

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

1

1 -----X

2 CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

3 PUBLIC MEETING

4 JANUARY 10, 2018

5 6:30 p.m.

6 -----X

7 37-44 21st Street
8 Long Island City, NY

8

9

10

11

12

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

13

14 B E F O R E:

15

FREDERICK R. DAVIE, Acting Chair

16

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

17

18 Transcribed by:

19

Deirdre Smith

20

21

22

23

24

25

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Report from the Acting Chair
3. Report from the Executive Director
4. Presentation from CCRB Outreach Director
5. Presentation from CCRB Policy and Data Director
6. Comment from Community Groups
7. Public Comment
8. Old Business
9. New Business
10. Adjourn to Executive Session

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

1 BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 =====

3 FRANK J. DWYER

4 LINDSAY EASON

5 ANGELA FERNANDEZ, ESQ

6 RAMON PEGUERO, ESQ.

7 JOSEPH A. PUMA,

8 YOUNGIK YOON, ESQ.

9 =====

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

5

1 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Good evening, and
2 welcome to the first Civilian Complaint Review
3 Board's community board meeting of 2018.

4 This happens to be my first community
5 board meeting as CCRB's Acting Chair. I'm honored
6 to serve along side with my colleagues here on the
7 board and thankful to have the confidence of this
8 great staff here at the CCRB and Mayor de Blasio as
9 I lead one of the most important agencies for this
10 city.

11 I would like to thank you all of you
12 for being here tonight. It's actually quite balmy
13 outside given what we had before, but it's still
14 chilly so I'm glad you could make your way here.
15 Some of you have just finished a long days work, or
16 you were just at school, or some of you may have a
17 shift ahead, but you're here and we're glad you're
18 here. And we're here this evening to talk about
19 police-community relations, and you're here because
20 you want to be a part of that conversation, and we
21 are very pleased about that.

22 As a proud resident of this borough,
23 I think this is a reflection of our community here
24 in Queens. I actually live in Long Island City, over
25 on Vernon Boulevard. I've been there for almost ten

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

6

1 years. As we prepare to honor Reverend Dr. Martin
2 Luther King, Jr., on Monday and indeed for many of
3 us this coming weekend, I remember his call when he
4 said make real the promises of democracy. Make real
5 the promises of democracy. And I believe that
6 meetings such as this, ones in which we take time to
7 listen to each other and to learn from each other in
8 a effort to make New York a better place, meetings
9 such as this are part of this process of making real
10 the promises of democracy.

11 Tonight we will review key statistics
12 about police-community relations in Queens. One
13 statistic that is particularly promising here is
14 that 33 percent of Queens complaints accompanied by
15 video footage resulted in a definitive
16 recommendation by the CCRB in 2017. So, 33 percent
17 of Queens complaints that had video footage
18 accompanying it resulted in a definitive
19 recommendation by the CCRB in 2017. For the
20 complaints that didn't have that kind of footage,
21 the percentage was 11 percent.

22 So what this means for us is that
23 video evidence makes a difference. And as New York
24 City moves toward ensuring that every patrol officer
25 has a body camera by the end of next year, video

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

7

1 evidence is going to have an even greater and more
2 significant impact.

3 But I also want to say that as some
4 of you are aware, City Council recently passed the
5 Right To Know Act. This legislation will do two
6 primary things. The first is it will require
7 officers to give civilians a business card that
8 includes the officer's name and shield number, and
9 the city's hotline 311 number, which civilians can
10 call to comment about their interaction with the law
11 enforcement during the stop. The second thing it
12 does, this Right To Know Act, is that it requires
13 officers to inform civilians of their right to
14 refuse consent to a search if the civilian agrees.
15 If the civilian agrees the documented of consent
16 through the officer's body worn camera will be
17 presented. So, if the civilian agrees that consent
18 will be so documented by the body worn camera.

19 The details of how this Right To Know
20 Act will be enforced is still coming together, but
21 the CCRB has been proactive in understanding how the
22 Right To Know Act will affect your interactions,
23 civilian's interactions, with police officers.

24 The legislation won't go into effect
25 until later this year, so we won't observe its

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

8

1 impact right away. But let me say this, the Right
2 To Know Act certainly will change policing in New
3 York City. And if it increases New York City's
4 ability to hold officers accountable for misconduct,
5 then the CCRB welcomes that change.

6 I would like to thank all of you once
7 again and issue a reminder that the conversation
8 about police-community relations doesn't end when
9 this meeting ends. This is a conversation that
10 everybody in this room must have and must consider
11 it their civic duty to ensure that respect is a
12 fundamental pillar of policing in New York City.

13 Before I turn things over to our
14 Executive Director, Mr. Darche, I would like to
15 thank some of the following commanding officers and
16 others that are here tonight.

17 So, Captain Esvaldo Nunez of the
18 114th precinct, welcome Captain Nunez.

19 CAPTAIN NUNEZ: Good evening.

20 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Deputy Inspector
21 Peter Fortune of the 103rd precinct.

22 INSPECTOR FORTUNE: Good evening.

23 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Representatives from
24 the 108th precinct, Officer Diaz. Officer Diaz.

25 OFFICER DIAZ: Hello.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

9

1 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: And from the 110th
2 precinct, Captain Nicola Ventre.

3 CAPTAIN VENTRE: Hello.

4 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Welcome, Captain
5 Ventre.

6 We also have the follow from the elected
7 officials offices, from the Queens DA office,
8 Executive DA Jesse Sligh.

9 A representative from Aravella Simotas'
10 office. Is that representative here? That's
11 you, okay, welcome.

12 We have a representative from
13 Assemblymember Nolan's office. Is that
14 representative here? Thank you,
15 representative.

16 A representative from Council Member
17 Moya's office. Welcome.

18 A representative from the comptroller's
19 office and a representative from Assemblyman
20 Barwell's office. Okay, I think that's it.

21 So, I will turn this portion of the
22 meeting over to CCRB Executive Director,
23 Jonathan Darche.

24 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Chairman Davie. I
25 would like to thank our host, the Queens

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

10

1 Library in long Island City, in particular the
2 library manager, Ms. Smith, and her incredible
3 staff for allowing us to use their facility
4 tonight.

5 It means a lot to me to be here in Queens
6 tonight. I grew up in Queens. I live in Queens
7 and my son is growing up in Queens too.

8 If the investigators Patrick Yu and
9 Charlie Hartford can stand up. So, they are
10 CCRB investigators and they are here today if
11 anyone wants to make a complaint, they're here
12 to take your complaints down so we can
13 investigate them. In addition, I would like to
14 acknowledge Tricia Ramcharit. She's the
15 agency's new Queens Outreach Coordinator.
16 Tricia, she's right there. Welcome, Trish.

17 Since we intend to have the outreach and
18 policy units do presentations that focus
19 specifically on Queens I'm going to forgo my
20 usual recitation of the monthly statistics.
21 But the full complement of the agency's
22 statistics is available on the agency's
23 website.

24 Chairman Davie spoke a little about the
25 Right To Know Act. Please note that should the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

11

1 Right To Know Act be enacted, it will not go
2 into effect until September of this year.

3 The act consists of two parts. The first
4 involves people's rights when getting stopped
5 by members of the NYPD. The second involves
6 documenting how people give consent to search.

7 The agency is coordinating with the
8 department to ensure we understand how they are
9 training members of service and what is
10 expected of officers.

11 The agency has also been in communications
12 with 311 to better understand how they train
13 operators to route comments received from
14 civilians. We are updating the scripts that
15 operators use when individuals call with
16 complaints or comments. In addition, the agency
17 is working with 311 to give presentations to 311
18 operators so that they will better understand
19 when to route callers to the CCRB, as well as
20 update the 311 website, to make it easier for
21 New Yorkers to file complaints with the agency
22 online.

23 Again, I would like to thank you all for
24 attending.

25 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Do any of our board

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

12

1 members have any questions for our Executive
2 Director?

3 (No response.)

4 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Then we
5 would like to give our commanding officers,
6 representatives from the precinct and other
7 representatives from elected officials an
8 opportunity to bring brief remarks. If you
9 would like to, you can come here to the podium.

10 Precinct captains, precinct
11 representatives, anyone?

12 (no response.)

13 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Anyone from the
14 elected officials offices?

15 (no response.)

16 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No? We got a quiet
17 group here.

18 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Chair, I just wanted to
19 thank Mr. Sligh from the Queens DA Office for
20 coming out today.

21 When I first went to the Queens DA Office,
22 Mr. Sligh taught me so much and it means a lot
23 to me, and the community, that he's here today.
24 And I just wanted to tell the member of the
25 community here how much he has done for Queens

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

13

1 County, and continues to do, and we are really
2 lucky to have someone like him working for all
3 of us.

4 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.
5 Mr. Sligh, are you sure we can't get you to say
6 something?

7 MR. DARCHE: That was not what I was
8 doing.

9 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Well,
10 welcome.

11 MR. SLIGH: Thank you.

12 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I guess we will now
13 move to public comment section. I want to give
14 all the people who have signed up to speak an
15 opportunity to speak. I will reminded you, we
16 would like for you to keep your comment to two
17 minutes, so if you will -- I'm sorry, I'm told
18 that these current speakers get five minute and
19 then for the public commentary period we will
20 ask speakers to keep their comments to two
21 minutes.

22 So, the first speaker I have is Kenny
23 Carter, who is founder of Fathers Alive In The
24 Hood, F.A.I.T.H, organization.

25 MR. CARTER: Peace everybody. How you all

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

14

1 doing? Like you said, it's a real quiet room
2 here today.

3 So, just to tap into the quietness, in our
4 communities every so often we have meetings
5 such as this, or even other meetings that are
6 really pertinent to the residents of the
7 communities -- just by a show of hands, how
8 many people live in this nearby area?

9 (Audience members raise hands.)

10 MR. CARTER: Case in point. Where you
11 have a lot of individuals that they're are not
12 hearing the call of civilians to be at these
13 kind of meetings, to understand that their
14 presence here is important. And it saddens me
15 on a regular basis -- I'm also part of my
16 community board, Community Board 12, in
17 Jamaica. I've done numerous groups in this
18 area here: Queensbridge Housing Projects,
19 Astoria, Ravenswood. We've done a lot of
20 mentorship programs that works with a lot of
21 the youth in these communities.

22 So, just dealing with things around here,
23 not only here but other places as well, people
24 who are not affected, directly, they really
25 don't respond. Do you agree?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

15

1 If they're not affected directly by any
2 kind of situation, whether it be a situation
3 with an officer or whatever it might be this is
4 going on in the community, if it's not that
5 particular group of people that are really
6 affected by it, not too many are going to show
7 up to events like this to voice their opinion.

8 So, you know, first, I think we need to,
9 kind of like, revise a tactic that will get the
10 community that's really being affected a lot
11 more involved.

12 From doing work with the 103rd precinct in
13 Jamaica, Southeast Queens area, we have BTG
14 It's a beautiful organization that was
15 constructed with police and civilians to pretty
16 much get together and it says exactly what it
17 says BTG, bridge the gap. And at Bridging The
18 Gap there is a Community Relations Liaison
19 who's here right now, Sergeant Fason, from the
20 103rd, and there's a few other officers that
21 work with it, hand in hand, and they kind of
22 hear the hearts of the people.

23 These officers are some of the only
24 officers that I probably ever seen that's
25 really literally out doing hand to hand work,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

16

1 like giving out turkeys, or coats, or whatever
2 it might be, really forming relationships with
3 the community.

4 At this particular point in time, we need
5 more officers like Sergeant Fason and the rest
6 of her partners that are actually out and
7 really trying to aggressively form a
8 relationship with the people that they're
9 policing.

10 At this point there is not a lot of
11 individuals who make it good for the officers
12 that do come into the community, the CBOs,
13 right? We have a CBO Program that they have,
14 and you have outside of CBO, you have special
15 units. So, they'll have a special unit from
16 the Bronx or somewhere, and they'll come into
17 the community not knowing anything that's been
18 going on with CBOs or whatever with programs
19 that have already been established and the
20 relationships that are being built. You have
21 these officers come from the Bronx, probably
22 coming over here to the 108th precinct, from
23 the 108 or the 114th precinct area, and then
24 they will harass, they will violate some kind
25 of rights, they will do something that will

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

18

1 grandmother or by himself, his mom and pops
2 past away when he was a young boy, and the kid
3 has other issues. But opposed to looking at
4 those kind of issues we go and put a stranger
5 in the midst of the situation and we expect a
6 stranger to respond in a pleasant manner, after
7 we have a lot of the media that is already
8 projecting a lot of the negative police
9 behaviors -- and nine times out ten the
10 negative police behaviors that I've been seeing
11 recently are not even from New York City. It
12 can be from a neighboring state or different
13 states, and you have these same cops that come
14 into your community. They're being judged by
15 what people are seeing outside.

16 So of course when an officer comes in the
17 community, and you got a community that what
18 they're talking about is guns or violence or
19 sex, or drugs or whatever it is, from out of
20 this community, whether it be via a web series
21 or via the internet, or Youtube, or whatever it
22 is, there is an imagery that is being pushed
23 out -- automatically. Anybody ever see a web
24 series based on the projects --

25 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I'm going to need you

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

19

1 to sum it up.

2 MR. CARTER: I'm about to sum it up right
3 now. There is a web series called Project Heat.
4 That's something out of pink house, that's one
5 of the areas that we are particularly working
6 in right now in East New York, Brooklyn. So,
7 in Project Heat, there's nothing but a lot of
8 gun slinging and a lot of people getting shot
9 and murdered.

10 So, if someone was to look at this
11 particular web series, they would really feel
12 that these are some of the real particular
13 situations that are really going on right now
14 in East New York, Brooklyn.

15 What I'm saying is instead of individuals
16 judging from outside, we need to have more
17 people that are willing to get out of their
18 cars and park for a minute and talk to some of
19 the people in the community.

20 There is no relationship. There is really
21 a hard, a hard dictatorship kind of
22 relationship that is going on --

23 (Inaudible response from the
24 audience.)

25 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, sir. Let

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

20

1 me see if anybody from any of the precincts
2 want to respond at all?

3 (No response.)

4 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Nobody? Okay. Any of
5 the board members?

6 (No response.)

7 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Okay, thank you,
8 Mr. Carter.

9 The next speaker is Reverend Pastor Thia
10 Reggio of Astoria First Presbyterian Church.

11 REVEREND REGGIO: Good evening everyone.
12 Thank you for those remarks. I knew that
13 anybody speaking, that we would overlap and
14 talk about similar issues.

15 If you live in Queens, you know it's about
16 the amazing diversity that's here and the need
17 to preserve that and be aware of it and work
18 with everybody.

19 The church that I serve in Astoria is a
20 very small congregation, but because we are
21 here, we have folks from every where, from
22 Japan and Philippines and Jamaica and Sudan and
23 other places in America. And what we've
24 noticed was that in this past year, since
25 November of 2016, people were having incidents

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

21

1 of real fear, and we got involved with,
2 informally, forming some accompaniment programs
3 for folks who felt uncomfortable from maybe
4 walking from home, the book store, or some
5 place where they were out. We had, there have
6 been people coming in, literally, on a Sunday
7 morning, coming in with experiences not with
8 the police or other authorities, but with other
9 people in the community who were saying things
10 that they weren't before.

11 I have a young mother in my congregation
12 who, as Mr. Carter said, is seeing things that
13 are going on in the world. And I see the fear
14 that she has for her son who's now six.

15 So, I feel that preserving that
16 immigration quality, but not just immigration,
17 I think it's really important to lift up that
18 people sometimes come to this country against
19 their will. And that's been a part of our
20 history and that's a part of who we are
21 currently and that we have that dynamic going
22 on as well.

23 I think, coming from a Presbyterian
24 background -- I don't know if you have heard
25 the saying, the frozen chosen? But we tend to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

22

1 have an emphasis on order. We have two parts of
2 our constitution, one is called The Book of
3 Order, so we're big on order. And I think
4 that's good in a sense of working together
5 within structures. I also think too often we
6 think of order as separating things out from
7 one another and creating boxes for people to be
8 in, and we're blessed to have a police officer
9 in our congregation who has been a way of
10 demonstrating to folks that that is not the way
11 that you build trust in communities.

12 So, I would love to see this program, this
13 camera program in particular, to be a way of
14 police supporting people and feeling safe and
15 that's it's not okay to be abusive to other
16 people in the community, and that the presence
17 of, the police presence, is something to
18 benefit that.

19 But I would also like to take this kind
20 of, I mean, I already now have information
21 about this other group that I would love to
22 know more about, and I think this is the
23 opportunity for us to work together because the
24 way that you build communities is to bring
25 people together, not separate them.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

23

1 I will sum up by saying one of the
2 questions was about the future and I think that
3 as Queens hits the slow roll of gentrification,
4 I think it's really important for us to
5 remember that this is a community that is very
6 diverse, and sometimes it's easy to default to
7 people who feel more entitled to the attention
8 of the police, or more attuned to a sense of
9 authority, where as people who are coming from
10 other cultures may be fearful or not aware of
11 those systems, and if we can foster a sense
12 that there is real equality and community
13 through this kind of effort, I think that would
14 be really beneficial.

15 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, Reverend
16 Reggio. Any questions from any of the board
17 members?

18 (No response.)

19 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Thank you.
20 Next on the speakers list is Karen Dennis,
21 the president of the PSA9 Police Precinct
22 Community Council.

23 MS. DENNIS: Good evening everyone. I
24 appreciate you allowing me the opportunity to
25 speak.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

24

1 As a board member, the title means
2 nothing, but as a board member for the
3 communities that we serve in the public housing
4 developments that exist in Queens, we are very
5 troubled. The Reverend made very clear that
6 people are living in fear. I think people in
7 public housing have extra fear because we are
8 already prejudged to a certain degree.

9 And although the police department does
10 insight that they are trying to do more
11 community policing, there's a disconnect. And
12 what we see is that they're managing people,
13 but they're not connecting with people.

14 And we want more open dialogue around that
15 because over the last six months, the four
16 developments around here have experienced an
17 extreme amount of crime. Public shootings
18 during the day, people losing their lives,
19 young people out on the street and just living
20 in a chaotic manner, and quality of life has
21 just gone through the door and out the window.
22 And no one really wants to come out and serve
23 the community if they are living in fear.

24 So, how do we engage with our police
25 department, who of course, we expect them to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

25

1 come out everyday and serve the community, and
2 do their job, and help the community. But
3 again, they're not the only ones out there
4 working. We have many business here. We have
5 many families that live in public housing that
6 are really good people and for some reason
7 everything gets overlooked.

8 She talked about a disconnect. There's a
9 disconnect. We can't get the merchants in the
10 community to embrace the public housing
11 community because they feel, you know, they're
12 only here to make their money and go home. So,
13 they take the economic dollars out of many
14 families who are living on extremely low income
15 or low income salaries or incomes of some sort,
16 and they don't come back and serve the
17 communities.

18 Then we have the police officers that
19 treat them just the same. It's just like
20 anything that is surrounding public housing
21 development doesn't really get the attention
22 that it should.

23 It's just policing, so they say, but for
24 me it's people just coming in to get their
25 paycheck every two weeks, or however many, and

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

26

1 then they go home. And I want them to go home
2 and I want them to be safe and I want to work
3 with them, but, as an advocate and as a person
4 who's supposed to be working with the police
5 department to do police-community engagement,
6 there is no engagement.

7 So, how do we fix that? It shouldn't
8 always be complaints about the police. It
9 should be things that are showing up where you
10 see partnership because that's what my board is
11 supposed to be about, a partnership, from the
12 housing development. As a resident of housing,
13 I'm supposed to be on this board to be the
14 voice of the people who live in these
15 developments, and bring back resources and
16 initiatives, and some type of, you know,
17 connection with the police department, so we
18 can live in harmony. But there is no harmony.

19 And again, we are living in troubled
20 times, we understand that. But where do we
21 build that relationship, that communication,
22 that connection with the police department that
23 is going to serve both the police department
24 and the people that live and work in these
25 communities, especially the people living in

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

27

1 public housing?

2 Because you know what, those are little
3 cities. If you look at it, those are virtual
4 cities because from the ground up, you can
5 have -- Ravenswood has over six thousand
6 residents. Queensbridge is supposed to have
7 what, ten thousand? It's really more like
8 twenty. And when you look at these little
9 cities, how do you serve them? There's no
10 program. We have a PAL program. You can't get a
11 PAL program over here --

12 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, Ms. Dennis are
13 you saying that these issues can't be addressed
14 or they're not be being addressed by the
15 precinct community council?

16 MS. DENNIS: They're not -- talk is cheap
17 is what I'm saying.

18 MR. LOGAN: That's right.

19 MS. DENNIS: You know, you go on the
20 website and you read all of these initiatives
21 that are out there for the communities that the
22 police are supposed to engage but they are not
23 slowing up in communities of trouble.

24 (Clapping from audience.)

25 MS. DENNIS: It's a very sad case of just

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

28

1 not being present, okay? And one thing I
2 believe is that people that are will willing to
3 get engaged and get involved, but if they're
4 living in fear they are not going to come out
5 of their doors to connect with what's out
6 there. You know, this is not the Mayor's forum,
7 so we can't talk about funding, but we can talk
8 about the fact that if people would just learn
9 to communicate better -- a lot times with the
10 police department, what I get, as a board
11 member, and as a person that is supposed to be
12 engaging a police community initiative, I get
13 the information 12 hours, 24 hours, 48 hours
14 before something is supposed to jump off, okay?

15 Now, if it wasn't for the fact that I stay
16 in touch with CCRB, I know when you guys have
17 meetings, but not everybody is out there,
18 connecting with that. So, what I think that we
19 need as far as the police department is
20 concerned is although we have neighborhood
21 community officers, it's not enough. It's not
22 showing up.

23 And I know that they have policing duties
24 and things that they're supposed to deal with
25 but it's the breakdown in communications is

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

29

1 really bad. And these people that are living
2 in fear now are mainly seniors and young
3 people, okay? We have very large populations.

4 So, as the work that you do, I think that
5 collectively if we would come to the table
6 together a little bit more often and have these
7 types of conversations. It doesn't have to be
8 a town hall --

9 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

10 MS. DENNIS: -- but there needs to be more
11 communication --

12 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

13 MS. DENNIS: -- whatever that looks like.

14 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you so much.

15 Thank you, thank you. I'll ask the members
16 again, do you have any questions, comments?

17 (No response.)

18 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Then we
19 will hear from, forgive me if I miss pronounce
20 it, Radia Rahdiao?

21 MS. RADEHA: You pronounce it right the
22 first time.

23 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Okay.

24 MS. RADEHA: Hello. I was an intern in
25 the outreach unit at the CCRB this past summer.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

30

1 Today it's important to talk about the
2 concerns and ideas on policy and police
3 interaction with Queens residents.

4 It's crucial to understand how much
5 sharing experiences about police misconduct can
6 help create a more trusting relationship with
7 the police.

8 In the past, precincts in Queens amassed
9 high CCRB complaints, proving that people are
10 not afraid of reporting misconduct from a
11 person of authority and are able to trust CCRB
12 to investigate and mediate and prosecute their
13 complaints.

14 However, there are severe issues among
15 police-communities relations. The Police
16 Executive Research Forum, back in 2015, hosted
17 a nation wide conference to develop tactics to
18 build trust among the precincts. A great
19 proposal was mentioned, being that police
20 officers should try their best to understand
21 and acknowledge past allegations, to confront
22 these issues with residents.

23 This meeting is gathering elected
24 officials, community leaders, residents and
25 officers to discuss the past allegations.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

31

1 Ideally, the best way to continue is hosting
2 meetings in the problematic precincts to help
3 mend the police-community relations.

4 CCRB can foster public trust between
5 officers and residents too by increasing the
6 number of presentations that outreach has done.
7 From my experience with presenting with CCRB,
8 you are able to see the audience engagement in
9 learning how to interact with officers and
10 knowing how to initiate a proper interaction.

11 With CCRB being a neutral agency, it's not
12 against officers, and their agency's best
13 interest is to build an understanding and do
14 justice to combat further complaints of police
15 misconduct. Because more often local precincts
16 can generate more complaints due to attention
17 of other misconducts who lose trust in police
18 in general.

19 The neighborhood community officers helped
20 decrease the rate of crime among the community
21 and increase the chances of a trusting
22 relationship knowing that officers devote their
23 time to help create a safer environment for
24 their residents.

25 The body worn camera act, I think the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

32

1 cameras will severe a great, concrete evidence,
2 related to any misconduct against the officer.

3 Officers are assured to have the best
4 behavior knowing that they're being watched,
5 and residents will also tend to give their best
6 behavior during an interaction because they,
7 too, being watched.

8 However, this sudden addition can not be
9 sufficiently guaranteed to be an efficient tool
10 because of privacy issues and can be
11 manipulated to the police's advantage.

12 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, very much.
13 I should say that Ms. Hawk is a high school
14 student and a Generation Citizen Community
15 Change fellow.

16 MR. DARCHE: And a great asset to the
17 agency when she was an intern this summer.

18 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Any comments?

19 MR. PUMA: May I?

20 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

21 MR. PUMA: I actually have a comment about
22 the previous speaker.

23 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure.

24 MR. PUMA: I just wanted to thank you for
25 lifting up the issues around public housing.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

33

1 I'm a member of this board, but I'm also a
2 life long resident of public housing, and I
3 wrote my masters thesis on this topic of
4 stigmatization of public housing and its
5 residence, and I'm well aware -- I do advocacy
6 on housing and public housing issues outside of
7 here -- and I'm well aware the largest public
8 housing development in North America is just a
9 few blocks away.

10 And I just wanted to point your attention,
11 if you haven't picked up the monthly report.
12 Several months ago and with the help of the
13 CCRB staff, which, you know, they did a lot of
14 work to actually begin to present statistics
15 about the public service areas, the PSAs.

16 And so, on page 26 and 27, they have
17 statistics as far as what our agency is getting
18 from each PSA. It's something that I requested
19 and thankfully got the support of other board
20 members and staff, so that we can present this
21 information and maybe get more of a picture of
22 what's happening.

23 Because one of my concerns was that there
24 was a period, it may not still be the case, I'm
25 not quite sure, but there was a period where

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

34

1 crime in public housing was higher even though
2 crime was going down in the city --

3 MS. DENNIS: It is.

4 MR. PUMA: -- and I believe that's still
5 the case. So, that's one of the reasons why I
6 decided to ask that we begin to present this
7 information more explicitly.

8 So, I would be very curious to see, if you
9 get to stay, to hear what your thoughts are on
10 that.

11 MS. DENNIS: I would love to stay.

12 MR. PUMA: Thank you.

13 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you, Mr. Puma.

14 Let me just say that one of the things
15 about being new to this is that you make
16 mistakes.

17 So, I missed a couple of presentations
18 from the staff that are on the agenda. So we
19 will hear from one other speaker, and then we
20 will go back and hear a couple of presentations
21 from the staff on some of the reports they have
22 produced for this evening.

23 So, let me call to the podium, Jonathan
24 Logan, who is the Vice President of the Cambria
25 Heights Civic Association.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

35

1 MR. LOGAN: Hello and good evening. I'm
2 going to get right into this. So, thank you,
3 Chair.

4 Like you said, I'm the Vice President of
5 the Cambria Heights Civic Association. I'm a
6 board member of Community Board 13.

7 But I'm really here to talk about two
8 concerns of my community, and possibly quite,
9 communities around New York City, possibly
10 around New York State, and possibly, probably
11 around the country.

12 The first concern I'd like to talk about
13 really is conversations and dialogues that
14 focus around how interactions should be between
15 members of the public and the police.

16 And those conversations tends to be --
17 they're tuned in, that narrative is tuned in to
18 how the civilians should act when they are
19 confronted with the police.

20 And I think that's somewhat of a backwards
21 narrative, right? I think that's somewhat of a
22 reverse narrative, whereby, I think the real
23 focus should be on how the police officer
24 should interact -- we talk about CPR on the
25 side of every car -- how the police officers

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

36

1 should be acting and held accountable to the
2 people.

3 So, with that -- I'm not here to have a
4 bleeding heart ceremony. I'm here to talk about
5 hardcore facts.

6 So, what I'm going to hold up -- one of
7 the most, the two most compelling reports that
8 I've ever read were the Attorney General's
9 report. One from Eliot Spitzer 1999, and the
10 2013 report, which gave hardcore evidence of
11 implicit bias. Okay, so anyone know what
12 implicit bias is?

13 Okay. So, it's time to start having some
14 honest dialogue and honest conversations about
15 implicit bias, and if you want to really talk
16 about it, we can talk about -- everyone heard
17 about Dr. Kenneth Clark? They did the doll
18 test, it's been reproduced many, many times,
19 black doll, white doll -- 3, 4, 5 years olds --
20 bad doll, black doll.

21 We have to start having an honest
22 dialogues as to why police officers act certain
23 ways. So, I'm just going to refer to some of
24 my notes here as we get into this discussion.
25 I'm trying to have a little bit of a basic

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

37

1 discussion on this, and trying to really get
2 into why these things are happening.

3 So, I'm not only here to present facts but
4 I'm here because I'm concerned, and more so to
5 present some solutions. If we want to get into
6 that, these conversations are about always
7 about complaints, but I'm really here to talk
8 about solutions, so we can really get down to
9 the bottom of it, okay? We don't want this
10 just to be a formality and everyone comes and
11 just goes home, we want to create some
12 solutions.

13 Okay. So, there's a narrative like I said,
14 it's always about where the police officer
15 comes in, but I'm just going to read one thing
16 really quick, that proves something that I'm
17 talking about. This is from the Schneiderman
18 Report, this is from our current Attorney
19 General. He talks about 1999 the OAG issued an
20 extensive report concerning NYPD Stop and
21 Frisk, and Stop and Frisk used to be a very
22 popular topic, it used to be very trendy topic,
23 it's not so much anymore.

24 The report demonstrates that even when
25 controlling for crime rates and demographics of

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

38

1 high crime neighborhoods where police are more
2 heavily deployed, Blacks and Hispanics are
3 stopped at a disproportion rate. Further,
4 police data reveal that only about 15 percent
5 of the stops are made on the basis that an
6 individual fits the description of a crime
7 suspect.

8 In this report, Stop and Frisk data
9 confirmed that racial disparities documented at
10 stops continued through to arrests, disposition
11 and sentencing. The disparity is especially
12 pronounced in marijuana arrest in which whites
13 defendants charged with misdemeanor marijuana
14 possession after a stop are nearly 50 percent
15 more likely than Blacks to receive an ACD --
16 everyone here know what an ACD is -- and
17 thereby avoid a conviction. In a ACD the
18 conviction is basically just thrown out.

19 We have to start having an honest
20 conversation about why this happens, okay? And
21 this is a major concern to me and to people in
22 my community. I would like some feedback on
23 that. We're not just going to have some
24 conversation that is stepped over, and I would
25 like to have to some honest conversations about

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

39

1 that.

2 Real quick, my next concern is really
3 about quotas. Quotas used to be a very, very
4 hot topic. There were ten --there was a class
5 action suit, ten officers sued New York City
6 anyone know about that?

7 Well, okay, let's have some feedback and
8 talk about it. Because I know this is
9 something that's on a lot of people's minds.
10 At least it is for me, because it affects me,
11 and it affects my children.

12 So, there was a class action suit, I know
13 at least 18 million-dollar was paid out just
14 for the attorney fees, and probably many
15 millions of dollar more, but what's significant
16 about this, what I found was -- and this is the
17 settlement of the Sharif Stinson et al verses
18 The City Of New York. The City of New York
19 Police Department never said that they were
20 guilty of anything -- and I'm going to try to
21 sum this up -- I'm trying to to have some
22 interesting dialogue here. They never had, or
23 admitted that any type of quotas or anything
24 really existed, yet there all types of
25 legislative reformations, all types of policy

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

40

1 reformations that they had to -- there was a
2 court monitor, and there was also a message
3 that was mandated, that the PC, the police
4 commissioner had to give out to the public,
5 stating that there had to be punitive actions
6 if any, if any supervisors had, or were in
7 fact, enforcing quotas.

8 So, why would a court monitor have to be
9 appointed, and all these public messages, if in
10 fact these thing did not exist?

11 Quotas, I believe is probably, if not the
12 most, insidious and treacherous act imposed
13 upon the city and the people in the City of New
14 York.

15 And why? I'm going to take a pro-cop
16 perspective at this point. Police officers who
17 have to go out in the street, who have to
18 essentially hunt people to meet their quotas
19 are faced with dire conditions and tons of
20 retaliation, okay? And that is a problem when
21 it comes to how we want to get served as
22 people.

23 When you have a police officer who is
24 literally afraid of not getting their time off,
25 can't get vacation time, can't go home early,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

41

1 can't do any of that, they'll do anything to
2 get their numbers, okay?

3 So, this is a major problem, here are the
4 facts, and these are the types of conversations
5 that I think we need to have so that we can get
6 somewhere.

7 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Sure, thank you.

8 MR. LOGAN: So, I would like to have some
9 feedback, because the sister right here was
10 talking about not having any real connection.
11 So, we need to establish some real connections
12 and I think the CCRB -- I can provide some real
13 solutions, robust solutions, that we need to
14 have -- but I think people like this, who are
15 boots on the ground, really understand.

16 I know this is your first meeting and I
17 know that there are things -- you know, I can
18 respect that, we all get twisted up and
19 sometimes things go around, but sometimes you
20 just have to let things flow -- that's a little
21 bit of advice for you.

22 But I'm concerned that we are not getting
23 to the bottom of the issues. So, with that
24 being said, I'd like to have some conversation,
25 I would like to have someone -- and I'm not

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

42

1 saying I'm due a response, but I would like to
2 have some type of response as to how we can get
3 some of these things solved, and some feedback
4 from the board.

5 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. So, let me
6 please say a couple of things and then I will
7 open it up to my colleagues.

8 I think one is that -- first of all in
9 these forums we hear you. The people, the
10 representatives from the precincts are here, as
11 well as representatives from elected officials,
12 all of this goes into consideration of policies
13 and procedures for how everybody does business,
14 vis a vis, this question of police-community
15 relations. So, that's the first piece.

16 The second thing I would say is this is a
17 marathon and not a sprint.

18 MR. LOGAN: Absolutely.

19 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, it's, things got
20 to where they were not over a short time but
21 over a long time. It's going to take some time
22 to get the kind of relationships we want to
23 have. But I think from top to bottom, many
24 people of good will are working on it.

25 MR. LOGAN: I believe that.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

43

1 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: And then the final
2 thing I would say is that it's forums like this
3 that hold all of my colleagues here, all of the
4 people who are in public office here,
5 accountable for ensuring that we do what we
6 need to do.

7 We made a lot of progress on Stop and
8 Frisk. We have the strongest civilian
9 oversight board in the country and we are
10 trying to make it stronger. We got new
11 legislation coming out of the City Council, we
12 have cooperation from the commissioner and
13 precinct captains and others.

14 So, we're going to work really hard to
15 ensure that we have safe communities. That we
16 have respect in those communities. That we
17 have accountability and transparency, and that
18 everybody assumes their responsibility to make
19 this system work.

20 So, that's our commitment. It's going to
21 take some time. I think we have made progress,
22 and we'll hear a little more on that when our
23 staff speaks, but we are committed to doing
24 this. It's just going to take a while.

25 MR. LOGAN: Okay, good. Is there anyone

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

44

1 else who wants to respond to that? Because we
2 want to establish some real hardcore -- and I
3 don't know if you noticed, I have kind of stood
4 up here to get a response. I don't want to
5 dictate the floor, I know you have an agenda,
6 so I'm going to move off, but encourage
7 everyone to just not be so formal. These
8 meetings are for the people, all right? And we
9 really need to establish some real hardcore --

10 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Well, we have a
11 speakers list, so anybody who wants to speak
12 who didn't get their name on the list, this is
13 the time.

14 MR. LOGAN: Okay. Very good. Thank you for
15 your time.

16 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We will probably have
17 another twenty people on our list to speak.

18 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Logan.

19 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, if we can hear
20 from our staff then, which I missed, on
21 outreach and on policy and data.

22 MR. TUBBS: Hello everybody, my name is
23 Keith Tubbs, and I'm the Director of Outreach
24 for the New York Civilian Review Board. I'm
25 going to give a short presentation to you guys

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

45

1 today.

2 The New York Civilian Complaint Review
3 Board is the largest independent oversight
4 agency in the United States of America. We
5 investigate, mediate, and in certain cases,
6 prosecute allegations of misconduct against
7 members of service.

8 What do we investigate? We investigate
9 four types of allegations; force, abuse of
10 authority, discourtesy and offensive language.
11 That's commonly known FADO.

12 Last but not least, how to file a
13 complaints with the CCRB. You can file a
14 complaint a few different ways. You can call
15 1-800-341-2272. You can also dial 311 to file
16 a complaint. You can also log onto the
17 website, which is www.NYC.gov/ccrbcomplaint.

18 And in Queens, we do have office hours
19 with Councilmember Donovan Richards. We have
20 some forms up front, so if you want to file a
21 complaint there, and you can also file a
22 complaint at your local precinct.

23 Last but not least, I did want to say that
24 our outreach department, we go into communities
25 and we give presentations to schools, churches,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

46

1 law enforcement. So, anybody who wants us to do
2 a prestation feel free to contact me or anyone
3 else in our Outreach Department. Can the folks
4 in the outreach department please stand up so
5 they know who you are?

6 (Outreach employees from CCRB
7 standup.)

8 MR. TUBBS: So, these are the folks in our
9 outreach department.

10 So, if you have any questions after the
11 meeting or during the meeting, you want to know
12 a little bit more about what we do, please come
13 over and contact us.

14 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.
15 Questions, comment from board members?

16 (No response.)

17 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: And the prestation on
18 our policy and data.

19 MS. NAPOLITANO: Good evening everyone.
20 I'm Nicole Napolitano, I'm the Director Of
21 Policy and Advocacy for the CCRB.

22 I have some data here, it's Queens at
23 large, but also focusing on the two closest
24 precincts from where we are right now.

25 In the hands outs you will find a list of

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

47

1 complaint related data for all precincts in
2 Queens. So, for any information that's not up
3 here, it should be in there, and if not, come
4 find me.

5 So, just looking at a quick snapshot, and
6 I know everyone can't see these in back, so
7 this is just an overall map of all of the
8 complaints that we received in 2017 in Queens.

9 And you can see, or hopefully you can see,
10 because I can barely see from where I am, that
11 we have some pretty high rates of complaints
12 actually in the 114, where we are right now.
13 So, that's red. So, any precincts that you see
14 that that are red have higher numbers of
15 complaints. And we also try to take a look at
16 how complaints match up to the number of people
17 who live in those precincts, so that's what
18 this map covers.

19 So, on the left here, we have complaints
20 per one thousand people. The right map is
21 actually the crime rate, so the number of
22 crimes per one thousand people. And what this
23 tells us, the reason why we compare these two
24 numbers together, is to take a look at what
25 precincts might have higher crime rates but

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

48

1 lower complaint rates. Those are areas that we
2 need to focus on in terms of our own outreach.

3 And I can show you also here the percent
4 of fully investigated allegations via FADO for
5 Queens. FADO is force, abuse of authority,
6 discourtesy and offensive language. And over
7 here on the left, we have Queens at large,
8 Queens as a total number. And so these are
9 fully investigated allegations for all of
10 Queens and then in the middle precinct 108, and
11 then on the right is precinct 114.

12 And give me a second -- for the borough of
13 Queens at large, we had 180 force complaints,
14 compared to 557 abuse of authority complaints,
15 130 discourtesy complaints and 33 offensive
16 language complaints. And the percentages are
17 pretty similar between Queens at large and the
18 114th precinct. The 108th precinct has a
19 higher proportion of abuse of authority, and a
20 lower rate of force-related complaints.

21 And so, what I'll show you next are the
22 breakdowns of the
23 substantiations/unsubstantiations for all of
24 the complaints in Queens as well.

25 So, an allegation is considered

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

49

1 substantiated if misconduct is found to be
2 improper based on a preponderance of the
3 evidence.

4 Allegations are unsubstantiated if there's
5 not enough evidence to determine whether or not
6 misconduct occurred.

7 Unfounded if a preponderance of the
8 evidence suggests that the event, or alleged
9 act did not occur.

10 Exonerated, if the event did occur but was
11 not found to be improper by preponderance of
12 the evidence.

13 And, closest officer unidentified, if we
14 could not tell who the officer was in question.

15 So, Queens is again, over on the left hand
16 side, the blue is the unsubstantiated rate, the
17 orange is exonerated, the kind of teal color is
18 substantiated -- thank you, I'm going to need
19 some glasses -- the kind of goldish color there
20 is MOS unidentified, member of service
21 unidentified, and the last one is a unfounded.

22 And again, these numbers are all in the
23 hand out for all precincts.

24 So, for Queens the total, for all the
25 fully investigated complaints, we had 35 that

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

50

1 were substantiated, 54 were exonerated, 12
2 unfounded, 17 MOS/unidentified, and 107 that
3 were unsubstantiated. Questions?

4 MR. CARTER: Once you substantiate the
5 claim, what's the next step after that? You
6 said you identify the one that are
7 substantiated, after that, then what?

8 MS. NAPOLITANO: So, any number of things
9 might happen after that --

10 MR. CARTER: What are things that are
11 likely to happen, or most likely did happen
12 already, after the substantiation of the claim
13 was determined?

14 MS. NAPOLITANO: So, once a complaints has
15 been substantiated, it depends on what the
16 recommended discipline was.

17 So, if the board recommended charges and
18 specifications, then our APU, our
19 Administrative Prosecution Unit, will prosecute
20 those charges.

21 Typically, off hand, I can't actually
22 recall the numbers, but those are on our
23 website. The rest of the substantiated
24 disciplinary recommendations would go through
25 the department's Advocate's Office, and then

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

51

1 there's an potential penalty associated with
2 those disciplinary recommendations. So command
3 discipline, verses training, verses
4 instructions.

5 MR. CARTER: Do you have an example that
6 you can give to us with regard to an officer or
7 someone who may have been disciplined, that you
8 most recently dealt with?

9 MS. NAPOLITANO: So, I can't give you any
10 specific examples, but I can, when I'm done
11 here, if you want to talk about where to find
12 all of our reports on the website, I can
13 absolutely show you exactly where that is. So,
14 So, there are some case studies that are in
15 there that are anonymous.

16 (Inaudible talk from the
17 audience.)

18 MS. NAPOLITANO: So, just to finish up
19 quickly, and this is something that Mr. Davie
20 had mentioned as well, that video evidence
21 plays a major role in closing all complaints on
22 what we call, on the merits.

23 So, that would be substantiated,
24 exonerated or unfounded complaints, things in
25 which we know a little bit more clearly about

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

52

1 what went on.

2 So, for Queens, the rate at which video
3 has an impact on closing cases on the merits is
4 much higher, 33 percent as compared to
5 11 percent of cases in which we did not have
6 video evidence. So, video evidence is becoming
7 increasingly important to CCRB's closing of any
8 investigation on the merits.

9 To file a complaint, as was mentioned
10 nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaints. Our data transparency
11 initiative has a wide variety of numbers on
12 there, complaints that are broken down in fifty
13 different ways.

14 And our reports can be found at
15 nyc.gov/ccrbreports. We issue an annual
16 report, a semiannual report, a monthly statical
17 report and then also issue-based reports.

18 If you have any question about that please
19 feel free to come and find me.

20 MR. CARTER: One more we question.

21 MS. NAPOLITANO: Sure.

22 MR. CARTER: In regards to visual, is the
23 audio also included in the cameras apparatus?
24 Sometimes you have a visual, where you can see
25 what's going on, but you don't hear anything.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

53

1 MS. NAPOLITANO: It depends on what type
2 of video evidence it is.

3 So, for example body worn cameras do have
4 audio, when people shoot cellphone footage that
5 also has audio, and if it's video evidence for
6 example, like security footage from a store,
7 that typically does not.

8 MR. CARTER: Specifically, in regards to
9 the officers that we will be paying for them to
10 be utilizing the camera, will the audio also be
11 operational so that we don't only see the video
12 but we can hear the audio?

13 MS. NAPOLITANO: Yes, there is audio on
14 the body worn camera.

15 MR. DARCHE: So, Mr. Carter is very loud,
16 so it's not too much of an issue, but if people
17 have questions they should really come up,
18 because we try to record everything, and it's
19 not easy for the reporter to get the questions
20 if people don't come up.

21 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I'm also going to ask
22 Executive Director Darche if he will talk, just
23 a little bit about the entire process, from,
24 and quickly, from the time we receive a
25 complaint to how the board engages around it,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

54

1 and how the board engages around those.

2 And then we'll get questions.

3 MR. DARCHE: So, as Keith mentioned, there
4 are a variety of ways that people can make
5 complaints to the agency.

6 As soon as we get a complaint through our
7 Intake Unit, two things happen. Number one,
8 our Field Evidence Collection Unit goes into
9 motion to try to collect evidence. Whether
10 it's going to the scene to try to find
11 witnesses, or collect video evidence from
12 surveillance cameras. And the case is also
13 assigned to an investigator, like two who I
14 introduce earlier in the evening, and those
15 investigators speak to the complainant, get as
16 much information about the incident as they
17 can, and then start trying to find other
18 evidence. Whether it's speaking to other
19 civilian witnesses, gathering medical records,
20 and then they also request document from the
21 police department. They request body worn
22 cameras footage from the police department.
23 And then once they've accumulated all the other
24 evidence they're going to need, we interview
25 the police officers who are involved.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

55

1 We interview officers who were accused of
2 misconduct. We also interview witnesses who we
3 believe may have witnesses what happened, who
4 may have been witnesses to the incident.

5 Once the investigators have gathered all
6 the evidence, they apply that evidence to the
7 law, whether it's the constitution, or the laws
8 of the State of New York, or the case law that
9 governs what is legal what isn't legal in New
10 York state. But they also use the patrol guide
11 for how officers are trained to determine
12 whether the officer has committed misconduct or
13 not.

14 Then, once all that evidence is marshaled
15 and presented, it's presented to the board.
16 Generally, cases go to panels of three board
17 members. Each panel has one person who was
18 designated by the mayor, one person who was
19 designated by the city council, and one person
20 who was designated by the police commissioner.

21 And these panels meet and they discuss the
22 cases as they are presented in the closing
23 report. They review video evidence and other
24 pieces of evidence that are associated with the
25 case, and they make a determination.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

56

1 And it's one of those questions, I think
2 it was Mr. Carter who asked, like what are the
3 dispositions?

4 So, if the board determines by
5 preponderance of the evidence, so anything
6 above 50 percent, that misconduct occurred they
7 substantiate the allegation.

8 It may be that the board can determine by
9 preponderance of the evidence that the act
10 occurred, that the person complained that they
11 were stopped and they shouldn't have been
12 stopped, the board may determine that that stop
13 occurred, but that the police officer had the
14 right to make that stop, in which case they
15 exonerate that allegation.

16 And it may be that the board determines
17 that the the alleged conduct did not occur. So
18 the person says, I was stopped, and the board
19 was able to determine that the stop did not
20 occur, in that case the allegation is
21 unfounded.

22 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Questions?

23 MR. LOGAN: I don't mean to interrupt you
24 but -- do you want me to approach the mic?

25 MR. DARCHE: You should approach the mic

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

57

1 if you have a question.

2 MR. LOGAN: Jon Logan, Cambria Heights. I
3 appreciate everything that you're saying. And I
4 just want to thank you, the board, the CCRB is
5 on our side.

6 This is wonderful information, and it's
7 all on the website, but these guys do a great
8 job. I know some people who have filed some
9 complaints and the process is very good, I must
10 say that.

11 But what we're trying to get across to you
12 is there is a disconnect between people. The
13 people who need this information, the majority
14 of them are probably not here.

15 MS. DENNIS: Exactly.

16 MR. LOGAN: They are not in this room.
17 They don't attend these types of meetings. The
18 deepest injustices that are on the people and
19 the city of New York and the people that pass
20 through this city, they're not here.

21 And so, the leaders, some of them are
22 here, but we need some kind of robust program
23 that gets this information back to the people.

24 Whether it be some type of video series,
25 brother Robert Reich does the inequality for

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

58

1 all. He has a ton of videos -- there needs to
2 be some type of substantial, robust program
3 that brings --

4 Everyone is on their phone now. People are
5 not reading. Now, I love to read. I read these
6 two 400 page reports, I read these things
7 because it gives me some good information to
8 bring back to the people, but people need to
9 understand what their rights are, so they can
10 really know where to go and how to bring some
11 type of change.

12 So, I appreciate the process, the process
13 is a very good process, there are people on the
14 phone, they record everything, it's very good,
15 so I appreciate you going through all that, but
16 how can we get this information where it needs
17 to go?

18 And I can speak more and more about the
19 implicit biases -- we need to have some real
20 conversations about things.

21 MR. DARCHE: So, Mr. Logan, I actually
22 think that the podcast, or videocast, that you
23 were just describing is a pretty good idea.
24 So, thank you for that.

25 As Keith was describing in his

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

59

1 presentation, our outreach unit does do a lot
2 work to try to get to people so they can find
3 out about us.

4 MR. LOGAN: They absolutely do.

5 MR. DARCHE: In 2017, I think there were,
6 approximately, four thousand complaints that
7 were within our jurisdiction that we
8 investigated.

9 And I don't think that there were only
10 four thousand times people interacted with the
11 police where they thought they weren't treated
12 properly.

13 MR. LOGAN: Exactly.

14 MR. DARCHE: So, I think that there is
15 clearly a lot of work that this agency has to
16 come up with ways to let people find out about
17 this agency. And I think the videocast idea is
18 a very good idea and I appreciate that and will
19 look into it.

20 MR. EASON: I would encourage you also,
21 Mr. Logan, to speak with our outreach unit.
22 And for the young lady who spoke from the
23 community board prior to you, I would encourage
24 you to take these conversations that needs to
25 be had, and we all recognize that, we all know

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

60

1 that, to the police precincts where the
2 neighborhood community officer, start with him
3 or her, and have that dialogue spread out from
4 there, and it will be a continuation of what's
5 going on here tonight -- at every opportunity
6 that you can.

7 These conversations should be had, and
8 certain individuals should be at the table.

9 It's disheartening to hear there is a
10 disconnect, nobody is doing this, nobody is
11 doing that. Because I believe on both fronts,
12 you're doing, you're speaking out, and the
13 police precincts also want to be held
14 responsible.

15 And, you heard Mr. Darche speak of the
16 number of ways that the complaints are
17 investigated, and he mentioned that police
18 officers are also bound by a code of conduct --

19 MR. LOGAN: They are.

20 MR. EASON: -- their patrol guide.

21 MR. LOGAN: Which is available on website,
22 the patrol guide.

23 MR. EASON: Correct. And that's just like
24 the public is expected to be guided by a code
25 of conduct, the police officers are trained in

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

61

1 that also. So, it's on both sides. The
2 responsibility is there. Maybe, it may not be
3 always to your satisfaction --

4 MR. LOGAN: No, no.

5 MR. EASON: -- but it's there.

6 MR. LOGAN: We have to have honest
7 conversations. The Mayor acknowledges -- he's
8 not here to speak for himself, but the Mayor
9 acknowledges that implicit bias exists. NCO
10 officers get implicit bias training, so they
11 get that.

12 See, if you ask a police officer right
13 now -- if he's required to have ten contact
14 cards on him every tour -- if you ask for one,
15 he may curse at you. I don't know if you have
16 ever been cursed at by a police officer. I'm
17 not here to broad stroke anyone, what I'm
18 saying is there are problems out there.

19 MR. EASON: Of course, that's why we're
20 all here --

21 MR. LOGAN: Absolutely.

22 MR. EASON: -- because we want to get at
23 the root of those problems.

24 MR. LOGAN: That's right.

25 MR. EASON: Nobody wants to sweep them

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

62

1 under the rug. It's there. That's why we're
2 here. That's why the public is here. That's
3 why the precinct representatives are here.

4 MR. LOGAN: I would like to hear from some
5 of the precinct representatives.

6 MR. DARCHE: We have a lot people who
7 signed up to speak, so thank you, Mr. Logan,
8 but we really need to --

9 MS. DENNIS: I really want to address the
10 issue that you're going through the protocol of
11 what happens with these inquires around
12 officers that are showing up badly in these
13 communities that we live and serve in, and what
14 I'm seeing is, the residual affect of that, is
15 that the relationship is broken. Once that
16 happens, results come back, and no one is being
17 held accountable.

18 How do you change people's mind set around
19 the police department if you slam the mallet
20 down and say, case closed? People are not
21 feeling that, okay? They're in fear and if
22 they're in fear of the officers that are
23 serving the communities that they're living in,
24 then they're not going to trust them, they're
25 not going to approach you or anybody else and

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

63

1 come and say, this is what happened.

2 A lot things are getting brushed to side.
3 You don't see half of the things going on, you
4 only hear about the ones that might be
5 broadcasted in the news. You don't really walk
6 these streets, working these trenches like we
7 do, so, when we come to you and ask for
8 solutions and you tell us that a due process is
9 going to happen between an officer that has
10 behaved badly in the community, and really
11 mistreated someone, and then that officer walks
12 away scot free, how do you turn that person's
13 attitude around about community partnerships,
14 community relationships or community building?
15 You can't engage people after that.

16 And that's what I see. I talked to
17 mothers. I talked to teenagers. I've talked to
18 people right from the DA's office that say they
19 got better treatment from the DA's office then
20 they did from the police department. And they
21 don't trust the police, but they'll call the
22 DA's office for services rather than dealing
23 with the police officers that are here, that
24 are in the communities.

25 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I think that's why we

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

64

1 have these meetings.

2 MS. DENNIS: And one more thing, the NCOs
3 are being dumped on, okay? They cannot serve
4 the masses that they're trying to cover with
5 the number of NCOs that are in these
6 communities. They are being dumped on and they
7 can't handle the work, and the police
8 department is just worried about their status.

9 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, the value of this
10 kind of public airing is that these issues have
11 been raised, there are people here who are
12 responsible for addressing them, and they will
13 be addressed.

14 Again, it won't change overnight. It's
15 going to take some time, but that's why we are
16 here. That's why we're here.

17 MS. DENNIS: That's all I'm asking.

18 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, we are going to
19 go to the speaker's list, and after speakers
20 list, if people still have questions then we'll
21 take questions.

22 So, I have first on the speakers list,
23 Maryanne Ryan. And two minutes please,
24 Ms. Ryan, thank you.

25 MS. RYAN: As we know NYPD has special

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

65

1 divisions, and that includes the police that go
2 into the department of homeless service
3 shelters.

4 Now, as a residence of one of those
5 shelters I have seen marijuana get by, I've
6 seen K2 get by. But I have -- when I go
7 through the metal detector, my titanium in my
8 leg goes off. I am often asked to go back
9 through the metal detector even though I have a
10 medical card that says I have metal in my body.

11 Now, I feel that's a violation of my
12 rights as a person with a disability. And
13 nobody else does that. There are some officers
14 that do recognize I will always bleep off. But
15 there are always a few that go above and beyond
16 the arrogant and ignorant, and insist I go back
17 through, even though I'm trying to find that
18 card, and I always keep it on me. That is
19 hubris at its height.

20 Unfortunately, I can't make a complaint
21 every time they do this about this disrespect.
22 I mean, I have seen them speak discourteously
23 to the residents. I have seen them use
24 excessive force with the residents and
25 excessive authority with the residents.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

66

1 I can't complaint until I leave the
2 shelter for fear of retribution when this
3 happens.

4 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, can I suggest
5 Ms. Ryan, that you at least have a conversation
6 with --who are the investigators here from
7 CCRB?

8 MR. DARCHE: Patrick.

9 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Would you just have a
10 conversation with him, yes? Next on the
11 speakers list is Susan Petza.

12 MS. PETZA: Hi, my name is Susan Petza.
13 I'm here representing Community Mediation
14 Services.

15 We are a nonprofit. We offer services to
16 the community, to the police. We're on 311.
17 We receive calls from communities with relation
18 to problem with family conflicts,
19 parents/teenagers, separating couples, divorce,
20 custody/visitation, and the list goes on in
21 like different cases that go through our
22 agency.

23 We have also a DT cases for first
24 nonviolent offenders, and this service is out
25 there for the community, and I'm here to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

67

1 represent that you don't have to go beyond
2 going to court or calling the police, or
3 anything that we can resolve by ourselves.

4 We have mediators, and I assume that you
5 guys have mediators here too, to resolve the
6 conflicts with the police and the communities.
7 And this extends beyond the police and
8 community and extends to the the whole
9 community itself.

10 We're here offering Queens, all of Queens,
11 there are five boroughs and we represent
12 Queens. The service is there, it's free of
13 costs and we are here to serve you.

14 So, please call us in case you have any
15 conflicts. We're here to help and this is a
16 confidential, so whatever is said there, stays
17 there. Of course, if there is violence, child
18 neglect, child abuse or any violence or threat
19 to the parties involved we don't have those
20 case there.

21 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: So, ma'am, if you can
22 give your card to our outreach people.
23 Actually, I think Rose is here, right?

24 So, you can give your card to Rosemary,
25 she's the deputy in our mediation unit.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

68

1 MS. PETZA: Great. I will talk to you
2 soon.

3 So, we are here offering the services, and
4 again, it's a volunteer process.

5 So, finishing off, and if there is an
6 agreement, your case doesn't have to be out
7 there. It can be resolved. We have our on right
8 to have that service. Thank you very much, I
9 appreciate it.

10 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you very much.
11 Next on the list is Philip Nelson.

12 MR. NELSON: Good evening everyone. My
13 name is Philip Nelson, I'm from Urban Upbound,
14 we're just around the corner, different sites
15 in New York City. We do breaking the cycles of
16 poverty through out workforce development
17 program child readiness program, free tax prep,
18 college access, job placement, job readiness,
19 financial literacy.

20 I'm one of the financial counselors for
21 the youth pathway in partnership with NYC and
22 human resources administration.

23 So, I'm going to be very brief, but one of
24 the things I'm hearing this is my first --
25 meeting with CCRB -- you have to find a way to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

69

1 connect with the youth.

2 I'm around the corner. I run the youth
3 pathway program financial, I found out about
4 this meeting an hour and a half ago, and our
5 offices are right around the corner. We handle
6 Queensbridge, Ravenswood, Astoria, and I just
7 found out about it, so I know the youth don't
8 know about it.

9 So, technology is important, I'm from the
10 tech business before I got into nonprofit,
11 there has got to be ways, a website or apps,
12 that kids just know that hey there's a meeting,
13 or hey, here's what you do if you get stopped
14 by the cops, or here's what you do -- a lot of
15 things are going on around here like the new
16 bike lanes. I've seen kids harassed for riding
17 their bikes on the sidewalk because they're
18 probably going to get hit by a car on Vernon
19 Boulevard, because everyone in this area knows
20 that Vernon Boulevard is a very, very busy
21 street. They get harassed for riding their
22 bike, going to their job, or going to an F
23 train to go to job placement. So, the
24 discouragement starts as soon as they leave
25 their house in order to better their life.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

70

1 So, we have to really try to find -- like
2 the brother said -- solutions. You know, forums
3 are great but we have to try to find solutions.

4 And again, we're just around the corner,
5 we have to find a way to reach the youth and
6 obviously the aging population. Okay. That's
7 it.

8 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Can we have our
9 Outreach Director --

10 MR. NELSON: They were there today, so
11 I'll give them credit. He did come by the
12 office today.

13 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: -- and here's another
14 one, right here, so we will continue to try to
15 work together.

16 MR. DARCHE: Give our regards to Bishop
17 Taylor.

18 MR. NELSON: Yeah, I know you guys know
19 Bishop Taylor, our CEO.

20 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

21 We have Mirian Jones. Did I get that
22 right?

23 MS. JONES: Good evening everybody. My
24 name is Miriam Jones, and I'm also from Urban
25 Upbound.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

71

1 I run the College Access Department and
2 I'm the College Access Coordinator. I actually
3 sent, for the last four years, I've sent my
4 high school interns to CCRB to intern in the
5 summer.

6 I'm very familiar with CCRB, but after
7 hearing everybody talk, especially you, and the
8 religious figure as well, I definitely see that
9 there is a need to get to the youth.

10 This Friday I'm actually having a session
11 with -- what's your name again -- Tricia --
12 she's coming to my organization to speak to the
13 youth about Know Your Rights.

14 Phil teaches financial literacy, I do
15 college prep work shops, and you know,
16 unfortunately, we have to have children know
17 their rights. So, you know what to do if a
18 creditor calls you saying you owe a debt, and
19 what to do if you owe a loan. Since there is a
20 problem that exist, we have to you know, know
21 what to do if you get into an issue with a
22 police officer.

23 So, I just recently -- I used to only
24 teach high school students, but recently we
25 partnered with HRA for young adults that are 18

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

72

1 to 24 year olds to come to our program every
2 day. A lot of them are undereducated, or they
3 may have records, or they may have had
4 encounters with the police, and I guarantee you
5 that they don't know about CCRB.

6 And I definitely want to make a conscious
7 effort for, you know, the youth and communities
8 like this and for people that look like me, to
9 know what they can do when they're approached
10 by police officers or if have an issue with
11 police officers. I'm going to help the
12 outreach team too, since I have worked with
13 CCRB for the last four years. My boss was on
14 the board and I've sent many -- at least 16 --
15 interns to you guys.

16 MR. DARCHE: Thank you.

17 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. I think
18 that is the end of the -- no, I have an
19 L. Picard.

20 MS. PICARD: Yes, that is a correct.

21 Good evening, I'm the mother of an
22 adolescent child. I'm here about police
23 activities with the adolescent children. Not
24 just the children that your are able to turn
25 into prisoners or make the count at the end of

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

73

1 the month.

2 There's a situation going on in district
3 30, and I'm not sure if any of these parents
4 who have children in district 30 are aware of a
5 Ms. Dionne Jaggon, who is married to a police
6 officer, who is just outrageous when it comes
7 to the discipline inside of PS 111 Community
8 School Jacob Blackwell. District 30,
9 Dr. Composto has been aware of these
10 situations. I have brought it to his
11 attention. It took me eight visits, lasting
12 four hours each, in order to get my daughter an
13 emergency safety transfer after she was
14 assaulted by Ms. Jaggon, and it is on camera.

15 District 30 -- I went to the district. I
16 filed a complete report with the district and
17 Dr. Composto showed me what he filed, three
18 complaints, not even a paragraph.

19 He also filed a complaint stating that it
20 was handled, the parent is satisfied. The
21 parent is not satisfied. The child is not
22 satisfied.

23 And if the police would like to, like
24 maybe get another PAL because PAL is seven
25 blocks from here.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

74

1 We have a hard time letting our children
2 going to the corner store, especially with all
3 this new violence activity happening in the
4 neighborhood.

5 So, there is a lot going on in District
6 30, within this Long Island City, Astoria
7 community. That's several schools --

8 MR. DARCHE: Ma'am, are these problems
9 with police officers or are these problems
10 within the schools about students, among the
11 students themselves?

12 MS. PICARD: Ms. Jaggon put her hand on my
13 child and --

14 MR. DARCHE: The teacher?

15 MS. PICARD: She's the principal.

16 MR. DARCHE: Oh, okay.

17 MS. PICARD: And the school did not have a
18 first grade teacher for eight months. I
19 complained to the district about these things.

20 I'm not exactly sure, I know this is about
21 police and everything like that, but the safety
22 officer, who is still working there, informed
23 me of several routes to take. And I do have my
24 hands on the security tape where this woman is
25 putting her hand on my daughter.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

75

1 So, District 30 and the police, you should
2 all been aware of what might be going on,
3 coming soon.

4 So, I would like to thank you all for
5 coming out to the community and finding out
6 what's happening, and 8, 9, 5, 6, 7, two and a
7 half, they go to early childhood development --

8 MR. DARCHE: So, it is either Charlie or
9 Patrick in the back?

10 MS. PICARD: I filed my complaint with
11 these young men already.

12 MR. DARCHE: Oh, okay, so thank you very
13 much ma'am.

14 MS. PICARD: All right. Thank you and have
15 a good night.

16 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you very much.

17 So, I'm going to ask our board member,
18 Angela Fernandez, if she will say a few words
19 in Spanish and then we'll see if there are any
20 people who want to make comments in Spanish and
21 she can translate.

22 SPEAKER: Is there any public speaking
23 time left?

24 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No, I'm sorry. Well,
25 other than to hear from people who haven't

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

76

1 already spoken and who like to speak in Spanish
2 only.

3 SPEAKER: We haven't heard anything from
4 the police officers and community officers.

5 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We gave them an
6 opportunity to speak.

7 (Mr. Fernandez addresses
8 audience in Spanish.)

9 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All right. Then
10 we'll have the one final person in the back who
11 said they wanted to speak, for two minutes, and
12 then we'll move on with the agenda.

13 SPEAKER: I'll be really quick. There's a
14 lot conversation about the youth and --

15 MR. DARCHE: Can you give us your name?

16 SPEAKER: I'm good. There's a lot of
17 conversation about the youth, and seeing as I'm
18 a young person myself, I'm 21, and a lot of my
19 close colleagues are in college or high school,
20 I live right next to Jamaica High School, and I
21 think we need to be a little more
22 clarification -- but I really want to backtrack
23 to some of the comments that were made earlier.

24 And to clarify, it shouldn't be on the
25 burden of people who are victims of police

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

77

1 misconduct, police brutality to then take their
2 traumas and go to those people who are causing
3 that in order to get justice. Justice should
4 just naturally flow down.

5 But one thing when it comes to the youth,
6 there was this one comment that was made, you
7 know, it a marathon and not a sprint. I think
8 that's kind of a little bit insulting to the
9 intelligence of everybody that's in here
10 because of the fact that 400 years is a long
11 ass marathon in order to get justice. And the
12 fact that we all kind of know the systematic
13 things that are going on. And one problem with
14 the CCRB is that through its complaint system,
15 it treats these things as individual cases of
16 misconduct. It doesn't actually attack the
17 systematic idea and the premise that the
18 brother was touching upon.

19 (Police exit.)

20 SPEAKER: Awesome. Good to see them go.
21 So, see, this is the type of disconnect that
22 happens when other people are speaking and when
23 the meeting isn't finished, you have the people
24 who are supposed to serve our communities just
25 walk out.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

78

1 MR. LOGAN: That's what I was speaking
2 about.

3 SPEAKER: After they took the pictures,
4 sat in the back --

5 MR. LOGAN: That's right.

6 SPEAKER: -- they walk out. See, this is
7 the type of behavior that the youth see, but
8 what's worse is we're expected to show up to
9 Know Your Rights Campaigns. We're supposed to
10 show up at each and every type of instance, and
11 what that does is it tells us that police
12 misconduct is normal. That through Knowing Your
13 Rights, they're going to be abridged at some
14 point, so make sure you're ready up. That
15 you're going to be stopped on the sidewalk,
16 that your humanity at each and every turn, from
17 when you walk to the corner store, to when
18 you're coming to the library, or when you're in
19 the school with the safety officers, that those
20 types of things are normal. And I'm here to
21 tell you it's not.

22 MR. LOGAN: That's right.

23 SPEAKER: So, me asking a lot of my
24 colleagues to come here tonight -- I told a lot
25 of my friends, a lot of high schoolers -- hey,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

79

1 I know you have a lot of things going on, but I
2 said, come -- and you know what they said? No.

3 Like this question is always framed to the
4 youth but the answer is no, because why, why
5 would I want to show up here and talk to people
6 who, one, aren't listening to the fact there is
7 a disconnect, but to hear the constant framing
8 of this issue as a, dialogue, as if our
9 experiences are the same. As if the
10 experiences of people who are subject -- I'll
11 finish, don't worry -- people who are subject
12 to misconduct and people who perpetuate
13 misconduct, those experiences are on the same
14 plane.

15 But what should really be talked about is,
16 and what the CCRB should really recommend is
17 actually investing in our communities, right?
18 People don't want to grow up and commit crimes.
19 My peers don't want to --

20 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: I'm going to have to
21 have to ask you to wrap it up.

22 SPEAKER: I got you, don't worry. So
23 people, I find it funny, the day that I'll be
24 convinced that we need an increase in police
25 officers and we need this dialogue to happen is

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

80

1 when we show up to show-and-tell days, or
2 what-do-you-want-to-be career days, and people
3 are saying, I want to grow up and be a
4 criminal. That's the day that I'll
5 understanding why we need to have increased
6 enforcement of police officers in our community
7 is when people decide when they grow up they
8 want to rob the local corner store, right?
9 People don't want to do that. What should
10 really be discussed here is how can we better
11 invest in our youth, invest in our communities
12 so that these things don't happen in the first
13 place.

14 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

15 SPEAKER: Hold on -- I'm almost done.
16 Rather than diagnosing the problems, we should
17 have a solution to the problems.

18 MR. LOGAN: Please let him finish.

19 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. Thank you.

20 SPEAKER: I'm almost done.

21 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No, you're done.

22 SPEAKER: I'm almost done.

23 MR. LOGAN: Mr. Chair?

24 SPEAKER: Let me wrap up --

25 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: No you are done.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

81

1 SPEAKER: -- all I want to do is wrap up.
2 I'm going to finish.

3 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We are going to cut
4 off the mic. I'll give you ten seconds and then
5 we're done. Thank you.

6 SPEAKER: Can I finish? Can I finish? I
7 didn't interrupt you. Can I wrap up?

8 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you. We are
9 done. So, who has the mic? Soren?

10 SPEAKER: How is this engaging? All I
11 wanted to do was wrap up. How is this engaging?
12 I'm going to finish anyway. So, what should
13 really be discussed here is how we can actually
14 embolden the youth to come out here, not to
15 show up for a photo op, not to show up to get
16 shut down, but to show up in a way that
17 actually empowers them.

18 What a lot of this is inspiring people to
19 come here, without actually giving them the
20 tools to solve their own communities. What we
21 should be asking people is why they feel that
22 it's necessary to have police in their
23 communities in the first place. Why should we
24 have this conversation in the first place? But
25 the dialogue is all wrong. We're not speaking

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

82

1 the same language, and we not coming from the
2 same place.

3 So, what you guys need to do is take a
4 step back.

5 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

6 SPEAKER: What you guys need to do are
7 research and studies about how you can help
8 empower the youth, not just ask them to show up
9 to some bullshit meeting.

10 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you.

11 (Some clapping.)

12 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: We have Vanessa
13 Jones. It seems she signed up to speak as
14 well. Okay. Ms. Jones, two minutes, please.

15 MS. JONES: Good evening everyone. My
16 name is Vanessa Jones Hall. I'm from Astoria
17 Housing and Residents Association as well as a
18 community board member of one.

19 I'm sorry that had to happen to you young
20 man, although the time is limited. But what you
21 said was very positive.

22 In my own community we had to fight for
23 those NCOs who are bombarded, and who are
24 overwhelmed, that come into protect our
25 neighborhood. We had to really fight for the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

83

1 officers to come and walk the beat, like it
2 used to be when I was young.

3 And when the officers were part of the
4 community, they became part of the family. And
5 when you have officers coming in and engaging
6 in your community -- engaging in your community
7 is not riding through in your vehicle. Because
8 that's intimidating. Engaging is actually
9 coming in and meet and greeting with the
10 residents of the community that they're in.
11 Come in to say hello. Speak to them. Have a
12 conversation. Not just try to inquire about
13 what just happen, or what is about to happen,
14 or what might occur, but have a general
15 conversation. Just a pow wow. Just to see
16 where everyone is coming from. And there you
17 will see a better relation, because if I'm
18 going to be out there, as a resident's
19 associate member, or even as a community board
20 member, and tell the youth, the young people to
21 respect law, they have to see for themselves
22 that the law is being respected.

23 And you have to make sure when you say
24 that you're here to serve the people of the
25 communities that all these officers serve, I'm

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

84

1 in the 114 precinct, PSA9, and we do have PSA9
2 officers that are very engaging. Our N C.O.
3 officers are very engaging. But the 114th
4 precinct, when they came out to our community
5 they did a planned raid. Two school terms ago,
6 beginning of the school year, in Astoria
7 houses, and they planned it on the first day of
8 school. And that was so disheartening to our
9 community. It was terrifying to our community.
10 We had children that had to be sent home
11 because they were terrified. We had residents
12 who were waiting to get on the bus to go to
13 work who was terrified.

14 Now this was a planned thing, it wouldn't
15 have wouldn't have been done in any other
16 neighborhood.

17 MR. CARTER: That's right.

18 MS. JONES: It was unfair. We got
19 apologies from the 114, only because we came
20 out in outrage of how dare they did that to us.

21 Now, it's one thing to say you're going to
22 plan a raid, because like us, we would like to
23 get rid of those element in our community but
24 there is certain way of how you do it, and what
25 was done is we were terrorize, the entire

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

85

1 community, when this took place.

2 I just want to say, like everyone else
3 said, let's properly engage one another. Let's
4 properly give each other respect. Because, just
5 like us, we want to feel safe in our
6 communities. Just like us, we want to make
7 sure that the law is respected. Just like us,
8 we want the law to enter our communities with
9 respect.

10 Have a good night everyone.

11 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you so very
12 much. Thank you.

13 That ends the Public Comment Section of
14 the meeting.

15 We will move to see if there is any Old
16 Business to come before the board?

17 (No response.)

18 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Any New Business to
19 come before the board?

20 (No response.)

21 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Hearing none I have a
22 motion to adjourn to Executive Session. Is
23 there a motion?

24 MR. DARCHE: Motion.

25 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Is there a second?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

86

1 MR. EASON: Second.

2 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: All those in favor of
3 adjourning to Executives Session, please say
4 aye.

5 (A chorus of ayes)

6 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Any opposition?

7 (No response.)

8 ACTING CHAIR DAVIE: Thank you all. We
9 will adjourn to Executives Session. I thank
10 you all for coming. Thank you for your
11 comments. I want you to know you have been
12 heard. And I want you to know that we don't
13 meet here and not take it seriously. So, keep
14 fighting. Keep contributing. Keep being good
15 citizens. And we are hear to do it with you.

16 Thank you so much. The meeting is being
17 adjourned to Executive Session.

18 (Whereupon, the board holds an
19 Executive Session.)

20 (Whereupon, the board meeting
21 concludes.)

22

23

24

25

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE OF NEW YORK)
) ss.
COUNTY OF WESTCHESTER)

I, DEIRDRE SMITH, Court Reporter and
Notary Public within and for the County of
Westchester, State of New York, do hereby certify
that I reported the proceedings that are
hereinbefore set forth, and that such transcript is
a true and accurate record of said proceedings.

I further certify that I am not related to any
of the parties to this action by blood or marriage,
and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of
this matter.

WITNESS MY HAND, this 6th day of February, 2018.

Deirdre Smith

Deirdre Smith	My commision expires:
Notary Public	April, 2019

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

A		
ability (1) 8:4	Advocate's (1) 50:25	ass (1) 77:11
able (4) 30:11 31:8 56:19 72:24	affect (2) 7:22 62:14	assaulted (1) 73:14
abridged (1) 78:13	Affirmations (1) 17:9	Assemblyman (1) 9:19
absolutely (4) 42:18 51:13 59:4 61:21	afraid (2) 30:10 40:24	Assemblymember (1) 9:13
abuse (5) 45:9 48:5,14,19 67:18	agencies (1) 5:9	asset (1) 32:16
abusive (1) 22:15	agency (12) 11:7,11,16,21 31:11 32:17 33:17 45:4 54:5 59:15,17 66:22	assigned (1) 54:13
abut (1) 25:8	agency's (4) 10:15,21,22 31:12	associate (1) 83:19
access (3) 68:18 71:1,2	agenda (4) 2:1 34:18 44:5 76:12	associated (2) 51:1 55:24
accompanied (1) 6:14	aggressively (1) 16:7	Association (5) 4:8,15 34:25 35:5 82:17
accompaniment (1) 21:2	aging (1) 70:6	assume (1) 67:4
accompanying (1) 6:18	ago (3) 33:12 69:4 84:5	assumes (1) 43:18
accountability (1) 43:17	agree (1) 14:25	assured (1) 32:3
accountable (4) 8:4 36:1 43:5 62:17	agreement (1) 68:6	Astoria (9) 4:4,15 14:19 20:10,19 69:6 74:6 82:16 84:6
accumulated (1) 54:23	agrees (3) 7:14,15,17	attack (1) 77:16
accurate (1) 87:11	ahead (1) 5:17	attend (1) 57:17
accused (1) 55:1	airing (1) 64:10	attending (1) 11:24
ACD (3) 38:15,16,17	al (1) 39:17	attention (5) 23:7 25:21 31:16 33:10 73:11
acknowledge (2) 10:14 30:21	Alive (2) 4:2 13:23	attitude (1) 63:13
acknowledges (2) 61:7,9	allegation (4) 48:25 56:7,15,20	attorney (3) 36:8 37:18 39:14
act (14) 7:5,12,20,22 8:2 10:25 11:1,3 31:25 35:18 36:22 40:12 49:9 56:9	allegations (7) 30:21,25 45:6,9 48:4,9 49:4	attuned (1) 23:8
acting (76) 1:15 2:4 5:1,5 8:20,23 9:1,4 11:25 12:4,13,16 13:4,9,12 18:25 19:25 20:4,7 23:15,19 27:12 29:9,12,14,18,23 32:12,18 32:20,23 34:13 36:1 41:7 42:5,19 43:1 44:10,16,19 46:14,17 53:21 56:22 63:25 64:9,18 66:4,9 67:21 68:10 70:8,13,20 72:17 75:16,24 76:5,9 79:20 80:14,19,21,25 81:3 81:8 82:5,10,12 85:11,18,21,25 86:2,6,8	alleged (2) 49:8 56:17	audience (7) 14:9 17:9 19:24 27:24 31:8 51:17 76:8
action (3) 39:5,12 87:14	allowing (2) 10:3 23:24	audio (6) 52:23 53:4,5,10,12,13
actions (1) 40:5	amassed (1) 30:8	authorities (1) 21:8
activities (1) 72:23	amazing (1) 20:16	authority (7) 23:9 30:11 45:10 48:5 48:14,19 65:25
activity (1) 74:3	America (3) 20:23 33:8 45:4	automatically (2) 17:23 18:23
addition (3) 10:13 11:16 32:8	amount (1) 24:17	available (2) 10:22 60:21
address (1) 62:9	Angela (2) 3:5 75:18	avoid (1) 38:17
addressed (3) 27:13,14 64:13	annual (1) 52:15	aware (8) 7:4 20:17 23:10 33:5,7 73:4,9 75:2
addresses (1) 76:7	anonymous (1) 51:15	Awesome (1) 77:20
addressing (1) 64:12	answer (1) 79:4	awkward (1) 17:21
adjourn (3) 2:12 85:22 86:9	anybody (7) 17:11 18:23 20:1,13 44:11 46:1 62:25	aye (1) 86:4
adjourned (1) 86:17	anymore (1) 37:23	eyes (1) 86:5
adjourning (1) 86:3	anyway (1) 81:12	
administration (1) 68:22	apologies (1) 84:19	B
Administrative (1) 50:19	apparatus (1) 52:23	B (1) 1:14
admitted (1) 39:23	apply (1) 55:6	back (14) 25:16 26:15 30:16 34:20 47:6 57:23 58:8 62:16 65:8,16 75:9 76:10 78:4 82:4
adolescent (2) 72:22,23	appointed (1) 40:9	background (1) 21:24
adults (1) 71:25	appreciate (6) 23:24 57:3 58:12,15 59:18 68:9	backtrack (1) 76:22
advantage (1) 32:11	approach (3) 56:24,25 62:25	backwards (1) 35:20
advice (1) 41:21	approached (1) 72:9	bad (2) 29:1 36:20
advocacy (2) 33:5 46:21	approximately (1) 59:6	badly (2) 62:12 63:10
advocate (1) 26:3	apps (1) 69:11	balmy (1) 5:12
	April (1) 87:22	barely (1) 47:10
	APU (1) 50:18	Barwell's (1) 9:20
	Aravella (1) 9:9	based (2) 18:24 49:2
	area (5) 14:8,18 15:13 16:23 69:19	basic (1) 36:25
	areas (3) 19:5 33:15 48:1	basically (1) 38:18
	arrest (1) 38:12	basis (2) 14:15 38:5
	arrests (1) 38:10	beat (1) 83:1
	arrogant (1) 65:16	
	asked (2) 56:2 65:8	
	asking (3) 64:17 78:23 81:21	

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

beautiful (1) 15:14
becoming (1) 52:6
beginning (1) 84:6
behaved (1) 63:10
behavior (3) 32:4,6 78:7
behaviors (2) 18:9,10
believe (7) 6:5 28:2 34:4 40:11
42:25 55:3 60:11
beneficial (1) 23:14
benefit (1) 22:18
best (5) 30:20 31:1,12 32:3,5
better (8) 6:8 11:12,18 28:9 63:19
69:25 80:10 83:17
beyond (3) 65:15 67:1,7
bias (5) 36:11,12,15 61:9,10
biases (1) 58:19
big (1) 22:3
bike (2) 69:16,22
bikes (1) 69:17
Bishop (2) 70:16,19
bit (7) 29:6 36:25 41:21 46:12
51:25 53:23 77:8
black (2) 36:19,20
Blacks (2) 38:2,15
Blackwell (1) 73:8
Blasio (1) 5:8
bleeding (1) 36:4
bleep (1) 65:14
blessed (1) 22:8
blocks (2) 33:9 73:25
blood (1) 87:14
blue (1) 49:16
board (44) 1:2 3:1 5:3,5,7 11:25
14:16,16 20:5 23:16 24:1,2 26:10
26:13 28:10 33:1,19 35:6,6 42:4
43:9 44:24 45:3 46:15 50:17
53:25 54:1 55:15,16 56:4,8,12,16
56:18 57:4 59:23 72:14 75:17
82:18 83:19 85:16,19 86:18,20
Board's (1) 5:3
body (8) 6:25 7:16,18 31:25 53:3
53:14 54:21 65:10
bombarded (1) 82:23
book (2) 21:4 22:2
boots (1) 41:15
borough (2) 5:22 48:12
boroughs (1) 67:11
boss (1) 72:13
bottom (3) 37:9 41:23 42:23
Boulevard (3) 5:25 69:19,20
bound (1) 60:18
boxes (1) 22:7
boy (2) 17:16 18:2
breakdown (1) 28:25
breakdowns (1) 48:22
breaking (1) 68:15
bridge (1) 15:17

Bridging (1) 15:17
brief (2) 12:8 68:23
bring (5) 12:8 22:24 26:15 58:8,10
brings (1) 58:3
broad (1) 61:17
broadcasted (1) 63:5
broken (2) 52:12 62:15
Bronx (3) 16:16,21 17:14
Brooklyn (3) 17:15 19:6,14
brother (4) 17:12 57:25 70:2 77:18
brought (1) 73:10
brushed (1) 63:2
brutality (1) 77:1
BTG (2) 15:13,17
build (5) 22:11,24 26:21 30:18
31:13
building (1) 63:14
built (1) 16:20
bullshit (1) 82:9
burden (1) 76:25
bus (1) 84:12
business (8) 2:10,11 7:7 25:4
42:13 69:10 85:16,18
busy (1) 69:20

C

C.O (1) 84:2
call (10) 2:3 6:3 7:10 11:15 14:12
34:23 45:14 51:22 63:21 67:14
called (2) 19:3 22:2
callers (1) 11:19
calling (1) 67:2
calls (2) 66:17 71:18
Cambria (4) 4:7 34:24 35:5 57:2
camera (8) 6:25 7:16,18 22:13
31:25 53:10,14 73:14
cameras (5) 32:1 52:23 53:3 54:12
54:22
Campaigns (1) 78:9
Captain (6) 8:17,18,19 9:2,3,4
captains (2) 12:10 43:13
car (2) 35:25 69:18
card (5) 7:7 65:10,18 67:22,24
cards (1) 61:14
career (1) 80:2
cars (1) 19:18
Carter (18) 4:2 13:23,25 14:10
17:10,13 19:2 20:8 21:12 50:4,10
51:5 52:20,22 53:8,15 56:2 84:17
case (14) 14:10 27:25 33:24 34:5
51:14 54:12 55:8,25 56:14,20
62:20 67:14,20 68:6
cases (8) 45:5 52:3,5 55:16,22
66:21,23 77:15
causing (1) 77:2
CBO (2) 16:13,14
CBOs (2) 16:12,18

CCRB (31) 2:6,7 5:8 6:16,19 7:21
8:5 9:22 10:10 11:19 28:16 29:25
30:9,11 31:4,7,11 33:13 41:12
45:13 46:6,21 57:4 66:7 68:25
71:4,6 72:5,13 77:14 79:16
CCRB's (2) 5:5 52:7
cellphone (1) 53:4
CEO (1) 70:19
ceremony (1) 36:4
certain (5) 24:8 36:22 45:5 60:8
84:24
certainly (1) 8:2
certify (2) 87:8,13
Chair (78) 1:15 2:4 5:1,5 8:20,23
9:1,4 11:25 12:4,13,16,18 13:4,9
13:12 18:25 19:25 20:4,7 23:15
23:19 27:12 29:9,12,14,18,23
32:12,18,20,23 34:13 35:3 41:7
42:5,19 43:1 44:10,16,19 46:14
46:17 53:21 56:22 63:25 64:9,18
66:4,9 67:21 68:10 70:8,13,20
72:17 75:16,24 76:5,9 79:20
80:14,19,21,23,25 81:3,8 82:5,10
82:12 85:11,18,21,25 86:2,6,8
Chairman (2) 9:24 10:24
chances (1) 31:21
change (7) 4:6 8:2,5 32:15 58:11
62:18 64:14
chaotic (1) 24:20
charged (1) 38:13
charges (2) 50:17,20
Charlie (2) 10:9 75:8
cheap (1) 27:16
child (6) 67:17,18 68:17 72:22
73:21 74:13
childhood (1) 75:7
children (7) 39:11 71:16 72:23,24
73:4 74:1 84:10
chills (1) 17:18
chilly (1) 5:14
chorus (1) 86:5
chosen (1) 21:25
church (4) 4:4 17:17 20:10,19
churches (1) 45:25
cities (3) 27:3,4,9
Citizen (2) 4:6 32:14
citizens (1) 86:15
city (22) 1:7 5:10,24 6:24 7:4 8:3
8:12 10:1 18:11 34:2 35:9 39:5
39:18,18 40:13,13 43:11 55:19
57:19,20 68:15 74:6
city's (2) 7:9 8:3
civic (4) 4:7 8:11 34:25 35:5
civilian (9) 1:2 5:2 7:14,15,17 43:8
44:24 45:2 54:19
civilian's (1) 7:23
civilians (7) 7:7,9,13 11:14 14:12

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

15:15 35:18
claim (2) 50:5,12
clapping (2) 27:24 82:11
clarification (1) 76:22
clarify (1) 76:24
Clark (1) 36:17
class (2) 39:4,12
clear (1) 24:5
clearly (2) 51:25 59:15
close (1) 76:19
closed (1) 62:20
closest (2) 46:23 49:13
closing (4) 51:21 52:3,7 55:22
coats (1) 16:1
code (2) 60:18,24
colleagues (5) 5:6 42:7 43:3 76:19
78:24
collect (2) 54:9,11
Collection (1) 54:8
collectively (1) 29:5
college (5) 68:18 71:1,2,15 76:19
color (2) 49:17,19
combat (1) 31:14
come (35) 12:9 16:12,16,21 17:7
17:14,15,15 18:13 21:18 24:22
25:1,16 28:4 29:5 46:12 47:3
52:19 53:17,20 59:16 62:16 63:1
63:7 70:11 72:1 78:24 79:2 81:14
81:19 82:24 83:1,11 85:16,19
comes (7) 17:18 18:16 37:10,15
40:21 73:6 77:5
coming (19) 6:3 7:20 12:20 16:22
21:6,7,23 23:9 25:24 43:11 71:12
75:3,5 78:18 82:1 83:5,9,16
86:10
command (1) 51:2
commanding (2) 8:15 12:5
comment (9) 2:8,9 7:10 13:13,16
32:21 46:15 77:6 85:13
commentary (1) 13:19
comments (8) 11:13,16 13:20
29:16 32:18 75:20 76:23 86:11
commision (1) 87:21
commissioner (3) 40:4 43:12
55:20
commit (1) 79:18
commitment (1) 43:20
committed (2) 43:23 55:12
commonly (1) 45:11
communicate (1) 28:9
communication (2) 26:21 29:11
communications (2) 11:11 28:25
communities (29) 14:4,7,21 22:11
22:24 24:3 25:17 26:25 27:21,23
35:9 43:15,16 45:24 62:13,23
63:24 64:6 66:17 67:6 72:7 77:24
79:17 80:11 81:20,23 83:25 85:6

85:8
community (72) 2:8 4:5,6,10 5:3,4
5:23 12:23,25 14:16,16 15:4,10
15:18 16:3,12,17 17:3 18:14,17
18:17,20 19:19 21:9 22:16 23:5
23:12,22 24:11,23 25:1,2,10,11
27:15 28:12,21 30:24 31:19,20
32:14 35:6,8 38:22 59:23 60:2
63:10,13,14,14 66:13,16,25 67:8
67:9 73:7 74:7 75:5 76:4 80:6
82:18,22 83:4,6,6,10,19 84:4,9,9
84:23 85:1
compare (1) 47:23
compared (2) 48:14 52:4
compelling (1) 36:7
complainant (1) 54:15
complained (2) 56:10 74:19
complaint (18) 1:2 5:2 10:11 45:2
45:14,16,21,22 47:1 48:1 52:9
53:25 54:6 65:20 66:1 73:19
75:10 77:14
complaints (34) 6:14,17,20 10:12
11:16,21 26:8 30:9,13 31:14,16
37:7 45:13 47:8,11,15,16,19
48:13,14,15,16,20,24 49:25
50:14 51:21,24 52:12 54:5 57:9
59:6 60:16 73:18
complement (1) 10:21
complete (1) 73:16
Composto (2) 73:9,17
comptroller's (1) 9:18
concern (3) 35:12 38:21 39:2
concerned (3) 28:20 37:4 41:22
concerning (1) 37:20
concerns (3) 30:2 33:23 35:8
concludes (1) 86:21
concrete (1) 32:1
conditions (1) 40:19
conduct (3) 56:17 60:18,25
conference (1) 30:17
confidence (1) 5:7
confidential (1) 67:16
confirmed (1) 38:9
conflicts (3) 66:18 67:6,15
confront (1) 30:21
confronted (1) 35:19
congregation (3) 20:20 21:11 22:9
connect (2) 28:5 69:1
connecting (2) 24:13 28:18
connection (3) 26:17,22 41:10
connections (1) 41:11
conscious (1) 72:6
consent (4) 7:14,15,17 11:6
consider (1) 8:10
consideration (1) 42:12
considered (1) 48:25
consists (1) 11:3

constant (1) 79:7
constitution (2) 22:2 55:7
constructed (2) 15:15 17:2
contact (3) 46:2,13 61:13
continuation (1) 60:4
continue (2) 31:1 70:14
continued (1) 38:10
continues (1) 13:1
contributing (1) 86:14
controlling (1) 37:25
conversation (13) 5:20 8:7,9 38:20
38:24 41:24 66:5,10 76:14,17
81:24 83:12,15
conversations (11) 29:7 35:13,16
36:14 37:6 38:25 41:4 58:20
59:24 60:7 61:7
conviction (2) 38:17,18
convinced (1) 79:24
cooperation (1) 43:12
coordinating (1) 11:7
Coordinator (2) 10:15 71:2
cops (2) 18:13 69:14
corner (7) 68:14 69:2,5 70:4 74:2
78:17 80:8
correct (2) 60:23 72:20
costs (1) 67:13
council (7) 4:5 7:4 9:16 23:22
27:15 43:11 55:19
Councilmember (1) 45:19
Counselor (1) 4:11
counselors (1) 68:20
count (1) 72:25
country (3) 21:18 35:11 43:9
County (3) 13:1 87:4,7
couple (3) 34:17,20 42:6
couples (1) 66:19
course (4) 18:16 24:25 61:19
67:17
court (4) 40:2,8 67:2 87:6
cover (1) 64:4
covers (1) 47:18
CPR (1) 35:24
create (3) 30:6 31:23 37:11
creating (1) 22:7
credit (1) 70:11
creditor (1) 71:18
crime (9) 24:17 31:20 34:1,2 37:25
38:1,6 47:21,25
crimes (2) 47:22 79:18
criminal (1) 80:4
crucial (1) 30:4
cultures (1) 23:10
curious (1) 34:8
current (2) 13:18 37:18
currently (1) 21:21
curse (1) 61:15
cursed (1) 61:16

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

custody/visitation (1) 66:20
cut (1) 81:3
cycles (1) 68:15

D

DA (4) 9:7,8 12:19,21
DA's (3) 63:18,19,22
Darche (27) 1:16 8:14 9:23,24
12:18 13:7 32:16 44:18 53:15,22
54:3 56:25 58:21 59:5,14 60:15
62:6 66:8 70:16 72:16 74:8,14,16
75:8,12 76:15 85:24
dare (1) 84:20
data (8) 2:7 38:4,8 44:21 46:18,22
47:1 52:10
daughter (2) 73:12 74:25
Davie (76) 1:15 5:1 8:20,23 9:1,4
9:24 10:24 11:25 12:4,13,16 13:4
13:9,12 18:25 19:25 20:4,7 23:15
23:19 27:12 29:9,12,14,18,23
32:12,18,20,23 34:13 41:7 42:5
42:19 43:1 44:10,16,19 46:14,17
51:19 53:21 56:22 63:25 64:9,18
66:4,9 67:21 68:10 70:8,13,20
72:17 75:16,24 76:5,9 79:20
80:14,19,21,25 81:3,8 82:5,10,12
85:11,18,21,25 86:2,6,8
day (6) 24:18 72:2 79:23 80:4 84:7
87:18
days (3) 5:15 80:1,2
de (1) 5:8
deal (1) 28:24
dealing (2) 14:22 63:22
dealt (1) 51:8
debt (1) 71:18
decide (1) 80:7
decided (1) 34:6
decrease (1) 31:20
deepest (1) 57:18
default (1) 23:6
defendants (1) 38:13
definitely (2) 71:8 72:6
definitive (2) 6:15,18
degree (1) 24:8
Deirdre (3) 1:19 87:6,21
demeanor (1) 17:20
democracy (3) 6:4,5,10
demographics (1) 37:25
demonstrates (1) 37:24
demonstrating (1) 22:10
Dennis (15) 4:5 23:20,23 27:12,16
27:19,25 29:10,13 34:3,11 57:15
62:9 64:2,17
department (21) 11:8 24:9,25 26:5
26:17,22,23 28:10,19 39:19
45:24 46:3,4,9 54:21,22 62:19
63:20 64:8 65:2 71:1

department's (1) 50:25
depends (2) 50:15 53:1
deployed (1) 38:2
deputy (2) 8:20 67:25
describing (2) 58:23,25
description (1) 38:6
designated (3) 55:18,19,20
details (1) 7:19
detector (2) 65:7,9
determination (1) 55:25
determine (5) 49:5 55:11 56:8,12
56:19
determined (1) 50:13
determines (2) 56:4,16
develop (1) 30:17
development (5) 25:21 26:12 33:8
68:16 75:7
developments (3) 24:4,16 26:15
devote (1) 31:22
diagnosing (1) 80:16
dial (1) 45:15
dialogue (7) 24:14 36:14 39:22
60:3 79:8,25 81:25
dialogues (2) 35:13 36:22
Diaz (3) 8:24,24,25
dictate (1) 44:5
dictatorship (1) 19:21
difference (1) 6:23
different (5) 18:12 45:14 52:13
66:21 68:14
Dionne (1) 73:5
dire (1) 40:19
directly (2) 14:24 15:1
Director (11) 1:16 2:5,6,7 8:14
9:22 12:2 44:23 46:20 53:22 70:9
disability (1) 65:12
disciplinary (2) 50:24 51:2
discipline (3) 50:16 51:3 73:7
disciplined (1) 51:7
disconnect (7) 24:11 25:8,9 57:12
60:10 77:21 79:7
discouragement (1) 69:24
discourteously (1) 65:22
discourtesy (3) 45:10 48:6,15
discus (1) 30:25
discuss (1) 55:21
discussed (2) 80:10 81:13
discussion (2) 36:24 37:1
disheartening (2) 60:9 84:8
disparities (1) 38:9
disparity (1) 38:11
disposition (1) 38:10
dispositions (1) 56:3
disproportion (1) 38:3
disrespect (1) 65:21
district (9) 73:2,4,8,15,15,16 74:5
74:19 75:1

diverse (1) 23:6
diversity (1) 20:16
divisions (1) 65:1
divorce (1) 66:19
document (1) 54:20
documented (3) 7:15,18 38:9
documenting (1) 11:6
doing (8) 13:8 14:1 15:12,25 43:23
60:10,11,12
doll (5) 36:17,19,19,20,20
dollar (1) 39:15
dollars (1) 25:13
Donovan (1) 45:19
door (1) 24:21
doors (1) 28:5
Dr (4) 6:1 36:17 73:9,17
drugs (1) 18:19
DT (1) 66:23
due (3) 31:16 42:1 63:8
dumped (2) 64:3,6
duties (1) 28:23
duty (1) 8:11
DWYER (1) 3:3
dynamic (1) 21:21

E

E (2) 1:14,14
earlier (2) 54:14 76:23
early (2) 40:25 75:7
easier (1) 11:20
EASON (9) 3:4 59:20 60:20,23
61:5,19,22,25 86:1
East (2) 19:6,14
easy (2) 23:6 53:19
economic (1) 25:13
effect (2) 7:24 11:2
efficient (1) 32:9
effort (3) 6:8 23:13 72:7
eight (2) 73:11 74:18
either (1) 75:8
elected (5) 9:6 12:7,14 30:23 42:11
element (1) 84:23
Eliot (1) 36:9
embolden (1) 81:14
embrace (1) 25:10
emergency (1) 73:13
emphasis (1) 22:1
employees (1) 46:6
empower (1) 82:8
empowers (1) 81:17
enacted (1) 11:1
encounters (1) 72:4
encourage (3) 44:6 59:20,23
ends (2) 8:9 85:13
enforced (1) 7:20
enforcement (3) 7:11 46:1 80:6
enforcing (1) 40:7

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

5

engage (4) 24:24 27:22 63:15 85:3
engaged (1) 28:3
engagement (3) 26:5,6 31:8
engages (2) 53:25 54:1
engaging (8) 28:12 81:10,11 83:5
83:6,8 84:2,3
ensure (3) 8:11 11:8 43:15
ensuring (2) 6:24 43:5
enter (1) 85:8
entire (2) 53:23 84:25
entitled (1) 23:7
environment (1) 31:23
equality (1) 23:12
especially (4) 26:25 38:11 71:7
74:2
ESQ (4) 1:16 3:5,6,8
essentially (1) 40:18
establish (3) 41:11 44:2,9
established (1) 16:19
Esvaldo (1) 8:17
et (1) 39:17
evening (14) 5:1,18 8:19,22 20:11
23:23 34:22 35:1 46:19 54:14
68:12 70:23 72:21 82:15
event (2) 49:8,10
events (1) 15:7
everybody (10) 8:10 13:25 20:18
28:17 42:13 43:18 44:22 70:23
71:7 77:9
everyday (1) 25:1
evidence (25) 6:23 7:1 32:1 36:10
49:3,5,8,12 51:20 52:6,6 53:2,5
54:8,9,11,18,24 55:6,6,14,23,24
56:5,9
exactly (5) 15:16 51:13 57:15
59:13 74:20
example (3) 51:5 53:3,6
examples (1) 51:10
excessive (2) 65:24,25
Executive (12) 1:16 2:5,12 8:14
9:8,22 12:1 30:16 53:22 85:22
86:17,19
Executives (2) 86:3,9
exist (3) 24:4 40:10 71:20
existed (1) 39:24
exists (1) 61:9
exit (1) 77:19
exonerate (1) 56:15
exonerated (4) 49:10,17 50:1
51:24
expect (2) 18:5 24:25
expected (3) 11:10 60:24 78:8
experience (1) 31:7
experienced (1) 24:16
experiences (5) 21:7 30:5 79:9,10
79:13
expires (1) 87:21

explicitly (1) 34:7
extends (2) 67:7,8
extensive (1) 37:20
extra (1) 24:7
extreme (1) 24:17
extremely (1) 25:14

F

F (2) 1:14 69:22
F.A.I.T.H (2) 4:3 13:24
faced (1) 40:19
facility (1) 10:3
fact (7) 28:8,15 40:7,10 77:10,12
79:6
facts (3) 36:5 37:3 41:4
FADO (3) 45:11 48:4,5
familiar (2) 17:7 71:6
families (2) 25:5,14
family (2) 66:18 83:4
far (2) 28:19 33:17
Fason (2) 15:19 16:5
Fathers (2) 4:2 13:23
favor (1) 86:2
fear (10) 21:1,13 24:6,7,23 28:4
29:2 62:21,22 66:2
fearful (1) 23:10
February (1) 87:18
feedback (4) 38:22 39:7 41:9 42:3
feel (9) 19:11 21:15 23:7 25:11
46:2 52:19 65:11 81:21 85:5
feeling (2) 22:14 62:21
fees (1) 39:14
fellow (1) 32:15
felt (1) 21:3
Fernandez (3) 3:5 75:18 76:7
Field (1) 54:8
fifty (1) 52:12
fight (2) 82:22,25
fighting (1) 86:14
figure (1) 71:8
file (7) 11:21 45:12,13,15,20,21
52:9
filed (5) 57:8 73:16,17,19 75:10
final (2) 43:1 76:10
financial (5) 4:11 68:19,20 69:3
71:14
find (14) 46:25 47:4 51:11 52:19
54:10,17 59:2,16 65:17 68:25
70:1,3,5 79:23
finding (1) 75:5
finish (7) 51:18 79:11 80:18 81:2,6
81:6,12
finished (2) 5:15 77:23
finishing (1) 68:5
first (22) 4:4 5:2,4 7:6 11:3 12:21
13:22 15:8 20:10 29:22 35:12
41:16 42:8,15 64:22 66:23 68:24

74:18 80:12 81:23,24 84:7
fits (1) 38:6
five (2) 13:18 67:11
fix (1) 26:7
floor (1) 44:5
flow (2) 41:20 77:4
focus (4) 10:18 35:14,23 48:2
focusing (1) 46:23
folks (5) 20:21 21:3 22:10 46:3,8
follow (1) 9:6
following (1) 8:15
footage (6) 6:15,17,20 53:4,6
54:22
force (4) 45:9 48:5,13 65:24
force-related (1) 48:20
forgive (1) 29:19
forgo (1) 10:19
form (1) 16:7
formal (1) 44:7
formality (1) 37:10
forming (2) 16:2 21:2
forms (1) 45:20
forth (1) 87:10
Fortune (2) 8:21,22
forum (2) 28:6 30:16
forums (3) 42:9 43:2 70:2
foster (2) 23:11 31:4
found (6) 39:16 49:1,11 52:14 69:3
69:7
founder (1) 13:23
four (7) 24:15 45:9 59:6,10 71:3
72:13 73:12
framed (1) 79:3
framing (1) 79:7
FRANK (1) 3:3
FREDERICK (1) 1:15
free (5) 46:2 52:19 63:12 67:12
68:17
Friday (1) 71:10
friends (2) 17:18 78:25
Frisk (4) 37:21,21 38:8 43:8
front (1) 45:20
fronts (1) 60:11
frozen (1) 21:25
full (1) 10:21
fully (3) 48:4,9 49:25
fundamental (1) 8:12
funding (1) 28:7
funny (1) 79:23
further (3) 31:14 38:3 87:13
future (1) 23:2

G

gap (2) 15:17,18
gathered (1) 55:5
gathering (2) 30:23 54:19
general (3) 31:18 37:19 83:14

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

General's (1) 36:8
Generally (1) 55:16
generate (1) 31:16
Generation (2) 4:6 32:14
gentrification (1) 23:3
getting (6) 11:4 19:8 33:17 40:24
 41:22 63:2
give (19) 7:7 11:6,17 12:5 13:13
 32:5 40:4 44:25 45:25 48:12 51:6
 51:9 67:22,24 70:11,16 76:15
 81:4 85:4
given (1) 5:13
gives (1) 58:7
giving (2) 16:1 81:19
glad (2) 5:14,17
glasses (1) 49:19
go (29) 7:24 11:1 18:4 25:12 26:1,1
 27:19 34:20 40:17,25 41:19
 45:24 50:24 55:16 58:10,17
 64:19 65:1,6,8,15,16 66:21 67:1
 69:23 75:7 77:2,20 84:12
goes (7) 17:17,24 37:11 42:12 54:8
 65:8 66:20
going (62) 7:1 10:19 15:4,6 16:18
 18:25 19:13,22 21:13,21 26:23
 28:4 34:2 35:2 36:6,23 37:15
 38:23 39:20 40:15 42:21 43:14
 43:20,24 44:6,25 49:18 52:25
 53:21 54:10,24 58:15 60:5 62:10
 62:24,25 63:3,9 64:15,18 67:2
 68:23 69:15,18,22,22 72:11 73:2
 74:2,5 75:2,17 77:13 78:13,15
 79:1,20 81:2,3,12 83:18 84:21
goldish (1) 49:19
good (28) 5:1 8:19,22 16:11 20:11
 22:4 23:23 25:6 35:1 42:24 43:25
 44:14 46:19 57:9 58:7,13,14,23
 59:18 68:12 70:23 72:21 75:15
 76:16 77:20 82:15 85:10 86:14
governs (1) 55:9
grade (1) 74:18
grandmother (1) 18:1
great (7) 5:8 30:18 32:1,16 57:7
 68:1 70:3
greater (1) 7:1
greeting (1) 83:9
grew (1) 10:6
ground (2) 27:4 41:15
group (3) 12:17 15:5 22:21
groups (2) 2:8 14:17
grow (3) 79:18 80:3,7
growing (1) 10:7
guarantee (1) 72:4
guaranteed (1) 32:9
guess (1) 13:12
guide (3) 55:10 60:20,22
guided (1) 60:24

guilty (1) 39:20
gun (1) 19:8
guns (1) 18:18
guys (9) 17:7 28:16 44:25 57:7
 67:5 70:18 72:15 82:3,6

H

half (3) 63:3 69:4 75:7
hall (2) 29:8 82:16
hand (10) 15:21,21,25,25 49:15,23
 50:21 74:12,25 87:18
handle (2) 64:7 69:5
handled (1) 73:20
hands (4) 14:7,9 46:25 74:24
happen (10) 50:9,11,11 54:7 63:9
 79:25 80:12 82:19 83:13,13
happened (2) 55:3 63:1
happening (4) 33:22 37:2 74:3
 75:6
happens (6) 5:4 38:20 62:11,16
 66:3 77:22
Haque (1) 4:6
harass (1) 16:24
harassed (2) 69:16,21
hard (4) 19:21,21 43:14 74:1
hardcore (4) 36:5,10 44:2,9
harmony (2) 26:18,18
Hartford (1) 10:9
Hawk (1) 32:13
hear (16) 15:22 29:19 34:9,19,20
 42:9 43:22 44:19 52:25 53:12
 60:9 62:4 63:4 75:25 79:7 86:15
heard (5) 21:24 36:16 60:15 76:3
 86:12
hearing (4) 14:12 68:24 71:7 85:21
heart (1) 36:4
hearts (1) 15:22
Heat (2) 19:3,7
heavily (1) 38:2
height (1) 65:19
Heights (4) 4:7 34:25 35:5 57:2
held (3) 36:1 60:13 62:17
hello (6) 8:25 9:3 29:24 35:1 44:22
 83:11
help (8) 25:2 30:6 31:2,23 33:12
 67:15 72:11 82:7
helped (1) 31:19
hereinbefore (1) 87:10
hey (3) 69:12,13 78:25
Hi (1) 66:12
high (9) 30:9 32:13 38:1 47:11 71:4
 71:24 76:19,20 78:25
higher (5) 34:1 47:14,25 48:19
 52:4
Hispanics (1) 38:2
history (1) 21:20
hit (1) 69:18

hits (1) 23:3
hold (4) 8:4 36:6 43:3 80:15
holds (1) 86:18
home (7) 21:4 25:12 26:1,1 37:11
 40:25 84:10
homeless (1) 65:2
honest (6) 36:14,14,21 38:19,25
 61:6
honor (1) 6:1
honored (1) 5:5
Hood (2) 4:3 13:24
hopefully (1) 47:9
host (1) 9:25
hosted (1) 30:16
hosting (1) 31:1
hot (1) 39:4
hotline (1) 7:9
hour (1) 69:4
hours (5) 28:13,13,13 45:18 73:12
house (2) 19:4 69:25
houses (1) 84:7
housing (18) 4:15 14:18 24:3,7
 25:5,10,20 26:12,12 27:1 32:25
 33:2,4,6,6,8 34:1 82:17
HRA (1) 71:25
hubris (1) 65:19
human (1) 68:22
humanity (1) 78:16
hunt (1) 40:18

I

idea (4) 58:23 59:17,18 77:17
Ideally (1) 31:1
ideas (1) 30:2
identify (1) 50:6
ignorant (1) 65:16
imagery (1) 18:22
immigration (2) 21:16,16
impact (3) 7:2 8:1 52:3
implicit (6) 36:11,12,15 58:19 61:9
 61:10
important (7) 5:9 14:14 21:17 23:4
 30:1 52:7 69:9
imposed (1) 40:12
improper (2) 49:2,11
Inaudible (2) 19:23 51:16
incident (2) 54:16 55:4
incidents (1) 20:25
included (1) 52:23
includes (2) 7:8 65:1
income (2) 25:14,15
incomes (1) 25:15
increase (2) 31:21 79:24
increased (1) 80:5
increases (1) 8:3
increasing (1) 31:5
increasingly (1) 52:7

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

incredible (1) 10:2
independent (1) 45:3
individual (2) 38:6 77:15
individuals (5) 11:15 14:11 16:11 19:15 60:8
inequality (1) 57:25
inform (1) 7:13
informally (1) 21:2
information (11) 22:20 28:13 33:21 34:7 47:2 54:16 57:6,13,23 58:7,16
informed (1) 74:22
infringe (1) 17:1
initiate (1) 31:10
initiative (2) 28:12 52:11
initiatives (2) 26:16 27:20
injustices (1) 57:18
inquire (1) 83:12
inquires (1) 62:11
inside (1) 73:7
insidious (1) 40:12
insight (1) 24:10
insist (1) 65:16
Inspector (2) 8:20,22
inspiring (1) 81:18
instance (1) 78:10
instructions (1) 51:4
insulting (1) 77:8
Intake (1) 54:7
intelligence (1) 77:9
intend (1) 10:17
interact (2) 31:9 35:24
interacted (1) 59:10
interaction (4) 7:10 30:3 31:10 32:6
interactions (3) 7:22,23 35:14
interest (1) 31:13
interested (1) 87:15
interesting (1) 39:22
intern (3) 29:24 32:17 71:4
internet (1) 18:21
interns (2) 71:4 72:15
interrupt (2) 56:23 81:7
interview (3) 54:24 55:1,2
intimidating (1) 83:8
introduce (1) 54:14
invest (2) 80:11,11
investigate (5) 10:13 30:12 45:5,8 45:8
investigated (5) 48:4,9 49:25 59:8 60:17
investigation (1) 52:8
investigator (1) 54:13
investigators (5) 10:8,10 54:15 55:5 66:6
investing (1) 79:17
involved (5) 15:11 21:1 28:3 54:25

67:19
involves (2) 11:4,5
Island (4) 1:7 5:24 10:1 74:6
issue (7) 8:7 52:15 53:16 62:10 71:21 72:10 79:8
issue-based (1) 52:17
issued (1) 37:19
issues (11) 18:3,4 20:14 27:13 30:14,22 32:10,25 33:6 41:23 64:10

J

J (1) 3:3
Jacob (1) 73:8
Jaggon (3) 73:5,14 74:12
Jamaica (4) 14:17 15:13 20:22 76:20
JANUARY (1) 1:4
Japan (1) 20:22
Jesse (1) 9:8
job (6) 25:2 57:8 68:18,18 69:22,23
Jon (1) 57:2
Jonathan (4) 1:16 4:7 9:23 34:23
Jones (10) 4:12,15 70:21,23,24 82:13,14,15,16 84:18
JOSEPH (1) 3:7
Jr (1) 6:2
judged (1) 18:14
judging (1) 19:16
jump (1) 28:14
jurisdiction (1) 59:7
justice (4) 31:14 77:3,3,11

K

K2 (1) 65:6
Karen (2) 4:5 23:20
keep (6) 13:16,20 65:18 86:13,14 86:14
Keith (3) 44:23 54:3 58:25
Kenneth (1) 36:17
Kenny (2) 4:2 13:22
key (1) 6:11
kid (1) 18:2
kids (2) 69:12,16
kind (22) 6:20 14:13 15:2,9,21 16:24 17:2,4,10,21 18:4 19:21 22:19 23:13 42:22 44:3 49:17,19 57:22 64:10 77:8,12
King (1) 6:2
knew (1) 20:12
know (66) 7:5,12,19,22 8:2 10:25 11:1 15:8 17:4,17,19,20,25 20:15 21:24 22:22 25:11 26:16 27:2,19 28:6,16,23 33:13 36:11 38:16 39:6,8,12 41:16,17,17 44:3,5 46:5,11 47:6 51:25 57:8 58:10 59:25 61:15 64:25 69:7,8,12 70:2

70:18,18 71:13,15,16,17,20,20 72:5,7,9 74:20 77:7,12 78:9 79:1 79:2 86:11,12
knowing (5) 16:17 31:10,22 32:4 78:12
known (1) 45:11
knows (1) 69:19

L

L (2) 4:13 72:19
lady (1) 59:22
lanes (1) 69:16
language (4) 45:10 48:6,16 82:1
large (5) 29:3 46:23 48:7,13,17
largest (2) 33:7 45:3
lasting (1) 73:11
law (8) 7:10 46:1 55:7,8 83:21,22 85:7,8
laws (1) 55:7
lead (1) 5:9
leaders (2) 30:24 57:21
learn (2) 6:7 28:8
learning (1) 31:9
leave (2) 66:1 69:24
left (5) 17:10 47:19 48:7 49:15 75:23
leg (1) 65:8
legal (2) 55:9,9
legislation (3) 7:5,24 43:11
legislative (1) 39:25
let's (3) 39:7 85:3,3
letting (1) 74:1
Liaison (1) 15:18
library (3) 10:1,2 78:18
life (3) 24:20 33:2 69:25
lift (1) 21:17
lifting (1) 32:25
limited (1) 82:20
LINDSAY (1) 3:4
list (11) 23:20 44:11,12,17 46:25 64:19,20,22 66:11,20 68:11
listen (1) 6:7
listening (1) 79:6
literacy (2) 68:19 71:14
literally (3) 15:25 21:6 40:24
little (12) 10:24 27:2,8 29:6 36:25 41:20 43:22 46:12 51:25 53:23 76:21 77:8
live (12) 5:24 10:6 14:8 17:3 20:15 25:5 26:14,18,24 47:17 62:13 76:20
lives (2) 17:25 24:18
living (9) 24:6,19,23 25:14 26:19 26:25 28:4 29:1 62:23
loan (1) 71:19
local (3) 31:15 45:22 80:8
log (1) 45:16

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

Logan (32) 4:7 17:12 27:18 34:24
35:1 41:8 42:18,25 43:25 44:14
44:18 56:23 57:2,2,16 58:21 59:4
59:13,21 60:19,21 61:4,6,21,24
62:4,7 78:1,5,22 80:18,23
long (8) 1:7 5:15,24 10:1 33:2
42:21 74:6 77:10
look (7) 19:10 27:3,8 47:15,24
59:19 72:8
looking (2) 18:3 47:5
looks (2) 17:20 29:13
lose (1) 31:17
losing (1) 24:18
lot (30) 10:5 12:22 14:11,19,20
15:10 16:10 18:7,8 19:7,8 28:9
33:13 39:9 43:7 59:1,15 62:6
63:2 69:14 72:2 74:5 76:14,16,18
78:23,24,25 79:1 81:18
loud (1) 53:15
love (4) 22:12,21 34:11 58:5
low (2) 25:14,15
lower (2) 48:1,20
lucky (1) 13:2
Luther (1) 6:2

M

ma'am (3) 67:21 74:8 75:13
major (3) 38:21 41:3 51:21
majority (1) 57:13
making (1) 6:9
mallet (1) 62:19
man (1) 82:20
manager (1) 10:2
managing (1) 24:12
mandated (1) 40:3
manipulated (1) 32:11
manner (2) 18:6 24:20
map (3) 47:7,18,20
marathon (3) 42:17 77:7,11
marijuana (3) 38:12,13 65:5
marriage (1) 87:14
married (1) 73:5
marshaled (1) 55:14
Martin (1) 6:1
Maryanne (2) 4:9 64:23
masses (1) 64:4
masters (1) 33:3
match (1) 47:16
matter (1) 87:16
mayor (4) 5:8 55:18 61:7,8
Mayor's (1) 28:6
mean (3) 22:20 56:23 65:22
means (4) 6:22 10:5 12:22 24:1
media (1) 18:7
mediate (2) 30:12 45:5
mediation (3) 4:10 66:13 67:25
mediators (2) 67:4,5

medical (2) 54:19 65:10
meet (4) 40:18 55:21 83:9 86:13
meeting (18) 1:3 2:1 5:3,5 8:9 9:22
30:23 41:16 46:11,11 68:25 69:4
69:12 77:23 82:9 85:14 86:16,20
meetings (10) 6:6,8 14:4,5,13
28:17 31:2 44:8 57:17 64:1
member (12) 9:16 12:24 24:1,2
28:11 33:1 35:6 49:20 75:17
82:18 83:19,20
members (13) 3:1 11:5,9 12:1 14:9
20:5 23:17 29:15 33:20 35:15
45:7 46:15 55:17
men (1) 75:11
mend (1) 31:3
mentioned (5) 30:19 51:20 52:9
54:3 60:17
mentorship (1) 14:20
merchants (1) 25:9
merits (3) 51:22 52:3,8
message (1) 40:2
messages (1) 40:9
metal (3) 65:7,9,10
mic (4) 56:24,25 81:4,9
middle (1) 48:10
midst (1) 18:5
million-dollar (1) 39:13
millions (1) 39:15
mind (1) 62:18
minds (1) 39:9
minute (2) 13:18 19:18
minutes (5) 13:17,21 64:23 76:11
82:14
Miriam (1) 70:24
Mirian (2) 4:12 70:21
misconduct (16) 8:4 30:5,10 31:15
32:2 45:6 49:1,6 55:2,12 56:6
77:1,16 78:12 79:12,13
misconducts (1) 31:17
misdeemeanor (1) 38:13
missed (2) 34:17 44:20
mistakes (1) 34:16
mistreated (1) 63:11
mom (1) 18:1
Monday (1) 6:2
money (1) 25:12
monitor (2) 40:2,8
month (1) 73:1
monthly (3) 10:20 33:11 52:16
months (3) 24:15 33:12 74:18
morning (1) 21:7
MOS (1) 49:20
MOS/unidentified (1) 50:2
mother (2) 21:11 72:21
mothers (1) 63:17
motion (4) 54:9 85:22,23,24
move (4) 13:13 44:6 76:12 85:15

moves (1) 6:24
Moya's (1) 9:17
murdered (1) 19:9

N

N (1) 84:2
name (9) 7:8 44:12,22 66:12 68:13
70:24 71:11 76:15 82:16
Napolitano (9) 46:19,20 50:8,14
51:9,18 52:21 53:1,13
narrative (4) 35:17,21,22 37:13
nation (1) 30:17
naturally (1) 77:4
NCO (1) 61:9
NCOs (3) 64:2,5 82:23
nearby (1) 14:8
nearly (1) 38:14
necessary (1) 81:22
need (26) 15:8 16:4 18:25 19:16
20:16 28:19 41:5,11,13 43:6 44:9
48:2 49:18 54:24 57:13,22 58:8
58:19 62:8 71:9 76:21 79:24,25
80:5 82:3,6
needs (4) 29:10 58:1,16 59:24
negative (2) 18:8,10
neglect (1) 67:18
neighborhood (6) 28:20 31:19
60:2 74:4 82:25 84:16
neighborhoods (1) 38:1
neighboring (1) 18:12
Nelson (6) 4:11 68:11,12,13 70:10
70:18
neutral (1) 31:11
never (2) 39:19,22
new (30) 2:11 6:8,23 8:2,3,12
10:15 11:21 18:11 19:6,14 34:15
35:9,10 39:5,18,18 40:13 43:10
44:24 45:2 55:8,9 57:19 68:15
69:15 74:3 85:18 87:2,8
news (1) 63:5
Nicola (1) 9:2
Nicole (1) 46:20
night (2) 75:15 85:10
nine (1) 18:9
Nolan's (1) 9:13
nonprofit (2) 66:15 69:10
nonviolent (1) 66:24
normal (2) 78:12,20
North (1) 33:8
Notary (2) 87:7,22
note (1) 10:25
notes (1) 36:24
noticed (2) 20:24 44:3
November (1) 20:25
number (10) 7:8,9 31:6 47:16,21
48:8 50:8 54:7 60:16 64:5
numbers (6) 41:2 47:14,24 49:22

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

50:22 52:11
numerous (1) 14:17
Nunez (3) 8:17,18,19
NY (1) 1:7
NYC (1) 68:21
nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaints (1) 52:10
nyc.gov/ccrbreports (1) 52:15
NYPD (3) 11:5 37:20 64:25

O

O (1) 1:14
OAG (1) 37:19
observe (1) 7:25
obviously (1) 70:6
occur (5) 49:9,10 56:17,20 83:14
occurred (4) 49:6 56:6,10,13
offenders (1) 66:24
offensive (3) 45:10 48:6,15
offer (1) 66:15
offering (2) 67:10 68:3
office (15) 9:7,10,13,17,19,20
12:19,21 43:4 45:18 50:25 63:18
63:19,22 70:12
officer (24) 6:24 8:24,24,25 15:3
18:16 22:8 32:2 35:23 37:14
40:23 49:13,14 51:6 55:12 56:13
60:2 61:12,16 63:9,11 71:22 73:6
74:22
officer's (2) 7:8,16
officers (52) 7:7,13,23 8:4,15
11:10 12:5 15:20,23,24 16:5,11
16:21 25:18 28:21 30:20,25 31:5
31:9,12,19,22 32:3 35:25 36:22
39:5 40:16 53:9 54:25 55:1,11
60:18,25 61:10 62:12,22 63:23
65:13 72:10,11 74:9 76:4,4 78:19
79:25 80:6 83:1,3,5,25 84:2,3
offices (3) 9:7 12:14 69:5
officials (5) 9:7 12:7,14 30:24
42:11
Oh (2) 74:16 75:12
okay (25) 9:11,20 20:4,7 22:15
28:1,14 29:3,23 36:11,13 37:9,13
38:20 39:7 40:20 41:2 43:25
44:14 62:21 64:3 70:6 74:16
75:12 82:14
Old (2) 2:10 85:15
olds (2) 36:19 72:1
once (7) 8:6 50:4,14 54:23 55:5,14
62:15
ones (3) 6:6 25:3 63:4
online (1) 11:22
op (1) 81:15
open (2) 24:14 42:7
operational (1) 53:11
operators (3) 11:13,15,18
opinion (1) 15:7

opportunity (6) 12:8 13:15 22:23
23:24 60:5 76:6
opposed (1) 18:3
opposition (1) 86:6
orange (1) 49:17
order (9) 2:3 22:1,3,3,6 69:25
73:12 77:3,11
organization (3) 13:24 15:14 71:12
outcome (1) 87:15
outrage (1) 84:20
outrageous (1) 73:6
outreach (18) 2:6 10:15,17 29:25
31:6 44:21,23 45:24 46:3,4,6,9
48:2 59:1,21 67:22 70:9 72:12
outs (1) 46:25
outside (6) 5:13 16:14 17:19 18:15
19:16 33:6
overall (1) 47:7
overlap (1) 20:13
overlooked (1) 25:7
overnight (1) 64:14
oversight (2) 43:9 45:3
overwhelmed (1) 82:24
owe (2) 71:18,19

P

p.m (1) 1:5
page (2) 33:16 58:6
paid (1) 39:13
PAL (4) 27:10,11 73:24,24
panel (1) 55:17
panels (2) 55:16,21
paragraph (1) 73:18
parent (2) 73:20,21
parents (1) 73:3
parents/teenagers (1) 66:19
park (1) 19:18
part (7) 5:20 6:9 14:15 21:19,20
83:3,4
particular (6) 10:1 15:5 16:4 19:11
19:12 22:13
particularly (2) 6:13 19:5
parties (2) 67:19 87:14
partnered (1) 71:25
partners (1) 16:6
partnership (3) 26:10,11 68:21
partnerships (1) 63:13
parts (2) 11:3 22:1
pass (1) 57:19
passed (1) 7:4
Pastor (1) 20:9
pathway (2) 68:21 69:3
Patrick (3) 10:8 66:8 75:9
patrol (4) 6:24 55:10 60:20,22
paycheck (1) 25:25
paying (1) 53:9
PC (1) 40:3

Peace (1) 13:25
peers (1) 79:19
PEGUERO (1) 3:6
penalty (1) 51:1
people (96) 11:6 13:14 14:8,23
15:5,22 16:8 17:2 18:15 19:8,17
19:19 20:25 21:6,9,18 22:7,14,16
22:25 23:7,9 24:6,6,12,13,18,19
25:6,24 26:14,24,25 28:2,8 29:1
29:3 30:9 36:2 38:21 40:13,18,22
41:14 42:9,24 43:4 44:8,17 47:16
47:20,22 53:4,16,20 54:4 57:8,12
57:13,18,19,23 58:4,8,8,13 59:2
59:10,16 62:6,20 63:15,18 64:11
64:20 67:22 72:8 75:20,25 76:25
77:2,22,23 79:5,10,11,12,18,23
80:2,7,9 81:18,21 83:20,24
people's (3) 11:4 39:9 62:18
percent (9) 6:14,16,21 38:4,14
48:3 52:4,5 56:6
percentage (1) 6:21
percentages (1) 48:16
period (3) 13:19 33:24,25
perpetuate (1) 79:12
person (11) 26:3 28:11 30:11
55:17,18,19 56:10,18 65:12
76:10,18
person's (1) 63:12
perspective (1) 40:16
pertinent (1) 14:6
Peter (1) 8:21
Petza (5) 4:10 66:11,12,12 68:1
Phil (1) 71:14
Philip (3) 4:11 68:11,13
Philippines (1) 20:22
phone (2) 58:4,14
photo (1) 81:15
Picard (8) 4:13 72:19,20 74:12,15
74:17 75:10,14
picked (1) 33:11
picture (1) 33:21
pictures (1) 78:3
piece (1) 42:15
pieces (1) 55:24
pillar (1) 8:12
pink (1) 19:4
place (7) 6:8 21:5 80:13 81:23,24
82:2 85:1
placement (2) 68:18 69:23
places (2) 14:23 20:23
plan (1) 84:22
plane (1) 79:14
planned (3) 84:5,7,14
plays (1) 51:21
pleasant (1) 18:6
please (10) 10:25 42:6 46:4,12
52:18 64:23 67:14 80:18 82:14

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

<p>86:3 pleased (1) 5:21 podcast (1) 58:22 podium (2) 12:9 34:23 point (7) 14:10 16:4,10 17:12 33:10 40:16 78:14 police (83) 4:5 7:23 15:15 17:16 18:8,10 21:8 22:8,14,17 23:8,21 24:9,24 25:18 26:4,8,17,22,23 27:22 28:10,12,19 30:2,5,7,15,19 31:14,17 35:15,19,23,25 36:22 37:14 38:1,4 39:19 40:3,16,23 54:21,22,25 55:20 56:13 59:11 60:1,13,17,25 61:12,16 62:19 63:20,21,23 64:7 65:1 66:16 67:2 67:6,7 71:22 72:4,10,11,22 73:5 73:23 74:9,21 75:1 76:4,25 77:1 77:19 78:11 79:24 80:6 81:22 police's (1) 32:11 police-communities (1) 30:15 police-community (6) 5:19 6:12 8:8 26:5 31:3 42:14 policies (1) 42:12 policing (6) 8:2,12 16:9 24:11 25:23 28:23 policy (7) 2:7 10:18 30:2 39:25 44:21 46:18,21 pops (1) 18:1 popular (1) 37:22 population (1) 70:6 populations (1) 29:3 portion (1) 9:21 positive (1) 82:21 possession (1) 38:14 possible (1) 17:24 possibly (3) 35:8,9,10 potential (1) 51:1 poverty (1) 68:16 pow (1) 83:15 precinct (23) 4:5 8:18,21,24 9:2 12:6,10,10 15:12 16:22,23 23:21 27:15 43:13 45:22 48:10,11,18 48:18 62:3,5 84:1,4 precincts (15) 17:6 20:1 30:8,18 31:2,15 42:10 46:24 47:1,13,17 47:25 49:23 60:1,13 prejudged (1) 24:8 premise (1) 77:17 prep (2) 68:17 71:15 prepare (1) 6:1 preponderance (5) 49:2,7,11 56:5 56:9 Presbyterian (3) 4:4 20:10 21:23 presence (3) 14:14 22:16,17 present (7) 3:1 28:1 33:14,20 34:6 37:3,5 presentation (4) 2:6,7 44:25 59:1</p>	<p>presentations (6) 10:18 11:17 31:6 34:17,20 45:25 presented (4) 7:17 55:15,15,22 presenting (1) 31:7 preserve (1) 20:17 preserving (1) 21:15 president (4) 4:7 23:21 34:24 35:4 prestation (2) 46:2,17 pretty (4) 15:15 47:11 48:17 58:23 previous (1) 32:22 primary (1) 7:6 principal (1) 74:15 prior (1) 59:23 prisoners (1) 72:25 privacy (1) 32:10 pro-cop (1) 40:15 proactive (1) 7:21 probably (9) 15:24 16:21 17:18 35:10 39:14 40:11 44:16 57:14 69:18 problem (6) 17:25 40:20 41:3 66:18 71:20 77:13 problematic (1) 31:2 problems (6) 61:18,23 74:8,9 80:16,17 procedures (1) 42:13 proceedings (3) 1:12 87:9,11 process (8) 6:9 53:23 57:9 58:12 58:12,13 63:8 68:4 produced (1) 34:22 program (12) 16:13 22:12,13 27:10,10,11 57:22 58:2 68:17,17 69:3 72:1 programs (3) 14:20 16:18 21:2 progress (2) 43:7,21 Project (2) 19:3,7 projecting (1) 18:8 projects (2) 14:18 18:24 promises (3) 6:4,5,10 promising (1) 6:13 pronounce (2) 29:19,21 pronounced (1) 38:12 proper (1) 31:10 properly (3) 59:12 85:3,4 proportion (1) 48:19 proposal (1) 30:19 prosecute (3) 30:12 45:6 50:19 Prosecution (1) 50:19 protect (1) 82:24 protocol (1) 62:10 proud (1) 5:22 proves (1) 37:16 provide (1) 41:12 proving (1) 30:9 PS (1) 73:7 PS9 (1) 4:5 PSA (1) 33:18</p>	<p>PSA9 (3) 23:21 84:1,1 PSAs (1) 33:15 public (31) 1:3 2:1,9 13:13,19 24:3 24:7,17 25:5,10,20 27:1 31:4 32:25 33:2,4,6,7,15 34:1 35:15 40:4,9 43:4 60:24 62:2 64:10 75:22 85:13 87:7,22 Puma (7) 3:7 32:19,21,24 34:4,12 34:13 punitive (1) 40:5 pushed (1) 18:22 put (3) 17:5 18:4 74:12 putting (1) 74:25</p> <hr/> <p align="center">Q</p> <hr/> <p>quality (2) 21:16 24:20 Queens (40) 4:10 5:24 6:12,14,17 9:7,25 10:5,6,6,7,15,19 12:19,21 12:25 15:13 17:16 20:15 23:3 24:4 30:3,8 45:18 46:22 47:2,8 48:5,7,8,10,13,17,24 49:15,24 52:2 67:10,10,12 Queensbridge (3) 14:18 27:6 69:6 question (6) 42:14 49:14 52:18,20 57:1 79:3 questions (14) 12:1 23:2,16 29:16 46:10,15 50:3 53:17,19 54:2 56:1 56:22 64:20,21 quick (4) 37:16 39:2 47:5 76:13 quickly (2) 51:19 53:24 quiet (2) 12:16 14:1 quietness (1) 14:3 quite (3) 5:12 33:25 35:8 quotas (6) 39:3,3,23 40:7,11,18</p> <hr/> <p align="center">R</p> <hr/> <p>R (2) 1:14,15 racial (1) 38:9 Radeha (3) 4:6 29:21,24 Radia (1) 29:20 Rahdiao (1) 29:20 raid (2) 84:5,22 raise (1) 14:9 raised (1) 64:11 Ramcharit (1) 10:14 RAMON (1) 3:6 rate (6) 31:20 38:3 47:21 48:20 49:16 52:2 rates (4) 37:25 47:11,25 48:1 Ravenswood (3) 14:19 27:5 69:6 reach (1) 70:5 read (6) 27:20 36:8 37:15 58:5,5,6 readiness (2) 68:17,18 reading (1) 58:5 ready (1) 78:14 real (15) 6:4,4,9 14:1 19:12 21:1 23:12 35:22 39:2 41:10,11,12</p>
--	---	--

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

<p>44:2,9 58:19 really (45) 13:1 14:6,24 15:5,10,25 16:2,7 19:11,13,20 21:17 23:4,14 24:22 25:6,21 27:7 29:1 35:7,13 36:15 37:1,7,8,16 39:2,24 41:15 43:14 44:9 53:17 58:10 62:8,9 63:5,10 70:1 76:13,22 79:15,16 80:10 81:13 82:25 reason (2) 25:6 47:23 reasons (1) 34:5 recall (1) 50:22 receive (3) 38:15 53:24 66:17 received (2) 11:13 47:8 recitation (1) 10:20 recognize (2) 59:25 65:14 recommend (1) 79:16 recommendation (2) 6:16,19 recommendations (2) 50:24 51:2 recommended (2) 50:16,17 record (3) 53:18 58:14 87:11 records (2) 54:19 72:3 red (2) 47:13,14 refer (1) 36:23 reflection (1) 5:23 reformations (2) 39:25 40:1 refuse (1) 7:14 regard (1) 51:6 regards (3) 52:22 53:8 70:16 Reggio (4) 4:4 20:10,11 23:16 regular (1) 14:15 Reich (1) 57:25 related (3) 32:2 47:1 87:13 relation (2) 66:17 83:17 relations (7) 5:19 6:12 8:8 15:18 30:15 31:3 42:15 relationship (8) 16:8 17:1 19:20,22 26:21 30:6 31:22 62:15 relationships (4) 16:2,20 42:22 63:14 religious (1) 71:8 remarks (2) 12:8 20:12 remember (2) 6:3 23:5 reminded (1) 13:15 reminder (1) 8:7 report (14) 2:4,5 33:11 36:9,10 37:18,20,24 38:8 52:16,16,17 55:23 73:16 reported (1) 87:9 reporter (2) 53:19 87:6 reporting (1) 30:10 reports (6) 34:21 36:7 51:12 52:14 52:17 58:6 represent (2) 67:1,11 representative (8) 9:9,10,12,14,15 9:16,18,19 representatives (8) 8:23 12:6,7,11 42:10,11 62:3,5</p>	<p>representing (1) 66:13 reproduced (1) 36:18 request (2) 54:20,21 requested (1) 33:18 require (1) 7:6 required (1) 61:13 requires (1) 7:12 research (2) 30:16 82:7 residence (2) 33:5 65:4 resident (3) 5:22 26:12 33:2 resident's (1) 83:18 residents (15) 4:15 14:6 27:6 30:3 30:22,24 31:5,24 32:5 65:23,24 65:25 82:17 83:10 84:11 residual (1) 62:14 resolve (2) 67:3,5 resolved (1) 68:7 resources (2) 26:15 68:22 respect (6) 8:11 41:18 43:16 83:21 85:4,9 respected (2) 83:22 85:7 respond (4) 14:25 18:6 20:2 44:1 response (15) 12:3,12,15 19:23 20:3,6 23:18 29:17 42:1,2 44:4 46:16 85:17,20 86:7 responsibility (2) 43:18 61:2 responsible (2) 60:14 64:12 rest (2) 16:5 50:23 resulted (2) 6:15,18 results (1) 62:16 retaliation (1) 40:20 retribution (1) 66:2 reveal (1) 38:4 Reverend (6) 4:4 6:1 20:9,11 23:15 24:5 reverse (1) 35:22 review (6) 1:2 5:2 6:11 44:24 45:2 55:23 revise (1) 15:9 Richards (1) 45:19 rid (1) 84:23 riding (3) 69:16,21 83:7 right (48) 7:5,12,13,19,22 8:1,1 10:16,25 11:1 12:4 13:9 15:19 16:13 17:12,13 19:2,6,13 23:19 27:18 29:18,21 35:2,21 41:9 44:8 46:24 47:12,20 48:11 56:14 61:12,24 63:18 67:23 68:7 69:5 70:14,22 75:14 76:9,20 78:5,22 79:17 80:8 84:17 rights (8) 11:4 16:25 58:9 65:12 71:13,17 78:9,13 rob (1) 80:8 Robert (1) 57:25 robust (3) 41:13 57:22 58:2 role (1) 51:21 roll (1) 23:3</p>	<p>room (3) 8:10 14:1 57:16 root (1) 61:23 Rose (1) 67:23 Rosemary (1) 67:24 route (2) 11:13,19 routes (1) 74:23 rug (1) 62:1 run (2) 69:2 71:1 Ryan (5) 4:9 64:23,24,25 66:5</p> <hr/> <p align="center">S</p> <hr/> <p>sad (1) 27:25 saddens (1) 14:14 safe (4) 22:14 26:2 43:15 85:5 safer (1) 31:23 safety (3) 73:13 74:21 78:19 salaries (1) 25:15 sat (1) 78:4 satisfaction (1) 61:3 satisfied (3) 73:20,21,22 saying (12) 17:11 19:15 21:9,25 23:1 27:13,17 42:1 57:3 61:18 71:18 80:3 says (4) 15:16,17 56:18 65:10 scene (1) 54:10 Schneiderman (1) 37:17 school (12) 5:16 32:13 71:4,24 73:8 74:17 76:19,20 78:19 84:5,6 84:8 schoolers (1) 78:25 schools (3) 45:25 74:7,10 scot (1) 63:12 scripts (1) 11:14 search (2) 7:14 11:6 second (6) 7:11 11:5 42:16 48:12 85:25 86:1 seconds (1) 81:4 section (2) 13:13 85:13 security (2) 53:6 74:24 see (28) 18:23 20:1 21:13 22:12 24:12 26:10 31:8 34:8 47:6,9,9 47:10,13 52:24 53:11 61:12 63:3 63:16 71:8 75:19 77:20,21 78:6,7 83:15,17,21 85:15 seeing (5) 18:10,15 21:12 62:14 76:17 seen (6) 15:24 65:5,6,22,23 69:16 semiannual (1) 52:16 seniors (1) 29:2 sense (3) 22:4 23:8,11 sent (4) 71:3,3 72:14 84:10 sentencing (1) 38:11 separate (1) 22:25 separating (2) 22:6 66:19 September (1) 11:2 Sergeant (2) 15:19 16:5 series (5) 18:20,24 19:3,11 57:24</p>
--	---	---

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

seriously (1) 86:13
serve (14) 5:6 20:19 24:3,22 25:1
25:16 26:23 27:9 62:13 64:3
67:13 77:24 83:24,25
served (1) 40:21
service (8) 11:9 33:15 45:7 49:20
65:2 66:24 67:12 68:8
services (5) 4:10 63:22 66:14,15
68:3
serving (1) 62:23
session (7) 2:12 71:10 85:22 86:3
86:9,17,19
set (2) 62:18 87:10
settlement (1) 39:17
seven (1) 73:24
severe (2) 30:14 32:1
sex (1) 18:19
Sharif (1) 39:17
sharing (1) 30:5
shelter (1) 66:2
shelters (2) 65:3,5
shield (1) 7:8
shift (1) 5:17
shoot (1) 53:4
shootings (1) 24:17
shops (1) 71:15
short (2) 42:20 44:25
shot (1) 19:8
show (13) 14:7 15:6 48:3,21 51:13
78:8,10 79:5 80:1 81:15,15,16
82:8
show-and-tell (1) 80:1
showed (1) 73:17
showing (3) 26:9 28:22 62:12
shut (1) 81:16
side (5) 5:6 35:25 49:16 57:5 63:2
sides (1) 61:1
sidewalk (2) 69:17 78:15
signed (3) 13:14 62:7 82:13
significant (2) 7:2 39:15
similar (2) 20:14 48:17
Simotas' (1) 9:9
sir (1) 19:25
sister (1) 41:9
sites (1) 68:14
situation (4) 15:2,2 18:5 73:2
situations (2) 19:13 73:10
six (3) 21:14 24:15 27:5
slam (1) 62:19
Sligh (5) 9:8 12:19,22 13:5,11
slinging (1) 19:8
slow (1) 23:3
slowing (1) 27:23
small (2) 4:15 20:20
Smith (4) 1:19 10:2 87:6,21
snapshot (1) 47:5
solution (1) 80:17

solutions (8) 37:5,8,12 41:13,13
63:8 70:2,3
solve (1) 81:20
solved (1) 42:3
somebody (2) 17:21,22
somewhat (2) 35:20,21
son (2) 10:7 21:14
soon (4) 54:6 68:2 69:24 75:3
Soren (1) 81:9
sorry (3) 13:17 75:24 82:19
sort (1) 25:15
Southeast (1) 15:13
Spanish (4) 75:19,20 76:1,8
speak (18) 13:14,15 23:25 44:11
44:17 54:15 58:18 59:21 60:15
61:8 62:7 65:22 71:12 76:1,6,11
82:13 83:11
speaker (22) 4:14 13:22 20:9
32:22 34:19 75:22 76:3,13,16
77:20 78:3,6,23 79:22 80:15,20
80:22,24 81:1,6,10 82:6
speaker's (1) 64:19
speakers (8) 4:1 13:18,20 23:20
44:11 64:19,22 66:11
speaking (8) 17:10 20:13 54:18
60:12 75:22 77:22 78:1 81:25
speaks (1) 43:23
special (5) 16:14,15 17:6,14 64:25
specific (1) 51:10
specifically (2) 10:19 53:8
specifications (1) 50:18
Spitzer (1) 36:9
spoke (2) 10:24 59:22
spoken (1) 76:1
spread (1) 60:3
sprint (2) 42:17 77:7
squads (1) 17:7
ss (1) 87:3
staff (8) 5:8 10:3 33:13,20 34:18,21
43:23 44:20
stand (2) 10:9 46:4
standup (1) 46:7
start (5) 36:13,21 38:19 54:17 60:2
starts (1) 69:24
state (6) 18:12 35:10 55:8,10 87:2
87:8
states (2) 18:13 45:4
statical (1) 52:16
stating (2) 40:5 73:19
statistic (1) 6:13
statistics (5) 6:11 10:20,22 33:14
33:17
status (1) 64:8
stay (3) 28:15 34:9,11
stays (1) 67:16
step (2) 50:5 82:4
stepped (1) 38:24

stigmatization (1) 33:4
Stinson (1) 39:17
stood (1) 44:3
stop (9) 7:11 37:20,21 38:8,14 43:7
56:12,14,19
stopped (7) 11:4 38:3 56:11,12,18
69:13 78:15
stops (2) 38:5,10
store (5) 21:4 53:6 74:2 78:17 80:8
stranger (2) 18:4,6
street (4) 1:6 24:19 40:17 69:21
streets (1) 63:6
stroke (1) 61:17
stronger (1) 43:10
strongest (1) 43:8
structures (1) 22:5
student (1) 32:14
students (3) 71:24 74:10,11
studies (2) 51:14 82:7
subject (2) 79:10,11
substantial (1) 58:2
substantiate (2) 50:4 56:7
substantiated (7) 49:1,18 50:1,7
50:15,23 51:23
substantiation (1) 50:12
substantiations/unsubstantiated...
48:23
Sudan (1) 20:22
sudden (1) 32:8
sued (1) 39:5
sufficiently (1) 32:9
suggest (1) 66:4
suggests (1) 49:8
suit (2) 39:5,12
sum (4) 19:1,2 23:1 39:21
summer (3) 29:25 32:17 71:5
Sunday (2) 17:17 21:6
supervisors (1) 40:6
support (1) 33:19
supporting (1) 22:14
supposed (10) 26:4,11,13 27:6,22
28:11,14,24 77:24 78:9
sure (13) 13:5 29:9,12 32:20,23
33:25 41:7 52:21 73:3 74:20
78:14 83:23 85:7
surrounding (1) 25:20
surveillance (1) 54:12
Susan (3) 4:10 66:11,12
suspect (1) 38:7
sweep (1) 61:25
system (3) 17:5 43:19 77:14
systematic (2) 77:12,17
systems (1) 23:11

T

table (2) 29:5 60:8
tactic (1) 15:9

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

tactics (1) 30:17
take (17) 6:6 10:12 22:19 25:13
 40:15 42:21 43:21,24 47:15,24
 59:24 64:15,21 74:23 77:1 82:3
 86:13
talk (21) 5:18 19:18 20:14 27:16
 28:7,7 30:1 35:7,12,24 36:4,15
 36:16 37:7 39:8 51:11,16 53:22
 68:1 71:7 79:5
talked (5) 25:8 63:16,17,17 79:15
talking (4) 17:8 18:18 37:17 41:10
talks (1) 37:19
tap (1) 14:3
tape (1) 74:24
taught (1) 12:22
tax (1) 68:17
Taylor (1) 70:17
Taylor (1) 70:19
teach (1) 71:24
teacher (2) 74:14,18
teaches (1) 71:14
teal (1) 49:17
team (1) 72:12
tech (1) 69:10
technology (1) 69:9
teenagers (1) 63:17
tell (5) 12:24 49:14 63:8 78:21
 83:20
tells (2) 47:23 78:11
ten (7) 5:25 18:9 27:7 39:4,5 61:13
 81:4
tend (2) 21:25 32:5
tends (1) 35:16
terms (2) 48:2 84:5
terrified (2) 84:11,13
terrifying (1) 84:9
terrorize (1) 84:25
test (1) 36:18
thank (55) 5:11 8:6,15 9:14,24,25
 11:23 12:19 13:4,11 19:25 20:7
 20:12 23:15,19 29:14,15,15
 32:12,24 34:12,13 35:2 41:7 42:5
 44:14,18 46:14 49:18 57:4 58:24
 62:7 64:24 68:8,10 70:20 72:16
 72:17 75:4,12,14,16 80:14,19,19
 81:5,8 82:5,10 85:11,12 86:8,9
 86:10,16
thankful (1) 5:7
thankfully (1) 33:19
thesis (1) 33:3
Thia (2) 4:4 20:9
thing (10) 7:11 28:1 37:15 40:10
 42:16 43:2 64:2 77:5 84:14,21
things (32) 7:6 8:13 14:22 21:9,12
 22:6 26:9 28:24 34:14 37:2 41:17
 41:19,20 42:3,6,19 50:8,10 51:24
 54:7 58:6,20 63:2,3 68:24 69:15

74:19 77:13,15 78:20 79:1 80:12
think (36) 5:23 9:20 15:8 21:17,23
 22:3,5,6,22 23:2,4,13 24:6 28:18
 29:4 31:25 35:20,21,22 41:5,12
 41:14 42:8,23 43:21 56:1 58:22
 59:5,9,14,17 63:25 67:23 72:17
 76:21 77:7
thought (1) 59:11
thoughts (1) 34:9
thousand (6) 27:5,7 47:20,22 59:6
 59:10
threat (2) 17:19 67:18
three (2) 55:16 73:17
thrown (1) 38:18
time (19) 6:6 16:4 29:22 31:23
 36:13 40:24,25 42:20,21,21
 43:21 44:13,15 53:24 64:15
 65:21 74:1 75:23 82:20
times (5) 18:9 26:20 28:9 36:18
 59:10
titanium (1) 65:7
title (1) 24:1
today (8) 10:10 12:20,23 14:2 30:1
 45:1 70:10,12
told (2) 13:17 78:24
ton (1) 58:1
tonight (7) 5:12 6:11 8:16 10:4,6
 60:5 78:24
tons (1) 40:19
tool (1) 32:9
tools (1) 81:20
top (1) 42:23
topic (4) 33:3 37:22,22 39:4
total (2) 48:8 49:24
touch (1) 28:16
touching (1) 77:18
tour (1) 61:14
town (1) 29:8
train (2) 11:12 69:23
trained (2) 55:11 60:25
training (3) 11:9 51:3 61:10
Transcribed (1) 1:18
transcript (2) 1:12 87:10
transfer (1) 73:13
translate (1) 75:21
transparency (2) 43:17 52:10
traumas (1) 77:2
treacherous (1) 40:12
treat (1) 25:19
treated (1) 59:11
treatment (1) 63:19
treats (1) 77:15
trenches (1) 63:6
trendy (1) 37:22
Tricia (3) 10:14,16 71:11
Trish (1) 10:16
trouble (1) 27:23

troubled (2) 24:5 26:19
true (1) 87:11
trust (7) 22:11 30:11,18 31:4,17
 62:24 63:21
trusting (2) 30:6 31:21
try (11) 30:20 39:20 47:15 53:18
 54:9,10 59:2 70:1,3,14 83:12
trying (10) 16:7 24:10 36:25 37:1
 39:21 43:10 54:17 57:11 64:4
 65:17
Tubbs (3) 44:22,23 46:8
tuned (2) 35:17,17
turkeys (1) 16:1
turn (5) 8:13 9:21 63:12 72:24
 78:16
twenty (2) 27:8 44:17
twisted (1) 41:18
two (18) 7:5 11:3 13:16,20 22:1
 25:25 35:7 36:7 46:23 47:23 54:7
 54:13 58:6 64:23 75:6 76:11
 82:14 84:5
type (10) 26:16 39:23 42:2 53:1
 57:24 58:2,11 77:21 78:7,10
types (7) 29:7 39:24,25 41:4 45:9
 57:17 78:20
typically (2) 50:21 53:7

U

uncomfortable (1) 21:3
undereducated (1) 72:2
understand (9) 11:8,12,18 14:13
 26:20 30:4,20 41:15 58:9
understanding (3) 7:21 31:13 80:5
understands (1) 17:11
unfair (1) 84:18
unfortunately (2) 65:20 71:16
unfounded (5) 49:7,21 50:2 51:24
 56:21
unidentified (3) 49:13,20,21
unit (8) 16:15 29:25 50:19 54:7,8
 59:1,21 67:25
United (1) 45:4
units (3) 10:18 16:15 17:14
unsubstantiated (3) 49:4,16 50:3
Upbound (4) 4:11,12 68:13 70:25
update (1) 11:20
updating (1) 11:14
Urban (4) 4:11,12 68:13 70:24
use (4) 10:3 11:15 55:10 65:23
usual (1) 10:20
utilizing (1) 53:10

V

vacation (1) 40:25
value (1) 64:9
Vanessa (3) 4:15 82:12,16
variety (2) 52:11 54:4

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018**

vehicle (1) 83:7
Ventre (3) 9:2,3,5
Vernon (3) 5:25 69:18,20
verses (3) 39:17 51:3,3
Vice (3) 4:7 34:24 35:4
victims (1) 76:25
video (14) 6:15,17,23,25 51:20
 52:2,6,6 53:2,5,11 54:11 55:23
 57:24
videocast (2) 58:22 59:17
videos (1) 58:1
violate (1) 16:24
violation (1) 65:11
violence (4) 18:18 67:17,18 74:3
virtual (1) 27:3
vis (2) 42:14,14
visiting (1) 17:6
visits (1) 73:11
visual (2) 52:22,24
voice (2) 15:7 26:14
volunteer (1) 68:4

W

waiting (1) 84:12
walk (5) 63:5 77:25 78:6,17 83:1
walking (1) 21:4
walks (1) 63:11
want (41) 5:20 7:3 13:13 20:2
 24:14 26:1,2,2 36:15 37:5,9,11
 40:21 42:22 44:2,4 45:20,23
 46:11 51:11 56:24 57:4 60:13
 61:22 62:9 72:6 75:20 76:22 79:5
 79:18,19 80:3,8,9 81:1 85:2,5,6,8
 86:11,12
wanted (6) 12:18,24 32:24 33:10
 76:11 81:11
wants (6) 10:11 24:22 44:1,11 46:1
 61:25
wasn't (1) 28:15
watched (2) 32:4,7
way (11) 5:14 22:9,10,13,24 31:1
 68:25 70:5 81:16 84:24 87:15
ways (7) 36:23 45:14 52:13 54:4
 59:16 60:16 69:11
we'll (6) 43:22 54:2 64:20 75:19
 76:10,12
we're (19) 5:17,18 22:3,8 38:23
 43:14 57:11 61:19 62:1 64:16
 66:16 67:10,15 68:14 70:4 78:8,9
 81:5,25
we've (2) 14:19 20:23
web (4) 18:20,23 19:3,11
website (9) 10:23 11:20 27:20
 45:17 50:23 51:12 57:7 60:21
 69:11
weekend (1) 6:3
weeks (1) 25:25

welcome (7) 5:2 8:18 9:4,11,17
 10:16 13:10
welcomes (1) 8:5
went (3) 12:21 52:1 73:15
weren't (2) 21:10 59:11
Westchester (2) 87:4,8
what-do-you-want-to-be (1) 80:2
whatnot (1) 17:21
white (1) 36:19
whites (1) 38:12
wide (2) 30:17 52:11
willing (2) 19:17 28:2
window (1) 24:21
WITNESS (1) 87:18
witnesses (5) 54:11,19 55:2,3,4
woman (1) 74:24
wonderful (1) 57:6
words (1) 75:18
work (18) 5:15 15:12,21,25 20:17
 22:23 26:2,24 29:4 33:14 43:14
 43:19 59:2,15 64:7 70:15 71:15
 84:13
worked (1) 72:12
workforce (1) 68:16
working (9) 11:17 13:2 19:5 22:4
 25:4 26:4 42:24 63:6 74:22
works (1) 14:20
world (1) 21:13
worn (6) 7:16,18 31:25 53:3,14
 54:21
worried (1) 64:8
worry (2) 79:11,22
worse (1) 78:8
wouldn't (2) 84:14,15
wow (1) 83:15
wrap (5) 79:21 80:24 81:1,7,11
wrong (1) 81:25
wrote (1) 33:3
www.NYC.gov/ccrbcomplaint (1)
 45:17

X

X (2) 1:1,6

Y

Yeah (1) 70:18
year (6) 6:25 7:25 11:2 20:24 72:1
 84:6
years (5) 6:1 36:19 71:3 72:13
 77:10
YOON (1) 3:8
York (22) 6:8,23 8:3,3,12 18:11
 19:6,14 35:9,10 39:5,18,18 40:14
 44:24 45:2 55:8,10 57:19 68:15
 87:2,8
Yorkers (1) 11:21
young (12) 17:16 18:2 21:11 24:19

29:2 59:22 71:25 75:11 76:18
 82:19 83:2,20
YOUNGIK (1) 3:8
youth (18) 14:21 68:21 69:1,2,7
 70:5 71:9,13 72:7 76:14,17 77:5
 78:7 79:4 80:11 81:14 82:8 83:20
Youtube (1) 18:21
Yu (1) 10:8

Z

0

1

1 (1) 2:3
1-800-341-2272 (1) 45:15
10 (2) 1:4 2:12
103rd (3) 8:21 15:12,20
107 (1) 50:2
108 (2) 16:23 48:10
108th (3) 8:24 16:22 48:18
11 (2) 6:21 52:5
110th (1) 9:1
111 (1) 73:7
114 (4) 47:12 48:11 84:1,19
114th (4) 8:18 16:23 48:18 84:3
12 (3) 14:16 28:13 50:1
13 (1) 35:6
130 (1) 48:15
15 (1) 38:4
16 (1) 72:14
17 (1) 50:2
18 (2) 39:13 71:25
180 (1) 48:13
1999 (2) 36:9 37:19

2

2 (1) 2:4
2013 (1) 36:10
2015 (1) 30:16
2016 (1) 20:25
2017 (4) 6:16,19 47:8 59:5
2018 (3) 1:4 5:3 87:18
2019 (1) 87:22
21 (1) 76:18
21st (1) 1:6
24 (2) 28:13 72:1
26 (1) 33:16
27 (1) 33:16

3

3 (2) 2:5 36:19
30 (6) 73:3,4,8,15 74:6 75:1
311 (7) 7:9 11:12,17,17,20 45:15
 66:16
33 (4) 6:14,16 48:15 52:4
35 (1) 49:25

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
January 10, 2018

37-44 (1) 1:6		
<hr/>		
4		
<hr/>		
4 (2) 2:6 36:19		
400 (2) 58:6 77:10		
48 (1) 28:13		
<hr/>		
5		
<hr/>		
5 (3) 2:7 36:19 75:6		
50 (2) 38:14 56:6		
54 (1) 50:1		
557 (1) 48:14		
<hr/>		
6		
<hr/>		
6 (2) 2:8 75:6		
6:30 (1) 1:5		
6th (1) 87:18		
<hr/>		
7		
<hr/>		
7 (2) 2:9 75:6		
<hr/>		
8		
<hr/>		
8 (2) 2:10 75:6		
<hr/>		
9		
<hr/>		
9 (2) 2:11 75:6		