

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

1

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD
PUBLIC MEETING
September 13, 2017
6:36 p.m.

-----X

IS 49 Berta A. Dreyfus
101 Warren Street
Staten Island, New York 10304

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE:

DEBORAH N. ARCHER, ESQ., Acting Chairperson
JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

Reported By:

Bonita Richards

STENO-KATH REPORTING SERVICES, LTD.
139 MAMARONECK AVENUE
MAMARONECK, NEW YORK 10543
212.95.DEPOS (953.3767) * 914.381.2061
FACSIMILE: 914.722.0816
E-MAIL: stenokath@verizon.net

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA:

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Report from the Chair
3. Report from the Executive Director
4. Presentation by Outreach on the CCRB
5. Presentation from Policy on Data
6. Comment from Community Groups
7. Public Comment
8. Old Business
9. New Business
10. Adjourn to Executive Session

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

=====

DEBORAH N ARCHER, ESQ., Acting Chairperson

SALVATORE F. CARCATERRA, Board Member

JOSEPH A. PUMA, Board Member

LINDSAY EASON, Board Member

FRANK J. DWYER, Board Member

FREDERICK DAVIE, Board Member

MABRE STAHLY-BUTTS, Board Member

JOHN SIEGAL, ESQ., Board Member

RAMON PEGUERO, ESQ., Board Member

YOUNGKIK YOON, ESQ., Board Member

=====

JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., Executive Director

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

4

1 Proceedings

2

3 MS. ARCHER: Good evening, everyone.

4

5 I'd like to call to order the
6 September meeting of the New York City Civilian
7 Complaint Review Board. My name is Deborah
8 Archer. I am the Acting Chair of the CCRB, and I
9 am a mayoral designee.

10 Before we get started, I want to ask
11 all of my fellow board members to also introduce
12 themselves. We'll start down at the end.

13 MR. CARCATERRA: Hi, everyone.

14 I'm Sal Carcaterra, and I'm a police
15 commissioner representative on the board.

16 MR. EASON: Good evening, everyone.

17 My name is Lindsay Eason, and I'm also
18 a police representative.

19 MR. DWYER: I'm Frank Dwyer, and I am
20 also.

21 MS STAHLY-BUTTS: Good evening, I hope
22 everyone's well.

23 My name is Mabre Stahly-Butts, and I
24 am a designee from Brooklyn for the City Counsel.

25 MR. DARCHE: I'm Jonathan Darche. I'm
the Executive Director of the agency.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

5

1 Proceedings

2 MR. SIEGAL: Good evening.

3 John Siegal. I was appointed by our
4 Mayor, Bill de Blasio.

5 MR. PEGUERO: Good evening.

6 My name is Ramon Peguero, I am the
7 City Counsel designee for Queens.

8 MR. YOON: My name is Youngik Yoon. I'm
9 also a City Counsel designee.

10 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

11 For those of you who may need it, we
12 do have translation services available in Spanish
13 and French. If you want to utilize those
14 services, please just go to the back and you can
15 grab a set of headphones.

16 For those who are not aware of what
17 the CCRB does, we are an independent civilian
18 oversight agency. We're charged with receiving,
19 investigating, and evaluating civilian complaints
20 alleging police misconduct.

21 Again, we're an independent agency,
22 that means we're not a part of NYPD and it also
23 means that the members of this board are not
24 employees of the NYPD.

25 We're really happy to be here with you

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

6

1 Proceedings

2 in the community. It gives us a unique
3 opportunity to get a better understanding of what
4 the issues are in this community, your concerns
5 around policing and police engagement. It also
6 gives us an opportunity to facilitate a
7 conversation between members of the local
8 precinct and members of the community.

9 So, to that end, we have several
10 community organizations here with us, and we've
11 also invited members of the local precinct to
12 help facilitate that conversation.

13 And I also thinks it helps advance our
14 understanding of what's going on, and it's
15 certainly a better understand of what is going on
16 in the communities around New York City will
17 really help inform our work.

18 Before we get started, I do want to
19 acknowledge some members of the community and
20 community organizations that I know are here to
21 participate.

22 And first we have a representative
23 from Councilwoman Debbie Rose's office,
24 Vincent Gregnanie.

25 Thank you for coming.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

7

1 Proceedings

2 We also have Barry Houses from NYCHA.

3 If you can stand up so folks can see
4 you, I appreciate that. Thank you.

5 We have someone here from the African
6 Community Organizations of Staten Island.

7 Thank you.

8 Someone from Mount Sinai United
9 Christian Church.

10 A representative from Staten Island
11 Coalition of Churches.

12 We also have Cesar Vargas from Dream
13 Action Coalition.

14 Thank you.

15 Michael Riley from Staten Island
16 Community Education Council 31.

17 And we have Sherise Lewis from NYCHA,
18 South Beach Houses.

19 Thank you.

20 I look forward to -- we look forward
21 to hearing from you all and receiving your
22 comments.

23 We're going to start off with a report
24 from Executive Director, and then also provide
25 some information to you all about what we're

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

8

1 Proceedings

2 seeing in your community. And then we'll take
3 community comments.

4 I'm going to turn it over to our
5 Executive Director.

6 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Madame Chair.

7 I'm actually going to keep my remarks
8 quite short. The full remarks are online, or if
9 you would like a copy, you can ask someone at the
10 desk out front and we'll give you copy.

11 I just wanted to say, thank you to our
12 host, the Jewish Community Center of Staten
13 Island, and particular Ingrid Ebanks and
14 Steven Kessler for allowing us to have this
15 meeting here. That's it.

16 MS. ARCHER: Okay, thank you.

17 I did miss that we have Pat Russo from
18 Cops and Kids.

19 Thank you for coming.

20 Next, we're going to have a
21 presentation by our outreach group.

22 MR. TUBBS: Hi, my name is Keith Tubbs.
23 I am the Outreach Director and Inter-government
24 Relations Director for the CCRB.

25 I'm going to do a short presentation

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

9

1 Proceedings

2 for you guys.

3 Hang on.

4 So, the CCRB, The Civilian Complaint
5 Review Board is a City agency that investigates,
6 mediates, allegations of misconduct filed against
7 members of the NYPD. In certain cases, the CCRB
8 Administrative Prosecution Unit prosecutes
9 officers who are found of having committed
10 misconduct.

11 What the CCRB investigates, we
12 investigate complaints alleging police
13 misconduct. Each police action that the
14 complainant or the victim describes, is
15 considered a distinct allegation even though only
16 a single complaint is filed. We don't review and
17 investigate every type of police encounter.

18 The four types of allegations that the
19 CCRB has jurisdiction over, we like to use an
20 acronym called FADO. F is for force, A is for
21 abuse of authority, D is for discourtesy, O is
22 for offensive language.

23 Force would include anything like
24 punching, kicking, slapping, grabbing, pushing;
25 use of impact weapons like nightsticks, pepper

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

10

1 Proceedings

2 spray, or tasers, or use of a firearm. So, even
3 if someone was to brandish a firearm, that would
4 be considered an act of a force.

5 Abuse of authority, would be stops of
6 persons in vehicles, frisks of persons, searches
7 of persons in vehicles and residences without
8 sufficient cause; refusal to provide name or
9 shield number.

10 Discourtesy, would be the use of foul
11 language, use of profanity, discourteous conduct,
12 discourteous gestures, and actions. So, another
13 example was, if I were to have a police
14 interaction and I gave him my ID and that ID
15 ended up being thrown on the ground. It would be
16 considered an act of discourtesy.

17 Offensive language, would be use of
18 racial and religious epithets; language that
19 inappropriately refers to race, nationality,
20 religion, gender, perceived sexual orientation,
21 and/or disability.

22 The life of a CCRB case, a complaint
23 is filed in person, by email, phone, or on our
24 website, and a person from our intake unit will
25 speak with that complainant. The matter will

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

11

1 Proceedings

2 then be sent to the investigation unit, then the
3 matter will be mediated, and/or investigated.

4 If the matter is investigated, the
5 investigator presents his or her findings and
6 recommendations to a three member panel that
7 includes a NYPD, City Council, and mayoral
8 appointees. The panel reviews the investigators
9 findings and makes a recommendation. The matter
10 may then go to the Administrative Prosecution
11 Unit.

12 To file a complaint, again, you can
13 call 311; you can go to the website which is
14 www.nyc.gov/ccrb; you can call, 1-800-341-CCRB;
15 or you can come to our office which is at
16 100 Church Street, New York, New York 10007.

17 You can also -- we have partnered with
18 the City Council's office. And so we have office
19 hours every third Thursday of the month from
20 4 p.m. to 7 p.m. at Council member Debbie Rose's
21 office. We have some of these located at the
22 front desk with our outreach team.

23 Also, if anybody is here from an
24 organization that's interested in having a
25 presentation from the Outreach Unit, you should

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

12

1 Proceedings

2 come talk to us and we will be more than happy to
3 come out to your organization and give a
4 presentation.

5 Thank you guys and have a great day.

6 MS. ARCHER: Thank you very much.

7 Now, we're going to hear about some
8 data from Lincoln MacVeagh in our Policy Unit.

9 MR. MACVEAGH: Hi, my name is
10 Lincoln MacVeagh. I'm the Director of Analytics
11 at the CCRB, and I want to talk briefly about the
12 complaint activity we see in Staten Island.

13 Let's start with the big picture.

14 This graph shows the total number of
15 complaints the CCRB has received Citywide, 2003
16 to 2016. Focusing on Staten Island, this chart
17 breaks out the CCRB complaints by borough.

18 As you can see that top line, most of
19 our complaints come from Brooklyn, followed by
20 Manhattan and the Bronx, then Queens. And that
21 little line at the bottom is Staten Island.

22 At first glance, this chart may give
23 you the impression that Staten Island doesn't
24 generate many CCRB complaints, and in absolute
25 terms that's true. But it's important to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

remember that Staten Island is the borough of parks. It is not as densely populated as the other boroughs.

So, let's compare the Staten Island complaint numbers to the size of it's population. The green one on the far right is Staten Island. Staten Islands makes up 5.7 percent of the City's population, and last year it accounted for 4.6 percent of the CCRB's complaints. When you look at it that way, the number of CCRB complaints from Staten Island doesn't seem particularly low. In fact, it's pretty much what you'd expect.

The real outlier in terms of CCRB complaints is Queens. Queens represents 27.3 percent of the City's population, but only generated 16.8 percent of all CCRB complaints.

Digging a little deeper, we want to know where the complaints in Staten Island are coming from.

This map breaks down the complaint numbers by police precinct. We can see that the majority of the Staten Island complaints come from the north. The 120th precinct generates the most complaints, followed closely by the 121,

1 Proceedings

2 with both the 122 and the 123 far behind.

3 But the precinct numbers can be
4 deceptive, because some of the Staten Island
5 precincts encompass very different neighborhoods.
6 For example, if we look just at the precinct
7 numbers, it seems like the center of the CCRB
8 complaint activity in Staten Island is in the
9 northeast, but oddly enough that is not true. In
10 fact, the center of Staten Island complaint
11 activity is on the other side of the island in
12 the northwest, in that red zone.

13 This slide breaks down the 2016
14 complaints by the zip code of the alleged
15 victims. Our zip code data is not perfect.
16 Complainants don't always give us their zip
17 codes, and when they do we can't always verify
18 them. But what this map shows is the home
19 address zip of complainant victims involved in
20 2016 CCRB complaints.

21 For each zip code, we have the
22 percentage of CCRB complainant victims, and the
23 percentage of Staten Island's population that the
24 zip code represents. It's very little text, but
25 I will tell you -- you can't read it but -- when

1 Proceedings

2 we looked at the 10303 zip, which is the red on
3 in the top left, we see that although it
4 represents only five percent of Staten Island's
5 population, it is the home zip of fully 15
6 percent of the CCRB complainant victims. All of
7 the northern zip codes are over represented in
8 CCRB complaints, but it's the 10303 that is the
9 most over represented.

10 To close out, I'd like to change tact
11 a little bit and talk about truncation rates. A
12 truncation occurs when somebody makes a complaint
13 with the CCRB, but then does not follow through
14 with the investigation. Sometimes truncations
15 happen because the complainant has trouble
16 getting to our office.

17 This chart breaks out the truncation
18 rates by borough. The truncation rate is lowest
19 in Manhattan, that's the red line where our
20 offices are located, and higher in other boroughs
21 where complainants may find it hard to travel to
22 us. For Staten Island, the truncation rate was
23 56.5 percent. That means that 56.5 percent of
24 the complaints had to be closed without an
25 investigation.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

16

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

Another cause of truncations, is sometimes we just lose contact with our complainants. The CCRB wants to reduce truncations, we want to fully investigate cases.

One thing we started doing in 2016 is asking complainants permission to text message them, in order to stay in touch. The text messaging has proved remarkably effective. That top chart shows the 2016 truncation rates, broken down by whether or not the complainant agreed to let us send them text messages. Without text messaging, the truncation rate was 60 percent. But with text messaging, the truncation rate was only 46 percent. That's a big difference, and text messaging is only going to get more important as more of you, more -- everyone abandons landlines.

Finally, the last chart is just a curiosity. It shows that in 2016 Staten Island complainants were the least likely to give CCRB permission to send them text messages. So, I'm going to end with a request, let us text you. It will help investigate your complaints.

Thanks a lot.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

17

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

I'd like to acknowledge that we also now have with us a representative from Council member Steve Matteo's office, and also a representative from Speaker Mark Viverito's office.

Thank you for joining us.

So, now we're going to turn to inviting some of the community organizations who've come to speak, and I have a list here of folks.

We're going to start with Cesar Vargas, co-founder of the Dream Action Coalition.

MR. VARGAS: I want to thank everyone, for the CCRB for giving me the opportunity to speak. My name is Cesar Vargas, and I am an immigration attorney here on Staten Island.

I work primarily with the immigrant community, especially the Latino community in the North Shore and mid-island and South Shore as well. I am actually myself, I'm also undocumented and also a DACA recipient, as we all have been hearing in the news.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

18

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

So, needless to say, there is a lot of anxiousness in the immigrant community, specifically of all the politics that has taken place across the country. On Staten Island it's no different.

We have been seeing that the immigrant community is much more reluctant to see the police as an agency that's there to serve them. Of course, many of this is unfounded and I got to give credit to the NYPD for actually keeping in place a very key policy, which is not to ask immigration status of people they detain, people that either through traffic stops or on the streets.

However, one of the concerns that we are seeing on Staten Island, is the lack of language, which we have seen create some type of miscommunication/conflict with the NYPD. Specifically, when either there is a -- for example, a neighbor dispute between neighbors and one of the neighbors doesn't speak English and the other neighbor is obviously fluent.

One of the things that we have been seeing more often here on Staten Island is that

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

19

1 Proceedings

2 usually the NYPD officer sides with the English
3 speaker, you know, for many factors. Obviously
4 most primarily because he can understand the
5 English speaker more than the person who has no
6 access to the English language or key word.

7 So, we have seen where, for example, a
8 domestic dispute with an employer/employee. We
9 saw that the NYPD took the report saying that the
10 actual immigrant worker was threatening and
11 assaulting the employer; which was not true
12 because we have actually investigated and we're
13 still working on it, where it was the other way
14 around but the worker could not communicate that
15 type of concern.

16 Now, one of the things that we've been
17 seeing that we hope to see, is an ability for
18 that type of bridge between the NYPD and the
19 immigrant community and the Latino community,
20 when it comes to that type of concerns. We
21 have -- at this moment, fortunately we have not
22 seen any complaint of immigration status being
23 that type of complaint from immigrant community.
24 But there's no question that the immigrant --
25 that the access to language has been a big

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

20

1 Proceedings

2 barrier. Not just because some of the community
3 don't speak English, but because the wide range
4 of languages as well; which includes Spanish,
5 which includes Middle Eastern languages, Asian
6 languages, as well as indigenous languages.

7 One of the things that we -- you know,
8 another example we saw, is an officer stopping a
9 young man who didn't speak Spanish or English.
10 And the officer took it as ignoring the young
11 man's request for information, which eventually
12 got a little bit tense. Fortunately, he was able
13 to resolve the situation without any type of
14 major incident. But those are the specific
15 situations what we are seeing here on this.

16 As an attorney, I try to provide them
17 as much information on their rights. But also
18 having this opportunity with this venue here, to
19 ensure that if there is any instances where there
20 is a violation of their rights, or a complaint,
21 grounds for a complaint, then I hope I can
22 provide them with concrete information that the
23 CCRB has provided me. And I hope to continue to
24 work with you, to ensure that we, the NYPD, and
25 the CCRB, and the New York City government works

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

for every New Yorker, regardless of immigration status.

So, everyone thank you so much for giving me the opportunity, and I hope to continue to work with everyone.

Thank you.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

Does anyone on the board have any questions for Mr. Vargas?

(No response.)

Thank you very much, we appreciate it.

MS. ARCHER: We have next, Michael Riley from the Staten Island Community Education Council.

MR. RILEY: Good evening, Madame Chair, thank you so much for the opportunity.

I think I have a unique perspective. I'm a Community Advocate, I'm the President with the Community Education Council, but I'm also a former New York City Police Officer. I retired as a lieutenant in the NYPD, and to be clear, I was the subject of at least five civilian complaints.

I'd like to discuss some of the things

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

22

1 Proceedings

2 that I've learned from that experience, and some
3 of the things that I've learned now as a
4 Community Advocate.

5 One of the things that we received
6 before speaking was some of the questions that we
7 would like to touch on. So, I'm going to touch
8 briefly on them and hopefully I can shed some
9 perspective.

10 One of the things that I really want
11 to touch on, is that presentation that we saw and
12 it talked about the impact of the CCRB by
13 percentage, by population. One of the things
14 that we saw in the questions here is that, the
15 120 precinct is historically the highest CCRB
16 complaint generated in Staten Island. I think
17 one of the things that needed to be added to that
18 data, is how many radio runs, calls to service,
19 those officers receive. And also the arrests
20 made in that area, because that is something that
21 plays a pivotal role throughout the City.

22 And I guarantee if you look at the
23 data across the City in all patrol boroughs, the
24 precincts with the highest activity including
25 radio runs, arrest activity, you will see higher

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

23

1 Proceedings

2 CCRB rates. That is something that I truly
3 believe in.

4 I also am curious, and I know there's
5 a push to keep track and use police officer's
6 records of CCRB's in future investigations. I
7 know there's talk about that. I also would like
8 to know if there's a recidivist list of people
9 that file CCRB's, and if they're against the same
10 officer.

11 The reason why I ask this, that
12 happened to me. I arrested an individual back in
13 1995 as a police officer in Midtown, and he was a
14 pimp. He beat up his prostitute, I arrested him
15 for assault. He filed a CCRB against me. It was
16 unsubstantiated, of course, but that's the key
17 here, unsubstantiated. That's not proven, not
18 unproven. That stayed on my record for my whole
19 career.

20 He also, less than a year later,
21 assaulted her again. I responded, he tried to
22 take my firearm, he pulled me down to the ground,
23 held me down. It was an SRO, a single room
24 occupancy in Midtown North precinct, and he was
25 swatting for my firearm. I hit his hand away,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

24

1 Proceedings

2 trying to keep it away, I could not. At one
3 point, I had to punch him in the face, I knocked
4 out two of his teeth. I was investigated by
5 CCRB, I said that in the investigation. Went all
6 through it, I had hospital report for my finger.
7 Having done that, I admitted doing it, it was
8 unsubstantiated.

9 I would like to see the CCRB gain
10 trust with the public and the NYPD by actually
11 exonerating officers when they can, and when the
12 evidence proves that. And by all means, find
13 them guilty when the evidence proves otherwise.
14 That is something that will build trust across
15 the board, and that's something that's lacking
16 right now.

17 The next thing I would like to talk
18 about real quick, is the NCO program. I think
19 it's a tremendous thing. I think it's doing a
20 great service. And listen, we didn't reinvent
21 the wheel, it was called CPOP when I was on the
22 job. But it's something now that technology's
23 enhancing. You're able to email the NCO, you're
24 able to get his phone number, because they all
25 have phones. This is a great thing for the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

25

1 Proceedings

2 community. And that's something that's going to
3 close that gap.

4 I would also like to see --

5 MS. ARCHER: Sorry, I want to interrupt
6 you.

7 For folks who might not be aware of
8 what the NCO program is, can you give two
9 sentences about that?

10 MR. RILEY: Sure, it's the Neighborhood
11 Community Officers Program. It basically assigns
12 an officer to a beat in the precinct. And they
13 cover a certain area, and they hold community
14 meetings, they respond to quality of life
15 complaints, they respond to crime complaints, all
16 things of that nature. So, they're more
17 available and there's more access to them.

18 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

19 MR. RILEY: I'm sorry, let me see.

20 The first question that was presented
21 to me and I forgot to touch on this is, "what do
22 you consider a major concern about police action
23 in your respective precinct." I'm going to talk
24 globally, not just my precinct. I live on the
25 South Shore, in the 123 precinct, but I want to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

26

1 Proceedings

2 talk globally on it.

3 I think one of the major concerns is,
4 that there's a disconnect between what's the law,
5 what's police department policy, and what's
6 public perception. Now, if we had more outreach
7 where we could give maybe dual training, have the
8 NYPD training unit and CCRB give a dual training
9 to the public, two officers. We'd actually take
10 away that disconnect a little bit. And that's
11 what it is, it's about building relationships,
12 and that's a relationship that's going to
13 actually improve things.

14 The last thing I'd like to touch on if
15 I can, is the body cameras. There's -- there's
16 going to be more officers wearing them by 2018, I
17 think it's 5000, if I'm not mistaken. There's
18 pros and cons, everybody talks about it, right?

19 Remember, police officers that are
20 going to wear these if they have a certain number
21 of years on the job, on patrol, it's going to be
22 a little different to them. I like the idea, I
23 think it holds everybody accountable, and the
24 public, the police officer as well.

25 The one thing I see is going to be a

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

27

1 Proceedings

2 challenge, is sometimes it's not going to provide
3 enough information; whether it's to clear the
4 officer or to find him guilty. The reason why
5 is, it's going to have a single lane view. You
6 won't be privy to everything around them. You
7 may hear sound, right, I'm not fully aware of the
8 cameras capacity of hearing the sound, but there
9 maybe other things. And that's the case in
10 every -- in all cases, right. There's always
11 some other issues that maybe there, but I think
12 it's something that's going to help the
13 community.

14 I'm sorry if I was a little long
15 winded, but thank you so much.

16 MS. ARCHER: Just very quickly, in
17 response to two of your questions or at least the
18 question, an issue that you raised.

19 In terms of civilian complaint CCRB
20 activity, that is included when we receive a
21 report for a specific complaint, that particular
22 civilian's CCRB history is included. So, that
23 information is provided.

24 And in terms of exonerations, we do
25 have a category where we can exonerate officer'

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

28

1 Proceedings

2 of allegations against them. In August of 2017,
3 at that point in the year, we had 19 percent of
4 the cases that we did a full investigation were
5 exonerated. And year to date, this year,
6 18 percent have been exonerated.

7 So, it is an option for members of the
8 board, and something that they do utilize. But I
9 appreciate you raising that issue, because it is
10 important that we accurately assess what's going
11 on in those cases. And if the facts indicate it,
12 there should be an exoneration.

13 Thank you.

14 MR. RILEY: Thank you.

15 MS. ARCHER: Does anyone else on the
16 board have any questions?

17 Yes, Mr. Siegal.

18 MR. SIEGAL: Just a follow-up on that.

19 We get not only a report of prior CCRB
20 complaints filed by that complainant, but we do
21 also get a report of prior CCRB complaints filed
22 against the officers involved in the case.

23 And I think anybody whose read the
24 volume of cases that we all read regularly, would
25 recognize that most police officers, particularly

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

29

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

if they've been on the job a number of years, have some CCRB complaints. And that most police officers most of the time, they're not substantiated complaints. And the existence of a complaint alone against a police officer, doesn't say anything other than the fact that they're on the job.

You have to analyze what those are, if there are trends, the same way you have to analyze for a complainant if there are trends, they make the same kinds of reports against the same officer or whatnot. So, we do see the full picture and it's important.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

MR. RILEY: Can I make one more comment?

See, that's something that the public and the police need to know. So, that's something that can come out of a joint meeting, and just -- I think it will be great.

Thank you.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

Next I'm going to invite Sherise Lewis from NYCHA South Beach Houses.

MS. LEWIS: Good evening, thank you for

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

30

1 Proceedings

2 the time to speak.

3 As the Resident Leader for South Beach
4 Houses for the last 17 years and one of NYCHA's
5 youngest president's, I see the tremendous change
6 in the police department. However, South Beach
7 is one of the top development's in Staten Island.
8 And as a president, we have an existent
9 relationship with the police department, the 120,
10 the 122, the 123, and the 121.

11 We have regular meetings with them,
12 with our chair, and the president's within Staten
13 Island, which is nine presidents. And we come
14 together collectively to assure quality of life,
15 like the NCO program. I think it's a tremendous
16 program. I have a rapport with the two officer's,
17 Siceliano and Terratto. I am on the 122 police
18 task force with Chief Delatory.

19 Touching back on what this young man
20 said about the education and knowing the police
21 and understanding police. Y'all have a good
22 program called The Police Citizens Academy, which
23 all nine presidents became police citizens; you
24 know, we did the training and we got to
25 understand how they train the police officers,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

31

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

and all aspects from undercover to the FBI; we understood how their way of thinking and how they interact with the community as a whole. And it's free. And I think that everyone should take it, to understand the relationship and what the police have to deal with on a day-to-day basis, whether they're good cops or they're bad cops.

My two NCO officer's, I have their number, I have their -- I call them constantly, they're on my speed dial. They come, they interact with the community, they let me know that they're there, they go to the community center, they interact with the children, they're at every meeting that I have, every event that I have. And it's just like from years ago when it was cops and kids.

We appreciate them, they handle our quality of life. The crime rate, which we don't really have a high crime rate in the South Beach Houses, but they're there. They make their presence known and we appreciate that. So, you know, on the South Beach side -- because I have a fellow president here from the Barry Houses as well -- we just, you know, we interact with the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

32

1 Proceedings

2 police in a good level. You know, we call them
3 constantly, you know, we speak and we try to come
4 to resolutions on all aspects of Staten Island.

5 I'm on the -- what's being considered
6 the East side, the East Shore, as opposed to the
7 North Shore. I've heard stories of the 120 and
8 the constant complaints that they get from the
9 CCRB. And I'm not really here to deliberate
10 about that, because I don't live on that side.

11 I know that the officer's that I deal
12 with on a day-to-day basis, Captain Larsen and
13 all the other team of the 120. As a president
14 I'm well respected, and you know, they're always
15 there for us. So, that's all I really have to
16 say.

17 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

18 Does anyone have questions for
19 Ms. Lewis?

20 (No response.)

21 MS. ARCHER: Thank you for speaking with
22 us.

23 Next I have Vincent Gregnoni from
24 Council member Debbie Rose's office.

25 MR. GREGNONI: Just briefly, I know the

1 Proceedings

2 Councilwoman wants to thank you for coming to
3 Staten Island.

4 Under your leadership, the CCRB has
5 recognized the need to make this board more
6 available to all New Yorker's, regardless of
7 location, and your presence here is a reflection
8 of that.

9 Another reflection of that commitment,
10 is your presence every month in our district
11 office. As Keith mentioned earlier, I believe
12 it's the third Thursday of every month, you're
13 present in our office from 4 to 7 p.m. So, I
14 encourage everybody here in attendance, to pick
15 up a flier, share with your friends. Just be
16 sure to call our office before, if you intend to
17 come and take advantage of that.

18 I would briefly add, that the
19 Councilwoman is also a big fan of the NCO
20 program. We see the NCO's, we work with them
21 regularly. And Ms. Lewis's comments were an
22 excellent illustration of that.

23 Finally, the Councilwoman believes
24 that our common goal should be reaching a point
25 where both residents of the City and NYPD see the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

34

1 Proceedings

2 CCRB as an institution that benefits all. And
3 when we reach that point, we've reached our goal.

4 Thank you.

5 MS. ARCHER: Thank you, and thank you for
6 partnering with us to make it easier to engage
7 with the community. We appreciate that.

8 MR. GREGNONI: We're very happy to make
9 that resource available.

10 Thank you.

11 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

12 And then I have Pat Russo from Cops
13 and Kids.

14 MR. RUSSO: Madame Chair.

15 MS. ARCHER: Hello.

16 MR. RUSSO: I am a retired NYPD Sergeant.
17 I also currently own a business in Flatbush,
18 Brooklyn, called Geoff Toy's, and we deliver to
19 all the schools in Staten Island, all the food.
20 And I'll take credit for delivering it, but I
21 don't cook it.

22 And probably my most important job and
23 why I'm here, is I'm the Director of the Atlas
24 Cops and Kid's Boxing Program. We have a program
25 at 140 Park Hill Avenue, right here in the Park

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

35

1 Proceedings

2 Hill Houses. And we have a program in the Barry
3 Houses.

4 Both programs are free for kids 12 to
5 21 years-old. They are run by coaches that we
6 pay, and it's sponsored by the Atlas Foundation
7 and the NYPD Boxing Program. Whenever you see o
8 Facebook or any of the social media outlets, cops
9 boxing each other, all that money is going to the
10 kids. So, that's cops fighting for kids.

11 And another reason why I agreed to
12 come here and speak, is my son is an NYPD Cadet.
13 And I'm nervous about him coming on the job in
14 the current atmosphere. And I was an original
15 CPOP cop in the 72 precinct. I think it's a
16 wonderful program. And I think the redeployment
17 of the NCO program, I think, is a fantastic idea.

18 And like Michael said, I think that if
19 they're going to be effective, they need to have
20 knowledge because knowledge is power, especially
21 in a police officer's hand. A police officer
22 needs to be able to go after the right people.

23 And I'll just go back to my experience
24 as a CPOP officer. We were told go out, meet
25 with the community, find out what the problems

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

36

1 Proceedings

2 were in that were facing that community. I was
3 in Sunset Park, Brooklyn. The problems that were
4 faced in that community were drugs, gangs. And
5 what the parents told me when we met with them,
6 because we were told, go to the community, meet
7 with the them, find out what the problems were,
8 work together, collaborate, solve their problems.

9 The problems in that community were
10 there was no programs for the kids to get the
11 kids off the street, a program that's going to
12 attract the kids. And you know what, at the time
13 I joined the NYPD boxing team, and I said "boxing
14 is going to get to a kid that wanted to be a
15 Latin King, that wanted to be a Blood, that
16 wanted to be a Crip." And I said, "I fell in
17 love with the sport and I think it would work."

18 We opened the gym in the precinct, and
19 that was 30 years ago and we're still going
20 strong today. We had a couple of kids from this
21 school here, one was 2012, Olympian Marcus Brown.
22 One kid just got a full ride to Dickerson
23 College, \$200,000, and he was also a Golden Glove
24 champion. I have a letter that he wrote, that I
25 left in the back. And everybody, please, pick it

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

37

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

up if you want some great reading, something that's going to make you feel good and it's going to bring a tear to your eye.

It's about a kid that came from this school, came from nothing. His parents were addicts, his brother was incarcerated numerous times. He said that's not going to be me. He made the choice in his life to go in the right direction.

And that came from cops, cops putting money together to open those programs. And I think the community needs to know that, that the cops are there for them. And there were bad people in the community, but it's probably one percent, like there are one percent bad cops in the police department; which is why the CCRB is necessary, which is why narcotics is necessary, which is why internal affairs is necessary.

We need to go after the bad people and we need -- we can't demonize cops because they're effective. When cops are effective, bad guys know how to get to those effective cops. They know how to put civilian complaints in, because I was victim of civilian complaints because in the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

38

1 Proceedings

2 72 we were effective, we went after the right
3 people, we worked our way up the chain ladders,
4 we shutdown drug locations.

5 But they use that -- they use you as a
6 tool sometimes, to try to get a cop off a beat
7 and get a cop out of the system or have a cop
8 transferred, and you need to be aware of that.

9 You need to also go after these people
10 that put false civilian complaints, they need to
11 be held accountable. If somebody puts a false
12 civilian complaint in and it can be proven, there
13 needs to be some kind of repercussions.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

16 And thank you, specifically, for the
17 work that you're doing with the children in our
18 community. We greatly appreciate --

19 MR. RUSSO: I also have applications, if
20 you have kids that want to join the program, and
21 the key word, it's is free. There's nothing free
22 in this City.

23 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

24 Does anyone else have any comments?

25 (No response.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

39

1 Proceedings

2 MS. ARCHER: Thank you very much for
3 coming and for participating.

4 MR. RUSSO: Thank you.

5 MS. ARCHER: I want to acknowledge that
6 we've joined by Adrian Kelton from the office of
7 Public Advocate Leticia James. And we've also
8 been joined by Jason Cohen, Assistant District
9 Attorney from Richmond County DA's office.

10 In addition, we've had two board
11 members join us.

12 If they could quickly introduce
13 yourselves.

14 MR. DAVIE: Hi, I'm Fred Davies.

15 MR. PUMA: Joseph Puma.

16 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

17 So, now we're going to turn to public
18 comments, for those of you who have signed up and
19 want to say something to the board. If you
20 haven't signed up, please feel free to talk, but
21 I'm going to call from the list first.

22 MR. DARCHE: Madame Chair, can I --

23 MS. ARCHER: Yes.

24 MR. DARCHE: I just want to tell people
25 that, we have two investigators here. If there

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

40

1 Proceedings

2 is anyone who has an issue, that they want to
3 file a complaint, they're in the back. Their
4 hands are up right there, Mack and Greg.

5 So, if anyone has a complaint that
6 they would just wish to file, they're in the
7 back.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. ARCHER: So, we have quite a few
10 people who have signed up to speak. And to make
11 sure that we get to as many people as possible,
12 I'm going to ask you to try to limit your remarks
13 to two minutes, if you can.

14 And first we have, Wayne McDoogal.

15 Good evening.

16 MR. MCDOOGAL: Good evening.

17 My name is Wayne McDoogal. I am
18 representing the Mount Sinai United Christian
19 Church. Our Senior Pastor is
20 Dr. Richard A. Brown couldn't be here today.

21 But I, you know, wear a lot of hats.
22 I'm the -- first of all I'm a Community Leader, a
23 Community Activist, a Community Organizer, and
24 I'm the Program Director for the Jersey City
25 Merchant's Association, which is a newly started

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

41

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

association in the Jersey City area for the
merchants.

And I'm also a Community Partner and a
Police Department Liaison. I was there in the
beginning when the Community Partnership Program
started in the 120 precinct. Prior to that, we
really didn't have a relationship in our
community with the police department. So, now we
have that relationship.

So, one of the things I always try to
be proactive. So, the things I'm out in the
community all the time. I walk the streets, you
know, my reputation in the community is, you
know, is very well and impeccable in terms of
having a relationship with the people on the
streets, with the police department, the
merchants and so on.

But the thing is I try to be proactive
to try to prevent incidents. So, if there's
officers who -- we have a lot of officers
sometimes who'll come in different squads from
different boroughs, that are not from Staten
Island. They may come up into a barbershop or a
business, and they may run up in there looking

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

42

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

for -- have you seen this guy, but they're going through, they're going in bathroom, they're opening up doors, they're not supposed to be doing that.

So, that's the kind of thing I don't want. I want community policing, but I don't want harassment. I don't want people -- you know, officers come in the community and, you know, just harassing people in the community. Everybody in the community is not a criminal, they're not there to commit crimes and so on or whatever.

So, I try to do community policing without some of the other stuff. So far we've been pretty successful. Our crime rate has come down in the New Brighton area, and our relationship with the police is very open. So, we can go -- I can go there if I have an issues in the community with the police, and prevent certain things for them, and they're very responsive to the things I have to say.

so, That's one of the things I really have to say. We don't really have an incident, so I'm really glad of that, and that's directly

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

43

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

responsible for the relationship that we now have
with our precinct. So, that's all I want to say.

Thank you so much.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you very much.

I have Louis Clinton, Sherise?

MS. LEWIS: I went.

MS. ARCHER: Oh, that was you, okay,
great.

Pat Rizzo?

MR. EASON: He spoke.

MR. RUSSO: That was me.

MS. ARCHER: That was you, okay.

We had him.

Michael Howell?

(No response.)

MS. ARCHER: No.

Tristan Sharpe?

MR. SHARPE: Good evening.

THE BOARD: Good evening.

MS. ARCHER: Hello.

MR. SHARPE: As you're aware, my name is
Tristan Sharpe. I'm actually a business owner
that resides in Staten Island. The business is
KTR Management., along with my fiancée, she has a

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

44

1 Proceedings

2 business as well, LaShon Cake Designs.

3 We are residents of this beautiful
4 borough. We've been here for a long time.
5 However, I seen one of the questions and it was
6 regarding the body cameras for the officers. And
7 I think that's something that is very important,
8 in fact, maybe even imperative for them to
9 actually have.

10 The only thing that I'm actually
11 questioning, is the fact that they're able to
12 turn it off and turn it on whenever they feel,
13 they have that leisure. And I think that right
14 there is something that's questionable, because
15 if we were able to see what transpires, what
16 happens from the second something happens to the
17 actual ending, there would be no controversy.
18 There would be anything -- no accusation of that
19 nature. And I also think it would be good if the
20 public had some type of access to it, to where
21 they can actually see it and view it as well.

22 You know, I was actually talking to
23 the president of my company where I work, I work
24 on Wall Street. And we was conversing about this
25 matter. I think a lot of times, the problem is

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

45

1 Proceedings

2 people stereotype too much. There's no -- not
3 every cop is a bad cop, understand. Not every
4 black guy is a thug or a gangster. Not every
5 Spanish guy or Mexican is illegal. You know, we
6 tend to look at people and automatically become
7 judgmental, which within us we have to fix first.

8 You know, these officers are coming
9 out here, they're putting their life on the line,
10 and they're doing what they have to do to protect
11 the community, which is something we do as well.

12 For instance, my business KTR and also
13 LaShon Cake Designs, we just had a school supply
14 giveaway for the community on Saturday. It
15 turned out beautiful, you know, the kids that
16 were in need they loved it, they needed it, cool.
17 However, when the officers showed up, it was a
18 problem. You know, they felt that seeing a bunch
19 of people together automatically it was a bad
20 thing, not realizing the 20 plus kids that were
21 there having fun, you know. So, sometimes we
22 have to change within ourselves in order to
23 change everything else.

24 But as far as the body cameras, I do
25 think it's important because then we can

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

46

1 Proceedings

2 visualize and actually see what's happening.

3 From the time of a traffic stop to a point of

4 arrest, whatever the case maybe. That way you

5 can weed out all the racist comments, or all the

6 bad cop comments, or you know, things of that

7 nature.

8 You know, us as Staten Islander's,

9 that's what I like to call them, we just want to

10 protect the community. Also protect the ones

11 that actually care about the community. A lot of

12 things have happened, a lot of things shouldn't

13 have happened, but at the end of the day we have

14 to come together in order to prosper.

15 You know, KTR Management, we have an

16 actual slogan that we say, if you win, I win, and

17 then we'll win together. We can't win together

18 if we're not working together. I think that's

19 all I really have to say.

20 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

21 MR. SHARPE: Thank you.

22 MS. ARCHER: You raised issues about body

23 worn cameras, and we had another speaker raise

24 issues about body worn cameras.

25 So, I think our Executive Director can

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

47

1 Proceedings

2 speak a little bit about the NYPD's policy.

3 MR. DARCHE: So, one of the things about
4 the body worn camera program is, it is cause the
5 department is trying to balance people's privacy
6 concerns with the need of the community to have a
7 record of police/civilian interactions. So, the
8 department's policies is trying to balance those
9 two competing interests.

10 There are strict rules about when an
11 officer can and must turn on and must turn off
12 their camera. We've -- it's just the beginning
13 of the program. We've seen instances where we'll
14 get video from a situation and there might be
15 eight or nine officer's in a situation. And
16 you'll have one officer leave their camera on
17 during the whole time, and another officer is
18 turning their camera on and off, and one
19 officer's camera isn't working.

20 So, these are things that we're going
21 do monitor and we're going to watch as this
22 progresses and as it develops. And just to, you
23 know, now with memo books, officer's are -- we
24 know when officer's isn't using -- following the
25 proper procedure for keeping their memo book or

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

48

1 Proceedings

2 filing a stop and frisk form, we'll know if
3 someone isn't using their body worn camera
4 properly.

5 MR. SHARPE: Awesome, I mean, you raise a
6 good point. I mean privacy is very important,
7 you know.

8 But being a person from Staten Island
9 and actually seeing what has happened with NYPD.
10 There's plenty of time where, there'll be an
11 excuse for certain things and it really turns out
12 to be nothing and it's borderline harassment.

13 So, if like for instance the cops say
14 it's a stop sign the guy blew. Okay, cool, if
15 you go to pull him over, the camera's on, right.
16 That way, whatever's happening in transition
17 between the two, there's no foul play, the
18 cameras on. The officer can do whatever he has
19 to do, everybody's safe. But if there's a point
20 where he can just turn it off or her turn it off
21 or turn it on, then we'll never actually know
22 what truly happened or what was going on between
23 the officer and the civilian.

24 So, I think it's something that's good
25 for both sides. It's safety for them and safety

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

49

1 Proceedings

2 for the community, for the civilians, because now
3 we actually can see it, it's recorded, it's
4 there, it's not hearsay, you know.

5 Plenty of times, like I said, there's
6 plenty of times the officer's they'll pull up on
7 the scene or whatever the case maybe. They see
8 what's going on, but through past situations or
9 just personal feelings, things happen. So, to be
10 able to monitor and record the actual things that
11 the officers is able to do would be great. It's
12 just, I don't know if they should have the
13 control of off and on, you know but.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

16 Does anyone else on the board have a
17 question or a comment?

18 MR. SHARPE: I mean, be aware, this
19 avoids police brutality, this avoids "oh, he had
20 gun but it's really a phone," this avoids so
21 much, you know. So, to be able to monitor and
22 record would be great.

23 Thank you.

24 MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

25 Michelle Howell?

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

50

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

(No response.)

MS. ARCHER: Shanell Matthews?

MS. MATTHEWS: Hello, how are you doing?

My name is Shanell Matthews and I'm here because June the 30th my son passed away. He was shot and he was killed.

And the reason why I came here is because I wanted to speak out and I wanted to seek for help. Because I feel like, I've been living here for ten years and this is the first borough that I ever lived in that I feel that there is no help with the community, not only the community but with the police.

And I've been going to them asking them for help numerous times, and I have not gotten any support at all. So, that's why I'm here, to get the support that I need and the justice that I need, the real justice that I need for my son. Because I feel like I'm not.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you.

We're very sorry to hear about your loss. If we can help you, we certainly want to be able to help you. We have some investigators in the back -- just raise your hand -- so if you

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

51

1 Proceedings

2 can stop over there and speak with them, and they
3 can be the first stop to see if there's something
4 that we can do to help you.

5 MS. MATTHEWS: Okay, thank you.

6 MS. ARCHER: Okay, thank you.

7 Lenora Matthews?

8 MS. MATTHEWS: She's with me.

9 MS. ARCHER: Okay.

10 Imam Abdul Shareef?

11 MR. SHAREEF: Good evening.

12 THE BOARD: Good evening.

13 MR. SHAREEF: First and foremost, I'd
14 like to express appreciation for being able to be
15 here.

16 MR. DARCHE: Imam, sir, can you pick up
17 the -- thank you.

18 MR. SHAREEF: Express appreciation for
19 being able to be here.

20 I'll try to keep it brief. I'm not a
21 Staten Islander, and most people that I know that
22 roll up their sleeves and put in the work on
23 Staten Island, come from the other five boroughs
24 or New Jersey.

25 I believe that there is a disconnect,

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

52

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

that was stated earlier. When I first came and I looked at the audience, and I saw that there is a disproportionate cultural representation. Now the board, you can't bring everybody in, I guess that's partially my job, our jobs, organizations. But these same youth and people that are targeted are not here to listen to it. I think that's very important.

We have a saying in my organization, which is Betajumi House of Community, if the people can't come to you, you go to the people. In my opinion, this is the same song. We get new representations, we hold them accountable, let's hold them accountable, political, et cetera. But it's the same thing over again.

I too lost a son, shot in the back, 2000. But hey, it's the nature of the beast. The people that should be here, I'm praying that maybe one day, one day this council can engage them as well, will be here.

It's very -- I mean, the police department, we work well with the 120, the 122, the 123, the 345 and 567, we work good with them. But that's not the issue, that's not the problem.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

53

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

In my opinion, the problem is the officers or the police that are racist. Now, sometimes it might not be race, it might just be one person don't like another person. But they just happen to be from two different tribes, because it's only one race, the human race.

But there is a prejudice that permeates throughout our community. And the officer's some of them that are not trained, it's a occupation so the trust is not there with the common folk. My son, my grandson, there's a trust that must be developed. It's a good thing to have the community officers -- I mean, if somebody is coming through your window, who are you going to call, you're going to call the police. And we look to be protected by our law enforcement.

I believe that this board has the greatest of intentions, the best of intentions, and I commend you for it. I also believe that everyone here is interested into bettering our community. As in South Beach Community Center, our organization went there and had a -- Sherise is very commendable.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

54

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

But we need to come together, I think that's one of the things, God consciousness -- I'm going to tell you about God, right. Because we have to have something that's greater than ourselves. With everything that's going on the Florida and the hurricanes and all the things. People having loved ones in the south and Puerto Rico, there's a lot of things. God is talking, are we listening?

We need to have representation, we need to have a communication between not just the police force and the community people, but the organizations. We need to address the racism, we need to address that, because until we do, we'll have Eric Garner's murderers saying "oh well, you did not substantiate it." We'll have people, police doing things, where other officers who are not like that hands are tied. Because if they report it, then they'll know, they'll get on the blacklist.

So, the police have to police each other. See something, say something, yes. If my partner's doing something that I know it's not within his job description or her job

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

55

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

description, it's my duty to say something, if not do something, because everyone has a command.

And I pray everyday that our officer's that are serving our community have safe tours, go home safely, because they're human beings and they want to get back to their families and do their job just like anybody else. But I also pray that my child doesn't get shot in the back because he's misinterpreted, or his movements are misinterpreted. And I pray that he doesn't do anything in order warrant a confrontation.

I do believe that the police cameras, I think that was a good idea to it's developmental. And I believe that it's good that if the officer have a little less control of the rules and regulations, are a little less stringent to where the officer's can cut it off at random or if it fits a certain criteria.

I want to just leave with this part, because I don't want to be too loquacious. I was asked one day, what is greatest room that you can think of? It was raining that day and I was going to the store for something or another. And it took me a minute, and he says I'm not going to

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

56

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

tax you. The greatest room that you can think of, is the room for improvement.

Thank you.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you very much for your comments.

Next, I apologize if I mispronounce this last name, Jennifer Gray Brumskein?

MS. BRUMSKEIN: Good evening, everyone.

THE BOARD: Good evening.

MS. BRUMSKEIN: My name is Jennifer Gray Brumskein. I'm an African, originally from Liberia.

We are the largest African community on Staten Island, and the second to the largest African community in New York City next to the Bronx. We are the new emerging community in New York City, the second largest immigrant population in the City, and the most educated immigrant in the United States today, African immigrants.

We bring with us our culture and our way of life. And we look forward to intertwine our culture with the culture on Staten Island, Brooklyn, Bronx, Manhattan, and Long Island.

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

57

1 Proceedings

2 In order for us to do that, we all
3 need to adapt, including the Civilian Complaint
4 Review Board, the police, the DA's office and the
5 justice system. So, if we can do that, then we
6 will make progress.

7 My concern as an immigrant looking
8 from outside, based on my past experiences on
9 Staten Island and New York City. Since I
10 arrived, I have spent most of my adult life in
11 the City. And I have observed sometimes from an
12 emotional perspective, and sometimes from a
13 critical perspective. So, what I will be
14 speaking on today will be both emotional and both
15 critical. So -- and also, I will be speaking on
16 based on my past experiences as an African
17 immigrant.

18 I was contacted by the Civilian
19 Complaint Review Board, and I say I was going to
20 be here. So, I kept my word, I'm here, and I
21 said I was going to talk.

22 We cannot continue to do things the
23 same old way and we expect change. As human
24 being, we go through different stages of our
25 lives. After every ten, 20 years as human

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

58

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

beings, we change and we adapt. There's no reason why New York City cannot change and adapt, in terms of the racial disparity.

In order for us to do that, we have to approach it, not by town hall meeting, we have to approach it through dialogues. We have to listen to one another, listen to what we agree on, what we disagree on, and cross out. Look at the complex brain that make all the analysis. The complex brain has been pushing things forward to us in our community. Now, it's time for us to be more inclusive, take the simple brain, take the complex brain, and we engage this problem.

We have a problem with racial disparity. I'm not going to say racism, because you're so used to hearing it, that people get emotional, and it's so sensitive, that no one wants to take about it. The issue we have in this City is the racial disparity on so many different levels. Don't just look at the police, it comes from the different agencies, from all the way Washington, DC.

So, if we're going to approach policing in our community, we also need to look

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

at the Justice Department, look at the Board of Education, look at all the different agencies, so that we can tackle this problem. And we need to have a dialogue, not complaints.

I told the people from the Complaint Review Board, I don't want to approach this as a complaint. Let's look at it from a holistic perspective. What has worked in the past, why it's not working?

In order for us to look forward, we as people, leaders, policymakers, youth, our kids, the parents, we need to change our behavior as human beings. We have to be more human to one another. The police need to change their behavior towards the community of color.

You can put all the ideas together, you can bring all the data in front of me today. From my experience on Park Hill, it has more to do with policing my community, engaging me, and being more sensitive to my culture, my way of life. That's the only way we're going to solve the problem, okay.

There's an issue that's going on, we have all the complaints. Secondly, you're going

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

to take all this complaints, you don't have the power to prosecute, you're going to give it to the commissioner, who's going to make a decision.

So, it's just a waste of our time.

Let's look at how you're engaging us, how you're going to do outreach, and how we can find a solution. It's not going to happen overnight.

If you have to engage it, it has to be a process from today, to three months, this is what we're going to do. And as we move along, we look at what is working and what is not working.

So, I'm here today to talk about policing in my community. We're going to work with the 120. Secondly, don't send the bad cops that have ethical problems, that have disciplinary problems to the 120. I was looking at the statistics from 2014, you took all the bad cops from all the different boroughs and send them here.

Just like you have a job, you have what they call a formal review. The Civilian Complaint Review Board should have a preliminary review system for those police are policing the different communities. Make comparative

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

61

1 Proceedings

2 analysis. How the police that's policing the
3 people in Titonville compared to the police
4 policing the police -- the community on Park
5 Hill. You will see.

6 Yesterday there was a incident that
7 happened. I was shocked to see the white kids
8 sitting all on the police car from the 121 and
9 all of them were smoking, having nice
10 conversation. I'm like I sit there for three
11 hours watching the police. I said, "oh, wow,
12 they have a human side." I would love to see
13 this human side on Park Hill, and it will happen.

14 But if you're willing to be truthful
15 to yourself and truthful to the issue that is at
16 hand. Stop putting cosmetic solutions to the
17 issue. I'm a woman, if I want to look good, I
18 put my makeup on, it look so nice. I didn't wear
19 no makeup today. But if I were to wear my makeup
20 and you see me I look so different. Stop putting
21 cosmetic solutions to the racial disparity in
22 this City. Let's confront it, let's be truthful
23 to ourselves, let's be honest and we all, we
24 all -- if the child in Titonville has an issue
25 with drugs, there's no reason why that child

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

62

1 Proceedings

2 issue with drugs become a social and
3 psychological problem compared to the child on
4 Park Hill having an issue with opium. What's the
5 difference in opium and pills, that's the same
6 drugs.

7 When you start classifying the
8 different kinds of criminal's activities based on
9 racial division, we will never have the solution
10 to the problem. The Civilian Complaint Review
11 Board would not be effective to the cops, they
12 would not be effective to the community of color,
13 and they would not be effective to the City.

14 Before I sit down, I will give you an
15 example. We had a crisis in the City, it could
16 have locked this whole City down. But the
17 Commissioner of Health, you know what she did,
18 she said "look, I'm going to approach it from a
19 practical perspective," when we met with her.
20 She knew Ebola crisis, I don't know if you all
21 heard the Ebola crisis. You know what the
22 Commissioner of Health did, she came and sat with
23 the African community. She didn't come and force
24 things down our throat. We told her "no, you
25 deal with the most educated immigrant population

1 Proceedings

2 in the United States of America. The highest
3 rate of high school graduate, the highest level
4 of ivy graduates from Ivy Leagues. So, when you
5 coming to us, come with your research. Don't
6 approach us like we can't read, we have complex
7 brains among us. We can make complex analysis.
8 We can look at the data.

9 You think I didn't look at the data
10 when I was coming here today? I looked at the
11 data from the 120 and it's a mess. Take all the
12 bad cops and throw it to us, you don't discipline
13 them, nothing. Then you say "oh, I'm going to
14 give them a two day or take a few days from their
15 leave," no.

16 Let us look at what the Health
17 Department did, and they did an excellent job
18 when we were in a state of crisis in the City.
19 The Health Department reached out to the African
20 community in the Bronx, in Staten Island. She
21 sent her people, we sat down, we had a dialogue.
22 CDC, CDC sat with the Africans. We had a
23 dialogue and we put a road map together on how to
24 deal with the crisis in New York City.

25 Today, New York City road map that

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

they put together is being used by other agencies, Homeland Security is using it. It was just this single lady, because she was so inclusive in tackling the Ebola crisis in New York City. We were able to calm the situation down.

The issue is with the police and race. The only way we're going tackle it, we must first of all identify the solution; not from a racial perspective, but from the actual issue. What is the issue, one of the main issue is the police must change their behavior. The command comes from the Commissioner, to the Borough Commander, to the Inspector of the precinct, and down to the patrol man on the street, they're in uniform.

The sole purpose of the police is to protect and serve the community. We got to come up with a guideline. What is a priority to us, one, two, three, four, five, six. That would be a recommendation to the police department. But you're not going to do it by yourself. You're going to have the commissioner sitting there, say these are the problems. Let's prioritize it, how can we address this racial issue and be more

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

65

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

inclusive. And I think if you do that, or sit with the -- involve the commissioner of the Health Department in it. She has a solution, grassroots.

Don't send it out. Grassroots means, take the drug dealer from the street, take the -- open -- the weed smoker, the teenager that smoke the weed, take the child from Titonville that is on drugs, opium overdose. Bring every fiber of your community to the table to have a solution.

Trust me, if you do that within the next six months, New York City, what you put together to address the racial disparity in New York City. It won't only be used in New York City, in the State of New York. It will be used as a pilot project in every other society, big metropolitan City, we have the solution to the problems that are happening in the inner City with the police. Don't do it, another 50 years, we'll still be talking about racial disparity.

Before I take my seat, as always, even though we have all the racial issues here, but Staten Island is a place. If you look at the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

66

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

2010 census, we have more increase in different immigrant communities than any other City, any other borough in the City. The demographic, we have the largest increase in population as of 2010. So, you have people from all walks of life.

I don't know if anyone of you, I'm inviting everyone of you on the Civilian Complaint Review Board to take the Staten Island Ferry. You want to see the melting pot in New York City, ride the ferry. I don't know how many of you rode the ferry to come here, but please ride the ferry before the holiday. You will see, Staten Island is a place where any pilot project you put in place addressing racial issue, it will come to focus.

We had a meeting, I must also give the 120 credit. Because we had a meeting last week. They're going to meet with us, but when they meet with us we're going to give them a demand. And when I leave, a copy of that demand from the African community to have, we start with the Department of Health. But that demand will be inclusive of the community of color, not just the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

67

1 Proceedings

2 African. But the racial issue is not just an
3 African, we just coming. It's been here 100 of
4 years.

5 But we have to find a solution,
6 because we continue to address this racial issue
7 the same way we addressing the issue in the 60's
8 and the 70's. We in 2017, the way we do things
9 has changed. We as policymakers of New York
10 City, we need to change the way we solve
11 problems.

12 MS. ARCHER: Thank you very much, we
13 appreciate your comments.

14 MS. RUMSTEIN: I have more time or I have
15 to take my seat?

16 MS. ARCHER: Well, we're asking people to
17 try to limit it two minutes.

18 MS. RUMSTEIN: Okay, I will limit it now
19 to two minutes.

20 MS. ARCHER: No, I would think you've
21 already used your two minutes.

22 MS. BRUMSKEIN: Okay.

23 MS. ARCHER: Thank you though.

24 Next we have Laura Cavaliere.

25 MS. CAVALIERE: Good evening, I'm

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

68

1 Proceedings

2 Laura Cavaliere. This place brings back memories
3 as PTA president, 2014.

4 Okay, I am Laura Cavaliere. I am
5 dyslexic. I share dyslexia awareness. I know the
6 great hardship of dyslexics dropping out, GED,
7 all right. Most dyslexics, do drop out of
8 school. So, what is the situation that happens
9 to us after school, is probably a life of crime.

10 Chuck Close, international dyslexic
11 artist and film said, "that if it wasn't for art,
12 I would have never made it to Yale, but I would
13 have went to jail." And many of the dyslexics
14 say that.

15 Joanne Simon, senator -- assemblywoman
16 Joanne Simon was just quoted in the Daily News, I
17 believe, September 6th or the 7th. We have now a
18 bill or a law up in New York State saying to make
19 all schools dyslexic friendly, so that dyslexic's
20 aren't dropping out and becoming a crime
21 statistic.

22 If I have anybody helping dyslexics
23 from the criminal source, know that there's many
24 of them on Rikers and in prisons. We have that
25 statistic. We built prisons based on third grade

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

69

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

reading levels.

So, just be aware that this bill is out there. It's great news. Tell the dyslexics, "don't drop out," we don't need them to be in other services that the City has to provide, like criminal systems and homeless shelters, and you can name it.

So, again, keep the dyslexics in school. Just happening now, the bill has just been signed, and the schools should be on board. Communities should get together and start helping making things dyslexic friendly.

Thank you.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you for sharing that.

So, I don't have anyone else who has signed up to speak, is that correct?

One more?

Please, just a friendly reminder that we're asking everyone to keep it to two minutes, if possible.

MR. JOHNSON: Yes, I'll try.

Simeon Johnson.

Jennifer, whom you just heard is a public relations officer in the African community

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

70

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

of Staten Island here. And it is not all bad news, I've been living in Staten Island for a long time. But most of the Staten Islanders know this neighborhood.

Since '91, you know, some of the challenges we're facing here had to deal with drugs, prostitution, and gangs. But we want to thank -- and the African community, as you know, has been working with the 120 precinct for quite a while with different groups, okay.

And the NYPD did step up, okay, and help with the issue of prostitution. You know how this neighborhood used to be, there's a few who live here, how it used to be. They did help. But the issue for all of us here had to deal with and still has to deal with trust, which I believe Imams and others have emphasized and brought alone.

And that is a common theme in our community and in the African community. The issue of trust, the issue of prejudice, and there is a loud cry -- we love the NYPD, we need them, they have helped us, we want to walk in partnership with them, you know, with all the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

71

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

issues and concerns in the neighborhood.

And a particular incident, Jennifer and myself, we're attending a meeting at the YMCA at one point a couple of months ago. And then a young cop, a rookie cop just pulled us over.

I am an episcopal priest, I am in the diocese of New York, for those of you who might have wondered why I wear this, I'm an episcopal priest, I should have said that earlier on. I've sat in on the ten churches here on Staten Island, and I'm familiar to some of you or not.

But Jennifer and I, we attend the meeting a couple of months ago. And then that area is noted for drugs and what not. So, as soon as I park my car, this young gentleman came over and said, "out of your car." I said, "what is it, did we do anything, officer?" I was very courteous to him.

He said, "well, you beat the red light -- Jennifer, do you remember that incident? He said, "well, you beat the red light." And it wasn't true. But I had to let him know that I'm a priest, I'm an episcopal priest. He said, "oh, Father, I'm sorry."

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

72

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

You see, what that does is betray the trust and responsibility that we have in our community. And people are afraid to reach out. The relationship has improved to the past 25 years or more. It's improved greatly, but we want some more of that to take place. So, at some point we'll elaborate more on that.

I didn't want to talk, I wanted to let Jennifer go. You know Jennifer, by now. But I'm going to stop here.

The issue of trust, the issue of prejudice, and cultural. Somebody mentioned about the cultural understanding in the community. That goes a long way to help understand each other.

Thank you for this meeting to understand ourselves better.

MS. ARCHER: Thank you so much.

We have no further public comments.

We do need to conduct a little piece of business before we adjourn to Executive Session, and that is to adopt our minutes from our last minute.

Do I have a motion to adopt the

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

73

1 Proceedings

2 minutes?

3 MR. EASON: So moved.

4 MS. ARCHER: Second?

5 MR. CARCATERRA: Second.

6 MS. ARCHER: All in favor?

7 (Chorus of ayes.)

8 MS. ARCHER: Any opposed?

9 (No response.)

10 MS. ARCHER: With that, can I have a
11 motion to adjourn to Executive Session?

12 MR. CARCATERRA: So moved.

13 MS. ARCHER: Second?

14 MR. DWYER: Second.

15 MS. ARCHER: All in favor?

16 (Chorus of ayes.)

17 MS. ARCHER: Before we leave, I just want
18 to again thank you all for coming out, and
19 letting your voice be heard, and contributing to
20 this meeting.

21 We really appreciate you taking your
22 time to let us know what's going on in the
23 community.

24 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
25 concluded at 8 p.m.)

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
) ss. :
COUNTY OF RICHMOND)

I, BONITA RICHARDS, a Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the within-entitled matter, and that within transcript is a true and record of such proceedings to the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage; and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 3rd of October 2017.

Bonita Richards
BONITA RICHARDS

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

| A | | |
|---|---|--|
| abandons (1) 16:18 | ago (4) 31:16 36:19 71:5,14 | attending (1) 71:4 |
| Abdul (1) 51:10 | agree (1) 58:8 | attorney (3) 17:19 20:16 39:9 |
| ability (2) 19:17 74:12 | agreed (2) 16:11 35:11 | attract (1) 36:12 |
| able (13) 20:12 24:23,24 35:22 44:11,15 49:10,11,21 50:24 51:14,19 64:6 | allegation (1) 9:15 | audience (1) 52:3 |
| above-entitled (1) 73:24 | allegations (3) 9:6,18 28:2 | August (1) 28:2 |
| absolute (1) 12:24 | alleged (1) 14:14 | authority (2) 9:21 10:5 |
| abuse (2) 9:21 10:5 | alleging (2) 5:20 9:12 | automatically (2) 45:6,19 |
| Academy (1) 30:22 | allowing (1) 8:14 | available (4) 5:12 25:17 33:6 34:9 |
| access (5) 19:6,25 25:17 28:10 44:20 | America (1) 63:2 | Avenue (2) 1:22 34:25 |
| accountable (4) 26:23 38:11 52:14 52:15 | analysis (3) 58:10 61:2 63:7 | avoids (3) 49:19,19,20 |
| accounted (1) 13:9 | Analytics (1) 12:10 | aware (7) 5:16 25:7 27:7 38:8 43:22 49:18 69:3 |
| accurately (1) 28:10 | analyze (2) 29:9,11 | awareness (1) 68:5 |
| accusation (1) 44:18 | and/or (2) 10:21 11:3 | Awesome (1) 48:5 |
| acknowledge (3) 6:19 17:3 39:5 | anxiousness (1) 18:3 | eyes (2) 73:7,16 |
| acronym (1) 9:20 | anybody (4) 11:23 28:23 55:8 68:22 | |
| act (2) 10:4,16 | apologize (1) 56:7 | B |
| Acting (3) 1:12 3:4 4:7 | applications (1) 38:19 | back (12) 5:14 23:12 30:19 35:23 36:25 40:3,7 50:25 52:17 55:7,9 68:2 |
| action (5) 7:13 9:13 17:14 25:22 74:14 | appointed (1) 5:3 | bad (12) 31:8 37:14,16,20,22 45:3 45:19 46:6 60:15,18 63:12 70:2 |
| actions (1) 10:12 | appointees (1) 11:8 | balance (2) 47:5,8 |
| Activist (1) 40:23 | appreciate (9) 7:4 21:12 28:9 31:18,22 34:7 38:18 67:13 73:21 | barbershop (1) 41:24 |
| activities (1) 62:8 | appreciation (2) 51:14,18 | barrier (1) 20:2 |
| activity (6) 12:12 14:8,11 22:24,25 27:20 | approach (6) 58:6,7,24 59:7 62:18 63:6 | Barry (3) 7:2 31:24 35:2 |
| actual (5) 19:10 44:17 46:16 49:10 64:11 | Archer (55) 1:12 3:4 4:3,7 5:10 8:16 12:6 17:2 21:8,13 25:5,18 27:16 28:15 29:15,22 32:17,21 34:5,11,15 38:15,23 39:2,5,16,23 40:9 43:5,8,13,17,21 46:20,22 49:15,24 50:3,21 51:6,9 56:5 67:12,16,20,23 69:15 72:19 73:4 73:6,8,10,13,15,17 | based (4) 57:8,16 62:8 68:25 |
| adapt (3) 57:3 58:2,3 | area (5) 22:20 25:13 41:2 42:17 71:15 | basically (1) 25:11 |
| add (1) 33:18 | arrest (2) 22:25 46:4 | basis (2) 31:7 32:12 |
| added (1) 22:17 | arrested (2) 23:12,14 | bathroom (1) 42:3 |
| addicts (1) 37:7 | arrests (1) 22:19 | Beach (7) 7:18 29:24 30:3,6 31:20 31:23 53:23 |
| addition (1) 39:10 | arrived (1) 57:10 | beast (1) 52:18 |
| address (6) 14:19 54:14,15 64:25 65:14 67:6 | art (1) 68:11 | beat (5) 23:14 25:12 38:6 71:20,22 |
| addressing (2) 66:16 67:7 | artist (1) 68:11 | beautiful (2) 44:3 45:15 |
| adjourn (3) 2:13 72:22 73:11 | Asian (1) 20:5 | becoming (1) 68:20 |
| Administrative (2) 9:8 11:10 | asked (1) 55:22 | beginning (2) 41:6 47:12 |
| admitted (1) 24:7 | asking (4) 16:7 50:15 67:16 69:20 | behavior (3) 59:13,16 64:13 |
| adopt (2) 72:23,25 | aspects (2) 31:2 32:4 | beings (3) 55:6 58:2 59:14 |
| Adrian (1) 39:6 | assault (1) 23:15 | believe (9) 23:3 33:11 51:25 53:19 53:21 55:13,15 68:17 70:17 |
| adult (1) 57:10 | assaulted (1) 23:21 | believes (1) 33:23 |
| advance (1) 6:13 | assaulting (1) 19:11 | benefits (1) 34:2 |
| advantage (1) 33:17 | assemblywoman (1) 68:15 | Berta (1) 1:6 |
| Advocate (3) 21:19 22:4 39:7 | assigns (1) 25:11 | best (2) 53:20 74:11 |
| affairs (1) 37:19 | Assistant (1) 39:8 | Betajumi (1) 52:11 |
| afraid (1) 72:4 | association (2) 40:25 41:2 | betray (1) 72:2 |
| African (14) 7:5 56:12,14,16,20 57:16 62:23 63:19 66:23 67:2,3 69:25 70:9,21 | assure (1) 30:14 | better (3) 6:3,15 72:18 |
| Africans (1) 63:22 | Atlas (2) 34:23 35:6 | bettering (1) 53:22 |
| agencies (3) 58:22 59:3 64:3 | atmosphere (1) 35:14 | big (5) 12:13 16:15 19:25 33:19 65:18 |
| agency (5) 4:25 5:18,21 9:5 18:9 | attend (1) 71:13 | bill (4) 5:4 68:18 69:3,10 |
| AGENDA (1) 2:3 | attendance (1) 33:14 | bit (4) 15:11 20:12 26:10 47:2 |
| | | black (1) 45:4 |
| | | blacklist (1) 54:21 |
| | | Blasio (1) 5:4 |
| | | blew (1) 48:14 |

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

blood (2) 36:15 74:14
board (37) 1:3 3:3,5,6,7,8,9,10,11
 3:12,13 4:6,10,14 5:23 9:5 21:9
 24:15 28:8,16 33:5 39:10,19
 43:20 49:16 51:12 52:5 53:19
 56:10 57:4,19 59:2,7 60:23 62:11
 66:10 69:11
body (7) 26:15 44:6 45:24 46:22,24
 47:4 48:3
Bonita (3) 1:16 74:7,20
book (1) 47:25
books (1) 47:23
borderline (1) 48:12
borough (7) 12:17 13:2 15:18 44:4
 50:12 64:14 66:4
boroughs (6) 13:4 15:20 22:23
 41:23 51:23 60:19
bottom (1) 12:21
boxing (5) 34:24 35:7,9 36:13,13
brain (4) 58:10,11,13,14
brains (1) 63:7
brandish (1) 10:3
breaks (4) 12:17 13:21 14:13
 15:17
bridge (1) 19:18
brief (1) 51:20
briefly (4) 12:11 22:8 32:25 33:18
Brighton (1) 42:17
bring (5) 37:4 52:5 56:22 59:18
 65:10
brings (1) 68:2
broken (1) 16:10
Bronx (4) 12:20 56:17,25 63:20
Brooklyn (5) 4:23 12:19 34:18 36:3
 56:25
brother (1) 37:7
brought (1) 70:18
Brown (2) 36:21 40:20
Brumskein (5) 56:8,9,11,12 67:22
brutality (1) 49:19
build (1) 24:14
building (1) 26:11
built (1) 68:25
bunch (1) 45:18
business (9) 2:11,12 34:17 41:25
 43:23,24 44:2 45:12 72:22

C

C (2) 74:3,3
Cadet (1) 35:12
Cake (2) 44:2 45:13
call (12) 2:4 4:4 11:13,14 31:10
 32:2 33:16 39:21 46:9 53:16,16
 60:22
called (4) 9:20 24:21 30:22 34:18
calls (1) 22:18
calm (1) 64:6

camera (6) 47:4,12,16,18,19 48:3
camera's (1) 48:15
cameras (8) 26:15 27:8 44:6 45:24
 46:23,24 48:18 55:13
capacity (1) 27:8
Captain (1) 32:12
car (3) 61:8 71:16,17
Carcatera (5) 3:5 4:12,13 73:5,12
care (1) 46:11
career (1) 23:19
case (5) 10:22 27:9 28:22 46:4
 49:7
cases (6) 9:7 16:5 27:10 28:4,11
 28:24
category (1) 27:25
cause (3) 10:8 16:2 47:4
Cavaliere (4) 67:24,25 68:2,4
CCRB (43) 2:7 4:7 5:17 8:24 9:4,7
 9:11,19 10:22 12:11,15,17,24
 13:11,14,17 14:7,20,22 15:6,8,13
 16:4,21 17:17 20:23,25 22:12,15
 23:2,15 24:5,9 26:8 27:19,22
 28:19,21 29:3 32:9 33:4 34:2
 37:17
CCRB's (3) 13:10 23:6,9
CDC (2) 63:22,22
census (1) 66:2
center (5) 8:12 14:7,10 31:14
 53:23
certain (6) 9:7 25:13 26:20 42:21
 48:11 55:19
certainly (2) 6:15 50:23
certify (2) 74:8,13
Cesar (3) 7:12 17:14,18
cetera (1) 52:15
chain (1) 38:3
chair (7) 2:5 4:7 8:6 21:16 30:12
 34:14 39:22
Chairperson (2) 1:12 3:4
challenge (1) 27:2
challenges (1) 70:7
champion (1) 36:24
change (11) 15:10 30:5 45:22,23
 57:23 58:2,3 59:13,15 64:13
 67:10
changed (1) 67:9
charged (1) 5:18
chart (5) 12:16,22 15:17 16:10,19
Chief (1) 30:18
child (5) 55:9 61:24,25 62:3 65:9
children (2) 31:14 38:17
choice (1) 37:9
Chorus (2) 73:7,16
Christian (2) 7:9 40:18
Chuck (1) 68:10
Church (3) 7:9 11:16 40:19
churches (2) 7:11 71:11

citizens (2) 30:22,23
City (41) 4:5,23 5:7,9 6:16 9:5 11:7
 11:18 20:25 21:21 22:21,23
 33:25 38:22 40:24 41:2 56:16,18
 56:19 57:9,11 58:3,20 61:22
 62:13,15,16 63:18,24,25 64:6
 65:13,15,16,18,20 66:3,4,12
 67:10 69:6
City's (2) 13:8,16
Citywide (1) 12:15
civilian (17) 1:3 4:5 5:17,19 9:4
 21:23 27:19 37:24,25 38:10,12
 48:23 57:3,18 60:22 62:10 66:9
civilian's (1) 27:22
civilians (1) 49:2
classifying (1) 62:7
clear (2) 21:22 27:3
Clinton (1) 43:6
close (3) 15:10 25:3 68:10
closed (1) 15:24
closely (1) 13:25
co-founder (1) 17:14
coaches (1) 35:5
Coalition (3) 7:11,13 17:15
code (4) 14:14,15,21,24
codes (2) 14:17 15:7
Cohen (1) 39:8
collaborate (1) 36:8
collectively (1) 30:14
College (1) 36:23
color (3) 59:16 62:12 66:25
come (24) 11:15 12:2,3,19 13:23
 17:11 29:19 30:13 31:11 32:3
 33:17 35:12 41:22,24 42:9 46:14
 51:23 52:12 54:2 62:23 63:5
 64:18 66:13,17
comes (3) 19:20 58:22 64:13
coming (12) 6:25 8:19 13:20 33:2
 35:13 39:3 45:8 53:15 63:5,10
 67:3 73:18
command (2) 55:3 64:13
Commander (1) 64:14
commend (1) 53:21
commendable (1) 53:25
comment (4) 2:9,10 29:16 49:17
comments (10) 7:22 8:3 33:21
 38:24 39:18 46:5,6 56:6 67:13
 72:20
commissioner (7) 4:14 60:4 62:17
 62:22 64:14,23 65:3
commit (1) 42:12
commitment (1) 33:9
committed (1) 9:9
common (3) 33:24 53:12 70:20
communicate (1) 19:14
communication (1) 54:12
communities (4) 6:16 60:25 66:3

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| <p>69:12 community (93) 2:9 6:2,4,8,10,19 6:20 7:6,16 8:2,3,12 17:10,21,21 18:3,8 19:19,19,23 20:2 21:14,19 21:20 22:4 25:2,11,13 27:13 31:4 31:12,13 34:7 35:25 36:2,4,6,9 37:13,15 38:18 40:22,23,23 41:4 41:6,9,13,14 42:7,9,10,11,14,20 45:11,14 46:10,11 47:6 49:2 50:13,14 52:11 53:9,14,23,23 54:13 55:5 56:14,16,17 58:12,25 59:16,20 60:14 61:4 62:12,23 63:20 64:18 65:11 66:23,25 69:25 70:9,21,21 72:4,15 73:23 company (1) 44:23 comparative (1) 60:25 compare (1) 13:5 compared (2) 61:3 62:3 competing (1) 47:9 complainant (9) 9:14 10:25 14:19 14:22 15:6,15 16:11 28:20 29:11 complainants (5) 14:16 15:21 16:4 16:7,21 complaint (30) 1:3 4:6 9:4,16 10:22 11:12 12:12 13:6,21 14:8 14:10 15:12 19:22,23 20:20,21 22:16 27:19,21 29:6 38:12 40:3,5 57:3,19 59:6,8 60:23 62:10 66:10 complaints (32) 5:19 9:12 12:15 12:17,19,24 13:10,11,15,17,19 13:23,25 14:14,20 15:8,24 16:24 21:24 25:15,15 28:20,21 29:3,5 32:8 37:24,25 38:10 59:5,25 60:2 complex (5) 58:10,11,14 63:6,7 concern (3) 19:15 25:22 57:7 concerns (6) 6:4 18:16 19:20 26:3 47:6 71:2 concluded (1) 73:25 concrete (1) 20:22 conduct (2) 10:11 72:21 confront (1) 61:22 confrontation (1) 55:12 cons (1) 26:18 consciousness (1) 54:3 consider (1) 25:22 considered (4) 9:15 10:4,16 32:5 constant (1) 32:8 constantly (2) 31:10 32:3 contact (1) 16:3 contacted (1) 57:18 continue (4) 20:23 21:5 57:22 67:6 contributing (1) 73:19 control (2) 49:13 55:16 controversy (1) 44:17 conversation (3) 6:7,12 61:10 conversing (1) 44:24 cook (1) 34:21</p> | <p>cool (2) 45:16 48:14 cop (9) 35:15 38:6,7,7 45:3,3 46:6 71:6,6 cops (20) 8:18 31:8,8,17 34:12,24 35:8,10 37:11,11,14,16,21,22,23 48:13 60:15,19 62:11 63:12 copy (3) 8:9,10 66:22 correct (1) 69:17 cosmetic (2) 61:16,21 council (8) 7:16 11:7,20 17:4 21:15 21:20 32:24 52:20 Council's (1) 11:18 Councilwoman (4) 6:23 33:2,19 33:23 Counsel (3) 4:23 5:7,9 country (1) 18:5 County (2) 39:9 74:5 couple (3) 36:20 71:5,14 course (2) 18:10 23:16 courteous (1) 71:19 cover (1) 25:13 CPOP (3) 24:21 35:15,24 create (1) 18:18 credit (3) 18:11 34:20 66:19 crime (6) 25:15 31:19,20 42:16 68:9,20 crimes (1) 42:12 criminal (3) 42:11 68:23 69:7 criminal's (1) 62:8 Crip (1) 36:16 crisis (6) 62:15,20,21 63:18,24 64:5 criteria (1) 55:19 critical (2) 57:13,15 cross (1) 58:9 cry (1) 70:23 cultural (3) 52:4 72:13,14 culture (4) 56:22,24,24 59:21 curiosity (1) 16:20 curious (1) 23:4 current (1) 35:14 currently (1) 34:17 cut (1) 55:18</p> <hr/> <p align="center">D</p> <p>D (1) 9:21 DA's (2) 39:9 57:4 DACA (1) 17:24 Daily (1) 68:16 Darce (9) 1:13 3:15 4:24,24 8:6 39:22,24 47:3 51:16 data (9) 2:8 12:8 14:15 22:18,23 59:18 63:8,9,11 date (1) 28:5 DAVIE (2) 3:9 39:14 Davies (1) 39:14 day (7) 12:5 46:13 52:20,20 55:22</p> | <p>55:23 63:14 day-to-day (2) 31:7 32:12 days (1) 63:14 DC (1) 58:23 de (1) 5:4 deal (7) 31:7 32:11 62:25 63:24 70:7,16,17 dealer (1) 65:7 Debbie (3) 6:23 11:20 32:24 Deborah (3) 1:12 3:4 4:6 deceptive (1) 14:4 decision (1) 60:4 deeper (1) 13:18 Delatory (1) 30:18 deliberate (1) 32:9 deliver (1) 34:18 delivering (1) 34:20 demand (3) 66:21,22,24 demographic (1) 66:4 demonize (1) 37:21 densely (1) 13:3 department (15) 26:5 30:6,9 37:17 41:5,9,17 47:5 52:23 59:2 63:17 63:19 64:21 65:4 66:24 department's (1) 47:8 describes (1) 9:14 description (2) 54:25 55:2 designee (4) 4:8,23 5:7,9 Designs (2) 44:2 45:13 desk (2) 8:10 11:22 detain (1) 18:13 developed (1) 53:13 development's (1) 30:7 developmental (1) 55:15 develops (1) 47:22 dial (1) 31:11 dialogue (3) 59:5 63:21,23 dialogues (1) 58:7 Dickerson (1) 36:22 difference (2) 16:15 62:5 different (16) 14:5 18:6 26:22 41:22,23 53:6 57:24 58:21,22 59:3 60:19,25 61:20 62:8 66:2 70:11 Digging (1) 13:18 diocese (1) 71:8 direction (1) 37:10 directly (1) 42:25 Director (12) 1:13 2:6 3:15 4:25 7:24 8:5,23,24 12:10 34:23 40:24 46:25 disability (1) 10:21 disagree (1) 58:9 disciplinary (1) 60:17 discipline (1) 63:12 disconnect (3) 26:4,10 51:25 discourteous (2) 10:11,12</p> |
|--|---|---|

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

discourtesy (3) 9:21 10:10,16
discuss (1) 21:25
disparity (6) 58:4,16,20 61:21
65:14,22
disproportionate (1) 52:4
dispute (2) 18:21 19:8
distinct (1) 9:15
district (2) 33:10 39:8
division (1) 62:9
doing (9) 16:6 24:7,19 38:17 42:5
45:10 50:4 54:18,24
domestic (1) 19:8
doors (1) 42:4
Dr (1) 40:20
Dream (2) 7:12 17:14
Dreyfus (1) 1:6
drop (2) 68:7 69:5
dropping (2) 68:6,20
drug (2) 38:4 65:7
drugs (7) 36:4 61:25 62:2,6 65:10
70:8 71:15
dual (2) 26:7,8
duty (1) 55:2
Dwyer (4) 3:8 4:18,18 73:14
dyslexia (1) 68:5
dyslexic (4) 68:5,10,19 69:13
dyslexic's (1) 68:19
dyslexics (6) 68:6,7,13,22 69:4,9

E

E (2) 74:3,3
E-MAIL (1) 1:24
earlier (3) 33:11 52:2 71:10
easier (1) 34:6
Eason (5) 3:7 4:15,16 43:11 73:3
East (2) 32:6,6
Eastern (1) 20:5
Ebanks (1) 8:13
Ebola (3) 62:20,21 64:5
educated (2) 56:19 62:25
education (5) 7:16 21:14,20 30:20
59:3
effective (9) 16:9 35:19 37:22,22
37:23 38:2 62:11,12,13
eight (1) 47:15
either (2) 18:14,20
elaborate (1) 72:8
email (2) 10:23 24:23
emerging (1) 56:17
emotional (3) 57:12,14 58:18
emphasized (1) 70:18
employees (1) 5:24
employer (1) 19:11
employer/employee (1) 19:8
encompass (1) 14:5
encounter (1) 9:17
encourage (1) 33:14

ended (1) 10:15
enforcement (1) 53:18
engage (4) 34:6 52:20 58:14 60:9
engagement (1) 6:5
engaging (2) 59:20 60:6
English (6) 18:22 19:2,5,6 20:3,9
enhancing (1) 24:23
ensure (2) 20:19,24
episcopal (3) 71:7,9,24
epithets (1) 10:18
Eric (1) 54:16
especially (2) 17:21 35:20
ESQ (7) 1:12,13 3:4,11,12,13,15
et (1) 52:15
ethical (1) 60:16
evaluating (1) 5:19
evening (16) 4:3,15,20 5:2,5 21:16
29:25 40:15,16 43:19,20 51:11
51:12 56:9,10 67:25
event (1) 31:15
eventually (1) 20:11
everybody (6) 26:18,23 33:14
36:25 42:11 52:5
everybody's (1) 48:19
everyday (1) 55:4
everyone's (1) 4:21
evidence (2) 24:12,13
example (6) 10:13 14:6 18:21 19:7
20:8 62:15
excellent (2) 33:22 63:17
excuse (1) 48:11
Executive (10) 1:13 2:6,13 3:15
4:25 7:24 8:5 46:25 72:22 73:11
existence (1) 29:5
existent (1) 30:8
exonerate (1) 27:25
exonerated (2) 28:5,6
exonerating (1) 24:11
exoneration (1) 28:12
exonerations (1) 27:24
expect (2) 13:13 57:23
experience (3) 22:2 35:23 59:19
experiences (2) 57:8,16
express (2) 51:14,18
eye (1) 37:4

F

F (3) 3:5 9:20 74:3
face (1) 24:3
Facebook (1) 35:8
faced (1) 36:4
facilitate (2) 6:6,12
facing (2) 36:2 70:7
FACSIMILE (1) 1:24
fact (5) 13:13 14:10 29:7 44:8,11
factors (1) 19:3
facts (1) 28:11

FADO (1) 9:20
false (2) 38:10,11
familiar (1) 71:12
families (1) 55:7
fan (1) 33:19
fantastic (1) 35:17
far (4) 13:7 14:2 42:15 45:24
Father (1) 71:25
favor (2) 73:6,15
FBI (1) 31:2
feel (6) 37:3 39:20 44:12 50:10,12
50:20
feelings (1) 49:9
fell (1) 36:16
fellow (2) 4:10 31:24
felt (1) 45:18
ferry (4) 66:11,12,13,14
fiancee (1) 43:25
fiber (1) 65:10
fighting (1) 35:10
file (4) 11:12 23:9 40:3,6
filed (6) 9:6,16 10:23 23:15 28:20
28:21
filing (1) 48:2
film (1) 68:11
Finally (2) 16:19 33:23
find (7) 15:21 24:12 27:4 35:25
36:7 60:7 67:5
findings (2) 11:5,9
finger (1) 24:6
firearm (4) 10:2,3 23:22,25
first (12) 6:22 12:22 25:20 39:21
40:14,22 45:7 50:11 51:3,13 52:2
64:9
fits (1) 55:19
five (4) 15:4 21:23 51:23 64:20
fix (1) 45:7
Flatbush (1) 34:17
flier (1) 33:15
Florida (1) 54:7
fluent (1) 18:23
focus (1) 66:17
Focusing (1) 12:16
folk (1) 53:12
folks (3) 7:3 17:12 25:7
follow (1) 15:13
follow-up (1) 28:18
followed (2) 12:19 13:25
following (1) 47:24
food (1) 34:19
force (6) 9:20,23 10:4 30:18 54:13
62:23
foremost (1) 51:13
forgot (1) 25:21
form (1) 48:2
formal (1) 60:22
former (1) 21:21

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

fortunately (2) 19:21 20:12
forward (5) 7:20,20 56:23 58:11
 59:11
foul (2) 10:10 48:17
found (1) 9:9
Foundation (1) 35:6
four (2) 9:18 64:20
Frank (2) 3:8 4:18
Fred (1) 39:14
FREDERICK (1) 3:9
free (5) 31:5 35:4 38:21,21 39:20
French (1) 5:13
friendly (3) 68:19 69:13,19
friends (1) 33:15
frisk (1) 48:2
frisks (1) 10:6
front (3) 8:10 11:22 59:18
full (4) 8:8 28:4 29:13 36:22
fully (3) 15:5 16:5 27:7
fun (1) 45:21
further (2) 72:20 74:13
future (1) 23:6

G

gain (1) 24:9
gangs (2) 36:4 70:8
gangster (1) 45:4
gap (1) 25:3
Garner's (1) 54:16
GED (1) 68:6
gender (1) 10:20
generate (1) 12:24
generated (2) 13:17 22:16
generates (1) 13:24
gentleman (1) 71:16
Geoff (1) 34:18
gestures (1) 10:12
getting (1) 15:16
give (14) 8:10 12:3,22 14:16 16:21
 18:11 25:8 26:7,8 60:3 62:14
 63:14 66:18,21
giveaway (1) 45:14
gives (2) 6:2,6
giving (2) 17:17 21:5
glad (1) 42:25
glance (1) 12:22
globally (2) 25:24 26:2
Glove (1) 36:23
go (18) 5:14 11:10,13 31:13 35:22
 35:23,24 36:6 37:9,20 38:9 42:19
 42:19 48:15 52:12 55:6 57:24
 72:10
goal (2) 33:24 34:3
God (3) 54:3,4,9
goes (1) 72:15
going (71) 6:14,15 7:23 8:4,7,20
 8:25 12:7 16:16,23 17:9,13 22:7

25:2,23 26:12,16,20,21,25 27:2,5
 27:12 28:10 29:23 35:9,19 36:11
 36:14,19 37:3,3,8 39:17,21 40:12
 42:2,3 47:20,21 48:22 49:8 50:15
 53:16,16 54:4,6 55:24,25 57:19
 57:21 58:16,24 59:22,24,25 60:3
 60:4,7,8,11,14 62:18 63:13 64:9
 64:22,23 66:20,21 72:11 73:22
Golden (1) 36:23
good (28) 4:3,15,20 5:2,5 21:16
 29:25 30:21 31:8 32:2 37:3 40:15
 40:16 43:19,20 44:19 48:6,24
 51:11,12 52:24 53:13 55:14,15
 56:9,10 61:17 67:25
gotten (1) 50:17
government (1) 20:25
grab (1) 5:15
grabbing (1) 9:24
grade (1) 68:25
graduate (1) 63:3
graduates (1) 63:4
grandson (1) 53:12
graph (1) 12:14
grassroots (2) 65:5,6
Gray (2) 56:8,12
great (10) 12:5 24:20,25 29:20
 37:2 43:9 49:11,22 68:6 69:4
greater (1) 54:5
greatest (3) 53:20 55:22 56:2
greatly (2) 38:18 72:6
green (1) 13:7
Greg (1) 40:4
Gregnanie (1) 6:24
Gregnoni (3) 32:23,25 34:8
ground (2) 10:15 23:22
grounds (1) 20:21
group (1) 8:21
groups (2) 2:9 70:11
guarantee (1) 22:22
guess (1) 52:5
guideline (1) 64:19
guilty (2) 24:13 27:4
gun (1) 49:20
guy (4) 42:2 45:4,5 48:14
guys (3) 9:2 12:5 37:22
gym (1) 36:18

H

hall (1) 58:6
hand (5) 23:25 35:21 50:25 61:16
 74:18
handle (1) 31:18
hands (2) 40:4 54:19
Hang (1) 9:3
happen (5) 15:15 49:9 53:5 60:8
 61:13
happened (6) 23:12 46:12,13 48:9

48:22 61:7
happening (4) 46:2 48:16 65:19
 69:10
happens (3) 44:16,16 68:8
happy (3) 5:25 12:2 34:8
harassing (1) 42:10
harassment (2) 42:8 48:12
hard (1) 15:21
hardship (1) 68:6
hats (1) 40:21
headphones (1) 5:15
Health (6) 62:17,22 63:16,19 65:4
 66:24
hear (3) 12:7 27:7 50:22
heard (4) 32:7 62:21 69:24 73:19
hearing (4) 7:21 17:25 27:8 58:17
hearsay (1) 49:4
held (2) 23:23 38:11
Hello (3) 34:15 43:21 50:4
help (13) 6:12,17 16:24 27:12
 50:10,13,16,23,24 51:4 70:13,15
 72:15
helped (1) 70:24
helping (2) 68:22 69:12
helps (1) 6:13
hereunto (1) 74:17
hey (1) 52:18
Hi (4) 4:12 8:22 12:9 39:14
high (2) 31:20 63:3
higher (2) 15:20 22:25
highest (4) 22:15,24 63:2,3
Hill (6) 34:25 35:2 59:19 61:5,13
 62:4
historically (1) 22:15
history (1) 27:22
hit (1) 23:25
hold (3) 25:13 52:14,15
holds (1) 26:23
holiday (1) 66:14
holistic (1) 59:8
home (3) 14:18 15:5 55:6
Homeland (1) 64:3
homeless (1) 69:7
honest (1) 61:23
hope (5) 4:20 19:17 20:21,23 21:5
hopefully (1) 22:8
hospital (1) 24:6
host (1) 8:12
hours (2) 11:19 61:11
House (1) 52:11
Houses (8) 7:2,18 29:24 30:4
 31:21,24 35:2,3
Howell (2) 43:15 49:25
human (8) 53:7 55:6 57:23,25
 59:14,14 61:12,13
hurricanes (1) 54:7

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

| I | J | K |
|--|--|---|
| <p>ID (2) 10:14,14 idea (3) 26:22 35:17 55:14 ideas (1) 59:17 identify (1) 64:10 ignoring (1) 20:10 illegal (1) 45:5 illustration (1) 33:22 Imam (2) 51:10,16 Imams (1) 70:18 immigrant (13) 17:20 18:3,7 19:10 19:19,23,24 56:18,20 57:7,17 62:25 66:3 immigrants (1) 56:21 immigration (4) 17:19 18:13 19:22 21:2 impact (2) 9:25 22:12 impeccable (1) 41:15 imperative (1) 44:8 important (9) 12:25 16:17 28:10 29:14 34:22 44:7 45:25 48:6 52:9 impression (1) 12:23 improve (1) 26:13 improved (2) 72:5,6 improvement (1) 56:3 inappropriately (1) 10:19 incarcerated (1) 37:7 incident (5) 20:14 42:24 61:6 71:3 71:21 incidents (1) 41:20 include (1) 9:23 included (2) 27:20,22 includes (3) 11:7 20:4,5 including (2) 22:24 57:3 inclusive (4) 58:13 64:5 65:2 66:25 increase (2) 66:2,5 independent (2) 5:17,21 indicate (1) 28:11 indigenous (1) 20:6 individual (1) 23:12 inform (1) 6:17 information (6) 7:25 20:11,17,22 27:3,23 Ingrid (1) 8:13 inner (1) 65:20 Inspector (1) 64:15 instance (2) 45:12 48:13 instances (2) 20:19 47:13 institution (1) 34:2 intake (1) 10:24 intend (1) 33:16 intentions (2) 53:20,20 Inter-government (1) 8:23 interact (4) 31:4,12,14,25 interaction (1) 10:14 interactions (1) 47:7 interested (3) 11:24 53:22 74:15</p> | <p>interests (1) 47:9 internal (1) 37:19 international (1) 68:10 interrupt (1) 25:5 intertwine (1) 56:23 introduce (2) 4:10 39:12 investigate (4) 9:12,17 16:5,24 investigated (4) 11:3,4 19:12 24:4 investigates (2) 9:5,11 investigating (1) 5:19 investigation (5) 11:2 15:14,25 24:5 28:4 investigations (1) 23:6 investigator (1) 11:5 investigators (3) 11:8 39:25 50:24 invite (1) 29:23 invited (1) 6:11 inviting (2) 17:10 66:9 involve (1) 65:3 involved (2) 14:19 28:22 island (47) 1:7 7:6,10,15 8:13 12:12,16,21,23 13:2,5,7,12,19,23 14:4,8,10,11 15:22 16:20 17:19 18:5,17,25 21:14 22:16 30:7,13 32:4 33:3 34:19 41:24 43:24 48:8 51:23 56:15,24,25 57:9 63:20 65:25 66:10,15 70:2,3 71:11 Island's (2) 14:23 15:4 Islander (1) 51:21 Islander's (1) 46:8 Islanders (1) 70:4 Islands (1) 13:8 issue (26) 27:18 28:9 40:2 52:25 58:19 59:24 61:15,17,24 62:2,4 64:8,11,12,12,25 66:17 67:2,6,7 70:13,16,22,22 72:12,12 issues (7) 6:4 27:11 42:19 46:22 46:24 65:24 71:2 ivy (2) 63:4,4</p> | <p>joined (3) 36:13 39:6,8 joining (1) 17:8 joint (1) 29:19 Jonathan (3) 1:13 3:15 4:24 Joseph (2) 3:6 39:15 judgmental (1) 45:7 June (1) 50:6 jurisdiction (1) 9:19 justice (4) 50:19,19 57:5 59:2</p> <hr/> <p>K</p> <p>keep (6) 8:7 23:5 24:2 51:20 69:9 69:20 keeping (2) 18:11 47:25 Keith (2) 8:22 33:11 Kelton (1) 39:6 kept (1) 57:20 Kessler (1) 8:14 key (4) 18:12 19:6 23:16 38:21 kicking (1) 9:24 kid (3) 36:14,22 37:5 Kid's (1) 34:24 kids (15) 8:18 31:17 34:13 35:4,10 35:10 36:10,11,12,20 38:20 45:15,20 59:12 61:7 killed (1) 50:7 kind (2) 38:13 42:6 kinds (2) 29:12 62:8 King (1) 36:15 knew (1) 62:20 knocked (1) 24:3 know (62) 6:20 13:19 19:3 20:7 23:4,7,8 29:18 30:24 31:12,23,25 32:2,3,11,14,25 36:12 37:13,23 37:24 40:21 41:14,15 42:9,10 44:22 45:5,8,15,18,21 46:6,8,15 47:23,24 48:2,7,21 49:4,12,13,21 51:21 54:20,24 62:17,20,21 66:8 66:12 68:5,23 70:4,6,9,13,25 71:23 72:10 73:22 knowing (1) 30:20 knowledge (2) 35:20,20 known (1) 31:22 KTR (3) 43:25 45:12 46:15</p> <hr/> <p>L</p> <p>lack (1) 18:17 lacking (1) 24:15 ladders (1) 38:3 lady (1) 64:4 landlines (1) 16:18 lane (1) 27:5 language (7) 9:22 10:11,17,18 18:18 19:6,25 languages (4) 20:4,5,6,6 largest (4) 56:14,15,18 66:5 Larsen (1) 32:12</p> |

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

LaShon (2) 44:2 45:13
Latin (1) 36:15
Latino (2) 17:21 19:19
Laura (3) 67:24 68:2,4
law (3) 26:4 53:17 68:18
Leader (2) 30:3 40:22
leaders (1) 59:12
leadership (1) 33:4
Leagues (1) 63:4
learned (2) 22:2,3
leave (5) 47:16 55:20 63:15 66:22 73:17
left (2) 15:3 36:25
leisure (1) 44:13
Lenora (1) 51:7
let's (9) 12:13 13:5 52:14 59:8 60:6 61:22,22,23 64:24
Leticia (1) 39:7
letter (1) 36:24
letting (1) 73:19
level (2) 32:2 63:3
levels (2) 58:21 69:2
Lewis (5) 7:17 29:23,25 32:19 43:7
Lewis's (1) 33:21
Liaison (1) 41:5
Liberia (1) 56:13
lieutenant (1) 21:22
life (11) 10:22 25:14 30:14 31:19 37:9 45:9 56:23 57:10 59:22 66:7 68:9
light (2) 71:21,22
limit (3) 40:12 67:17,18
Lincoln (2) 12:8,10
Lindsay (2) 3:7 4:16
line (4) 12:18,21 15:19 45:9
list (3) 17:11 23:8 39:21
listen (4) 24:20 52:8 58:7,8
listening (1) 54:10
little (12) 12:21 13:18 14:24 15:11 20:12 26:10,22 27:14 47:2 55:16 55:17 72:21
live (3) 25:24 32:10 70:15
lived (1) 50:12
lives (1) 57:25
living (2) 50:11 70:3
local (2) 6:7,11
located (2) 11:21 15:20
location (1) 33:7
locations (1) 38:4
locked (1) 62:16
long (5) 27:14 44:4 56:25 70:4 72:15
look (25) 7:20,20 13:10 14:6 22:22 45:6 53:17 56:23 58:9,21,25 59:2 59:3,8,11 60:6,11 61:17,18,20 62:18 63:8,9,16 65:25
looked (3) 15:2 52:3 63:10

looking (3) 41:25 57:7 60:17
loquacious (1) 55:21
lose (1) 16:3
loss (1) 50:23
lost (1) 52:17
lot (8) 16:25 18:2 40:21 41:21 44:25 46:11,12 54:9
loud (1) 70:23
Louis (1) 43:6
love (3) 36:17 61:12 70:23
loved (2) 45:16 54:8
low (1) 13:12
lowest (1) 15:18

M

Mabre (2) 3:10 4:22
Mack (1) 40:4
MacVeagh (3) 12:8,9,10
Madame (4) 8:6 21:16 34:14 39:22
main (1) 64:12
major (3) 20:14 25:22 26:3
majority (1) 13:23
makeup (3) 61:18,19,19
making (1) 69:13
MAMARONECK (2) 1:22,23
man (3) 20:9 30:19 64:16
man's (1) 20:11
Management (2) 43:25 46:15
Manhattan (3) 12:20 15:19 56:25
map (4) 13:21 14:18 63:23,25
Marcus (1) 36:21
Mark (1) 17:6
marriage (1) 74:14
Matteo's (1) 17:5
matter (8) 10:25 11:3,4,9 44:25 73:24 74:10,16
Matthews (6) 50:3,4,5 51:5,7,8
Mayor (1) 5:4
mayoral (2) 4:8 11:7
McDoogal (3) 40:14,16,17
mean (5) 48:5,6 49:18 52:22 53:14
means (5) 5:22,23 15:23 24:12 65:6
media (1) 35:8
mediated (1) 11:3
mediates (1) 9:6
meet (4) 35:24 36:6 66:20,20
meeting (13) 1:4 2:3 4:5 8:15 29:19 31:15 58:6 66:18,19 71:4 71:14 72:17 73:20
meetings (2) 25:14 30:11
melting (1) 66:11
member (13) 3:5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12 3:13 11:6,20 17:5 32:24
members (10) 3:3 4:10 5:23 6:7,8 6:11,19 9:7 28:7 39:11
memo (2) 47:23,25

memories (1) 68:2
mentioned (2) 33:11 72:13
Merchant's (1) 40:25
merchants (2) 41:3,18
mess (1) 63:11
message (1) 16:7
messages (2) 16:12,22
messaging (4) 16:9,13,14,16
met (2) 36:5 62:19
metropolitan (1) 65:18
Mexican (1) 45:5
Michael (4) 7:15 21:13 35:18 43:15
Michelle (1) 49:25
mid-island (1) 17:22
Middle (1) 20:5
Midtown (2) 23:13,24
minute (2) 55:25 72:24
minutes (7) 40:13 67:17,19,21 69:20 72:23 73:2
miscommunication/conflict (1) 18:19
misconduct (4) 5:20 9:6,10,13
misinterpreted (2) 55:10,11
mispronounce (1) 56:7
mistaken (1) 26:17
moment (1) 19:21
money (2) 35:9 37:12
monitor (3) 47:21 49:10,21
month (3) 11:19 33:10,12
months (4) 60:10 65:13 71:5,14
motion (2) 72:25 73:11
Mount (2) 7:8 40:18
move (1) 60:11
moved (2) 73:3,12
movements (1) 55:10
murderers (1) 54:16

N

N (2) 1:12 3:4
name (15) 4:6,16,22 5:6,8 8:22 10:8 12:9 17:18 40:17 43:22 50:5 56:8,11 69:8
narcotics (1) 37:18
nationality (1) 10:19
nature (4) 25:16 44:19 46:7 52:18
NCO (7) 24:18,23 25:8 30:15 31:9 33:19 35:17
NCO's (1) 33:20
necessary (3) 37:18,18,19
need (28) 5:11 29:18 33:5 35:19 37:20,21 38:8,9,10 45:16 47:6 50:18,19,19 54:2,11,12,14,15 57:3 58:25 59:4,13,15 67:10 69:5 70:23 72:21
needed (2) 22:17 45:16
needless (1) 18:2
needs (3) 35:22 37:13 38:13

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

neighbor (2) 18:21,23
neighborhood (4) 25:10 70:5,14
 71:2
neighborhoods (1) 14:5
neighbors (2) 18:21,22
nervous (1) 35:13
never (3) 48:21 62:9 68:12
new (32) 1:7,23 2:12 4:5 6:16
 11:16,16 20:25 21:2,21 33:6
 42:17 51:24 52:13 56:16,17,18
 57:9 58:3 63:24,25 64:6 65:13,15
 65:16,16 66:12 67:9 68:18 71:8
 74:4,8
newly (1) 40:25
news (4) 17:25 68:16 69:4 70:3
nice (2) 61:9,18
nightsticks (1) 9:25
nine (3) 30:13,23 47:15
north (4) 13:24 17:22 23:24 32:7
northeast (1) 14:9
northern (1) 15:7
northwest (1) 14:12
Notary (1) 74:7
noted (1) 71:15
number (7) 10:9 12:14 13:11 24:24
 26:20 29:2 31:10
numbers (4) 13:6,22 14:3,7
numerous (2) 37:7 50:16
NYCHA (3) 7:2,17 29:24
NYCHA's (1) 30:4
NYPD (21) 5:22,24 9:7 11:7 18:11
 18:19 19:2,9,18 20:24 21:22
 24:10 26:8 33:25 34:16 35:7,12
 36:13 48:9 70:12,23
NYPD's (1) 47:2

O

o (2) 9:21 35:7
observed (1) 57:11
obviously (2) 18:23 19:3
occupancy (1) 23:24
occupation (1) 53:11
occurs (1) 15:12
October (1) 74:18
oddy (1) 14:9
offensive (2) 9:22 10:17
office (15) 6:23 11:15,18,18,21
 15:16 17:5,7 32:24 33:11,13,16
 39:6,9 57:4
officer (21) 19:2 20:8,10 21:21
 23:10,13 25:12 26:24 27:4 29:6
 29:13 35:21,24 47:11,16,17
 48:18,23 55:16 69:25 71:18
officer' (1) 27:25
officer's (13) 23:5 30:16 31:9
 32:11 35:21 47:15,19,23,24 49:6
 53:10 55:4,18

officers (21) 9:9 22:19 24:11 25:11
 26:9,16,19 28:22,25 29:4 30:25
 41:21,21 42:9 44:6 45:8,17 49:11
 53:2,14 54:18
offices (1) 15:20
oh (6) 43:8 49:19 54:16 61:11
 63:13 71:24
okay (13) 8:16 43:8,13 48:14 51:5
 51:6,9 59:23 67:18,22 68:4 70:11
 70:12
old (2) 2:11 57:23
Olympian (1) 36:21
ones (2) 46:10 54:8
online (1) 8:8
open (3) 37:12 42:18 65:8
opened (1) 36:18
opening (1) 42:4
opinion (2) 52:13 53:2
opium (3) 62:4,5 65:10
opportunity (6) 6:3,6 17:17 20:18
 21:5,17
opposed (2) 32:6 73:8
option (1) 28:7
order (9) 2:4 4:4 16:8 45:22 46:14
 55:12 57:2 58:5 59:11
organization (4) 11:24 12:3 52:10
 53:24
organizations (6) 6:10,20 7:6
 17:10 52:6 54:14
Organizer (1) 40:23
orientation (1) 10:20
original (1) 35:14
originally (1) 56:13
outcome (1) 74:15
outlets (1) 35:8
outlier (1) 13:14
outreach (7) 2:7 8:21,23 11:22,25
 26:6 60:7
outside (1) 57:8
overdose (1) 65:10
overnight (1) 60:8
oversight (1) 5:18
owner (1) 43:23

P

p.m (5) 1:5 11:20,20 33:13 73:25
panel (2) 11:6,8
parents (3) 36:5 37:6 59:13
park (8) 34:25,25 36:3 59:19 61:4
 61:13 62:4 71:16
parks (1) 13:3
part (2) 5:22 55:20
partially (1) 52:6
participate (1) 6:21
participating (1) 39:3
particular (3) 8:13 27:21 71:3
particularly (2) 13:12 28:25

parties (1) 74:14
Partner (1) 41:4
partner's (1) 54:24
partnered (1) 11:17
partnering (1) 34:6
partnership (2) 41:6 70:25
passed (1) 50:6
Pastor (1) 40:19
Pat (3) 8:17 34:12 43:10
patrol (3) 22:23 26:21 64:16
pay (1) 35:6
Peguero (3) 3:12 5:5,6
people (33) 18:13,13 23:8 35:22
 37:15,20 38:3,9 39:24 40:10,11
 41:16 42:8,10 45:2,6,19 51:21
 52:7,12,12,19 54:8,13,17 58:17
 59:6,12 61:3 63:21 66:6 67:16
 72:4
people's (1) 47:5
pepper (1) 9:25
perceived (1) 10:20
percent (14) 13:8,10,16,17 15:4,6
 15:23,23 16:13,15 28:3,6 37:16
 37:16
percentage (3) 14:22,23 22:13
perception (1) 26:6
perfect (1) 14:15
permeates (1) 53:9
permission (2) 16:7,22
person (6) 10:23,24 19:5 48:8 53:4
 53:5
personal (1) 49:9
persons (3) 10:6,6,7
perspective (7) 21:18 22:9 57:12
 57:13 59:9 62:19 64:11
phone (3) 10:23 24:24 49:20
phones (1) 24:25
pick (3) 33:14 36:25 51:16
picture (2) 12:13 29:14
piece (1) 72:21
pills (1) 62:5
pilot (2) 65:17 66:16
pimp (1) 23:14
pivotal (1) 22:21
place (7) 18:5,12 65:25 66:15,16
 68:2 72:7
play (1) 48:17
plays (1) 22:21
please (5) 5:14 36:25 39:20 66:14
 69:19
plenty (3) 48:10 49:5,6
plus (1) 45:20
point (9) 24:3 28:3 33:24 34:3 46:3
 48:6,19 71:5 72:8
police (63) 4:13,17 5:20 6:5 9:12
 9:13,17 10:13 13:22 18:9 21:21
 23:5,13 25:22 26:5,19,24 28:25

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

9

29:3,6,18 30:6,9,17,20,21,22,23
30:25 31:7 32:2 35:21,21 37:17
41:5,9,17 42:18,20 49:19 50:14
52:22 53:3,17 54:13,18,22,22
55:13 57:4 58:21 59:15 60:24
61:2,3,4,8,11 64:8,12,17,21
65:20
police/civilian (1) 47:7
policies (1) 47:8
policing (9) 6:5 42:7,14 58:25
59:20 60:14,24 61:2,4
policy (5) 2:8 12:8 18:12 26:5 47:2
policymakers (2) 59:12 67:9
political (1) 52:15
politics (1) 18:4
populated (1) 13:3
population (9) 13:6,9,16 14:23
15:5 22:13 56:19 62:25 66:5
possible (2) 40:11 69:21
pot (1) 66:11
power (2) 35:20 60:3
practical (1) 62:19
pray (3) 55:4,9,11
praying (1) 52:19
precinct (18) 6:8,11 13:22,24 14:3
14:6 22:15 23:24 25:12,23,24,25
35:15 36:18 41:7 43:3 64:15
70:10
precincts (2) 14:5 22:24
prejudice (3) 53:8 70:22 72:13
preliminary (1) 60:23
presence (3) 31:22 33:7,10
present (2) 3:3 33:13
presentation (7) 2:7,8 8:21,25
11:25 12:4 22:11
presented (1) 25:20
presents (1) 11:5
president (6) 21:19 30:8 31:24
32:13 44:23 68:3
president's (2) 30:5,12
presidents (2) 30:13,23
pretty (2) 13:13 42:16
prevent (2) 41:20 42:20
priest (4) 71:7,10,24,24
primarily (2) 17:20 19:4
prior (3) 28:19,21 41:7
prioritize (1) 64:24
priority (1) 64:19
prisons (2) 68:24,25
privacy (2) 47:5 48:6
privy (1) 27:6
proactive (2) 41:12,19
probably (3) 34:22 37:15 68:9
problem (10) 44:25 45:18 52:25
53:2 58:14,15 59:4,23 62:3,10
problems (10) 35:25 36:3,7,8,9
60:16,17 64:24 65:19 67:11

procedure (1) 47:25
proceedings (73) 1:9 4:1 5:1 6:1
7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1
14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1
20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1
26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1
32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1
38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1
44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1
50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1
56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1
62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1
68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1
74:9,11
process (1) 60:9
profanity (1) 10:11
program (19) 24:18 25:8,11 30:15
30:16,22 33:20 34:24,24 35:2,7
35:16,17 36:11 38:20 40:24 41:6
47:4,13
programs (3) 35:4 36:10 37:12
progress (1) 57:6
progresses (1) 47:22
project (2) 65:17 66:16
proper (1) 47:25
properly (1) 48:4
pros (1) 26:18
prosecute (1) 60:3
prosecutes (1) 9:8
Prosecution (2) 9:8 11:10
prosper (1) 46:14
prostitute (1) 23:14
prostitution (2) 70:8,13
protect (4) 45:10 46:10,10 64:18
protected (1) 53:17
proved (1) 16:9
proven (2) 23:17 38:12
proves (2) 24:12,13
provide (6) 7:24 10:8 20:16,22
27:2 69:6
provided (2) 20:23 27:23
psychological (1) 62:3
PTA (1) 68:3
public (14) 1:4 2:3,10 24:10 26:6,9
26:24 29:17 39:7,17 44:20 69:25
72:20 74:7
Puerto (1) 54:9
pull (2) 48:15 49:6
pulled (2) 23:22 71:6
Puma (3) 3:6 39:15,15
punch (1) 24:3
punching (1) 9:24
purpose (1) 64:17
push (1) 23:5
pushing (2) 9:24 58:11
put (9) 37:24 38:10 51:22 59:17
61:18 63:23 64:2 65:13 66:16

puts (1) 38:11
putting (4) 37:11 45:9 61:16,20

Q

quality (3) 25:14 30:14 31:19
Queens (4) 5:7 12:20 13:15,15
question (4) 19:24 25:20 27:18
49:17
questionable (1) 44:14
questioning (1) 44:11
questions (7) 21:10 22:6,14 27:17
28:16 32:18 44:5
quick (1) 24:18
quickly (2) 27:16 39:12
quite (3) 8:8 40:9 70:10
quoted (1) 68:16

R

R (1) 74:3
race (5) 10:19 53:4,7,7 64:8
racial (14) 10:18 58:4,15,20 61:21
62:9 64:10,25 65:14,22,24 66:16
67:2,6
racism (2) 54:14 58:16
racist (2) 46:5 53:3
radio (2) 22:18,25
raining (1) 55:23
raise (3) 46:23 48:5 50:25
raised (2) 27:18 46:22
raising (1) 28:9
Ramon (2) 3:12 5:6
random (1) 55:19
range (1) 20:3
rapport (1) 30:16
rate (8) 15:18,22 16:13,14 31:19
31:20 42:16 63:3
rates (4) 15:11,18 16:10 23:2
reach (2) 34:3 72:4
reached (2) 34:3 63:19
reaching (1) 33:24
read (4) 14:25 28:23,24 63:6
reading (2) 37:2 69:2
real (3) 13:14 24:18 50:19
realizing (1) 45:20
really (14) 5:25 6:17 22:10 31:20
32:9,15 41:8 42:23,24,25 46:19
48:11 49:20 73:21
reason (6) 23:11 27:4 35:11 50:8
58:3 61:25
receive (2) 22:19 27:20
received (2) 12:15 22:5
receiving (2) 5:18 7:21
recidivist (1) 23:8
recipient (1) 17:24
recognize (1) 28:25
recognized (1) 33:5
recommendation (2) 11:9 64:21

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| <p>recommendations (1) 11:6 record (5) 23:18 47:7 49:10,22 74:11 recorded (1) 49:3 records (1) 23:6 red (5) 14:12 15:2,19 71:20,22 redeployment (1) 35:16 reduce (1) 16:4 refers (1) 10:19 reflection (2) 33:7,9 refusal (1) 10:8 regarding (1) 44:6 regardless (2) 21:2 33:6 regular (1) 30:11 regularly (2) 28:24 33:21 regulations (1) 55:17 reinvent (1) 24:20 related (1) 74:13 relations (2) 8:24 69:25 relationship (9) 26:12 30:9 31:6 41:8,10,16 42:18 43:2 72:5 relationships (1) 26:11 religion (1) 10:20 religious (1) 10:18 reluctant (1) 18:8 remarkably (1) 16:9 remarks (3) 8:7,8 40:12 remember (3) 13:2 26:19 71:21 reminder (1) 69:19 repercussions (1) 38:13 report (9) 2:5,6 7:23 19:9 24:6 27:21 28:19,21 54:20 reported (2) 1:15 74:9 REPORTING (1) 1:22 reports (1) 29:12 representation (2) 52:4 54:11 representations (1) 52:14 representative (6) 4:14,17 6:22 7:10 17:4,6 represented (2) 15:7,9 representing (1) 40:18 represents (3) 13:15 14:24 15:4 reputation (1) 41:14 request (2) 16:23 20:11 research (1) 63:5 residences (1) 10:7 Resident (1) 30:3 residents (2) 33:25 44:3 resides (1) 43:24 resolutions (1) 32:4 resolve (1) 20:13 resource (1) 34:9 respected (1) 32:14 respective (1) 25:23 respond (2) 25:14,15 responded (1) 23:21 response (7) 21:11 27:17 32:20</p> | <p>38:25 43:16 50:2 73:9 responsibility (1) 72:3 responsible (1) 43:2 responsive (1) 42:22 retired (2) 21:21 34:16 review (12) 1:3 4:6 9:5,16 57:4,19 59:7 60:22,23,24 62:10 66:10 reviews (1) 11:8 Richard (1) 40:20 Richards (3) 1:16 74:7,20 Richmond (2) 39:9 74:5 Rico (1) 54:9 ride (3) 36:22 66:12,14 right (14) 13:7 24:16 26:18 27:7,10 34:25 35:22 37:9 38:2 40:4 44:13 48:15 54:4 68:7 rights (2) 20:17,20 Rikers (1) 68:24 Riley (7) 7:15 21:13,16 25:10,19 28:14 29:16 Risso (1) 43:10 road (2) 63:23,25 rode (1) 66:13 role (1) 22:21 roll (1) 51:22 rookie (1) 71:6 room (4) 23:23 55:22 56:2,3 Rose's (3) 6:23 11:20 32:24 rules (2) 47:10 55:17 RUMSTEIN (2) 67:14,18 run (2) 35:5 41:25 runs (2) 22:18,25 Russo (7) 8:17 34:12,14,16 38:19 39:4 43:12</p> <hr/> <p align="center">S</p> <hr/> <p>safe (2) 48:19 55:5 safely (1) 55:6 safety (2) 48:25,25 Sal (1) 4:13 SALVATORE (1) 3:5 sat (4) 62:22 63:21,22 71:11 Saturday (1) 45:14 saw (5) 19:9 20:8 22:11,14 52:3 saying (4) 19:9 52:10 54:16 68:18 says (1) 55:25 scene (1) 49:7 school (7) 36:21 37:6 45:13 63:3 68:8,9 69:10 schools (3) 34:19 68:19 69:11 searches (1) 10:6 seat (2) 65:23 67:15 second (7) 44:16 56:15,18 73:4,5 73:13,14 Secondly (2) 59:25 60:15 Security (1) 64:3 see (32) 7:3 12:12,18 13:22 15:3</p> | <p>18:8 19:17 22:25 24:9 25:4,19 26:25 29:13,17 30:5 33:20,25 35:7 44:15,21 46:2 49:3,7 51:3 54:23 61:5,7,12,20 66:11,15 72:2 seeing (8) 8:2 18:7,17,25 19:17 20:15 45:18 48:9 seek (1) 50:10 seen (6) 18:18 19:7,22 42:2 44:5 47:13 senator (1) 68:15 send (5) 16:12,22 60:15,19 65:6 Senior (1) 40:19 sensitive (2) 58:18 59:21 sent (2) 11:2 63:21 sentences (1) 25:9 September (3) 1:4 4:5 68:17 Sergeant (1) 34:16 serve (2) 18:9 64:18 service (2) 22:18 24:20 services (4) 1:22 5:12,14 69:6 serving (1) 55:5 Session (3) 2:13 72:23 73:11 set (2) 5:15 74:17 sexual (1) 10:20 Shanell (2) 50:3,5 share (2) 33:15 68:5 Shareef (4) 51:10,11,13,18 sharing (1) 69:15 Sharpe (7) 43:18,19,22,23 46:21 48:5 49:18 shed (1) 22:8 shelters (1) 69:7 Sherise (4) 7:17 29:23 43:6 53:24 shield (1) 10:9 shocked (1) 61:7 Shore (5) 17:22,22 25:25 32:6,7 short (2) 8:8,25 shot (3) 50:7 52:17 55:9 showed (1) 45:17 shows (4) 12:14 14:18 16:10,20 shutdown (1) 38:4 Siciliano (1) 30:17 side (6) 14:11 31:23 32:6,10 61:12 61:13 sides (2) 19:2 48:25 Siegel (5) 3:11 5:2,3 28:17,18 sign (1) 48:14 signed (5) 39:18,20 40:10 69:11,17 Simeon (1) 69:23 Simon (2) 68:15,16 simple (1) 58:13 Sinai (2) 7:8 40:18 single (4) 9:16 23:23 27:5 64:4 sir (1) 51:16 sit (3) 61:10 62:14 65:2 sitting (2) 61:8 64:23 situation (5) 20:13 47:14,15 64:7</p> |
|--|--|--|

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>68:8 situations (2) 20:15 49:8 six (2) 64:20 65:13 size (1) 13:6 slapping (1) 9:24 sleeves (1) 51:22 slide (1) 14:13 slogan (1) 46:16 smoke (1) 65:8 smoker (1) 65:8 smoking (1) 61:9 social (2) 35:8 62:2 society (1) 65:18 sole (1) 64:17 solution (7) 60:8 62:9 64:10 65:4 65:11,19 67:5 solutions (2) 61:16,21 solve (3) 36:8 59:22 67:10 somebody (4) 15:12 38:11 53:15 72:13 son (5) 35:12 50:6,20 52:17 53:12 song (1) 52:13 soon (1) 71:16 sorry (5) 25:5,19 27:14 50:22 71:25 sound (2) 27:7,8 source (1) 68:23 south (10) 7:18 17:22 25:25 29:24 30:3,6 31:20,23 53:23 54:8 Spanish (4) 5:12 20:4,9 45:5 speak (14) 10:25 17:11,18 18:22 20:3,9 30:2 32:3 35:12 40:10 47:2 50:9 51:2 69:17 speaker (4) 17:6 19:3,5 46:23 speaking (4) 22:6 32:21 57:14,15 specific (2) 20:14 27:21 specifically (3) 18:4,20 38:16 speed (1) 31:11 spent (1) 57:10 spoke (1) 43:11 sponsored (1) 35:6 sport (1) 36:17 spray (1) 10:2 squads (1) 41:22 SRO (1) 23:23 ss (1) 74:4 stages (1) 57:24 Stahly-Butts (3) 3:10 4:20,22 stand (1) 7:3 start (7) 4:11 7:23 12:13 17:13 62:7 66:23 69:12 started (5) 4:9 6:18 16:6 40:25 41:7 state (5) 63:18 65:16 68:18 74:4,8 stated (1) 52:2 Staten (51) 1:7 7:6,10,15 8:12 12:12,16,21,23 13:2,5,7,8,12,19</p> | <p>13:23 14:4,8,10,23 15:4,22 16:20 17:19 18:5,17,25 21:14 22:16 30:7,12 32:4 33:3 34:19 41:23 43:24 46:8 48:8 51:21,23 56:15 56:24 57:9 63:20 65:25 66:10,15 70:2,3,4 71:11 States (2) 56:20 63:2 statistic (2) 68:21,25 statistics (1) 60:18 status (3) 18:13 19:22 21:3 stay (1) 16:8 stayed (1) 23:18 STENO-KATH (1) 1:22 stenokath@verizon.net (1) 1:24 step (1) 70:12 stereotype (1) 45:2 Steve (1) 17:5 Steven (1) 8:14 stop (8) 46:3 48:2,14 51:2,3 61:16 61:20 72:11 stopping (1) 20:8 stops (2) 10:5 18:14 store (1) 55:24 stories (1) 32:7 street (6) 1:7 11:16 36:11 44:24 64:16 65:7 streets (3) 18:15 41:13,17 strict (1) 47:10 stringent (1) 55:18 strong (1) 36:20 stuff (1) 42:15 subject (1) 21:23 substantiate (1) 54:17 substantiated (1) 29:5 successful (1) 42:16 sufficient (1) 10:8 Sunset (1) 36:3 supply (1) 45:13 support (2) 50:17,18 supposed (1) 42:4 sure (3) 25:10 33:16 40:11 swatting (1) 23:25 system (3) 38:7 57:5 60:24 systems (1) 69:7</p> <hr/> <p align="center">T</p> <hr/> <p>T (2) 74:3,3 table (1) 65:11 tackle (2) 59:4 64:9 tackling (1) 64:5 tact (1) 15:10 take (19) 8:2 23:22 26:9 31:5 33:17 34:20 58:13,13,19 60:2 63:11,14 65:7,7,9,23 66:10 67:15 72:7 taken (1) 18:4 talk (11) 12:2,11 15:11 23:7 24:17 25:23 26:2 39:20 57:21 60:13</p> | <p>72:9 talked (1) 22:12 talking (3) 44:22 54:10 65:21 talks (1) 26:18 targeted (1) 52:7 tasers (1) 10:2 task (1) 30:18 tax (1) 56:2 team (3) 11:22 32:13 36:13 tear (1) 37:4 technology's (1) 24:22 teenager (1) 65:8 teeth (1) 24:4 tell (4) 14:25 39:24 54:4 69:4 ten (3) 50:11 57:25 71:11 tend (1) 45:6 tense (1) 20:12 terms (6) 12:25 13:14 27:19,24 41:15 58:4 Terratto (1) 30:17 text (9) 14:24 16:7,8,12,12,14,16 16:22,23 thank (66) 5:10 6:25 7:4,7,14,19 8:6,11,16,19 12:5,6 17:2,8,16 21:4,7,8,12,17 25:18 27:15 28:13 28:14 29:15,21,22,25 32:17,21 33:2 34:4,5,5,10,11 38:14,15,16 38:23 39:2,4,16 40:8 43:4,5 46:20,21 49:14,15,23,24 50:21 51:5,6,17 56:4,5 67:12,23 69:14 69:15 70:9 72:17,19 73:18 Thanks (1) 16:25 theme (1) 70:20 thing (12) 16:6 24:17,19,25 26:14 26:25 41:19 42:6 44:10 45:20 52:16 53:13 things (34) 18:24 19:16 20:7 21:25 22:3,5,10,13,17 25:16 26:13 27:9 41:11,12 42:21,22,23 46:6,12,12 47:3,20 48:11 49:9,10 54:3,7,9 54:18 57:22 58:11 62:24 67:8 69:13 think (34) 21:18 22:16 24:18,19 26:3,17,23 27:11 28:23 29:20 30:15 31:5 35:15,16,17,18 36:17 37:13 44:7,13,19,25 45:25 46:18 46:25 48:24 52:8 54:2 55:14,23 56:2 63:9 65:2 67:20 thinking (1) 31:3 thinks (1) 6:13 third (3) 11:19 33:12 68:25 threatening (1) 19:10 three (4) 11:6 60:10 61:10 64:20 throat (1) 62:24 throw (1) 63:12 thrown (1) 10:15 thug (1) 45:4</p> |
|---|---|--|

Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017

Thursday (2) 11:19 33:12
tied (1) 54:19
time (13) 29:4 30:2 36:12 41:13
44:4 46:3 47:17 48:10 58:12 60:5
67:14 70:4 73:22
times (5) 37:8 44:25 49:5,6 50:16
Titonville (3) 61:3,24 65:9
today (10) 36:20 40:20 56:20 57:14
59:18 60:10,13 61:19 63:10,25
told (5) 35:24 36:5,6 59:6 62:24
tool (1) 38:6
top (4) 12:18 15:3 16:10 30:7
total (1) 12:14
touch (6) 16:8 22:7,7,11 25:21
26:14
Touching (1) 30:19
tours (1) 55:5
town (1) 58:6
Toy's (1) 34:18
track (1) 23:5
traffic (2) 18:14 46:3
train (1) 30:25
trained (1) 53:10
training (4) 26:7,8,8 30:24
transcript (2) 1:9 74:10
transferred (1) 38:8
transition (1) 48:16
translation (1) 5:12
transpires (1) 44:15
travel (1) 15:21
tremendous (3) 24:19 30:5,15
trends (2) 29:10,11
tribes (1) 53:6
tried (1) 23:21
Tristan (2) 43:18,23
trouble (1) 15:15
true (5) 12:25 14:9 19:11 71:23
74:11
truly (2) 23:2 48:22
truncation (8) 15:11,12,17,18,22
16:10,13,14
truncations (3) 15:14 16:2,5
trust (9) 24:10,14 53:11,13 65:12
70:17,22 72:3,12
truthful (3) 61:14,15,22
try (11) 20:16 32:3 38:6 40:12
41:11,19,20 42:14 51:20 67:17
69:22
trying (3) 24:2 47:5,8
Tubbs (2) 8:22,22
turn (10) 8:4 17:9 39:17 44:12,12
47:11,11 48:20,20,21
turned (1) 45:15
turning (1) 47:18
turns (1) 48:11
two (18) 24:4 25:8 26:9 27:17
30:16 31:9 39:10,25 40:13 47:9

48:17 53:6 63:14 64:20 67:17,19
67:21 69:20
type (8) 9:17 18:18 19:15,18,20,23
20:13 44:20
types (1) 9:18

U

undercover (1) 31:2
understand (7) 6:15 19:4 30:25
31:6 45:3 72:16,18
understanding (4) 6:3,14 30:21
72:14
understood (1) 31:3
undocumented (1) 17:24
unfounded (1) 18:10
uniform (1) 64:16
unique (2) 6:2 21:18
unit (7) 9:8 10:24 11:2,11,25 12:8
26:8
United (4) 7:8 40:18 56:20 63:2
unproven (1) 23:18
unsubstantiated (3) 23:16,17 24:8
use (9) 9:19,25 10:2,10,11,17 23:5
38:5,5
usually (1) 19:2
utilize (2) 5:13 28:8

V

Vargas (5) 7:12 17:14,16,18 21:10
vehicles (2) 10:6,7
venue (1) 20:18
verify (1) 14:17
victim (2) 9:14 37:25
victims (4) 14:15,19,22 15:6
video (1) 47:14
view (2) 27:5 44:21
Vincent (2) 6:24 32:23
violation (1) 20:20
visualize (1) 46:2
Viverito's (1) 17:6
voice (1) 73:19
volume (1) 28:24

W

walk (2) 41:13 70:24
walks (1) 66:6
Wall (1) 44:24
want (34) 4:9 5:13 6:18 12:11
13:18 16:5 17:16 22:10 25:5,25
37:2 38:20 39:5,19,24 40:2 42:7
42:7,8,8 43:3 46:9 50:23 55:7,20
55:21 59:7 61:17 66:11 70:8,24
72:7,9 73:17
wanted (7) 8:11 36:14,15,16 50:9,9
72:9
wants (3) 16:4 33:2 58:19
warrant (1) 55:12

Warren (1) 1:7
Washington (1) 58:23
wasn't (2) 68:11 71:23
waste (1) 60:5
watch (1) 47:21
watching (1) 61:11
way (18) 13:11 19:13 29:10 31:3
38:3 46:4 48:16 56:23 57:23
58:23 59:21,22 64:9 67:7,8,10
72:15 74:15
Wayne (2) 40:14,17
we'll (11) 4:11 8:2,10 46:17 47:13
48:2,21 54:15,17 65:21 72:8
we're (28) 5:18,21,22,25 7:23,25
8:20 12:7 17:9,13 19:12 34:8
36:19 39:17 46:18 47:20,21
50:22 58:24 59:22 60:10,14 64:9
66:21 67:16 69:20 70:7 71:4
we've (10) 6:10 19:16 34:3 39:6,7
39:10 42:15 44:4 47:12,13
weapons (1) 9:25
wear (5) 26:20 40:21 61:18,19 71:9
wearing (1) 26:16
website (2) 10:24 11:13
weed (3) 46:5 65:8,9
week (1) 66:19
went (5) 24:5 38:2 43:7 53:24
68:13
whatever's (1) 48:16
whatnot (1) 29:13
wheel (1) 24:21
WHEREOF (1) 74:17
white (1) 61:7
who've (1) 17:11
wide (1) 20:3
willing (1) 61:14
win (4) 46:16,16,17,17
winded (1) 27:15
window (1) 53:15
wish (1) 40:6
within-entitled (1) 74:10
WITNESS (1) 74:17
woman (1) 61:17
wondered (1) 71:9
wonderful (1) 35:16
word (3) 19:6 38:21 57:20
work (14) 6:17 17:20 20:24 21:6
33:20 36:8,17 38:17 44:23,23
51:22 52:23,24 60:14
worked (2) 38:3 59:9
worker (2) 19:10,14
working (7) 19:13 46:18 47:19
59:10 60:12,12 70:10
works (1) 20:25
worn (4) 46:23,24 47:4 48:3
wow (1) 61:11
wrote (1) 36:24

**Civilian Complaint Review Board - Final
September 13, 2017**

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| <p>www.nyc.gov/ccrb (1) 11:14</p> <hr/> <p align="center">X</p> <hr/> <p>X (2) 1:2,6</p> <hr/> <p align="center">Y</p> <hr/> <p>Y'all (1) 30:21 Yale (1) 68:12 year (5) 13:9 23:20 28:3,5,5 years (10) 26:21 29:2 30:4 31:16 36:19 50:11 57:25 65:21 67:4 72:6 years-old (1) 35:5 Yesterday (1) 61:6 YMCA (1) 71:4 Yoon (3) 3:13 5:8,8 York (25) 1:7,23 4:5 6:16 11:16,16 20:25 21:21 56:16,18 57:9 58:3 63:24,25 64:6 65:13,15,16,16 66:12 67:9 68:18 71:8 74:4,8 Yorker (1) 21:2 Yorker's (1) 33:6 young (5) 20:9,10 30:19 71:6,16 youngest (1) 30:5 Youngik (1) 5:8 YOUNGKIK (1) 3:13 youth (2) 52:7 59:12</p> | <p>16.8 (1) 13:17 17 (1) 30:4 18 (1) 28:6 19 (1) 28:3 1995 (1) 23:13</p> <hr/> <p align="center">2</p> <hr/> <p>2 (1) 2:5 20 (2) 45:20 57:25 200,000 (1) 36:23 2000 (1) 52:18 2003 (1) 12:15 2010 (2) 66:2,6 2012 (1) 36:21 2014 (2) 60:18 68:3 2016 (6) 12:16 14:13,20 16:6,10,20 2017 (4) 1:4 28:2 67:8 74:18 2018 (1) 26:16 21 (1) 35:5 212.95.DEPOS (1) 1:23 25 (1) 72:5 27.3 (1) 13:15</p> | <p>7th (1) 68:17</p> <hr/> <p align="center">8</p> <hr/> <p>8 (2) 2:11 73:25</p> <hr/> <p align="center">9</p> <hr/> <p>9 (1) 2:12 91 (1) 70:6 914.381.2061 (1) 1:23 914.722.0816 (1) 1:24 953.3767 (1) 1:23</p> |
| <hr/> <p align="center">Z</p> <hr/> <p>zip (9) 14:14,15,16,19,21,24 15:2,5 15:7 zone (1) 14:12</p> <hr/> <p align="center">0</p> <hr/> <p align="center">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 (1) 2:4 1-800-341-CCRB (1) 11:14 10 (1) 2:13 100 (2) 11:16 67:3 10007 (1) 11:16 101 (1) 1:7 10303 (2) 15:2,8 10304 (1) 1:7 10543 (1) 1:23 12 (1) 35:4 120 (11) 22:15 30:9 32:7,13 41:7 52:23 60:15,17 63:11 66:19 70:10 120th (1) 13:24 121 (3) 13:25 30:10 61:8 122 (4) 14:2 30:10,17 52:23 123 (4) 14:2 25:25 30:10 52:24 13 (1) 1:4 139 (1) 1:22 140 (1) 34:25 15 (1) 15:5</p> | <hr/> <p align="center">3</p> <hr/> <p>3 (1) 2:6 30 (1) 36:19 30th (1) 50:6 31 (1) 7:16 311 (1) 11:13 345 (1) 52:24 3rd (1) 74:18</p> | |
| <hr/> <p align="center">0</p> <hr/> <p align="center">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 (1) 2:4 1-800-341-CCRB (1) 11:14 10 (1) 2:13 100 (2) 11:16 67:3 10007 (1) 11:16 101 (1) 1:7 10303 (2) 15:2,8 10304 (1) 1:7 10543 (1) 1:23 12 (1) 35:4 120 (11) 22:15 30:9 32:7,13 41:7 52:23 60:15,17 63:11 66:19 70:10 120th (1) 13:24 121 (3) 13:25 30:10 61:8 122 (4) 14:2 30:10,17 52:23 123 (4) 14:2 25:25 30:10 52:24 13 (1) 1:4 139 (1) 1:22 140 (1) 34:25 15 (1) 15:5</p> | <hr/> <p align="center">4</p> <hr/> <p>4 (3) 2:7 11:20 33:13 4.6 (1) 13:9 46 (1) 16:15 49 (1) 1:6</p> | |
| <hr/> <p align="center">0</p> <hr/> <p align="center">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 (1) 2:4 1-800-341-CCRB (1) 11:14 10 (1) 2:13 100 (2) 11:16 67:3 10007 (1) 11:16 101 (1) 1:7 10303 (2) 15:2,8 10304 (1) 1:7 10543 (1) 1:23 12 (1) 35:4 120 (11) 22:15 30:9 32:7,13 41:7 52:23 60:15,17 63:11 66:19 70:10 120th (1) 13:24 121 (3) 13:25 30:10 61:8 122 (4) 14:2 30:10,17 52:23 123 (4) 14:2 25:25 30:10 52:24 13 (1) 1:4 139 (1) 1:22 140 (1) 34:25 15 (1) 15:5</p> | <hr/> <p align="center">5</p> <hr/> <p>5 (1) 2:8 5.7 (1) 13:8 50 (1) 65:21 5000 (1) 26:17 56.5 (2) 15:23,23 567 (1) 52:24</p> | |
| <hr/> <p align="center">0</p> <hr/> <p align="center">1</p> <hr/> <p>1 (1) 2:4 1-800-341-CCRB (1) 11:14 10 (1) 2:13 100 (2) 11:16 67:3 10007 (1) 11:16 101 (1) 1:7 10303 (2) 15:2,8 10304 (1) 1:7 10543 (1) 1:23 12 (1) 35:4 120 (11) 22:15 30:9 32:7,13 41:7 52:23 60:15,17 63:11 66:19 70:10 120th (1) 13:24 121 (3) 13:25 30:10 61:8 122 (4) 14:2 30:10,17 52:23 123 (4) 14:2 25:25 30:10 52:24 13 (1) 1:4 139 (1) 1:22 140 (1) 34:25 15 (1) 15:5</p> | <hr/> <p align="center">6</p> <hr/> <p>6 (1) 2:9 6:36 (1) 1:5 60 (1) 16:13 60's (1) 67:7 6th (1) 68:17</p> | |
| | <hr/> <p align="center">7</p> <hr/> <p>7 (3) 2:10 11:20 33:13 70's (1) 67:8 72 (2) 35:15 38:2</p> | |