

In Re March Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board  
March 13, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD  
PUBLIC MEETING  
March 13, 2024  
4:06 p.m.

-----X

HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE/  
100 Church Street, 10th Floor  
New York, New York 10007

B E F O R E:  
ARVA RICE - INTERIM CHAIR  
JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ. - EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
  
COURT REPORTER:  
Sabrina Brown Stewart

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Remarks from the Chair
3. Remarks from the Executive Director
4. Presentation from Outreach on the CCRB
5. Public Comment
6. Old Business
7. New Business
8. Adjourn to Executive Session

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

=====

1. Arva Rice - Interim Chair
2. Joseph A. Puma - Board Member
3. AU Hogan - Board Member
4. June Northern - Board Member
5. Herman Merritt - Board Member
6. Joseph Fox - Board Member
7. Kevin Jemmott - Board Member
8. Pat Smith - Board Member
9. Charlane Brown-Wyands, Esq. - Board Member
10. Frank Dwyer - Board Member
11. Esmeralda Simmons, Esq. - Board Member

PRESENTERS:

MAROUA RIGHI - Deputy Director of Outreach and  
Intergovernmental Affairs  
Civilian Complaint Review Board

PRINCE COBBINA - Staten Island Outreach Coordinator  
Civilian Complaint Review Board

1 MR. ROSE: Good evening, everyone.  
2 Thank you for joining us. For those  
3 utilizing ASL Interpretation Services, our  
4 two interpreters today are Tolly Tolman and  
5 Allison Besserman (phonetic). Display names  
6 are on the screen as ASL Interpreter  
7 SignNexus Allison and ASL Interpreter Tolly.  
8 Instructions for how to pin their videos and  
9 access CART services will be found in the  
10 chat.

11 Thank you.

12 CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

13 Good evening and welcome. My name is  
14 Arva Rice. I use she/her pronouns, and I'm  
15 the Interim Chair of the Civilian Complaint  
16 Review Board. I would like to call the CCRB's  
17 February (sic) Public Meeting to order.

18 Would the Board please introduce  
19 themselves now, and I'll start on this side  
20 with Joe Puma.

21 MR. PUMA: Good afternoon. My name is  
22 Joe Puma. I'm the Manhattan City Council  
23 designee to the Board, and I go by he/him  
24 pronouns.

25 MR. HOGAN: Good afternoon. I'm AU

1 Hogan. I'm a City Council designee, and I go  
2 by he/him pronouns. And welcome, everybody.

3 MS. NORTHERN: Hi. I'm June Northern.  
4 I am a mayoral appointee from Brooklyn.

5 MR. MERRITT: Hello. My name is Herman  
6 Merritt, City Council designee from Brooklyn.

7 MR. DARCHE: Hi. I'm Jon Darche. I use  
8 he/him pronouns, and I'm the Executive  
9 Director of the CCRB.

10 MR. FOX: Hello. Joe Fox, Police  
11 Commissioner representative.

12 MR. JEMMOTT: Good afternoon. My name  
13 is Kevin Jemmott, and I'm a mayoral appointee  
14 from Queens.

15 MR. SMITH: Good afternoon. Pat Smith,  
16 mayoral appointee, Manhattan.

17 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Good afternoon.  
18 Charlane Brown-Wyands, Police Commissioner  
19 designee.

20 CHAIR RICE: Thank you.  
21 Is there anyone, Sorin (phonetic), on the  
22 line?

23 SPEAKER: No.

24 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Terrific.

25 I'd like to ask for a motion to approve

1 the February board meeting minutes, as  
2 presented.

3 MR. SMITH: So moved.

4 CHAIR RICE: A second?

5 MR. JEMMOTT: Madam Chair?

6 CHAIR RICE: Uh-huh. Did you have a  
7 question?

8 MR. JEMMOTT: Yes. I saw the  
9 introductions from the virtual board members,  
10 but I didn't see the introduction from the  
11 board members that were present in the  
12 minutes.

13 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Kevin, for  
14 bringing that to light.

15 MR. DARCHE: Chair Rice, if I could  
16 suggest that we table the minutes until next  
17 month, where we will go over both and we'll  
18 make sure these get corrected.

19 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Thank you for  
20 that suggestion.

21 And thank you, Mr. Jemmott, for  
22 bringing that to our attention. That did --  
23 we did miss that.

24 Okay. I joined this board in 2021 and  
25 have witnessed firsthand the incredible work

1           this agency accomplishes. The CCRB is a core  
2           component of public safety in the City.  
3           Disciplining officers and holding them  
4           accountable for their misconduct is a  
5           necessity if we want to see patterns of  
6           misconduct change. The City Council showed  
7           their faith in the work of the CCRB by  
8           passing a bill in 2021, asking the CCRB to  
9           take on the investigations of racial  
10          profiling and bias-based policing. That same  
11          year, this board voted to include sexual  
12          misconduct and untruthful statements in the  
13          CCRB's jurisdiction.

14                 The next year, the CCRB began  
15          investigating body-worn camera misuse. These  
16          various expansions to our jurisdiction added  
17          3,825 allegations to our docket. While our  
18          work grows, our funding does not. We want to  
19          serve New Yorkers as best we can, and we  
20          believe the best way to serve the City is by  
21          holding all misconduct accountable.

22                 Last year, we received 50 percent more  
23          complaints than the year before. This is not  
24          due solely to our expanded jurisdiction, but  
25          New Yorkers are filing more complaints than

1           they have in the past ten years. It is  
2           impossible to take on this much extra work  
3           and not hire more people. Sadly, this has  
4           resulted in necessary cuts from the Agency.  
5           As we announced in December, the CCRB will no  
6           longer investigate certain allegations, as we  
7           did not have the funding to do so. Thus far,  
8           we have closed 406 cases due to budget cuts.

9                        Next week, I will be testifying before  
10           the Public Safety Committee as to why the  
11           CCRB needs far more funding than we have ever  
12           been granted. No misconduct should go  
13           unaddressed, but the only way to properly  
14           address all misconduct is to properly fund  
15           the CCRB. We hope for support from the City  
16           Council and the Mayor's Office, as we fight  
17           for sufficient funding for the coming years,  
18           in order to make New York safe for all of its  
19           people. I will be testifying at the Public  
20           Safety Committee's budget hearing on  
21           March 20th. I look forward to continuing to  
22           advocate for the CCRB to be funded at a level  
23           that will enable it to guarantee a fair and  
24           impartial investigation to our neighbors who  
25           feel they are victims to police misconduct.



1 I will now pass it over to Executive  
2 Director Jonathan Darche, who will speak to  
3 continued increase in cases in 2024.

4 Jon.

5 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Chair Rice.

6 As the Chair just mentioned, the CCRB  
7 received 50 percent more complaints in 2023  
8 than in 2022, for a total of 5,550  
9 complaints. In January and February of 2024,  
10 we are already on pace to receive even more  
11 complaints. We received 15 percent more  
12 complaints than we did during the same time  
13 period last year. If we continue to receive  
14 complaints at this rate, we will receive  
15 6,200 complaints in 2024; that would be the  
16 highest level of complaints since 2010. If  
17 you look quickly at the Agency's open docket,  
18 you would see that it was at 1,693 open  
19 investigations on March 1st of this year, as  
20 compared to 1,630 on March 1st of last year.  
21 This is misleading because of the new policy  
22 on allegations that we are not investigating.

23 The open docket was actually 2,000 on  
24 January 1st of 2024. Since then, the Agency  
25 has closed 379 complaints in January and

1 another 124 in February, due to the new  
2 policy that we've been forced to adopt  
3 because of budget cuts. That is more than  
4 500 complaints all within the Agency's  
5 jurisdiction, that the CCRB will not  
6 investigate. As Chair Rice said, to keep up  
7 with this ever-increasing number of  
8 complaints, the CCRB needs a significant  
9 amount of additional staff and resources.

10 This past Saturday, I spoke at a panel  
11 on the state of civilian oversight in  
12 New York State. It was hosted by Assembly  
13 Member Catalina Cruz and Senator Jamaal  
14 Bailey at Somos in Albany. One of the other  
15 panel members was Larry Knox of the Rochester  
16 Police Accountability Board. As we look  
17 forward to next week's budget hearing, I  
18 think there might be something to learn, by  
19 comparing the relative fiscal commitments to  
20 the civilian oversight by both cities.

21 Larry spoke about how the Rochester  
22 Police Accountability Board has a staff of 30  
23 and a budget of \$3.5 million, to conduct  
24 oversight over a police force of  
25 approximately 850 people.

1                   The NYPD is approximately 43 times  
2                   bigger than the Rochester PD. That makes  
3                   sense because New York City's population is  
4                   roughly 41 times bigger than Rochester's. If  
5                   the New York City CCRB was 41 times bigger  
6                   than Rochester's, we would have 1,256 people  
7                   on staff. The current proposed budget would  
8                   limit the CCRB to 228 people. If the CCRB's  
9                   budget was 41 times bigger than the Rochester  
10                  Police Accountability Board's budget, the  
11                  CCRB's budget would be \$146 million, about  
12                  seven times its current size.

13                  New York City has been considered a  
14                  leader in police reform since the inception  
15                  of the CCRB, but we are trailing other cities  
16                  in terms of funding, staffing, and access to  
17                  police records. We hope to begin rectifying  
18                  these discrepancies and funding the CCRB  
19                  appropriately, so that we can continue to  
20                  oversee the largest police force in the  
21                  country.

22                  Just a few administrative reminders as  
23                  we go on to the rest of the meeting. Our  
24                  office is open for walk-in complaints, but  
25                  it's also possible to file complaints online

1 at nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint. That's  
2 N-Y-C.G-O-V/C-C-R-B-C-O-M-P-L-A-I-N-T. By  
3 telephone at 1(800)341-2272 or by dialing  
4 3-1-1. If anyone wishes to file a complaint  
5 who is here today or joining us online today,  
6 we have three investigators on hand ready to  
7 take new complaints; Jillian Bevens, Emma  
8 Stydahar, and Jessica Russo, as well as one of  
9 our CAU associates, Brennia Feliciano.

10 We're going to hear from folks who are  
11 joining us online first before we go to  
12 people who are at the meeting in person and  
13 wish to comment. Regardless of whether you  
14 are joining online or here in person, please  
15 keep your comments to four minutes. If you  
16 are joining online and wish to participate,  
17 please use the raise-your-hand feature.

18 Thanks to the staff for their hard  
19 work, and thanks again to the members of the  
20 public for participating in tonight's  
21 meeting.

22 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much, Jon.

23 We'll ask Frank, as you come to join  
24 us, if you can introduce yourself for the  
25 record.

1 Frank.

2 MR. DWYER: I'm Frank Dwyer. Sorry to  
3 join you late. I'm a Police Commissioner  
4 representative.

5 CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

6 Does anyone have any questions for our  
7 executive director?

8 (No response).

9 CHAIR RICE: Any questions?

10 (No response).

11 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Thank you.

12 We're going to have a presentation from  
13 our Deputy Director of Outreach and  
14 Intergovernmental Affairs, Mister -- wait.  
15 No, we're not having Jahi. We're having --  
16 he's over there.

17 We're having Maroua Righi. And my  
18 apologies if I mispronounce your name, and  
19 please feel free to correct me.

20 MS. RIGHI: Good afternoon, everyone. My  
21 name is Maroua Righi, and I'm the Deputy  
22 Director of Outreach and Intergovernmental  
23 Affairs of the Civilian Complaint Review  
24 Board.

25 The CCRB is the nation's largest

1 independent oversight entity of the largest  
2 police force in the country. The CCRB  
3 investigates, mediates, and prosecutes  
4 complaints of misconduct against members of  
5 the NYPD. And the agency is governed by a  
6 15-member board with five seats appointed by  
7 the Mayor, five appointed by City Council,  
8 three designated by the Police Commissioner,  
9 one appointed by the Public Advocate, and the  
10 Chair is appointed jointly by the Mayor and  
11 City Council.

12 The CCRB investigates abuses of force,  
13 abuse of authority, discourtesy, and  
14 offensive language. On September 9th of  
15 2023, the Office of Management and Budget  
16 announced citywide budget cuts. So, as a  
17 result, the CCRB is no longer able to fully  
18 investigate certain cases within its  
19 jurisdiction. After careful consideration,  
20 effective January 1, 2024, the CCRB suspended  
21 investigating the following; failure to  
22 provide Right-to-Know Act cards with no other  
23 allegations, refusal to provide name or  
24 shield number with no other allegations,  
25 discourteous words or actions with no other

1           allegations, threats with no action with no  
2           other allegations, refusal to process a  
3           civilian complaint with no other allegations,  
4           property seizures with to other allegations,  
5           forceable removal to hospital with no other  
6           allegations, untruthful statements with no  
7           other allegations, and lastly, any complaint  
8           that has only the above-referenced  
9           allegations.

10                   The CCRB will resume investigating  
11           these cases as soon as the City allocates  
12           sufficient funding to do so. If a complaint  
13           contains one of the above allegations, in  
14           addition to other allegations that still fall  
15           with CCRB jurisdiction, every allegation in  
16           the complaint will still be investigated.  
17           So, if a person would like to file a CCRB  
18           complaint, they can do so by filing the  
19           complaint online at our website  
20           nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint. You could also call  
21           the CCRB at our number 1(800)341-CCRB. And  
22           remember, if you see footage of misconduct on  
23           social media or in the news, you can still  
24           file a complaint, even if you weren't there  
25           in person.

1                   There's a few other ways: You can also  
2                   visit us at our office. We're located at  
3                   100 Church Street, 10th Floor, here in  
4                   Manhattan. You can also file a complaint at  
5                   your local police precinct. NYPD is required  
6                   to accept CCRB complaints at any precinct.  
7                   And you can request a complaint form and  
8                   postage free envelope.

9                   Now, I will ask our Staten Island  
10                  Outreach Coordinator to discuss Staten Island  
11                  outreach.

12                  MR. COBBINA: Good afternoon. My name  
13                  is Prince Cobbina. I am the Staten Island  
14                  outreach coordinator. So, I'm just here to  
15                  give an overview of year up to date, from the  
16                  beginning of the year to now, what outreach  
17                  activities been going on in Staten Island, so  
18                  I'm just going to give a brief data.

19                  So, the year to date, we encountered at  
20                  least 1,720 people, individuals, you know,  
21                  giving information about CCRB. Regards to  
22                  outreach events up to the year is 50,  
23                  outreach events partners to the date, 21;  
24                  complaints received 2023 to date from Staten  
25                  Island is 246, complaints closed from 2023 to



1 date is 278, for the substantiated cases from  
2 '23 to date is 70.

3 So, some of the outreaches, there are  
4 pictures on the board, on the screen, rather.  
5 The first on the top left is myself and with  
6 some of the CMS programs, I know Brother AU.  
7 CMS, True 2 Life, definitely, we work with  
8 them on Staten Island, you know, doing a lot  
9 of things on Staten Island, giving out flyers  
10 and as well as helping them, you know,  
11 conduct their services as well. And, also,  
12 on the bottom right, some of our CCRB  
13 initiative, which is the CCRB Cares. Myself  
14 helping one of the Muslim community on Staten  
15 Island, you know, giving out food to the  
16 parish and as well as the members in the  
17 community. And, also, some of the other  
18 activities on Martin Luther King's Day, a day  
19 of service, I was able to work with some of  
20 the elected officials on Staten Island,  
21 Assemblyman Charles Fall, Counsel Woman  
22 Hanks, as well as Senator Spanton. The  
23 Borough President was there as well, so we  
24 were able to clean up some of the portions of  
25 Staten Island.

1                   And the middle picture is one of the  
2                   presentations I conducted at A Chance In  
3                   Life. A Chance In Life is another  
4                   organization on Staten Island which -- they  
5                   work with young individuals, young youth on  
6                   Staten Island, that's to educate them with  
7                   leadership and empowerment. So, I was asked  
8                   to come in to speak to them about, you know,  
9                   the CCRB, what we provide and things like  
10                  that.

11                  The last picture is one of the recent  
12                  Youth Empowerment Summit, which is by Island  
13                  Voice and Canvas Institute by a gentleman  
14                  named Bobby Digi; that was done probably like  
15                  a week or two ago. So, it was a lot of teens  
16                  from different parts of Staten Island come in  
17                  to discuss any current events, as well as any  
18                  concerns that the teens is having. And they  
19                  have breakout rooms where it's talking about  
20                  gun violence and other activities. They have  
21                  breakout rooms. So, I was able to go in --  
22                  and as well as tabling as well, so I was  
23                  doing both.

24                  So, after they finish the breakout  
25                  room, they will come and get information from

1 my table, and as well I give them more  
2 explanation about CCRB, you know, the  
3 structure, the complaints, how to file and  
4 all those things like that. So, this is some  
5 of the things that's going on in Staten  
6 Island right now through March, but it's  
7 always something going on.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. RIGHI: Thank you, Prince.

10 So, just to end, if anyone would like  
11 to request an outreach presentation, they can  
12 reach out by e-mailing outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov,  
13 and please follow us on social media. We  
14 have the same user name on Instagram, Twitter  
15 and Facebook at CCRB\_NYC.

16 Thank you.

17 MR. DARCHE: Madam Chair, I probably  
18 should have explained this before, but as you  
19 know, in the past, we've tried to go to every  
20 borough at least once during the year, and  
21 we've been unable to do so this year after  
22 the budget cuts. And so, we're still  
23 committed to giving each borough, once a  
24 year, time in the spotlight. And I want to  
25 thank Prince for joining Maroua in giving

1                   that presentation. It was very helpful.

2                   CHAIR RICE: Very much. Thank you so  
3 much. I know I enjoyed hearing the  
4 additional information.

5                   So, that means we'll be hearing from  
6 each one of the boroughs over the course of  
7 the next couple of months?

8                   MR. DARCHE: Yes.

9                   CHAIR RICE: Okay. Terrific. Good.  
10 Good. I look forward to that.

11                   Are there any questions from other  
12 members of the Board?

13                   AU.

14                   MR. HOGAN: I just want to say that I  
15 really appreciate the presentation. And it's  
16 good seeing Staten Island being in front of  
17 something in New York City. But yeah, on a  
18 serious note, the brother that Prince talked  
19 about, one of the brothers from CMS, Iron  
20 Mike Perry, lost his brother this past week,  
21 and I just wanted to send condolences to him  
22 and his family on the Board. You know, the  
23 work is very complicated what we do out  
24 there, you know, and I just want to put that  
25 out.

1                   And Prince, thank you for the work out  
2                   there, man.

3                   MR. COBBINA: That happened this past  
4                   weekend, so we're dealing with that as well  
5                   on Staten Island in regards to his brother,  
6                   so -- and he was part of the CMS program,  
7                   too, and it's kind of difficult for them  
8                   going through that, but they're still out  
9                   there in the streets doing what they're  
10                  doing. They're not stopping, so my hats goes  
11                  off to them, the guys and the ladies out,  
12                  it's -- they do amazing things on Staten  
13                  Island, so...

14                  MR. HOGAN: So do you. Thank you, man.  
15                  (Laughter).

16                  CHAIR RICE: Thank you, AU.  
17                  Thank you, Prince, again.

18                  Any other questions or comments from  
19                  the members of the Board?

20                  (No response).

21                  CHAIR RICE: Okay. Thank you. We  
22                  really appreciated that presentation.

23                  We have another board member who has  
24                  joined us.

25                  Esmeralda, can you state your name for

1 the record, please.

2 MS. SIMMONS: Esmeralda Simmons. I'm  
3 an appointee of the Public Advocate Jumaane  
4 Williams. I hail from Bed-Stuy, Brooklyn.

5 CHAIR RICE: Terrific. Good to see  
6 you, Esmeralda.

7 We will now enter the public comment  
8 portion of the meeting. We will begin with  
9 those joining us virtually who would like to  
10 make a comment, followed by those who are  
11 joining us in person. For those joining  
12 virtually, please use the raise-your-hand  
13 feature, and please keep your comments to  
14 four minutes.

15 All righty. Jahi, would you call on  
16 the first person, virtually.

17 MR. ROSE: Okay. So, so far, there are  
18 no hands raised for the public comment  
19 section online.

20 CHAIR RICE: No one virtually? No one.  
21 Okay. Great. Thank you.

22 For those who are joining us in person  
23 and are interested in making a public  
24 comment, please line up behind the podium.  
25 We're going to ask you to keep your comments

1 to four minutes, anyone who is joining us in  
2 person who would like to make a comment  
3 today.

4 (No response).

5 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Seeing none, do we  
6 have any old business to come before the  
7 Board this evening?

8 (No response).

9 CHAIR RICE: Do we have any old  
10 business to come before the Board; any old  
11 business?

12 (No response).

13 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Do we have any new  
14 business to come before the Board?

15 (No response).

16 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing none, I'm  
17 going to now move that we break into  
18 Executive Session. The agenda for the  
19 Executive Session is the Board will undergo  
20 training, the Executive Director will discuss  
21 pending personnel actions, and the general  
22 counsel will update the Board on pending  
23 litigation. I would like to call the March  
24 Board meeting, the CCRB, to a close.

25 Do I have a motion for us to call the

1 board meeting to a close?

2 MR. DARCHE: So, just to be clear, the  
3 motion is to adjourn to Executive Session.

4 CHAIR RICE: I'm sorry. Yes, thank  
5 you.

6 Do I have a motion to adjourn to the  
7 Executive Session?

8 MR. MERRITT: So moved.

9 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Do I have a second?

10 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Second.

11 CHAIR RICE: Okay. So moved.

12 The March meeting public session is  
13 adjourned. Thank you.

14 (TIME NOTED: 4:33 p.m.)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness whose examination is hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn and that such an examination is a true record of the testimony given by such a witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of these parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am not in any way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand on this 21st day of March, 2024.

*Sabrina Brown Stewart*  
Sabrina Brown Stewart