

**Community Board 7 Monthly Meeting  
January 15, 2020**

**Prior to the opening of the meeting:**

**Members of the Media present:**

The following publications and members of the media announced themselves: Brooklyn Eagle, Brooklyn Paper, Brooklyn, CUNY Grad School, News 12, Meerkat Media, Independent Documentarian, Curbed New York, Politico

**Housekeeping rules for the meeting from Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga:**

A letter was distributed to all board members at the beginning of the meeting from Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga (see attached). In order to maximize debate and deliberation among board members on consequential land use actions related to Industry City, Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga announced that there would be no public comment prior to the committee reports in the order of business. The public comment at the end of the agenda will be open, as always. He also indicated that the meeting would not be shut down, as the vote on Industry City's zoning application was an obligation of the community board. Cesar indicated that we would need to respect the process and challenge ideas, but not people and motives. He also said that the board would not be rushed during the meeting and asked board members to prepare themselves for a long meeting in order to have a substantive conversation around the proposal.

**1. The Pledge of Allegiance**

**2. Opening of the meeting**

Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga opened the meeting, and indicated that Council Member Carlos Menchaca was asked not to attend the meeting because there were concerns by some board members about the influence of his presence. Out of respect for these concerns and the board's process, he was asked not to come and this is why he would not be present. If it had been up to him, he would have been at the meeting.

District Manager Jeremy Laufer and Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga asked people not to use the wifi network for the Community Board and instead to use the Brooklyn Public Library's network in order to allow the meeting to be livestreamed.

**3. Adoption of the agenda**

Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga proposed to adopt the agenda. Vice Chairperson Julio Peña made a motion to adopt the agenda and Cindy VandenBosch seconded. District Manager Jeremy Laufer interrupted the process to point out that there was an amendment required before a motion was made to adopt the agenda.

Amendment to the agenda: Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga proposed an amendment to include a report from the Membership and Attendance Committee. Second Vice Chair Pat Ruiz motioned to accept the amendment, Vice Chair Julio Peña seconded. The motion carried with all in favor, and no objections nor abstentions.

**4. Adoption of the Minutes of the Board Meeting of December 18, 2019**

A motion was proposed by Secretary Pat Ruiz to accept the minutes of the board meeting of December 18, 2019. The motion was seconded by Samuel Sierra. The motion carried with all in favor, with no objections nor abstentions.

**5. Committee Reports:**

- a. **Membership and Attendance Committee Report:** Report by Beverly Kleinman, Vice Chair of the Membership and Attendance Committee: The committee convened a meeting with Marilyn Melman on 1/15/2020 just prior to the monthly meeting to discuss her three absences at community board monthly meetings, as is required by the by-laws. She presented a doctor's note and credible information about why she was absent. The committee voted not to remove her from the board, as she shows enthusiasm and has a real interest in the community. No board vote was required.
- b. **Report from the Sanitation/Environment Committee (no vote required):** Presentation from the Department of Sanitation on the Make Compost, Not Trash campaign in CB7 district. Sanitation/Environment Committee Chairperson Joseph Canale did not have a report. He encouraged board members to review the minutes from the committee meeting.

Issue with livestreaming the meeting/ Change in the sequence of the agenda: Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga indicated that time was needed to resolve issues with livestreaming the meeting, and invited Elected Officials/Representatives to make their reports.

**6. Elected Officials/Representatives**

- a. **Report from the NYPD 72nd Precinct:**  
Robberies: There has been a slight increase in robberies. The NYPD advises residents to turn back and look behind themselves when walking into their buildings. There have been a couple of incidents where people are being followed into their hallways where they are being robbed.  
  
Chinese New Year celebration: On Sunday, January 26th, 2020 from 12-6pm: We're looking forward to the neighborhood's celebration of Chinese New Year Celebration at 8th Ave and 50th Street.
- b. **Brooklyn District Attorney Eric Gonzalez's office report:** The District Attorney has been hosting a number of public appearances and events, including an event about human trafficking that took place on Monday (1/13/2020) and an upcoming Deeds Fraud event. Go to [BrooklynDA.org](http://BrooklynDA.org) to learn about upcoming events.
- c. **Senator Montgomery's report** by Carolina Nunez: Due to a bill that was signed into law last year, adults now have the right in New York State to request their pre-adoption birth certificates. Applications started to be accepted as of today. Senator Montgomery's office has prepared a Q&A sheet for people to pick up. We have a parking calendar on the table for everyone for 2020.
- d. **Senator Myrie's office:** Session resumed last week and started with **voting reforms**. As Chair of Elections, Senator Myrie helped pass automatic voter registration and early voting reforms. You can watch the sessions live on the [nysenate.gov](http://nysenate.gov) website.

**Community Board 7 Monthly Meeting  
January 15, 2020**

**Prior to the opening of the meeting:**

**Members of the Media present:**

The following publications and members of the media announced themselves: Brooklyn Eagle, Brooklyn Paper, Brooklyn, CUNY Grad School, News 12, Meerkat Media, Independent Documentarian, Curbed New York, Politico

**Housekeeping rules for the meeting from Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga:**

A letter was distributed to all board members at the beginning of the meeting from Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga (see attached). In order to maximize debate and deliberation among board members on consequential land use actions related to Industry City, Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga announced that there would be no public comment prior to the committee reports in the order of business. The public comment at the end of the agenda will be open, as always. He also indicated that the meeting would not be shut down, as the vote on Industry City's zoning application was an obligation of the community board. Cesar indicated that we would need to respect the process and challenge ideas, but not people and motives. He also said that the board would not be rushed during the meeting and asked board members to prepare themselves for a long meeting in order to have a substantive conversation around the proposal.

**1. The Pledge of Allegiance**

**2. Opening of the meeting**

Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga opened the meeting, and indicated that Council Member Carlos Menchaca was asked not to attend the meeting because there were concerns by some board members about the influence of his presence. Out of respect for these concerns and the board's process, he was asked not to come and this is why he would not be present. If it had been up to him, he would have been at the meeting. .

District Manager Jeremy Laufer and Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga asked people not to use the wifi network for the Community Board and instead to use the Brooklyn Public Library's network in order to allow the meeting to be livestreamed.

**3. Adoption of the agenda**

Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga proposed to adopt the agenda. Vice Chairperson Julio Peña made a motion to adopt the agenda and Cindy VandenBosch seconded. District Manager Jeremy Laufer interrupted the process to point out that there was an amendment required before a motion was made to adopt the agenda.

Amendment to the agenda: Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga proposed an amendment to include a report from the Membership and Attendance Committee. Second Vice Chair Pat Ruiz motioned to accept the amendment, Vice Chair Julio Peña seconded. The motion carried with all in favor, and no objections nor abstentions.

**4. Adoption of the Minutes of the Board Meeting of December 18, 2019**

Over the weekend, we had a great event with the Attorney General's office to bring awareness to Brooklyn residents about **deed theft**, a major issue which involves deceiving or coercing homeowners into signing over ownership of their properties in gentrifying neighborhoods. The big takeaway is that the Attorney General's office has a homeowner protection hotline. We can connect you to it if you call our office. We also have, "This house is not for sale," signs on the table for people to take.

**Low income tax prep assistance** begins Tuesday, February 1st and continues from 1-9pm at our district office, and you can make an appointment by calling our office.

The office is also offering **free legal services** with the Metropolitan Black Bar Association for anyone who needs assistance with **housing or immigration**. The first drop-in assistance session will be on Thursday, January 23rd from 6-8pm here at the Sunset Park Library. You can also make an appointment by calling our office.

Upcoming events:

- Lunar New Year on Saturday, February 1st from 11:30am-2pm at PS 310 with the Chinese American Planning Council
- Lovers' Rock... for Seniors, Thursday, February 6 11am-2pm
- State of the District Address Sunday 2/23, 2-5pm at the Brooklyn Public Library Central Branch. Agenda for the work ahead, food, performances, and an opportunity to take a picture with the senator. You can RSVP by calling their office.
- Office calendar is on the table for those interested

**e. Borough President Adams' report by Sherman Jackson:**

Last night, we held a hearing to review the ULURP for Industry City. It was well-attended and is a work-in-progress.

**PS1 Annex** - Senator Myrie and local councilperson, representative from your Congresswoman's office, and BP Adams' office met with the parents' association at PS 1, and managed to convince the School Construction Authority to forego establishing an Annex across Third Avenue. There is a parcel there, but obviously parents are concerned about traversing from 4th Avenue to 3rd Avenue. SCA is now undertaking a feasibility study to see if the annex can be situated on the property where PS 1 is located. Pre-K children will be given priority. They are now currently housed at a Lutheran Church, which is across from PS1. It was significant that we were able to get the SCA to reconsider and it is a work in progress, but we're proud of our work, along with the parents association and elected officials.

Hate crimes are rising exponentially. In 2019, the NYPD reported a 19% increase in hate crimes. Borough President Adams invites everyone to join him in his "**Breaking Breads, Building Bonds**" initiative. He plans to hold 100 dinners, each with 10 everyday New Yorkers with distinct identities, ethnicities, faiths, and lifestyles together in order to unite us through shared commonalities.

On December 6, 2019, the Borough President announced the expansion of his **Operation Safe Shopper program**, which began in 2016, and is a partnership with local shopping districts, civic groups, and the NYPD to monitor heavily trafficked commercial corridors that can benefit from additional monitoring via security cameras. The Office of the Borough President has funded approximately \$30,000 of cameras that will be maintained and operated by the local businesses.

On December 22, 2019, the Borough President stood with Councilmembers Justin Brannan and Robert Cornegy as they unveiled **new legislation to use drones to enhance the efficiency and efficacy of building inspections**. Drones are being used in various other cities and are used as a novel technology for public safety.

- f. **Council Member Menchaca's Office report by Community Liaison Ting:**  
There are flyers available with constituent services updates and contact information. The Councilmember's office is open Tues-Thurs 10-6pm.

On January 29, 2020, the New York Legal Assistance Group will provide legal assistance at our office from 10am-3pm. Call the office to make an appointment.

On January 16, 2020 at 7pm, there will be a presentation by the Landmarks Preservation Commission to discuss Sunset Park Historic District. If you live in the historic district, come out to learn about special privileges you may have, and tenants and homeowners are encouraged to attend.

Participatory budgeting is going to be in full swing. If you have any questions, contact the district office.

- g. **Report from Assembly Member Robert Carroll:**

During the Governor's State of the State last week, he announced that **there is a \$6 billion budget deficit**. Our state budget is about \$176 billion and \$76 billion of those dollars are pass-through dollars from the Federal Government. There's about \$100 to \$110 billion actual budget. The Governor has not introduced any revenue increases in his budget. Assembly Member Carroll's office is seeking to address how it can be funded without cuts to Medicaid to ensure that hospitals like Maimonides, Lutheran, and Methodist stay open and are well-funded.

**Bail reform laws** - There have been recent New York Post articles about the new bail reform laws that we passed last year. This is fear-mongering. These laws correct wrongs of criminal justice system. We can get a smart cogent well-run criminal justice system that doesn't preordain who is dangerous or not. If you're middle class or wealthy, you can post bail and walk free. If you're poor, you can lose your job or housing if you spend a few days in jail. Hoping we stand strong.

NYC Department of Ed for first time ever announced **universal dyslexia screening at D15**. If we're going to get universal - 20% of people are dyslexic, we can ID them quickly and cheaply to make the right intervention. This screener is \$1/kid. One in Park Slope and one in Kensington. We could do it for every school for under \$3M.

Over the weekend, we had a great event with the Attorney General's office to bring awareness to Brooklyn residents about **deed theft**, a major issue which involves deceiving or coercing homeowners into signing over ownership of their properties in gentrifying neighborhoods. The big takeaway is that the Attorney General's office has a homeowner protection hotline. We can connect you to it if you call our office. We also have, "This house is not for sale," signs on the table for people to take.

**Low income tax prep assistance** begins Tuesday, February 1st and continues from 1-9pm at our district office, and you can make an appointment by calling our office.

The office is also offering **free legal services** with the Metropolitan Black Bar Association for anyone who needs assistance with **housing or immigration**. The first drop-in assistance session will be on Thursday, January 23rd from 6-8pm here at the Sunset Park Library. You can also make an appointment by calling our office.

Upcoming events:

- Lunar New Year on Saturday, February 1st from 11:30am-2pm at PS 310 with the Chinese American Planning Council
- Lovers' Rock... for Seniors, Thursday, February 6 11am-2pm
- State of the District Address Sunday 2/23, 2-5pm at the Brooklyn Public Library Central Branch. Agenda for the work ahead, food, performances, and an opportunity to take a picture with the senator. You can RSVP by calling their office.
- Office calendar is on the table for those interested

**e. Borough President Adams' report by Sherman Jackson:**

Last night, we held a hearing to review the ULURP for Industry City. It was well-attended and is a work-in-progress.

**PS1 Annex** - Senator Myrie and local councilperson, representative from your Congresswoman's office, and BP Adams' office met with the parents' association at PS 1, and managed to convince the School Construction Authority to forego establishing an Annex across Third Avenue. There is a parcel there, but obviously parents are concerned about traversing from 4th Avenue to 3rd Avenue. SCA is now undertaking a feasibility study to see if the annex can be situated on the property where PS 1 is located. Pre-K children will be given priority. They are now currently housed at a Lutheran Church, which is across from PS1. It was significant that we were able to get the SCA to reconsider and it is a work in progress, but we're proud of our work, along with the parents association and elected officials.

Hate crimes are rising exponentially. In 2019, the NYPD reported a 19% increase in hate crimes. Borough President Adams invites everyone to join him in his **"Breaking Breads, Building Bonds"** initiative. He plans to hold 100 dinners, each with 10 everyday New Yorkers with distinct identities, ethnicities, faiths, and lifestyles together in order to unite us through shared commonalities.

**h. Council Member Brad Lander's report:**

Two upcoming bills that the Council Member is hoping to pass this session: **1) Reckless Drivers' bill** and **2) Capital Projects' tracker**. Councilmember Lander is working to pass the Reckless Driver Accountability Act, to hold drivers accountable, and another bill to hold the city accountable for capital projects with a Universal Capital Projects tracking system.

Some have claimed **bail reform** has led to anti-semitic hate crimes. It was not bail reform that has to do with anti-semitic hate crimes, and Jewish New Yorkers will stand strong with Rep. Bobby Carroll and the Assembly.

**Desegregating schools in the district** - In the Ed space, congrats to Bobby on the dyslexia testing, D15 middle school integration school is going well, whereas last fall of the 11 middle schools in D15, 8 were highly segregated: more than 75 or 90% white, or 75% students of color. Now, 8 of the 11 schools reflect the diversity of our district. Hopefully all 11 next year will reflect goals of the community. The D15 Youth Diversity Council at MS51 with students from elementary and middle schools from all over the district, as diverse as our communities and city.

**7. Land Use Committee Report (see above for other committee reports)**

**a. Agenda items:**

- i. Committee reports and recommendations
- ii. Review coordinated response
- iii. Board primer and comment process

**b. Opening remarks:** Chairperson Cesar Zuffiga indicated that he was going to table elected officials until the end of the meeting, as this is the first time that the full board will have the opportunity to debate and discuss this monumental action. He indicated that he wanted to give as much time as possible for that to happen. He also addressed the board in preparation for the discussions and voting on the Industry City rezoning application:

"A couple of other things I want to frame this conversation. We recognize as a board two years ago that this was coming, that this was not an ordinary run of the mill rezoning application. We recognize that this was a massive rezoning. And so we engaged in a process because personally and I've heard a lot of you as board members express this, that ULURP is broken. It is a farce. It is broken. It doesn't provide for community-led planning. It doesn't provide for meaningful engagement. We decided to mobilize based on those facts. For the last two years, we have been discussing through town halls and community meetings and through a whole host of public engagements. From my estimation, about 25, in order to have a process that was beyond the ULURP process. Tonight is the culmination of that for us, and what I would also remind you is that there are several more layers of the ULURP process, and I would encourage all of us to continue to stay engaged in this process. Tonight is our charter-mandated role and responsibilities, but the process continues to move forward. There is a whole lot at stake in this action and proposed project, and so I would again highly encourage all of us not to sit back and think that we can ride out the rest of the process because this is too consequential for us to do that.

I want to remind us of a couple of things. We went into this process and got a whole bunch of insights. Some of the things we knew were basically that affordable housing is the most critical issue facing our community, and this process further verified that for us, and we will take actions on that in other contexts. We knew that people were and are super anxious about gentrification and displacement. We knew that we had a traffic problem in this community. What I want to remind you is that all of these problems are not up to us to fix. It's the City's responsibility to take on these issues, and frankly I also want to remind you that the City very unfortunately has responded in a way that continues, in my mind, to indicate that they don't really care about this community, as per the response we got from the administration when we asked them to engage with us in this process. They basically said, 'No Thanks,' and I think you should keep that in mind tonight. This is the context we're operating in. The message was rubber stamp it, and then we'll talk. That's not ok. That's not enough. That's the context we're in right now, and within that context we need to make our decision tonight."

- c. **Chairperson Zuñiga recognized Land Use Committee Chairperson John Fontillas:** "He deserves so much credit and recognition that he's been doing over the last two years. [Applause] I've had stressful nights and have sometimes had no sleep. But I can't imagine what it's been like for him to carry this on his shoulders. From the bottom of my heart, I appreciate that you took this on without complaining, with a lot of grace, and you listened, which is something we need to do more of in this community, and I'm going to give you the floor **now**."
- d. **Land Use Cte. Chair John Fontillas** read the four actions that are included in the Industry City zoning application into the record:
  - i. Zoning map amendment: Application # C190296 ZMK
  - ii. Zoning text amendment: Application # N190298 ZRK
  - iii. Zoning special permit: Application # C190297 ZSK
  - iv. Related change in the city map: Application #C160146MMK
- e. **Overview of process and structure:**
  - i. Land Use Committee presented its recommendations based on the community board's work over the past two years and final committee votes and recommendations on the four actions. Mr. Fontillas indicated that the committee and board sought to give everyone a voice from the start, including residents, local businesses, and other interested stakeholders and now it is time to conduct a final review of the resolutions and recommendations and vote as a board, and forward the board's recommendations to the Borough President, City Planning Commission, and the City Council.
  - ii. **The committee report is structured in two parts:**
    - 1. **First Part: Resolutions** regarding the Industry City zoning application, which was initially discussed in 7 standing committees of the board. These resolutions will be attached to each of the four recommendations. These resolutions are grouped into 6 issue sections, each includes:
      - a. recommendations for the applicant; and
      - b. recommendations for government agencies.
    - 2. **Second Part: Recommendations** - The four recommendations on each of the land use zoning actions.
- f. **First Part: Resolutions**



**h. Council Member Brad Lander's report:**

Two upcoming bills that the Council Member is hoping to pass this session: **1) Reckless Drivers' bill** and **2) Capital Projects' tracker**. Councilmember Lander is working to pass the Reckless Driver Accountability Act, to hold drivers accountable, and another bill to hold the city accountable for capital projects with a Universal Capital Projects tracking system.

Some have claimed **bail reform** has led to anti-semitic hate crimes. It was not bail reform that has to do with anti-semitic hate crimes, and Jewish New Yorkers will stand strong with Rep. Bobby Carroll and the Assembly.

**Desegregating schools in the district** - In the Ed space, congrats to Bobby on the dyslexia testing, D15 middle school integration school is going well, whereas last fall of the 11 middle schools in D15, 8 were highly segregated: more than 75 or 90% white, or 75% students of color. Now, 8 of the 11 schools reflect the diversity of our district. Hopefully all 11 next year will reflect goals of the community. The D15 Youth Diversity Council at MS51 with students from elementary and middle schools from all over the district, as diverse as our communities and city.

**7. Land Use Committee Report (see above for other committee reports)**

**a. Agenda items:**

- i. Committee reports and recommendations
- ii. Review coordinated response
- iii. Board primer and comment process

**b. Opening remarks:** Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga indicated that he was going to table elected officials until the end of the meeting, as this is the first time that the full board will have the opportunity to debate and discuss this monumental action. He indicated that he wanted to give as much time as possible for that to happen. He also addressed the board in preparation for the discussions and voting on the Industry City rezoning application:

"A couple of other things I want to frame this conversation. We recognize as a board two years ago that this was coming, that this was not an ordinary run of the mill rezoning application. We recognize that this was a massive rezoning. And so we engaged in a process because personally and I've heard a lot of you as board members express this, that ULURP is broken. It is a farce. It is broken. It doesn't provide for community-led planning. It doesn't provide for meaningful engagement. We decided to mobilize based on those facts. For the last two years, we have been discussing through town halls and community meetings and through a whole host of public engagements. From my estimation, about 25, in order to have a process that was beyond the ULURP process. Tonight is the culmination of that for us, and what I would also remind you is that there are several more layers of the ULURP process, and I would encourage all of us to continue to stay engaged in this process. Tonight is our charter-mandated role and responsibilities, but the process continues to move forward. There is a whole lot at stake in this action and proposed project, and so I would again highly encourage all of us not to sit back and think that we can ride out the rest of the process because this is too consequential for us to do that.

- i. The board voted to adopt the executive summary for the resolutions (see attached) to avoid having to read the whole document for the record, as all board members were provided with the printed executive summary to read on their own. Land Use Chair John Fontillas made a motion to dispense with reading the entire document into the record and to accept the executive summary as being read. Gloria Rodriguez Novoa seconded. The motion was approved unanimously. 0 - opposed. 0 - abstentions.
  - ii. Mr. Fontillas called for amendments to the resolutions:
    - 1. Antoinette Martinez offered: Add "Applicant to hire locally and provide a living wage and benefits, health care, paid time off, retirement savings, and professional career development for contracted and internal employees, and to work with its tenants to do the same." Marcela Mitaynes seconded. Vote to add was approved, **44 – in favor, 4 – opposed, with 0 - abstentions.**
    - 2. Mr. Fontillas moved to adopt the resolutions as amended. Peter Wong seconded. The motion was approved, **45 – in favor, 3 – opposed, with 0 - abstentions.**
    - 3. Resolutions were declared as being adopted into the record by Mr. Fontillas.
- g. Second Part: Land Use Committee recommendations on the four Industry City proposed land use (ULURP) actions**
- i. Mr. Fontillas read the recommendations from the Land Use Committee on the four proposed land use actions into the record (see attached document). There was a discussion on the work the committee undertook.
  - ii. Called for amendments to land use section text: five offered, one was not approved, three were approved to be added, one was revised by Chair.
    - 1. Dan Murphy offered: On A69 recommendation - Demap 40<sup>th</sup> St, affirm statement as written in executive summary (disapproval with conditions – Mr. Wong questioned if adding conditions was approved by the Land Use Committee). Joan Botti seconded. Vote to affirm was approved **45 – in favor, 2 – opposed, with 1 – abstention.**
    - 2. Justin Collins offered: Add a recommendation "Prohibit additional retail uses on any floor in any of the 39<sup>th</sup> St Buildings." Cindy VandenBosch seconded. Vote to add was approved, **34 – in favor, 11 – opposed with 2 – abstentions.**
    - 3. Antoinette Martinez offered: Revise the A66 recommendation to read: "In order to maintain view corridors from Sunset Park to Lower Manhattan and the waterfront, the special permit drawings shall be amended to include a maximum building height of 90' (change from 110') for Buildings 11, 21 and Gateway." Marcela Mitaynes seconded. Vote to add was not approved, **23 – in favor, 25 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**
    - 4. David Estrada offered: Revise A48a recommendation to read: "Zoning text of the special district must prohibit all self service storage facilities and other warehousing not ancillary to manufacturing and industrial uses. Warehousing ancillary to wholesale trade is limited to no more than 10,000 sf (change from 2,500 sf) per establishment, except this limit may be increased upon review and approval by the Board. Lynn

Massimo seconded. Vote to add was approved, **46 – in favor, 2 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**

5. Lynn Massimo offered: Revise A56 recommendation to read “Accessory parking shall be provided in the application, except that it shall also include all newly permitted retail and service establishments, including retail, local service and eating and drinking establishments in UG6a/6C and such parking shall be provided when such uses reach (change word from “exceed”) 40,000 sf and go beyond. (added text) Chair accepted text change.
6. Vote on amended/added recommendations (Jimmy Li seconded) in this section was approved, **44 – in favor, 4 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.** There were several clarifying questions.

iii. Called for substitutions, strike outs, change in language of the actions.

1. Marcela Mitaynes offered: “In A44 - Mapping the Special District, revise “The Committee recommends APPROVAL” to “The Board recommends DISAPPROVAL, unless”. Fred Wolf seconded. There was a lengthy discussion on the substitution. Vote to change failed, **20 – in favor, 27 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**
2. Nick Azadian offered: “In A45 – Zoning Text Amendment, revise “The Committee recommends APPROVAL” to “The Board recommends DISAPPROVAL”. Second was inaudible. Vote to change failed, **21 – in favor, 26 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**
3. Fred Wolf offered: “In A69 – Demap 40<sup>th</sup> St, revise “The Committee recommends APPROVAL” to “The Board recommends DISAPPROVAL, unless”. Seconded by David Estrada. Vote to change was approved, **29 – in favor, 18 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**

iv. Explanation of voting process and clarifying questions:

1. Mr. Fontillas indicated that the board would vote on four separate land use actions as written and described each, one by one.
2. District Manager Laufer attempted to clarify since the board took split positions on the four land use actions: two “Approval with conditions” positions for the first two land use actions and two “Disapproval unless” on the last two land use actions. He indicated that a ‘Yes’ on the first would be to approve and the motion would pass, while a ‘No’ for that vote means you do not approve of the motion. He further indicated that if there was a ‘No’ vote on the “Approval with conditions” position, there could then substitute with the complete opposite motion, which you’d assume would pass as affirmative for the opposite position. He reminded board members that if the board cannot get to an affirmative vote on a position, then the board takes no position. He indicated that the vote is not on the ULURP, but rather on the language of each individual motion: to approve or disapprove the motion. Mr. Fontillas indicated that each motion was on each action, and that it was the final vote. Mr. Laufer said that there would be no amending at this point. Mr. Fontillas indicated that it was the final four votes on the final four land use actions, as stated.
3. Clarifying questions were asked, as there was some confusion in the room:

- i. The board voted to adopt the executive summary for the resolutions (see attached) to avoid having to read the whole document for the record, as all board members were provided with the printed executive summary to read on their own. Land Use Chair John Fontillas made a motion to dispense with reading the entire document into the record and to accept the executive summary as being read. Gloria Rodriguez Novoa seconded. The motion was approved unanimously. 0 - opposed. 0 - abstentions.
- ii. Mr. Fontillas called for amendments to the resolutions:
  1. Antoinette Martinez offered: Add "Applicant to hire locally and provide a living wage and benefits, health care, paid time off, retirement savings, and professional career development for contracted and internal employees, and to work with its tenants to do the same." Marcela Mitaynes seconded. Vote to add was approved, **44 – in favor, 4 – opposed, with 0 - abstentions.**
  2. Mr. Fontillas moved to adopt the resolutions as amended. Peter Wong seconded. The motion was approved, **45 – in favor, 3 – opposed, with 0 - abstentions.**
  3. Resolutions were declared as being adopted into the record by Mr. Fontillas.

**g. Second Part: Land Use Committee recommendations on the four Industry City proposed land use (ULURP) actions**

- i. Mr. Fontillas read the recommendations from the Land Use Committee on the four proposed land use actions into the record (see attached document). There was a discussion on the work the committee undertook.
- ii. Called for amendments to land use section text: five offered, one was not approved, three were approved to be added, one was revised by Chair.
  1. Dan Murphy offered: On A69 recommendation - Demap 40<sup>th</sup> St, affirm statement as written in executive summary (disapproval with conditions – Mr. Wong questioned if adding conditions was approved by the Land Use Committee). Joan Botti seconded. Vote to affirm was approved **45 – in favor, 2 – opposed, with 1 – abstention.**
  2. Justin Collins offered: Add a recommendation "Prohibit additional retail uses on any floor in any of the 39<sup>th</sup> St Buildings." Cindy VandenBosch seconded. Vote to add was approved, **34 – in favor, 11 – opposed with 2 – abstentions.**
  3. Antoinette Martinez offered: Revise the A66 recommendation to read: "In order to maintain view corridors from Sunset Park to Lower Manhattan and the waterfront, the special permit drawings shall be amended to include a maximum building height of 90' (change from 110') for Buildings 11, 21 and Gateway." Marcela Mitaynes seconded. Vote to add was not approved, **23 – in favor, 25 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**
  4. David Estrada offered: Revise A48a recommendation to read: "Zoning text of the special district must prohibit all self service storage facilities and other warehousing not ancillary to manufacturing and industrial uses. Warehousing ancillary to wholesale trade is limited to no more than 10,000 sf (change from 2,500 sf) per establishment, except this limit may be increased upon review and approval by the Board. Lynn

- a. Marcela Mityanes asked whether it was the final vote, and Mr. Fontillas said yes.
  - b. Cindy VandenBosch asked what would happen if the majority was a 'No' vote on an individual action. Mr. Fontillas indicated this was parliamentary procedure. Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga said let's deal with it once we get there.
  - c. Daniel Murphy attempted to clarify for everyone that we were voting on exactly what we've been talking about for the last 30 minutes, the four items. We are voting to affirm or not, he said.
  - d. Mr. Fontillas heard a board member ask whether we were voting on a package. Mr. Fontillas said no, because these are mandated charter use actions, they have to be voted on separately. Basically what happened is that the committee presented its recommendations and the board said, "No, we override a couple of them," and so now we need to vote on each one individually.
  - e. Jose Aleman asked whether we were voting on our overall position. Mr. Fontillas responded that, "you are voting your conscience" on whether each land use action should be approved or disapproved, based on the language that was changed or affirmed for the past 30 minutes. Mr. Aleman asked whether these four votes would determine the final position, and Mr. Fontillas said yes, but there are four separate votes for four separate land use actions, and then he provided a summary of each individual action.
  - f. Cynthia Gonzalez said that we are now voting on A44, and let's focus on A44, and then move on to something else so that everyone is clear exactly what they're voting on. I think we're confusing people with all of these facts when we're just voting on A44, and that's what people need to know.
  - g. Cindy VandenBosch asked, "It is important for me to understand, if there is a majority 'No' vote, for example, for this first one, what is the procedure?" District Manager Jeremy Laufer said, "Again, you are voting on language. Yes, we approve this language. No, we don't approve this language. If you vote, 'No,' we don't approve this language, we have no language. So then somebody can put a substitute motion later on. Maybe we won't get to that."
  - h. Cynthia Felix asked to confirm that we had two "Yes with conditions" and two "No, with conditions", and District Manager Laufer said, "Correct."
4. Chairperson Zuñiga's remarks before the vote: "You could be in favor of development and you could be in favor of Industry City's project, and it is also possible to be against this application... I want to make that clear. I want to make another point very clear. We are the first in a process. I hope to God that we all decide to continue to engage in this ULURP process because it is not over by any stretch of the imagination. Let's make sure we keep that in mind as we go into the vote."

- v. Called for Final Vote on the amended actions:
1. A44 – Map Special District, 190296ZMK, “The Board recommends APPROVAL, with conditions”. Vote on recommendation failed, **23 – in favor, 22 – opposed, 2 – abstentions (1 for cause). No position carried a majority.**
  2. A45 – Zoning Text Amendment, N190298ZRK, “The Board recommends APPROVAL, with conditions”. Vote on recommendation failed, **23 – in favor, 21 – opposed, with 3 abstentions. No position carried a majority.**
  3. A63 – Special Permit, 190297ZSK, “The Board recommends DISAPPROVAL, with conditions”. Vote on recommendation was approved, **32 – in favor, 12 – opposed, with 2 abstentions (1 for cause).**
  4. A69 – Demap 40<sup>th</sup> St, 160146MMK, “The Board recommends DISAPPROVAL, with conditions”. Vote on recommendation was approved, **31 – in favor, 13 – opposed with 3 abstentions (1 for cause).**
- vi. Discussion and motions following the Final Vote:
1. There was a discussion on what to do about the two motions that did not receive a majority vote. Marcela Mityanes asked what happens next, and what are the options.
  2. Mr. Wong motioned to adjourn, and there was a second made (unclear who), but Mr. Fontillas indicated that the meeting was still in session as there were still agenda items. Cesar Zuñiga said he was out of order, and the meeting continued.
  3. Ms. Massimo made a motion to reconsider and amend A44, 190296ZMK. Mr. Peña, acting a parliamentarian, stated that a motion to reconsider would require a 2/3 majority. Mr. Collins seconded. A44 – Map Special District – 190296ZMK, Vote to reconsider and amend did not reach 2/3<sup>rd</sup> threshold to reconsider, **23 – favor, 22 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**
  4. There was a discussion on whether the vote to reconsider can be reconsidered again. Mr. Peña and Mr. Zuñiga stated that only those who voted in favor of a motion can make a motion to reconsider a vote. Mr. Zuñiga stated that taking no position means the board does not send a recommendation to the Department of City Planning.
  5. Ms. Aviles made a motion to reconsider and amend A45, N190298ZRK. Ms. VandenBosch seconded. A45 – Zoning Text Amendment – Vote to reconsider and amend did not reach 2/3<sup>rd</sup> threshold to reconsider, **27 – in favor, 17 – opposed, with 0 – abstentions.**
  6. Mr. Fontillas clarified that the motion does not go forward, but the language of the amendments approved will be referred to in the submission.
  7. As Mr. Li voted to approve during the Final Vote, he made a motion to re-reconsider A44, 190296ZMK. Mr. Azadian seconded. Mr. Fontillas clarified that this would also need 2/3 to pass. Mr. Murphy stated that it was past 10:30 PM and several board members had already left. He stated his belief that these motions to reconsider were unfair, especially

- a. Marcela Mityanes asked whether it was the final vote, and Mr. Fontillas said yes.
  - b. Cindy VandenBosch asked what would happen if the majority was a 'No' vote on an individual action. Mr. Fontillas indicated this was parliamentary procedure. Chairperson Cesar Zuñiga said let's deal with it once we get there.
  - c. Daniel Murphy attempted to clarify for everyone that we were voting on exactly what we've been talking about for the last 30 minutes, the four items. We are voting to affirm or not, he said.
  - d. Mr. Fontillas heard a board member ask whether we were voting on a package. Mr. Fontillas said no, because these are mandated charter use actions, they have to be voted on separately. Basically what happened is that the committee presented its recommendations and the board said, "No, we override a couple of them," and so now we need to vote on each one individually.
  - e. Jose Aleman asked whether we were voting on our overall position. Mr. Fontillas responded that, "you are voting your conscience" on whether each land use action should be approved or disapproved, based on the language that was changed or affirmed for the past 30 minutes. Mr. Aleman asked whether these four votes would determine the final position, and Mr. Fontillas said yes, but there are four separate votes for four separate land use actions, and then he provided a summary of each individual action.
  - f. Cynthia Gonzalez said that we are now voting on A44, and let's focus on A44, and then move on to something else so that everyone is clear exactly what they're voting on. I think we're confusing people with all of these facts when we're just voting on A44, and that's what people need to know.
  - g. Cindy VandenBosch asked, "It is important for me to understand, if there is a majority 'No' vote, for example, for this first one, what is the procedure?" District Manager Jeremy Laufer said, "Again, you are voting on language. Yes, we approve this language. No, we don't approve this language. If you vote, 'No,' we don't approve this language, we have no language. So then somebody can put a substitute motion later on. Maybe we won't get to that."
  - h. Cynthia Felix asked to confirm that we had two "Yes with conditions" and two "No, with conditions", and District Manager Laufer said, "Correct."
4. Chairperson Zuñiga's remarks before the vote: "You could be in favor of development and you could be in favor of Industry City's project, and it is also possible to be against this application... I want to make that clear. I want to make another point very clear. We are the first in a process. I hope to God that we all decide to continue to engage in this ULURP process because it is not over by any stretch of the imagination. Let's make sure we keep that in mind as we go into the vote."

to seniors and those with child care needs. Mr. Jasie stated that we were out of order. Mr. Zuñiga stated that was not the case. Vote to reconsider and amend did not reach 2/3 threshold to reconsider, **20 – in favor, 21 – opposed with 0 – abstentions.**

8. Mr. Wong stated he would like to make a motion to close debate, but that this is becoming a war of attrition. Mr. Peña stated that technically we have completed debate.
9. Ms. Walsh stated that men were expressing themselves and using their physical presence, and were yelling a few minutes earlier and, as a woman, that made her uncomfortable and feel unsafe. We shouldn't use our stature and positions to do that.
10. Mrs. VandenBosch stated that there were many people who worked on the comments that felt strongly about taking a disapproval position with conditions on the land use actions. She said that there was a reason she asked about procedure and next steps prior to the final vote, and she said it was a problem that we decided not to talk about that. Not being informed that there would need to be a two-thirds vote would have been important and useful information for everyone in the room.

#### **8. District Manager's Report**

- a. The District Manager thanked Natasha Cordero concerning her efforts on the Holiday Toy Drive; Denny Chen, United Senior Citizens of Sunset Park and other donors and volunteers. More than 800 toys were distributed, mostly to local homeless shelters.
- b. There are two public hearings on land use matters coming up in the next six weeks:
  - i. January 30 - Public hearing regarding 312 Coney Island Avenue at PS130, the Upper School on Caton Avenue;
  - ii. March 4 - Physical Culture Establishment / Gym on 3rd Avenue and 26th Street
- c. He stated that the old 68<sup>th</sup> Precinct is starting to come down across the street for the new school. They are saving part of the façade.
- d. There were 7 new and renewal applications for liquor licenses since the last month and police department statistics are on the back table.

#### **9. Chairperson's Report - Tabled**

#### **10. Old Business - None**

#### **11. New Business - None**

#### **12. Public Comment**

- a. Cynthia Gonzalez, speaking as a resident, stated that she shares concerns with those who spoke against the threat of Industry City. She encourages others to come to the board to deal with neighborhood concerns. All board members have had a chance to add input to the Industry City issue. IC's information on health and mental health aspects was insufficient. There needs to be an EIS in any community benefits agreement. She was not able to speak at the Borough Presidents Public Hearing because it was shut down by groups that thought their issues were more important than other issues. Many issues were not discussed because it was shut down. All voices



cannot be heard when people are disrespectful or divisive. Some board members have said they are fearful to state their position in public.

- b.** Victoria Linchong from Target Margin Theater mentioned several upcoming performances.
- c.** Tom Murphy stated that he heard on the radio that the Councilman in the southern Bronx would not approve a rezoning important to the Mayor and the Councilman from Bushwick stated that the Community Board rezoning was disapproved. He stated a recent court ruling stated the Inwood Rezoning created uncertainty about the public review process.
- d.** There being no additional public comment, the meeting was closed.

Respectfully submitted,  
Cynthia VandenBosch  
Secretary