

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018

1

2

3

-----X

4

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD

5

PUBLIC MEETING

6

September 12, 2018

7

6:40 p.m.

8

-----X

9

Port Richmond High School

10

85 St. Joseph Avenue

11

Staten Island, New York

12

13

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS:

14

BEFORE:

15

FREDERICK DAVIE, Chair

16

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

17

18

19

REPORTED BY:

20

Rita Persichetty

21

22

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.

23

139 MAMARONECK AVENUE

MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543

24

212.95.DEPOS (953.3767) \* 914.381.2061

FACSIMILE: 914.722.0816

25

E-MAIL: Stenokath@verizon.net

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final**  
**September 12, 2018**

2

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of Minutes
3. Report from the Chair
4. Report from the Executive Director
5. Presentation by Outreach on the CCRB
6. Presentation from Policy on Data
7. Comment from Community Groups
8. Public Comment
9. Old Business
10. New Business
11. Adjourn to Executive Session

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

3

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

RAMON PEGUERO, Board Member

FRANK J. DWYER, Board Member

LINDSAY EASON, Board Member

SALVATORE CARCATERRA, Board Member

MARBRE STAHLY-BUTTS, Board Member

MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA, Board Member

JOSEPH A. PUMA, Board Member

ERICA BOND, Board Member

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

4

PROCEEDINGS

P R O C E E D I N G S

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: We would like to call this meeting of the Civilian Complaint Review Board to order. We would ask if board members who are here would introduce themselves.

So we'll start to my left with Mr. Puma.

MR. PUMA: Good evening, everyone.

It's great to be in Staten Island. I'm Joseph Puma. I'm the City Council designee on the CCRB from Manhattan.

MR. EASON: Good evening, everyone.

Nice to be in Staten Island. My name is Lindsay Eason, and I'm a police commissioner appointee.

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Good evening.

My name is Marbre Stahly-Butts, and I'm a City Council appointee from Brooklyn.

MR. MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA: Good evening, everyone.

I'm Michael Rivadeneyra, and I am a City Council appointee from the Bronx.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

5

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 MR. DARCHE: Good evening.

3 My name is Jonathan Darche, I'm the  
4 executive director of the agency.

5 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: I'm Fred Davie. I'm  
6 a mayoral designee, and I'm the chair of  
7 the CCRB.

8 MS. BOND: Good evening, Erica Bond  
9 mayoral designee.

10 MR. CARCATERRA: Hi everyone. Sal  
11 Carcaterra, and I'm a police commissioner  
12 designee.

13 MR. RAMON PEGUERO: Good evening.

14 Thank you for having us. My name is  
15 Ramon Peguero. I am the City Council  
16 designee for the County of Queens.

17 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: We want to welcome  
18 you all here. We have just one little  
19 housekeeping piece of business we have to  
20 take care of, and that is approving the  
21 minutes from the last meeting.

22 Is there a motion that we approve the  
23 minutes from the last meeting?

24 MR. MICHAEL RIVADENEYRA: Motion.

25 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Is there a second?

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

6

PROCEEDINGS

MR. CARCATERRA: Second.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: All those in favor,  
please say "aye"?

(All in the room respond in the  
affirmative.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Opposed no.

(No verbal)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: The minutes are  
adopted.

Let me welcome all of you here to  
this September 2018 meeting of the  
Civilian Complaint Review Board.

Before we begin and foremost, I would  
like to acknowledge that we're meeting the  
day after the anniversary of  
September 11th, a day on which members of  
the NYPD rushed into chaos and,  
ultimately, in some cases gave their lives  
in service of the people of New York City.

Let's have a moment of silence in  
remembrance of those officers and the  
others who paid the ultimate sacrifice on  
behalf of the people of the city and the  
people of this country.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

7

PROCEEDINGS

(Moment of Silence)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

At the Civilian Complaint Review Board, by the very nature of our work, we often hear about what NYPD officers are doing wrong. And make no mistake, it is important to receive that information. Officers who engage in misconduct must be held accountable.

But in remembering 9/11, we recall how important it is that everyone who sees something suspicious isn't afraid to tell an officer. We remember how important it is that the public have full confidence that their police will protect and serve them.

At the CCRB, we remember how important it is to push toward improving police community relations and, ultimately, make sure that we all can work together to keep New York City safe.

Secondly, as many of you are aware, the CCRB recently filed charges against Officer Daniel Pantaleo in relation to the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

8

PROCEEDINGS

2014 death of Eric Garner here on Staten Island.

While I am not able to share further details, I can assure you the attorneys in our administrative prosecution unit, a team of prosecutors within the CCRB, is working -- they are working very hard and are committed to the pursuit of justice in this case as they are in all others. I have full confidence they will bring the same level of diligence to this work as they bring to all other work that they do.

Finally, as Port Richmond students, faculty, parents, and staff know -- and we thank you for having us here -- we are in a week into the new school year, a time when our city is focused on its young people, as it should be.

Ensuring the well-being of New York City's youth population, the future of our city requires us all to be concerned about what's happening in New York City schools. We have to remember however, that while the six- to seven-hour block that young



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

9

PROCEEDINGS

people spend in school is important, they have a whole life that is shaped by experiences that they have outside of school.

Tragically, too many New Yorkers will recall one particular experience, that of being stopped and frisked by a police officer on the way to and from school, as something of a right of passage.

Although the way we -- although the way that practice had been carried out for years has been ruled unconstitutional recently, we know that generations of New Yorkers' attitudes about the NYPD were shaped by the interactions they had with police during their youth.

Even today here on Staten Island one out of every five complaints is filed by someone between the ages of 14 and 24, which makes it clear that there's still work to do in repairing the relationships between young people and the NYPD.

The CCRB takes seriously its moral obligation to play a role in ensuring

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

10

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 future generations of New Yorkers trust  
3 the police and feel safe and comfortable  
4 enough to report crime or to ask for help  
5 when needed. We know that learning how to  
6 move police community relations forward  
7 starts with listening, and young New  
8 Yorkers must be leaders in that  
9 conversation.

10 That's why we are pleased to announce  
11 tonight that the CCRB will host its first  
12 ever youth summit in February at New York  
13 University. We will be inviting New  
14 Yorkers from every borough -- young New  
15 Yorkers from every borough to lead a  
16 discussion about their experiences with the  
17 NYPD and to tell us what they think is working  
18 well, as well as what needs to be changed.

19 So if you're a young person who would  
20 like to be a part of our youth summit or  
21 you know a young person who might be  
22 interested, please see our outreach  
23 director, Yojaira Alvarez, or visit  
24 [nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit](http://nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit),  
25 [nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit](http://nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit).

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

11

PROCEEDINGS

1  
2           Thank you all for being here. I look  
3 forward to a robust conversation tonight,  
4 and I'd like to now turn over the mic and  
5 the floor to our executive director,  
6 Mr. Jon Darche.

7           MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8           I'd like to welcome you all to the  
9 Staten Island board meeting, and I'd like  
10 to thank the Port Richmond High School  
11 principal, Andrew Greenfield, for allowing  
12 us to use this facility.

13           I'll be brief because it's we really  
14 want to hear from the members of the  
15 community while we're out here. But I  
16 just wanted to let you all know that the  
17 policy unit is working on a number of  
18 reports, including our 2018 semiannual  
19 report, a follow-up report on taser use,  
20 and a report on the effectiveness of  
21 body-worn cameras.

22           Reports are significant. No other  
23 entity, other than the CCRB, issues the  
24 kind of in-depth data and  
25 information-based reports on police

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

12

PROCEEDINGS

community relations in New York City. The CCRB data helps the agency identify problems and push for solutions which we hope ultimately makes New York a better city for all of its residents.

I'd also like to reiterate what the Chair said about our youth summit. It's going to be in February at NYU, and this is a youth-led event aimed at improving the relationship between the NYPD and young New Yorkers.

If you are interested in participating, you can either speak to Yojaira Alvarez who's here in the front row, our director of outreach, or go to [nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit](http://nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit).

And, finally, if someone is here who wants to make a complaint, we have two investigators here, Zachary Herman and Volha Shavchenka.

If you can stand up. Thanks, guys.

Mr. Chair.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you,  
Mr. Darsche.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

13

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 We have a number of public officials  
3 here who are represented here, but we do  
4 have a city council member here. We're so  
5 pleased that she can join us. So I'm  
6 going to ask Council Member Debbie Rose if  
7 she will bring some remarks for us.

8 COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: Good evening,  
9 everyone.

10 (Audience members respond "good  
11 evening.")

12 COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: I want to welcome  
13 you to the 49th District Staten Island  
14 North Shore, the best district, I have to  
15 say. And I want to thank the board, the  
16 CCRB, for convening this meeting here on  
17 the north shore.

18 I want to thank our representatives  
19 from the NYPD who have been working very  
20 diligently with us to improve police  
21 community relations, and I want to thank  
22 you for taking time out of your busy  
23 schedules to be here to discuss your  
24 issues and concerns. I want to really  
25 thank you for coming to Staten Island this

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

14

PROCEEDINGS

evening.

And under the leadership of Chair Davie, the Civilian Complaint Review Board has recognized the need to make this board more available to New Yorkers and regardless of their location, and the fact that they are making themselves accessible to hear from the public is greatly appreciated by myself, and your presence here reflects that desire to be accountable and accessible.

And I'm pleased to announce tonight that the New York City Council approved the appointment last month of the next appointee to the CCRB, our Staten Island representative, Mr. Nathan Joseph, and I'm looking forward to his confirmation by the mayor to be a board member. I also know Mr. Joseph looks forward to joining you at your next meeting.

I've known Mr. Joseph for decades and have found him to be an objective, pragmatic person. Everything he has taken on in his career he's performed with

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

15

PROCEEDINGS

excellence, and I know he will do the same as the Staten Island representative to the Civilian Complaint Review Board.

He has demonstrated a keen ability to analyze empirical evidence and make decisions based on that evidence. I know he will use those same skills to weigh and analyze evidence to ultimately strengthen public safety and accountability and raise the esteem with which we hold our law enforcement officers.

And so I was pleased to nominate him for this position. His skills and the skills of the Board will be needed as we proceed with the internal investigation into the officers involved in the death of Eric Garner, and I join my constituents tonight in their inquiries regarding the status of the investigation.

I do understand that it's an ongoing investigation, and we will not be able to get that information, but I do want you to know that we are anxious. It's been a long time coming, and so as soon as that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

16

PROCEEDINGS

is -- you're able to make that information available, I would appreciate it because, as you know, more than four years have passed since Mr. Garner's death, and New Yorkers are still waiting for justice.

While I look forward to seeing the CCRB continue to transform so that it benefits the entire city, I frequently remind city officials and NYPD officials that the CCRB's commitment to transparency, efficiency, and reform is only meaningful if its recommendations are followed by the police department.

I know that your conclusions are weighted carefully, and my hope is that Chief O'Neill will respect your work and follow your recommendations. My repeated calls for accountability is rooted in the belief that the NYPD should and does protect all citizens with courtesy, professionalism, and respect.

To strengthen that accountability and increase police community relations, I want to remind everyone here that if you



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

17

PROCEEDINGS

or someone you know wants to meet with a representative of the CCRB, you can do so in my office.

I'm really proud to say that on the third Thursday of every month we have a representative from the CCRB, because we understand how important accessibility is. And we know that NYPD and the CCRB wants to be accountable, and so we make our office space available on the third Thursday of every month, but you have to call for an appointment.

So I'm going to give you a number. So if anyone is interested, you can call for an appointment. You won't have to go into Manhattan or into a precinct. My office is located at 130 Stuyvesant Place in St. George on the sixth floor, and my number is (718) 556-7370.

And again, I know that this will be a productive evening. I want to thank you for your time and your effort, and I want to commend NYPD for the community policing initiative which has transformed the way

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

18

PROCEEDINGS

communities interact with NYPD.

Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you, council member.

Let me just take an opportunity to address one thing that you raised, and then we'll see if any of the members of the board have any comments or questions.

We are working diligently just to address the issue of recommended discipline and in concurrence with the department about what that discipline should be.

In 2017, 75 percent of the time we recommended discipline, and the department agreed with it. What we're working more closely on now is to get to greater concurrence between the department and our recommendations.

COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: So important.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Indeed it is and the commissioner has appointed a blue ribbon commission to take a look at that question, and we are working with that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

19

PROCEEDINGS

commission. We have ongoing conversations with the department about this and our staff, Mr. Darche and his staff and others.

So we are working very hard to see if we can't tighten that concurrence rate a little bit more and get at the very thing that you've raised. So thank you for that comment and the rest.

COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Sure.

Any comments from any of the members of the Board?

(No audible response from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: All right.

As the council member said, we are very pleased that the NYPD is represented here tonight by commanders and supervisors and inspectors and others, and we want to give you a chance to speak as well.

I have a list. I'll go through the list. And if I missed anybody, then we will ask you to identify yourself and speak.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

20

PROCEEDINGS

So first on the list I have is Deputy  
Inspector Matthew Harrington from the  
121st Precinct. You have a comment, sir?

MR. HARRINGTON: Oh, no. Thank you  
for having me.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Sure. Staten Island  
Patrol Borough Commander Kenneth E. Corey.

BOROUGH COMMANDER KENNETH: Hi. Good  
evening, everyone.

(Audience responds "good evening.")

BOROUGH COMMANDER KENNETH: To the  
board, thank you for the invitation to be  
here this evening. I think we've got to  
listen and hear what the people who came  
here have to say.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you, Deputy  
Inspector Isa Abbassi.

How did I do on that?

MR. ABBASSI: Not bad. Good evening.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Captain Melissa  
Eger.

MS. EAGER: Eger. Good evening.  
Thank you for having us.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Captain Kenneth

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

21

PROCEEDINGS

Noonan.

CAPTAIN NOONAN: How are you? Good evening.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: And did I miss anyone?

(Applause from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: So we're going to do a few things. Before we hear from the public, we want to have a few brief presentations, one from our outreach director, another on policy and data, and then we'll hear from community groups, and then we'll open it up for public comment.

So we will hear first from Yojaira Alvarez and discussion of policy. Thank you.

MS. YOJAIRA ALVAREZ: Hello, everyone. Thank you so much for coming.

I know that some of you are familiar with the Civilian Complaint Review Board, but for those of you who aren't, I just want to take a quick minute to go over our jurisdiction and who exactly we are.

So the CCRB is a city agency

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

22

PROCEEDINGS

independent from the NYPD. We investigate, mediate, and administratively prosecute allegations of police misconduct. We are the nation's largest civilian oversight entity of the nation's largest police department.

Now, we're not -- we can't investigate all allegations of misconduct. There are four major categories that fall under our jurisdiction. One way of remembering that is the acronym F-A-D-O, or FADO.

The first category is force. If a police officer uses force, that falls under our jurisdiction. That could include a punch, kick, throwing someone up against the wall, et cetera.

The second category is abuse of authority. So that is a bigger category. That could mean an improper stop, an improper search, forceable removal that results in someone going to the hospital. If I ask a police officer for their name and badge number and they don't give it to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

23

PROCEEDINGS

me, that would be something that we would investigate.

As of February, we've been also investigating allegations of sexual harassment. So that can include verbal harassment, taking inappropriate photos, inappropriate stops related to that and also sexual or romantic propositions, et cetera.

The third category is discourtesy. So that can include profanity, a police officer using the middle finger. If a police officer asked for my name, asks for my I.D. and I give it to her, perhaps she throws it on the ground. That's something we investigate.

And the last category is offensive language. So this is language that inappropriately refers to your race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, religion, disability status.

This is very limited examples that I gave. So if you encounter -- if you feel that you've experienced police misconduct,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

24

PROCEEDINGS

if you know of anybody who's experienced police misconduct, please direct them to us. There are multiple ways of filing a complaint.

Council Member Rose mentioned the off sight hours we have a CCRB representative that they have in her office the third Thursday of every month. We also have our website, [www.nyc.gov/ccrb](http://www.nyc.gov/ccrb). You can call us at 311, everyone's favorite number. 1-800-341 CCRB as well. You can also come to our office at 100 Church Street in Manhattan, the tenth floor. You can also file a complaint at your local precinct.

Now, another reason we're here is because we want to be here more. So if you have an after-school program, a youth group, a student group, we would love to come give a presentation. This is a very brief one. A full one is about 30 to 40 minutes long.

We talk about interactions like street encounters. We talk about mediation process. We talk about our



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

25

PROCEEDINGS

investigative process more in depth.

We have a new coordinator. Ernest,  
if you want to stand up?

So Ernest Estime (phonetic) is  
dedicated to Staten Island. So feel free  
to stop by, get his card or grab my card.  
You can also reach us at  
outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov. Please, we want to  
be out as much as possible. You can also  
follow us on Twitter and be abreast of any  
upcoming events and any news that we have.

Thank you so much.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

MR. DARCHE: Mr. Chair, can I add one  
thing?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Sure.

MR. DARCHE: I also wanted to point  
out that Council Member Rose has -- is a  
member of the Community Partners  
Initiative. And if any of you would like  
to meet with investigators at her office  
rather than coming all the way down to  
CCRB, you can do so. And you can actually  
contact her office at (718)556-7370.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

26

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 And she's located, I think, at  
3 130 Stuyvesant Place?

4 COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: Yes.

5 MR. DARCHE: And I just want to say  
6 on behalf of everyone at the agency, we  
7 really appreciate the council member for  
8 stepping up and helping us serve the  
9 community in Staten Island as well as we  
10 are able to, due to her help.

11 Thank you, Councilwoman Rose.

12 COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: Thank you.

13 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Any other comments?

14 (No response from audience.)

15 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: All right. Our  
16 policy -- I'm sorry, our data -- policy  
17 presentation with data.

18 MS. HARYA TAREKEGN: Good evening,  
19 everybody.

20 (Audience responds "good evening.")

21 MS. HARYA TAREKEGN: My name is Harya  
22 Tarekegn. I'm senior counsel for data  
23 policy and advocacy. While my  
24 presentation loads, I will take this  
25 moment to tell you guys how excited we

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

27

PROCEEDINGS

really are about this youth summit that we're going to be having in February.

We're trying to do things a little differently, understanding that a lot of times city agencies, adults, academics, practitioners are really talking to youth and telling them what they should be doing or how they should be changing the things that they see.

We're trying to flip that script a little bit and make sure that we hear from youth, hear from you guys what you are experiencing and the solutions that you think would best affect you, yourself, your friends, your communities and start with the youth coming to us both with problems and solutions and then pair the youth with practitioners and academics to then figure out how to actually implement the solutions brought to us by youth.

So your voices are going to be the most important part of that. And we're really excited to have as many of you as possible. It's going to be in conjunction

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

28

PROCEEDINGS

with two schools at NYU, which we're really excited about: The McSilver Institute and the Center on Race, Justice and Inequality.

So please come out and come talk to me. If you want to learn more about it, come talk to me if you already have ideas before February, as we're planning. And due to technical difficulties, I'm just going to -- I'm going to give him one minute.

But I'm going to start talking to you guys a little bit about what we do and why these policy presentations are even part of the board meetings which is that we want to give you guys a snapshot of the data that we're seeing from your communities.

So we in the policy department take all of the complaints that we get and do analyses to see patterns that we're seeing in certain communities to figure out why we're seeing maybe certain -- more of a certain type of allegation or less of a

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

29

PROCEEDINGS

certain type of allegation in different boroughs, in different precincts, what that can be related to, and how we can put together policy recommendations for NYPD knowing that information.

So in Staten Island we have -- in the 120th precinct, when we looked at the crime rate for the eight major felonies, where there is a high complaint rate, there is also a high crime rate.

In the 123rd, there's a low to moderate complaint rate and a low to moderate crime rate.

But in the 121st and 122nd, we see kind of a reverse. So the 121st there's a higher crime rate compared to the complaint rate, which can be indicative of several things. It can be that we need to do additional CCRB outreach. It could be because a community has better relations with that police department.

There are several factors, and we're trying to figure out what that means, what that looks like, and also trying to target

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

30

PROCEEDINGS

our outreach to places where we see lower complaint rates compared to the crime rates.

In the 122nd, we have a higher complaint rate compared to the crime rate. And so that could either indicate higher rates of misconduct, or it could indicate higher rates of reporting maybe, and probably our outreach team is doing a great job in that precinct or in that -- yeah, precinct. So people know about us more and file claimants with us more.

I had beautiful charts to go along with this conversation which hopefully will come at some point, but stick with me for a little bit.

So when we investigate complaints, there are some complaints that go through a full investigation, meaning that civilians cooperate with us, go through our whole process, and we are able to come out with some determination on the merits.

And for those cases in Staten Island compared to New York City as a whole,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

31

PROCEEDINGS

there are more force allegations, fewer abuse of authority and discourtesy allegations from Staten Island. This is something that we're looking at, trying to figure out what that's for; and, of course, the more that we hear from the community, the more we are able to inform our policy recommendations.

I said fully investigated because there are a number of our cases that we call "truncated" which means that at some point during the process the complainant, or the victim, decides to no longer pursue our complaint process. And so we often look at why that person wasn't able to go through our process or why that person chose not to.

And so one of the great things about the council member being one of our partners is that we understand how far our offices are from you and how difficult it is to come down to our offices to file a complaint, and so we have been partnering with council members across the boroughs

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

32

PROCEEDINGS

to make sure that there is another location where you guys can come to file your complaints.

I will end there because it's a lot of information, but I will say that our upcoming policy initiatives are to come up with -- we're writing several reports right now. We're working on a body-worn camera report. We're working on a report that was a follow-up to our 2016 taser report.

We are looking into write a report on police interactions with New Yorkers experiencing homelessness, a report on sexual misconduct, and finally a report using complaints from young people.

As Chair Davie mentioned, in Staten Island nearly one fifth of the complaints that we receive are between the ages of 14 and 24. So we know that there are a lot of voices here that we need to capture. So we look forward to hearing from you guys. Please stop me. I'll be here all night. I'll be sitting right there. I'll



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

33

PROCEEDINGS

be around, so come talk to me, I'm easy to  
talk to and I want to hear from you.  
Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

Any of the members have any comments  
or questions?

(No response from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: So we'll move to  
that part of the agenda that we are all  
here for and that is to hear from you, the  
public. We are going to start first with  
community groups. I have a list here that  
I will go through, and then again, if  
anyone is missed, please let me know, and  
we'll make sure that you get a chance to  
speak.

I have -- and I'm really going to  
butcher this -- but I have a Ranti  
Ogunaleye who is the director of the  
Gerard Carter Center and a group of  
speakers, Christopher Shannon and Laisha  
McClellan (phonetics). They're not here.

So next on the list I have Sibhon  
White who is a community coordinator of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

34

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

Project Hospitality. You're ready to speak? Okay.

MS. WHITE: I was worried that I wouldn't be able to reach this thing but it seems I'll do just fine.

Good evening, everyone.

(Audience responds "good evening.")

MS. WHITE: As you said, I'm a new hire at Project Hospitality as their new outreach coordinator, and I was invited by CCRB to come in and speak.

Unfortunately, my youth are not here today. I work with the youth Drop-In Center on 27 Port Richmond. But I'm here, and I would just like to say, I know we're here about some complaints and things like that, but I'd like to give -- or shine light on the fact that we have some wonderful officers here. You know, that they have done a tremendous job in our community.

And I actually have two small children, a small story. I have two young boys, and one night we were on our way to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

35

PROCEEDINGS

the movies not too long ago, and we saw two officers. My youngest, he's five years old. He ran into the store and he said, "Hey, Officer, hey." And the officer shook his hand.

And I said, you know what? Just got off work, taking my kids to the movies. But I said, how about I think about how about I'm going to ask these officers if they could come to the youth center and decide to give a little presentation to our youth, right, about how they can join, you know, whether it be the cadets or if they can give a presentation on the DARE program.

And lo and behold, one of the officers that I run into, he is a part of the neighborhood coordination officers. So he gives me his card. We go back and forth on text. "Hey, how are you doing, what's up? What's going on," you know. And, eventually, he actually dropped in to the Drop-In Center. And while he was there, he was able to give information to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

36

PROCEEDINGS

the youth that had some legal issues.  
They were so excited.

You know, him and his partner came in, and I was so happy for that interaction. And for them to see that, you know what, although there might be some negatives in some people that are out there, but there are also great officers as well, and I'm so glad to have two of them sitting here today.

I contacted their lieutenant, and I wanted to let them know how great of an officer they were, and I actually -- upon that meeting when he came into the youth Drop-In Center, and I am speaking of PO Babiak who is sitting back there.

Raise your hand. There you go.

And he came in, and he made sure that he also brought along fliers for the -- what was it? -- Build the Block. And we did have that. And I made sure I attended. I said, hey, you know, one hand washes the other. He showed up for my youth; I had to go ahead, you know, and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

37

PROCEEDINGS

support them.

And it was a nice turnout. And it was on Thursday, September 6th, and it was held at the Garden Manor Apartments. And it was really nice. It was really nice. Something similar to this. People come out and talk about what they need to see done or what's happening with the community and the officers were very polite and gracious enough to talk and hear everyone's concerns much like this one.

And if you allow me, I did -- it's nothing big. It's nothing fancy. But I did just have a few certificates that I would just like for them to have.

So, Officer Babiak, would you come up.

(Applause from audience.)

MS. WHITE: And this is your neighborhood coordination officers.

So, Officer Babiak, I would like to present you with a few so you can take back with you, okay? I spoke to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

38

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 lieutenant. I don't know if you know  
3 about that. But Lieutenant Tripolsi  
4 (phonetic), if I'm saying his name right.

5 We have Sergeant Montez (phonetic),  
6 who was there at the meeting that night,  
7 and CO Flores as well as -- I always have  
8 trouble with this name -- NCO Terranova.  
9 Right?

10 NCO Ruff (phonetic) who's also the  
11 one that gave the DARE program  
12 information. Right, there you go.

13 NCO Lenza, partner Patty and NCO  
14 Babiak, thank you very much.

15 OFFICER BABIAK: Thank you.

16 MS. WHITE: Thank you guys for having  
17 me.

18 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: You're very welcome,  
19 and thank you for the presentation.

20 Next I have on the list Reverend  
21 Stephanie Marcella who is associate  
22 minister of Outreach and Touch Ministries  
23 International.

24 REVEREND MARCELLA: Good evening,  
25 everyone.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

39

PROCEEDINGS

(Audience responds "good evening.")

REVEREND MARCELLA: I am speaking on behalf of Reverend Dr. Kathlyn Barret-Layne who is our apostle and pastor at Outreach and Touch Ministries and which I am a minister of.

So before I read her statement, I will say I am the daughter of a retired New York City police officer, and so I've had wonderful encounters as well with police officers from New York City throughout my life.

But at the same time working with a lot of kids, I do have a lot of concerns as well, especially nowadays with certain things that I've been seeing with NYPD community relations.

So Reverend Dr. Kathlyn Barret-Lane, she writes, "I grew up in a law enforcement family that began with my dad who worked as a federal police officer, an older brother who worked not only as a police officer but climbed to the ranks of sergeant, lieutenant, and then chief of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

40

PROCEEDINGS

police in several counties in South Carolina, also post retirement worked as a deputy chief -- deputy sheriff and was previously married to NYPD police officer who retired after 20 years on the job."

I'm familiar with the day-to-day operations of the job, the perils of answering calls, the gut-wrenching pain of saluting a fellow officer shot in the line of duty, and the reward of helping and serving the community that come along with working for the NYPD. The reward fortunately outweighs the perils.

I've seen the great job police officers can do, but I've also seen the damages that have been done. The major concerns about police action in this precinct specifically have to do with apathy and indifference to humanity.

I've personally witnessed this being demonstrated when a distraught mother called me after her 15-year-old son went missing for over three hours. This child had vanished without a trace or a clue.



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

41

PROCEEDINGS

After searching the neighborhood, the mother went to the police station, the 121 and was met with, "Yeah, we got him. He's been arrested for stealing a cellphone." While the charges were dropped due to lack of positive identification by the victim, complaints and legal action have been initiated.

I put myself in the place of this mother and acted quickly to make sure appropriate and prompt legal help was received to rectify this situation. What if the officer were in this mother's shoes and their child went missing and someone knew where the child was but didn't tell them? How would they feel if for over three hours they didn't know where their 15-year-old child was?

The community needs to feel that officers will treat them with the same respect and care as they would want for themselves and their family members.

The high number of CCRB complaints on Staten Island are of great concern, and I

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

42

PROCEEDINGS

believe these numbers can be drastically reduced if officers who patrol the communities and serve the community are not opposed or afraid of interacting with the community where they work. They should be getting to know the community and the families in the community where they work.

Our church recently had a back-to-school event where the street and yard was flooded with children from toddler through college age. Instead of the officers who were there using this time to get to know the community where they serve and the children and parents by interacting in a friendly game, having a hamburger or a hot dog from the grill, they insisted and on choosing to sit in their patrol cars with the windows up.

Instead of being viewed in a positive light, these officers, because they presented themselves as aloft [sic] and indifferent, were viewed negatively. Positive interactions with the community

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

43

PROCEEDINGS

should be mandatory, not optional, and  
should be the primary part of this job.

I believe that if news, media and the  
CCRB were collecting this type of data, we  
will see fewer incidences and issues of  
negative interactions with the community.

Thank you for your time and for  
listening to our concerns this evening.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. Thank  
you so much.

Let's see if any of the members have  
questions or comments.

(No response from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: All right. Thank  
you. Thank you very much.

We now have Mr. John McBeth who is  
the chairman of Community Board One.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: There you go, you  
got a promotion.

MR. MCBETH: I'm actually the  
chairperson of the local area committee  
which encompasses the 121 Precinct,  
Port Richmond, Mariners Harbor, Arlington,  
Elm Park, and parts of Graniteville.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

44

PROCEEDINGS

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Welcome.

MR. MCBETH: Good evening, everyone.

(Audience responds "good evening.")

MR. MCBETH: First, in relation to what the minister said, we have had those types of things that have happened during events. Most events, I would say, are well attended. Most events, the officers do interact. However, there have been times when those officers who are not the usual, whether it's the NCOs or the community officers, they don't tend to interact as much, and that's really what we want as a community.

So, first, representing the community board, in my position as the chairperson for the local area community board, I'm available to field complaints as well as pass out information with regards to the CCRB. We have been doing that for the past two years.

So I kind of want to refute the data on the 121st Precinct in particular because we believe that we've gotten that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

45

PROCEEDINGS

information out, and the low number of complaints is most likely due to people's reluctance to file complaints, if necessary, or an actual lack of actual complaints taken place in regards to the 121.

And with the new NCO program rolled out, we shouldn't expect too many more complaints as well only because with that program in particular -- just to give you an idea of what that looked like in one particular neighborhood, Mariners Harbor. Mariners Harbor had two patrol officers ahead of the NCO program, and when the NCO program was eventually introduced and rolled out, there was a major concern within that community that they would lose those two officers in that the program, would assign them elsewhere.

So during the rollout it was announced that they would remain with the Mariners Harbor NYCHA Housing Development, and the residents were happy, even the officers were happy to remain in that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

46

PROCEEDINGS

position, and it's worked out well for all involved in this. It's one of those positive aspects.

In regards to complaints, I haven't personally fielded a lot of complaints in my position as the area chair; however, because I am so widely spread in other things -- in my activism, in my volunteerism -- I have fielded some complaints in regards to interactions with NYPD, and they're not usually force complaints. It's usually basic courtesy.

Whether it's basic courtesy when someone's going into the police precinct to fill out a form. They have simple interaction. Twice I've had to actually call the inspector to put pressure on his personnel to perform the job that they were supposed to be perform anyway. It's very simple, very straightforward things.

But the experiences of the people who were involved unfortunately left a negative impact on them, and it should not be, in my estimation, that someone who

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

47

PROCEEDINGS

knows someone has to call in order to get the appropriate service.

So it is something that because I've sat on both sides of the fence -- and let me explain that -- I have both, protested and marched and I've sat at the table to work out police community relations both with the Department of Justice and the NYPD both here and at One Police Plaza.

In that capacity it gives me an opportunity to pass off some good suggestions, good recommendations of things that worked in other industries and other areas as well, and so I will continue to do that as well in the area of -- basic customer service is basically what I'm talking about.

That's about all that I have. The few complaints that I've had from people -- again, as an individual, not as a member of the community board -- I've always recommended that they pursue those complaints, that they not just let it go. Whether they have or haven't, I wouldn't

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

48

PROCEEDINGS

know because I just pass the information on.

When I was in the streets as part of the anti-violence group, part of the information that we gave out was information to connect with the CCRB as well as knowing your own rights if you're stopped and things like that.

So, again, outreach is taking place on a regular basis in both the community level, if you will, and the street level. All right. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

Comments and questions from the board members?

(No response from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. We'll now go to the public comment from individuals.

The first person I have on the list -- I'm not going to get this right, although I think you may have already spoken. Let me just see.

Stephanie King? How did I do?



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

49

PROCEEDINGS

(Discussion off the record)

COUNCILWOMAN ROSE: That's the minister.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

Diane Signorelli.

MS. SIGNORILE: Good evening.

(Audience responds "good evening.")

MS. SIGNORILE: I come from a law enforcement family. My brother was a rookie cop. Every day I would pray "Come home in one piece," and that's what I've always done. He was Hero Cop of the Year.

When I had problems in my neighborhood with the police, I reached out to my brother. I couldn't understand why a policeman of the year wouldn't help his big sister, because I've always been that advocate, helping save souls, animals, anybody. It's been terrible.

In 2015, CCRB helped me, but the problem was "you dropped the ball." I've been abused just like Eric Garner for eight years, but I'm not dead yet. Everything I have is on audio, video.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

50

PROCEEDINGS

This is how you cops behave, and I know it's not the bad cops -- I mean, it's not the good cops. It's the ones who aren't doing their job. It's constantly...

It's on video at the 121 precinct live stream. They tried to have me arrested again, the same people. They're old. They're in my neighborhood. They're 70 years old. They're selling drugs. I'm reporting it because I'm the whistleblower. I'm being so ostracized.

Every day I'm in fear because I don't know if it's going to be one of the bad cops trying to help them get me. And I look at all your faces. I have to say that I believe you all have good souls, because I have Jesus in my heart and I don't hate anybody.

But if I report the bad cop, why is he still abusing me? Why did he not let me in the fair on Monday? He was blocking me for an hour. I had to stand on the side. All I wanted to do was get a caramel apple. I even offered to pay

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

51

PROCEEDINGS

admission to go in. They had to open up  
another case.

MR. DARCHE: Miss Signorile --  
continue.

MS. SIGNORILE: It's always the same  
thing. They have the same people that  
come out, they call themselves on the  
phone, and it just happens to be not the  
homeowners of my development. It's the  
people that are the Section 8 that are on  
drugs, that are getting all these free  
things that I have to pay for, and they're  
abusing drugs. They're abusing us.

So when someone is coming up to  
you -- I mean, I look in people's eyes all  
the time, and I do tell my story, and I  
tell them "all the cops aren't bad. You  
have to believe in someone."

And I do refer them to you, CCRB, and  
they do know. I try to say to them the  
cops have their union, and I explain to  
them that CCRB is our union. And I  
believe in you 100 percent, but I just  
wish you didn't drop the ball in 2015 and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

52

PROCEEDINGS

let me be abused some more. I am permanently disabled because the cops did this to me.

MR. DARCHE: Ma'am, so we have investigators here who will be happy to talk to you about the recent incident, but it's really inappropriate for you to discuss --

MS. SIGNORILE: Oh, I didn't know. Pardon me.

MR. DARCHE: No, I understand. So they'll speak to you right now. Volha, could you speak with her?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

The next person I have on our list is Ammu Kowolik.

MS. AMMU KOWOLIK: Good evening. I am not here under my official daytime job, but I do work for NY McSilver so we are very, very thrilled to be sponsoring with you and doing the youth summit in February. So we're very, very much looking forward to that. So I just want to tip my hat there --

MR. DARCHE: We appreciate your help

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

53

PROCEEDINGS

in that.

MS. AMMU KOWOLIK: Oh. Absolutely.

So my name is Ammu Kowolik, and I'm a member of the board of directors for Move Forward Staten Island. We're a nonpartisan, Staten Island based organization focused on moving social justice issues forward in our community, their civic engagement, education, grass roots organizing and policy advocacy.

So I just want to start by thanking and applauding the CCRB's work, especially with regard to the case against the officer who placed Eric Garner in the banned choke hold.

I'd also like to say that we are grateful for and have much respect for the majority of outstanding police officers that are on Staten Island, but having a Civilian Complaint Review Board is essential to ensure that no one, including law enforcement, is above the law.

Not many residents know about the CCRB. I'll admit I am one of them. And,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

54

PROCEEDINGS

you know, it's -- this is a very, very important board, and I want to be a part of it. Move Forward Staten Island wants to partner with you to do some presentations so the community is more aware.

I found out about the town hall a little late, and I'm glad I was able to make it today, but I know a lot more folks would have been in this room had they known about it. So we definitely want to pledge our support there, and we will be connecting. I got to meet some colleagues yesterday so we will be getting some presentations on locally.

And so last, but not least, we just wanted to offer our support and say thank you to that and we think it will be inherently important for you to continue to offer ongoing info sessions and town halls just like this on what the CCRB does.

And I think something like offering a lesson around "Know your rights" and other related workshops, I know you talked about

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

55

PROCEEDINGS

some of the presentations you offer would  
be really, really welcomed, and I look  
forward to connecting.

Thank you for your time.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

MR. EASON: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Members, any  
questions and comments?

(No response.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

Mr. Justin Alexander? No? Okay.

I want to acknowledge another board  
member who has come into the room since we  
got started, who decided to become part of  
the audience. Frank Dwyer. Frank's a  
representative of the designee of the  
police commissioner.

Frank, welcome.

MR. DWYER: Sorry I came in late.  
That's why I chose to sit here.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: There is a chair up  
here for you, Mr. Dwyer, if you would  
like.

We also have Jonathan Logan who's

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

56

PROCEEDINGS

asked to speak.

MR. LOGAN: Hello. Good evening.

(Audience replies good evening.)

MR. LOGAN: I'll get right to the point. Jonathan Logan. Cambridge Heights, Queens.

I'm here, I'll get right to the point. I'll testify real quick. Let's say you're driving in your car. You're with your wife maybe, and you got your kids in the car. You're driving down the street. You get pulled over. Police officer asks you to explain why you were doing whatever you did, whether it was changing a lane improperly or riding in the shoulder improperly, whatever it was.

The police officer didn't really give you the opportunity to speak, didn't really give you the opportunity to really explain yourself. You could tell there was some interaction there. Then all of a sudden the police officer says to you, "Well, stop acting dumb."

How would you feel? Probably wouldn't be a good feeling, right? But



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

57

PROCEEDINGS

then also your kids then turn to you and say, "Wait a second. You know, this is my dad. This is my mom here. Why is this person speaking to my dad and my mom this way?" Probably would infuriate you even more.

May 25th was probably one of the darkest days of my life when just something like that happened riding my motorcycle with my son, my eight-year-old son. And, in fact, when the police officer asked me --

MR. DARCHE: Mr. Logan --

MR. LOGAN: Yeah, I know. I'm not going to give any credence to it. What I would really like to really say is that situations like this happen time and time and time again, and hearing testimonies from other people who just spoke, it's important to know that these are not isolated incidents.

And so what I would like to say to the board and to the members of the public, a lot of times the most

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

58

PROCEEDINGS

disenfranchised, the most demoralized people, the most -- the people who most marginalized folks, they do not attend these types of meetings. They don't -- they're not here. They don't have time to. They've lost faith. They've given up hope.

So what I'm saying is to the CCRB and to the members of the public, we have to do a much better job reaching out to people who need the CCRB more, and I think that's extremely important. Because we can sit up here and be dressed up and do all that we're saying that we're doing -- and I'm speaking to elected officials maybe there as still some officials here in the room. We have to do a much better job of reaching people.

So I know I only have 45 seconds left. But to the big brass that are in the room, whether you're a DI, whether you're an inspector, whether you're a captain, if you're a commanding officer, you have to really take a vested interest

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

59

PROCEEDINGS

in the public and understand.

I don't know if you're from the neighborhoods that you police, but community policing and the NCO programs, they're not enough. Every officer should be a community policing officer. This philosophy -- I know I call it philosophy instead of a program. This philosophy is not enough.

So what I'm saying to you is my testimony is not just one. It's many, many, many testimonies. My heart was going out to the lady that just came up here.

These police officers, whether they're reprimanded or not, you cannot report. You can't cry wolf. The fox can't cry wolf to the fox, and the fox can't cry to the wolf. It doesn't happen. The police can't police the police, which is why we have a CCRB.

My time is up. But what I'm trying to really say is that you have to do a better job. There are people here who

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

60

PROCEEDINGS

live under this type of thing time and time again. And the police can't police the police. In the precinct, these things happen, and they keep going on and on and on and nothing happens because truth of the matter is whether they're ICO or assistant ICOs speak to each other. They may be going out to company functions together, parties together. It doesn't work.

So we have to take that into consideration and really speak credence to what's really going on and speak for the people. I like how the lady said it. She says, CCRB is the people's union.

That's my time. Thank you so much.  
Peace and love.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

Comments? Questions?

MR. DARCHE: So I just wanted to say one of the things that Mr. Logan said that struck me is the need to hear from people who might not be able to come to a meeting, and we're hoping that the youth

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

61

PROCEEDINGS

summit in February is the opportunity for people who traditionally aren't heard from -- young people -- to have their voice heard in this conversation.

And I notice that there are some young people in the back who might not feel comfortable speaking here today. I would urge you, if you do have something you think you can add to the conversation, don't -- we're here to hear from you.

And so I would like to ask you guys if one or some of you who would like to come up and speak, I think we would like to hear from you. And if -- come on.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Do I have to come up there? I feel more comfortable --

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: We can't hear you. Otherwise.

MISS BROWN: All right. Good evening, everyone. My name is Kiara Brown. I'm an activist on Staten Island, and I'm part of a lot of organizations.

One thing I just want to say is that I go to Curtis High School in New York

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

62

PROCEEDINGS

City. I'm on the north shore, like I live there. And I just want to say that, back to what that man said -- I'm sorry. I don't remember your name -- Mr. Jonathan. He's completely right about marginalized people not given the opportunity to speak and be on that platform.

Because even in like town hall meetings, I'm one of the only youth that's actually allowed to speak, that is actually given the microphone to say what I feel is necessary to, you know, help progression on Staten Island. So I'm nervous. I apologize, my voice is really shaky.

But as -- since I go to a school so close to the 121, the precinct by St. George Ferry, I just want to say that our altercations with police officers is on a daily -- all the time.

And a lot of -- no one is coming to students and telling us that you guys exist or that we can even file a complaint, because I know my friends have

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

63

PROCEEDINGS

1  
2 been arrested for having weed when they  
3 don't have weed, and they just don't give  
4 the -- they don't give people the  
5 knowledge to know what their rights are  
6 and know how to properly express  
7 themselves for them to, you know, not be  
8 penalized for stuff that they haven't  
9 done.

10 So I feel like you guys definitely  
11 need -- you guys not just -- don't just go  
12 to the organizations, go into the schools  
13 also because people don't really know that  
14 a lot of children are often brutalized by  
15 cops also. And I don't believe all cops  
16 are bad, but a lot of students, all they  
17 know is that cops are bad, and they don't  
18 feel comfortable going into a precinct  
19 when those same people are against them at  
20 all times.

21 So I just want you guys to make sure  
22 that you're going into more  
23 youth-orientated organizations and more  
24 schools and more after schools and just  
25 letting them know that you guys exist and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

64

PROCEEDINGS

you guys are there to help them. So,  
yeah, that's it.

MR. DARCHE: I would like to say to  
your friends, it's not really fair to make  
her the one that has to speak, and she's  
right. There aren't a lot of town halls  
where someone your age gets to talk, but  
we actually want to hear from you. And so  
if you can come up, we would appreciate  
it.

And you saw we didn't bite her, so...

MR. EASON: I can speak.

Mr. Chair, while we're waiting for  
her to come up, can the outreach unit, tell  
us, if they, in fact, go to outreach to  
schools.

MS. YOJAIRA ALVAREZ: I completely  
agree with what you said. We want to be  
out as much as possible and even more.

At Curtis High School we've partnered  
with the local kids, and we hosted one of  
the students to come to our office and do  
an after-school program last semester, but  
that is some engagement but we want even



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

65

PROCEEDINGS

more.

So in these organizations and meetings that you are attending, we would love to attend as well. We would love to come after school and give those presentations to talk about those types of interactions, what the contours of that should look like, and if it deviates from that how to contact us.

So Harya gave you her card. I'll swing by. We want to continue this partnership. Throughout the five boroughs we're in schools, but we want to increase that number by a lot. So thank you.

MS. ERICA SANTIAGO: Hi. My name is Erica Santiago. I work for the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. I'm with the group of youth that are here.

So we are mostly here today because I told them to be here but also because I wanted them to see community engagement in action, and I wanted them to know the resource in this way.

So of course we're going to do more

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

66

PROCEEDINGS

education behind everything and would love a presentation to our group. But right here we're trying to witness in action and see how this looks. Kiara did a wonderful job speaking and she's a newly hired youth leader in our group. But you have a powerful group of young people.

I'm born and raised here in Staten Island. I went to Port Richmond High School. I live down the block. I mean, we've all had our own scenarios and situations within our community, and I think people are speaking very lovely, which is great, but I know that there's an honest part in us that we -- and I think Deacon John McBeth spoke very eloquently about this of you got to know someone to make sure things get done, and that's a very Staten Island mentality, and I don't like to think of that being the mentality, especially with NYPD relations. That would make me kind of scared.

But it does turn into that. And I know Staten Island thrives on networking

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

67

PROCEEDINGS

and, of course, connecting to one another,  
but I hope that there's more -- it remains  
the public front that it needs to be and  
accessible in the way that it should be.

But I thank you so much for having us  
today.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

MR. LOGAN: I have a question. You  
know, my heart goes out --

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: I think that's  
slightly out of order, if you want to  
talk, you guys can talk off line. Thanks.

We have on the list to speak Shirley  
Belton.

MS. SHIRLEY BELTON: Okay. Yes. My  
name is Ms. Shirley A. Belton. I am most  
definitely an activist. And out there I'm  
old school. They know me as "Sister  
Shirley" to the older ones. And to the  
younger ones, "Aunt Shirley" from the  
forgotten borough of Staten Island.

Okay. There is definitely a major,  
major problem with the police, period.

Okay. No matter what. But it is more of

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

68

PROCEEDINGS

a problem here on Staten Island.

From the time that I could remember when I was small, there were problems. Right now I'm talking about most people don't -- that I know off and on the island don't want to go to the police, but if they feel they have to, then they'll take that plunge.

Now, I found myself in that predicament not too long ago. I had a problem with this young woman, and I called the police, and they came to my home, six strong. And I told them they don't have to stay in the hallway. They could come into my home so they wouldn't disturb my neighbors. But they said, "Oh, we can't do that." So two came in, and they left my door wide open.

So I'm like, okay. I'm doing what I have to do. And they gave me a report to write, and I was writing it. And one of the officers said, "You know, you don't have to. Sign here. You can just do this." I said, "Listen, any time that I'm

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

69

PROCEEDINGS

signing something, I read it."

But he was rushing me. He says, "We have things to do." I'm like, "Oh, really?" And I said, "Well, if you stop interrupting me, then maybe I'll get this done." So then I said, "Could you go outside and send one of the other officers in." And he said, "No, I have to stay with my partner."

So I'm reading it and everything. So I said, "Listen, I really wish you would stop doing what you're doing because you're annoying me." And at that point he took the paper, said that I was -- what did he say? -- that I refused to write an incident, and he took it and crumpled it.

So what I did was I called back, and they sent some other officers. These other officers were truly CPR. I could not -- they are definitely not the norm, okay? They gave me -- they took my information. They gave me the proper papers to sign. And the ones that had me sign it before, they gave me the wrong

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

70

PROCEEDINGS

incident paper to sign in the first place.

So I said, "I want to put a complaint against them." He said, "Okay. Do what you have to do, but we're taking your report," and they made it an assault. And not only did they take my report, but they brought the report back to me. I didn't even have to go to the precinct to get it myself.

In the interim, the woman's children started harassing me, so I called the police again. They came. They talked to one of the these -- and these children, I call them children, but they're like 18, 19, okay? I called them, and they talked to the kids, but they didn't take a report.

I went to the precinct to get a report, and in the interim they broke into my home. Called the police back again. They came and they said they have to wait for dusting and everything. Then afterwards they said, oh, they're not going to do any dusting.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

71

PROCEEDINGS

So these people were allowed to come into my home, and the police decided that they didn't have to do any dusting. They broke into the window, took the fan out and put it back in backwards, and the police decided, no, we're not going to do any dusting. So I can't even tell who broke into my apartment, but they decided this. You have no idea. So I want to --

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Just be mindful of the time.

MS. SHIRLEY BELTON: What did you say?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Please be mindful of your time.

MS. SHIRLEY BELTON: So I went to the precinct to get the incident report, the last one, and I was told that I can get a order of protection. I went down to the criminal court, got an order of protection. They said they can't get an order of protection unless the detective arrests the woman. The detective never arrested the woman. This is going on a

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

72

PROCEEDINGS

month, okay?

I went back to the precinct, said, okay, I want -- she said I should talk to the desk sergeant. I went to talk to the desk sergeant, and I was told by the person who was at the front, the officer there, the desk sergeant yelled out, "Whatever he says to you is fine with me," and he didn't even bother to talk to me.

So you know what? I'd rather do things by myself, bottom line. As far as I'm concerned, police are not there to protect us. They're there to monitor us, to control us, to decide what's best by the powers that be.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: So would you like to --

MR. DARCHE: Would it be okay if our investigators spoke to you now and took your information so we can investigate the incident?

MS. SHIRLEY BELTON: At this point the woman is still not arrested. The children broke -- the people broke into my



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

73

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 apartment. Nothing's being done.

3 MR. DARCHE: So I'm not sure exactly  
4 what we can do, but we'd appreciate it  
5 if --

6 MS. SHIRLEY BELTON: As far as the  
7 CCRB, I know how the CCRB is. Right, you  
8 know what? You make recommendations and  
9 everything, but you know what? I have  
10 known for -- you make recommendations.  
11 That's not on you. And then it goes to  
12 the police, and they decide, oh, we're not  
13 going to do anything, and they don't. You  
14 don't have the power that you really,  
15 really need, period.

16 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. We could  
17 investigate it. And more times than not,  
18 a recommendation for discipline that the  
19 CCRB makes to the department is upheld.  
20 We want to get it better, but it's --

21 MS. SHIRLEY BELTON: I even asked for  
22 internal affairs. Nothing.

23 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. Thank  
24 you for coming out. If you would like to  
25 talk to our investigators, they'll talk to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

74

PROCEEDINGS

you.

We have one more person on the list,  
ED Josie -- Ed Josie.

MR. JOSIE: Good evening.

I would like to make a few comments  
based upon my experience with the CCRB.  
I've been president at NAACP for quite a  
while, and I have filed quite a few  
complaints.

Now it might not be the best game in  
town but it's something that we have at  
our disposal. So now normally we speak to  
the person comes to me with a complaint I  
would ask them to fill a CCRB complaint  
form out. I would take it to the office  
and the City being Rector Street which is  
no longer being used or Church Street.

I would not advise them to go to the  
precinct that might have done harm to  
them. I don't believe in going back to  
the hand that bit me. So I would go to  
CCRB office itself. And I would say most  
cases -- not every case, but most  
complaint the people who filed the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

75

PROCEEDINGS

complaint did get some degree of satisfaction.

Now, in many cases the police that we don't know, he might not get fired, but now from my understanding, this police person is in a certain precinct and this captain, or whoever runs the precinct, is a lot of complaints against him that could in some way affect his progress. So maybe the policeman himself might not pay the price, but the person who's in charge of the precinct might ultimately pay the price.

Now, I'm also told that when you file a complaint, there's three columns. Now, there's one column that says if a complaint is filed against this precinct or this particular person. This column over here says the complaint was substantiated or nonsubstantiated.

So now the first column it says there was a filed complaint against I understand that stays there forever now. The disposition might not stay there forever, but at least the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

76

PROCEEDINGS

disposition complaint is stayed there. So I do think there's some value to it.

Now, I know -- I filed a few complaints, and when the investigation was done by the police department, they found out that maybe the policeman did not keep a logbook up to date. So not only was a complaint lodged against him for what he might have done wrong, but now he has an issue because his black book is not kept up to date. So I would not say it's the best game in town, but yet it's something that we have at our disposal right now and does not cost money.

Now, I would also tell the person who files a complaint when you go for the investigation, do not go by yourself. I would go with you, or someone should go with because you're going into an area where you might not feel totally comfortable. So having a person with you might give you a feeling of support. So that's what I try to advise people to do, and I will say that basically speaking,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

77

PROCEEDINGS

the complaints that I have filled out per the NAACP the people has been somewhat satisfied.

So I would say by all means if the police do something you don't like, you can argue with them, if you choose to, but ultimately speaking, file a complaint out, and that's your best resource because if you start to argue with them you might find yourself in more trouble than you were initially.

File a complaint, and that eliminates the necessity for you to argue with them in the street or wherever you might be. So file the complaint. Go through the proper legal proceedings and you might get some results, that's the way I've done it before. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

So we have Christopher Shannon to speak. Is Christopher Shannon here?

Step up to the mic, take a deep breath and step on up.

(Discussion held off the record)

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

78

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 MR. OGUNLEYE: What was the question  
3 we talked about yesterday? So introduce  
4 yourself again.

5 MR. SHANNON: My name is Chris. I  
6 feel okay about the cops in our  
7 neighborhood.

8 MR. OGUNLEYE: So, again, guys --  
9 sorry -- my name is Ranti. I'm the new  
10 director at the Cartison (phonetic) Center  
11 on Staten Island, and I've been working  
12 with Chris for eight weeks.

13 So recently we just got into the  
14 questions about how do we feel about  
15 police in our community, what was some of  
16 the things we want to see change or things  
17 that are going well we can kind of  
18 highlight.

19 So we had a conversation about --  
20 some of the things. So in the community  
21 that you live in, what was some of the  
22 positive things that we talked about and  
23 what are some of the things that we feel  
24 could get better? So maybe that will help  
25 guide you.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

79

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Chris, you should feel very comfortable talking to us. We are on your side.

MR. OGUNLEYE: Is it possible to give him a second?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Sure.

(Discussion held off the record)

MR. OGUNLEYE: We have another student who was going to come and speak, and she's ready.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Sure.

MISS LASHIYA: So I'm Leshia. I live in Stapleton. I think the cops be in Stapleton -- I think it's like good. It's better, making our community safer. And it can get better if, like, the people in the community tried to work together.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. Thank you.

MR. OGUNLEYE: We need some time.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thanks for coming. And we understand how you can walk into a room this large. I've been doing this I won't tell you how long, and I get nervous

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

80

PROCEEDINGS

every time I public speak. In fact, I get nervous every time I come and chair one of these meetings but for probably different reasons than they do. But thank you for coming.

We will continue with our agenda.  
Are there any other public comments?

MISS ESTUDILLO: Hi. I'm Mars.  
Okay. So I guess I'm just going to take their questions as like a reference.  
Sorry, I'm nervous.

Okay. So I have lived in Staten Island like all my life. And the times -- so I lived in communities that have like been labeled as, like, "ghetto" and, like, "horrible" by like people who don't know the community. So like I've been living in Mariners Harbor now for like three years.

I just want to say like the relationship with the community there compared to where I used to live, which would be like New Brighton, was a lot better. Maybe it was because like I was



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

81

PROCEEDINGS

living in a different area.

But when I lived in New Brighton, I kind of felt like, yeah, the police were there, but they weren't doing anything to like engage in the community, and they were just there. Like nothing was going on. There were no changes. They were just there like supervising. I don't know what else to say. Like I don't have anything against the police, but I just -- I don't really see how sometimes they help things, you know.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

MR. DARCHE: Give us your name?

MISS ESTUDILLO: I'm Mars Estudillo.

MR. DARCHE: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Are there any more comments from the public? Yes.

MR. JORDAN WOUK: My name is Jordon Wouk. I actually live in the 1-9. It took me two hours to come out here, and I'm really very glad that I did.

Among the hats that I wear, I happen to be a volunteer at the New York

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

82

PROCEEDINGS

Historical Society, and we have an  
exhibition right now: Black Citizenship  
in the Age of Jim Crow.

Now, this is talking about 1865 to  
1919, but what I'm not allowed to say when  
I'm giving a tour is "So many of the  
issues which came up in that time are  
still coming up today," and anybody who's  
interested in coming, the board knows how  
to reach me.

I'd be happy, first of all, to make  
sure that you can get in for free, if that  
is appropriate, and if you'd like me to be  
your guide, I'd really be honored to do it  
but it's an opportunity to learn about  
history, and some of it has been repeated  
here today. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

Other comments?

MR. NEIL BERRY: Yes. I had no  
intention of making a comment but I just  
wanted to talk about the lack of training  
in mental health in our communities  
because we suffer from anxiety and

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

83

PROCEEDINGS

depression.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: What's your name,  
sir?

MR. NEIL BERRY: My name is Neil  
Berry and I run a domestic violence and  
trafficking is my stated field. And a lot  
of our clients are part of intimate parts  
of domestic violence.

They suffer from a lot of mental like  
depression and anxiety, and male officers  
are not trained in that area. I'm also  
worried about the civilians because the  
officers are not trained in that area, how  
do they react. And will not be here  
because they do suffer from these things.

If you answer these calls because  
your officer understands that minute --  
those clients I have say they can't  
respond to because they're scared because  
many of them don't know, whether they be  
the client or whether it be the police  
officers, the serious nature of what  
domestic violence is.

So I think -- and with our younger

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

84

PROCEEDINGS

kids, they're growing into these relationships and this rape culture. I just don't see how we don't give -- if we don't have this training about mental health and these issues, we're going to have a lot more problems than we have now.

In Staten Island, these numbers are going through the wall in terms of domestic violence and human trafficking. So I'd love to discuss that more about mental health in terms of from a civilian point of view and from the police officers getting more training.

Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you, sir.

Any comments from any of the board members?

MR. SHANNON: I feel like there should be more cops than less cops because it would be less drama in the neighborhood.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. Thank you so much.

MR. OGUNLEYE: Thank you to Chris and Laisha. They're freshmans [sic] at Curtis

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

85

PROCEEDINGS

High School. This is really their first time speaking in front of a crowd like this. So definitely give them your support. It's not easy. It's not easy for adults to come up here. So I understand.

Again, my name is Ranti Ogunleye, and I see my mentor, Councilwoman Rose, here. And sorry that we're late. We were coming from our first day of after-school programming. So it's just a little bit of transitioning.

But I would like to talk about the community that I currently work in -- Stapleton -- where I've been seeing some amazing work, I will say, by the cops that have been coming into the center. They've been really personable with the young people. They know the community and you can see the ease that they work.

So it's about having cops who really understand the community, who are culturally competent, who understand, you know, that young person that may be acting

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

86

PROCEEDINGS

aggressive, really had like a horrible night or had a situation with the family because they're in the community and constantly talking.

And I'm just going to use one example. Officer Santana, who is here, comes into the center and always -- like I didn't even have to ask her. She buys like pizza for the kids and says, "Hey, do you want to have pizza?" Or you'll see them playing ping pong. And that's the measure and a mark of an officer who is not afraid. And actually now the students are seeing that officer as an ally, as a supporter. But it's far too many. We don't see too many cops like that in our community.

So we need to have examples like that officer. We need to have examples like the officer over there who works in the community affairs department who is not afraid, right? We know we hear a lot of these things that are not true in our community, and if you know -- if they're

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

87

PROCEEDINGS

not, they have to come here to see why they're not true. They have to come and engage.

But these officers can show what real community policing looks like. So there's examples here, and we just need more examples of that.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. Thank you so much, so much.

Anyone else to speak? Come to the mic, and you have three minutes.

(Discussion held off the record)

MS. KRAMER: I'm Lucenda (phonetic) Kramer. And I filed a complaint with CCRB on an incident that occurred in Union Square. Three of us witnessed it. Two of them were handicapped were interviewed by phone and it took about three or four months before the -- you know, I was called in. I wrote a letter to CCRB.

I showed up for the -- and had a long interview with one of the interviewers who was clearly very frustrated in her job,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

88

PROCEEDINGS

because I gather that they hear a great deal of complaints that they feel are valid, and then they're turned over to the police department, and nothing happens.

And I think that -- I mean, you are a board that talks a lot. You have good intentions, but you have no power whatsoever, and ultimately, the police has power.

And to be perfectly honest, we came to Staten Island when what's now called CSI, the College of Staten Island, was then Richmond College opened and one of our children is black, and we have had -- we've had an enormous amount of problems with the police, you know.

I mean, the day she was picked up in a park, and she was with two white children. The police rang the doorbell, and I answered the door. My husband is answering the phone, and my daughter is crying. The police have their arms on her shoulder. I said, "What's happened?" They said, "You know her?" I said, "She's



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

89

PROCEEDINGS

my daughter." And they said, "Oh. Well, she was in Snug Harbor, and it's half past five on a Saturday. We thought it wasn't safe. So we brought her home."

Her friends -- her two white friends are on the phone in tears to my husband saying, "The police grabbed Elizabeth and said they were taking her back to niggerville." I mean, that was our first major problem with the police, but I would say we've had several.

I mean, I've been in the car with her when she was driving. My back was out, and we were stopped by the police. She wound down the window, and the policeman said, "Show me your papers, girl." And as soon as I sat up, they start saying one of the rear lights was out, which it wasn't.

I mean, I just felt that I have a great deal of trouble feeling any respect for the police because most of our experiences have been negative. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

90

PROCEEDINGS

Tell us your name.

MR. ROBERT PERKINS: I'm getting to that. My name is Robert Perkins. I'm the committee school director over in Stapleton. I definitely echo what the brother said as far as the NCOs. They definitely got it. We got cops and community basketball tournament where we got together, the cops and the community play together.

I called up Detective Rios, Detective Wilford, Officer Marin (phonetics). Just like that, they were there participating.

Our issue over there is police is riding in the car that refused to get out. Get out of the car. Come and introduce yourself. Officer -- NCO Giuliani (phonetic) and my man Martini, they always come out. They understand it. They get it.

And I think right now at least in Stapleton the climate is a whole lot better. They really want to do better,

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

91

PROCEEDINGS

but they need to get those two NCO officers and explain to some of the other NCO officers on other parts of Staten Island, how it's really done with authenticity.

That's it.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. I just wanted to say to the mother who just spoke, if -- I don't want you to think that we don't hear you and your concern both about the CCRB and whether or not we do or don't have current power and authority.

We try to exercise our responsibility to the degree that the statutes will allow us to do it. I also want to say that we know that profiling is still a very real issue and that it hasn't gone away. We are now wrestling ourselves with figuring out how to respond to it and to the complaints that we get about it.

So I just want you to know that we hear you. You know, we could take exceptions with some of the things that

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

92

PROCEEDINGS

you said and some of the ways you characterize things, but in the end, you're a mother who's concerned about your daughter, and you've had negative experiences, and you're not alone.

So we don't -- I want you to know that we've heard you, and you know, it's never a comfortable situation to be in. We're going to do what we can as an agency to try to improve police community relations within the parameters we are allowed to do that. Accountability and transparency are key to that. So I just want you to know that we did hear you.

Are there other comments?

(No response from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Okay. Why don't you all just -- anybody that wants to speak, please just line up here, and we can save some time. Just remember it's three minutes. So anyone who wants to speak, please just line up at the mic.

MR. MARICHAL: Hi. I'm Juan Marichal. I'm with the YLT, Youth

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

93

PROCEEDINGS

Leadership Team from New York City  
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.

I just wanted to add on to what my  
partner Mars said. I also went to Curtis  
High School. I agree with her a little.  
I also don't see how cops are really  
helping. I feel like no matter how hard  
you try to make cops seem safe, I don't  
think you can ever do that because there's  
always going to be cops who want -- or  
won't help you or do their job right.

Based off all the stories I heard  
from my older ones or family  
members, all the stories they told me seem  
to be true because I've been in the same  
situations they've been in. To be honest,  
I'm afraid to look at a cop when I see one  
or walk by one because I've been in so  
many situations where I've just been  
stopped for no reason or questioned for no  
reason.

I feel like you need to work harder  
with getting out to the youth because the  
youth are the future. If they don't feel

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

94

PROCEEDINGS

safe in the school or outside of the school being around cops, then that's how it's going to be passed down to their kids, and then that's just how the cycle will just keep repeating and repeating.

Thank you for your time.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

MISS BROWN: This isn't really a comment. It's really a question. Or is there another section of that?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: No. Please go ahead.

MISS BROWN: Okay. So I'm kind of new to this because I'm just finding out about the CCRB. I just want to know when you get these complaints, what are your motives like after it? Because if you have racial -- if you get a complaint and it seems racially motivated, are you going to precincts and you're asking them to have like a cultural acceptance day or like just have a workshop on accepting different cultures?

I mean, like if you have a complaint

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

95

PROCEEDINGS

about sexual assault, not only do you try to get the message out to everyone else that this isn't okay? Like are there other ways other than just, like, taking someone and then putting -- like firing them and then trying to push it under the rug or like not shine any light on it so other people don't really notice it?

Are you trying to make sure that other workers are also getting the understanding that this stuff isn't okay? And even if you think it's okay, here's how like it's -- you can show them the wrongs to their own stuff.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: So there are a lot of questions there. So let me just say that -- and then I'll open up for board members of the staff to comment.

The reason we're here is because we want people to know what we do. And what we do is we investigate complaints in four areas: Excessive force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, and offensive language.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

96

PROCEEDINGS

We encourage people who've had encounters with New York City police officers that they believe have not been appropriate to file those complaints and allow us to investigate them and to stay with us once they file a complaint.

One of the biggest issues we have is that people file complaints and then don't follow through. So we are here to encourage people to file the complaints and then to follow through with them.

We have our team of staff and other people who seek to engage the public in a variety of ways, and we also work with the police department letting them know what we see and what we learn so that they can be better at their training.

We have one of our staff now who wants to speak to this.

MS. TAREKEGN: So as senior counsel for policy and advocacy, one of the things that we do -- so like board member Davies said -- or Chair Davies said, we investigate each complaint that we get and



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

97

PROCEEDINGS

then recommend discipline for that officer if we find that the complaint is substantiated for that one officer, but also from a policy perspective, we are looking at trends but also issues.

So one of the reasons that we're writing a report on New Yorkers experiencing homelessness is because while we can recommend discipline on certain issues by themselves or certain complaints by themselves, we recognize that there are issues that people experience in homelessness are facing as a whole or youth are facing as a whole.

One of our reports that I would recommend for everybody to read is a very good example of this. We had a report on the LGBTQ community and how they experience policing. And so we looked at trends that that community is facing, made recommendations to the police department on training -- different training on different policies in and of itself.

And we, from the policy team, try to

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

98

PROCEEDINGS

attend trainings, have conversations with the police department all the time, and it's a back and forth with the police departments also asking us questions about trends that we're seeing to make sure that they're responding effectively to that. And then we're highlighting things that we see in our complaints.

But the biggest part of this is that if we're not hearing what's happening on the streets -- so if we're not hearing that you've been stopped in what you think is inappropriately several times, we are not able to report on that, and we're not able to give the police department that data to say, look, we've seen this problem time and time again, and we've substantiated this complaint time and time again. So we are recommending that you change your policy in X or Y way.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Let's -- you want to speak. Sure.

(Discussion held off the record)

MS. SALMERON: Good evening. My name

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

99

PROCEEDINGS

is Suzette Salmeron.

Who is the 120 precinct sergeant?

Nice to meet you.

Okay. This was overwhelming in terms of information for me. I'm a retiree. So the young ones -- I haven't spoken publicly in a while, so it takes a little. It's a little nerve racking, but it will be okay.

I wanted to -- knowledge is power, and I don't understand why your particular division is not in the high schools teaching this as an optional course. I think when -- whether it's youth, middle age, elder, we need to understand what our rights are. Once we know our rights, you take it on after that, okay, because one thing I'm hearing and are confused about is that you make recommendations.

Are they adhered to?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: So last year 75 percent of the recommendations -- 75 percent of the times we recommended discipline to the department, discipline

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

100

PROCEEDINGS

was imposed.

MS. SALMERON: Okay. I'm a retired civil servant. So I know that when there are disciplinary issues, union is on one side, the officers on the other, and there are actions that are taken; but they have to be taken, and they have to be listened to because then that agency that's not meeting the needs of the public.

But I think you should be in every high school, in every junior high school. It should be offered as a college elective because in knowledge there is definite power.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. We'd be more than willing to do that if you get the councilwoman and the mayor to increase our budget and we'll be off to the races.

MS. MALONEY: Sometimes it doesn't take all that budget, and sometimes it doesn't take all that money. Sometimes it just takes like this at a university or at a high school during the day, because town hall meetings can be held during the day.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

101

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 It would be wonderful, and your attendance  
3 record -- I think you will be hearing the  
4 truth from a lot of young people.

5 I've never had a problem with the  
6 police. I don't intend to have a problem  
7 with the police, but if I did, I think I'm  
8 versed enough and knowledgeable enough to  
9 take it where I have to take.

10 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

11 MS. SALMERON: And I have one quick  
12 question.

13 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Sure.

14 MS. SALMERON: In the event that  
15 somebody had a problem with a precinct  
16 officer, would I -- would that individual  
17 citizen take it to the captain or sergeant  
18 or the lieutenant of the precinct, or they  
19 would go to you?

20 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: It depends on --  
21 start with us. Go to the councilwoman's  
22 office, dial 311, and then we will sort it  
23 out.

24 MS. SALMERON: All right. Looking  
25 forward to future meetings.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

102

1 PROCEEDINGS

2 CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you.

3 MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: And this is partly  
4 a question but also a comment because I  
5 want to make sure we're very clear and  
6 transparent.

7 When we say something is a percent of  
8 discipline, we don't mean that our  
9 recommendation is adhered to. It's  
10 because of the cases. Just that some action  
11 was taken -- we may say this officer should  
12 be -- should have serious charges or some  
13 type of discipline, it's taking the facts  
14 that they're taught by the superior to not  
15 do that again.

16 So I think we should not overstate  
17 our power which is very limited, right?  
18 The police department decides how they  
19 deal with misconduct, right, not us. And  
20 as a board, we are honest about that, and  
21 it's important that you tell us what's  
22 going on. We have data. We can talk  
23 about it.

24 But I think it's very important not  
25 to act as if we have the power that we

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

103

PROCEEDINGS

don't have it. And more than that, we have a closer relationship with the department and with the community in almost every single way institutionally.

So it's important that you share what's going on, but I want to make sure we're not overstating either our power or the difference and kind -- I guess it would be independent of all our commission.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you for that clarification, Ms. Stahly-Butts.

MR. OBISANYA: My name is Stephen, my question actually tacks onto what she just said. I think a lot of the conversation has been mostly around how there are some police officers in the communities that are very involved in getting to know the communities that they serve.

While those are few and far between, I feel that the conversation should revolve more so around the systemic issue that exists in the police departments. So

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

104

PROCEEDINGS

while the CCRB might be doing all they can to be of service to the community, what actions are being taken in the police department to deal with the systematic issues that exist and how they handle those situations?

So you guys, you know, can advocate for the community as much as you want, but at the end of the day, police are policing each other. So at the end of the day, nothing is being done, right?

So I think the issue and the conversation should revolve around what that looks like in police departments, how they are being held accountable and how they are being treated equally as citizens are being treated.

When someone commits a crime, there is immediacy as to how they're sentenced. So there should be an immediacy as to how police are held accountable for their actions. And I feel like a lot of the things you guys are doing are great, but the conversation should not revolve around



**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final**  
**September 12, 2018**

105

PROCEEDINGS

how, you know, one person out of the whole force is being involved in the community where 99 percent of, you know, the other -- well, you know, the rest of the other cops are not doing what one person is doing in the force, correct? So we can't let one person doing good to dictate what, you know, everybody else is doing because that's not the case.

MS. STAHLY-BUTTS: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: So would anyone from the police department like to respond at all about --

ASSISTANT CHIEF COREY: No. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: We are just going -- you've already spoken. So we want to get anyone that hasn't spoken.

Yojaira, did you have something you wanted to say?

(Discussion held off the record)

MS. YOJAIRA ALVAREZ: Council had something.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: No, no. We can't do

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

106

PROCEEDINGS

that. I think we just have to keep moving. Thank you.

MS. YOJAIRA ALVAREZ: I just wanted to follow up on the woman speaking about curriculum. We have been in the Hostos Community college curriculum, in the John Jay curriculum as well as Monroe College. When it comes to youth, we've been collaborating with youth organizations and after-school programs to expand that for not just a one off 30 to 40-minute presentation but something a little bit more in depth and it's targeted to youth.

And so I would love to also meet with you afterwards to discuss how we can kind of collaborate and move forward to really have a more enriching process when it comes to the educating the public about what we do and how we do it. So thanks.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Other comments? Anyone who hasn't had a chance to speak, come on up.

MS. ESPINOZA: Hello, everybody. How

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

107

PROCEEDINGS

are you doing?

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Good.

MS. ESPINOZA: My name is Josefina Espinoza. I'm part of the youth leadership team, and I want to discuss a little bit more about what my other youth teams members were talking about.

So I live on this side of the island, like past New Dorp towards the areas of Petrides, and I go to school near Tottenville and like the St. Joseph by the Sea area, and like I realize that the difference between how the youth feels about police differs from the different areas.

From where I live, I live by Grasmere, which is pretty close to Stapleton, and I've realized that a lot of the youth there fear police, and I also kind of do also like -- I'm not really comfortable talking about like issues with them. And by where I go in Tottenville, there's like -- the fear really doesn't exist there.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

108

PROCEEDINGS

So when I go from school now, I'll be over there, and like I also see a police officer, and I'll keep my head down like just walk by them and try to not draw too much attention to myself. And then I see my fellow other classmates from over there, and they'll walk calmly. Like, they'll have confidence. They'll be able to trust the police officers. And, like, I feel like that's an issue that needs to be addressed.

Yeah. That's all I have.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you. So I think it's clear that we have a lot of work to do to improve community police relations. We are really happy for the progress that we are making, but we have miles to go before we rest, and it is particularly clear that there is a dynamic between young people and our NYPD officers that we have to better understand and see if we can't better address.

Some of this is outside of the jurisdiction of -- and the purview of this

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

109

PROCEEDINGS

agency, but the more you give voice to it,  
the more we're able to share this  
information and the more it is out there  
for our partners in this effort to be able  
to address some of the issues that you  
have raised.

So we appreciate all of the comments  
tonight. We particularly appreciate the  
comments from the young people. We want  
to emphasize, again, the youth event that  
we're going to have at NYU in February.  
We'll be doing a lot of outreach around  
that, but we want to make this thing work,  
and it's just going to take a lot of  
effort to do it, but it's in no one's  
interest to have an unhealthy relationship  
between the communities and the officers  
who serve it.

It's in everybody's interest to make  
sure that that works as well as it  
possibly can, and it's no easy task. But  
I think I can speak for everybody who is  
around this table to say that we are  
committed to it. That's why we're here.

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

110

PROCEEDINGS

It sounds like a lot of you are committed to that very same thing. It's going to take a lot of work, a lot of effort and a lot of commitment. But let's stay at it because the alternative is not very attractive.

If our board members have no comments -- I'm sorry, Mr. Peguero.

MR. RAMON PEGUERO: First of all, I want to thank everyone for coming out. I really appreciate the fact that not only did you have your voices be heard, but you also sat down and were patient and heard others. I've been in town hall meetings where people speak and then they walk away.

I want to acknowledge the leadership of Councilwoman Rose she was the first one here, and she's still here. She could have found an excuse to walk away.

(Audience applause)

MR. PEGUERO: Also your partnership with CCRB, we appreciate you being the first city council member to open her

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

111

PROCEEDINGS

doors to us. So we appreciate you taking  
that lead.

To the borough commander, I don't  
remember ever having a borough commander  
in one of our meetings. I really  
appreciate the leadership of the NYPD that  
is here and listening very attentively.

And I want to especially acknowledge  
Kiara, Mars, Juan, Laisha, Josephine and Chris,  
the young people that spoke.

Since I was your age many, many,  
many, many, many, many, many years ago, I  
have been hearing the fact that young  
people are the future. They're the  
leaders of the future. And I want to be  
able to push back on that and say I don't  
ascribe to that. You are the now, you are  
the present, and your voices are very,  
very, very valuable to us being able to  
change the narrative.

To me, this is not about us having  
power. It's about empowering you and our  
communities to be able to be agents of  
change for us for the present and for the

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

112

PROCEEDINGS

future.

The summit that we are having  
February the 5th is important because it's  
all about you. It's about your voices.  
It's about your peers. It's about you  
telling us what needs to happen now for  
the now and for the future.

So I encourage you to come out and  
have your voices be heard because we see  
you, we hear you, and we need you. Thank  
you so much for being here today.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you,  
Mr. Peguero.

Any comments from board members? Is  
there any new business to come before this  
body? Any old business?

(No response from audience.)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Is there a motion to  
adjourn to an executive session?

MR. PEGUERO: So move.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Is there a second?

MS. BOND: Second.

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: All those in favor  
of adjourning to executive session, please



Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018

113

PROCEEDINGS

say "aye."

(Audience responds "aye.")

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: All opposed "no".

(No audience response)

CHAIRMAN DAVIE: Thank you for  
coming. Hoping everybody has a good night  
and safe one.

(Time noted: 8:30 p.m.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018

114

PROCEEDINGS

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:ss

COUNTY OF RICHMOND )

I, RITA M. PERSICHETTY, a Notary Public within  
and for the State of New York, do hereby certify  
that the within is a true and accurate transcript of  
the proceedings taken on September 12, 2018.

I further certify that I am not related to any  
of the parties to this action by blood or marriage;  
and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of  
this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand  
this 1st day of October, 2018.

*Rita M. Persichetty*

RITA M. PERSICHETTY

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

1

A		
<b>Abbassi (2)</b> 20:18,20	<b>age (5)</b> 42:13 64:8 82:4 99:16 111:12	<b>appreciate (11)</b> 16:3 26:7 52:25 64:10 73:4 109:8,9 110:12,24 111:2,7
<b>ability (1)</b> 15:5	<b>agencies (1)</b> 27:6	<b>appreciated (1)</b> 14:10
<b>able (19)</b> 8:4 15:22 16:2 26:10 30:22 31:8,16 34:5 35:25 54:9 60:24 98:15,16 108:9 109:3,5 111:17,20,24	<b>agency (7)</b> 5:4 12:3 21:25 26:6 92:10 100:9 109:2	<b>appropriate (4)</b> 41:12 47:3 82:14 96:5
<b>abreast (1)</b> 25:11	<b>agenda (3)</b> 2:3 33:10 80:7	<b>approve (1)</b> 5:22
<b>Absolutely (1)</b> 53:3	<b>agents (1)</b> 111:24	<b>approved (1)</b> 14:14
<b>abuse (3)</b> 22:19 31:3 95:23	<b>ages (2)</b> 9:20 32:20	<b>approving (1)</b> 5:20
<b>abused (2)</b> 49:23 52:2	<b>aggressive (1)</b> 86:2	<b>area (9)</b> 43:22 44:18 46:7 47:16 76:20 81:2 83:12,14 107:13
<b>abusing (3)</b> 50:21 51:14,14	<b>ago (3)</b> 35:2 68:11 111:13	<b>areas (4)</b> 47:15 95:23 107:10,16
<b>academics (2)</b> 27:6,19	<b>agree (2)</b> 64:19 93:6	<b>argue (3)</b> 77:7,10,14
<b>acceptance (1)</b> 94:22	<b>agreed (1)</b> 18:17	<b>Arlington (1)</b> 43:24
<b>accepting (1)</b> 94:23	<b>ahead (3)</b> 36:25 45:15 94:13	<b>arms (1)</b> 88:23
<b>accessibility (1)</b> 17:8	<b>aimed (1)</b> 12:10	<b>arrested (5)</b> 41:5 50:8 63:2 71:25 72:24
<b>accessible (3)</b> 14:8,12 67:5	<b>Alexander (1)</b> 55:12	<b>arrests (1)</b> 71:24
<b>accountability (4)</b> 15:10 16:19,23 92:13	<b>allegation (2)</b> 28:25 29:2	<b>ascribe (1)</b> 111:18
<b>accountable (5)</b> 7:10 14:12 17:10 104:16,22	<b>allegations (5)</b> 22:4,9 23:5 31:2,4	<b>asked (4)</b> 23:14 56:2 57:13 73:21
<b>accurate (1)</b> 114:11	<b>allow (3)</b> 37:14 91:16 96:6	<b>asking (2)</b> 94:21 98:5
<b>acknowledge (4)</b> 6:15 55:13 110:18 111:9	<b>allowed (4)</b> 62:11 71:2 82:6 92:13	<b>asks (2)</b> 23:14 56:13
<b>acronym (1)</b> 22:12	<b>allowing (1)</b> 11:11	<b>aspects (1)</b> 46:4
<b>act (1)</b> 102:25	<b>ally (1)</b> 86:15	<b>assault (2)</b> 70:6 95:2
<b>acted (1)</b> 41:11	<b>aloft (1)</b> 42:23	<b>assign (1)</b> 45:20
<b>acting (2)</b> 56:23 85:25	<b>altercations (1)</b> 62:20	<b>assistant (2)</b> 60:8 105:15
<b>action (6)</b> 40:18 41:8 65:23 66:4 102:10 114:14	<b>alternative (1)</b> 110:6	<b>associate (1)</b> 38:21
<b>actions (3)</b> 100:7 104:4,23	<b>Alvarez (7)</b> 10:23 12:15 21:16,18 64:18 105:23 106:4	<b>assure (1)</b> 8:5
<b>activism (1)</b> 46:9	<b>amazing (1)</b> 85:17	<b>attend (3)</b> 58:4 65:5 98:2
<b>activist (2)</b> 61:22 67:18	<b>Ammu (4)</b> 52:17,18 53:3,4	<b>attendance (1)</b> 101:2
<b>actual (2)</b> 45:5,5	<b>amount (1)</b> 88:16	<b>attended (2)</b> 36:23 44:9
<b>add (3)</b> 25:15 61:10 93:4	<b>analyses (1)</b> 28:22	<b>attending (1)</b> 65:4
<b>additional (1)</b> 29:20	<b>analyze (2)</b> 15:6,9	<b>attention (1)</b> 108:6
<b>address (4)</b> 18:7,11 108:23 109:6	<b>Andrew (1)</b> 11:11	<b>attentively (1)</b> 111:8
<b>addressed (1)</b> 108:12	<b>animals (1)</b> 49:19	<b>attitudes (1)</b> 9:15
<b>adhered (2)</b> 99:21 102:9	<b>anniversary (1)</b> 6:16	<b>attorneys (1)</b> 8:5
<b>adjourn (2)</b> 2:14 112:20	<b>announce (2)</b> 10:10 14:13	<b>attractive (1)</b> 110:7
<b>adjourning (1)</b> 112:25	<b>announced (1)</b> 45:22	<b>audible (1)</b> 19:15
<b>administrative (1)</b> 8:6	<b>annoying (1)</b> 69:14	<b>audience (23)</b> 13:10 19:15 20:11 21:7 26:14,20 33:8 34:8 37:20 39:2 43:14,19 44:4 48:17 49:8 55:16 56:4 61:16 92:17 110:22 112:18 113:3,5
<b>administratively (1)</b> 22:3	<b>answer (1)</b> 83:17	<b>audio (1)</b> 49:25
<b>admission (1)</b> 51:2	<b>answered (1)</b> 88:21	<b>Aunt (1)</b> 67:21
<b>admit (1)</b> 53:25	<b>answering (2)</b> 40:9 88:22	<b>authenticity (1)</b> 91:6
<b>adopted (1)</b> 6:10	<b>anti-violence (1)</b> 48:5	<b>authority (4)</b> 22:20 31:3 91:14 95:24
<b>Adoption (1)</b> 2:5	<b>anxiety (2)</b> 82:25 83:11	<b>available (4)</b> 14:6 16:3 17:11 44:19
<b>adults (2)</b> 27:6 85:6	<b>anxious (1)</b> 15:24	<b>Avenue (2)</b> 1:10,22
<b>advise (2)</b> 74:19 76:24	<b>anybody (6)</b> 19:23 24:2 49:20 50:19 82:9 92:19	<b>aware (2)</b> 7:23 54:7
<b>advocacy (3)</b> 26:23 53:11 96:22	<b>anyway (1)</b> 46:20	<b>aye (3)</b> 6:4 113:2,3
<b>advocate (2)</b> 49:19 104:8	<b>apartment (2)</b> 71:9 73:2	
<b>affairs (2)</b> 73:22 86:22	<b>Apartments (1)</b> 37:5	
<b>affect (2)</b> 27:15 75:10	<b>apathy (1)</b> 40:20	
<b>affirmative (1)</b> 6:6	<b>apologize (1)</b> 62:15	
<b>afraid (5)</b> 7:13 42:5 86:14,23 93:18	<b>apostle (1)</b> 39:5	
<b>after-school (4)</b> 24:18 64:24 85:11 106:11	<b>applauding (1)</b> 53:13	
	<b>applause (3)</b> 21:7 37:20 110:22	
	<b>apple (1)</b> 50:25	
	<b>appointed (1)</b> 18:23	
	<b>appointee (4)</b> 4:17,20,25 14:16	
	<b>appointment (3)</b> 14:15 17:13,16	
		<b>B</b>
		<b>Babiak (5)</b> 36:17 37:18,23 38:14 38:15
		<b>back (15)</b> 35:20 36:17 37:25 61:7

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

2

62:3 69:18 70:8,21 71:6 72:3  
74:21 89:9,14 98:4 111:17  
**back-to-school (1)** 42:11  
**backwards (1)** 71:6  
**bad (7)** 20:20 50:3,14,20 51:18  
63:16,17  
**badge (1)** 22:25  
**ball (2)** 49:22 51:25  
**banned (1)** 53:16  
**Barret-Lane (1)** 39:19  
**Barret-Layne (1)** 39:5  
**based (4)** 15:7 53:7 74:7 93:13  
**basic (3)** 46:13,14 47:17  
**basically (2)** 47:17 76:25  
**basis (1)** 48:11  
**basketball (1)** 90:9  
**beautiful (1)** 30:14  
**began (1)** 39:21  
**behalf (3)** 6:24 26:6 39:4  
**behave (1)** 50:2  
**behold (1)** 35:17  
**belief (1)** 16:20  
**believe (9)** 42:2 43:4 44:25 50:17  
51:19,24 63:15 74:21 96:4  
**Belton (8)** 67:15,16,17 71:13,17  
72:23 73:6,21  
**benefits (1)** 16:9  
**Berry (3)** 82:21 83:5,6  
**best (6)** 13:14 27:15 72:15 74:11  
76:13 77:9  
**better (15)** 12:5 29:21 58:11,18  
59:25 73:20 78:24 79:16,17  
80:25 90:25,25 96:18 108:22,23  
**big (3)** 37:15 49:18 58:21  
**bigger (1)** 22:20  
**biggest (2)** 96:8 98:10  
**bit (8)** 19:8 27:12 28:14 30:17  
74:22 85:12 106:14 107:7  
**bite (1)** 64:12  
**black (3)** 76:11 82:3 88:15  
**block (3)** 8:25 36:21 66:11  
**blocking (1)** 50:22  
**blood (1)** 114:14  
**blue (1)** 18:23  
**board (44)** 1:4 3:3,5,6,7,8,9,10,11  
3:12 4:5,6 6:13 7:5 11:9 13:15  
14:4,5,19 15:4,15 18:9 19:14  
20:13 21:21 28:16 43:18 44:17  
44:18 47:22 48:15 53:5,21 54:3  
55:13 57:24 82:10 84:17 88:7  
95:18 96:23 102:20 110:8 112:15  
**body (1)** 112:17  
**body-worn (2)** 11:21 32:9  
**Bond (4)** 3:12 5:8,8 112:23  
**book (1)** 76:11  
**born (1)** 66:9  
**borough (8)** 10:14,15 20:8,9,12

67:22 111:4,5  
**boroughs (3)** 29:3 31:25 65:13  
**bother (1)** 72:10  
**bottom (1)** 72:12  
**boys (1)** 34:25  
**brass (1)** 58:21  
**breath (1)** 77:24  
**brief (3)** 11:13 21:10 24:21  
**Brighton (2)** 80:24 81:3  
**bring (3)** 8:11,13 13:7  
**broke (5)** 70:20 71:5,9 72:25,25  
**Bronx (1)** 4:25  
**Brooklyn (1)** 4:21  
**brother (4)** 39:23 49:10,16 90:7  
**brought (4)** 27:21 36:20 70:8 89:5  
**Brown (4)** 61:20,22 94:9,14  
**brutalized (1)** 63:14  
**budget (2)** 100:19,21  
**Build (1)** 36:21  
**business (5)** 2:12,13 5:19 112:16  
112:17  
**busy (1)** 13:22  
**butcher (1)** 33:19  
**buys (1)** 86:9

## C

**C (3)** 4:2 114:3,3  
**cadets (1)** 35:14  
**call (11)** 2:4 4:4 17:13,15 24:10  
31:12 46:18 47:2 51:8 59:8 70:15  
**called (9)** 40:23 68:13 69:18 70:12  
70:16,21 87:22 88:12 90:12  
**calls (3)** 16:19 40:9 83:17  
**calmly (1)** 108:8  
**Cambridge (1)** 56:6  
**camera (1)** 32:10  
**cameras (1)** 11:21  
**capacity (1)** 47:11  
**captain (6)** 20:21,25 21:3 58:24  
75:8 101:17  
**capture (1)** 32:22  
**car (5)** 56:10,11 89:13 90:17,18  
**caramel (1)** 50:25  
**Carcatera (4)** 3:8 5:10,11 6:2  
**card (4)** 25:7,7 35:20 65:11  
**care (2)** 5:20 41:22  
**career (1)** 14:25  
**carefully (1)** 16:16  
**Carolina (1)** 40:3  
**carried (1)** 9:12  
**cars (1)** 42:20  
**Carter (1)** 33:21  
**Cartison (1)** 78:10  
**case (5)** 8:10 51:3 53:14 74:24  
105:10  
**cases (6)** 6:19 30:24 31:11 74:24  
75:4 102:10

**categories (1)** 22:10  
**category (5)** 22:14,19,20 23:11,18  
**CCRB (47)** 2:8 4:13 5:7 7:18,24 8:7  
9:24 10:11 11:23 12:3 13:16  
14:16 16:8 17:3,7,9 21:25 24:7  
24:12 25:24 29:20 34:12 41:24  
43:5 44:21 48:7 49:21 51:20,23  
53:25 54:22 58:9,12 59:22 60:16  
73:7,7,19 74:7,15,23 87:16,22  
91:12 94:16 104:2 110:24  
**CCRB's (2)** 16:11 53:13  
**cellphone (1)** 41:5  
**center (9)** 28:4 33:21 34:15 35:11  
35:24 36:16 78:10 85:18 86:8  
**certain (8)** 28:23,24,25 29:2 39:16  
75:7 97:10,11  
**certificates (1)** 37:16  
**certify (2)** 114:10,13  
**cetera (2)** 22:18 23:10  
**chair (14)** 1:15 2:6 5:6 11:7 12:8  
12:23 14:3 25:15 32:18 46:7  
55:22 64:14 80:3 96:24  
**chairman (86)** 4:3 5:5,17,25 6:3,7  
6:9 7:3 12:24 18:4,22 19:12,16  
20:7,17,21,25 21:5,8 25:14,17  
26:13,15 33:5,9 38:18 43:10,15  
43:18 44:2 48:14,18 49:5 52:15  
55:6,8,11,22 60:19 61:18 67:8,11  
71:11,15 72:17 73:16,23 77:20  
79:2,7,12,19,22 81:14,18 82:19  
83:3 84:16,22 87:9 89:25 91:8  
92:18 94:8,12 95:16 98:22 99:22  
100:16 101:10,13,20 102:2  
103:12 105:12,17,25 106:22  
107:3 108:14 112:13,19,22,24  
113:4,6  
**chairperson (2)** 43:22 44:17  
**chance (3)** 19:21 33:16 106:23  
**change (4)** 78:16 98:21 111:21,25  
**changed (1)** 10:18  
**changes (1)** 81:8  
**changing (2)** 27:9 56:15  
**chaos (1)** 6:18  
**characterize (1)** 92:3  
**charge (1)** 75:12  
**charges (3)** 7:24 41:6 102:12  
**charts (1)** 30:14  
**chief (4)** 16:17 39:25 40:4 105:15  
**child (4)** 40:24 41:15,16,19  
**children (10)** 34:24 42:12,16 63:14  
70:11,14,15 72:25 88:15,20  
**choke (1)** 53:16  
**choose (1)** 77:7  
**choosing (1)** 42:19  
**chose (2)** 31:18 55:21  
**Chris (5)** 78:5,12 79:2 84:24  
111:10

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

3

**Christopher (3)** 33:22 77:21,22  
**church (3)** 24:13 42:10 74:18  
**citizen (1)** 101:17  
**citizens (2)** 16:21 104:17  
**Citizenship (1)** 82:3  
**city (26)** 4:12,20,25 5:15 6:20,24  
 7:22 8:18,22,23 12:2,6 13:4  
 14:14 16:9,10 21:25 27:6 30:25  
 39:10,12 62:2 74:17 93:2 96:3  
 110:25  
**City's (1)** 8:21  
**civic (1)** 53:10  
**civil (1)** 100:4  
**civilian (10)** 1:4 4:4 6:13 7:4 14:4  
 15:4 21:21 22:6 53:21 84:12  
**civilians (2)** 30:21 83:13  
**claimants (1)** 30:13  
**clarification (1)** 103:13  
**classmates (1)** 108:7  
**clear (4)** 9:21 102:5 108:15,20  
**clearly (1)** 87:25  
**client (1)** 83:22  
**clients (2)** 83:8,19  
**climate (1)** 90:24  
**climbed (1)** 39:24  
**close (2)** 62:18 107:18  
**closely (1)** 18:18  
**closer (1)** 103:3  
**clue (1)** 40:25  
**collaborate (1)** 106:18  
**collaborating (1)** 106:10  
**colleagues (1)** 54:14  
**collecting (1)** 43:5  
**college (6)** 42:13 88:13,14 100:13  
 106:7,9  
**column (3)** 75:17,19,22  
**columns (1)** 75:16  
**come (42)** 24:12,20 28:6,6,8 30:16  
 30:22 31:23 32:3,7 33:2 34:12  
 35:11 37:7,18 40:12 49:9,11 51:8  
 55:14 60:24 61:14,15,16 64:10  
 64:15,23 65:6 68:16 71:2 79:10  
 80:3 81:22 85:6 87:2,3,11 90:18  
 90:21 106:24 112:9,16  
**comes (4)** 74:14 86:8 106:9,20  
**comfortable (8)** 10:3 61:8,17  
 63:18 76:22 79:3 92:9 107:22  
**coming (16)** 13:25 15:25 21:19  
 25:23 27:17 51:15 62:22 73:24  
 79:22 80:6 82:9,10 85:10,18  
 110:11 113:7  
**commander (5)** 20:8,9,12 111:4,5  
**commanders (1)** 19:19  
**commanding (1)** 58:24  
**commend (1)** 17:24  
**comment (10)** 2:10,11 19:10 20:4  
 21:14 48:19 82:22 94:10 95:19

102:4  
**comments (19)** 18:9 19:13 26:13  
 33:6 43:13 48:15 55:9 60:20 74:6  
 80:8 81:19 82:20 84:17 92:16  
 106:22 109:8,10 110:9 112:15  
**commission (3)** 18:24 19:2 103:11  
**commissioner (4)** 4:17 5:11 18:23  
 55:18  
**commitment (2)** 16:11 110:5  
**commits (1)** 104:19  
**committed (3)** 8:9 109:25 110:2  
**committee (2)** 43:22 90:5  
**communities (11)** 18:2 27:16  
 28:19,23 42:4 80:15 82:24  
 103:19,20 109:18 111:24  
**community (68)** 2:10 7:20 10:6  
 11:15 12:2 13:21 16:24 17:24  
 21:13 25:20 26:9 29:21 31:8  
 33:13,25 34:22 37:10 39:18  
 40:12 41:20 42:4,6,7,8,15,25  
 43:7,18 44:13,15,16,18 45:18  
 47:8,22 48:11 53:9 54:6 59:5,7  
 65:22 66:13 78:15,20 79:16,18  
 80:18,22 81:6 85:15,20,23 86:4  
 86:18,22,25 87:6 90:9,10 92:11  
 97:19,21 103:4 104:3,9 105:3  
 106:7 108:16  
**company (1)** 60:9  
**compared (5)** 29:17 30:3,6,25  
 80:23  
**competent (1)** 85:24  
**complainant (1)** 31:13  
**complaint (41)** 1:4 4:5 6:13 7:4  
 12:19 14:4 15:4 21:21 24:5,15  
 29:10,13,18 30:3,6 31:15,24  
 53:21 62:25 70:3 74:14,15,25  
 75:2,16,18,20,23 76:2,9,17 77:8  
 77:13,16 87:16 94:19,25 96:7,25  
 97:3 98:19  
**complaints (34)** 9:19 28:21 30:18  
 30:19 32:4,17,19 34:17 41:8,24  
 44:19 45:3,4,6,10 46:5,6,11,13  
 47:20,24 74:10 75:9 76:5 77:2  
 88:3 91:22 94:17 95:22 96:5,9,11  
 97:11 98:9  
**completely (2)** 62:6 64:18  
**concern (3)** 41:25 45:17 91:11  
**concerned (3)** 8:22 72:13 92:4  
**concerns (5)** 13:24 37:12 39:15  
 40:18 43:9  
**conclusions (1)** 16:15  
**concurrence (3)** 18:12,19 19:7  
**confidence (3)** 7:15 8:11 108:9  
**confirmation (1)** 14:18  
**confused (1)** 99:19  
**conjunction (1)** 27:25  
**connect (1)** 48:7

**connecting (3)** 54:14 55:4 67:2  
**consideration (1)** 60:13  
**constantly (2)** 50:5 86:5  
**constituents (1)** 15:18  
**contact (2)** 25:25 65:10  
**contacted (1)** 36:12  
**continue (6)** 16:8 47:16 51:5 54:20  
 65:12 80:7  
**contours (1)** 65:8  
**control (1)** 72:15  
**convening (1)** 13:16  
**conversation (10)** 10:9 11:3 30:15  
 61:5,10 78:19 103:17,23 104:14  
 104:25  
**conversations (2)** 19:2 98:2  
**cooperate (1)** 30:21  
**coordination (2)** 35:19 37:22  
**coordinator (3)** 25:3 33:25 34:11  
**cop (4)** 49:11,13 50:20 93:18  
**cops (24)** 50:2,3,4,15 51:18,22  
 52:3 63:15,15,17 78:6 79:14  
 84:20,20 85:17,22 86:17 90:8,10  
 93:7,9,11 94:3 105:6  
**Corey (2)** 20:8 105:15  
**correct (1)** 105:7  
**cost (1)** 76:15  
**council (16)** 4:12,20,25 5:15 13:4,6  
 14:14 18:4 19:17 24:6 25:19 26:7  
 31:20,25 105:23 110:25  
**councilwoman (11)** 13:8,12 18:21  
 19:11 26:4,11,12 49:3 85:9  
 100:18 110:19  
**councilwoman's (1)** 101:21  
**counsel (2)** 26:22 96:21  
**counties (1)** 40:2  
**country (1)** 6:25  
**County (2)** 5:16 114:7  
**course (4)** 31:7 65:25 67:2 99:14  
**court (1)** 71:21  
**courtesy (3)** 16:21 46:13,14  
**CPR (1)** 69:20  
**credence (2)** 57:16 60:13  
**crime (8)** 10:4 29:9,11,14,17 30:3  
 30:6 104:19  
**criminal (1)** 71:21  
**Crow (1)** 82:4  
**crowd (1)** 85:3  
**crumpled (1)** 69:17  
**cry (3)** 59:18,19,20  
**crying (1)** 88:23  
**CSI (1)** 88:13  
**cultural (1)** 94:22  
**culturally (1)** 85:24  
**culture (1)** 84:3  
**cultures (1)** 94:24  
**current (1)** 91:13  
**currently (1)** 85:15

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

4

**curriculum (3)** 106:6,7,8  
**Curtis (4)** 61:25 64:21 84:25 93:5  
**customer (1)** 47:17  
**cycle (1)** 94:5

## D

**D (1)** 4:2  
**dad (3)** 39:21 57:4,5  
**daily (1)** 62:21  
**damages (1)** 40:17  
**Daniel (1)** 7:25  
**Darche (20)** 1:16 5:2,3 11:6,7 19:4  
25:15,18 26:5 51:4 52:5,12,25  
57:14 60:21 64:4 72:19 73:3  
81:15,17  
**DARE (2)** 35:15 38:11  
**darkest (1)** 57:9  
**Darsche (1)** 12:25  
**data (12)** 2:9 11:24 12:3 21:12  
26:16,17,22 28:18 43:5 44:23  
98:17 102:22  
**date (2)** 76:8,12  
**daughter (4)** 39:9 88:22 89:2 92:5  
**Davie (89)** 1:15 4:3 5:5,5,17,25 6:3  
6:7,9 7:3 12:24 14:4 18:4,22  
19:12,16 20:7,17,21,25 21:5,8  
25:14,17 26:13,15 32:18 33:5,9  
38:18 43:10,15 44:2 48:14,18  
49:5 52:15 55:6,8,11,22 60:19  
61:18 67:8,11 71:11,15 72:17  
73:16,23 77:20 79:2,7,12,19,22  
81:14,18 82:19 83:3 84:16,22  
87:9 89:25 91:8 92:18 94:8,12  
95:16 98:22 99:22 100:16 101:10  
101:13,20 102:2 103:12 105:12  
105:17,25 106:22 107:3 108:14  
112:13,19,22,24 113:4,6  
**Davies (2)** 96:23,24  
**day (12)** 6:16,17 49:11 50:13 85:11  
88:18 94:22 100:24,25 104:10,11  
114:18  
**day-to-day (1)** 40:7  
**days (1)** 57:9  
**daytime (1)** 52:19  
**Deacon (1)** 66:17  
**dead (1)** 49:24  
**deal (4)** 88:3 89:21 102:19 104:5  
**death (3)** 8:2 15:17 16:5  
**Debbie (1)** 13:6  
**decades (1)** 14:22  
**decide (3)** 35:12 72:15 73:12  
**decided (4)** 55:15 71:3,7,9  
**decides (2)** 31:14 102:18  
**decisions (1)** 15:7  
**dedicated (1)** 25:6  
**deep (1)** 77:23  
**definite (1)** 100:14

**definitely (8)** 54:12 63:10 67:18,23  
69:21 85:4 90:6,8  
**degree (2)** 75:2 91:16  
**demonstrated (2)** 15:5 40:22  
**demoralized (1)** 58:2  
**department (24)** 16:14 18:13,16  
18:19 19:3 22:7 28:20 29:22 47:9  
65:17 73:19 76:6 86:22 88:5 93:3  
96:16 97:22 98:3,16 99:25  
102:18 103:4 104:5 105:13  
**departments (3)** 98:5 103:25  
104:15  
**depends (1)** 101:20  
**depression (2)** 83:2,11  
**depth (2)** 25:2 106:14  
**deputy (4)** 20:2,17 40:4,4  
**designee (6)** 4:13 5:6,9,12,16  
55:17  
**desire (1)** 14:11  
**desk (3)** 72:5,6,8  
**details (1)** 8:5  
**detective (4)** 71:23,24 90:12,13  
**determination (1)** 30:23  
**development (2)** 45:23 51:10  
**deviates (1)** 65:9  
**DI (1)** 58:22  
**dial (1)** 101:22  
**Diane (1)** 49:6  
**dictate (1)** 105:8  
**difference (2)** 103:9 107:14  
**different (8)** 29:2,3 80:4 81:2 94:24  
97:23,24 107:15  
**differently (1)** 27:5  
**differs (1)** 107:15  
**difficult (1)** 31:22  
**difficulties (1)** 28:10  
**diligence (1)** 8:12  
**diligently (2)** 13:20 18:10  
**direct (1)** 24:3  
**director (10)** 1:16 2:7 5:4 10:23  
11:5 12:16 21:12 33:20 78:10  
90:5  
**directors (1)** 53:5  
**disability (1)** 23:22  
**disabled (1)** 52:3  
**disciplinary (1)** 100:5  
**discipline (10)** 18:12,13,16 73:18  
97:2,10 99:25,25 102:8,13  
**discourtesy (3)** 23:11 31:3 95:24  
**discuss (5)** 13:23 52:9 84:11  
106:17 107:6  
**discussion (8)** 10:16 21:16 49:2  
77:25 79:8 87:13 98:24 105:22  
**disenfranchised (1)** 58:2  
**disposal (2)** 74:13 76:14  
**disposition (2)** 75:24 76:2  
**distraught (1)** 40:22

**district (2)** 13:13,14  
**disturb (1)** 68:17  
**division (1)** 99:13  
**dog (1)** 42:18  
**doing (22)** 7:7 27:8 30:10 35:21  
44:21 50:5 52:22 56:14 58:15  
68:20 69:13,13 79:24 81:5 104:2  
104:24 105:6,7,8,9 107:2 109:13  
**domestic (4)** 83:6,9,24 84:10  
**door (2)** 68:19 88:21  
**doorbell (1)** 88:20  
**doors (1)** 111:2  
**Dorp (1)** 107:10  
**Dr (2)** 39:4,19  
**drama (1)** 84:21  
**drastically (1)** 42:2  
**draw (1)** 108:5  
**dressed (1)** 58:14  
**driving (3)** 56:9,12 89:14  
**drop (1)** 51:25  
**Drop-In (3)** 34:14 35:24 36:16  
**dropped (3)** 35:23 41:6 49:22  
**drugs (3)** 50:10 51:12,14  
**due (4)** 26:10 28:10 41:6 45:3  
**dumb (1)** 56:23  
**dusting (4)** 70:23,25 71:4,8  
**duty (1)** 40:11  
**Dwyer (4)** 3:6 55:16,20,23  
**dynamic (1)** 108:20

## E

**E (5)** 4:2,2 20:8 114:3,3  
**E-MAIL (1)** 1:24  
**EAGER (1)** 20:23  
**ease (1)** 85:21  
**Eason (5)** 3:7 4:14,16 55:7 64:13  
**easy (4)** 33:2 85:5,5 109:22  
**echo (1)** 90:6  
**Ed (2)** 74:4,4  
**educating (1)** 106:20  
**education (2)** 53:10 66:2  
**effectively (1)** 98:7  
**effectiveness (1)** 11:20  
**efficiency (1)** 16:12  
**effort (4)** 17:23 109:5,16 110:4  
**Eger (2)** 20:22,23  
**eight (3)** 29:9 49:24 78:12  
**eight-year-old (1)** 57:11  
**either (3)** 12:14 30:7 103:8  
**elder (1)** 99:16  
**elected (1)** 58:16  
**elective (1)** 100:13  
**eliminates (1)** 77:13  
**Elizabeth (1)** 89:8  
**Elm (1)** 43:25  
**eloquently (1)** 66:17  
**emphasize (1)** 109:11

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

5

empirical (1) 15:6  
empowering (1) 111:23  
encompasses (1) 43:23  
encounter (1) 23:24  
encounters (3) 24:24 39:11 96:3  
encourage (3) 96:2,11 112:9  
enforcement (4) 15:12 39:21  
49:10 53:23  
engage (4) 7:9 81:6 87:4 96:14  
engagement (3) 53:10 64:25 65:22  
enormous (1) 88:16  
enriching (1) 106:19  
ensure (1) 53:22  
ensuring (2) 8:20 9:25  
entire (1) 16:9  
entity (2) 11:23 22:6  
equally (1) 104:17  
Eric (4) 8:2 15:18 49:23 53:15  
Erica (4) 3:12 5:8 65:16,17  
Ernest (2) 25:3,5  
especially (4) 39:16 53:13 66:22  
111:9  
Espinoza (3) 106:25 107:4,5  
ESQ (1) 1:16  
essential (1) 53:22  
esteem (1) 15:11  
estimation (1) 46:25  
Estime (1) 25:5  
Estudillo (3) 80:9 81:16,16  
et (2) 22:18 23:10  
ethnicity (1) 23:21  
evening (34) 4:10,14,18,23 5:2,8  
5:13 13:8,11 14:2 17:22 20:10,11  
20:14,20,23 21:4 26:18,20 34:7,8  
38:24 39:2 43:9 44:3,4 49:7,8  
52:18 56:3,4 61:21 74:5 98:25  
event (4) 12:10 42:11 101:14  
109:11  
events (4) 25:12 44:8,8,9  
eventually (2) 35:23 45:16  
everybody (6) 26:19 97:17 105:9  
106:25 109:23 113:7  
everybody's (1) 109:20  
everyone's (2) 24:11 37:12  
evidence (3) 15:6,7,9  
exactly (2) 21:24 73:3  
example (2) 86:7 97:18  
examples (5) 23:23 86:19,20 87:7  
87:8  
excellence (1) 15:2  
exceptions (1) 91:25  
Excessive (1) 95:23  
excited (4) 26:25 27:24 28:3 36:3  
excuse (1) 110:21  
executive (7) 1:16 2:7,14 5:4 11:5  
112:20,25  
exercise (1) 91:15

exhibition (1) 82:3  
exist (4) 62:24 63:25 104:6 107:25  
exists (1) 103:25  
expand (1) 106:12  
expect (1) 45:9  
experience (4) 9:7 74:7 97:13,20  
experienced (2) 23:25 24:2  
experiences (5) 9:4 10:16 46:22  
89:23 92:6  
experiencing (3) 27:14 32:15 97:9  
explain (5) 47:6 51:22 56:13,20  
91:3  
express (1) 63:6  
extremely (1) 58:13  
eyes (1) 51:16

## F

F (1) 114:3  
F-A-D-O (1) 22:12  
faces (1) 50:16  
facility (1) 11:12  
facing (3) 97:14,15,21  
FACSIMILE (1) 1:24  
fact (7) 14:7 34:19 57:12 64:16  
80:2 110:12 111:14  
factors (1) 29:23  
facts (1) 102:13  
faculty (1) 8:15  
FADO (1) 22:13  
fair (2) 50:22 64:5  
faith (1) 58:7  
fall (1) 22:10  
falls (1) 22:15  
familiar (2) 21:20 40:7  
families (1) 42:8  
family (5) 39:21 41:23 49:10 86:3  
93:14  
fan (1) 71:5  
fancy (1) 37:15  
far (6) 31:21 72:12 73:6 86:16 90:7  
103:22  
favor (2) 6:3 112:24  
favorite (1) 24:11  
fear (3) 50:13 107:20,24  
February (9) 10:12 12:9 23:4 27:3  
28:9 52:22 61:2 109:12 112:4  
federal (1) 39:22  
feel (25) 10:3 23:24 25:6 41:17,20  
56:24 61:8,17 62:13 63:10,18  
68:8 76:21 78:6,14,23 79:3 84:19  
88:3 93:8,23,25 103:23 104:23  
108:11  
feeling (3) 56:25 76:23 89:21  
feels (1) 107:14  
fellow (2) 40:10 108:7  
felonies (1) 29:9  
felt (2) 81:4 89:20

fence (1) 47:5  
Ferry (1) 62:19  
fewer (2) 31:2 43:6  
field (2) 44:19 83:7  
fielded (2) 46:6,10  
fifth (1) 32:19  
figure (4) 27:20 28:23 29:24 31:6  
figuring (1) 91:20  
file (14) 24:15 30:13 31:23 32:3  
45:4 62:24 75:15 77:8,13,16 96:5  
96:7,9,11  
filed (8) 7:24 9:19 74:9,25 75:18,23  
76:4 87:16  
files (1) 76:17  
filing (1) 24:4  
fill (2) 46:16 74:15  
filled (1) 77:2  
finally (3) 8:14 12:18 32:16  
find (2) 77:11 97:3  
finding (1) 94:15  
fine (2) 34:6 72:9  
finger (1) 23:13  
fired (1) 75:5  
firing (1) 95:6  
first (17) 10:11 20:2 21:15 22:14  
33:12 44:5,16 48:21 70:2 75:22  
82:12 85:2,11 89:10 110:10,19  
110:25  
five (4) 9:19 35:3 65:13 89:4  
fliers (1) 36:20  
flip (1) 27:11  
flooded (1) 42:12  
floor (3) 11:5 17:19 24:14  
Flores (1) 38:7  
focused (2) 8:18 53:8  
folks (2) 54:10 58:4  
follow (5) 16:18 25:11 96:10,12  
106:5  
follow-up (2) 11:19 32:11  
followed (1) 16:14  
force (7) 22:14,15 31:2 46:12  
95:23 105:3,7  
forceable (1) 22:22  
foremost (1) 6:14  
forever (2) 75:24,25  
forgotten (1) 67:22  
form (2) 46:16 74:16  
forth (2) 35:21 98:4  
fortunately (1) 40:14  
forward (13) 10:6 11:3 14:18,20  
16:7 32:23 52:23 53:6,9 54:4  
55:4 101:25 106:18  
found (5) 14:23 54:8 68:10 76:6  
110:21  
four (4) 16:4 22:10 87:20 95:22  
fox (3) 59:18,19,19  
Frank (3) 3:6 55:16,19

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

6

**Frank's (1)** 55:16  
**Fred (1)** 5:5  
**FREDERICK (1)** 1:15  
**free (3)** 25:6 51:12 82:13  
**frequently (1)** 16:9  
**freshmans (1)** 84:25  
**friendly (1)** 42:17  
**friends (5)** 27:16 62:25 64:5 89:6,6  
**frisked (1)** 9:8  
**front (4)** 12:15 67:4 72:7 85:3  
**frustrated (1)** 87:25  
**full (4)** 7:15 8:11 24:21 30:20  
**fully (1)** 31:10  
**functions (1)** 60:9  
**further (2)** 8:4 114:13  
**future (8)** 8:21 10:2 93:25 101:25  
 111:15,16 112:2,8

## G

**G (1)** 4:2  
**game (3)** 42:17 74:11 76:13  
**Garden (1)** 37:5  
**Garner (4)** 8:2 15:18 49:23 53:15  
**Garner's (1)** 16:5  
**gather (1)** 88:2  
**generations (2)** 9:14 10:2  
**George (2)** 17:19 62:19  
**Gerard (1)** 33:21  
**getting (8)** 42:7 51:12 54:15 84:14  
 90:3 93:24 95:11 103:20  
**ghetto (1)** 80:16  
**girl (1)** 89:17  
**Giuliani (1)** 90:19  
**give (25)** 17:14 19:21 22:25 23:15  
 24:20 28:11,17 34:18 35:12,15  
 35:25 45:11 56:17,19 57:16 63:3  
 63:4 65:6 76:23 79:5 81:15 84:4  
 85:4 98:16 109:2  
**given (3)** 58:7 62:7,12  
**gives (2)** 35:20 47:11  
**giving (1)** 82:7  
**glad (3)** 36:10 54:9 81:23  
**go (39)** 12:16 17:16 19:22 21:23  
 30:14,19,21 31:16 33:14 35:20  
 36:18,25 38:12 43:19 47:24  
 48:19 51:2 61:25 62:17 63:11,12  
 64:16 68:7 69:7 70:9 74:19,22  
 76:17,18,19,19 77:16 94:12  
 101:19,21 107:11,23 108:2,19  
**goes (2)** 67:10 73:11  
**going (49)** 12:9 13:6 17:14 21:8  
 22:23 27:3,22,25 28:11,11,13  
 33:12,18 35:10,22 46:15 48:22  
 50:14 57:16 59:14 60:5,9,14  
 63:18,22 65:25 70:25 71:7,25  
 73:13 74:21 76:20 78:17 79:10  
 80:10 81:7 84:6,9 86:6 92:10

93:11 94:4,20 102:22 103:7  
 105:17 109:12,15 110:3  
**good (41)** 4:10,14,18,22 5:2,8,13  
 13:8,10 20:9,11,20,23 21:3 26:18  
 26:20 34:7,8 38:24 39:2 44:3,4  
 47:12,13 49:7,8 50:4,17 52:18  
 56:3,4,25 61:20 74:5 79:15 88:7  
 97:18 98:25 105:8 107:3 113:7  
**gotten (1)** 44:25  
**grab (1)** 25:7  
**grabbed (1)** 89:8  
**gracious (1)** 37:11  
**Graniteville (1)** 43:25  
**Grasmere (1)** 107:18  
**grass (1)** 53:10  
**grateful (1)** 53:18  
**great (11)** 4:11 30:11 31:19 36:9  
 36:13 40:15 41:25 66:15 88:2  
 89:21 104:24  
**greater (1)** 18:18  
**greatly (1)** 14:9  
**Greenfield (1)** 11:11  
**grew (1)** 39:20  
**grill (1)** 42:18  
**ground (1)** 23:16  
**group (8)** 24:19,19 33:21 48:5  
 65:19 66:3,7,8  
**groups (3)** 2:10 21:13 33:13  
**growing (1)** 84:2  
**guess (2)** 80:10 103:9  
**guide (2)** 78:25 82:15  
**gut-wrenching (1)** 40:9  
**guys (19)** 12:22 26:25 27:13 28:14  
 28:17 32:3,24 38:16 61:12 62:23  
 63:10,11,21,25 64:2 67:13 78:8  
 104:8,24

## H

**half (1)** 89:3  
**hall (4)** 54:8 62:9 100:25 110:15  
**halls (2)** 54:22 64:7  
**hallway (1)** 68:15  
**hamburger (1)** 42:18  
**hand (5)** 35:6 36:18,23 74:22  
 114:17  
**handicapped (1)** 87:19  
**handle (1)** 104:6  
**happen (5)** 57:18 59:20 60:5 81:24  
 112:7  
**happened (3)** 44:7 57:10 88:24  
**happening (3)** 8:23 37:9 98:11  
**happens (3)** 51:9 60:6 88:5  
**happy (6)** 36:5 45:24,25 52:6 82:12  
 108:17  
**harassing (1)** 70:12  
**harassment (2)** 23:6,7  
**Harbor (6)** 43:24 45:13,14,23

80:19 89:3  
**hard (3)** 8:8 19:6 93:8  
**harder (1)** 93:23  
**harm (1)** 74:20  
**Harrington (2)** 20:3,5  
**Harya (4)** 26:18,21,21 65:11  
**hat (1)** 52:24  
**hate (1)** 50:19  
**hats (1)** 81:24  
**head (1)** 108:4  
**health (5)** 65:18 82:24 84:6,12 93:3  
**hear (24)** 7:6 11:14 14:9 20:15  
 21:9,13,15 27:12,13 31:7 33:3,11  
 37:12 60:23 61:11,15,18 64:9  
 86:23 88:2 91:11,24 92:15  
 112:11  
**heard (7)** 61:3,5 92:8 93:13 110:13  
 110:14 112:10  
**hearing (7)** 32:23 57:19 98:11,12  
 99:19 101:3 111:14  
**heart (3)** 50:18 59:13 67:10  
**Heights (1)** 56:7  
**held (10)** 7:10 37:5 77:25 79:8  
 87:13 98:24 100:25 104:16,22  
 105:22  
**Hello (3)** 21:18 56:3 106:25  
**help (11)** 10:4 26:10 41:12 49:17  
 50:15 52:25 62:13 64:2 78:24  
 81:12 93:12  
**helped (1)** 49:21  
**helping (4)** 26:8 40:11 49:19 93:8  
**helps (1)** 12:3  
**hereunto (1)** 114:17  
**Herman (1)** 12:20  
**Hero (1)** 49:13  
**hey (5)** 35:5,5,21 36:23 86:10  
**Hi (5)** 5:10 20:9 65:16 80:9 92:24  
**high (14)** 1:9 11:10 29:10,11 41:24  
 61:25 64:21 66:10 85:2 93:6  
 99:13 100:12,12,24  
**higher (4)** 29:17 30:5,7,9  
**highlight (1)** 78:18  
**highlighting (1)** 98:8  
**hire (1)** 34:10  
**hired (1)** 66:6  
**Historical (1)** 82:2  
**history (1)** 82:17  
**hold (2)** 15:11 53:16  
**home (6)** 49:12 68:14,16 70:21  
 71:3 89:5  
**homelessness (3)** 32:15 97:9,14  
**homeowners (1)** 51:10  
**honest (4)** 66:16 88:11 93:17  
 102:20  
**honored (1)** 82:15  
**hope (4)** 12:5 16:16 58:8 67:3  
**hopefully (1)** 30:15



# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

7

hoping (2) 60:25 113:7  
horrible (2) 80:17 86:2  
hospital (1) 22:23  
Hospitality (2) 34:2,10  
host (1) 10:11  
hosted (1) 64:22  
Hostos (1) 106:7  
hot (1) 42:18  
hour (1) 50:23  
hours (4) 24:7 40:24 41:18 81:22  
housekeeping (1) 5:19  
Housing (1) 45:23  
human (1) 84:10  
humanity (1) 40:20  
husband (2) 88:21 89:7  
Hygiene (2) 65:18 93:3

## I

I.D (1) 23:15  
ICO (1) 60:7  
ICOs (1) 60:8  
idea (2) 45:12 71:10  
ideas (1) 28:8  
identification (1) 41:7  
identify (2) 12:3 19:24  
immediacy (2) 104:20,21  
impact (1) 46:24  
implement (1) 27:20  
important (16) 7:8,12,14,19 9:2  
17:8 18:21 27:23 54:3,20 57:21  
58:13 102:21,24 103:6 112:4  
imposed (1) 100:2  
improper (2) 22:21,22  
improperly (2) 56:15,16  
improve (3) 13:20 92:11 108:16  
improving (2) 7:19 12:10  
in-depth (1) 11:24  
inappropriate (3) 23:7,8 52:8  
inappropriately (2) 23:20 98:14  
incidences (1) 43:6  
incident (6) 52:7 69:17 70:2 71:18  
72:22 87:17  
incidents (1) 57:22  
include (3) 22:17 23:6,12  
including (2) 11:18 53:22  
increase (3) 16:24 65:14 100:18  
independent (2) 22:2 103:10  
indicate (2) 30:7,8  
indicative (1) 29:18  
indifference (1) 40:20  
indifferent (1) 42:24  
individual (2) 47:21 101:16  
individuals (1) 48:20  
industries (1) 47:14  
Inequality (1) 28:5  
info (1) 54:21  
inform (1) 31:8

information (16) 7:8 15:23 16:2  
29:6 32:6 35:25 38:12 44:20 45:2  
48:2,6,7 69:23 72:21 99:6 109:4  
information-based (1) 11:25  
infuriate (1) 57:6  
inherently (1) 54:20  
initially (1) 77:12  
initiated (1) 41:9  
initiative (2) 17:25 25:21  
initiatives (1) 32:7  
inquiries (1) 15:19  
insisted (1) 42:19  
inspector (4) 20:3,18 46:18 58:23  
inspectors (1) 19:20  
Institute (1) 28:4  
institutionally (1) 103:5  
intend (1) 101:6  
intention (1) 82:22  
intentions (1) 88:8  
interact (3) 18:2 44:10,14  
interacting (2) 42:5,17  
interaction (3) 36:6 46:17 56:21  
interactions (7) 9:16 24:23 32:14  
42:25 43:7 46:11 65:8  
interest (3) 58:25 109:17,20  
interested (5) 10:22 12:13 17:15  
82:10 114:15  
interim (2) 70:11,20  
internal (2) 15:16 73:22  
International (1) 38:23  
interrupting (1) 69:6  
interview (1) 87:24  
interviewed (1) 87:19  
interviewers (1) 87:24  
intimate (1) 83:8  
introduce (3) 4:7 78:3 90:18  
introduced (1) 45:16  
investigate (10) 22:3,9 23:3,17  
30:18 72:21 73:17 95:22 96:6,25  
investigated (1) 31:10  
investigating (1) 23:5  
investigation (6) 15:16,20,22  
30:20 76:5,18  
investigative (1) 25:2  
investigators (5) 12:20 25:22 52:6  
72:20 73:25  
invitation (1) 20:13  
invited (1) 34:11  
inviting (1) 10:13  
involved (5) 15:17 46:3,23 103:19  
105:3  
Isa (1) 20:18  
island (37) 1:11 4:11,15 8:3 9:18  
11:9 13:13,25 14:16 15:3 20:7  
25:6 26:9 29:7 30:24 31:4 32:19  
41:25 53:6,7,20 54:4 61:22 62:14  
66:10,20,25 67:22 68:2,6 78:11

80:14 84:8 88:12,13 91:5 107:9  
isolated (1) 57:22  
issue (7) 18:11 76:11 90:16 91:19  
103:24 104:13 108:11  
issues (15) 11:23 13:24 36:2 43:6  
53:9 82:8 84:6 96:8 97:6,11,13  
100:5 104:6 107:22 109:6

## J

J (1) 3:6  
Jay (1) 106:8  
Jesus (1) 50:18  
Jim (1) 82:4  
job (15) 30:11 34:21 40:6,8,15 43:3  
46:19 50:5 52:19 58:11,19 59:25  
66:6 87:25 93:12  
John (3) 43:17 66:17 106:8  
join (3) 13:5 15:18 35:13  
joining (1) 14:20  
Jon (1) 11:6  
Jonathan (5) 1:16 5:3 55:25 56:6  
62:5  
JORDAN (1) 81:20  
Jordon (1) 81:20  
Josefina (1) 107:4  
Joseph (7) 1:10 3:11 4:12 14:17,20  
14:22 107:12  
Josephine (1) 111:10  
Josie (3) 74:4,4,5  
Juan (2) 92:24 111:10  
junior (1) 100:12  
jurisdiction (4) 21:24 22:11,16  
108:25  
justice (5) 8:9 16:6 28:4 47:9 53:9  
Justin (1) 55:12

## K

Kathlyn (2) 39:4,19  
keen (1) 15:5  
keep (6) 7:22 60:5 76:7 94:6 106:2  
108:4  
Kenneth (4) 20:8,9,12,25  
kept (1) 76:11  
key (1) 92:14  
Kiara (3) 61:21 66:5 111:10  
kick (1) 22:17  
kids (9) 35:8 39:15 56:11 57:2  
64:22 70:17 84:2 86:10 94:5  
kind (10) 11:24 29:16 44:23 66:23  
78:17 81:4 94:14 103:9 106:17  
107:21  
King (1) 48:25  
knew (1) 41:16  
know (100) 8:15 9:14 10:5,21  
11:16 14:19 15:2,7,24 16:4,15  
17:2,9,21 21:20 24:2 30:12 32:21  
33:15 34:16,20 35:7,14,22 36:4,7

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

8

36:13,23,25 38:2,2 41:18 42:7,15  
48:2 50:2,14 51:21 52:10 53:24  
54:2,10,24,25 57:3,15,21 58:20  
59:3,8 62:13,25 63:5,6,7,13,17  
63:25 65:23 66:15,18,25 67:10  
67:19 68:6,23 72:11 73:7,8,9  
75:5 76:4 80:17 81:9,13 83:21  
85:20,25 86:23,25 87:21 88:17  
88:25 91:18,23,24 92:7,8,15  
94:16 95:21 96:16 99:17 100:4  
103:20 104:8 105:2,4,5,9  
**knowing (2)** 29:6 48:8  
**knowledge (3)** 63:5 99:11 100:14  
**knowledgeable (1)** 101:8  
**known (3)** 14:22 54:12 73:10  
**knows (2)** 47:2 82:10  
**Kowolik (4)** 52:17,18 53:3,4  
**Kramer (2)** 87:15,16

## L

**labeled (1)** 80:16  
**lack (3)** 41:6 45:5 82:23  
**lady (2)** 59:14 60:15  
**Laisha (3)** 33:22 84:25 111:10  
**lane (1)** 56:15  
**language (3)** 23:19,19 95:25  
**large (1)** 79:24  
**largest (2)** 22:5,7  
**LASHIYA (1)** 79:13  
**late (3)** 54:9 55:20 85:10  
**law (5)** 15:11 39:20 49:9 53:23,23  
**lead (2)** 10:15 111:3  
**leader (1)** 66:7  
**leaders (2)** 10:8 111:16  
**leadership (5)** 14:3 93:2 107:6  
110:18 111:7  
**learn (3)** 28:7 82:16 96:17  
**learning (1)** 10:5  
**left (4)** 4:8 46:23 58:21 68:19  
**legal (4)** 36:2 41:8,12 77:17  
**Lenza (1)** 38:13  
**Leshia (1)** 79:13  
**lesson (1)** 54:24  
**let's (5)** 6:21 43:12 56:9 98:22  
110:5  
**letter (1)** 87:22  
**letting (2)** 63:25 96:16  
**level (3)** 8:12 48:12,12  
**LGBTQ (1)** 97:19  
**lieutenant (5)** 36:12 38:2,3 39:25  
101:18  
**life (4)** 9:3 39:13 57:9 80:14  
**light (3)** 34:19 42:22 95:8  
**lights (1)** 89:19  
**limited (2)** 23:23 102:17  
**Lindsay (2)** 3:7 4:16  
**line (5)** 40:10 67:13 72:12 92:20,23

**list (10)** 19:22,23 20:2 33:13,24  
38:20 48:22 52:16 67:14 74:3  
**listen (3)** 20:15 68:25 69:12  
**listened (1)** 100:8  
**listening (3)** 10:7 43:9 111:8  
**little (14)** 5:18 19:8 27:4,12 28:14  
30:17 35:12 54:9 85:12 93:6 99:8  
99:9 106:14 107:7  
**live (11)** 50:7 60:2 62:2 66:11  
78:21 79:13 80:23 81:21 107:9  
107:17,17  
**lived (3)** 80:13,15 81:3  
**lives (1)** 6:19  
**living (2)** 80:18 81:2  
**lo (1)** 35:17  
**loads (1)** 26:24  
**local (4)** 24:15 43:22 44:18 64:22  
**locally (1)** 54:16  
**located (2)** 17:18 26:2  
**location (2)** 14:7 32:3  
**lodged (1)** 76:9  
**Logan (8)** 55:25 56:3,5,6 57:14,15  
60:22 67:9  
**logbook (1)** 76:8  
**long (6)** 15:25 24:22 35:2 68:11  
79:25 87:23  
**longer (2)** 31:14 74:18  
**look (11)** 11:2 16:7 18:24 31:16  
32:23 50:16 51:16 55:3 65:9  
93:18 98:17  
**looked (3)** 29:8 45:12 97:20  
**looking (6)** 14:18 31:5 32:13 52:23  
97:6 101:24  
**looks (5)** 14:20 29:25 66:5 87:6  
104:15  
**lose (1)** 45:18  
**lost (1)** 58:7  
**lot (34)** 27:5 32:5,21 39:15,15 46:6  
54:10 57:25 61:23 62:22 63:14  
63:16 64:7 65:15 75:9 80:24 83:7  
83:10 84:7 86:23 88:7 90:24  
95:16 101:4 103:16 104:23  
107:19 108:15 109:13,15 110:2,4  
110:4,5  
**love (7)** 24:19 60:18 65:5,5 66:2  
84:11 106:16  
**lovely (1)** 66:14  
**low (3)** 29:12,13 45:2  
**lower (1)** 30:2  
**Lucenda (1)** 87:15

## M

**M (2)** 114:9,21  
**Ma'am (1)** 52:5  
**major (7)** 22:10 29:9 40:17 45:17  
67:23,24 89:11  
**majority (1)** 53:19

**making (4)** 14:8 79:16 82:22  
108:18  
**male (1)** 83:11  
**MALONEY (1)** 100:20  
**MAMARONECK (2)** 1:22,23  
**man (2)** 62:4 90:20  
**mandatory (1)** 43:2  
**Manhattan (3)** 4:13 17:17 24:14  
**Manor (1)** 37:5  
**Marbre (2)** 3:9 4:19  
**Marcella (3)** 38:21,24 39:3  
**marched (1)** 47:7  
**marginalized (2)** 58:4 62:6  
**Marichal (2)** 92:24,25  
**Marin (1)** 90:13  
**Mariners (5)** 43:24 45:13,14,23  
80:19  
**mark (1)** 86:13  
**marriage (1)** 114:14  
**married (1)** 40:5  
**Mars (4)** 80:9 81:16 93:5 111:10  
**Martini (1)** 90:20  
**matter (4)** 60:7 67:25 93:8 114:16  
**Matthew (1)** 20:3  
**mayor (2)** 14:19 100:18  
**mayoral (2)** 5:6,9  
**McBeth (5)** 43:17,21 44:3,5 66:17  
**McClean (1)** 33:23  
**McSilver (2)** 28:3 52:20  
**mean (11)** 22:21 50:3 51:16 66:11  
88:6,18 89:10,13,20 94:25 102:8  
**meaning (1)** 30:20  
**meaningful (1)** 16:13  
**means (3)** 29:24 31:12 77:5  
**measure (1)** 86:13  
**media (1)** 43:4  
**mediate (1)** 22:3  
**mediation (1)** 24:25  
**meet (5)** 17:2 25:22 54:14 99:4  
106:16  
**meeting (14)** 1:5 2:3 4:4 5:21,23  
6:12,15 11:9 13:16 14:21 36:15  
38:6 60:25 100:10  
**meetings (9)** 28:16 58:5 62:10  
65:4 80:4 100:25 101:25 110:15  
111:6  
**Melissa (1)** 20:21  
**member (25)** 3:5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12  
13:4,6 14:19 18:5 19:17 24:6  
25:19,20 26:7 31:20 43:19 47:22  
53:5 55:14 61:16 96:23 110:25  
**members (21)** 3:3 4:6 6:17 11:14  
13:10 18:8 19:13 31:25 33:6  
41:23 43:12 48:16 55:8 57:24  
58:10 84:18 93:15 95:19 107:8  
110:8 112:15  
**mental (6)** 65:18 82:24 83:10 84:5

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

9

84:12 93:3  
**mentality (2)** 66:20,21  
**mentioned (2)** 24:6 32:18  
**mentor (1)** 85:9  
**merits (1)** 30:23  
**message (1)** 95:3  
**met (1)** 41:4  
**mic (4)** 11:4 77:23 87:12 92:23  
**Michael (4)** 3:10 4:22,24 5:24  
**microphone (1)** 62:12  
**middle (2)** 23:13 99:15  
**miles (1)** 108:19  
**mindful (2)** 71:11,15  
**minister (4)** 38:22 39:7 44:6 49:4  
**Ministries (2)** 38:22 39:6  
**minute (3)** 21:23 28:12 83:18  
**minutes (7)** 2:5 5:21,23 6:9 24:22 87:12 92:22  
**misconduct (8)** 7:9 22:5,9 23:25 24:3 30:8 32:16 102:19  
**missed (2)** 19:23 33:15  
**missing (2)** 40:24 41:15  
**mistake (1)** 7:7  
**moderate (2)** 29:13,14  
**mom (2)** 57:4,5  
**moment (3)** 6:21 7:2 26:25  
**Monday (1)** 50:22  
**money (2)** 76:15 100:22  
**monitor (1)** 72:14  
**Monroe (1)** 106:9  
**Montez (1)** 38:5  
**month (5)** 14:15 17:6,12 24:9 72:2  
**months (1)** 87:21  
**moral (1)** 9:24  
**mother (5)** 40:22 41:3,11 91:9 92:4  
**mother's (1)** 41:14  
**motion (3)** 5:22,24 112:19  
**motivated (1)** 94:20  
**motives (1)** 94:18  
**motorcycle (1)** 57:11  
**move (6)** 10:6 33:9 53:5 54:4 106:18 112:21  
**movies (2)** 35:2,8  
**moving (2)** 53:8 106:3  
**multiple (1)** 24:4

## N

**N (1)** 4:2  
**NAACP (2)** 74:8 77:3  
**name (26)** 4:15,19 5:3,14 22:24 23:14 26:21 38:4,8 53:4 61:21 62:5 65:16 67:17 78:5,9 81:15,20 83:3,5 85:8 90:2,4 98:25 103:14 107:4  
**narrative (1)** 111:21  
**Nathan (1)** 14:17  
**nation's (2)** 22:5,6

**nature (2)** 7:5 83:23  
**NCO (11)** 38:8,10,13,13 45:8,15,15 59:5 90:19 91:2,4  
**NCOs (2)** 44:12 90:7  
**near (1)** 107:11  
**nearly (1)** 32:19  
**necessary (2)** 45:5 62:13  
**necessity (1)** 77:14  
**need (16)** 14:5 29:19 32:22 37:8 58:12 60:23 63:11 73:15 79:21 86:19,20 87:7 91:2 93:23 99:16 112:11  
**needed (2)** 10:5 15:15  
**needs (6)** 10:18 41:20 67:4 100:10 108:11 112:7  
**negative (4)** 43:7 46:24 89:23 92:5  
**negatively (1)** 42:24  
**negatives (1)** 36:8  
**neighborhood (8)** 35:19 37:22 41:2 45:13 49:15 50:9 78:7 84:21  
**neighborhoods (1)** 59:4  
**neighbors (1)** 68:17  
**Neil (3)** 82:21 83:5,5  
**nerve (1)** 99:9  
**nervous (4)** 62:15 79:25 80:3,12  
**networking (1)** 66:25  
**never (3)** 71:24 92:9 101:5  
**new (42)** 1:11,23 2:13 6:20 7:22 8:17,20,23 9:6,14 10:2,7,12,13 10:14 12:2,5,12 14:6,14 16:6 25:3 30:25 32:14 34:9,10 39:10 39:12 45:8 61:25 78:9 80:24 81:3 81:25 93:2 94:15 96:3 97:8 107:10 112:16 114:5,10  
**newly (1)** 66:6  
**news (2)** 25:12 43:4  
**nice (5)** 4:15 37:3,6,6 99:4  
**niggerville (1)** 89:10  
**night (5)** 32:25 34:25 38:6 86:3 113:7  
**nominate (1)** 15:13  
**nonpartisan (1)** 53:7  
**nonsubstantiated (1)** 75:21  
**Noonan (2)** 21:2,3  
**norm (1)** 69:21  
**normally (1)** 74:13  
**north (3)** 13:14,17 62:2  
**Notary (1)** 114:9  
**noted (1)** 113:9  
**Nothing's (1)** 73:2  
**notice (2)** 61:6 95:9  
**nowadays (1)** 39:16  
**number (10)** 11:17 13:2 17:14,20 22:25 24:11 31:11 41:24 45:2 65:15  
**numbers (2)** 42:2 84:8  
**NY (1)** 52:20

**nyc.gov/ccrbyouthsummit (3)** 10:24,25 12:17  
**NYCHA (1)** 45:23  
**NYPD (23)** 6:18 7:6 9:15,23 10:17 12:11 13:19 16:10,20 17:9,24 18:2 19:18 22:2 29:5 39:17 40:5 40:13 46:12 47:10 66:22 108:21 111:7  
**NYU (3)** 12:9 28:2 109:12

## O

**O (1)** 4:2  
**O'Neill (1)** 16:17  
**OBISANYA (1)** 103:14  
**objective (1)** 14:23  
**obligation (1)** 9:25  
**occurred (1)** 87:17  
**October (1)** 114:18  
**offensive (2)** 23:18 95:24  
**offer (3)** 54:18,21 55:2  
**offered (2)** 50:25 100:13  
**offering (1)** 54:23  
**office (11)** 17:4,11,18 24:8,13 25:22,25 64:23 74:16,23 101:22  
**officer (41)** 7:14,25 9:9 22:15,24 23:13,14 35:5,6 36:14 37:18,23 38:15 39:10,22,24 40:5,10 41:14 53:15 56:13,17,22 57:13 58:24 59:6,7 72:7 83:18 86:7,13,15,20 86:21 90:13,19 97:2,4 101:16 102:11 108:4  
**officers (45)** 6:22 7:6,9 15:12,17 34:20 35:3,10,18,19 36:9 37:10 37:22 39:12 40:16 41:21 42:3,14 42:22 44:9,11,13 45:14,19,25 53:19 59:16 62:20 68:23 69:8,19 69:20 83:11,14,23 84:13 87:5 91:3,4 96:4 100:6 103:18 108:10 108:21 109:18  
**offices (2)** 31:22,23  
**official (1)** 52:19  
**officials (5)** 13:2 16:10,10 58:16,17  
**Ogunaleye (1)** 33:20  
**Ogunleye (7)** 78:2,8 79:5,9,21 84:24 85:8  
**oh (8)** 20:5 52:10 53:3 68:17 69:4 70:24 73:12 89:2  
**okay (25)** 34:3 37:25 55:12 67:16 67:23,25 68:20 69:22 70:4,16 72:2,4,19 78:6 80:10,13 92:18 94:14 95:4,12,13 99:5,10,18 100:3  
**old (6)** 2:12 35:4 50:9,10 67:19 112:17  
**older (3)** 39:23 67:20 93:14  
**once (2)** 96:7 99:17  
**one's (1)** 109:16

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

10

**ones (6)** 50:4 67:20,21 69:24 93:14 99:7  
**ongoing (3)** 15:21 19:2 54:21  
**open (5)** 21:14 51:2 68:19 95:18 110:25  
**opened (1)** 88:14  
**operations (1)** 40:8  
**opportunity (7)** 18:6 47:12 56:18 56:19 61:2 62:7 82:16  
**opposed (3)** 6:7 42:5 113:4  
**optional (2)** 43:2 99:14  
**order (7)** 2:4 4:5 47:2 67:12 71:20 71:21,23  
**organization (1)** 53:8  
**organizations (5)** 61:23 63:12,23 65:3 106:11  
**organizing (1)** 53:11  
**orientation (1)** 23:21  
**ostracized (1)** 50:12  
**outcome (1)** 114:15  
**outreach (14)** 2:8 10:22 12:16 21:11 29:20 30:2,10 34:11 38:22 39:6 48:10 64:15,16 109:13  
**outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov (1)** 25:9  
**outside (4)** 9:4 69:8 94:2 108:24  
**outstanding (1)** 53:19  
**outweighs (1)** 40:14  
**oversight (1)** 22:6  
**overstate (1)** 102:16  
**overstating (1)** 103:8  
**overwhelming (1)** 99:5

## P

**P (1)** 4:2  
**p.m (2)** 1:7 113:9  
**paid (1)** 6:23  
**pain (1)** 40:9  
**pair (1)** 27:18  
**Pantaleo (1)** 7:25  
**paper (2)** 69:15 70:2  
**papers (2)** 69:24 89:17  
**parameters (1)** 92:12  
**Pardon (1)** 52:11  
**parents (2)** 8:15 42:16  
**park (2)** 43:25 88:19  
**part (15)** 10:20 27:23 28:15 33:10 35:18 43:3 48:4,5 54:3 55:15 61:23 66:16 83:8 98:10 107:5  
**participating (2)** 12:14 90:15  
**particular (6)** 9:7 44:24 45:11,13 75:19 99:12  
**particularly (2)** 108:20 109:9  
**parties (2)** 60:10 114:14  
**partly (1)** 102:3  
**partner (5)** 36:4 38:13 54:5 69:10 93:5  
**partnered (1)** 64:21

**partnering (1)** 31:24  
**partners (3)** 25:20 31:21 109:5  
**partnership (2)** 65:13 110:23  
**parts (3)** 43:25 83:8 91:4  
**pass (3)** 44:20 47:12 48:2  
**passage (1)** 9:10  
**passed (2)** 16:5 94:4  
**pastor (1)** 39:5  
**patient (1)** 110:14  
**patrol (4)** 20:8 42:3,20 45:14  
**patterns (1)** 28:22  
**Patty (1)** 38:13  
**pay (4)** 50:25 51:13 75:11,13  
**Peace (1)** 60:18  
**peers (1)** 112:6  
**Peguero (8)** 3:5 5:13,15 110:9,10 110:23 112:14,21  
**penalized (1)** 63:8  
**people (55)** 6:20,24,25 8:19 9:2,23 20:15 30:12 32:17 36:8 37:7 46:22 47:21 50:8 51:7,11 57:20 58:3,3,12,19 59:25 60:15,23 61:3 61:4,7 62:7 63:4,13,19 66:8,14 68:5 71:2 72:25 74:25 76:24 77:3 79:17 80:17 85:20 95:9,21 96:2,9 96:11,14 97:13 101:4 108:21 109:10 110:16 111:11,15  
**people's (3)** 45:3 51:16 60:16  
**percent (6)** 18:15 51:24 99:23,24 102:7 105:4  
**perfectly (1)** 88:11  
**perform (2)** 46:19,20  
**performed (1)** 14:25  
**perils (2)** 40:8,14  
**period (2)** 67:24 73:15  
**Perkins (2)** 90:3,4  
**permanently (1)** 52:3  
**Persichetty (3)** 1:20 114:9,21  
**person (20)** 10:19,21 14:24 31:16 31:17 48:21 52:16 57:5 72:7 74:3 74:14 75:7,12,19 76:16,22 85:25 105:2,6,8  
**personable (1)** 85:19  
**personally (2)** 40:21 46:6  
**personnel (1)** 46:19  
**perspective (1)** 97:5  
**Petrides (1)** 107:11  
**philosophy (3)** 59:8,8,9  
**phone (4)** 51:9 87:20 88:22 89:7  
**phonetic (7)** 25:5 38:4,5,10 78:10 87:15 90:20  
**phonetics (2)** 33:23 90:14  
**photos (1)** 23:7  
**picked (1)** 88:18  
**piece (2)** 5:19 49:12  
**ping (1)** 86:12  
**pizza (2)** 86:10,11

**place (6)** 17:18 26:3 41:10 45:6 48:10 70:2  
**placed (1)** 53:15  
**places (1)** 30:2  
**planning (1)** 28:9  
**platform (1)** 62:8  
**play (2)** 9:25 90:11  
**playing (1)** 86:12  
**Plaza (1)** 47:10  
**please (12)** 6:4 10:22 24:3 25:9 28:6 32:24 33:15 71:15 92:20,23 94:12 112:25  
**pleased (5)** 10:10 13:5 14:13 15:13 19:18  
**pledge (1)** 54:13  
**plunge (1)** 68:9  
**PO (1)** 36:17  
**point (8)** 25:18 30:16 31:13 56:6,8 69:14 72:23 84:13  
**police (100)** 4:16 5:11 7:16,20 9:8 9:17 10:3,6 11:25 13:20 16:14,24 22:4,7,15,24 23:12,14,25 24:3 29:22 32:14 39:10,12,22,24 40:2 40:5,15,18 41:3 46:15 47:8,10 49:15 53:19 55:18 56:13,17,22 57:12 59:4,16,21,21,21 60:3,3,4 62:20 67:24 68:7,13 70:13,21 71:3,7 72:13 73:12 75:4,6 76:6 77:6 78:15 81:4,11 83:22 84:13 88:5,9,17,20,23 89:8,11,15,22 90:16 92:11 96:3,16 97:22 98:3,4 98:16 101:6,7 102:18 103:18,25 104:4,10,15,22 105:13 107:15,20 108:3,10,16  
**policeman (4)** 49:17 75:11 76:7 89:16  
**policies (1)** 97:24  
**policing (6)** 17:24 59:5,7 87:6 97:20 104:10  
**policy (17)** 2:9 11:17 21:12,16 26:16,16,23 28:15,20 29:5 31:9 32:7 53:11 96:22 97:5,25 98:21  
**polite (1)** 37:11  
**pong (1)** 86:12  
**population (1)** 8:21  
**Port (6)** 1:9 8:14 11:10 34:15 43:24 66:10  
**position (4)** 15:14 44:17 46:2,7  
**positive (5)** 41:7 42:21,25 46:4 78:22  
**possible (4)** 25:10 27:25 64:20 79:5  
**possibly (1)** 109:22  
**post (1)** 40:3  
**power (10)** 73:14 88:8,10 91:13 99:11 100:15 102:17,25 103:8 111:23

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

11

powerful (1) 66:8  
powers (1) 72:16  
practice (1) 9:12  
practitioners (2) 27:7,19  
pragmatic (1) 14:24  
pray (1) 49:11  
precinct (26) 17:17 20:4 24:15  
29:8 30:11,12 40:19 43:23 44:24  
46:15 50:6 60:4 62:18 63:18 70:9  
70:19 71:18 72:3 74:20 75:7,8,13  
75:18 99:3 101:15,18  
precincts (2) 29:3 94:21  
predicament (1) 68:11  
presence (1) 14:10  
present (4) 3:3 37:24 111:19,25  
presentation (10) 2:8,9 24:20  
26:17,24 35:12,15 38:19 66:3  
106:13  
presentations (6) 21:11 28:15 54:6  
54:16 55:2 65:7  
presented (1) 42:23  
president (1) 74:8  
pressure (1) 46:18  
pretty (1) 107:18  
previously (1) 40:5  
price (2) 75:12,14  
primary (1) 43:3  
principal (1) 11:11  
probably (5) 30:10 56:24 57:6,8  
80:4  
problem (9) 49:22 67:24 68:2,12  
89:11 98:17 101:5,6,15  
problems (6) 12:4 27:18 49:14  
68:4 84:7 88:16  
proceed (1) 15:16  
proceedings (114) 1:13 4:1 5:1 6:1  
7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1  
14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1  
20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1  
26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1  
32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1  
38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1  
44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1  
50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1  
56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1  
62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1  
68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1  
74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1,17 78:1 79:1  
80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1  
86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1  
92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1  
98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1 102:1  
103:1 104:1 105:1 106:1 107:1  
108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1 112:1  
113:1 114:1,12  
process (7) 24:25 25:2 30:22  
31:13,15,17 106:19

productive (1) 17:22  
profanity (1) 23:12  
professionalism (1) 16:22  
profiling (1) 91:18  
program (10) 24:18 35:16 38:11  
45:8,11,15,16,19 59:9 64:24  
programming (1) 85:12  
programs (2) 59:5 106:11  
progress (2) 75:10 108:18  
progression (1) 62:14  
Project (2) 34:2,10  
promotion (1) 43:20  
prompt (1) 41:12  
proper (2) 69:23 77:17  
properly (1) 63:6  
propositions (1) 23:9  
prosecute (1) 22:4  
prosecution (1) 8:6  
prosecutors (1) 8:7  
protect (3) 7:16 16:21 72:14  
protection (3) 71:20,22,23  
protested (1) 47:6  
proud (1) 17:5  
public (22) 1:5 2:3,11 7:15 13:2  
14:9 15:10 21:10,14 33:12 48:19  
57:25 58:10 59:2 67:4 80:2,8  
81:19 96:14 100:10 106:20 114:9  
publicly (1) 99:8  
pulled (1) 56:12  
Puma (4) 3:11 4:9,10,12  
punch (1) 22:17  
pursue (2) 31:14 47:23  
pursuit (1) 8:9  
purview (1) 108:25  
push (4) 7:19 12:4 95:7 111:17  
put (5) 29:4 41:10 46:18 70:3 71:6  
putting (1) 95:6

## Q

Queens (2) 5:16 56:7  
question (7) 18:25 67:9 78:2 94:10  
101:12 102:4 103:15  
questioned (1) 93:21  
questions (10) 18:9 33:7 43:13  
48:15 55:9 60:20 78:14 80:11  
95:17 98:5  
quick (3) 21:23 56:9 101:11  
quickly (1) 41:11  
quite (2) 74:8,9

## R

R (2) 4:2 114:3  
race (2) 23:20 28:4  
races (1) 100:19  
racial (1) 94:19  
racially (1) 94:20  
racking (1) 99:9

raise (2) 15:10 36:18  
raised (4) 18:7 19:9 66:9 109:7  
Ramon (4) 3:5 5:13,15 110:10  
ran (1) 35:4  
rang (1) 88:20  
ranks (1) 39:24  
Ranti (3) 33:19 78:9 85:8  
rape (1) 84:3  
rate (10) 19:7 29:9,10,11,13,14,17  
29:18 30:6,6  
rates (4) 30:3,4,8,9  
reach (3) 25:8 34:5 82:11  
reached (1) 49:15  
reaching (2) 58:11,19  
react (1) 83:15  
read (3) 39:8 69:2 97:17  
reading (1) 69:11  
ready (2) 34:2 79:11  
real (3) 56:9 87:5 91:18  
realize (1) 107:13  
realized (1) 107:19  
really (50) 11:13 13:24 17:5 26:7  
27:2,7,24 28:3 33:18 37:6,6  
44:14 52:8 55:3,3 56:17,19,19  
57:17,17 58:25 59:24 60:13,14  
62:15 63:13 64:5 69:5,12 73:14  
73:15 81:12,23 82:15 85:2,19,22  
86:2 90:25 91:5 93:7 94:9,10  
95:9 106:18 107:21,24 108:17  
110:12 111:6  
rear (1) 89:19  
reason (4) 24:16 93:21,22 95:20  
reasons (2) 80:5 97:7  
recall (2) 7:11 9:7  
receive (2) 7:8 32:20  
received (1) 41:13  
recognize (1) 97:12  
recognized (1) 14:5  
recommend (3) 97:2,10,17  
recommendation (2) 73:18 102:9  
recommendations (11) 16:13,18  
18:20 29:5 31:9 47:13 73:8,10  
97:22 99:20,23  
recommended (4) 18:11,16 47:23  
99:24  
recommending (1) 98:20  
record (7) 49:2 77:25 79:8 87:13  
98:24 101:3 105:22  
rectify (1) 41:13  
Rector (1) 74:17  
reduced (1) 42:3  
refer (1) 51:20  
reference (1) 80:11  
refers (1) 23:20  
reflects (1) 14:11  
reform (1) 16:12  
refused (2) 69:16 90:17

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

12

**refute (1)** 44:23  
**regard (1)** 53:14  
**regarding (1)** 15:19  
**regardless (1)** 14:7  
**regards (4)** 44:20 45:6 46:5,11  
**regular (1)** 48:11  
**reiterate (1)** 12:7  
**related (4)** 23:8 29:4 54:25 114:13  
**relation (2)** 7:25 44:5  
**relations (11)** 7:20 10:6 12:2 13:21  
 16:24 29:21 39:18 47:8 66:22  
 92:12 108:17  
**relationship (4)** 12:11 80:22 103:3  
 109:17  
**relationships (2)** 9:22 84:3  
**religion (1)** 23:21  
**reluctance (1)** 45:4  
**remain (2)** 45:22,25  
**remains (1)** 67:3  
**remarks (1)** 13:7  
**remember (7)** 7:14,18 8:24 62:5  
 68:3 92:21 111:5  
**remembering (2)** 7:11 22:12  
**remembrance (1)** 6:22  
**remind (2)** 16:10,25  
**removal (1)** 22:22  
**repairing (1)** 9:22  
**repeated (2)** 16:18 82:17  
**repeating (2)** 94:6,6  
**replies (1)** 56:4  
**report (24)** 2:6,7 10:4 11:19,19,20  
 32:10,10,12,13,15,16 50:20  
 59:18 68:21 70:6,7,8,18,20 71:18  
 97:8,18 98:15  
**REPORTED (1)** 1:19  
**reporting (3)** 1:22 30:9 50:11  
**reports (5)** 11:18,22,25 32:8 97:16  
**representative (6)** 14:17 15:3 17:3  
 17:7 24:7 55:17  
**representatives (1)** 13:18  
**represented (2)** 13:3 19:18  
**representing (1)** 44:16  
**reprimanded (1)** 59:17  
**requires (1)** 8:22  
**residents (3)** 12:6 45:24 53:24  
**resource (2)** 65:24 77:9  
**respect (5)** 16:17,22 41:22 53:18  
 89:21  
**respond (5)** 6:5 13:10 83:20 91:21  
 105:13  
**responding (1)** 98:7  
**responds (7)** 20:11 26:20 34:8  
 39:2 44:4 49:8 113:3  
**response (9)** 19:15 26:14 33:8  
 43:14 48:17 55:10 92:17 112:18  
 113:5  
**responsibility (1)** 91:15

**rest (3)** 19:10 105:5 108:19  
**results (2)** 22:23 77:18  
**retired (3)** 39:9 40:6 100:3  
**retiree (1)** 99:6  
**retirement (1)** 40:3  
**Reverend (5)** 38:20,24 39:3,4,19  
**reverse (1)** 29:16  
**Review (8)** 1:4 4:5 6:13 7:4 14:4  
 15:4 21:21 53:21  
**revolve (3)** 103:24 104:14,25  
**reward (2)** 40:11,13  
**ribbon (1)** 18:23  
**Richmond (8)** 1:9 8:14 11:10  
 34:15 43:24 66:10 88:14 114:7  
**riding (3)** 56:15 57:10 90:17  
**right (31)** 9:10 19:16 26:15 32:9,25  
 35:13 38:4,9,12 43:15 48:13,22  
 52:13 56:5,8,25 61:20 62:6 64:7  
 66:3 68:5 73:7 76:14 82:3 86:23  
 90:23 93:12 101:24 102:17,19  
 104:12  
**rights (5)** 48:8 54:24 63:5 99:17,17  
**Rios (1)** 90:12  
**Rita (3)** 1:20 114:9,21  
**Rivadeneyra (4)** 3:10 4:22,24 5:24  
**Robert (2)** 90:3,4  
**robust (1)** 11:3  
**role (1)** 9:25  
**rolled (2)** 45:8,17  
**rollout (1)** 45:21  
**romantic (1)** 23:9  
**rookie (1)** 49:11  
**room (6)** 6:5 54:11 55:14 58:18,22  
 79:24  
**rooted (1)** 16:19  
**roots (1)** 53:11  
**Rose (13)** 13:6,8,12 18:21 19:11  
 24:6 25:19 26:4,11,12 49:3 85:9  
 110:19  
**row (1)** 12:16  
**Ruff (1)** 38:10  
**rug (1)** 95:8  
**ruled (1)** 9:13  
**run (2)** 35:18 83:6  
**runs (1)** 75:8  
**rushed (1)** 6:18  
**rushing (1)** 69:3

## S

**S (1)** 4:2  
**sacrifice (1)** 6:23  
**safe (6)** 7:22 10:3 89:5 93:9 94:2  
 113:8  
**safer (1)** 79:16  
**safety (1)** 15:10  
**Sal (1)** 5:10  
**Salmeron (6)** 98:25 99:2 100:3

101:11,14,24  
**saluting (1)** 40:10  
**SALVATORE (1)** 3:8  
**Santana (1)** 86:7  
**Santiago (2)** 65:16,17  
**sat (4)** 47:5,7 89:18 110:14  
**satisfaction (1)** 75:3  
**satisfied (1)** 77:4  
**Saturday (1)** 89:4  
**save (2)** 49:19 92:20  
**saw (2)** 35:2 64:12  
**saying (6)** 38:4 58:9,15 59:11 89:8  
 89:18  
**says (8)** 56:22 60:16 69:3 72:9  
 75:17,20,22 86:10  
**scared (2)** 66:23 83:20  
**scenarios (1)** 66:12  
**schedules (1)** 13:23  
**school (22)** 1:9 8:17 9:2,5,9 11:10  
 61:25 62:17 64:21 65:6 66:11  
 67:19 85:2 90:5 93:6 94:2,3  
 100:12,12,24 107:11 108:2  
**schools (8)** 8:23 28:2 63:12,24,24  
 64:17 65:14 99:13  
**script (1)** 27:11  
**Sea (1)** 107:13  
**search (1)** 22:22  
**searching (1)** 41:2  
**second (7)** 5:25 6:2 22:19 57:3  
 79:6 112:22,23  
**Secondly (1)** 7:23  
**seconds (1)** 58:20  
**section (2)** 51:11 94:11  
**see (30)** 10:22 18:8 19:6 27:10  
 28:22 29:15 30:2 36:6 37:8 43:6  
 43:12 48:24 65:22 66:5 78:16  
 81:12 84:4 85:9,21 86:11,17 87:2  
 93:7,18 96:17 98:9 108:3,6,22  
 112:10  
**seeing (8)** 16:7 28:18,22,24 39:17  
 85:16 86:15 98:6  
**seek (1)** 96:14  
**seen (3)** 40:15,16 98:17  
**sees (1)** 7:12  
**selling (1)** 50:10  
**semester (1)** 64:24  
**semiannual (1)** 11:18  
**send (1)** 69:8  
**senior (2)** 26:22 96:21  
**sent (1)** 69:19  
**sentenced (1)** 104:20  
**September (5)** 1:6 6:12,17 37:4  
 114:12  
**sergeant (7)** 38:5 39:25 72:5,6,8  
 99:3 101:17  
**serious (2)** 83:23 102:12  
**seriously (1)** 9:24

# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

13

**servant (1)** 100:4  
**serve (6)** 7:16 26:8 42:4,16 103:21 109:19  
**service (4)** 6:20 47:3,17 104:3  
**SERVICES (1)** 1:22  
**serving (1)** 40:12  
**session (3)** 2:14 112:20,25  
**sessions (1)** 54:21  
**set (1)** 114:17  
**seven-hour (1)** 8:25  
**sexual (5)** 23:5,9,21 32:16 95:2  
**shaky (1)** 62:16  
**Shannon (5)** 33:22 77:21,22 78:5 84:19  
**shaped (2)** 9:3,16  
**share (3)** 8:4 103:6 109:3  
**Shavchenka (1)** 12:21  
**sheriff (1)** 40:4  
**shine (2)** 34:18 95:8  
**Shirley (10)** 67:14,16,17,20,21 71:13,17 72:23 73:6,21  
**shoes (1)** 41:14  
**shook (1)** 35:6  
**shore (3)** 13:14,17 62:2  
**shot (1)** 40:10  
**shoulder (2)** 56:16 88:24  
**show (3)** 87:5 89:17 95:14  
**showed (2)** 36:24 87:23  
**Sibhon (1)** 33:24  
**sic (2)** 42:23 84:25  
**side (4)** 50:24 79:4 100:6 107:9  
**sides (1)** 47:5  
**sight (1)** 24:7  
**sign (4)** 68:24 69:24,25 70:2  
**significant (1)** 11:22  
**signing (1)** 69:2  
**Signorelli (1)** 49:6  
**Signorile (5)** 49:7,9 51:4,6 52:10  
**silence (2)** 6:21 7:2  
**similar (1)** 37:7  
**simple (2)** 46:16,21  
**single (1)** 103:5  
**sir (3)** 20:4 83:4 84:16  
**sister (2)** 49:18 67:19  
**sit (3)** 42:19 55:21 58:14  
**sitting (3)** 32:25 36:11,17  
**situation (3)** 41:13 86:3 92:9  
**situations (5)** 57:18 66:13 93:17 93:20 104:7  
**six (1)** 68:14  
**six- (1)** 8:25  
**sixth (1)** 17:19  
**skills (3)** 15:8,14,15  
**slightly (1)** 67:12  
**small (3)** 34:23,24 68:4  
**snapshot (1)** 28:17  
**Snug (1)** 89:3

**social (1)** 53:8  
**Society (1)** 82:2  
**solutions (4)** 12:4 27:14,18,21  
**somebody (1)** 101:15  
**someone's (1)** 46:15  
**somewhat (1)** 77:3  
**son (3)** 40:23 57:11,12  
**soon (2)** 15:25 89:18  
**sorry (7)** 26:16 55:20 62:4 78:9 80:12 85:10 110:9  
**sort (1)** 101:22  
**souls (2)** 49:19 50:17  
**sounds (1)** 110:2  
**South (1)** 40:2  
**space (1)** 17:11  
**speak (31)** 12:14 19:21,25 33:17 34:3,12 52:13,14 56:2,18 60:8,13 60:14 61:14 62:7,11 64:6,13 67:14 74:13 77:22 79:10 80:2 87:11 92:19,22 96:20 98:23 106:23 109:23 110:16  
**speakers (1)** 33:22  
**speaking (11)** 36:16 39:3 57:5 58:16 61:8 66:6,14 76:25 77:8 85:3 106:5  
**specifically (1)** 40:19  
**spend (1)** 9:2  
**spoke (6)** 37:25 57:20 66:17 72:20 91:10 111:11  
**spoken (4)** 48:24 99:7 105:18,19  
**sponsoring (1)** 52:21  
**spread (1)** 46:8  
**Square (1)** 87:18  
**ss (1)** 114:6  
**St (4)** 1:10 17:19 62:19 107:12  
**staff (6)** 8:15 19:4,4 95:19 96:13,19  
**Stahly-Butts (6)** 3:9 4:18,19 102:3 103:13 105:11  
**stand (3)** 12:22 25:4 50:23  
**Stapleton (6)** 79:14,15 85:16 90:6 90:24 107:19  
**start (8)** 4:8 27:16 28:13 33:12 53:12 77:10 89:18 101:21  
**started (2)** 55:15 70:12  
**starts (1)** 10:7  
**State (2)** 114:5,10  
**stated (1)** 83:7  
**statement (1)** 39:8  
**Staten (35)** 1:11 4:11,15 8:2 9:18 11:9 13:13,25 14:16 15:3 20:7 25:6 26:9 29:7 30:24 31:4 32:18 41:25 53:6,7,20 54:4 61:22 62:14 66:9,20,25 67:22 68:2 78:11 80:13 84:8 88:12,13 91:4  
**station (1)** 41:3  
**status (2)** 15:20 23:22  
**statutes (1)** 91:16

**stay (5)** 68:15 69:9 75:25 96:6 110:5  
**stayed (1)** 76:2  
**stays (1)** 75:24  
**stealing (1)** 41:5  
**STENO-KATH (1)** 1:22  
**Stenokath@verizon.net (1)** 1:24  
**step (2)** 77:23,24  
**Stephanie (2)** 38:21 48:25  
**Stephen (1)** 103:14  
**stepping (1)** 26:8  
**stick (1)** 30:16  
**stop (6)** 22:21 25:7 32:24 56:23 69:5,13  
**stopped (5)** 9:8 48:9 89:15 93:21 98:13  
**stops (1)** 23:8  
**store (1)** 35:4  
**stories (2)** 93:13,15  
**story (2)** 34:24 51:17  
**straightforward (1)** 46:21  
**stream (1)** 50:7  
**street (8)** 24:13,24 42:11 48:12 56:12 74:17,18 77:15  
**streets (2)** 48:4 98:12  
**strengthen (2)** 15:9 16:23  
**strong (1)** 68:14  
**struck (1)** 60:23  
**student (2)** 24:19 79:10  
**students (5)** 8:14 62:23 63:16 64:23 86:14  
**stuff (3)** 63:8 95:12,15  
**Stuyvesant (2)** 17:18 26:3  
**substantiated (3)** 75:21 97:4 98:19  
**sudden (1)** 56:22  
**suffer (3)** 82:25 83:10,16  
**suggestions (1)** 47:13  
**summit (7)** 10:12,20 12:8 27:2 52:22 61:2 112:3  
**superior (1)** 102:14  
**supervising (1)** 81:9  
**supervisors (1)** 19:19  
**support (5)** 37:2 54:13,18 76:23 85:5  
**supporter (1)** 86:16  
**supposed (1)** 46:20  
**sure (23)** 7:21 19:12 20:7 25:17 27:12 32:2 33:16 36:19,22 41:11 63:21 66:19 73:3 79:7,12 82:13 95:10 98:6,23 101:13 102:5 103:7 109:21  
**suspicious (1)** 7:13  
**Suzette (1)** 99:2  
**swing (1)** 65:12  
**systematic (1)** 104:5  
**systemic (1)** 103:24

## 14

T		
<b>T (2)</b> 114:3,3	108:14 110:11 112:11,13 113:6	<b>trained (2)</b> 83:12,14
<b>table (2)</b> 47:7 109:24	<b>thanking (1)</b> 53:12	<b>training (6)</b> 82:23 84:5,14 96:18 97:23,23
<b>tacks (1)</b> 103:15	<b>thanks (4)</b> 12:22 67:13 79:22 106:21	<b>trainings (1)</b> 98:2
<b>take (24)</b> 5:20 18:6,24 21:23 26:24 28:20 37:24 58:25 60:12 68:8 70:7,17 74:16 77:23 80:10 91:24 99:18 100:21,22 101:9,9,17 109:15 110:4	<b>thing (10)</b> 18:7 19:8 25:16 34:5 51:7 60:2 61:24 99:19 109:14 110:3	<b>transcript (2)</b> 1:13 114:11
<b>taken (7)</b> 14:24 45:6 100:7,8 102:11 104:4 114:12	<b>things (31)</b> 21:9 27:4,9 29:19 31:19 34:17 39:17 44:7 46:9,21 47:14 48:9 51:13 60:4,22 66:19 69:4 72:12 78:16,16,20,22,23 81:13 83:16 86:24 91:25 92:3 96:22 98:8 104:24	<b>transform (1)</b> 16:8
<b>takes (3)</b> 9:24 99:8 100:23	<b>think (36)</b> 10:17 20:14 26:2 27:15 35:9 48:23 54:19,23 58:12 61:10 61:14 66:14,16,21 67:11 76:3 79:14,15 83:25 88:6 90:23 91:10 93:10 95:13 98:13 99:15 100:11 101:3,7 102:16,24 103:16 104:13 106:2 108:15 109:23	<b>transformed (1)</b> 17:25
<b>talk (22)</b> 24:23,24,25 28:6,8 33:2,3 37:8,11 52:7 64:8 65:7 67:13,13 72:4,5 10 73:25,25 82:23 85:14 102:22	<b>third (4)</b> 17:6,11 23:11 24:8	<b>transitioning (1)</b> 85:13
<b>talked (5)</b> 54:25 70:13,16 78:3,22	<b>thought (1)</b> 89:4	<b>transparency (2)</b> 16:12 92:14
<b>talking (9)</b> 27:7 28:13 47:18 68:5 79:3 82:5 86:5 107:8,22	<b>three (8)</b> 40:24 41:18 75:16 80:19 87:12,18,20 92:21	<b>transparent (1)</b> 102:6
<b>talks (1)</b> 88:7	<b>thrilled (1)</b> 52:21	<b>treat (1)</b> 41:21
<b>Tarekegn (4)</b> 26:18,21,22 96:21	<b>thrives (1)</b> 66:25	<b>treated (2)</b> 104:17,18
<b>target (1)</b> 29:25	<b>throwing (1)</b> 22:17	<b>tremendous (1)</b> 34:21
<b>targeted (1)</b> 106:14	<b>throws (1)</b> 23:16	<b>trends (3)</b> 97:6,21 98:6
<b>taser (2)</b> 11:19 32:11	<b>Thursday (4)</b> 17:6,12 24:9 37:4	<b>tried (2)</b> 50:7 79:18
<b>task (1)</b> 109:22	<b>tighten (1)</b> 19:7	<b>Tripolsi (1)</b> 38:3
<b>taught (1)</b> 102:14	<b>time (36)</b> 8:17 13:22 15:25 17:23 18:15 39:14 42:15 43:8 51:17 55:5 57:18,18,19 58:6 59:23 60:2 60:3,17 62:21 68:3,25 71:12,16 79:21 80:2,3 82:8 85:3 92:21 94:7 98:3,18,18,19,19 113:9	<b>trouble (3)</b> 38:8 77:11 89:21
<b>teaching (1)</b> 99:14	<b>times (8)</b> 27:6 44:11 57:25 63:20 73:17 80:14 98:14 99:24	<b>true (4)</b> 86:24 87:3 93:16 114:11
<b>team (6)</b> 8:7 30:10 93:2 96:13 97:25 107:6	<b>tip (1)</b> 52:24	<b>truly (1)</b> 69:20
<b>teams (1)</b> 107:8	<b>today (10)</b> 9:18 34:14 36:11 54:10 61:8 65:20 67:7 82:9,18 112:12	<b>truncated (1)</b> 31:12
<b>tears (1)</b> 89:7	<b>toddler (1)</b> 42:13	<b>trust (2)</b> 10:2 108:10
<b>technical (1)</b> 28:10	<b>told (6)</b> 65:21 68:14 71:19 72:6 75:15 93:15	<b>truth (2)</b> 60:6 101:4
<b>tell (13)</b> 7:13 10:17 26:25 41:16 51:17,18 56:20 64:15 71:8 76:16 79:25 90:2 102:21	<b>tonight (6)</b> 10:11 11:3 14:13 15:19 19:19 109:9	<b>try (8)</b> 51:21 76:24 91:15 92:11 93:9 95:2 97:25 108:5
<b>telling (3)</b> 27:8 62:23 112:7	<b>totally (1)</b> 76:21	<b>trying (10)</b> 27:4,11 29:24,25 31:5 50:15 59:23 66:4 95:7,10
<b>tend (1)</b> 44:13	<b>Tottenville (2)</b> 107:12,23	<b>turn (3)</b> 11:4 57:2 66:24
<b>tenth (1)</b> 24:14	<b>Touch (2)</b> 38:22 39:6	<b>turned (1)</b> 88:4
<b>terms (3)</b> 84:9,12 99:5	<b>tour (1)</b> 82:7	<b>turnout (1)</b> 37:3
<b>Terranova (1)</b> 38:8	<b>tournament (1)</b> 90:9	<b>Twice (1)</b> 46:17
<b>terrible (1)</b> 49:20	<b>town (8)</b> 54:8,21 62:9 64:7 74:12 76:13 100:24 110:15	<b>Twitter (1)</b> 25:11
<b>testify (1)</b> 56:9	<b>trace (1)</b> 40:25	<b>two (15)</b> 12:19 28:2 34:23,24 35:3 36:10 44:22 45:14,19 68:18 81:22 87:18 88:19 89:6 91:2
<b>testimonies (2)</b> 57:19 59:13	<b>traditionally (1)</b> 61:3	<b>type (5)</b> 28:25 29:2 43:5 60:2 102:13
<b>testimony (1)</b> 59:12	<b>trafficking (2)</b> 83:7 84:10	<b>types (3)</b> 44:7 58:5 65:7
<b>text (1)</b> 35:21	<b>Tragically (1)</b> 9:6	
<b>thank (88)</b> 5:14 7:3 8:16 11:2,7,10 12:24 13:15,18,21,25 17:22 18:3 18:4 19:9,11 20:5,13,17,24 21:16 21:19 25:13,14 26:11,12 33:4,5 38:14,15,16,19 43:8,10,10,15,16 48:13,14,18 49:5 52:15 54:18 55:5,6,7,11 60:17,19 65:15 67:6 67:8 73:16,23,23 77:19,20 79:19 79:19 80:5 81:14,17 82:18,19 84:15,16,22,22,24 87:9,9 89:23 89:25 91:8 94:7,8 100:16 101:10 102:2 103:12 105:11,15 106:3		

U
<b>ultimate (1)</b> 6:23
<b>ultimately (7)</b> 6:19 7:21 12:5 15:9 75:13 77:8 88:9
<b>unconstitutional (1)</b> 9:13
<b>understand (15)</b> 15:21 17:8 31:21 49:16 52:12 59:2 75:23 79:23 85:7,23,24 90:21 99:12,16 108:22
<b>understanding (3)</b> 27:5 75:6 95:12
<b>understands (1)</b> 83:18
<b>unfortunately (2)</b> 34:13 46:23
<b>unhealthy (1)</b> 109:17
<b>union (5)</b> 51:22,23 60:16 87:17 100:5
<b>unit (3)</b> 8:6 11:17 64:15
<b>university (2)</b> 10:13 100:23
<b>upcoming (2)</b> 25:12 32:7
<b>upheld (1)</b> 73:19



# Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final September 12, 2018

15

**urge (1)** 61:9  
**use (4)** 11:12,19 15:8 86:6  
**uses (1)** 22:15  
**usual (1)** 44:12  
**usually (2)** 46:12,13

## V

**valid (1)** 88:4  
**valuable (1)** 111:20  
**value (1)** 76:3  
**vanished (1)** 40:25  
**variety (1)** 96:15  
**verbal (2)** 6:8 23:6  
**versed (1)** 101:8  
**vested (1)** 58:25  
**victim (2)** 31:14 41:7  
**video (2)** 49:25 50:6  
**view (1)** 84:13  
**viewed (2)** 42:21,24  
**violence (4)** 83:6,9,24 84:10  
**visit (1)** 10:23  
**voice (3)** 61:5 62:15 109:2  
**voices (6)** 27:22 32:22 110:13  
111:19 112:5,10  
**Volha (2)** 12:21 52:13  
**volunteer (1)** 81:25  
**volunteerism (1)** 46:10

## W

**wait (2)** 57:3 70:22  
**waiting (2)** 16:6 64:14  
**walk (6)** 79:23 93:19 108:5,8  
110:16,21  
**wall (2)** 22:18 84:9  
**want (68)** 5:17 11:14 13:12,15,18  
13:21,24 15:23 16:25 17:22,23  
19:20 21:10,23 24:17 25:4,9 26:5  
28:7,17 33:3 41:22 44:15,23  
52:24 53:12 54:3,12 55:13 61:24  
62:3,19 63:21 64:9,19,25 65:12  
65:14 67:12 68:7 70:3 71:10 72:4  
73:20 78:16 80:21 86:11 90:25  
91:10,17,23 92:7,15 93:11 94:16  
95:21 98:22 102:5 103:7 104:9  
105:18 107:6 109:10,14 110:11  
110:18 111:9,16  
**wanted (14)** 11:16 25:18 36:13  
50:24 54:18 60:21 65:22,23  
82:23 91:9 93:4 99:11 105:21  
106:4  
**wants (7)** 12:19 17:2,9 54:4 92:19  
92:22 96:20  
**washes (1)** 36:24  
**wasn't (3)** 31:16 89:4,19  
**way (15)** 9:9,11,12 17:25 22:11  
25:23 34:25 57:6 65:24 67:5  
75:10 77:18 98:21 103:5 114:15

**ways (4)** 24:4 92:2 95:5 96:15  
**we'll (9)** 4:8 18:8 21:13,14 33:9,16  
48:18 100:19 109:13  
**we're (50)** 6:15 11:15 13:4 18:17  
21:8 22:8 24:16 27:3,4,11,23  
28:2,9,18,22,24 29:23 31:5 32:8  
32:9,10 34:16 52:23 53:6 58:15  
58:15 60:25 61:11 64:14 65:14  
65:25 66:4 70:5 71:7 73:12 84:6  
85:10 92:10 95:20 97:7 98:6,8,11  
98:12,15 102:5 103:8 109:3,12  
109:25  
**we've (11)** 20:14 23:4 44:25 64:21  
66:12 88:16 89:12 92:8 98:17,18  
106:10  
**wear (1)** 81:24  
**website (1)** 24:10  
**weed (2)** 63:2,3  
**week (1)** 8:17  
**weeks (1)** 78:12  
**weigh (1)** 15:8  
**weighted (1)** 16:16  
**welcome (7)** 5:17 6:11 11:8 13:12  
38:18 44:2 55:19  
**welcomed (1)** 55:3  
**well-being (1)** 8:20  
**went (10)** 40:23 41:3,15 66:10  
70:19 71:17,20 72:3,5 93:5  
**weren't (1)** 81:5  
**whatsoever (1)** 88:9  
**WHEREOF (1)** 114:17  
**whistleblower (1)** 50:12  
**white (7)** 33:25 34:4,9 37:21 38:16  
88:19 89:6  
**who've (1)** 96:2  
**wide (1)** 68:19  
**widely (1)** 46:8  
**wife (1)** 56:10  
**Wilford (1)** 90:13  
**willing (1)** 100:17  
**window (2)** 71:5 89:16  
**windows (1)** 42:20  
**wish (2)** 51:25 69:12  
**witness (2)** 66:4 114:17  
**witnessed (2)** 40:21 87:18  
**wolf (3)** 59:18,19,20  
**woman (5)** 68:12 71:24,25 72:24  
106:5  
**woman's (1)** 70:11  
**wonderful (4)** 34:20 39:11 66:5  
101:2  
**work (24)** 7:5,21 8:12,13 9:22  
16:17 34:14 35:8 42:6,9 47:8  
52:20 53:13 60:11 65:17 79:18  
85:15,17,21 93:23 96:15 108:16  
109:14 110:4  
**worked (5)** 39:22,23 40:3 46:2

47:14  
**workers (1)** 95:11  
**working (14)** 8:8,8 10:17 11:17  
13:19 18:10,17,25 19:6 32:9,10  
39:14 40:13 78:11  
**works (2)** 86:21 109:21  
**workshop (1)** 94:23  
**workshops (1)** 54:25  
**worried (2)** 34:4 83:13  
**Wouk (2)** 81:20,21  
**wouldn't (5)** 34:5 47:25 49:17  
56:25 68:16  
**wound (1)** 89:16  
**wrestling (1)** 91:20  
**write (3)** 32:13 68:22 69:16  
**writes (1)** 39:20  
**writing (3)** 32:8 68:22 97:8  
**wrong (3)** 7:7 69:25 76:10  
**wrongs (1)** 95:15  
**wrote (1)** 87:22  
**www.nyc.gov/ccrb (1)** 24:10

## X

**X (3)** 1:3,8 98:21

## Y

**Y (1)** 98:21  
**yard (1)** 42:12  
**yeah (6)** 30:12 41:4 57:15 64:3  
81:4 108:13  
**year (4)** 8:17 49:13,17 99:22  
**years (9)** 9:13 16:4 35:4 40:6 44:22  
49:24 50:10 80:20 111:13  
**yelled (1)** 72:8  
**yesterday (2)** 54:15 78:3  
**YLT (1)** 92:25  
**Yojaira (8)** 10:23 12:15 21:15,18  
64:18 105:20,23 106:4  
**York (19)** 1:11,23 6:20 7:22 8:20  
8:23 10:12 12:2,5 14:14 30:25  
39:10,12 61:25 81:25 93:2 96:3  
114:5,10  
**Yorkers (10)** 9:6 10:2,8,14,15  
12:12 14:6 16:6 32:14 97:8  
**Yorkers' (1)** 9:15  
**young (22)** 8:18,25 9:23 10:7,14  
10:19,21 12:12 32:17 34:24 61:4  
61:7 66:8 68:12 85:19,25 99:7  
101:4 108:21 109:10 111:11,14  
**younger (2)** 67:21 83:25  
**youngest (1)** 35:3  
**youth (37)** 8:21 9:17 10:12,20 12:8  
24:18 27:2,7,13,17,19,21 34:13  
34:14 35:11,13 36:2,15,25 52:22  
60:25 62:10 65:19 66:6 92:25  
93:24,25 97:15 99:15 106:9,10  
106:15 107:5,7,14,20 109:11

**Civilian Complaint Review Board Meeting - Final  
September 12, 2018**

16

<b>youth-led (1) 12:10</b> <b>youth-orientated (1) 63:23</b>	<b>49th (1) 13:13</b>	
<b>Z</b>	<b>5</b>	
<b>Zachary (1) 12:20</b>	<b>5 (1) 2:8</b> <b>5th (1) 112:4</b>	
<b>0</b>	<b>6</b>	
<b>1</b>	<b>6 (1) 2:9</b> <b>6:40 (1) 1:7</b> <b>6th (1) 37:4</b>	
<b>1 (1) 2:4</b> <b>1-800-341 (1) 24:12</b> <b>1-9 (1) 81:21</b> <b>10 (1) 2:13</b> <b>100 (2) 24:13 51:24</b> <b>10543 (1) 1:23</b> <b>11 (1) 2:14</b> <b>11th (1) 6:17</b> <b>12 (2) 1:6 114:12</b> <b>120 (1) 99:3</b> <b>120th (1) 29:8</b> <b>121 (5) 41:3 43:23 45:7 50:6 62:18</b> <b>121st (4) 20:4 29:15,16 44:24</b> <b>122nd (2) 29:15 30:5</b> <b>123rd (1) 29:12</b> <b>130 (2) 17:18 26:3</b> <b>139 (1) 1:22</b> <b>14 (2) 9:20 32:20</b> <b>15-year-old (2) 40:23 41:19</b> <b>18 (1) 70:15</b> <b>1865 (1) 82:5</b> <b>19 (1) 70:16</b> <b>1919 (1) 82:6</b> <b>1st (1) 114:18</b>	<b>7</b> <b>7 (1) 2:10</b> <b>70 (1) 50:10</b> <b>718)556-7370 (2) 17:20 25:25</b> <b>75 (3) 18:15 99:23,24</b>	
<b>2</b>	<b>8</b>	
<b>2 (1) 2:5</b> <b>20 (1) 40:6</b> <b>2014 (1) 8:2</b> <b>2015 (2) 49:21 51:25</b> <b>2016 (1) 32:11</b> <b>2017 (1) 18:15</b> <b>2018 (5) 1:6 6:12 11:18 114:12,18</b> <b>212.95.DEPOS (1) 1:23</b> <b>24 (2) 9:20 32:21</b> <b>25th (1) 57:8</b> <b>27 (1) 34:15</b>	<b>8 (2) 2:11 51:11</b> <b>8:30 (1) 113:9</b> <b>85 (1) 1:10</b>	
<b>3</b>	<b>9</b>	
<b>3 (1) 2:6</b> <b>30 (2) 24:21 106:12</b> <b>311 (2) 24:11 101:22</b>	<b>9 (1) 2:12</b> <b>9/11 (1) 7:11</b> <b>914.381.2061 (1) 1:23</b> <b>914.722.0816 (1) 1:24</b> <b>953.3767 (1) 1:23</b> <b>99 (1) 105:4</b>	
<b>4</b>		
<b>4 (1) 2:7</b> <b>40 (1) 24:22</b> <b>40-minute (1) 106:13</b> <b>45 (1) 58:20</b>		