

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

1

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

PUBLIC MEETING

OCTOBER 10, 2018

4:00 p.m.

-----X

100 Church Street  
New York, New York

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

B E F O R E:

FREDERICK R. DAVIE, Chair

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

Transcribe by:

Deirdre Smith

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of the Minutes
3. Report from the Chair
4. Report from the Executive Director
5. New Business
  - Investigation Update
  - Training Update
6. Old Business
7. Public Comment
8. Adjourn to Executive Session

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

=====

- Erica Bond, Board Member
- Salvatore F. Carcaterra, Board Member
- Jonathan Darche, Esq., Board Member
- Frederick Davie, Board Member
- Frank Dwyer, Board Member
- Lindsay Eason, Board Member
- Nathan Joseph, Board Member
- Michael Rivadeneyra, Esq., Board Member
- John Siegal, Esq., Board Member
- Marbre Stahly-Butts, Esq., Board Member

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

SPEAKERS

=====

Olas Carayannis

Monte Givhan

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

5

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

CHAIR DAVIE: Good afternoon, I would like to call this meeting of the Civilian Complaint Review Board to order.

As a first order business, the Chair will entertain a motion to adopt the minutes from the last meeting.

MR. DARCHE: Motion.

CHAIR DAVIE: Is there a second?

MS. BOND: Second.

CHAIR DAVIE: All those in favor -- are there any corrections or additions to the minutes?

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: Hearing none, all those in favor of adopting the minutes please say aye.

(A chorus of ayes.)

CHAIR DAVIE: Those opposed say no.

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: The ayes have it. The minutes are adopted.

I would like to welcome all of you here this afternoon. As a first order of business I want to extend a very hearty welcome to our

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

6

1 Proceedings

2 newest board member, Mr. Nathan Joseph, who  
3 comes to us as the City Council's Designee from  
4 Staten Island.

5 (Applause)

6 CHAIR DAVIE: Mr. Joseph has spent his  
7 entire life on Staten Island, as I am told, and  
8 he is honored and eager to serve his community  
9 as a board member.

10 As a matter of fact, Mr. Joseph, we know  
11 that you've only been on the board a few weeks,  
12 but we've seen you doing outreach, already, to  
13 the people of Staten Island in an effort to  
14 improve community and police relations.

15 So, we would like to welcome you and give  
16 you a chance to say a few words if you would  
17 like.

18 MR. JOSEPH: Well, thank you for the  
19 welcome, I appreciate that, I'm surprised, but  
20 thank you very much. And I'm really excited to  
21 be here on the CCRB, and I can't wait to  
22 continue to do outreach and improve  
23 community-police relations. I really, really  
24 enjoy that. So, thank you very much.

25 CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you and welcome. Why

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

7

1 Proceedings

2 don't we have other the board members  
3 introduced themselves. And I'll start with  
4 Mr. Siegal, to my left.

5 MR. SIEGAL: John Siegal, and I'm a  
6 Mayoral Designee on the Board.

7 MS. BOND: Erica Bond, Mayoral Designee.

8 MR. DARCHE: Jonathan Darche, Executive  
9 Director.

10 CHAIR DAVIE: Fred Davie, I'm the Chair.

11 MR. RIVADENEYRA: Michael Rivadeneyra,  
12 City Council Bronx Designee.

13 MR. CARCATERRA: Sal Carcaterra, Police  
14 Commissioner Designee.

15 MR. EASON: Good evening everyone, Lindsay  
16 Eason, Police Commissioner Designee.

17 MR. DWYER: Good evening, Frank Dwyer,  
18 Police Commissioner Designee.

19 CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. Thank you all.

20 Before I turn things over to our Executive  
21 Director, Jon Darche, I would just like to talk  
22 a bit about the upcoming Youth Summit, which  
23 will take place on February 5, 2019.

24 This is something we first announced at  
25 last month's board meeting, and I know February

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

8

1 Proceedings

2 feels like a long time away from now, but it  
3 will be here, obviously, before we know it.

4 Our data tells us that police misconduct  
5 affects people of all ages, including young New  
6 Yorkers. I think the question driving everyone  
7 involved in planning this summit is; what are  
8 we as a city, as a people who want to build a  
9 better New York for the next generation, going  
10 to do about youth and police encounters?

11 That's a big question. We can't expect to  
12 have an answer at the end of this summit, but I  
13 do believe this is an important first step for  
14 the City, and I'm looking forward to being a  
15 part of it.

16 As for those who pay close attention to  
17 issues related to the CCRB, there's another  
18 matter that I would like to raise and discuss,  
19 and that is about the CCRB discussion that has  
20 come before the recent Charter Commission, the  
21 Charter Commission that has been convened by  
22 the City Council.

23 This is going to be an ongoing process,  
24 and over the months to come, we the board and  
25 the staff of the CCRB, will have much more to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

9

1 Proceedings

2 say publically about Charter Revision Proposals  
3 related to this board and this agency.

4 For now, as Chair, I want to be clear in  
5 stating that my colleagues of the board and I  
6 are in constant pursuit of practical ways to  
7 make the CCRB a better agency and to make us  
8 better board members for all New Yorkers. And  
9 that same philosophy will apply when we engage  
10 in Charter Commission around potential  
11 revisions.

12 With that, I will now turn the meeting  
13 over to our Executive Director, Jon Darche.

14 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I  
15 would like to welcome all of you to the October  
16 Board Meeting. And I would especially like to  
17 welcome Mr. Joseph to his first board meeting.  
18 It's a, we're very excited to have Mr. Joseph  
19 on the board, and the work he's done with  
20 outreach already shows that, we are very  
21 excited to have you on board and your  
22 participation.

23 As many of you know, the Right To Know Act  
24 is going to go into effect next week, and the  
25 agency has been working very hard preparing

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

10

1 Proceedings

2 materials as part of its public education  
3 function to make sure that the people who live  
4 in the City of New York understand their rights  
5 under the Right To Know Act as it involves  
6 police officers, and we're going to make sure  
7 that we are a presence in the community so that  
8 people understand their rights.

9 Also, today in the meeting, you're going  
10 to be hearing presentations by members of the  
11 Training Unit and Investigations Division, who  
12 will be providing updates on their respective  
13 units.

14 Finally, we have investigators here today  
15 who are going to be assigned to handle any  
16 complaints from people who might be here today.

17 Andrew and Rolando, can you stand up?

18 (Investigators stand up.)

19 MR. DARCHE: So, thanks, guys. If any of  
20 you have any complaints that you would like to  
21 file, they're there in the back.

22 That's it, Mr. Chair.

23 CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, Mr. Darche.

24 We have now been joined by our Brooklyn  
25 Designee to the board, and I'm going to let her

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

11

1 Proceedings

2 introduce herself as she gets settled.

3 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Hello y'all, Marbre,  
4 she and her pronouns, Brooklyn.

5 CHAIR DAVIE: Welcome, Marbre.

6 We will now move into New Business. And  
7 we have two updates on the agenda, one is the  
8 investigation update and the second is the  
9 training update.

10 So I will ask the appropriate staff to  
11 make the presentation.

12 MR. CARAYANNIS: Good afternoon, my name is  
13 Olas Carayannis and I'm the Director of  
14 Quality Assurance and Improvement at the CCRB,  
15 and I'm here to report on the impact of the  
16 increase in video evidence on agency  
17 benchmarks. In your packets, and on the  
18 website, you'll find a memo regarding this  
19 report.

20 So in 2014 the CCRB instituted a benchmark  
21 of an average of 90 days for investigations to  
22 be completed. During the last half of 2014,  
23 the CCRB received 393 video files of roughly  
24 136 gigabytes total.

25 In the first half of 2018 the CCRB

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

12

1 Proceedings

2 received 2,198 video files of roughly 908  
3 gigabytes total. That's a 563-percent increase  
4 in the amount of video evidence we have  
5 received.

6 Corresponding with this increase in the  
7 amount of video evidence, the average time that  
8 an investigation takes has increased. In the  
9 first half of 2018, the average days to  
10 investigate a full investigation was 130 days,  
11 and 71 days when including truncations in that  
12 average.

13 The amount of video evidence received by  
14 the CCRB will continue to rise, and we expect  
15 that the days a case spends in investigations  
16 will have rise as a result.

17 So this increase in video evidence comes  
18 from several sources, but the most notable  
19 source is the continuing rollout of the NYPD's  
20 body-worn camera program.

21 We expect that the amount of video evident  
22 received by the CCRB will continue to rise as  
23 new commands are enrolled in this program.  
24 Once the program is fully implemented,  
25 approximately 20,000 police officers will be

1 Proceedings

2 equipped with body-worn cameras. In turn, we  
3 expect that virtually all CCRB investigations  
4 will include some amount of video evidence.

5 Video evidence increases the amount of  
6 time it takes for CCRB to investigate our  
7 cases. Not only must the investigators obtain  
8 the video and watch the videos for their entire  
9 run time, they must also analyze the evidence,  
10 identify any witnesses and additional leads,  
11 locate those witnesses, and follow those leads.  
12 Often video evidence requires an investigator  
13 go frame by frame to properly analyze the  
14 depicted event.

15 The CCRB has taken some steps to address  
16 the time that this increase in video evidence  
17 adds to investigations. The CCRB has a field  
18 team whose job it is in part to locate evidence  
19 from non-NYPD sources and to extract this  
20 evidence early.

21 The CCRB has also expanded its NYPD  
22 Liaison Unit to assist in the timely  
23 acquisition of body-worn camera footage. Also  
24 the CCRB has obtained a training in powerful  
25 video analysis software to ensure the video

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

14

1 Proceedings

2 evidence is analyzed properly. However, this  
3 software will likely increase the length of  
4 time a case spends in investigations because  
5 proper analysis requires careful processing,  
6 and as a result, more time.

7 The increase in video evidence is a boon  
8 to investigations and we embrace it. The  
9 investigations division is aware of the  
10 challenges that the increase in video evidence  
11 presents to the agency, especially in terms of  
12 expeditious investigations.

13 However, the 2014 benchmarks were created  
14 before the rollout of the body-worn camera  
15 program, when the agency received 563-percent  
16 less video evidence than we currently receive.  
17 Furthermore, the expected increase in  
18 complaints due to the commencement of the Right  
19 To Know Act, and implementation of Phase 2 of  
20 the agency's plan to investigate allegations of  
21 sexual misconduct, will likely cause a further  
22 increase in investigative times.

23 So, in the coming months, the CCRB will  
24 continue to study this issue and we'll revise  
25 the agency benchmarks accordingly.

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

15

1 Proceedings

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIR DAVIE: Are there any questions or  
4 comments?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIR DAVIE: From the members?

7 (No response.)

8 CHAIR DAVIE: From the public?

9 (No response.)

10 CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Well, thank you.  
11 We look forward to continuing to get updates on  
12 our investigation and the timetables for them.  
13 Thank you.

14 ATTORNEY2: Thank you.

15 CHAIR DAVIE: All right.

16 MR. GIVHAN: Good afternoon everyone, my  
17 name Monte Givhan, and for the last two years  
18 I've served as the Director of Training for the  
19 CCRB.

20 I'm here today to provided you with a  
21 brief overview of CCRB's plan to train our  
22 investigators to responsibly and effectively  
23 handle Phase 2 Sexual Misconduct Allegations.

24 Following the board's adoption of the  
25 Sexual Misconduct Resolution in February, the

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

16

1 Proceedings

2 agency began a dialogue with advocates and  
3 experts in the field of sexual assault and  
4 trauma in order to educate ourselves.

5 As a result of those conversations we  
6 determined that the following is needed in  
7 order to effectively and responsibly  
8 investigate Phase 2 Cases; our investigators  
9 must have a foundational understanding of  
10 sexual assault and rape culture. They need a  
11 deep understanding of the neuroscience of  
12 trauma, in particular how trauma impacts memory  
13 and recollection. They need to understand and  
14 embrace a victim-centered approach to  
15 interacting with complainants. They need to  
16 master the nuts and bolts of documenting their  
17 sexual assault investigations. They need to  
18 understand issues related to false reporting.  
19 And they need to know how to manage their own  
20 emotional needs and wellness while  
21 investigating these cases.

22 In the coming months CCRB will be  
23 collaborating with multiple entities to address  
24 these training needs, including Bellevue  
25 Hospital Center, the New York City Alliance for

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

17

1 Proceedings

2 Sexual Assault, FETI, which is an acronym that  
3 stands for Forensic Experiential Trauma  
4 Interviewing, and End Violence Against Woman  
5 International.

6 So, first a word about the Bellevue  
7 Hospital Center collaboration. Beginning this  
8 Saturday, and continuing through the end of the  
9 month, seven CCRB investigators will be  
10 participating in a 40-hour Victim Advocates  
11 Training Program conducted at Bellevue  
12 Hospital.

13 The 40-hours of training takes place on  
14 evenings and weekends and includes speakers  
15 from the district attorney's office and police  
16 department, survivors and other sexual assault  
17 service providers. During the training there  
18 will be roll-plays on interacting with  
19 survivors in a manner consistent with best  
20 known practices for not retraumatizing them.

21 We are also currently in the process of  
22 collaborating with the New York City Alliance  
23 for Sexual Assault to develop at least three  
24 customized trainings for our investigators.  
25 The first of these trainings, which is called

1 Proceedings

2 Understanding Trauma and Adapting a  
3 Victim-Centered Approach, will take place  
4 before the winter holidays.

5 Because trauma is inherent in most of the  
6 work that CCRB does, we've decided to have all  
7 CCRB investigators participate in this  
8 training, not only the Phase 2 investigators.

9 For Phase 2 investigators this will serve  
10 as a primer for the five day FETI certification  
11 training that I will discuss in a  
12 a moment.

13 The New York City Alliance training will  
14 introduce investigators to the neuroscience of  
15 trauma, symptomology, how trauma impacts memory  
16 and narrative, and common responses to trauma  
17 including fight, flight or freeze, and at times  
18 immobility and other implications.

19 We will also collaborate with the Alliance  
20 on developing a customized training that will  
21 provide an overview of sexual assault and rape  
22 culture. That date has yet to be set.

23 The Alliance has a version of this  
24 training that it provides for advocates and for  
25 law enforcement, and we will work together in

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

19

1 Proceedings

2 training, as well as the investigative  
3 division, to adapt that training for our  
4 purposes.

5 And the third customized training that  
6 we're working on in the partnership with the  
7 Alliance will cover the fundamentals of  
8 documenting an investigation. This will be  
9 adapted from trainings that the Alliance does  
10 for law enforcement and for forensic rape  
11 examiners.

12 In addition to helping us to develop and  
13 deliver customized trainings, the Alliance will  
14 be working with the Investigative Division  
15 Leadership to conduct an audit of all CCRB case  
16 management practices, from intake through  
17 notification of disposition, and provide expert  
18 feedback of what current procedures will need  
19 to be modified or overhauled for Phase 2 Sexual  
20 Misconduct Cases.

21 The seventeen Phase 2 Investigators will  
22 also be participating in a five day FETI  
23 training. As I said before, that stand for  
24 Forensic Experiential Trauma Interviewing.  
25 That training will take place between

1 Proceedings

2 January 7th and January 11th. All the Phase 2  
3 Investigators will participate in it. It's a  
4 five-day certification training that is widely  
5 considered to be the gold standard in trauma  
6 informed interviewing protocols. This training  
7 includes a one-day course in the neuroscience  
8 of trauma, a one-day course on FETI  
9 methodology, and then three-day  
10 simulation-based course on practical  
11 applications of FETI methodology when  
12 conducting interviews of trauma victims.

13 Using the Forensic Experiential Trauma  
14 Interview Approach, investigators can gather  
15 the best possible evidence by interviewing  
16 victims in ways that empower and calm them, so  
17 they are able to provided more accurate,  
18 coherent, consistent and persuasive narratives.  
19 All seventeen of the Phase 2 Investigators, as  
20 well as all three members of the training team,  
21 will participate in that training.

22 And then finally, I mentioned End Violence  
23 Against Women International, which has an  
24 online training institute. So to provided our  
25 agency with the capacity to do ongoing

1 Proceedings

2 in-service trainings, and refreshers for Phase  
3 2 Investigators, we've identified End Violence  
4 Against Woman International's Online Training  
5 Institute.

6 EVAWI, which is an acronym for End  
7 Violence Against Women International, is a  
8 Spokane, Washington, based professional  
9 training organization that envisions a world  
10 where gender-based violence is unacceptable,  
11 where perpetrators are held accountable and  
12 victims receive the compassion, support and  
13 justice they deserve.

14 Their online training institute is funded  
15 through a grant from the U.S. Justice  
16 Department Office for Victims of Crime, and it  
17 provides free training courses designed to  
18 improve professional responses to sexual  
19 assault.

20 Participants can access training modules  
21 by enrolling through their website. Currently,  
22 their online training institute offers 18  
23 training modules with a total of a 190 hours of  
24 instruction on topics that include  
25 investigative strategies and tactics, report

1 Proceedings

2 writing, understanding rape kits, and many  
3 other topics important to understanding sexual  
4 assault and investigating allegations of  
5 assault.

6 CCRB's Phase 2 Sexual Misconduct working  
7 group is presently in the process of reviewing  
8 and vetting these online trainings to determine  
9 which ones are likely to be relevant and useful  
10 to Phase 2 Investigators.

11 The organization, EVAWI, has been very  
12 supportive and enthusiastic about CCRB  
13 inhabiting this space and our decision to take  
14 on these cases. And so, similar to the New  
15 York City Alliance, they will be serving as  
16 sort of an institutional mentor to us,  
17 reviewing our policies and practices, and work  
18 with us on developing investigative protocols  
19 for handling Phase 2 cases.

20 CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. Comments or  
21 questions?

22 MR. SIEGAL: Just a quick question, I  
23 don't know if it was covered in the past -- and  
24 that's excellent, all that training, it's not  
25 an easy investigation to do.

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

23

1 Proceedings

2 So on that, how are -- and maybe  
3 investigations can answer it better -- how are  
4 those cases going to be handled? Is it going  
5 to be any investigator or are there going to be  
6 a certain squad of more well trained  
7 investigators to handle these cases?

8 MR. GIVHAN: So the Investigations Unit is  
9 in the process of identifying the seventeen  
10 investigators that will be primarily  
11 responsible. They will be attending all the  
12 trainings that I just referenced.

13 MR. SIEGAL: So, there will be seventeen?  
14 I thought you said seven initially.

15 ATTORNEY2: So, for the Bellevue  
16 training --

17 MR. SIEGAL: Au-hau.

18 MR. GIVHAN: -- since that's not a  
19 training for us, it's a training for their  
20 victim advocates, they were willing to set  
21 aside seven slots.

22 So, they are supportive of our efforts,  
23 they are committed to providing additional  
24 slots in future trainings, but for the training  
25 that will begin this Saturday they set aside

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

24

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

seven slots for us.

MR. DARCHE: Can I jump in for a second?

MR. GIVHAN: Yes, please.

MR. DARCHE: So, we have not settled on one procedure yet that we would recommend to you for how we're going to do this.

Part of it is evaluating the case load that is coming in while we're still in Phase 1 of this program, because we don't know how many people we really need to have trained in order to investigate the Phase 2 complaints yet.

The other issue is we're not sure how we want to structure it. Do we want to have a squad, or two squads, that are just dedicated to this? Or do we want to have people distributed throughout all of the squads so that -- we're still working on actual procedure, but Monte's report is on how we're getting people trained-up, so that we have a group of investigators who can conduct these investigations once we've figured out how to actually do it.

MR. SIEGAL: Yes, and Monte, thank you, that report was excellent, that covered a lot,

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

and the reason I did bring that up is because in my prior life, you know, these are complicated investigations, and I guess what Jon just said, was whether or not it's a group within each squad, or just a squad, we'll know once the cases come in and you can better manage these cases.

I know if, you know, throughout these kinds of investigations, normally, there is not everyone that catches those cases.

MR. GIVHAN: Right.

MR. SIEGAL: There are very specific, very well trained investigators, because of the sensitivity for the victims, and that's why they do that.

MR. GIVHAN: That's exactly right. And just to sort of reinforce what I said earlier, one of the nice things about some of the people that we'll be partnering with on the training is their commitment to this, to this overall project that we're taking on, and they're will to really sort of shepard us through it.

So they will be doing, as I said, an audit of our procedures, and be providing some

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

26

1 Proceedings

2 suggestions. I think we certainly have some  
3 ideas internally, but we really are a looking  
4 and grateful for the access to some experts who  
5 can really tell us whether, whether we're on  
6 the right path.

7 MR. SIEGAL: Great, thank you.

8 CHAIR DAVIE: Other comments or questions?

9 MR. DARCHE: Yes, I have a question.

10 CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

11 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: And thank you for that,  
12 that was super helpful.

13 And you may not be the only person to  
14 answer this, but curious about kind of the  
15 outward facing campaign. We didn't take these  
16 complaints for a long time. This type of  
17 violence is especially difficult for folks to  
18 come forward with. I think as Andrea, who  
19 brought this to us, talked about, fear of  
20 retaliation by the NYPD.

21 So, I'm curious, what is our outward  
22 facing campaign around inviting folks to make  
23 these complaints and protecting them once they  
24 make those?

25 MR. GIVHAN: So, it's something that's

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

27

1 Proceedings

2 very much on our radar. I think that, that  
3 sort of developing the training protocols and  
4 the procedures is sort of the first piece of  
5 that.

6 Outreach is involved in all of the efforts  
7 and there is ongoing conversations, and I think  
8 that the Outreach efforts need to be informed  
9 by what we're doing in practice.

10 But we know that it's, that we'll be, that  
11 once, as word gets out about us taking these  
12 on, there will be an uptick in our ability to  
13 talk, with knowledge, about this work when  
14 we're dealing with the public is critical. So  
15 that's sort of baked into this process of  
16 putting together the training.

17 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: I guess I'm curious too  
18 about how folks who are doing the outreach are  
19 also being trained or instructed. And then if  
20 there is like, if we have a forum who does our  
21 outreach if there is some way they will also  
22 incorporate some of these trauma informed  
23 practices around survivors into that as well,  
24 to make sure that as we're asking folks and  
25 inviting folks in, that we're doing that in way

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

28

1 Proceedings

2 that's sensitive.

3 CHAIR DAVIE: So Yojaira-- Monte, should  
4 we have Yojaira address any of this? Thanks.

5 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you so much. That's a  
6 really good point. We are having our team do  
7 mental health first aid training. Everyone on  
8 our team is certified in that. And then as  
9 these trainings come to us, we want to be  
10 participating in that way, because we don't  
11 want to retraumatize, we want to be able to  
12 discuss it in a way that's informative but not  
13 triggering.

14 And then moving forward we really want to  
15 be able to share additional resources like  
16 ThriveNYC, at the end of the presentation, just  
17 with everyone that is present, to help in that  
18 effort.

19 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: And I think  
20 specifically, this piece around if you report  
21 sexual violence, how folks are safeguarded from  
22 retaliation. Fear is, just from my own  
23 experience of having these conversations, is  
24 really important to folks and a big piece of  
25 fear for folks.

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

29

1 Proceedings

2 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you for bringing that  
3 up. We'll definitely be able to fold that into  
4 the presentation as well. Thanks.

5 MR. DARCHE: One of the ways that the  
6 Outreach Unit has really been very helpful to  
7 this process, and similar to the way the Policy  
8 Unit has been helpful, is their contacts  
9 throughout the community, so they brings us  
10 resources in a way. And Yojaira has been  
11 extremely helpful to us on that front, and the  
12 Training Unit in particular, for developing the  
13 trainings that we have now.

14 So, it's kind of an all hands on deck,  
15 where we're having to kind of transform the  
16 agency to handle these things in a way that, as  
17 Yojaira said, doesn't retrigger or retraumatize  
18 people.

19 CHAIR DAVIE: Other questions, comments?  
20 From members, sure.

21 MR. JOSEPH: I'm glad we're do this. It's  
22 great and it's really important. One question  
23 I have, if you know, you may not know, does  
24 training include everyone? By that I mean men,  
25 woman, transgender, gay? Is that all part of

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

30

1 Proceedings

2 the training?

3 MR. GIVHAN: Are you talking about who  
4 will be trained or --

5 MR. JOSEPH: No.

6 MR. GIVHAN: -- about sexual violence

7 --MR. JOSEPH: About people who have  
8 been assaulted sexually.

9 MR. GIVHAN: The full universe.

10 MR. JOSEPH: Okay.

11 MR. GIVHAN: The full universe because,  
12 you know, our investigators and everybody here  
13 needs to be equipped to handle anything that  
14 comes through the door, and so those, I think  
15 that it's very safe to predict.

16 And we know that many of the vulnerable  
17 populations that you just named are  
18 particularly susceptible, so that is absolutely  
19 critical.

20 One thing that I probably should have said  
21 before, is that I'm excited about this for the  
22 agency as a whole because I think a lot of the  
23 training that we'll be doing around Phase 2 is  
24 going to make us a stronger agency as a whole.

25 Some of the best practices around dealing

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

31

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

with victims of trauma are in no way particular to victims of sexual trauma. So, all these things, as we begin to think about these things and take on trainings and other things that we haven't done before, that those will all make us a better, stronger agency, not just with regard to Phase 2.

CHAIR DAVIE: Any other comments?

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: Questions?

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you Monte, great work, and we look forward to it continuing.

MR. GIVHAN: Thank you.

CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

Is there any Old Business to come before this board?

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: I don't have a list for public comment.

Do we have anyone from the public who wishes to make statement or ask a question?

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: Hearing and seeing none, the

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

32

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Proceedings

Chair will entertain a motion to adjourn to Executive Session. Is there a motion?

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Yeah, I move.

CHAIR DAVIE: Maybe not, maybe we'll just sit here.

The motion has been made and second.

All those in favor to adjourn to Executive Session please say aye.

(A chorus of ayes.)

CHAIR DAVIE: All opposed no.

(No response.)

CHAIR DAVIE: The ayes have it. We are adjourned to Executive Session. Thank you.

(Time noted 4:30 p.m.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATE OF NEW YORK            )  
  ) ss.  
COUNTY OF WESTCHESTER    )

I, DEIRDRE SMITH, Court Reporter and  
Notary Public with and for the County of  
Westchester, State of New York, do hereby certify  
that I reported the proceedings that are  
hereinbefore set forth, and that such transcript is  
a true and accurate record of said proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related to  
any of the parties to this action by blood or  
marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the  
outcome of this matter.

WITNESS MY HAND, 24th day of October, 2018.

Deirdre Smith

Deirdre Smith  
Notary Public

My commission expires:  
April, 2019

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

<b>A</b>		
ability (1) 27:12	asking (1) 27:24	calm (1) 20:16
able (4) 20:17 28:11,15 29:3	assault (10) 16:3,10,17 17:2,16,23 18:21 21:19 22:4,5	camera (3) 12:20 13:23 14:14
absolutely (1) 30:18	assaulted (1) 30:8	cameras (1) 13:2
access (2) 21:20 26:4	assigned (1) 10:15	campaign (2) 26:15,22
accountable (1) 21:11	assistant (1) 13:22	capacity (1) 20:25
accurate (2) 20:17 33:11	Assurance (1) 11:14	Carayannis (3) 4:4 11:12,13
acquisition (1) 13:23	attending (1) 23:11	Carcatera (3) 3:6 7:13,13
acronym (2) 17:2 21:6	attention (1) 8:16	careful (1) 14:5
Act (3) 9:23 10:5 14:19	attorney's (1) 17:15	case (4) 12:15 14:4 19:15 24:8
action (1) 33:14	ATTORNEY2 (2) 15:14 23:15	cases (11) 13:7 16:8,21 19:20 22:14,19 23:4,7 25:7,8,11
actual (1) 24:18	Au-hau (1) 23:17	catches (1) 25:11
adapt (1) 19:3	audit (2) 19:15 25:24	cause (1) 14:21
adapted (1) 19:9	average (4) 11:21 12:7,9,12	CCRB (25) 6:21 8:17,19,25 9:7 11:14,20,23,25 12:14,22 13:3,6 13:15,17,21,24 14:23 15:19 16:22 17:9 18:6,7 19:15 22:12
Adapting (1) 18:2	aware (1) 14:9	CCRB's (2) 15:21 22:6
addition (1) 19:12	aye (2) 5:17 32:9	Center (2) 16:25 17:7
additional (3) 13:10 23:23 28:15	eyes (4) 5:18,21 32:10,13	certain (1) 23:6
additions (1) 5:13		certainly (1) 26:2
address (3) 13:15 16:23 28:4	<b>B</b>	certification (2) 18:10 20:4
adds (1) 13:17	B (1) 1:14	certified (1) 28:8
adjourn (3) 2:13 32:2,8	back (1) 10:21	certify (2) 33:8,13
adjourned (1) 32:14	baked (1) 27:15	Chair (39) 1:15 2:6 5:3,6,10,12,16 5:19,21 6:6,25 7:10,10,19 9:4,14 10:22,23 11:5 15:3,6,8,10,15 22:20 26:8,10 28:3 29:19 31:9,11 31:13,16,20,25 32:2,5,11,13
adopt (1) 5:7	based (1) 21:8	challenges (1) 14:10
adopted (1) 5:22	began (1) 16:2	chance (1) 6:16
adopting (1) 5:17	Beginning (1) 17:7	Charter (4) 8:20,21 9:2,10
adoption (2) 2:5 15:24	believe (1) 8:13	chorus (2) 5:18 32:10
advocates (4) 16:2 17:10 18:24 23:20	Bellevue (4) 16:24 17:6,11 23:15	Church (1) 1:7
afternoon (4) 5:3,24 11:12 15:16	benchmark (1) 11:20	city (10) 6:3 7:12 8:8,14,22 10:4 16:25 17:22 18:13 22:15
agency (13) 9:3,7,25 11:16 14:11 14:15,25 16:2 20:25 29:16 30:22 30:24 31:7	benchmarks (3) 11:17 14:13,25	Civilian (2) 1:3 5:4
agency's (1) 14:20	best (3) 17:19 20:15 30:25	clear (1) 9:4
agenda (2) 2:2 11:7	better (6) 8:9 9:7,8 23:3 25:7 31:7	close (1) 8:16
ages (1) 8:5	big (2) 8:11 28:24	coherent (1) 20:18
aid (1) 28:7	bit (1) 7:22	collaborate (1) 18:19
allegations (3) 14:20 15:23 22:4	blood (1) 33:14	collaborating (2) 16:23 17:22
Alliance (9) 16:25 17:22 18:13,19 18:23 19:7,9,13 22:15	board (29) 1:3 3:3,5,6,7,8,9,10,11 3:12,13,14 5:5 6:2,9,11 7:2,6,25 8:24 9:3,5,8,16,17,19,21 10:25 31:18	collaboration (1) 17:7
ALVAREZ (2) 28:5 29:2	board's (1) 15:24	colleagues (1) 9:5
amount (6) 12:4,7,13,21 13:4,5	body-worn (4) 12:20 13:2,23 14:14	come (6) 8:20,24 25:7 26:18 28:9 31:17
analysis (2) 13:25 14:5	bolts (1) 16:16	comes (3) 6:3 12:17 30:14
analyze (2) 13:9,13	Bond (4) 3:5 5:11 7:7,7	coming (3) 14:23 16:22 24:9
analyzed (1) 14:2	boon (1) 14:7	commands (1) 12:23
Andrea (1) 26:18	brief (1) 15:21	commencement (1) 14:18
Andrew (1) 10:17	bring (1) 25:2	comment (2) 2:12 31:21
announced (1) 7:24	bringing (1) 29:2	comments (5) 15:4 22:20 26:8 29:19 31:9
answer (3) 8:12 23:3 26:14	brings (1) 29:9	commission (4) 8:20,21 9:10 33:21
Applause (1) 6:5	Bronx (1) 7:12	Commissioner (3) 7:14,16,18
applications (1) 20:11	Brooklyn (2) 10:24 11:4	commitment (1) 25:21
apply (1) 9:9	brought (1) 26:19	
appreciate (1) 6:19	build (1) 8:8	
approach (3) 16:14 18:3 20:14	business (6) 2:8,11 5:6,24 11:6 31:17	
appropriate (1) 11:10		
approximately (1) 12:25	<b>C</b>	
April (1) 33:22	call (2) 2:4 5:4	
aside (2) 23:21,25	called (1) 17:25	

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

**committed (1)** 23:23  
**common (1)** 18:16  
**community (4)** 6:8,14 10:7 29:9  
**community-police (1)** 6:23  
**compassion (1)** 21:12  
**complainants (1)** 16:15  
**Complaint (2)** 1:3 5:4  
**complaints (6)** 10:16,20 14:18  
 24:12 26:16,23  
**completed (1)** 11:22  
**complicated (1)** 25:4  
**conduct (2)** 19:15 24:21  
**conducted (1)** 17:11  
**conducting (1)** 20:12  
**considered (1)** 20:5  
**consistent (2)** 17:19 20:18  
**constant (1)** 9:6  
**contacts (1)** 29:8  
**continue (4)** 6:22 12:14,22 14:24  
**continuing (4)** 12:19 15:11 17:8  
 31:14  
**convened (1)** 8:21  
**conversations (3)** 16:5 27:7 28:23  
**corrections (1)** 5:13  
**Corresponding (1)** 12:6  
**Council (2)** 7:12 8:22  
**Council's (1)** 6:3  
**County (2)** 33:4,7  
**course (3)** 20:7,8,10  
**courses (1)** 21:17  
**Court (1)** 33:6  
**cover (1)** 19:7  
**covered (2)** 22:23 24:25  
**created (1)** 14:13  
**Crime (1)** 21:16  
**critical (2)** 27:14 30:19  
**culture (2)** 16:10 18:22  
**curious (3)** 26:14,21 27:17  
**current (1)** 19:18  
**currently (3)** 14:16 17:21 21:21  
**customized (4)** 17:24 18:20 19:5  
 19:13

**D**

**Darche (14)** 1:16 3:7 5:9 7:8,8,21  
 9:13,14 10:19,23 24:3,5 26:9  
 29:5  
**data (1)** 8:4  
**date (1)** 18:22  
**Davie (34)** 1:15 3:8 5:3,10,12,16,19  
 5:21 6:6,25 7:10,10,19 10:23  
 11:5 15:3,6,8,10,15 22:20 26:8  
 26:10 28:3 29:19 31:9,11,13,16  
 31:20,25 32:5,11,13  
**day (3)** 18:10 19:22 33:18  
**days (5)** 11:21 12:9,10,11,15  
**dealing (2)** 27:14 30:25

**decided (1)** 18:6  
**decision (1)** 22:13  
**deck (1)** 29:14  
**dedicated (1)** 24:15  
**deep (1)** 16:11  
**definitely (1)** 29:3  
**Deirdre (3)** 1:19 33:6,21  
**deliver (1)** 19:13  
**department (2)** 17:16 21:16  
**depicted (1)** 13:14  
**deserve (1)** 21:13  
**designed (1)** 21:17  
**Designee (8)** 6:3 7:6,7,12,14,16,18  
 10:25  
**determine (1)** 22:8  
**determined (1)** 16:6  
**develop (2)** 17:23 19:12  
**developing (4)** 18:20 22:18 27:3  
 29:12  
**dialogue (1)** 16:2  
**difficult (1)** 26:17  
**Director (7)** 1:16 2:7 7:9,21 9:13  
 11:13 15:18  
**discuss (3)** 8:18 18:11 28:12  
**discussion (1)** 8:19  
**disposition (1)** 19:17  
**distributed (1)** 24:17  
**district (1)** 17:15  
**division (4)** 10:11 14:9 19:3,14  
**documenting (2)** 16:16 19:8  
**doing (6)** 6:12 25:24 27:9,18,25  
 30:23  
**door (1)** 30:14  
**driving (1)** 8:6  
**due (1)** 14:18  
**Dwyer (3)** 3:9 7:17,17

**E**

**E (2)** 1:14,14  
**eager (1)** 6:8  
**earlier (1)** 25:18  
**early (1)** 13:20  
**Eason (7)** 3:10 7:15,16 29:21 30:5  
 30:7,10  
**easy (1)** 22:25  
**educate (1)** 16:4  
**education (1)** 10:2  
**effect (1)** 9:24  
**effectively (2)** 15:22 16:7  
**effort (2)** 6:13 28:18  
**efforts (3)** 23:22 27:6,8  
**embrace (2)** 14:8 16:14  
**emotional (1)** 16:20  
**empower (1)** 20:16  
**encounters (1)** 8:10  
**enforcement (2)** 18:25 19:10  
**engage (1)** 9:9

**enjoy (1)** 6:24  
**enrolled (1)** 12:23  
**enrolling (1)** 21:21  
**ensure (1)** 13:25  
**entertain (2)** 5:7 32:2  
**enthusiastic (1)** 22:12  
**entire (2)** 6:7 13:8  
**entities (1)** 16:23  
**envisions (1)** 21:9  
**equipped (2)** 13:2 30:13  
**Erica (2)** 3:5 7:7  
**especially (3)** 9:16 14:11 26:17  
**Esq (5)** 1:16 3:7,12,13,14  
**evaluating (1)** 24:8  
**EVAWI (2)** 21:6 22:11  
**evening (2)** 7:15,17  
**evenings (1)** 17:14  
**event (1)** 13:14  
**everybody (1)** 30:12  
**evidence (17)** 11:16 12:4,7,13,17  
 13:4,5,9,12,16,18,20 14:2,7,10  
 14:16 20:15  
**evident (1)** 12:21  
**exactly (1)** 25:17  
**examiners (1)** 19:11  
**excellent (2)** 22:24 24:25  
**excited (4)** 6:20 9:18,21 30:21  
**Executive (9)** 1:16 2:7,13 7:8,20  
 9:13 32:3,8,14  
**expanded (1)** 13:21  
**expect (4)** 8:11 12:14,21 13:3  
**expected (1)** 14:17  
**expeditious (1)** 14:12  
**experience (1)** 28:23  
**Experiential (3)** 17:3 19:24 20:13  
**expert (1)** 19:17  
**experts (2)** 16:3 26:4  
**expires (1)** 33:21  
**extend (1)** 5:25  
**extract (1)** 13:19  
**extremely (1)** 29:11

**F**

**F (2)** 1:14 3:6  
**facing (2)** 26:15,22  
**fact (1)** 6:10  
**false (1)** 16:18  
**favor (3)** 5:12,17 32:8  
**fear (3)** 26:19 28:22,25  
**February (3)** 7:23,25 15:25  
**feedback (1)** 19:18  
**feels (1)** 8:2  
**FETI (5)** 17:2 18:10 19:22 20:8,11  
**field (2)** 13:17 16:3  
**fight (1)** 18:17  
**figured (1)** 24:22  
**file (1)** 10:21

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

**files (2)** 11:23 12:2  
**finally (2)** 10:14 20:22  
**find (1)** 11:18  
**first (11)** 5:6,24 7:24 8:13 9:17  
 11:25 12:9 17:6,25 27:4 28:7  
**five (2)** 18:10 19:22  
**five-day (1)** 20:4  
**flight (1)** 18:17  
**fold (1)** 29:3  
**folks (8)** 26:17,22 27:18,24,25  
 28:21,24,25  
**follow (1)** 13:11  
**following (2)** 15:24 16:6  
**footage (1)** 13:23  
**forensic (4)** 17:3 19:10,24 20:13  
**forth (1)** 33:10  
**forum (1)** 27:20  
**forward (5)** 8:14 15:11 26:18 28:14  
 31:14  
**foundational (1)** 16:9  
**frame (2)** 13:13,13  
**Frank (2)** 3:9 7:17  
**Fred (1)** 7:10  
**Frederick (2)** 1:15 3:8  
**free (1)** 21:17  
**freeze (1)** 18:17  
**front (1)** 29:11  
**full (3)** 12:10 30:9,11  
**fully (1)** 12:24  
**function (1)** 10:3  
**fundamentals (1)** 19:7  
**funded (1)** 21:14  
**further (2)** 14:21 33:13  
**Furthermore (1)** 14:17  
**future (1)** 23:24

**G**

**gather (1)** 20:14  
**gay (1)** 29:25  
**gender-based (1)** 21:10  
**generation (1)** 8:9  
**getting (1)** 24:20  
**gigabytes (2)** 11:24 12:3  
**give (1)** 6:15  
**Givhan (14)** 4:5 15:16,17 23:8,18  
 24:4 25:12,17 26:25 30:3,6,9,11  
 31:15  
**glad (1)** 29:21  
**go (2)** 9:24 13:13  
**going (12)** 8:9,23 9:24 10:6,9,15  
 10:25 23:4,4,5 24:7 30:24  
**gold (1)** 20:5  
**good (6)** 5:3 7:15,17 11:12 15:16  
 28:6  
**grant (1)** 21:15  
**grateful (1)** 26:4  
**great (3)** 26:7 29:22 31:13

**group (3)** 22:7 24:21 25:5  
**guess (2)** 25:4 27:17  
**guys (1)** 10:19

**H**

**half (3)** 11:22,25 12:9  
**HAND (1)** 33:18  
**handle (5)** 10:15 15:23 23:7 29:16  
 30:13  
**handled (1)** 23:4  
**handling (1)** 22:19  
**hands (1)** 29:14  
**hard (1)** 9:25  
**health (1)** 28:7  
**hearing (3)** 5:16 10:10 31:25  
**hearty (1)** 5:25  
**held (1)** 21:11  
**Hello (1)** 11:3  
**help (1)** 28:17  
**helpful (4)** 26:12 29:6,8,11  
**helping (1)** 19:12  
**hereinbefore (1)** 33:10  
**holidays (1)** 18:4  
**honored (1)** 6:8  
**Hospital (3)** 16:25 17:7,12  
**hours (1)** 21:23

**I**

**ideas (1)** 26:3  
**identified (1)** 21:3  
**identify (1)** 13:10  
**identifying (1)** 23:9  
**immobility (1)** 18:18  
**impact (1)** 11:15  
**impacts (2)** 16:12 18:15  
**implementation (1)** 14:19  
**implemented (1)** 12:24  
**implications (1)** 18:18  
**important (4)** 8:13 22:3 28:24  
 29:22  
**improve (3)** 6:14,22 21:18  
**Improvement (1)** 11:14  
**in-service (1)** 21:2  
**include (3)** 13:4 21:24 29:24  
**includes (2)** 17:14 20:7  
**including (4)** 8:5 12:11 16:24  
 18:17  
**incorporate (1)** 27:22  
**increase (10)** 11:16 12:3,6,17  
 13:16 14:3,7,10,17,22  
**increased (1)** 12:8  
**increases (1)** 13:5  
**informative (1)** 28:12  
**informed (3)** 20:6 27:8,22  
**inhabiting (1)** 22:13  
**inherent (1)** 18:5  
**initially (1)** 23:14

**institute (4)** 20:24 21:5,14,22  
**instituted (1)** 11:20  
**institutional (1)** 22:16  
**instructed (1)** 27:19  
**instruction (1)** 21:24  
**intake (1)** 19:16  
**interacting (2)** 16:15 17:18  
**interested (1)** 33:15  
**internally (1)** 26:3  
**International (3)** 17:5 20:23 21:7  
**International's (1)** 21:4  
**Interview (1)** 20:14  
**interviewing (4)** 17:4 19:24 20:6  
 20:15  
**interviews (1)** 20:12  
**introduce (2)** 11:2 18:14  
**introduced (1)** 7:3  
**investigate (5)** 12:10 13:6 14:20  
 16:8 24:12  
**investigating (2)** 16:21 22:4  
**investigation (7)** 2:9 11:8 12:8,10  
 15:12 19:8 22:25  
**investigations (15)** 10:11 11:21  
 12:15 13:3,17 14:4,8,9,12 16:17  
 23:3,8 24:22 25:4,10  
**investigative (5)** 14:22 19:2,14  
 21:25 22:18  
**investigator (2)** 13:12 23:5  
**investigators (22)** 10:14,18 13:7  
 15:22 16:8 17:9,24 18:7,8,9,14  
 19:21 20:3,14,19 21:3 22:10 23:7  
 23:10 24:21 25:14 30:12  
**inviting (2)** 26:22 27:25  
**involved (2)** 8:7 27:6  
**involves (1)** 10:5  
**Island (3)** 6:4,7,13  
**issue (2)** 14:24 24:13  
**issues (2)** 8:17 16:18

**J**

**January (2)** 20:2,2  
**job (1)** 13:18  
**John (2)** 3:13 7:5  
**joined (1)** 10:24  
**Jon (3)** 7:21 9:13 25:5  
**Jonathan (3)** 1:16 3:7 7:8  
**Joseph (7)** 3:11 6:2,6,10,18 9:17  
 9:18  
**jump (1)** 24:3  
**justice (2)** 21:13,15

**K**

**kind (3)** 26:14 29:14,15  
**kinds (1)** 25:10  
**kits (1)** 22:2  
**know (19)** 6:10 7:25 8:3 9:23,23  
 10:5 14:19 16:19 22:23 24:10

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

<p>25:3,6,9,9 27:10 29:23,23 30:12 30:16 <b>knowledge (1)</b> 27:13 <b>known (1)</b> 17:20</p>	<p><b>month (1)</b> 17:9 <b>month's (1)</b> 7:25 <b>months (3)</b> 8:24 14:23 16:22 <b>motion (5)</b> 5:7,9 32:2,3,7 <b>move (2)</b> 11:6 32:4 <b>moving (1)</b> 28:14 <b>multiple (1)</b> 16:23</p>	<p>27:18,21 29:6 <b>outward (2)</b> 26:15,21 <b>overall (1)</b> 25:21 <b>overhauled (1)</b> 19:19 <b>overview (2)</b> 15:21 18:21</p>
<b>L</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>P</b>
<p><b>law (2)</b> 18:25 19:10 <b>Leadership (1)</b> 19:15 <b>leads (2)</b> 13:10,11 <b>left (1)</b> 7:4 <b>length (1)</b> 14:3 <b>Liaison (1)</b> 13:22 <b>life (2)</b> 6:7 25:3 <b>Lindsay (2)</b> 3:10 7:15 <b>list (1)</b> 31:20 <b>live (1)</b> 10:3 <b>load (1)</b> 24:8 <b>locate (2)</b> 13:11,18 <b>long (2)</b> 8:2 26:16 <b>look (2)</b> 15:11 31:14 <b>looking (2)</b> 8:14 26:3 <b>lot (2)</b> 24:25 30:22</p>	<p><b>name (2)</b> 11:12 15:17 <b>named (1)</b> 30:17 <b>narrative (1)</b> 18:16 <b>narratives (1)</b> 20:18 <b>Nathan (2)</b> 3:11 6:2 <b>need (8)</b> 16:10,13,15,17,19 19:18 24:11 27:8 <b>needed (1)</b> 16:6 <b>needs (3)</b> 16:20,24 30:13 <b>neuroscience (3)</b> 16:11 18:14 20:7 <b>new (15)</b> 1:8,8 2:8 8:5,9 9:8 10:4 11:6 12:23 16:25 17:22 18:13 22:14 33:2,8 <b>newest (1)</b> 6:2 <b>nice (1)</b> 25:19 <b>non-NYPD (1)</b> 13:19 <b>normally (1)</b> 25:10 <b>notable (1)</b> 12:18 <b>Notary (2)</b> 33:7,22 <b>noted (1)</b> 32:15 <b>notification (1)</b> 19:17 <b>nuts (1)</b> 16:16 <b>NYPD (2)</b> 13:21 26:20 <b>NYPD's (1)</b> 12:19</p>	<p><b>p.m (2)</b> 1:6 32:15 <b>packets (1)</b> 11:17 <b>part (5)</b> 8:15 10:2 13:18 24:8 29:25 <b>Participants (1)</b> 21:20 <b>participate (3)</b> 18:7 20:3,21 <b>participating (3)</b> 17:10 19:22 28:10 <b>participation (1)</b> 9:22 <b>particular (3)</b> 16:12 29:12 31:2 <b>particularly (1)</b> 30:18 <b>parties (1)</b> 33:14 <b>partnering (1)</b> 25:20 <b>partnership (1)</b> 19:6 <b>path (1)</b> 26:6 <b>pay (1)</b> 8:16 <b>people (12)</b> 6:13 8:5,8 10:3,8,16 24:11,16,20 25:19 29:18 30:7 <b>perpetrators (1)</b> 21:11 <b>person (1)</b> 26:13 <b>persuasive (1)</b> 20:18 <b>Phase (17)</b> 14:19 15:23 16:8 18:8 18:9 19:19,21 20:2,19 21:2 22:6 22:10,19 24:9,12 30:23 31:8 <b>philosophy (1)</b> 9:9 <b>piece (3)</b> 27:4 28:20,24 <b>place (4)</b> 7:23 17:13 18:3 19:25 <b>plan (2)</b> 14:20 15:21 <b>planning (1)</b> 8:7 <b>please (3)</b> 5:17 24:4 32:9 <b>point (1)</b> 28:6 <b>police (9)</b> 6:14 7:13,16,18 8:4,10 10:6 12:25 17:15 <b>policies (1)</b> 22:17 <b>Policy (1)</b> 29:7 <b>populations (1)</b> 30:17 <b>possible (1)</b> 20:15 <b>potential (1)</b> 9:10 <b>powerful (1)</b> 13:24 <b>practical (2)</b> 9:6 20:10 <b>practice (1)</b> 27:9 <b>practices (5)</b> 17:20 19:16 22:17 27:23 30:25 <b>predict (1)</b> 30:15 <b>preparing (1)</b> 9:25 <b>presence (1)</b> 10:7 <b>present (2)</b> 3:3 28:17 <b>presentation (3)</b> 11:11 28:16 29:4 <b>presentations (1)</b> 10:10 <b>presently (1)</b> 22:7 <b>presents (1)</b> 14:11 <b>primarily (1)</b> 23:10</p>
<b>M</b>	<b>O</b>	
<p><b>manage (2)</b> 16:19 25:8 <b>management (1)</b> 19:16 <b>manner (1)</b> 17:19 <b>Marbre (3)</b> 3:14 11:3,5 <b>marriage (1)</b> 33:15 <b>master (1)</b> 16:16 <b>materials (1)</b> 10:2 <b>matter (3)</b> 6:10 8:18 33:16 <b>Mayoral (2)</b> 7:6,7 <b>mean (1)</b> 29:24 <b>meeting (9)</b> 1:4 2:2 5:4,8 7:25 9:12 9:16,17 10:9 <b>member (12)</b> 3:5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12 3:13,14 6:2,9 <b>members (7)</b> 3:3 7:2 9:8 10:10 15:6 20:20 29:20 <b>memo (1)</b> 11:18 <b>memory (2)</b> 16:12 18:15 <b>men (1)</b> 29:24 <b>mental (1)</b> 28:7 <b>mentioned (1)</b> 20:22 <b>mentor (1)</b> 22:16 <b>methodology (2)</b> 20:9,11 <b>Michael (2)</b> 3:12 7:11 <b>minutes (5)</b> 2:5 5:7,14,17,22 <b>misconduct (6)</b> 8:4 14:21 15:23,25 19:20 22:6 <b>modified (1)</b> 19:19 <b>modules (2)</b> 21:20,23 <b>moment (1)</b> 18:12 <b>Monte (5)</b> 4:5 15:17 24:24 28:3 31:13 <b>Monte's (1)</b> 24:19</p>	<p><b>O (1)</b> 1:14 <b>obtain (1)</b> 13:7 <b>obtained (1)</b> 13:24 <b>obviously (1)</b> 8:3 <b>October (3)</b> 1:5 9:15 33:18 <b>offers (1)</b> 21:22 <b>office (2)</b> 17:15 21:16 <b>officers (2)</b> 10:6 12:25 <b>Okay (1)</b> 30:10 <b>Olas (2)</b> 4:4 11:13 <b>Old (2)</b> 2:11 31:17 <b>once (5)</b> 12:24 24:22 25:7 26:23 27:11 <b>one-day (2)</b> 20:7,8 <b>ones (1)</b> 22:9 <b>ongoing (3)</b> 8:23 20:25 27:7 <b>online (5)</b> 20:24 21:4,14,22 22:8 <b>opposed (2)</b> 5:19 32:11 <b>order (7)</b> 2:4 5:5,6,24 16:4,7 24:11 <b>organization (2)</b> 21:9 22:11 <b>outcome (1)</b> 33:16 <b>outreach (8)</b> 6:12,22 9:20 27:6,8</p>	

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

**primer (1)** 18:10  
**prior (1)** 25:3  
**probably (1)** 30:20  
**procedure (2)** 24:6,19  
**procedures (3)** 19:18 25:25 27:4  
**proceedings (31)** 1:12 5:1 6:1 7:1  
 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1  
 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1  
 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1  
 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1  
 33:9,11  
**process (6)** 8:23 17:21 22:7 23:9  
 27:15 29:7  
**processing (1)** 14:5  
**professional (2)** 21:8,18  
**program (6)** 12:20,23,24 14:15  
 17:11 24:10  
**project (1)** 25:22  
**pronouns (1)** 11:4  
**proper (1)** 14:5  
**properly (2)** 13:13 14:2  
**Proposals (1)** 9:2  
**protecting (1)** 26:23  
**protocols (3)** 20:6 22:18 27:3  
**provide (2)** 18:21 19:17  
**provided (3)** 15:20 20:17,24  
**providers (1)** 17:17  
**provides (2)** 18:24 21:17  
**providing (3)** 10:12 23:23 25:25  
**public (10)** 1:4 2:2,12 10:2 15:8  
 27:14 31:21,22 33:7,22  
**publically (1)** 9:2  
**purposes (1)** 19:4  
**pursuit (1)** 9:6  
**putting (1)** 27:16

**Q**

**Quality (1)** 11:14  
**question (6)** 8:6,11 22:22 26:9  
 29:22 31:23  
**questions (5)** 15:3 22:21 26:8  
 29:19 31:11  
**quick (1)** 22:22

**R**

**R (2)** 1:14,15  
**radar (1)** 27:2  
**raise (1)** 8:18  
**rape (4)** 16:10 18:21 19:10 22:2  
**really (12)** 6:20,23,23 24:11 25:23  
 26:3,5 28:6,14,24 29:6,22  
**reason (1)** 25:2  
**receive (2)** 14:16 21:12  
**received (6)** 11:23 12:2,5,13,22  
 14:15  
**recollection (1)** 16:13  
**recommend (1)** 24:6

**record (1)** 33:11  
**referenced (1)** 23:12  
**refreshers (1)** 21:2  
**regard (1)** 31:8  
**regarding (1)** 11:18  
**reinforce (1)** 25:18  
**related (4)** 8:17 9:3 16:18 33:13  
**relations (2)** 6:14,23  
**relevant (1)** 22:9  
**report (8)** 2:6,7 11:15,19 21:25  
 24:19,25 28:20  
**reported (1)** 33:9  
**Reporter (1)** 33:6  
**reporting (1)** 16:18  
**requires (2)** 13:12 14:5  
**Resolution (1)** 15:25  
**resources (2)** 28:15 29:10  
**respective (1)** 10:12  
**response (10)** 5:15,20 15:5,7,9  
 31:10,12,19,24 32:12  
**responses (2)** 18:16 21:18  
**responsible (1)** 23:11  
**responsibly (2)** 15:22 16:7  
**result (3)** 12:16 14:6 16:5  
**retaliation (2)** 26:20 28:22  
**retraumatize (2)** 28:11 29:17  
**retraumatizing (1)** 17:20  
**retrigger (1)** 29:17  
**Review (2)** 1:3 5:5  
**reviewing (2)** 22:7,17  
**revise (1)** 14:24  
**Revision (1)** 9:2  
**revisions (1)** 9:11  
**right (8)** 9:23 10:5 14:18 15:10,15  
 25:12,17 26:6  
**rights (2)** 10:4,8  
**rise (3)** 12:14,16,22  
**Rivadeneira (3)** 3:12 7:11,11  
**Rolando (1)** 10:17  
**roll-plays (1)** 17:18  
**rollout (2)** 12:19 14:14  
**roughly (2)** 11:23 12:2  
**run (1)** 13:9

**S**

**safe (1)** 30:15  
**safeguarded (1)** 28:21  
**Sal (1)** 7:13  
**Salvatore (1)** 3:6  
**Saturday (2)** 17:8 23:25  
**second (5)** 5:10,11 11:8 24:3 32:7  
**seeing (1)** 31:25  
**seen (1)** 6:12  
**sensitive (1)** 28:2  
**sensitivity (1)** 25:15  
**serve (2)** 6:8 18:9  
**served (1)** 15:18

**service (1)** 17:17  
**serving (1)** 22:15  
**Session (4)** 2:13 32:3,9,14  
**set (4)** 18:22 23:20,25 33:10  
**settled (2)** 11:2 24:5  
**seven (4)** 17:9 23:14,21 24:2  
**seventeen (4)** 19:21 20:19 23:9,13  
**sexual (17)** 14:21 15:23,25 16:3,10  
 16:17 17:2,16,23 18:21 19:19  
 21:18 22:3,6 28:21 30:6 31:3  
**sexually (1)** 30:8  
**share (1)** 28:15  
**shepard (1)** 25:23  
**shows (1)** 9:20  
**Siegal (10)** 3:13 7:4,5,5 22:22  
 23:13,17 24:24 25:13 26:7  
**similar (2)** 22:14 29:7  
**simulation-based (1)** 20:10  
**sit (1)** 32:6  
**slots (3)** 23:21,24 24:2  
**Smith (3)** 1:19 33:6,21  
**software (2)** 13:25 14:3  
**sort (6)** 22:16 25:18,23 27:3,4,15  
**source (1)** 12:19  
**sources (2)** 12:18 13:19  
**space (1)** 22:13  
**speakers (2)** 4:2 17:14  
**specific (1)** 25:13  
**specifically (1)** 28:20  
**spends (2)** 12:15 14:4  
**spent (1)** 6:6  
**Spokane (1)** 21:8  
**squad (4)** 23:6 24:15 25:6,6  
**squads (2)** 24:15,17  
**ss (1)** 33:3  
**staff (2)** 8:25 11:10  
**Stahly-Butts (6)** 3:14 11:3 26:11  
 27:17 28:19 32:4  
**stand (3)** 10:17,18 19:23  
**standard (1)** 20:5  
**stands (1)** 17:3  
**start (1)** 7:3  
**State (2)** 33:2,8  
**statement (1)** 31:23  
**Staten (3)** 6:4,7,13  
**stating (1)** 9:5  
**step (1)** 8:13  
**steps (1)** 13:15  
**strategies (1)** 21:25  
**Street (1)** 1:7  
**stronger (2)** 30:24 31:7  
**structure (1)** 24:14  
**study (1)** 14:24  
**suggestions (1)** 26:2  
**summit (3)** 7:22 8:7,12  
**super (1)** 26:12  
**support (1)** 21:12

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

<p><b>supportive (2)</b> 22:12 23:22  <b>sure (6)</b> 10:3,6 24:13 26:10 27:24 29:20  <b>surprised (1)</b> 6:19  <b>survivors (3)</b> 17:16,19 27:23  <b>susceptible (1)</b> 30:18  <b>symptomology (1)</b> 18:15</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>T</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>tactics (1)</b> 21:25  <b>take (6)</b> 7:23 18:3 19:25 22:13 26:15 31:5  <b>taken (1)</b> 13:15  <b>takes (3)</b> 12:8 13:6 17:13  <b>talk (2)</b> 7:21 27:13  <b>talked (1)</b> 26:19  <b>talking (1)</b> 30:3  <b>team (4)</b> 13:18 20:20 28:6,8  <b>tell (1)</b> 26:5  <b>tells (1)</b> 8:4  <b>terms (1)</b> 14:11  <b>thank (22)</b> 6:18,20,24,25 7:19,19 9:14 10:23 15:2,10,13,14 22:20 24:24 26:7,11 28:5 29:2 31:13,15 31:16 32:14  <b>thanks (3)</b> 10:19 28:4 29:4  <b>thing (1)</b> 30:20  <b>things (6)</b> 7:20 25:19 29:16 31:4,4 31:5  <b>think (9)</b> 8:6 26:2,18 27:2,7 28:19 30:14,22 31:4  <b>third (1)</b> 19:5  <b>thought (1)</b> 23:14  <b>three (2)</b> 17:23 20:20  <b>three-day (1)</b> 20:9  <b>ThriveNYC (1)</b> 28:16  <b>time (9)</b> 8:2 12:7 13:6,9,16 14:4,6 26:16 32:15  <b>timely (1)</b> 13:22  <b>times (2)</b> 14:22 18:17  <b>timetables (1)</b> 15:12  <b>today (4)</b> 10:9,14,16 15:20  <b>told (1)</b> 6:7  <b>topics (2)</b> 21:24 22:3  <b>total (3)</b> 11:24 12:3 21:23  <b>train (1)</b> 15:21  <b>trained (5)</b> 23:6 24:11 25:14 27:19 30:4  <b>trained-up (1)</b> 24:20  <b>training (44)</b> 2:10 10:11 11:9 13:24 15:18 16:24 17:11,13,17 18:8,11 18:13,20,24 19:2,3,5,23,25 20:4 20:6,20,21,24 21:4,9,14,17,20,22 21:23 22:24 23:16,19,19,24 25:20 27:3,16 28:7 29:12,24 30:2 30:23  <b>trainings (11)</b> 17:24,25 19:9,13</p>	<p>21:2 22:8 23:12,24 28:9 29:13 31:5  <b>Transcribe (1)</b> 1:18  <b>transcript (2)</b> 1:12 33:10  <b>transform (1)</b> 29:15  <b>transgender (1)</b> 29:25  <b>trauma (17)</b> 16:4,12,12 17:3 18:2,5 18:15,15,16 19:24 20:5,8,12,13 27:22 31:2,3  <b>triggering (1)</b> 28:13  <b>true (1)</b> 33:11  <b>truncations (1)</b> 12:11  <b>turn (3)</b> 7:20 9:12 13:2  <b>two (3)</b> 11:7 15:17 24:15  <b>type (1)</b> 26:16</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>U</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>U.S (1)</b> 21:15  <b>unacceptable (1)</b> 21:10  <b>understand (4)</b> 10:4,8 16:13,18  <b>understanding (5)</b> 16:9,11 18:2 22:2,3  <b>Unit (6)</b> 10:11 13:22 23:8 29:6,8,12  <b>units (1)</b> 10:13  <b>universe (2)</b> 30:9,11  <b>upcoming (1)</b> 7:22  <b>update (4)</b> 2:9,10 11:8,9  <b>updates (3)</b> 10:12 11:7 15:11  <b>uptick (1)</b> 27:12  <b>useful (1)</b> 22:9</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>V</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>version (1)</b> 18:23  <b>vetting (1)</b> 22:8  <b>victim (2)</b> 17:10 23:20  <b>victim-centered (2)</b> 16:14 18:3  <b>victims (7)</b> 20:12,16 21:12,16 25:15 31:2,3  <b>video (18)</b> 11:16,23 12:2,4,7,13,17 12:21 13:4,5,8,12,16,25,25 14:7 14:10,16  <b>videos (1)</b> 13:8  <b>violence (8)</b> 17:4 20:22 21:3,7,10 26:17 28:21 30:6  <b>virtually (1)</b> 13:3  <b>vulnerable (1)</b> 30:16</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>W</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>wait (1)</b> 6:21  <b>want (10)</b> 5:25 8:8 9:4 24:14,14,16 28:9,11,11,14  <b>Washington (1)</b> 21:8  <b>watch (1)</b> 13:8  <b>way (9)</b> 27:21,25 28:10,12 29:7,10 29:16 31:2 33:15  <b>ways (3)</b> 9:6 20:16 29:5  <b>we'll (7)</b> 14:24 25:6,20 27:10 29:3</p>	<p>30:23 32:5  <b>we're (16)</b> 9:18 10:6 19:6 24:7,9,13 24:18,19 25:22 26:5 27:9,14,24 27:25 29:15,21  <b>we've (4)</b> 6:12 18:6 21:3 24:22  <b>website (2)</b> 11:18 21:21  <b>week (1)</b> 9:24  <b>weekends (1)</b> 17:14  <b>weeks (1)</b> 6:11  <b>welcome (8)</b> 5:23,25 6:15,19,25 9:15,17 11:5  <b>wellness (1)</b> 16:20  <b>Westchester (2)</b> 33:4,8  <b>widely (1)</b> 20:4  <b>willing (1)</b> 23:20  <b>winter (1)</b> 18:4  <b>wishes (1)</b> 31:23  <b>WITNESS (1)</b> 33:18  <b>witnesses (2)</b> 13:10,11  <b>woman (3)</b> 17:4 21:4 29:25  <b>Women (2)</b> 20:23 21:7  <b>word (2)</b> 17:6 27:11  <b>words (1)</b> 6:16  <b>work (6)</b> 9:19 18:6,25 22:17 27:13 31:13  <b>working (5)</b> 9:25 19:6,14 22:6 24:18  <b>world (1)</b> 21:9  <b>writing (1)</b> 22:2</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>X</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>X (2)</b> 1:2,7</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>Y</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>y'all (1)</b> 11:3  <b>Yeah (1)</b> 32:4  <b>years (1)</b> 15:17  <b>Yojaira (3)</b> 28:4 29:10,17  <b>Yojaira-- (1)</b> 28:3  <b>York (10)</b> 1:8,8 8:9 10:4 16:25 17:22 18:13 22:15 33:2,8  <b>Yorkers (2)</b> 8:6 9:8  <b>young (1)</b> 8:5  <b>youth (2)</b> 7:22 8:10</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>Z</b></p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>0</b></p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>1</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>1 (2)</b> 2:4 24:9  <b>10 (1)</b> 1:5  <b>110 (1)</b> 1:7  <b>11th (1)</b> 20:2  <b>130 (1)</b> 12:10  <b>136 (1)</b> 11:24  <b>18 (1)</b> 21:22</p>
---	--	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
October 10, 2018**

<b>190 (1)</b> 21:23		
<b>2</b>		
<b>2 (17)</b> 2:5 14:19 15:23 16:8 18:8,9 19:19,21 20:2,19 21:3 22:6,10,19 24:12 30:23 31:8		
<b>2,198 (1)</b> 12:2		
<b>20,000 (1)</b> 12:25		
<b>2014 (3)</b> 11:20,22 14:13		
<b>2018 (4)</b> 1:5 11:25 12:9 33:18		
<b>2019 (2)</b> 7:23 33:22		
<b>24th (1)</b> 33:18		
<b>3</b>		
<b>3 (1)</b> 2:6		
<b>393 (1)</b> 11:23		
<b>4</b>		
<b>4 (1)</b> 2:7		
<b>4:00 (1)</b> 1:6		
<b>4:30 (1)</b> 32:15		
<b>40-hour (1)</b> 17:10		
<b>40-hours (1)</b> 17:13		
<b>5</b>		
<b>5 (2)</b> 2:8 7:23		
<b>563-percent (2)</b> 12:3 14:15		
<b>6</b>		
<b>6 (1)</b> 2:11		
<b>7</b>		
<b>7 (1)</b> 2:12		
<b>71 (1)</b> 12:11		
<b>7th (1)</b> 20:2		
<b>8</b>		
<b>8 (1)</b> 2:13		
<b>9</b>		
<b>90 (1)</b> 11:21		
<b>908 (1)</b> 12:2		