

In Re Public Board meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board  
January 8, 2025

1 -----X

2 CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

3 PUBLIC MEETING

4 January 8, 2025

5 4:00 p.m.

6 -----X

7 HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE/

8 100 CHURCH STREET, 10th FLOOR

9 NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10007

10

11 B E F O R E :

12 Dr. Mohammad Khalid, Interim Chair

13 Jonathan Darche, Esq. Executive Director

14

15

16 COURT REPORTER:

17 Stephanie O'Keefe

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

-----

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of Minutes
3. Remarks from Interim Chair
4. Remarks from the Executive Director
5. Presentation from Outreach on the CCRB
6. Public Comment
7. Old Business
8. New Business
9. Adjourn to Executive Session

1 CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Dr. Mohammad Khalid Interim Chair

3 June Northern - Board Member

4 John Siegal Esq. - Board Member

5 Charlane Brown-Wyands, Esq. - Board Member

6 Joseph A. Puma - Board Member

7 Frank Dwyer - Board Member

8 AU Hogan - Board Member

9 Herman Merritt - Board Member

10 Esmeralda Simmons, Esq. - Board Member

11 Pat Smith - Board Member

12

13

14

15

16 PRESENTERS:

17 JAHl ROSE - Director of Outreach

18 New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 SPEAKERS:

2 Andrew Case, Esq. - Supervising Attorney - Latino  
3 Justice PRLDEF

4 Doyin Adeeko Abowaba - Civilian

5 Mari Moss - Taskforce Member - Mayor's Taskforce to  
6 End Gender-based and Domestic Violence

7 Michael Myers - President - New York Civil Rights  
8 Coalition

9 Asmaa Abdalla - Civilian

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PROCEEDINGS

1 MS. ALVAREZ: For those utilizing ASL  
2 interpreter services, our two interpreters are  
3 Kate Brenton and Beth Zuriff. Instructions on  
4 how to pin their videos to your screen are in  
5 the chat. For those utilizing CART closed  
6 captioning services a link is in the chat as  
7 well. Thank you.

8 CHAIR KHALID: Good afternoon, everyone.  
9 My name is Dr. Mohammad Khalid, and I am the  
10 interim chair of the Civilian Complaint Review  
11 Board. I'd like to call the CCRB, January 2025  
12 public board meeting to order. Thank you for  
13 joining us.

14 Will the Board, please, introduce  
15 themselves now, from the right.

16 MR. SIEGAL: Yes, good afternoon, John  
17 Siegal. I was appointed by a mayor.

18 Welcome Dr. Khalid. Nice to meet you.

19 I just want to note for the record, maybe  
20 it's obvious, this meeting marks the beginning  
21 of the fourth year in which this Board has been  
22 without a duly-appointed chair.

23 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you, sir.

24 MR. DWYER: Good afternoon, I'm Frank  
25 Dwyer, I'm a police commissioner Designee.

PROCEEDINGS

1 MS. NORTHERN: June Northern, mayoral  
2 appointee.

3 MR. DARCHE: Jonathan Darche. I use  
4 he/him pronouns, and I'm the executive director  
5 of the Agency.

6 MS. SIMMONS: Esmeralda Simmons, I am the  
7 public advocate appointee from Bed-Stuy.

8 MR. HOGAN: AU Hogan. Happy New Year. I  
9 am the designee from Queens City Council.

10 MR. PUMA: Good afternoon. My name is  
11 Joseph Puma. I go by he/him pronouns. I am  
12 the City Council designee from Manhattan. I  
13 hail from the Lowest East Side.

14 MR. SMITH: Good afternoon and Happy New  
15 Year. I'm Pat Smith, the mayoral appointee  
16 from Manhattan.

17 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you all.

18 I'd like to ask for the motion --

19 Yes, the Board members who are online,  
20 could you please introduce yourself?

21 MR. BROWN: Good afternoon. Charlane  
22 Brown, police commissioner designee.

23 MR. MERRITT: Herman Merritt, City Council  
24 representative from Brooklyn.

25 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

PROCEEDINGS

1 Anybody else? No, that's it.

2 I'd like to ask for a motion to approve  
3 the November board meeting.

4 (No audible motion heard by reporter.)

5 Any second on that?

6 MS. NORTHERN: Second.

7 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

8 Are there any changes or corrections to  
9 the minutes? If yes, note that we will make  
10 the appropriate changes and review the  
11 corrected minutes next month. Anybody say no?

12 (No response.)

13 Hearing none, all those in favor approving  
14 the minutes say aye.

15 (No response.)

16 All those opposed?

17 (No response.)

18 The minutes are approved.

19 I'd like to ask a motion to approve the  
20 December board meeting. Is there any second  
21 here?

22 MS. NORTHERN: Second.

23 CHAIR KHALID: Are there any changes or  
24 corrections to the minutes? If yes, we will  
25 make the appropriate changes and review the

PROCEEDINGS

1 corrected minutes next month. If none, say --  
2 hearing none, all those in favor of approving  
3 the minutes, say aye.

4 (No response.)

5 All those opposed?

6 (No response.)

7 The minutes are approved.

8 I'd like to begin by saying that it is a  
9 great honor for me to serve as the interim  
10 chair, and I am truly grateful to Mayor Eric  
11 Adams for his trust in me for giving me this  
12 responsibility.

13 Civilian oversight law enforcement plays a  
14 key role in public safety, and I look forward  
15 to representing this agency as we begin the new  
16 year.

17 Now, I'd like to ask the Executive  
18 Director Jonathan Darche to give us all the  
19 agency's updates. Jon.

20 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Dr. Khalid.  
21 Congratulations on your appointment of interim  
22 chair.

23 Dr. Khalid already boasts ten years of  
24 dedicated service to the CCRB, and I'm  
25 confident in Dr. Khalid's leadership of this



PROCEEDINGS

1 agency as we go into 2025.

2 As we look ahead to the new year, I want  
3 to take a moment to reflect on some of the many  
4 accomplishments of the Agency in 2024. The  
5 Agency received 5,709 complaints in 2024. That  
6 is three percent higher than in 2023 and 55  
7 percent higher than in 2022. That's the  
8 highest number of complaints from, in the last  
9 12 years. This trend underscores the  
10 increasing demand for effective and impartial  
11 civilian oversight.

12 The Agency fully investigated 2,551  
13 complaints in 2024, but also closed 1,734  
14 complaints without any investigation at all.  
15 It remains crucial that the Agency receive  
16 necessary -- support necessary to fulfill our  
17 charter mandate and continue serving New  
18 Yorkers.

19 The Administrative Prosecution Unit closed  
20 358 cases in 2024, including 32 findings of  
21 guilt after trial by the police commissioner  
22 and 128 guilty pleas. All together, 228  
23 members of the NYPD were disciplined because of  
24 APU action, which is slightly more than double  
25 the number of members of service disciplined in

PROCEEDINGS

1 2023 as a result of APU action.

2 Also, in December, the first Racial  
3 Profiling and Bias Based Policing case was  
4 tried, a milestone of collaboration between the  
5 APU and the new Racial Profiling and Bias Based  
6 Policing Unit.

7 The Outreach Unit conducted over 1,000  
8 presentations, workshops, and events, reaching  
9 more than 40,000 New Yorkers. The CCRB's Youth  
10 Advisory Council's Speak Up, Speak Out Youth  
11 Summit was the huge success, and the cohort  
12 also produced two radio ad campaigns on iHeart  
13 radio and the Spanish broadcast systems of New  
14 York. These ad campaigns reached an impressive  
15 175,000 listeners.

16 I'm confident that the Agency will build  
17 on the successes of 2024 and continue to make  
18 meaningful strides in 2025.

19 Our office is open for walk-in complaints,  
20 but it is also possible to file complaints  
21 online at [nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint](https://nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint), by telephone  
22 at 1-800-341-2272, by dialing 311 or by tagging  
23 the Agency on Twitter, Facebook, and Instagram.

24 For those wishing to speak during today's  
25 public comment session of today's meeting, we

PROCEEDINGS

1 ask that you keep your questions and comments  
2 to four minutes.

3 If anyone wishes to file a complaint now,  
4 we have two investigators on hand, ready to  
5 take any new complaints. The investigators on  
6 call this afternoon are Emma Stydahar and Will  
7 Jacobson, Yvonne Torres is also here from our  
8 Civilian Assistance Unit.

9 I turn it back to you, Dr. Khalid.

10 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you, Jon.

11 I'd like to thank all of your, my Board  
12 members, that they have sent me good wishes  
13 when I became the interim chair. I'm very  
14 happy that we have a great board, a great  
15 staff, a great director, and I'm looking  
16 forward to making sure that we work in an  
17 impartial way and make sure that the public is  
18 fully protected, and, at the same time,  
19 everything is in a fair way.

20 So, at this time, if anybody has any  
21 questions, any Board member has any question on  
22 Jon?

23 MR. SMITH: Chair, if I may ask a question  
24 of the executive director.

25 CHAIR KHALID: Yes.

PROCEEDINGS

1 MR. SMITH: Jon, in 2023, I think you  
2 reported 5,500 complaints or thereabouts.

3 MR. DARCHE: Correct.

4 MR. SMITH: And of those 5,500, now it's a  
5 year later, how many of those have resulted in  
6 a finding of substantiated?

7 MR. DARCHE: So, I'll have to pull that  
8 number for you for next month, Mr. Smith,  
9 because the math on that is a little difficult.

10 MR. SMITH: Alright, thank you.

11 CHAIR KHALID: Anybody else have any  
12 questions, any Board member?

13 (No response.)

14 If none, we will proceed with the  
15 presentation from the Director of Outreach,  
16 Jahi Rose.

17 MR. ROSE: Good afternoon, everyone. As  
18 mentioned, my name is Jahi Rose. I am the  
19 director of outreach for the Civilian Complaint  
20 Review Board. I go by he/him pronouns.

21 Congratulations on your appointment as  
22 interim chair.

23 The New York City Civilian Complaint  
24 Review Board is the nation's largest  
25 independent oversight entity for the largest

PROCEEDINGS

1 police force in the country.

2 The CCRB investigates, mediates, and in  
3 some cases, administratively prosecutes  
4 allegations of misconduct alleged against  
5 members of the New York City Police Department.

6 The Agency is formed of 15 Board members,  
7 some of which you have met tonight. There are  
8 five members that are appointed by the New York  
9 City Mayor, five that are appointed by the New  
10 York City Council, three designated by the  
11 police commissioner, one appointed by the  
12 public advocate, and the chair is jointly  
13 appointed by the Mayor and City Council.

14 The Agency can investigate various types  
15 of complaints, those include force, abuse of  
16 authority, discourtesy, and offensive language,  
17 a helpful acronym is FADO.

18 If you would like to report police  
19 misconduct, as previously mentioned, you can  
20 file a complaint with our Agency's website  
21 [nyc.gov/ccrb complaints](https://nyc.gov/ccrb/complaints), call the Agency phone  
22 number 1-800-341-CCRB or 1-800-341-2272.

23 Remember, if you see footage of misconduct  
24 on social media or in news media, you can feel  
25 free to file a complaint, even if you weren't

PROCEEDINGS

1           there. You can tag the CCRB in our typical  
2           handle, which is ccrb underscore nyc.

3           Other ways to file a complaint at our  
4           Agency include calling 311. You can also come  
5           to the Agency's headquarters at 100 Church  
6           Street in lower Manhattan on the tenth floor.  
7           You can also direct message the Agency on our  
8           social media platforms, which is Facebook,  
9           Instagram, Twitter or X. You can also send a  
10          letter to the agency at 100 Church Street, New  
11          York, New York, zip code 10007.

12          You can also file a complaint at a local  
13          police precinct. It does not have to be the  
14          precinct in the confines where the incident may  
15          have taken place, or the encounter took place.  
16          The police officers at the precinct are  
17          required to take complaints from -- despite  
18          where the complaint may have come from, from  
19          any member of the public. You can also just  
20          request an application or a form and a  
21          self-addressed envelope and you can send that  
22          by mail straight to the Agency.

23          If you would like to request a CCRB  
24          presentation, you can feel free to contact the  
25          Outreach unit at outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov. Also

PROCEEDINGS

1 follow us on our social media platforms, as  
2 mentioned, Instagram, Twitter or X, and  
3 Facebook.

4 Thank you very much.

5 CHAIR KHALID: Any Board member has any  
6 questions regarding the --

7 MR. SMITH: To clarify, we investigate  
8 alleged misconduct, people report alleged  
9 misconduct, we investigate alleged. If we  
10 sustain it, then it is misconduct.

11 Thank you.

12 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

13 Anybody else has any questions?

14 (No response.)

15 Well, I -- my discussion with the  
16 executive director, sometime in 2025 we will be  
17 outreaching in every borough when it permits us  
18 to do that, when the staff and the budget  
19 allows us, we will be going to all the five  
20 boroughs and have the outreach meeting there.  
21 When will that happen? We'll let you know on  
22 that.

23 Now we have public comments. I would like  
24 to begin by saying -- let's see here, anybody  
25 who wants to -- we'll start with the virtual

PROCEEDINGS

1 meeting, people who are calling us who, we want  
2 them to make a comment, please use the  
3 raise-your-hand feature. Please keep your  
4 comment to four minutes on virtually calling  
5 us.

6 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair.

7 First we'll be hearing from Andrew Case,  
8 joining us virtually.

9 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Case, are you there?

10 MR. CASE: I'm here. It just took a  
11 minute to get to me. Thank you.

12 I come bringing good news, I am Andrew  
13 Case, I am supervising attorney at Latino  
14 Justice PRLDEF. I have been following your  
15 work for a long time, as you know, Dr. Khalid.  
16 It is so great to see you again. Jonathan said  
17 you had been there for ten years. You were  
18 there when I left in 2007, and you had been  
19 there for a couple years at the time, so it's  
20 much more than ten years. You have great  
21 experience, and I wish you the very best and  
22 have the greatest hopes for you.

23 I come bearing with me --

24 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

25 MR. CASE: -- Franklin Stone, who was the



PROCEEDINGS

1 chair, Dr. Khalid, you will remember, when you  
2 were first named to the Board, and Philip Eure,  
3 the former inspector general for the NYPD, and  
4 Nicholas Mitchell, who was an investigator with  
5 me and is now the monitor for the LA County  
6 jails.

7 As you all might know, in September, the  
8 New York City monitor for the police department  
9 issued a discipline report criticizing the  
10 NYPD's disciplinary actions, particularly in  
11 response to investigations that you have so  
12 thoroughly investigated and substantiated, and  
13 sought public comments.

14 Chair Stone, Philip Eure, and Nick  
15 Mitchell submitted a joint comment, which I  
16 will be happy to send along to you all, if any  
17 of you want it, suggesting two significant  
18 modifications to the operations of the CCRB.

19 First they recommend that, because of the  
20 structure of the Board and the fact that you  
21 are no longer investigating or overseeing  
22 police investigations where they need to have  
23 police bias taken away, you have a full  
24 investigative staff and lawyers reviewing the  
25 cases, that the Board should no longer vote in

PROCEEDINGS

1 panels on cases. You should allow the  
2 Agency -- you should, as the charter says that  
3 you have to hear, make findings on cases,  
4 delegate hearing cases to the Agency, you  
5 should delegate making findings to the Agency.  
6 This will save you tons of time, tons of work.  
7 Board members are overworked, having to read  
8 stacks of cases, only to approve the  
9 investigations that are far more thorough than  
10 they were 40 years ago when Board review began.

11 The other thing that Phil and Franklin and  
12 Nick recommend is that you restart the process  
13 of trying cases before oath, cases used to be  
14 tried before oath, instead of in the NYPD trial  
15 room and that was ended in 2001, based on a  
16 decision from the First Department that has  
17 come under substantial criticism, including  
18 from the monitor's report and which is almost  
19 certainly no longer good law.

20 So, I -- and Michael Gerber at the NYPD is  
21 a very reasonable man and a great attorney, and  
22 I suggest that the CCRB reach out to find a way  
23 to send at least some of the cases -- it used  
24 to be that police officer cases were tried at  
25 oath and high-ranking officers were tried in

PROCEEDINGS

1 the trial room. You can do that again.

2 I will send the letter on to everybody.  
3 These are recommendations from people who I  
4 respect a great deal, and I hope that you  
5 respect a great deal as well.

6 Thank you all for your work. Dr. Khalid,  
7 congratulations. I look forward to hearing  
8 great things from you.

9 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you very much. I  
10 appreciate that, and everything you said is  
11 noted.

12 Anything you want to add, Jon, to it?

13 MR. DARCHE: Yes. Mr. Case if you -- you  
14 have my e-mail, you can send me the letter, and  
15 I'll make sure it gets forwarded to the Board  
16 members.

17 MR. CASE: Thank you so much, Jon.

18 CHAIR KHALID: Yes.

19 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you, Mr. Case, for  
20 relaying those recommendations. I find both of  
21 them to be very interesting. Could you -- I  
22 would like to see the letter, but also, at this  
23 point, since you're right here, I'd like to ask  
24 you to embellish upon having the staff make  
25 findings. I think that would require a change

PROCEEDINGS

1 in the charter.

2 MR. CASE: Sorry, I had muted myself  
3 already.

4 I think that it would require a change in  
5 your rules, but not a change in the charter,  
6 and it's explained why in the letter, but I  
7 will scroll to it.

8 Okay, the language of Section 440 says  
9 that "the Board shall consist of 15 members and  
10 they may establish panels." So there is no  
11 requirement to have Board panels. "The Board  
12 has the power to receive, investigate, hear,  
13 and make findings and recommend actions on  
14 complaints by members of the public." The  
15 Board has delegated the power to receive, it  
16 has delegated the power to investigate, it has  
17 delegated the power to hear the complaint. The  
18 only thing that it currently does is make  
19 findings and recommend actions.

20 There is nothing in that sentence that  
21 suggests any portion of those elements are  
22 different from the others and must be and  
23 cannot be subject to delegation, and there's  
24 lots of law on agencies' ability to delegate  
25 authority to staff, which is maybe too much to

PROCEEDINGS

1 get into verbally.

2 I admit that it would be -- some people  
3 would challenge it or question it, but I think  
4 that it's a sound policy, particularly given  
5 the fact, as you guys all know, the Board  
6 originally, in the Lindsay administration was  
7 simply a group of some police officials, some  
8 civilians who reviewed investigations from the  
9 police department. The civilian portion was  
10 simply to add civilian views to police  
11 investigations. We now have fully civilianized  
12 investigations, we have -- you have attorneys.  
13 The attorneys that are gonna bring the cases in  
14 the trial room or under oath are the ones that  
15 (technical interruption). And ultimately, the  
16 police commissioner is going to be making a  
17 decision on discipline anyway.

18 So, the idea that you need to have more  
19 roadblocks in the way, particularly, I know  
20 there have been staffing issues with the Board  
21 that has slowed down cases in the past couple  
22 years with the more complaints you're getting.  
23 You're having cases age so that NYPD is calling  
24 short statute of limitations on some cases,  
25 even when there is time left in the statute of

PROCEEDINGS

1 limitations. All of this will help move cases  
2 along, allow for effective resolution of cases  
3 substantiated and unfounded exonerated cases so  
4 that police officers and civilians would have  
5 quicker resolution to their complaints.

6 But I'll send the letter.

7 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you, we'll be looking  
8 forward to your letter. Thank you.

9 Anybody else?

10 MR. SMITH: We have discussed, there are  
11 11 members on this Board right now, when it  
12 is -- because the mayor has failed to make two  
13 appointments and the City Council speaker has  
14 failed to make an appointment, and the two of  
15 them jointly have failed to name a chair. So  
16 if you can send recommendations to those two  
17 elected officials to do their duty and get us  
18 up to a full 15-member strength, that would  
19 give us five three-member panels hearing cases,  
20 rather than three three-member panels hearing  
21 cases.

22 MR. CASE: I think that would be great. I  
23 will write to them all.

24 MR. SMITH: Thank you, appreciate that.

25 CHAIR KHALID: Anyone else on the -- yes.

PROCEEDINGS

1 MS. ALVAREZ: Next, we'll be hearing from  
2 Doyin Adeeko Abowaba.

3 MR. ABOWABA: Yeah. Good afternoon, sirs.

4 CHAIR KHALID: Good afternoon.

5 MR. ABOWABA: I have my CCRB number  
6 20247306. The complaint, I came in person to  
7 complain about the implication of the police to  
8 the scene of harassment and stalking. So they  
9 did not show up, but when I came, I received  
10 this complaint number, and I was asked to call  
11 the AIB (sic) number, 212741848401 (sic). I  
12 have called the number. One time they asked me  
13 to go to Police Plaza to collect the reports.  
14 I went there, they said I should do it online  
15 again, I did all they asked me to do. Since  
16 then I have not collect the police report yet.

17 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Abowaba, did you -- are  
18 you trying to get the result of an NYPD  
19 investigation or a CCRB investigation?

20 MR. ABOWABA: I came to CCRB to report, to  
21 complain about calling 911 police, and they  
22 said they were coming, I did not see them.  
23 They received my call, they did not come  
24 around.

25 So, I now went there to see -- since they

PROCEEDINGS

1 did not come, this is what has happened. So I  
2 came to CCRB to complain, and I received a  
3 complaint number from CCRB that I should call  
4 AIB, you know, to collect the report. So this  
5 is almost four months ago, about three months  
6 ago, I've not, you know, be able to receive  
7 any.

8 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Abowaba, what I'm gonna  
9 ask is that one of our investigators, Will,  
10 your -- if you can hold on, Will, will get in  
11 touch with your right now, and we will try and  
12 get you the information you need, whether it's  
13 tonight or tomorrow, we'll get it to you, sir.

14 MR. ABOWABA: Okay, sir. Thank you.

15 CHAIR KHALID: Anybody else? Anybody next  
16 online?

17 MS. ALVAREZ: Just really quickly. Mr.  
18 Abowaba, we will send you a text in the chat,  
19 directly requesting your contact information.

20 Chair, that concludes the virtual portion  
21 of the public session.

22 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

23 For those joining in person and are  
24 interested making a public comment, please line  
25 up behind the podium, and, again, please keep



PROCEEDINGS

1 your comment to four minutes.

2 MS. MOSS: Hello, I am (technical issue),  
3 I am the mother of Clarissa (technical issue)  
4 Taskforce to End Gender-Based and Domestic  
5 Violence, I serve on the community action board  
6 that gives federal funding to non-profits and  
7 after-school programs and happy New Year to all  
8 of CCRB.

9 I'm happy to hear of the accomplishments  
10 that we saw and achieved last year with the  
11 CCRB. I want to stress that, moving forward in  
12 2025, we need to take special attention to  
13 domestic violence situations and ensure that  
14 our police have the sensitivities in dealing  
15 with those matters.

16 Some people have New Year's resolutions, I  
17 have New Year's wishes. My wishes are to see  
18 more proactivity about the budget that Arva  
19 Rice did as an interim chair was phenomenal, so  
20 we don't want to lose any of the progress that  
21 she achieved as the interim chair. Those are  
22 great shoes to fill, Dr. Khalid, I'm sure you  
23 are phenomenal, but she was so exceptional, so  
24 I just want to point that out.

25 I also would love to see government

PROCEEDINGS

1 efficiency to minimize trauma and to make sure  
2 that when people are submitting reports, that  
3 they are done in an efficient time span, so  
4 that it doesn't go on and take a long time to  
5 resolve and that there is no violation of the  
6 people that the NYPD are supposed to protect.

7 Last year, I experienced police brutality  
8 from the 24 Precinct. I was zapped by some  
9 kind of electrical device on my right side when  
10 I was chained to a bench, and I was shackled at  
11 the ankles like, as reminiscent of the slaves,  
12 enslaved people who were brought over in  
13 chains. So I would like to ensure that all  
14 of -- when people are submitting complaints,  
15 that the CCRB, you all know that your role and  
16 your responsibility is so great to ensure that  
17 when police are not -- the word "chastised"  
18 come to mind, but when they're not held  
19 accountable for the things that they do that  
20 are against the needs of the community or  
21 taking certain sensitivities, that those things  
22 cause greater detriment and it allows more  
23 police officers to do greater harms and  
24 damages, so it's very important that we are  
25 making the right decisions and setting a

PROCEEDINGS

1 standard for the police, and that is the  
2 responsibility of this Board, thank you.

3 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you very much. You  
4 have been a great advocate. Thank you. And I  
5 promise you that, I don't know Arva Rice, but  
6 I'm sure she was a great chair and I'll try to  
7 do the best I can. Thank you.

8 Mr. Meyers.

9 MR. MEYERS: I'm Michael Meyers. I'm the  
10 president, New York Civil Rights Coalition.

11 I will keep my comments within four  
12 minutes, which is gonna be impossible to do,  
13 but I will do that, per your new rules about  
14 the -- and your concerns about disruptions.

15 John Siegal, thanks for reminding us that  
16 it's been four, you didn't say "damn years," I  
17 will say it, four damn years we're waiting for  
18 the mayor of the city to appoint somebody who  
19 is a permanent chair, in quotes, permanent  
20 chair of the CCRB.

21 What is going on? Nobody here on the  
22 Board has written and protested the mayor. I  
23 urge you to do that. I don't have a copy of  
24 the letter. I don't have a copy of telegrams,  
25 e-mails, nothing. Have you done it? Why don't

PROCEEDINGS

1           you mail the mayor the appointment of a  
2           permanent chair of this panel. This is an  
3           insult. You sit there and you take the insult  
4           month after month, year after year. His term  
5           as mayor will run out before you have a  
6           permanent chair because he, apparently, will  
7           not appoint one. It's impossible that, to  
8           accept this nonsense now.

9           I hope his term runs out sooner than  
10          later, maybe without a pardon from president --  
11          President Trump, his term will end sooner than  
12          we think.

13          With respect to the interim chair, thank  
14          you for getting into the hot seat and being so  
15          respectful and civil, more respectful and civil  
16          than I could ever be.

17          CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

18          MR. MEYERS: You used the word "trust." I  
19          don't use the word "trust." There used to be a  
20          phrase, trust but verify. You got to verify,  
21          and that's Commission's role. Verify, to  
22          check, to investigate, to chastise, and punish  
23          when punishment seems indicated.

24          Based on previous reports of the executive  
25          director and the other chair, the police

PROCEEDINGS

1 commissioners are not interested, willing to  
2 punish the police officers who have been  
3 adjudicated, to have been found responsible for  
4 misdeeds and misconduct towards the public.

5 You have to ask what kind of police  
6 commissioner do we have that will not enforce  
7 the law, the law, meaning the public policy  
8 that created this damn commission in the first  
9 place. She disrespects you, she disrespects  
10 the public, and I don't care what their name  
11 is, he or she, they is disrespecting the public  
12 and we're so hopeful because I'm a quote  
13 unquote fan of the Tisch's, you know. I was so  
14 hopeful, this current, present police  
15 commissioner would come here, talk to the  
16 public, talk to the commission and tell -- and  
17 advise you that it's gonna be a new day, I'm  
18 gonna listen to you all, I'm going to follow  
19 your advice and your guidance, and when I don't  
20 (unintelligible) and specify why I can't do it,  
21 but I will not violate the law, or the spirit  
22 of the law. Haven't heard a word from her  
23 about that. I haven't seen her on the subways,  
24 I haven't seen her on the streets, I haven't  
25 seen her on TV, I haven't seen anything, other

PROCEEDINGS

1 than running her mouth in terms of making  
2 information, public relations. I'm serious, I  
3 really am. We don't have a police commissioner  
4 who has the decency and the respect for this  
5 body to come here to talk to you as a board at  
6 public session so we can hear it, we want to  
7 see it, we want to hear what she's got to say.

8 So finally, I was hopeful for this police  
9 commissioner, I really was, but I'm not  
10 anymore, and the reason why I'm not anymore and  
11 it has not been a month, but I read a column  
12 from my former intern, he was a young guy, I  
13 hired him as an intern at the New York Civil  
14 Rights Coalition, his name is Harry Siegal. He  
15 is now a columnist for the New York Daily News.  
16 I suggest you read, or reread Harry Siegal's  
17 column about this police commissioner. I'm  
18 trying to find the title, but it was a pun on  
19 the name of Chell. Yeah, a shell game, Chell  
20 meaning the new guy in charge of NYPD. It was  
21 an interesting column, but I don't have time to  
22 go over it now, but it was shocking that Harry  
23 documented the current police commissioner's  
24 insensitivity, irresponsibility. It's her  
25 idiocy with respect to police, civilians,

PROCEEDINGS

1 review processes. She just taps people on the  
2 hand, just like the other police commissioners  
3 did. She ain't no different than anyone else.

4 I want to tell you that it's shocking, I'm  
5 so disaffected and disappointed. Every time I  
6 look for hope, every time I think we're going  
7 to have progress, something else happens.

8 We have another police commissioner who  
9 doesn't respect you, another police  
10 commissioner doesn't respect the public,  
11 another police commissioner that doesn't  
12 respect civil rights, another police  
13 commissioner that doesn't understand what civil  
14 liberties are, another one. And her term may  
15 end prior to the mayor's or the mayor's term  
16 may end prior to her term ending. I can only  
17 say, read the column of Harry Siegal, and I'm  
18 not gonna read it here on the record, I only  
19 have less than four minutes, it is time for  
20 them both to go, Mayor Eric Adams, get the hell  
21 out. Police commissioner, you have already  
22 failed to be responsible as a public servant.  
23 When you pat the hand of people on the police  
24 force, as opposed to enforcing the law and  
25 making sure the police department is held

PROCEEDINGS

1 responsible and accountable to the people, you  
2 have already failed. Why do we have to wait  
3 three more months, much less three more years?

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you, Mr. Meyers.

6 Next is the Board's business. Do we have  
7 any old business to come before the Board.

8 MR. DARCHE: You should come up.

9 CHAIR KHALID: I'm sorry.

10 MS. ABDALLA: Good afternoon, everyone.

11 My name is Asmaa, and I was here before, I  
12 think 2024, and I have so many cases with the  
13 CCRB, but in same time, they close all  
14 (unintelligible) NYPD, so nothing happen up  
15 until this month. They keep doing harassment  
16 us, abusing us, assaulting us, and when we told  
17 (unintelligible) area until this moment.  
18 (Unintelligible) before even I finish the call  
19 with 911, I see in front of my door whatever,  
20 every single time I feel not safe, the neighbor  
21 is (unintelligible) me and I know they are  
22 behind everything (unintelligible), and I  
23 already told them so many times if you have  
24 something against us, it's okay, you already --  
25 have already my apartment, you have already my



PROCEEDINGS

1 address, you have everything you  
2 (unintelligible) what I have done to  
3 (unintelligible) treating us like that, abusing  
4 us, so you don't have to hit our reputation by  
5 saying I'm a criminal or I am just, like,  
6 psycho. So they are doctor, that is fine, if  
7 they are doctor, they can just examine us, that  
8 is fine for me, but they don't have something  
9 to (unintelligible) us like that.

10 Just a few days ago, like, two days ago, I  
11 called them and the reason they give to me they  
12 don't want to come, even to call 911, they keep  
13 refuse to answer me over the phone, and I  
14 already got, already, like, got abusing by the  
15 people, (unintelligible) like it's natural,  
16 (unintelligible) with me, they already  
17 (unintelligible) me so many times and they  
18 already told me, threaten me, they said, we're  
19 not gonna leave you (unintelligible) to leave  
20 this country, but I'm not going to listen to  
21 anyone because I need to know what I have done.  
22 And the same time, I keep continuing, I told to  
23 Mr. John, please let me just know what is going  
24 on, he said to me before, okay, I will handle  
25 your case by myself, and if you didn't feel

PROCEEDINGS

1 satisfied with the results, I'm gonna discuss  
2 with you and that is last September, and  
3 nothing happened. I tried to reach him, he  
4 didn't respond. I tried to reach anyone from  
5 his office, never respond. So I don't know  
6 what is going on. And I was victim so much  
7 since I saw him, I see it's like myself  
8 (unintelligible) something is big, something  
9 for me that is (unintelligible) but actually  
10 that has not happen because I was feeling that  
11 he was going to do something for me, even told  
12 me it is your case, it's not gonna be something  
13 (unintelligible) allegation, I will  
14 (unintelligible) different department, you  
15 know, or whatever who can just hand you like  
16 Human Rights or something, no one do something  
17 with me until this month, six years later, they  
18 keep continuing surrounded, they keep doing,  
19 bother me, they involved all the people in my  
20 area, my neighborhood, they call me psycho  
21 (unintelligible) anything you can say, they say  
22 to me, and if I did something to  
23 (unintelligible) I have the right to see, if I  
24 (unintelligible), that's fine, just show it to  
25 me, even a criminal is supposed to be just

PROCEEDINGS

1           given the punishment after (unintelligible) I  
2           did this one, and after they can  
3           (unintelligible) but it's not gonna just play  
4           games with me like (unintelligible) like that,  
5           whatever they have (unintelligible) so why  
6           ain't they dong something like that with me?  
7           This I don't understand (unintelligible) I want  
8           to understand what I have done. That is not  
9           fair for me, every single time I make a lot of  
10          complaint, they close it. Even I  
11          (unintelligible) some stuff they said that is  
12          from his job, his job is talking  
13          (unintelligible) they have police cars when I  
14          ask them why you (unintelligible) they have no  
15          answer (unintelligible) they broke my  
16          apartment, I have defend myself, even to push  
17          him outside, they said, you hit him. It  
18          doesn't make sense, if somebody broke your  
19          apartment and they're supposed to be help  
20          yourself and they took me with no clothes, and  
21          when I ask them why, they said, you're under  
22          arrest. As of this moment, I have to wait for  
23          this one. Everybody, they have  
24          (unintelligible) because no one was inside my  
25          apartment, only the cops and us and they took

PROCEEDINGS

1 my picture and the people said, oh we sue you,  
2 that is all crazy, they took out to police car  
3 like crazy person and they showed to all the  
4 people in the mosque, until this moment, I have  
5 to wait for this one and everything is  
6 (unintelligible) they fabricate some stuff, I  
7 don't know why they have no (unintelligible)  
8 they have no duty to do it, so that's  
9 (unintelligible) I just (unintelligible)  
10 surround us. Trust me, I didn't want to come  
11 today, my husband too, he said, I have already  
12 more than enough and I left everything in  
13 between God because no one is gonna do  
14 anything, and that is true. But the same time  
15 they say, because as a woman, I can't bear this  
16 one because not every single time -- and I'm  
17 not gonna cry, because every single time I  
18 have, they said, oh you have (unintelligible) I  
19 am a human being. Same time, I just -- I  
20 request from them, let me know what I have  
21 done, but they send for me the letter that they  
22 closed this one because they have something  
23 against me, so I want to see right now, front  
24 you all, I want to see what I have done.

25 CHAIR KHALID: Jon, would you?

PROCEEDINGS

1 MR. DARCHE: First of all, I want to  
2 apologize because I made many efforts to get in  
3 touch with the New York City Commission on  
4 Human Rights and they also ignored me so -- but  
5 on behalf of the City, I apologize that no one  
6 got in touch with you.

7 MS. ABDALLA: It's okay for me. It's  
8 okay, just I need to know why, just why, why  
9 me, why especially us, why you choose us to  
10 play games on us like that, why does he hit our  
11 reputation, why everybody, even now back home,  
12 they contact somebody and I (unintelligible)  
13 they already have my address back home and they  
14 keep continue (unintelligible) we know already  
15 everything happen to you in America. Just  
16 imagine -- just to prove that I am the one, I'm  
17 not good person, I am terrible (unintelligible)  
18 just imagine, I can't bring my kids, I can't  
19 bring anyone from my family because they're  
20 gonna do something. This month I am -- between  
21 me and (unintelligible) I have a lot of  
22 problems, (unintelligible) religion, I ask  
23 them, I have to wear my scarf for religion  
24 (unintelligible) fuck my religion  
25 (unintelligible) that is fine, if they say

PROCEEDINGS

1 something like that, why is he saying something  
2 like that. I don't have the right to wear my  
3 scarf, I don't have the right to wear something  
4 under my (unintelligible) I already was  
5 (unintelligible) broke in my door and my, my  
6 leg is bleeding and I showed to the people who  
7 work in the CCRB and they never do anything and  
8 they want to show to you everything and already  
9 everything is already clear.

10 MR. DARCHE: So, one of the problems,  
11 ma'am, is we have jurisdiction over the police  
12 and when we spoke, there were issues that  
13 weren't police related, so they needed to be  
14 handled by the Commission on Human Rights, so I  
15 will re-double my efforts to get someone from  
16 there who can handle your complaints because,  
17 not within our jurisdiction, there are no  
18 complaints within our jurisdiction that are  
19 open. So I will be in touch after I am in  
20 touch with the Commission on Human Rights, and  
21 I will talk to my chief of staff, Yojaira  
22 Alvarez, about making sure that we get in touch  
23 with someone from CHR this week who can take  
24 your complaints.

25 MS. ABDALLA: But I need to know why

PROCEEDINGS

1 (unintelligible).

2 MR. DARCHE: I understand that, but I  
3 can't --

4 MS. ABDALLA: I told you they keep  
5 continue surrounding me, even I told them I  
6 don't want to even make complaint with you,  
7 trust me. That is what -- I need to be alone  
8 and in peace, that is what I said to IAB, I  
9 said, okay, if the cops don't want to leave  
10 because they pay money, somebody pay for them  
11 money to hit and let us leave the country, that  
12 is fine, here in New York City there is mean  
13 dirty cops, but I don't know even why they do  
14 something like that.

15 CHAIR KHALID: Cops hit you?

16 MS. ABDALLA: Yes, of course, he  
17 (unintelligible) everything I have.

18 CHAIR KHALID: You didn't file a complaint  
19 with the --

20 MS. ABDALLA: I did file but they  
21 (unintelligible) even I brought for the, I have  
22 the video and I showed to them and they  
23 (unintelligible) even they have some people  
24 USB, Amazon, stuff like that, when I  
25 (unintelligible) they see everything, they have

PROCEEDINGS

1 my social security, they have my ID, they have  
2 everything. Whatever I'm trying to prove that  
3 is (unintelligible) I have some stuff in my  
4 hand, already have (unintelligible) in my hand  
5 after they (unintelligible) they already know  
6 how to do something like that, and they  
7 continue to do something different. I already  
8 have the MRI prove this one that I got hit from  
9 them after this one, and (unintelligible) send  
10 they send ambulance, they send somebody from  
11 them, refused to give me the right number, they  
12 refused to give me anything, they refused to  
13 give me they name. How come it is I can't  
14 trust even when I was in the ambulance, you  
15 have to fuck shut up your mouth, you're a  
16 criminal. Just imagine how you gonna just  
17 trust the people, if I am inside the ambulance,  
18 they told me something like that.

19 I requested from them give me your plate  
20 number, they refused, I said just give me your  
21 name, they refused. After that they said,  
22 you're a criminal, so I can't just everything  
23 (unintelligible) gonna start to  
24 (unintelligible) by something, I'm gonna just  
25 ask like (unintelligible) something like that



PROCEEDINGS

1           they gonna (unintelligible), everyone, they  
2           have my picture (unintelligible) and they show  
3           it to everybody, they show it --

4           MR. DARCHE: She has filed a complaint  
5           with the CCRB and the CCRB has investigated  
6           them and has also determined that many of the  
7           issues that she had with the religious  
8           institution or the restaurants in her  
9           neighborhood are not issues that the CCRB can  
10          handle, or issues with the EMTs, those are  
11          things that really are best investigated by the  
12          Commission on Human Rights.

13          So we are not saying that you're not  
14          making valid complaints about all of these  
15          different people, we respond --

16          MS. ABDALLA: You have more than four  
17          cases and you close it already, even you have  
18          the proof, even they stopped me in the  
19          street -- I'm sorry, because you don't have  
20          time, but I have to finish a little bit  
21          something because if I'm --

22          MR. DARCHE: You're already --

23          MS. ABDALLA: -- one year, I'm not gonna  
24          finish, one minute I'm not gonna finish, not  
25          four minutes, four years, ten years, I'm not

PROCEEDINGS

1           gonna finish.

2                   They stopped me in the street, they took  
3           my bags, they put it in the garbage in the  
4           street, and after I show it to the people here  
5           from the CCRB, they have proof, so what is kind  
6           of proof this one, if they stop me in the  
7           street and they told me, they spit in the  
8           floor, in the street, what's going on, of  
9           course I have some medical history and when  
10          they smell any drugs, any (unintelligible) I  
11          can't feel something like that, I have to take  
12          my breath, so what's going on with them? They  
13          have nothing to do, this is all because they  
14          spit on the people, so they are crazy, not me,  
15          because I'm the people in the car, how I'm  
16          gonna spit on them if they are in the car. I  
17          am walking in the street and they are in the  
18          car, I can show it to you, the people, they  
19          have come from the (unintelligible) they throw  
20          it on me when they are in the car. They give  
21          me the finger when they are in the car, they  
22          trying to provoke me by everything. Because I  
23          am walking already in the street, you can show  
24          them already, of course, because they have the  
25          car, I don't have the car. They abusing me

PROCEEDINGS

1 (unintelligible) and they give me the finger  
2 and (unintelligible) all these issues, why they  
3 don't want to take care?

4 CHAIR KHALID: Have you filed with the  
5 Human Rights Commission, any report?

6 MS. ABDALLA: I told them so many times,  
7 please, I left them my address, I left them my  
8 phone, they never -- I'm saying six years like  
9 that surrounded me, I left it so many times  
10 with the Human Rights. I go everywhere, with  
11 the CCRB, I go everything, even last time just  
12 two days ago, they send some people behind me  
13 in the store is calling (unintelligible) so for  
14 what, I pay money for everything I got, if they  
15 have proof, why they do not show it to me,  
16 (unintelligible) prove it to me, so if I did  
17 something wrong --

18 CHAIR KHALID: You're over time now, but  
19 we'll look into it.

20 MS. ABDALLA: That is fine. Thank you,  
21 but you have to talk this one because I'm not  
22 gonna keep my holy days like that and they have  
23 Ramadan, they keep from the Masjid, too. You  
24 have to understand, I can't just live like  
25 that. And the mosque told me, you don't have

PROCEEDINGS

1 to come because you cops always behind you and  
2 they troublemaker (unintelligible) I'm not  
3 gonna keep my life like that, you have to take  
4 care of this one.

5 CHAIR KHALID: We'll look into it. Thank  
6 you.

7 Anybody else from the public?

8 (No response.)

9 CHAIR KHALID: Nobody from the public any  
10 more, so we'll go into the old business. Do  
11 you have any old business to discuss?

12 (No response.)

13 MS. ABDALLA: -- because this one  
14 something bigger more than you, I want to know  
15 who is the bigger that he already put me in  
16 (unintelligible) something like that, so I want  
17 to know who is this person. And I have so many  
18 proofs that people said something like that.  
19 That's why, even all the people in my area, my  
20 neighbors, my friends, they get scared because  
21 they said they gonna do same like that did we  
22 me, so please just try the take care, and I  
23 want to understand what's going on, at least  
24 let me just know. Okay.

25 CHAIR KHALID: Thank you.

PROCEEDINGS

1           Is there any new business before the  
2           Board?

3                           (No response.)

4           Hearing none, I'm going to move now to  
5           break into the executive session. The agenda  
6           for the executive session is the executive  
7           director will discuss pending personnel actions  
8           and the general counsel will provide updates  
9           regarding pending litigation.

10          Is there a motion to adjourn to the  
11          executive session?

12                           (No verbal response heard.)

13          So I have a second?

14          MS. SIMMONS: Second.

15          CHAIR KHALID: So moved. This meeting is  
16          now adjourned for the executive session.

17                           (Time Noted: 4:54 p.m.)

C E R T I F I C A T E

[illegible]

I, STEPHANIE O'KEEFFE, a Reporter and Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify that the within is a true and accurate transcript of the proceedings taken on January 8, 2025.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my  
hand this 8th day of January, 2025.

Stephanie O'Keeffe