

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019

1

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD
PUBLIC MEETING

1619 East 174th Street
Bronx, New York 10472

May 8, 2019 6:30p.m.

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDING:

FREDERICK DAVIE, Chair

JONATHAN DARCHE, Esq., Executive Director

TRANSCRIBED BY: Kathleen T. Keilty

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of Minutes
3. Report from the Chair
4. Report from the Executive Director
5. Presentation by Outreach of the CCRB
6. Presentation from Policy on Data
7. Comment from Community Groups
8. Public Comment
9. Old Business
10. New Business
11. Adjourn to Executive Session

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

FREDERICK DAVIE, Chair

NATHAN JOSEPH, Board Member

SALVATORE F. CARCATERRA, Board Member

JOHN SIEGAL, ESQ., Board Member

LINDSAY EASON, Board Member

MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA, ESQ., Board Member

JOSEPH PUMA, Board Member

MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS, Board Member

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

5

1 name is Ramon Peguero. I am the City
2 Council designee representing Queens.

3 SAL CARCATERRA: Hello, everyone. I'm
4 Sal Carcaterra and I'm a police
5 commissioner representative to the board.

6 NATHAN JOSEPH: Good evening. My name
7 is Nathan Joseph. I am a City Council
8 appointee from Staten Island.

9 FREDERICK DAVIE: Good. Thank you
10 all. And we'll be joined by at least one
11 other, maybe two other board members as the
12 night goes on. So at the top of this meeting
13 I'd like to give you a very brief update on
14 the city charter revision process. As many
15 of you know, the charter is New York City's
16 constitution. It's the document by which we
17 govern ourselves. And as a group called the
18 Charter Revision Commission, it's a group of
19 people that's been appointed by the City
20 Council to change that charter, to revise
21 it so that we can improve how we do
22 governance in the city. And I mention this
23 because police accountability is one of the
24 major topics that the commission is
25 discussing. And if you're at this meeting

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

6

1 tonight, then we know that police
2 accountability is important to you. It means
3 that it's an issue that you care about. As
4 New Yorkers we want to make continued
5 changes to more responsibly hold the NYPD
6 accountable to us as citizens of New York,
7 and the CCRB has been a vocal agency in
8 pushing for our budget, for this agency's
9 budget to be a standard percentage of the
10 budget of the NYPD. We're not the only city
11 in America who has pushed for this to have
12 our budget as a percentage of the NYPD's
13 budget. They do it in Chicago and other
14 cities around the country and we felt it's
15 important for us to do it here in New York.
16 The NYPD has a budget of six billion dollars
17 and if we took just 1% of six billion
18 dollars that would be 60 million dollars for
19 the agency to have as its budget. And even
20 though we're doing a good job, a very good
21 job on a fraction of that budget, we could
22 do even a better job with 60 million
23 dollars. So, we're making a big push with
24 the Charter Revision Commission to make that
25 change in the budget to have our budget, the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

7

1 agency's budget tied to the budget of the
2 NYPD. Another big push is to do something
3 that we call duty to cooperate and that
4 simply means that we're asking the charter
5 to require certain things of the NYPD in
6 relation to this agency. Now, we get a lot
7 done currently with the NYPD and with this
8 current commissioner, but there are many
9 more things that we could do to make this
10 relationship work even more efficiently and
11 more effectively, and one of those things,
12 for example, is that we don't always have
13 access to the types of records and
14 disciplinary histories of police officers
15 that we could use in order to adjudicate the
16 cases and complaints that come before us
17 much better in order that the board could
18 make more informed decisions about how we
19 recommend discipline as it relates to
20 police misconduct. So, we're pushing for
21 these changes with the Charter Revision
22 Commission and we hope you will do the same.
23 There are meetings around the city on the
24 charter revision. There was one held last
25 night here in the Bronx at Lehman College.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

8

1 There will be one tomorrow night at City
2 Hall. And then there is another next Tuesday
3 on Staten Island. If you can't make these
4 meetings, you can still register your
5 opinion on these issues that are important
6 to the CCRB such as having our budget tied
7 to the police budget and making sure that
8 the NYPD cooperates with the agency
9 optimally. And the way you can do that
10 without going to those meetings is to go
11 online and go to charter2019.nyc, again,
12 it's very easy, charter2019.nyc, and
13 register your support for these charter
14 revisions that will make this agency even
15 more effective in the job it does. And you
16 can also talk to our staff here,
17 particularly our Director of Outreach and
18 Intergovernmental Affairs. You're going to
19 hear from her later but I'm going to ask her
20 to stand now. That's Yojaira Alvarez. She
21 can also talk to you about how to register
22 your opinion in relation to these charter
23 revisions. Now, just one more thing before I
24 ask our executive director Jonathan Darche
25 to address this. As many of you know and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

9

1 have heard, the CCRB is prosecuting Officer
2 Pantaleo and that trial will begin Monday
3 morning. Prosecutors at the CCRB's
4 administrative prosecution unit are ready to
5 proceed with this trial and it will be a
6 fair trial. I want to thank the prosecutors.
7 I want to thank the members of the CCRB
8 staff. And I want to thank all of the board
9 members who have supported this effort as
10 we bring this case and all other cases
11 forward to be adjudicated and, in this case,
12 tried. There are some who have tried and
13 continue to try to delay this trial, but we
14 believe after five years it is time to
15 proceed, it is time for the Garner family,
16 for Miss Karr, Mr. Garner's mother, for the
17 rest of that family, and for the people of
18 the City of New York to have closure. He
19 CCRB staff and the legal team have pursued a
20 process that is rigorous and fair in the
21 prosecution of this case. The Garner family
22 and the people of the City of New York
23 deserve no less. I turn to you now and give
24 you now Mr. Darche, our executive director.
25 Jonathan.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

10

1 JONATHAN DARCHE: Thank you, Mr.
2 Chair. I'd also like to thank the president
3 of the Bronx River Houses tenants
4 association, Norma Saunders, and I met the
5 vice-president Eddie earlier, so thank you
6 to you for allowing us to use your space and
7 for coming down and joining us here today,
8 and also to Tomas Ramos, the Program
9 Director of Children's Arts & Science
10 Workshops here at the Bronx River Community
11 Center. Thank you. And thank you for
12 arranging to have some of the participants
13 in your programs and your mentees come
14 speak to us later. Last week I testified
15 before members of the City Council's Public
16 Safety Committee regarding the Right to Know
17 Act. The Right to Know Act took effect in
18 October of 2018. It requires in certain
19 situations members of the NYPD to issue a
20 business card and ask for consent to
21 search. We're here if you feel that someone
22 has not given you your rights under the
23 Right to Know Act and the way you can file a
24 complaint is here today. We have
25 investigators or you can call 311 or you

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

11

1 could call our hotline or you could go
2 online to contact us. And for more
3 information you can visit NYC.gov/RTKA.
4 We're going to be taking public comment. If
5 you have comments on specific instances of
6 police misconduct, whether you'd like to
7 report misconduct or follow up on a
8 complaint you've already filed, those should
9 be directed to the investigators who are
10 present with us. Matthew Chaves?

11 MATTHEW CHAVES: Chaves.

12 JONATHAN DARCHE: Chaves. Sorry. I
13 should know that. And Philip [PH]
14 Woroniecki. They're in the back. Could you
15 guys wave? Otherwise, if you sign up with
16 Jahi or one of the other outreach people
17 we'll make sure that you can come up and
18 speak during public comment. To ensure
19 fairness and give everyone who wants to the
20 opportunity to speak, please limit comments
21 to four minutes. Thank you very much, Mr.
22 Chair.

23 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you, Mr.
24 Darche. I'm going to just take care of a
25 little housekeeping thing and that is ask

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

12

1 for a motion to approve the minutes of the
2 last meeting. Is there a motion?

3 MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA: So motioned.

4 FREDERICK DAVIE: Is there a second?

5 LINDSAY EASON: Second.

6 FREDERICK DAVIE: Are there any
7 questions, comments, or revisions for the
8 minutes? I'm hearing none. Are we ready to
9 vote? All those in favor of approving the
10 motion, please say aye.

11 LINDSAY EASON: Aye.

12 MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA: Aye.

13 FREDERICK DAVIE: The opposed no. The
14 Aye's have it. The motion is passed.

15 Minutes are adopted. We'll move now to just
16 acknowledge some people we have here with
17 us, public officials, and then members of
18 the NYPD. I'm going to call out the names of
19 some of these officials and then I'm going
20 to ask the members of the NYPD if you would
21 introduce yourselves to us. So from New
22 York Assembly Member Marco Crespo's office
23 we have is it Anais de la Cruz?

24 ANAIS DE LA CRUZ: Anais.

25 FREDERICK DAVIE: I'm sorry. Say that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

13

1 again.

2 ANAIS DE LA CRUZ: Anais.

3 FREDERICK DAVIE: Anais de la Cruz.

4 ANAIS DE LA CRUZ: Yeah.

5 FREDERICK DAVIE: Welcome. And then
6 we have a number of people from the Bronx
7 DA's office and we're just going to ask you
8 if you would stand and acknowledge your
9 presence here.

10 JOHN SIEGAL: Hello, everybody.

11 FREDERICK DAVIE: Hi. Right. Thank
12 you. Thank you for being here. And I'm
13 going to ask if the officers from the NYPD
14 if you would come and introduce yourselves
15 at the mike so that we can hear you. Yeah,
16 yeah. Thanks.

17 JOHN POTKAY: Hi, good evening. I'm
18 Deputy Inspector John Potkay from PSA 7. I
19 cover housing in the 4-0 and the 4-2
20 Precincts. Thank you.

21 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Hi. I'm Deputy
22 Inspector Joyce Williams. I'm the
23 administrator at Patrol Borough Bronx.

24 JAMES MARKERT: Good evening. I'm
25 Sergeant James Markert from PSA 8. I'm the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

14

1 Neighborhood Coordination Sergeant. We
2 cover housing developments in the 4-3, the
3 4-5, and the 4-7 Precinct, including Bronx
4 River Houses right where we are now.

5 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. And we
6 may ask you to answer some questions that
7 come up during the course of the meeting.
8 Thanks. We've been joined by another one of
9 our board members and I'm going to ask him
10 if he would introduce himself.

11 JOSEPH PUMA: Sure. Good evening,
12 everyone. My name is Joseph Puma. I'm the
13 City Council designee from the Borough of
14 Manhattan. I'm also a NYCHA resident. And
15 today NYCHA had announced it was going to
16 shut off the electricity in my building
17 during some renovation work and they
18 extended that a little bit longer and lots
19 of my neighbors were a little bit worried
20 about that, so apologies for my tardiness
21 today.

22 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. And
23 we're glad you got here. Thanks. We'll move
24 to now to the next item on our agenda and
25 it's a presentation by our outreach team and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

15

1 Yojaira Alvarez.

2 YOJAIRA ALVAREZ: Hello, everyone.

3 Thank you so much for coming on such a
4 beautiful day. So, as you know my name
5 Yojaira Alvarez. I'm the Director of
6 Outreach and Intergovernmental Affairs here
7 at the CCRB. I just want to go over a little
8 bit about our jurisdiction for those of you
9 who are unfamiliar with the agency. So we're
10 a city agency independent from the NYPD and
11 we're responsible for mediating,
12 investigating, and administratively
13 prosecuting allegations of police
14 misconduct. As an agency we're neutral and
15 unbiased. Some of the board members have
16 introduced themselves. The full board is
17 composed of 13 members, five are appointed
18 by the mayor, five are designated by the
19 City Council, and three by the police
20 commissioner. Now, we don't investigate all
21 allegations of misconduct. There are four
22 buckets that fall under our jurisdiction. A
23 way of remembering that is the acronym FADO,
24 F-A-D-O. The F stands for Force If force is
25 used in an interaction with a police officer

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

16

1 we are enabled to investigate that. We would
2 determine if that in that interaction that
3 force was excessive or unnecessary. We also
4 investigate allegations of abuse of
5 authority. Now, this is a large category. It
6 includes improper stop, improper search,
7 improper entry. It also includes if a
8 police officer threatens to call ICE,
9 threatens to take you to the hospital,
10 threatens arrest. And as of February of last
11 year we are also empowered to investigate
12 allegations of sexual harassment. So that
13 includes inappropriate stops, it also
14 includes sexual innuendos, inappropriate
15 summons or arrests based off of that. We
16 also are empowered to investigate
17 allegations of discourtesy. So that could
18 include discourteous gesture and also
19 profanity. And the final category is
20 offensive language. So this is language that
21 inappropriately refers to my race,
22 ethnicity, sexual orientation, religion,
23 disability status. Now, I know that John
24 mentioned this before. There is more
25 information in the back. So the Right to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

17

1 Know Act went into effect in October. So
2 what this means is that in some situations,
3 in some encounters with police officers,
4 police officers have to give you a reason
5 for that interaction. In some situations
6 they also have to proactively give you a
7 business card. Now, regardless of if they
8 give you a business card or not, you always
9 have the right to request that card from
10 them. Also what is included in the Right to
11 Know Act is if a police officer is asking
12 for consent to search your person, your
13 property, your vehicle, your home, they have
14 to also inform you that you have the right
15 to say no to that search if they don't have
16 the legal justification for it. This is what
17 the business card looks like. On the back
18 it'll leave you with the phone number, 311,
19 which everyone knows about. If you want to
20 file a comment or a complaint, if it's a
21 complaint, it will go to us. Come in to
22 request more information. You can also file
23 a complaint directly at a precinct. You can
24 call 311, 1-800-341-CCRB, or file a
25 complaint online, www.nyc.gov/CCRB. Finally,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

18

1 I know a lot of you know Tim. This is my
2 email. Feel free to reach out to us. We want
3 to be as busy as possible. We want to go to
4 churches, afterschool programs, wherever
5 people are, family days, street fairs, in
6 order to spread the word. And you can
7 follow us on Twitter for upcoming events.
8 Thank you so much.

9 FREDERICK DAVIE: Are there any
10 questions just on Miss Alvarez's
11 presentation, anything for clarification?
12 All right. Thank you. We're going to have a
13 policy update and Harya.

14 HARYA TAREKEGN: Thank you, Fred.
15 Good evening, everybody. My name is Harya
16 Tarekegn. I am Senior Counsel for Policy
17 and Advocacy. And I just want to give you
18 all a snapshot of what the data we see looks
19 like in the Bronx. This comes from our
20 complaints. So one of the things that we do
21 on top of investigating, mediating, and
22 prosecuting complaints is that we look into
23 what the complaints look like across
24 boroughs, across age demographics, across
25 race demographics to really see if there

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

19

1 are area for police improvement, but also
2 areas that we should focus on and let the
3 community know what is going on in their
4 communities. So you'll see here that
5 complaints that are fully investigated by us
6 in the Bronx are very similar complaints
7 that we get across New York City. This is
8 divided by the FADO categories that we
9 talked about. So the percentages are pretty
10 even in terms of what we're seeing in the
11 Bronx compared to the rest of New York City.
12 In those fully investigated allegations we
13 can substantiate a complaint, exonerate,
14 unfound, unsubstantiated, or the officer is
15 unidentified. What those mean,
16 substantiation means that we know by
17 preponderance of the evidence, so we're
18 more sure than not that misconduct did
19 occur, and those are the complaints that we
20 refer to the police commissioner for some
21 sort of discipline. There are complaints
22 that are unsubstantiated. And so we don't
23 know one way or the other if misconduct did
24 occur. There are complaints that are
25 exonerated. So the police activity that did

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

20

1 occur was allowed to occur per police
2 guidelines. And then unfounded means that
3 the complaint actually didn't occur the way
4 that we were informed of it. And finally,
5 officer unidentified is a very small sliver
6 of cases where we are unable to identify
7 which police officer engaged in that
8 conduct. I will stop here and say that our
9 agency is actually very good at identifying
10 police officers, and you should know that
11 if you have an interaction with a police
12 officer that you want to report, you do not
13 need to know the name or shield of that
14 police officer. It's great now with the
15 Right to Know Act you can always ask that
16 officer for a business card, but if you are
17 in a position where you are reporting a
18 complaint and don't know who the officer is,
19 we are able to get documents from the
20 police department, we are able to figure out
21 who was on duty at that time, who was on
22 that corner, and figure out who the police
23 officer was. So that should not by any
24 means be a deterrence to you coming to us.
25 This is a comparison of the complaints that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

21

1 we receive in the Bronx compared to the
2 felony crime rate. One of the reasons that
3 we use this map is just to see if there are
4 areas in the city where there is high police
5 interaction where we are not getting a lot
6 of complaints. That lets us know where we
7 need to be out on the ground letting people
8 know that the CCRB exists, is a resource for
9 them, and gives us an idea of where we need
10 to make sure our resources are distributed.
11 Finally, we have taken this year to make
12 sure we do a strong push with interactions
13 with young people. And I'm very excited to
14 see young people here today and that you
15 will be able to hear from them, but one of
16 the reasons that we are doing that is it is
17 so critical for our young people to have
18 positive experiences. And you'll see that in
19 the Bronx we have a little bit higher than
20 the New York population number of
21 complaints coming in from our young people.
22 That's something that we are aware of,
23 looking into, and this past year in February
24 we actually held a youth summit where young
25 people were able to speak about interactions

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

22

1 themselves. We had panels of young people
2 moderated by young people and then we had
3 them work together with practitioners to
4 think about solutions they think really
5 need to come about to deal with police
6 interactions themselves. And we have a
7 youth advisory council now for the CCRB. It
8 is a 19-member council. And they come in and
9 talk to us about issues they're seeing,
10 solutions they have and ideas they have on
11 how to get our message out with the youth.
12 We want to make sure that young people know
13 they can file complaints with us
14 themselves. They don't need necessarily to
15 have a parent or a guardian. So it is a
16 resource that is available to young people
17 as well as to adults. Finally, here are
18 complaints that we are receiving in PSAs.
19 You will see the complaint breakdown by
20 borough but then also by particular PSAs. We
21 are in PSA 7, 8, sorry, where that is the
22 dark green color and it's about 9% of the
23 PSA complaints that we receive. Finally,
24 here are some additional resources. We have
25 a ton of data online. I will be here if you

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

23

1 want to talk about anything or flag any
2 issues that you see for us, things that you
3 think we should be focused on, particularly
4 in your community here. But also, there is a
5 link to our youth council. We'll be having
6 one every year so that's definitely a
7 resource to share and make sure young people
8 that you know who are interested in these
9 sorts of issues apply and get on our youth
10 council. You can also see the youth summit I
11 was talking about at the URL, which is
12 NYC.gov/CCRByouthsummit. And, again, my
13 name is Harya and I'll be around if you
14 have any questions. Thank you.

15 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. So any
16 questions for Harya just on her
17 presentation? All right. Thank you. So we're
18 going to go to community organizations and
19 public comment from community organizations.
20 And then after that we'll go to individual
21 public comment. So we have a list here and
22 first on the list that I have is Tomas
23 Ramos, who is the Director of the Bronx
24 River Community Center.

25 TOMAS RAMOS: Thank you all for

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

24

1 coming out today. It's a beautiful crowd. I
2 love you all. So there's a question that
3 I'm going to answer and it's in regards to
4 the NCO program. What are some positives
5 that I've seen from the NCO program and what
6 would you like to see change? So I want to
7 be very transparent and honest. Before I
8 started working here my whole perspective
9 in just about policing in general was
10 negative. And then when I started working
11 here about three years ago I find out about
12 this NCO program with the PSA8, in
13 particular, and all the officers that I've
14 encountered are amazing and they really care
15 about the community. So I want to
16 give props to PSA8. Captain Ramsey is not
17 here, I know he's not, but he has been doing
18 an amazing job. And one of the things that I
19 focus on is youth prevention. So how are we
20 going to prevent crimes from happening in
21 the future? And when it comes to young
22 people, in particular, we have to start
23 exposing our young people to the NCOs in
24 particular and showing them that they're
25 not bad people. They're here to protect us

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

25

1 and our community. So about two years ago I
2 actually launched the first advisory board
3 meeting with four housing complexes. So it
4 was Bronx River Houses, James Monroe Houses,
5 Sotomayor Houses, and Soundview Houses, and
6 we had all four tenant association
7 presidents there, we had all four program
8 directors, and we had PSA8 and the 43rd
9 Precinct, and we were talking and discussing
10 about all the issues that were going on in
11 our community and how we can work together
12 to resolve that moving forward. So I
13 just want to say the NCO program has been
14 really, really well and they've been doing
15 a lot of stuff with young people,
16 especially with the children when they came
17 in to read books, to come out and give gifts
18 and things like that, playing basketball,
19 family day, and things of those likes. So
20 the NCO program and the one thing that I do
21 want to say is that the particular people
22 that I don't know the process of how you
23 guys pick police officers from the NCOs, but
24 they're all phenomenal, and, yeah, no, they
25 really are. And CCRB, I know they did a

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

26

1 curriculum development with Soundview before
2 and I want to bring that here to Bronx
3 River. So I want to start teaching our young
4 people at a young age about CCRB and have
5 that actual structured programming and then
6 we can actually show some outcomes in the
7 long run. But that's all I wanted just to
8 talk about the NCO particulars. But I have
9 some young people that I want them to speak
10 more so than myself and you can get their
11 perspectives. So thank you guys very much.
12 All right.

13 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. So we're
14 going to ask the young people that you
15 brought that want to speak just go to the
16 mike and identify yourselves and please
17 present.

18 MARCOS LUGO: How are you doing,
19 guys? My name is [PH] Marcos Lugo. I would
20 love to ask two questions. What role do you
21 believe the CCRB can play in your community?
22 Have you seen any changes in the policing
23 community, positive or negative? How do you
24 consider a major constant about police
25 actions in your respective perspective? How

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

27

1 do you see from your perspective the
2 actions of the police? What do they do?

3 FREDERICK DAVIE: So, you're asking
4 us those questions? All right. Can you
5 repeat them for us, please?

6 MARCOS LUGO: What are some positive,
7 no, what are the roles you believe the CCRB
8 can play in your community what
9 are some positives you've seen from your NCO
10 program and what would you like to change?

11 FREDERICK DAVIE: So, I'm going to
12 give my colleagues a chance to answer those
13 questions or I'll jump in. Michael?

14 MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA: Thank you. So
15 I'll start with your first question. What
16 role do we see the CCRB playing within the
17 community? And actually, I think the
18 director Tomas highlighted one of the key
19 things that we can be doing here is actually
20 doing more outreach, and I'm glad that we
21 are doing the outreach out in Soundview, in
22 Bronx River. These are actually
23 neighborhoods that I worked in when I worked
24 for the City Council and it's definitely
25 something I saw that was needed in the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

28

1 community sort of that avenue to file a
2 complaint, that avenue to have some redress
3 is you had a negative experience, and I feel
4 that that itself helps build the
5 relationship within the community and helps
6 strengthen that relationship between our
7 youth and the police officers because there
8 should be a working relationship. It should
9 not be a negative relationship that we have.
10 And I commend you for being here today to
11 ask us these questions and your colleague
12 there as well. I commend you both for
13 standing up here before us. Let me add that,
14 first of all, I want to thank you for the
15 work that you're doing with the young
16 people in the Bronx. I think it's very
17 important, very needed, and our future
18 depends on it. Marcos, to your question, I
19 think that knowledge is power, you've heard
20 it before, and our role is really to
21 disseminate some information and try to also
22 be a bridge between communities and the
23 police department.

24 RAMON PEGUERO: We believe that the
25 solutions to the problems that are ailing

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

29

1 our communities are within the community to
2 resolve, vis-à-vis relationships, and Tomas
3 was talking about the NCO program, and we
4 are hoping to be that bridge and that's why
5 we have our community personnel going out
6 educating our communities on what they could
7 do both good and bad. If there is a
8 complaint that needs to be lodged, so be it.

9 Do it. We'll follow it to the full extent of
10 our capacity. But we also want to hear
11 what's working and what could be duplicated
12 in other communities so that we could learn
13 from those lessons.

14 JONATHAN DARCHE: I just with regard
15 to the question about what could we do to
16 improve the CCRB, I think the chair was
17 talking earlier about the charter revision
18 process, and I urge all of you to engage in
19 that because that is the way that we can
20 increase the power and independence of the
21 CCRB so that we could do more for all of
22 you. And I think one of the most important
23 elements that's being considered by the
24 charter revision process would be to set
25 the CCRB's budget as a percentage of the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

30

1 police department's or some other process by
2 which we could have independent budgeting to
3 go with the rest of our independence from
4 the NYPD.

5 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Any
6 other comments from the board members on
7 this question? All right. Thank you. And
8 we'll go to our second speaker.

9 AGIL MITCHELL: Okay. Hello,
10 everyone. My name is [PH] Agil, Agil
11 Mitchell. I come from Comp Sci High. That's
12 my school. I come here today to talk about
13 at least two topics. The first one I want to
14 talk about that just sprung up on me today
15 as I walked in was what can the CCRB do to
16 foster public trust? And I have two ideas
17 about this and they will be answered in the
18 next two questions. So the question of the
19 NYPD plans to roll out body-worn cameras to
20 5,000 patrol officers by the end of 2018.
21 What issues or challenges, if any, do you
22 anticipate arising from your community with
23 regards to body-worn cameras? Well, to this
24 I think that it would create a lot of
25 distrust within the public and the police

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

31

1 officers. Does anyone in here have siblings,
2 like preferably younger siblings? Yeah. So
3 you know that time when if ever they try to
4 record you do something bad so then they
5 could go tell your mom or dad? That's
6 basically what people view the police doing
7 to the citizens. So you know how you felt
8 when your brother or sister did that to you.
9 It was horrible. And I think that another
10 thing that we can also do to solve this
11 would be to make sure that the police use
12 this appropriately, so don't use it in a
13 level like one offenses and encounters, not
14 to make people feel that they're always
15 being recorded no matter what, and that's
16 how I feel about that question. The next
17 question: with your experience on the ground
18 and in the community, what police community
19 relations issue would you suggest we
20 examine in the future? To this I
21 think that we should try to keep our youth
22 and young people off the streets at a
23 really late hour. There's a lot of ways
24 that we can solve this. And I like to take a
25 lot of inspiration from other countries,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

32

1 ethnicities, and cultures. For example, I
2 know that certain parts of Japan and certain
3 parts of Great Britain have established a
4 curfew system. Some parts of the world have
5 done a lot of other great things to keep the
6 youth off the streets so that they aren't
7 doing any negative behaviors that may
8 inhibit the relations between the police and
9 the civilians. Thank you.

10 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you.
11 [INDISCERNIBLE]. All right. So just to
12 thank you. And my colleague and I here were
13 debating who was going to address the
14 body-worn camera issue. So I'm going to take
15 a dive and then he can follow and then we
16 can have a fuller discussion. So I never
17 wanted my brothers and sisters recording me
18 either, particularly if they could use it
19 and go back and get me in trouble, but this
20 is a little different. So a couple of
21 things. One is all the police officers now
22 who are on patrol have body-worn cameras,
23 and there are clear guidelines as to how
24 they should be used, but they're expected to
25 be used. I think the other thing we can say

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

33

1 about it is that early indications, at
2 least as it relates to CCRB, the use of
3 body-worn cameras are very effective in our
4 being able to both investigate complaints
5 and then reach some conclusions about those
6 complaints. Video footage generally is more
7 helpful in that, but body-worn cameras
8 particularly are really important. You do
9 make a good point and that is that how they
10 are used is extremely important. And so it
11 is crucial for this agency as well as for
12 the NYPD to ensure that the best practices,
13 the most effective practices are in place
14 with NYPD officers in the use of those
15 cameras. We do that in an oversight role and
16 the NYPD does that in a training role. So
17 there's always a tendency, let me put it in
18 another way, there's always an opportunity
19 to misuse any instrument that we have to
20 help us do what we do better. But in this
21 case, body-worn cameras are proving to be a
22 very effective tool in policing and in
23 oversight, and we hope that irrespective of
24 what our siblings might do to us with
25 recording devices, that we'll find body-worn

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

34

1 cameras to be pretty helpful in our work.

2 Thanks. Anybody else? John?

3 JONATHAN DARCHE: The only thing I
4 wanted to add about body-worn cameras is
5 one of the things that makes them so
6 effective is the audio that goes with them
7 and that context lets us reach dispositions
8 on the merits far more often, especially in
9 cases where we would really be relying only
10 on the word of a civilian against the word
11 of an officer. Having the video and the
12 audio really makes a difference. And with
13 regard to your concern about privacy, the
14 department has tried to develop protocols
15 that balance the need for people's right to
16 privacy and need for privacy with the need
17 to make sure that officers are accountable
18 for their behavior. And those procedures are
19 new. And so they're still looking at them
20 and examining them along with the federal
21 monitor and with the community groups to
22 make sure that that balance is preserved.
23 But one of the reasons we're so happy to
24 hear from you is to get your perspective.
25 And thank you for coming down.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

35

1 FREDERICK DAVIE: Are there other
2 comments? Sure. Mr. Siegal.

3 JOHN SIEGAL: So just, first of all,
4 for the record, my sister never told on me,
5 and I'm really very grateful for that and
6 I'd like a printout of the transcript that I
7 can send her. I've been on the board two or
8 three years. The amount of video that we're
9 seeing in our cases has grown tremendously.
10 It's not just the body-worn camera footage,
11 although there's a lot of it now, but
12 people witnessing things and videoing them
13 with their phones, and also the
14 investigative staff of the CCRB goes out and
15 looks for video around certain events, and
16 building complexes, lobby videos, stores. We
17 had one case they got video from a financial
18 institution that was there. There's just a
19 lot more video. That said it doesn't always
20 make what happened clearer. It's just more
21 information. But the one thing I wanted to
22 just point out, it may be obvious, but we're
23 seeing is just because there's video that
24 doesn't determine what the outcome of the
25 case is. We have had cases similar things

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

36

1 you've seen on the news where video shows
2 that an officer committed misconduct. We've
3 also had a lot of cases where a civilian
4 makes a complaint against an officer and
5 when you look at the video it didn't happen
6 that way. And it serves to protect police
7 officers from false charges, too. So it's
8 really valuable I think to everybody in the
9 process and just leads to more evidence and
10 ultimately more fairness for everyone.

11 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Other
12 comments? All right. Just a comment on the
13 engagement of youth. So curfews are one way
14 to do it. We'd like to opt for a few more.
15 And one of those has to do with our youth
16 council. And we'd love to engage you in the
17 youth council as perhaps an alternative to
18 curfews. So I see both Yojaira and Harya
19 reaching for business cards and they're
20 going to share them with you and they'll be
21 in touch with you. We'll get your contact
22 information, you have theirs, and it would
23 be our pleasure to have your contributions
24 to this youth council. So thank you. Thank
25 you for your courage to come to speak tonight

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

37

1 JOHN SIEGAL: Thank you, everyone.
2 And on one more side note, I think that it
3 would be a great benefit to everyone if
4 everyone would go out and read the book The
5 Hate U Give or watch the movie. I think it
6 would be really good to read or watch
7 because of what this organization is doing.
8 I think it would help a lot.

9 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you very
10 much. Thanks. So next on our list is Freddy
11 Charles who is the outreach worker at
12 Release the Grip.

13 PATTERSON: I'm not Freddy Charles,
14 by the way. He wasn't able to make it
15 today. But I'm a violence interrupter for
16 Release the Grip. And also, yes, my name is
17 [PH] Jacques Patterson and this is--

18 TREYVON: My name is Treyvon [PH]
19 Vizcarrondo.

20 PATTERSON: So, we're here as a team
21 on behalf of Freddy Charles. So as far as a
22 role that the CCRB could play in my
23 community, it's basically letting the youth
24 know or having them be aware that they can
25 make complain, as you said, and that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

38

1 they could also know their rights. So it
2 would be great that maybe as an idea as they
3 partner up with organizations that they were
4 high-risk individuals, yeah, such as also
5 where you all could because since we do
6 community events and etc. you all could
7 come out and maybe table and give out public
8 education for the youth to have just in
9 case. And also, a major issue with police in
10 my community is more of abusing authority
11 and harassing. And the reason for that is
12 because there's a lot of youth, since we
13 deal with high-risk individuals, there are
14 youth that have been incarcerated before.
15 So, as they come out and they could be our
16 participants, they could constantly be
17 harassed by always being asked question such
18 as, "Where are you going to today?" or, "Are
19 you carrying a weapon on you today?"

20 TREYVON: Or even little things such
21 as--

22 FREDERICK DAVIE: Can you just use
23 the mike?

24 TREYVON: Even those things such as a
25 white shirt being on-call and you're just

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

39

1 riding by, you see a group of kids, and
2 he's screaming out one individual name. That
3 doesn't look good on that individual. That
4 could change a whole atmosphere of things
5 and have him put in a different situation
6 where he has no choice but to survive and
7 do what he has to do, and it's just not
8 right.

9 PATTERSON: Also, a lot of youth feel
10 uncomfortable speaking to cops because they
11 feel they get scared and they feel like
12 they're pressured when they're not, and if
13 they knew certain rights that they have,
14 they would be more comfortable speaking or
15 not speaking to an officer. Also, as an
16 organization, when we deal with them, we try
17 to change their lives such as by offering
18 job readiness services and, God forbid they
19 do get arrested, we have legal aid services
20 so where we could get them an affordable
21 lawyer, a free lawyer so where it won't be
22 no hassle for them to come home. Also, we
23 help with therapeutic. So, say, an
24 individual wants to come and speak about
25 their home issues etc., we also have

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

40

1 therapeutic services where we could help the
2 individual out. And we deal with a lot of
3 referrals. So we can help out with a lot of
4 partnerships where we can help high-risk
5 youth either help get them a home to stay
6 or help with employment. So that's what we
7 do as the Bronx Connect Release the Grip
8 and that is our major concern about policing
9 in our community. So thank you for having
10 us.

11 FREDERICK DAVIE: That's great. So
12 that's great work and an excellent program.

13 PATTERSON: Thank you.

14 FREDERICK DAVIE: So, thank you. Let
15 me see if the board members have any
16 comments or questions for you.

17 PATTERSON: Any comments or questions?

18 FREDERICK DAVIE: From the board
19 members.

20 PATTERSON: From the board members.

21 FREDERICK DAVIE: All right. Well,
22 thank you. Thank you for your comments and
23 for your contributions and for the good
24 work that you do in the community.

25 PATTERSON: Thank you.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

41

1 FREDERICK DAVIE: Keep it up. Thanks.

2 Next on the list is Althea Stevens who's
3 the Deputy Director of Community Based
4 Programs.

5 ALTHEA STEVENS: Good evening,
6 everyone.

7 FREDERICK DAVIE: Good evening.

8 ALTHEA STEVENS: Like they mentioned,
9 my name is Althea Stevens. I've worked in
10 youth development and advocacy for the past
11 15 years. In my current role at East Side
12 House I'm Department Director of Community
13 Based Programs and Community Affairs So a
14 major part of my work is building positive
15 relationships with the community members and
16 community partners in the Mott Haven section
17 of the Bronx. I've developed a great
18 positive working relationship with our
19 neighborhood coordination officers and
20 community affairs officers from PSA 7 and
21 the 40th Precinct. We've partnered on a
22 number of community events. They're often in
23 my programs working with staff, families,
24 and our teens. However, that camaraderie is
25 not seen throughout the department with

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

42

1 everyone. This was very evident last fall,
2 and this was when one of my program
3 directors was tased and arrested because he
4 was trying to deescalate a situation between
5 community members and police officers. My
6 director filed a complaint with the CCRB.
7 Until this day he still has not received the
8 response or any information about his
9 investigation. We are in a community who
10 historically does not trust cops and
11 authority agencies, therefore when CCRB
12 fails to follow through with complaints it
13 only adds to that distrust. I would like to
14 offer a few recommendations to CCRB. CCRB
15 needs to ensure consistent communication
16 with all individuals when they file a
17 complaint by letting them know every step of
18 the way where they're at with the
19 investigation. I believe CCRB needs to get
20 community members more involved by hiring
21 community leaders, young people in impacted
22 communities. Lastly, I feel like CCRB needs
23 to do a better job at outreach in vulnerable
24 communities and meet them at their
25 territory, right? I hear a lot of, "Oh, let

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

43

1 us know when we're having events." That
2 needs to be the other way around. They need
3 to do a better job at coming into our
4 communities, meeting our young people where
5 they're at, whether that's on the
6 basketball court, whether that's at the
7 McDonald's , whether that's at community
8 centers, wherever they are at, that's where
9 you should be letting them know about these
10 services. I hope that CCRB strongly takes my
11 recommendations into consideration. I have
12 two you young people who are here who have
13 some experiences that they would like to
14 share with you guys at this time.

15 FREDERICK DAVIE: Please.

16 TARIQ: Good evening, everybody. My
17 name is Tariq. I'm from the East Side
18 Housing Teen Program. And I would like to
19 discuss an opinion on the CCRB and some
20 things I feel need to be fixed or addressed.
21 I feel like the CCRB should not be such a
22 secretive group of people, more of like a
23 community effort between us and you because
24 until recently I have never heard of you
25 guys, honestly, and I just have found out of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

44

1 you guys since recently. And I just want to
2 say that I feel like if it was more of a
3 community effort we could help hold more
4 unlawful cops accountable for their actions.
5 And we need to build that trust between us
6 and the police. And I feel like us as a
7 community, we should be one, not separate
8 individuals. We need to come together as
9 one to do what we need to do to fix problems
10 and solve stuff that needs to be solved.
11 And also, I feel that many of my friends or
12 many of the people in my neighborhood they
13 would agree with me. And I've actually
14 talked to them about it. And we believe that
15 if it was more of like a community effort it
16 would be handled much safer and better.
17 Thank you.

18 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you.

19 IBRAHIM: Good afternoon. My name is
20 Ibrahim and I am a participant in the East
21 Side House teen program located in the
22 South Bronx and today I'm here to talk about
23 a personal story I had and offer a
24 recommendation. I personally had experienced
25 this event when I was coming out of my job

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

45

1 and me and my father with friends who were
2 black and Latinos were just standing
3 outside minding our business talking to each
4 other. And so we were stopped and searched
5 by four plainclothes officers who pulled up
6 on us in their vehicles. We were searched
7 and one of my friends was slammed onto the
8 vehicle because he said he didn't like how
9 rough that they were touching his private
10 area. And I feel this needs to change
11 because the officer can't pick and choose
12 who they want to search and not to search
13 because I bet if it was a group of white
14 kids standing outside they would've just
15 drove past. And not even looked their way, but
16 just for some reason when they saw us black
17 and Latino kids they decided to stop their
18 cars and frisk us. And I wanted to also say
19 that I have never heard of CCRB. And so my
20 teen program director at East Side House
21 took our program to the CCRB youth forum in
22 February and it is important that the CCRB
23 does outreach to young people like me so
24 when situations like this happen to know
25 where to turn. Thank you

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

46

1 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you.

2 JAFAR: Good afternoon. My name is
3 [PH] Jafar. And just to piggyback off of
4 what my two friends said and to answer the
5 first question, how can CCRB affect our
6 community, it could affect our community
7 because it would be able to give the youth
8 knowledge on their rights because not a lot
9 of youth know about their rights and usually
10 when cops stop them they get nervous and
11 they don't know what to do. So if they have
12 knowledge on what their rights are then
13 they will be able to communicate with the
14 police and be able to are then they will be
15 able to communicate with the police and be
16 able to like, yeah--

17 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you.

18 JAFAR: Thank you.

19 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Let me
20 just make a few comments and I'm going to
21 ask Mr. Darche to respond and then I'm
22 going to see if any of the board members
23 would like to respond. So as to the issues
24 you raised, I'm going to ask Mr. Darche to
25 respond to those, but I do want to just

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

1 comment on and affirm the need for the CCRB
2 to be more engaged with public outreach.
3 We've done a lot and the staff works really
4 hard to get out. There was a time when we
5 didn't do as many community meetings as we
6 do, but every other month we hold a meeting
7 like this in one of the boroughs, generally
8 at a community center or another public
9 space so that people can get to know us
10 better and know who we are, but we've got a
11 long way to go in that. And we've been
12 hounding both the Mayor's Office and the
13 City Council for more money so that we can
14 do more outreach, and hopefully we'll make
15 some progress on the budget to be able to do
16 that. So you're absolutely right. We do need
17 to do more. I have relatives who when I tell
18 them what I do look at me and with cross
19 eyes. So we've got to straighten that out.
20 More people need to know about the agency,
21 and I think more people do than they did
22 five years ago, but five years from now we
23 want the CCRB to be a household name in New
24 York City, a place where people can go to
25 have their issues as it relates to the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

48

1 police officers within our jurisdiction
2 redressed and dealt with. So a very
3 important point. Also, I just want to say
4 that it's really encouraging to see so many
5 young people come out and speak and be a
6 part of this night and to show that you're
7 very much a part of your community because I
8 got a lot of gray hair, what I have left,
9 and we need to make sure that there are some
10 folks in the pipeline who are going to be
11 able to continue this work. And when I see
12 young people out here like you all, it gives
13 me hope for the future, but it also gives
14 me hope as to what can happen in our
15 neighborhoods, particularly when it comes to
16 police community relations, which is really
17 important. So let me stop and just say thank
18 you again and then turn to Mr. Darche and
19 have him answer or address some of the
20 issues that were raised by Miss Stevens.

21 JONATHAN DARCHE: Miss Stevens, I
22 wanted to apologize to you and the director
23 of your agency that no one got back to him.
24 And if you would be willing to speak to
25 Investigator Chaves and Warren [PH] Eckie,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

49

1 and just give him your director's
2 information so we can follow up and make
3 sure that they're getting the information.
4 Normally what happens is we give people a
5 case number and then you can just check the
6 status online, but it's unconscionable that
7 no one has got in touch with the director,
8 and that's my fault and I own that and we're
9 going to fix that. With regard to getting
10 community members more involved recently the
11 agency has hired a recruiter to make sure
12 that we're getting staff members who
13 reflect the diversity of this city and,
14 frankly, reflect the diversity of the board
15 members that you see before you. So it is a
16 priority for the agency and we take it very
17 seriously. Tariq, you mentioned that you
18 thought the agency should be less secretive.
19 Not so secretive is I think how you said it.
20 One of the issues that the agency has with
21 sharing information about what we do is
22 Civil Rights Law 50-a and that is a state
23 law that really hinders the agency in
24 sharing information about what we do. And
25 right now in Albany there is consideration

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

50

1 going on to changing that law, but the
2 legislative session is going to end soon.
3 And really, without hearing from you, the
4 people who live in the city, there becomes
5 less impetus for your representatives in
6 Albany to change it. So I'm going to
7 encourage you all to reach out to your
8 elected officials and let them know how
9 important it is to change 50-a before the
10 end of the legislative session. Ibrahim, I
11 just wanted to say two things to you. First,
12 I really would urge you to talk to
13 Investigator Chaves and Woroniecki and
14 file a complaint because if we know about
15 misconduct or allegations of misconduct
16 then we can investigate them. And the other
17 thing is I was curious what your experience
18 was at the youth summit.

19 ALTHEA STEVENS: So you went to the
20 youth summit.

21 MALE 1: Oh, yeah.

22 JONATHAN DARCHE: Oh, sorry, sorry.

23 MALE 1: It was a lot of
24 people there. They were talking about
25 issues they had to address with police

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

51

1 officers and they were just trying to be
2 heard. And they were talking about different
3 alternatives to fix their problems and get
4 them to feel comfortable where they're at
5 and comfortable with police officers around
6 the city.

7 ALTHEA STEVENS: How did you feel
8 about it? What was your experience? MALE 1:
9 I'm sorry. It was a good experience. I
10 liked it. It was good for, yeah, it was good
11 for everybody, the youth, adults, everybody,
12 we enjoyed ourselves, and we loved talking to
13 each other about different situations and
14 all our experiences and ways to just stop
15 all the violence.

16 FREDERICK DAVIE: Right. Thank you.
17 Any other comments or questions? Sure,
18 Yojaira.

19 YOJAIRA ALVAREZ: First and foremost,
20 thank you so much for coming out. I just
21 wanted to add that I completely agree with
22 what you were saying and the suggestion
23 about being in more unconventional spaces.
24 So it's one thing if somebody is coming into
25 a community center or a program and they're

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

52

1 already connected and have those resources,
2 but I love the idea of going to basketball
3 courts, basketball tournaments, coming to
4 the community. We've been working with
5 Jahai. He's building out a plan for doing
6 basketball tournaments over the summer. And
7 we would love to go to East Side Houses, see
8 how we could collaborate and possibly have
9 you guys as kind of like ambassadors in
10 continuous conversation. Thank you

11 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. I see
12 we've been joined by another one of our
13 board members and I'd like to give her a
14 chance to introduce herself.

15 MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS: Good afternoon.
16 Good afternoon. That's better. Hi, you all.
17 I'm so sorry. My Organization is Bailing Out
18 Black Mama For Mother's Day. And so I've been
19 fighting with the Sheriff in Colorado all
20 afternoon. I was late, but super grateful to be
21 here. My name is Marbre Stahly-Butts. I'm the
22 City Council appointee from Brooklyn.

23 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. And
24 welcome. We'll now go to, unless there are
25 more comments from our board members, we'll

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

53

1 go to public comment. I have a--

2 CARMEN PINEIRO: [INDISCERNIBLE].

3 FREDERICK DAVIE: Okay, sure. Please,
4 come on up.

5 CARMEN PINEIRO: Good evening,
6 everyone. So my name is Carmen Pineiro. I'm
7 the Director of Organizing & Community
8 Engagement for The Bronx Defenders. And I
9 just want to be very clear I am not an
10 attorney, right? I am a community organizer
11 and I say that because it's very important
12 that we recognize The Bronx Defenders as a
13 holistic defense organization. We serve well
14 over 35,000 clients per year that we didn't
15 choose them that we didn't choose them. Well,
16 basically, they came in through the court
17 system. It isn't that they said they want to
18 work with us. But we also work on community
19 engagement where we additionally work with
20 anyone from five to ten thousand Bronx
21 residents every year to do popular education
22 and to basically work with the community for
23 them to know their rights. So I give a
24 little bit of that context because I want
25 to be very clear and it's very important

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

54

1 for folks to understand the communities that
2 they are serving. One of the comments that
3 Miss Althea Stevens mentioned is going to
4 the community, not so much that you're
5 waiting for it, but that you are actually in
6 these spaces. Right now as you walk through
7 this New York Housing Authority public
8 development complex you are able to see how
9 it thrives and how the people in the
10 community are out there. There is an actual
11 fear, right, that comes from the community
12 to have conversations with police officers.
13 We see that directly when a police officer
14 can just say, "Hey, how are you doing? Let
15 me talk to you." And at that exact instant,
16 they start bolting. People will run away.
17 And they run away because they don't know
18 what is going to come of that interaction,
19 right? We also have something called the
20 Notice of Claim's clinic and we see people
21 come through our doors once a month and we
22 fill them up and people are making
23 complaints, right, because there's a lot
24 folks that don't know that in order to sue
25 any city agency you literally have to ask

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

55

1 for permission, right? You're asking the
2 city for permission to sue them, right?
3 There's something very questionable about
4 that. And right now as we're speaking this
5 is the CCRB and you are an independent and
6 neutral body. However, the commissioner has
7 the authority to exonerate the folks that
8 you're deciding on, right? So let's have a
9 conversation about that because if the CCRB
10 is really in the business of reviewing
11 allegations and making creative and
12 innovative changes we have to begin to
13 think outside the box. You are all sitting
14 in a seat where you have to really ask
15 yourselves how are you communicating with
16 the communities that you are currently
17 serving. And you are absolutely right. That
18 funding is imperative and sometimes we don't
19 have that conversation about funding. The
20 movement has to be funded, right? And for
21 you to be independent, you also have to be
22 funded, maybe independently, maybe asking
23 for another line on the budget to be able
24 to do that work, right? It's phenomenal that
25 you are here right now and that you are

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

56

1 having these conversations, but each and
2 every person here, recognize why is it that
3 people organize in the first place. You only
4 organize because you feel you don't have a
5 voice, right? The voiceless have to stand
6 up. And it's when they finally come together
7 to discuss those issues that change can
8 actually happen, right? I'm very
9 disappointed, right, because there's no
10 other way to put that when we're looking at
11 a system and a structure that has put in
12 place that is governmental, that seeks to do
13 good in the community, but instead of doing
14 good has actually been more detrimental.
15 What happens in many of these spaces is that
16 we have the usual suspects, the usual
17 person that comes out and is already
18 civically engaged. What you need to do is
19 reach out to those who are not civically
20 engaged, to reach out to those who you feel,
21 right, are not doing what you consider to be
22 the right thing. Our communities are being
23 over-policed on culture. Our communities
24 are being over-policed for being people of
25 color. The same issues we have in this

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

57

1 community are not happening in other
2 communities. And we have to be honest about
3 that and we have to talk about the elephant
4 in the room. So if I stand before you it's
5 to recognize myself as an organizer in a
6 legal space that I challenge every single
7 day for people to think outside of the box
8 on figuring out how we continuously work
9 together. But even more importantly, for
10 those of you who are sitting in spaces of
11 power and decision-making, to share that
12 power because we already know that absolute
13 powers corrupt. Thank you.

14 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you very
15 much. And we agree with you on the need for
16 the independent budget and are working hard
17 on that. And, as I said in my opening
18 comments, it's before the Charter Revision
19 Commission to allow the CCRB to have an
20 independent budget that's tied to a
21 percentage of the NYPD's budget. And I would
22 encourage you again to talk to your City
23 Council person to make sure that provision
24 of the commission of the charter revision
25 stays in or to go online again at

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

58

1 charterNYC.nyc and register support for
2 that. But thank you for your comments. Much
3 appreciated. So we'll go to public comment
4 now. I'm sorry. Sure.

5 MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS, ESQ.: I would also
6 just say that the decision to have the authority
7 of discipline with the commissioner is also
8 before the City Council. And so I encourage
9 you to also talk to your City Council about
10 giving us the power to actually enact
11 discipline and not having to be with the
12 commissioner.

13 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Thank
14 you. Other comments, questions? All right.
15 So we'll go to public comment. And the
16 first person I have on this. So what we'll
17 do is we'll go through the list I have and
18 then at the end of this list if there are
19 still people who would like to comment we'll
20 give you a couple minutes to do that. We
21 want to remind you again that your comment
22 time is two minutes. There's a little timer
23 right here and there's a spray that comes
24 out of it that puts you to sleep if you
25 don't adhere to the time limit. So we're

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

59

1 going to get started with Mr. Jose Torres.

2 JOSE TORRES: So, hi. Yeah. My name
3 is Jose Torres and I work with the Center
4 for Court Innovation. I'm actually part of
5 the Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood
6 Safety, which is working in 50,000
7 developments throughout the City of New York
8 to develop social efficacy and focus on
9 triaging the concerns of the residencies
10 and helping them leverage the capacity of
11 the internal infrastructure, whether it be
12 local organizations, as well as city
13 agencies to kind of triage these issues. And
14 I want to kind of touch on a nerve that I
15 think has been hit here with regards to how
16 the CCRB can play a more effective or a
17 more impactful role in these communities,
18 right? And it's clearly stating that
19 publicity is one of those, right, like
20 presence, right? Intentional presence as
21 well, right? Not reactive presence, but
22 actually preemptive, right? We know that
23 nowadays social media is a very useful tool
24 for engaging with communities and exchanging
25 information. And how can that be played into

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

60

1 your own engagement strategies? Because I
2 do think that one of the things that we
3 highlight is that the police officers are a
4 very forward-facing organization. They're
5 present in these communities every day. And
6 so the tools that we have to use to kind of
7 engage with them, and I don't want to make
8 it seem like there's a dichotomous
9 relationship between the NYPD and these
10 communities, yes, there is tensions in these
11 communities, right, but it's only
12 exacerbated because we don't have proper
13 vehicles to be able to address these
14 things. And so the vehicle for the community
15 to be able to have this conversation is the
16 CCRB. So I do encourage as it's been said
17 here I think a campaign on civic education
18 that is not just tailored to the
19 neighborhoods in these communities but also
20 in the educational system because I do think
21 that we need to get to our young people
22 early and often and explain to them their
23 rights. They do have rights as people and
24 they should be able to have the civic
25 education be part of that dialogue and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

61

1 conversation. And so I think that that's
2 what I would want to just offer as a piece
3 of advice is how do you guys discuss
4 engagement because one of the things that we
5 do in our initiative is that we have a
6 public engagement strategy, but it is very
7 out of the box. We are present in
8 communities where communities are present,
9 right? I have a saying that communities
10 happen after 6:00. I'm happy to see that
11 this is happening after 6:00. But usually,
12 we have a very ancient and antiquated system
13 where it's like 9:00 to 5:00 is when we
14 address these problems and then we go home
15 to do our community. And so we should also
16 be mindful that there are people in these
17 neighborhoods who are coming home after
18 6:00 and should be engaging with us and you
19 should be more present in these
20 neighborhoods. And so I think that that
21 would be the one thing I would offer.

22 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Next I
23 have on the list Carmen Pineiro.

24 CARMEN PINEIRO: That was me.

25 FREDERICK DAVIE: That was you. All

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

62

1 right, all right. Here we go. Is it
2 Menepelle Nuhann?

3 MENEPELLE NUHANN: Yeah, Nuhann.

4 FREDERICK DAVIE: Nuhann.

5 MENEPELLE NUHANN: I just want to
6 say, hi, everyone. Well, this is my first
7 time to be here, but I'm very concerned.
8 That's why I came. All right, speaking to
9 you, my name is Menepelle Nuhann. I am the
10 Chairman for the African Immigrants'
11 Commission of New York and Connecticut, the
12 Vice Chairman, I'm so sorry, not the
13 Chairman, the Vice Chairman. Now, I came
14 here because I'm very concerned being of
15 African descent from Liberia in West
16 Africa. I live in the community. Besides
17 serving for the African Immigrants'
18 Commission, I'm also the Vice-Chairman and I
19 advocate for my community. Now, we are very
20 concerned. My people, sometimes they tell me
21 they have no way to get to authority,
22 especially our people that are serving our
23 community trying to keep us safe. There's
24 no way for them to voice out and they are
25 very concerned that they want to have time

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

63

1 to come to leaders, especially police, in
2 order to address that they're concerned, but
3 because of too much fear that somebody
4 doesn't have documents and all those things
5 go wrong, they are very afraid to come and
6 express themselves. And sometimes a lot of
7 things go on with the community. Sometimes
8 they can't voice out. So that's one of our
9 concerns. Being the Vice Chairman for the
10 African Immigrants' Commission, it is a
11 serious concern for me. How can I reach to
12 authority like you to be able to address our
13 people in the community their concerns so
14 that I can be able to carry the message to
15 them to give it to them? That's one. Two,
16 we are also concerned about some months ago
17 some arrests of a cab driver in New York
18 City. And up to today's date there have been
19 no arrests. I was one of those that went to
20 the family. I sat with them. We tried to
21 really help them. And we saw how his wife
22 was so concerned and I mean her mind was so
23 destroyed. So we came around her as
24 Africans to help her to go through that
25 transition. But the question from us to you,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

64

1 what is an arrest? That is one of our
2 concerns. If there was an arrest, we have
3 nothing updated from you people. So, it
4 concerns us because the other thing is
5 fair. He was just a young man that went to
6 look for his daily bread for his family and
7 that occurred. He died. And we can't even
8 see any concern coming from you people to us
9 to kind of communicate with the family. So
10 that's one of the things that really
11 stressed them out, and they want to come
12 out and speak, but there is no one to kind
13 of open the avenue for them to come to sit
14 on the roundtable for them to speak. So it
15 has been a serious concern for the family.
16 So that's one of the questions we are faced
17 with serving our African Immigrants'
18 Commission. The last thing is on our safety
19 within our community. We see officers come
20 in our community sometimes just the fact
21 that you're driving and maybe the fear that
22 you're from somewhere else. I mean I'm not
23 speaking for me. I'm a citizen. I don't
24 care. But the problem is I literally see
25 officers stopping our people for no reason

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

65

1 sometimes. And I ask them to step out and
2 they will be like, "Okay, what have I done
3 wrong?" Do you know what I mean? And just
4 because they're trying to have a
5 conversation with them, I think they have
6 the right as humans to ask questions, "What
7 have I done wrong?" So I don't think what
8 have I done wrong is the crime that that
9 individual commits in order to be kind of
10 hostage with that individual. And you go
11 back and forth because I believe as the
12 safety officer or police; you are there in
13 order to protect life and property. So
14 therefore, if you have any civilian that
15 you're trying to bring out of the car having
16 a conversation, I think you should approach
17 them with respect and professionalism, but I
18 don't see that. What I see is I see
19 aggressiveness. I see having a tough
20 conversation that I am the authority and I
21 can do what I want to do. I don't think
22 that's how it should be. That's not how it
23 should be. But I think how it should be is
24 we approach our civilian with respect
25 because we are working for them. They work

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

66

1 and they pay tax. So therefore, they have
2 the right when you're approaching them to
3 speak to them right, not being very
4 aggressive. Thank you.

5 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. So just
6 two points. And, again, I'll see if my
7 colleagues want to address this. One is in
8 terms of engaging your community I think
9 Miss Alvarez would be more than happy to
10 come or some of her staff come and talk to
11 your community and in your space here in New
12 York City and offer ways that you can better
13 engage the CCRB around these issues. The
14 second thing I would say is that discourtesy
15 is one of the four areas over which this
16 agency has jurisdiction. So if people in
17 your community, family, friends, are
18 experiencing what they consider to be
19 inappropriate behavior by members of the
20 NYPD, then you should report it. You don't
21 have to leave home to report it. You can
22 call 311. You can call the CCRB's office.
23 You can go online and do it. But report it.
24 Because if you don't report it, we can't
25 investigate it, and if we don't investigate

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

67

1 it, then things don't necessarily change. So
2 thank you for your comments and we will do
3 what we can. Let me just see if there are
4 any other. John?

5 JONATHAN DARCHE: So I just wanted to
6 make sure everyone was aware that if you
7 feel like you've been targeted because of
8 your immigration status that is a complaint
9 you can make to the CCRB. If you feel like
10 you've been denied translation services,
11 that is a complaint you can make to the CCRB
12 .If you feel like you've been discriminated
13 against because of the language that you
14 speak, that is a complaint that you can make
15 to the CCRB. And you can make it here with
16 either Philip or Matt. You can call us. You
17 can go online. And we will investigate those
18 complaints. So we are here to serve you and
19 we can't investigate misconduct if no one
20 makes a complaint. That's one of the
21 provisions of the charter. And if you think
22 that should be different, then you should
23 talk to the people at the Charter Revision
24 Commission.

25 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Another

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

68

1 comment? Yeah, sorry. Harya?

2 HARYA TAREKEGN: Hi, sorry. I also
3 just wanted to add that at the CCRB we
4 don't ask about immigration status. So
5 people should feel free to come in. We also
6 have investigators that speak several
7 languages on hand, but also have translation
8 services, so that shouldn't be a barrier.
9 And again, like John said, a lot of those
10 things are complaints, and so should be
11 things that you can file. But in general, if
12 you do not like the way that your
13 interaction with police officers went, even
14 if you don't know if it falls in one of our
15 FADO categories, I encourage you to call us
16 anyway and let us figure that out and let us
17 help you figure out the best resources to
18 use to file that complaint.

19 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you.

20 JONATHAN DARCHE: Thank you, Harya.

21 FREDERICK DAVIE: Next on the list is
22 Allison Bridges-Matthews or Matthews-
23 Bridges.

24 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: Hello.

25 FREDERICK DAVIE: Hi.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

69

1 JONATHAN DARCHE: Hi.

2 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: So I'm here
3 as a civilian. I work for the City of New York,
4 but I'm going to cover up my ID so no one
5 knows where I work so I don't in trouble
6 tomorrow. So I don't know your name, but I
7 wanted to say something to you, and it's
8 that I am not one of the usual suspects. I
9 rarely come to these meetings because I
10 never know about them. And so someone else
11 made, and it might be you, made the point
12 that meeting people where they are. I had a
13 very random email at work. I happened to
14 read these random emails. The gentleman who
15 sends them is in the back. And a lot of
16 people do not read these emails. I just
17 happened to and that's how I found out about
18 this meeting. And while I had three other
19 previous engagements, I said I'm going to
20 come to this one. I came to this meeting
21 because it's the only one in the Bronx for
22 the rest of the year. I don't know how often
23 you meet in the Bronx, but you might need to
24 come a little bit more. Don't take time off
25 for their clapping, though, because that's

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

70

1 not on me. But my major concern is I have a
2 young black 18-year-old male who presents
3 as neurotypical, but he is not. He has an
4 autism diagnosis. A couple of years ago we
5 were in a playground at Orchard Beach and he
6 was on a swing and a cop approached him and
7 he had his headphones on and his hands were
8 in his pockets and I was too far away and it
9 scared the life out of me. And I ran and I
10 yelled and I'm like, "He cannot hear you. He
11 cannot hear you. And he has autism. Leave
12 him alone." And he's like, "Well, this man
13 should not be in this park." I said, "He's
14 15. He's not a man. He's a little boy." And
15 this officer continued to talk to me about
16 the man. I said he's not a man. He's 15. He
17 can't be here. Yes, he can. I'm sorry. I
18 know I'm going over time

19 FREDERICK DAVIE: No. That's all
20 right.

21 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: But
22 that's my concern. So now my son is 18. I'm
23 terrified. I raised him to be
24 extraordinarily independent. He's home
25 right now probably burning some pancakes.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

71

1 But his expressive language skills, his
2 receptive language skills are not what they
3 should be. And I'm concerned about sending
4 him to the supermarket to go get Pringles
5 because I don't know what the interaction is
6 going to be if a cop just asks him for his
7 ID or where he's going or tell him not to
8 go there. The random things that a lot of
9 young people in this community deal with, it
10 frightens me. His response is not even going
11 to be leave me. I don't know what his
12 response is going to be, but I don't know,
13 and I don't know what a cop's response is
14 going to be. I know I don't want that
15 response to end with me having to complain
16 to you about my dead child, my shot child,
17 my imprisoned child, none of that. Again,
18 I'm not a civic parent, but there was a
19 young man that was arrested several years
20 ago. He eventually killed himself. He was
21 held for how long? I'm like my son, if that
22 happened to my son, oh, my God, he wouldn't
23 even be able to advocate for himself. He
24 might not even be able to tell you his
25 name. That frightens me and I don't know

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

72

1 what to do about it. And I'm not saying that
2 you have to do anything. But if you can,
3 please do, because this is one child out of
4 many. There are so many news stories happening
5 with people who are not neurotypical who
6 are dealing with some sort of intellectual
7 disability and my son is one of those. I
8 don't want him falsely accused. I just don't
9 want any of these things that we see
10 happening in the new and in the media to
11 happen to him. And so is anyone in the room
12 has any advice for me, I would appreciate
13 that. And if there's anything anyone can do,
14 I would appreciate that. Thank you.

15 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. So our
16 outreach workers are going to talk to you.
17 Yojaira is coming now. And I'd just say
18 generally that part of these conversations
19 are really about trying to improve
20 interactions between police officers and the
21 community, particularly young males of color
22 because the highest number of complaints we
23 get are from mainly young men of color. So
24 we're working on it. It's not going to
25 change overnight. But we are working on it.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

73

1 And I think we can say that our colleagues
2 in the police department are doing what they
3 can as well. You heard the comments earlier
4 about the neighborhood coordinating officers
5 and some of that work. We've got a long way
6 to go, but a trip of a million miles starts
7 with the first step. So we're trying to
8 take those steps to make this thing better.
9 Thank you. Any other reflections? Mr.
10 Siegal?

11 JOHN SIEGAL: It's not the same
12 situation, but it's a related situation.
13 Because we ask police officers to deal with
14 everything in society and they're not
15 trained to deal with everything. We had one
16 of these meetings a couple months ago with
17 advocates for people with disabilities
18 talking about some of the situations that
19 they encounter, and particularly, people
20 who are hearing-impaired. And one of the
21 things that they said that struck me that is
22 similar to what you're dealing with is, and
23 I didn't know this, deaf people are trained
24 that when they don't understand something
25 they go like this. Well, that means

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

74

1 something different probably to a police
2 officer who doesn't know who he or she is
3 dealing with in a situation where they
4 don't what it is. And I know that's the kind
5 misunderstanding, miscommunication you're
6 talking about. And there weren't a lot of
7 answers at this meeting and the police
8 department resources in terms of training
9 officers to deal with people in situations
10 like this is shockingly small in a very big
11 city, but I know that the staff is working
12 with those advocates to try to deal with
13 these issues, and this is a very similar
14 though different situation. So it's not like
15 we haven't paid attention to this, but it's
16 a very difficult problem.

17 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. And
18 thanks again for bringing this to our
19 attention. And we'll continue to work on it.
20 Thank you. I'm going to try this. Is it
21 Brady? Is it S-A-U-N? Is there anybody here
22 named Brady? All right, did you sign up to
23 speak?

24 SANDRA BRADY: No, but I do have.

25 FREDERICK DAVIE: Would you like to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

75

1 speak? All right, can you come to the mike?

2

3 SANDRA BRADY: Actually,
4 [INDISCERNIBLE].

5 FREDERICK DAVIE: No. Can we bring it
6 around? Do we have a port? She has wheels.

7 SANDRA BRADY: Good evening, everyone.
8 My name is Sandra Brady. I live here in the
9 complex. My question is why is it that the
10 police department, the policemen with their
11 guns have to shoot to kill when they can
12 shoot to maim and leave the person alive and
13 not dead? And they don't have a gun. They
14 don't have a gun. But they've been shot dead
15 when all they had to do was maim them.

16 FREDERICK DAVIE: That side of our
17 jurisdiction to discuss I think that we can
18 have a side conversation with you if you
19 like if the officer wants to speak.

20 SANDRA BRADY: But it's something
21 this whole community needs to know about.

22 FREDERICK DAVIE: Okay. Okay, great.

23 SANDRA BRADY: This whole community
24 needs to know about that. Why kill him if
25 he doesn't have a gun or knife? Why kill

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

76

1 him? Okay. Thank you.

2 JOHN POTKAY: It's a very tough
3 question. I've got 21 years on. I've never
4 fired my weapon. No one wants to. Trust me.
5 That's the God's honest truth. The last
6 thing in the world we want to do is fire our
7 weapons. It's a very stressful situation. We
8 do actually have a simulator now, a video
9 simulator just to put you in that situation
10 so that you can see what it's like being in
11 a gun battle and whatnot.

12 SANDRA BRADY: But I say they didn't
13 have a gun.

14 JOHN POTKAY: Well, that's a whole--

15 SANDRA BRADY: [INDISCERNIBLE] I
16 expect you to shoot back. But if they don't
17 have any weapons, no guns, why kill 'em.

18 JOHN POTKAY: We don't do that. That's
19 yeah, yeah --

20 SANDRA BRADY: Yes, you do. Yes, you
21 do.

22 JOYCE WILLIAMS: We do not shoot to
23 kill. I know people think that, but that's
24 not what we do.

25 SANDRA BRADY: It is what you do.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

77

1 JOYCE WILLIAMS: And I can't answer
2 why an officer would shoot somebody that
3 doesn't have a gun. I've never shot anyone.
4 He's never shot any. Right. But we can't
5 speak for all the police officers in the
6 police department. I can speak for myself. I
7 can speak for our training and what we are
8 trained to do. We're not trained to shoot to
9 kill. I don't know where that came from, but
10 that is not something that the police
11 department. Listen, I know that it happens.
12 It happens in New York. It happens in other
13 states. But that's not what we're trained to
14 do. And you know what? I just want to say
15 something else in regards to the young lady
16 that was up here speaking about her son. I
17 think it was you, ma'am. The whole
18 department is getting training now regarding
19 dealing with kids, people with all kinds of
20 disabilities and stuff like that. So we've
21 all been getting the training and it's
22 constantly, constantly something that we're
23 going through and make sure we're teaching
24 everyone out there on patrol, so we do know
25 how to approach somebody that doesn't speak

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

78

1 English, doesn't speak at all, so we're
2 definitely training the entire police
3 department. So dealing with your child and
4 other people in the community is not going
5 to be a problem for... Well, I'm not going
6 to say it's not going to be a problem
7 because there's always going to be issues,
8 but we're definitely trying to address
9 those.

10 JOHN POTKAY: We're always trying to
11 better ourselves, become a better
12 department so we can better serve you. Like
13 we always say, that's why this is all part
14 of the NCO philosophy, neighborhood
15 coordination philosophy is that we have to
16 work together for this to work. We have to.
17 Yeah. It's a shared responsibility we have
18 to.

19 SANDRA BRADY: [INDISCERNIBLE].

20 JOHN POTKAY: Yeah. We are doing our
21 best.

22 JOYCE WILLIAMS: And picking these
23 NCOs is not a. I was a commanding officer.
24 I ran a precinct. He runs a precinct. And
25 we're very particular in how we pick these

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

79

1 officers to be out there in the community.
2 Most of us in the police department we live
3 in the community. We grew up in the
4 community. I grew up the community. My
5 family, I have nephews, brothers. Just like
6 you said, you're scared. I'm scared, too.
7 You know what I'm saying?

8 JOHN POTKAY: But the reason why I'm
9 here--

10 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: What this
11 community is going to say is that we're not
12 talking to you. No, we're not. And we could
13 all live in this community. The Bronx is a
14 very diverse community.

15 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Absolutely.

16 SANDRA BRADY: And so my son walking
17 through Throgs Neck, walking through
18 Country Club, walking through Riverdale, we
19 just really have to be honest with each
20 other. These communities are treated very
21 differently. There's a historic issue here.
22 So I totally agree. It wasn't made in a day.
23 It's not going to be done in a day.

24 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Exactly.

25 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: But what I am

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

80

1 tired of and what I think a lot of people in
2 this room are tired of is that we don't talk
3 about the history. And if you're not talking
4 about the history, the imbalance that is
5 deeply, deeply historic, we're not having an
6 honest conversation. So it's great.

7 Everybody in this room gets it. We're not
8 worried about the people in this room. We
9 are worried about the people that are never
10 in this room, the cops that are never in
11 this room, the cops that don't care, the
12 cops that are looking at you all like
13 whatever. Those are the people that I'm
14 worried about. It's not just skin color.
15 It's not black. It's not white. There are
16 white officers that are great, but there
17 are black officers that are A-holes. Let's
18 be clear about that. [INDISCERNIBLE].

19 JOYCE WILLIAMS: And that's going to
20 be in any profession. That's going to be in
21 any profession, unfortunately.

22 SANDRA BRADY: But when your life is
23 in jeopardy, absolutely.

24 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Absolutely.

25 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: I'm not worried

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

81

1 about my son being arrested and someone calling
2 me and saying, "Look, your son was
3 arrested."

4 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Yeah. I understand.

5 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: I'm worried
6 about the day they call me and say, "Your son
7 was shot and was killed because we didn't know
8 and he didn't know or we didn't know. We're
9 sorry." Then someone gets to go home, but my
10 son doesn't. That's what everyone should be
11 worried about. We totally agree and we know
12 that all cops are not bad, but there are
13 some fundamental historic issues that need
14 to be dealt with, and you wind up in a room
15 like this all the time. Like I said, I work
16 for a city agency. We have very honest
17 conversations about things all the time, all
18 kinds of issues that this country is dealing
19 with, but if you are not having an honest
20 conversation and literally talking about the
21 dirt that is the dirt, you are not really
22 talking.

23 JOYCE WILLIAMS: And I would also--

24 JOHN POTKAY: But that's part of the
25 reason why I'm here.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

82

1 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Yeah.

2 JOHN POTKAY: Director Alvarez invited
3 me. I'm in charge of 280 officers. I'm
4 making sure that they care and that they're
5 aware and they're becoming better and that
6 they're opening the conversation, but I'm
7 the voice behind them.

8 JOYCE WILLIAMS: They work in this
9 development.

10 JOHN POTKAY: Yes.

11 JOYCE WILLIAMS: Some of them work in
12 this development.

13 SANDRA BRADY: Listen, when I got
14 here today I encountered two officers. I
15 was like, "I don't know where I'm going."
16 They were the nicest gentlemen. I don't
17 feel like cops are not nice people. They are
18 if they are [INDISCERNIBLE] but I've
19 encountered cops that aren't. And I keep
20 moving if I'm lucky enough just to
21 [INDISCERNIBLE].

22 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: Yes.

23 [INDISCERNIBLE].

24 JOHN POTKAY: Yeah. We're always
25 working to improve ourselves, always.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

83

1 FREDERICK DAVIE: And thank you. I
2 think all of this is about culture change
3 that we're all working on and we have to
4 appreciate the efforts that our partners at
5 the NYPD make. We have to continue to
6 increase accountability, transparency, and
7 we have to keep these conversations going.
8 And the CCRB wants to make sure that your
9 complaints are taken seriously. We want you
10 to know that you have a place to go. And we
11 want to promote partnerships where it makes
12 sense to promote them. The big thing is for
13 us to try to reverse this really troubled
14 history. And meetings like this and agencies
15 like ours and progressive leadership at the
16 NYPD are elements to us reversing some of
17 that history.

18 JONATHAN DARCHE: Mr. Chair, can I--

19 FREDERICK DAVIE: Sure.

20 JONATHAN DARCHE: So, one of the
21 things that happened in 2016 is that the
22 department changed its use of force
23 guidelines to require de-escalation in
24 situations where it's possible. So we no
25 longer just evaluate use of force as to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

84

1 whether it was appropriate as the situation
2 eventually got bad, but we look and see if
3 whether the officer involved, the member of
4 the service involved could've de-escalated
5 the situation. But I just wanted to say I
6 understand as a parent that that is a small
7 comfort to you and that we will continue to
8 have this conversation because it's not
9 something that we're going to be able to
10 solve. I have nothing to tell you that we
11 can fix it tomorrow, but we will continue
12 this conversation and we will make sure, not
13 just the people from the department who
14 we're talking to today, but also go back to
15 our people we work with at One Police Plaza
16 and make sure they're aware of your concerns
17 and that this is something that they are
18 struggling with also to ensure that these
19 are issues that are dealt with in a humane
20 way and that officers aren't encountering
21 people who whether it is they are deaf or
22 they are autistic that there is a situation
23 that causes them to think that there is bad
24 action or bad attitude when really there's
25 just people who are differently abled who

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

85

1 aren't able to respond in the way that they
2 are expecting it. And that's a challenge
3 that the department is facing, but they're
4 still grappling with it, and they haven't
5 achieved that yet.

6 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. And
7 thanks to everybody for your comments. Just
8 one second. We'll go through the list and
9 then we'll get people who weren't on the
10 list. I have Justin. And, Justin, I can't
11 make the writing for your last name.

12 NATHAN JOSEPH: Is this on?

13 ALLISON BRIDGES-MATTHEWS: Yeah.

14 NATHAN JOSEPH: Can I just before--

15 FREDERICK DAVIE: Oh, I'm sorry.

16 [INDISCERNIBLE].

17 NATHAN JOSEPH: Oh, before he speaks.
18 Where is the young lady that was here?

19 JOHN POTKAY: She just sat down in the
20 back.

21 NATHAN JOSEPH: Oh, okay. Sorry. Thank
22 you. Your son is my grandson. I have been
23 through what you're going through. I'm
24 still going through it. So maybe we can talk
25 later. I can tell you some of the things

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

86

1 we've done. And I wanted to thank you
2 officers for getting up and answering a
3 very, very difficult question. I know you
4 were a little reluctant, but then you got up
5 and did it. So thank you for doing that.

6 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. Thank
7 you, Mr. Joseph.

8 JUSTIN: [INDISCERNIBLE]. My name is
9 Justin [INDISCERNIBLE]. It's a pleasure to
10 meet all of you beautiful people today. And
11 I'm not really here to complain. I'm not
12 really here to tell you to do your job. But
13 I'm just here to tell you what I went
14 through and how I view things. To be honest
15 with you all, where I'm at or where me and
16 my brothers where we chill at, we don't have
17 to be bound by blood. We share the same
18 struggles. Do you understand what I'm
19 saying? And it's like it's sad, too, the
20 way I could feel like something could be
21 done to me today and I don't even want to
22 call the police because I feel like I'm
23 going to go to jail and I'm going to have
24 feel it. I've done things I shouldn't have
25 done in the past. I'm older now. But some of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

87

1 those things still haunt you. I got a job.
2 I practice my talents every day. I've got
3 people I can talk to. I do specific things
4 of art. Do you understand? I'm an artistic
5 person. But, see, I go outside and something
6 happens to me and I call the police, they
7 want to take me in for questioning, and
8 then, hey, something pops up. It's happened
9 before. You know what I'm saying? And it
10 should've been taken care of. And now I've
11 got to go to jail. I've got to lose my job,
12 my peace of mind. You understand? My faith
13 in what's going on out here. It makes me
14 mad. I've been assaulted by a cop before for
15 defending my bro from getting a sandwich. We
16 were on the block, he was getting a
17 sandwich, and they want to roughhouse him.
18 I'm like you can't do that. His partner
19 want do that to me. I'm defending
20 myself. You're not just going to beat me up.
21 You're not going to hurt me. I'm still a
22 man. And what does your partner do? They
23 step on my face and they tell me, "Every
24 time I see you I'm going to step on your
25 face." You know what I told him? I told him,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

88

1 "Every time I see you we're going to fight
2 because you're not just going to step on my
3 face." I got let out 20 minutes later. What
4 does that mean? Any time I've ever been a
5 situation where I've got to go through
6 paperwork it's never no 20 minutes. At least
7 it's three or four. So that means you know
8 what you were doing. You knew that was
9 wrong, right? You understand the rules and
10 the regulations we are bound by our
11 surroundings and our environment. So you
12 chose to take upon and prey upon that and
13 use that for your good. Part of me I know
14 I'm over. Do you understand? But I'm going
15 to just wrap it up like this. It's like I
16 tell my brothers we're walking and we're
17 doing something good and they see a
18 policeman and they want to run. I'm like,
19 "What are you running for, bro? We can be
20 right here. Do you all know your rights?"
21 They know it but they don't even believe in
22 it. So it's the different between knowing
23 your right and having faith in it. Do you
24 understand what I'm saying? They talk to me
25 crazy. Sometimes they will come. I'm a man,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

89

1 sir. Don't talk to me like that. Well,
2 you're going to have to do this. I'm not
3 your pet. You're not going to tell me put my
4 hands down and I'm automatically going to
5 do it if I don't see the probable cause. I
6 asked you, "What are you doing this for? You
7 don't tell me nothing real. You beat around
8 the bush." Psychology is a beautiful thing,
9 but it can be very dangerous, too. I get
10 judged on how I look sometimes. I don't like
11 being followed. I don't like being stared
12 at. I don't like getting a half-assed
13 answer when I talk to you. And not all cops
14 are like that. No. I'm not going to sit
15 there and say that. Some of them are very
16 good people. Some of them are saints in
17 uniforms. But why is it that I have to get
18 more of the eviler side or the gritty side,
19 more of the controlling side rather than a
20 compassionate person? No. I'm just saying
21 our young ones, it's young kids, little
22 kids that don't trust the police. They're
23 scared of them. I see that. Do you think I
24 want to call the police if my little brother
25 or my little sister is getting violated?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

90

1 You're going to manhandle her, too, and then
2 I'm going to be forced to act belligerently
3 because it's within my human nature. Do you
4 understand? Because there's laws to this.
5 Everybody is not going to follow it. I
6 understand that. But don't sit there and
7 look at me for the way I dress, how I move
8 my bop, how I talk, all that. Don't
9 underestimate me and think I'm doing this
10 because I could pop out in a suit, too. Do
11 you understand what I'm saying? And the
12 pleasure was mine. Now, I don't come to
13 these types of events. I should. I really
14 should. I just don't. I would like to come
15 out and participate more. So I appreciate
16 everybody here that listens, you
17 understand, but I appreciate the message
18 that everybody brought. It touched me and I
19 don't really know anybody here, but it
20 touched me, and that's a beautiful thing,
21 but you've also got to look at why I was
22 touched to begin with. It's a good and a
23 bad side to everything. It's just about
24 bringing it to the righteous. It's absolute.

25 FREDERICK DAVIE: So, Justin, thank

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

91

1 you. Keep coming out to these meetings.
2 Keep voicing your frustrations with this. I
3 would say that I would not physically engage
4 an officer. I don't think that's advisable.
5 If something goes wrong, you call us, simple
6 311, and we will investigate it.

7 JUSTIN: Pardon me. I don't mean to
8 cut you off, but it's a New York minute. I
9 could call you, but you've got to get here.
10 I don't have to get crazy off the
11 rip, but I've got to defend
12 myself, right?

13 FREDERICK DAVIE: But, Justin, we
14 want to make sure that you're not behind
15 bars so that you can come to these meetings.

16 So make it a New York hour and make that
17 call, all right? Thank you. Thanks.

18 JONATHAN DARCHE: I'd just like to
19 point out when you heard one of the
20 previous speakers talking about her fear of
21 her son not coming home, so I hear that you
22 say you're a man and that you're entitled to
23 be treated properly and treated like an
24 adult, and you're 100% right, but you also
25 have an obligation to yourself and to your

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

92

1 family to come home. And when you're in
2 those situations it might seem like you're
3 making the right choice to stand up and be
4 a man and fight. But I can only tell you I
5 think it is a real mistake and that you
6 should not do that, not because you're
7 morally wrong, but because you want to go
8 home and you don't want your mom or your dad
9 to not have you.

10

11 JUSTIN: I understand that. I'd like
12 to make a comment on that and I appreciate
13 you saying that. I really would like to
14 express my gratitude for you saying that
15 because it kind of shows me that you have a
16 concern for me making the right thing. So
17 that also maybe leads to you having a
18 certain type of, I don't know how to say it
19 right now, but you have a concern for my
20 wellbeing, you understand, and I appreciate
21 that because the world we live in is cold.
22 The next person doesn't really care about
23 the next person. And I'm going to say this.
24 There's more than one way to fight.
25 Sometimes I fight verbally in a

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

93

1 sophisticated manner. Do you understand what
2 I'm saying? So and some people get up and
3 they'll be on the wrong side of the bed
4 sometimes and they will exact that
5 aggression on you. I don't like to be
6 nervous. Do you understand? But I don't want
7 you to sit there and make it seem like I
8 can't say what I want to say. Now you're
9 going to manhandle me because I'm right. Not
10 every officer does this. I'm going to say
11 that again. But I've come across a couple
12 that does. I've seen my brothers get beaten
13 at a young age. I've been beaten at a young
14 age. And then I've seen officers get
15 attacked for doing what they've got to do.
16 It's both sides to this. It's a double-edged
17 sword. Do you understand what I'm saying?
18 But it's like at the end of the day
19 sometimes when I say fight I don't mean
20 physical aggression. Sometimes I don't mean
21 beating on my chest and raising my voice.
22 Sometimes I might fight with intellect
23 because the pen is mightier than the sword.
24 That's the world we live in today. So that's
25 why I feel like I'm going to fight

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

94

1 regardless. You're not going to attack my
2 character or my humanity. I'm not going to
3 sit there and make things worse. If you've
4 got to do your job and I understand the
5 circumstances I'll tell them. Do your job. I
6 ain't mad at you. You've got to get it like
7 how I've got to get it because sometimes
8 they're very respectful and I appreciate
9 that, but sometimes they're not.

10 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you, Justin.
11 Thank you. We have two more speakers. And,
12 again, I'm going to have a "print only" put on
13 these sheets so that I can read these names.
14 This one I can't read at all. It may be
15 M-A-R-D. Well, did somebody sign up to speak
16 who hasn't spoken? Why don't we do it that
17 way since there are only two? All right. You
18 want to come up? You want to come up to the
19 mike? Yes. In the back, the very back. Oh,
20 right here I'm sorry.

21 EDWARD FELDER: Hello. My name is
22 Edward Felder and I'm the vice president of
23 the tenant association for Bronx River
24 Housing. I would like to thank the captain
25 right there. You've got a nice crew. You all

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

95

1 take care of the people around here. You all
2 really look out for us. And a question for
3 the panel. Excuse me. I'm going to see how
4 I'm going to put it. A long, long time ago
5 when we were coming up, you all are a little
6 older than me, but you all might remember,
7 we had neighborhood cops come out, play
8 with the kids, play with the ball,
9 basketball, jump rope with the little girls.
10 Why they can't do that now? Maybe that would
11 make the area good with the police. That's
12 what we really need. We need the police to
13 stick together with the kids. Then the kids
14 won't be afraid of them. See, I'm a little
15 nervous and I just want to cry, but these
16 cops around here love the kids and when the
17 little kids see the police they run to the
18 police and give them hugs. They give them
19 shakes. We need police to come out and jump
20 rope with the little girls, throw balls
21 like the old times, and I know you all know
22 about it, panel, because you all look like
23 the types that you all used to play ball
24 with the police when you all were younger.
25 And I was sitting down over there and I'm

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

96

1 looking at the, I can't think of his name,
2 the one right beside you, he--

3 FREDERICK DAVIE: He looks like he
4 used to run from the police.

5 (Laughter)

6 EDWARD FELDER: He looks like he was
7 a troublemaker but he got used to the cops.
8 That's what I was going to say.

9 FREDERICK DAVIE: He's a former
10 prosecutor.

11 EDWARD FELDER: And the young man
12 right there with the water, you made the
13 little tears come to my eyes when you told
14 this young lady her son was your niece I
15 mean nephew.

16 FREDERICK DAVIE: Grandson.

17 EDWARD FELDER: Grandson. You made
18 the little tears come to my eyes because a
19 lot of people will not say that and she
20 might didn't even know that. She might
21 didn't even know it, but you knew it, and
22 God is going to bless you for saying that.
23 See, I hang out with the golden girls and I
24 look out for the golden girls. These are the
25 golden girls in the back here in the second

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

97

1 row and I look out for them. I'm the vice
2 president, like I said, but I look out for
3 them. They're going to kill me, but that's
4 okay.

5 FREDERICK DAVIE: All right. Thank
6 you. Mr. Vice President, so the golden girls
7 might want to go home and have some dinner
8 tonight. [INDISCERNIBLE].

9 EDWARD FELDER: They already ate.
10 They already ate. That's it. I'm finished.
11 I'm finished.

12 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you, sir.
13 Thank you so much. Thank you. Thank you
14 Thanks, sir. All right. I have one more
15 speaker on my list. Yvonne Jennings,
16 Shavonne Jennings here, and then this.

17 FEMALE 2: Could you fix this because
18 I'm not good at this? Let me know when
19 you're ready. I spoke in February a stalking
20 issue of 12 years. I sat in the back over
21 there. I just sat because I do this. I was
22 chased all day and my first call went to
23 Tubbs, the assistant to the Bronx Borough
24 president, and I saw them a few weeks at a
25 Stop the Killing event and I said to them

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

98

1 then that I feared for my life and CO
2 [INDISCERNIBLE] was there as all in here and
3 he did what they did in here all under
4 these cameras. I had gone to see CO
5 Alps some months before about
6 the stalking, taunting and harassing me. If
7 you spent the day watching me your jaw would
8 drop. I was talking to a nice man here from
9 the DA's office. Brennan I think he's
10 called. And then I was talking to the other
11 nice man. And I showed him the wonderful
12 letters that go daily somewhere. They go
13 under every bus and train cam. Let us say in
14 case anything happens to me. See the
15 wonderful boys in blue over there? It's
16 unfortunate that I've met many of the CO,
17 no, I've not met many, but I've tried to
18 speak to their CO. They don't get the calls
19 and letters. I just called MTA Transit on the
20 train as I was harassed at the store. The
21 list on those letters is long. I don't lie.
22 My diary that I write everything in goes
23 [INDISCERNIBLE]. A month ago, I'll make it
24 short, a month ago I was in the Bronx. The
25 coop city Bronx DA was there. I spoke to Mr.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

99

1 Linton, three people. I don't hear back from
2 them. I told them that at this point I stay
3 dizzy. I have to lean on a wall. I came out
4 today and all these wonderful people that
5 are in here sitting down and acting smart
6 and sharp run me down, not these
7 people, but more or less of this, run me
8 down At the camera over there speaking to
9 Mr. Brennan I think from the DA as they
10 marched at me [INDISCERNIBLE].

11 FREDERICK DAVIE: Sure. So why don't
12 we have one our staff have a conversation
13 with you because we're going to have to
14 call the meeting to a close?

15 FEMALE 2: No, no, no. That's not a problem.
16 I fear for my life and I make sure in those
17 letters. I'm going to really work on them
18 even more because you all had 12 years to
19 deal with this. It's not your department.
20 It's a police issue.

21 FREDERICK DAVIE: Yeah. Okay.

22 FEMALE 2: See the wonderful police over
23 here? But I go and ask for help and they
24 take off. I call 911 in front of a car for
25 help, don't get help.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

100

1 FREDERICK DAVIE: Well, we'll keep
2 working on it with you and we have people
3 here who can help you.

4 FEMALE 2: No. There's no working on it.
5 You've had 12 years and I fear for my life.

6 FREDERICK DAVIE: Okay.

7 FEMALE 2: So see your wonderful police
8 over there?

9 FREDERICK DAVIE: Mm-hmm.

10 FEMALE 2: Wonderful Larry [INDISCERNIBLE]
11 and the wonderful Miss Williams that's over
12 there that know about this, the 200 and
13 something officers that know about it and
14 encourage it with every bit of their being.
15 Do you want to see my diary? It's fabulous.
16 It goes in every camera.

17 FREDERICK DAVIE: Okay. Thank you.
18 Thank you so much.

19 FEMALE 2: Corruption, corruption.
20 [INDISCERNIBLE].

21 FREDERICK DAVIE: Thank you. All
22 righty. We are going to go to. Thank you. I
23 want to thank everybody for their
24 contributions. I'm going to ask the board if
25 there is any old business. Is there any new

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

101

1 business? Yeah. Mr. Joseph.

2 NATHAN JOSEPH: Hello? Oh, okay. Last
3 month we were talking about duty to
4 cooperate. Do we have any update on that
5 from some of those questions that we raised
6 during that meeting?

7 JONATHAN DARCHE: So, staff has been
8 working on the answers to those questions
9 and we don't have them yet.

10 NATHAN JOSEPH: Okay. All right.

11 JONATHAN DARCHE: We're hopeful for
12 the June meeting, but it might have to go
13 to July.

14 NATHAN JOSEPH: Okay. Thank you.

15 FREDERICK DAVIE: All right. Thank
16 you. Any other business to come before this
17 body? The chair will entertain a motion to
18 adjourn to executive session. Is there such
19 a motion? Is there a second? All those in
20 favor adjourning to executive session,
21 please say aye.

22 JONATHAN DARCHE: Aye.

23 FREDERICK DAVIE: Opposed, no. Is
24 have it. We are adjourned to executive
25 session.

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

STATE OF NEW YORK))
ss.
COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, KATHLEEN T. KEILTY, a Shorthand Reporter
and Notary Public within and for the State of
New York, do hereby certify:

That the foregoing is a transcript of a
DVD/CD/wav or MP3 file transcribed by me to
the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am not related to
any of the parties to this action by blood or
marriage, and that I am in no way interested in
the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
hand this 29th day of May, 2019.

Kathleen T. Keilty
KATHLEEN T. KEILTY, C.S.R.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

A		
a-- (1) 53:1	affirm (1) 47:1	answers (2) 74:7 101:8
A-holes (1) 80:17	affordable (1) 39:20	anticipate (1) 30:22
ability (1) 102:13	afraid (2) 63:5 95:14	antiquated (1) 61:12
able (24) 20:19,20 21:15,25 33:4 37:14 46:7,13,14,15,16 47:15 48:11 54:8 55:23 60:13,15,24 63:12,14 71:23,24 84:9 85:1	Africa (1) 62:16	anybody (3) 34:2 74:21 90:19
abled (1) 84:25	African (5) 62:10,15,17 63:10 64:17	anyway (1) 68:16
absolute (2) 57:12 90:24	Africans (1) 63:24	apologies (1) 14:20
absolutely (5) 47:16 55:17 79:15 80:23,24	afternoon (7) 4:11,25 44:19 46:2 52:15,16,20	apologize (1) 48:22
abuse (1) 16:4	afterschool (1) 18:4	apply (1) 23:9
abusing (1) 38:10	age (4) 18:24 26:4 93:13,14	appointed (3) 4:13 5:19 15:17
access (1) 7:13	agencies (3) 42:11 59:13 83:14	appointee (2) 5:8 52:22
accountability (3) 5:23 6:2 83:6	agency (21) 4:24 6:7,19 7:6 8:8,14 15:9,10,14 20:9 33:11 47:20 48:23 49:11,16,18,20,23 54:25 66:16 81:16	appreciate (8) 72:12,14 83:4 90:15 90:17 92:12,20 94:8
accountable (3) 6:6 34:17 44:4	agency's (2) 6:8 7:1	appreciated (1) 58:3
accused (1) 72:8	agenda (2) 2:4 14:24	approach (3) 65:16,24 77:25
achieved (1) 85:5	aggression (2) 93:5,20	approached (1) 70:6
acknowledge (2) 12:16 13:8	aggressive (1) 66:4	approaching (1) 66:2
acronym (1) 15:23	aggressiveness (1) 65:19	appropriate (1) 84:1
act (7) 10:17,17,23 17:1,11 20:15 90:2	Agil (3) 30:9,10,10	appropriately (1) 31:12
acting (1) 99:5	ago (10) 24:11 25:1 47:22 63:16 70:4 71:20 73:16 95:4 98:23,24	approve (1) 12:1
action (3) 59:5 84:24 102:16	agree (5) 44:13 51:21 57:15 79:22 81:11	approving (1) 12:9
actions (3) 26:25 27:2 44:4	aid (1) 39:19	area (3) 19:1 45:10 95:11
activity (1) 19:25	ailing (1) 28:25	areas (3) 19:2 21:4 66:15
actual (2) 26:5 54:10	ain't (1) 94:6	arising (1) 30:22
add (4) 28:13 34:4 51:21 68:3	Albany (2) 49:25 50:6	arranging (1) 10:12
additional (1) 22:24	alive (1) 75:12	arrest (3) 16:10 64:1,2
additionally (1) 53:19	allegations (8) 15:13,21 16:4,12 16:17 19:12 50:15 55:11	arrested (5) 39:19 42:3 71:19 81:1 81:3
address (10) 8:25 32:13 48:19 50:25 60:13 61:14 63:2,12 66:7 78:8	Allison (10) 68:22,24 69:2 70:21 79:10,25 80:25 81:5 82:22 85:13	arrests (3) 16:15 63:17,19
addressed (1) 43:20	allow (1) 57:19	art (1) 87:4
adds (1) 42:13	allowed (1) 20:1	artistic (1) 87:4
adhere (1) 58:25	allowing (1) 10:6	Arts (1) 10:9
adjourn (2) 2:17 101:18	Alps (1) 98:5	as-- (1) 38:21
adjourned (1) 101:24	also-- (1) 81:23	asked (2) 38:17 89:6
adjourning (1) 101:20	alternative (1) 36:17	asking (5) 7:4 17:11 27:3 55:1,22
adjudicate (1) 7:15	alternatives (1) 51:3	asks (1) 71:6
adjudicated (1) 9:11	Althea (7) 41:2,5,8,9 50:19 51:7 54:3	assaulted (1) 87:14
administrative (1) 9:4	Alvarez (7) 8:20 15:1,2,5 51:19 66:9 82:2	Assembly (1) 12:22
administratively (1) 15:12	Alvarez's (1) 18:10	assistant (1) 97:23
administrator (1) 13:23	amazing (2) 24:14,18	association (3) 10:4 25:6 94:23
adopted (1) 12:15	ambassadors (1) 52:9	ate (2) 97:9,10
Adoption (1) 2:8	America (1) 6:11	atmosphere (1) 39:4
adult (1) 91:24	amount (1) 35:8	attack (1) 94:1
adults (2) 22:17 51:11	Anais (7) 12:23,24,24 13:2,2,3,4	attacked (1) 93:15
advice (2) 61:3 72:12	ancient (1) 61:12	attention (2) 74:15,19
advisable (1) 91:4	announced (1) 14:15	attitude (1) 84:24
advisory (2) 22:7 25:2	answer (7) 14:6 24:3 27:12 46:4 48:19 77:1 89:13	attorney (1) 53:10
advocacy (2) 18:17 41:10	answered (1) 30:17	audio (2) 34:6,12
advocate (2) 62:19 71:23	answering (1) 86:2	authority (9) 16:5 38:10 42:11 54:7 55:7 58:6 62:21 63:12 65:20
advocates (2) 73:17 74:12		autism (2) 70:4,11
affairs (4) 8:18 15:6 41:13,20		autistic (1) 84:22
affect (2) 46:5,6		automatically (1) 89:4

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

B		
back (15) 11:14 16:25 17:17 32:19 48:23 65:11 69:15 76:16 84:14 85:20 94:19,19 96:25 97:20 99:1	33:3,7,21,25 34:4 35:10	call (21) 2:7 7:3 10:25 11:1 12:18 16:8 17:24 66:22,22 67:16 68:15 81:6 86:22 87:6 89:24 91:5,9,17 97:22 99:14,24
bad (8) 24:25 29:7 31:4 81:12 84:2 84:23,24 90:23	bolting (1) 54:16	called (4) 5:17 54:19 98:10,19
Bailing (1) 52:17	book (1) 37:4	calling (1) 81:1
balance (2) 34:15,22	books (1) 25:17	calls (1) 98:18
ball (2) 95:8,23	bop (1) 90:8	cam (1) 98:13
balls (1) 95:20	borough (4) 13:23 14:13 22:20 97:23	camaraderie (1) 41:24
barrier (1) 68:8	boroughs (2) 18:24 47:7	camera (4) 32:14 35:10 99:8 100:16
bars (1) 91:15	bound (2) 86:17 88:10	cameras (10) 30:19,23 32:22 33:3 33:7,15,21 34:1,4 98:4
based (3) 16:15 41:3,13	box (3) 55:13 57:7 61:7	campaign (1) 60:17
basically (4) 31:6 37:23 53:16,22	boy (1) 70:14	capacity (2) 29:10 59:10
basketball (6) 25:18 43:6 52:2,3,6 95:9	boys (1) 98:15	captain (2) 24:16 94:24
battle (1) 76:11	Brady (16) 74:21,22,24 75:3,7,8,20 75:23 76:12,15,20,25 78:19 79:16 80:22 82:13	car (2) 65:15 99:24
Beach (1) 70:5	bread (1) 64:6	Carcatera (3) 3:8 5:3,4
beat (2) 87:20 89:7	breakdown (1) 22:19	card (6) 10:20 17:7,8,9,17 20:16
beaten (2) 93:12,13	Brennan (2) 98:9 99:9	cards (1) 36:19
beating (1) 93:21	bridge (2) 28:22 29:4	care (9) 6:3 11:24 24:14 64:24 80:11 82:4 87:10 92:22 95:1
beautiful (5) 15:4 24:1 86:10 89:8 90:20	Bridges (1) 68:23	Carmen (5) 53:2,5,6 61:23,24
becoming (1) 82:5	Bridges-Matthews (10) 68:22,24 69:2 70:21 79:10,25 80:25 81:5 82:22 85:13	carry (1) 63:14
bed (1) 93:3	brief (2) 4:6 5:13	carrying (1) 38:19
before-- (1) 85:14	bring (4) 9:10 26:2 65:15 75:5	cars (1) 45:18
behalf (1) 37:21	bringing (2) 74:18 90:24	case (9) 9:10,11,21 33:21 35:17,25 38:9 49:5 98:14
behavior (2) 34:18 66:19	Britain (1) 32:3	cases (7) 7:16 9:10 20:6 34:9 35:9 35:25 36:3
behaviors (1) 32:7	bro (2) 87:15 88:19	categories (2) 19:8 68:15
believe (8) 9:14 26:21 27:7 28:24 42:19 44:14 65:11 88:21	Bronx (32) 1:10 4:20,21 7:25 10:3 10:10 13:6,23 14:3 18:19 19:6,11 21:1,19 23:23 25:4 26:2 27:22 28:16 40:7 41:17 44:22 53:8,12 53:20 69:21,23 79:13 94:23 97:23 98:24,25	category (2) 16:5,19
belligerently (1) 90:2	Brooklyn (1) 52:22	cause (1) 89:5
benefit (1) 37:3	brother (2) 31:8 89:24	causes (1) 84:23
best (4) 33:12 68:17 78:21 102:13	brothers (5) 32:17 79:5 86:16 88:16 93:12	CCRB (46) 2:11 6:7 8:6 9:1,7,19 15:7 21:8 22:7 25:25 26:4,21 27:7,16 29:16,21 30:15 33:2 35:14 37:22 42:6,11,14,14,19,22 43:10,19,21 45:19,21,22 46:5 47:1,23 55:5,9 57:19 59:16 60:16 66:13 67:9,11,15 68:3 83:8
bet (1) 45:13	brought (2) 26:15 90:18	CCRB's (3) 9:3 29:25 66:22
better (14) 6:22 7:17 33:20 42:23 43:3 44:16 47:10 52:16 66:12 73:8 78:11,11,12 82:5	buckets (1) 15:22	center (5) 10:11 23:24 47:8 51:25 59:3
big (4) 6:23 7:2 74:10 83:12	budget (20) 6:8,9,10,12,13,16,19 6:21,25,25 7:1,1 8:6,7 29:25 47:15 55:23 57:16,20,21	centers (1) 43:8
billion (2) 6:16,17	budgeting (1) 30:2	certain (7) 7:5 10:18 32:2,2 35:15 39:13 92:18
bit (7) 14:18,19 15:8 21:19 53:24 69:24 100:14	build (2) 28:4 44:5	CERTIFICATE (1) 102:2
black (6) 45:2,16 52:18 70:2 80:15 80:17	building (4) 14:16 35:16 41:14 52:5	certify (2) 102:9,15
Blasio (1) 4:13	burning (1) 70:25	chair (9) 1:15 2:9 3:6 4:5 10:2 11:22 29:16 83:18 101:17
bless (1) 96:22	bus (1) 98:13	Chairman (5) 62:10,12,13,13 63:9
block (1) 87:16	bush (1) 89:8	challenge (2) 57:6 85:2
blood (2) 86:17 102:16	business (13) 2:15,16 10:20 17:7 17:8,17 20:16 36:19 45:3 55:10 100:25 101:1,16	challenges (1) 30:21
blue (1) 98:15	busy (1) 18:3	chance (2) 27:12 52:14
board (32) 1:4 3:4,7,8,9,10,11,12 3:13 4:4,5,8,13,20 5:5,11 7:17 9:8 14:9 15:15,16 25:2 30:6 35:7 40:15,18,20 46:22 49:14 52:13 52:25 100:24	C	change (13) 5:20 6:25 24:6 27:10 39:4,17 45:10 50:6,9 56:7 67:1 72:25 83:2
Board's (1) 4:4	C.S.R (1) 102:24	
body (2) 55:6 101:17	cab (1) 63:17	
body-worn (10) 30:19,23 32:14,22		

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

<p>changed (1) 83:22 changes (4) 6:5 7:21 26:22 55:12 changing (1) 50:1 character (1) 94:2 charge (1) 82:3 charges (1) 36:7 Charles (3) 37:11,13,21 charter (16) 5:14,15,18,20 6:24 7:4 7:21,24 8:13,22 29:17,24 57:18 57:24 67:21,23 charter2019.nyc (2) 8:11,12 charterNYC.nyc (1) 58:1 chased (1) 97:22 Chaves (6) 11:10,11,11,12 48:25 50:13 check (1) 49:5 chest (1) 93:21 Chicago (1) 6:13 child (5) 71:16,16,17 72:3 78:3 children (1) 25:16 Children's (1) 10:9 chill (1) 86:16 choice (2) 39:6 92:3 choose (3) 45:11 53:15,15 chose (1) 88:12 churches (1) 18:4 circumstances (1) 94:5 cities (1) 6:14 citizen (1) 64:23 citizens (2) 6:6 31:7 city (38) 4:19 5:1,7,14,19,22 6:10 7:23 8:1 9:18,22 10:15 14:13 15:10,19 19:7,11 21:4 27:24 47:13,24 49:13 50:4 51:6 52:22 54:25 55:2 57:22 58:8,9 59:7,12 63:18 66:12 69:3 74:11 81:16 98:25 City's (1) 5:15 civic (3) 60:17,24 71:18 civically (2) 56:18,19 Civil (1) 49:22 civilian (7) 1:4 4:3 34:10 36:3 65:14,24 69:3 civilians (1) 32:9 Claim's (1) 54:20 clapping (1) 69:25 clarification (1) 18:11 clear (4) 32:23 53:9,25 80:18 clearer (1) 35:20 clearly (1) 59:18 clients (1) 53:14 clinic (1) 54:20 close (1) 99:14 closure (1) 9:18 Club (1) 79:18 cold (1) 92:21 collaborate (1) 52:8 colleague (2) 28:11 32:12</p>	<p>colleagues (5) 4:7,21 27:12 66:7 73:1 College (1) 7:25 color (5) 22:22 56:25 72:21,23 80:14 Colorado (1) 52:19 come (47) 7:16 10:13 11:17 13:14 14:7 17:21 22:5,8 25:17 30:11,12 36:25 38:7,15 39:22,24 44:8 48:5 53:4 54:18,21 56:6 63:1,5 64:11 64:13,19 66:10,10 68:5 69:9,20 69:24 75:1 88:25 90:12,14 91:15 92:1 93:11 94:18,18 95:7,19 96:13,18 101:16 comes (6) 18:19 24:21 48:15 54:11 56:17 58:23 comfort (1) 84:7 comfortable (3) 39:14 51:4,5 coming (17) 10:7 15:3 20:24 21:21 24:1 34:25 43:3 44:25 51:20,24 52:3 61:17 64:8 72:17 91:1,21 95:5 commanding (1) 78:23 commend (2) 28:10,12 comment (16) 2:13,14 11:4,18 17:20 23:19,21 36:12 47:1 53:1 58:3,15,19,21 68:1 92:12 comments (19) 11:5,20 12:7 30:6 35:2 36:12 40:16,17,22 46:20 51:17 52:25 54:2 57:18 58:2,14 67:2 73:3 85:7 commission (11) 5:18,24 6:24 7:22 57:19,24 62:11,18 63:10 64:18 67:24 commissioner (7) 5:5 7:8 15:20 19:20 55:6 58:7,12 commissioner's (1) 4:16 commits (1) 65:9 committed (1) 36:2 Committee (1) 10:16 communicate (3) 46:13,15 64:9 communicating (1) 55:15 communication (1) 42:15 communities (23) 19:4 28:22 29:1 29:6,12 42:22,24 43:4 54:1 55:16 56:22,23 57:2 59:17,24 60:5,10 60:11,19 61:8,8,9 79:20 community (85) 2:13 10:10 19:3 23:4,18,19,24 24:15 25:1,11 26:21,23 27:8,17 28:1,5 29:1,5 30:22 31:18,18 34:21 37:23 38:6 38:10 40:9,24 41:3,12,13,15,16 41:20,22 42:5,9,20,21 43:7,23 44:3,7,15 46:6,6 47:5,8 48:7,16 49:10 51:25 52:4 53:7,10,18,22 54:4,10,11 56:13 57:1 60:14 61:15 62:16,19,23 63:7,13 64:19 64:20 66:8,11,17 71:9 72:21</p>	<p>75:21,23 78:4 79:1,3,4,4,11,13 79:14 Comp (1) 30:11 compared (2) 19:11 21:1 comparison (1) 20:25 compassionate (1) 89:20 complain (3) 37:25 71:15 86:11 complaint (23) 1:4 4:3 10:24 11:8 17:20,21,23,25 19:13 20:3,18 22:19 28:2 29:8 36:4 42:6,17 50:14 67:8,11,14,20 68:18 complaints (23) 7:16 18:20,22,23 19:5,6,19,21,24 20:25 21:6,21 22:13,18,23 33:4,6 42:12 54:23 67:18 68:10 72:22 83:9 completely (1) 51:21 complex (2) 54:8 75:9 complexes (2) 25:3 35:16 composed (1) 15:17 concern (9) 34:13 40:8 63:11 64:8 64:15 70:1,22 92:16,19 concerned (8) 62:7,14,20,25 63:2 63:16,22 71:3 concerns (6) 59:9 63:9,13 64:2,4 84:16 conclusions (1) 33:5 conduct (1) 20:8 Connect (1) 40:7 connected (1) 52:1 Connecticut (1) 62:11 consent (2) 10:20 17:12 consider (3) 26:24 56:21 66:18 consideration (2) 43:11 49:25 considered (1) 29:23 consistent (1) 42:15 constant (1) 26:24 constantly (3) 38:16 77:22,22 constitution (1) 5:16 contact (2) 11:2 36:21 context (2) 34:7 53:24 continue (6) 9:13 48:11 74:19 83:5 84:7,11 continued (2) 6:4 70:15 continuous (1) 52:10 continuously (1) 57:8 contributions (3) 36:23 40:23 100:24 controlling (1) 89:19 conversation (15) 52:10 55:9,19 60:15 61:1 65:5,16,20 75:18 80:6 81:20 82:6 84:8,12 99:12 conversations (5) 54:12 56:1 72:18 81:17 83:7 coop (1) 98:25 cooperate (2) 7:3 101:4 cooperates (1) 8:8 coordinating (1) 73:4 coordination (3) 14:1 41:19 78:15</p>
---	---	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

cop (3) 70:6 71:6 87:14
cop's (1) 71:13
cops (14) 39:10 42:10 44:4 46:10
 80:10,11,12 81:12 82:17,19
 89:13 95:7,16 96:7
corner (1) 20:22
corrupt (1) 57:13
corruption (2) 100:19,19
could've (1) 84:4
council (18) 5:2,7,20 14:13 15:19
 22:7,8 23:5,10 27:24 36:16,17,24
 47:13 52:22 57:23 58:8,9
Council's (2) 4:19 10:15
Counsel (1) 18:16
countries (1) 31:25
country (3) 6:14 79:18 81:18
COUNTY (1) 102:5
couple (5) 32:20 58:20 70:4 73:16
 93:11
courage (1) 36:25
course (1) 14:7
court (3) 43:6 53:16 59:4
courts (1) 52:3
cover (3) 13:19 14:2 69:4
crazy (2) 88:25 91:10
create (1) 30:24
creative (1) 55:11
Crespo's (1) 12:22
crew (1) 94:25
crime (2) 21:2 65:8
crimes (1) 24:20
critical (1) 21:17
cross (1) 47:18
crowd (1) 24:1
crucial (1) 33:11
Cruz (5) 12:23,24 13:2,3,4
cry (1) 95:15
culture (2) 56:23 83:2
cultures (1) 32:1
curfew (1) 32:4
curfews (2) 36:13,18
curious (1) 50:17
current (2) 7:8 41:11
currently (2) 7:7 55:16
curriculum (1) 26:1
cut (1) 91:8

D

DA (2) 98:25 99:9
DA's (2) 13:7 98:9
dad (2) 31:5 92:8
daily (2) 64:6 98:12
dangerous (1) 89:9
Darce (25) 1:16 3:16 4:23,24 8:24
 9:24 10:1 11:12,24 29:14 34:3
 46:21,24 48:18,21 50:22 67:5
 68:20 69:1 83:18,20 91:18 101:7
 101:11,22

dark (1) 22:22
data (3) 2:12 18:18 22:25
date (1) 63:18
Davie (81) 1:15 3:6 4:2,5,22 5:9
 11:23 12:4,6,13,25 13:3,5,11
 14:5,22 18:9 23:15 26:13 27:3,11
 30:5 32:10 35:1 36:11 37:9 38:22
 40:11,14,18,21 41:1,7 43:15
 44:18 46:1,17,19 51:16 52:11,23
 53:3 57:14 58:13 61:22,25 62:4
 66:5 67:25 68:19,21,25 70:19
 72:15 74:17,25 75:5,16,22 83:1
 83:19 85:6,15 86:6 90:25 91:13
 94:10 96:3,9,16 97:5,12 99:11,21
 100:1,6,9,17,21 101:15,23
day (14) 15:4 25:19 42:7 52:18
 57:7 60:5 79:22,23 81:6 87:2
 93:18 97:22 98:7 102:21
days (1) 18:5
de (6) 4:13 12:23,24 13:2,3,4
de-escalated (1) 84:4
de-escalation (1) 83:23
dead (3) 71:16 75:13,14
deaf (2) 73:23 84:21
deal (10) 22:5 38:13 39:16 40:2
 71:9 73:13,15 74:9,12 99:19
dealing (6) 72:6 73:22 74:3 77:19
 78:3 81:18
dealt (3) 48:2 81:14 84:19
debating (1) 32:13
decided (1) 45:17
deciding (1) 55:8
decision (1) 58:6
decision-making (1) 57:11
decisions (1) 7:18
deeply (2) 80:5,5
deescalate (1) 42:4
defend (1) 91:11
Defenders (2) 53:8,12
defending (2) 87:15,19
defense (1) 53:13
definitely (4) 23:6 27:24 78:2,8
delay (1) 9:13
demographics (2) 18:24,25
denied (1) 67:10
department (18) 20:20 28:23
 34:14 41:12,25 73:2 74:8 75:10
 77:6,11,18 78:3,12 79:2 83:22
 84:13 85:3 99:19
department's (1) 30:1
depends (1) 28:18
Deputy (3) 13:18,21 41:3
descent (1) 62:15
deserve (1) 9:23
designated (1) 15:18
designee (3) 4:20 5:2 14:13
destroyed (1) 63:23
determine (2) 16:2 35:24

deterrence (1) 20:24
detrimental (1) 56:14
develop (2) 34:14 59:8
developed (1) 41:17
development (5) 26:1 41:10 54:8
 82:9,12
developments (2) 14:2 59:7
devices (1) 33:25
diagnosis (1) 70:4
dialogue (1) 60:25
diary (2) 98:22 100:15
dichotomous (1) 60:8
died (1) 64:7
difference (1) 34:12
different (8) 32:20 39:5 51:2,13
 67:22 74:1,14 88:22
differently (2) 79:21 84:25
difficult (2) 74:16 86:3
dinner (1) 97:7
directed (1) 11:9
directly (2) 17:23 54:13
director (19) 1:16 2:10 3:16 4:24
 8:17,24 9:24 10:9 15:5 23:23
 27:18 41:3,12 42:6 45:20 48:22
 49:7 53:7 82:2
director's (1) 49:1
directors (2) 25:8 42:3
dirt (2) 81:21,21
disabilities (2) 73:17 77:20
disability (2) 16:23 72:7
disappointed (1) 56:9
disciplinary (1) 7:14
discipline (4) 7:19 19:21 58:7,11
discourteous (1) 16:18
discourtesy (2) 16:17 66:14
discriminated (1) 67:12
discuss (4) 43:19 56:7 61:3 75:17
discussion (2) 5:25 25:9
discussion (1) 32:16
dispositions (1) 34:7
disseminate (1) 28:21
distributed (1) 21:10
distrust (2) 30:25 42:13
dive (1) 32:15
diverse (1) 79:14
diversity (2) 49:13,14
divided (1) 19:8
dizzy (1) 99:3
document (1) 5:16
documents (2) 20:19 63:4
doing (24) 6:20 21:16 24:17 25:14
 26:18 27:19,20,21 28:15 31:6
 32:7 37:7 52:5 54:14 56:13,21
 73:2 78:20 86:5 88:8,17 89:6
 90:9 93:15
dollars (4) 6:16,18,18,23
doors (1) 54:21
double-edged (1) 93:16

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

dress (1) 90:7
driver (1) 63:17
driving (1) 64:21
drop (1) 98:8
drove (1) 45:15
duplicated (1) 29:11
duty (3) 7:3 20:21 101:3
DVD/CD/wav (1) 102:12

E

earlier (3) 10:5 29:17 73:3
early (2) 33:1 60:22
Eason (5) 3:10 4:14,15 12:5,11
East (6) 1:9 41:11 43:17 44:20
 45:20 52:7
easy (1) 8:12
Eckie (1) 48:25
Eddie (1) 10:5
educating (1) 29:6
education (4) 38:8 53:21 60:17,25
educational (1) 60:20
Edward (6) 94:21,22 96:6,11,17
 97:9
effect (2) 10:17 17:1
effective (6) 8:15 33:3,13,22 34:6
 59:16
effectively (1) 7:11
efficacy (1) 59:8
efficiently (1) 7:10
effort (4) 9:9 43:23 44:3,15
efforts (1) 83:4
either (3) 32:18 40:5 67:16
elected (1) 50:8
electricity (1) 14:16
elements (2) 29:23 83:16
elephant (1) 57:3
em (1) 76:17
email (2) 18:2 69:13
emails (2) 69:14,16
employment (1) 40:6
empowered (2) 16:11,16
enabled (1) 16:1
enact (1) 58:10
encounter (1) 73:19
encountered (3) 24:14 82:14,19
encountering (1) 84:20
encounters (2) 17:3 31:13
encourage (6) 50:7 57:22 58:8
 60:16 68:15 100:14
encouraging (1) 48:4
engage (5) 29:18 36:16 60:7 66:13
 91:3
engaged (4) 20:7 47:2 56:18,20
engagement (6) 36:13 53:8,19
 60:1 61:4,6
engagements (1) 69:19
engaging (3) 59:24 61:18 66:8
English (1) 78:1

enjoyed (1) 51:12
ensure (4) 11:18 33:12 42:15
 84:18
entertain (1) 101:17
entire (1) 78:2
entitled (1) 91:22
entry (1) 16:7
environment (1) 88:11
especially (4) 25:16 34:8 62:22
 63:1
Esq (5) 1:16 3:9,11,16 58:5
established (1) 32:3
ethnicities (1) 32:1
ethnicity (1) 16:22
evaluate (1) 83:25
evening (14) 4:2,12,14,18 5:6
 13:17,24 14:11 18:15 41:5,7
 43:16 53:5 75:7
event (2) 44:25 97:25
events (6) 18:7 35:15 38:6 41:22
 43:1 90:13
eventually (2) 71:20 84:2
everybody (12) 13:10 18:15 36:8
 43:16 51:11,11 80:7 85:7 90:5,16
 90:18 100:23
evidence (2) 19:17 36:9
evident (1) 42:1
eviler (1) 89:18
exacerbated (1) 60:12
exact (2) 54:15 93:4
Exactly (1) 79:24
examine (1) 31:20
examining (1) 34:20
example (2) 7:12 32:1
excellent (1) 40:12
excessive (1) 16:3
exchanging (1) 59:24
excited (1) 21:13
Excuse (1) 95:3
executive (10) 1:16 2:10,17 3:16
 4:24 8:24 9:24 101:18,20,24
exists (1) 21:8
exonerate (2) 19:13 55:7
exonerated (1) 19:25
expect (1) 76:16
expected (1) 32:24
expecting (1) 85:2
experience (5) 28:3 31:17 50:17
 51:8,9
experienced (1) 44:24
experiences (3) 21:18 43:13 51:14
experiencing (1) 66:18
explain (1) 60:22
exposing (1) 24:23
express (2) 63:6 92:14
expressive (1) 71:1
extended (1) 14:18
extent (1) 29:9

extraordinarily (1) 70:24
extremely (1) 33:10
eyes (3) 47:19 96:13,18

F

F (2) 3:8 15:24
F-A-D-O (1) 15:24
fabulous (1) 100:15
face (3) 87:23,25 88:3
faced (1) 64:16
facing (1) 85:3
fact (1) 64:20
FADO (3) 15:23 19:8 68:15
fails (1) 42:12
fair (3) 9:6,20 64:5
fairness (2) 11:19 36:10
fairs (1) 18:5
faith (2) 87:12 88:23
fall (2) 15:22 42:1
falls (1) 68:14
false (1) 36:7
falsely (1) 72:8
families (1) 41:23
family (12) 9:15,17,21 18:5 25:19
 63:20 64:6,9,15 66:17 79:5 92:1
far (3) 34:8 37:21 70:8
father (1) 45:1
fault (1) 49:8
favor (2) 12:9 101:20
fear (6) 54:11 63:3 64:21 91:20
 99:16 100:5
feared (1) 98:1
February (4) 16:10 21:23 45:22
 97:19
federal (1) 34:20
feel (28) 10:21 18:2 28:3 31:14,16
 39:9,11,11 42:22 43:20,21 44:2,6
 44:11 45:10 51:4,7 56:4,20 67:7
 67:9,12 68:5 82:17 86:20,22,24
 93:25
Felder (6) 94:21,22 96:6,11,17
 97:9
felony (1) 21:2
felt (2) 6:14 31:7
FEMALE (7) 97:17 99:15,22 100:4
 100:7,10,19
fight (7) 88:1 92:4,24,25 93:19,22
 93:25
fighting (1) 52:19
figure (4) 20:20,22 68:16,17
figuring (1) 57:8
file (11) 10:23 17:20,22,24 22:13
 28:1 42:16 50:14 68:11,18
 102:12
filed (2) 11:8 42:6
fill (1) 54:22
final (1) 16:19
finally (6) 17:25 20:4 21:11 22:17

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

<p>22:23 56:6 financial (1) 35:17 find (2) 24:11 33:25 finished (2) 97:10,11 fire (1) 76:6 fired (1) 76:4 first (14) 23:22 25:2 27:15 28:14 30:13 35:3 46:5 50:11 51:19 56:3 58:16 62:6 73:7 97:22 five (6) 9:14 15:17,18 47:22,22 53:20 fix (5) 44:9 49:9 51:3 84:11 97:17 fixed (1) 43:20 flag (1) 23:1 focus (3) 19:2 24:19 59:8 focused (1) 23:3 folks (4) 48:10 54:1,24 55:7 follow (7) 11:7 18:7 29:9 32:15 42:12 49:2 90:5 followed (1) 89:11 footage (2) 33:6 35:10 forbid (1) 39:18 force (5) 15:24,24 16:3 83:22,25 forced (1) 90:2 foregoing (1) 102:11 foremost (1) 51:19 former (1) 96:9 forth (1) 65:11 forum (1) 45:21 forward (2) 9:11 25:12 forward-facing (1) 60:4 foster (1) 30:16 found (2) 43:25 69:17 four (8) 11:21 15:21 25:3,6,7 45:5 66:15 88:7 fraction (1) 6:21 frankly (1) 49:14 Fred (2) 4:4 18:14 Freddy (3) 37:10,13,21 FREDERICK (80) 1:15 3:6 4:2,22 5:9 11:23 12:4,6,13,25 13:3,5,11 14:5,22 18:9 23:15 26:13 27:3,11 30:5 32:10 35:1 36:11 37:9 38:22 40:11,14,18,21 41:1,7 43:15 44:18 46:1,17,19 51:16 52:11,23 53:3 57:14 58:13 61:22,25 62:4 66:5 67:25 68:19,21,25 70:19 72:15 74:17,25 75:5,16,22 83:1 83:19 85:6,15 86:6 90:25 91:13 94:10 96:3,9,16 97:5,12 99:11,21 100:1,6,9,17,21 101:15,23 free (3) 18:2 39:21 68:5 friends (5) 44:11 45:1,7 46:4 66:17 frightens (2) 71:10,25 frisk (1) 45:18 front (1) 99:24 frustrations (1) 91:2 full (2) 15:16 29:9</p>	<p>fuller (1) 32:16 fully (2) 19:5,12 fundamental (1) 81:13 funded (2) 55:20,22 funding (2) 55:18,19 further (1) 102:15 future (4) 24:21 28:17 31:20 48:13</p> <hr/> <p align="center">G</p> <hr/> <p>Garner (2) 9:15,21 Garner's (1) 9:16 general (2) 24:9 68:11 generally (3) 33:6 47:7 72:18 gentleman (1) 69:14 gentlemen (1) 82:16 gesture (1) 16:18 getting (11) 21:5 49:3,9,12 77:18 77:21 86:2 87:15,16 89:12,25 gifts (1) 25:17 girls (6) 95:9,20 96:23,24,25 97:6 give (21) 5:13 9:23 11:19 17:4,6,8 18:17 24:16 25:17 27:12 37:5 38:7 46:7 49:1,4 52:13 53:23 58:20 63:15 95:18,18 given (1) 10:22 gives (3) 21:9 48:12,13 giving (1) 58:10 glad (2) 14:23 27:20 go (51) 4:10 8:10,11 11:1 15:7 17:21 18:3 23:18,20 26:15 30:3,8 31:5 32:19 37:4 47:11,24 52:7,24 53:1 57:25 58:3,15,17 61:14 62:1 63:5,7,24 65:10 66:23 67:17 71:4 71:8 73:6,25 81:9 83:10 84:14 85:8 86:23 87:5,11 88:5 92:7 97:7 98:12,12 99:23 100:22 101:12 God (3) 39:18 71:22 96:22 God's (1) 76:5 goes (6) 5:12 34:6 35:14 91:5 98:22 100:16 going (93) 8:10,18,19 11:4,24 12:18,19 13:7,13 14:9,15 18:12 19:3 23:18 24:3,20 25:10 26:14 27:11 29:5 32:13,14 36:20 38:18 46:20,22,24 48:10 49:9 50:1,2,6 52:2 54:3,18 59:1 69:4,19 70:18 71:6,7,10,12,14 72:16,24 74:20 77:23 78:4,5,6,7 79:11,23 80:19 80:20 82:15 83:7 84:9 85:23,24 86:23,23 87:13,20,21,24 88:1,2 88:14 89:2,3,4,14 90:1,2,5 92:23 93:9,10,25 94:1,2,12 95:3,4 96:8 96:22 97:3 99:13,17 100:22,24 golden (4) 96:23,24,25 97:6 good (40) 4:2,11,11,14,17,25 5:6,9 6:20,20 13:17,24 14:11 18:15 20:9 29:7 33:9 37:6 39:3 40:23</p>	<p>41:5,7 43:16 44:19 46:2 51:9,10 51:10 52:15,16 53:5 56:13,14 75:7 88:13,17 89:16 90:22 95:11 97:18 govern (1) 5:17 governance (1) 5:22 governmental (1) 56:12 grandson (3) 85:22 96:16,17 grappling (1) 85:4 grateful (2) 35:5 52:20 gratitude (1) 92:14 gray (1) 48:8 great (11) 20:14 32:3,5 37:3 38:2 40:11,12 41:17 75:22 80:6,16 green (1) 22:22 grew (2) 79:3,4 Grip (3) 37:12,16 40:7 gritty (1) 89:18 ground (2) 21:7 31:17 group (5) 5:17,18 39:1 43:22 45:13 groups (2) 2:13 34:21 grown (1) 35:9 guardian (1) 22:15 guidelines (3) 20:2 32:23 83:23 gun (6) 75:13,14,25 76:11,13 77:3 guns (2) 75:11 76:17 guys (9) 11:15 25:23 26:11,19 43:14,25 44:1 52:9 61:3</p> <hr/> <p align="center">H</p> <hr/> <p>hair (1) 48:8 half-assed (1) 89:12 Hall (1) 8:2 hand (2) 68:7 102:21 handled (1) 44:16 hands (2) 70:7 89:4 hang (1) 96:23 happen (6) 36:5 45:24 48:14 56:8 61:10 72:11 happened (6) 35:20 69:13,17 71:22 83:21 87:8 happening (5) 24:20 57:1 61:11 72:4,10 happens (7) 49:4 56:15 77:11,12 77:12 87:6 98:14 happy (3) 34:23 61:10 66:9 harassed (2) 38:17 98:20 harassing (2) 38:11 98:6 harassment (1) 16:12 hard (2) 47:4 57:16 Harya (9) 18:13,14,15 23:13,16 36:18 68:1,2,20 hassle (1) 39:22 Hate (1) 37:5 haunt (1) 87:1 Haven (1) 41:16 he-- (1) 96:2 headphones (1) 70:7</p>
--	---	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

<p>hear (10) 8:19 13:15 21:15 29:10 34:24 42:25 70:10,11 91:21 99:1 heard (7) 9:1 28:19 43:24 45:19 51:2 73:3 91:19 hearing (2) 12:8 50:3 hearing-impaired (1) 73:20 held (3) 7:24 21:24 71:21 Hello (7) 5:3 13:10 15:2 30:9 68:24 94:21 101:2 help (16) 33:20 37:8 39:23 40:1,3,4 40:5,6 44:3 63:21,24 68:17 99:23 99:25,25 100:3 helpful (2) 33:7 34:1 helping (1) 59:10 helps (2) 28:4,5 here-- (1) 79:9 hereunto (1) 102:20 hey (2) 54:14 87:8 hi (10) 4:17 13:11,17,21 52:16 59:2 62:6 68:2,25 69:1 high (2) 21:4 30:11 high-risk (3) 38:4,13 40:4 higher (1) 21:19 highest (1) 72:22 highlight (1) 60:3 highlighted (1) 27:18 hinders (1) 49:23 hired (1) 49:11 hiring (1) 42:20 historic (3) 79:21 80:5 81:13 historically (1) 42:10 histories (1) 7:14 history (4) 80:3,4 83:14,17 hit (1) 59:15 hold (3) 6:5 44:3 47:6 holistic (1) 53:13 home (13) 17:13 39:22,25 40:5 61:14,17 66:21 70:24 81:9 91:21 92:1,8 97:7 honest (8) 24:7 57:2 76:5 79:19 80:6 81:16,19 86:14 honestly (1) 43:25 hope (5) 7:22 33:23 43:10 48:13 48:14 hopeful (1) 101:11 hopefully (1) 47:14 hoping (1) 29:4 horrible (1) 31:9 hospital (1) 16:9 hostage (1) 65:10 hotline (1) 11:1 hounding (1) 47:12 hour (2) 31:23 91:16 House (3) 41:12 44:21 45:20 household (1) 47:23 housekeeping (1) 11:25 Houses (7) 10:3 14:4 25:4,4,5,5 52:7</p>	<p>housing (6) 13:19 14:2 25:3 43:18 54:7 94:24 hugs (1) 95:18 human (1) 90:3 humane (1) 84:19 humanity (1) 94:2 humans (1) 65:6 hurt (1) 87:21</p> <hr/> <p align="center">I</p> <hr/> <p>I-- (1) 83:18 Ibrahim (3) 44:19,20 50:10 ICE (1) 16:8 ID (2) 69:4 71:7 idea (3) 21:9 38:2 52:2 ideas (2) 22:10 30:16 identify (2) 20:6 26:16 identifying (1) 20:9 imbalance (1) 80:4 Immigrants' (4) 62:10,17 63:10 64:17 immigration (2) 67:8 68:4 impacted (1) 42:21 impactful (1) 59:17 imperative (1) 55:18 impetus (1) 50:5 important (13) 6:2,15 8:5 28:17 29:22 33:8,10 45:22 48:3,17 50:9 53:11,25 importantly (1) 57:9 imprisoned (1) 71:17 improper (3) 16:6,6,7 improve (4) 5:21 29:16 72:19 82:25 improvement (1) 19:1 inappropriate (3) 16:13,14 66:19 inappropriately (1) 16:21 incarcerated (1) 38:14 include (1) 16:18 included (1) 17:10 includes (4) 16:6,7,13,14 including (1) 14:3 increase (2) 29:20 83:6 independence (2) 29:20 30:3 independent (7) 15:10 30:2 55:5 55:21 57:16,20 70:24 independently (1) 55:22 indications (1) 33:1 INDISCERNIBLE (18) 32:11 53:2 75:4 76:15 78:19 80:18 82:18,21 82:23 85:16 86:8,9 97:8 98:2,23 99:10 100:10,20 individual (7) 23:20 39:2,3,24 40:2 65:9,10 individuals (4) 38:4,13 42:16 44:8 inform (1) 17:14 information (12) 11:3 16:25 17:22 28:21 35:21 36:22 42:8 49:2,3,21</p>	<p>49:24 59:25 informed (2) 7:18 20:4 infrastructure (1) 59:11 inhibit (1) 32:8 initiative (1) 61:5 Innovation (1) 59:4 innovative (1) 55:12 innuendos (1) 16:14 Inspector (2) 13:18,22 inspiration (1) 31:25 instances (1) 11:5 instant (1) 54:15 institution (1) 35:18 instrument (1) 33:19 intellect (1) 93:22 intellectual (1) 72:6 Intentional (1) 59:20 interaction (8) 15:25 16:2 17:5 20:11 21:5 54:18 68:13 71:5 interactions (4) 21:12,25 22:6 72:20 interested (2) 23:8 102:17 Intergovernmental (2) 8:18 15:6 internal (1) 59:11 interruption (1) 37:15 introduce (5) 4:8 12:21 13:14 14:10 52:14 introduced (1) 15:16 investigate (12) 15:20 16:1,4,11 16:16 33:4 50:16 66:25,25 67:17 67:19 91:6 investigated (2) 19:5,12 investigating (2) 15:12 18:21 investigation (2) 42:9,19 investigative (1) 35:14 Investigator (2) 48:25 50:13 investigators (3) 10:25 11:9 68:6 invited (1) 82:2 involved (4) 42:20 49:10 84:3,4 irrespective (1) 33:23 is-- (1) 37:17 Island (2) 5:8 8:3 issue (8) 6:3 10:19 31:19 32:14 38:9 79:21 97:20 99:20 issues (21) 8:5 22:9 23:2,9 25:10 30:21 39:25 46:23 47:25 48:20 49:20 50:25 56:7,25 59:13 66:13 74:13 78:7 81:13,18 84:19 it'll (1) 17:18 item (1) 14:24</p> <hr/> <p align="center">J</p> <hr/> <p>Jacques (1) 37:17 Jafar (3) 46:2,3,18 Jahai (1) 52:5 Jahi (1) 11:16 jail (2) 86:23 87:11 James (3) 13:24,25 25:4</p>
--	--	---

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

Japan (1) 32:2
jaw (1) 98:7
Jennings (2) 97:15,16
jeopardy (1) 80:23
job (14) 6:20,21,22 8:15 24:18
 39:18 42:23 43:3 44:25 86:12
 87:1,11 94:4,5
John (24) 3:9 4:11,12 13:10,17,18
 16:23 34:2 35:3 37:1 67:4 68:9
 73:11 76:2,14,18 78:10,20 79:8
 81:24 82:2,10,24 85:19
joined (3) 5:10 14:8 52:12
joining (1) 10:7
Jonathan (21) 1:16 3:16 4:23,23
 8:24 9:25 10:1 11:12 29:14 34:3
 48:21 50:22 67:5 68:20 69:1
 83:18,20 91:18 101:7,11,22
Jose (3) 59:1,2,3
Joseph (15) 3:7,12 5:6,7 14:11,12
 85:12,14,17,21 86:7 101:1,2,10
 101:14
Joyce (14) 13:21,22 76:22 77:1
 78:22 79:15,24 80:19,24 81:4,23
 82:1,8,11
judged (1) 89:10
July (1) 101:13
jump (3) 27:13 95:9,19
June (1) 101:12
jurisdiction (5) 15:8,22 48:1 66:16
 75:17
justification (1) 17:16
Justin (9) 85:10,10 86:8,9 90:25
 91:7,13 92:11 94:10

K

Karr (1) 9:16
Kathleen (3) 1:19 102:7,24
keep (9) 31:21 32:5 41:1 62:23
 82:19 83:7 91:1,2 100:1
Keilty (3) 1:19 102:7,24
key (1) 27:18
kids (11) 39:1 45:14,17 77:19
 89:21,22 95:8,13,13,16,17
kill (7) 75:11,24,25 76:17,23 77:9
 97:3
killed (2) 71:20 81:7
Killing (1) 97:25
kind (9) 52:9 59:13,14 60:6 64:9,12
 65:9 74:4 92:15
kinds (2) 77:19 81:18
knew (3) 39:13 88:8 96:21
knife (1) 75:25
know (94) 5:15 6:1 8:25 10:16,17
 10:23 11:13 15:4 16:23 17:1,11
 18:1,1 19:3,16,23 20:10,13,15,18
 21:6,8 22:12 23:8 24:17 25:22,25
 31:3,7 32:2 37:24 38:1 42:17
 43:1,9 45:24 46:9,11 47:9,10,20

50:8,14 53:23 54:17,24 57:12
 59:22 65:3 68:14 69:6,10,22
 70:18 71:5,11,12,13,14,25 73:23
 74:2,4,11 75:21,24 76:23 77:9,11
 77:14,24 79:7 81:7,8,8,11 82:15
 83:10 86:3 87:9,25 88:7,13,20,21
 90:19 92:18 95:21,21 96:20,21
 97:18 100:12,13
knowing (1) 88:22
knowledge (3) 28:19 46:8,12
knows (2) 17:19 69:5

L

la (5) 12:23,24 13:2,3,4
lady (3) 77:15 85:18 96:14
language (5) 16:20,20 67:13 71:1
 71:2
languages (1) 68:7
large (1) 16:5
Larry (1) 100:10
Lastly (1) 42:22
late (2) 31:23 52:20
Latino (1) 45:17
Latinos (1) 45:2
Laughter (1) 96:5
launched (1) 25:2
law (3) 49:22,23 50:1
laws (1) 90:4
lawyer (2) 39:21,21
leaders (2) 42:21 63:1
leadership (1) 83:15
leads (2) 36:9 92:17
lean (1) 99:3
learn (1) 29:12
leave (5) 17:18 66:21 70:11 71:11
 75:12
left (1) 48:8
legal (4) 9:19 17:16 39:19 57:6
legislative (2) 50:2,10
Lehman (1) 7:25
lessons (1) 29:13
let's (2) 55:8 80:17
letters (4) 98:12,19,21 99:17
letting (4) 21:7 37:23 42:17 43:9
level (1) 31:13
leverage (1) 59:10
Liberia (1) 62:15
lie (1) 98:21
life (6) 65:13 70:9 80:22 98:1 99:16
 100:5
liked (1) 51:10
likes (1) 25:19
limit (2) 11:20 58:25
Lindsay (5) 3:10 4:14,15 12:5,11
line (1) 55:23
link (1) 23:5
Linton (1) 99:1
list (12) 23:21,22 37:10 41:2 58:17

58:18 61:23 68:21 85:8,10 97:15
 98:21
Listen (2) 77:11 82:13
listens (1) 90:16
literally (3) 54:25 64:24 81:20
little (22) 11:25 14:18,19 15:7
 21:19 32:20 38:20 53:24 58:22
 69:24 70:14 86:4 89:21,24,25
 95:5,9,14,17,20 96:13,18
live (7) 50:4 62:16 75:8 79:2,13
 92:21 93:24
lives (1) 39:17
lobby (1) 35:16
local (1) 59:12
located (1) 44:21
lodged (1) 29:8
long (7) 26:7 47:11 71:21 73:5
 95:4,4 98:21
longer (2) 14:18 83:25
look (16) 18:22,23 36:5 39:3 47:18
 64:6 81:2 84:2 89:10 90:7,21
 95:2,22 96:24 97:1,2
looked (1) 45:15
looking (5) 21:23 34:19 56:10
 80:12 96:1
looks (5) 17:17 18:18 35:15 96:3,6
lose (1) 87:11
lot (29) 7:6 18:1 21:5 25:15 30:24
 31:23,25 32:5 35:11,19 36:3 37:8
 38:12 39:9 40:2,3 42:25 46:8
 47:3 48:8 50:23 54:23 63:6 68:9
 69:15 71:8 74:6 80:1 96:19
lots (1) 14:18
love (6) 24:2 26:20 36:16 52:2,7
 95:16
loved (1) 51:12
lucky (1) 82:20
Lugo (3) 26:18,19 27:6

M

M-A-R-D (1) 94:15
ma'am (1) 77:17
mad (2) 87:14 94:6
maim (2) 75:12,15
major (6) 5:24 26:24 38:9 40:8
 41:14 70:1
making (7) 6:23 8:7 54:22 55:11
 82:4 92:3,16
male (4) 50:21,23 51:8 70:2
males (1) 72:21
Mama (1) 52:18
man (13) 64:5 70:12,14,16,16
 71:19 87:22 88:25 91:22 92:4
 96:11 98:8,11
manhandle (2) 90:1 93:9
Manhattan (1) 14:14
manner (1) 93:1
map (1) 21:3

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

Marbre (4) 3:13 52:15,21 58:5
marched (1) 99:10
Marco (1) 12:22
Marcos (4) 26:18,19 27:6 28:18
Markert (2) 13:24,25
marriage (1) 102:17
Matt (1) 67:16
matter (2) 31:15 102:18
Matthew (2) 11:10,11
Matthews- (1) 68:22
mayor (2) 4:13 15:18
Mayor's (2) 47:12 59:5
McDonald's (1) 43:7
mean (9) 19:15 63:22 64:22 65:3
 88:4 91:7 93:19,20 96:15
means (8) 6:2 7:4 17:2 19:16 20:2
 20:24 73:25 88:7
media (2) 59:23 72:10
mediating (2) 15:11 18:21
meet (3) 42:24 69:23 86:10
meeting (17) 1:5 2:4 4:4 5:12,25
 12:2 14:7 25:3 43:4 47:6 69:12
 69:18,20 74:7 99:14 101:6,12
meetings (9) 7:23 8:4,10 47:5 69:9
 73:16 83:14 91:1,15
member (9) 3:7,8,9,10,11,12,13
 12:22 84:3
members (25) 3:4 5:11 9:7,9 10:15
 10:19 12:17,20 14:9 15:15,17
 30:6 40:15,19,20 41:15 42:5,20
 46:22 49:10,12,15 52:13,25
 66:19
men (1) 72:23
Menepelle (4) 62:2,3,5,9
mentees (1) 10:13
mention (1) 5:22
mentioned (4) 16:24 41:8 49:17
 54:3
merits (1) 34:8
message (3) 22:11 63:14 90:17
met (3) 10:4 98:16,17
Michael (7) 3:11 4:17,18 12:3,12
 27:13,14
mightier (1) 93:23
mike (5) 13:15 26:16 38:23 75:1
 94:19
miles (1) 73:6
million (3) 6:18,22 73:6
mind (2) 63:22 87:12
mindful (1) 61:16
mindng (1) 45:3
mine (1) 90:12
minute (1) 91:8
minutes (9) 2:8 11:21 12:1,8,15
 58:20,22 88:3,6
miscommunication (1) 74:5
misconduct (11) 7:20 11:6,7 15:14
 15:21 19:18,23 36:2 50:15,15

67:19
mistake (1) 92:5
misunderstanding (1) 74:5
misuse (1) 33:19
Mitchell (2) 30:9,11
Mm-hmm (1) 100:9
moderated (1) 22:2
mom (2) 31:5 92:8
Monday (1) 9:2
money (1) 47:13
monitor (1) 34:21
Monroe (1) 25:4
month (5) 47:6 54:21 98:23,24
 101:3
months (3) 63:16 73:16 98:5
morally (1) 92:7
morning (1) 9:3
mother (1) 9:16
Mother's (1) 52:18
motion (6) 12:1,2,10,14 101:17,19
motioned (1) 12:3
Mott (1) 41:16
move (3) 12:15 14:23 90:7
movement (1) 55:20
movie (1) 37:5
moving (2) 25:12 82:20
MP3 (1) 102:12
MTA (1) 98:19

N

name (30) 4:15,18 5:1,6 14:12 15:4
 18:15 20:13 23:13 26:19 30:10
 37:16,18 39:2 41:9 43:17 44:19
 46:2 47:23 52:21 53:6 59:2 62:9
 69:6 71:25 75:8 85:11 86:8 94:21
 96:1
named (1) 74:22
names (2) 12:18 94:13
Nathan (10) 3:7 5:6,7 85:12,14,17
 85:21 101:2,10,14
nature (1) 90:3
NCO (9) 24:4,5,12 25:13,20 26:8
 27:9 29:3 78:14
NCOs (3) 24:23 25:23 78:23
necessarily (2) 22:14 67:1
Neck (1) 79:17
need (25) 20:13 21:7,9 22:5,14
 34:15,16,16 43:2,20 44:5,8,9
 47:1,16,20 48:9 56:18 57:15
 60:21 69:23 81:13 95:12,12,19
needed (2) 27:25 28:17
needs (9) 29:8 42:15,19,22 43:2
 44:10 45:10 75:21,24
negative (5) 24:10 26:23 28:3,9
 32:7
neighborhood (7) 14:1 41:19
 44:12 59:5 73:4 78:14 95:7
neighborhoods (5) 27:23 48:15

60:19 61:17,20
neighbors (1) 14:19
nephew (1) 96:15
nephews (1) 79:5
nerve (1) 59:14
nervous (3) 46:10 93:6 95:15
neurotypical (2) 70:3 72:5
neutral (2) 15:14 55:6
never (11) 32:16 35:4 43:24 45:19
 69:10 76:3 77:3,4 80:9,10 88:6
new (28) 1:10 2:16 5:15 6:4,6,15
 9:18,22 12:21 19:7,11 21:20
 34:19 47:23 54:7 59:7 62:11
 63:17 66:11 69:3 72:10 77:12
 91:8,16 100:25 102:3,5,9
news (2) 36:1 72:4
nice (4) 82:17 94:25 98:8,11
nicest (1) 82:16
niece (1) 96:14
night (4) 5:12 7:25 8:1 48:6
Norma (1) 10:4
Normally (1) 49:4
Notary (1) 102:8
note (1) 37:2
Notice (1) 54:20
nowadays (1) 59:23
Nuhann (6) 62:2,3,3,4,5,9
number (6) 13:6 17:18 21:20 41:22
 49:5 72:22
NYC.gov/CCRB youth summit (1)
 23:12
NYC.gov/RTKA (1) 11:3
NYCHA (2) 14:14,15
NYPD (21) 6:5,10,16 7:2,5,7 8:8
 10:19 12:18,20 13:13 15:10 30:4
 30:19 33:12,14,16 60:9 66:20
 83:5,16
NYPD's (2) 6:12 57:21

O

obligation (1) 91:25
obvious (1) 35:22
occur (5) 19:19,24 20:1,1,3
occurred (1) 64:7
October (2) 10:18 17:1
offenses (1) 31:13
offensive (1) 16:20
offer (5) 42:14 44:23 61:2,21 66:12
offering (1) 39:17
office (5) 12:22 13:7 47:12 66:22
 98:9
officer (27) 9:1 15:25 16:8 17:11
 19:14 20:5,7,12,14,16,18,23
 34:11 36:2,4 39:15 45:11 54:13
 65:12 70:15 74:2 75:19 77:2
 78:23 84:3 91:4 93:10
officers (40) 7:14 13:13 17:3,4
 20:10 24:13 25:23 28:7 30:20

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

31:1 32:21 33:14 34:17 36:7
41:19,20 42:5 45:5 48:1 51:1,5
54:12 60:3 64:19,25 68:13 72:20
73:4,13 74:9 77:5 79:1 80:16,17
82:3,14 84:20 86:2 93:14 100:13
officials (3) 12:17,19 50:8
oh (9) 42:25 50:21,22 71:22 85:15
85:17,21 94:19 101:2
okay (14) 30:9 53:3 65:2 75:22,22
76:1 85:21 97:4 99:21 100:6,17
101:2,10,14
old (3) 2:15 95:21 100:25
older (2) 86:25 95:6
on-call (1) 38:25
once (1) 54:21
ones (1) 89:21
online (8) 8:11 11:2 17:25 22:25
49:6 57:25 66:23 67:17
open (1) 64:13
opening (2) 57:17 82:6
opinion (3) 8:5,22 43:19
opportunity (2) 11:20 33:18
opposed (2) 12:13 101:23
opt (1) 36:14
optimally (1) 8:9
Orchard (1) 70:5
order (8) 2:7 7:15,17 18:6 54:24
63:2 65:9,13
organization (5) 37:7 39:16 52:17
53:13 60:4
organizations (4) 23:18,19 38:3
59:12
organize (2) 56:3,4
organizer (2) 53:10 57:5
Organizing (1) 53:7
orientation (1) 16:22
outcome (2) 35:24 102:18
outcomes (1) 26:6
outreach (13) 2:11 8:17 11:16
14:25 15:6 27:20,21 37:11 42:23
45:23 47:2,14 72:16
outside (5) 45:3,14 55:13 57:7
87:5
over-policed (2) 56:23,24
overnight (1) 72:25
oversight (2) 33:15,23

P

paid (1) 74:15
pancakes (1) 70:25
panel (2) 95:3,22
panels (1) 22:1
Pantaleo (1) 9:2
paperwork (1) 88:6
Pardon (1) 91:7
parent (3) 22:15 71:18 84:6
park (1) 70:13
part (9) 41:14 48:6,7 59:4 60:25

72:18 78:13 81:24 88:13
participant (1) 44:20
participants (2) 10:12 38:16
participate (1) 90:15
particular (6) 22:20 24:13,22,24
25:21 78:25
particularly (7) 8:17 23:3 32:18
33:8 48:15 72:21 73:19
particulars (1) 26:8
parties (1) 102:16
partner (3) 38:3 87:18,22
partnered (1) 41:21
partners (2) 41:16 83:4
partnerships (2) 40:4 83:11
parts (3) 32:2,3,4
passed (1) 12:14
patrol (4) 13:23 30:20 32:22 77:24
Patterson (8) 37:13,17,20 39:9
40:13,17,20,25
pay (1) 66:1
peace (1) 87:12
Peguero (3) 4:25 5:1 28:24
pen (1) 93:23
people (97) 5:19 9:17,22 11:16
12:16 13:6 18:5 21:7,13,14,17,21
21:25 22:1,2,12,16 23:7 24:22,23
24:25 25:15,21 26:4,9,14 28:16
31:6,14,22 35:12 42:21 43:4,12
43:22 44:12 45:23 47:9,20,21,24
48:5,12 49:4 50:4,24 54:9,16,20
54:22 56:3,24 57:7 58:19 60:21
60:23 61:16 62:20,22 63:13 64:3
64:8,25 66:16 67:23 68:5 69:12
69:16 71:9 72:5 73:17,19,23 74:9
76:23 77:19 78:4 80:1,8,9,13
82:17 84:13,15,21,25 85:9 86:10
87:3 89:16 93:2 95:1 96:19 99:1
99:4,7 100:2
people's (1) 34:15
percentage (4) 6:9,12 29:25 57:21
percentages (1) 19:9
permission (2) 55:1,2
person (10) 17:12 56:2,17 57:23
58:16 75:12 87:5 89:20 92:22,23
personal (1) 44:23
personally (1) 44:24
personnel (1) 29:5
perspective (4) 24:8 26:25 27:1
34:24
perspectives (1) 26:11
pet (1) 89:3
PH (7) 11:13 26:19 30:10 37:17,18
46:3 48:25
phenomenal (2) 25:24 55:24
Philip (2) 11:13 67:16
philosophy (2) 78:14,15
phone (1) 17:18
phones (1) 35:13

physical (1) 93:20
physically (1) 91:3
pick (3) 25:23 45:11 78:25
picking (1) 78:22
piece (1) 61:2
piggyback (1) 46:3
Pineiro (5) 53:2,5,6 61:23,24
pipeline (1) 48:10
place (5) 33:13 47:24 56:3,12
83:10
plainclothes (1) 45:5
plan (2) 52:5 59:5
plans (1) 30:19
play (7) 26:21 27:8 37:22 59:16
95:7,8,23
played (1) 59:25
playground (1) 70:5
playing (2) 25:18 27:16
Plaza (1) 84:15
please (8) 11:20 12:10 26:16 27:5
43:15 53:3 72:3 101:21
pleasure (3) 36:23 86:9 90:12
pockets (1) 70:8
point (6) 33:9 35:22 48:3 69:11
91:19 99:2
points (1) 66:6
police (81) 4:16 5:4,23 6:1 7:14,20
8:7 11:6 15:13,19,25 16:8 17:3,4
17:11 19:1,20,25 20:1,7,10,11,14
20:20,22 21:4 22:5 25:23 26:24
27:2 28:7,23 30:1,25 31:6,11,18
32:8,21 36:6 38:9 42:5 44:6
46:14,15 48:1,16 50:25 51:5
54:12,13 60:3 63:1 65:12 68:13
72:20 73:2,13 74:1,7 75:10 77:5
77:6,10 78:2 79:2 84:15 86:22
87:6 89:22,24 95:11,12,17,18,19
95:24 96:4 99:20,22 100:7
policeman (1) 88:18
policemen (1) 75:10
policing (4) 24:9 26:22 33:22 40:8
policy (3) 2:12 18:13,16
pop (1) 90:10
pops (1) 87:8
popular (1) 53:21
population (1) 21:20
port (1) 75:6
position (1) 20:17
positive (5) 21:18 26:23 27:6
41:14,18
positives (2) 24:4 27:9
possible (2) 18:3 83:24
possibly (1) 52:8
Potkay (13) 13:17,18 76:2,14,18
78:10,20 79:8 81:24 82:2,10,24
85:19
power (5) 28:19 29:20 57:11,12
58:10

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

powers (1) 57:13
practice (1) 87:2
practices (2) 33:12,13
practitioners (1) 22:3
precinct (6) 14:3 17:23 25:9 41:21
 78:24,24
Precincts (1) 13:20
preemptive (1) 59:22
preferably (1) 31:2
preponderance (1) 19:17
presence (4) 13:9 59:20,20,21
present (7) 3:4 11:10 26:17 60:5
 61:7,8,19
presentation (5) 2:11,12 14:25
 18:11 23:17
presents (1) 70:2
preserved (1) 34:22
president (5) 10:2 94:22 97:2,6,24
presidents (1) 25:7
pressured (1) 39:12
pretty (2) 19:9 34:1
prevent (1) 24:20
prevention (1) 24:19
previous (2) 69:19 91:20
prey (1) 88:12
Pringles (1) 71:4
print (1) 94:12
printout (1) 35:6
priority (1) 49:16
privacy (3) 34:13,16,16
private (1) 45:9
proactively (1) 17:6
probable (1) 89:5
probably (2) 70:25 74:1
problem (5) 64:24 74:16 78:5,6
 99:15
problems (4) 28:25 44:9 51:3
 61:14
procedures (1) 34:18
proceed (2) 9:5,15
PROCEEDING (1) 1:14
Proceedings (1) 4:1
process (7) 5:14 9:20 25:22 29:18
 29:24 30:1 36:9
profanity (1) 16:19
profession (2) 80:20,21
professionalism (1) 65:17
program (16) 10:8 24:4,5,12 25:7
 25:13,20 27:10 29:3 40:12 42:2
 43:18 44:21 45:20,21 51:25
programming (1) 26:5
programs (5) 10:13 18:4 41:4,13
 41:23
progress (1) 47:15
progressive (1) 83:15
promote (2) 83:11,12
proper (1) 60:12
properly (1) 91:23

property (2) 17:13 65:13
props (1) 24:16
prosecuting (3) 9:1 15:13 18:22
prosecution (2) 9:4,21
prosecutor (1) 96:10
prosecutors (2) 9:3,6
protect (3) 24:25 36:6 65:13
protocols (1) 34:14
proving (1) 33:21
provision (1) 57:23
provisions (1) 67:21
PSA (5) 13:18,25 22:21,23 41:20
PSA8 (3) 24:12,16 25:8
PSAs (2) 22:18,20
Psychology (1) 89:8
public (20) 1:5 2:4,14 10:15 11:4
 11:18 12:17 23:19,21 30:16,25
 38:7 47:2,8 53:1 54:7 58:3,15
 61:6 102:8
publicity (1) 59:19
pulled (1) 45:5
Puma (3) 3:12 14:11,12
pursued (1) 9:19
push (3) 6:23 7:2 21:12
pushed (1) 6:11
pushing (2) 6:8 7:20
put (8) 33:17 39:5 56:10,11 76:9
 89:3 94:12 95:4
puts (1) 58:24

Q

Queens (1) 5:2
question (15) 24:2 27:15 28:18
 29:15 30:7,18 31:16,17 38:17
 46:5 63:25 75:9 76:3 86:3 95:2
questionable (1) 55:3
questioning (1) 87:7
questions (18) 12:7 14:6 18:10
 23:14,16 26:20 27:4,13 28:11
 30:18 40:16,17 51:17 58:14
 64:16 65:6 101:5,8

R

race (2) 16:21 18:25
raised (4) 46:24 48:20 70:23 101:5
raising (1) 93:21
Ramon (3) 4:25 5:1 28:24
Ramos (3) 10:8 23:23,25
Ramsey (1) 24:16
ran (2) 70:9 78:24
random (3) 69:13,14 71:8
rarely (1) 69:9
rate (1) 21:2
reach (7) 18:2 33:5 34:7 50:7 56:19
 56:20 63:11
reaching (1) 36:19
reactive (1) 59:21
read (7) 25:17 37:4,6 69:14,16

94:13,14
readiness (1) 39:18
ready (3) 9:4 12:8 97:19
real (2) 89:7 92:5
really (38) 18:25 22:4 24:14 25:14
 25:14,25 28:20 31:23 33:8 34:9
 34:12 35:5 36:8 37:6 47:3 48:4
 48:16 49:23 50:3,12 55:10,14
 63:21 64:10 72:19 79:19 81:21
 83:13 84:24 86:11,12 90:13,19
 92:13,22 95:2,12 99:17
reason (6) 17:4 38:11 45:16 64:25
 79:8 81:25
reasons (3) 21:2,16 34:23
receive (2) 21:1 22:23
received (1) 42:7
receiving (1) 22:18
receptive (1) 71:2
recognize (3) 53:12 56:2 57:5
recommend (1) 7:19
recommendation (1) 44:24
recommendations (2) 42:14 43:11
record (2) 31:4 35:4
recorded (1) 31:15
recording (2) 32:17 33:25
records (1) 7:13
recruiter (1) 49:11
redress (1) 28:2
redressed (1) 48:2
refer (1) 19:20
referrals (1) 40:3
refers (1) 16:21
reflect (2) 49:13,14
reflections (1) 73:9
regard (3) 29:14 34:13 49:9
regarding (2) 10:16 77:18
regardless (2) 17:7 94:1
regards (4) 24:3 30:23 59:15 77:15
register (4) 8:4,13,21 58:1
regulations (1) 88:10
related (2) 73:12 102:15
relates (3) 7:19 33:2 47:25
relation (2) 7:6 8:22
relations (3) 31:19 32:8 48:16
relationship (7) 7:10 28:5,6,8,9
 41:18 60:9
relationships (2) 29:2 41:15
relatives (1) 47:17
Release (3) 37:12,16 40:7
religion (1) 16:22
reluctant (1) 86:4
relying (1) 34:9
remarks (1) 4:7
remember (1) 95:6
remembering (1) 15:23
remind (1) 58:21
renovation (1) 14:17
repeat (1) 27:5

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

<p>report (8) 2:9,10 11:7 20:12 66:20 66:21,23,24 Reporter (1) 102:7 reporting (1) 20:17 representative (2) 4:16 5:5 representatives (1) 50:5 representing (1) 5:2 request (2) 17:9,22 require (2) 7:5 83:23 requires (1) 10:18 residencies (1) 59:9 resident (1) 14:14 residents (1) 53:21 resolve (2) 25:12 29:2 resource (3) 21:8 22:16 23:7 resources (5) 21:10 22:24 52:1 68:17 74:8 respect (2) 65:17,24 respectful (1) 94:8 respective (1) 26:25 respond (4) 46:21,23,25 85:1 response (5) 42:8 71:10,12,13,15 responsibility (1) 78:17 responsible (1) 15:11 responsibly (1) 6:5 rest (4) 9:17 19:11 30:3 69:22 reverse (1) 83:13 reversing (1) 83:16 Review (2) 1:4 4:3 reviewing (1) 55:10 revise (1) 5:20 revision (10) 5:14,18 6:24 7:21,24 29:17,24 57:18,24 67:23 revisions (3) 8:14,23 12:7 riding (1) 39:1 right (82) 4:9 10:16,17,23 13:11 14:4 16:25 17:9,10,14 18:12 20:15 23:17 26:12 27:4 30:7 32:11 34:15 36:12 39:8 40:21 42:25 47:16 49:25 51:16 53:10 54:6,11,19,23 55:1,2,4,8,17,20 55:24,25 56:5,8,9,21,22 58:14,23 59:18,19,20,21,22 60:11 61:9 62:1,1,8 65:6 66:2,3 70:20,25 74:22 75:1 77:4 88:9,20,23 91:12 91:17,24 92:3,16,19 93:9 94:17 94:20,25 96:2,12 97:5,14 101:10 101:15 righteous (1) 90:24 rights (11) 10:22 38:1 39:13 46:8,9 46:12 49:22 53:23 60:23,23 88:20 righty (1) 100:22 rigorous (1) 9:20 rip (1) 91:11 Rivadeneira (6) 3:11 4:17,19 12:3 12:12 27:14 River (8) 10:3,10 14:4 23:24 25:4</p>	<p>26:3 27:22 94:23 Riverdale (1) 79:18 role (8) 26:20 27:16 28:20 33:15,16 37:22 41:11 59:17 roles (1) 27:7 roll (1) 30:19 room (8) 57:4 72:11 80:2,7,8,10,11 81:14 rope (2) 95:9,20 rough (1) 45:9 roughhouse (1) 87:17 roundtable (1) 64:14 row (1) 97:1 rules (1) 88:9 run (8) 26:7 54:16,17 88:18 95:17 96:4 99:6,7 running (1) 88:19 runs (1) 78:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p> <hr/> <p>S-A-U-N (1) 74:21 sad (1) 86:19 safe (1) 62:23 safer (1) 44:16 safety (4) 10:16 59:6 64:18 65:12 saints (1) 89:16 Sal (2) 5:3,4 SALVATORE (1) 3:8 Sandra (14) 74:24 75:3,7,8,20,23 76:12,15,20,25 78:19 79:16 80:22 82:13 sandwich (2) 87:15,17 sat (4) 63:20 85:19 97:20,21 Saunders (1) 10:4 saw (4) 27:25 45:16 63:21 97:24 saying (15) 51:22 61:9 72:1 79:7 81:2 86:19 87:9 88:24 89:20 90:11 92:13,14 93:2,17 96:22 scared (5) 39:11 70:9 79:6,6 89:23 school (1) 30:12 Sci (1) 30:11 Science (1) 10:9 screaming (1) 39:2 search (6) 10:21 16:6 17:12,15 45:12,12 searched (2) 45:4,6 seat (1) 55:14 second (7) 12:4,5 30:8 66:14 85:8 96:25 101:19 secretive (3) 43:22 49:18,19 section (1) 41:16 see (52) 18:18,25 19:4 21:3,14,18 22:19 23:2,10 24:6 27:1,16 36:18 39:1 40:15 46:22 48:4,11 49:15 52:7,11 54:8,13,20 61:10 64:8,19 64:24 65:18,18,18,19 66:6 67:3 72:9 76:10 84:2 87:5,24 88:1,17 89:5,23 95:3,14,17 96:23 98:4,14</p>	<p>99:22 100:7,15 seeing (4) 19:10 22:9 35:9,23 seeks (1) 56:12 seen (7) 24:5 26:22 27:9 36:1 41:25 93:12,14 send (1) 35:7 sending (1) 71:3 sends (1) 69:15 Senior (1) 18:16 sense (1) 83:12 separate (1) 44:7 Sergeant (2) 13:25 14:1 serious (2) 63:11 64:15 seriously (2) 49:17 83:9 serve (3) 53:13 67:18 78:12 serves (1) 36:6 service (1) 84:4 services (6) 39:18,19 40:1 43:10 67:10 68:8 serving (5) 54:2 55:17 62:17,22 64:17 session (6) 2:17 50:2,10 101:18,20 101:25 set (2) 29:24 102:20 sexual (3) 16:12,14,22 shakes (1) 95:19 share (5) 23:7 36:20 43:14 57:11 86:17 shared (1) 78:17 sharing (2) 49:21,24 sharp (1) 99:6 Shavonne (1) 97:16 sheets (1) 94:13 Sheriff (1) 52:19 shield (1) 20:13 shirt (1) 38:25 shockingly (1) 74:10 shoot (6) 75:11,12 76:16,22 77:2,8 short (1) 98:24 Shorthand (1) 102:7 shot (5) 71:16 75:14 77:3,4 81:7 should've (1) 87:10 show (2) 26:6 48:6 showed (1) 98:11 showing (1) 24:24 shows (2) 36:1 92:15 shut (1) 14:16 siblings (3) 31:1,2 33:24 side (13) 37:2 41:11 43:17 44:21 45:20 52:7 75:16,18 89:18,18,19 90:23 93:3 sides (1) 93:16 Siegel (10) 3:9 4:9,11,12 13:10 35:2,3 37:1 73:10,11 sign (3) 11:15 74:22 94:15 similar (4) 19:6 35:25 73:22 74:13 simple (1) 91:5 simply (1) 7:4</p>
---	---	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

simulator (2) 76:8,9
single (1) 57:6
sir (3) 89:1 97:12,14
sister (3) 31:8 35:4 89:25
sisters (1) 32:17
sit (5) 64:13 89:14 90:6 93:7 94:3
sitting (4) 55:13 57:10 95:25 99:5
situation (12) 39:5 42:4 73:12,12
 74:3,14 76:7,9 84:1,5,22 88:5
situations (9) 10:19 17:2,5 45:24
 51:13 73:18 74:9 83:24 92:2
six (2) 6:16,17
skills (2) 71:1,2
skin (1) 80:14
slammed (1) 45:7
sleep (1) 58:24
sliver (1) 20:5
small (3) 20:5 74:10 84:6
smart (1) 99:5
snapshot (1) 18:18
social (2) 59:8,23
society (1) 73:14
solutions (3) 22:4,10 28:25
solve (4) 31:10,24 44:10 84:10
solved (1) 44:10
somebody (5) 51:24 63:3 77:2,25
 94:15
son (13) 70:22 71:21,22 72:7 77:16
 79:16 81:1,2,6,10 85:22 91:21
 96:14
soon (1) 50:2
sophisticated (1) 93:1
sorry (16) 11:12 12:25 22:21 50:22
 50:22 51:9 52:17 58:4 62:12 68:1
 68:2 70:17 81:9 85:15,21 94:20
sort (3) 19:21 28:1 72:6
sorts (1) 23:9
Sotomayor (1) 25:5
Soundview (3) 25:5 26:1 27:21
South (1) 44:22
space (4) 10:6 47:9 57:6 66:11
spaces (4) 51:23 54:6 56:15 57:10
speak (25) 10:14 11:18,20 21:25
 26:9,15 36:25 39:24 48:5,24
 64:12,14 66:3 67:14 68:6 74:23
 75:1,19 77:5,6,7,25 78:1 94:15
 98:18
speaker (2) 30:8 97:15
speakers (2) 91:20 94:11
speaking (8) 39:10,14,15 55:4
 62:8 64:23 77:16 99:8
speaks (1) 85:17
specific (2) 11:5 87:3
spent (1) 98:7
spoke (2) 97:19 98:25
spoken (1) 94:16
spray (1) 58:23
spread (1) 18:6

sprung (1) 30:14
ss (1) 102:4
staff (11) 8:16 9:8,19 35:14 41:23
 47:3 49:12 66:10 74:11 99:12
 101:7
Stahly-Butts (4) 3:13 52:15,21
 58:5
stalking (2) 97:19 98:6
stand (5) 8:20 13:8 56:5 57:4 92:3
standard (1) 6:9
standing (3) 28:13 45:2,14
stands (1) 15:24
stared (1) 89:11
start (5) 4:9 24:22 26:3 27:15
 54:16
started (4) 4:6 24:8,10 59:1
starts (1) 73:6
state (3) 49:22 102:3,8
Staten (2) 5:8 8:3
states (1) 77:13
stating (1) 59:18
status (4) 16:23 49:6 67:8 68:4
stay (2) 40:5 99:2
stays (1) 57:25
step (6) 42:17 65:1 73:7 87:23,24
 88:2
steps (1) 73:8
Stevens (9) 41:2,5,8,9 48:20,21
 50:19 51:7 54:3
stick (1) 95:13
stop (7) 16:6 20:8 45:17 46:10
 48:17 51:14 97:25
stopped (1) 45:4
stopping (1) 64:25
stops (1) 16:13
store (1) 98:20
stores (1) 35:16
stories (1) 72:4
story (1) 44:23
straighten (1) 47:19
strategies (1) 60:1
strategy (1) 61:6
street (2) 1:9 18:5
streets (2) 31:22 32:6
strengthen (1) 28:6
stressed (1) 64:11
stressful (1) 76:7
strong (1) 21:12
strongly (1) 43:10
struck (1) 73:21
structure (1) 56:11
structured (1) 26:5
struggles (1) 86:18
struggling (1) 84:18
stuff (3) 25:15 44:10 77:20
substantiate (1) 19:13
substantiation (1) 19:16
sue (2) 54:24 55:2

suggest (1) 31:19
suggestion (1) 51:22
suit (1) 90:10
summer (1) 52:6
summit (4) 21:24 23:10 50:18,20
summons (1) 16:15
super (1) 52:20
supermarket (1) 71:4
support (2) 8:13 58:1
supported (1) 9:9
sure (29) 8:7 11:17 14:11 19:18
 21:10,12 22:12 23:7 31:11 34:17
 34:22 35:2 48:9 49:3,11 51:17
 53:3 57:23 58:4 67:6 77:23 82:4
 83:8,19 84:12,16 91:14 99:11,16
surroundings (1) 88:11
survive (1) 39:6
suspects (2) 56:16 69:8
swing (1) 70:6
sword (2) 93:17,23
system (5) 32:4 53:17 56:11 60:20
 61:12

T

T (3) 1:19 102:7,24
table (1) 38:7
tailored (1) 60:18
take (11) 11:24 16:9 31:24 32:14
 49:16 69:24 73:8 87:7 88:12 95:1
 99:24
taken (3) 21:11 83:9 87:10
takes (1) 43:10
talents (1) 87:2
talk (24) 8:16,21 22:9 23:1 26:8
 30:12,14 44:22 50:12 54:15 57:3
 57:22 58:9 66:10 67:23 70:15
 72:16 80:2 85:24 87:3 88:24 89:1
 89:13 90:8
talked (2) 19:9 44:14
talking (19) 23:11 25:9 29:3,17
 45:3 50:24 51:2,12 73:18 74:6
 79:12 80:3 81:20,22 84:14 91:20
 98:8,10 101:3
tardiness (1) 14:20
Tarekegn (3) 18:14,16 68:2
targeted (1) 67:7
Tariq (3) 43:16,17 49:17
tased (1) 42:3
taunting (1) 98:6
tax (1) 66:1
teaching (2) 26:3 77:23
team (3) 9:19 14:25 37:20
tears (2) 96:13,18
teen (3) 43:18 44:21 45:20
teens (1) 41:24
tell (15) 31:5 47:17 62:20 71:7,24
 84:10 85:25 86:12,13 87:23
 88:16 89:3,7 92:4 94:5

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

ten (1) 53:20
tenant (2) 25:6 94:23
tenants (1) 10:3
tendency (1) 33:17
tensions (1) 60:10
terms (3) 19:10 66:8 74:8
terrified (1) 70:23
territory (1) 42:25
testified (1) 10:14
thank (101) 4:22 5:9 9:6,7,8 10:1,2 10:5,11,11 11:21,23 13:11,12,20 14:5,22 15:3 18:8,12,14 23:14,15 23:17,25 26:11,13 27:14 28:14 30:5,7 32:9,10,12 34:25 36:11,24 36:24 37:1,9 40:9,13,14,22,22,25 44:17,18 45:25 46:1,17,18,19 48:17 51:16,20 52:10,11,23 57:13,14 58:2,13,13 61:22 66:4,5 67:2,25 68:19,20 72:14,15 73:9 74:17,20 76:1 83:1 85:6,21 86:1 86:5,6,6 90:25 91:17 94:10,11,24 97:5,12,13,13,13 100:17,18,21 100:22,23 101:14,15
thanks (10) 13:16 14:8,23 34:2 37:10 41:1 74:18 85:7 91:17 97:14
theirs (1) 36:22
therapeutic (2) 39:23 40:1
thing (20) 8:23 11:25 25:20 31:10 32:25 34:3 35:21 50:17 51:24 56:22 61:21 64:4,18 66:14 73:8 76:6 83:12 89:8 90:20 92:16
things (39) 7:5,9,11 18:20 23:2 24:18 25:18,19 27:19 32:5,21 34:5 35:12,25 38:20,24 39:4 43:20 50:11 60:2,14 61:4 63:4,7 64:10 67:1 68:10,11 71:8 72:9 73:21 81:17 83:21 85:25 86:14 86:24 87:1,3 94:3
think (47) 22:4,4 23:3 27:17 28:16 28:19 29:16,22 30:24 31:9,21 32:25 36:8 37:2,5,8 47:21 49:19 55:13 57:7 59:15 60:2,17,20 61:1 61:20 65:5,7,16,21,23 66:8 67:21 73:1 75:17 76:23 77:17 80:1 83:2 84:23 89:23 90:9 91:4 92:5 96:1 98:9 99:9
thought (1) 49:18
thousand (1) 53:20
threatens (3) 16:8,9,10
three (6) 15:19 24:11 35:8 69:18 88:7 99:1
thrives (1) 54:9
Throgs (1) 79:17
throw (1) 95:20
tied (3) 7:1 8:6 57:20
Tim (1) 18:1
time (18) 9:14,15 20:21 31:3 43:14

47:4 58:22,25 62:7,25 69:24 70:18 81:15,17 87:24 88:1,4 95:4
timer (1) 58:22
times (1) 95:21
tired (2) 80:1,2
today (19) 10:7,24 14:15,21 21:14 24:1 28:10 30:12,14 37:15 38:18 38:19 44:22 82:14 84:14 86:10 86:21 93:24 99:4
today's (1) 63:18
told (5) 35:4 87:25,25 96:13 99:2
Tomas (5) 10:8 23:22,25 27:18 29:2
tomorrow (3) 8:1 69:6 84:11
ton (1) 22:25
tonight (3) 6:1 36:25 97:8
tool (2) 33:22 59:23
tools (1) 60:6
top (2) 5:12 18:21
topics (2) 5:24 30:13
Torres (3) 59:1,2,3
totally (2) 79:22 81:11
touch (3) 36:21 49:7 59:14
touched (3) 90:18,20,22
touching (1) 45:9
tough (2) 65:19 76:2
tournaments (2) 52:3,6
train (2) 98:13,20
trained (5) 73:15,23 77:8,8,13
training (6) 33:16 74:8 77:7,18,21 78:2
transcribed (2) 1:19 102:12
transcript (3) 1:14 35:6 102:11
Transit (1) 98:19
transition (1) 63:25
translation (2) 67:10 68:7
transparency (1) 83:6
transparent (1) 24:7
treated (3) 79:20 91:23,23
tremendously (1) 35:9
Treyvon (4) 37:18,18 38:20,24
triage (1) 59:13
triaging (1) 59:9
trial (4) 9:2,5,6,13
tried (5) 9:12,12 34:14 63:20 98:17
trip (1) 73:6
trouble (2) 32:19 69:5
troubled (1) 83:13
troublemaker (1) 96:7
trust (5) 30:16 42:10 44:5 76:4 89:22
truth (1) 76:5
try (8) 9:13 28:21 31:3,21 39:16 74:12,20 83:13
trying (9) 42:4 51:1 62:23 65:4,15 72:19 73:7 78:8,10
Tubbs (1) 97:23
Tuesday (1) 8:2

turn (3) 9:23 45:25 48:18
Twitter (1) 18:7
two (16) 5:11 25:1 26:20 30:13,16 30:18 35:7 43:12 46:4 50:11 58:22 63:15 66:6 82:14 94:11,17
type (1) 92:18
types (3) 7:13 90:13 95:23

U

U (1) 37:5
ultimately (1) 36:10
unable (1) 20:6
unbiased (1) 15:15
uncomfortable (1) 39:10
unconsciousable (1) 49:6
unconventional (1) 51:23
underestimate (1) 90:9
understand (20) 54:1 73:24 81:4 84:6 86:18 87:4,12 88:9,14,24 90:4,6,11,17 92:11,20 93:1,6,17 94:4
unfamiliar (1) 15:9
unfortunate (1) 98:16
unfortunately (1) 80:21
unfounded (1) 19:14
unfounded (1) 20:2
unidentified (2) 19:15 20:5
uniforms (1) 89:17
unit (1) 9:4
unlawful (1) 44:4
unnecessary (1) 16:3
unsubstantiated (2) 19:14,22
upcoming (1) 18:7
update (3) 5:13 18:13 101:4
updated (1) 64:3
urge (2) 29:18 50:12
URL (1) 23:11
use (14) 7:15 10:6 21:3 31:11,12 32:18 33:2,14 38:22 60:6 68:18 83:22,25 88:13
useful (1) 59:23
usual (3) 56:16,16 69:8
usually (2) 46:9 61:11

V

valuable (1) 36:8
vehicle (3) 17:13 45:8 60:14
vehicles (2) 45:6 60:13
verbally (1) 92:25
vice (6) 62:12,13 63:9 94:22 97:1,6
Vice-Chairman (1) 62:18
vice-president (1) 10:5
video (10) 33:6 34:11 35:8,15,17 35:19,23 36:1,5 76:8
videoing (1) 35:12
videos (1) 35:16
view (2) 31:6 86:14
violated (1) 89:25

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

violence (2) 37:15 51:15
vis-à-vis (1) 29:2
visit (1) 11:3
Vizcarrondo (1) 37:19
vocal (1) 6:7
voice (5) 56:5 62:24 63:8 82:7
 93:21
voiceless (1) 56:5
voicing (1) 91:2
vote (1) 12:9
vulnerable (1) 42:23

W

waiting (1) 54:5
walk (1) 54:6
walked (1) 30:15
walking (4) 79:16,17,18 88:16
wall (1) 99:3
want (65) 4:20 6:4 9:6,7,8 15:7
 17:19 18:2,3,17 20:12 22:12 23:1
 24:6,15 25:13,21 26:2,3,9,15
 28:14 29:10 30:13 44:1 45:12
 46:25 47:23 48:3 53:9,17,24
 58:21 59:14 60:7 61:2 62:5,25
 64:11 65:21 66:7 71:14 72:8,9
 76:6 77:14 83:9,11 86:21 87:7,17
 87:19 88:18 89:24 91:14 92:7,8
 93:6,8 94:18,18 95:15 97:7
 100:15,23
wanted (13) 26:7 32:17 34:4 35:21
 45:18 48:22 50:11 51:21 67:5
 68:3 69:7 84:5 86:1
wants (5) 11:19 39:24 75:19 76:4
 83:8
Warren (1) 48:25
wasn't (2) 37:14 79:22
watch (2) 37:5,6
watching (1) 98:7
water (1) 96:12
wave (1) 11:15
way (26) 8:9 10:23 15:23 19:23
 20:3 29:19 33:18 36:6,13 37:14
 42:18 43:2 45:15 47:11 56:10
 62:21,24 68:12 73:5 84:20 85:1
 86:20 90:7 92:24 94:17 102:17
ways (3) 31:23 51:14 66:12
we'll (22) 5:10 11:17 12:15 14:23
 23:5,20 29:9 30:8 33:25 36:21
 47:14 52:24,25 58:3,15,16,17,19
 74:19 85:8,9 100:1
we're (51) 6:10,20,23 7:4,20 10:21
 11:4 13:7 14:23 15:9,11,14 18:12
 19:10,17 23:17 26:13 34:23 35:8
 35:22 37:20 43:1 49:8,12 55:4
 56:10 58:25 72:24 73:7 77:8,13
 77:22,23 78:1,8,10,25 79:11,12
 80:5,7 81:8 82:24 83:3 84:9,14
 88:1,16,16 99:13 101:11

we've (12) 14:8 36:2 41:21 47:3,10
 47:11,19 52:4,12 73:5 77:20 86:1
weapon (2) 38:19 76:4
weapons (2) 76:7,17
week (1) 10:14
weeks (1) 97:24
welcome (4) 4:3,21 13:5 52:24
wellbeing (1) 92:20
went (7) 17:1 50:19 63:19 64:5
 68:13 86:13 97:22
weren't (2) 74:6 85:9
West (1) 62:15
whatnot (1) 76:11
wheels (1) 75:6
WHEREOF (1) 102:20
white (4) 38:25 45:13 80:15,16
whole-- (1) 76:14
wife (1) 63:21
Williams (15) 13:21,22 76:22 77:1
 78:22 79:15,24 80:19,24 81:4,23
 82:1,8,11 100:11
willing (1) 48:24
wind (1) 81:14
WITNESS (1) 102:20
witnessing (1) 35:12
wonderful (7) 98:11,15 99:4,22
 100:7,10,11
word (3) 18:6 34:10,10
work (30) 7:10 14:17 22:3 25:11
 28:15 34:1 40:12,24 41:14 48:11
 53:18,18,19,22 55:24 57:8 59:3
 65:25 69:3,5,13 73:5 74:19 78:16
 78:16 81:15 82:8,11 84:15 99:17
worked (3) 27:23,23 41:9
worker (1) 37:11
workers (1) 72:16
working (18) 24:8,10 28:8 29:11
 41:18,23 52:4 57:16 59:6 65:25
 72:24,25 74:11 82:25 83:3 100:2
 100:4 101:8
works (1) 47:3
Workshops (1) 10:10
world (4) 32:4 76:6 92:21 93:24
Woroniecki (2) 11:14 50:13
worried (7) 14:19 80:8,9,14,25
 81:5,11
worse (1) 94:3
would've (1) 45:14
wouldn't (1) 71:22
wrap (1) 88:15
write (1) 98:22
writing (1) 85:11
wrong (8) 63:5 65:3,7,8 88:9 91:5
 92:7 93:3
www.nyc.gov/CCRB (1) 17:25

X

X (1) 1:2

Y

yeah (21) 13:4,15,16 25:24 31:2
 38:4 50:21 51:10 59:2 62:3 68:1
 76:19,19 78:17,20 81:4 82:1,24
 85:13 99:21 101:1
yeah-- (1) 46:16
year (7) 16:11 21:11,23 23:6 53:14
 53:21 69:22
years (13) 9:14 24:11 25:1 35:8
 41:11 47:22,22 70:4 71:19 76:3
 97:20 99:18 100:5
yelled (1) 70:10
Yojaira (8) 8:20 15:1,2,5 36:18
 51:18,19 72:17
York (23) 1:10 5:15 6:6,15 9:18,22
 12:22 19:7,11 21:20 47:24 54:7
 59:7 62:11 63:17 66:12 69:3
 77:12 91:8,16 102:3,5,9
Yorkers (1) 6:4
young (40) 21:13,14,17,21,24 22:1
 22:2,12,16 23:7 24:21,23 25:15
 26:3,4,9,14 28:15 31:22 42:21
 43:4,12 45:23 48:5,12 60:21 64:5
 70:2 71:9,19 72:21,23 77:15
 85:18 89:21,21 93:13,13 96:11
 96:14
younger (2) 31:2 95:24
youth (27) 21:24 22:7,11 23:5,9,10
 24:19 28:7 31:21 32:6 36:13,15
 36:17,24 37:23 38:8,12,14 39:9
 40:5 41:10 45:21 46:7,9 50:18,20
 51:11
Yvonne (1) 97:15

Z

0

1

1 (4) 2:7 50:21,23 51:8
1-800-341-CCRB (1) 17:24
1% (1) 6:17
10 (1) 2:16
100% (1) 91:24
10472 (1) 1:10
11 (1) 2:17
12 (3) 97:20 99:18 100:5
13 (1) 15:17
15 (3) 41:11 70:14,16
1619 (1) 1:9
174th (1) 1:9
18 (1) 70:22
18-year-old (1) 70:2
19-member (1) 22:8

2

2 (8) 2:8 97:17 99:15,22 100:4,7,10

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
May 8, 2019**

100:19
20 (2) 88:3,6
200 (1) 100:12
2016 (1) 83:21
2018 (2) 10:18 30:20
2019 (3) 1:12 4:4 102:21
21 (1) 76:3
280 (1) 82:3
29th (1) 102:21

3

3 (1) 2:9
311 (5) 10:25 17:18,24 66:22 91:6
35,000 (1) 53:14

4

4 (1) 2:10
4-0 (1) 13:19
4-2 (1) 13:19
4-3 (1) 14:2
4-5 (1) 14:3
4-7 (1) 14:3
40th (1) 41:21
43rd (1) 25:8

5

5 (1) 2:11
5,000 (1) 30:20
5:00 (1) 61:13
50-a (2) 49:22 50:9
50,000 (1) 59:6

6

6 (1) 2:12
6:00 (3) 61:10,11,18
6:30p.m (1) 1:12
60 (2) 6:18,22

7

7 (4) 2:13 13:18 22:21 41:20

8

8 (4) 1:12 2:14 13:25 22:21

9

9 (1) 2:15
9% (1) 22:22
9:00 (1) 61:13
911 (1) 99:24