positions, we
20 remain thankful for this additional support
21 and what it represents for our agency's
22 ability to fulfill its duties.

23 While it is true we cannot eliminate
24 the Strategic Resource Allocation
25 Determination policy or SRAD, without full

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

14

1 funding of the Agency, the new funding has
2 allowed us to revise the policy. After a
3 thorough review, the Agency will eliminate
4 forcible removal allegations from the list of
5 allegations closed under SRAD, effective
6 January 1st. I want to thank the entire
7 investigations unit for all the diligent work
8 they do. Our Administrative Prosecution Unit
9 has also been hard at work this year. It
10 closed 291 cases in 2025 so far and have
11 conducted 29 trials. They've also welcomed
12 several new prosecutors to the unit, which
13 will help further streamline the group's
14 efforts in 2026.

15 This year saw the CCRB become an even
16 more robust partner in the nationwide police
17 oversight community. In May, we were proud
18 to host a regional meeting alongside the
19 National Association for Civilian Oversight
20 of Law Enforcement, or NACOLE. At this
21 convening, oversight practitioners, community
22 members, and others engaged in discussions,
23 training, and networking regarding the
24 civilian oversight of law enforcement. In
25 October, I led a delegation to the NACOLE

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

15

1 annual conference in Minneapolis where we
2 further engaged with police oversight leaders
3 from across the country. It was there that
4 our own Yojaira Alvarez was elected to the
5 organization's board of directors.

6 But our most valuable work was done
7 here in our city, connecting with and working
8 on behalf of all New Yorkers. So far, we've
9 received over 5,200 complaints in 2025 alone.
10 That's roughly fifteen a day, for an agency
11 with a staff of approximately 250 people.
12 I'm grateful for each and every one of them
13 for the hard work they do, whether it's
14 investigating those complaints or supporting
15 the work of our agency in other ways.

16 Our outreach unit has conducted 866
17 events across all five boroughs, connecting
18 with New Yorkers of all ages to explain how
19 the CCRB does its work and how affected
20 individuals can file a complaint. These
21 face-to-face interactions help demystify our
22 agency and build a stronger relationship with
23 communities throughout the City. We deepened
24 our connection with the youth of New York
25 City through both our Youth Advisory Council

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

16

1 and our internship program. These efforts
2 included pilot programs for a new video
3 series and a new podcast. We're thankful for
4 the community partners who supported this
5 youth engagement, like the Best Buy tech
6 team, Grand Street Settlement, and Chase
7 Bank.

8 As a reminder, applications for the
9 next Youth Advisory Council cohort are open
10 to all New Yorkers ages ten through eighteen
11 until December 31st. As you can see, we've
12 accomplished a lot in 2025, and there's so
13 much more I don't have time to specifically
14 acknowledge here, from our working group
15 focused on building a trauma-informed agency,
16 to our civilian assistance unit, to our
17 administrative and support staff, and so many
18 others.

19 It's true, 2025 hasn't been without its
20 challenges or difficulties, but the CCRB
21 remains committed to working on behalf of all
22 New Yorkers, to investigate complaints of
23 police misconduct. It is my hope that all of
24 our staff are proud of the work they've done
25 this year, and I look forward to continuing

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

17

1 that effort in 2026.

2 As a reminder, our office is open for
3 walk-in complaints, but it is also possible
4 to file complaints online at nyc.gov/CCRB
5 complaint, by telephone at 1(800)341-2272 or
6 by dialing 3-1-1, or on social media by
7 tagging the Agency on Twitter, Facebook, and
8 Instagram. For those wishing to speak during
9 the public comment section of today's
10 meeting, we ask that you keep your questions
11 and comments to four minutes.

12 If anyone wishes to file a complaint
13 right now, we have two investigators on hand
14 ready to take any new complaints. The
15 investigators on call this afternoon are Emma
16 Stydahar and Rob Bryan. Ruth Villafane is
17 also here from the Civilian Assistance Unit.
18 Thank you all for your presence here today.
19 And we'll now move on to our board's formal
20 business.

21 CHAIR SMITH: Jon, thank you again for
22 the great work you and the staff have done in
23 2025. And now we move on to Jahi Rose of the
24 outreach unit.

25 Jahi, please.

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

18

1 MR. ROSE: Good evening. Thank you
2 very much, Chair.

3 As was mentioned, my name is Jahi Rose.
4 I go by he/him pronouns, and I'm the director
5 of public engagement and community
6 partnerships.

7 So, the Civilian Complaint Review Board
8 is the nation's largest independent oversight
9 entity over the largest police force in the
10 country. The Civilian Complaint Review Board
11 investigates, mediates, and in some cases,
12 prosecutes allegations of misconduct alleged
13 against members of the New York City Police
14 Department. The Agency is governed by a
15 15-member board, some of which you've met on
16 the dais today.

17 Five seats are appointed by the
18 New York City Mayor, five are appointed by
19 the New York City Council, three designated
20 by the Police Commissioner, one appointed by
21 the Public Advocate, and the Chair is jointly
22 appointed by the mayor and the City Council.
23 The Agency can investigate specific types of
24 allegations that includes force, abuse of
25 authority, discourtesy, and offensive

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

19

1 language.

2 As previously mentioned, there are
3 various ways to file complaints if you
4 witness or experience police misconduct.
5 That one was previously mentioned was going
6 to our agency's website, which is
7 nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint. You could also call
8 the Agency's hotline at 1(800)341-CCRB or
9 1(800)341-2272. Remember, if you see footage
10 of misconduct on social media or on the news,
11 you could feel free to file a complaint, even
12 if you were not there in person.

13 Other ways to file complaints include
14 calling 3-1-1. You could also come to the
15 Agency's building in person. The
16 headquarters is 100 Church Street on the 10th
17 Floor in Lower Manhattan. You could also
18 direct message or DM the CCRB on our social
19 media platforms, which include Facebook,
20 Twitter or X, and Instagram. The typical
21 handle is @CCRB_NYC, or you could also send a
22 letter to the Agency to 100 Church Street,
23 10th Floor, New York, New York, ZIP code
24 10007.

25 You could also file a complaint in

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

20

1 person at a local police precinct. It does
2 not have to be the precinct within the
3 confines of where the interaction may have
4 taken place. Officers are required to accept
5 CCRB complaints in the building. If you do
6 not feel comfortable leaving that complaint
7 there, you could feel free to request a
8 complaint form and a self-addressed envelope
9 postage-free, and you can mail that complaint
10 directly to the Agency.

11 As mentioned, the CCRB has a Youth
12 Advisory Council. The applications are live.

13 The CCRB's Youth Advisory Council are a
14 group of young people that have a committee.
15 They are young leaders throughout the City of
16 New York that are committed to criminal
17 justice issues and improving policy and
18 community relations. Applications are open
19 to all young people between the ages of ten
20 and eighteen that live within the five
21 boroughs. The deadline is December 31st. If
22 you do have any questions about the
23 application process or the YAC, feel free to
24 e-mail the YAC at yac@ccrb.nyc.gov.

25 If you would like to request an

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

21

1 outreach presentation, feel free to send an
2 e-mail to the outreach unit at
3 outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov. Feel free, also, to
4 follow us on our social media platforms,
5 which includes Instagram, Twitter or X, and
6 Facebook. Thank you.

7 CHAIR SMITH: Jahi, thank you very
8 much. Do we have any questions for Jahi?
9 (No response).

10 CHAIR SMITH: We will now enter the
11 public comment portion of the meeting. We
12 will begin with those joining us virtually who
13 would like to make a comment, followed by
14 those who are joining us in person. For those
15 joining personally, please use the raise-your-
16 hand feature. Please keep your comments to
17 four minutes. Thank you.

18 Yojaira, would you please call on the
19 first person.

20 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair.

21 First, we'll be hearing from Jennifer
22 Ochoa.

23 CHAIR SMITH: Unmute, please.

24 MS. OCHOA: Thank you.

25 Hi. My name is Jennifer Ochoa. I'm a

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

22

1 member of the Queens Community Board 4. I
2 just wanted to get some information as to how
3 we can get someone on the CCRB to come and do
4 a presentation at one of our board meetings,
5 so we can invite the community and they can
6 be more informed of all the changes that are
7 upcoming with the new administration.

8 Thank you.

9 MR. DARCHE: Ms. Ochoa, if you hang
10 online, someone from our team will get your
11 contact information, and we'll be happy to
12 reach out and -- probably in Community Board
13 4 I will go to say hi.

14 (Laughter).

15 MS. OCHOA: Thank you so much.

16 CHAIR SMITH: All right. Thank you.
17 We have another speaker, Yojaira?

18 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair. I just
19 want to give folks a couple more seconds.

20 (Whereupon, there was a brief
21 pause in the proceedings.)

22 MS. ALVAREZ: Looks like that concludes
23 our virtual public session.

24 CHAIR SMITH: All right. Thank you
25 very much.

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

23

1 For those joining us in person and are
2 interested in making public comment, please
3 line up behind the podium, and please keep
4 your comments to four minutes.

5 Thank you.

6 MR. CASE: Hi, everyone. I'm Andrew
7 Case, supervising attorney for police and
8 prisons at LatinoJustice PRLDEF.

9 First, I want to congratulate
10 Ms. Simmons for your service. And not just
11 for the service that you have done on this
12 board, but for what your service on this
13 board represents. Because five years ago,
14 the people of the City of New York amended
15 the City Charter to provide that the Public
16 Advocate can name someone to this board.
17 When I worked at this board in 2003 to 2008,
18 every single member of this board was
19 appointed by the mayor. The City Council
20 could nominate members. The police
21 commissioner could nominate members. But the
22 mayor approved every single member.

23 And there is one time in this board's
24 history in which the mayor refused to approve
25 a nominee who had been put forward by one of

1 the constituent groups, and that was when
2 Iris Baez, the mother of Anthony Baez who was
3 killed by the NYPD, was named to this board
4 by the Bronx delegation, and Mayor Rudy
5 Giuliani denied her a seat on this board.
6 And the fact that the City of New York,
7 through its people in 1999, broadened the
8 representation of this board to ensure the
9 City Council members could not be vetoed by
10 the mayor, and the Public Advocate would have
11 a voice, and even the police commissioner's
12 nominees could not be vetoed by the mayor, is
13 a huge step forward, even for those of us who
14 might think that some future mayor of the
15 City of New York might be appropriately
16 nominating every member of this board. Those
17 of you who were nominated by this mayor might
18 not like the next mayor and vice-versa.
19 Every constituent group gets a voice.

20 I want to congratulate you, Mr. Smith,
21 on being named the Chair. And I am hopeful
22 that now you will take this role and build
23 consensus on this board, because this board
24 has a major role to play in the future. This
25 board is one of the two remaining prongs of

1 the NYPD monitorship. Since 2013, the NYPD
2 has been under a federal monitorship, and
3 every report in the last couple of years has
4 made two things clear; the specialized units
5 that go out and do stop-and-frisks on the
6 street without having to respond to calls,
7 whether you call them the NST or the
8 anticrime unit or the street crime unit or
9 whatever you've called them over the years,
10 are always stopping and frisking people at
11 lower constitutional rates than people who
12 get calls and people who respond to calls.

13 And two, accountability is a major
14 issue, and the monitor is not going to let
15 the NYPD out of the monitorship until there's
16 accountability. And however much it sounds
17 like good fun to support police officers by
18 flipping cases, that's only good for the
19 planners in the monitorship, because those of
20 us who are planners in the monitorship get
21 our fees every single year. And as long as
22 the NYPD is in the monitorship, that will
23 continue to happen.

24 So, if you want to help the City of
25 New York, and you want to promote an end to

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

26

1 the monitorship, then make sure that
2 accountability comes in the future. And I'm
3 sure you will build consensus and do that
4 going forward.

5 Thank you all.

6 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Case.

7 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you, Sir. Perfect
8 timing.

9 MR. MEYERS: I'm Michael Meyers,
10 president, New York Civil Rights Coalition.

11 I heard a rumor -- it's just a rumor
12 'cause I haven't read it yet, but it might be
13 in the news papers. But I didn't hear the
14 Chair, Interim Chair, and I didn't hear the
15 executive director say what I heard, that the
16 Police Commissioner supposedly, allegedly,
17 rejected a recommendation of the CCRB board.
18 And if that's true, and I don't know if it's
19 true. But if it's true, why didn't we hear
20 from the interim chair? Why didn't we here
21 from the executive director that the Police
22 Commissioner has rejected a majority vote of
23 this board on a matter of police misconduct?
24 I just want -- I want to put that question to
25 you. 'Cause if it's true, I want to hear

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

27

1 something at this meeting today.

2 Now, you know I don't like this new
3 police commissioner. I just don't like her.
4 I don't trust her. She has lots of big mouth
5 stuff to say, and she says she knows the
6 executive director, and she knew the chair of
7 the CCRB several months ago, but she still
8 hasn't come here. She hasn't come here to
9 address the members of this board in a public
10 session.

11 As I keep telling you every month, we
12 look forward to the Police Commissioner
13 coming here, and we want to hear what she has
14 to say to you. We want to hear it. And we
15 want to know why she rejects the
16 recommendations of this panel. Why? Not
17 just to you, but we want to hear it. We want
18 to hear from her, the supposed police
19 commissioner. So, that's my question to both
20 of you, the interim chair and the executive
21 director.

22 Secondly, you know, I remember a time
23 when Al Sharpton was a militant, and he would
24 come to meetings like this. Not this
25 meeting, but he would come to the Board of

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

28

1 Education meeting in Brooklyn. And back
2 then, the people was -- they stand up on dais
3 or something high up, and Al Sharpton was
4 serious on the matter. And he went over
5 there and sat in the Chair's position, high
6 up there, and he got up on the podium and
7 said, "I'm the Chair. Meeting dismissed,
8 adjourned." We want to have those days
9 again.

10 We want to have civil rights activist
11 come here again and say, "Meeting adjourned."
12 Because you guys are not addressing the
13 issues of the day. How can there be action
14 of a police commissioner that reverses --
15 again, reportedly -- reverses a
16 recommendation, a strong recommendation, of
17 the CCRB on a matter involving police
18 misconduct and there not be any comment from
19 the interim chair, from the executive
20 director, from any of you.

21 So, maybe I'm mistaken, but I got it
22 from a reliable source. Maybe she didn't do
23 what I've heard she's done. But if she's
24 done that, I want to hear the voices. I want
25 to hear your voice in the descent. I want to

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

29

1 hear your voices saying, "What the hell are
2 you doing? You just got here. Do you really
3 want to stay as police commissioner, and in
4 so doing, disrespect the People's
5 Commission?"

6 Finally, to Esmeralda. I respect you,
7 you know that, almost love you.

8 (Laughter).

9 MR. MEYERS: I don't know why the hell
10 you're leaving. I didn't realize there was a
11 term limit. So, in your announcement, nobody
12 said that you resigned voluntarily or the
13 Public Advocate want --

14 MS. SIMMONS: I resigned voluntarily.

15 MR. MEYERS: Okay. That the Public
16 Advocate doesn't want you on the committee
17 anymore, but this is not the time to resign.
18 This is not the time to resign, Esmeralda.
19 We need voices like yours on this panel. Let
20 the Public Advocate take you off if he wants
21 that, but stay. Rescind your resignation.
22 We need strong voices here. We need the
23 people who's a representative to speak up.

24 CHAIR SMITH: Sir, please conclude. MR.

25 MEYERS: I am concluded.

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

30

1 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

2 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you very much.

3 MR. MEYERS: But answer my question.

4 MR. DARCHE: So, if you look on page 31
5 of my monthly report, there's figure 51,
6 which has NYPD discipline for adjudicated APU
7 cases, and it shows that there were four
8 cases in November of 2025 in which the Police
9 Commissioner did not impose disciplinary
10 action on an APU case. And then, if you
11 would turn to page 57 on -- or page 42,
12 figure 57, it lists the four cases that had
13 the discipline -- had no discipline imposed.
14 And then, if you look at page --

15 MR. MEYERS: (Inaudible).

16 MR. DARCHE: So, that is oversight on
17 our part, and we'll give you the report. And
18 in figure 52 has the NYPD impose for non-APU
19 cases, and it looks like there were eight
20 cases closed with no disciplinary action.
21 But there was no effort to hide it. It was
22 all in the report, and I'm sure that we will
23 get you a copy of the report forthwith. If I
24 have to give you mine, I will.

25 MR. MEYERS: You had all these people

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

31

1 in here, in this room, a couple of months
2 ago.

3 Was that one of the cases that she
4 rejected?

5 MS. SIMMONS: No.

6 MR. DARCHE: Which -- which --

7 CHAIR SMITH: The Win Rozario case.

8 MS. SIMMONS: No.

9 CHAIR SMITH: That has not come to trial
10 yet.

11 MR. DARCHE: So, the Win Rozario case
12 has not come to trial.

13 Are you talking about the Isaacs case?

14 MR. MEYERS: Yes.

15 MR. DARCHE: So, we had a very lengthy
16 conversation about the Isaacs case last
17 month. And the Police Commissioner hasn't
18 made a decision in the Isaacs case. That is
19 still pending.

20 MR. MEYERS: Thank you.

21 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

22 MR. MAHONEY: Hello. My name is Wes.
23 I'm here --

24 MS. SIMMONS: Sorry. Your last name
25 is?

1 MR. MAHONEY: Mahoney.

2 I'm here on behalf of the New York
3 Civil Liberties Union. The NYCLU would like
4 to raise a concern with and ask a question
5 about the November 2025 case resolution data.
6 Specifically, it appears that only 15 percent
7 of cases closed in November 2025 were fully
8 investigated, which would be a multiyear low,
9 and notably below the previous norm. The
10 previous low of the past four years was
11 23 percent back in January 2024. And monthly
12 investigation rates seem to typically range
13 between 30 and 50 percent.

14 For instance, in the immediately
15 preceding month, October 2025, 48 percent of
16 all cases closed received a full
17 investigation. In November 2024, so this
18 time last year, 33 percent of cases received
19 full investigation. Correspondingly,
20 78 percent of November 2025 cases were
21 resolved as unable to investigate or
22 withdrawn. That seems to be a multiyear high
23 as well. I was hoping the Board could
24 provide some insight on any factors that
25 might be driving the shift in case resolution

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

33

1 patterns, and if you see them as temporary or
2 liking to continue moving forward.

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

5 Jon, please handle --

6 MR. DARCHE: So, there were several
7 panels that were scheduled to meet during
8 November that had to be rescheduled, that
9 caused a temporary shift in the numbers. But
10 I think if you look at the overall trends,
11 they should return to normal going forward.
12 And the addition of a new board member
13 will -- Kevin, I forgot your last name.

14 MR. MCGINN: McGinn.

15 MR. DARCHE: Mr. McGinn should also
16 help process cases faster, and certainly more
17 of them in the coming months.

18 CHAIR SMITH: If I might address, also,
19 we are short two board members because the New
20 York City Council has not named all five
21 members it's allowed to name. So, if you have
22 the ear of someone at the Council, speak to
23 it. Thank you.

24 Do we have any -- yes, go ahead.

25 MR. PINTO: Hi. My name is Nick Pinto.

1 I'm a reporter for Hell Gate.

2 CHAIR SMITH, I wanted to congratulate
3 you on your appointment, and I also wanted to
4 ask you, as we've reported, you've been very
5 forthright in your time on the Board about
6 your belief that too many people are lodging
7 complaints against police officers, and that
8 many of them are doing so maliciously with
9 the intent to damage the reputations of
10 officers. And you've also been part of
11 panels that have rejected investigative
12 recommendations at a very high rate, higher
13 than the historical average, sometimes as
14 much as half of investigative
15 recommendations.

16 So, given that, and given the fact that
17 you're now the interim chair, I wondered if
18 you could speak to people who might sort of
19 wonder about your philosophy of this agency
20 and its function, whether you believe in the
21 mission or whether you just have sort of a
22 different perspective on how it ought to
23 work.

24 And then, if I can just ask a second
25 question, and then I'll sit down. The second

1 question, I think is for the Board in
2 general, but Mr. Smith, if want to take it,
3 I'd welcome it.

4 Your predecessor, by all accounts, by
5 his account certainly, seems to have been,
6 basically, hounded out of office by a police
7 union campaign running attacks on him in the
8 New York Post. And so, you know, I wonder
9 how members of this board think about the
10 role of police unions in the police
11 accountability project that you're engaged
12 in, whether that was appropriate, whether
13 there's anything to be said about what has
14 happened, whether anything can be done
15 differently going forward.

16 Thank you.

17 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

18 What I said is on the record. If you
19 have questions about my case decisions, feel
20 free to take the time to review the cases on
21 which I've ruled and look at them and see
22 what you think. I believe in the mission,
23 and as I said in my opening remarks, I will
24 have a proposal to roll out at this meeting,
25 looking to improve the performance of the

1 CCRB and the PBA, the unions. I am a former
2 union organizer. I believe in unions. I
3 believe that the leaders of unions advocate
4 for their members. Let them advocate.

5 And, again, I told Dr. Khalid as he was
6 contemplating the criticism, I said, "Have a
7 thick skin." I had a thick skin facing your
8 criticism. And have a thick skin and accept
9 the fact that the police unions are going to
10 represent and protect their members. Let it
11 go. What doesn't kill you makes you
12 stronger.

13 Anybody else on the Board want to
14 address any of Mr. Pinto's questions?

15 Thank you. Yes, sir.

16 MR. MENA: Thank you. Good evening.
17 My name is Harry Mena. I'm the artistic
18 director --

19 MR. DARCHE: Excuse me, Mr. Mena.
20 Would -- John Siegal wanted to address it?

21 CHAIR SMITH: I'm sorry, John.

22 MR. SIEGAL: Let me just note for the
23 record that the criticism of Dr. Khalid was
24 unfair, unwarranted, and completely pointless,
25 will achieve nothing, and the

1 Agency's work will go forward,
2 notwithstanding how unfairly he was treated.
3 I think probably we all agree with that, but
4 certainly that's how I feel about it. I just
5 wanted to say that on the record.

6 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you, John. Sorry I
7 missed you. I'm not caught up with the 21st
8 century yet.

9 MR. MENA: Again, thank you for your
10 service. I provide my service as a community
11 artist on the Sunset Park Railroad where I
12 celebrate our elders, immigrants, and our
13 humanity with the intention of crashing
14 through walls of hatred, misogyny, and
15 bigotry. And for the last two years, I've
16 been on a campaign to keep people from
17 violating the Americans with Disability Act on
18 crosswalks and bus stops. It happens every
19 single day, all day long in my community, and
20 it's my understanding that it happens in many
21 other communities as we speak.

22 Our elders and the disabled are being
23 violated and with impunity. I have
24 photographic evidence of traffic agents and
25

1 police officers not ticketing violators. I
2 have profit being put before people -- UPS,
3 Federal Express, DHL, and even our own
4 government US Postal Service violate our
5 elders and the disabled. I, myself, have
6 been violated for documenting this --
7 traumatized, arrested, taken hostage,
8 kidnapped, put into a cell, a dirty, filthy
9 cell that should be on the human's watch
10 list. I've never been arrested before that.

11 I am in mental therapy and physical
12 therapy, and this continues to be a problem
13 in my community where I am harassed by police
14 officers for documenting their violation
15 against our elders and the disabled every
16 day, all day long. And I came here today to
17 make it very, very public, aside from the
18 videos that I've produced on social media,
19 just so that someone would listen because our
20 council member, as much as I love her, and I
21 do. I voted for her. It's an open dirty,
22 ugly secret, that our elders and the disabled
23 don't matter, that the Americans with
24 Disability Act no longer matters, that profit
25 now comes before people.

1 Please tell me, those on the Board, if
2 you would do anything about this injustice
3 that is an open dirty, ugly secret, because
4 it happens right under our noses. Traffic
5 agents refuse to ticket people parked at the
6 bus stop. I've got them saying -- doing
7 nothing, passing right by. Instead, they'll
8 park -- rather, they'll ticket a
9 double-parked car, as rightfully so. But
10 those at the bus stop, our elders and the
11 disabled matter not. And I hope that this
12 sounds as repulsive to you as it is to me.

13 Perhaps you don't live in a community
14 where your elders and the disabled are
15 violated, but I guarantee you folks, one day
16 you will be an elder. One day you will be
17 disabled, and I hope that something will be
18 done before that.

19 Thank you.

20 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you, sir. Sir, I am
21 elderly and I am disabled. This body has to
22 pass judgment on police officers who are
23 accused of misconduct. We can't address your
24 council member, and I don't think we can
25 address traffic agents, right?

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

40

1 MR. DARCHE: So, there are things
2 that -- Mr. Mena.

3 MR. MENA: They also park at the bus
4 stop.

5 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Mena, I just wanted to
6 say we have an investigator here who's -- if
7 you're willing to file a -- sorry, Rob. I
8 was looking at you when I said it.

9 So, if you could speak with him now and
10 let us know. Because we can't handle the
11 complaint until you've made the complaint.

12 MR. MENA: They don't get answered.

13 MR. DARCHE: To this agency?

14 MR. MENA: Yes, sir.

15 MR. DARCHE: So, speak to Rob now --

16 MR. MENA: Officer Khan, Officer
17 Gonzalez, investigators, rather, neither of
18 them finished this case, which has been over
19 six months, and it's terribly disappointing.

20 MR. DARCHE: So, why don't you speak
21 with Rob.

22 MR. MENA: Yes, sir.

23 MR. DARCHE: Let him know what the
24 issues are, and then he will talk to me, and
25 we'll figure out whether there are open

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

41

1 complaints that we are addressing that just
2 haven't been closed yet, or there are new
3 issues that we need to reinterview you for
4 and get the information.

5 MR. MENA: Thank you, sir.

6 CHAIR SMITH: Is there anyone else who
7 has --

8 MR. MENA: Merry Christmas.

9 CHAIR SMITH: Merry Christmas. Thank
10 you, sir.

11 Anybody else who has a question or
12 comment?

13 MR. HOGAN: Pat, I just -- Chairman, I
14 just want to make a comment that was a little
15 earlier.

16 CHAIR SMITH: Yeah.

17 MR. HOGAN: Our board member, John
18 Siegal, had said something that came to mind
19 for me, that I think as soon as possible that
20 we can get information -- what was the actual
21 reasons or threats that was given to our
22 former chairperson, so that the Board can
23 fully be aware. Because not only was it
24 unfair and unprofessional, but someone was
25 threatening lives, you know. So, one threat

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

42

1 to our chairperson, our interim chair, our
2 former interim chair, is a threat to the
3 Board. And I think that we should know fully
4 exactly what was the reason and what was the
5 things that was said to him. Because whatever
6 is said to Dr. Mohammad was said to the rest
7 of us.

8 CHAIR SMITH: Right.

9 MR. HOGAN: And I just think one wants
10 full disclosure, and I just want to put that
11 on the record.

12 And in the respect, also, it's good you
13 gave advice, Brother Smith, but from your
14 position, you might be able to say, you know,
15 do take it hard or whatever term you used, to
16 have tough skin. And in some positions -- in
17 other positions, most of us can't be in tough
18 skins.

19 CHAIR SMITH: Yeah.

20 MR. HOGAN: You know, and so we have to
21 be very careful when we give that advice when
22 some of us can't be the tough skins when some
23 people can. I just wanted to have to say
24 that.

25 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you.

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

43

1 MR. HOGAN: Thank you.

2 MS. SIMMONS: Very good. Very good.

3 CHAIR SMITH: Any other comments?

4 (No response).

5 CHAIR SMITH: We're moving to
6 old business.

7 Do we have any old business before this
8 board?

9 (No response).

10 CHAIR SMITH: We're moving to new
11 business. And as said in my original remarks,
12 I have a proposal to put before this board. I
13 will read this into the record. I call upon
14 this board. Today, there's no action to be
15 taken. We can take the weeks ahead to
16 reflect, to discuss, to amend. And perhaps at
17 our January meeting or our February meeting,
18 we can vote some or all of the items in this
19 proposal.

20 We are proposing is, the members of the
21 New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board
22 recommend an increase in compensation for CCRB
23 investigators with said increased compensation
24 link to the measures outlined below. This
25 increase compensation could be

1 decided by a committee composed of a
2 representative of the Mayor's office, a
3 representative of the City Council Speaker,
4 three members of the CCRB, including a
5 mayor's designee, a City Council Speaker's
6 designee, and a police commissioner's
7 designee, and the CCRB executive director or
8 his or her representative.

9 Linked to this increased compensation
10 should be several measures to improve the
11 hiring and training of CCRB investigators. A
12 committee consisting of three members of the
13 CCRB, a mayor's designee, a City Council
14 designee, and a police commissioner's
15 designee, and the CCRB executive director or
16 his or her representative, would make
17 recommendations for development and
18 implementation of these measures subject to
19 full CCRB approval.

20 The measures are: Improved standards
21 for hiring investigators, including a
22 psychological screening, a bachelor's degree
23 with at least a minor in law enforcement,
24 criminal justice, law, sociology or some
25 field deemed relevant to the work of a CCRB

1 investigator. A complete review of prior
2 writing and social media post to identify
3 attitude relevant to the work of a CCRB
4 investigator.

5 Second, review and upgrade training for
6 CCRB investigators, including having John Jay
7 College of Criminal Justice develop and
8 implement a training program for new and
9 current investigators, requiring all new and
10 current investigators to accompany a member
11 of the New York Police Department on an
12 actual night or overnight patrol at least
13 every two years in a program coordinated by
14 the CCRB and the NYPD, requiring all new and
15 current investigators to participate in a
16 session in the NYPD firearms and tactics
17 simulator at least every two years, requiring
18 all new and current investigators to attend
19 classes at the NYPD Academy with the CCRB and
20 NYPD selecting classes which best help the
21 investigators better stand the nature of
22 police work.

23 This is my proposal. Members of the
24 Board, you all have a copy of it. Welcome
25 any comments today. And beyond that, we can

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

46

1 reflect and come back to this in a month.

2 MS. SIMMONS: There was no motion.

3 CHAIR SMITH: There was no motion.

4 MS. SIMMONS: I definitely have
5 comments on this.

6 CHAIR SMITH: All right.

7 MS. SIMMONS: First of all, this is not
8 a -- this is your -- Chair's recommendation.
9 It's not a CCRB recommendation.

10 CHAIR SMITH: I understand.

11 MS. SIMMONS: I'm just make -- these
12 are my comments. All right? So, let's make
13 clear that these are your personal comments,
14 your personal recommendations, not the
15 Board's recommendation.

16 I have some overall comments about it,
17 and I think the essence of what you're
18 attempting to do is to improve the quality of
19 the investigators. But I think the way
20 you're going about it, Chair, is
21 disrespectful to the staff. It's
22 disrespectful to actually -- to somebody, the
23 current investigators, and it's even
24 disrespectful to the members of the force.
25 Why do I say that? Number 1, when you're

1 talking about personnel issues, the first
2 thing that most boards do is discuss
3 personnel issues with administration, and
4 particularly with executive administration
5 and with HR, to see whether or not the
6 recommendations make sense in the whole view
7 of the City of New York workforce.

8 I had the dubious privilege of once
9 working at Corporation Counsel office, and
10 one of my assignments was the Civil Service
11 Board for the City of New York, and I had to
12 review the regulations for hiring of several
13 thousand titles to see whether or not there
14 were disparities, unnecessary disparities.
15 And, you know, I'm a racial justice lawyer.
16 I wasn't working as that. Yeah, I was
17 working as a civil rights attorney under the
18 Corporation Counsel in this building, by the
19 way, sixth floor. And well, I learned a lot.

20 I learned particularly that the City of
21 New York tries to align positions and titles
22 in bunches, in groups, and they want the
23 recom -- they want the experience, the
24 qualifications, and the salaries rate, salary
25 rates, to be aligned. This recommendation is

1 onerous for investigators. It would require
2 investigators to do things that many police
3 officers don't have to do. I'm talking about
4 candidates, have to do, in order to be hired.
5 And I do not think it's aligned with the
6 entire scheme of government employees in the
7 City of New York. That doesn't mean it's
8 bad. That just means that it's maybe
9 inappropriately handled, which is why I
10 suggest that this entire thing be tabled
11 until there's a discussion with
12 administration about how this could work,
13 what's good, what's workable, what's not
14 workable, what's going to be rejected by the
15 City, what's going to be rejected in terms of
16 possible increases in salary and definitely
17 in regard to qualifications.

18 Secondly, I have a major objection to
19 the scheme under which you've laid this out
20 to be determined. First of all, I am opposed
21 to it. Let me say that on the record. I'm
22 opposed to it. I will not motion it. I will
23 not second it. And if I were here in the
24 months to come, I would vote against it, and
25 instead ask for the staff to come up with a

1 recommendation in response to your
2 recommendation. But in your recommendation,
3 you slight the Public Advocate's office. I
4 am the first representative of the Public
5 Advocate on this board. You have
6 representation from every other appointing
7 authority on this board for your two
8 committees, which are supposed to be looking
9 at whether or not compensation and looking at
10 hiring and training, every single elected
11 official that appoints to this board is
12 represented in your committees, except the
13 Public Advocate's office.

14 I think that slight is horrendous, not
15 just because I'm sitting as a public
16 advocate's representee, but because the
17 public advocate has a real -- this public
18 advocate, and I think every public advocate
19 in the future, will have a real interest in
20 seeing that the CCRB does its job well, and
21 that the view of the Public Advocate's office
22 are incorporated in any changes to this body,
23 including the staffing.

24 Finally, there are some things in here
25 where you repeat things that are, you know,

1 inappropriate. You call for a Council
2 Speaker designee, when it should be a Council
3 designee. I'm mean, you know, I'm looking at
4 it as an attorney, so I will go through line.
5 I redlined it and all the errors that are in
6 here in terms of what you're trying to do, I
7 think, even if I was supporting what you're
8 trying to do, and how there are errors in
9 there.

10 And I also do not believe that John Jay
11 College should be highlighted out as the only
12 place that training could be conducted for
13 our staff. I could think of several other
14 places. I'm not against John Jay College.
15 I'm a CUNY person, so definitely, you know,
16 John Jay is a great place, but it's not the
17 only place. So, therefore, it should not be
18 exclusive, any exclusivity.

19 In addition to that, New York City has
20 training courses already for various issues,
21 and some of those courses for staff need to
22 be looked at to see whether or not they could
23 satisfy some of the things that you're
24 attempting to do. You know, all of the other
25 things that you recommended, a bachelor's

1 degree, having it be law enforcement, et
2 cetera, I would have to see how that would
3 work in terms of other staff -- staffing with
4 other agencies. They don't require police
5 recruits to have these degrees, so it's a
6 little interesting that people who will be
7 looking at the police officers will have more
8 training in -- academic training than the
9 actual officers themselves.

10 And in regard to ride-alongs and
11 firearms, et cetera, I don't think you need
12 to go on a firearms range to learn about
13 firearm. And I have long held that I think
14 it's a good idea for everybody to do at least
15 one ride-along. I think once every two years
16 is onerous, but I'm just commenting on your
17 ideas in terms of having people understand
18 what police officers actually go through.
19 And I hope that you were considering giving
20 them bulletproof vests.

21 Those are my comments to date. I
22 recommend that this not be taken up by the
23 Board. I recommend that instead that to you,
24 Chair, respectfully, that you give this to
25 the staff, have a real conversation with the

1 administrators about it and work it out and
2 see what they think is a good idea, and
3 address what things they might think would
4 harm us in recruiting, and what things they
5 think will harm us in retention. You know,
6 I'm always for a raise in salary. I don't
7 have any problem with that. Everybody here
8 needs to get more money. That long -- I may
9 not be on the Board anymore, but I'll still
10 be a member of the public. If you want my
11 comments as this thing rolls out, I'll be
12 very happy to give them to you.

13 CHAIR SMITH: If I may --

14 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you for your
15 efforts.

16 CHAIR SMITH: Thank you. You said I
17 kind of sprung this. We have discussed this
18 in our executive sessions for at least a year.

19 MS. SIMMONS: We have not discussed it
20 with the staff.

21 CHAIR SMITH: We haven't discussed it
22 with the staff, not yet, no.

23 MS. SIMMONS: That's the disrespect I'm
24 talking about. I was an executive for a
25 state agency, and this is -- they're the

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

53

1 first people you talk to about whether this
2 is a good idea, but I like your spirit.

3 CHAIR SMITH: Well, thank you. I like
4 your spirit, too.

5 (Laughter).

6 CHAIR SMITH: Do we have any other
7 comments?

8 MR. HOGAN: Just that, uh --

9 MS. SIMMONS: John Siegal has a yellow
10 hand up.

11 CHAIR SMITH: John, yes.

12 MR. SIEGAL: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
13 Everything has unintended consequences, and
14 the consequence of your putting forth this
15 proposal today is we got a great opportunity
16 one last time to hear Esmeralda Simmons give
17 a very thorough early presentation --

18 MS. SIMMONS: An abbreviated comment.
19 Abbreviated comment.

20 MR. SIEGAL: Abbreviated. So, you
21 know, I thank you for that and for raising
22 the issue.

23 Look, we're in the 47th or 48th month
24 in which this board has had no duly appointed
25 chair. And I'm glad to discuss these issues,

1 but I think very clearly, in my view, when
2 we're hopefully on the precipice of a new
3 administration on both sides of City Hall
4 that should result in, finally after
5 four years, having an appointed chair. I
6 don't think this board should be taking
7 positions that have fiscal and operational
8 impact before the transition and the new
9 administration has its opportunity.

10 That's my view. I'm glad to discuss it
11 if there's a motion in the future, that
12 will -- just previewing, that will be my
13 position 'cause I don't think we should be
14 doing that in this transitional circumstance.
15 Thank you.

16 CHAIR SMITH: Anyone else?

17 Frank.

18 MR. DWYER: Well, first, I view this as
19 a working document, as sort of an opening
20 statement of these are some things that one
21 of the board members who was proposing this
22 before he was named interim chair, so it sort
23 of ends up to certain irony that -- sort of
24 his role. So, I mean, I would think any
25 organization day in and day out wants to say,

1 "How can we make our organization better?"
2 And I totally agree, but I certainly -- I
3 don't want to speak for Mr. Darche, but
4 that's what he does all the time, dialogues
5 with us about how to make things better. So,
6 I don't know. I don't want to speak for you,
7 but I don't think -- I'd be shocked if he was
8 offended that a bunch of ideas were thrown
9 out to discuss how to make the organization
10 continue to be better.

11 I've always said, and I've raised it
12 over the years, that I think all board
13 members should spend a day in the Police
14 Academy and go through the tactics house and
15 such things. I just think it's an
16 opportunity for learning, so I think that's
17 good. This organization has evolved into
18 looking at very sensitive matters that
19 require great discernment in some cases.
20 Some cases, it's very easy to see what's
21 right or wrong, what's sexually offensive,
22 what's bias. But other cases are very
23 sensitive in the sense that, God, these are
24 hard decisions to make.

25 And the fact that since, I guess, at

1 least the 1970s, the 1960s, we've been giving
2 police officers at least one-day
3 psychological exams to help identify bias in
4 them, and help identify other things that
5 these exams can surface. So, I mean, I view
6 that as a very healthy recommendation, that
7 if somebody is investigating bias, they
8 certainly would want as a city, as an
9 organization, to make sure that their own
10 biases aren't excessively present or aren't
11 not identified.

12 So, I just think -- I totally agree
13 that we should have a dialogue with the
14 executive staff and with current
15 investigators and other people through the
16 organization. But I don't think whether we
17 have a new administration or not a new
18 administration, I just think it's our job to
19 work to make this a better organization, as
20 it is the job of every organization to work
21 to make itself better.

22 CHAIR SMITH: Frank, thank you.

23 Anyone else?

24 MR. HOGAN: Yeah, I'm going to go.

25 Thank you, Frank.

1 Thank you, Chair.

2 CHAIR SMITH: Yeah.

3 MR. HOGAN: Cognitive biases, we all
4 have them, right?

5 CHAIR SMITH: Yep.

6 MR. HOGAN: You know, you look at
7 something and you pay attention. It might
8 seem so totally different to you in one
9 sense, but the way you look at it from your
10 experience and you're putting stuff in
11 historical context, it looks different. One
12 of the things that, uh -- out of it, I look
13 at what is the intent and what's inside the
14 content, inside the proposal. There's a
15 piece that said five years historical of
16 social media that was in there just -- I
17 think it was yesterday, when the Trump
18 Administration, you know, not only ask for
19 five years of back history in social media,
20 this is for the tourists that are coming in.

21 So, where do we start and where do we
22 stop? And, you know, to the point where now
23 they're asking for social media, and now they
24 want everyone that you spoke to the last ten
25 years, every phone number that you knew the

1 last five years. This is all the way from
2 your grandparents to your children. This is
3 what's happening in the new administration.
4 So, at what point do we look at stuff and
5 then come together as a collective, as a
6 board, and then -- and know it's feasible and
7 respect to prevent in front of the public.
8 Because when these things get out, a lot of
9 people go home and people that's looking at
10 us on the internet, you know, are saying,
11 "Wow, look what the Board has done."

12 We've been accused so many times about
13 how we vote and what we do, and that's not
14 the way -- that's not the consensus of the
15 Board. And I don't want to be making
16 divisions, you know, but just look at what's
17 being said. What is the intent? What is the
18 reason? We need to have that conversation in
19 Executive Session, you know, or when we speak
20 with staff. But if we keep going down these
21 roads where we're taking positions, personal
22 positions, you know, and we're all agreeing
23 to those personal positions, we're going to
24 fail the people that we say we come to serve.

25 And I'm on this board to be a servant

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

59

1 of -- not trying to destroy policing and
2 policies or police culture, but trying to
3 correct some of the errors that are made by
4 police misconduct. And we all want a better
5 police force, right? I think that's what we
6 do -- that's what we want. And regardless of
7 who does or not, I think we should just
8 really look at those measures as they come,
9 not look at them as we feel about them.

10 Thank you.

11 CHAIR SMITH: Anyone else? Any other
12 insight? We will go on.

13 Do we have a motion to adjourn?

14 MR. HOGAN: So moved.

15 CHAIR SMITH: We adjourn to Executive
16 Session. Thank you all. Have good holidays.
17 See you in the new year.

18 (TIME NOTED: 5:10 p.m.)

19
20
21
22
23
24
25

In Re December Public Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint
Review Board
December 10, 2025

60

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a Notary Public
within and for the State of New York, do hereby
certify:

That the witness whose examination is
hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn and that such
an examination is a true record of the testimony
given by such a witness.

I further certify that I am not related to
any of these parties to this action by blood or
marriage, and that I am not in any way interested in
the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
hand on this 18th day of December, 2025.

Sabrina Brown Stewart
Sabrina Brown Stewart