1 2 ----X 3 CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD PUBLIC MEETING 4 FEBRUARY 9, 2022 5 б 4:00 P.M. 7 -----X 8 9 HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE 10 11 BEFORE: ARVA RICE, CHAIR 12 13 JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR 14 15 16 Transcribed by: 17 Elbia Baires 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

In Re February Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board February 9, 2022

1		
2	PUBLIC	MEETING AGENDA
3	======	
4	1.	Call to Order
5	2.	Adoption of Minutes
6	3.	Report from the Chair
7	4.	Report from the Executive Director
8	5.	Presentation from Outreach on the CCRB
9	б.	Public Comment
10	7.	Old Business
11	8.	New Business
12	9.	Adjourn to Executive Session
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

In Re February Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board February 9, 2022

3

1 2 BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT 3 1. Arva Rice - Chair 4 5 2. Corrine A. Irish, Esq., Board Member 3. Joseph A. Puma, Board Member 6 7 Willie Freeman, Board Member 4. 5. 8 Esmeralda Simmons, Esq., Board Member 9 6. Erica Bond, Board Member 7. Herman Merritt, Board Member 10 Michael Rivadeneyra, Esq. Board Member 11 8. 12 Rev. Dr. Demetrius Carolina, Board 9. 13 Member 14 10. Salvatore F. Carcaterra, Board Member John Siegal, Esq , Board Member 15 11. 16 Frank Dwyer, Board Member 12. 17 18 Presenters: 19 Jahi Rose - Director of Outreach 20 New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board 21 2.2 23 24 25

1 2 MS. ALVAREZ: Good evening, 3 everyone. Thank you so much for 4 joining us. For those that would like 5 to use, utilize our ASL service, our two interpreters are Andria and Craig 6 7 Ridgway. In the chat, you will find instructions on how to pin their video 8 9 throughout the meeting. Thank you. CHAIR RICE: Good afternoon, 10 everyone. I'm Arva Rice, and I would 11 12 like to call the February 2022 13 Civilian Complaint Review Board 14 meeting to order. And with that said, I'd like to 15 introduce myself, and I will do that a 16 17 little bit later. But I'm Arva Rice 18 serving as the interim Chair for CCRB. If I can have the members of the 19 20 board introduce themselves. 21 John Siegal? 2.2 MR. SIEGAL, ESQ.: Yes. Good 23 afternoon, Ms. Rice. My name is John 24 Siegal. I'm a lawyer in Manhattan 25 living in the Bronx, and appointed by

2 Mayor de Blasio to the CCRB. 3 And I welcome you as Chair.	ıch,
	ıch,
	ıch,
4 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so mu	
5 John.	
6 Erica Bond?	
7 MS. ALVAREZ: Erica will be	
8 joining us a little later.	
9 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so mu	ich.
10 Corrine Irish?	
11 MS. IRISH, ESQ.: Thank you	,
12 Chair Rice. And welcome.	
13 My name is Corrine Irish.	E
14 am I am a mayoral appointee and	ł
15 live in Harlem.	
16 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so mu	ich.
17 Reverend Demetrius Carolina	
18 REV. DR. CAROLINA: Thank yo	ou,
19 Chair Rice. This is Demetrius	
20 Carolina from Staten Island and	
21 mayoral appointee as well.	
22 CHAIR RICE: Perfect.	
23 Joseph, have you joined us?	
24 Joseph Puma?	
25 MR. PUMA: Yes. Good aftern	100n,

1 2 Chair Rice. Pleasure to welcome you 3 as Chair. My name is Joseph Puma. I am 4 5 the Manhattan City Council representative to the board from the 6 7 Borough of Manhattan. And I live on the Lower East Side. 8 9 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Michael. Michael Rivadeneyra. 10 11 And please correct my pronunciation of 12 your last name. 13 MR. RIVADENEYRA, ESQ.: Sure. 14 No problem. And thank you and congratulations, Chair Rice. 15 I am Michael Rivadeneyra. 16 The 17 City Council's Bronx designee, and I 18 reside in the Bronx. 19 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Michael. 20 And thank you for being gracious. 21 Has Frank joined us yet? I 2.2 don't think he has. 23 So has Sal joined us? Sal 24 Carcaterra? 25 (No response.)

1 2 MS. ALVAREZ: Sal joins us by calling in and Sorin will let us know 3 when he's been upgraded. 4 CHAIR RICE: Terrific. 5 Esmeralda Simmons? 6 7 MS. SIMMONS, ESQ.: Good afternoon. So happy to call you Chair 8 9 Rice. My name is Esmeralda Simmons. 10 I'm a resident of Bedford-Stuyvesant, 11 12 Brooklyn. Appointed by public 13 advocate Jumaane Williams to this 14 board. CHAIR RICE: Terrific. 15 16 And Herman Merritt? Herman, are 17 you with us? 18 MS. ALVAREZ: Mr. Merritt, I 19 believe you are muted. 20 MR. MERRITT: I'm so sorry. 21 Welcome again, Chair Rice. 2.2 And my name is Herman Merritt. 23 I'm the Brooklyn representative 24 appointed by the City Council. 25 CHAIR RICE: Terrific. Thank

1 2 you. 3 And as you heard from -- that there will be a couple of other board 4 members who will join us over the 5 course of the meeting. But thank you 6 7 so much, board members, for joining us for this February meeting. 8 MS. ALVAREZ: And Chair Rice, we 9 are joined by two more. I know that 10 the setting, you might not be able to 11 see all the videos. We've been joined 12 13 by board member Erica Bond and Frank 14 Dwyer. CHAIR RICE: Wonderful. 15 16 Erica, can you introduce 17 yourself? 18 MS. BOND: Of course. 19 Good afternoon, all. My name is 20 Erica Bond. Apologies, I'm a few 21 minutes late here. I am a Mayoral 2.2 Designee, and I reside in Brooklyn. 23 Good to see everybody. 24 CHAIR RICE: And then I believe that Frank Dwyer joined us as well. 25

1 2 MR. DWYER: Thank you. I'm Frank Dwyer. I want to 3 thank Sorin for his herculean effort 4 to reroute me through a different 5 б route in, and he did it amazingly 7 quickly in 10, 15, 20 different little things. So that was really 8 9 impressive. 10 I'm Frank Dwyer. I'm a Police Commissioner designee. 11 12 CHAIR RICE: Terrific. Thank 13 you so much. And I believe I have all the 14 board members who are with us this 15 16 afternoon. 17 I'd like to ask for a motion to 18 approve the minutes? 19 MR. DWYER: So motioned. 20 REV. DR. CAROLINA: Second. 21 CHAIR RICE: We have a second. 2.2 All right. Are there any 23 changes or corrections to the minutes 24 as presented? 25 (No response.)

1 CHAIR RICE: If not, if not, 2 hearing none, all those in favor of 3 4 approving the minutes, say aye. 5 (Chorus of ayes.) CHAIR RICE: All those opposed? 6 7 (No response.) CHAIR RICE: All those opposed? 8 9 (No response.) CHAIR RICE: All right. The 10 11 minutes are approved. Thank you so 12 very much. 13 Good afternoon, and welcome 14 again to the Civilian Complaint Review 15 Board's February meeting. My name, as you just heard, is Arva Rice. And I'm 16 17 thrilled to welcome you and to accept the role as the interim chair of the 18 board. 19 20 I'm particularly excited to be 21 chairing my first meeting during Black 2.2 History Month. As some of you know, I joined this prestigious group of men 23 and women on the board last year, and 24 25 I am very proud to now serve as the

1 interim chair. 2 3 As the current president and CEO of the New York Urban League, I am 4 5 working to enable underserved communities to secure a first class 6 7 education, economic self reliance and equal respect of their civil rights 8 through programs, services, and 9 10 advocacy, which is the mission of the 11 New York Urban League. 12 Before joining the Urban League, 13 I served as Executive Director of 14 Project Enterprise, an organization 15 that provides business loans, technical assistance and peer support 16 17 to New York City entrepreneurs who 18 lack adequate resources and to 19 business financing. 20 Under the last administration, I served as commissioner for the New 21 22 York City Equal Employment Practices 23 Commission and Mayor de Blasio's commission for gender equity. Before 2.4 joining the CCRB, I worked with former 25

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	
2	Police Commissioner Shea and Mayor de
3	Blasio on a department wide initiative
4	to reform the NYPD. And in March of
5	last year, the City Council passed a
6	resolution adopting our final police
7	reform and reinvention collaborative
8	plan.
9	After decades working to make
10	New York City a fair, more equitable
11	and safer city, I'm pleased to use my
12	expertise to lead the CCRB in its next
13	chapter.
14	The CCRB is a uniquely important
15	agency that is key to fulfilling this
16	great City's mission to protect New
17	Yorker. And as it grows in number and
18	power, the agency continues to expand
19	its services to those in need.
20	I would like to particularly
21	thank Chair Fred Davie for his
22	impeccable service to the City. Under
23	his leadership, the board made great
24	strides in the last several years,
25	expanding the CCRB's powers with the

1 2 right to investigate sexual 3 misconduct, untruthful statements, 4 bias based policing and more. 5 At the end of the last year, the City Council passed a groundbreaking 6 7 bill, allowing the CCRB to self-initiate complaints. I hope to 8 build on that momentum and continue to 9 10 push the agency forward. 11 We have many goals for the 12 coming year, and we will need to work 13 closely with the new administration 14 and City and state legislatures to 15 achieve them. A top priority is passing a bill in the State Senate to 16 17 give oversight agencies like the CCRB 18 an exemption from sealing statutes. 19 With the recently added ability 20 to self-initiate complaints and 21 investigate incidents of racial 2.2 profiling occurring since 2016, the CCRB needs access to seal arrest 23 records, which often cover up officer 24 misconduct. I will also continue the 25

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	
2	fight for final disciplinary authority
3	in CCRB cases. Misconduct cannot be
4	truly addressed while the NYPD has the
5	final say.
6	I am hopeful that we will
7	partner we will have a partner with
8	Mayor Adams who has continually called
9	for safety and justice together to
10	improve the City's policing, and has
11	been a reformer of the NYPD, both when
12	he wore a badge and when he served as
13	a state senator.
14	The CCRB will be a key part in
15	ensuring accountability for police
16	misconduct, and repairing police
17	community relations in the coming
18	years. And I look forward to doing
19	all I can to help facilitate that.
20	I will next I will next
21	acknowledge Board Member, Corrine
22	Irish has been selected as part of the
23	prestigious 2022 Class of Presidential
24	Leadership Scholars. Please bring
25	together bringing together a

1 diverse network of leaders to 2 3 collaborate and create meaningful change in the United States. 4 5 Congratulations on this incredibly exciting honor. 6 7 MS. IRISH, ESO.: Thank you. CHAIR RICE: You are welcome. 8 And I would also like to 9 congratulate Board Member Reverend 10 Dr. Demetrius Carolina, who has been 11 12 named as a New York City Commission on 13 Human Rights Trailblazer. 14 Dr. Carolina is specifically being honored for his outstanding work 15 advocating for Black American human 16 17 rights in New York City. 18 So thank you for your incredible 19 service to the City. And thank you 20 all. I am now going to turn it over 21 to our Executive Director, Jonathan 2.2 Darche. 23 Jonathan? 24 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Chair 25 Rice. The staff is very lucky to have

1 2 your dedication and expertise leading 3 this agency. 4 Last week, a court upheld the 5 CCRB's right to prosecute serious misconduct. Last fall, the CCRB 6 7 substantiated charges against Officer Wayne Isaacs. The NYPD served those 8 charges. Officer Isaacs sued to avoid 9 discipline for his misconduct. 10 While this decision is a success 11 12 for the CCRB and the City as a whole, 13 the case will now go in front of the 14 Deputy Commissioner for trials and the 15 APU team that is handling that case will make sure to present all of the 16 17 evidence in order to convict Officer 18 Isaacs in the disciplinary trial. 19 Two quick updates on agency operations. First, the CCRB continues 20 21 to review protest cases and we expect 2.2 to have a protest report out in the 23 coming months. And the office is 2.4 open. And so if you want to file your 25 complaint in person, we are here and

1 available. But it would still be 2 3 easier if you want to file your 4 complaint online or over the phone, if 5 possible. Some ground rules for today's 6 7 meeting. In the public session, please use the "raise the hand" 8 feature to make a comment. And please 9 10 keep your comments to two minutes. 11 And I'd like to thank the people who 12 will be participating and who are 13 watching today, for participating in 14 this meeting. Thank you, Chair Rice. 15 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much. 16 17 Jon, we appreciate that presentation. And I wanted to ask the 18 19 members of the board if you all have 20 any questions in regards to the 21 presentation that you just heard from 2.2 your Executive Director. 23 (No response.) 24 CHAIR RICE: Any questions? 25 (No response.)

1 2 CHAIR RICE: Giving people a moment to click on their muted 3 4 button --5 All right. So seeing none, we will go forward with our report. 6 The 7 presentation from our Director of Outreach. 8 So Jahi Rose, if you can come 9 10 forward to make your presentation. 11 Thank you, Jahi. 12 MR. ROSE: Thank you very much, 13 Chair Rice. We definitely appreciate 14 having you on board as our interim Chair. 15 16 Can everyone see my screen? 17 As many of you know, the 18 Civilian Complaint Review Board is the 19 nation's largest independent oversight 20 entity over the largest police force 21 in the country. The CCRB 2.2 investigates, mediates and prosecutes 23 complaints of police misconduct made against officers in the New York City 24 25 Police Department. The agency is

1	
2	governed by 15-member board. You have
3	met many of our board members today.
4	Five being appointed by the New York
5	City Council, five being appointed by
6	the Mayor. Three designated by the
7	Police Commissioner. One appointed by
8	the Public Advocate and the Chair is
9	jointly appointed by the Mayor and the
10	City Council.
11	The CCRB's jurisdiction allows
12	us to investigate four categories of
13	allegations, that includes force,
14	abuse of authority, discourtesy and
15	offensive language. FADO is a helpful
16	acronym that can be used to remember
17	the CCRB's jurisdiction.
18	I wanted to provide you with a
19	little bit of information regarding
20	the Right to Know Act. The Right to
21	Know Act is a law that went into
22	effect October 19th of 2018. This
23	pertains to stop frisks and searches,
24	checkpoints and other encounters.
25	Though components of the Right to Know

1 2 Act include officers identifying 3 themselves by providing their name and other information such as rank, 4 command and shield number. With some 5 exemptions. Explaining the purpose of 6 7 the encounter. Under certain circumstances, 8 they should inform an individual of 9 10 their right to say no when asking for consent search of someone's person, 11 12 property, vehicle and/or home. And 13 under certain circumstances, they should offer business card with the 14 officer's information, which explains 15 how to make a comment and/or complaint 16 17 about an interaction with the New York 18 City police officer. And civilians 19 can make a request for this business card in all encounters. 20 21 Now, this is an image of what 22 the business cards look like. 23 Now, there are a few ways to 2.4 file a complaint about police 25 misconduct. As mentioned by Executive

1 Director Darche, one of the easiest 2 3 ways is by filing it online, at 4 nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint. You can also 5 call CCRB's hotline, which is 1800-341-CCRB, or 1800-341-2272. 6 7 Remember, if you see footage of misconduct on social media or in the 8 9 news, you can file a complaint even if 10 you weren't there in person. Feel 11 free to tag the CCRB in the complaint 12 and you will receive a response. 13 Additional ways to file a 14 complaint to the CCRB about misconduct 15 include calling 311, visiting the CCRB at our headquarters at 100 Church 16 17 Street on the 10th floor in Lower Manhattan. 18 You can also DM the CCRB on our 19 20 social media platforms, which will be 21 shared immediately after. You can 2.2 send the CCRB a letter in the mail 23 once again to 100 Church Street on the 24 10th floor, New York, New York. Zip code 10007. 25

1	
2	You can also file a complaint at
3	any local police precinct. It does
4	not have to be the precinct where the
5	encounter interaction may have taken
б	place.
7	If you'd like to request a CCRB
8	outreach presentation, feel free to
9	contact the outreach unit at
10	outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov. You can also
11	follow us on our social media
12	platform, includes our Instagram,
13	Twitter and Facebook.
14	Thank you very much, Chair Rice.
15	CHAIR RICE: Thank you. And I'm
16	going to ask if our board members have
17	any additional questions. But before
18	they do that, I want them to hold that
19	thought because we have been joined by
20	two additional board members, who I'm
21	going to add to introduce themselves.
22	So Willie Freeman. Willie?
23	MR. FREEMAN: Willie Freeman.
24	I'm a Police Commissioner Designee.
25	CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much,

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 2 Willie. I appreciate that. And then also I believe that Sal 3 4 Carcaterra has also joined us as well. 5 MR. CARCATERRA: Hi. Yes, hi, Chair Rice. Congratulations. 6 7 My name is Sal Carcaterra. And I'm a Police Commissioner Designee and 8 I reside on Staten Island. 9 CHAIR RICE: Wonderful. Thank 10 11 you so much, gentlemen. 12 And do we have any questions 13 about the presentation that was made 14 by Jahi? 15 (No response.) CHAIR RICE: Any questions from 16 17 our board? 18 (No response.) 19 CHAIR RICE: Okay. We will now 20 enter the public comment portion of 21 the meeting. As you heard from your 2.2 executive director, if you are 23 interested in making a public comment, 24 please use the "raise your hand" feature that can be found at the 25

1 2 bottom of the screen and we will go down the list. 3 4 Please keep your comments to 5 two minutes. And Yojaira, will you please call on the first person? 6 7 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Chair. As we wait for folks to utilize 8 the "raise the hand" feature, I just 9 wanted to thank the following elected 10 official officers and their 11 12 representatives for being here in 13 attendance. Council member Gale 14 Brewer, Assembly member Salazar, Council member Stevens, Council member 15 Clarke, Council Member Rivera, Carlina 16 17 Rivera. The Manhattan District 18 Attorney's Office, as well as the 19 Brooklyn District Attorney's Office. Council member Narcisse. And Council 20 member Won. In addition to the Queens 21 22 Attorney General's Office. As well as 23 Congress Member Meng. 24 So thank you all for joining us. 25 The first person on our list is

1 2 Michael Meyers. MR. MEYERS: Yes. Can you hear 3 4 Can you hear me? me? 5 MR. DARCHE: Yes, Mr. Meyers. MR. MEYERS: Yes. I have a 6 7 couple of questions in my two minutes. My first question is, when and where 8 will I find it in the minutes when the 9 rules of the CCRB changed or amended 10 11 to limit the public participation 12 questions and comments on your 13 meetings to two minutes? 14 I used to come to every meeting 15 of the board, the CCRB board, and everybody at that time, every board 16 17 member rejected the notion that you 18 can limit the public comments and/or 19 questions to two minutes. And my --20 my second question is, when will 21 in-person meetings of the CCRB board 2.2 return? In as much as the COVID situation has now under control. 23 24 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Michael, 25 for your two questions. I appreciate

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 2 that. And I'm going to defer the --3 MR. MEYERS: Oh, and by the way, 4 I forgot to say I'm Michael Meyers. 5 I'm the president of the New York Civil Rights Coalition, for those who 6 7 don't know. CHAIR RICE: Terrific. 8 Thank 9 you so much, Mr. Meyers, and thank you 10 for your two questions. And I'm going to defer both of those to executive 11 12 director, because I'm not sure when 13 the two-minute rule went into effect. 14 And he can also respond in regards to 15 when we will go into real life 16 meetings again. 17 MR. DARCHE: So the two-minute 18 rule is not in our rules. It was put 19 in place when we originally started 20 going into community to take comments, 21 and many of the locations we were 2.2 going, we had a hard stop because of 23 locations where we were -- wouldn't 24 allow us to go long. So we wanted to 25 make sure that everyone who wanted to

1 2 participate could. 3 But it is a good point. We 4 might need to look and that might 5 actually need to be changed. That goes into the rules. Thank you for 6 7 pointing that out, Mr. Meyers. And then the plan is to move to 8 9 in-person meetings for the March 10 meeting. But we are taking steps to ensure that we continue to do a live 11 12 broadcast so that people have the 13 opportunity to be in person, as well 14 as still be able to not only watch the 15 meetings online, but participate when 16 they are online. 17 MR. MEYERS: My question is, the 18 board has never amended the rules to 19 limit the public's questions and 20 comments to two minutes. That is --21 that is an ultravirus rule that you 2.2 made up. 23 CHAIR RICE: Well, thank you, 24 Mr. Meyers, for your -- for bringing 25 that to our attention. We will

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 2 certainly bring it back to the board 3 as we go into further discussions. 4 But thank you for bringing that to our 5 attention. We appreciate it. Yojaira, can you tell us about 6 7 who is next. MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, 8 9 Mr. Meyers. 10 Next on the list, we have Raul Rivera. 11 12 MR. RIVERA: Hello. I'm trying 13 to -- can you hear me? 14 CHAIR RICE: Yes, Mr. Rivera. 15 We can hear you. MR. RIVERA: How you doing? 16 My 17 name is Raul Rivera. I'm a New York 18 City TLC driver. I'm also a TLC 19 driver advocate. We have a petition to reform the tax limousine 20 commission. 21 2.2 And my -- I just want to bring 23 to the attention of the CCRB, I'm a 24 very outspoken advocate and we fight 25 for the drivers. And on July of

1	
2	last July of 2020, I had a visit at
3	my home from two NYPD officers.
4	Apparently, somebody didn't like the
5	fact somebody didn't like the post
6	that I was putting on Twitter.
7	They officers told me that Twitter
8	sent them to do a wellness check on
9	me. And real quickly, it turned from
10	a wellness check to maybe I
11	shouldn't post so much, maybe I should
12	take it easy with the posting, that
13	I'm posting and I'm tagging high
14	profile people. And that was a little
15	disturbing. I took it as intimidation
16	and harassment.
17	I filed a complaint with the
18	CCRB, and apparently, according to the
19	CCRB, I did it too late. The the
20	limitation on the complaint passed.
21	Which is actually not true because the
22	CCRB allows 18 months, 18 months for
23	you to file your complaint. Which I
24	did. I filed my complaint three weeks
25	before the 18 months.

1 And I want the CCRB to 2 3 understand that, you know, when a person decides to file a complaint, 4 5 they really contemplate it. And a lot of times, six months will go by, 6 7 three months will go by, or maybe a year will go by before -- because 8 there's a lot of fear in filing 9 complaints. And we know that the 10 11 complaints are -- are down. At least 12 according to what I was told in 2020, 13 that the complaints are down. And 14 that has to be corrected. Because I 15 file a complaint and that goes nowhere. 16 17 And I have 20 minutes of audio 18 when this officer is speaking to me 19 and telling me all these things. So I 20 wish -- I'm going to have to go public 21 and put it out there publicly on Twitter and -- and -- and contact the 2.2 23 mayor. 24

CHAIR RICE: All right. Thank you for sharing that with us. And

25

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 2 also thank you for taking the time 3 to -- to file the complaint. Because we realize that's a decision that you 4 5 have to make. I just wanted to -- I realize, Mr. Rivera, that we are out 6 7 of time. But I just want to see, were you making a comment or did you have a 8 9 question as well? MR. RIVERA: There needs to be 10 clarification of how much time a 11 12 person has to file a complaint. 13 CHAIR RICE: All right. I'll 14 ask -- I will ask Jon --15 MR. RIVERA: You can't -- you can't say 18 months, the person files 16 17 before 18 months and then you get a 18 notice saying that it's too late. When it's not too late. 19 20 CHAIR RICE: Understood. Thank 21 you, Mr. Rivera. I'm going to ask our 2.2 executive director to respond to the 23 question about the statute of limitations on filing the complaint. 24 25 MR. DARCHE: So the statute of

1 2 limitations for these disciplinary investigations is 18 months. And that 3 4 is set by state law. Civil service 5 Law Section 75 of New York State. Which means that, the 6 7 investigation needs to be complete. 8 And if disciplinary charges are going 9 to be brought against the member of 10 service, they need to be served with 11 those charges within 18 months. Which 12 means that not only do we need to 13 receive the complaint within 14 18 months, we must fully investigate 15 the complaint, the board needs to deliberate on the -- on the complaint 16 17 and we need to then go to the police 18 department and have them take 19 disciplinary action. Which sometimes 20 can take considerable amount of time. 21 And so it's not so much that we 2.2 need to have the complaint within 23 18 months. It's that the entire 2.4 investigation needs to be completed within 18 months from the date of 25

incident.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

One of the -- there's only one exception in the law to the -- the statute of limitations in Civil Service Law Section 75, and that we refer to as the crime exception. And that is if the conduct to which -which the officer is accused of committing could have been charged as a crime, then the statute of limitation does not apply.

13 So in our rules, we have a 14 process for complaints that come in 15 either -- there are two separate processes. One for cases that are 16 past the statute of limitations and 17 18 another one for cases that are over a 19 year old. Where we go through and try 20 to figure out if there is some way to 21 complete the investigation within the 2.2 statutorily approved period of time, 23 we will conduct an investigation. But it is -- it is -- it is not 24 25 a CCRB choice that the statute of

1 limitations is 18 months. It's state 2 3 that law that's a requirement. 4 CHAIR RICE: Thank you, Jonathan, for that clarification. 5 That was extremely helpful. 6 7 Yojaira, do you have another 8 person on the list? MS. ALVAREZ: We -- that 9 concludes the public session. 10 Before -- before that, I just 11 12 wanted to additionally thank Community 13 Board 3 and Queens Community Board 16. The Office of Councilmember Hanks and 14 15 Councilmember Hudson, thank you so much for joining us. 16 17 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. 18 MR. DARCHE: Madam chair, I just 19 wanted to -- to -- back to Mr. Mayer's 20 questions, if I could just address 21 them real quick. Because I think 2.2 Mr. Meyers brings up an important 23 point, and he has been someone who has 24 been very active in the creation of the CCRB. And the CCRB, as is, 25

1 2 existed for the last 25 years and I 3 don't want to -- to -- I want to 4 certainly acknowledge his 5 contributions to the agency and to the City. 6 7 And just point out that we -when we set the time limit, we thought 8 we were acting within the Open 9 Meetings Law. But I will make sure 10 that the general council's office goes 11 12 back and looks at it and we will 13 report back as a staff to -- to the 14 board about -- about how we should proceed in the future. 15 16 To be honest with you, it was 17 not something I considered and we will 18 look at it and report back to you. 19 CHAIR RICE: Great. So thank 20 you again, Mr. Meyers, for bringing 21 that to our attention. We appreciate 2.2 it. 23 Going to old business. Do we have any old business to come before 24 the board? Old business? 25

1 2 (No response.) 3 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing 4 none, do we have any new business to come before the board? 5 (No response.) 6 7 CHAIR RICE: New business? 8 (No response.) 9 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Hearing 10 none, I'm going to move now that we break into executive session. 11 The 12 agenda for the executive --13 MS. IRISH, ESQ.: Chair, I'm 14 sorry. I actually think more hands have been raised. I don't know if 15 there's still time for public comment. 16 17 But --18 CHAIR RICE: Yojaira, do you 19 have more questions, more hands have been raised? 20 21 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you. Yes. 2.2 It looks like we have a few additional folks. 23 24 Sorin, can you -- the next on 25 the list will be Vincent Riggins.

37

1 2 CHAIR RICE: Thank you for 3 bringing that to our attention. MR. RIGGINS: Good afternoon, 4 5 and thank you for having this session, making it available to the community. 6 7 My name is Vincent Riggins. I'm Chair of Public Safety, Community 8 9 Board 5 in East New York, Brooklyn. 10 And I apologize for coming on late, 11 but I just had a few questions. 12 One, can you guys now 13 investigate officers without a formal 14 complaint? 15 Can you hear me? CHAIR RICE: Yes, we can. 16 Mr. Riggins, can you go ahead 17 18 and state your questions in a row? 19 And then we can go ahead and answer 20 them. I'm holding the first, which is 21 whether we can go forward with a case 2.2 against an officer when there is no 23 formal complaint; is that correct? MR. RIGGINS: Right. Can you 24 now investigate officers without a 25

1 formal complaint. And has -- has a 2 3 decision been made as to whether you guys would have final say on 4 5 discipline of officers? And I'll just stop right there 6 7 because I don't want to take up all your time. We've got other hands. 8 9 CHAIR RICE: Thank you so much. I will once again go to our executive 10 11 directer to answer the questions that 12 were raised in regards to doing 13 investigation without a formal 14 complaint, and then the second whether 15 the CCRB has got final authority on recommendations that are made in 16 17 regards to discipline. 18 I believe you are on mute. 19 MR. DARCHE: Sorry, sorry. Ι needed to unmute. I apologize. 20 21 The -- last year, the City 2.2 Council changed the City Charter, 23 which gives the CCRB the power to investigate cases before we receive a 24 25 complaint, without receiving a

1 2 complaint. 3 We have not yet changed our rules to set up the system by which 4 5 the agency will determine which -what incidents it will investigate 6 7 without receiving a complaint. I -- I anticipate that 8 conversation will begin in March, 9 10 either the March board meeting or the 11 April board meeting. 12 The second question --13 CHAIR RICE: Whether --14 whether --15 MR. DARCHE: Final authority --Police Commissioner is the final 16 17 arbiter of police discipline under 18 state law right now. The agency has 19 been asking for final authority for 20 several years, and there is some 21 legislation in Albany that would --2.2 that would change -- change a system 23 and change the City Charter so that the CCRB would have final authority. 24 But that is not the situation we have 25

1 2 right now. 3 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. 4 Yojaira, is there another 5 question? MS. ALVAREZ: Yes. Next, we 6 7 will be hearing from Civan Ozkanoglu. Apologies for my mispronunciation. 8 9 MR. OZKANOGLU: Hi. I have a 10 very quick question for Mr. Darche. 11 I have an open case, I have a 12 case open for like more than a year 13 ago. And the last time I heard from 14 the investigator was like June, 15 June 8. And after that, like -- I 16 sent several e-mails and phone calls. 17 I don't get any -- any response from 18 the investigator. And this -- this 19 doesn't sound normal to me. 20 I understand that 18 months 21 timeline to solve the case. But not 2.2 hearing from the investigator for 23 eight months, it's -- it's not normal 24 to me. 25 This was my only comment and

40

1 2 question. Thanks. 3 CHAIR RICE: Thank you for that question. And I will ask Jon to 4 5 respond, if you can, on an open case. MR. DARCHE: I actually just 6 7 looked in our system to see if I could find your complaint, and I don't see 8 9 it. So I'm going to ask if you can hold on and one of our investigators 10 11 is going to -- or someone from my --12 from the office is going to reach out 13 to you right now and get your 14 information. And we'll get back to 15 you and see exactly what the disconnect is. Because that is -- it 16 17 is unusual. 18 So I don't know what happened there. And we will find out. We'll 19 20 get back to you. If you hold on, we 21 can tell you what's going on. 2.2 CHAIR RICE: All right. So we 23 are asking him to hold on and be directly connected with staff of the 24 25 CCRB --

1 2 MR. DARCHE: Yes. 3 CHAIR RICE: -- to see if they 4 can get that issue resolved. So thank 5 you. MS. ALVAREZ: Perfect. And 6 7 Civan, I just sent you a message in the chat, if you can read that. If 8 9 not, we can e-mail you with your 10 registration information that you 11 provided. Thank you so much. 12 Next, we will be hearing from --13 looks like Mr. Meyers would like to 14 say one more thing. 15 Michael Meyers. 16 CHAIR RICE: Mr. Meyers, if you 17 had another comment? Are you still 18 with us? 19 (No response.) CHAIR RICE: Okay. Yojaira, can 20 21 you see if he's still on the line? 2.2 Can you tell? 23 MS. ALVAREZ: We'll try to 24 reconnect. In the meantime, the next 25 one on our list is Chad Royer.

1 2 MR. ROYER: Hi. Good afternoon, 3 everyone. My name is Chad Royer. I'm Vice Chair in Bronx Community Board 7 4 5 in the Bronx. Thank you for having 6 the meeting. 7 Two quick questions. In the 8 interest of trying to set up an event for -- for a group that may be 9 interested, would that be virtual or 10 11 would that be in person or would that 12 be a combination of both? 13 And then the other question that 14 I have is, can you -- can someone file 15 a CCRB complaint against an officer who is off duty? 16 17 CHAIR RICE: Sure. Can I ask 18 you to clarify your first question? 19 You were asking about setting up a 20 meeting, an outreach meeting so that 21 people could find out more about the 2.2 CCRB process? I didn't know what type of event you were speaking of. 23 MR. ROYER: That's what I mean. 24 25 If I want to invite CCRB to do an

44

1 2 event, would it be in person or virtual or a combination of both? 3 4 CHAIR RICE: Absolutely. Okay. 5 Thank you. Thank you for that б clarification. 7 Jon? MR. DARCHE: We can do both. 8 We 9 are eager to -- to go out and meet folks and talk to them about the 10 11 agency. 12 And Jahi, if you could put again 13 in the chat the ways that -- to reach 14 out to you. 15 And we'll be happy to meet with 16 your group, whether it's online, in 17 person or both. That's -- that's 18 exciting. Thank you. 19 And then the -- what was your 20 second question, sir? 21 MR. ROYER: Hi. My second 2.2 question was, can someone file a 23 complaint against someone --24 CHAIR RICE: When they're off 25 duty.

1 2 MR. DARCHE: So the agency does 3 not have jurisdiction against officers 4 who are off duty, unless they invoke 5 their authority as a police officer. That is sometimes a complicated 6 7 analysis that we do. If you feel that you were the victim of misconduct by 8 an off-duty officer who invoked their 9 10 authority, I suggest that you actually 11 file a complaint with the agency and 12 let us make the determination. 13 If it is within our 14 jurisdiction, we will investigate it. And if it's not within our 15 jurisdiction, we will refer it to the 16 17 department so that they can 18 investigate. 19 MR. ROYER: Thank you. 20 CHAIR RICE: Yojaira, are there 21 any other people on the list? 2.2 MS. ALVAREZ: We will try Mr. Meyers again. If not, that will 23 24 conclude the public session. 25 MR. MEYERS: I'm here. Can you

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

45

1 2 hear me? 3 CHAIR RICE: Yes, we can. Thank 4 you for joining us again, Mr. Meyers. 5 MR. MEYERS: I tried to say it before. I was -- I was satisfied with 6 7 the executive director's response to 8 my initial questions. And as I said to the board 9 10 earlier, I will see you next month for more than two minutes. 11 12 CHAIR RICE: Thank you. Thank 13 you for that. Thank you for 14 acknowledging the response, and we 15 look forward to seeing you next month. Terrific. 16 17 Yojaira, does that conclude 18 those who are on our list? 19 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes, Chair. 20 CHAIR RICE: Okay. Thank you so 21 much. All right. So the agenda for 2.2 the executive session is that the board will deliberate on one full 23 24 board case, and receive an update from 25 the executive director and the general

Γ

1	
2	counsel.
3	The executive director will
4	discuss the following three items:
5	One, scheduling issues for panelists
6	on full board cases. An update on
7	pending personnel actions. And the
8	general council will discuss the
9	following updates: An update on
10	current litigation.
11	Do I have a second to close
12	I'm sorry, do I have a motion to close
13	out the February CCRB meeting?
14	MS. IRISH, ESQ.: So moved.
15	MR. SIEGAL, ESQ.: Motioned.
16	CHAIR RICE: And do I have a
17	second?
18	MR. PUMA: Second.
19	CHAIR RICE: All right. So
20	moved. Thank you very much, everyone.
21	See you next month.
22	(TIME NOTED: 4:47 p.m.)
23	
24	
25	

In Re February Board Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board February 9, 2022

1	
2	CERTIFICATE
3	
4	STATE OF NEW YORK)
5	:SS
6	COUNTY OF SUFFOLK)
7	
8	I, Elbia Baires, a Notary Public within
9	and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:
10	I reported the proceedings in the
11	within-entitled matter, and that the within
12	transcript is a true record of such proceedings to
13	the best of my ability.
14	I further certify that I am not related
15	to any of the parties to this action by blood or
16	marriage; and that I am in no way interested in
17	the outcome of this matter.
18	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set
19	my hand this 16th day of February, 2022.
20	
21	
22	Ele (B.)
	Elbia Merino (Baires)
23	
24	
25	
	LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

48