

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

1

1 -----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

2

PUBLIC MEETING

3

November 14, 2018

4

6:47 p.m.

5

5 -----X

Saint Clare Catholic Academy

6

137-25 Brookville Boulevard

Auditorium

7

Rosedale, New York

8

9

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

10

B E F O R E:

11

FREDERICK DAVIE, Chair

12

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

13

14

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

15

1. Call to Order

16

2. Adoption of Minutes

17

3. Report from Chair

18

4. Report from the Executive Director

19

5. Presentation by Outreach on the CCRB

20

6. Presentation from Policy on Data

21

7. Comment from Community Groups

22

8. Public Comment

23

9. Old Business

24

10. New Business

25

11. Adjourn to Executive Session

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:
=====

FREDERICK DAVIE, Chair

RAMON PEGUERO, ESQ., Board Member

NATHAN JOSEPH, Board Member

JOSEPH A. PUMA, Board Member

ERICA BOND, Board Member

MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA, ESQ., Board Member

MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS, Board Member
=====

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

Reported By:
Nicole Ellis

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

3

1 Proceedings

2 MS. BOND: Good evening. Welcome
3 to the November meeting of the Civilian
4 Complaint Review Board. I'm not actually
5 our chair, Fred Davie. My name is Erica
6 Bond. Fred is running a few minutes late
7 so we're going to get the meeting started
8 without him and he'll be joining us
9 shortly.

10 And before we begin, I will just
11 ask each of the board members to please
12 introduce themselves. We'll start with
13 our newest board member, Nathan.

14 MR. JOSEPH: Good evening. My
15 name is Nathan Joseph. I'm a City Council
16 appointee representing Staten Island.

17 MR. RIVADENEYRA: Good evening,
18 everyone. I'm Michael Rivadeneyra, the
19 Council Bronx designee. Thank you.

20 MS. BOND: I'm Erica Bond. I'm a
21 mayoral designee.

22 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: Jonathan
23 Darche, executive director.

24 MR. PEGUERO: Ramon Peguero, City
25 Council designee for the Borough of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

4

1 Proceedings

2 Queens.

3 MS. BOND: And with that, our
4 executive director, John Darche.

5 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: Good evening,
6 everyone. It's good to be in my home
7 borough today. I'd like to thank the
8 principal of the school, Mary Rafferty
9 Brazil, Assistant principal Deanna Mayer
10 and the board of St. Clare Catholic
11 Academy for hosting us this evening. I'm
12 glad to see so many young people here.

13 We're having a Youth Summit in
14 February and I hope many of you will be
15 able to participate in that. The Youth
16 Summit is on February 5th of next year at
17 NYU. It's a full day opportunity for
18 young people ages 10 to 24 from every
19 neighborhood of this city, every borough,
20 to offer their input on police-community
21 relations in New York City.

22 We're -- this program is going to
23 be for youth, by youth. We're setting up
24 a Youth Advisory Council to help not only
25 steer this event, but steer the CCRB as it

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

5

1 Proceedings

2 deals with police-community relations.

3 The applications to be on the
4 Youth Advisory Council are due on Monday,
5 November 26th, which is the Monday after
6 Thanksgiving.

7 The Youth Advisory Council is a
8 select group of 15 young people between
9 the ages of 10 and 24 who want to make a
10 difference in their communities as
11 ambassadors in the conversation about the
12 CCRB and improving police-community
13 relations.

14 You can apply online at
15 nyc.gov/ccrbyouthcouncil and for more
16 information you can see our director of
17 outreach and intergovernmental affairs,
18 Yojaira Alvarez.

19 So we have two investigators here
20 today; Zachary Herman and Harold
21 Rodriguez. I think they are already
22 outside meeting with someone who wants to
23 file a complaint or who is filing a
24 complaint.

25 When people come up to speak, one

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

6

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

of the things we can't do is speak publicly about complaints, so if you have an incident that you want to discuss specifically, I'm going to ask that you not discuss it in public and instead speak to the investigators.

We have one person who we've invited to speak who has to leave, so I'm going to -- I'm going to ask Ms. Erica Ford to speak at the podium briefly out of order.

Thank you, Ms. Ford.

MS. FORD: Good afternoon -- good evening. Thank you for holding this.

I just want to say that CCRB is a valuable tool and we have to get a way for more people to engage and maybe even more ways to build community partnership in getting the stories out and hearing the stories, because most people don't come to meetings, right? But a lot of people have stories. And valid or not, we have to create a way for someone to listen and so maybe if there's ways not to have full

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

7

1 Proceedings

2 meetings, but ways that we can have
3 community conversations around what's
4 going on that we can take back or Facebook
5 live conversations maybe to engage or the
6 process itself, because some people don't
7 even know the process.

8 But I also want to just speak
9 on -- a lot of times we speak on the
10 negative things that are happening and I
11 also want to take a second to speak on the
12 positive. Because of so many incidents
13 that were happening in our community, we
14 took it upon ourselves to work together
15 with the precinct to form a way that we
16 can be an inter -- in between the police
17 and the community.

18 And so now when there's different
19 situations, people call LIFE Camp or when
20 the police have situations with
21 individuals who they don't want to
22 escalate, they call LIFE Camp, and so we
23 go and respond to both sides of the
24 equation and create a situation where
25 there can be community conversation and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

9

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

you really going to listen to them or you really don't understand what it is they're saying, because sometimes we don't know what we don't know and don't know how to listen what we never knew we should be listening to, because we don't know how to hear it because we never can imagine it.

And so sometimes we have to take out our professional being and just become human beings and really interconnect in what's going on in our community and how we resolve it, and sometimes it's creating other ways than just the process of filing a complaint.

Like I'm somebody who got attacked by the police before and the process was so complicated that I didn't go through with the process and it's a legitimate process. I still have a scar right here (indicating) on my hand, right?

And so I just want to say on all of our sides, there's an even road that we can find to resolve communication on resolving issues that we have either with

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

11

1 Proceedings

2 relations.

3 All right. Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 THE CHAIR: Good evening and let
6 me apologize for being late. My name is
7 Fred Davie. I'm the chair of the CCRB. I
8 understand my colleagues have introduced
9 themselves already except for the one who
10 came in with me.

11 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Sorry, I got
12 lost. Marbre Stahly-Butts from Brooklyn.

13 THE CHAIR: And Marbre is...

14 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: A City Council
15 appointee.

16 THE CHAIR: Appointee, right.

17 I want to thank my colleague,
18 Erica, for -- Ms. Bond for standing in for
19 me. She probably would make a better
20 chair anyway, but in the meantime, I think
21 you're stuck with me.

22 Thanks to all of you for coming
23 out, particularly on such a chilly night
24 to share with us your thoughts and ideas
25 about how we might continue to improve

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

12

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

police-community relations here in this part of the Borough of Queens and thanks to the officers and others who have come out as well.

Did we acknowledge our newest board member? He's here. Good to have Mr. Joseph who comes to us from Staten Island.

As some of you may be aware, New York City underwent a significant change the last month. The Right to Know Act is a new law that affects how police interact with civilians. It took effect on October 19th. I thought it might be beneficial for us to take some time to talk about what it means and exactly what -- and exactly what rights do you have -- what exactly you have a right to know.

Overall, The Right to Know Act is about ensuring civilians understand their rights during an encounter with the police and know what to do if they feel their rights are violated during that encounter.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

13

1 Proceedings

2 This law is made up of two components.

3 First, the law says that in
4 certain situations, officers should
5 identify themselves by providing their
6 name, their rank, their command and their
7 shield number to civilians.

8 As a means of advancing that part
9 of the law, officers now carry business
10 cards with that information. Those
11 business cards also include a couple of
12 other items, such as where you can ask for
13 body-worn camera footage in an interaction
14 with an officer and where you can comment
15 or complain about the encounter.

16 The cards note that you can call
17 311 and 311 reroutes calls of police
18 misconduct to us. And as is the case with
19 all complaints, our staff will investigate
20 those complaints thoroughly.

21 While officers are only required
22 to offer a card in certain situations,
23 such as during a frisk, during a search or
24 at sobriety checkpoints, you can always
25 ask an officer for a card if you are

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

14

1 Proceedings

2 stopped by an officer for any reason.

3 If you do not receive a card upon
4 asking, that is a violation of the Right
5 to Know Act and you can file a complaint
6 with us here at the CCRB.

7 The second part of the law says
8 that again, in certain situations an
9 officer must explain that he or she will
10 not search you unless you consent to a
11 search. This is really about empowering
12 civilians who may feel uncertain about
13 what's expected during an encounter with
14 an officer with the knowledge that they
15 have a right to say no when an officer
16 asks to, for example, search their pockets
17 or look into their car.

18 Now you may have picked up on the
19 fact that I repeatedly have mentioned that
20 the Right to Know Act applies only in
21 certain situations. It is a complex law
22 with a few exceptions which you can learn
23 about at nyc.gov/rтка, and I think we're
24 going to talk about this a little bit
25 later in more detail tonight.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

15

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

But if nothing else, the one thing you must know is that if you have any doubt about where the misconduct occurred during an encounter with an NYPD officer, you can always file a complaint with the CCRB.

If you're ever unsure how to do that, simply call 311 or come to our office at 100 Church Street or go to nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint to report what has occurred or what has happened to you. Our staff will work diligently to get to the bottom of what took place. We believe this new step in policing will advance ongoing improvement in police-community relations, we believe it will support transparency, we believe it will enhance accountability, which are at the core of the mission of this agency.

I was going to say I believe our chair (sic) has remarks, but I suspect he's already given those remarks before we got in here, so we will go to the next item on the agenda, which is -- have we

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

16

1 Proceedings

2 done outreach?

3 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: We have not.

4 THE CHAIR: Okay. So we will do
5 a report from our outreach team, Yojaira.
6 Thank you.

7 MS. ALVAREZ: Hello, everyone.
8 Thank you so much for coming. I know that
9 it was a little round-about getting in
10 here, but thank you for your patience and
11 dedication to being here today.

12 So I'm the director of outreach
13 and intergovernmental affairs for the
14 agency. I know some of you know about the
15 CCRB. I want to take a quick moment to go
16 over it with you as well.

17 As you know, we're a city agency
18 independent from the NYPD and we're
19 responsible for mediating, investigating
20 and administratively prosecuting
21 allegations of police misconduct.

22 As introduced, we're governed by
23 a thirteen member board. That board is
24 appointed by the mayor, the city council
25 and the police commissioner. We are the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

17

1 Proceedings

2 largest oversight entity of the nation's
3 largest police force.

4 With that said, we really want to
5 be out in the community more to let people
6 know exactly what it is we do because we
7 don't have the authority to investigate
8 all allegations of police misconduct, but
9 all jurisdictions act under FADO, F-A-D-O.
10 The F stands for force.

11 If a police officer uses force,
12 for example, a push, a kick, a shove,
13 pushing you up against a wall, using a
14 taser, et cetera, that falls under our
15 jurisdiction. We would investigate that
16 allegation to determine, under the
17 totality of the circumstances, was that
18 force excessive or unnecessary.

19 The second category is abuse of
20 authority. This is a large bucket. It
21 can include an improper stop, an improper
22 search, threatening to call ICE, entering
23 my house without a warrant and as of
24 February of this year, it also includes
25 allegations of sexual harassment. That

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

20

1 Proceedings

2 empowered with those rights.

3 There are multiple ways of
4 initiating this process. Again, 311.
5 1-800-341-CCRB. You can file a complaint
6 on line at www.nyc.gov/ccrb.

7 We've also partnered with Council
8 Member Donovan Richards' office, which is
9 at 1931 Mott Avenue, where we have
10 investigators on staff on the third
11 Wednesday of every month where you can
12 come in and initiate that process or get
13 more information about the agency.

14 You can also file a complaint
15 right at a local precinct or mail in a
16 complaint with us as well.

17 And last thing is if you want to
18 contact me, my e-mail is yalvarez --
19 that's y-a-l-v-a-r-e-z -- @ccrb.nyc.gov.

20 I know a lot of you know Tricia,
21 who is our Queens representative, but
22 again, we'll be happy to come out
23 weekends, evenings and share this
24 information with you.

25 Thank you so much.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

21

1 Proceedings

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Yojaira.
3 Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 MR. JOSEPH: I don't know if you
6 know, maybe the officers here might know,
7 do all the police officers in New York
8 City have these ID cards now or business
9 cards? Do all of them have them and if
10 they don't, what is the option?

11 CAPTAIN ROBINSON: It's very
12 simple. They have been issued from
13 One Police Plaza and handed out precinct
14 by precinct. Each officer has been given
15 a card at this point. I can't speak for
16 76 commands but...

17 THE CHAIR: Sure. So for the
18 people who are live streaming, they have
19 been issued by One Police Plaza to all
20 police officers in New York City.

21 So I want to acknowledge the
22 elected officials here before we move to
23 the next report and their representatives,
24 so if there are any elected officials or
25 representatives for elected officials, can

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

22

1 Proceedings

2 you stand and identify yourself for us.

3 AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm from
4 Assemblywoman Alicia Hyndman's office.

5 THE CHAIR: Assemblywoman...

6 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Alicia Hyndman.

7 THE CHAIR: Great. And would you
8 like to speak to us at all?

9 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We have an
10 event coming up.

11 THE CHAIR: We're live streaming
12 so it's better if you come to the mic.

13 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good evening,
14 everybody. I am from Assemblywoman Alicia
15 Hyndman's office.

16 November 27th we have our
17 congestion forum going on. Pretty much
18 that's where, you know, dealing with the
19 high prices of public transportation
20 during high peak times. For some of you
21 guys that do rely upon public
22 transportation, it could be a headache.

23 With that being said, we are
24 having a forum with all different people
25 of government, all different forms of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

going to have to leave in a hurry. That's why I don't look as good as my counterparts here.

So anything in the 113, as long as I don't get called away, if you have anything after, by all means please grab me.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

CAPTAIN CHAN: Good evening, everyone. My name is Captain Kevin Chan from the 105 Precinct. I'm executive officer over there. I just want to wish everyone a happy holiday for Thanksgiving and happy holiday season.

CAPTAIN DELEO: Good evening. My name is Captain Joseph DeLeo. I'm the executive officer of PSA 9. We cover the developments in the 107, 103, 113 and 114 so anything housing related or any issues like that, you can see me about. I'll be here after the meeting. Thank you.

THE CHAIR: Thank you for being here. Thanks all of you.

Any other public officials that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

we need to acknowledge tonight?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: Thank you. We will return to our agenda and we will hear a presentation on policy data from Harya.

MS. TAREKEGN: Good evening, everybody. So my name is Harya Tarekegn and I'm senior counsel for policy and advocacy at the CCRB, and I just want to give you guys an overview of the data that we get from Queens and give you guys a little bit of perspective from what we're seeing here.

So this is a map of CCRB complaint rate as compared to the felony crime rate in Queens. The reason we show this is to show in areas where there is higher police activity so higher felony crime rate, we expect to see more complaints.

You will see that here in the 105 there is a higher rate of CCRB complaints received than there is felony crime rate. We don't know why these things happen. We

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

26

Proceedings

1
2 have hypotheses, but some of it might be
3 that our outreach team is out in the 105 a
4 lot and so a lot of people know about us
5 and are coming to us with their
6 complaints, but you will see that the maps
7 match pretty closely except that we do see
8 higher crime rates in the 115 and lower
9 complaint rates, so that's definitely an
10 area that we target with outreach to make
11 sure people know about us and feel
12 comfortable coming to us.

13 This is a breakdown of the fully
14 investigated allegations that we see from
15 Queens. You'll see that they match up
16 pretty similarly, with abuse of authority
17 being the highest category followed by
18 force.

19 And looking at our truncation
20 rates, so when you come to the CCRB with a
21 complaint, there is a complaint process
22 that you go through. You meet with our
23 investigator, they collect all the
24 information, interview you and the
25 officers to try and determine what

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

27

1 Proceedings

2 happened, but sometimes individuals do not
3 follow through with the entire complaint
4 process and we at the CCRB call this a
5 truncation rate.

6 It's something that we are
7 working really hard on figuring out how to
8 lower. We want to make sure that our
9 process is transparent and our process is
10 clear, that people understand how to go
11 through our process, and part of that is
12 making sure that our investigators are
13 available to meet individuals whenever
14 convenient for them.

15 We do send investigators out to
16 the field to take witness statements, so
17 if you're not able to come to our office,
18 an investigator can come to you and we are
19 working to lower this truncation rate all
20 over the city, and especially in Queens.

21 Again, in the 105, truncation
22 rate is generally lower, but you'll see in
23 our neighboring precincts, the 103 and the
24 113, we have a pretty high truncation
25 rate, so that's definitely focusing on,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

28

Proceedings

1
2 and to echo what Yojaira said, if you know
3 any after-school programs or church
4 functions, any community organizations
5 that we can come and present to and talk
6 to, we would be more than happy to come
7 out, so definitely reach out to us.

8 We will be here after the meeting
9 of course, but you can also e-mail us. I
10 will also give you guys my e-mail address
11 after my presentation.

12 And then this chart shows our
13 dispositions of complaints that we have
14 fully investigated, so it shows again,
15 similarly tracking New York City with
16 Queens. We have a majority of
17 unsubstantiated, which means that we are
18 not able to determine one way or the
19 other. Again, this happens a lot when we
20 hear both sides of the story. We look at
21 the patrol guide, we need to make sure
22 that we're determining things on the
23 merits, so we look at both sides of the
24 story to determine if misconduct occurred
25 or not.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

30

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

be 15 students that are chosen from all different boroughs that will work with the CCRB to help us not only plan our Youth Summit, which will be in February, but really think about how the CCRB can better help and be a better resource for young people, and also how to engage young New Yorkers to serve as ambassadors for us within their communities.

The application, like Jon Darche said, is due on November 26th. If you guys want to come talk to us, if you know youth that you think should apply, please come talk to us. We're really excited about this and think it will be great to have the young voices there as part of the conversation at the outset so that we're really doing a great job contacting and working with youth.

Finally, our Youth Summit is going to be on February 5th. I encourage everyone between the ages of 10 and 24, especially if you made it out here on this very cold day and you're that dedicated to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

35

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

sorry. Mr. Peguero.

MR. PEGUERO: Quick question.

The youth council, the young men and women that are selected, are they going to get a stipend or some sort of incentive given that they transport themselves from the railroad to NYU?

MS. TAREKEGN: Everyone who needs any help with transportation for the Youth Advisory Council or the Youth Summit just needs to contact us and we will arrange for transportation needs as necessary.

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: But there's no stipend for the young folks?

MS. TAREKEGN: No stipend.

THE CHAIR: Any other questions?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: Well, I'm pleased to announce the arrival of Council Member Richards and want to give you an opportunity to speak to us if you'd like. Welcome.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. Such a great thing to see you out in

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

37

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

the police department, and let me be clear with that, with that comes the conversation of transparency and with transparency you get accountability. So if there's a lack of transparency around the way we're operating as a city and the way the department is operating, we will never build complete trust that we need to do with the police department.

And we know that a transparent department that holds those that may be the bad apples accountable equals safer communities, right? So we stress that conversation all of the time, so please use CCRB as a resource.

Now one of the things or a few things that we're up to is we want to see their budget increase. Knock, knock, knock, knock, knock. We can have all the conversations around investigations and that, but if the CCRB got one percent of the police department's budget, we would be a different city.

And I don't want to paint all the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

38

1 Proceedings

2 men and women of the NYPD as bad actors,
3 but we know that in every industry there
4 are going to be some bad actors and we
5 need to route out those who certainly are
6 doing a dishonor to the badge, and part of
7 the way to do that to ensure that we have
8 an enforcement -- enforcer in an
9 organization like CCRB that certainly has
10 more teeth as we look to codify their APU
11 unit, as we look at strengthening some of
12 the things they can do through charter
13 revisions that are going to come down the
14 pipeline through the city council.

15 I do want to stress that, that
16 the city council has its own charter
17 commission, that we're going to be looking
18 at ways to strengthen the CCRB through
19 this process. I don't want to overpromise
20 tonight, but we are definitely going to be
21 looking at ways to do that.

22 So many of you know there are a
23 few things that are going on within the
24 NYPD and I want to commend the police
25 commissioner for certainly taking some

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

39

Proceedings

1
2 valuable and important steps at building
3 more trust with the police department and
4 our communities. We talk about the
5 neighborhood coordinating officers,
6 community policing model. I know our
7 community affairs officers had been doing
8 the work way before NCOs even existed, but
9 I think that's certainly been something
10 important for our communities.

11 Body cameras, you spoke about
12 that I'm sure, so I don't want to repeat,
13 be repetitive in everything, but we do
14 anticipate, I think in the few months, I
15 know we had an incident where there was a
16 camera that exploded, but I'm confident by
17 the new year, January, every police
18 precinct and patrol officer will have body
19 cameras attached to their officers.

20 And that's important for several
21 reasons, not just for us, but also for the
22 police department as well. It's great for
23 both sides so that we can see what's going
24 on in a transparent fashion, but also for
25 the public to also be able to hold people

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

40

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

accountable. So there's still a lot of questions around what that process is going to look like, the release of footage, and those sort of things, but that is something we will hold hearings on in the new year.

The Right to Know Act, I'm sure they spoke about that. Did you bring cards tonight? So you should know about the Right to Know Act by now, so if you're stopped, you certainly can raise questions and you should be given a card if you request it. Now it only applies to certain stops, level two stops.

I'm looking at revising it, by the way, for level ones as well, so we're in the process of looking at legislation to do that, and that entails when you're in your car and we know that's a common stop for black -- especially black men in our community, black and brown folks in our community.

So those are some of the things we've been up to in conjunction with the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

41

Proceedings

1
2 police department, in conjunction with the
3 CCRB. A lot more work has to be done to
4 really ensure once again that we
5 strengthen them and really give them the
6 tools they need to be successful, which I
7 believe will ensure that our communities
8 are safer and that we really build true
9 trust with our communities.

10 I don't know if you touched on
11 this. If you want me to touch on a
12 broader base of things, we have a
13 discipline panel now going on as well,
14 which the police commissioner has
15 commissioned. So we're looking at in
16 January, several recommendations, which we
17 don't really have the details yet, but
18 they are really looking very intimately
19 into the dealings of the police
20 department, and we hope to come back to
21 the city with recommendations from that
22 panel on ways we can improve the
23 department and their responsiveness, and
24 the way that they respond to our
25 communities, which I believe will really

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

42

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

continue, like I said, to build trust. So please use CCRB.

One of the things I want to stress is also follow through, follow through, and sometimes an incident may happen and we may not see it all the way through. If you see an incident, there could be individuals from our communities. Sometimes that happens. You know, you may be a witness to something but be scared to follow through or actually be a part of an investigation.

We really need people to step up. We really do in those times of need to really ensure, once again, that we get those who dishonor the badge out of the department, and I'm not shy about saying it, work very well with the police commissioner, but we also have to ensure that we're holding people accountable who may not be acting the way they should.

So that being said, am I taking questions?

THE CHAIR: If you'd like to,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

43

1 Proceedings

2 sure.

3 Any questions for the council
4 member?

5 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Those letters
6 that they send out after they do their
7 investigation, very generic. They don't
8 deal with the allegation that we're
9 reporting.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: CCRB
11 you're saying?

12 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So we
14 have legislation on that so it's something
15 we're working with them on, but it's
16 something we certainly are interested in
17 the Public Safety Committee and seeing a
18 further breakdown of why something wasn't
19 or was substantiated so this is something
20 that we are working with them on, and I
21 want to thank -- I know Jonathan and I
22 have had several conversations.

23 AUDIENCE MEMBER: 'Cause if you
24 stop-and-frisk in the street --

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

1 Proceedings

2 you're talking about the stop-and-frisk?

3 AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm talking
4 about I had two women who were
5 grandmothers, they were dropping they kids
6 off at school in South Jamaica, right by
7 the Projects, and the story is that a
8 police van pulled up, followed them up
9 onto 60th Street --

10 THE CHAIR: Excuse me, ma'am.
11 Since we're live streaming, can you come
12 up come to the mic?

13 MS. PHIPPS: My name is Shirley
14 Phipps.

15 THE CHAIR: So we're going to ask
16 you to talk generally about -- because
17 if -- do we have the complaint that you
18 are -- has it been filed or has it been
19 resolved?

20 MS. PHIPPS: Well, this happened
21 a couple years ago and the lady that
22 reported to me, we did a field trip, I
23 said we'll go downtown to the office.

24 THE CHAIR: The only thing we're
25 going to ask you not to do is not to,

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

45

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

because we may still have some more work we can do on that, not to identify the officers.

MS. PHIPPS: I don't know who they were.

All I'm saying is when they made the complaint to me, I said come on, let's go downtown. I took them downtown, we filed a complaint and then they did an investigation based upon the complaint.

I did receive the letter back. There was an investigation and it was four officers that was involved, and they just -- it was very generic and they break it down. I think one person had a complaint against somebody. They didn't deal with the actual issue of the stop-and-frisk, if that area was a target for drugs sales or something. They don't give you an explanation for the stop-and-frisk. It wasn't stop and question, it was stop-and-frisk, and these were grandmothers dropping kids off to school.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

46

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

So that was the end of it, but I'm saying those letters need to be amended in some way that it's just not generic. Deal with the allegation; was it -- you know, was there just cause for that particular issue to happen at that particular time. That's all I'm saying.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

Council Member, you want to respond?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I'll say that's why we passed The Right to Know Act. Now you should be able to get a card and that's the reason for these particular interactions. We want to make sure that, you know, that there's a mechanism and that was the reason for the legislation, so that you could get that officer's card and name and be able to report that to CCRB accurately as well.

So if you've ever run into a case -- I've been stopped and frisked many years ago, but it's about education, and I think that's why it's important to have

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

47

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

forums like this so that you're educated on what to do in those instances.

THE CHAIR: Our executive director, Jon Darche, also wants to speak to this.

EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: One of the issues that is confronting the agency is Civil Rights Law 50-A, which is a state law which Council Member Richards has been very diligent in focusing on. And just as it prevents us from talking about specific cases here in the public session, it also restricts the amount of information that we can give in the disposition letters, which causes us to give generic disposition letters that sometimes leave people with more questions than they had before the incident.

And it's something that we are working always to try and improve the ways we disseminate information to people to make sure they understand it better, so it's something that we are aware we need to do a better job on and we're working

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

48

1 Proceedings

2 on.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And let
4 me just add to that, because now it's --
5 and I guess I can be political, they
6 can't, but we now have a state senate that
7 is 100 percent -- well, not 100 percent,
8 but now is majority led by democrats. We
9 need to make sure that we are -- in the
10 Daily News, I think either today or
11 yesterday came out, I know I was in an
12 article I think Sunday, just raising the
13 flag on 50-A.

14 50-A shields transparency
15 information on officers who may have been
16 engaged or may have, could be 50
17 complaints against them. We'll never
18 know. There's no transparency around it.
19 So we can have a person walking around our
20 community who has not engaged in CPR the
21 right way and they are out in the
22 department, and they can't be held
23 accountable because there's no
24 transparency around their record. So it's
25 going to be very important for communities

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

49

1 Proceedings

2 such as this one when this conversation
3 comes up to definitely be in support of
4 it.

5 But secondly, let me say this:

6 We have state senators and assembly people
7 in our communities. We need to make sure
8 that they are aware that this is an
9 important issue to our community. This is
10 not a flashy issue, unfortunately. It's
11 not as flashy as other issues;
12 transportation, the subways. So 50-A can
13 get lost in a lot of conversations. It's
14 really going to be up the public to also
15 have a conversation around it.

16 I definitely intend, as the
17 Chair, to definitely utilize my voice in
18 helping to push this conversation up in
19 Albany big time as we move forward, but
20 he's totally right, 50-A, it's critical
21 that either we have a repeal or, you know,
22 that's my opinion, but definitely looking
23 at a repeal and ways to make sure that the
24 process and officers' records are a little
25 bit more transparent.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

50

1 Proceedings

2 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Are you saying
3 that police --

4 THE CHAIR: Just come to the mic.

5 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Are you saying
6 that the police captains are not aware of
7 their police officers or their records?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I can
9 let them speak for themselves.

10 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Because if they
11 know, they should be able to take action
12 no matter what comes in the public.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I agree
14 and I definitely agree with that
15 statement, but then there's also questions
16 of what discipline looks like, right?
17 Like for some offenses should an officer
18 just be docked five days of pay depending
19 on how egregious the incident is.

20 So because there's very little
21 transparency in the way discipline is
22 handled, there's no real matrix,
23 discipline matrix like some other cities
24 have. You know, we intend on requesting
25 the NYPD to study the discipline matrix so

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

51

1 Proceedings

2 that there is, you know, similar
3 discipline handed out for everyone, which
4 I think would be fair.

5 But I will just add once again,
6 without transparency, it's not good enough
7 for the police just to police the police.
8 The public also has a right to know who is
9 serving them, because guess what, just as
10 you have the right to know about my
11 record. You pay my salary. Everyone
12 has -- shouldn't, you know, be shrouded in
13 secrecy what we do. So we are public
14 figures and one way to ensure we're doing
15 our job is transparency to hold us all
16 accountable. So no, it's not good enough.

17 And in some cases, and I don't
18 want to say that captains and I know the
19 113 and others, I've had conversations
20 with people there, and I don't want to say
21 that captains and inspectors aren't
22 identifying those individuals and taking
23 appropriate action. I don't want to put
24 that totally out there, but what I do want
25 to say is that the public should have a

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

52

1 Proceedings

2 right to that information as well.

3 THE CHAIR: So, Council Member,
4 before we take another question, we have a
5 fairly irate neighbor because somebody has
6 blocked the driveway of their home. It's
7 a white Nissan and the license plate is
8 GMU-3130, white Nissan.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: That's
10 a complaint for me?

11 (Laughter.)

12 THE CHAIR: Any more questions
13 for the council member?

14 MR. ROBIN: Is there something
15 wrong with the CCRB process if the
16 percentage of cases that are
17 unsubstantiated, unfounded, is a lot
18 higher than those that are substantiated?
19 Is there something wrong with the way
20 y'all investigate a case?

21 Because it just seems looking at
22 this chart that those who do report are
23 not finding any results that would be
24 truthful to them.

25 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: So I think

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

53

1 Proceedings

2 it's important to kind of look a little
3 deeper at what the different dispositions
4 are.

5 Unsubstantiated means that the
6 agency couldn't determine by a
7 preponderance of the evidence that
8 misconduct occurred, and so that means
9 that just slightly more than 50 percent we
10 couldn't make a determination, and we are
11 very hopeful that body-worn camera footage
12 will change that percentage. We're
13 hopeful that when we have independent
14 evidence, video and audio, that will tell
15 us what's happening in an incident, we'll
16 be able to make a determination on the
17 merits and say we know what occurred here
18 and we can make a determination of what
19 occurred was misconduct or if it was --
20 did not happen or one of the most
21 misunderstood dispositions is exonerated.

22 So when conduct is exonerated, it
23 does not mean that we do not believe the
24 civilian when they make their complaint.
25 We're saying we think that the conduct

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

54

Proceedings

1
2 that was complained about occurred and
3 we're not saying it's good police work.
4 We're not saying that that conduct should
5 be repeated. We're merely stating that
6 under the law and the patrol guide as it
7 is written, the officer did not commit
8 misconduct.

9 And I can understand why that is
10 frustrating if you feel that you were
11 treated poorly to hear that the officer
12 had the right to do what he did, but it is
13 not saying that we do not believe the
14 civilian.

15 So I just wanted -- and it's not
16 saying that the civilian was wrong. The
17 civilian is bringing up conduct that they
18 had a problem with and we are saying that
19 that conduct did occur, and maybe that
20 even though we exonerated the conduct, we
21 let the department know that this conduct
22 was not good police work because if it's
23 resulting in a complaint, it means that
24 the conduct probably could have been
25 handled in a better way.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

55

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

MR. ROBIN: It was also mentioned that you are forming a youth program. Can you form something for adults?

I know the police have a citizens police academy, which is like 14 weeks, and people learn the same thing that the police learn when they go to the academy, so whatever you're doing for the youth, can you form something for adults.

EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: I think it's something we'll look at, sir.

THE CHAIR: I can also say that our public engagement unit with Yojaira and her staff, they try to make the rounds to different organizations throughout the city from youth groups to senior groups and others to talk about the work of the CCRB and to make sure people are fully informed. So if there are opportunities for them that you know of, we'd certainly like to hear about it.

Let me see if there are any more questions for the council -- questions. Not comments, but questions for the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

56

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

council member, so we'll go here, I saw a hand back here (indicating). Again, questions only and then a hand here (indicating).

And everybody can come up to the mic so that we can move this along.

MS. DAVIS: Thank you. My name is Karen Davis. I'm the president for the precinct council for the PSA 9 and a lot of times we have these in our community and there's great leadership there with our electeds and the people that work in the community, but to be a support system and help support what change needs to come to address some of these issues, especially talking about the results of what he's saying when things are unfounded or unsubstantiated and you're still dealing with your community base, our leadership, we don't have funding, okay? So a lot of times we look to city council to fund some of the leadership initiatives that can support what CCRB does and help them transition the complainant and the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

57

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

officers to do better work.

Is there any area in discretionary funding that could support that under your directorship?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: That's a good question. And none of the nonprofits from this community should keep their ears open, 'cause it doesn't mean you get additional funding, I'm playing, but I'm certainly willing to explore that. I know a few precinct counsel that I've certainly given funding to. 113 being one, the precinct council there led by Karen.

So I'm willing to have a conversation. I do think that I am looking in all honesty, looking at a broader initiative under the Public Safety Committee. What that entails is being shaped right now, but it is something I'm interested in exploring and you said you're part of a precinct council?

MS. DAVIS: PSA 9.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: PSA 9,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

58

1 Proceedings

2 right.

3 So in my mind, I'm not saying
4 it's going to happen, and please put that
5 on tape 'cause I don't need people running
6 up and down on me, but I am interested in
7 an initiative that would support precinct
8 counsels around the city. How much that's
9 going to cost, all of that has to be
10 determined through the budget process, but
11 it is something -- I do recognize the
12 work, the volunteer work that a lot of
13 council is doing, and I know for the 113
14 in particular, they're funding even
15 programming, you know, informational
16 sessions on how to become a cop. How do
17 we get our young people from our
18 communities to want to be a part of the
19 department and change it from within,
20 right?

21 So if you are a precinct council,
22 I would love to hear a little bit more,
23 but it is something I am exploring and I
24 hope to have some more information on
25 that, but I do recognize the important

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

59

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

work that council is doing.

THE CHAIR: So I think we have one more question here. Did I see another hand for a question?

MR. CARTER: My name is Kenny Carter. I'm the president of F.A.I.T.H. Fathers Alive In The Hood. I have engaged a lot of young men and also older men through the course of the weeks, and one of the issues that's consistently coming to me is we have in Far Rockaway and also in South Jamaica, Queens, Southeast Queens, is that you have officers from different patrol areas, from the Bronx and these different sectors, that are coming to, let's say, like the 113 Precinct area. You have somebody from the Bronx that's patrolling this area, so they are really not familiar with the individuals who come into -- who they're coming into contact with.

And I'm sure they have a CBO program, if I'm not mistaken, they put together for the community policing to be

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

60

Proceedings

1
2 kind of tight. So what happens is you
3 have an officer from the Bronx that comes
4 into Far Rockaway in the 100 or
5 101 District and they'll do something that
6 would be disorderly and deal with the
7 individual in a disorderly fashion or
8 manner, and that whole relationship that
9 was tried to be forged by the CBO program
10 then becomes null and void, because now we
11 have these officers that come from out of
12 different areas.

13 And they have no way -- I don't
14 know what is the -- what are the ways that
15 we can track these different officers who
16 are coming and visiting to these
17 particular areas, either for quotas,
18 collars, I don't know how -- what the
19 situation is or how they are maneuvering,
20 but when they come into our district, they
21 have no idea who's who, what's what, don't
22 know how to deal with the people, don't
23 know how to speak to the people and they
24 deal with everybody in an aggressive
25 manner.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

61

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

And it's usually the guy that's rolling around about five-nine, six feet, 200 and something pounds, four guys in a little car, they all hop out and it's really scary when you're dealing with a 15-year-old, 16-year-old child, you know what I mean?

So I just want to know what is the tracking process to identify these individuals who are coming in from different precincts collaring, giving kids cases or men cases in these particular neighborhoods and they're just taking them out. So I want to know how is that being dealt with.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So what I would say, I guess it depends on if, you know, sometimes a response can be different, right? So if there's been a bevy of shootings or something and an outside unit comes out, I definitely agree with you, and I've been stopped in my car by an outside unit that way before, a few years ago. You take down and this is, and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

62

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

you tell me if I'm wrong, wherever you're at, you want to write down the make, the model of the car and the time. And that's very important and I guess they can go into a little bit more information on that, but I definitely agree with you.

Sometimes what happens in some of these scenarios, you'll have SRG come out, which are different units who are not necessarily part of the local community and they're in because there may have been some incidents that have been brought them, and there's very little ways of tracking those interactions, and once again going back to transparency, how do we hold those individuals accountable.

I'm assuming most captains and deputy inspectors know who is in their flock, but once again, when the outside units come in, that is something that we -- I haven't heard as much of recently, but there have been incidents around the city that we can point to where it's questionable, should these units be in the

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

63

1 Proceedings

2 community or what would that look like.

3 So I would suggest, and I'll let
4 them add onto it, and I think I had this
5 conversation with inspectors in the past
6 as well, you definitely want to take down
7 the location, the time, the date. Very
8 important that you take that information
9 down so that we can try to track who those
10 individuals are.

11 THE CHAIR: Thanks.

12 Jon, you had a comment on this?

13 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: CCRB keeps
14 track of data based on the officer's
15 command and also the location of
16 occurrence, but to be honest, I don't know
17 that we track whether people -- or not
18 that we track it, I don't know that we
19 connect those two items. So it's
20 something that I'll talk to our policy
21 unit about, whether allegations are coming
22 in about officers who are not assigned to
23 a geographic spot.

24 MR. CARTER: What you're saying
25 is you have rogue units that are coming

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

64

1 Proceedings

2 into --

3 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: That's not
4 what I said. I'm saying we track what
5 unit people are in and I'm saying we track
6 where the incidents occur, and so we
7 could -- it may be possible for us to
8 correlate those -- connect those two
9 factors, but I don't think we do that
10 right now.

11 THE CHAIR: And as I recall, if
12 not at our last public meeting, I think
13 our last community meeting, which was in a
14 different borough, a similar issue was
15 raised about police officers coming in
16 from other places who aren't familiar with
17 the neighborhood. The people in the
18 neighborhood have pretty good
19 relationships with the NCO and other
20 officers, and then someone from the
21 outside has an impact that isn't always
22 positive.

23 So I think if that is a pattern,
24 then the other thing we can do is simply
25 talk to the police commissioner as well

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

65

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

and maybe you've heard it before, maybe you haven't, but also talk to commanding officers as well and see if there is some kind of cultural change within the department itself that can take place, so there's a level of training for people who come in who don't generally patrol those areas.

MR. CARTER: So you're taking the responsibility for speaking to the commissioner?

THE CHAIR: I will. We both will.

MR. CARTER: Thank you.

THE CHAIR: Any other questions for the council member?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: We're going to thank you. We thank you for all your support and we thank you for coming out.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you. Thank you for the work you're doing.

(Applause.)

THE CHAIR: I'd also like to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

66

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

acknowledge from the New York City
Comptroller's office, Mr. James Johnson.

Do you want to --

(Applause.)

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

So we have a member who's come in
since we've started. I'm going to let him
introduce himself.

MR. PUMA: Good evening,
everyone. My name is Joseph Puma. I'm
the city council designee on the board
from the Borough of Manhattan.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

Since we have a quorum here, I
want to do just one little housekeeping
thing. I'd like to see if we can get a
motion to approve the minutes.

Is there a motion?

Let's get a motion on the floor
and then we'll...

MR. RIVADENEYRA: Motion.

THE CHAIR: Is there a second?

MS. BOND: Second.

THE CHAIR: Are there any

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

67

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

revisions to the amendment?

MR. JOSEPH: Yes.

THE CHAIR: Mr. Joseph.

MR. JOSEPH: On page 29, line 21, I had asked a question and it's written as Eason asked the question, but it's actually me who asked the question. And it goes from page 29, line 21 to page 30, line 10. It needs to be changed to Joseph.

THE CHAIR: We'll make that revision.

Any other questions or comments on the minutes? Ready to vote.

All those in favor of the minutes as amended, please say aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

THE CHAIR: All those opposed?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: No. The ayes have it. Minutes are approve as amended.

So we'll do two other things quickly. We want to hear from you, so we have a number of speakers who have

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

68

1 Proceedings

2 registered to speak from organizations and
3 I'm just going to go through the list that
4 I have here, and if I miss anybody, we
5 will get you later.

6 So from the Caribbean Equality
7 Project, Mohamed Amin.

8 (No response.)

9 THE CHAIR: Not here. Okay.

10 From -- a youth representative
11 from John Adams YABC.

12 Would you like to speak?

13 MR. ROSHEA: Hi. Hello. My name
14 is Anthony Roshea. I am from John Adams
15 YABC and I just came here to talk about
16 how the program has helped me, even though
17 I have been there, you know, not for that
18 long, two months exact, but compared to my
19 day school that I went to, which was
20 Springfield Gardens, which is nearby to
21 here, and John Adams, I feel more
22 comfortable to be there because there are
23 other people like me who, you know, needed
24 a second chance through situations, and I
25 feel more comfortable to have people who

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

69

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

like couldn't graduate on time or anything like that.

And I just came here to talk about how good it is and that the program should stay, because there are a lot of people out there who due to circumstances, due to parents, due to whatever, can't graduate on time.

And to be honest, part of the reason I went to YABC is because I was kind of ashamed that I didn't graduate when my peers, and to go back there again and do it, like be seeing the people that were freshmans and juniors ask me what happened. Now I'm at YABC, I don't feel that shame. I feel very comfortable and being around people who understand me.

And the teachers and staff there, they are very understanding. Like let's say you're absent for a day. They know how to ask questions, but don't push too much unless you want to talk about it. So let's say like family matters, you want to speak about them, they use the right

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

70

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

amount of like point to push to see if you want to talk about it or not. They don't step over boundaries just to make you feel comfort -- sorry. I'm kind of nervous. Make you feel uncomfortable about anything, so I just want to let everybody know.

THE CHAIR: Any questions?

EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: So I just wanted to say that as someone who dropped out and went back to school, that you shouldn't feel ashamed and doing it so young in life, going back, you only have your future ahead of you. And I urge you to keep doing things like showing up here and being a positive influence on your community, and I identify with you and feel proud of you, and so thank you for coming out tonight.

(Applause.)

THE CHAIR: A youth representative from St. Johns University Students of Consciousness.

MS. ROBINSON: Good afternoon. I

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

71

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

was made aware that we only have two minutes to speak per person, so we have two representatives that will run through our speech. All right. Thank you. So I'm going to get started here.

Good afternoon. My name is Claire Robinson and I'm a student at St. Johns University in Jamaica, Queens. I'm with the collective called Students of Consciousness, which is a movement to dismantle oppression in all of its forms on St. Johns' campus.

We're students invested in justice for all by any means necessary, using lessons from history, from the black liberation tradition, from the decolonialization traditions and from queer traditions to serve as our guide.

Because of this movement, I'm also connected to the St. Albans Civic and to community leaders in Hollis, Queens and we're honored that the CCRB has invited us here tonight.

So the prompts given beforehand

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

72

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

are questions that the Community Complaint Review Board has formulated to understand what the community needs are in relation to policing, what needs to be changed and how CCRB can help.

What I'm submitting tonight and what my colleague, my comrade, rather, will also submit is the case for total abolition of the police department.

It's no secret that black and brown bodies across the United States are policed differently than white bodies. A report by sociologists taught here detailed on police killings. At the end of 2018 of June, of the 102 black individuals killed by police, 11 were completely unarmed. That's 11 percent of black people killed by police.

15 of the 211 white people killed by police were unarmed. That's 7.1 percent.

Of the 68 Hispanics killed by police so far in 2018, two were completely unarmed. That's 3 percent.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

73

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Black people account for 38 percent of the unarmed citizens killed by police and that accounts for 52 percent of the unarmed citizens killed police thus far.

Even as the lesser aggressions are also heinous and so last spring a member of my community in Hollis St. Albans reported to the board an incident of harassment. This member of the community was driving and was -- happened to be driving on the shoulder and was pulled over, and had an incident escalate to the point where the officer called this black member of the community dumb. And he reported that and this is a member of the community whose lived here his entire life, so that's also heinous.

So brutality of killings should strike you as a human being as immoral and unjust, but the harassment of a community member of mine is enough for me.

Students of Consciousness are of the mind that structures that are harmful

1 Proceedings

2 to any of us that crush the human body and
3 spirit must be dismantled and replaced with
4 new systems. New systems that we have
5 thought about, theorized about and who our
6 predecessors and ancestors have also
7 thought about, require us to ask the
8 question: What are our alternatives to
9 policing? And also the question, what are
10 our alternatives to capitalism?

11 And as you see, our
12 sociopolitical analysis is such that
13 capitalism is racialized and it's also
14 tied to systems of surveillance of black
15 and brown bodies. So what the solutions
16 are, we have to -- we don't have a lot of
17 time -- restorative justice and also
18 preventative community measures.

19 Restorative justice is
20 essentially the idea that recognition of
21 crime is a violation of one person by
22 another rather than an act against the
23 state. It functions with the voluntary
24 participation of victims, offenders and
25 community members. Victims typically

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

75

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

address how the crime has impacted their lives and offenders are encouraged to take responsibility.

And in terms of preventative community measures, anticrime design is one such method. Creation of public spaces that actively prevent crime such as more windows to decrease secret spaces where crime may occur, and natural access of control, which is just building fences to clearly delineate public and private spaces are also better solutions.

So to conclude my portion, I thank you for listening to my speech about the world that students such as myself and my comrades at Students of Consciousness would like to bring to fruition.

Please consider this alternative to policing as an entire structure and remember that it is not the alternatives that are so radical, but the initial violence of policing as a system that's radically antihuman.

I leave you with the words of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

76

1 Proceedings

2 Dr. King; "The arc of the moral universe
3 is long, but it bends toward justice."

4 MS. O'CREA: I'm going to be very
5 fast and way more simple speech. More
6 about the pertinent issues as to what's
7 going on right now.

8 A pertinent topic that's been
9 spoken about tonight within this
10 conversation is the idea of body cameras
11 being a solution, when in fact how can
12 you -- how can solving something after the
13 fact of it happening be a solution for it
14 not to happen again.

15 The body camera only provides a
16 solution in a way that it shows what
17 happened previously rather than what's
18 going to happen after, and it's been
19 statistically proven that it doesn't
20 change a police officer's behavior. You
21 can see this in the New York Times. You
22 can see this in the Washington Post with
23 Washington, D.C. being a big example of
24 this. Body cameras have not been
25 helpful, but they also have not been

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

77

1 Proceedings

2 harmful. They show us what happened, they
3 don't give us a solution to what can
4 happen in the future.

5 So perhaps, though, the abolition
6 of the NYPD may not happen tomorrow,
7 changing the training that the NYPD
8 follows can happen today. So if you
9 follow these trainings and you follow this
10 destruction of the fight or flight
11 mentality within these human beings, then
12 you can train these human beings to
13 further their knowledge into the
14 community. So what is the community?

15 The community of Jamaica, Queens
16 is black and brown bodies. What does that
17 mean for us? What are these body cameras
18 going to do for us? They're just going to
19 show and further traumatize us by showing
20 us what has been done to us, what will be
21 done to us and then that furthers the
22 thinking of what will be done to my son or
23 daughter.

24 So when you think -- when you
25 have that in mind, the assumption that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

78

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

transparency and accountability tools will directly improve performance needs to be questioned, and that can only be questioned by the community and it's the community's job to further the questions of those who are in power.

The idea of an enforcer enforcing the enforced makes no sense to me because then you're just asking for more people to be in power. So you have someone enforcing the NYPD, then you have someone enforcing that enforcer and it keeps going until you find someone who has too much innate power that further oppresses black and brown bodies. So that's my...

THE CHAIR: Can you identify yourself for us?

MS. O'CREA: My name is Naday O'Crea. I'm a student at St. Johns University. I'm also a part of Students of Consciousness. I apologize. That was very rude of me.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.
Any comments or questions?

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

79

1 Proceedings

2 (Applause.)

3 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Question.

4 First of all, I want to commend you on
5 your research and everything that you've
6 done. I'm that person you were talking
7 about in that report so I appreciate --

8 THE CHAIR: Can you identify
9 yourself?

10 AUDIENCE MEMBER: So my question
11 to you is, how can you -- how did you
12 inspire -- because tonight I'm
13 representing the Lebanon Seventh-Day
14 Adventist Church Community Outreach and I
15 brought four or five young brothers from
16 my church who I believe need to emulate
17 what you're doing.

18 How would you encourage other
19 young folks your age range, a little bit
20 older or maybe in the teenage range to be
21 as inspired and as diligent and
22 intentional in research, and in being
23 aware about civic engagement and being
24 involved in finding their place and
25 purpose in the community? How would you

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

80

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

do that? What does that look like?

MS. ROBINSON: So what that looks like is first, just picking up a history book, right? So you have to understand that perhaps in any kind of school, I went to private catholic school my whole life, you don't have to go to public school to be mistaught history, is to read history from the perspective of black and brown people.

I recognize that you as a black or brown person didn't get here today by your own efforts or even by the efforts of your parents, but by the collective efforts of black and brown people who have got you here today.

So your answer is from Dr. King, Malcolm X, Fannie Lou Hamer, or Ella Baker, any such person who dismantled something so you can be here today. If we didn't abolish slavery, I couldn't stand here today free in any kind of way.

So another thing that you should do is dedicate yourself to your community

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

81

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

and put community first. Find your civic -- find those clubs, those organizations that encourage civic engagement, and if you feel like those places aren't doing enough, then go back to the history books, because history will really tell you what to do. History is that guiding force.

(Applause.)

THE CHAIR: Thank you. Thank you very much.

EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: I would just like to urge you guys if you're interested, or any of those people who came late, to apply to our Youth Advisory Council 'cause we're eager to hear from people your age and a little bit younger and get your input on how to improve the CCRB. And I know you have different views on policing than some of us here, but we want to hear those things.

MS. ROBINSON: Another recommendation, there are Cure Violence Offices within your borough, so I work

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

82

Proceedings

1
2 cure violence and these offices, their job
3 is to bridge the gap between police and
4 community, but taking away the authority
5 of policing. So going to your Cure
6 Violence office, this teaches you not only
7 how to interview for a future job, but
8 also how to tackle discrimination in the
9 workplace or tackle pay gaps in the
10 workplace in terms of intersectionality
11 between race and gender. It tackles the
12 hard stuff that you wouldn't necessarily
13 receive from school, or college in my
14 case.

15 And another way for you to get
16 further connected within your community or
17 even feel as though you should take on the
18 role of being a, quote, unquote, activist
19 is really looking around, taking the time
20 to look at yourself and look at others and
21 recognize what's happening in your
22 community.

23 So, for example, I only got
24 involved when I witnessed my brother get
25 arrested in our apartment when I was

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

83

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

living in Brownsville in Brooklyn. So that's the only time when I realized oh, wow, this is real. But it shouldn't have taken me that long, but it did, so maybe just taking some time, you need to take a step and recognize what's happening around you or realize what's happening around you.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

(Applause.)

EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: Our website where you can apply for the Youth Advisory Council, nyc.gov/ccrbyouthcouncil.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

We have Andrea Colon from the Rockaway Youth Task Force.

MS. COLON: Good evening. So my name is Andrea Colon and I'm the community engagement organizer with the Rockaway Youth Task Force and currently attending Baruch College. I just want to say thank you to everyone who presented before me.

And so we're a community-based advocacy group out in Rockaway and we work

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

84

Proceedings

1
2 with young people of color throughout the
3 peninsula on different issues, and one
4 issue is criminal justice reform, and we
5 do see that there is a lack of
6 transparency and trust between law
7 enforcement and the residents in our
8 community, and particularly there's two
9 high school campuses in the peninsula that
10 many youth are concerned that there's a
11 feeling of overpolicing and
12 criminalization.

13 And I myself graduated from one
14 of those high schools in June and felt
15 that there weren't any strong
16 relationships or connections with the
17 SSAs, and we recognize that to have this
18 community policing model, it has to start
19 at the local level.

20 So we have a lot of our young
21 people attend precinct council meetings
22 and then invite their parents, friends to
23 get more people there, and we realize that
24 the NCOs are present at the meetings, but
25 if people don't attend the precinct

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

85

1 Proceedings

2 council meetings, for the most part,
3 community members don't even know that
4 NCOs are in the community; you don't see
5 them, you don't hear about them so that
6 there's like this big distinction between
7 it being in place and then like community
8 members actually knowing that it's there.

9 And yeah, just knowing that it
10 exists is an important first step and,
11 again, like the previous person before me
12 said, there needs to be -- there's many
13 reasons why there's lack of trust between
14 law enforcement and communities of color,
15 but we really need to take a look at that
16 and see what can we do to improve, and
17 again, like I said, just making it known
18 that NCOs are a thing and making sure that
19 it is a real relationship and not just
20 showing up at meetings and saying here are
21 some community updates.

22 It has to actually be a community
23 effort to build relationships and
24 transparency, and yeah, so we're training
25 young people on the Right to Know Act. We

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

86

1 Proceedings

2 were a part of getting it passed and just
3 realizing that it's important for
4 community members to know that their
5 experiences with the police are validated,
6 and knowing that CCRB could play a role in
7 that more better in making sure that,
8 again, that things aren't just
9 unsubstantiated or just exonerated off the
10 bat, making sure our experiences as people
11 of color in our communities are taken
12 seriously in just overall leads to a safer
13 environment. Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

15 (Applause.)

16 THE CHAIR: Any questions from
17 the board members? Comments from board
18 members.

19 Thank you so much.

20 We also have Gordon Jackson, who
21 is the vice president of community affairs
22 at Core Services Group.

23 MR. JACKSON: Good evening, to
24 the community. I want to thank Jahi Rose
25 and Yojaira Alvarez for bringing us out.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

87

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Core Services Group, we host homeless shelters here in New York City and I want to be brief in what we talked about our success with the CCRB. We've been very fortunate to bring trainers from the CCRB to educate our clients about healthy police relations.

Additionally, educate our staff about how to educate our clients on healthy police relations and what actions we can take to support our clients moving back into the community from shelters and to not be stigmatized because they are homeless and to promote, once again, healthy relationships.

So that's primarily what we do. Thanks for bringing us out and we look forward to continued partnerships that are specifically aimed towards educating our clients and educating our staff on productive, healthy relationships.

Thank you.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

Questions, comments from members?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

88

1 Proceedings

2 (No response.)

3 THE CHAIR: All right. Thank
4 you.

5 (Applause.)

6 THE CHAIR: So we will open it up
7 for public comment. I don't have -- I do
8 have a list and so I will go down this as
9 best I can.

10 You have three minutes and if I
11 miss you, I will ask at the end if there's
12 anybody who hasn't been called on.

13 And if I somehow mispronounce
14 your name, I'm going to ask for
15 forgiveness before I get started, and I'm
16 going to totally mess up the first one
17 because I can't read the handwriting.

18 So let's try this: Bobby Cashawn
19 from LIC Cam.

20 (No response.)

21 THE CHAIR: No?

22 All right. I'll see if I can get
23 another interpretation of this and we'll
24 come back.

25 John Logan.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

89

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

MR. LOGAN: Hello and good evening. Jonathan Logan, Cambria Heights. I have one question for the board, one question for the members of 105 Precinct, I guess, and then at the very end. Most importantly, I'm also going to introduce some of the other brothers from my church, the Lebanon Seventh-Day Adventist Church Community Outreach.

So first of all, so one thing, I've been following Ms. Marbre Butts and following a lot of work she's been doing, and one thing that resonated with me that she said at a previous board meeting is that the CCRB is somewhat strictly, solely, I'm paraphrasing, like an advisory board, advisory to the PC. She stressed that and that resonated with me 'cause that translated in my mind to somewhat being like somewhat of a rubber stamp.

So although we appreciate, I know I appreciate greatly, the work the CCRB and the community does also, what really does that mean when it comes down to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

90

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

really substantiating and enforcing punitive or disciplinary charges on a police officer who has committed something that is under the purview of the CCRB. That's one question. I don't know if you want to take that.

THE CHAIR: Sure. We can take that and answer in succession. I'm going to open it up to the other members to speak as well.

So the CCRB does in the end make a recommendation to the department and to the commissioner about discipline for officers.

I think what prompted my colleague to, and she can speak for herself, but to make the comment that she did, and she actually challenged me on it even after we had the meeting, was that I pointed out that last year in 2017, 75 percent of the times that the CCRB said that there should be discipline, the commissioner agreed with us.

Where he didn't agree was what

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

91

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

that discipline should be and so only 45 percent of the times that we agree and, that's what I left out. I think that's what precipitated the comment.

This year so far, and this report is due to come out soon, 85 percent of the time that the CCRB has recommended discipline, the commissioner has agreed, and 55 percent of the time so far of what we call non-APU cases, the commissioner has agreed.

In the end, whether non-APU cases or APU, meaning the most serious cases, our recommendations are just that; recommendations for discipline to the department. And the police commissioner has the right, under the law, to either agree, to disagree or to modify.

Other comments?

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Thank you for the clarification.

I would just say, so I come from an organizing background. What that means is that I believe first and foremost in

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

92

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

the power of people and the power of the movements.

The CCRB is a body that at the end of the day does not have control over the discipline of the police officers in this city. And so I would advocate and do advocate and want to advocate for a body that not only recommends whether the police department agrees or disagrees, but actually has the power to dictate discipline and that actually is at its heart of what community control looks like and means.

I think we should honor this very important body. We receive complaints. We elevate issues. We are working towards increased transparency, but it is actually not a body that disciplines officers and therefore is not a body that is able to claim that power, and that's an important distinction. And that doesn't make this body not a very important body. It's a very important body, but I think it is an ongoing fight to ensure the police don't

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

93

1 Proceedings

2 police themselves as the council member
3 said, which is still the state of reality
4 in this city.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you for your
6 time.

7 Any other comments?

8 MR. LOGAN: And again, I'm going
9 to reiterate how much I appreciate what
10 CCRB does and how important it is to the
11 community.

12 Now for 105, like students from
13 St. Johns had mentioned, I'm the one that
14 had a complaint, I filed a complaint, but
15 as I got my letter substantiating in fact
16 what had happened for the police officer,
17 it was important to know that this
18 officer, it wasn't his first rodeo if you
19 were to say.

20 So that's important to me.
21 That's kind of scary to me in that an
22 officer would have multiple interactions
23 in this way. In fact I asked for
24 mediation and I was denied mediation. The
25 officer did not qualify for mediation,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

94

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

because in fact it had been multiple times so he did not qualify.

So my question to you as commanding officers, as executive officers, how do you build trust? How do you build trust with a community when in fact the community is telling you their problems? They're telling you that in fact hey, this police officer is a problem and we're showing you.

And not only that, the advisory board, the largest civilian oversight agency in the country, if not in the world, over a police agency is substantiating that, and yet on record the commanding officer of the precinct says well, it's because this officer's nature of his assignment why he has these type of complaints. This is what was said publicly at a 113 Precinct community council meeting, almost as if he validated the fact that it was because of his assignment why he has all these complaints.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

95

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

I don't think that's fair and I think it validates and gives credence and it gives okay to an officer misbehaving.

I understand the challenges that you guys face by interacting with the community. I know it's very challenging, but at the end of the day how do you build trust when in fact it's substantiated by an outside, civilian oversight agency, it's then validated and the commanding officer says hey, it's because of the nature of his assignment why, in fact, he has these complaints. One cannot balance. How do you build trust --

THE CHAIR: Let's see if you'd like to comment.

CAPTAIN ROBINSON: Sure.

Again, I'm Eric Robinson, the executive officer of the 113th Precinct.

First I have to say, it may not be the most popular opinion, but I think it's very unfair for you to sit here and say that it has nothing to do with it, because let's be honest with one another,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

96

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

it's different policing in the 113 then it is in some other neighborhoods in this community, and I think what we have to do is take everything as a whole.

And I'll be the first to admit there are human beings inside these uniforms. Not all of us are -- I still have yet to meet the perfect person other than my wife, but other than that, we do make mistakes.

And as far as building up trust goes, again, I can only speak for the 113. I don't think we have a problem building trust in my precinct. I think that we have some amazing inroads, we have some amazing partnerships within our precinct, we get a lot of positive feedback, but we also look at our problems as opportunities and we can always improve.

But I think we do have to take things as a whole and due to the nature of the officer's assignment does leave him susceptible, and I'm not advocating for any officer in particular, I'm not talking

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

97

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

about anything specific, but I think what my commanding officer spoke to the last time is that is something we have to consider is what does this officer do for a living, what is his job.

You know, if he's doing community affairs, I have the greatest community affairs officer, although my partners will disagree with me, in Detective Duhaney. She's been in this community, she's raised in this community. No one is complaining about Tanya Duhaney, all right? If you spend five minutes, there's nothing to complain about and she's out there every day, but she's not making arrests. She doesn't write summonses.

Unfortunately, sometimes some of my officers do meet people at the lowest points of their life and that's why we have an open door policy at the 113. Nothing against CCRB. I encourage everybody to always follow whatever avenues you wish, but please also come to the command.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

98

1 Proceedings

2 CCRB does take some time. If you
3 have a pressing issue, come into our
4 building. Come in. I have no life. I'm
5 there all the time. My commanding officer
6 is there all the time, and if not, you
7 e-mail me. It's eric.robinson@nypd.org.
8 And Captain Chan will tell you the same
9 thing. This is what we pride ourselves
10 on.

11 Our borough chief, Chief David
12 Barrere, has made community the
13 cornerstone long before it became the goal
14 to be the cornerstone. He's been our
15 borough commander for almost five years.

16 Again, we're not perfect, we can
17 always be better, but I think we have to
18 look at things as a whole.

19 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: And I'm sure
20 that the captain would, you know, if a
21 complaint comes in that's in your
22 jurisdiction, you of course would prefer
23 it --

24 CAPTAIN ROBINSON: It always
25 does, sir. To be honest with you, what we

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

99

Proceedings

1
2 try to do is -- sometimes there is a lag.
3 I don't ever want someone to get bogged
4 down in the bureaucracy that is the City
5 of New York when if there's a problem that
6 we can solve immediately and then deal
7 with again somewhere down the road.

8 It doesn't -- we're not trying to
9 wash away the conduct which may or may not
10 be justified under CCRB's purview, but
11 we'd like to solve that problem as soon as
12 humanly possible, and if there is a
13 secondary issue, if there's a disciplinary
14 issue, we're going to look at that down
15 the road and what we do, and I know the
16 commanding officers of PSA 9 and 105 that
17 are here now, they're at the top of their
18 game.

19 Something that we are vigorously
20 and aggressively on top of is our
21 officers' conduct in the street, and
22 officers with negative histories and
23 officers with problems, they are under
24 constant review. It's something we keep a
25 very close eye on. So we do encourage

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

100

1 Proceedings

2 people to reach out to us as often as
3 possible. Believe me, our doors are
4 always open.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, sir.

6 MR. LOGAN: And lastly -- first
7 of all, Jerry O'Sullivan is a gentleman
8 he's a -- that's a commanding officer who
9 worked 113 by the way, he's a gentleman
10 reached out to me personally on my cell
11 phone. He's a gentleman. We spoke.

12 Last and most importantly, there
13 are a couple of young men from my church,
14 Lebanon Seventh-Day Adventist, where I'm
15 the director of Community Outreach and I
16 found it very important that they be here
17 because once I found out about the Youth
18 Advisory Council, and so I have some
19 candidates for you, they will be signed
20 up, but most importantly there's
21 testimony, and so I'd like to bring up one
22 young man. His name is Odane and if
23 that's okay with you. I know there's more
24 people on your list.

25 THE CHAIR: There are more people

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

101

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

on the list, but we're happy to hear from him.

MR. LOGAN: We appreciate that. Thank you. Odane Denton.

Things happen and I think it's wonderful that we want to listen to our young people so they can see our different perspective. Interactions with police from older people, 70 years old, gray hair, looks a lot different from young men, especially people of color.

(Applause.)

MR. DENTON: I don't have anything prepared like the two girls from St. Johns, but it is related.

I'm 17 years old now, so two years ago when I was 15, I was a sophomore in high school. I was going to my friend's house and we were walking in the back blocks, and I was in the back blocks for 15 minutes prior to an incident. And we were walking and a black car stopped with two, it was uncover police officers, but I didn't know that at the time. So

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

102

1 Proceedings

2 they asked had we seen any -- had we heard
3 any gunshots. So we said no and we find
4 it a little bit suspicious 'cause we were
5 in the neighborhood for like 10,
6 15 minutes prior.

7 So we walked a little faster and
8 we were probably like four houses away
9 from our destination and they stopped us.
10 They reversed the car, got out of the car
11 and pointed their guns at us straight and
12 said, "Get on the ground now." This was
13 at Springfield Boulevard and 140th Avenue,
14 so it's not that far from here. And they
15 said, "Get on the ground now."

16 So I said, "I don't have
17 anything," right? I had skinny pants, I
18 had skinny jeans on, right, so I was like,
19 "I don't have anything."

20 He said, "Get on the ground now."

21 So I got on the ground, laid on
22 the ground like this (indicating) and they
23 made me lay down for probably like five
24 minutes, and they searched me and they
25 said, "So why are you walking faster?"

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

103

1 Proceedings

2 And I said, "Because you guys are
3 suspicious and I was walking in the
4 neighborhood for a while before that and I
5 didn't hear anything, any police cars, any
6 sirens, any ambulance, anything."

7 And they searched my bookbag,
8 everything. I had to empty everything out
9 on the floor and searched my pockets,
10 everything. And it was like I could have
11 been one of the 38, that she said, black
12 men shot, and I was only 15 years old and
13 yeah.

14 THE CHAIR: Well, I'll personally
15 say I'm very sorry that that has happened.
16 I know a little bit about what that feels
17 like not having always been 62 and wearing
18 a suit and tie, and it's very unfortunate.

19 I think if officers who are
20 undercover do stop you, they should
21 identify themselves right away so that you
22 know that -- who you're dealing with and
23 you don't have to be afraid.

24 But I think I want to commend you
25 for doing what they told you to do. I

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

104

1 Proceedings

2 think that's always important whether you
3 agree with it or not. If you get an
4 order, follow it and then let us deal with
5 it on the back end.

6 But I personally want to
7 apologize that you had to go through that
8 and I hope it never happens to you again,
9 'cause I definitely know it doesn't feel
10 good when it does.

11 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: I just want
12 to add one thing.

13 Commonly people feel that if they
14 don't know the name of the officer, that
15 they can't make a complaint, but one of
16 the things that this agency is very good
17 at is identifying police officers and with
18 body-worn camera footage and The Right to
19 Know Act, we've been getting better at
20 doing that.

21 So two years, it is probably past
22 the statute of limitations, but if you --
23 we have investigators here if you want to
24 make a complaint now, and I join the Chair
25 in apologizing to you.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

105

1 Proceedings

2 MR. LOGAN: It's important, just
3 lastly, that we understand. It's
4 unfortunate I have to give this
5 disclaimer, but these young men are, just
6 as I was born at Lebanon Church and grew
7 up, my son crawls underneath the pews now,
8 these young men have grown up in my
9 church.

10 These young men are part of the
11 drill corps, they're part of the
12 Pathfinders organization. These are --
13 they don't have police records. They
14 don't have rap sheets. They don't have
15 any of that.

16 Oftentimes I think a lot what we
17 do --

18 (Applause.)

19 MR. LOGAN: We can applaud for
20 that.

21 Oftentimes it's always like in
22 the back of our minds we say well, what
23 was he doing back there or did he have a
24 record, or was he walking suspiciously.
25 No. These young men are good young men if

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

106

1 Proceedings

2 that can be defined, so we have to
3 understand that these things happen. It
4 happened to --

5 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: Do you have
6 another -- someone else who's coming up?

7 MR. LOGAN: Yes, sure. And
8 that's that and that's my time, and I
9 appreciate the extended time and I just
10 want to thank you for this time and that's
11 it. Thank you. Appreciate it.

12 (Applause.)

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

14 Do you have another young man? I
15 think that's what he was asking.

16 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: One of the
17 reasons we're here is to hear from you
18 guys, so like we appreciate that you came
19 out, but we want to hear from you.

20 MATTHEW: Good evening. My name
21 is Matthew. It was recently just happened
22 I was stopped by police and they asked to
23 search me, and quick question; is it true
24 that you can like deny the right for them
25 to search you?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

107

1 Proceedings

2 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: So it
3 depends. You have the right to say no and
4 then if there are factors that give the
5 officer the right to continue to search,
6 they can do so.

7 But if you -- if an officer
8 treats you in a way that you feel that
9 your rights were violated, you can contact
10 the CCRB and we will determine whether or
11 not, as best we can, the officer acted
12 lawfully.

13 MATTHEW: All right. So I was
14 walking, I was on my way home from
15 basketball practice. I had a big blue
16 duffel bag, which is probably why he
17 stopped me 'cause big bags are suspicious
18 nowadays due to terrorism, and he asked to
19 search my bag.

20 And I was like okay, no problem,
21 but then he searches my bag, he took the
22 contents out and started throwing it
23 around.

24 Is that a proper way to go about
25 searching my bag?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

108

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: So all of those things depend, and we would need to -- and what I would urge you to do is actually talk to our investigators and sit down and talk to them.

It's not something that we can just give you a quick answer to unfortunately, 'cause there are a lot of different things that we would need to find out. We need to talk to you and then we need to talk to the officers.

THE CHAIR: But what I will say in regard to that is that the assumption should be that all officers will comport themselves in a way that respects the badge that they have been given the privilege to wear.

MATTHEW: Thank you. And the situation escalated 'cause I started to get mad at him for throwing my items around on the floor like they were rag dolls, and he started spewing out very disgusting words like shut the f... up and like sit your -- sit down. And I started

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

109

1 Proceedings

2 getting heated and I had to like -- my
3 cousin had to step in and sit me in his
4 car for me to cool down while he searched.
5 My cousin filed a report and everything.
6 I'm not sure what's going on now, but
7 that's that.

8 THE CHAIR: Well, again just as I
9 said to the other young man, really sorry
10 you had to go through that and hope you'll
11 keep a positive attitude about life in
12 general and about engagement with the NYPD
13 more specifically, because I think it's
14 really important that we do what we can to
15 improve the relationship between the
16 police and young people, particularly
17 young people of color, particularly young
18 men of color.

19 And I hope you will get involved
20 with our Youth Council and help us advance
21 that work, 'cause I think it's crucial to
22 the life of this city, if not the life of
23 the nation. Thank you.

24 MR. WILLIAMS: My name is Clayton
25 Williams. I go to New Visions August

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

110

1 Proceedings

2 Martin High School and I'm a senior.

3 And this issue with police
4 department terrorism. And I'm sorry, I
5 know you guys are police (indicating), but
6 it's not all police officers. But
7 although this is happening, isn't it like
8 what like type of stuff is going on? How
9 do you feel like they're trying to figure
10 out their mental, 'cause it's not just you
11 yourself, it's your brain. It's something
12 wrong with you I guess. So is there a
13 type of mental test?

14 THE CHAIR: Illness?

15 MR. WILLIAMS: Not illness, but
16 like is there like a mental investigation
17 going on in the police force like to find
18 out the type of officers that are --

19 MR. PEGUERO: Are you asking if
20 there's a psychological test that police
21 officers have to go through?

22 MR. WILLIAMS: What?

23 MR. PEGUERO: Are you asking if
24 there's a psychological test that police
25 officers have to go through?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

111

1 Proceedings

2 MR. WILLIAMS: No. I know that
3 there's a psychological test, like what's
4 your name and stuff like that, but like
5 people are still passing those tests with
6 their mind still being corrupted and still
7 doing these, so these officers that are
8 able to like do these to people on the
9 streets, they pass the test in order to be
10 there, so there needs to be like other
11 tests to find out if there's something
12 really wrong with you, so what can be
13 done?

14 (Applause.)

15 THE CHAIR: So let me just say,
16 one of the things that we've had
17 conversations with the department about
18 and that others have as well, elected
19 officials and others, is about the issue
20 of implicit bias. The way in which -- and
21 the city has mandated that police officers
22 and actually a number of other people,
23 including folks at the CCRB, go through
24 implicit bias training.

25 We used a group that was

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

112

1 Proceedings

2 excellent and they focus on -- they start
3 looking -- by looking at the mental
4 aspects of bias and how we -- and the
5 unconscious aspects of bias and the ways
6 in which we think we are not biased, but
7 really we are, and the ways in which that
8 unconscious bias has a real impact on how
9 we do our jobs, and that includes police
10 officers.

11 So I think that as you all and
12 others continue to raise these issues it
13 is going to be really incumbent upon the
14 NYPD, the city, the mayor, city council,
15 CCRB and others to pay attention to the
16 way we all are impacted by our prejudices
17 and the real potential for very negative
18 consequences of those prejudices when it
19 comes to officers interacting with people
20 who look like you and who look like me,
21 and we're going to continue to push that
22 'cause it's important.

23 Again, if we want to improve
24 police-community relations in this city
25 and in this nation, then we've got to take

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

113

1 Proceedings

2 seriously the things that stand in the way
3 of that and clearly implicit bias is one
4 of those things that stand in the way, and
5 we are advocating every day for there to
6 be more trainings for officers and others
7 when it comes to those issues, so thank
8 you both.

9 (Applause.)

10 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: I just also
11 want to thank you both for speaking. I
12 know it's difficult.

13 I think implicit bias is a thing
14 and so is structural racism, and a lot of
15 the things that we see happen in our
16 communities, lots of experience that you
17 have shared, lots of our living conditions
18 are actually impacted, not just by
19 implicit bias or outward bias or racism,
20 but also of structural racism.

21 And I think it's an interesting
22 important factor that police in this
23 country came about actually as slave
24 patrollers. So from its very inception,
25 the police, the criminal justice system

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

114

1 Proceedings

2 are systems that are deeply, deeply
3 structurally racist. And so I think as we
4 think about our experiences, thinking
5 about the ways that bias plays into it,
6 but also the ways that the system is set
7 up to prosecute, exploit and sometimes
8 kill our people is a really important
9 thing to keep in mind.

10 And the responsibility for any
11 structural racism is on each of us and
12 also on how we transform the systems, and
13 so it's not just about building
14 relationships with police, but also try to
15 dismantle some of the structural racism
16 that exists that allows for these systems
17 to perpetuate.

18 And so I want to thank you, but
19 also note it's not just the individuals,
20 it's systemic and so our work is both
21 systemic work and individual work.

22 MR. WILLIAMS: My friends Odane
23 and Matthew, what do you think could have
24 been done in their situations, because
25 there's a lot of young men across America

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

115

1 Proceedings

2 being brought up by the situations, so how
3 do you feel -- what do you feel like they
4 should have done in these situations?

5 THE CHAIR: I think they did
6 exactly what you -- if the police gives
7 you a command, follow it.

8 If you disagree with it, talk to
9 us, talk to Mr. Logan, talk to your mom,
10 your minister, your dad, a neighbor, an
11 uncle. Don't resist an order from a cop.
12 That's the best advice I think I can give
13 you. Let us do our job. The best thing
14 for you to do is not go to jail and not
15 get harmed, and come home.

16 MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you.

17 MS. DAVIS: Again, Karen Davis,
18 PSA 9. I just want you to understand what
19 he talked about. This training that the
20 police department is going through about
21 implicit bias and how it shows up in
22 everyday lives, they also showed it to
23 leadership. I was part of the pilot that
24 they did when they brought this initiative
25 to the police department to see if they

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

116

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

could restructure the way things are
looked at.

So it's the crimes that we see
from officers that have overaggressive
attitudes or dispositions in our community
really need to be looked at through a
mental aspect, because people don't know
what their biases are.

And one of the great things that
I think they're going to do is after they
totally train the whole police department,
they're going to come back into the
community and offer those classes to
individuals like yourself and other people
in the community.

And think I if anyone here does
not know what their biases are, they
should really take a part and take a real
good look at that training. It was
excellent.

And I can honestly tell you that
the things that you're saying were things
that were very descriptive in some of that
training that they gave us and you would

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

117

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

really learn a lot, so don't cut off the conversation with this justice meeting. Look forward to it coming in the future and you can take a part of that and spread it throughout the community to tell people they should really address their biases from an internal level as well as an external level.

Thank you.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

Earl Robins.

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: I'm going to need some help with this one. Garth Girenelli (phonetic)?

Is there a Garth in the house?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: Is it Huguette Prophete?

MS. PROPHETE: Good evening, everyone and thank you for pronouncing my name correctly. I know it's a bit challenging. My name is Huguette Prophete and I'm actually here representing a

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

118

1 Proceedings

2 company, a community-based organization
3 called Centers Adult Day Care. We are
4 actually a medical model adult day program
5 and we have six locations but I handle the
6 one in Jamaica. It's basically on Baisley
7 Boulevard, corner of Merrill.

8 And we provide services to people
9 that have a medical condition that can be
10 physical or as the young man previously
11 discussed, mental. So we offer services
12 like transportation to and from. We will
13 pick them up from their home.

14 We have two meals for them when
15 they come in; breakfast, lunch and a snack
16 in between.

17 We have a social service
18 department that can assist them with
19 things like housing application, Medicaid
20 recertification, food stamps.

21 And we also have a registered
22 nurse that makes sure that their compliant
23 with taking their meds and going to the
24 doctor's appointment.

25 We also have a podiatrist that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

119

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

comes in once every two months and a registered nutritionist that comes in weekly to make sure they're eating properly.

And we keep them engaged with activities like yoga, zumba, tai chi.

We may take them on trips where we load them up in the van and go to the museums and we just keep them busy throughout eight to one, six days a week depending on how many days they qualify for and this is a service that's completely covered by Medicaid.

And the reason why I came here today is because doing community outreach as a community liaison, I witness different aspects of the community where it could result with, you know, a little bit better in my opinion. You know, going to networking events and meeting other communities leaders, we have so many underutilized resources just not getting out to the community, so there has to be a better way of letting people know that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

120

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

hey, you know, rather than being idle and getting into something that you shouldn't be getting into, talk to their care providers, make sure that they know these services are available.

And it's just not our center. There's numerous resources out there that's just not being utilized. So I say that to say, you know, like we start at age 21 for God sake, you know? We take people in their 30s, 40s, 50s, so it's a shame that people aren't using these resources, so maybe if you can give some suggestions as to how we can better get, you know...

And I work with Officer Duhaney and she's amazing in the community events, but there has to be a way to keep people from being idle and just busy throughout the course of the day, 'cause a lot of us -- a lot of folks in this country do suffer from mental illness and it's sad that they're not using the resources that's available.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

121

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

THE CHAIR: So a little bit outside the realm of my expertise, but I do think that leaders like yourself and others can continue to push and advocate for this level of engagement and for services that will sort of support and help people. And inasmuch as our community outreach can be helpful with you in that, I'm sure Yojaira and her team would be willing to do that. I think conversations obviously with precinct councils, with NCOs and others; complicated issues that CCRB is not always equipped to address and a little bit outside our purview, but if there's any way we can be supportive, even stretching what it is we're supposed to do, we will try to be helpful.

MS.PROPHETE: Thank you.

And I do have some information if anyone is currently working with clients or know of anyone that may benefit from this program.

THE CHAIR: Thank you so much.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

122

1 Proceedings

2 (Applause.)

3 THE CHAIR: Mr. Peguero.

4 MR. PEGUERO: We can talk about
5 mental health and I know that many times
6 the police will be called to deal with an
7 emotionally disturbed person, and it got
8 me thinking about the possibility of an
9 emotionally disturbed police officer.

10 A lot of times police officers
11 are called upon to go to a home where
12 somebody has been slashed, cut up,
13 bleeding, dead, bloated, and I'm wondering
14 what kind of trauma that causes. I know
15 that some officers that are friends of
16 mine will tell me that after a while you
17 are able to have your lunch in front of a
18 dead body, and I'm trying to connect this
19 to what the young man said.

20 I'm wondering if there's a trauma
21 process that police officers go through or
22 whether there is a rotation, shift
23 rotation to ensure that a police officer
24 is not always dealing with the same type
25 of trauma that could potentially lead them

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

123

1 Proceedings

2 to see individuals not as people and as
3 objects.

4 THE CHAIR: Any desire to comment
5 on that sort of trauma services that the
6 department offers?

7 I can say that I do know that
8 there are psychologists who are employed
9 by the NYPD to assist in any number of
10 issues. I know it really...

11 CAPTAIN DELEO: Captain Joseph
12 DeLeo from PSA 9.

13 We have like different outreach
14 programs. Like we have a psychological
15 service program that's through the
16 department, and we have something called,
17 it's called Pop-Up. It's staffed by
18 current like active and retired officers
19 and it's kind of like an unofficial way to
20 get help. You may not want to go through
21 the department, go through the official
22 means, so you can make a phone call there
23 if you're feeling under stress or
24 something like that.

25 But as for the gentleman was

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

124

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

saying with the shift rotations, I mean there are different assignments in this department, some of which are less active than others, but for the most part you do have the same officers on patrol. It could be like that for years at a time. It's just the way it is.

THE CHAIR: Thank you.

MR. JOSEPH: I worked in healthcare for a long time and many hospitals will rotate their staff, nursing staff, doctors, out of the ER, out of the ICUs because of the level of stress that they have to go through and they realize that eventually it burns them out, they start to suppress their own emotions and not feel. So this is not every single hospital, but many hospitals started to do this where they will rotate the staff out of those high stress areas because it just results in burnout.

CAPTAIN DELEO: I mean obviously as myself and the other captains, if you see -- if I were to see someone

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

125

1 Proceedings

2 individually that you could tell is
3 showing that stress, that could be done,
4 but a lot of people just they don't show
5 it. They have ways of coping with it and
6 you would never know. We have a lot of
7 suicides, unfortunately, within the
8 department. It's a horrible thing, but I
9 mean sometimes you just don't know until
10 it's too late, but it's something we all
11 try to keep an eye on, try keep an eye on
12 our officers, talk to our subordinates and
13 it's just a matter of just if people show
14 it or not.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Thank you
16 very much.

17 MS. TAREKEGN: I want to mention
18 that both for police officers and for any
19 individuals that come into our offices, we
20 have NYC Well. We work with NYC Well,
21 Thrive and Safe Horizon to provide or
22 connect people with services, mental
23 health services or any other services they
24 may need. And so that's important both
25 for the police officers and for

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

127

1 Proceedings

2 think I put my name on the wrong list.

3 THE CHAIR: And can you tell us
4 who you are?

5 MR. BILLINGSLEY: I'm Joseph
6 Billingsley.

7 Speaking to the young men that
8 came up here earlier, my daughter had a
9 car accident and she got all frustrated,
10 and I said to her and my son, if you
11 encounter an accident or the police, you
12 have a weapon on you, that's your phone.
13 Turn your phone on, hit record and record
14 everything that happened, because instead
15 of being your word to their word, your
16 phone can speak for you as well. It got
17 audio and video.

18 So I say to the young men, and
19 these kids always carrying phones with
20 them, use your phone. That's it.

21 THE CHAIR: I agree with every
22 bit of that except one thing; I wouldn't
23 see it as a weapon so much as a resource.

24 MR. BILLINGSLEY: I'm sorry. Let
25 me rephrase that. As a resource because

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

128

1 Proceedings

2 it's your word to their word. And in many
3 cases we have seen people -- when one cop
4 came to the four gentlemen in the car and
5 he said, You don't speak English, and he
6 didn't realize and maybe mocking them, one
7 gentleman took the phone out and he was
8 recording it.

9 THE CHAIR: Sure.

10 MR. BILLINGSLEY: I'm saying your
11 word to their word, so use your phone.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

13 EXEC. DIR. DARCHE: The agency
14 has recently invested a lot of resources
15 in software that lets us better analyze
16 digital recordings and training our
17 investigators in how to analyze digital
18 recordings, so it's not just body-worn
19 camera footage that we are able to use to
20 determine what happened in an incident, we
21 can also use surveillance footage and cell
22 phone video.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

24 One last name on our list is
25 Shirley Phipps. She's gone?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

129

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Anybody who didn't make the list who would like three minutes?

MS. DAVIS: Again, my name is Karen Davis. I'm president for PSA 9 and we cover a lot of housing developments in the borough, and one of the things that I would like, and I've been speaking to Ms. Alvarez about, is about building bridges of communication between the things that go on in our community and resource or providers of resources like the CCRB and other agencies.

Our break down in communication is so poorly distributed in the communities, low-income families and extremely low-income families, that no, they don't come to these meetings and they don't put their children in these meetings. They don't go out to their schools. They don't go out to their community center. They don't engage in whatever empowerment or initiatives that are out there in the programs.

So one of the things that we're

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

130

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

working on this year and it's a platform on top of all of the issues of platforms that we deal with in the police council, is building better bridges of communications.

One of things that I take to be really informative to the community is that we have digital displays, all community engagement meetings, programs and things visually displayed for people who don't come into those meetings, so as they pass through their communities, they can see a digital display saying okay, you have a CCRB meeting this night, come out, bring your family members, bring whomever; or the church is giving certain type of domestic violence initiative, come out, bring your people who have serious issues and are looking for some therapeutic solution.

Communications is such a really horrible type of vehicle that every city agency has a problem with, and I think that I mean the numbers are here, they're

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

131

1 Proceedings

2 fine, but they could have been greater if
3 communication was set up in a different
4 way.

5 And for CCRB, if you really want
6 to be a partner with us, the leadership,
7 find a way to get your information
8 displayed visually for people who can see
9 it. They might not be able to hear, they
10 might not be able to talk, but they can
11 read. And you can do it in any language
12 so we can get more numbers in these rooms
13 so the complaints that we hear about that
14 go unheard can also address the ones that
15 have been heard and they can be fixed.

16 People don't really know that a
17 lot of things don't exist. They don't
18 know about the PSA 9. Why? Because you
19 know what, the police department doesn't
20 give us that type of promotion. So it's
21 us, the leadership, that are elected into
22 our positions, come out and do these
23 things.

24 A lot of people don't come to
25 these meetings. That's a big problem, but

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

132

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

a lot of people don't know about these meetings, so if you could fix your vehicle of communication and address it to the leadership to the other departments in the city, I think we're going to have a better turnout with a better result, and we wouldn't have to feel like people don't matter because people don't know.

THE CHAIR: Thank you so much.

(Applause.)

THE CHAIR: And let me say that you heard Council Member Richards talk about wanting to get the CCRB additional funding. We are in conversations with him and with the mayor's office about resources for enhanced community outreach, enhanced public engagement and public relations. It's a key budget item that we've put on our list.

So I hear you, it's a very good point and we will work double time to make sure the public knows about the CCRB when we're doing these meetings and the other things that we do, so thank you.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

133

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

I think there's been a rich discussion tonight. I'm going to ask if we have any old business to come before us.

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: Hearing none, is there any new business to come before us?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: Hearing none, is there a motion to adjourn the executive session?

MR. PEGUERO: So moved.

MR. JOSEPH: Is there a second?

THE CHAIR: All those in favor of adjourning the executive session say aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

THE CHAIR: Opposed?

(No response.)

THE CHAIR: No. The ayes have it.

This meeting is adjourned. Thank you all for coming.

(Time noted: 8:58 p.m.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

134

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
 : ss.:
COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, NICOLE ELLIS, a Notary Public for and within
the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the
within-entitled matter, and that the within
transcript is a true record of such proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related to any
of the parties to this action by blood or by
marriage and that I am in no way interested in the
outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
this 20th day of November 2018.

Nicole Ellis

NICOLE ELLIS

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

A		
able (15) 4:15 8:15 27:17 28:18 39:25 46:14,20 50:11 53:16 92:20 111:8 122:17 128:19 131:9 131:10	94:12 100:18	anticipate (1) 39:14
abolish (1) 80:22	advocacy (2) 25:10 83:25	anticrime (1) 75:6
abolition (2) 72:10 77:5	advocate (4) 92:7,8,8 121:5	antihuman (1) 75:24
absent (1) 69:21	advocates (1) 31:15	anybody (4) 10:11 68:4 88:12 129:2
Absolutely (1) 34:15	advocating (2) 96:24 113:5	anyway (1) 11:20
abuse (2) 17:19 26:16	affairs (6) 5:17 16:13 39:7 86:21 97:8,9	apartment (1) 82:25
academics (1) 31:14	afraid (1) 103:23	apologies (1) 23:24
academy (4) 1:5 4:11 55:6,8	after-school (2) 19:19 28:3	apologize (3) 11:6 78:22 104:7
access (1) 75:10	afternoon (4) 6:14 31:12 70:25 71:7	apologizing (1) 104:25
accident (2) 127:9,11	age (3) 79:19 81:18 120:11	applaud (1) 105:19
account (1) 73:2	agencies (1) 129:13	Applause (19) 10:10 11:4 21:4 32:7 65:24 66:5 70:21 79:2 81:10 83:11 86:15 88:5 101:13 105:18 106:12 111:14 113:9 122:2 132:11
accountability (3) 15:19 37:5 78:2	agency (12) 15:20 16:14,17 20:13 47:8 53:6 94:14,15 95:10 104:16 128:13 130:24	apples (1) 37:13
accountable (6) 37:13 40:2 42:21 48:23 51:16 62:17	agenda (3) 1:14 15:25 25:5	application (3) 30:11 31:22 118:19
accounts (1) 73:4	ages (3) 4:18 5:9 30:23	applications (1) 5:3
accurately (1) 46:21	aggressions (1) 73:7	applies (2) 14:20 40:14
acknowledge (4) 12:6 21:21 25:2 66:2	aggressive (1) 60:24	apply (4) 5:14 30:14 81:16 83:13
act (12) 12:12,21 14:5,20 17:9 18:22 40:8,11 46:14 74:22 85:25 104:19	aggressively (1) 99:20	appointed (1) 16:24
acted (1) 107:11	ago (4) 44:21 46:24 61:25 101:18	appointee (3) 3:16 11:15,16
acting (1) 42:22	agree (11) 33:25,25 50:13,14 61:22 62:7 90:25 91:3,19 104:3 127:21	appointment (1) 118:24
action (3) 50:11 51:23 134:12	agreed (3) 90:24 91:9,12	appreciate (8) 79:7 89:22,23 93:9 101:4 106:9,11,18
actions (1) 87:11	agrees (1) 92:10	appropriate (1) 51:23
active (2) 123:18 124:4	ahead (1) 70:15	approve (2) 66:18 67:22
actively (1) 75:8	aimed (1) 87:20	APU (2) 38:10 91:14
activist (1) 82:18	Albans (2) 71:21 73:10	arc (1) 76:2
activities (1) 119:7	Albany (1) 49:19	area (5) 26:10 45:19 57:3 59:17,19
activity (1) 25:19	Alicia (3) 22:4,6,14	areas (6) 25:18 59:15 60:12,17 65:9 124:21
actors (2) 38:2,4	Alive (1) 59:8	arrange (1) 35:12
actual (1) 45:18	allegation (3) 17:16 43:8 46:5	arrest (1) 8:18
Adams (3) 68:11,14,21	allegations (5) 16:21 17:8,25 26:14 63:21	arrested (1) 82:25
add (4) 48:4 51:5 63:4 104:12	allow (1) 33:16	arrests (1) 97:16
additional (3) 31:20 57:10 132:14	allows (1) 114:16	arrival (1) 35:20
Additionally (1) 87:9	alternative (1) 75:19	article (1) 48:12
address (9) 23:3 28:10 31:24 56:16 75:2 117:7 121:15 131:14 132:4	alternatives (3) 74:8,10 75:21	ashamed (2) 69:12 70:13
adjourn (2) 1:25 133:11	Alvarez (4) 5:18 16:7 86:25 129:9	asked (7) 67:6,7,8 93:23 102:2 106:22 107:18
adjourned (1) 133:22	amazing (3) 96:16,17 120:18	asking (5) 14:4 78:10 106:15 110:19,23
adjourning (1) 133:16	ambassadors (2) 5:11 30:9	asks (2) 14:16 18:9
administratively (1) 16:20	ambulance (1) 103:6	aspect (1) 116:8
admit (1) 96:6	amended (3) 46:4 67:17,22	aspects (3) 112:4,5 119:18
Adoption (1) 1:16	amendment (1) 67:2	assembly (1) 49:6
adult (2) 118:3,4	America (1) 114:25	Assemblywoman (3) 22:4,5,14
adults (2) 55:4,10	Amin (1) 68:7	assigned (1) 63:22
advance (2) 15:15 109:20	amount (2) 47:14 70:2	assignment (4) 94:19,24 95:13 96:23
advancing (1) 13:8	analysis (1) 74:12	assignments (1) 124:3
Adventist (3) 79:14 89:9 100:14	analyze (2) 128:15,17	assist (2) 118:18 123:9
advice (1) 115:12	ancestors (1) 74:6	Assistant (1) 4:9
advisory (11) 4:24 5:4,7 29:25 35:11 81:16 83:13 89:17,18	Andrea (2) 83:16,19	assuming (1) 62:18
	announce (1) 35:20	assumption (2) 77:25 108:14
	answer (3) 80:18 90:9 108:8	
	answered (1) 23:4	
	Anthony (1) 68:14	

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

attached (1) 39:19
attacked (1) 9:17
attend (2) 84:21,25
attending (1) 83:21
attention (1) 112:15
attitude (1) 109:11
attitudes (1) 116:6
AUDIENCE (15) 22:3,6,9,13 23:9
 23:11 43:5,12,23 44:3 50:2,5,10
 79:3,10
audio (2) 53:14 127:17
Auditorium (1) 1:6
August (1) 109:25
authority (4) 17:7,20 26:16 82:4
available (6) 27:13 36:13 120:6,25
 126:4,8
Avenue (2) 20:9 102:13
avenues (1) 97:24
aware (7) 12:10 36:12 47:24 49:8
 50:6 71:2 79:23
aye (2) 67:17 133:16
eyes (4) 67:18,21 133:17,20

B

B (1) 1:10
back (18) 7:4 19:6 41:20 45:12
 56:3 62:16 69:13 70:12,14 81:6
 87:13 88:24 101:21,21 104:5
 105:22,23 116:13
background (1) 91:24
bad (3) 37:13 38:2,4
badge (3) 38:6 42:17 108:17
bag (4) 107:16,19,21,25
bags (1) 107:17
Baisley (3) 8:4,5 118:6
Baker (1) 80:20
balance (1) 95:14
Barrere (1) 98:12
Baruch (1) 83:22
base (2) 41:12 56:20
based (3) 33:4 45:11 63:14
basically (1) 118:6
basketball (2) 19:20 107:15
bat (1) 86:10
behalf (2) 29:15,16
behavior (1) 76:20
beings (4) 9:11 77:11,12 96:7
believe (11) 15:14,17,18,21 41:7
 41:25 53:23 54:13 79:16 91:25
 100:3
bends (1) 76:3
beneficial (1) 12:16
benefit (1) 121:23
best (4) 88:9 107:11 115:12,13
better (20) 11:19 22:12 30:6,7
 31:18 47:23,25 54:25 57:2 75:13
 86:7 98:17 104:19 119:20,25

120:15 128:15 130:5 132:6,7
bevy (1) 61:21
bias (11) 111:20,24 112:4,5,8
 113:3,13,19,19 114:5 115:21
biased (1) 112:6
biases (3) 116:9,18 117:7
big (7) 23:5 49:19 76:23 85:6
 107:15,17 131:25
Billingsley (6) 126:24,25 127:5,6
 127:24 128:10
bit (18) 14:24 18:21,25 19:6 25:13
 29:7 49:25 58:22 62:6 79:19
 81:18 102:4 103:16 117:23
 119:20 121:2,15 127:22
black (17) 40:21,21,22 71:16 72:11
 72:16,19 73:2,16 74:14 77:16
 78:15 80:10,12,16 101:23 103:11
bleeding (1) 122:13
bloated (1) 122:13
blocked (1) 52:6
blocks (2) 101:21,21
blood (1) 134:12
blue (1) 107:15
board (27) 1:1 2:1,3,4,5,6,7,8 3:4
 3:11,13 4:10 12:7 16:23,23 33:3
 33:24 34:7 66:12 72:3 73:10
 86:17,17 89:4,15,18 94:13
Bobby (1) 88:18
bodies (5) 72:12,13 74:15 77:16
 78:16
body (17) 19:8 39:11,18 74:2 76:10
 76:15,24 77:17 92:4,8,16,19,20
 92:23,23,24 122:18
body-worn (4) 13:13 53:11 104:18
 128:18
bogged (1) 99:3
Bond (8) 2:6 3:2,6,20,20 4:3 11:18
 66:24
book (1) 80:5
bookbag (1) 103:7
books (1) 81:7
born (1) 105:6
borough (10) 3:25 4:7,19 12:3
 64:14 66:13 81:25 98:11,15
 129:7
boroughs (1) 30:3
bottom (1) 15:14
Boulevard (3) 1:6 102:13 118:7
boundaries (1) 70:4
brain (1) 110:11
Brazil (1) 4:9
break (3) 31:12 45:15 129:14
breakdown (2) 26:13 43:18
breakfast (1) 118:15
bridge (1) 82:3
bridges (2) 129:10 130:5
brief (1) 87:4

briefly (1) 6:11
bring (8) 31:15 40:9 75:18 87:6
 100:21 130:16,16,19
bringing (3) 54:17 86:25 87:18
broader (2) 41:12 57:19
Bronx (4) 3:19 59:15,18 60:3
Brooklyn (2) 11:12 83:2
Brookville (1) 1:6
brother (1) 82:24
brothers (2) 79:15 89:8
brought (4) 62:13 79:15 115:2,24
brown (8) 40:22 72:12 74:15 77:16
 78:16 80:10,13,16
Brownsville (1) 83:2
brutality (1) 73:20
bucket (1) 17:20
budget (4) 37:19,23 58:10 132:19
build (10) 6:19 36:10 37:9 41:8
 42:2 85:23 94:6,7 95:8,15
building (9) 10:25 39:2 75:11
 96:12,14 98:4 114:13 129:9
 130:5
bureaucracy (1) 99:4
burnout (1) 124:22
burns (1) 124:16
business (9) 1:23,24 13:9,11 19:4
 19:5 21:8 133:4,8
busy (2) 119:10 120:20
Butts (1) 89:12

C

C (2) 134:1,1
call (11) 1:15 7:19,22 13:16 15:9
 17:22 19:7 27:4 34:13 91:11
 123:22
called (9) 24:6 71:10 73:16 88:12
 118:3 122:6,11 123:16,17
calls (1) 13:17
Cam (1) 88:19
Cambria (1) 89:3
camera (7) 13:13 19:8 39:16 53:11
 76:15 104:18 128:19
cameras (5) 39:11,19 76:10,24
 77:17
Camp (2) 7:19,22
campus (1) 71:13
campuses (1) 84:9
candidates (1) 100:19
capitalism (2) 74:10,13
captain (15) 8:10 21:11 23:21,22
 24:10,11,16,17 95:18 98:8,20,24
 123:11,11 124:23
captains (5) 50:6 51:18,21 62:18
 124:24
car (11) 14:17 40:20 61:5,23 62:4
 101:23 102:10,10 109:4 127:9
 128:4

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

card (9) 13:22,25 14:3 19:4,5
21:15 40:13 46:14,19
cards (7) 13:10,11,16 18:24 21:8,9
40:10
care (2) 118:3 120:4
Caribbean (1) 68:6
carry (1) 13:9
carrying (1) 127:19
cars (1) 103:5
Carter (6) 59:6,7 63:24 65:10,15
126:23
case (7) 13:18 33:23 34:18 46:23
52:20 72:9 82:14
cases (9) 47:13 51:17 52:16 61:13
61:13 91:11,13,14 128:3
Cashawn (1) 88:18
categories (1) 32:15
category (4) 17:19 18:6,13 26:17
catholic (3) 1:5 4:10 80:7
cause (16) 10:4 43:23 46:6 57:9
58:5 81:17 89:19 102:4 104:9
107:17 108:9,20 109:21 110:10
112:22 120:21
causes (2) 47:16 122:14
CBO (2) 59:23 60:9
CCRB (54) 1:19 4:25 5:12 6:16
11:7 14:6 15:7 16:15 25:10,15,23
26:20 27:4 29:13 30:4,6 36:6
37:16,22 38:9,18 41:3 42:3 43:10
46:21 52:15 55:19 56:24 63:13
71:23 72:6 81:20 86:6 87:5,7
89:16,23 90:5,12,22 91:8 92:4
93:10 97:22 98:2 107:10 111:23
112:15 121:14 129:13 130:15
131:5 132:14,23
CCRB's (1) 99:10
ccrb.nyc.gov (1) 20:19
cell (2) 100:10 128:21
center (5) 23:12 31:4,5 120:7
129:22
centers (2) 31:4 118:3
certain (8) 13:4,22 14:8,21 19:2,13
40:15 130:17
certainly (9) 38:5,9,25 39:9 40:12
43:16 55:21 57:11,13
certify (2) 134:7,11
cetera (3) 17:14 18:5 23:19
chair (107) 1:11,17 2:2 3:5 11:5,7
11:13,16,20 15:22 16:4 18:20
21:2,17 22:5,7,11 23:7,13,17
24:9,23 25:4 32:6,8 34:10,21,25
35:17,19 42:25 44:10,15,24 46:9
47:4 49:17 50:4 52:3,12 55:13
59:3 63:11 64:11 65:13,16,19,25
66:6,14,23,25 67:4,12,19,21 68:9
70:9,22 78:17,24 79:8 81:11
83:10,15 86:14,16 87:24 88:3,6

88:21 90:8 93:5 95:16 100:5,25
103:14 104:24 106:13 108:13
109:8 110:14 111:15 115:5
117:11,14,19 121:2,25 122:3
123:4 124:9 125:15 126:11,18
127:3,21 128:9,12,23 132:10,12
133:7,10,15,18,20
chairing (1) 36:4
challenged (1) 90:19
challenges (1) 95:5
challenging (2) 95:7 117:24
Chan (3) 24:10,11 98:8
chance (1) 68:24
change (6) 12:11 53:12 56:15
58:19 65:5 76:20
changed (2) 67:10 72:5
changing (1) 77:7
charges (1) 90:3
chart (2) 28:12 52:22
charter (2) 38:12,16
checkpoints (1) 13:24
chi (1) 119:7
chief (2) 98:11,11
child (1) 61:7
children (1) 129:19
chilly (1) 11:23
Chorus (2) 67:18 133:17
chosen (1) 30:2
church (11) 15:10 19:19 28:3
79:14,16 89:8,9 100:13 105:6,9
130:17
circumstances (3) 17:17 33:21
69:7
cities (1) 50:23
citizens (3) 55:5 73:3,5
city (36) 3:15,24 4:19,21 11:14
12:11 16:17,24 21:8,20 27:20
28:15 31:19 36:2 37:7,24 38:14
38:16 41:21 55:17 56:22 58:8
62:24 66:2,12 87:3 92:7 93:4
99:4 109:22 111:21 112:14,14,24
130:23 132:6
City's (1) 29:7
civic (4) 71:21 79:23 81:3,4
Civil (1) 47:9
civilian (9) 1:1 3:3 53:24 54:14,16
54:17 94:13 95:10 126:10
civilians (4) 12:14,22 13:7 14:12
claim (1) 92:21
Claire (1) 71:8
Clare (2) 1:5 4:10
clarification (1) 91:22
classes (1) 116:14
Clayton (1) 109:24
clear (2) 27:10 37:2
clearly (2) 75:12 113:3
clients (5) 87:7,10,12,21 121:22

close (1) 99:25
closely (1) 26:7
clubs (1) 81:3
codify (1) 38:10
cold (1) 30:25
collaring (1) 61:12
collars (1) 60:18
colleague (3) 11:17 72:8 90:17
colleagues (1) 11:8
collect (1) 26:23
collective (2) 71:10 80:15
college (2) 82:13 83:22
Colon (3) 83:16,18,19
color (6) 84:2 85:14 86:11 101:12
109:17,18
come (55) 5:25 6:21 12:4 15:9
20:12,22 22:12 23:3 26:20 27:17
27:18 28:5,6 29:13 30:13,15 31:2
31:17 32:2 34:17,19 38:13 41:20
44:11,12 45:8 50:4 56:6,15 59:20
60:11,20 62:9,21 65:8 66:7 88:24
91:7,23 97:24 98:3,4 115:15
116:13 118:15 125:19 126:2
129:18 130:12,15,18 131:22,24
133:4,8
comes (12) 12:8 37:3 49:3 50:12
60:3 61:22 89:25 98:21 112:19
113:7 119:2,3
comfort (1) 70:5
comfortable (5) 26:12 29:18 68:22
68:25 69:17
coming (20) 11:22 16:8 18:19
22:10 26:5,12 29:6 59:11,16,21
60:16 61:11 63:21,25 64:15
65:21 70:20 106:6 117:4 133:23
command (4) 13:6 63:15 97:25
115:7
commander (1) 98:15
commanding (9) 65:3 94:5,17
95:11 97:3 98:5 99:16 100:8
126:17
commands (1) 21:16
commend (3) 38:24 79:4 103:24
comment (10) 1:21,22 13:14 19:9
63:12 88:7 90:18 91:5 95:17
123:4
comments (7) 55:25 67:14 78:25
86:17 87:25 91:20 93:7
commission (1) 38:17
commissioned (1) 41:15
commissioner (12) 16:25 38:25
41:14 42:20 64:25 65:12 90:14
90:24 91:9,11,17 126:14
commit (1) 54:7
committed (1) 90:4
Committee (3) 36:5 43:17 57:20
common (1) 40:20

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

Commonly (1) 104:13
communication (5) 9:24 129:10
 129:14 131:3 132:4
communications (2) 130:6,22
communities (19) 5:10 30:10
 36:11 37:14 39:4,10 41:7,9,25
 42:9 48:25 49:7 58:18 85:14
 86:11 113:16 119:22 129:16
 130:13
community (93) 1:21 6:19 7:3,13
 7:17,25 8:2,8 9:12 10:25 17:5
 28:4 31:18 36:15 39:6,7 40:22,23
 48:20 49:9 56:11,14,20 57:8
 59:25 62:11 63:2 64:13 70:18
 71:22 72:2,4 73:9,12,16,18,22
 74:18,25 75:6 77:14,14,15 78:5
 79:14,25 80:25 81:2 82:4,16,22
 83:19 84:8,18 85:3,4,7,21,22
 86:4,21,24 87:13 89:10,24 92:13
 93:11 94:7,8,21 95:7 96:4 97:7,8
 97:11,12 98:12 100:15 116:6,14
 116:16 117:6 119:16,17,18,24
 120:18 121:9 129:11,22 130:8,10
 132:17
community's (1) 78:6
community-based (2) 83:24 118:2
company (1) 118:2
compared (2) 25:16 68:18
complain (4) 13:15 29:13 97:15
 126:3
complainant (2) 32:21 56:25
complained (1) 54:2
complaining (1) 97:12
complaint (35) 1:1 3:4 5:23,24
 9:15 14:5 15:6 19:10 20:5,14,16
 25:16 26:9,21,21 27:3 29:15,22
 32:14,16,18 44:17 45:8,10,11,17
 52:10 53:24 54:23 72:2 93:14,14
 98:21 104:15,24
complaints (17) 6:3 13:19,20
 25:21,23 26:6 28:13 29:6,22
 32:11 34:4 48:17 92:16 94:20,25
 95:14 131:13
complete (1) 37:9
completely (3) 72:18,24 119:14
complex (1) 14:21
compliant (1) 118:22
complicated (2) 9:18 121:14
components (1) 13:2
comport (1) 108:15
Comptroller's (1) 66:3
comrade (1) 72:8
comrades (1) 75:17
concerned (1) 84:10
concerns (1) 23:3
conclude (1) 75:14
conclusions (1) 34:13

condition (1) 118:9
conditions (1) 113:17
conduct (10) 53:22,25 54:4,17,19
 54:20,21,24 99:9,21
confident (1) 39:16
confronting (1) 47:8
congestion (1) 22:17
conjunction (3) 31:3 40:25 41:2
connect (5) 19:10 63:19 64:8
 122:18 125:22
connected (2) 71:21 82:16
connections (1) 84:16
Consciousness (5) 70:24 71:11
 73:24 75:17 78:22
consent (2) 14:10 19:15
consequences (1) 112:18
consider (2) 75:19 97:5
consistently (1) 59:11
constant (1) 99:24
contact (7) 20:18 32:2 35:12 36:20
 36:22 59:21 107:9
contacting (1) 30:19
contents (1) 107:22
continue (6) 11:25 42:2 107:5
 112:12,21 121:5
continued (1) 87:19
control (3) 75:11 92:5,13
convenient (1) 27:14
conversation (13) 5:11 7:25 8:25
 30:18 37:4,15 49:2,15,18 57:17
 63:5 76:10 117:3
conversations (9) 7:3,5 37:21
 43:22 49:13 51:19 111:17 121:12
 132:15
cool (1) 109:4
coordinating (1) 39:5
cop (3) 58:16 115:11 128:3
coping (1) 125:5
core (3) 15:19 86:22 87:2
corner (1) 118:7
cornerstone (2) 98:13,14
corps (1) 105:11
correctly (1) 117:23
correlate (1) 64:8
corrupted (1) 111:6
cost (1) 58:9
council (58) 3:15,19,25 4:24 5:4,7
 11:14 16:24 20:7 29:25 31:22
 35:4,11,20,24 36:3,21 38:14,16
 43:3,10,13,25 46:10,12 47:10
 48:3 50:8,13 52:3,9,13 55:24
 56:2,10,22 57:6,14,23,25 58:13
 58:21 59:2 61:17 65:17,22 66:12
 81:17 83:14 84:21 85:2 93:2
 94:22 100:18 109:20 112:14
 130:4 132:13
councils (1) 121:13

counsel (2) 25:9 57:12
counsels (1) 58:8
counterparts (1) 24:4
country (3) 94:14 113:23 120:22
COUNTY (1) 134:4
couple (3) 13:11 44:21 100:13
course (5) 28:9 29:14 59:10 98:22
 120:21
cousin (2) 109:3,5
cover (2) 24:18 129:6
covered (1) 119:14
CPR (1) 48:20
crawls (1) 105:7
create (3) 6:24 7:24 8:20
created (1) 18:25
creating (1) 9:13
Creation (1) 75:7
credence (1) 95:3
crime (8) 25:17,20,24 26:8 74:21
 75:2,8,10
crimes (1) 116:4
criminal (2) 84:4 113:25
criminalization (1) 84:12
critical (1) 49:20
crucial (1) 109:21
crush (1) 74:2
cultural (1) 65:5
cure (3) 81:24 82:2,5
current (1) 123:18
currently (2) 83:21 121:22
cut (2) 117:2 122:12

D

D.C (1) 76:23
dad (1) 115:10
Daily (1) 48:10
Darce (25) 1:12 2:10 3:22,23 4:4
 4:5 10:8 16:3 30:11 47:5,7 52:25
 55:11 63:13 64:3 70:10 81:13
 83:12 98:19 104:11 106:5,16
 107:2 108:2 128:13
data (5) 1:20 25:6,11 31:20 63:14
date (1) 63:7
daughter (2) 77:23 127:8
David (1) 98:11
Davie (4) 1:11 2:2 3:5 11:7
Davis (7) 56:8,9 57:24 115:17,17
 129:4,5
day (13) 4:17 8:9 30:25 68:19
 69:21 92:5 95:8 97:16 113:5
 118:3,4 120:21 134:16
days (3) 50:18 119:11,12
dead (2) 122:13,18
deal (10) 43:8 45:18 46:5 60:6,22
 60:24 99:6 104:4 122:6 130:4
dealing (5) 22:18 56:20 61:6
 103:22 122:24

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

dealings (1) 41:19
deals (1) 5:2
dealt (1) 61:16
Deanna (1) 4:9
decide (1) 34:20
decides (1) 33:24
decolonialization (1) 71:18
decrease (1) 75:9
dedicate (1) 80:25
dedicated (1) 30:25
dedication (1) 16:11
deeper (1) 53:3
deeply (2) 114:2,2
defined (1) 106:2
definitely (15) 10:15 26:9 27:25
28:7 29:9 38:20 49:3,16,17,22
50:14 61:22 62:7 63:6 104:9
DeLeo (5) 24:16,17 123:11,12
124:23
delineate (1) 75:12
democrats (1) 48:8
denied (1) 93:24
Denton (2) 101:5,14
deny (1) 106:24
department (31) 32:25 37:2,8,10
37:12 39:3,22 41:2,20,23 42:18
48:22 54:21 58:19 65:6 72:10
90:13 91:17 92:10 110:4 111:17
115:20,25 116:12 118:18 123:6
123:16,21 124:4 125:8 131:19
department's (1) 37:23
departments (1) 132:5
depend (1) 108:3
depending (2) 50:18 119:12
depends (2) 61:18 107:3
deputy (1) 62:19
descriptive (1) 116:24
design (1) 75:6
designee (4) 3:19,21,25 66:12
desire (1) 123:4
destination (1) 102:9
destruction (1) 77:10
detail (1) 14:25
detailed (1) 72:15
details (1) 41:17
Detective (1) 97:10
determination (3) 53:10,16,18
determine (9) 17:16 26:25 28:18
28:24 32:13 33:19 53:6 107:10
128:20
determined (1) 58:10
determining (1) 28:22
developments (2) 24:19 129:6
dictate (1) 92:11
difference (1) 5:10
different (25) 7:18 22:24,25 30:3
37:24 53:3 55:16 59:15,16 60:12

60:15 61:12,20 62:10 64:14
81:20 84:3 96:2 101:8,11 108:10
119:18 123:13 124:3 131:3
differently (1) 72:13
difficult (1) 113:12
digital (4) 128:16,17 130:9,14
diligent (2) 47:11 79:21
diligently (1) 15:13
DIR (19) 3:22 4:5 10:8 16:3 47:7
52:25 55:11 63:13 64:3 70:10
81:13 83:12 98:19 104:11 106:5
106:16 107:2 108:2 128:13
directly (1) 78:3
director (10) 1:12,18 2:10 3:23 4:4
5:16 16:12 29:3 47:5 100:15
directorship (1) 57:5
disability (1) 18:17
disagree (4) 34:3 91:19 97:10
115:8
disagrees (1) 92:10
disciplinary (2) 90:3 99:13
discipline (13) 41:13 50:16,21,23
50:25 51:3 90:14,23 91:2,9,16
92:6,12
disciplines (1) 92:19
disclaimer (1) 105:5
discourteous (1) 18:8
discourtesy (1) 18:7
discretionary (1) 57:4
discrimination (1) 82:8
discuss (2) 6:4,6
discussed (1) 118:11
discussing (1) 31:10
discussion (1) 133:3
disgusting (1) 108:24
dishonor (2) 38:6 42:17
dismantle (2) 71:12 114:15
dismantled (2) 74:3 80:20
disorderly (2) 60:6,7
display (1) 130:14
displayed (2) 130:11 131:8
displays (1) 130:9
disposition (5) 33:3 34:6,9 47:15
47:17
dispositions (4) 28:13 53:3,21
116:6
disseminate (1) 47:22
distinction (2) 85:6 92:22
distributed (1) 129:15
district (2) 60:5,20
disturbed (2) 122:7,9
docked (1) 50:18
doctor's (1) 118:24
doctors (1) 124:13
doing (24) 10:15 30:19 31:3 36:9
36:10 38:6 39:7 51:14 55:9 58:13
59:2 65:23 70:13,16 79:17 81:6

89:13 97:7 103:25 104:20 105:23
111:7 119:16 132:24
dolls (1) 108:23
domestic (1) 130:18
Donovan (2) 20:8 36:3
door (1) 97:21
doors (1) 100:3
double (1) 132:22
doubt (1) 15:4
downtown (3) 44:23 45:9,9
Dr (2) 76:2 80:18
drill (1) 105:11
driveway (1) 52:6
driving (2) 73:12,13
dropped (1) 70:11
dropping (2) 44:5 45:24
drugs (1) 45:20
due (8) 5:4 30:12 69:7,8,8 91:7
96:22 107:18
duffel (1) 107:16
Duhaney (3) 97:10,13 120:17
dumb (1) 73:17
duty (1) 23:24

E

E (4) 1:10,10 134:1,1
e-mail (5) 20:18 28:9,10 31:24 98:7
eager (1) 81:17
Earl (2) 32:10 117:12
earlier (1) 127:8
ears (1) 57:9
Eason (1) 67:7
eating (1) 119:4
echo (1) 28:2
echoing (1) 29:2
educate (3) 87:7,9,10
educated (1) 47:2
educating (2) 87:20,21
education (1) 46:24
effect (1) 12:14
effort (1) 85:23
efforts (3) 80:14,14,16
egregious (1) 50:19
eight (1) 119:11
either (5) 9:25 48:10 49:21 60:17
91:18
elected (7) 21:22,24,25 23:8,15
111:18 131:21
electeds (1) 56:13
elevate (1) 92:17
Ella (1) 80:19
Ellis (3) 2:14 134:6,22
emotionally (2) 122:7,9
emotions (1) 124:17
emphasize (1) 18:22
employed (1) 123:8
empowered (1) 20:2

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

empowering (1) 14:11
empowerment (1) 129:23
empty (1) 103:8
emulate (1) 79:16
encounter (6) 12:23,25 13:15
 14:13 15:5 127:11
encourage (5) 30:22 79:18 81:4
 97:22 99:25
encouraged (1) 75:3
ends (1) 32:14
enforced (1) 78:9
enforcement (4) 18:19 38:8 84:7
 85:14
enforcer (3) 38:8 78:8,13
enforcing (4) 78:8,12,13 90:2
engage (4) 6:18 7:5 30:8 129:22
engaged (4) 48:16,20 59:8 119:6
engagement (9) 8:2 55:14 79:23
 81:5 83:20 109:12 121:6 130:10
 132:18
English (1) 128:5
enhance (1) 15:18
enhanced (2) 132:17,18
ensure (8) 38:7 41:4,7 42:16,20
 51:14 92:25 122:23
ensuring (1) 12:22
entails (2) 40:19 57:20
entered (1) 18:24
entering (1) 17:22
entire (3) 27:3 73:19 75:20
entity (1) 17:2
environment (1) 86:13
Equality (2) 31:5 68:6
equals (1) 37:13
equation (1) 7:24
equipped (1) 121:15
ER (1) 124:13
Eric (2) 23:22 95:19
eric.robinson@nypd.org (1) 98:7
Erica (6) 2:6 3:5,20 6:10 10:12
 11:18
escalate (2) 7:22 73:15
escalated (1) 108:20
especially (7) 18:19 19:23 27:20
 30:24 40:21 56:17 101:12
ESQ (4) 1:12 2:3,7,10
essentially (1) 74:20
et (3) 17:14 18:4 23:19
ethnicity (1) 18:16
evening (18) 3:2,14,17 4:5,11 6:15
 11:5 22:13 23:21 24:10,16 25:7
 66:10 83:18 86:23 89:3 106:20
 117:21
evenings (1) 20:23
event (2) 4:25 22:10
events (2) 119:21 120:18
eventually (1) 124:16

everybody (7) 10:15 22:14 25:8
 56:6 60:24 70:7 97:23
everyday (1) 115:22
evidence (6) 32:24 33:8,12,14 53:7
 53:14
exact (1) 68:18
exactly (5) 12:17,18,19 17:6 115:6
example (5) 8:4 14:16 17:12 76:23
 82:23
excellent (2) 112:2 116:21
exceptions (1) 14:22
excessive (1) 17:18
excited (3) 30:15 31:7 32:5
Excuse (1) 44:10
EXEC (19) 3:22 4:5 10:8 16:3 47:7
 52:25 55:11 63:13 64:3 70:10
 81:13 83:12 98:19 104:11 106:5
 106:16 107:2 108:2 128:13
executive (15) 1:12,18,25 2:10
 3:23 4:4 23:22 24:12,18 29:3
 47:4 94:5 95:20 133:11,16
exist (1) 131:17
existed (1) 39:8
exists (2) 85:10 114:16
exonerated (6) 32:12 33:13 53:21
 53:22 54:20 86:9
expect (1) 25:20
expected (1) 14:13
experience (1) 113:16
experiences (3) 86:5,10 114:4
expertise (1) 121:3
explain (2) 14:9 32:13
explained (1) 34:14
explaining (1) 33:22
explanation (1) 45:21
exploded (1) 39:16
exploit (1) 114:7
explore (1) 57:11
exploring (2) 57:22 58:23
extended (1) 106:9
external (1) 117:9
extremely (1) 129:17
eye (3) 99:25 125:11,11

F

f (4) 1:10 17:10 108:24 134:1
F-A-D-O (1) 17:9
F.A.I.T.H (1) 59:7
face (1) 95:6
Facebook (1) 7:4
fact (11) 14:19 76:11,13 93:15,23
 94:2,8,10,23 95:9,13
factor (1) 113:22
factors (2) 64:9 107:4
FADO (1) 17:9
fair (2) 51:4 95:2
fairly (1) 52:5

falls (1) 17:14
familiar (2) 59:20 64:16
families (2) 129:16,17
family (3) 8:11 69:24 130:16
Fannie (1) 80:19
far (8) 59:12 60:4 72:24 73:6 91:6
 91:10 96:12 102:14
fashion (2) 39:24 60:7
fast (1) 76:5
faster (2) 102:7,25
Fathers (1) 59:8
favor (2) 67:16 133:15
February (6) 4:14,16 17:24 30:5,22
 31:2
feedback (1) 96:18
feel (25) 8:25 12:24 14:12 26:11
 29:18 36:18 54:10 68:21,25
 69:16,17 70:4,6,13,19 81:5 82:17
 104:9,13 107:8 110:9 115:3,3
 124:18 132:8
feeling (2) 84:11 123:23
feels (1) 103:16
feet (1) 61:3
felony (3) 25:16,19,24
felt (1) 84:14
fences (1) 75:11
field (2) 27:16 44:22
fight (2) 77:10 92:25
figure (1) 110:9
figures (1) 51:14
figuring (1) 27:7
file (6) 5:23 14:5 15:6 20:5,14
 29:14
filed (4) 44:18 45:10 93:14 109:5
filing (2) 5:23 9:14
final (1) 34:8
finally (2) 29:2 30:21
find (11) 8:16 9:24 10:22 78:14
 81:2,3 102:3 108:11 110:17
 111:11 131:7
finding (2) 52:23 79:24
fine (1) 131:2
first (12) 13:3 79:4 80:4 81:2 85:10
 88:16 89:11 91:25 93:18 95:21
 96:6 100:6
five (5) 50:18 79:15 97:14 98:15
 102:23
five-nine (1) 61:3
fix (1) 132:3
fixed (1) 131:15
flag (1) 48:13
flashy (2) 49:10,11
flight (1) 77:10
flock (1) 62:20
floor (3) 66:20 103:9 108:22
focus (2) 29:4 112:2
focusing (3) 27:25 29:9 47:11

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

folks (5) 35:15 40:22 79:19 111:23 120:22
follow (10) 27:3 42:5,5,12 77:9,9 97:23 104:4 115:7 126:19
followed (2) 26:17 44:8
following (2) 89:12,13
follows (1) 77:8
food (1) 118:20
footage (7) 13:13 19:8 40:5 53:11 104:18 128:19,21
force (9) 17:3,10,11,18 26:18 81:9 83:17,21 110:17
Ford (6) 6:11,13,14 10:9,11,12
foremost (1) 91:25
forged (1) 60:9
forgiveness (1) 88:15
form (3) 7:15 55:4,10
forming (1) 55:3
forms (2) 22:25 71:12
formulated (1) 72:3
forth (1) 8:18
fortunate (1) 87:6
forum (2) 22:17,24
forums (1) 47:2
forward (3) 49:19 87:19 117:4
found (2) 100:16,17
four (5) 45:13 61:4 79:15 102:8 128:4
Fred (4) 3:5,6 11:7 36:8
FREDERICK (2) 1:11 2:2
free (1) 80:23
freshmans (1) 69:15
friend's (1) 101:20
friends (4) 29:16 84:22 114:22 122:15
frisk (1) 13:23
frisked (1) 46:23
front (1) 122:17
fruition (1) 75:18
frustrated (1) 127:9
frustrating (1) 54:10
full (2) 4:17 6:25
fully (4) 26:13 28:14 34:4 55:19
functions (2) 28:4 74:23
fund (1) 56:23
funding (6) 56:21 57:4,10,13 58:14 132:15
further (7) 43:18 77:13,19 78:6,15 82:16 134:11
further (1) 77:21
future (4) 70:15 77:4 82:7 117:4

G

game (1) 99:18
gap (1) 82:3
gaps (1) 82:9
Gardens (1) 68:20

Garth (2) 117:15,17
gender (2) 18:16 82:11
general (1) 109:12
generally (3) 27:22 44:16 65:8
generic (4) 43:7 45:15 46:5 47:16
gentleman (6) 10:18 100:7,9,11 123:25 128:7
gentlemen (3) 10:21,22 128:4
geographic (1) 63:23
gesture (1) 18:9
getting (9) 6:20 16:9 36:19 86:2 104:19 109:2 119:23 120:3,4
Girenelli (1) 117:15
girls (1) 101:15
give (18) 18:10 19:4 25:11,12 28:10 35:21 41:5 45:21 47:15,16 77:3 105:4 107:4 108:8 115:12 120:14 126:13 131:20
given (7) 15:23 21:14 35:6 40:13 57:13 71:25 108:17
gives (3) 95:3,4 115:6
giving (2) 61:12 130:17
glad (1) 4:12
GMU-3130 (1) 52:8
go (36) 7:23 8:24 9:19 15:10,24 16:15 26:22 27:10 44:23 45:9 55:8 56:2 62:5 68:3 69:13 80:8 81:6 88:8 104:7 107:24 109:10 109:25 110:21,25 111:23 115:14 119:9 122:11,21 123:20,21 124:15 129:11,20,21 131:14
goal (1) 98:13
God (1) 120:11
goes (3) 19:2 67:9 96:13
going (65) 3:7 4:22 6:5,10,10 7:4 9:2,12 10:14 14:24 15:21 22:17 24:2 29:25 30:22 31:8 35:5 36:24 38:4,13,17,20,23 39:23 40:4 41:13 44:15,25 48:25 49:14 58:4 58:9 62:16 65:19 66:8 68:3 70:14 71:6 76:4,7,18 77:18,18 78:13 82:5 88:14,16 89:7 90:9 93:8 99:14 101:19 109:6 110:8,17 112:13,21 115:20 116:11,13 117:14 118:23 119:20 132:6 133:3
good (36) 3:2,14,17 4:5,6 6:14,14 10:4 11:5 12:7 22:13 23:21 24:3 24:10,16 25:7 51:6,16 54:3,22 57:7 64:18 66:10 69:5 70:25 71:7 83:18 86:23 89:2 104:10,16 105:25 106:20 116:20 117:21 132:21
Gordon (1) 86:20
governed (1) 16:22
government (2) 22:25 29:18
grab (1) 24:7

graduate (3) 69:2,9,12
graduated (1) 84:13
grandmothers (2) 44:5 45:24
gray (1) 101:10
great (9) 19:22 22:7 30:16,19 32:4 35:25 39:22 56:12 116:10
greater (1) 131:2
greatest (1) 97:8
greatly (1) 89:23
grew (1) 105:6
ground (6) 18:11 102:12,15,20,21 102:22
group (5) 5:8 83:25 86:22 87:2 111:25
groups (3) 1:21 55:17,17
grown (1) 105:8
guess (6) 48:5 51:9 61:18 62:5 89:6 110:12
guide (4) 28:21 33:15 54:6 71:19
guidelines (1) 33:5
guiding (1) 81:9
guns (1) 102:11
gunshots (1) 102:3
guy (1) 61:2
guys (14) 8:24 22:21 23:5 25:11,12 28:10 30:13 32:3 61:4 81:14 95:6 103:2 106:18 110:5

H

H-T-A-R-E-K-E-G-N (1) 31:25
hair (1) 101:11
Hamer (1) 80:19
hand (7) 9:21 36:5,5 56:3,4 59:5 134:15
handed (2) 21:13 51:3
handle (1) 118:5
handled (2) 50:22 54:25
handwriting (1) 88:17
happen (14) 25:25 36:16 42:7 46:7 53:20 58:4 76:14,18 77:4,6,8 101:6 106:3 113:15
happened (15) 15:12 27:2 33:14 33:23 44:20 69:16 73:13 76:17 77:2 93:16 103:15 106:4,21 127:14 128:20
happening (8) 7:10,13 53:15 76:13 82:21 83:7,8 110:7
happens (6) 23:25 28:19 42:10 60:2 62:8 104:8
happy (5) 20:22 24:14,15 28:6 101:2
harassment (5) 17:25 18:2,3 73:11 73:22
hard (2) 27:7 82:12
harmed (1) 115:15
harmful (2) 73:25 77:2
Harold (1) 5:20

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

Harya (6) 25:6,8 31:23 32:6,9 34:22
he'll (1) 3:8
headache (1) 22:22
health (2) 122:5 125:23
healthcare (1) 124:11
healthy (4) 87:8,11,16,22
hear (19) 9:8 18:18 25:5 28:20 32:16 54:11 55:22 58:22 67:24 81:17,22 85:5 101:2 103:5 106:17,19 131:9,13 132:21
heard (5) 62:22 65:2 102:2 131:15 132:13
hearing (3) 6:20 133:7,10
hearings (1) 40:6
heart (1) 92:13
heated (1) 109:2
Heights (1) 89:3
heinous (2) 73:8,19
held (1) 48:22
Hello (3) 16:7 68:13 89:2
help (11) 4:24 30:4,7 35:10 56:15 56:24 72:6 109:20 117:15 121:8 123:20
helped (1) 68:16
helpful (2) 121:9,19
helpful, but (1) 76:25
helping (1) 49:18
hereunto (1) 134:15
Herman (1) 5:20
hey (3) 94:10 95:12 120:2
Hi (1) 68:13
high (8) 22:19,20 27:24 84:9,14 101:19 110:2 124:21
higher (6) 25:19,19,23 26:8 29:7 52:18
highest (1) 26:17
Hispanics (1) 72:23
histories (1) 99:22
history (7) 71:16 80:4,9,9 81:7,7,8
hit (1) 127:13
hold (4) 39:25 40:6 51:15 62:17
holding (2) 6:15 42:21
holds (1) 37:12
holiday (2) 24:14,15
Hollis (2) 71:22 73:9
home (7) 4:6 8:17 52:6 107:14 115:15 118:13 122:11
homeless (2) 87:3,15
honest (4) 63:16 69:10 95:25 98:25
honestly (1) 116:22
honesty (1) 57:18
honor (2) 36:4 92:15
honored (1) 71:23
Hood (1) 59:8
hop (1) 61:5

hope (8) 4:14 10:6 23:4 41:20 58:24 104:8 109:10,19
hopeful (2) 53:11,13
Horizon (1) 125:21
horrible (2) 125:8 130:23
hospital (1) 124:19
hospitals (2) 124:12,19
host (1) 87:2
hosting (1) 4:11
hours (1) 8:7
house (3) 17:23 101:20 117:17
housekeeping (1) 66:16
houses (3) 8:4,5 102:8
housing (3) 24:20 118:19 129:6
htarekegn@ccrb (1) 31:25
Huguette (2) 117:19,24
human (6) 9:11 73:21 74:2 77:11 77:12 96:7
humanly (1) 99:12
hurry (1) 24:2
Hyndman (1) 22:6
Hyndman's (2) 22:4,15
hypotheses (1) 26:2

I

ICE (1) 17:22
ICUs (1) 124:14
ID (2) 18:10 21:8
idea (4) 60:21 74:20 76:10 78:8
ideas (1) 11:24
identify (8) 13:5 22:2 45:3 61:10 70:18 78:17 79:8 103:21
identifying (2) 51:22 104:17
idle (2) 120:2,20
illness (3) 110:14,15 120:23
imagine (1) 9:8
immediately (1) 99:6
immoral (1) 73:21
impact (2) 64:21 112:8
impacted (3) 75:2 112:16 113:18
implement (1) 31:16
implicit (6) 111:20,24 113:3,13,19 115:21
important (29) 8:22 19:17 39:2,10 39:20 46:25 48:25 49:9 53:2 58:25 62:5 63:8 85:10 86:3 92:16 92:21,23,24 93:10,17,20 100:16 104:2 105:2 109:14 112:22 113:22 114:8 125:24
importantly (3) 89:7 100:12,20
improper (2) 17:21,21
improve (9) 11:25 41:22 47:21 78:3 81:19 85:16 96:20 109:15 112:23
improvement (1) 15:16
improving (1) 5:12
inappropriate (1) 18:4

inappropriately (1) 18:15
inasmuch (1) 121:8
incentive (1) 35:6
inception (1) 113:24
incident (12) 6:4 33:6 39:15 42:6,8 47:19 50:19 53:15 73:11,14 101:22 128:20
incidents (4) 7:12 62:13,23 64:6
include (5) 13:11 17:21 18:2,7,8
includes (2) 17:24 112:9
including (1) 111:23
increase (1) 37:19
increased (1) 92:18
incumbent (1) 112:13
independent (2) 16:18 53:13
indicating (5) 9:21 56:3,5 102:22 110:5
individual (3) 33:22 60:7 114:21
individually (1) 125:2
individuals (16) 7:21 27:2,13 34:16 42:9 51:22 59:20 61:11 62:17 63:10 72:17 114:19 116:15 123:2 125:19 126:2
industry (1) 38:3
influence (1) 70:17
information (22) 5:16 10:20 13:10 19:2,7,21 20:13,24 26:24 34:2,16 34:17 47:14,22 48:15 52:2 58:24 62:6 63:8 121:21 126:8 131:7
informational (1) 58:15
informative (1) 130:8
informed (1) 55:20
initial (1) 75:22
initiate (1) 20:12
initiating (1) 20:4
initiative (4) 57:19 58:7 115:24 130:18
initiatives (2) 56:23 129:23
innate (1) 78:15
input (2) 4:20 81:19
inroads (1) 96:16
inside (1) 96:7
inspectors (3) 51:21 62:19 63:5
inspire (1) 79:12
inspired (1) 79:21
instances (1) 47:3
Institute (1) 31:6
intend (2) 49:16 50:24
intentional (1) 79:22
inter (1) 7:16
interact (1) 12:13
interacting (2) 95:6 112:19
interaction (1) 13:13
interactions (4) 46:16 62:15 93:22 101:9
interconnect (1) 9:11
interested (5) 43:16 57:22 58:6

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

81:15 134:13
interesting (1) 113:21
intergovernmental (2) 5:17 16:13
internal (1) 117:8
interpretation (1) 88:23
intersectionality (1) 82:10
interview (3) 26:24 32:22 82:7
intimately (1) 41:18
intimidating (1) 29:20
introduce (4) 3:12 23:20 66:9 89:7
introduced (2) 11:8 16:22
invasion (1) 8:17
invested (2) 71:14 128:14
investigate (5) 13:19 17:7,15
 18:12 52:20
investigated (3) 26:14 28:14 34:5
investigating (1) 16:19
investigation (5) 42:13 43:7 45:11
 45:13 110:16
investigations (1) 37:21
investigator (6) 26:23 27:18 33:2
 34:2,3,5
investigators (10) 5:19 6:7 20:10
 27:12,15 32:21 104:23 108:5
 126:6 128:17
invite (1) 84:22
invited (2) 6:9 71:23
involved (5) 10:16 45:14 79:24
 82:24 109:19
irate (1) 52:5
Island (2) 3:16 12:9
issue (11) 45:18 46:7 49:9,10
 64:14 84:4 98:3 99:13,14 110:3
 111:19
issued (2) 21:12,19
issues (17) 9:25 10:5 24:20 31:11
 47:8 49:11 56:16 59:11 76:6 84:3
 92:17 112:12 113:7 121:14
 123:10 130:3,19
item (2) 15:25 132:19
items (3) 13:12 63:19 108:21

J

jacket (1) 10:18
Jackson (2) 86:20,23
Jahi (1) 86:24
jail (1) 115:14
Jamaica (5) 44:6 59:13 71:9 77:15
 118:6
James (1) 66:3
January (2) 39:17 41:16
jeans (1) 102:18
Jerry (1) 100:7
job (8) 30:19 47:25 51:15 78:6 82:2
 82:7 97:6 115:13
jobs (1) 112:9
John (5) 4:4 68:11,14,21 88:25

Johns (5) 70:23 71:9 78:20 93:13
 101:16
Johns' (1) 71:13
Johnson (1) 66:3
join (1) 104:24
joining (1) 3:8
Jon (3) 30:11 47:5 63:12
Jonathan (6) 1:12 2:10 3:22 36:8
 43:21 89:3
Joseph (16) 2:4,5 3:14,15 12:8
 21:5 24:17 66:11 67:3,4,5,11
 123:11 124:10 127:5 133:14
June (2) 72:16 84:14
juniors (1) 69:15
jurisdiction (2) 17:15 98:22
jurisdictions (1) 17:9
justice (8) 31:5 71:15 74:17,19
 76:3 84:4 113:25 117:3
justification (1) 19:14
justified (1) 99:10

K

Karen (4) 56:9 57:15 115:17 129:5
keep (10) 57:8 70:16 99:24 109:11
 114:9 119:6,10 120:19 125:11,11
keeps (2) 63:13 78:13
Kenny (2) 59:6 126:23
Kevin (1) 24:11
key (1) 132:19
Keyshawn (1) 10:19
kick (1) 17:12
kids (4) 44:5 45:24 61:12 127:19
kill (1) 114:8
killed (6) 72:17,19,20,23 73:3,5
killings (2) 72:15 73:20
kind (10) 53:2 60:2 65:5 69:12 70:5
 80:6,23 93:21 122:14 123:19
King (2) 76:2 80:18
knew (1) 9:6
knock (5) 37:19,19,20,20,20
know (130) 7:7 9:4,5,5,7 12:12,20
 12:21,24 14:5,20 15:3 16:8,14,14
 16:17 17:6 18:20,21,24 19:25,25
 20:20,20 21:5,6,6 22:18 25:25
 26:4,11 28:2 29:10,19 30:13 33:8
 34:11 36:16 37:11 38:3,22 39:6
 39:15 40:8,10,11,20 41:10 42:10
 43:21 45:5 46:6,13,17 48:11,18
 49:21 50:11,24 51:2,8,10,12,18
 53:17 54:21 55:5,21 57:12 58:13
 58:15 60:14,18,22,23 61:7,9,15
 61:19 62:19 63:16,18 68:17,23
 69:21 70:8 81:20 85:3,25 86:4
 89:22 90:6 93:17 95:7 97:7 98:20
 99:15 100:23 101:25 103:16,22
 104:9,14,19 110:5 111:2 113:12
 116:8,18 117:23 119:19,20,25

120:2,5,10,11,16 121:23 122:5
 122:14 123:7,10 125:6,9 131:16
 131:18,19 132:2,9
knowing (3) 85:8,9 86:6
knowledge (2) 14:14 77:13
known (1) 85:17
knows (1) 132:23

L

lack (3) 37:6 84:5 85:13
lady (1) 44:21
lag (1) 99:2
laid (1) 102:21
language (3) 18:14,14 131:11
large (1) 17:20
largest (3) 17:2,3 94:13
lastly (2) 100:6 105:3
late (4) 3:6 11:6 81:16 125:10
Laughter (1) 52:11
law (15) 12:13 13:2,3,9 14:7,21
 18:19 31:5 33:5 47:9,10 54:6
 84:6 85:14 91:18
lawfully (1) 107:12
laws (1) 33:16
lay (1) 102:23
lead (1) 122:25
leaders (3) 71:22 119:22 121:4
leadership (7) 56:12,21,23 115:23
 131:6,21 132:5
leads (1) 86:12
learn (4) 14:22 55:7,8 117:2
leave (7) 6:9 10:17 19:9 24:2 47:17
 75:25 96:23
Lebanon (4) 79:13 89:9 100:14
 105:6
led (5) 8:17,18 31:9 48:8 57:14
left (1) 91:4
legal (1) 19:14
legislation (3) 40:18 43:14 46:18
legitimate (1) 9:20
lesser (1) 73:7
lessons (1) 71:16
let's (8) 45:8 59:17 66:20 69:20,24
 88:18 95:16,25
letter (4) 32:17 33:22 45:12 93:15
letters (6) 34:12,14 43:5 46:3
 47:15,17
letting (1) 119:25
level (8) 40:15,17 65:7 84:19 117:8
 117:9 121:6 124:14
liaison (1) 119:17
liberation (1) 71:17
LIC (1) 88:19
license (1) 52:7
life (11) 7:19,22 31:16 70:14 73:19
 80:7 97:20 98:4 109:11,22,22
lifecampinc.com (1) 10:16

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

limitations (1) 104:22
line (4) 20:6 67:5,9,10
links (1) 31:21
list (9) 68:3 88:8 100:24 101:2
 126:22 127:2 128:24 129:2
 132:20
listen (5) 6:24 9:2,6 29:21 101:7
listening (2) 9:7 75:15
little (23) 14:24 16:9 18:21 19:5
 25:13 29:4,7 49:24 50:20 53:2
 58:22 61:5 62:6,14 66:16 79:19
 81:18 102:4,7 103:16 119:19
 121:2,15
live (4) 7:5 21:18 22:11 44:11
lived (1) 73:18
lives (2) 75:3 115:22
living (3) 83:2 97:6 113:17
load (1) 119:9
local (4) 20:15 36:20 62:11 84:19
location (2) 63:7,15
locations (1) 118:5
Logan (10) 88:25 89:2,3 93:8
 100:6 101:4 105:2,19 106:7
 115:9
long (7) 24:5 32:3 68:18 76:3 83:5
 98:13 124:11
look (24) 8:21 14:17 24:3 28:20,23
 38:10,11 40:4 53:2 55:12 56:22
 63:2 80:2 82:20,20 85:15 87:18
 96:19 98:18 99:14 112:20,20
 116:20 117:4
looked (2) 116:3,7
looking (16) 8:12 26:19 38:17,21
 40:16,18 41:15,18 49:22 52:21
 57:18,18 82:19 112:3,3 130:20
looks (5) 19:5 50:16 80:3 92:13
 101:11
lost (2) 11:12 49:13
lot (38) 6:22 7:9 10:5 18:23 20:20
 26:4,4 28:19 36:23 40:2 41:3
 49:13 52:17 56:10,22 58:12 59:9
 69:6 74:16 84:20 89:13 96:18
 101:11 105:16 108:9 113:14
 114:25 117:2 120:21,22 122:10
 125:4,6 128:14 129:6 131:17,24
 132:2
lots (2) 113:16,17
Lou (1) 80:19
love (1) 58:22
low-income (2) 129:16,17
lower (4) 26:8 27:8,19,22
lowest (1) 97:19
lunch (2) 118:15 122:17

M

ma'am (1) 44:10
mad (1) 108:21

mail (1) 20:15
major (1) 23:25
majority (2) 28:16 48:8
making (6) 27:12 85:17,18 86:7,10
 97:16
Malcolm (1) 80:19
man (5) 100:22 106:14 109:9
 118:10 122:19
mandated (1) 111:21
mandatory (1) 126:14
maneuvering (1) 60:19
Manhattan (1) 66:13
manner (2) 60:8,25
map (1) 25:15
maps (1) 26:6
Marbre (4) 2:8 11:12,13 89:12
marriage (1) 134:13
Martin (1) 110:2
Mary (1) 4:8
match (2) 26:7,15
materials (4) 32:23,25 34:8 126:7
matrix (3) 50:22,23,25
matter (6) 34:20 50:12 125:13
 132:9 134:9,14
matters (1) 69:24
Matthew (5) 106:20,21 107:13
 108:19 114:23
Mayer (1) 4:9
mayor (2) 16:24 112:14
mayor's (1) 132:16
mayoral (1) 3:21
McSilver (1) 31:6
meals (1) 118:14
mean (9) 53:23 57:9 61:8 77:17
 89:25 124:2,23 125:9 130:25
meaning (1) 91:14
means (14) 12:17 13:8 24:7 28:17
 33:7,11,13 53:5,8 54:23 71:15
 91:24 92:14 123:22
measures (2) 74:18 75:6
mechanism (1) 46:17
mediating (1) 16:19
mediation (4) 8:7 93:24,24,25
Medicaid (2) 118:19 119:14
medical (2) 118:4,9
meds (1) 118:23
meet (4) 26:22 27:13 96:9 97:19
meeting (16) 1:2,14 3:3,7 5:22
 24:22 28:8 64:12,13 89:15 90:20
 94:22 117:3 119:21 130:15
 133:22
meetings (13) 6:22 7:2 84:21,24
 85:2,20 129:18,20 130:10,12
 131:25 132:3,24
member (55) 2:3,4,5,6,7,8 3:13
 12:7 16:23 20:8 22:3,6,9,13 23:9
 23:11 35:20,24 36:3 43:4,5,10,12

43:13,23,25 44:3 46:10,12 47:10
 48:3 50:2,5,8,10,13 52:3,9,13
 56:2 57:6,25 61:17 65:17,22 66:7
 73:9,11,16,18,23 79:3,10 93:2
 132:13
member's (1) 36:21
members (13) 2:1 3:11 31:10
 74:25 85:3,8 86:4,17,18 87:25
 89:5 90:10 130:16
men (18) 35:4 38:2 40:21 59:9,9
 61:13 100:13 101:12 103:12
 105:5,8,10,25,25 109:18 114:25
 127:7,18
mending (1) 36:25
mental (9) 110:10,13,16 112:3
 116:8 118:11 120:23 122:5
 125:22
mentality (1) 77:11
mention (1) 125:17
mentioned (4) 14:19 19:12 55:2
 93:13
merely (1) 54:5
merits (2) 28:23 53:17
Merrill (1) 118:7
mess (1) 88:16
method (1) 75:7
mic (4) 22:12 44:12 50:4 56:7
Michael (2) 2:7 3:18
mind (6) 58:3 73:25 77:25 89:20
 111:6 114:9
minds (1) 105:22
mine (2) 73:23 122:16
minister (1) 115:10
minutes (14) 1:16 3:6 66:18 67:15
 67:16,22 71:3 88:10 97:14
 101:22 102:6,24 126:19 129:3
misbehaving (1) 95:4
miscommunication (1) 8:14
misconduct (11) 13:18 15:4 16:21
 17:8 28:24 33:9,12 53:8,19 54:8
 126:4
mispronounce (1) 88:13
mission (1) 15:20
mistaken (1) 59:24
mistakes (1) 96:11
mistaught (1) 80:9
misunderstanding (1) 8:14
misunderstood (1) 53:21
mocking (1) 128:6
model (4) 39:6 62:4 84:18 118:4
moderated (1) 31:9
modify (1) 91:19
Mohamed (1) 68:7
mom (1) 115:9
moment (2) 16:15 29:4
Monday (2) 5:4,5
month (2) 12:12 20:11

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

months (3) 39:14 68:18 119:2
moral (1) 76:2
morning (1) 31:9
motion (5) 66:18,19,20,22 133:11
Mott (1) 20:9
move (3) 21:22 49:19 56:7
moved (1) 133:13
movement (2) 71:11,20
movements (1) 92:3
moving (1) 87:12
MS.PROPHETE (1) 121:20
multiple (3) 20:3 93:22 94:2
museums (1) 119:10

N

Naday (1) 78:19
name (29) 3:5,15 11:6 13:6 24:11
 24:17 25:8 31:23 32:10 44:13
 46:20 56:8 59:6 66:11 68:13 71:7
 78:19 83:19 88:14 100:22 104:14
 106:20 109:24 111:4 117:23,24
 127:2 128:24 129:4
Nathan (3) 2:4 3:13,15
nation (2) 109:23 112:25
nation's (1) 17:2
natural (1) 75:10
nature (3) 94:18 95:13 96:22
NCO (1) 64:19
NCOs (5) 39:8 84:24 85:4,18
 121:13
nearby (1) 68:20
necessarily (2) 62:11 82:12
necessary (2) 35:13 71:15
neck (1) 36:2
need (26) 25:2 28:21 29:12 34:2
 36:17,20 37:9 38:5 41:6 42:14,15
 46:3 47:24 48:9 49:7 58:5 79:16
 83:6 85:15 108:3,10,11,12 116:7
 117:14 125:24
needed (1) 68:23
needs (10) 35:9,12,13 56:15 67:10
 72:4,5 78:3 85:12 111:10
negative (3) 7:10 99:22 112:17
neighbor (2) 52:5 115:10
neighborhood (6) 4:19 39:5 64:17
 64:18 102:5 103:4
neighborhoods (2) 61:14 96:3
neighboring (1) 27:23
nervous (1) 70:5
networking (1) 119:21
never (8) 8:24 9:6,8 32:16 37:9
 48:17 104:8 125:6
new (27) 1:7,24 4:21 12:10,13
 15:15 21:7,20 28:15 29:7 30:8
 31:19 34:16,17 36:2 39:17 40:7
 66:2 74:4,4 76:21 87:3 99:5
 109:25 133:8 134:3,7

newest (2) 3:13 12:6
News (1) 48:10
Nicole (3) 2:14 134:6,22
night (2) 11:23 130:15
Nissan (2) 52:7,8
non-APU (2) 91:11,13
nonprofits (1) 57:8
Notary (1) 134:6
note (3) 13:16 114:19 126:18
noted (1) 133:24
November (6) 1:3 3:3 5:5 22:16
 30:12 134:16
nowadays (1) 107:18
nuance (1) 18:23
null (1) 60:10
number (5) 13:7 34:12 67:25
 111:22 123:9
numbers (2) 130:25 131:12
numerous (1) 120:8
nurse (1) 118:22
nursing (1) 124:12
nutritionist (1) 119:3
NYC (2) 125:20,20
nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint (1) 15:11
nyc.gov/ccrbbyouthcouncil (2)
 5:15 83:14
nyc.gov/rтка (1) 14:23
NYPD (13) 15:5 16:18 23:19 36:6
 38:2,24 50:25 77:6,7 78:12
 109:12 112:14 123:9
NYU (4) 4:17 31:3,4 35:8

O

O (1) 1:10
O'Crea (3) 76:4 78:19,20
O'Sullivan (1) 100:7
objects (1) 123:3
observation (1) 126:16
obviously (3) 36:24 121:12 124:23
occur (6) 33:9,12,15 54:19 64:6
 75:10
occurred (8) 15:5,12 28:24 33:20
 53:8,17,19 54:2
occurrence (1) 63:16
October (1) 12:15
Odane (3) 100:22 101:5 114:22
offenders (2) 74:24 75:3
offenses (1) 50:17
offensive (1) 18:14
offer (4) 4:20 13:22 116:14 118:11
offers (1) 123:6
office (14) 15:10 19:11 20:8 22:4
 22:15 23:6 27:17 36:10,21,22
 44:23 66:3 82:6 132:16
officer (44) 13:14,25 14:2,9,14,15
 15:6 17:11 18:9 19:3 21:14 23:23
 24:13,18 33:16 39:18 50:17 54:7

54:11 60:3 73:15 90:4 93:16,18
 93:22,25 94:10,17 95:4,12,20
 96:25 97:3,5,9 98:5 100:8 104:14
 107:5,7,11 120:17 122:9,23
officer's (5) 46:19 63:14 76:20
 94:18 96:23
officers (60) 12:4 13:4,9,21 21:6,7
 21:20 23:18 26:25 32:23 39:5,7
 39:19 45:4,14 48:15 50:7 57:2
 59:14 60:11,15 63:22 64:15,20
 65:4 90:15 92:6,19 94:5,6 97:19
 99:16,22,23 101:24 103:19
 104:17 108:12,15 110:6,18,21,25
 111:7,21 112:10,19 113:6 116:5
 122:10,15,21 123:18 124:6
 125:12,18,25 126:9,15,17
officers' (2) 49:24 99:21
offices (4) 81:25 82:2 125:19 126:3
official (1) 123:21
officials (7) 21:22,24,25 23:8,15
 24:25 111:19
Ofentimes (2) 105:16,21
oh (2) 43:25 83:3
okay (7) 16:4 56:21 68:9 95:4
 100:23 107:20 130:14
old (5) 1:23 101:10,17 103:12
 133:4
older (3) 59:9 79:20 101:10
once (8) 41:4 42:16 51:5 62:15,20
 87:15 100:17 119:2
ones (3) 31:17 40:17 131:14
ongoing (2) 15:16 92:25
online (1) 5:14
open (5) 57:9 88:6 90:10 97:21
 100:4
operating (2) 37:7,8
opinion (3) 49:22 95:22 119:20
opportunities (2) 55:20 96:19
opportunity (2) 4:17 35:22
opposed (3) 67:19 126:16 133:18
oppresses (1) 78:15
oppression (1) 71:12
option (1) 21:10
orange (1) 10:18
order (6) 1:15 6:12 19:25 104:4
 111:9 115:11
organization (3) 38:9 105:12 118:2
organizations (4) 28:4 55:16 68:2
 81:4
organizer (1) 83:20
organizing (1) 91:24
orientation (1) 18:16
outcome (1) 134:14
outreach (15) 1:19 5:17 16:2,5,12
 26:3,10 36:9 79:14 89:10 100:15
 119:16 121:9 123:13 132:17
outset (1) 30:18

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

outside (8) 5:22 61:22,24 62:20
64:21 95:10 121:3,16
outward (1) 113:19
overaggressive (1) 116:5
overall (2) 12:21 86:12
overpolicing (1) 84:11
overpromise (1) 38:19
oversight (3) 17:2 94:13 95:10
overview (1) 25:11

P

p.m (2) 1:4 133:24
page (3) 67:5,9,9
paint (1) 37:25
paired (1) 31:13
panel (3) 31:10 41:13,22
panels (1) 31:8
pants (1) 102:17
paraphrasing (1) 89:17
parent (1) 29:13
parents (3) 69:8 80:15 84:22
part (21) 12:3 13:8 14:7 19:19
27:11 30:17 38:6 42:12 57:23
58:18 62:11 69:10 78:21 85:2
86:2 105:10,11 115:23 116:19
117:5 124:5
participate (1) 4:15
participation (1) 74:24
particular (9) 36:12,22 46:7,8,15
58:14 60:17 61:13 96:25
particularly (4) 11:23 84:8 109:16
109:17
parties (2) 8:6 134:12
partner (1) 131:6
partnered (1) 20:7
partners (1) 97:9
partnership (1) 6:19
partnerships (2) 87:19 96:17
pass (2) 111:9 130:13
passed (2) 46:13 86:2
passing (1) 111:5
Pathfinders (1) 105:12
patience (1) 16:10
patrol (7) 28:21 33:15 39:18 54:6
59:15 65:8 124:6
patrollers (1) 113:24
patrolling (1) 59:19
pattern (1) 64:23
pay (4) 50:18 51:11 82:9 112:15
PC (1) 89:18
peak (1) 22:20
peers (1) 69:13
Peguero (11) 2:3 3:24,24 35:2,3
110:19,23 122:3,4 126:12 133:13
peninsula (2) 84:3,9
people (99) 4:12,18 5:8,25 6:18,21
6:22 7:6,19 8:21,22,23 10:19

17:5 19:23 21:18 22:24 26:4,11
27:10 29:12 30:8 34:11 39:25
42:14,21 47:18,22 49:6 51:20
55:7,19 56:13 58:5,17 60:22,23
63:17 64:5,17 65:7 68:23,25 69:7
69:14,18 72:19,20 73:2 78:10
80:11,16 81:15,18 84:2,21,23,25
85:25 86:10 92:2 97:19 100:2,24
100:25 101:8,10,12 104:13
109:16,17 111:5,8,22 112:19
114:8 116:8,15 117:6 118:8
119:25 120:12,13,19 121:8 123:2
125:4,13,22 126:22 128:3 130:11
130:19 131:8,16,24 132:2,8,9
percent (14) 29:5 37:22 48:7,7
53:9 72:18,22,25 73:3,4 90:22
91:3,7,10
percentage (2) 52:16 53:12
perfect (2) 96:9 98:16
performance (1) 78:3
perpetuate (1) 114:17
person (11) 6:8 45:16 48:19 71:3
74:21 79:6 80:13,20 85:11 96:9
122:7
personally (3) 100:10 103:14
104:6
perspective (3) 25:13 80:10 101:9
pertinent (2) 76:6,8
pews (1) 105:7
Phipps (5) 44:13,14,20 45:5
128:25
phone (9) 100:11 123:22 127:12
127:13,16,20 128:7,11,22
phones (1) 127:19
phonetic (1) 117:16
photographs (1) 18:4
physical (2) 18:3 118:10
pick (1) 118:13
picked (1) 14:18
picking (1) 80:4
pilot (3) 10:14,24 115:23
pipeline (1) 38:14
place (7) 15:14 23:10,12 31:18
65:6 79:24 85:7
places (2) 64:16 81:6
plan (1) 30:4
plate (1) 52:7
platform (1) 130:2
platforms (1) 130:3
play (1) 86:6
playing (1) 57:10
plays (1) 114:5
Plaza (2) 21:13,19
please (10) 3:11 24:7 30:14 37:15
42:3 58:4 67:17 75:19 97:24
126:6
pleased (1) 35:19

pockets (2) 14:16 103:9
podiatrist (1) 118:25
podium (1) 6:11
point (5) 21:15 62:24 70:2 73:15
132:22
pointed (2) 90:21 102:11
points (1) 97:20
police (109) 7:16,20 8:8 9:17 10:2
10:3,3,14,25 12:13,23 13:17
16:21,25 17:3,8,11 18:9 19:3
21:7,13,19,20 23:18 25:19 32:25
33:5,16 37:2,10,23 38:24 39:3,17
39:22 41:2,14,19 42:19 44:8 50:3
50:6,7 51:7,7,7 54:3,22 55:5,6,8
64:15,25 72:10,15,17,19,21,24
73:4,5 76:20 82:3 86:5 87:8,11
90:4 91:17 92:6,10,25 93:2,16
94:10,15 101:9,24 103:5 104:17
105:13 106:22 109:16 110:3,5,6
110:17,20,24 111:21 112:9
113:22,25 114:14 115:6,20,25
116:12 122:6,9,10,21,23 125:18
125:25 126:3,15 127:11 130:4
131:19
police-community (6) 4:20 5:2,12
12:2 15:16 112:24
policed (1) 72:13
policing (11) 15:15 39:6 59:25
72:5 74:9 75:20,23 81:21 82:5
84:18 96:2
policy (5) 1:20 25:6,9 63:20 97:21
political (1) 48:5
poorly (2) 54:11 129:15
Pop-Up (1) 123:17
popular (1) 95:22
population (1) 29:8
portion (1) 75:14
positions (1) 131:22
positive (5) 7:12 64:22 70:17 96:18
109:11
possibility (1) 122:8
possible (3) 64:7 99:12 100:3
possibly (1) 19:8
Post (1) 76:22
posters (1) 126:8
potential (1) 112:17
potentially (1) 122:25
pounds (1) 61:4
Poverty (1) 31:6
power (7) 78:7,11,15 92:2,2,11,21
practice (1) 107:15
practitioners (1) 31:14
precinct (23) 7:15 20:15 21:13,14
23:23 24:12 39:18 56:10 57:12
57:14,23 58:7,21 59:17 84:21,25
89:5 94:17,21 95:20 96:15,17
121:12

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

precincts (3) 23:19 27:23 61:12
precipitated (1) 91:5
predecessors (1) 74:6
prefer (1) 98:22
prejudices (2) 112:16,18
prepared (1) 101:15
preponderance (4) 33:8,11,14
 53:7
present (3) 2:1 28:5 84:24
presentation (6) 1:19,20 25:6
 28:11 32:9 34:23
presented (1) 83:23
president (4) 56:9 59:7 86:21
 129:5
pressing (1) 98:3
pretty (5) 22:17 26:7,16 27:24
 64:18
prevent (1) 75:8
preventative (2) 74:18 75:5
prevents (1) 47:12
previous (2) 85:11 89:15
previously (2) 76:17 118:10
prices (1) 22:19
pride (1) 98:9
primarily (1) 87:17
principal (2) 4:8,9
prior (2) 101:22 102:6
private (2) 75:12 80:7
privilege (1) 108:18
proactively (2) 19:4,15
probably (6) 11:19 54:24 102:8,23
 104:21 107:16
problem (8) 54:18 94:10 96:14
 99:5,11 107:20 130:24 131:25
problems (3) 94:9 96:19 99:23
proceedings (134) 1:9 3:1 4:1 5:1
 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1
 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1
 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1
 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1
 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1
 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1
 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1
 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1
 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1
 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1
 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1
 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1
 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1
 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1
 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1
 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1 102:1
 103:1 104:1 105:1 106:1 107:1
 108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1 112:1
 113:1 114:1 115:1 116:1 117:1
 118:1 119:1 120:1 121:1 122:1
 123:1 124:1 125:1 126:1 127:1

128:1 129:1 130:1 131:1 132:1
 133:1 134:8,10
process (25) 7:6,7 8:13,15 9:14,18
 9:19,20 20:4,12 26:21 27:4,9,9
 27:11 29:20 32:20 38:19 40:3,18
 49:24 52:15 58:10 61:10 122:21
processes (1) 8:19
productive (1) 87:22
profanity (1) 18:7
professional (2) 8:22 9:10
program (10) 4:22 19:19 55:3
 59:24 60:9 68:16 69:5 118:4
 121:24 123:15
programming (1) 58:15
programs (4) 28:3 123:14 129:24
 130:10
Project (1) 68:7
Projects (1) 44:7
promote (1) 87:15
promotion (1) 131:20
prompted (1) 90:16
prompts (1) 71:25
pronouncing (1) 117:22
proper (1) 107:24
properly (1) 119:5
Prophete (3) 117:20,21,24
proposition (1) 18:4
prosecute (1) 114:7
prosecuting (1) 16:20
proud (1) 70:19
proven (1) 76:19
provide (2) 118:8 125:21
providers (2) 120:5 129:12
provides (1) 76:15
providing (1) 13:5
PSA (9) 24:18 56:10 57:24,25
 99:16 115:18 123:12 129:5
 131:18
psychological (4) 110:20,24 111:3
 123:14
psychologists (1) 123:8
public (27) 1:2,14,22 6:6 22:19,21
 24:25 36:4 39:25 43:17 47:13
 49:14 50:12 51:8,13,25 55:14
 57:19 64:12 75:7,12 80:8 88:7
 132:18,18,23 134:6
publicly (2) 6:3 94:21
pulled (2) 44:8 73:14
Puma (3) 2:5 66:10,11
punitive (1) 90:3
purpose (1) 79:25
purview (3) 90:5 99:10 121:16
push (6) 17:12 49:18 69:22 70:2
 112:21 121:5
pushing (1) 17:13
put (7) 51:23 58:4 59:24 81:2 127:2
 129:19 132:20

Q

qualify (3) 93:25 94:3 119:12
Queens (18) 4:2 10:25 12:3 20:21
 23:24,25 25:12,17 26:15 27:20
 28:16 29:5 59:13,14 71:9,22
 77:15 134:4
queer (1) 71:19
question (18) 35:3 45:23 52:4 57:7
 59:4,5 67:6,7,8 74:8,9 79:3,10
 89:4,5 90:6 94:4 106:23
questionable (1) 62:25
questioned (2) 78:4,5
questions (28) 10:9,12 23:4,13
 32:9 34:22 35:17 40:3,12 42:24
 43:3 47:18 50:15 52:12 55:24,24
 55:25 56:4 65:16 67:14 69:22
 70:9 72:2 78:6,25 86:16 87:25
 126:5
quick (4) 16:15 35:3 106:23 108:8
quickly (1) 67:24
quorum (1) 66:15
quotas (1) 60:17
quote (1) 82:18

R

R (2) 1:10 134:1
race (3) 18:15 31:4 82:11
racialized (1) 74:13
racism (5) 113:14,19,20 114:11,15
racist (1) 114:3
radical (1) 75:22
radically (1) 75:24
Rafferty (1) 4:8
rag (1) 108:22
railroad (1) 35:8
raise (2) 40:12 112:12
raised (2) 64:15 97:11
raising (1) 48:12
Ramon (2) 2:3 3:24
range (2) 79:19,20
rank (1) 13:6
rap (1) 105:14
rate (9) 25:16,17,20,23,24 27:5,19
 27:22,25
rates (3) 26:8,9,20
reach (2) 28:7 100:2
reached (1) 100:10
read (3) 80:9 88:17 131:11
Ready (1) 67:15
real (6) 50:22 83:4 85:19 112:8,17
 116:19
reality (1) 93:3
realize (4) 83:8 84:23 124:15 128:6
realized (1) 83:3
realizing (1) 86:3
really (47) 9:2,3,11 14:11 17:4
 19:24 23:4 27:7 30:6,15,19 31:7

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

<p>31:16 32:5 36:10 41:4,5,8,17,18 41:25 42:14,15,16 49:14 59:19 61:6 81:8 82:19 85:15 89:24 90:2 109:9,14 111:12 112:7,13 114:8 116:7,19 117:2,7 123:10 130:8 130:22 131:5,16 realm (1) 121:3 reason (6) 14:2 25:17 46:15,18 69:11 119:15 reasons (3) 39:21 85:13 106:17 recall (1) 64:11 receive (4) 14:3 45:12 82:13 92:16 received (1) 25:24 recertification (1) 118:20 recognition (1) 74:20 recognize (6) 58:11,25 80:12 82:21 83:7 84:17 recommend (2) 33:2,4 recommendation (3) 81:24 90:13 126:13 recommendations (4) 41:16,21 91:15,16 recommended (2) 34:6 91:8 recommends (1) 92:9 record (7) 48:24 51:11 94:16 105:24 127:13,13 134:10 recording (1) 128:8 recordings (2) 128:16,18 records (3) 49:24 50:7 105:13 refers (1) 18:15 reform (1) 84:4 regard (1) 108:14 registered (3) 68:2 118:21 119:3 reiterate (1) 93:9 related (3) 24:20 101:16 134:11 relation (1) 72:4 relations (11) 4:21 5:2,13 11:2 12:2 15:17 31:19 87:8,11 112:24 132:19 relationship (4) 36:25 60:8 85:19 109:15 relationships (6) 64:19 84:16 85:23 87:16,22 114:14 release (1) 40:4 religion (1) 18:17 rely (1) 22:21 remarks (2) 15:22,23 remember (1) 75:21 reopened (1) 34:18 repeal (2) 49:21,23 repeat (1) 39:12 repeated (1) 54:5 repeatedly (1) 14:19 repetitive (1) 39:13 rephrase (1) 127:25 replaced (1) 74:3 report (12) 1:17,18 15:11 16:5</p>	<p>21:23 36:17 46:20 52:22 72:14 79:7 91:6 109:5 reported (5) 2:13 44:22 73:10,17 134:8 reporting (1) 43:9 representative (3) 20:21 68:10 70:23 representatives (4) 21:23,25 23:14 71:4 representing (4) 3:16 23:18 79:13 117:25 request (3) 19:9 34:18 40:14 requesting (1) 50:24 require (1) 74:7 required (1) 13:21 reroutes (1) 13:17 research (3) 31:7 79:5,22 residents (1) 84:7 resist (1) 115:11 resolution (1) 8:16 resolve (3) 9:13,24 10:3 resolved (2) 10:5 44:19 resolving (1) 9:25 resonated (2) 89:14,19 resource (6) 19:22 30:7 37:16 127:23,25 129:12 resources (11) 29:19 31:20,21 36:12 119:23 120:8,14,24 128:14 129:12 132:17 respects (1) 108:16 respond (3) 7:23 41:24 46:11 response (16) 23:16 25:3 34:24 35:18 36:19 61:19 65:18 67:20 68:8 88:2,20 117:13,18 133:6,9 133:19 responsibility (3) 65:11 75:4 114:10 responsible (1) 16:19 responsiveness (1) 41:23 restorative (2) 74:17,19 restricts (1) 47:14 restructure (1) 116:2 result (2) 119:19 132:7 resulting (1) 54:23 results (3) 52:23 56:17 124:22 retired (1) 123:18 retrieve (1) 19:8 return (1) 25:5 reversed (1) 102:10 review (5) 1:1 3:4 34:7 72:3 99:24 revising (1) 40:16 revision (1) 67:13 revisions (2) 38:13 67:2 rich (1) 133:2 Richards (17) 35:21,24 36:3 43:10 43:13,25 46:12 47:10 48:3 50:8 50:13 52:9 57:6,25 61:17 65:22</p>	<p>132:13 Richards' (1) 20:8 right (51) 6:22 9:21,21 10:18 11:3 11:16 12:12,19,21 14:4,15,20 18:21,24 19:24 20:15 37:14 40:8 40:11 44:6 46:13 48:21 49:20 50:16 51:8,10 52:2 54:12 57:21 58:2,20 61:20 64:10 69:25 71:5 76:7 80:5 85:25 88:3,22 91:18 97:13 102:17,18 103:21 104:18 106:24 107:3,5,13 126:21 rights (6) 12:18,23,25 20:2 47:9 107:9 riot (1) 8:5 Rivadeneyra (4) 2:7 3:17,18 66:22 road (3) 9:23 99:7,15 Robert (1) 23:12 Robin (4) 32:10,11 52:14 55:2 Robins (1) 117:12 Robinson (11) 8:10 21:11 23:21,22 70:25 71:8 80:3 81:23 95:18,19 98:24 Rockaway (5) 59:12 60:4 83:17,20 83:25 rodeo (1) 93:18 Rodriguez (1) 5:21 rogue (1) 63:25 role (2) 82:18 86:6 rolling (1) 61:3 romantic (1) 18:3 room (2) 126:9,10 rooms (1) 131:12 Rose (1) 86:24 Rosedale (1) 1:7 Roshea (2) 68:13,14 Roslyn (1) 23:12 rotate (2) 124:12,20 rotation (2) 122:22,23 rotations (1) 124:2 round-about (1) 16:9 rounds (1) 55:15 route (1) 38:5 rubber (1) 89:21 rude (1) 78:23 rug (1) 36:18 run (2) 46:22 71:4 running (2) 3:6 58:5</p> <hr/> <p align="center">S</p> <hr/> <p>sad (1) 120:23 Safe (1) 125:21 safer (3) 37:13 41:8 86:12 Safety (4) 36:5,7 43:17 57:19 Saint (1) 1:5 sake (1) 120:11 salary (1) 51:11 sales (1) 45:20</p>
---	--	---

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018

Sandra (1) 126:24
sat (1) 8:6
saw (3) 8:11 18:24 56:2
saying (24) 9:4 42:18 43:11 45:7
46:3,8 50:2,5 53:25 54:3,4,13,16
54:18 56:18 58:3 63:24 64:4,5
85:20 116:23 124:2 128:10
130:14
says (4) 13:3 14:7 94:17 95:12
scar (1) 9:20
scared (1) 42:11
scary (2) 61:6 93:21
scenarios (1) 62:9
school (13) 4:8 36:7 44:6 45:25
68:19 70:12 80:6,7,8 82:13 84:9
101:19 110:2
schools (2) 84:14 129:21
screening (1) 126:15
search (11) 13:23 14:10,11,16
17:22 19:14,16 106:23,25 107:5
107:19
searched (4) 102:24 103:7,9 109:4
searches (1) 107:21
searching (1) 107:25
season (1) 24:15
second (7) 7:11 14:7 17:19 66:23
66:24 68:24 133:14
secondary (1) 99:13
secondly (1) 49:5
secrecy (1) 51:13
secret (2) 72:11 75:9
sectors (1) 59:16
see (42) 4:12 5:16 23:5 24:21
25:20,22 26:6,7,14,15 27:22 29:4
31:11,17 35:25 37:18 39:23 42:7
42:8 55:23 59:4 65:4 66:17 70:2
74:11 76:21,22 84:5 85:4,16
88:22 95:16 101:8 113:15 115:25
116:4 123:2 124:25,25 127:23
130:14 131:8
seeing (3) 25:14 43:17 69:14
seen (3) 29:17 102:2 128:3
select (1) 5:8
selected (1) 35:5
senate (1) 48:6
senators (1) 49:6
send (2) 27:15 43:6
senior (4) 23:12 25:9 55:17 110:2
sense (3) 8:8 10:7 78:9
serious (2) 91:14 130:19
seriously (3) 29:22 86:12 113:2
serve (2) 30:9 71:19
service (3) 118:17 119:13 123:15
services (10) 86:22 87:2 118:8,11
120:6 121:7 123:5 125:22,23,23
serving (1) 51:9
session (4) 1:25 47:13 133:12,16

sessions (2) 31:13 58:16
set (3) 114:6 131:3 134:15
setting (1) 4:23
Seventh-Day (3) 79:13 89:9
100:14
sexual (4) 17:25 18:2,3,16
shame (2) 69:17 120:13
shaped (1) 57:21
share (3) 11:24 19:21 20:23
shared (1) 113:17
sheets (1) 105:14
shelters (2) 87:3,13
shield (1) 13:7
shields (1) 48:14
shift (2) 122:22 124:2
Shirley (2) 44:13 128:25
shootings (1) 61:21
shortly (1) 3:9
shot (1) 103:12
shoulder (1) 73:13
shove (1) 17:12
show (6) 25:17,18 77:2,19 125:4
125:13
showed (1) 115:22
showing (5) 70:16 77:19 85:20
94:11 125:3
shows (4) 28:12,14 76:16 115:21
shrouded (1) 51:12
shut (1) 108:24
shy (1) 42:18
sic (1) 15:22
sides (5) 7:23 9:23 28:20,23 39:23
signed (1) 100:19
significant (1) 12:11
similar (2) 51:2 64:14
similarly (2) 26:16 28:15
simple (2) 21:12 76:5
simply (2) 15:9 64:24
single (1) 124:18
sir (3) 55:12 98:25 100:5
sirens (1) 103:6
sit (5) 95:23 108:5,25,25 109:3
situation (4) 7:24 8:3 60:19 108:20
situations (12) 7:19,20 13:4,22
14:8,21 19:3,13 68:24 114:24
115:2,4
six (4) 8:7 61:3 118:5 119:11
skinny (2) 102:17,18
slashed (1) 122:12
slave (1) 113:23
slavery (1) 80:22
slightly (1) 53:9
smaller (1) 31:12
snack (1) 118:15
sobriety (1) 13:24
social (1) 118:17
sociologists (1) 72:14

sociopolitical (1) 74:12
software (1) 128:15
solely (1) 89:17
solution (5) 76:11,13,16 77:3
130:21
solutions (4) 31:15,16 74:15 75:13
solve (2) 99:6,11
solving (1) 76:12
somebody (7) 9:16 10:7 32:15
45:17 52:5 59:18 122:12
somewhat (3) 89:16,20,21
son (3) 77:22 105:7 127:10
soon (2) 91:7 99:11
sophomore (1) 101:18
sorry (7) 11:11 35:2 70:5 103:15
109:9 110:4 127:24
sort (5) 35:6 40:5 121:7 123:5
126:14
South (2) 44:6 59:13
southeast (2) 10:24 59:13
spaces (3) 75:8,9,13
speak (25) 5:25 6:2,6,9,11 7:8,9,11
21:15 22:8 35:22 36:15,25 47:5
50:9 60:23 68:2,12 69:25 71:3
90:11,17 96:13 127:16 128:5
speakers (1) 67:25
speaking (4) 65:11 113:11 127:7
129:8
specific (3) 33:6 47:12 97:2
specifically (3) 6:5 87:20 109:13
speech (3) 71:5 75:15 76:5
spend (1) 97:14
spewing (1) 108:23
spirit (1) 74:3
spoke (5) 32:11 39:11 40:9 97:3
100:11
spoken (1) 76:9
spot (1) 63:23
spread (1) 117:5
spring (1) 73:8
Springfield (2) 68:20 102:13
SRG (1) 62:9
ss (1) 134:3
SSAs (1) 84:17
St (9) 4:10 70:23 71:9,13,21 73:10
78:20 93:13 101:16
staff (11) 13:19 15:13 20:10 36:8
55:15 69:19 87:9,21 124:12,13
124:20
staffed (1) 123:17
Stahly-Butts (7) 2:8 11:11,12,14
35:14 91:21 113:10
stamp (1) 89:21
stamps (1) 118:20
stand (4) 22:2 80:22 113:2,4
standing (1) 11:18
stands (1) 17:10

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

start (5) 3:12 84:18 112:2 120:10 124:17
started (9) 3:7 66:8 71:6 88:15 107:22 108:20,23,25 124:19
state (7) 47:9 48:6 49:6 74:23 93:3 134:3,7
statement (1) 50:15
statements (1) 27:16
Staten (2) 3:16 12:8
States (1) 72:12
stating (2) 32:18 54:5
statistically (1) 76:19
status (1) 18:17
statute (1) 104:22
stay (1) 69:6
steer (2) 4:25,25
step (6) 15:15 42:14 70:4 83:7 85:10 109:3
steps (1) 39:2
stigmatized (1) 87:14
stipend (3) 35:6,15,16
stop (4) 17:21 40:21 45:22 103:20
stop-and-frisk (5) 43:24 44:2 45:19,22,23
stopped (8) 14:2 40:12 46:23 61:23 101:23 102:9 106:22 107:17
stops (2) 40:15,15
stories (3) 6:20,21,23
story (3) 28:20,24 44:7
straight (1) 102:11
streaming (3) 21:18 22:11 44:11
street (4) 15:10 43:24 44:9 99:21
streets (1) 111:9
strengthen (2) 38:18 41:5
strengthening (1) 38:11
stress (8) 36:14 37:14 38:15 42:5 123:23 124:14,21 125:3
stressed (1) 89:18
stretching (1) 121:17
strictly (1) 89:16
strike (1) 73:21
strong (1) 84:15
structural (4) 113:14,20 114:11,15
structurally (1) 114:3
structure (1) 75:20
structures (1) 73:25
stuck (1) 11:21
student (2) 71:8 78:20
students (9) 30:2 70:24 71:10,14 73:24 75:16,17 78:21 93:12
study (1) 50:25
stuff (3) 82:12 110:8 111:4
subject (1) 32:22
submit (1) 72:9
submitting (1) 72:7
subordinates (1) 125:12

substantiated (5) 32:12 33:10 43:19 52:18 95:9
substantiating (3) 90:2 93:15 94:16
subways (1) 49:12
success (1) 87:5
successful (2) 10:24 41:6
succession (1) 90:9
suffer (1) 120:23
suggest (1) 63:3
suggestions (1) 120:15
suicides (1) 125:7
suit (1) 103:18
Summit (7) 4:13,16 30:5,21 31:22 32:5 35:11
summonses (1) 97:17
Sunday (1) 48:12
support (10) 15:17 49:3 56:14,15 56:24 57:4 58:7 65:20 87:12 121:7
supportive (1) 121:17
supposed (1) 121:18
suppress (1) 124:17
sure (33) 21:17 26:11 27:8,12 28:21 29:10,17 36:11 39:12 40:8 43:2 46:16 47:23 48:9 49:7,23 55:19 59:23 85:18 86:7,10 90:8 95:18 98:19 106:7 109:6 118:22 119:4 120:5 121:10 126:19 128:9 132:23
surveillance (2) 74:14 128:21
susceptible (1) 96:24
suspect (1) 15:22
suspicious (3) 102:4 103:3 107:17
suspiciously (1) 105:24
swept (1) 36:18
system (4) 56:14 75:23 113:25 114:6
systemic (2) 114:20,21
systems (6) 74:4,4,14 114:2,12,16

T

T (2) 134:1,1
tackle (2) 82:8,9
tackles (1) 82:11
tai (1) 119:7
take (32) 7:4,11 9:9 12:16 16:15 27:16 29:3,21,23 50:11 52:4 61:25 63:6,8 65:6 75:3 82:17 83:6 85:15 87:12 90:7,8 96:5,21 98:2 112:25 116:19,19 117:5 119:8 120:11 130:7
taken (2) 83:5 86:11
talk (32) 10:20,21 12:17 14:24 28:5 30:13,15 32:2,21 34:13 39:4 44:16 55:18 63:20 64:25 65:3 68:15 69:4,23 70:3 108:5,6,11,12

115:8,9,9 120:4 122:4 125:12 131:10 132:13
talked (2) 87:4 115:19
talking (6) 44:2,3 47:12 56:17 79:6 96:25
Tanya (1) 97:13
tape (1) 58:5
Tarekegn (8) 25:7,8 31:23 32:19 34:15 35:9,16 125:17
target (2) 26:10 45:19
taser (1) 17:14
Task (2) 83:17,21
taught (1) 72:14
teachers (1) 69:19
teaches (1) 82:6
team (4) 16:5 19:20 26:3 121:10
teenage (1) 79:20
teeth (1) 38:10
tell (9) 53:14 62:2 81:8 98:8 116:22 117:6 122:16 125:2 127:3
telling (2) 94:8,9
terms (3) 18:18 75:5 82:10
terrorism (2) 107:18 110:4
test (5) 110:13,20,24 111:3,9
testimony (1) 100:21
tests (2) 111:5,11
thank (75) 3:19 4:7 6:13,15 11:3,17 16:6,8,10 20:25 21:2,3 23:7 24:9 24:22,23 25:4 32:6 34:21 35:24 36:7 43:21 46:9 56:8 65:15,19,20 65:21,22,23 66:6,14 70:19 71:5 75:15 78:24 81:11,11 83:10,15 83:22 86:13,14,19,24 87:23,24 88:3 91:21 93:5 100:5 101:5 106:10,11,13 108:19 109:23 113:7,11 114:18 115:16 117:10 117:11,22 121:20,25 124:9 125:15,15 126:11 128:12,23 132:10,25 133:22
thanks (5) 11:22 12:3 24:24 63:11 87:18
Thanksgiving (2) 5:6 24:14
theorized (1) 74:5
therapeutic (1) 130:20
thing (20) 10:13 15:3 20:17 35:25 36:15 44:24 55:7 64:24 66:17 80:24 85:18 89:11,14 98:9 104:12 113:13 114:9 115:13 125:8 127:22
things (44) 6:2 7:10 8:12 25:25 28:22 36:16,23 37:17,18 38:12 38:23 40:5,24 41:12 42:4 56:18 67:23 70:16 81:22 86:8 96:22 98:18 101:6 104:16 106:3 108:3 108:10 111:16 113:2,4,15 116:2 116:10,23,23 118:19 129:7,11,25 130:7,11 131:17,23 132:25

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

think (62) 5:21 11:20 14:23 30:6,14
30:16 36:24 39:9,14 45:16 46:25
48:10,12 51:4 52:25 53:25 55:11
57:17 59:3 63:4 64:9,12,23 77:24
90:16 91:4 92:15,24 95:2,3,22
96:4,14,15,21 97:2 98:17 101:6
103:19,24 104:2 105:16 106:15
109:13,21 112:6,11 113:13,21
114:3,4,23 115:5,12 116:11,17
121:4,11 127:2 130:24 132:6
133:2
thinking (3) 77:22 114:4 122:8
third (2) 18:6 20:10
thirteen (1) 16:23
thoroughly (1) 13:20
thought (3) 12:15 74:5,7
thoughts (1) 11:24
threatening (1) 17:22
three (2) 88:10 129:3
Thrive (1) 125:21
throwing (2) 107:22 108:21
throws (1) 18:10
tie (1) 103:18
tied (1) 74:14
tight (1) 60:2
time (27) 12:16 37:15 46:8 49:19
62:4 63:7 69:2,9 74:17 82:19
83:3,6 91:8,10 93:6 97:4 98:2,5,6
101:25 106:8,9,10 124:7,11
132:22 133:24
times (11) 7:9 22:20 42:15 56:11
56:22 76:21 90:22 91:3 94:2
122:5,10
today (10) 4:7 5:20 16:11 48:10
77:8 80:13,17,21,23 119:16
told (1) 103:25
tomorrow (1) 77:6
tonight (10) 14:25 25:2 38:20
40:10 70:20 71:24 72:7 76:9
79:12 133:3
tool (2) 6:17 19:22
tools (2) 41:6 78:2
top (3) 99:17,20 130:3
topic (1) 76:8
total (1) 72:9
totality (1) 17:17
totally (4) 49:20 51:24 88:16
116:12
touch (1) 41:11
touched (1) 41:10
track (7) 60:15 63:9,14,17,18 64:4
64:5
tracking (3) 28:15 61:10 62:15
tradition (1) 71:17
traditions (2) 71:18,19
train (2) 77:12 116:12
trainers (1) 87:6

training (8) 65:7 77:7 85:24 111:24
115:19 116:20,25 128:16
trainings (2) 77:9 113:6
transcript (2) 1:9 134:10
transform (1) 114:12
transition (1) 56:25
translated (1) 89:20
transparency (15) 15:18 37:4,5,6
48:14,18,24 50:21 51:6,15 62:16
78:2 84:6 85:24 92:18
transparent (4) 27:9 37:11 39:24
49:25
transport (1) 35:7
transportation (7) 22:19,22 23:2
35:10,13 49:12 118:12
trauma (5) 122:14,20,25 123:5
126:15
traumatize (1) 77:19
treated (1) 54:11
treats (1) 107:8
Tricia (1) 20:20
tried (1) 60:9
trip (1) 44:22
trips (1) 119:8
true (3) 41:8 106:23 134:10
truncation (5) 26:19 27:5,19,21,24
trust (12) 37:9 39:3 41:9 42:2 84:6
85:13 94:6,7 95:9,15 96:12,15
truthful (1) 52:24
try (10) 26:25 47:21 55:15 63:9
88:18 99:2 114:14 121:19 125:11
125:11
trying (3) 99:8 110:9 122:18
Turn (1) 127:13
turnout (1) 132:7
two (22) 5:19 8:6 10:22 13:2 31:4,8
40:15 44:4 63:19 64:8 67:23
68:18 71:2,4 72:24 84:8 101:15
101:17,24 104:21 118:14 119:2
type (8) 94:19 110:8,13,18 122:24
130:17,23 131:20
typically (1) 74:25

U

unarmed (5) 72:18,21,25 73:3,5
uncertain (1) 14:12
uncle (1) 115:11
uncomfortable (1) 70:6
unconscious (2) 112:5,8
uncover (1) 101:24
undercover (1) 103:20
underneath (1) 105:7
understand (13) 9:3 11:8 12:22
27:10 47:23 54:9 69:18 72:3 80:5
95:5 105:3 106:3 115:18
understanding (1) 69:20
underutilized (1) 119:23

underwent (1) 12:11
unfair (1) 95:23
unfortunate (2) 103:18 105:4
unfortunately (4) 49:10 97:18
108:9 125:7
unfounded (5) 32:12,18 33:7 52:17
56:18
unheard (1) 131:14
uniforms (1) 96:8
unit (6) 38:11 55:14 61:22,24 63:21
64:5
United (1) 72:12
units (4) 62:10,21,25 63:25
universe (1) 76:2
University (3) 70:23 71:9 78:21
unjust (1) 73:22
unnecessary (1) 17:18
unofficial (1) 123:19
unquote (1) 82:18
unsubstantiated (6) 28:17 33:18
52:17 53:5 56:19 86:9
unsure (1) 15:8
updates (1) 85:21
urge (3) 70:15 81:14 108:4
use (7) 37:16 42:3 69:25 127:20
128:11,19,21
uses (1) 17:11
usually (1) 61:2
utilize (1) 49:17
utilized (1) 120:9

V

valid (1) 6:23
validated (3) 86:5 94:22 95:11
validates (1) 95:3
valuable (2) 6:17 39:2
van (2) 44:8 119:9
vehicle (3) 8:20 130:23 132:3
verbal (1) 18:2
vice (1) 86:21
victims (2) 74:24,25
video (4) 32:24 53:14 127:17
128:22
views (1) 81:20
vigorously (1) 99:19
violated (2) 12:25 107:9
violation (2) 14:4 74:21
violence (5) 75:23 81:24 82:2,6
130:18
Visions (1) 109:25
visiting (1) 60:16
visual (1) 126:16
visually (2) 130:11 131:8
voice (1) 49:17
voices (1) 30:17
void (1) 60:10
voluntary (1) 74:23

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

volunteer (1) 58:12
vote (2) 34:8 67:15
votes (1) 33:24

W

waiting (2) 126:9,10
walked (1) 102:7
walking (7) 48:19 101:20,23
102:25 103:3 105:24 107:14
wall (1) 17:13
want (75) 5:9 6:4,16 7:8,11,21 9:22
10:15 11:17 16:15 17:4 18:18
19:20,24 20:17 21:21 24:13
25:10 27:8 29:3,9,17 30:13 32:3
35:21 36:7 37:18,25 38:15,19,24
39:12 41:11 42:4 43:21 46:10,16
51:18,20,23,24 58:18 61:9,15
62:3 63:6 66:4,16 67:24 69:23,24
70:3,7 79:4 81:22 83:22 86:24
87:4 90:7 92:8 99:3 101:7 103:24
104:6,11,23 106:10,19 112:23
113:11 114:18 115:18 123:20
125:17 131:5
wanted (2) 54:15 70:11
wanting (1) 132:14
wants (2) 5:22 47:5
warrant (1) 17:23
wash (1) 99:9
Washington (2) 76:22,23
wasn't (3) 43:18 45:22 93:18
way (46) 6:17,24 7:15 10:4 28:18
32:19 33:19 37:7,8 38:7 39:8
40:17 41:24 42:7,22 46:4 48:21
50:21 51:14 52:19 54:25 60:13
61:24 76:5,16 80:23 82:15 93:23
100:9 107:8,14,24 108:16 111:20
112:16 113:2,4 116:2 119:25
120:19 121:17 123:19 124:8
131:4,7 134:13
ways (17) 6:19,25 7:2 9:14 20:3
38:18,21 41:22 47:21 49:23
60:14 62:14 112:5,7 114:5,6
125:5
we'll (13) 3:12 20:22 31:12 44:23
48:17 53:15 55:12 56:2 66:21
67:12,23 88:23 126:18
we're (53) 3:7 4:13,22,23 14:23
16:17,18,22 19:18 22:11 25:13
28:22 29:8,20 30:15,18 31:3,7
37:7,18 38:17 40:17 41:15 42:21
43:8,15 44:11,15,24 47:25 51:14
53:12,25 54:3,4,5 65:19 71:14,23
81:17 83:24 85:24 94:11 98:16
99:8,14 101:2 106:17 112:21
121:18 129:25 132:6,24
we've (10) 6:8 18:25 20:7 40:25
66:8 87:5 104:19 111:16 112:25

132:20
weapon (2) 127:12,23
wear (1) 108:18
wearing (1) 103:17
website (1) 83:12
Wednesday (1) 20:11
week (1) 119:11
weekends (1) 20:23
weekly (1) 119:4
weeks (2) 55:6 59:10
Welcome (2) 3:2 35:23
went (5) 18:20 68:19 69:11 70:12
80:6
weren't (2) 8:12 84:15
WHEREOF (1) 134:15
white (4) 52:7,8 72:13,20
wife (1) 96:10
Williams (7) 109:24,25 110:15,22
111:2 114:22 115:16
willing (3) 57:11,16 121:11
windows (1) 75:9
wish (2) 24:13 97:24
within-entitled (1) 134:9
witness (4) 27:16 42:11 119:17
134:15
witnessed (1) 82:24
witnesses (1) 32:22
women (3) 35:4 38:2 44:4
wonderful (2) 8:10 101:7
wondering (3) 122:13,20 126:12
woods (1) 36:2
word (6) 127:15,15 128:2,2,11,11
words (2) 75:25 108:24
work (32) 7:14 8:23 10:22,23 15:13
30:3 36:5,9 39:8 41:3 42:19 45:2
54:3,22 55:18 56:13 57:2 58:12
58:12 59:2 65:23 81:25 83:25
89:13,23 109:21 114:20,21,21
120:17 125:20 132:22
worked (2) 100:9 124:10
working (10) 27:7,19 30:20 43:15
43:20 47:21,25 92:17 121:22
130:2
workplace (2) 82:9,10
works (1) 32:20
world (2) 75:16 94:15
wouldn't (3) 82:12 127:22 132:8
wow (1) 83:4
write (2) 62:3 97:17
written (2) 54:7 67:6
wrong (7) 52:15,19 54:16 62:2
110:12 111:12 127:2
www.nyc.gov/ccrb (1) 20:6

X

X (3) 1:1,5 80:19

Y

y'all (2) 8:21 52:20
y-a-l-v-a-r-e-z (1) 20:19
YABC (4) 68:11,15 69:11,16
yalvarez (1) 20:18
yeah (3) 85:9,24 103:13
year (7) 4:16 17:24 39:17 40:7
90:21 91:6 130:2
years (10) 44:21 46:24 61:25 98:15
101:10,17,18 103:12 104:21
124:7
yesterday (1) 48:11
yoga (1) 119:7
Yojaira (8) 5:18 16:5 21:2 28:2
32:2 55:14 86:25 121:10
York (15) 1:7 4:21 12:11 21:7,20
28:15 29:7 31:19 36:2 66:2 76:21
87:3 99:5 134:3,7
Yorkers (1) 30:9
young (36) 4:12,18 5:8 29:12 30:7
30:8,17 35:4,15 58:17 59:9 70:14
79:15,19 84:2,20 85:25 100:13
100:22 101:8,11 105:5,8,10,25
105:25 106:14 109:9,16,17,17
114:25 118:10 122:19 127:7,18
younger (1) 81:18
youth (40) 4:13,15,23,23,24 5:4,7
19:24 29:4,5,10,18,25 30:4,14,20
30:21 31:9,10,10,13,21,22 32:4,5
35:4,10,11 55:3,9,17 68:10 70:22
81:16 83:13,17,21 84:10 100:17
109:20

Z

Zachary (1) 5:20
zumba (1) 119:7

0

1

1 (1) 1:15
1-800-341-CCRB (1) 20:5
10 (6) 1:24 4:18 5:9 30:23 67:10
102:5
100 (4) 15:10 48:7,7 60:4
101 (1) 60:5
102 (1) 72:16
103 (2) 24:19 27:23
105 (7) 24:12 25:22 26:3 27:21
89:5 93:12 99:16
107 (1) 24:19
11 (3) 1:25 72:17,18
113 (13) 23:23 24:5,19 27:24 51:19
57:13 58:13 59:17 94:21 96:2,13
97:21 100:9
113th (1) 95:20
114 (1) 24:19

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting-Final
November 14, 2018**

<p>115 (1) 26:8 137-25 (1) 1:6 14 (2) 1:3 55:6 140th (1) 102:13 15 (7) 5:8 30:2 72:20 101:18,22 102:6 103:12 15-year-old (1) 61:7 16-year-old (1) 61:7 17 (2) 29:5 101:17 1931 (1) 20:9 19th (1) 12:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>2 (1) 1:16 200 (1) 61:4 2017 (1) 90:21 2018 (4) 1:3 72:16,24 134:16 20th (1) 134:16 21 (3) 67:5,9 120:11 211 (1) 72:20 24 (3) 4:18 5:9 30:23 26th (2) 5:5 30:12 27th (1) 22:16 29 (2) 67:5,9</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>3 (2) 1:17 72:25 30 (1) 67:9 30s (1) 120:12 311 (5) 13:17,17 15:9 19:10 20:4 38 (2) 73:3 103:11</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <p>4 (1) 1:18 40s (1) 120:12 45 (1) 91:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <p>5 (1) 1:19 50 (2) 48:16 53:9 50-A (5) 47:9 48:13,14 49:12,20 50s (1) 120:12 52 (1) 73:4 55 (1) 91:10 5th (3) 4:16 30:22 31:2</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <p>6 (1) 1:20 6:47 (1) 1:4 60th (1) 44:9 62 (1) 103:17 68 (1) 72:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>7 (1) 1:21 7.1 (1) 72:22 70 (1) 101:10</p>	<p>75 (1) 90:22 76 (1) 21:16</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <p>8 (1) 1:22 8:58 (1) 133:24 85 (1) 91:7</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9 (10) 1:23 24:18 56:10 57:24,25 99:16 115:18 123:12 129:5 131:18</p>	
--	---	--