

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

PUBLIC BOARD MEETING

MARCH 8, 2023

6:39 P.M.

HELD AT BRONX COMMUNITY BOARD 12 OFFICE

4101 WHITE PLAINS ROAD

BRONX, NEW YORK

AND VIA WEBEX VIDEOCONFERENCE

B E F O R E:

ARVA RICE, INTERIM CHAIR

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Transcribed By:

Tiffanie Jones

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of Minutes
3. Remarks from the Chair
4. Remarks from the Executive Director
5. Presentation from the Director of
Outreach on the CCRB
6. Comment from Community Groups
7. Public Comment
8. Old Business
9. New Business
10. Adjourn to Executive Session

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

=====

- 1. Arva Rice - Interim Chair
- 2. Charlane Brown-Wyands, Esq. - Board Member
- 3. Joseph Fox - Board Member
- 4. Frank Dwyer - Board Member
- 5. Joseph A. Puma - Board Member
- 6. June Northern - Board Member
- 7. AU Hogan - Board Member
- 8. John Siegal, Esq. - Board Member
- 9. Esmeralda Simmons, Esq. - Board Member
- 10. Kevin Jemmott - Board Member
- 11. Herman Merritt - Board Member

PRESENTERS

=====

JAHl ROSE - Director of Outreach New York City
Civilian Complaint Review Board

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKERS

=====

- 1. Yadiria Moncion - B.R.A.G. North Director,
Bronx Rises Against Gun (B.R.A.G.)
Violence, Good Shepherd Services
- 2. Kevin Riley - Council Member
- 3. Rue Parkin - Founder & Chair, HelpNYC
- 4. Subira Williams - Director, Will.I.Dance
- 5. Ms. Jennings, Community Member
- 6. Loretta Humphrey - President, Greater
Triangular Civic Association
- 7. Hyne Lanoris
- 8. Emma Louis Green
- 9. Chris Teel
- 10. Ms. Green
- 11. Gina Williams - Bronx Advocate, Office of
the NYC Public Advocate
- 12. Ron Franklin
- 13. Javier Seda
- 14. Anthony Jennings

1
2 CHAIR RICE: Good evening. Good
3 evening. Good evening. Good evening,
4 and welcome. My name is Arva Rice. I
5 use she/her pronouns, and I'm the
6 interim chair of the Civilian Complaint
7 Review Board. I would like to call the
8 CCRB's March public board meeting to
9 order.

10 I would like to start tonight's
11 meeting by acknowledging some of the
12 changes to our board. I would like to
13 thank Dr. Carolina, Mr. Freeman and Mr.
14 Carcaterra for their service to this
15 board. They dedicated much of their
16 lives to serving New Yorkers, and we are
17 grateful for the time that they gave to
18 this agency. And pleased to welcome two
19 new board members, Charlane Brown-Wyands
20 and Joseph Fox, Commissioner Sewell's
21 first two designees. Ms. Brown and Mr.
22 Fox both served the New York -- the New
23 York for decades, and we are lucky to
24 have their expertise and passion as they
25 join this board.

1
2 Will Ms. Charlane Brown-Wyands and
3 Mr. Fox please now introduce themselves.
4 Charlane.

5 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Thank you, Madam
6 Chairman. As Ms. Rice said, my name is
7 Charlane Brown-Wyands, and it is a -- it
8 is a pleasure and an honor for me to
9 return to city service in this capacity.
10 I worked with the City for over 26
11 years, and I'm looking forward to using
12 my experience to help New Yorkers.
13 Thank you very much.

14 MR. FOX: Thank you, Madam Chair. I
15 -- I'm also honored to be here. I
16 signed onto the NYPD in 1981 to serve
17 our city, and I'm very fortunate to be
18 able to continue in this important form
19 of -- form of service. And I just a --
20 a -- it's the -- it truly is an honor.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

23 I would like to ask for a motion to
24 approve the minutes as presented.

25 BOARD MEMBER: So moved.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIR RICE: Do I have a second?

BOARD MEMBER: Second.

CHAIR RICE: Are there any changes?

MR. SIEGAL: There actually was a --

CHAIR RICE: Oh, we do have a change? Okay. All right. Let's hear them.

MR. SIEGAL: Page 19, Line 25, it says "end", and it should say tend with a "T".

CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

MR. SIEGAL: I went through the notes. They actually get read.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

Anyone else have any amendments to the minutes?

(No response.)

CHAIR RICE: All right. We will make the appropriate changes, and review the corrected meetings next month.

Last week, Executive Director, Jonathan Darche, and I testified before the City Council Public Safety Committee regarding NYPD's strategic resource

1
2 group. In this testimony, I shared CCRB
3 complaint data regarding S -- SRG
4 officers, and answered council members'
5 questions on our work. I also used the
6 opportunity to advocate for the agency.

7 The CCRB has a unique role in public
8 safety that is critical. We are the
9 place for citizens to voice their
10 complaints in regards to FADO issues. I
11 re -- I reiterated that the
12 ever-increasing work the agency is
13 taking on, both with rule changes and
14 charter changes. The CCRB has taken on
15 over 800 new cases with the new powers,
16 including racial profiling and
17 biased-based policing. The power to
18 investigate untruthful statements,
19 sexual misconduct, body-worn camera
20 misuse and more.

21 In order to keep up with this new
22 case load, we need more investigative
23 staff in order to close these cases in
24 an efficient and timely manner. In
25 addition, since the implementation of

1
2 the disciplinary matrix, six times the
3 number of cases were sent to the APU in
4 2021 than in 2020. The APU has hundreds
5 of cases waiting to be tried, and we
6 need more prosecutors to keep up with
7 the quantity of new cases. We will
8 reiterate our need for more head count
9 and money in our budget hearing on March
10 20th.

11 We also reiterated our need for
12 direct access to NYPD documents and
13 data. Last week, the City Council
14 introduced a bill that would give the
15 CCRB direct access to body-worn camera
16 footage. The City Council will hold a
17 hearing on this bill on March 27th, and
18 the CCRB will testify.

19 I'm grateful for the opportunity to
20 address the City Council so many times
21 this month, and advocate for the urgent
22 needs of the agency. I thank all the
23 investigators, prosecutors and staff at
24 large for taking on this extra work, as
25 we try and secure more reasonable

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

staffing levels.

As we kickoff women's history month, I would like to take a moment to acknowledge that for the first time ever, women of color are leading the City Council, the Police Department and the CCRB. 50 percent of CCRB's employees are women, and the CCRB's women's affinity group will be holding its first meeting of the year in two weeks.

I would also like to thank George Torres and the Bronx Community Board 12 for hosting us this evening. We are so happy to bring the CCRB back to the Bronx. I will now pass it off to Executive Director, Jonathan Darche.

Jon.

MR. DARCHE: Madam Chair, do you want to ask the other board members to introduce themselves?

CHAIR RICE: Oh, my apologies. I would like to do that.

Could I have the board members

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

introduce themselves. I'm starting on my right.

MR. DWYER: I am Frank Dwyer, and I'm the third police commissioner representative.

MR. PUMA: Good evening, everyone. My name is Joseph Puma. I'm the Manhattan City Council appointee on the board, lifelong NYCHA resident. I also wanted to extend the regrets of our City Council designee from the Bronx, Michael Rivadeneyra, who couldn't attend today. He's actually in D.C. for his full-time job. I know it was really tough for him not to be able to attend today.

MS. NORTHERN: Oh, I'm June Northern. I'm mayor appointee for Brooklyn.

MR. DARCHE: I'm Jon Darche, I'm the executive director of the agency, and I use he/him pronouns.

MR. HOGAN: AU Hogan, Queens City Council designee from Southeast Queens.

MR. SIEGAL: John Siegal, I'm one of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the mayoral appointees. And I live right here in the Bronx, in the Riverdale section.

CHAIR RICE: And if we could have our board members who are joining us online introduce themselves, as well, starting with Esmeralda.

MS. SIMMONS: Esmeralda Simmons, I'm the public advocate appointee, and I live in Bedford-Stuyvesant, Brooklyn.

CHAIR RICE: Okay.

MR. JEMMOTT: Good evening. I'm Kevin Jemmott, and I'm the mayor appointee from Queens.

MR. MERRITT: Good evening. My name is Herman Merritt, I'm the City Council designee from Brooklyn. I live in Bed-Stuy.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Thank you so much.

And with that, I'll turn it over to our executive director.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Madam Chair.

At last week's City Council hearing,

1
2 one of the council members asked about
3 our status with data and document
4 sharing with the NYPD. This is
5 particularly relevant for the new unit
6 investigating racial profiling and
7 biased-based policing. In order to
8 investigate racial profiling and
9 bias-based policing, the CCRB needs
10 access to data beyond that for the
11 incident, which is being complained
12 about. This is one of the reasons the
13 CCRB needs to be sent from State-sealing
14 statutes. To investigate profiling
15 complaints, we need to compare the
16 behavior of the subject officer or
17 subject officers to larger data sets, in
18 order to see if the subject officer's
19 behavior deviates from the larger group.
20 Since our testimony last week, we have
21 made significant progress working with
22 the New York City Police Department, and
23 we are optimistic that we will receive
24 the data we need soon.

25 I would also like to update the

1
2 public on the case of Delrawn Small.
3 Mr. Small was killed in 2016 by officer
4 Wayne Isaac. And in 2020, the CCRB
5 substantiated misconduct against that
6 member of service. In 2021, the agency
7 filed a motion to unseal court records
8 that would provide evidence to our
9 prosecutors, in order for them to bring
10 that case to trial. Last week, a judge
11 granted the CCRB access to the sealed
12 records, and our prosecutors are now
13 moving forward with this case. This is
14 another illustration of why the CCRB
15 needs to be exempt from State-sealing
16 statutes. Mr. Small's family have
17 waited seven years for accountability.
18 And the CCRB staff will do its utmost to
19 move this case forward quickly.

20 Finally, just some notes about
21 tonight's meeting. If you are
22 interested in filing a complaint, our
23 office is open for walk-in complaints,
24 but it's also possible to file a
25 complaint here tonight. The

1
2 investigators who are with us tonight
3 are Emma Stydahar and Michael Talisayan.
4 If you guys could raise your hands.
5 Right there. Or, you can file complaint
6 online at NYC.gov/CCRBComplaint. That
7 is NYC.gov/CCRBComplaint. You can call
8 us by telephone to file a complaint at:
9 1(800) 341-2272, or by dialing 3-1-1.

10 And finally, this evening, if you
11 would like to make a comment and you're
12 online with us, please use the raise
13 your hand feature. And whether you are
14 online or here tonight and you're making
15 a comment, please keep your comments to
16 a four-minute maximum. I want to thank
17 our staff for their hard work. It's --
18 it's tough for us when we bring -- when
19 we come into communities sometimes to
20 get all of our IT equipment ready, and
21 they do a very good job. And I want to
22 thank everyone who is here with us
23 tonight, and the folks who are with us
24 online for joining us this meeting.

25 Thank you, Madam Chair.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

Does anyone have any questions for executive director? Does anyone have any questions?

(No response.)

CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing none, we will hear our presentation from Director of Outreach, Jahi Rose.

MR. ROSE: Well, thank you all very much for attending. I'm just going to give you some brief information relating to the Civilian Complaint Review Board. My name is Jahi Rose, I go by he/him pronouns, and I'm the director of outreach for the Civilian Complaint Review Board.

So the Civilian Complaint Review Board is the largest oversight entity over the largest police force in the country. The CCRB investigates, mediates, and administratively prosecutes complaints about misconduct against members of the New York City Police Department. The agency is

1
2 governed by a 15-member board: Five
3 seats are appointed by the mayor; five
4 are appointed by the New York City
5 Council; three designated by the police
6 commissioner; one appointed by the New
7 York City public advocate; and the chair
8 is jointly appointed by the mayor and
9 the City Council. You've met a few of
10 our board members here on dais.

11 The CCRB investigates allegations of
12 force, abuse of authority, discourtesy,
13 and offensive language. Just a few
14 facts about the -- Right-to-Know Act.
15 The Right-to-Know Act was a rule that
16 went into -- a law that went into effect
17 in October of 2018. This impacts the
18 police interactions with the -- with New
19 York City civilians, which includes
20 officers being required under certain
21 circumstances to identify themselves by
22 providing things like their name, their
23 rank, command, and shield number. With
24 some exceptions, officers should be
25 explaining the purpose of the encounter

1
2 or the interaction. Officers should be
3 informing individuals of their right to
4 say no, when requesting consent to search
5 an individual's person, property, vehicle
6 or home. And officers under certain
7 circumstances should be offering business
8 cards, which has information about how
9 you can make a comment and/or complaint
10 about an interaction with an officer.
11 Civilians may request a business card in
12 all encounters.

13 This is a -- just a copy of what the
14 business card looks like.

15 There are various ways to report
16 police misconduct. As mentioned by
17 Executive Director, Jon Darche, I could
18 file a complaint by using our website
19 NYC.gov/CCRBComplaint, or call the CCRB
20 hotline at 1(800) 341-CCRB or 1(800)
21 341-2272.

22 Remember, if you see footage of
23 misconduct on social media or in the
24 news, you could file a complaint online.
25 Even if you weren't there in person, you

1
2 could feel free to use the typical
3 handle for the CCRB, which is CCRB_NYC.

4 Other ways to file complaints
5 include coming to the CCRB's office at
6 100 Church Street in Lower Manhattan, on
7 the 10th Floor. You can also direct
8 message the CCRB on our platforms at
9 Facebook, Twitter and Instagram. As
10 I've mentioned, the handle is CCRB_NYC.

11 You could also file a complaint
12 using snail mail or mail by sending it
13 to one of -- 100 Church Street, 10th
14 Floor, New York, New York; ZIP code,
15 10007. You could also file a complaint
16 at any local police precinct. It does
17 not have to be the precinct where the
18 encounter may have taken place.

19 Officers are required to accept CCRB
20 complaints at any precinct in the City
21 of New York, and you can also request a
22 complaint form and a self-addressed
23 envelope -- postage free.

24 If you'd like to receive an outreach
25 presentation and learn more about the

1
2 Civilian Complaint Review Board to
3 virtually anyone in your community, feel
4 free to contact the CCRB's outreach team
5 at Outreach@CCRB.NYC.gov. And also,
6 feel free to follow us on social media
7 -- on Instagram, Twitter and Facebook.

8 Thank you, Chair.

9 CHAIR RICE: Do any members of the
10 board have any questions for Jahi? Any
11 questions?

12 (No response.)

13 CHAIR RICE: All right. Thank you
14 so much.

15 At this time, we'd like to hear from
16 Council Member, Kevin Riley.

17 Council Member Riley, thank you for
18 joining us this evening.

19 MR. RILEY: Thank you, Madam Chair.
20 And to the board, just thank you so much
21 for coming to the 12th District and
22 having your hearing today, and to
23 everyone that came out here. I think
24 it's important the work that you guys
25 do. As you stated, you guys were at

1

2

City Hall last week, and we asked you guys some tough questions, which you were able to answer for us. And also, we're going to continue to advocate for your funding. I think it's very important that you receive adequate funding towards -- the work that you do.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

So I would just like to thank you for everything that you've been doing. This is a very vibrant community. We try our best to work with our officers, but there are still some that, you know, don't -- are bad apples. That's why I personally wanted to come today because a constituent of mine was going through something with her son recently, and hopefully you guys -- she said that you guys have been doing amazing work with her already, so, hopefully, she'll get some justice, as well; but thank you so much for everything you're doing.

23

24

25

Madam Chair, happy Women's International Day and -- and we celebrate you guys every single month.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

So continue doing the great work that you're doing. And to everyone that came in today, thank you for coming, also.

I have to run to a couple other events, but Max from our office, that's raised his hands is going to be here; and Jasmine from Speaker Heastie's office is also here, as well. All right. Thank you, everyone.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much. We will now hear from local community leaders. We want to thank you so much for joining us. And as a reminder, we are going to ask you to remember to keep your comments to four minutes.

MR. DARCHE: Yes, you should ask Yojaira if she could tell us who's up next.

CHAIR RICE: Yojaira, can you let us know who is up next?

Yojaira, can you hear us?

MS. ALVAREZ: Hello? Can you hear me now.

Chair?

1
2 First we'll be hearing from Yadira
3 Moncion from BRAG North. She's the
4 director there.

5 MS. MONCION: Yadira, Yojaira, I'm
6 like -- good evening, and thank you for
7 having me here. Good evening, everyone.
8 So my name is Yadira Moncion, and I am
9 currently a director of BRAG North,
10 under the umbrella of Good Shepherd
11 Services. That is an anti-gun violence
12 program that I worked for -- Cure
13 violence to be specific.

14 So I had the privilege to just get
15 some community members together, and
16 staff members that are born, lifetime
17 residents of the Bronx. And I have had
18 previous engagements with police
19 officers in our local precincts. And it
20 was a consensus that what the community
21 is looking for is engagement training
22 for police officers. There's such a
23 disconnect between the officers who are
24 serving our communities, and the members
25 who are actually there living there.

1
2 I heard plenty stories where the
3 disconnect is just not knowing what is
4 the purpose. So, for example, is: We
5 have cars patrolling our complex -- our
6 NYCHA complex. They're not actually
7 patrolling. Sitting in your car is not
8 patrolling. Sitting in your car and not
9 engaging civilians is not patrolling.
10 If anything, it's intimidating and
11 standoffish.

12 The community wants to actually
13 engage. It's -- where does the starting
14 point begin to let -- let go of what has
15 transpired in the past. We can't make
16 up -- there's no making up of what has
17 happened, but let's come to -- make some
18 amends and let's move forward. The
19 public is crying for engagement.

20 We want to take it back to basics.
21 We're not seeing events being done with
22 police officers. And when I say
23 "basics", basics. The basketball
24 tournaments. We don't have enough
25 officers just stopping and engaging our

1
2 youth, and that's where a lot of our
3 issues and current violence is
4 happening. It's starting at a younger
5 and younger age in the Bronx, and across
6 New York City, as well.

7 So we're doing our part, and what we
8 want as communities from the Bronx is
9 for officers to acknowledge that they
10 have also been a part of that issue with
11 engagement with civilians. The stop and
12 frisk has been an issue. It's
13 constantly being harassed -- the same
14 people. Once I paid my dues and I come
15 back, why am I still being harassed, why
16 am I being still stopped. So that was
17 also a constant cry from community
18 members.

19 Working on building trust is
20 something that the community knows.
21 It's -- It's scary, not only for the
22 officers, but to us as civilians; but
23 it's something that they're open to.
24 They just want to see the change from
25 officers that are patrolling their

1
2 communities. Again, engagement is
3 important, and building that trust would
4 lead to rapport where we are starting to
5 police ourselves, where police officers
6 are not -- going to be no longer needed
7 in our communities. So I thank you for
8 this time.

9 CHAIR RICE: We're going to try
10 again.

11 Yojaira, do you have the next
12 speaker.

13 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair. Are
14 you able to hear me now? Chair, are you
15 able to hear me now?

16 CHAIR RICE: Yes, we can.

17 MS. ALVAREZ: Okay. Perfect. Next,
18 we'll be hearing from Subira Williams,
19 who is joining us virtually.

20 RUE PARKIN: This is Rue Parkin,
21 I've been unmuted. I also can't see the
22 room.

23 CHAIR RICE: Mr. Parkin, we can --
24 proceed.

25 MR. DARCHE: There's no Ms. Williams

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

on?

MS. ALVAREZ: It looks like we're getting a little -- a bit of technical difficulties online.

Mr. -- Mr. Parkin, we can hear you, so you can proceed.

RUE PARKIN: Okay. I'm not sure if you can see me or not, but I'm Mitch Parkin -- I'm Rue Parkin. Please call me Rue. My pronouns are they/them. And I would like to thank the Community Board -- okay. I'm getting a prompt on my end -- okay. I guess you guys can see me now. I can't see you. I'm sorry about this.

I'd like to thank Community Board 12 for hosting tonight, and Nick, Jahi for their work and outreach to us community leaders and the CBO's here in New York City. HelpNYC is a peer-driven organization that covers all five boroughs here in New York City. We are people with lived experience that help people navigate low-barrier services

1
2 here in the city. Our primary program
3 is the HelpNYC.Info resource navigator.
4 That is the only verified resource
5 navigator that is based in New York
6 City, serving all New Yorkers that have
7 experienced systemic trauma, either
8 connecting with or disconnecting from
9 community-based services and city
10 services.

11 7,000 -- over 7,000 New Yorkers
12 access our website a month to gather
13 information on where to get food
14 assistance, advocacy resources, mental
15 health, substance use; over 65
16 categories of service. We have 230
17 partners spread across all five boroughs
18 and we list over 500 low-barrier,
19 verified resources.

20 A huge part of HelpNYC's work is
21 mental health response, and those who
22 are unhoused and experiencing street
23 homelessness here in New York City. I
24 have personally witnessed misconduct to
25 those populations. In 2000 -- in the

1
2 early 2000's, I was street homeless
3 myself; and countless times, I was
4 abused by DHS police and the NYPD for
5 the mere fact of minding my business and
6 sitting on the street.

7 And I am a huge advocate of the Be
8 Heard program, with the addition of
9 peers to the response, preferably to
10 remove the police response -- the police
11 response entirely. I also worked in the
12 adult homes here in the city, and
13 witnessed police pull their weapons on
14 people who were experiencing mental
15 health crisis that I knew personally,
16 that would not harm even a spec of dust.
17 I had NYPD officer pull a -- actually,
18 five of them pull their firearm on a
19 person who did not understand what was
20 going on, for the mere fact that he
21 wanted to get his laundry, and he was
22 upset because he didn't understand that
23 he could not. So the adult home called
24 9-1-1 on him.

25 HelpNYC continues to advocate for

1
2 the response that respects the dignity
3 of those who are in crisis. That does
4 not diminish the humanity of those
5 people. Over the pandemic and even 'til
6 today, the NYPD lacks the training to
7 engage those that have mental health or
8 substance abuse challenges, or
9 experiencing a severe mental health
10 crisis. Handcuffs and forced transport
11 to a hospital are not the answer. It
12 adds trauma and more trauma.

13 And on a personal note, my first and
14 only interaction with the CCRB was when
15 I was hosting a drag show. I used to be
16 a fabulous drag queen in Hell's Kitchen,
17 and I stopped by a friend of mine's
18 establishment there; and I was harassed
19 going into this establishment and coming
20 out. And during that time, also, there
21 were two officers that stood outside of
22 this establishment and name called, and
23 abused their authority and blocked entry
24 into the establishment to trans women,
25 especially trans women of color. This

1
2 is disgraceful and the CCRB would not
3 hear the case. They wouldn't even go
4 beyond even talking to me about it.

5 So I hope the CCRB since 2018, when
6 this -- this incident happened will take
7 into account that not everyone can file
8 a report in the means that you require,
9 and that assistance be made to do so.

10 We are people of different abilities,
11 different backgrounds, languages, and I
12 hope that you'll consider that and
13 continue. A little bit more personal.
14 I live here in the Bronx. I'm in the
15 46th Precinct, and I have seen an
16 amazing response to mental health from
17 the 46th Precinct here in the Bronx.
18 And I think every precinct across the
19 city could learn something from the 46.

20 So thank you for letting me
21 speaking, and I'm grateful to be here
22 tonight. Thanks.

23 CHAIR RICE: Thank you for your
24 comments -- our technology. Can I ask
25 you one followup question.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

The interaction that you had with the CCRB, you said, was in 2018; is that correct?

RUE PARKIN: Yes, the incident happened June -- it was Pride of 2018, and I believe I filed in mid-July. And the -- two of my friends who were -- one was a trans woman of color, and one was a white trans woman -- were too afraid to file complaints. So I filed a complaint for the harassment I received, and on behalf of the two trans women.

CHAIR RICE: And thank you for that clip -- for that clarification, and for sharing that with us this evening. I wanted to have our executive director respond because things have changed since -- at the CCRB since 2018, but I still wanted to acknowledge the injustice and pain that you and your friends experienced at that time.

Jon.

MR. DARCHE: On behalf of the staff, I want to apologize that -- at the way

1
2 your complaint was handled, that you
3 feel that you were not allowed to file a
4 complaint.

5 RUE PARKIN: Oh, I filed a
6 complaint.

7 MR. DARCHE: In order to --

8 RUE PARKIN: Sorry, I filed a
9 complaint, but it was turned down. And
10 I fought it and nothing happened.

11 MR. DARCHE: We -- we missed you for
12 a second.

13 RUE PARKIN: Yeah, there's something
14 going on, on my end, too.

15 No, I filed a complaint. They took
16 the complaint, but when I tried to
17 follow up on it, nothing happened and I
18 couldn't speak to anyone. Oh, we'll
19 call you back. Oh, we'll e-mail you
20 back. Nothing. And then, I got the
21 denial or whatever it's called letter,
22 saying that you won't take up the
23 matter.

24 MR. DARCHE: I'm going to look into
25 this personally, and I'll reach out to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

you during --

RUE PARKIN: Great.

MR. DARCHE: At least by Friday.

RUE PARKIN: Thank you so much.

CHAIR RICE: Yojaira, can you share with us the next -- the next speaker.

MS. ALVAREZ: Yes. Thank you, Chair. First of all, apologies, Rue, for misgendering you.

Next, we'll be hearing from Subira Williams.

CHAIR RICE: Is she online?

MS. WILLIAMS: Hello, can you hear me?

CHAIR RICE: Oh, she's online.

MS. WILLIAMS: Yes, I'm online.

MR. DARCHE: We can hear you now.

MS. WILLIAMS: Okay. Good evening, everyone. So I'm actually -- my name is Subira Williams, I am the director of Will.I.Dance dance program in the Bronx -- actually, the Melrose section of the Bronx. And I'm pretty new to attending you guys' meetings, but the question

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

that I did have after hearing your introductions: What can the City do to improve the relations between the police and the community in the neighborhoods of the Bronx?

I know I'm probably going to get her name incorrect, but the first speaker pretty much touched on it, about trying to get police officers to engage with the community more, and the community to engage with the police officers that police our neighborhoods more.

So I wanted to know: Do you actively have steps in place to improve those relationships?

CHAIR RICE: Your voice went out a little bit, so I just want -- had in place initiatives to improve police community relations; is that correct?

MS. WILLIAMS: Correct.

CHAIR RICE: Okay. I can let our executive director respond to that, as well; that the overall goal of the CCRB is to make sure that when citizens have

1
2 interaction with the police that fall
3 within certain guidelines, which have
4 grown. That was one of the things that
5 I wanted to get to, as well.

6 Our powers have grown since 2018.
7 The City Council put into place some
8 additional powers. And so now, we can
9 look at things like racial profiling, as
10 well as gender-based policing. And so
11 we have an opportunity to look at some
12 additional things when the individual
13 community members feel like they -- that
14 they were there -- their rights were
15 violated. And so the -- our powers have
16 grown over the course of the last few
17 years, but our role really is to make
18 sure that when community members have
19 interaction with the police and have an
20 issue, that they have some place to
21 come. And so we investigate those
22 issues, and have a team of investigators
23 who do that work.

24 In terms of police and community
25 relations, we feel that our work will

1
2 help to improve that. So if the -- if
3 the individual has an interaction with a
4 police officer that's negative, that
5 they have some place to go. We have
6 lots of opinions, a lot of us folks on
7 this panel in their individual roles and
8 expertise have opinions about that; but
9 it's not specifically the CCRB's role to
10 improve police-community relations, but
11 I'll have the executive director speak a
12 little bit on that.

13 MR. DARCHE: The Chair is 100
14 percent correct. The CCRB -- our
15 primary role of investigating and
16 prosecuting administrative cases of
17 police misconduct does not directly work
18 to improve police-community relations.
19 It's more of a bank shot, whereby
20 increasing people's faith that there can
21 be accountability for police misconduct.
22 It will improve police-community
23 relations.

24 There are two ways in which we act
25 directly to try and improve

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

police-community relations. One is in meetings like this. We take the feedback we hear from the community and give it to the Police Department, so that they can hear what you folks are saying. It's not just coming to us.

And the second thing is: We have a very robust mediation program. And so in cases where both the civilian who is making the complaint, and the subject officers who have been complained about both volunteer -- both sides agree to participate in the mediation program. We put them in rooms together, or sometimes now for the last three years, on the teams meeting together with a neutral party, who does not work for the CCRB. It's an independent mediator, so that they can discuss what happened, and maybe come to a resolution and understanding between each other.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Yojaira, can you --

MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair.

1
2 That concludes our community group
3 portion. Before we move on to the
4 public comment, I would like to thank
5 the office of Congress Member, Grace
6 Meng; the public -- the public
7 advocate's office. The Offices of State
8 Senator, Jamaal Bailey; Speaker, Carl
9 Heastie, and all of their staff for
10 attending.

11 Thank you so much.

12 CHAIR RICE: Thank you.

13 We will now enter the public comment
14 portion of the meeting. We will begin
15 with those joining -- we've already
16 began with those joining us virtually.
17 Now, we're asking those who are here in
18 the room, if you have a comment, if you
19 wanted to join us at the podium. And we
20 have four minutes for you to make your
21 comments this evening.

22 MS. LANORIS: Thank you very much.
23 I was invited here by AU Hogan. And
24 often times, when things go down with
25 the police -- my name is Hyne Lanoris,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I'm a resident of the Bronx. I live in this community. As a matter of fact, I used to be on the Community Board some, some, some time ago.

But a lot of times when there's problems with the police, you know, I try to find someone to speak to. And it's very, very difficult to get people on the phone, and get some advice whether this is something that you should actually go to the C -- CCRB with. We have problems with a lot of false arrests. A lot of young men are being pulled away in our community, losing time, having to go to Central Booking just for their cases to be dissolved.

And particularly, even my son had experiences of not dispersing when the police told you to move fast enough. You know, even though the police may not come out for that offense -- but if anybody is around, they want an arrest, and they just pick out somebody to

1
2 arrest because they didn't move fast
3 enough. And then, that parent is, you
4 know, anxious; that young person is
5 anxious and possibly hurt, particularly
6 -- in that particular situation, my son
7 had an injury to his shoulder. So to be
8 arrested just exacerbated the injury.

9 But I'm just saying, this is an
10 ongoing thing. I've been living in this
11 community for a long time. There has
12 been ups and downs. The 47th Precinct
13 has been a challenge, but now the 49th
14 Precinct is the challenge. There are
15 times, though, that we had the situation
16 where we have the clusters. Where the
17 15 police officers have to stand around
18 on the same block, and they say that's
19 monitoring the neighborhoods. That is
20 intimidating the neighborhood.

21 Talking -- I'm not going to say that
22 I haven't seen some police officers
23 engage -- as a matter fact, Wednesday
24 just a real quick story. I was going
25 upstairs in the subway, and I was

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

looking down out of the little holes in the subway. And I saw a police -- two police talking to my son and two of his friends, and I ran like hell down there. And they were just talking, but that's the trauma of constantly seeing them doing the wrong thing.

So the question I have is for us as a community: If you're getting a lot of complaints in one area, how do we not know we're -- are we told that, okay, this police officer, or this precinct had this amount of complaints in the same week? How do we know if someone is constantly being assaulted by particular police, where it could be a class-action situation like they had years ago in the Bronx. There was class-action suits for stop and frisk and false arrest. How do we know that the CCRB is letting us know whether there is a particular problem in a particular area, with a particular police officer or particular precinct? That's one question I have.

1
2 Secondly, when you go into the
3 precinct, are we being given the
4 opportunity to know about CCRB? I know
5 I've been to precinct before. I never
6 been told, you know, you have a
7 complaint. Why was my son arrested?
8 Because he had a water gun. Why? I
9 want to know why did you -- and then,
10 you let him go. Why did he have to go
11 through the trauma? No one ever says,
12 well, go complain to -- to CCRB.

13 So there is not enough communication
14 to let us know what our rights are. And
15 then, even if the CCRB turns us away and
16 says this is not a complaint, are you
17 letting us know what else we can do
18 because right is right. Whether you say
19 it's -- you know, you weren't able to
20 substantiate the claim. We still have
21 rights. So, you know, are you letting
22 us know that?

23 But for the most part, you know -- I
24 mean, I -- I just see some of these
25 organizations to be bureau -- you know,

1
2 bureaucracies and it's hard to really
3 get through. And I think to have more
4 relationships with community groups and
5 going to community groups might be
6 helpful. So, you know, churches and
7 schools and letting us know our rights,
8 because this is a daily thing. I mean,
9 this has been going on for a long time.

10 I have a son, who is 12 years older
11 than my other son beat up by police, and
12 then let go. He didn't even get
13 sentenced with anything. Just -- it's
14 still going on. So, you know, I'm just
15 saying that we need to know what's going
16 on with you all, so we can advocate for
17 ourselves. Thank you.

18 CHAIR RICE: Thank you very much. I
19 heard a couple of different -- thank
20 you. I wanted to make sure that you
21 heard your applause. So I wanted to
22 pause in order for you to hear that.

23 I heard a couple of different
24 things. I'll respond, and then let our
25 executive director respond in kind.

1
2 You asked about how people find out
3 if there's multiple issues in the
4 community. And so, as a result of a --
5 a statute that was -- the rule called --
6 called 50A, we're able to have on our
7 website -- from CCRB website. It does
8 have a listing of the CCRB complaints
9 that were made on particular officers,
10 so you can -- so that information is now
11 public. And our executive director can
12 talk more about that.

13 When you talked about the issues
14 about false arrest and what can be done,
15 I'll have him speak a little bit more
16 about how, and why the work that our
17 Director of Outreach, Jahi does, is so
18 important. It's because we want to get
19 out to more and more people that the
20 CCRB is here. We think that we have
21 done some great work around that. We
22 had a CCRB week earlier this year, which
23 was all about letting people know who we
24 are, and how we can access it; but
25 there's always more work that we -- that

1
2 can be done. So he's very serious when
3 he says: Is there some place that we
4 can go and make a presentation? And we
5 want to continue to do that, and so
6 we'll go where we're invited to; but we
7 do know that there's more work that we
8 need to do in that area. So thank you
9 for bringing that up.

10 MR. DARCHE: If you know --

11 CHAIR RICE: Please.

12 MR. HOGAN: Thank you, Madam Chair.

13 I just wanted to know -- I'm hearing
14 three different comments that some of
15 the answers are within yourself. If you
16 introduce yourself to BRAG right now,
17 the Life Camp is right behind you, like
18 Sister Hyne.

19 Often times, you know, if you look
20 at these times -- when the police and
21 public get together, it's like two
22 different worlds colliding. And part of
23 the fixes of -- that are the public --
24 what is the patients, the articulations,
25 that has to be brought from you, you

1
2 know, and -- and -- and us, but we
3 cannot do it separately. Because if
4 something's wrong, something's wrong,
5 and we need to address it. And I just
6 think Bronx Rise Against Gun Violence
7 and definitely Life -- Life Camp is
8 doing this work. And when they first
9 came into CMS -- when CMS first started,
10 the main problem that they had was not
11 gun violence. It was -- it was police
12 misconduct.

13 So if you know the history of those
14 things, it was trying to build --
15 co-produce public safety. It's
16 happening, but the answer amongst itself
17 right up in audience -- read each
18 other's numbers, have real
19 conversations. And then, you know,
20 Sister Hyne tell you, I always -- I get
21 calls from everywhere, and we're trying
22 to fix this because part of the -- one
23 of the comments was: What do we do to
24 fix it? We have to fix it together,
25 because there our problems, there is

1
2 misconduct. You know, when you -- when
3 you have someone that -- and I know the
4 Bronx. Young people in the Bronx are
5 stopped every single day, every minute
6 of the day out here. You know, when I
7 was -- when I was riding out here -- I
8 don't want to make a joke, but I was
9 hoping that I wasn't going to get pulled
10 over. And I didn't want to say it
11 because I was in the Bronx, but I know
12 it's happening here. Because often,
13 when you see a level -- a high -- high
14 rise in crime, police react a different
15 way. Police are reacting to people that
16 are not committing crimes more than they
17 are to the people that are committing
18 crimes, and that's a problem. And the
19 public has to fix that. Thank you,
20 Madam Chair.

21 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, AU, for
22 that.

23 Go ahead, Frank.

24 MR. DWYER: I mean, a common refrain
25 from the speakers is -- is the need to

1
2 establish relationship, and I'm not sure
3 if people realize that every police
4 precinct has a monthly meeting much like
5 this that you can go to. Occasionally,
6 they get cancelled when something
7 happens in the city that demands a
8 response, but every precinct has a
9 monthly meeting generally listed on
10 their website. Every precinct has a
11 community affairs officer, who any
12 precinct commander will tell you is one
13 of their closest aides and confidants to
14 feedback what's going on in the
15 community. And again, their phone
16 number is generally listed on the
17 website.

18 So establishing a relationship with
19 them early on before anything happens,
20 knowing them for years, and being
21 recognized by him or her as a -- as a
22 community member, a community friend, a
23 community colleague; and them working to
24 solve your problems. There are now
25 neighborhood coordination offices.

1
2 Their phone numbers and their
3 supervisors, and their e-mails sometimes
4 are also generally on the websites. So,
5 I mean -- and there is all -- numerous
6 other offices and, you know, youth
7 offices, auxiliary coordinators; all of
8 whom you can meet with. But, of course,
9 in policing, it's a funny world, right?
10 You know, their time to meet with you
11 might be 9:00 at night because they
12 might be assigned to work from 8:00 at
13 night to 4:00 in the morning. So you
14 may walk in and say, you know, I went in
15 twice at 10:00 in the morning and nobody
16 was there, but that could be because of
17 the condition they've been assigned to
18 work, as I say 8:00 at night to 4:00 in
19 the morning.

20 But I think so much of this could be
21 addressed if relationships were
22 established early on. And it happens by
23 making the phone calls and inviting
24 these people to your place of business
25 or your community center, or say I'll

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

come into the precinct with a couple of community members and meet with you. It's the same way we build bonds, friendships and relationships with all sorts of professional people.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much, both -- to both of you. We've gotten responses on both sides. So having conversations with your violence interrupters, and some of whom are already in the room. And then, also, places that you can go within NYPD itself.

Did you want to make another comment, Jon, before we go on?

MR. DARCHE: I just want to expand that our -- our website allows you to search on the CCRB allegation histories of members of service by precinct. So you should be able to find out who are the -- the histories of the members of service in your -- in your local precinct. And one of the things we're saying about never having been offered

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to file a complaint through the department is they have an obligation to take the complaint. There's no obligation for them to say: If you wish to file a complaint, you can do so.

So that's -- that's a subtle difference, but there should be information in every police precinct that would lead you to be able to file a complaint, should you choose to do so.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you very much, gentleman. Can we have our next speaker.

MS. JENNINGS: Hello, I've spoken many times. It's an issue that unfortunately you don't deal with. It's a stalking issue that started May 11th, 2006.

CHAIR RICE: -- for the -- that have not met you before. The members --

MS JENNINGS: I'm sorry, I really don't like giving out my name, but I will. Ms. Jennings.

CHAIR RICE: Yes.

1
2 MS. JENNINGS: January the 19th,
3 2023, I stopped at 25th Precinct; Badge
4 Number, 8037. I asked for some help for
5 some information -- for his NCO or his
6 CO. And he said something about putting
7 it in the shredder, which is kind of not
8 uncommon. I think it was the last year
9 Obama was in office, I saw former
10 Governor Patterson at an event. I
11 introduced myself. I said my name is Ms.
12 Jennings, to your last day in office, I
13 reached out to you. And then, this lady
14 sit here and she -- I said it's a
15 stalking issue, he paused because, you
16 know he is blind. Then he went on to say
17 something about he worked with the
18 Brooklyn DA. That was when he was last
19 year of Obama, which was seven years ago,
20 six years ago.

21 I said in all of my correspondence
22 the 3-1-1 to the 9-1-1, the e-mails to
23 the letters the NYPD, MTA, mayor,
24 governor, and most of all, the White
25 House, where do the complaints go?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Where do they go? I'm sitting over here minding my business, and I don't -- I act like I don't see what's going on.

You noticed me move, and as I move, people get closer and I'm like this. You don't handle stalking. Does the mayor at all see any of these? Because I know the staffers and the mayor, and the governor's office know all about this, but they -- do they know anything about issues when you make a complaint. Because Patterson seems to not have a clue. Yet, Obama, 2009 to this date, when I go out, it's a daily letter. It goes to every camera and they go -- sent prior mail. Mr. Darche knows about it, and the other wonderful staffers know because they seen it. I just showed some to Riley. This is one letter here that was given to me on the -- 2014 from Andy King. It went twice to Obama. It's about stalking.

And just the other day, Riley and -- what's the other man? Speaker Heastie

1
2 -- yeah -- he got a copy of this. And I
3 asked could they give me, like, a copy
4 because I would like to send it to the
5 White House. Because the mayor and the
6 governor can't seem to do anything about
7 this, and I stare purposefully at
8 cameras -- call 3-3-1, yes. And that's
9 why I'm making calls to the most
10 interesting places.

11 The 47th police precinct, I don't
12 know where my calls go. They don't get
13 answered. MTA, they don't get --
14 certain calls don't get answered. This
15 is this -- this is dated 2014 -- oh,
16 just a question. You know, I just
17 wanted to know if anyone has the ear of
18 the mayor or the governor, because Ms.
19 Jennings is very concerned for her
20 safety, yeah?

21 If I'm standing against the police
22 and people are coming at me and marching
23 and the police are marching, and I look
24 at you -- again, the man said something
25 about a shredder. That was January

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

19th. So where do my complaints go? Because you got cameras. So everybody knows what everybody is doing. I'm sitting over here like this. I just went out and made a phone call to a place you don't want to know. Garland, you don't want to know.

So again, if anyone has the ear of the mayor or the governor, help a nice lady out -- I said yes because everybody knows I'm in here, because I got chased from 6:00 o'clock when I left from where I'm at. Real to come here, chased. Every camera sees this, and CEO's, they use -- all the stores that I go in, go in -- wonderful -- yes. Yeah, they do on the letters because this started in 2006. I don't understand it.

Mr. Darche knows about this because this is -- you don't handle stalking. IAB doesn't handle -- no one seems to handle it. But again, I'm at the camera. That's where I'm making a phone call and I will stay there, because you

1
2 see me swaying in the breeze. I suffer
3 -- sonic attacks where I'm at. Anyone
4 with the ear of the mayor, not the
5 wonderful staffers now. The ear of the
6 mayor because, again, the last year of
7 Obama, I see former Governor Patterson
8 and he doesn't see me, you know, but he
9 act like he didn't have a clue. Really?
10 Where are the complaints going? If you
11 spend a day watching me, a jaw drop.

12 CHAIR RICE: Thank you for sharing.

13 MS JENNINGS: Thank you. Have a good
14 night.

15
16 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Yes, can we
17 have the name and the comments of the
18 next speaker.

19 MS. HUMPHREY: Good evening. My
20 name is Loretta Humphrey, I'm from
21 Southeast Queens. Hello, Mr. Hogan.
22 Hello, Mr. Darche, and to the board. I
23 mention these people because I know
24 them. I have a few questions. I have a
25 few questions, and something at the end.

1
2 I would like to know what the turnover
3 -- because you talked about the footage
4 -- the body-cam footage. What is the
5 turnover for police -- for the NYPD to
6 turnover the footage when it's
7 requested? I would also like to know
8 who is funding these cameras, and I
9 would like to know the training -- the
10 training because I -- I had written up
11 something regarding -- it's called lock
12 box policy, the police officers are not
13 allowed to look at the footage while
14 they are writing their scenario.

15 I find that disingenuous. I find it
16 to -- their story to -- to tailor from
17 the video, as opposed to telling the
18 story as you -- as the person sees it,
19 not as the video -- you know what I'm
20 saying? Am I making myself clear? Am I
21 making sense?

22 MR. DARCHE: Yes.

23 MS. HUMPHREY: Okay. So I find it
24 to be disingenuous to have the officer
25 look at the footage, and then turn

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

around and write the scenario. So there needs to be a lock box policy in place. When the police officer writes his story, the video is viewed and compare the story to the video.

And then, I would like to say the gentleman that was speaking on the mental health, that's a -- that's a passion for me; that police officers, they do not have training. I'm the president of the Greater TriAngula Civic Association in Southeast Queens. We hold our meetings at Roy Wilkins every third Tuesday of the month in Room 2.

The mental -- we're working on mental illness now with the Police Department, DOC, mental illness professionals, social workers. And we want to know what -- the training that police officers have in dealing with mental-ill persons when they are arrested, or come upon them because they definitely -- as someone said, they don't have that skill. And not even DOC

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

has that skill. That training should not be once a year, twice a year, but it should be ongoing.

I also want to say that there is a number that most of us don't know, and I've only learned this myself three weeks ago. 988. Everyone familiar with that number? 988. You are because you -- you know, you do what I do. You're activists. I just learned about 988. Is the board familiar with that number? The 988 number is what you can call when your loved one is in a crisis -- a mental-illness crisis or having a breakdown. They call 988 and a social worker, a professional will show up on the scene. Are you familiar with them?

Everybody up here is familiar with it, but we're not familiar with it. So that lacks communication and getting the message out, and I think that's the breakdown with the community. I personally want to see change. I just don't want to live my life and -- and

1
2 doing something, and nothing's not being
3 done.

4 Is there anything I wanted to
5 address -- but I -- I do want to know
6 what the turnover time is for the body
7 cams -- cameras when -- when the public
8 at --

9 CHAIR RICE: You can make the
10 request how the camera footage is
11 funded. And training for officers
12 around mental health and training for
13 officers involving the use of the body
14 cameras.

15 MS. HUMPHREY: Yes, I want to be
16 able to send you -- because Mr.
17 Scarborough worked on this with me --
18 lock box policy.

19 CHAIR RICE: Okay.

20 MS. HUMPHREY: Because like I said,
21 I think it's disingenuous that a police
22 officer can look at his footage and
23 write his scenario according to the
24 footage. Thank you.

25 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Let us

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

answer your question as we have done.

MS. HUMPHREY: Okay.

MR. DARCHE: So, Ms. Humphrey, thank you for those questions.

Generally, it takes the Police Department five days to respond when they cannot find body-worn camera footage and we've requested it; and seven days when they're getting us body-worn camera footage that they are able to locate. Right now, we have 137 requests outstanding, of which 84 are less than one month old. So the department is really trying to -- has improved greatly from the pre-2020 days, when there were often -- it took months to get body-worn camera footage requests back.

With regard to who is paying for the body-worn camera footage -- who is pay for the body-worn cameras, I'm -- I'm not really sure. I think it is just out of our --

MS. HUMPHREY: Is it private to you?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Private?

MR. DARCHE: I don't think so.

MS. HUMPHREY: I thought it was private.

CHAIR RICE: I'm sorry?

MS. HUMPHREY: I thought it was a private entity corporation paying for that.

MR. DARCHE: So we --

MS. HUMPHREY: Instead of the tax payer.

MR. DARCHE: We have a private corporation for the body-worn cameras, so there's a -- I think it's called Axon, right? There's a company that makes all the body-worn cameras, and they also make the tasers and then they make the -- they maintain the website where all the footage is stored. So that is a private company that New York City has a contract with, and -- and that's how it's -- it's maintained.

And then, the last question you had about the lock box. The current policy

1
2 is actually the opposite of that. So
3 members of the NYPD are allowed to
4 review their body-worn camera footage.
5 In fact, they're supposed to review it
6 when they are done with their tour and
7 uploaded, so that they can put in notes,
8 which we call metadata. And then,
9 they're allowed to review it again
10 before they give statements to the CCRB.

11 MS. HUMPHREY: That that -- that --
12 just when --

13 MR. SIEGAL: One clarification. But
14 when you said we are paying for it, I
15 want to clarify. You're not saying
16 CCRB. You're saying that we, all of us
17 in New York?

18 MR. DARCHE: Yes, the taxpayers.

19 MS. HUMPHREY: Yes, but the
20 taxpayers are paying for this body-cam
21 footage. Now, it was in my policy that
22 I was writing -- that I had written the
23 CCRB -- the patrol borough commander,
24 the precinct commander, and where the
25 incident took place, and the -- a clergy

1
2 or another private citizen within the
3 community. They should be the first
4 ones to look at that body-cam footage.
5 No police officer should have the
6 opportunity to look at body-cam footage
7 and tailor his story according to the
8 body-cam footage. And they'll say that
9 he can.

10 I worked for the Police Department
11 for 32 years. When they wrote their
12 scenario, they came in before there was
13 a body cam and had to write that story.
14 So now, you know, you're making people
15 not only lazy, but you're giving them an
16 opportunity to -- y'all know what I'm
17 trying to say. It's disingenuous, it's
18 not honest and it's not fair. And I
19 hope that the CCRB can have some type of
20 input into that -- and this funding.
21 You know, it's our taxpayer dollars so,
22 you know, that's it.

23 MR. DARCHE: Madam Chair, can I just
24 add one last thing?

25 CHAIR RICE: Yes, you can respond.

1
2 MR. DARCHE: But there's actually a
3 bill that the City Council introduced
4 last week, or maybe two weeks ago that
5 will be -- there's going to be a hearing
6 on -- on March 27th, in which that would
7 give the CCRB and the -- the Inspector
8 General for the NYPD direct access to
9 body-worn camera footage, and I'm -- I'm
10 very hopeful that bill will pass.

11 CHAIR RICE: Our next speaker.

12 MS. GREEN: Good evening. My name
13 is Emma Louis Green, I am a part of the
14 CCRB Youth Advisory Council. I'm going
15 on two years now. I hope everyone is
16 well today. I'm 12 years young, and I
17 want to discuss an incident that I
18 endured on January 13, 2023, at a train
19 station going to my internship with one
20 of the assembly members.

21 I saw my Metro card, which my mom
22 loaded up for me. And I was on my way
23 to my internship, I take the train. I
24 had an issue as I swiped, and I was --
25 sometimes there's an issue with people's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Metro cards when they're trying to swipe through the train station. And you could have money on it, but then the Metro card gets corrupted while the money is on it, which is what happened as I went to the teller the next day.

It wouldn't go for me, so I continued to FaceTime my mom, as she would probably know more about this, as I've been on this earth for 12 years. I haven't reached the full amount that she has. I didn't want to be late to my destination because I start at 10:30 to 5:00, but I like to get there early to get a head start on any type of work I might have.

So since there is no token booth at that specific station, I had to go to the police officers who were there. Now, I'm not trying to say they are racists, but they were white. Now, I --I keep my receipts. So in my wallet, I keep my receipts and my Metro card. And my mom said to go to the teller booth,

1
2 but since there was no teller there, I
3 went to the police officers to ask if
4 they could let me in. I then told the
5 male officer. He proceeded to tell me
6 in my face: Don't lie to me, you
7 weren't going to pay. The reason why we
8 are here is because people like to hop
9 and not pay, so please do not lie to my
10 face.

11 As I had the Metro card in my hand,
12 and they saw -- they saw me swipe the
13 Metro card multiple times -- and it
14 would not work. And he proceeded to say
15 to my face: Do not lie to me. Now, I
16 believe this was very racist and hostile
17 because it's mostly a black and brown
18 neighborhood. So imagine a 12 year old,
19 who has no convicts, I have nothing in
20 the system is told that they were not
21 going to pay when I pay my dues every
22 time. Now, I use my mom's card because
23 I no longer go to school in New York.
24 My school is all the way in California,
25 so I don't get a New York State issued

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Metro card.

So the male officer -- yes, it was a male. He was very rude, so I'm also going to go with sexist. And I -- my mom was on the FaceTime still and she heard all of this, and she questioned me about the headphones. And I keep them in so people don't hear my conversation. And this was very emotional for me because as a younger child, I used to love the police. I would -- I knew that was my place to go if I was in any trouble. And as I got older, the police are now a definition of why I'm scared to walk the streets. I -- any time something happens, I can't trust the police.

There were times I'm on the train and this man -- he was threatening to kill people and that he had a gun, and that he was drunk. My mom called the cops. They did not come on time, and this man was now walking and running the streets and drunk and high as a kite,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

and talking about sexual things in a car full of minors. And it was around 3:00, that's the time where teenagers, children they're out with their parents and are going back home. So that was not right at all. We called the cops. They come two stops late. They should be on call all the time.

Oh, yeah. I would definitely like this blue wall of silence to stop because everywhere you look -- that one good police officer is outranked by all the bad. Now, I'm not saying that all police officers are bad because I have met lovely police officers, like this police officer in the picture. They -- they were so kind. They gave -- they had a nice conversation. We communicated.

And this man, the short person in the photo. There was this man, and he -- he did not have any money on his Metro card, and he didn't know how to reload it. We were by the Long Island

1
2 Railroad station. It was very rough in
3 the beginning, and I thought he was
4 going to write him a ticket as he
5 brought out his ticket book, but he left
6 him with a warning. Now, that is the
7 nicest thing he could have done because
8 many -- they would have brought out a
9 weapon, they would have brought out
10 their taser. And they would have given
11 him a ticket right then or right there.
12 And he would have now had to pay this
13 ticket, when he has no idea what is
14 going on. And I believe it is actually
15 something that you should not let happen
16 to people who are not sure, or with
17 people who might have mental illness. I
18 see it a lot.

19 I see a lot of things because I am
20 thankful very much that my mom was able
21 to make sure that I don't have any
22 problems. I live in a predominantly
23 black and brown neighborhood, but it's
24 also mixed with Jews. So I grew up in a
25 well-renowned neighborhood. I did not

1
2 grow up in the hood. I don't know most
3 slang, and most people -- especially
4 with the police, when they act
5 accordingly to what they see in these
6 neighborhoods, that's their sign to beat
7 them up; or, if they're doing something
8 bad, they're criminals. And one thing
9 that me and my mom talk about all the
10 time. How do 16-year olds, 15-year
11 olds, 14-year olds find these drug
12 dealers? Police cannot find them, and
13 they have all the time in the world, the
14 resources to find them. Thirteen to
15 seventeen, they -- they have no
16 resources. They don't have a database
17 to find drug dealers, they don't have an
18 area. So they just walk around. They
19 know people who know how to find them.
20 Why can't the police find them, as well?
21 It takes them years to find a ring of
22 drug dealers. It takes a child at least
23 a day or two. That -- this isn't
24 correct at all.

25 So I definitely have a strong

1
2 dislikeness for that, and this is the
3 reason why I joined the youth advisory
4 council, to help fight this. And I hope
5 that we can also make sure that this
6 never happens to another young child
7 again because I -- I heard the lady
8 before me. This is traumatic because I
9 would -- whenever I see a police
10 officer, I'm like, do I have to fight
11 for my life.

12 I recently bought a key chain with
13 pepper spray and items to help me
14 protect myself. As a 12 year-old, young
15 child, who has to walk around and -- all
16 these pedophiles. If I'm not with my
17 mom, I'm very much fearful of what can
18 happen to me. Thank you.

19 CHAIR RICE: Thank you for sharing
20 your story, and thank you for your
21 activism and your engagement with the
22 advisory council. I think that's
23 fantastic. I look forward to -- to
24 seeing what amazing things that you'll
25 do as you progress.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

AU, I saw you writing on your notebook. Did you have something you want to add.

MR. HOGAN: I'm just amazed that a young person like that is able to articulate an experience, you know, good and bad as she said. We -- or that, you know, like most people, you know, because I said before that they grow up liking officers and I be -- it's not all officers. But when the bad has a greater influence than the good, then it becomes all officers, you know.

And so I think, you know, the relationship that I've had with the police department here is try to change communications. I'm in the precincts everyday to try to let them know that, hey, the public really cares about you, doing something or showing something different. And this young foreman right here just articulated to the point where you know some of us older folks got to, you know, jump up and do the work

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

because we shouldn't be thinking about our children and our grandchildren have to be repeating that same stuff -- on both parts, on the Police Department and the public. Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you again for -- and thank you again for your testimony.

Sir, did you have a comment? Can you tell us your name.

MR. TEEL: Hello. Hello, everybody. My name is Chris Teel, I'm a resident of Southeast Jamaica, Queens.

So I came here -- I run movies, family movies in the park for an organization named the Better Jamaica. A Better Jamaica, we have a group of young children back here, 11th graders that are all here, so during the summertime last year, we're doing family movies in the park. And I expected to do it probably normal. So I went to the 113th Precinct and I spoke to the community person, because I wanted to inform them that the crowd might be bigger than

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

normal. I didn't have to do it, just felt like it was the right thing to do so that, you know, they wouldn't get called later or something like that, right?

So the police officer for the --well, the community affairs officer was so like -- I don't know. Like, he was just trying to intimidate me. He was saying, well, if you guys are going to be out there smoking and drinking, then we will be there.

We've had movies in the park, I've -- I've been managing movies in the park for at least a decade. No incidents that were in Baisley Park, St. Albans Park, Rufus King Park, Cambria Heights Park, and Brookville Park -- different parks every single day, no incident. When I went there to -- like the gentleman at the end said, there's a community person that you can speak to. They have meetings every month. I was doing the right thing by letting them know we're expecting a group. And they

1
2 just made me feel like, I don't want to
3 go there anymore.

4 So that's what we're dealing with.
5 Yeah, that's what the community is
6 dealing with. And that's something that
7 I don't want to pass down to these 11th
8 Graders that I have, because if we're
9 not able to speak to the police like
10 humans, then there's never going to be
11 any resolve. I'm not even going to use
12 my four minutes.

13 I'm married to a police officer.
14 It's difficult. It's not -- not my
15 marriage, but it's -- it's difficult
16 because there's this, like, push-pull
17 relationship with the Police Department,
18 and I'm a community person. I know Life
19 Camp very well. Ms. Humphrey, we're
20 friends and we share messages on
21 Facebook all the time. I'm part of her
22 group online.

23 So I'm outside doing the work --
24 purposely outside. And the Police
25 Department seems to be another gang that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

we have to deal with, whether we're gang banging or not. So that's just my -- my piece. Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: Can you come to the microphone. And, Mr. Teel, thank you so much for your -- for your comment, and for doing the right thing. So thank you for going to see the police --

MS. GREEN: Man, you hit a button in my -- O'Chomsky, I will never forget him with her in my belly. And that man, whoa, he said I was riding his tail while I was driving to go to get somebody in Brooklyn. That man tried to pull me over on the Belt, and I went -- and I pulled in over there. I forget what -- that Burger King right there.

This man threatened to pepper spray me with this little girl in my stomach. His partner was like, oh, just be quiet. I said this man handcuffed me in the back of the car. I did nothing. All I did was come outside with my pregnant stomach. That girl right there you see.

1
2 And that man was so nasty to me. I
3 swear. It was in 2009, '10 -- because
4 she was born in '20. Yeah, it still
5 gets me like this. O'Chomsky, I will
6 never forget that name. He was a pig,
7 and I tell you -- I know how you feel,
8 my brother. That 113th precinct -- and
9 exactly what you said. I'm glad
10 somebody said. Community affairs, they
11 don't even pick up the phone. They
12 don't pick up the phone. And when you
13 get there -- 113, no. Right? But I
14 don't train her that way. I make sure
15 -- listen, you give everybody a chance.
16 You think these children have no sense?
17 These children hear what these teachers
18 say, what they're doing. They see it.
19 Believe me, they come home and tell us
20 parents, we know; but, you know, you got
21 to fight the system, fight that system.
22 Then, you want us parents to do the
23 right thing, and do this. And then, when
24 we -- when we chastise them, then we in
25 trouble.

1
2 So somebody got to make sense out of
3 all of this, but this has to stop
4 because it's too much. I shouldn't
5 still feel like this from 2009, 2010, in
6 my belly; put me in handcuffs, and
7 threatened to pepper spray me. And I
8 let him know, I think you better shoot
9 me now because -- you know, I told him
10 -- I said you put your hands on me, it's
11 me and you, okay. Because trust me, I
12 was going to fight for my life and hers
13 because I did that man nothing. He woke
14 up on the wrong side of the bed to be
15 rude, biased, disrespectful and racist.
16 And you know what, I wrote the
17 complaint, but I never followed up
18 because somebody told me, oh, CCRB don't
19 do nothing. So they have -- and I never
20 followed up. But it was so funny I
21 found that paper, and I laughed and I
22 showed it to her. And I told her, I
23 said hey -- she said, mommy, they have
24 this today. Come. I said okay. I left
25 from afar to get here because she wanted

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to say what she had to say, because I said no problem. And I said, well, see if you can file a complaint, because you children don't have a voice for nothing. It's either you're too young, you're too young. So I told her: Here, this is how you experience life, by living it and learning it.

And you're my brother, don't give up on these children. And y'all, just know your rights and then what you do -- remain respectful. Always remember, get a badge number and a name and file that report. And I'm done speaking.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you, sister, for your comments. Is there anyone else who wants to make a comment?

MR. DARCHE: I think there's someone online that raised their hand.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Can you tell us who you are?

MS. WILLIAMS: A brief moment --

MR. DARCHE: What's your name, ma'am?

1
2 MS. WILLIAMS: I'm about to give it
3 to you. A brief moment to introduce
4 myself. My name is Gina Williams, and I
5 am the Bronx advocate on behalf of the
6 Jumaane Williams, the public advocate.
7 I will just give my number right now.
8 It's 646-952-1549. My e-mail address is
9 GWilliams@advocate.NYC.gov.

10 And I appreciate some of the people
11 coming to share their stories. I worked
12 with Good Shepherds before, so I've had
13 positive interactions with BRAG when I
14 -- Riley. I look forward to building
15 healthy, professional relationships
16 throughout the city, as well as the main
17 borough that I'm representing in the
18 Bronx. So you have my information.
19 Please feel free to use it, call, e-mail
20 and I am available. Thank you.

21 CHAIR RICE: Can you let folks know
22 -- a lot of people do know who Jumaane
23 Williams is, some people do not. And
24 the role of the public advocate.

25 MS. WILLIAMS: So Jumaane Williams

1
2 is the public advocate for New York
3 City. And every borough has a
4 representative from that office. So the
5 public advocate's job is to definitely
6 -- first, he oversees City Council
7 members. That's one. Two, his job and
8 our job is to definitely make sure that
9 the city is running on alignment; every
10 agency, every official, etcetera through
11 policies and procedures, rules,
12 regulations. And to also bridge gaps
13 with community and with agencies, and to
14 bring the city together as a whole, so
15 that we operate properly, professionally
16 and efficiently. It's not always about
17 always calling people out. It's like
18 how do we make these corrections in a
19 positive light, and in a professional
20 light.

21 But on that note, that is a part of
22 our job -- is to make sure that people
23 are doing their jobs. And so that's why
24 it's very important we also definitely
25 -- that's why the word "advocate" is so

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

strong, because that is the voice to speak for the voiceless.

And I admire the young lady, 12. I commend you, I applaud you, and you have a fearless leader in your mom. To get up here today and to speak your statement and your truth says volumes. It also says how we're preparing our children for the future.

And so while I'm speaking about children in particular right now, I want to just reflect back to City Council House Speaker, Adrienne Adams -- today gave an amazing -- amazing state of the city, and what the plan of action is. And how monies should be spent, and how housing, employment, NYPD, public service people, children, schools, education is extremely, extremely important.

So there were definitely a lot of officials there. Definitely Bronx borough President, Vanessa Gibson was present, our mayor was present. And all

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

in alignment to wake up every day with a mindful purpose, a mindful purpose of intent, so that this city is governed for equity for all. Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Ms. Williams. And can we have the next speaker.

MR. FRANKLIN: Good evening. My name is Ron Franklin. I'm a community organizer here in the South Bronx. I've been a community organizer for, like, the last 20 years. I'm a former ward of state; former employee of NYPD, as well. I'm here because I'm really trying to figure out the role between community and policing, when it comes to community organizers and the -- my current situation as a father fighting for custody for his daughter.

I had recently had some visits from the sheriff department, and I spoke to a -- one of the officials of the service department, and their demeanor is like they have to come out to your apartment,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

or they're sent to your residence,
you're already guilty of whatever the
charges are or whatever the allegations
are. And I'm just trying to understand.
Like, is that the way that everybody's
treated, or is that the way that
particular people are treated?

I do live in a building that is
quoted in a different way for low-income
people. So when they come up to my
apartment, it's -- it's assuming that I
don't have the means to fight whatever
the charges are, or the situation when
it comes to me fighting for custody for
my daughter. As a community organizer
for the last 20 years, I had a pretty
good relationship with the Police
Department. I've definitely had some --
some incidents with the Police
Department, I'm not going to talk about
right now, but I'm -- I'm just trying to
figure out how this all goes together.
I can do great work for 20 years, and
one incident can transform everything?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

One incident can transform everything?
So I'm just trying to figure out if this
is something that's continuously
happening, or is it something that we're
going to pay attention to, to change.

We have a lot of individuals in here
that do great work for the community,
and we still have these incidences where
those individuals are still targeted by
the department that supposed to be
protecting individuals that are doing
great things for the community. I'm
just trying to figure out where the
understanding is, that we do have people
that are doing great things for the
community, and we need to be looking out
for those people instead of looking at
those people as the troublemakers.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you for that
comment. One of the things I often say
is that people should be policed not
based on their ZIP code, but everybody
should have the same experience. And so
thank you for the comment. I think it's

1
2 part of the work that -- AU said, that
3 we, as individuals, have to take on; and
4 also, us as an accountability board. In
5 order to do that, there's much more work
6 that needs to be done with the local
7 level, and at the national level with the
8 George Floyd Policing Act.

9 And so I think we all need to
10 continue this work and -- and move
11 forward. And I don't know if any other
12 members of my panel have any other
13 comments.

14 MR. DARCHE: Madam Chair, there was
15 one thing I wanted to say to both Ms.
16 Green's, which is that you can file a
17 complaint with us. Ms. Green, you can
18 file on behalf of your daughter. Or
19 also, you know, if you're a young person
20 who has been -- or feels they were a
21 victim of misconduct, you can file a
22 complaint on your own. If you want to
23 talk to someone, we have investigators
24 here tonight. Or, because you're with
25 the YAC, we know you and we -- you know,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

you'll have the opportunity later. But if you would like to do so tonight, you can.

MR. FOX: So I'm not going to reveal anything that you did not, but you said enough that tells me as a father, as a human being that it's a very difficult situation that you're going through. It's -- it can be more traumatic than death, than, you know, losing a loved one.

You mentioned sheriff, which is another agency, and you also mentioned a life of activism and doing in the world. And we just -- you deserve to get to the bottom of how you're being treated with this particular case, with whatever agency's coming with whatever papers they're bringing to you. And there's -- there's people who can answer that. It's a very difficult process, and sometimes it doesn't seem as humane as we'd like it to be, especially while we're dealing with children and -- in

1
2 our lives and relationships; but if you
3 keep these resources available, I can
4 help you with that. There's advocacy
5 groups that can help you navigate those
6 waters, and those are much -- I can tell
7 you for sure: What you're going through
8 doesn't last forever.

9 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: So there was some
10 valuable information given out. The
11 CCRB works hard to make sure that the
12 agency is as transparent as possible.
13 So for those of you who worries -- that
14 stayed here late tonight that learned
15 things about how to report, how to find
16 the information about an officer, CCRB
17 does have that information online. Tell
18 your neighbors. Share that information
19 because CCRB works hard, where we have
20 information, we're on social media. But
21 sometimes, when a neighbor or a friend
22 shares that information, that's how the
23 information builds, so -- and that's how
24 we build capacity and build continuing
25 engagement. And we need the engagement

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

from you, so I'd like to thank you all for taking the time out for being here tonight.

CHAIR RICE: I've also been asked to make one other -- I've been asked to make one other comment. And then, sir, we would like to hear your comment. I just wanted to let Mr. Teel, as well as everyone else in the room know that we're going to be having our next CCRB meeting -- not our next, but we'll be having a CCRB meeting. The CCRB Queens board meeting will be on July 12th at the Robert Ross Life Center, which is at 172-17 Linden Boulevard in Queens, and that is within the 113th Precinct. So I just wanted to let you all know that we will be there in July, and we'll be having our board meeting there.

Okay. Before we have the gentleman in the room speak, is there someone on the line, Yojaira, who also had their hand raised?

MS. ALVAREZ: Yes, Chair. Javier

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Seda, and that would conclude our online public portion.

MR. SEDA: Hello, can you hear me?

CHAIR RICE: Yes.

MR. SEDA: Hi. My name is Javier Seda, I represent The Institute for Mediation and Conflict Resolution. I am very glad to hear that the CCRB has a mediation arm, and I wanted to know that -- I wanted to let -- first, let the community and the CCRB know that we are available. IMCR has been the Bronx's mediation center. We have city and state contracts. I have been in small claims court myself to mediate cases, and mediate any permutation or conflict that exists. And my -- my direct manager -- our director of mediation, Artis Rich, he used to be a transit cop in Brooklyn way back in the 80's. Yes, he's 80-years old now, and has a great love for this city, has a great love for our police force. And we want to marry those two things. And our

1
2 entire job is about bringing together
3 individuals and being for the last year
4 50 years, the -- the answer, the
5 alternative to incarceration and --
6 yeah, I just wanted to ask -- if at any
7 point the CCRB can answer -- how can
8 IMCR help this process? How can we help
9 with -- especially the mediation arm,
10 and maybe for the training of mediators
11 and even training for the community,
12 which is also something that we do.

13 I will -- at any point, I'll make a
14 -- I can't really access the chat
15 function right now, but I'll make my
16 number and my e-mail available to anyone
17 who wants it.

18 CHAIR RICE: We'll have our
19 executive director respond in regard to
20 the offer of mediation.

21 MR. DARCHE: So we're always looking
22 for new mediators. And I will have our
23 -- the director of our mediation unit
24 reach out to you and -- and see if we
25 can have your institute work with us and

1
2 provide mediators. I think that would
3 be very helpful.

4 MR. SEDA: Perfect. Excellent.

5 MR. DARCHE: Thank you.

6 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Thank you
7 for your comment.

8 And we'll return back into the room.

9 MR. JENNINGS: Good evening. My
10 name is Anthony Jennings, I'm a youth
11 development specialist for Life Camp,
12 Inc. I'm also a resident of Brooklyn.
13 Just listening -- there's been like four
14 of these meetings already, and the
15 common thing is training, right? Its
16 motto is to protect and serve, right?
17 We can go back to the Eleanor Bumpurs the
18 conversation was training.

19 The -- Amadou Diallo, is that how you
20 pronounce it? Diallo, training, the
21 brother that got the plunger, training!
22 How much training is it going to be? This
23 young lady -- sister right here, her
24 reserve. It could have turned out a
25 different way, like the young lady on

1
2 Staten Island. Training, training,
3 training. You have officers that come
4 to these communities that's scared. How
5 can you train fear away? How can you
6 train? You keep talking about training
7 is going to get better. After how many
8 deaths is it going to get better? And we
9 are saying -- are saying the same
10 argument, training; the same
11 conversation, training. It ain't enough
12 training in the world to bring those
13 people back at the hands of officers that
14 were afraid to police these communities.

15 Action. We got to stop talking. We
16 got to commit actions. That's what we
17 need to do, actions. This young lady
18 should have never had to go through
19 that. Never. If he was trained, it
20 wouldn't have been that. A pregnant
21 woman, if he was trained, it wouldn't
22 have been that. If he was trained,
23 Eleanor Bumpurs -- wouldn't have died at
24 the hands of officers. And we can have
25 so many other -- I'll keep going. And

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

it's training. After every incident,
training. When is training going to
start? Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Mr.
Jennings, for your comment. And how can
you train for your way is something that
-- that really struck with me. And I do
think that we have other suggestions
beyond training that -- that will lead to
accountability. And that's what this --
what this body is about, but we can thank
you for that -- for that comment and
belief that there are other things that
need to be in place beyond training.

Are there any other comments from
anyone in the room? Any other members of
the community have any comments?

All right. Seeing none.
(Unknown woman speaking in room with no
mic.)

MR. DARCHE: So to one of the areas
where I don't think we do need to improve
much is in sharing information

1
2 that we developed with the Police
3 Department. We -- we give them -- every
4 time that we substantiate a complaint,
5 we let them know. We also let them know
6 when we receive complaints which
7 officers have -- are subject to
8 complaints, which officers are witnesses
9 to complaints. And we let them know
10 what are the underlying facts that we
11 are able to determine, and -- and I
12 think one of the changes that's -- since
13 I've been executive director is -- we --
14 we've managed to convey -- sometimes
15 when we find conduct within NYPD
16 guidelines, it doesn't necessarily mean
17 it was good police work. And so I -- I
18 think that we've been -- we've been very
19 effective. And a lot of people in the
20 room today putting on this meeting
21 online are the people who are making
22 sure that data gets to the Police
23 Department on a regular basis, so that
24 they know who are the officers, who are
25 the subjects of new complaints, and what

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

happens when we close a complaint and make a disposition.

MR. SIEGAL: May I ask a followup question. I think you asked a very good question. And I know the information goes from CCRB to the Police Department about what training we recommend -- when we recommend training. I've been on this board a long time. I have received no information about what training is actually implemented when we recommend training for certain incidents. And I don't know that we ever get that information. And that's a question, Jon, as to what comes back.

MR. DARCHE: So we are informed when there is training issued. And in certain limited number of cases, we will be informed of what the -- what subjects the training is given in. We are not told what is the content of the individual training.

CHAIR RICE: If I could just quickly -- and I do see your question, as well,

1
2 and I wanted to answer that. We want to
3 let you all know that we -- we govern
4 our work by something called the
5 discipline matrix. And so the
6 discipline matrix, if we -- if we look
7 through -- if the investigators for the
8 CCRB present to this board, and we --
9 and look at the information, and we find
10 that there's a preponderance of evidence
11 to say that there was, you know,
12 misconduct that was there, that's
13 something that's called being
14 substantiated, right?

15 And that information is what lives
16 on -- on the website. When we -- we
17 make that -- make that -- make that
18 decision based on -- as a panel. Some
19 of the recommendations that we make are
20 based on that discipline matrix. And so
21 it could be -- it could be that
22 training, but it also could be a loss of
23 vacation days or could be other
24 penalties that are in place. And so
25 those penalties are not something that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

the CCRB creates, but it's something that comes from discipline matrix, which we came to agreement with the NYPD, in order to implement those -- those disciplinary recommendations.

One of the continued challenges is that when we make a recommendation to the NYPD, it is then up to the NYPD's police commissioner to, then, enforce that or not. But we do not have final say on the recommendation to see if it's implemented or not. And so that's something that we will continue to fight for -- is that the CCRB has -- is the final say when it comes to discipline recommendations.

And, I'm sorry, sir, you had a question?

(Unknown man speaking in the room with no mic.)

MR. DARCHE: The police commissioner is the final arbiter of discipline. So if the CCRB determines that misconduct occurred, the CCRB then recommends to

1
2 the Police Department what level of
3 discipline to impose on the member of
4 service. It is up to the department
5 whether or not they are going to impose
6 the levels of the -- impose discipline.

7 There is a process that has to --
8 once the CCRB's process is concluded,
9 then there's an entire NYPD disciplinary
10 process they must go through. In 2012,
11 the CCRB signed an agreement with the
12 NYPD, which created a unit; so that in
13 the most serious cases, the CCRB's
14 administrative prosecution unit actually
15 handles those cases in the discipline
16 system. So it's not an NYPD attorney
17 bringing the case -- the CCRB's case
18 against the member of service. It is
19 the CCRB attorney who brings that case,
20 but it's still the police commissioner
21 who has the final authority over what
22 discipline, if any, should be given.

23
24 (Unknown woman speaking in the room
25 with no mic.)

1
2 MR. DARCHE: So first, I want to
3 acknowledge, ma'am, how you feel is
4 extremely -- I don't understand. I've
5 never been in that situation, but I hear
6 the pain in your voice and I want to
7 acknowledge it. If you -- you don't
8 even need to make a FOIA request to find
9 out what happens in one of these cases.
10 We put it on the website, so that it is
11 there for anyone to see. We say what
12 happened, what the -- what the board
13 determined happened in every allegation.
14 And if the board determined misconduct
15 occurred, what the board recommended
16 happened. And then, when the police
17 inform us of what they decided to do, we
18 put that on the website, as well.

19 So all of that information is there
20 for you, the community, to see.

21 (Unknown woman speaking in the room
22 with no mic.)

23 MR. DARCHE: So the problem is when
24 you guys are down there, and we can hear
25 you up here, but people -- so if you

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

could just come up and ask your questions again.

MS. GREEN: To verify what my mom just said -- I found out what the CCRB -- when I first went to Albany for caucus, I went for 49th. And I should have probably known before because it's definitely good to know about this, because it's mostly students who are -- problems -- police misconduct. We -- and -- are in less cared for areas and considering the fact that there's probably people -- adults, who still don't know about the CCRB because there is not proper advertisement. And the police could probably care less to tell us we can file complaints with you because that's -- it may not cause any problems on their part, but better for them to be safe than sorry, and not tell anyone about it.

So sometimes you can't always look to the people who are supposed to tell you about it and -- yeah, you have to do

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

it yourself. Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: So the overall question just for those folks on the line who may not have heard it was about whether the CCRB has funding in order to do TV, or streaming advertising.

MR. DARCHE: Last year, the CCRB was given money by the City Council for the first time to do public outreach through advertising. Before that, we've been given some funding by -- I should really remember the name of the young -- young man's -- that is not -- the young men's initiative. Thank you, David.

But last year was the first time the money was given in the budget to the CCRB. And I don't think it is currently in the executive budget now. Correct, David? It's not there anymore? We were not -- it's not in the current executive budget.

(Unknown woman speaking in the room with no mic.)

MR. DARCHE: We'll have to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

fundraise.

CHAIR RICE: We'll put it in our testimony for our budget -- our budget hearing on March 20th. If you have another comment, if you don't mind, once again, coming to the podium for our board members online.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: So what's done with the funds?

MR. DARCHE: We put money on online platforms, and also on the radio.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thank you.

CHAIR RICE: Are there any other questions of those gathered, or online? Any other comments,

MR. PUMA: I wanted to kind of go back to the -- the topic of the final arbiter of discipline on the police commissioner being the final arbiter of discipline. This has come -- this came up in our Harlem meeting two months ago. It comes up in our community meetings often, but one thing that I just want to note is that, you know, -- how that

1
2 changes is probably with -- with you
3 all, and legislation. So that's just --
4 if you want the CCRB to have that
5 paradigm to change, then legislation is
6 one of the main ways to get there.
7 That's -- I always feel like we bring up
8 this -- this topic, it comes up and
9 community members, you know -- you know,
10 sort of understand us a little bit more,
11 but we may be, you know, don't
12 necessarily see things changing, but I
13 -- without -- and without that extra bit
14 of information that, you know, there
15 could be a way to change that, but it is
16 through legislation and advocacy.

17 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Joe. Do we
18 have any old business to come before the
19 board? Any old business? Do we have
20 any new business to come before the
21 board? Any new business?

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing done.
24 I'm going to move now that we break into
25 executive session. The agenda for the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

executive session is: The board will receive an update from the executive director on pending personal actions.

Do I have a motion to adjourn the meeting?

MS. BROWN-WYANDS: I move that the meeting is adjourned.

CHAIR RICE: Do I have a second?

BOARD MEMBER: Second.

MR. DARCHE: So moved. The March meeting of the CCRB is concluded. Thank you.

(TIME NOTED: 8:24 p.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, TIFFANIE JONES, a Notary Public within
and for the State of New York, do hereby
certify:

That the witness whose examination is
hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn and that
such an examination is a true record of the
testimony given by such a witness.

I further certify that I am not related to
any of these parties to this action by blood or
marriage, and that I am not in any way
interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
hand this 8th day of March, 2023.

Tiffanie Jones

Tiffanie Jones