

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019

1

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD  
PUBLIC MEETING  
February 13, 2019

-----X

100 Church Street  
10th Floor  
New York, New York  
6:00p.m. - 7:00p.m.

TRANSCRIPTS OF PROCEEDINGS FROM VIDEO  
BEFORE:

FREDERICK DAVIE, Acting Chair

JONATHAN DARCHE, Esq., Executive Director

REPORTED BY:

Kristina Trnka

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.  
139 MAMARONECK AVENUE  
MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543  
212.95.DEPOS (953.3767) \* 914.381.2061  
FACSIMILE: 914.722.0816  
E-MAIL: Stenokath@verizon.net

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

=====

1. Call to Order.
2. Adoption of Minutes.
3. Report from the Chair.
4. Report from the Executive Director.
5. New Business Testimony from the following speakers:
  - Nicolyn Plummer, Senior Social Worker, Coordinator of Outreach and Advocacy, Barrier Free Living
  - Christina Curry, Executive Director of Harlem Independent Living Center
  - Opal Gordon, Independent, Deaf Advocate
  - Ruth Lowenstein, Esq., Director, New York Lawyers for the Public Interest
6. Old Business
7. Public Comment
8. Adjourn to Executive Session

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

=====

JOHN SIEGAL, Acting Chair

FRANK J. DWYER, Board Member

JOSEPH A. PUMA, Board Member

ANGELA FERNANDEZ, Board Member

MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA, Board Member

ERICA BOND, Board Member

RAMON PEGUERO, Board Member

MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS, Board Member

SALVATORE CARCATERRA, Board Member

=====

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

4

1 Proceedings

2 MR. SIEGAL: Good afternoon. I  
3 welcome you all to the February board  
4 meeting of the Civilian Complaint Review  
5 Board.

6 My name's John Siegal. I'm a  
7 mayoral designee to the board and I'm  
8 serving as Acting Chair today in the  
9 absence of our real Chair Fred Davie. I'm  
10 serving as Acting Chair today in absence  
11 of our real Chair Reverend Fred Davie who  
12 is out of town attending to a family  
13 matter.

14 Thank you all for being here this  
15 afternoon.

16 As a board we'd like to begin by  
17 paying our respects to the two NYPD  
18 officers who were shot in the line of duty  
19 yesterday, Detective Brian Simonsen -- the  
20 late Detective Brian Simonsen and Sergeant  
21 Matthew Gorman. It is a reminder of the  
22 serious nature of the business that this  
23 agency and the police department deal  
24 with.

25 I was struck in reading the news

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

5

Proceedings

1 reports regarding Detective Simonsen.  
2 That this is a 42-year old man who had  
3 19 years of service on the job after  
4 having been a college graduate. And it's  
5 a reminder that -- there's very few  
6 places, I think, in our society where  
7 42-year olds have nearly 20 years of  
8 service on a job.  
9

10 And it's a reminder that the  
11 officers whose conduct we review here are  
12 not only vulnerable and often in dangerous  
13 situations but also they're young and they  
14 face considerable risks in their work.  
15 Our thoughts and prayers go out to his  
16 family, as well as to Sergeant Gorman and  
17 his family as he hopefully recuperates  
18 quickly.

19 Before we get started with our  
20 business agenda, I'd like to offer a  
21 reminder that the CCRB's first ever youth  
22 summit on policing entitled, Speak Up  
23 Speak Out, is about two weeks away. On  
24 Tuesday, February 26th, hundreds of young  
25 people between the ages of 10 and 24 will

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

6

Proceedings

1  
2 be meeting at NYU to share their  
3 experiences with the NYPD and to talk  
4 about their ideas for moving New York City  
5 forward.

6 The CCRB staff and our youth  
7 advisory council have been working hard to  
8 plan this event and we are all excited to  
9 attend to hear from young New Yorkers from  
10 every borough. For more information on  
11 the youth summit, please see Outreach  
12 Director Yojaira Alvarez or visit  
13 NYC./CCRB youthsummit.

14 The independent panel that last  
15 year began a review of how the NYPD  
16 disciplines its members for misconduct  
17 known as the Blue Ribbon Commission  
18 recently issued a report. The CCRB staff  
19 has been pouring over that report, as have  
20 I'm sure board members. Executive  
21 Director Jonathan Darche will share a few  
22 comments about it.

23 I note that one of the big  
24 takeaways is a call for more transparency  
25 within the disciplinary system. That's







**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

9

1 Proceedings

2 Dwyer. I'm a police commissioner's  
3 designee on the board.

4 MR. SIEGAL: Our next order of  
5 business will be the executive director's  
6 report. So I turn it over to Jonathan  
7 Darche.

8 MR. DARCHE: Thank you,  
9 Mr. Siegal.

10 I want to echo Mr. Siegal's call  
11 for young people to participate in the  
12 youth summit. It's a full-day event on  
13 Tuesday, February 26th at NYU. It is  
14 going to be helpful for a report that the  
15 CCRB's doing on the relationship between  
16 young people in the city and the police.

17 But it is -- I think it is going  
18 to be an opportunity for us to listen to  
19 young people and get ideas from them about  
20 how we can serve them better. So I'm  
21 excited to listen to them and learn from  
22 them.

23 As Mr. Siegal said earlier, the  
24 Blue Ribbon Commission issued its report  
25 with a number of the recommendations that



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

11

Proceedings

1  
2 report to the 2019 Charter Revision  
3 Commission. Among the suggested changes  
4 by the City Council were changes that we  
5 feel -- or I feel if they were adopted  
6 would strengthen police oversight in New  
7 York City. And the council's  
8 recommendations included some proposals  
9 like codifying the CCRB's administrative  
10 prosecution unit and tying the CCRB's  
11 budget to the NYPD's budget.

12           The CCRB will work with the  
13 Council and others to continue to push for  
14 these changes in the interest of improving  
15 transparency and accountability in  
16 policing.

17           We have two investigators here  
18 today, Sara Griffin and Carter Salis. Can  
19 you guys -- oh, Sara is here. You know,  
20 we are here to hear from people about  
21 their -- what they feel about  
22 police-community relations in this city.

23           But if you have a specific  
24 complaint about an incident or if you have  
25 questions about a complaint you have

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

12

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

already made, instead of addressing it in public where we have an issue with 50A, we ask that you talk to Sara in the back so that we can actually investigate and that way we can better -- better handle your issue.

For the public speakers in the interest of ensuring that everyone has equal time to talk today and share their thoughts with us, we are going to ask that everyone keep their comments to two minutes. There's a -- I can't see the -- the time on the clock but there's a clock here. So when the public comment is happening if you guys could respect the clock, we would really appreciate it.

That's all I have.

MR. SIEGAL: So we now have the always exciting moment where we review and consider the minutes of the prior month's board meeting.

Does anyone have a motion to approve the minutes?

MR. DARCHE: There were a couple

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

13

1 Proceedings

2 of errors that I would like to -- just to  
3 keep it spicy while you're the Acting  
4 Chair.

5 MR. SIEGAL: See it's not  
6 perfunctory.

7 MR. DARCHE: On page 6, line 20  
8 the first word should be concurrences; on  
9 page 45, line 23 where it says form it  
10 should actually be from; the same mistake  
11 was made on page 81, line 9; and on page  
12 97 the last name of the speaker should be  
13 spelt Wouk, W-O-U-K.

14 MR. SIEGAL: So does anyone have a  
15 motion to approve the minutes  
16 incorporating the changes that Mr. Darche  
17 has dictated?

18 MS. FERNANDEZ: So moved.

19 MR. SIEGAL: Is there a second?

20 MR. RIVADENEYRA: Aye.

21 MR. SIEGAL: All in favor?

22 (Chorus of ayes.)

23 MR. SIEGAL: Anyone opposed?

24 (No response.)

25 MR. SIEGAL: The minutes are

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

14

1 Proceedings

2 adopted.

3 Testimony now from -- we have a  
4 series of speakers to testify before the  
5 open public comment section.

6 Let me first call on Nicolyn  
7 Plummer from the Barrier Free Living.

8 MS. PLUMMER: Two minutes.

9 MR. SIEGAL: You're invited  
10 guests, as are the others. Full  
11 presentation, please.

12 MS. PLUMMER: Good afternoon.

13 Can you guys hear me? Okay.

14 Thank you for inviting us to speak  
15 and thank you for the opportunity  
16 (indecipherable) NYPD family.

17 I want to start, there have been  
18 various challenges with the NYPD and the  
19 deaf community. There's a lot of  
20 misunderstanding and misconception between  
21 NYPD and how to interact with the deaf  
22 community.

23 But first I want to say, there are  
24 500,000 who are considered deaf who live  
25 in New York City who communicate primarily

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

15

1 Proceedings

2 in sign language.

3 Firstly, the ADA has passed to  
4 stop people with disabilities, deaf  
5 community still (indecipherable) interacts  
6 with NYPD because the way we sound tends  
7 to be too threatening. How do we help the  
8 community to understand by deaf community,  
9 it is very challenging for us to reach out  
10 to NYPD or reach out to police officer for  
11 assistance because of the communication  
12 barriers.

13 When we talk to the police there  
14 tends to be a lot of misunderstanding,  
15 misconception. Most of the time NYPD  
16 (indecipherable) how we communicate appear  
17 aggressive because we stand so big and  
18 most likely tone deaf, most likely to be  
19 arrested because officers feel threatened.

20 But however, deaf community  
21 communicate through their body language.  
22 That's how we communicate. We tend to  
23 stand -- just like hearing people speak  
24 louder, deaf bigger. (Indecipherable)  
25 they tend to stand big.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

16

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

A lot of time there are misunderstanding with the information that they convey to the officer. Most of the time (indecipherable) when we are trying to convey our message to the officer there's always a lack of understanding and we (indecipherable) officer because deaf tend to be mocked, they make fun of because the inability to speak and articulate the situation. Is that clear?

That's another layer of victimization that we encounter with NYPD, why we are less likely to report for assistance. Another thing that we don't want to go to the NYPD station because we experience humiliation, mistreatment.

And another situation where I want to describe. When an officer arrive at the scene to communicate with the deaf, a lot of time an officer will say (indecipherable) a deaf individual cannot hear themselves. So how do you expect a deaf to follow instructions when they



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

17

1 Proceedings

2 cannot hear you. And if they can't hear  
3 and they fail to follow the command, they  
4 end up being arrested and go to jail. So  
5 (indecipherable).

6 How can we improve our  
7 interactions with the police officer when  
8 they have a misconceptions about us. They  
9 have a lack of sensitive training. They  
10 need to understand about deaf --  
11 understand about the culture because they  
12 sign doesn't mean it's a sign of a gang.  
13 It's just the way we communicate.

14 (Indecipherable) interaction with  
15 NYPD. NYPD needs training how to interact  
16 with the deaf. Not only that, the system  
17 itself needs to be changed, needs to be  
18 reformed, to better our  
19 communities, to better accommodate deaf  
20 and hard of hearing communities. Thank  
21 you.

22 MR. SIEGAL: Our next speaker is  
23 Christina Curry, Executive Director of  
24 Harlem Independent Living Center.

25 UNKNOWN SPEAKER 1: So there will

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

18

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

be a little bit of pausing while we're processing but we'll be voicing for Dennis.

MR. MARTINEZ: Good afternoon. My name is Dennis Martinez. And I work for Harlem Independent Living Center. And I'm a deaf advocate. And I am replacing Christina Curry today.

So the police don't know how to approach deaf people and what ends up happening is that a deaf person will go to sign to the police officer and they think that they're being aggressive. So what ends up happening is that they go to sign and what the police will do is take their hands, put them behind their backs and not allow them to communicate with them.

And obviously they cannot sign with their hands behind their backs. And some deaf people cannot voice for themselves, some are hard of hearing. Nicolyn was just voicing for herself but not all deaf people are like that. And it prevents them for being able to have that



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

20

1 Proceedings

2 to home. That's exactly what happened to  
3 me actually.

4 Last September or in September of  
5 2015 I went to family court. It was  
6 actually -- it was downtown. It was very  
7 close to here. This was for personal  
8 reasons. And I was in the judge's room  
9 and, you know, there was people there in  
10 the courtroom but there was no  
11 interpreter.

12 I was lost. I didn't know what  
13 was going on. And my social worker, she's  
14 hearing and she was in the back of the  
15 room. My lawyer was next to me. So I  
16 said, what's going on? What happened?  
17 They told me that our court date -- that  
18 is was actually postponed. It was going  
19 to be cancelled because there was no  
20 interpreter.

21 So I was walking in between the  
22 judge's room and then there's another  
23 room, and then a lobby. So me, my social  
24 worker, and the lawyer -- the three of us  
25 -- we were walking out. I just grabbed my

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

21

Proceedings

1  
2 pocketbook and I was going into this next  
3 room and two detectives came right up to  
4 me. And the first thing I noticed were  
5 these silver handcuffs that they were  
6 holding. I was frightened. I had no idea  
7 what to do.

8           They came right up to me and I  
9 said I need an interpreter. I signed like  
10 this. I need an interpreter. And my  
11 social worker told me or told them Opal  
12 needs an interpreter. My lawyer said,  
13 calm down. I said, no. I have a right.  
14 I need an interpreter. I don't know  
15 what's going on.

16           After fighting back and forth I  
17 just -- I put my bag down and I put my  
18 hands in front of me. And I had a good  
19 reason why I put my hands in front of me.  
20 So I could communicate or if I need to  
21 write something down or write notes back  
22 and forth. But again, the detectives in  
23 front of me, they kept saying please turn  
24 around, turn around. I said no.

25           And I just -- I had to grit and





**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

24

Proceedings

1  
2 department is aware of what you're telling  
3 us and this issue. Because it's -- we  
4 appreciate you coming down and sharing  
5 these incidents with us so that we can  
6 tell the department and try and improve  
7 the relationship between the deaf  
8 community and the NYPD.

9           Before -- and I didn't want you to  
10 think that we weren't -- that the lack of  
11 questions -- that we -- wasn't a lack of  
12 understanding or appreciation of what you  
13 were saying.

14           MR. SIEGAL: The next speaker is  
15 Ruth Lowenstein Director of the New York  
16 Lawyers for the Public Interest.

17           MS. LOWENKRON: Good afternoon.  
18 First minor correction, Lowenkron,  
19 L-O-W-E-N-K-R-O-N.

20           Thank you for the opportunity to  
21 speak to you today. I am the director of  
22 the disability justice program at New York  
23 Lawyers for the public interest. We work  
24 with the deaf community in a coalition  
25 known as the Deaf Justice Coalition. The



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

primary goal of that coalition is figuring out the best working relationship we can with the NYPD. We do other things as well but this is one of the primary things.

As you heard so eloquently from the speakers before me, it is an enormous problem for the deaf community. There is -- the fear that was articulated that I can't and won't try to do justice to. But I think it really is so important for you who are trying to think of the best policies to serve our city, that you recognize the huge numbers of people who are deaf and the huge fear that they have, which is sadly also well founded from their negative experiences with the police.

So I'm going to focus on what we think are some of the solutions and I know that Nicolyn, among others, mentioned them. The key is to have training of the police officers. There's just no way around it. It's easy to understand. We are not trying to malign the police





**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

28

1 Proceedings

2 replicated.

3 And in addition, they were putting  
4 much too much of an emphasis from our  
5 perspective on computer communication.  
6 They purchased tablets so that they could  
7 avail themselves of an internet service to  
8 do the interpreting. Now that's fine in a  
9 pinch but it's only fine in a pinch. They  
10 need that real, live interpreter present.  
11 As I said, not enough emphasis on that.

12 And this pilot program did not go  
13 far enough. It was only in three  
14 precincts. We understand that there are  
15 efforts to broaden it but we have not seen  
16 the results of that yet. That is key. So  
17 we ask you to push for that.

18 The other thing that's really  
19 important is -- one of the things that  
20 we've been involved in is getting visors  
21 in automobiles that point out the fact  
22 that people are deaf. But there's a lot  
23 of resistance in the deaf community to  
24 even raising one little finger to say look  
25 at my visor. So that's another part of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

29

Proceedings

1  
2 the training that's critical. The visor  
3 says I'm deaf. The visor also has a few  
4 canned, if you will, statements -- I just  
5 -- my car doesn't work or whatever the  
6 statements are. It's a great idea but it's  
7 only great if the police, again, are  
8 trained at every level.

9           Those are the key things I wanted  
10 to articulate. But while I have the  
11 platform I just want to talk about two  
12 other areas related to people with  
13 disabilities that my office is also  
14 working on that are also hugely critical.

15           So we work on behalf of people  
16 with mental health as part of the CCIT  
17 NYC, which is the Coalition for Crisis  
18 Intervention Training New York City. And  
19 as part of that coalition and what our  
20 office otherwise does, is advocate on  
21 behalf of individuals who experience  
22 mental health crisis and find themselves  
23 in the worst case scenario and way too  
24 often literally shot dead as a result of a  
25 communication effort gone awry.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

30

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

We are active in one case of that sort, which will actually be heard next week in state supreme court, about just trying to get body-worn documents with respect to one of those interactions. But this is -- and I don't mean to minimize anything in the deaf community. There are deaths that result from the miscommunications there too. So we are talking about things that are literally matters of life and death.

With respect to the mental health crisis, what we are advocating for and what we are hoping that you would be supportive of is to the best we can to remove the police from the situation. This is a win-win. The police do not want to be involved when someone is having a mental health crisis if they don't have to be involved. Most frequently what is required is a health professional.

What we say is that you should have mental health professionals and what are known as peers, individuals who



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

32

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

and we try our hardest to make things work. This is just another area where we've been working with the police to make sure that police officers are trained across the board in this agreed upon method of training, crisis intervention training. That's key and we hope you can support us in that.

And of course it goes without saying but I will say it, that one of the best ways to avoid interactions with people with mental health crisis is to avoid the crisis in the first place. And the way to avoid crisis is to have decent mental health services and that is sorely lacking in this city. And that would be something if we could count on you to support that.

I will say one last thing about -- and very quickly on this -- the last group of person's with disabilities that we advocate on behalf of and that is those with physical disabilities. We are very concerned about physical access both to



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

33

Proceedings

1  
2 police stations, again, something sorely  
3 lacking and to the transportation vans  
4 available to the police. That was  
5 something we were forced to litigate and  
6 we are seeing changes happen in that  
7 regard to ensure that people that have  
8 mobility impairments, use wheelchairs will  
9 be transported in an accessible vans. But  
10 it's not happening across the board  
11 either. And again, something that we  
12 would call on you to please support us  
13 with.

14           So thank you very much. If you  
15 have any questions of me now or at any  
16 other point I would be more than happy to  
17 discuss them with you. Thank you.

18           MR. SIEGAL: Let me just start  
19 asking a couple of questions -- and I'm  
20 asking you because you're there but others  
21 who spoke may have the answers or our  
22 research department may.

23           And let me say there's no one who  
24 can be on this board and deal with the  
25 cases that we deal with who isn't



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

35

1 Proceedings

2 exact answer how many times there have  
3 been interactions but we have asked many  
4 times. We can say about 55 percent of the  
5 deaf (indecipherable) the NYPD. But in  
6 term of the records we don't have that  
7 information. (Indecipherable) up in the  
8 air. We don't know the answer.

9 MR. SIEGAL: And the other  
10 question, it's just obvious to me, is how  
11 many members of service in the NYPD, if  
12 you know, know American Sign Language or  
13 personnel in the police department  
14 actually know how to sign.

15 MS. PLUMMER: My understanding --  
16 we were told there are 15 officers who  
17 know sign language. And they are  
18 classified as a certified interpreter and  
19 they are not certified. They are an  
20 officer who can be able to communicate  
21 with the deaf in sign language. But when  
22 it comes to (indecipherable) we don't  
23 recommend them (indecipherable) as an  
24 interpreter.

25 But when we call (indecipherable)

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

36

1 Proceedings

2 the NYPD, 90 percent of the time we do not  
3 interact with an officer who knows sign  
4 language. Most of the time we interact  
5 with an officer who failed to provide a  
6 sign language interpreter and the  
7 situation escalated at some point.

8 MR. SIEGAL: Are there staff sign  
9 language interpreters any where in the  
10 police department other than these 15  
11 officers?

12 MS. PLUMMER: You mean staff and  
13 not an officer?

14 MR. SIEGAL: Correct.

15 MS. PLUMMER: We don't know.

16 MR. SIEGAL: Thank you.

17 Anyone else have questions?

18 MR. CARCATERRA: I have some.

19 The pilot program you spoke about,  
20 when did that start and what three  
21 precincts is that in? Do you know?

22 MS. PLUMMER: You want to answer?  
23 You want to answer?

24 We did three pilot programs that  
25 we have been working with NYPD three years



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

38

1 Proceedings

2 I don't have them on me either. Sorry.

3 MR. SIEGAL: Any other board  
4 members have questions.

5 MS. BOND: I just have one.

6 And apologies, everyone, for being  
7 late.

8 My name is Erica Bond. I'm a  
9 mayoral designee.

10 Just one question. I was  
11 wondering whether there are other cities  
12 around the country that have models for,  
13 you know, better working with the deaf  
14 community and improving relationships  
15 between the deaf community and their  
16 local police departments? Are there  
17 places we should be looking to for  
18 projects or programs that have helped to  
19 address some of the concerns you raised  
20 today?

21 MS. PLUMMER: If you're familiar  
22 with Washington D.C., (indecipherable)  
23 University. Are you familiar with  
24 (indecipherable) University? They have a  
25 strong relationship with NYPD. We have







**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

41

1 Proceedings

2 familiar with, or Tanya Towers, which is  
3 the one on my block, on 620 East 13th  
4 Street.

5 MS. PLUMMER: The pilot in that  
6 area, that's one of the pilots in the  
7 police station. That's one of the pilots  
8 in Manhattan. We don't know how many have  
9 gone to. But I do know the people from  
10 Tanya Tower are complaining about they not  
11 getting -- they not being served well by  
12 the police officers. So we start to think  
13 about how we can improve our interactions  
14 but that's one of the pilots that take  
15 place. (Indecipherable).

16 It's Precinct 121. That's one of  
17 the pilots, Precinct 121. Staten Island  
18 is Precinct 115 -- no. The one in Staten  
19 Island is 121. One in Queens is 115 near  
20 the Lexington school for the deal.

21 MS. LOWENKRON: I think you were  
22 obviously onto something and the idea that  
23 the police have of community policing we  
24 understand it to make a difference. I  
25 don't know that we have a study because we





**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

44

1 Proceedings

2 they need to know the protocol to call for  
3 an interpreter. It's so important because  
4 you go there and yet you're standing in  
5 front of someone that needs help and you  
6 can't -- you can't understand each other.  
7 We need -- we need improvements. It needs  
8 to be better.

9 MR. SIEGAL: Thank you.

10 MS. PLUMMER: I would like to add  
11 (indecipherable) I would say 90 percent of  
12 the time when a deaf call 911 and identify  
13 them self as deaf, they just pass us to  
14 all (indecipherable). When they arrive at  
15 the scene, interpreter never showed up.  
16 Officer has never been accompanied by an  
17 interpreter. When they arrive, what  
18 happens? How do you communicate with a  
19 deaf individual? How? If you're not able  
20 to communicate with a deaf individual, the  
21 deaf become -- their anxiety is very high  
22 and the situation starts to escalate. The  
23 officer (indecipherable) and then at one  
24 point the officer will arrest the deaf  
25 because they seem to be portrayed aggressive

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

45

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

but no, they're not aggressive. That's the way they (indecipherable) and if you have no way of communicating.

Normally I would tell the victim if the officer arrive without an interpreter, what's the back up plan? If the officer doesn't have any tablet or telephone with a video interpreter where you can communicate with a live interpreter -- I don't know if they have it in place yet. That was one of the pilots. If the officer does not have a video in the tablet (indecipherable) live interpreter not available, what is the back up plan? We tell the victim, the deaf to give the officer the number -- give the officer the number. Not all officers will be willing to take the number. Why so the victim can be able to communicate with the officer through the video relay services (indecipherable). Remember they arrived without an interpreter. When the officer dial the number the victim is able to communicate through the video relay

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

46

Proceedings

1  
2 services. The officer will understand  
3 what the victim is saying through the  
4 screen. The operator hear what the  
5 officer is talking through the video relay  
6 services, it's not supposed to happen.  
7 It's against FCC. It's a violation of FCC  
8 because officer and victim cannot be in  
9 the same room because remember we have no  
10 other choice. We have to tell the victim  
11 to use video relay services that officer  
12 is not able to provide a live interpreter  
13 at the moment or don't have any form of  
14 device or know how to communicate with the  
15 deaf at the moment.

16 We have to come up with a  
17 different strategy of how we can  
18 have better services because we do a lot  
19 of things we are not supposed to do. Even  
20 though it is against FCC. Understand  
21 that? Because they are not supposed to be  
22 in the same room. But if you use  
23 (indecipherable) officer and the deaf can  
24 be in the same room. We don't know how many  
25 officer or how many tablets that they can

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

47

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

be able to communicate through the live interpreter. We don't know. I heard that it's taken place but I haven't seen it so I don't know.

MR. SIEGAL: Thank you.

I think we all appreciate all the speakers who came down and opened our eyes to this issue and the staff who arranged for this. I know there will be follow up. This raises so many questions and issues for us to deal with, I think.

MR. DARCHE: There's not only going to be follow up with regard to the relationship between the NYPD and the deaf and disabled community. But also the CCRB's relationship with the deaf and disabled community. To make sure we are providing the services that you all need and so that we can make sure that we treat you with the respect that everyone is entitled to.

MR. SIEGAL: Thank you very much.

We are going move to the public comment section of the meeting. We have a







**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

50

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

that I fear for me life you can grab and reach, march into me and I can go into a precinct, Long Island Rail Road No. 4 -- more than a few times -- ask for help, asked to leave, asked to leave.

November 2018 by Lieutenant Allen.

I feel bad for the deaf person here because they treat me unbelievably badly, I can't imagine how they treat them. And I can't do anything but sit in the back, as you saw me sitting back there like this, as all of this was going on.

Maybe we can speak after,  
Mr. Darche?

When I say until 12 years ago I never opened my mouth or hated anyone. I'm tired of saying that. But it's on now. And I know one thing, this is not going to play out in the good light. The underline is drugs -- I don't do drugs. I'm lying.

I'm going to sit back there and maybe Mr. D can find time today to speak to me or I can come back another time and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

51

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

we can try to talk. But, again, this is bad because you see me sit back there. You all notice me look -- I just go like this because I know I can't do anything because I'll go to jail. So I just sit back there because you'll are watching me.

I'm going to go sit back there and we can see what we can do. I've seen the paper, water bottles, everything else. How does this end? I do fear for my life. Have a good day.

MR. SIEGAL: Thank you.

Are there other public citizens with comments?

Sir.

The man brings his own clock.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER 2: I'm going to give myself 22 minutes.

Following up on Ms. Lowenkron's second point. The police department has a subject called EDP, Emotionally Disturbed Persons. They receive a tremendous amount of training. I'm sure most of you are aware in here that there are lots of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

52

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

citizen groups who are very concerned about what happens when somebody with that kind of situation is addressed by the police. Deborah Danner, Mohammed Bhai. There's a long list of them.

And one of the problems that we -- that people see is if a police officer shows up in uniform that is initially a trigger no matter how politely or relaxed form the police office is in. That's still uniform, armed is a trigger. So what people are talking about is, yes, having a different number to call and to then have people respond who are particularly trained in this. Not necessarily even members of the NYPD.

But that is a lot of what's going on. Press conferences on the city hall steps, all sorts of groups getting together. It's interesting several groups have come together and right now they are pushing for people other than police responding to calls. So when Mrs. Bhai, the mother, called and said my son is

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

53

1 Proceedings

2 having a problem, somehow it would have  
3 been great if she was able to call  
4 something other than 911 and to have other  
5 people come who have those skills.

6 There's a famous officer John --  
7 Mr. Shanahan. He does all sorts of movies  
8 and he is involved in hostage situations.  
9 He's the kind of person who deals with a  
10 hostage. You can't just train any police  
11 officer -- I have another 15 minutes. You  
12 can't just train any police officer to  
13 handle hostage situations and no, you  
14 can't train every police officer to handle  
15 an EDP situation. Thank you.

16 MR. SIEGAL: Thank you.

17 Are there other people with  
18 comments?

19 (No response.)

20 MR. SIEGAL: Seeing none. We are  
21 at the end of our agenda.

22 Is there a motion to adjourn to  
23 executive session?

24 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: I have a quick  
25 question or comment.



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

55

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

around how to make sure that our recommendations to the City Council include advocating for our own power and also in line with I think advocates across the city who really are demanding some reallocation of power.

MR. SIEGAL: Any other comments or business from the board?

(No response.)

MR. SIEGAL: Hearing none, is there a motion to adjourn to executive session?

MR. DWYER: So moved.

MR. SIEGAL: Second?

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Second.

MR. SIEGAL: All in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

MR. SIEGAL: Any opposition?

(No response.)

MR. SIEGAL: We're adjourned until the March meeting. Thank you all very much.

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, KRISTINA TRNKA, a shorthand reporter and  
Notary Public within and for the State of New York,  
do hereby certify:

That the within statement is a true and  
accurate record of the stenographic notes taken by  
me.

In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my  
hand this 27th day of February, 2019.

*Kristina Trnka*

---

KRISTINA TRNKA



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

A		
<p>ability (1) 10:16  <b>able (10)</b> 18:25 19:15 31:18 35:20            44:19 45:20,24 46:12 47:2 53:3  <b>absence (2)</b> 4:9,10  <b>absolutely (2)</b> 26:12 27:13  <b>access (3)</b> 10:6 19:2 32:25  <b>accessible (1)</b> 33:9  <b>accommodate (1)</b> 17:19  <b>accompanied (1)</b> 44:16  <b>accountability (1)</b> 11:15  <b>accurate (1)</b> 56:8  <b>accused (1)</b> 10:19  <b>acting (6)</b> 1:14 3:4 4:8,10 13:3 26:4  <b>actions (1)</b> 10:11  <b>active (1)</b> 30:2  <b>ADA (1)</b> 15:3  <b>add (3)</b> 42:24 44:10 48:7  <b>addition (1)</b> 28:3  <b>address (1)</b> 38:19  <b>addressed (1)</b> 52:4  <b>addressing (1)</b> 12:2  <b>adjourn (3)</b> 2:20 53:22 55:12  <b>adjourned (1)</b> 55:21  <b>administrative (1)</b> 11:9  <b>adopted (2)</b> 11:5 14:2  <b>Adoption (1)</b> 2:5  <b>adopts (1)</b> 31:5  <b>advisory (1)</b> 6:7  <b>Advocacy (1)</b> 2:11  <b>advocate (6)</b> 2:15 18:8 29:20 32:23            42:25 54:24  <b>advocated (1)</b> 7:2  <b>advocates (4)</b> 10:7,22 54:18 55:5  <b>advocating (3)</b> 30:14 54:22 55:4  <b>afternoon (7)</b> 4:2,15 8:22,25 14:12            18:5 24:17  <b>agencies (1)</b> 10:21  <b>agency (2)</b> 4:23 54:17  <b>agenda (3)</b> 2:2 5:20 53:21  <b>ages (1)</b> 5:25  <b>aggressive (4)</b> 15:17 18:14 44:25            45:2  <b>ago (3)</b> 37:2 49:8 50:16  <b>agreed (1)</b> 32:6  <b>ahead (2)</b> 22:13 23:20  <b>air (1)</b> 35:8  <b>Allen (1)</b> 50:7  <b>allow (1)</b> 18:18  <b>Alvarez (1)</b> 6:12  <b>amenable (1)</b> 27:23  <b>American (2)</b> 19:10 35:12  <b>amount (2)</b> 39:10 51:23  <b>anecdotally (2)</b> 42:3,8  <b>Angela (2)</b> 3:7 8:15  <b>annual (1)</b> 34:14  <b>answer (7)</b> 27:15,16 34:21 35:2,8</p>	<p>36:22,23  <b>answers (1)</b> 33:21  <b>anxiety (1)</b> 44:21  <b>apologies (1)</b> 38:6  <b>apologize (1)</b> 54:4  <b>appear (1)</b> 15:16  <b>appreciate (3)</b> 12:17 24:4 47:7  <b>appreciation (1)</b> 24:12  <b>approach (1)</b> 18:11  <b>approaching (1)</b> 19:17  <b>approve (2)</b> 12:24 13:15  <b>area (3)</b> 32:3 41:6 43:16  <b>areas (1)</b> 29:12  <b>armed (1)</b> 52:12  <b>arranged (1)</b> 47:9  <b>arrest (2)</b> 44:24 48:15  <b>arrested (4)</b> 15:19 17:4 22:7,13  <b>arrive (4)</b> 16:20 44:14,17 45:6  <b>arrived (2)</b> 7:24 45:22  <b>articulate (2)</b> 16:11 29:10  <b>articulated (1)</b> 25:9  <b>ascertain (1)</b> 26:8  <b>asked (4)</b> 34:17 35:3 50:6,6  <b>asking (3)</b> 33:19,20 43:11  <b>assistance (2)</b> 15:11 16:15  <b>assisted (1)</b> 40:3  <b>assume (1)</b> 23:17  <b>Attempts (2)</b> 27:16,17  <b>attend (1)</b> 6:9  <b>attending (1)</b> 4:12  <b>authority (1)</b> 54:11  <b>automobiles (1)</b> 28:21  <b>avail (1)</b> 28:7  <b>available (2)</b> 33:4 45:15  <b>Avenue (2)</b> 1:22 40:25  <b>avoid (3)</b> 32:12,14,15  <b>aware (3)</b> 24:2 48:22 51:25  <b>awful (1)</b> 22:25  <b>awry (1)</b> 29:25  <b>Aye (1)</b> 13:20  <b>ayes (2)</b> 13:22 55:18</p>	<p><b>believe (1)</b> 42:18  <b>beneficial (1)</b> 7:13  <b>benefit (1)</b> 7:7  <b>best (5)</b> 19:13 25:3,12 30:16 32:12  <b>better (10)</b> 9:20 10:10 12:6,6 17:18            17:19 38:13 39:5 44:8 46:18  <b>Bhai (2)</b> 52:5,24  <b>big (4)</b> 6:23 15:17,25 26:20  <b>bigger (1)</b> 15:24  <b>bit (2)</b> 18:2 19:23  <b>block (2)</b> 40:5 41:3  <b>Blue (2)</b> 6:17 9:24  <b>board (36)</b> 1:3 3:2,5,6,7,8,9,10,11            3:12 4:3,5,7,16 6:20 7:2,4,8,24            8:13,16,21,24 9:3 10:8 12:22            23:6 26:22 32:6 33:10,24 34:5            38:3 39:16 54:4 55:9  <b>body (2)</b> 15:21 42:13  <b>body-worn (1)</b> 30:5  <b>bolster (1)</b> 10:23  <b>Bond (5)</b> 3:9 38:5,8 39:13,15  <b>borough (2)</b> 6:10 8:10  <b>bottles (1)</b> 51:10  <b>Brian (2)</b> 4:19,20  <b>bridge (1)</b> 23:12  <b>brings (1)</b> 51:17  <b>broaden (1)</b> 28:15  <b>Bronx (2)</b> 8:20 37:12  <b>Brooklyn (2)</b> 8:6,7  <b>budget (2)</b> 11:11,11  <b>building (1)</b> 40:15  <b>bus (1)</b> 49:17  <b>business (8)</b> 2:8,18 4:22 5:20 7:22            9:5 54:3 55:9</p>
	<b>B</b>	
	<p><b>back (20)</b> 12:4 19:4 20:14 21:16,21            22:5,23 27:11 45:7,15 49:12,12            49:23 50:12,12,23,25 51:3,7,8  <b>backs (2)</b> 18:17,20  <b>bad (2)</b> 50:8 51:3  <b>badly (1)</b> 50:10  <b>bag (1)</b> 21:17  <b>Barrier (4)</b> 2:12 14:7 40:6,24  <b>barriers (1)</b> 15:12  <b>basis (1)</b> 34:14  <b>bear (1)</b> 22:2  <b>beat (2)</b> 27:2 42:17  <b>began (1)</b> 6:15  <b>behalf (4)</b> 29:15,21 32:23 48:13</p>	<b>C</b>
		<p><b>C (3)</b> 40:25 56:2,2  <b>call (12)</b> 2:4 6:24 9:10 14:6 23:15            26:18 33:12 35:25 44:2,12 52:14            53:3  <b>called (6)</b> 22:12 31:20 48:12 49:9            51:22 52:25  <b>calling (1)</b> 54:19  <b>calls (1)</b> 52:24  <b>calm (1)</b> 21:13  <b>camera (1)</b> 49:18  <b>cancelled (1)</b> 20:19  <b>canned (1)</b> 29:4  <b>car (1)</b> 29:5  <b>Carcatera (6)</b> 3:12 8:11,12 36:18            37:14,22  <b>care (1)</b> 48:19  <b>Carter (1)</b> 11:18  <b>case (4)</b> 29:23 30:2 34:5 49:19  <b>cases (2)</b> 33:25 34:3  <b>CCIT (1)</b> 29:16  <b>CCRB (7)</b> 6:6,18 10:20 11:12 54:11</p>

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

<p>54:13,21  <b>CCRB's (5)</b> 5:21 9:15 11:9,10  47:17  <b>Center (3)</b> 2:14 17:24 18:7  <b>certain (1)</b> 31:10  <b>certainly (2)</b> 42:3,4  <b>certified (3)</b> 19:7 35:18,19  <b>certify (1)</b> 56:6  <b>Chair (9)</b> 1:14 2:6 3:4 4:8,9,10,11  13:4 23:14  <b>challenges (1)</b> 14:18  <b>challenging (1)</b> 15:9  <b>changed (1)</b> 17:17  <b>changes (5)</b> 11:3,4,14 13:16 33:6  <b>charter (2)</b> 11:2 54:9  <b>chasing (1)</b> 49:9  <b>choice (1)</b> 46:10  <b>Chorus (2)</b> 13:22 55:18  <b>Christina (3)</b> 2:13 17:23 18:9  <b>Church (1)</b> 1:8  <b>cities (1)</b> 38:11  <b>citizen (1)</b> 52:2  <b>citizens (2)</b> 43:7 51:14  <b>city (21)</b> 6:4 7:7 8:6,10,23 9:16  10:15,25 11:4,7,22 14:25 25:13  29:18 31:5 32:17 34:11 52:19  54:19 55:3,6  <b>Civilian (2)</b> 1:3 4:4  <b>classified (1)</b> 35:18  <b>clear (1)</b> 16:11  <b>clearly (1)</b> 31:13  <b>clock (4)</b> 12:14,14,17 51:17  <b>close (2)</b> 19:25 20:7  <b>coalition (6)</b> 24:24,25 25:2 29:17  29:19 31:24  <b>codifying (1)</b> 11:9  <b>college (1)</b> 5:5  <b>come (6)</b> 7:19 31:17 46:16 50:25  52:22 53:5  <b>comedy (2)</b> 39:22,24  <b>comes (2)</b> 26:24 35:22  <b>coming (1)</b> 24:4  <b>command (1)</b> 17:3  <b>comment (6)</b> 2:19 12:15 14:5  42:22 47:25 53:25  <b>comments (5)</b> 6:22 12:12 51:15  53:18 55:8  <b>commission (4)</b> 6:17 9:24 10:3  11:3  <b>commissioner (4)</b> 7:12 8:13 23:25  37:21  <b>commissioner's (1)</b> 9:2  <b>commitment (1)</b> 27:21  <b>committee (1)</b> 54:9  <b>communal (1)</b> 27:17  <b>communicate (19)</b> 14:25 15:16,21  15:22 16:21 17:13 18:18 19:14</p>	<p>21:20 22:24 27:12 35:20 44:18  44:20 45:10,20,25 46:14 47:2  <b>communicating (1)</b> 45:4  <b>communication (6)</b> 15:11 19:2,6  28:5 29:25 43:10  <b>communities (2)</b> 17:19,20  <b>community (24)</b> 14:19,22 15:5,8,8  15:20 19:14 24:8,24 25:8 26:14  28:23 30:8 38:14,15 40:2 41:23  42:12,25 43:6,21 47:16,18 48:8  <b>complaining (1)</b> 41:10  <b>complaint (4)</b> 1:3 4:4 11:24,25  <b>complaints (1)</b> 43:7  <b>computer (1)</b> 28:5  <b>concerned (3)</b> 26:5 32:25 52:2  <b>concerns (2)</b> 38:19 54:8  <b>concurrences (1)</b> 13:8  <b>conduct (1)</b> 5:11  <b>conferences (1)</b> 52:19  <b>confidence (1)</b> 10:23  <b>consider (1)</b> 12:21  <b>considerable (1)</b> 5:14  <b>considered (1)</b> 14:24  <b>contact (1)</b> 26:24  <b>context (2)</b> 34:18 42:5  <b>continue (1)</b> 11:13  <b>continuing (1)</b> 54:15  <b>control (2)</b> 48:12,18  <b>conversation (1)</b> 54:25  <b>conversations (1)</b> 43:12  <b>convey (3)</b> 16:4,6 23:23  <b>cooperate (1)</b> 22:2  <b>coordinate (1)</b> 7:16  <b>Coordinator (1)</b> 2:11  <b>Correct (1)</b> 36:14  <b>correction (1)</b> 24:18  <b>council (8)</b> 6:7 8:7,10,24 10:25  11:4,13 55:3  <b>council's (1)</b> 11:7  <b>count (1)</b> 32:18  <b>country (2)</b> 19:12 38:12  <b>couple (4)</b> 12:25 33:19 34:6 48:2  <b>course (3)</b> 27:5 31:8 32:10  <b>court (5)</b> 20:5,17 22:4,8 30:4  <b>courtroom (1)</b> 20:10  <b>crisis (12)</b> 29:17,22 30:14,20 31:2  31:7,20 32:7,13,14,15 34:4  <b>critical (2)</b> 29:2,14  <b>crying (1)</b> 19:23  <b>culture (1)</b> 17:11  <b>Curry (3)</b> 2:13 17:23 18:9</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>D</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>D (2)</b> 49:23 50:24  <b>D.C (1)</b> 38:22  <b>dangerous (2)</b> 5:12 31:11  <b>Danner (1)</b> 52:5</p>	<p><b>Darche (15)</b> 1:15 3:14 6:21 8:17,17  9:7,8 12:25 13:7,16 23:14,21  34:23 47:13 50:15  <b>date (1)</b> 20:17  <b>Davie (3)</b> 1:14 4:9,11  <b>day (4)</b> 10:22 49:16 51:12 56:11  <b>dead (1)</b> 29:24  <b>deaf (64)</b> 2:15 14:19,21,24 15:4,8  15:18,20,24 16:8,21,23,25 17:10  17:16,19 18:8,11,12,21,24 19:5,7  19:13,17 24:7,24,25 25:8,15 26:8  26:13 27:10 28:22,23 29:3 30:8  34:8,10 35:5,21 37:5 38:13,15  40:4,10,16,20 42:24 43:6,15  44:12,13,19,20,21,24 45:16  46:15,23 47:15,17 48:8 50:8  <b>deal (8)</b> 4:23 33:24,25 37:14,15,17  41:20 47:12  <b>deals (1)</b> 53:9  <b>death (1)</b> 30:12  <b>deaths (1)</b> 30:9  <b>Deborah (1)</b> 52:5  <b>decent (1)</b> 32:15  <b>decide (1)</b> 54:21  <b>demanding (1)</b> 55:6  <b>Dennis (2)</b> 18:4,6  <b>department (18)</b> 4:23 7:11,18  10:12,13,18 23:3,24 24:2,6 26:2  33:22 34:13 35:13 36:10 37:16  51:21 54:20  <b>departments (1)</b> 38:16  <b>describe (1)</b> 16:20  <b>designee (7)</b> 4:7 8:10,16,20,24 9:3  38:9  <b>destroyed (1)</b> 22:6  <b>Detective (3)</b> 4:19,20 5:2  <b>detectives (2)</b> 21:3,22  <b>developed (2)</b> 31:13 42:20  <b>device (1)</b> 46:14  <b>dial (1)</b> 45:24  <b>dictated (1)</b> 13:17  <b>difference (1)</b> 41:24  <b>different (4)</b> 19:6 42:6 46:17 52:14  <b>director (11)</b> 1:15 2:7,13,16 3:14  6:12,21 8:18 17:23 24:15,21  <b>director's (1)</b> 9:5  <b>disabilities (5)</b> 15:4 29:13 32:22,24  34:14  <b>disability (1)</b> 24:22  <b>disabled (2)</b> 47:16,18  <b>disciplinary (4)</b> 6:25 10:4,17 54:10  <b>discipline (4)</b> 7:17 10:24 54:14,21  <b>disciplines (1)</b> 6:16  <b>disconnect (1)</b> 7:10  <b>discuss (1)</b> 33:17  <b>Disturbed (1)</b> 51:22  <b>documents (1)</b> 30:5</p>
---	---	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

<p><b>doing (2)</b> 9:15 10:4  <b>downtown (1)</b> 20:6  <b>drugs (2)</b> 50:21,21  <b>duty (1)</b> 4:18  <b>Dwyer (4)</b> 3:5 8:25 9:2 55:14</p>	<p><b>experiences (3)</b> 6:3 23:7 25:17  <b>explain (1)</b> 48:17  <b>express (1)</b> 54:7  <b>extent (1)</b> 34:2  <b>extremely (1)</b> 7:13  <b>eyes (1)</b> 47:8</p>	<p><b>FREDERICK (1)</b> 1:14  <b>Free (4)</b> 2:12 14:7 40:6,24  <b>frequently (1)</b> 30:21  <b>frightened (1)</b> 21:6  <b>front (6)</b> 21:18,19,23 43:9,19 44:5  <b>Full (1)</b> 14:10  <b>full-day (1)</b> 9:12  <b>fun (1)</b> 16:9  <b>future (1)</b> 23:11</p>
<p align="center"><b>E</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>F</b></p>	
<p><b>E (2)</b> 56:2,2  <b>E-MAIL (1)</b> 1:24  <b>eager (1)</b> 26:14  <b>earlier (1)</b> 9:23  <b>East (1)</b> 41:3  <b>easy (1)</b> 25:24  <b>echo (1)</b> 9:10  <b>EDP (2)</b> 51:22 53:15  <b>effect (2)</b> 10:13 42:9  <b>effectiveness (1)</b> 54:17  <b>effort (1)</b> 29:25  <b>efforts (1)</b> 28:15  <b>either (3)</b> 33:11 37:13 38:2  <b>elected (1)</b> 49:25  <b>Ellen (1)</b> 48:3  <b>eloquently (1)</b> 25:6  <b>emotional (1)</b> 19:23  <b>Emotionally (1)</b> 51:22  <b>emphasis (2)</b> 28:4,11  <b>encounter (2)</b> 16:13 40:16  <b>encountered (1)</b> 34:7  <b>ends (2)</b> 18:11,15  <b>enforce (1)</b> 54:14  <b>English (1)</b> 19:8  <b>enormous (1)</b> 25:7  <b>ensure (2)</b> 27:13 33:7  <b>ensuring (1)</b> 12:9  <b>entitled (2)</b> 5:22 47:22  <b>equal (1)</b> 12:10  <b>equally (1)</b> 27:5  <b>Erica (2)</b> 3:9 38:8  <b>errors (1)</b> 13:2  <b>escalate (1)</b> 44:22  <b>escalated (1)</b> 36:7  <b>Esq (3)</b> 1:15 2:16 3:14  <b>evening (2)</b> 8:8 19:21  <b>event (2)</b> 6:8 9:12  <b>everybody (3)</b> 8:4,11 49:11  <b>everybody's (1)</b> 7:23  <b>exact (1)</b> 35:2  <b>exactly (1)</b> 20:2  <b>excited (4)</b> 6:8 9:21 26:4 48:10  <b>exciting (1)</b> 12:20  <b>excuse (1)</b> 23:4  <b>executive (11)</b> 1:15 2:7,13,20 3:14              6:20 8:18 9:5 17:23 53:23 55:12  <b>expect (2)</b> 16:24 26:11  <b>experience (5)</b> 16:17 23:2 29:21              40:9,11  <b>experienced (1)</b> 31:2</p>	<p><b>F (1)</b> 56:2  <b>face (1)</b> 5:14  <b>facilities (2)</b> 40:3,12  <b>facility (1)</b> 40:7  <b>facing (1)</b> 43:4  <b>FACSIMILE (1)</b> 1:24  <b>fact (3)</b> 26:16 28:21 40:5  <b>fail (1)</b> 17:3  <b>failed (1)</b> 36:5  <b>familiar (4)</b> 34:2 38:21,23 41:2  <b>family (7)</b> 4:12 5:16,17 14:16 20:5              22:4,8  <b>famous (1)</b> 53:6  <b>far (2)</b> 8:2 28:13  <b>fast (1)</b> 27:25  <b>favor (3)</b> 10:8 13:21 55:17  <b>FCC (3)</b> 46:7,7,20  <b>fear (4)</b> 25:9,15 50:2 51:11  <b>February (5)</b> 1:5 4:3 5:24 9:13              56:11  <b>feel (7)</b> 7:8,10 11:5,5,21 15:19 50:8  <b>felt (2)</b> 22:6,23  <b>Fernandez (4)</b> 3:7 8:14,15 13:18  <b>fight (1)</b> 43:17  <b>fighting (1)</b> 21:16  <b>figuring (1)</b> 25:2  <b>find (3)</b> 27:3 29:22 50:24  <b>fine (3)</b> 28:8,9 31:13  <b>finger (1)</b> 28:24  <b>fire (1)</b> 43:17  <b>first (10)</b> 5:21 13:8 14:6,23 19:9              21:4 24:18 32:14 39:19 48:3  <b>Firstly (1)</b> 15:3  <b>floor (3)</b> 1:8 22:11 23:3  <b>focus (2)</b> 25:19 31:15  <b>folks (1)</b> 54:12  <b>follow (4)</b> 16:25 17:3 47:10,14  <b>following (2)</b> 2:8 51:20  <b>force (1)</b> 31:22  <b>forced (1)</b> 33:5  <b>forgive (1)</b> 19:22  <b>forgot (2)</b> 42:24,25  <b>form (3)</b> 13:9 46:13 52:11  <b>formal (1)</b> 31:4  <b>forth (2)</b> 21:16,22  <b>forward (1)</b> 6:5  <b>founded (1)</b> 25:16  <b>Frank (2)</b> 3:5 8:25  <b>Fred (2)</b> 4:9,11</p>	<p align="center"><b>G</b></p> <p><b>gang (2)</b> 17:12 26:3  <b>gap (1)</b> 23:12  <b>generally (1)</b> 10:14  <b>getting (5)</b> 27:21 28:20 34:19              41:11 52:20  <b>give (4)</b> 7:24 45:16,17 51:19  <b>go (16)</b> 5:15 7:5 16:16 17:4 18:12              18:15 23:20 26:15 28:12 43:18              44:4 49:17 50:3 51:4,6,8  <b>goal (1)</b> 25:2  <b>goes (1)</b> 32:10  <b>going (23)</b> 9:14,17 12:11 20:13,16              20:18 21:2,15 25:19 31:9 40:16              43:8 47:14,24 48:5 49:4,6 50:13              50:20,23 51:8,18 52:18  <b>good (14)</b> 4:2 8:8,22,25 10:15              14:12 18:5 19:21 21:18 24:17              31:14 50:20 51:12 54:6  <b>Gordan (1)</b> 19:22  <b>Gordon (6)</b> 2:15 19:20,21 23:22              42:21,23  <b>Gorman (2)</b> 4:21 5:16  <b>grab (2)</b> 22:15 50:2  <b>grabbed (1)</b> 20:25  <b>grabbing (1)</b> 49:21  <b>graduate (1)</b> 5:5  <b>great (4)</b> 10:2 29:6,7 53:3  <b>greater (1)</b> 7:5  <b>Griffin (1)</b> 11:18  <b>grit (1)</b> 21:25  <b>group (1)</b> 32:21  <b>groups (3)</b> 52:2,20,21  <b>guess (1)</b> 40:8  <b>guests (1)</b> 14:10  <b>guys (3)</b> 11:19 12:16 14:13</p> <p align="center"><b>H</b></p> <p><b>half (2)</b> 34:9,10  <b>hall (1)</b> 52:19  <b>hand (2)</b> 34:20 56:11  <b>handcuffed (1)</b> 19:3  <b>handcuffs (2)</b> 21:5 22:22  <b>handle (4)</b> 12:6 31:19 53:13,14  <b>hands (7)</b> 18:17,20 19:3 21:18,19              22:5 27:10  <b>happen (5)</b> 22:3 26:12,23 33:6</p>

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

46:6  
**happened (2)** 20:2,16  
**happening (5)** 12:16 18:12,15  
 33:10 43:13  
**happens (5)** 7:15 26:21 44:18  
 49:19 52:3  
**happy (2)** 33:16 37:24  
**harassing (1)** 49:22  
**harassment (1)** 49:20  
**hard (11)** 6:7 17:20 18:22 22:20  
 34:19 40:4,10,16,21 48:9,17  
**hardest (1)** 32:2  
**Harlem (4)** 2:14 17:24 18:7 37:13  
**hated (1)** 50:17  
**health (14)** 29:16,22 30:13,20,22  
 30:24 31:2,6 32:13,16 34:3,4,18  
 42:5  
**hear (13)** 6:9 11:20 14:13 16:24  
 17:2,2 23:6,9 27:8 43:4,22 46:4  
 49:5  
**heard (3)** 25:6 30:3 47:3  
**hearing (12)** 15:23 17:20 18:22  
 20:14 34:14 40:4,10,17,21 48:9  
 48:17 55:11  
**Hello (2)** 8:3,14  
**help (8)** 7:8 15:7 26:14,16,19 44:5  
 49:24 50:5  
**helped (1)** 38:18  
**helpful (1)** 9:14  
**hereunto (1)** 56:10  
**Herman (2)** 37:19,21  
**Hi (3)** 8:11,19 48:5  
**high (2)** 44:21 48:11  
**hits (2)** 19:25,25  
**holding (1)** 21:6  
**home (3)** 20:2 40:7,24  
**hope (1)** 32:8  
**hopeful (1)** 23:5  
**hopefully (2)** 5:17 7:18  
**hoping (1)** 30:15  
**hospital (1)** 43:18  
**hostage (3)** 53:8,10,13  
**house (1)** 40:4  
**huge (3)** 25:14,15 34:5  
**hugely (1)** 29:14  
**humiliation (1)** 16:17  
**hundreds (1)** 5:24

**I**

**idea (6)** 21:6 22:6,14 29:6 37:11  
 41:22  
**ideas (2)** 6:4 9:19  
**identify (1)** 44:12  
**imagine (1)** 50:10  
**immigrant (1)** 19:11  
**impairments (1)** 33:8  
**implement (1)** 39:11

**important (6)** 10:20 25:11 27:6  
 28:19 39:25 44:3  
**improve (3)** 17:6 24:6 41:13  
**improvements (1)** 44:7  
**improving (2)** 11:14 38:14  
**inability (1)** 16:10  
**incident (1)** 11:24  
**incidents (1)** 24:5  
**include (1)** 55:4  
**included (1)** 11:8  
**including (1)** 54:10  
**incorporating (1)** 13:16  
**indecipherable (27)** 14:16 15:5,16  
 15:24 16:5,8,23 17:5,14 35:5,7  
 35:22,23,25 37:12 38:22,24 39:7  
 39:11 41:15 44:11,14,23 45:3,14  
 45:22 46:23  
**independence (1)** 54:16  
**independent (6)** 2:14,15 6:14 10:5  
 17:24 18:7  
**individual (5)** 16:23 27:8 40:20  
 44:19,20  
**individuals (3)** 29:21 30:25 42:6  
**information (7)** 6:10 16:3 34:19  
 35:7 39:2 42:2 48:8  
**initially (1)** 52:9  
**insight (1)** 7:14  
**instances (1)** 31:10  
**institutions (1)** 7:19  
**instructions (1)** 16:25  
**interact (5)** 14:21 17:15 36:3,4  
 40:18  
**interaction (1)** 17:14  
**interactions (6)** 17:7 30:6 32:12  
 34:12 35:3 41:13  
**interacts (1)** 15:5  
**interest (6)** 2:17 10:2 11:14 12:9  
 24:16,23  
**interesting (2)** 42:9 52:21  
**internet (1)** 28:7  
**interpreter (25)** 19:7,16 20:11,20  
 21:9,10,12,14 22:15 27:14 28:10  
 35:18,24 36:6 43:11 44:3,15,17  
 45:7,9,10,14,23 46:12 47:3  
**interpreters (5)** 22:12 27:7,20,21  
 36:9  
**interpreting (2)** 22:9 28:8  
**intervention (3)** 29:18 31:21 32:7  
**intimately (1)** 34:2  
**introduce (1)** 7:25  
**investigate (1)** 12:5  
**investigators (1)** 11:17  
**invited (1)** 14:9  
**inviting (1)** 14:14  
**involved (4)** 28:20 30:19,21 53:8  
**involving (1)** 34:3  
**Island (4)** 37:3 41:17,19 50:4

**issue (8)** 12:3,7 24:3 39:21 47:9  
 48:14,23 54:16  
**issued (2)** 6:18 9:24  
**issues (4)** 23:18 34:4,8 47:11

**J**

**J (1)** 3:5  
**jail (2)** 17:4 51:6  
**Jennings (4)** 49:2,2,4,7  
**Jenningsy (1)** 49:3  
**job (2)** 5:4,9  
**Joe (1)** 39:18  
**John (3)** 3:4 4:6 53:6  
**Jonathan (5)** 1:15 3:14 6:21 8:17  
 9:6  
**Joseph (2)** 3:6 8:23  
**judge's (2)** 20:8,22  
**justice (3)** 24:22,25 25:10

**K**

**keep (2)** 12:12 13:3  
**kept (1)** 21:23  
**key (6)** 25:22 26:12 28:16 29:9  
 31:12 32:8  
**killed (1)** 42:12  
**kind (4)** 22:19 42:7 52:4 53:9  
**knew (1)** 22:9  
**knit (1)** 43:21  
**know (57)** 7:9 11:19 18:10 19:10  
 19:11,25 20:9,12 21:14 22:19  
 23:2 25:20 26:7,8,10 31:19 34:11  
 34:17 35:8,12,12,14,17 36:15,21  
 37:5,7,8 38:13 39:12,12 40:13,14  
 40:20 41:8,9,25 42:3,6,10 43:5  
 43:16,20,20,25 44:2 45:11 46:14  
 46:24 47:3,5,10 49:7,11 50:19  
 51:5 54:13  
**known (5)** 6:17 24:25 30:25 42:11  
 42:12  
**knows (2)** 36:3 42:16  
**Kristina (3)** 1:18 56:4,15

**L**

**L-O-W-E-N-K-R-O-N (1)** 24:19  
**lack (4)** 16:7 17:9 24:10,11  
**lacking (2)** 32:17 33:3  
**language (14)** 15:2,21 19:9,10,12  
 19:16 27:18 35:12,17,21 36:4,6,9  
 43:25  
**languages (1)** 22:11  
**late (2)** 4:20 38:7  
**lawmakers (1)** 10:21  
**lawyer (3)** 20:15,24 21:12  
**Lawyers (3)** 2:17 24:16,23  
**layer (1)** 16:12  
**learn (1)** 9:21  
**learned (2)** 37:8,11

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

leave (2) 50:6,6  
 let's (1) 7:23  
 letter (2) 49:16,18  
 letters (1) 49:17  
 level (1) 29:8  
 levels (1) 19:6  
 Levine (2) 48:3,5  
 Lexington (1) 41:20  
 Lieutenant (1) 50:7  
 life (3) 30:12 50:2 51:11  
 light (1) 50:20  
 line (5) 4:18 13:7,9,11 55:5  
 list (1) 52:6  
 listen (4) 9:18,21 23:8 48:20  
 literally (3) 29:24 30:11 43:19  
 litigate (1) 33:5  
 litigators (1) 31:23  
 little (3) 18:2 19:23 28:24  
 live (9) 14:24 28:10 40:5 43:2,16  
 45:10,14 46:12 47:2  
 living (8) 2:12,14 14:7 17:24 18:7  
 40:3,6,24  
 load (1) 34:5  
 lobby (1) 20:23  
 local (1) 38:16  
 locations (1) 40:23  
 long (5) 7:3,5 37:20 50:4 52:6  
 look (2) 28:24 51:4  
 looking (1) 38:17  
 lost (2) 20:12 54:23  
 lot (12) 10:5 14:19 15:14 16:2,22  
 23:17 28:22 31:22 39:2 43:15  
 46:18 52:18  
 lots (1) 51:25  
 louder (1) 15:24  
 Lowenkron (5) 24:17,18 34:15  
 37:24 41:21  
 Lowenkron's (1) 51:20  
 Lowenstein (2) 2:16 24:15  
 lower (2) 48:16,19  
 lying (1) 50:22

**M**

making (1) 39:24  
 malign (1) 25:25  
**MAMARONECK (2)** 1:22,23  
 man (2) 5:3 51:17  
 Manhattan (3) 8:23 37:4 41:8  
 Marbre (3) 3:11 8:2,4  
 march (2) 50:3 55:22  
 Martinez (3) 18:5,6 23:22  
 matter (3) 4:13 26:5 52:10  
 matters (1) 30:12  
 Matthew (1) 4:21  
 mayor (1) 54:11  
 mayoral (3) 4:7 8:15 38:9  
 mean (4) 17:12 30:7 36:12 40:19

meeting (8) 1:4 2:2 4:4 6:2 12:22  
 47:25 54:25 55:22  
 member (9) 3:5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12  
 7:4  
 members (11) 3:2 6:16,20 7:9,24  
 35:11 38:4 39:16,20 52:17 54:3  
 mental (13) 29:16,22 30:13,20,24  
 31:2,6 32:13,16 34:3,4,18 42:4  
 mention (1) 43:2  
 mentioned (1) 25:21  
 message (1) 16:6  
 method (1) 32:7  
 Michael (2) 3:8 8:19  
 million (2) 34:9,10  
 minimize (1) 30:7  
 minor (1) 24:18  
 minutes (10) 2:5 12:13,21,24  
 13:15,25 14:8 48:4 51:19 53:11  
 miscommunications (1) 30:10  
 misconception (2) 14:20 15:15  
 misconceptions (1) 17:8  
 misconduct (2) 6:16 10:19  
 mistake (1) 13:10  
 mistreatment (1) 16:18  
 misunderstanding (3) 14:20 15:14  
 16:3  
 mobility (1) 33:8  
 mocked (1) 16:9  
 models (1) 38:12  
 Mohammed (1) 52:5  
 moment (3) 12:20 46:13,15  
 month's (1) 12:21  
 months (2) 10:3 37:10  
 mother (1) 52:25  
 motion (4) 12:23 13:15 53:22  
 55:12  
 mouth (1) 50:17  
 move (1) 47:24  
 moved (2) 13:18 55:14  
 movies (1) 53:7  
 moving (1) 6:4

**N**

name (9) 8:4,14 13:12 18:6 19:22  
 38:8 48:25 54:7,18  
 name's (2) 4:6 8:9  
 natural (1) 26:6  
 nature (1) 4:22  
 near (1) 41:19  
 nearly (1) 5:8  
 necessarily (1) 52:17  
 need (13) 17:10 19:7 21:9,10,14,20  
 23:9 28:10 43:25 44:2,7,7 47:19  
 needed (1) 42:15  
 needs (8) 17:15,17,17 19:6 21:12  
 43:18 44:5,7  
 negative (1) 25:17

neighborhood (1) 40:8  
 never (4) 43:16 44:15,16 50:17  
**New (16)** 1:9,9,23 2:8,16 6:4,9  
 10:22 11:6 14:25 24:15,22 29:18  
 34:11 39:6 56:5  
**news (2)** 4:25 39:23  
**Nicolyn (8)** 2:10 14:6 18:23 19:24  
 25:21 34:20,23,24  
**Normally (1)** 45:5  
**Notary (1)** 56:5  
**note (1)** 6:23  
**notes (2)** 21:21 56:8  
**notice (1)** 51:4  
**noticed (1)** 21:4  
**November (1)** 50:7  
**number (7)** 9:25 31:13 45:17,18,19  
 45:24 52:14  
**numbers (2)** 25:14 37:25  
**NYC (1)** 29:17  
**NYC./CCRByouthsummit (1)** 6:13  
**NYPD (27)** 4:17 6:3,15 10:6 14:16  
 14:18,21 15:6,10,15 16:13,16  
 17:15,15 19:14 23:5 24:8 25:4  
 27:22 35:5,11 36:2,25 38:25  
 39:11 47:15 52:17  
**NYPD's (1)** 11:11  
**NYU (2)** 6:2 9:13

**O**

obvious (1) 35:10  
 obviously (2) 18:19 41:22  
 offer (1) 5:20  
 office (6) 22:10,10 29:13,20 31:24  
 52:11  
**officer (38)** 15:10 16:4,6,8,20,22  
 17:7 18:13 26:10,24 31:16 35:20  
 36:3,5,13 40:20 42:16 44:16,23  
 44:24 45:6,8,13,17,17,20,23 46:2  
 46:5,8,11,23,25 52:8 53:6,11,12  
 53:14  
**officers (11)** 4:18 5:11 10:19 15:19  
 25:23 32:5 35:16 36:11 41:12  
 43:8 45:18  
**official (1)** 49:25  
**oh (1)** 11:19  
**Okay (1)** 14:13  
**old (3)** 2:18 5:3 54:3  
**olds (1)** 5:8  
**Opal (4)** 2:15 19:20,22 21:11  
**open (2)** 10:20 14:5  
**opened (2)** 47:8 50:17  
**operator (1)** 46:4  
**opportunity (5)** 7:25 9:18 14:15  
 24:20 54:23  
**opposed (1)** 13:23  
**opposition (1)** 55:19  
**order (2)** 2:4 9:4

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

**ought (1)** 7:21  
**outcome (1)** 37:10  
**Outreach (2)** 2:11 6:11  
**oversight (1)** 11:6

**P**

**page (4)** 13:7,9,11,11  
**panel (1)** 6:14  
**paper (1)** 51:10  
**part (6)** 28:25 29:16,19 31:4 34:5 37:16  
**participate (1)** 9:11  
**particularly (1)** 52:16  
**partners (1)** 31:25  
**pass (1)** 44:13  
**passed (1)** 15:3  
**pausing (1)** 18:2  
**paying (1)** 4:17  
**PD (1)** 37:17  
**peers (1)** 30:25  
**Peguero (3)** 3:10 8:8,9  
**Penn (1)** 49:16  
**people (37)** 5:25 9:11,16,19 10:16 11:20 15:4,23 18:11,21,24 20:9 25:14 28:22 29:12,15 31:6,25 32:13 33:7 34:3,8,11,13 40:10,15 40:17 41:9 43:15 48:2 49:21 52:8 52:13,15,23 53:5,17  
**percent (3)** 35:4 36:2 44:11  
**perfunctory (1)** 13:6  
**period (1)** 37:20  
**person (8)** 18:12 19:5,17 26:8 27:9 42:11 50:8 53:9  
**person's (1)** 32:22  
**personal (1)** 20:7  
**personnel (1)** 35:13  
**Persons (1)** 51:23  
**perspective (1)** 28:5  
**physical (2)** 32:24,25  
**pilot (8)** 27:24 28:12 36:19,24 37:2 37:7,11 41:5  
**pilots (7)** 37:9,10 41:6,7,14,17 45:12  
**pinch (2)** 28:9,9  
**place (6)** 32:14 37:3,12 41:15 45:11 47:4  
**places (2)** 5:7 38:17  
**plan (3)** 6:8 45:7,15  
**platform (1)** 29:11  
**play (1)** 50:20  
**please (8)** 6:11 14:11 19:22 21:23 23:6 26:18 33:12 34:21  
**Plummer (17)** 2:10 14:7,8,12 23:22 34:25 35:15 36:12,15,22 37:18 37:23 38:21 39:14 40:19 41:5 44:10  
**pocketbook (1)** 21:2

**point (6)** 10:9 28:21 33:16 36:7 44:24 51:21  
**points (1)** 39:25  
**police (56)** 4:23 7:11 8:12 9:2,16 10:23 11:6 15:10,13 17:7 18:10 18:13,16 23:24,24 25:18,23,25 26:10,24 27:2 29:7 30:17,18 31:9 31:16,21 32:4,5 33:2,4 34:12 35:13 36:10 37:15 38:16 39:5 40:9,11 41:7,12,23 42:5,16 43:8 43:24 48:13 51:21 52:5,8,11,23 53:10,12,14 54:20  
**police-community (1)** 11:22  
**policies (1)** 25:13  
**policing (4)** 5:22 11:16 41:23 42:7  
**policy (1)** 23:18  
**politely (1)** 52:10  
**portrayed (1)** 44:25  
**positive (1)** 42:19  
**postponed (1)** 20:18  
**pouring (1)** 6:19  
**power (4)** 54:13,20 55:4,7  
**prayers (1)** 5:15  
**precinct (5)** 37:25 41:16,17,18 50:4  
**precincts (4)** 28:14 36:21 37:6,9  
**precisely (1)** 39:23  
**prepared (1)** 40:17  
**present (2)** 3:2 28:10  
**presentation (1)** 14:11  
**Press (1)** 52:19  
**prevents (1)** 18:25  
**pride (1)** 31:23  
**primarily (2)** 14:25 40:4  
**primary (2)** 25:2,5  
**prior (1)** 12:21  
**probably (1)** 40:13  
**problem (3)** 25:8 49:9 53:2  
**problems (3)** 23:11 43:5 52:7  
**Proceedings (53)** 1:12 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1  
**process (4)** 7:15,21 10:5 31:4  
**processing (1)** 18:3  
**professional (1)** 30:22  
**professionals (1)** 30:24  
**program (4)** 24:22 27:24 28:12 36:19  
**programs (3)** 36:24 37:2 38:18  
**projects (1)** 38:18  
**pronouns (1)** 8:5

**proposals (1)** 11:8  
**prosecution (1)** 11:10  
**protocol (2)** 39:12 44:2  
**provide (4)** 19:15 36:5 37:25 46:12  
**providing (1)** 47:19  
**public (17)** 1:4 2:2,17,19 10:23 12:3,8,15 14:5 24:16,23 26:25 39:20 47:24 51:14 54:24 56:5  
**Puma (5)** 3:6 8:22,23 39:19 40:22  
**purchased (1)** 28:6  
**push (2)** 11:13 28:17  
**pushing (1)** 52:23  
**put (5)** 18:17 21:17,17,19 22:5  
**putting (1)** 28:3

**Q**

**Queens (3)** 8:9 37:3 41:19  
**question (3)** 35:10 38:10 53:25  
**questions (10)** 11:25 23:18 24:11 33:15,19 34:7 36:17 38:4 39:17 47:11  
**quick (2)** 22:21 53:24  
**quickly (2)** 5:18 32:21  
**quietly (1)** 49:13  
**quite (2)** 26:17 39:8

**R**

**R (1)** 56:2  
**Rail (1)** 50:4  
**raised (1)** 38:19  
**raises (1)** 47:11  
**raising (3)** 23:19 28:24 34:20  
**Ramon (2)** 3:10 8:9  
**reach (3)** 15:9,10 50:3  
**reaching (1)** 49:22  
**reaction (1)** 26:6  
**reading (1)** 4:25  
**real (4)** 4:9,11 28:10 54:23  
**reallocation (1)** 55:7  
**really (9)** 12:17 19:25 22:25 23:4 25:11 28:18 43:22 48:11 55:6  
**reason (2)** 21:19 39:8  
**reasons (1)** 20:8  
**receive (1)** 51:23  
**receiving (1)** 39:10  
**recognize (2)** 25:14 31:8  
**recommend (1)** 35:23  
**recommendations (6)** 7:17 9:25 11:8 54:8,15 55:3  
**record (1)** 56:8  
**records (2)** 10:6 35:6  
**recuperates (1)** 5:17  
**reformed (1)** 17:18  
**refuse (1)** 48:20  
**regard (3)** 26:19 33:7 47:14  
**regarding (1)** 5:2  
**related (2)** 27:6 29:12

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

**relations (1)** 11:22  
**relationship (10)** 9:15 24:7 25:3  
 38:25 39:3,5 42:7,19 47:15,17  
**relationships (1)** 38:14  
**relaxed (1)** 52:10  
**relay (4)** 45:21,25 46:5,11  
**rely (1)** 42:15  
**remain (1)** 22:19  
**remember (2)** 45:22 46:9  
**reminder (4)** 4:21 5:6,10,21  
**remove (1)** 30:17  
**rep (1)** 8:7  
**replacing (1)** 18:8  
**replicated (1)** 28:2  
**report (10)** 2:6,7 6:18,19 9:6,14,24  
 10:7 11:2 16:14  
**REPORTED (1)** 1:17  
**reporter (1)** 56:4  
**REPORTING (1)** 1:22  
**reports (2)** 5:2 49:20  
**representative (1)** 8:13  
**required (1)** 30:22  
**research (1)** 33:22  
**resistance (1)** 28:23  
**respect (4)** 12:16 30:6,13 47:21  
**respects (1)** 4:17  
**respond (3)** 31:6,9 52:15  
**responding (4)** 40:11,14,22 52:24  
**response (4)** 13:24 53:19 55:10,20  
**result (2)** 29:24 30:9  
**results (2)** 7:21 28:16  
**Reverend (1)** 4:11  
**review (6)** 1:3 4:4 5:11 6:15 10:4  
 12:20  
**reviewing (1)** 10:2  
**revision (2)** 11:2 54:9  
**Ribbon (2)** 6:17 9:24  
**right (8)** 8:2 21:3,8,13 22:18 42:15  
 43:9 52:22  
**risks (1)** 5:14  
**Rivadeneira (4)** 3:8 8:19,20 13:20  
**Road (1)** 50:4  
**Rochester (1)** 39:3  
**room (9)** 20:8,15,22,23 21:3 46:9  
 46:22,24 54:12  
**run (1)** 22:14  
**Ruth (2)** 2:16 24:15

**S**

**sad (1)** 43:23  
**sadly (1)** 25:16  
**Sal (1)** 8:12  
**Salis (1)** 11:18  
**SALVATORE (1)** 3:12  
**Sara (3)** 11:18,19 12:4  
**saw (2)** 39:22 50:12  
**saying (6)** 21:23 24:13 26:15 32:11

46:3 50:18  
**says (3)** 13:9 29:3 49:18  
**scenario (1)** 29:23  
**scene (3)** 16:21 31:3 44:15  
**school (1)** 41:20  
**screen (1)** 46:4  
**second (7)** 13:19 22:11 23:3 40:24  
 51:21 55:15,16  
**section (2)** 14:5 47:25  
**see (12)** 6:11 12:13 13:5 26:3,4  
 43:9,12,19 49:16 51:3,9 52:8  
**seeing (3)** 7:20 33:6 53:20  
**seen (4)** 28:15 42:8 47:4 51:9  
**segment (1)** 39:23  
**self (1)** 44:13  
**senior (2)** 2:10 43:6  
**sensitive (1)** 17:9  
**sent (1)** 10:25  
**September (2)** 20:4,4  
**Sergent (2)** 4:20 5:16  
**series (1)** 14:4  
**serious (1)** 4:22  
**serve (2)** 9:20 25:13  
**served (1)** 41:11  
**service (4)** 5:4,9 28:7 35:11  
**services (9)** 1:22 32:16 39:10  
 45:21 46:2,6,11,18 47:19  
**serving (2)** 4:8,10  
**session (3)** 2:20 53:23 55:13  
**set (1)** 56:10  
**setting (1)** 27:23  
**seven (1)** 10:3  
**Shanahan (1)** 53:7  
**share (3)** 6:2,21 12:10  
**sharing (1)** 24:4  
**short (2)** 49:5,6  
**shorthand (1)** 56:4  
**shot (2)** 4:18 29:24  
**showed (1)** 44:15  
**shows (2)** 39:23 52:9  
**side (1)** 37:16  
**Siegal (41)** 3:4 4:2,6 9:4,9,23 10:8  
 12:19 13:5,14,19,21,23,25 14:9  
 17:22 19:19 23:17 24:14 33:18  
 35:9 36:8,14,16 38:3 39:16 42:21  
 44:9 47:6,23 48:24 51:13 53:16  
 53:20 54:2 55:8,11,15,17,19,21  
**Siegal's (1)** 9:10  
**sign (18)** 15:2 17:12,12 18:13,15  
 18:19 19:10,11,16 27:17 35:12  
 35:14,17,21 36:3,6,8 43:25  
**signed (3)** 21:9 48:2,25  
**significantly (1)** 7:9  
**signing (1)** 26:3  
**silent (1)** 22:19  
**silver (1)** 21:5  
**Simonsen (3)** 4:19,20 5:2

**Sir (1)** 51:16  
**sit (8)** 31:25 49:11,13 50:11,23  
 51:3,6,8  
**sitting (1)** 50:12  
**situation (8)** 16:11,19 30:17 31:19  
 36:7 44:22 52:4 53:15  
**situations (5)** 5:13 31:11 42:3 53:8  
 53:13  
**size (1)** 39:7  
**skills (1)** 53:5  
**social (4)** 2:10 20:13,23 21:11  
**society (1)** 5:7  
**solutions (1)** 25:20  
**somebody (1)** 52:3  
**son (1)** 52:25  
**soon (1)** 54:25  
**sorely (2)** 32:16 33:2  
**Sorry (1)** 38:2  
**sort (2)** 27:17 30:3  
**sorts (2)** 52:20 53:7  
**sound (1)** 15:6  
**speak (13)** 5:22,23 14:14 15:23  
 16:10 24:21 27:11 48:3,6,9 49:25  
 50:14,24  
**speaker (9)** 13:12 17:22,25 19:20  
 23:16 24:14 48:3,24 51:18  
**speakers (6)** 2:9 12:8 14:4 25:7  
 34:10 47:8  
**specific (2)** 11:23 40:23  
**spelt (1)** 13:13  
**spent (1)** 10:3  
**spicy (1)** 13:3  
**spoke (3)** 33:21 36:19 49:23  
**spoken (1)** 42:20  
**staff (5)** 6:6,18 36:8,12 47:9  
**Stahly-Butts (6)** 3:11 8:3,5 53:24  
 54:6 55:16  
**stand (3)** 15:17,23,25  
**standing (1)** 44:4  
**start (4)** 14:17 33:18 36:20 41:12  
**started (1)** 5:19  
**Starting (1)** 8:2  
**starts (1)** 44:22  
**state (2)** 30:4 56:5  
**statement (1)** 56:7  
**statements (2)** 29:4,6  
**Staten (3)** 37:3 41:17,18  
**station (3)** 16:16 27:3 41:7  
**stations (1)** 33:2  
**STENO-KATH (1)** 1:22  
**stenographic (1)** 56:8  
**Stenokath@verizon.net (1)** 1:24  
**steps (1)** 52:20  
**stop (1)** 15:4  
**stories (5)** 23:7,23 27:9 43:5,22  
**strategy (1)** 46:17  
**street (6)** 1:8 31:17 40:24 41:4

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

43:3,13  
**strengthen (1)** 11:6  
**strong (1)** 38:25  
**struck (1)** 4:25  
**study (2)** 41:25 42:8  
**subject (1)** 51:22  
**suffering (1)** 39:9  
**suggested (1)** 11:3  
**summit (3)** 5:22 6:11 9:12  
**support (3)** 32:9,19 33:12  
**supportive (1)** 30:16  
**supposed (3)** 46:6,19,21  
**supreme (1)** 30:4  
**sure (12)** 6:20 23:20,25 26:21 32:5  
 39:8 42:8 47:18,20 48:25 51:24  
 55:2  
**Susan (2)** 37:19,21  
**system (4)** 6:25 7:6 10:17 17:16

**T**

**T (2)** 56:2,2  
**tablet (2)** 45:8,14  
**tablets (2)** 28:6 46:25  
**take (6)** 18:16 37:2,2,12 41:14  
 45:19  
**takeaways (1)** 6:24  
**taken (2)** 47:4 56:8  
**talk (6)** 6:3 12:4,10 15:13 29:11  
 51:2  
**talking (3)** 30:11 46:5 52:13  
**Tanya (4)** 41:2,10 43:3,8  
**team (1)** 23:12  
**telephone (1)** 45:9  
**tell (8)** 23:21 24:6 26:16 45:5,16  
 46:10 48:16,18  
**telling (1)** 24:2  
**tend (3)** 15:22,25 16:9  
**tends (2)** 15:6,14  
**term (1)** 35:6  
**terms (2)** 7:20 31:5  
**testify (2)** 14:4 39:21  
**testimony (3)** 2:8 14:3 23:20  
**thank (25)** 4:14 9:8 14:14,15 17:20  
 19:18,19 23:13 24:20 33:14,17  
 36:16 37:22 39:13,15,19 44:9  
 47:6,23 48:6,23 51:13 53:15,16  
 55:22  
**thing (6)** 16:15 21:4 23:15 28:18  
 32:20 50:19  
**things (7)** 25:4,5 28:19 29:9 30:11  
 32:2 46:19  
**think (21)** 5:7 7:4 9:17 10:14,16  
 18:13 24:10 25:11,12,20 26:2  
 41:12,21 47:7,12 49:2 54:12,16  
 54:21,23 55:5  
**thoughts (2)** 5:15 12:11  
**threaten (1)** 48:15

**threatened (1)** 15:19  
**threatening (1)** 15:7  
**three (9)** 20:24 28:13 36:20,24,25  
 37:2,6,9,9  
**threw (2)** 22:22,22  
**tied (1)** 27:10  
**tight (1)** 43:21  
**time (17)** 7:3,19 12:10,14 15:15  
 16:2,5,22 34:19 36:2,4 37:21  
 44:12 49:6,23 50:24,25  
**times (3)** 35:2,4 50:5  
**tired (1)** 50:18  
**today (8)** 4:8,10 11:18 12:10 18:9  
 24:21 38:20 50:24  
**told (4)** 20:17 21:11,11 35:16  
**tone (1)** 15:18  
**top (1)** 49:18  
**topic (1)** 39:24  
**Tower (1)** 41:10  
**Towers (3)** 41:2 43:3,9  
**town (1)** 4:12  
**train (4)** 49:17 53:10,12,14  
**trained (5)** 26:9,10 29:8 32:5 52:16  
**training (16)** 17:9,15 25:22 26:12  
 26:18,21,23 29:2,18 31:14,15,21  
 32:7,8 43:14 51:24  
**TRANSCRIPTS (1)** 1:12  
**transfer (2)** 54:10,19  
**translating (1)** 22:10  
**translation (1)** 23:3  
**transparency (6)** 6:24 7:14 10:7,9  
 10:14 11:15  
**transportation (1)** 33:3  
**transported (1)** 33:9  
**treat (3)** 47:20 50:9,10  
**treated (1)** 10:12  
**treats (1)** 10:18  
**tremendous (1)** 51:23  
**triage (2)** 31:11,16  
**trigger (2)** 52:10,12  
**Trnka (3)** 1:18 56:4,15  
**true (1)** 56:7  
**trust (1)** 7:6  
**try (5)** 23:6 24:6 25:10 32:2 51:2  
**trying (4)** 16:5 25:12,25 30:5  
**Tuesday (2)** 5:24 9:13  
**turn (4)** 9:6 21:23,24 34:22  
**turned (1)** 22:4  
**two (9)** 4:17 5:23 7:18 11:17 12:12  
 14:8 21:3 29:11 48:4  
**tying (1)** 11:10  
**type (1)** 48:23

**U**

**ultimately (2)** 7:6,12  
**unbelievably (1)** 50:9  
**underline (1)** 50:21

**understand (11)** 10:17 15:8 17:10  
 17:11 25:24 28:14 39:14 41:24  
 44:6 46:2,20  
**understanding (5)** 10:11 16:7  
 24:12 35:15 39:4  
**understood (1)** 22:20  
**uniform (2)** 52:9,12  
**unit (1)** 11:10  
**University (2)** 38:23,24  
**UNKNOWN (2)** 17:25 51:18  
**update (1)** 37:13  
**upset (2)** 22:16 48:10  
**upstairs (1)** 22:15  
**use (4)** 8:5 33:8 46:11,22

**V**

**vans (2)** 33:3,9  
**various (1)** 14:18  
**victim (7)** 45:5,16,19,24 46:3,8,10  
**victimization (1)** 16:13  
**video (7)** 1:12 45:9,13,21,25 46:5  
 46:11  
**view (1)** 10:10  
**views (1)** 7:16  
**violation (1)** 46:7  
**visit (1)** 6:12  
**visor (3)** 28:25 29:2,3  
**visors (1)** 28:20  
**vocalizing (1)** 27:16  
**voice (5)** 18:21 48:11,16,18,19  
**voicing (2)** 18:3,23  
**vulnerable (1)** 5:12

**W**

**W-O-U-K (1)** 13:13  
**wait (1)** 27:18  
**walking (2)** 20:21,25  
**want (16)** 9:10 14:17,23 16:16,19  
 22:2 23:8,10 24:9 29:11 30:18  
 36:22,23 39:19 48:22 54:24  
**wanted (6)** 23:21 29:9 40:8 48:7  
 54:7,18  
**Washington (1)** 38:22  
**wasn't (3)** 24:11 27:24,25  
**watch (2)** 49:13,14  
**watching (2)** 49:10 51:7  
**water (1)** 51:10  
**way (12)** 7:5 12:6 15:6 17:13 19:13  
 25:23 26:17 29:23 32:15 42:20  
 45:3,4  
**ways (1)** 32:12  
**we'll (1)** 18:3  
**we're (3)** 18:2 26:15 55:21  
**we've (4)** 28:20 32:4 37:20 42:7  
**week (2)** 30:4 39:22  
**weeks (1)** 5:23  
**welcome (2)** 4:3 37:23



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final  
February 13, 2019**

<p>went (2) 20:5 22:13 weren't (1) 24:10 wheelchairs (1) 33:8 whereof (1) 56:10 willing (1) 45:18 win-win (1) 30:18 window (2) 43:10,20 witness (1) 56:10 wondering (1) 38:11 word (1) 13:8 work (12) 5:14 7:8 11:12 18:6 19:8 23:9,11 24:23 29:5,15 31:22 32:3 worked (1) 27:22 worker (4) 2:10 20:13,24 21:11 working (9) 6:7 10:21 25:3 29:14 32:4 36:25 37:19,20 38:13 works (2) 10:18 27:19 worst (1) 29:23 Wouk (1) 13:13 write (4) 21:21,21 22:24 49:14 Writing (1) 27:15</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>X</b></p> <hr/> <p>X (2) 1:2,7</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>Y</b></p> <hr/> <p>Y (1) 49:2 ya'll (1) 26:15 year (1) 6:15 years (5) 5:4,8 36:25 49:8 50:16 yesterday (2) 4:19 49:10 Yojaira (1) 6:12 York (13) 1:9,9,23 2:16 6:4 11:7 14:25 24:15,22 29:18 34:11 39:6 56:5 Yorkers (2) 6:9 10:22 young (6) 5:13,24 6:9 9:11,16,19 youth (4) 5:21 6:6,11 9:12</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>Z</b></p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>0</b></p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>1</b></p> <hr/> <p>1 (2) 2:4 17:25 10 (1) 5:25 100 (1) 1:8 10543 (1) 1:23 10th (1) 1:8 115 (2) 41:18,19 12 (1) 50:16 121 (3) 41:16,17,19 13 (1) 1:5 139 (1) 1:22 13th (1) 41:3 14th (1) 43:3 15 (3) 35:16 36:10 53:11</p>	<p>1600 (1) 49:16 19 (1) 5:4</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>2</b></p> <hr/> <p>2 (2) 2:5 51:18 20 (2) 5:8 13:7 2015 (1) 20:5 2018 (1) 50:7 2019 (3) 1:5 11:2 56:11 212.95.DEPOS (1) 1:23 22 (1) 51:19 23 (1) 13:9 24 (1) 5:25 26th (2) 5:24 9:13 27th (1) 56:11</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>3</b></p> <hr/> <p>3 (1) 2:6</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>4</b></p> <hr/> <p>4 (2) 2:7 50:4 42-year (2) 5:3,8 45 (1) 13:9</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>5</b></p> <hr/> <p>5 (1) 2:8 500,000 (1) 14:24 50A (1) 12:3 55 (1) 35:4</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>6</b></p> <hr/> <p>6 (2) 2:18 13:7 6:00p.m (1) 1:9 620 (1) 41:3</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>7</b></p> <hr/> <p>7 (1) 2:19 7:00p.m (1) 1:9</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>8</b></p> <hr/> <p>8 (1) 2:20 81 (1) 13:11</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>9</b></p> <hr/> <p>9 (1) 13:11 90 (2) 36:2 44:11 911 (4) 31:12,16 44:12 53:4 914.381.2061 (1) 1:23 914.722.0816 (1) 1:24 953.3767 (1) 1:23 97 (1) 13:12</p>
---	--